

# **Immunobiodiversity: Conserved and specific immunity across land plants and beyond.**

Baptiste Castel, Karima El Mahboubi, Christophe Jacquet, Pierre-Marc

Delaux

# **To cite this version:**

Baptiste Castel, Karima El Mahboubi, Christophe Jacquet, Pierre-Marc Delaux. Immunobiodiversity: Conserved and specific immunity across land plants and beyond.. Molecular Plant, 2024, 17 (1), pp.92- 111. 10.1016/j.molp.2023.12.005. hal-04700244

# **HAL Id: hal-04700244 <https://hal.science/hal-04700244v1>**

Submitted on 17 Sep 2024

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

# **Title**

Immunobiodiversity: conserved and specific immunity across land plants and beyond.

# **Authors**

Baptiste CASTEL, Karima EL MAHBOUBI, Christophe JACQUET, Pierre-Marc DELAUX

# **Affiliations**

- Laboratoire de Recherche en Sciences Végétales (LRSV), Université de Toulouse, CNRS,
- UPS, Toulouse INP, Castanet-Tolosan, France.
- **Contact**
- PMD: pierre-marc.delaux@cnrs.fr

# **Running title**

Diversity of immunity mechanisms

# **Short summary**

 Interactions between plants and microbes have been shaped by millions of years of evolution. Here, we compare molecular mechanisms known in extant plant lineages, other eukaryotes and bacteria, to evaluate the history of the plant immune system. We conclude that our knowledge is biased toward angiosperms and propose that studying other lineages will enable the discovery of novel immune mechanisms.

### **Abstract**

 Angiosperms represent most of plants that human cultivate, grow and eat. However, angiosperms are only one of five major land plant lineages. As a whole lineage, plants also include algal groups. All these clades represent a tremendous genetic diversity, that can be investigated to reveal the evolutionary history of any given mechanism. In this review, we describe the current model of the plant immune system, discuss its evolution based on the recent literature and propose future directions for the field. In angiosperms, plant-microbe interactions have been intensively studied, revealing essential cell surface and intracellular immune receptors, as well as metabolic and hormonal defence pathways. Exploring diversity at the genomic and functional levels demonstrated the conservation of theses pathways across land plants, and for some of them beyond plants. From the conserved mechanisms, lineage-specific variations have occurred leading to diversified reservoirs of immune mechanisms. In rare cases, this diversity has been harnessed and successfully transferred to other species, by integration of wild immune receptors or engineering of novel forms of receptors, for improved resistance to pathogens. We propose that exploring further the diversity of immune mechanisms in the whole plant lineage will reveal completely novel sources of resistance to be deployed in crops.

## **Key words**

Evolution; MPMI; immunity; plant; evoMPMI; symbiosis

#### **Introduction**

 During the Cambrian (542-488 million years ago, MYA), plant colonised lands, during the so- called plant terrestrialization, and rapidly split in two main lineages: the tracheophytes and the bryophytes (Harris et al., 2022). Plant macrofossils from this time have not been discovered yet. The oldest land plant macrofossils are from the Rhynie Chert in Scotland and date back to the Early Devonian (420-393 MYA) (Strullu-Derrien et al., 2019; Donoghue et al., 2021). These remarkably well-conserved relics represent tracheophytes, some of which interacting with micro-organisms. *Aglaophyton major* was capable of arbuscular mycorrhizal symbiosis (Taylor et al., 1995), a type of mutualistic symbiotic interaction which promotes plant growth through nutrient exchanges between the plant and Glomeromycota fungi (Harrison, 2005; Smith and Read, 2008). Arbuscular mycorrhizal symbiosis is believed to have contributed to plant terrestrialization (Rich et al., 2021). In extant plants, other types of symbiotic interactions are also described including diverse mycorrhizal forms (Delaux and Schornack, 2021) or the nitrogen-fixing root nodule symbiosis with diazotrophic bacteria (Oldroyd, 2013). The Rhynie Chert macrofossils of *Asteroxylon mackiei* display a cellular response to filamentous pathogens (Strullu-Derrien et al., 2023), indicating that plants have co-evolved with pathogenic microbes at least since the Devonian. Plants were flourishing on lands even before, as attested by the discovery of cryptospores from the Dapingian (470-467 MYA) in Argentina (Rubinstein et al., 2010). More fossils would help filling in the missing gaps and better understand the biology of these ancient plants.

 Extant land plants can be categorized in seven lineages. Three are bryophytes: anthocerotophytes (horworts), bryophytes *sensu stricto* (mosses) and marchantiophytes (liverworts); and four are tracheophytes: lycophytes, monilophytes (ferns), gymnosperms, and angiosperms (Morris et al., 2018). Each lineage contains diverse species, making it possible to infer the history of traits. (Rich et al., 2021). The field of evolution of the molecular basis of plant-microbe interaction (evoMPMI) aims at comparing immunity and symbiosis between lineages to understand their evolution (Upson et al., 2018; Delaux and Schornack, 2021; Schornack and Kamoun, 2023). One interest is eventually to describe the immune system of the first land plant. Another one is to identify the diversity of immunity mechanisms and potentially transfer novel mechanisms into crop species to improve their resistance to pests.

 Angiosperms diverged from others tracheophytes during the Triassic and underwent massive radiation during the Late Jurassic and Early Cretaceous to become the most diverse plant lineage (Li et al., 2019). Today they represent ~450,000 of the ~500,000 land plant species, including most of our crops (Corlett, 2016). Hence, huge efforts have been put in place to

 understand the angiosperm immune system to propose genetic resistance in agriculture, with the aim to limit the need for costly and controversial chemicals (Ngou et al., 2022a). Angiosperm immunity is based on two types of receptors: some at the cell surface called Pattern-Recognition Receptors (PRRs) and some intracellular called Nucleotide-Binding (NB) and Leucine-Rich Repeats (LRR) receptors (NLRs) (Iakovidis et al., 2023). Upon activation, they trigger two signalling pathways called Pattern-Triggered Immunity (PTI) for PRR and Effector-Triggered Immunity (ETI) for NLRs. Several mechanisms are markers of ETI and PTI. They include a burst of Reactive Oxygen Species (ROS), accumulation of hormones such as Salicylic Acid (SA), activation of calcium channels and calcium-dependent protein kinases, which trigger in turn the phosphorylation of mitogen activated protein kinases, specific transcriptional reprogramming, induction of pathogenesis-related proteins including antimicrobial peptides, callose deposition or phytoalexin synthesis. The plant response might eventually culminate in triggering a form of localised cell death called hypersensitive response.

 The evolution of these receptors and of the signalling pathways they drive has been studied in recent years, in particular in the light of the large diversity of non-flowering plant genomes which are now available, including ferns (Li et al., 2018a; Fang et al., 2022; Marchant et al., 2022; Huang et al., 2022b), gymnosperms (Wan et al., 2018; Zhao et al., 2019; Scott et al., 2020; Wan et al., 2021; Liu et al., 2022), lycophytes (Banks et al., 2011; Wickell et al., 2021; Yu et al., 2023), hornworts (Li et al., 2020), liverworts (Montgomery et al., 2020; Rich et al., 2021; Singh et al., 2023) and mosses (Lang et al., 2018; Yu et al., 2022b). These genomes are essential tools to assess the evolution of known immune mechanisms and to discover novel ones at the genetic level. Beyond prediction on the conservation of immunity mechanisms based on genome comparisons, the research field of evoMPMI has recently put efforts to describe pathosystems in bryophytes, going down to the mechanistic details (Davey and Currah, 2006; Oliver et al., 2009; Carella and Schornack, 2018; Carella et al., 2019; Gimenez-Ibanez et al., 2019; Matsui et al., 2019; Redkar et al., 2021; Reboledo et al., 2021; Redkar et al., 2022; Moner-Ros et al., 2023). Studying the diversity of immune mechanisms, genetically and functionally, also revealed similarities with other eukaryotic clades. In this review, we first describe the current knowledge on plant immunity. Then we discuss the conservation of these mechanisms in plants and contrast to other lineages. We also propose directions to discover novel, lineage-specific, immune mechanisms that could represent opportunities for improved disease resistance in crops.

# **Angiosperm NLRs are major actors of the plant immune system and generally display a conserved architecture**

108 During the 20<sup>th</sup> century, Flor proposed the gene-for-gene model to describe the genetic basis of plant resistance to pathogens. It postulates that '*for each gene that conditions reaction in the host there is a corresponding gene in the parasite that conditions pathogenicity*' (Flor, 1971). Flor called the host factor 'resistance gene' (*R-*gene in the rest of the text) and the 112 pathogen factor 'avirulence gene'. The concept of avirulence gene is somehow incompatible with the concepts of adaptive evolution, as factors promoting host immunity are predicted to be eliminated over time from pathogen populations. The simplest hypothesis to explain maintenance of avirulence genes is that they contribute to pathogenicity in the absence of the cognate *R*-gene. This led to the hypothesis that R-proteins not necessarily monitor the presence of their cognate avirulence factor, but could also guard their virulence target, in the so-called 'guard model' (Van Der Biezen and Jones, 1998). These working models motivated genetic screens for plant *R*-genes. Several of these screens pinpointed proteins from the NLR family. More than 140 NLRs with their cognate effectors have been characterised so far (Kourelis and Van Der Hoorn, 2018), revealing in most cases a canonical tripartite architecture with conserved domains. Plant NLRs are indeed part of the bigger Signal Transduction ATPase with Numerous Domains (STAND) superfamily (Jones et al., 2016). STANDs are tripartite proteins consisting of (i) a variable N-terminal signalling domain (ii) a central ATPase domain for activation switch and (iii) a C-terminal recognition domain forming super-secondary structures (**Figure 1**). In plants, the C-terminal super-secondary structure is often an LRR domain. NLR specifically defines STANDs with C-terminal LRRs although this 128 term is sometimes used to describe proteins with other types of C-terminal super-secondary structure repeats. For plant NLRs, the central switch domain is always an NB adaptor shared by Apaf-1, some *R*-gene products, and CED-4 (NB-ARC). The N-terminal signalling domain can be a Toll, Interleukin-1 and some plant *R*-gene products (TIR) or a Coiled-Coil (CC), leading to diverse modes of action. TIRs are enzymes that consume oxidised Nicotinamide Adenosine Dinucleotide (NAD+) or dsDNA/RNA to form immune signalling molecules (Yu et al., 2022a; Jia et al., 2023). CCs can be classified into three monophyletic groups: Resistance to Powdery mildew 8 (RPW8), G10 and others CC (referred as CC in the rest of the text) (Kourelis et al., 2021). The RPW8 group specialised to function downstream of others NLRs (Bonardi et al., 2011; Qi et al., 2018; Castel et al., 2019a; Wu et al., 2019). Particularly, TIR-NLRs enzymatic product is recognised by the receptor Enhanced Disease Susceptibility 1 (EDS1), in complex with Senescence-Associated Carboxylesterase 101 (SAG101) or phytoalexin dependent 4 (PAD4), which activates the RPW8-NLR N Requirement Gene 1 (NRG1) or Activated Disease Resistance 1 (ADR1) respectively (Feehan et al., 2020). G10-NLRs specialisation is not known yet, but they work as singletons 143 (Lee et al., 2020). Both RPW8-NLRs and CC-NLRs can form calcium ion  $(Ca^{2+})$  channels at  the plasma membrane (Bi et al., 2021; Jacob et al., 2021). TIR and CC domains are functional only as oligomers (Maekawa et al., 2011; Duxbury et al., 2020).

 In their pre-activation state, NLRs are monomeric in the cytoplasm and safeguard the cell. The NB-ARC is maintained in an off-state condition by binding to an ADP. When encountering a cognate pathogenic effector, the NLR turns on. This activation leads to a switch from adenosine diphosphate (ADP) to an adenosine triphosphate (ATP), causing allosteric conformational changes. Four or five ATP-bound NLRs oligomerise and form a structure called resistosome (Wang et al., 2019a; Ma et al., 2020; Martin et al., 2020). Formation of the resistosome brings the TIR or CC domains into close proximity, enabling signalling and initiating ETI.

 The mechanism of NLR activation has been elucidated through research in angiosperms (Ngou et al., 2022a). Its conservation across the green lineage remains to be studied.

## **Growing genomic knowledge reveals the range of NLR diversity**

 The sequencing and analysis of diverse plant genomes demonstrated that plant NLRs are as ancient as the green lineage itself. They are found in streptophyte green algae and chlorophytes and specialised as TIR-, CC- and RPW8-NLRs before the diversification of the *Viridiplantae* (Shao et al., 2018). Besides defining the conservation of some domains, these genomic analyses lead to the identification of variations in the NLR architecture. To date, 481 plant NLRs have been at least partly characterised, and they are not always canonical (Kourelis et al., 2021). In fact, several NLRs diverge from the tripartite structure (Meyers et al., 2003). Some contain extra integrated domains (Marchal et al., 2022). A common one is the C-terminal jelly roll and Ig-like (C-JID), previously known as "post-LRR", found after the LRR of many TIR-NLRs (Saucet et al., 2021). It is a structurally defined domain required for effector recognition (Lapin et al., 2022). Other extra domains can be Kinases, WRKY, BEAF- and DREF-type zinc finger (BED), Heavy Metal Associated (HMA), Lin-11, Isl-1, and Mec-3 (LIM), or even extra TIR or extra NB-ARC. Some are thought to play a role in effector recognition, acting sometimes as decoys for effectors, but it cannot be excluded that others may contribute to signalling (Meyers et al., 2003; Marchal et al., 2022). Besides, some NLRs lack one of the three domains. For instance, Chilling Sensitive 1 (CHS1) and TIR-NB 2 (TN2) are TIR-NB only proteins, they lack an LRR, but they are functional, signalling with the full TIR-NLR suppressor of *chs1-2* 3 (SOC3) (Liang et al., 2018). There are even functional TIR- only proteins, lacking NB-ARC and LRR, such as Response to HopBA1 (RBA1) that contributes to immunity through EDS1-dependent HR and enzymatic activity, similarly to canonical TIR-NLRs (Nishimura et al., 2016; Wan et al., 2019). RPW8 domains exist alone and confer resistance to the powdery mildew fungus (after which they get named) (Xiao et  al., 2001), the rice blast fungus (Li et al., 2018b), the downy mildew oomycete (Ma et al., 2014) and some pathogenic bacteria (Li et al., 2018b; Castel et al., 2019b). Others CC, CC- NB, and NB-ARC alone have been identified but they are rare and their function in immunity has not been tested yet (Wroblewski et al., 2018). STANDs associated with C-terminal super- secondary structure-forming tandem repeats others than LRR also exist in plants. For instance, TNPs (short for TIR-NB-ARC-TPR) are proteins with a TIR and a NB-ARC domains associated with Tetratricopeptide Repeats (TPR), instead of the canonical LRRs (Lapin et al., 2022). They can induce a hypersensitive response when transiently expressed in *Nicotiana tabacum* leaves, a typical NLR phenotype. They do so via a signalling pathway different than classic TIR-NLRs; their role in immunity requires further investigation (Johanndrees et al., 2023).

 Genome comparisons across land plants revealed new structural organisations among the NLR families. If genome analyses showed a strong conservation of NLR in tracheophytes, there is an enhanced diversity in this family among bryophytes. Bryophytes, ferns, gymnosperms and lycophytes also contain TIR-, CC- and RPW8-NLRs, just like angiosperms (Liu et al., 2023). However, bryophytes also harbour specific features. They encode for NLR associated with atypical N-terminal domains such as -kinases or α/β hydrolase. They fall into the same phylogenetic clade as TIR-NLRs (Gao et al., 2018; Andolfo et al., 2019). This monophyly suggests that they evolved after a signalling domain swap in the TIR-NLR of bryophytes. One typical response of angiosperm NLRs is a TIR-, CC- or RPW8-mediated cell death activation. This feature is conserved for many tested TIR, CC and RPW8 domains of NLRs from non-vascular plants such as *Marchantia polymorpha*, ferns and lycophytes (Chia et al., 2022). In particular, a conserved group of CC-NLR, called MAEPL, is present in the genome of many non-flowering plant, and triggers responses analogous to the angiosperms CC-NLRs responses: hypersensitive response, transcriptional reprogramming and growth inhibition (Chia et al., 2022).

### **Immunity (almost) without NLR in ecologically peculiar plants**

 A survey of NLR diversity in plants revealed that their repertoire is reduced in the aquatic and floating angiosperm duckweed (*Lemnoideae*) (Baggs et al., 2020). As duckweeds are monophyletic, this NLR contraction could be a clade specificity linked to the adaptation to the aquatic lifestyle. The genomes of aquatic and floating ferns also contain few NLRs compared to terrestrial ferns (Liu et al., 2021). This suggests that NLR contraction is associated with evolutionary distinctiveness of aquatic and floating plants. Similarly, carnivorous and parasitic plant genomes encode for a low number of NLRs (Liu et al., 2021; Ngou et al., 2022b). One hypothesis for the reduction of the NLR repertoires in these clades could be that aquatic  plants cannot be infected by aerial pathogens, reducing the spectrum of potential pathogens, and thus the need for a diverse immune system. However, there are yet no evidence that aquatic plants face fewer parasites than terrestrial plants. Moreover, carnivorous and parasitic plants are not aquatic, so this lifestyle is not sufficient to explain the loss of NLRs. An interesting hypothesis is that evolutionary distinctiveness prevents rapid host jump from closely related species (Huang et al., 2015). In the case of duckweed, it would mean that their floating and aquatic lifestyle prevents host jump from related terrestrial *Araceae*. Pathogen of a given terrestrial *Araceae* can evolve new effectors to become compatible with another terrestrial *Araceae*, expanding its host range. But to turn compatible with aquatic *Araceae*, it would also require aerial to aquatic adaptation, which represents an extra step in term of genetic adaptation. This hinders host jump, reducing the need for ETI in duckweed. This hypothesis could be tested by comparing the microbiome of duckweeds and a closely related terrestrial *Araceae* and assess whether gene-flow is higher within terrestrial than between terrestrial and aquatic microbes. Duckweeds, carnivorous and parasitic plants also share a reduction of their root system, decreasing exposure to root microbes. One can imagine that it lowers the need for a diversified NLR repertoire. Conversely, it could be that these plants still encounter pathogens but evolved an immune system less dependent on NLRs. For example, in duckweed, the antimicrobial peptide family MiAMP1 has expanded and is upregulated upon pathogen inoculation (Baggs et al., 2022). Kiwi, papaya and maize also contains fewer NLRs (Baggs et al., 2017). Here the explanation could be domestication, dioecy, or both. Orchids also present a small number of NLRs, despite being the most diverse angiosperm family (Xue et al., 2020). Orchids engage in a particular type of mycorrhizal interaction (Dearnaley, 2007). For some orchids, this fungal interaction became so important that the plant became achlorophyllous and myco-heterotrophic (Gebauer et al., 2016). The loss of NLR could be explained by the accommodation of this particular symbiont, but this trend is not observed in other plant lineages that have evolved diverse mycorrhizal forms (Wu et al., 2023). Understanding how orchids, duckweeds and other plant lineages with limited NLR repertoire resist to pest will reveal unexplored aspect of plant immunity.

# **When NLRs drive plant speciation**

243 It is well known in agriculture that a cross between two plants can result in a bigger and more productive F1 progeny. This phenomenon is called hybrid vigour or heterosis (Lewontin et al., 2010). But the opposite can also happen, when the F1 progeny is stunted due to hybrid necrosis or hybrid incompatibility (Bomblies and Weigel, 2007). These phenomena are explained by dysregulation of the immune system. For heterosis, the defence-related hormone salicylic acid is down-regulated (Groszmann et al., 2015). For hybrid incompatibility, genetic approaches revealed that a single locus from each parent explains the stunted  phenotype (Chae et al., 2014). The causal genes are often alleles encoding NLR immune receptors, which, when co-expressed in the same plant, cause growth detrimental effect. For example, in *Arabidopsis thaliana*, incompatibility between accessions Uk-1 and Uk-3 is explained by alleles of the NLRs Resistance to *Peronospora Parasitica* 1 (RPP1) in Uk-1 and Suppressor of Salicylic acid Insensitive 4 (SSI4) in Uk-3 (Tran et al., 2017). Incompatibility between accessions Lerik-1 and KZ10 is explained by an allele of the NLR Resistance to *Peronospora Parasitica* 7 (RPP7) in Lerik-1 and the atypical R-protein RPW8 in KZ10 (Barragan et al., 2019). It illustrates a simple model for allopatric speciation proposed during 258 the early 20<sup>th</sup> century by Dobzhansky, Muller and Bateson (Orr, 1996). These authors proposed that sexual incompatibility between two related organisms is driven by only two genes, one from each parent. From an *aabb* genotype, two population evolve: to *aAbb* on the one population and *aabB* on the other population. The *A* and the *B* allele are incompatible: when they get expressed in the same plant, for example in an *aAbb* x *aabB* cross, the resulting progeny is either dead or stunted. Over time, the two populations become independent species. This model explains the presented cases of hybrid incompatibility, suggesting that NLRs not only regulate plant-microbe interactions, but can also contribute to 266 the evolution of plants (Calvo-Baltanás et al., 2021).

### **NLRs beyond plants**

 Although originally discovered in plants, NLRs are not specific to this lineage, and even play important roles in human (Bent et al., 1994; Harton et al., 2002). In animal research, NLRs stands for Nod-Like Receptors, but anyway describes STANDs with LRR. Like plant NLRs, they form ADP-bound monomer, sense nonself molecules via a C-terminal LRR and, upon ADP to ATP switch, form ring-shape oligomers (Duxbury et al., 2021). These oligomers are called inflammasomes instead of resistosomes, as such oligomers cause caspase-1 inflammation in animals (Wang et al., 2019a). The central NB domain, called NACHT (named after NAIP, CIITA, HET-E and TP1), is similar to the NB-ARC domain. Structurally, they are both made of an NB domain, a helical domain 1 and a winged helix domain. The only difference is that NACHTs also contain a second helical domain (Hu et al., 2013), lacking in NB-ARCs (Wang et al., 2019b). Animal NLRs have different N-terminal signalling domains, such as a caspase recruitment domain (Poyet et al., 2001) or a pyrin domain (Martinon et al., 2001) (**Figure 1**) which directly or indirectly activate caspases (Chou et al., 2023). Just like plant resistosomes, animal inflammasomes sense pathogens (Miao et al., 2006) and can be involved in autoimmune symptoms (Hoffman et al., 2001). Some also regulate other biological functions such as embryogenesis (Tong et al., 2000) and spermatogenesis (Westerveld et al., 2006). The presence of NLRs, among other STANDs, in sponges (Yuen et al., 2014), the sister lineage of all other animals, indicates that they originated at least in the

 first animal, during the Precambrian. NLR-like are also present in other eukaryotes. Genome mining in fungi revealed an even greater diversity in STANDs (Dyrka et al., 2014; Loquet and Saupe, 2017; Daskalov et al., 2020). They are referred as NLRs in the literature, but their C- terminal repeats are not LRR, unlike plants and animals. Instead, they display TPR, ankyrin or WD40 repeats (**Figure 1**). The central domain can either be the plant-type NB-ARC or the (almost identical) animal NACHT. Fungal STANDs, such as Patatin-Like Phospholipase-1 292 (PLP-1) and NACHT and WD repeat domain containing 2 (NWD2), control nonself recognition to prevent hyphae fusion between incompatible strains (Heller et al., 2018; Saupe, 2020). Their role in immunity is yet to be explored (Daskalov, 2023). Besides plants, animals and fungi, STANDs have been mostly overlooked in other lineages. There are putative genes encoding LRR-, TPR- and WD40-associated STANDs in the TSAR supergroup (Telonemia, Rhizaria, Alveolata and Stramenopila) and Caspase HetF Associated with TPRs (CHAT) domain with NB-ARC and LRR in Haptista and diatom (Richter and Levin, 2019). In particular, brown algae, that belong to the Stramenopila, have NB-TPRs, and red algae, a sister clade of the green lineage, have NB-WD40 (Andolfo et al., 2019) (**Figure 1**). These observations indicate that STANDs were already present in the eukaryote most recent common ancestor. It seems that CC-NLRs and TIR-NLRs evolved specifically in the green lineage. In angiosperms, TIR-NLRs were lost in monocots, while they expanded in rosids. CC-NLRs instead are present in all lineages and expanded in asterids (Shao et al., 2016). In bryophytes, TIR-NLRs underwent a domain swap leading to kinase- NLRs and α/β hydrolase-NLRs (Andolfo et al., 2019). The evolutionary history of the other eukaryotic STANDs presented here remains to be explored.

 The recent discovery of NLR in bacteria and archaea repositions our view of NLR evolution (Gao et al., 2022; Kibby et al., 2023). Bacteria can be attacked by pathogens such as viral bacteriophages. The description of an antiphage system, clustered and regularly interspaced palindromic repeats (CRISPR), led to a revolutionary genome editing tool. In this context, Gao *et al.* looked for NLR homologues in bacterial genomes (Gao et al., 2022). They found four classes that they called antiviral STAND (Avs): Avs1, Avs2, Avs3 and Avs4. They all have a central ATPase domain homologous to NACHT and NB-ARC, C-terminal TPR domains and a N-terminal enzymatic domains. The N-terminal domain is most often a nuclease, but sometimes a protease, a TIR, a CMP-hydrolase, transmembrane helixes or a sirtuin. Avs can form oligomeric structures upon recognition of specific viral proteins, similar to inflammasomes and resistosomes. Each class likely evolved independently as they are phylogenetically distant (Gao et al., 2022). Independently, Kibby *et al.* searched for novel antiphage systems by looking at uncharacterised genes from "defence island" loci in bacteria (Kibby et al., 2023). They found a gene encoding for a NACHT-containing protein in

 *Klebsiella pneumoniae* inducing phage resistance in *Escherichia coli*. Therefore, they conducted a systematic mining for NACHT in bacteria and found ~15,000 of them. These domains are ultimately quite common, particularly among cyanobacteria, actinobacteria and deltaproteobacteria (Kibby et al., 2023). There is co-evolution between the central NACHT and the C-terminal sensor, but not the N-terminal signalling domain. At the C-terminus, they carry super-secondary structure-forming tandem repeats such as LRR, TPR like in plants, 328 but also HEAT (for Huntingtin, elongation factor 3 [EF3], protein phosphatase 2A [PP2A], and 329 the yeast kinase TOR1) repeats (Kibby et al., 2023). At the N-terminus, they contain TIRs like in plants, but also nucleases, peptidases, sirtuins and domains of unknown function (**Figure 1**). Some of these domains could be involved in protein-protein interactions rather than acting as enzymes. This corroborates the role of NACHT / NB-ARC as adaptors between C-terminal sensor repeats and N-terminal immune signalling domains.

 Fusion of a C-terminal super-secondary structure and an N-terminal signalling domain to a central NB domain, the characteristic of STANDs, occurred several times independently in the tree of life (Dyrka et al., 2014; Urbach and Ausubel, 2017; Gao et al., 2022). Besides, they can play a role in defence against non-self (**Figure 1**). Hence, we propose that they emerged at early stage of life diversification to protect from biotic stress. Plant NLRs (as STANDs with LRR) are monophyletic and they share a different origin than other plants STANDs, such as TPRs or armadillo (ARM)-associated STANDs (Andolfo et al., 2019; Johanndrees et al., 2023). They also share a different origin than metazoan NLRs (Urbach and Ausubel, 2017). We discuss here many STANDs characterised as immune signaller but they can regulate other functions. Some human NLRs regulate embryogenesis (NLR-pyrin 5, NRLP5) and spermatogenesis (NLR-pyrin 14, NRLP14) (Tong et al., 2000; Westerveld et al., 2006; Chou et al., 2023). Some plant NLRs could regulate tolerance to abiotic stress, as mutants of the TIR-NLR encoding genes *White Rust Resistance 4A* (*WRR4A*)/*Activated Disease Resistance 2* (*ADR2*) and *CHS1* are more resistant to UV stress (Piofczyk et al., 2015) and cold temperature respectively (Wang et al., 2013). In addition, STANDs often regulate programmed cell death (Tamborski and Krasileva, 2020), but there are exceptions. For example, in *A. thaliana*, ADR1 is required for immunity upon recognition of the bacterial effector AvrRps4 but not for cell death (Castel et al., 2019a). Extrapolating from the current state of research, the common feature of STANDs is to sense modifications of the environment through a C-terminal super-secondary structure, and to bring in close proximity several N-terminal signalling domains for execution of a response. The thorough description of more STANDs will highlight the specialisation and convergent evolution of these proteins.

## **TIRs are present across the tree of life and often regulate immunity**

 TIR is the signalling domain of many NLRs, from prokaryotes to eukaryotes (**Figure 2**). It plays a central role in immunity, even beyond NLRs. TIRs were discovered in the 1990s. A striking ~200 amino acids homologous region was observed between Toll, Interleukin-1 and some plant *R*-gene products, and was subsequently named TIR (Parnet et al., 1996; Hammond-Kosack and Jones, 1997). It happens that these three proteins regulate immunity. Toll was first identified in *Drosophila* as a regulator of embryogenesis; its main role in defence against fungi was later revealed (Valanne et al., 2011). It is a transmembrane protein with an extracellular LRR sensing domain and an intracellular TIR signalling domain. Its homologues in human are Toll-like Receptors (TLRs), which sense non-self through their extracellular variable domain and induce immune response through their intracellular TIR domain (Akira and Takeda, 2004). In plants, TIR are mostly found as the N-terminus signalling domain of some NLRs, particularly in Rosids (Shao et al., 2016). For a long time, the major known features of plant TIRs were that they can dimerize and signal via the protein EDS1 (Parker et al., 1996; Bernoux et al., 2011). A breakthrough in TIR research was the discovery that Sterile Alpha and TIR Motif-containing protein 1 (SARM1), a TIR-containing regulator of neuron degeneration, is an enzyme capable of hydrolysing NAD+ (Essuman et al., 2017). This piece of research enabled to demonstrate that plant TIR can also catalyse NAD+ degradation (Horsefield et al., 2019; Wan et al., 2019). In parallel, it was shown that effector recognition induces TIR-NLR tetramerization and assembles the four TIRs in proximity (Ma et al., 2020; Martin et al., 2020). They associate to form two asymmetric homodimers, creating two composite catalytic sites. EDS1, in heterodimer with PAD4 or SAG101, is the receptor of some TIR catalytic products: pRib-AMP or pRib-ADP for EDS1- PAD4 (Huang et al., 2022a), and di-ADPR or ADPr-ATP for EDS1-SAG101 (Jia et al., 2022). Ligand-bound EDS1-PAD4 or EDS1-SAG101 activate the RPW8-NLRs ADR1 or NRG1 respectively, resulting in a similar transcriptional response as one observed upon CC-NLR activation (Saile et al., 2020). Bacteria also have a defence system based on TIR: Thoeris (Ths). It relies on two TIR-containing proteins: ThsB and ThsA. Upon phage infection, ThsB converts NAD+ to an isomer of cADPR. This product activates ThsA leading to depletion of NAD+, and ultimately cell death (Ofir et al., 2021). NAD+ depletion is also the cause of SARM1-mediated cell death, but it is not required for plant TIR-mediated cell death (Duxbury et al., 2020). Some phages can inactivate Thoeris by sequestering the TIR molecular product, through the viral encoded protein Tad1 (Leavitt et al., 2022). Similarly, the plant pathogen effectors HopAM1 and HopBY contain TIRs that can highjack the NAD metabolism to suppress host TIR-mediated immunity (Eastman et al., 2022; Hulin et al., 2023). By contrast, some animal TIRs, such as TLRs, function as adaptor for protein-protein interaction rather than enzymes (Takeda and Akira, 2015). The ancient TIR domain shows conserved

- and divergent function and perfectly illustrates the concept that starting with identical building
- blocks, immunity has evolved in different directions leading to diversified mechanisms.

# **Pikobodies: introgression of the animal adaptive immunity into plants**

 Customizing NLR receptors to enhance their recognition spectra represents an opportunity to improve crop resistance (Zdrzałek et al., 2023). One elegant approach proposed to equip plant with a part of the animal adaptive immune system, leading to the development of the pikobodies (Kourelis et al., 2023). By contrast with plants that rely solely on genetically encoded immune receptors, each generally conferring resistance to a limited range of pathogens, vertebrates evolved a singular adaptive immune system: it generates a myriad of antibodies capable of recognising virtually any antigen (Cooper and Alder, 2006). Antibodies are combinations of protein chains defined by their length and their degree of conservation. Heavy chain-only Antibodies (HcAb) were isolated from camelids and triggered interest for their simple structure (Bao et al., 2021). They contain constant heavy chains and a variable domain binding the antigen: the nanobody. Pikobodies are fusions between Pikm-1 and nanobodies. Pikm-1 is an NLR immune receptor from rice with an HMA recognition domain (De la Concepcion et al., 2021). This HMA binds effectors from the rice blast fungus *Magnaporthe oryzae*, causing Pikm-1 to form a complex with a related NLR: Pikm-2. The effector-Pikm-1-Pikm-2 complex then initiates immune signalling. Kourelis *et al.* had the brilliant idea to replace the HMA by a nanobody to test if it could recognise its cognate antigen (Kourelis et al., 2023). NLRs are sensitive to even subtle changes, and many constructs were auto-active, or loss-of-function. After several trials, Kourelis *et al.* finally engineered pikobodies with nanobodies binding Green Fluorescent Protein (GFP) or mCherry, that were able to induce an immune response specifically in the presence of GFP or mCherry respectively (Kourelis et al., 2023). These pikobodies were expressed in *Nicotiana benthamiana* and the plants turned indeed resistant to viruses expressing GFP or mCherry.

 Plants evolved immune receptors with integrated domains capable of both recognising effectors and triggering an immune response. There is a relatively high diversity of integrated domains (Marchal et al., 2022), but still limited compared to the billions of human antibodies (Alberts et al., 2002). Pikobodies illustrate that scientists can combine knowledge on the divergent evolution of the immune systems from two lineages to engineer novel pathogen recognition capabilities in plants.

## **Some immune receptors are at the cell surface**

 Cells harbour at their surface proteins that can sense and respond to their environment, such as a pathogen invasion. In most eukaryotes, they are generally G protein-coupled receptors  (GPCRs) (Hanlon and Andrew, 2015). In plants, the most diversified plant cell surface 429 receptors belong to the receptor-kinase (RK, also known as Receptor-Like Kinase, RLK) and receptor-protein (RP also known as Receptor-Like Protein, RLP) families (Bender and Zipfel, 2023). These receptors combine an extracellular sensor domain and a single transmembrane domain. The extracellular domain is often an LRR but other domains have been identified such as S-domain, cell-Wall Associated Kinase (WAK), Cysteine-Rich Repeat (CRR, also known as DUF26), L-Lectin, Malectin, extensin, Lysin Motif (LysM), C-lectin, thaumatin, tumor necrosis factor receptor, NHL (NCL-1, HT2A and Lin-41) repeats, WD40 repeats, U Box, and Pathogenesis-Related (PR-1) domains (Dievart et al., 2020; Gong and Han, 2021). In addition, RKs also carry an intracellular kinase domain, while RPs do not. RPs and RKs which are specialised in pathogen detection often recognise conserved pathogen molecules known as Pathogen-Associated Molecular Patterns (PAMPs). Therefor they are also referred as Pattern Recognition Receptors (PRRs). These receptors activate an immune signalling pathway, known as Pattern Triggered Immunity (PTI) (Jones and Dangl, 2006). In 1994, the RP Cladosporium fulvum 9 (Cf-9) was the first cell surface receptor identified as an immune receptor (Jones et al., 1994). Cf-9 harbours an extracellular LRR domain and confers resistance to the fungus *Cladosporium fulvum* in tomato. Since this first discovery, more than 60 RPs/RKs from diverse plant species have been shown to participate in sensing varieties 446 of pathogens (Dievart et al., 2020; Ngou et al., 2022a). For instance, the LRR-RKs Flagellin Sensing 2 (FLS2) and Elongation Factor Tu Recognition (EFR) recognise flagellin and a bacterial elongation factor epitope respectively (Gómez-Gómez and Boller, 2000; Zipfel et al., 2006), the LysM-RK Chitin Elicitor Receptor Kinase 1 (CERK1) recognises the fungal cell wall constituent chitin (Shimizu et al., 2010) while the LRR-RP Receptor-Like Protein 23 (RLP23) recognises epitopes from a superfamily of proteins from bacteria, fungi and oomycetes known as Necrosis- and ethylene-inducing peptide 1-Like Protein (NLP) (Albert et al., 2015). Although many of these PRRs vary across linages, some of them seem to have experienced strong purifying selection during plant evolution, as they are maintained across diverse plant lineages (**Figure 3**). The best studied example is the LysM-RK CERK1 which recognises chitin, leading to immune responses, in angiosperms (Miya et al., 2007; Bozsoki et al., 2017) and bryophytes (Bressendorff et al., 2016; Yotsui et al., 2023). RPs, which lack a kinase, can associate with an RK for signalling. For instance, LRR-RPs (such as RLP23) generally associate with Suppressor Of [[Brassinosteroid Insensitive 1 (BRI1)]-associated kinase 1 (BAK1)]-Interactive RK 1 (SOBIR1) to form a complete signalling unit (Albert et al., 2015). Interestingly, glaucophytes, rhodophytes and many green algae lineages encode for diverse LRR-RPs but lack SOBIR1, suggesting that other mechanisms exist (Ngou et al., 2023).

 PRRs generally recruit RK coreceptors to form an active signalling complex. For example, FLS2, EFR or RLP23-SOBIR1 associate with the LRR-RK BAK1 (also known as Somatic Embryogenesis Receptor Kinase 3, SERK3) (Chinchilla et al., 2009), and CERK1 associates with the LysM-RP Chitin Elicitor Binding Protein (CEBiP) in rice or LysM-RK 5 (LYK5) in *A. thaliana* (Shimizu et al., 2010; Cao et al., 2014). The combinatorial nature of these receptor complexes suggests that a large diversity of associations may occur in response to diverse environmental triggers and might be spatially and temporally controlled. As an example, the FLS2 receptor leads to different behaviour when its expression pattern is disturbed in a spatial manner (Emonet et al., 2021). It can be anticipated that each plant lineage also evolved diverse combinations of receptors, regulated in a multitude of ways. We thus propose that an exponential number of complexes will be discovered when exploring the entire plant diversity. This diversification, driven by coevolution, represents a source of biotechnology potential for the transfer of resistance, as exemplified by the increased resistance of *Solanaceae* to a range of pathogenic bacteria following the transfer of the EFR receptor from *A. thaliana* (Lacombe et al., 2010).

 Upon activation at the cell surface, it has been demonstrated in several angiosperms that PRR complexes phosphorylate intracellular Receptor-Like Cytoplasmic Kinases (RLCKs), particularly those of the subfamily RLCK VII such as Avr9/Cf-9 Induced Kinase 1 (ACIK1) or Botrytis-Induced Kinase (BIK1) (Rowland et al., 2005; Lu et al., 2010a). RLCKs are a large sub-group of RKs that lack ectodomains, and in most cases the transmembrane domain too, and are considered cytoplasmic. Specific phosphorylation of RLCKs activates downstream 485 immune signalling such as callose deposition,  $Ca^{2+}$  flux, ROS burst and a PTI-specific transcriptional reprogramming (Couto and Zipfel, 2016). Particularly, flg22-recognition by the RK FLS2 results in (1) formation of a complex between FLS2 and BAK1 (Chinchilla et al., 2007), (2) activation by FLS2-BAK1 of the RLCK BIK1 (Lu et al., 2010b) and (3) activation by BIK1 of the NADPH oxidase Respiratory Burst Oxidase Homologue D (RBOHD) responsible for the ROS burst (Kadota et al., 2014). Although part of these responses is PAMP-specific, such as PAMP perception itself which is receptor-dependent, most of them are similar and converge from diverse pathways on conserved integrators, such as BIK1 (Bjornson et al., 2021). A recent breakthrough in our understanding of the evolution of this pathway was the discovery that BIK1-RBOHD-mediated PTI is a conserved and ancient immune pathway, as it is present in both *A. thaliana* and *M. polymorpha*, which diverged 450 million years ago during land plant colonisation (Chu et al., 2023; Yotsui et al., 2023). This conserved activation of immunity responses following PAMP activation is also described in the moss *Physcomitrium patens* indicating a wide conservation (Bressendorff et al., 2016). In addition to its positive activation, negative feedback loops acting on PTI have been described in *A.*   *thaliana*, such as the phosphorylation of BIK1 by Calcium-dependent Protein Kinase 28 (CPK28) which regulates its turnover (Monaghan et al., 2015). As auto-immunity imposes a significant fitness cost to plants, one may speculate that the conservation of these immune homeostasis mechanisms has been essential during plant evolution, although this concept remains to be tested. This hypothesis can be tested in the future using reverse genetics in model bryophytes, such as in *Marchantia sp.* in which the immune function of BIK1-RBOHD has been demonstrated (Chu et al., 2023).

## **Genomes of extant plants shed light on the evolution of RK and RP**

 The ectodomain of PRRs is variable (Dievart et al., 2020; Gong and Han, 2021). Because of this domain diversity, reconstructing the evolutionary history of this superfamily has proven challenging. By contrast, the more conserved kinase domain is suitable to elucidate the evolution of RKs. Plant genomes encode for hundreds of RKs (*e.g.* ~615 in *A. thaliana*), which can be classified into 46 subfamilies (Shiu and Bleecker, 2003). Twelve subfamilies (I to XII) encompass RLCKs, while 34 encompass kinases associated with specific ectodomains (including 15 with LRR). The specificities between the kinases and the ectodomains phylogenies indicate that coevolution, more than domain shuffling, drives the specialisation of RKs (Man et al., 2023).

 A presence / absence analysis of each family in plant genomes has enabled dating the emergence of the diverse clades known in angiosperms (Dievart et al., 2020). The presumed absence of RKs in chlorophytic algae suggests that RKs diversified during the radiation of the streptophytes (Dievart et al., 2020). One alternative hypothesis would be that RKs pre- dated the diversification of the Viridiplantae and were subsequently lost specifically in chlorophytes. Dievart *et al*. proposed that LRR-RKs and LysM-RKs evolved before the split between streptophyte algae and embryophytes, a hypothesis supported by phylogenetic analyses (Delaux et al., 2015; Nishiyama et al., 2018). In contrast, they proposed that WAK- RKs emerged along the colonisation of land, in embryophytes (Dievart et al., 2020). A recent study challenges this last assumption, identifying WAK-RPs in chlorophytes. The authors suggest that WAK-RKs predated terrestrialization but were lost multiple times in streptophyte algae, and expanded in tracheophytes (Ngou et al., 2023). These observations indicate that a mix of ancestral and convergent gains followed by lineage-specific losses occurred in this complex family. How these gains originated is an exciting question in the field. One possible model for the gain of RPs and RKs is that (1) intracellular receptor domains pre-exist, (2) gain a transmembrane domain and (3) gain an intracellular kinase domain by chromosome rearrangement. RPs still co-exist with RKs in many plants (**Figure 3**) indicating that this putative model is not going from a 'less evolved' toward a 'better evolved' mechanism.

 Instead, both intracellular receptor domains, RPs and RKs can undergo various modifications resulting in the extant diversity (Ngou et al., 2023). This evolutionary model implies that other type of RKs probably evolved in each plant lineage, including chlorophytes, and remain to be discovered and described by exploring a wider diversity of Viridiplantae genomes.

# **PTI and ETI are part of an integrated and conserved immunity pathway**

 ETI and PTI were first conceptualized as separate pathways, but it appears that they potentiate each other and can be considered as two parts of a single immunity pathway. This novel concept comes from two observations (Ngou et al., 2021; Yuan et al., 2021). On the one hand, effector recognition by NLR is not sufficient to trigger hypersensitive response, the hallmark of ETI. It also requires PTI elicitors. On the other hand, effector-activated NLRs can enhance flg22-induced ROS burst, a hallmark of PTI. The way ETI potentiates PTI is by boosting the expression of *BAK1* and *BIK1*, as well as sustaining the activation of RBOHD (Ngou et al., 2021). The exact mechanism linking PTI and ETI is not known yet. This crosstalk between NLR and PRR signalling led to the hypotheses that these separate receptors could have co-evolved. Genome comparison in spermatophytes revealed that indeed NLRs expanded or contracted in concert with RKs and RPs. Particularly, the subfamilies VII\_1, VIII\_2, Xa and XII of RKs are specifically expended in genomes where NLRs are expanded, while others RPs/RKs are not (Ngou et al., 2022b). Well-described PRRs, including FLS2 and EFR, belong to these families. The drivers of this putative coevolution are not known yet, and the fact that some PRRs, such as CERK1, do not show evidence of coevolution with NLRs (Ngou et al., 2022c) indicates specificity in this coevolution process. In the future, accumulating more details on NLR and PRR crosstalk in diverse plant lineages, in various environmental conditions, including on their shared targets (such as RBOHD and BIK1) will shed light on the mechanisms and ecological drivers of the coevolution between these two classes of immune receptors.

## **PRRs show similarities with receptors from other eukaryotes**

 We described above that PRRs have expanded in all known streptophyte lineages, and presumed that the same occurred in chlorophytes, indicating that they have been the standard cell surface sensing mechanism since the beginning of plant diversification (Dievart et al., 2020) (**Figure 3**). Homologous receptors also exist in metazoans. Some homologs of plant RKs are animal Receptor Tyrosine Kinases (RTKs), sharing a similar architecture with an extra-cellular, a transmembrane and an intracellular kinase domain (Shiu and Bleecker, 2001). RTKs differ from RKs in that they phosphorylate tyrosine, instead of serine/threonine for plant RKs. Moreover, they contribute to cell homeostasis, rather than stress sensing (Lemmon and Schlessinger, 2010). Based on sequence identity, plant RKs are more closely

 related to Pelle/IRAKs proteins found in animals and alveolate (Shiu and Bleecker, 2001; Dievart et al., 2020). It suggests a common origin in early eukaryotes, pre-dating the emergence of plants, alveolates and animals. Mammalian IRAKs do not harbour a transmembrane domain. Instead, they form a complex with the TLR transmembrane immune receptors and Myd88 adaptor, forming the myddosome (**Figure 2**) (Balka and De Nardo, 2019). This myddosome can be seen as a structural homolog of a plant RK containing an extracellular sensing domain and a kinase in a single protein. In the myddosome, binding between TLR and Myd88 is mediated by a TIR-TIR interaction. Here, TIR functions as adaptor rather than enzyme, a function we discussed in the paragraph related to plant TIRs.

 The different diversification of RPs and RKs observed between plants and mammals are the result of two distinct evolutionary trajectories. In animals, this pathway has not diversified, instead cell surface surveillance is mediated mainly by G-Protein-Coupled Receptors GPCR (Hanlon and Andrew, 2015), biochemically unrelated to RPs/RKs. This exemplifies that eukaryotes select non-homologous pathway to sustain analogous functions. Beyond plants and mammals, one can hypothesize that studying immunity mechanisms in other eukaryotes will reveal yet other pathways.

## **Conserved and divergent immunity functions for phytohormones across land plants**

 Phytohormones control diverse processes including immunity. Salicylic Acid (SA) and Jasmonic Acid (JA) are the main hormones involved in plant immunity. In angiosperms, infection with (hemi)-biotrophic pathogens induce SA biosynthesis while JA is important against necrotrophic pathogens (Berens et al., 2017). In most plant species, increase of SA levels occurs upon infection with pathogens (Klessig et al., 2018). SA accumulation has also been described in the moss *P. patens* infected with the fungus *Botrytis cinerea* (Ponce De León et al., 2012). Infection with *Pseudomonas syringae* also triggers SA biosynthesis in *M. polymorpha* (Gimenez-Ibanez et al., 2019). SA is also essential for the establishment of a broad spectrum and long-lasting resistance, named Systemic Acquired Resistance (SAR) (Durrant and Dong, 2004). In SAR, a signal is transmitted via the phloem throughout the plant, priming the plant for subsequent infections. Despite the absence of vascular tissue, Winter et al., described a SAR-like response in the moss *Amblystegium serpens* upon inoculation with the oomycete *Pythium irregulare* (Winter et al., 2014). Yet, presence of SAR in *M. polymorpha* has not been described.

 Hormone detection by receptors is necessary to initiate their signalling pathway. In *A. thaliana*, Non-expressors of PR1 (NPRs): NPR1, NPR3 and NPR4 are SA receptors (Ding et al., 2018). While NPR1 is a positive regulator of SA signalling, NPR3/NPR4 act as repressors (Ding et al., 2018). The liverwort *M. polymorpha* presents a single NPR ortholog (Bowman et

 al., 2017). Its recent characterization showed that *MpNPR* can complement *Atnpr1* mutant but not *Atnpr3-npr4* mutants (Jeon et al., 2022). Similarly, the single NPR protein of the moss *Physcomitrium patens* can partially complement the *Atnpr1* mutant but not *Atnpr3-npr4* mutants (Peng et al., 2017). Thus, NPR biochemical functions are likely at least partially conserved between bryophytes and tracheophytes. However, *Mpnpr* is more resistant to *P. syringae* than Tak-1 (wild-type background, WT), while an *Atnpr1* mutant is more susceptible than the wild-type background (Cao Hui et al., 1994). This indicates that unlike *A. thaliana* NPR1, MpNPR acts as a negative regulator of immunity in *M. polymorpha* (despite MpNPR being able to complement an *A. thaliana npr1* mutant, as we saw earlier). Paradoxically, *Mpnpr1* is hypersensitive to SA exogenous treatment, as compared to WT, but *Mpnpr* and WT share the same transcriptional pattern after treatment with SA (Jeon et al., 2022). Taken together, there recent data show both conservation and specialisation of NPR in land plants. In addition, NPR orthologues have been lost in hornworts, while SA is still produced in this lineage (Li et al., 2020; Zhang et al., 2020; Rieseberg et al., 2023). It seems that NPR is generally contributing to immunity, by regulating SA signalling in *A. thaliana* and by an unknown mechanism in bryophytes. If NPR is not a receptor for SA in *M. polymorpha* and in hornwort, it could be that other proteins bind SA - as do other angiosperm proteins (Pokotylo et al., 2019) - explaining the persistence of SA in bryophytes. Further characterization of NPR in *M. polymorpha*, *A. thaliana* and other plant clades is now required to understand how the biological function of NPR in land plants, while maintaining the ability to complement mutants between bryophytes and tracheophytes.

 In angiosperms, JA biosynthesis is important for inducing responses against necrotrophic pathogens. After pathogen attack, JA-Isoleucine (JA-Ile) and the precursor 12-oxo- phytodienoic acid (OPDA) accumulate in angiosperms and bryophytes respectively (Ponce De León et al., 2012; Berens et al., 2017; Chini et al., 2023). In fact, tracheophytes can use both OPDA and JA-Ile. But the JA-Ile pathway is favoured in angiosperms while the OPDA pathway is favoured in ferns, and even more in lycophytes (Fang et al., 2022). It is not known if the JA-Ile synthesis pathway existed in the first land plant but was lost or reduced in bryophytes, lycophytes and ferns, or if it is an innovation of tracheophytes which became fundamental in angiosperms. In *A. thaliana*, JA is perceived by the complex coronatine insensitive 1 (COI1) (Xie et al., 1998) and requires the transcription activator complex Jasmonate ZIM-domain (JAZ)-Myelocytomatosis oncogenes (MYC) (Santner and Estelle, 2007). These proteins are conserved in bryophytes and tracheophytes (Monte et al., 2018). Nevertheless, the ligands perceived by COI1 differ across land plants. In bryophytes and lycophytes, two isomers of dn-OPDA served as ligands (Chini et al., 2023) while angiosperms and ferns perceive JA-Ile (Chini et al., 2023). This is in line with the absence of ortholog of Jasmonate Resistant 1 (JAR1), which conjugates Ile to JA, in bryophytes and

 lycophytes (Monte et al., 2018). It has been shown that ligand specificity is due to a variation of a single amino acid in the binding pocket (Ala in *A. thaliana*vs Val/Ile in bryophytes) and two residues of the loop region in JAZ (Monte et al., 2018; Monte et al., 2022). The lycophyte *Selaginella moellendorffii* synthesizes both dn-OPDA and JA-Ile (Chini et al., 2023). It constitutes a good model to discriminate the role of both ligands in JA-mediated responses. Development of pathosystems involving lycophytes will help to decipher the evolution of JA-related molecules in plant immunity.

 In tracheophytes, with few exceptions, the signalling pathways mediated by SA and JA antagonize(Thaler et al., 2012; Berens et al., 2017). Antagonism between SA and JA signalling pathways is also described in *M. polymorpha* (Matsui et al., 2019). Indeed, when treated with SA, *M. polymorpha* is more susceptible to the necrotrophic fungus *Irpex lacteus*. This is reversed by co-treatment with OPDA (Matsui et al., 2019). Also, treatment with OPDA increases susceptibility to *P. syringae*.

 The study of the interaction between SA and JAs pathways in additional plant species are needed to support the conservation of the antagonism. Further investigation of non-seed plants species, notably lycophytes and ferns, is necessary for understanding evolution of plant hormones signalling during immunity.

#### **Specialized metabolism illustrates non-angiosperm immune specificities**

 One strategy against pathogens is the accumulation of metabolites that have antimicrobial activities (Compean and Ynalvez, 2014), such as glucosinolates from the *Brassicales* (Bischoff, 2016) or flavonoids and anthocyanins from the phenylpropanoid pathway (Agar and Cankaya, 2020). As in angiosperms, the phenylpropanoids pathway is activated upon pathogen infection in bryophytes, with the example of auronidins in *M. polymorpha* (Berland et al., 2019; Davies et al., 2022). *Phythophtora palmivora*, a plant pathogen with broad host range, can infect *M. polymorpha* (Carella et al., 2018). It enters the thallus via air pores and activates the expression of pathogenesis-related proteins, and a Myb14-dependent accumulation of flavonoid and phenylpropanoids important to limit the spread of infection (Carella et al., 2019). This response is conserved in the angiosperm *Nicotiana benthamiana* inoculated with the same pathogen (Carella et al., 2019). Thus, as for receptor-based immunity, the role of phenylpropanoids in defence described in angiosperms can be expanded to the land plants.

 Terpenes metabolism is also important in plant defence (Osbourn, 1996). Bryophytes are well-known for their wide array of metabolites, with the terpene pathway being the main source (Chen et al., 2018). Some bryophyte terpenes are rare as they only occur in a few species, while others appear to be specific to liverworts, as they have not been detected in  any other living organisms (Chen et al., 2018). For example, pinguisanes are a noteworthy type of terpenes specific to liverworts (Asakawa, 2004). Terpene synthases (TPS) drive this diversity (Chen et al., 2018). Interestingly, bryophytes have two types of TPS: typical ones (also found in tracheophytes) and Microbial TPS like (MTPSL). MTPSL share similarities with TPS from bacteria and fungi (Jia et al., 2016). *M. polymorpha* encode 39 *TPS* genes, of which 32 are *MTPSL* genes. In contrast, no *MTPSL* has been identified in *P. patens*. The genomes of the hornworts *Anthoceros agrestis* and *Anthoceros punctatus* contain 6 and 7 MTPSLs respectively (Jia et al., 2016). To date, MTPSLs from bryophytes and ferns have been biochemically characterized as mono and sesquiterpene synthases (Jia et al., 2018). Such diversity of terpenes likely played a crucial role in the adaptation of plants to land and during the diversification of bryophytes, but their actual role in plant adaptation to stress remains to be determined. This might reveal lineage-specific immune mechanisms absent from angiosperms. In its natural environment, *M. polymorpha* interacts with many bacteria and fungi (Nelson et al., 2018; Alcaraz et al., 2018; Matsui et al., 2019). They include many *Proteobacteria*, *Xylariaceae*, *Glomerellaceae*, *Irpicaceae* and *Phanerochaetaceae*. Some of these microbes, such as *Irepex lacteus* and *Xylaria cubensis*, induce disease symptoms. As exemplified for NLRs, PRRs and specialized metabolism, studying the evolution of immune mechanisms in bryophytes delivered a broader understanding of plant immunity. The development of new pathosystems and the use of forward genetics will complement the existing reverse genetic based approaches to reveal the bryophyte immunity toolkit. However, shifting the focus from angiosperm to only liverworts and mosses does not allow understanding diversity at the scale of the land plants.

## **Immunity in non-angiosperm vascular plants**

 Beyond bryophytes, assessing immunity mechanisms in gymnosperms, ferns and lycophytes is the next obvious, and essential, step to get the full picture of plant immunity. In that respect, ferns have an interesting potential. It is a diverse group, with evolutionary distinctiveness. They undergo a macroscopic gametophytic phase and reproduce by spores, which distinguish them from gymnosperms and angiosperms. They have megaphylls (multi- vessel leaves), which distinguish them from lycophytes having microphylls (single-vein 706 leaves). 18<sup>th</sup> century naturalist Miles Joseph Berkeley noticed that ferns where less infected by pathogens than angiosperms (Berkeley, 1862). However, many fungi have been observed on ferns (Stevenson, 1945; Kirschner et al., 2019), making questionable the statement that ferns are more resistant to pests than angiosperms. The best described fern pathogen so far is *Mixia osmunda*, isolated from the fern *Osmunda japonic*a. Its genome is 13 Mb, the smallest of plant pathogenic basidiomycetes, and encodes about 500 secreted proteins (Toome et al., 2014). The host response is not known, as the fern immune system, in part

 due to complex genomes. To date, five genomes including two aquatic floating ferns (*Azolla filiculoides*, 0.75 Gb, n = 22, and *Salvinia cucullata*, 0.25 Gb, n = 9) (Li et al., 2018a), one semi-aquatic fern (*Ceratopteris richardii*, 9.6 Gb, n = 39) (Marchant et al., 2022), one tree fern (*Alsophila spinulosa*, 6.23 Gb, n = 69) (Huang et al., 2022b) and one terrestrial fern (*Adiantum capillus-veneris*, 5 Gb, n = 30) (Fang et al., 2022) have been sequenced. The large genome sizes are not explained by a high number of genes, but instead by large introns, and more repetitive regions and transposons than other plant lineages. The genomes of the two aquatic floating ferns are reduced due to gene losses and gene family contractions, reminiscent of duckweeds in angiosperms that shares an analogous lifestyle and genome reduction (An et al., 2018). Exploring these additional lineages, from ferns, lycophytes to the massive diversity observed in gymnosperms (Woudstra et al., 2023) could reveal the conservation and innovations for immunity in these lineages.

# **Managing pathogenic and mutualistic interactions**

 In this review article, we have focussed on the diversity of mechanisms plants have evolved to fight against the pathogens present in their microbiota. Beyond the pathogens, more and more studies have identified genetic components involved in modulating the interactions between plants and their microbiota as a whole (Paasch and He, 2021), identifying mechanisms shared with plant immunity (Chen et al., 2020, Rey and Jacquet 2018) but also more general physiological processes such as the phosphate-starvation response (Finkel et al., 2019). Among the microbiota members, specific groups of microorganisms co-evolved with plants to form mutualistic symbioses (Delaux and Schornack, 2021). The mutualistic associations include for instance the nitrogen-fixing root-nodule symbiosis between plant species from the *Fabales*, *Fagales*, *Cucurbitales* and *Rosales* clades and rhizobia or Frankia bacteria, which evolved 100 MYA (Griesmann et al., 2018; van Velzen et al., 2018; Libourel et al., 2023), the arbuscular mycorrhizal symbiosis that evolved between the first land plants and Glomeromycota fungi (Remy et al., 1994; Rich et al., 2021) or ectomycorrhizal symbiosis that evolved in a convergent manner in several tracheophyte lineages (Genre et al., 2020). The co-occurrence of pathogenic and mutualistic microorganisms within the same microbial communities, and their similarities – they are for instance fungi or bacteria – led the research field to ask a simple question: How do plant lineages discriminate between pathogens and mutualists (Zipfel and Oldroyd, 2017)?

 One satisfying hypothesis came early on from the work carried on the symbionts. Rhizobia, which induce nodule formation and colonize *Fabaceae* during the nitrogen-fixing root nodule symbiosis, produce blends of lipochitooligosaccharides (LCOs) which are essential for the symbiosis to occur and are perceived by the host plants with high level of specificity (Lerouge  et al., 1990). This specific symbiotic signal explained both the discrimination between pathogens and symbionts because pathogenic bacteria do not produce these molecules, and the specificity of this particular symbiosis. Indeed, the blends of specific LCOs produced by a given bacteria correlates with its host range (Dénarié et al., 1996). Two additional discoveries corroborated this view. First, *Fabaceae*, such as *Lotus japonicus* or *Medicago truncatula*  have specific LysM-RK receptors that recognize these molecules with high affinity, and these receptors are essential for symbiosis with rhizobia to occur (Radutoiu et al., 2003; Limpens et al., 2003; Bozsoki et al., 2020). Second, Arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi also produce these compounds (Maillet et al., 2011). This link between LCOs and mutualism was even expanded to the ectomycorrhizal symbiosis in poplar (Cope et al., 2019). The hypothesis that LCOs are the key to initiate symbiosis lasted for three decades, and probably holds true in the context of the nitrogen-fixing root nodule symbiosis that has evolved high-affinity receptors (Bozsoki et al., 2020). However, its extension to all mutualistic symbiosis is now compromised. On the plant side, the LysM-RKs chitin receptors were found to be essential for both immunity but also symbiotic signalling (Rey et al., 2013; Zhang et al., 2015; Feng et al., 2019; Giblin-Viala et al., 2019), and small and large chitin fragment were as potent as LCOs to triggering symbiotic responses (Genre et al., 2013; Feng et al., 2019). Expanding the range of organisms analysed for their ability to produce LCOs, it was found that the vast majority of the fungi, either symbiotic, pathogen or saprotrophs, produce LCOs (Rush et al., 2020). If LCOs are the universal symbiotic signals, the question of discriminating pathogens and symbionts remains unresolved. Two main hypotheses can be proposed. First, additional signalling components, possibly downstream the LysM-RKs may channel the chitin/LCO perception toward symbiosis or immunity. What leads to the switch from one to the other pathway remains to be discovered, but the general, or local, physiological status of the host is the leading candidate (Li et al., 2022). Indeed, phosphate starvation seems to reduce the immune response while at the same time favouring the interaction with the microbiota and symbionts (Finkel et al., 2019; Li et al., 2022; Paries and Gutjahr, 2023). The second hypothesis would be that other symbiotic signals, either generic or symbiosis-specific, exist and have yet to be characterized. Expanding the breadth of symbioses explored at the mechanistic level, and the diversity of covered plant lineages should improve our understanding of this complex process. The recent finding that *M. polymorpha* LysM-RKs are essential for chitin-triggered immunity (Yotsui et al., 2023) indicates that this function, at least, is conserved across land plants. Whether the symbiotic pathway is also conserved is a question to be addressed in the near future. This could be achieved for instance using *Marchantia paleacea*, the sister species to *M. polymorpha*. By contrast to *M. polymorpha*, *M. paleacea* retains the association with arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi. Genomic and genetic  tools have been recently developed for that species, making it an ideal model liverwort to study symbiosis (Radhakrishnan et al., 2020; Rich et al., 2021; Kodama et al., 2022a).

#### **Concluding remarks and perspective**

 Decades of genetics in angiosperms has revealed layers of immune mechanisms, from surface-localized to intracellular receptors. From this angiosperm-centred view of plant immunity, the sequencing of many plant genomes in non-flowering plants has allowed the description of variations in the plant immune repertoire. Development of pathosystems in model bryophytes such as the liverwort *M. polymorpha*, is now allowing the evoMPMI community to test assumptions defined based on genomic comparisons. From these extensive comparative studies, three main conclusions can be reached. First, immunity in plants relies on highly conserved components. Chitin perception, the BIK1-RBOH module or the biosynthesis of phenylpropanoids are conserved across all land plants studied so far. This is reminiscent of other highly conserved pathways, the ones allowing association with symbiotic fungi (Rich et al., 2021; Kodama et al., 2022b). Plants have thus evolved for 450 million years with pathways for accommodating or protecting against microorganisms. One can propose that mechanisms to negatively regulate these pathways and selecting one over the other depending on the context must have co-evolved with them. Future investigation of conserved, yet undeciphered, gene networks should shed light on these mechanisms, and possibly resolve the question of how plants distinguish and adapt their responses to symbionts and pathogens. A second conclusion is that immune mechanisms have diversified from these conserved pathways. This is exemplified by PRRs and STANDs, shared by most plants, yet showing extremely diverse repertoire and architecture. Increasing the set of explored genomes and lineages should lead to the discovery of even more diverse sets of receptors. From this diversity to be described, biotechnological options to augment immunity in crops may emerge. The use of pikobodies to engineer resistance is the perfect demonstration that diversifying the sets of immune receptors can contribute to improved crop resilience. The last, and possibly most important conclusion, is that despites the massive effort in describing and dissecting immune mechanisms, our understanding remains limited to very few lineages. The discovery of plants with an almost absent repertoire of STANDs, such as carnivorous or aquatic species, exemplifies this limitation. In the future, the development of additional pathosystems in all the five main land plants lineages, coupled with forward genetics and genome-wide association studies, will finally enable the community 816 to grasp the diversity of immunity mechanisms in plants.

**Funding**

- BC, KEM, CJ and PMD are funded by the ANR Level-up (ANR-21-CE20-0010-01). Research
- performed at LRSV is supported by the 'Laboratoires d'Excellence (LABEX)' TULIP (ANR-10-
- LABX-41).
- 
- **Declaration of interests**
- The authors declare no competing interests.
- 
- **References**
- **Agar, O. T., and Cankaya, I. I. T.** (2020). Analysis of phenylethanoids and their glycosidic derivatives. In *Recent Advances in Natural Products Analysis*, Chapter 5. Elsevier Inc.
- **Akira, S., and Takeda, K.** (2004). Toll-like receptor signalling. *Nat Rev Immunol* **4**:499–511.
- **Albert, I., Böhm, H., Albert, M., Feiler, C. E., Imkampe, J., Wallmeroth, N., Brancato, C., Raaymakers, T. M., Oome, S., Zhang, H., et al.** (2015). An RLP23-SOBIR1-BAK1 complex mediates NLP-triggered immunity. *Nat Plants* **1**:15140.
- **Alberts, B., Johnson, A., Lewis, J., Raff, M., Roberts, K., and Walter, P.** (2002). The generation of antibody diversity. In *Molecular Biology of the Cell. 4th edition*, Chapter 24. Garland Science.
- **Alcaraz, L. D., Peimbert, M., Barajas, H. R., Dorantes-Acosta, A. E., Bowman, J. L., and Arteaga-Vázquez, M. A.** (2018). Marchantia liverworts as a proxy to plants' basal microbiomes. *Sci Rep* **8**:12712.
- **An, D., Li, C., Zhou, Y., Wu, Y., and Wang, W.** (2018). Genomes and transcriptomes of duckweeds. *Front Chem* **6**:doi.org/10.3389/fchem.2018.00230.
- **Andolfo, G., Di Donato, A., Chiaiese, P., De Natale, A., Pollio, A., Jones, J. D. G., Frusciante, L., and Ercolano, M. R.** (2019). Alien domains shaped the modular structure of plant NLR proteins. *Genome Biol Evol* **11**:evz248.
- **Asakawa, Y.** (2004). Chemosystematics of the Hepaticae. *Phytochemistry* **65**:623–669.
- **Baggs, E., Dagdas, G., and Krasileva, K. V.** (2017). NLR diversity, helpers and integrated domains: making sense of the NLR IDentity. *Curr Opin Plant Biol* **38**:59–67.
- **Baggs, E., Monroe, J. G., Thanki, A. S., O'Grady, R., Schudoma, C., Haerty, W., and Krasileva, K. V** (2020). Convergent Loss of an EDS1/PAD4 Signaling Pathway in Several Plant Lineages Reveals Co-evolved Components of Plant Immunity and Drought Response. *Plant Cell* **32**:2158–2177.
- **Baggs, E. L., Tiersma, M. B., Abramson, B. W., Michael, T. P., and Krasileva, K. V.** (2022). Characterization of defense responses against bacterial pathogens in duckweeds lacking EDS1. *New Phytologist* **236**:1838–1855.
- **Balka, K. R., and De Nardo, D.** (2019). Understanding early TLR signaling through the Myddosome. *J Leukoc Biol* **105**:339–351.
- **Banks, J. A., Nishiyama, T., Hasebe, M., Bowman, J. L., Gribskov, M., DePamphilis, C., Albert, V. A., Aono, N., Aoyama, T., Ambrose, B. A., et al.** (2011). The selaginella genome identifies genetic changes associated with the evolution of vascular plants. *Science* **332**:960–963.
- **Bao, G., Tang, M., Zhao, J., and Zhu, X.** (2021). Nanobody: a promising toolkit for molecular imaging and disease therapy. *EJNMMI Res* **11**:doi.org/10.1186/s13550-021- 00750-5.
- **Barragan, C. A., Wu, R., Kim, S.-T., Xi, W., Habring, A., and Hagmann, J.** (2019). RPW8 / HR Repeats Predict NLR-dependent Hybrid Performance. *PLoS Genet* **15**:e1008313.
- **Bender, K. W., and Zipfel, C.** (2023). Paradigms of receptor kinase signaling in plants. *Biochemical Journal* **480**:835–854.
- **Bent, A. F., Kunkel, B., Dahlbeck, D., Brown, K., Schmidt, R., Giraudat, J., Leung, J., and Staskawicz, B.** (1994). RPS2 of Arabidopsis thaliana - a leucine rich repeat class of plant disease resistance genes. *Science* **265**:1856–1860.
- **Berens, M. L., Berry, H. M., Mine, A., Argueso, C. T., and Tsuda, K.** (2017). Evolution of Hormone Signaling Networks in Plant Defense. *Annual Review of Phytopathology* **55**:401–425.
- **Berland, H., Albert, N. W., Stavland, A., Jordheim, M., McGhie, T. K., Zhou, Y., Zhang, H., Deroles, S. C., Schwinn, K. E., Jordan, B. R., et al.** (2019). Auronidins are a previously unreported class of flavonoid pigments that challenges when anthocyanin biosynthesis evolved in plants. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **116**:20232–20239.
- **Bernoux, M., Ve, T., Williams, S., Warren, C., Hatters, D., Valkov, E., Zhang, X., Ellis, J. G., Kobe, B., and Dodds, P. N.** (2011). Structural and functional analysis of a plant resistance protein TIR domain reveals interfaces for self-association, signaling, and autoregulation. *Cell Host Microbe* **9**:200–211.
- **Bi, G., Su, M., Li, N., Liang, Y., Dang, S., Xu, J., Hu, M., Wang, J., Zou, M., Deng, Y., et al.** (2021). The ZAR1 resistosome is a calcium-permeable channel triggering plant immune signaling. *Cell* **184**:doi.org/10.1016/j.cell.2021.05.003.
- **Bischoff, K. L.** (2016). Glucosinolates. In *Nutraceuticals: Efficacy, Safety and Toxicity*, pp. 551–554. Elsevier Inc.
- **Bjornson, M., Pimprikar, P., Nürnberger, T., and Zipfel, C.** (2021). The transcriptional landscape of Arabidopsis thaliana pattern-triggered immunity. *Nat Plants* **7**:579–586.
- **Bomblies, K., and Weigel, D.** (2007). Hybrid necrosis: Autoimmunity as a potential gene-flow barrier in plant species. *Nat Rev Genet* **8**:382–393.
- **Bonardi, V., Tang, S., Stallmann, A., Roberts, M., Cherkis, K. A., and Dangl, J. L.** (2011). Expanded functions for a family of plant intracellular immune receptors beyond specific recognition of pathogen effectors. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **108**:16463–16468.
- **Bowman, J. L., Kohchi, T., Yamato, K. T., Jenkins, J., Shu, S., Ishizaki, K., Yamaoka, S., Nishihama, R., Nakamura, Y., Berger, F., et al.** (2017). Insights into Land Plant Evolution Garnered from the Marchantia polymorpha Genome. *Cell* **171**:287-304.e15.
- **Bozsoki, Z., Cheng, J., Feng, F., Gysel, K., Vinther, M., Andersen, K. R., Oldroyd, G., Blaise, M., Radutoiu, S., and Stougaard, J.** (2017). Receptor-mediated chitin perception in legume roots is functionally separable from Nod factor perception. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **114**:E8118–E8127.
- **Bozsoki, Z., Gysel, K., Hansen, S. B., Lironi, D., Krönauer, C., Feng, F., de Jong, N., Vinther, M., Kamble, M., Thygesen, M. B., et al.** (2020). Ligand-recognizing motifs in plant LysM receptors are major determinants of specificity. *Science* **369**:663–670.
- **Bressendorff, S., Azevedo, R., Kenchappa, C. S., de León, I. P., Olsen, J. V., Rasmussen, M. W., Erbs, G., Newman, M. A., Petersen, M., and Mundy, J.** (2016). An Innate Immunity Pathway in the Moss Physcomitrella patens. *Plant Cell* **28**:1328– 1342.
- **Calvo-Baltanás, V., Wang, J., and Chae, E.** (2021). Hybrid Incompatibility of the Plant Immune System : An Opposite Force to Heterosis Equilibrating Hybrid Performances. *Front Plant Sci* **11**:576796.
- **Cao, Y., Liang, Y., Tanaka, K., Nguyen, C. T., Jedrzejczak, R. P., Joachimiak, A., and Stacey, G.** (2014). The kinase LYK5 is a major chitin receptor in Arabidopsis and forms a chitin-induced complex with related kinase CERK1. *Elife* **3**:e03766.
- **Cao Hui, Bowling, S. A., Gordon, A. S., and Dong Xinnian** (1994). Characterization of an Arabidopsis mutant that is nonresponsive to inducers of systemic acquired resistance. *Plant Cell* **6**:1583–1592.
- **Carella, P., and Schornack, S.** (2018). Manipulation of Bryophyte Hosts by Pathogenic and Symbiotic Microbes. *Plant Cell Physiol* **59**:651–660.
- **Carella, P., Gogleva, A., Tomaselli, M., Alfs, C., and Schornack, S.** (2018). Phytophthora palmivora establishes tissue-specific intracellular infection structures in the earliest divergent land plant lineage. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **115**:E3846–E3855.
- **Carella, P., Gogleva, A., Hoey, D. J., Bridgen, A. J., Stolze, S. C., Nakagami, H., and Schornack, S.** (2019). Conserved Biochemical Defenses Underpin Host Responses to Oomycete Infection in an Early-Divergent Land Plant Lineage. *Current Biology* **29**:2282- 2294.e5.
- **Castel, B., Ngou, P. M., Cevik, V., Kim, D. S., Yang, Y., Ding, P., and Jones, J. D. G.** (2019a). Diverse NLR immune receptors activate defence via the RPW8-NLR NRG1. *New Phytologist* **222**:966–980.
- **Castel, B., Wu, Y., Xiao, S., and Jones, J. D. G.** (2019b). An rpw8 quadruple mutant of Arabidopsis Col-0 is partially compromised in bacterial and fungal resistance. *bioRxiv. doi.org/10.1101/839308*.
- **Chae, E., Bomblies, K., Kim, S.-T., Karelina, D., Zaidem, M., Ossowski, S., Martín- Pizarro, C., Laitinen, R. A. E., Rowan, B. A., Tenenboim, H., et al.** (2014). Species- wide genetic incompatibility analysis identifies immune genes as hot spots of deleterious epistasis. *Cell* **159**:1341–1351.
- **Chen, F., Ludwiczuk, A., Wei, G., Chen, X., Crandall-Stotler, B., and Bowman, J. L.** (2018). Terpenoid Secondary Metabolites in Bryophytes: Chemical Diversity, Biosynthesis and Biological Functions. *Crit Rev Plant Sci* **37**:210–231.
- **Chen, T., Nomura, K., Wang, X., Sohrabi, R., Xu, J., Yao, L., Paasch, B. C., Ma, L., Kremer, J., Cheng, Y., et al.** (2020). A plant genetic network for preventing dysbiosis in the phyllosphere. *Nature* **580**:653–657.
- **Cheng, S., Xian, W., Fu, Y., Marin, B., Keller, J., Wu, T., Sun, W., Li, X., Xu, Y., Zhang, Y., et al.** (2019). Genomes of Subaerial Zygnematophyceae Provide Insights into Land Plant Evolution. *Cell* **179**:1057-1067.e14.
- **Chia, K.-S., Kourelis, J., Vickers, M., Sakai, T., Kamoun, S., and Carella, P.** (2022). The N-terminal executioner domains of NLR immune receptors are functionally conserved across major plant lineages. *bioRxiv*, doi:doi.org/10.1101/2022.10.19.512840.
- **Chinchilla, D., Zipfel, C., Robatzek, S., Kemmerling, B., Nürnberger, T., Jones, J. D. G., Felix, G., and Boller, T.** (2007). A flagellin-induced complex of the receptor FLS2 and BAK1 initiates plant defence. *Nature* **448**:497–500.
- **Chinchilla, D., Shan, L., He, P., de Vries, S., and Kemmerling, B.** (2009). One for all: the receptor-associated kinase BAK1. *Trends Plant Sci* **14**:535–541.
- **Chini, A., Monte, I., Zamarreño, A. M., García-Mina, J. M., and Solano, R.** (2023). Evolution of the jasmonate ligands and their biosynthetic pathways. *New Phytologist* **238**:2236–2246.
- **Chou, W. C., Jha, S., Linhoff, M. W., and Ting, J. P. Y.** (2023). The NLR gene family: from discovery to present day. *Nat Rev Immunol* **23**:635–654.
- **Chu, J., Monte, I., DeFalco, T. A., Köster, P., Derbyshire, P., Menke, F. L. H., and Zipfel, C.** (2023). Conservation of the PBL-RBOH immune module in land plants. *Current Biology* **33**:1130-1137.e5.
- **Compean, K. L., and Ynalvez, R. A.** (2014). Antimicrobial activity of plant secondary metabolites: A review. *Research Journal of Medicinal Plant* **8**:204–213.
- **Cooper, M. D., and Alder, M. N.** (2006). The evolution of adaptive immune systems. *Cell* **124**:815–822.
- **Cope, K. R., Bascaules, A., Irving, T. B., Venkateshwaran, M., Maeda, J., Garcia, K., Rush, T. A., Ma, C., Labbé, J., Jawdy, S., et al.** (2019). The ectomycorrhizal fungus laccaria bicolor produces lipochitooligosaccharides and uses the common symbiosis pathway to colonize populus roots. *Plant Cell* **31**:2386–2410.
- **Corlett, R. T.** (2016). Plant diversity in a changing world: Status, trends, and conservation needs. *Plant Divers* **38**:10–16.
- **Couto, D., and Zipfel, C.** (2016). Regulation of pattern recognition receptor signalling in plants. *Nat Rev Immunol* **16**:537–552.
- **Daskalov, A.** (2023). Emergence of the fungal immune system. *iScience* **26**:106793.
- **Daskalov, A., Dyrka, W., and Saupe, S. J.** (2020). NLR Function in Fungi as Revealed by the Study of Self/Non-self Recognition Systems. In *Genetics and Biotechnology*, pp. 123–141.
- **Davey, M. L., and Currah, R. S.** (2006). Interactions between mosses (Bryophyta) and fungi. *Canadian Journal of Botany* **84**:1509–1519.
- **Davies, K. M., Landi, M., Van Klink, J. W., Schwinn, K. E., Brummell, D. A., Albert, N. W., Chagné, D., Jibran, R., Kulshrestha, S., Zhou, Y., et al.** (2022). Evolution and function of red pigmentation in land plants. *Ann Bot* **130**:613–636.
- **De la Concepcion, J. C., Vega Benjumea, J., Bialas, A., Terauchi, R., Kamoun, S., and Banfield, M. J.** (2021). Functional diversification gave rise to allelic specialization in a rice NLR immune receptor pair. *Elife* **10**:e71662.
- **Dearnaley, J. D. W.** (2007). Further advances in orchid mycorrhizal research. *Mycorrhiza* **17**:475–486.
- **Delaux, P.-M., and Schornack, S.** (2021). Plant evolution driven by interactions with symbiotic and pathogenic microbes. *Science* **371**:eaba6605.
- **Delaux, P. M., Radhakrishnan, G. V., Jayaraman, D., Cheema, J., Malbreil, M., Volkening, J. D., Sekimoto, H., Nishiyama, T., Melkonian, M., Pokorny, L., et al.** (2015). Algal ancestor of land plants was preadapted for symbiosis. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **112**:13390–13395.
- **Dénarié, J., Debellé, F., and Promé, J. C.** (1996). Rhizobium lipo-chitooligosaccharide nodulation factors: Signaling molecules mediating recognition and morphogenesis. *Annu Rev Biochem* **65**:503–535.
- **Dievart, A., Gottin, C., Peacuterin, C., Ranwez, V., and Chantret, N.** (2020). Origin and Diversity of Plant Receptor-Like Kinases. *Annu Rev Plant Biol* **71**:131–156.
- **Ding, Y., Sun, T., Ao, K., Peng, Y., Zhang, Y., Li, X., and Zhang, Y.** (2018). Opposite Roles of Salicylic Acid Receptors NPR1 and NPR3/NPR4 in Transcriptional Regulation of Plant Immunity. *Cell* **13**:191–202.
- **Donoghue, P. C. J., Harrison, C. J., Paps, J., and Schneider, H.** (2021). The evolutionary emergence of land plants. *Current Biology* **31**:R1281–R1298.
- **Durrant, W. E., and Dong, X.** (2004). Systemic Acquired Resistance. *Annu Rev Phytopathol* **42**:185–209.
- **Duxbury, Z., Wang, S., Mackenzie, C. I., Tenthorey, J. L., Zhang, X., Huh, S. U., Hu, L., Hill, L., Ngou, P. M., Ding, P., et al.** (2020). Induced proximity of a TIR signaling domain on a plant-mammalian NLR chimera activates defense in plants. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **117**:18832–18839.
- **Duxbury, Z., Wu, C., and Ding, P.** (2021). A Comparative Overview of the Intracellular Guardians of Plants and Animals: NLRs in Innate Immunity and Beyond. *Annu Rev Plant Biol* **72**:14.1–14.30.
- **Dyrka, W., Lamacchia, M., Durrens, P., Kobe, B., Daskalov, A., Paoletti, M., Sherman, D. J., and Saupe, S. J.** (2014). Diversity and variability of NOD-like receptors in fungi. *Genome Biol Evol* **6**:3137–3158.
- **Eastman, S., Smith, T., Zaydman, M. A., Kim, P., Martinez, S., Damaraju, N., DiAntonio, A., Milbrandt, J., Clemente, T. E., Alfano, J. R., et al.** (2022). A phytobacterial TIR domain effector manipulates NAD+ to promote virulence. *New Phytologist* **233**:890–904.
- **Emonet, A., Zhou, F., Vacheron, J., Heiman, C. M., Tendon, V. D., Ma, K.-W., Schulze- Lefert, P., Keel, C., and Geldner, N.** (2021). Spatially Restricted Immune Responses Are Required for Maintaining Root Meristematic Activity upon Detection of Bacteria. *Current Biology* **31**:1012-1028.e7.
- **Essuman, K., Summers, D. W., Sasaki, Y., Mao, X., DiAntonio, A., and Milbrandt, J.** (2017). The SARM1 Toll/Interleukin-1 Receptor Domain Possesses Intrinsic NAD+ Cleavage Activity that Promotes Pathological Axonal Degeneration. *Neuron* **93**:1334- 1343.e5.
- **Fang, Y., Qin, X., Liao, Q., Du, R., Luo, X., Zhou, Q., Li, Z., Chen, H., Jin, W., Yuan, Y., et al.** (2022). The genome of homosporous maidenhair fern sheds light on the euphyllophyte evolution and defences. *Nat Plants* **8**:1024–1037.
- **Feehan, J. M., Castel, B., Bentham, A. R., and Jones, J. D. G.** (2020). Plant NLRs get by with a little help from their friends. *Curr Opin Plant Biol* **56**:99–108.
- **Feng, F., Sun, J., Radhakrishnan, G. V., Lee, T., Bozsóki, Z., Fort, S., Gavrin, A., Gysel, K., Thygesen, M. B., Andersen, K. R., et al.** (2019). A combination of chitooligosaccharide and lipochitooligosaccharide recognition promotes arbuscular mycorrhizal associations in Medicago truncatula. *Nat Commun* **10**:5047.
- **Finkel, O. M., Salas-González, I., Castrillo, G., Spaepen, S., Law, T. F., Teixeira, P. J. P. L., Jones, C. D., and Dangl, J. L.** (2019). The effects of soil phosphorus content on plant microbiota are driven by the plant phosphate starvation response. *PLoS Biol* **17**:e3000534.
- **Flor, H. H.** (1971). Current status of the gene-for-gene concept. *Annual Review Phytopathology* **9**:275–296.
- **Gao, Y., Wang, W., Zhang, T., Gong, Z., Zhao, H., and Han, G.-Z.** (2018). Out of Water: The Origin and Early Diversification of Plant R-Genes. *Plant Physiol* **177**:pp.00185.2018.
- **Gao, L. A., Wilkinson, M. E., Strecker, J., Makarova, K. S., Macrae, R. K., Koonin, E. V, and Zhang, F.** (2022). Prokaryotic innate immunity through pattern recognition of conserved viral proteins. *Science* **377**:10.1126/science.abm4096.
- **Gebauer, G., Preiss, K., and Gebauer, A. C.** (2016). Partial mycoheterotrophy is more widespread among orchids than previously assumed. *New Phytologist* **211**:11–15.
- **Genre, A., Chabaud, M., Balzergue, C., Puech-Pagès, V., Novero, M., Rey, T., Fournier, J., Rochange, S., Bécard, G., Bonfante, P., et al.** (2013). Short-chain chitin oligomers from arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi trigger nuclear Ca2+ spiking in Medicago truncatula roots and their production is enhanced by strigolactone. *New Phytologist* **198**:190–202.
- **Genre, A., Lanfranco, L., Perotto, S., and Bonfante, P.** (2020). Unique and common traits in mycorrhizal symbioses. *Nat Rev Microbiol* **18**:649–660.
- **Gimenez-Ibanez, S., Zamarreño, A. M., García-Mina, J. M., and Solano, R.** (2019). An Evolutionarily Ancient Immune System Governs the Interactions between Pseudomonas syringae and an Early-Diverging Land Plant Lineage. *Current Biology* **29**:2270-2281.e4.
- **Gómez-Gómez, L., and Boller, T.** (2000). FLS2: An LRR Receptor–like Kinase Involved in the Perception of the Bacterial Elicitor Flagellin in Arabidopsis. *Mol Cell* **5**:1003–1011.
- **Gong, Z., and Han, G. Z.** (2021). Flourishing in water: the early evolution and diversification of plant receptor-like kinases. *Plant Journal* **106**:174–184.
- **Griesmann, M., Chang, Y., Liu, X., Song, Y., Haberer, G., Crook, M. B., Billault- Penneteau, B., Lauressergues, D., Keller, J., Imanishi, L., et al.** (2018). Phylogenomics reveals multiple losses of nitrogen-fixing root nodule symbiosis. *Science* **361**:eaat1743.
- **Groszmann, M., Gonzalez-Bayon, R., Lyons, R. L., Greaves, I. K., Kazan, K., Peacock, W. J., and Dennis, E. S.** (2015). Hormone-regulated defense and stress response networks contribute to heterosis in *Arabidopsis* F1 hybrids. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **112**:E6397–E6406.
- **Hammond-Kosack, K. E., and Jones, J. D. G.** (1997). Plant Disease Resistance Genes. *Annu Rev Plant Physiol Plant Mol Biol* **48**:575–607.
- **Hanlon, C. D., and Andrew, D. J.** (2015). Outside-in signaling A brief review of GPCR signaling with a focus on the Drosophila GPCR family. *J Cell Sci* **128**:3533–3542.
- **Harris, B. J., Clark, J. W., Schrempf, D., Szöllősi, G. J., Donoghue, P. C. J., Hetherington, A. M., and Williams, T. A.** (2022). Divergent evolutionary trajectories of bryophytes and tracheophytes from a complex common ancestor of land plants. *Nat Ecol Evol* **6**:1634–1643.
- **Harrison, M. J.** (2005). Signaling in the arbuscular mycorrhizal symbiosis. *Annu Rev Microbiol* **59**:19–42.
- **Harton, J. A., Linhoff, M. W., Zhang, J., and Ting, J. P.-Y.** (2002). Cutting Edge: CATERPILLER: A Large Family of Mammalian Genes Containing CARD, Pyrin, Nucleotide-Binding, and Leucine-Rich Repeat Domains. *The Journal of Immunology* **169**:4088–4093.
- **Heller, J., Clavé, C., Gladieux, P., Saupe, S. J., and Glass, N. L.** (2018). NLR surveillance of essential SEC-9 SNARE proteins induces programmed cell death upon allorecognition in filamentous fungi. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **115**:E2292–E2301.
- **Hoffman, H. M., Mueller, J. L., Broide, D. H., Wanderer, A. A., and Kolodner, R. D.** (2001). Mutation of a new gene encoding a putative pyrin-like protein causes familial cold autoinflammatory syndrome and Muckle–Wells syndrome. *Nat Genet* **29**:301–305.
- **Horsefield, S., Burdett, H., Zhang, X., Manik, M. K., Shi, Y., Chen, J., Qi, T., Gilley, J., Lai, J.-S., Rank, M. X., et al.** (2019). NAD+ cleavage activity by animal and plant TIR domains in cell death pathways. *Science* **365**:793–799.
- **Hu, Z., Yan, C., Liu, P., Huang, Z., Ma, R., Zhang, C., Wang, R., Zhang, Y., Martinon, F., Miao, D., et al.** (2013). Crystal structure of NLRC4 reveals its autoinhibition mechanism. *Science* **341**:172–175.
- **Huang, S., Drake, J. M., Gittleman, J. L., and Altizer, S.** (2015). Parasite diversity declines with host evolutionary distinctiveness: A global analysis of carnivores. *Evolution* **69**:621– 630.
- **Huang, S., Jia, A., Song, W., Hessler, G., Meng, Y., Sun, Y., Xu, L., Laessle, H., Jirschitzka, J., Ma, S., et al.** (2022a). Identification and receptor mechanism of TIR-catalyzed small molecules in plant immunity. *Science* **337**:10.1126/science.abq3297.
- **Huang, X., Wang, W., Gong, T., Wickell, D., Kuo, L.-Y., Zhang, X., Wen, J., Kim, H., Lu, F., Zhao, H., et al.** (2022b). The flying spider-monkey tree fern genome provides insights into fern evolution and arborescence. *Nat Plants* **8**:500–512.
- **Hulin, M. T., Hill, L., Jones, J. D. G., and Ma, W.** (2023). Pangenomic analysis reveals plant NAD+ manipulation as an important virulence activity of bacterial pathogen effectors. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **120**:e2217114120.
- **Iakovidis, M., Chung, E. H., Saile, S. C., Sauberzweig, E., and El Kasmi, F.** (2023). The emerging frontier of plant immunity's core hubs. *FEBS Journal* **290**:3311–3335.
- **Jacob, P., Kim, N. H., Wu, F., El-kasmi, F., Walton, W. G., Furzer, O. J., Lietzen, A. D., Sunil, S., Kempthorn, K., Redinbo, M. R., et al.** (2021). Plant "helper" immune receptors are Ca2+-permeable nonselective cation channels. *Science* **373**:420–425.
- **Jeon, H.-W., Iwakawa, H., Naramoto, S., Herrfurth, C., Gutsche, N., Schlueter, T., Kyozuka, J., Miyauchi, S., Feussner, I., Zachgo, S., et al.** (2022). Contrasting and conserved roles of NPR proteins in diverged land plant lineages. *bioRxiv* doi:10.1101/2022.07.19.500630.
- **Jia, Q., Li, G., Köllner, T. G., Fu, J., Chen, X., Xiong, W., Crandall-Stotler, B. J., Bowman, J. L., Weston, D. J., Zhang, Y., et al.** (2016). Microbial-type terpene synthase genes occur widely in nonseed land plants, but not in seed plants. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **113**:12328–12333.
- **Jia, Q., Köllner, T. G., Gershenzon, J., and Chen, F.** (2018). MTPSLs: New Terpene Synthases in Nonseed Plants. *Trends Plant Sci* **23**:121–128.
- **Jia, A., Huang, S., Song, W., Wang, J., Meng, Y., Sun, Y., Xu, L., Laessle, H., Jirschitzka, J., Hou, J., et al.** (2022). TIR-catalyzed ADP-ribosylation reactions produce signaling molecules for plant immunity. *Science* **377**:10.1126/science.abq8180.
- **Jia, A., Huang, S., Ma, S., Chang, X., Han, Z., and Chai, J.** (2023). TIR-catalyzed nucleotide signaling molecules in plant defense. *Curr Opin Plant Biol* **73**:102334.
- **Johanndrees, O., Baggs, E. L., Uhlmann, C., Locci, F., Läßle, H. L., Melkonian, K., Käufer, K., Dongus, J. A., Nakagami, H., Krasileva, K. V., et al.** (2023). Variation in plant Toll/Interleukin-1 receptor domain protein dependence on ENHANCED DISEASE SUSCEPTIBILITY 1. *Plant Physiol* **191**:626–642.
- **Jones, J. D. G., and Dangl, J. L.** (2006). The plant immune system. *Nature* **444**:323–329.
- **Jones, D. A., Thomas, C. M., Hammond-Kosack, K. E., Balint-Kurti, P. J., and Jones, J. D. G.** (1994). Isolation of the tomato Cf-9 gene for resistance to Cladosporium fulvum by transposon tagging. *Science* **266**:789–793.
- **Jones, J. D. G., Vance, R. E., and Dangl, J. L.** (2016). Intracellular innate immune surveillance devices in plants and animals. *Science* **354**.
- **Kadota, Y., Sklenar, J., Derbyshire, P., Stransfeld, L., Asai, S., Ntoukakis, V., Jones, J. D. G., Shirasu, K., Menke, F., Jones, A., et al.** (2014). Direct Regulation of the NADPH Oxidase RBOHD by the PRR-Associated Kinase BIK1 during Plant Immunity. *Mol Cell* **54**:43–55.
- **Kibby, E. M., Conte, A. N., Burroughs, A. M., Nagy, T. A., Vargas, J. A., Whalen, L. A., Aravind, L., and Whiteley, A. T.** (2023). Bacterial NLR-related proteins protect against phage. *Cell* **186**:2410-2424.e18.
- **Kirschner, R., Lee, P. H., and Huang, Y.-M.** (2019). Diversity of fungi on Taiwanese fern plants: review and new discoveries. *Taiwania* **64**:163–175.
- **Klessig, D. F., Choi, H. W., and Dempsey, D. A.** (2018). Systemic acquired resistance and salicylic acid: Past, present, and future. *Molecular Plant-Microbe Interactions* **31**:871– 888.
- **Kodama, K., Rich, M. K., Yoda, A., Shimazaki, S., Xie, X., Akiyama, K., Mizuno, Y., Komatsu, A., Luo, Y., Suzuki, H., et al.** (2022a). An ancestral function of strigolactones as symbiotic rhizosphere signals. *Nat Commun* **13**:3974.
- **Kodama, K., Rich, M. K., Yoda, A., Shimazaki, S., Xie, X., Akiyama, K., Mizuno, Y., Komatsu, A., Luo, Y., Suzuki, H., et al.** (2022b). An ancestral function of strigolactones as symbiotic rhizosphere signals. *Nat Commun* **13**:3974.
- **Kourelis, J., and Van Der Hoorn, R. A. L.** (2018). Defended to the Nines: 25 years of Resistance Gene Cloning Identifies Nine Mechanisms for R Protein Function. *Plant Cell* **30**:285–299.
- **Kourelis, J., Sakai, T., Adachi, H., and Id, S. K.** (2021). RefPlantNLR is a comprehensive collection of experimentally validated plant disease resistance proteins from the NLR family. *PLoS Biol* **19**:e3001124.
- **Kourelis, J., Marchal, C., Posbeyikian, A., Harant, A., and Kamoun, S.** (2023). NLR immune receptor–nanobody fusions confer plant disease resistance. *Science* **379**:934– 939.
- **Lacombe, S., Rougon-Cardoso, A., Sherwood, E., Peeters, N., Dahlbeck, D., Van Esse, H. P., Smoker, M., Rallapalli, G., Thomma, B. P. H. J., Staskawicz, B., et al.** (2010). Interfamily transfer of a plant pattern-recognition receptor confers broad-spectrum bacterial resistance. *Nat Biotechnol* **28**:365–369.
- **Lang, D., Ullrich, K. K., Murat, F., Fuchs, J., Jenkins, J., Haas, F. B., Piednoel, M., Gundlach, H., Van Bel, M., Meyberg, R., et al.** (2018). The Physcomitrella patens chromosome-scale assembly reveals moss genome structure and evolution. *The Plant Journal* **93**:515–533.
- **Lapin, D., Johanndrees, O., Wu, Z., Li, X., and Parker, J. E.** (2022). Molecular innovations in plant TIR-based immunity signaling. *Plant Cell* **34**:1479–1496.
- **Leavitt, A., Yirmiya, E., Amitai, G., Lu, A., Garb, J., Herbst, E., Morehouse, B. R., Hobbs, S. J., Antine, S. P., Sun, Z.-Y. J., et al.** (2022). Viruses inhibit TIR gcADPR signaling to overcome bacterial defense. *Nature* **611**:326–331.
- **Lee, H.-Y., Oh, S., Mang, H., Choi, E., Seo, Y.-E., Kim, M.-S., Oh, S., Kim, S.-B., and Choi, D.** (2020). Genome-wide functional analysis of hot pepper immune receptors reveals an autonomous NLR clade in seed plants. *New Phytologist* **229**:532–547.
- **Lemmon, M. A., and Schlessinger, J.** (2010). Cell Signaling by Receptor Tyrosine Kinases. *Cell* **141**:1117–1134.
- **Lerouge, P., Roche, P., Faucher, C., Maillet, F., Truchet, G., Promé, J. C., and Dénarié, J.** (1990). Symbiotic host-specificity of Rhizobium meliloti is determined by a sulphated and acylated glucosamine oligosaccharide signal. *Nature* **344**:781–784.
- **Lewontin, R. C., Ginzburg, L. R., and Tuljapurkar, S. D.** (2010). Heterosis. *Plant Cell* **22**:2105–2112.
- **Li, F. W., Brouwer, P., Carretero-Paulet, L., Cheng, S., De Vries, J., Delaux, P.-M., Eily, A., Koppers, N., Kuo, L. Y., Li, Z., et al.** (2018a). Fern genomes elucidate land plant evolution and cyanobacterial symbioses. *Nat Plants* **4**:460–472.
- **Li, Y., Zhang, Y., Wang, Q. X., Wang, T. T., Cao, X. L., Zhao, Z. X., Zhao, S. L., Xu, Y. J., Xiao, Z. Y., Li, J. L., et al.** (2018b). RESISTANCE TO POWDERY MILDEW8.1 boosts
- pattern-triggered immunity against multiple pathogens in Arabidopsis and rice. *Plant Biotechnol J* **16**:428–441.
- **Li, H. T., Yi, T. S., Gao, L. M., Ma, P. F., Zhang, T., Yang, J. B., Gitzendanner, M. A., Fritsch, P. W., Cai, J., Luo, Y., et al.** (2019). Origin of angiosperms and the puzzle of the Jurassic gap. *Nat Plants* **5**:461–470.
- **Li, F. W., Nishiyama, T., Waller, M., Frangedakis, E., Keller, J., Li, Z., Fernandez-Pozo, N., Barker, M. S., Bennett, T., Blázquez, M. A., et al.** (2020). Anthoceros genomes illuminate the origin of land plants and the unique biology of hornworts. *Nat Plants* **6**:259–272.
- **Li, X. R., Sun, J., Albinsky, D., Zarrabian, D., Hull, R., Lee, T., Jarratt-Barnham, E., Chiu, C. H., Jacobsen, A., Soumpourou, E., et al.** (2022). Nutrient regulation of lipochitooligosaccharide recognition in plants via NSP1 and NSP2. *Nat Commun* **13**:10.1038/s41467-022-33908–3.
- **Liang, W., van Wersch, S., Tong, M., and Li, X.** (2018). TIR-NB-LRR immune receptor SOC3 pairs with truncated TIR-NB protein CHS1 or TN2 to monitor the homeostasis of E3 ligase SAUL1. *New Phytologist* **221**:2054–2066.
- **Libourel, C., Keller, J., Brichet, L., Cazalé, A. C., Carrère, S., Vernié, T., Couzigou, J. M., Callot, C., Dufau, I., Cauet, S., et al.** (2023). Comparative phylotranscriptomics reveals ancestral and derived root nodule symbiosis programmes. *Nat Plants* **9**:1067–1080.
- **Limpens, E., Franken, C., Smit, P., Willemse, J., Bisseling, T., and Geurts, R.** (2003). LysM Domain Receptor Kinases Regulating Rhizobial Nod Factor-Induced Infection. *Science* **302**:630–633.
- **Liu, Y., Zeng, Z., Zhang, Y. M., Li, Q., Jiang, X. M., Jiang, Z., Tang, J. H., Chen, D., Wang, Q., Chen, J. Q., et al.** (2021). An angiosperm NLR Atlas reveals that NLR gene reduction is associated with ecological specialization and signal transduction component deletion. *Mol Plant* **14**:2015–2031.
- **Liu, Y., Wang, S., Li, L., Yang, T., Dong, S., Wei, T., Wu, S., Liu, Y., Gong, Y., Feng, X., et al.** (2022). The Cycas genome and the early evolution of seed plants. *Nat Plants* **8**:389– 401.
- **Liu, Y., Zhang, Y. M., Tang, Y., Chen, J. Q., and Shao, Z. Q.** (2023). The evolution of plant NLR immune receptors and downstream signal components. *Curr Opin Plant Biol* **73**:102363.
- **Loquet, A., and Saupe, S. J.** (2017). Diversity of amyloid motifs in NLR signaling in fungi. *Biomolecules* **7**:38.
- **Lu, D., Wu, S., Gao, X., Zhang, Y., Shan, L., and He, P.** (2010a). A receptor-like cytoplasmic kinase, BIK1, associates with a flagellin receptor complex to initiate plant innate immunity. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **107**:496–501.
- **Lu, D., Wu, S., Gao, X., Zhang, Y., Shan, L., and He, P.** (2010b). A receptor-like cytoplasmic kinase, BIK1, associates with a flagellin receptor complex to initiate plant innate immunity. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **107**:496–501.
- **Ma, X. F., Li, Y., Sun, J. L., Wang, T. T., Fan, J., Lei, Y., Huang, Y. Y., Xu, Y.-J., Zhao, J. Q., Xiao, S., et al.** (2014). Ectopic expression of RESISTANCE to POWDERY MILDEW8.1
- Confers resistance to fungal and oomycete pathogens in arabidopsis. *Plant Cell Physiol* **55**:1484–1496.
- **Ma, S., Lapin, D., Liu, L., Sun, Y., Song, W., Zhang, X., Logemann, E., Yu, D., Wang, J., Jirschitzka, J., et al.** (2020). Direct pathogen-induced assembly of an NLR immune receptor complex to form a holoenzyme. *Science* **370**:eabe3069.
- **Maekawa, T., Cheng, W., Spiridon, L. N., Töller, A., Lukasik, E., Saijo, Y., Liu, P., Shen, Q. H., Micluta, M. A., Somssich, I. E., et al.** (2011). Coiled-coil domain-dependent homodimerization of intracellular barley immune receptors defines a minimal functional module for triggering cell death. *Cell Host Microbe* **9**:187–199.
- **Maillet, F., Poinsot, V., André, O., Puech-Pagés, V., Haouy, A., Gueunier, M., Cromer, L., Giraudet, D., Formey, D., Niebel, A., et al.** (2011). Fungal lipochitooligosaccharide symbiotic signals in arbuscular mycorrhiza. *Nature* **469**:58–63.
- **Man, J., Harrington, T., Lally, K., and Bartlett, M. E.** (2023). Asymmetric evolution of protein domains in the leucine-rich repeat receptor-like kinase (LRR-RLK) family of plant developmental coordinators. *Mol Biol Evol* doi:10.1093/MOLBEV/MSAD220.
- **Marchal, C., Michalopoulou, V. A., Zou, Z., Cevik, V., and Sarris, P. F.** (2022). Show me your ID: NLR immune receptors with integrated domains in plants. *Essays Biochem* **66**:527–539.
- **Marchant, D. B., Chen, G., Cai, S., Chen, F., Schafran, P., Jenkins, J., Shu, S., Plott, C., Webber, J., Lovell, J. T., et al.** (2022). Dynamic genome evolution in a model fern. *Nat Plants* **8**:1038–1051.
- **Martin, R., Qi, T., Zhang, H., Liu, F., King, M., Toth, C., and Staskawicz, B. J.** (2020). Structure of the activated Roq1 resistosome directly recognizing the pathogen effector XopQ. *Science* **370**:eabd9993.
- **Martinon, F., Hofmann, K., and Tschopp, J.** (2001). The pyrin domain: A possible member of the death domain-fold family implicated in apoptosis and inflammation. *Current Biology* **11**:R118–R120.
- **Matsui, H., Iwakawa, H., Hyon, G. S., Yotsui, I., Katou, S., Monte, I., Nishihama, R., Franzen, R., Solano, R., and Nakagami, H.** (2019). Isolation of Natural Fungal Pathogens from Marchantia polymorpha Reveals Antagonism between Salicylic Acid and Jasmonate during Liverwort-Fungus Interactions. *Plant Cell Physiol* **61**:265–275.
- **Meyers, B. C., Kozik, A., Griego, A., Kuang, H., and Michelmore, R. W.** (2003). Genome-Wide Analysis of NBS-LRR – Encoding Genes in Arabidopsis. *Plant Cell* **15**:809–834.
- **Miao, E. A., Alpuche-Aranda, C. M., Dors, M., Clark, A. E., Bader, M. W., Miller, S. I., and Aderem, A.** (2006). Cytoplasmic flagellin activates caspase-1 and secretion of interleukin 1β via Ipaf. *Nat Immunol* **7**:569–575.
- **Miya, A., Albert, P., Shinya, T., Desaki, Y., Ichimura, K., Shirasu, K., Narusaka, Y., Kawakami, N., Kaku, H., and Shibuya, N.** (2007). CERK1, a LysM receptor kinase, is essential for chitin elicitor signaling in Arabidopsis. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **104**:19613–19618.
- **Monaghan, J., Matschi, S., Romeis, T., and Zipfel, C.** (2015). The calcium-dependent 1277 protein kinase CPK28 negatively regulates the BIK1-mediated PAMPinduced calcium burst. *Plant Signal Behav* **10**:e1018497.
- **Moner-Ros, E., Jiménez-Góngora, T., Villar-Martín, L., González-Miguel, V. M., Kutnjak, D., and Rubio-Somoza, I.** (2023). Conservation of molecular responses upon viral infection in the non-vascular plant Marchantia polymorpha. *bioRxiv* doi:10.1101/2023.11.06.565823.
- **Monte, I., Ishida, S., Zamarreño, A. M., Hamberg, M., Franco-Zorrilla, J. M., García- Casado, G., Gouhier-Darimont, C., Reymond, P., Takahashi, K., García-Mina, J. M., et al.** (2018). Ligand-receptor co-evolution shaped the jasmonate pathway in land plants. *Nat Chem Biol* **14**:480–488.
- **Monte, I., Caballero, J., Zamarreño, A. M., Fernández-Barbero, G., García-Mina, J. M., and Solano, R.** (2022). JAZ is essential for ligand specificity of the COI1/JAZ co-receptor. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **119**:e2212155119.
- **Montgomery, S. A., Tanizawa, Y., Galik, B., Wang, N., Ito, T., Mochizuki, T., Akimcheva, S., Bowman, J. L., Cognat, V., Maréchal-Drouard, L., et al.** (2020). Chromatin Organization in Early Land Plants Reveals an Ancestral Association between H3K27me3, Transposons, and Constitutive Heterochromatin. *Current Biology* **30**:573- 588.e7.
- **Morris, J. L., Puttick, M. N., Clark, J. W., Edwards, D., Kenrick, P., Pressel, S., Wellman, C. H., Yang, Z., Schneider, H., and Donoghue, P. C. J.** (2018). The timescale of early land plant evolution. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **115**:E2274– E2283.
- **Nelson, J. M., Hauser, D. A., Hinson, R., and Shaw, A. J.** (2018). A novel experimental system using the liverwort Marchantia polymorpha and its fungal endophytes reveals diverse and context-dependent effects. *New Phytologist* **218**:1217–1232.
- **Ngou, B. P. M., Ahn, H. K., Ding, P., and Jones, J. D. G.** (2021). Mutual potentiation of plant immunity by cell-surface and intracellular receptors. *Nature* **592**:110–115.
- **Ngou, B. P. M., Ding, P., and Jones, J. D. G.** (2022a). Thirty years of resistance: Zig-zag through the plant immune system. *Plant Cell* **34**:1447–1478.
- **Ngou, B. P. M., Heal, R., Wyler, M., Schmid, M. W., and Jones, J. D. G.** (2022b). Concerted expansion and contraction of immune receptor gene repertoires in plant genomes. *Nat Plants* **8**:1146–1152.
- **Ngou, B. P. M., Heal, R., Wyler, M., Schmid, M. W., and Jones, J. D. G.** (2022c). Concerted expansion and contraction of immune receptor gene repertoires in plant genomes. *Nat Plants* **8**:1146–1152.
- **Ngou, B. P. M., Wyler, M., Schmid, M. W., Kadota, Y., and Shirasu, K.** (2023). Evolutionary Trajectory of Pattern Recognition Receptors in Plants. *bioRxiv* doi:10.1101/2023.07.04.547604.
- **Nishimura, M. T., Anderson, R. G., Cherkis, K. A., Law, T. F., Liu, Q. L., and Machius, Mischa.** (2016). TIR-only protein RBA1 recognizes a pathogen effector to regulate cell death in Arabidopsis. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **114**:E2053– E2062.
- **Nishiyama, T., Sakayama, H., de Vries, J., Buschmann, H., Saint-Marcoux, D., Ullrich, K. K., Haas, F. B., Vanderstraeten, L., Becker, D., Lang, D., et al.** (2018). The Chara Genome: Secondary Complexity and Implications for Plant Terrestrialization. *Cell* **174**:448-464.e24.
- **Ofir, G., Herbst, E., Baroz, M., Cohen, D., Millman, A., Doron, S., Tal, N., Malheiro, D. B. A., Malitsky, S., Amitai, G., et al.** (2021). Antiviral activity of bacterial TIR domains via signaling molecules. *Nature* **600**:116–120.
- **Oldroyd, G. E. D.** (2013). Speak, friend, and enter: Signalling systems that promote beneficial symbiotic associations in plants. *Nat Rev Microbiol* **11**:252–263.
- **Oliver, J. P., Castro, A., Gaggero, C., Cascón, T., Schmelz, E. A., Castresana, C., and Ponce De León, I.** (2009). Pythium infection activates conserved plant defense responses in mosses. *Planta* **230**:569–579.
- **Orr, H. A.** (1996). Dobzhansky, Bateson, and the genetics of speciation. *Genetics* **144**:1331– 1335.
- **Osbourn, A. E.** (1996). Preformed Antimicrobial Compounds and Plant Defense against Fungal Attack. *Plant Cell* **8**:1821–1831.
- **Paasch, B. C., and He, S. Y.** (2021). Toward understanding microbiota homeostasis in the plant kingdom. *PLoS Pathog* **17**:e1009472.
- **Paries, M., and Gutjahr, C.** (2023). The good, the bad, and the phosphate: regulation of beneficial and detrimental plant–microbe interactions by the plant phosphate status. *New Phytologist* **239**:29–46.
- **Parker, J. E., Holub, E. B., Frost, L. N., Falk, A., Gunn, N. D., and Daniels, M. J.** (1996). Characterization of eds1, a mutation in Arabidopsis suppressing resistance to Peronospora parasitica specified by several different RPP genes. *Plant Cell* **8**:2033– 2046.
- **Parnet, P., Garka, K. E., Bonnert, T. P., Dower, S. K., and Sims, J. E.** (1996). IL-1Rrp is a novel receptor-like molecule similar to the type I interleukin-1 receptor and its homologues T1/ST2 and IL-1R AcP. *Journal of Biological Chemistry* **271**:3967–3970.
- **Peng, Y., Sun, T., and Zhang, Y.** (2017). Perception of salicylic acid in Physcomitrella patens. *Front Plant Sci* **8**:318389.
- **Piofczyk, T., Jeena, G., and Pecinka, A.** (2015). Arabidopsis thaliana natural variation reveals connections between UV radiation stress and plant pathogen-like defense responses. *Plant Physiology and Biochemistry* **93**:34–43.
- **Pokotylo, I., Kravets, V., and Ruelland, E.** (2019). Salicylic acid binding proteins (SABPs): The hidden forefront of salicylic acid signalling. *Int J Mol Sci* **20**:4377.
- **Ponce De León, I., Schmelz, E. A., Gaggero, C., Castro, A., Álvarez, A., and Montesano, M.** (2012). Physcomitrella patens activates reinforcement of the cell wall, programmed cell death and accumulation of evolutionary conserved defence signals, such as salicylic acid and 12-oxo-phytodienoic acid, but not jasmonic acid, upon Botrytis cinerea infection. *Mol Plant Pathol* **13**:960–974.
- **Poyet, J. L., Srinivasula, S. M., Tnani, M., Razmara, M., Fernandes-Alnemri, T., and Alnemri, E. S.** (2001). Identification of Ipaf, a Human Caspase-1-activating Protein Related to Apaf-1. *Journal of Biological Chemistry* **276**:28309–28313.
- **Qi, T., Seong, K., Thomazella, D. P. T., Kim, J. R., Pham, J., Seo, E., Cho, M.-J., Schultink, A., and Staskawicz, B. J.** (2018). NRG1 functions downstream of EDS1 to regulate TIR-NLR-mediated plant immunity in Nicotiana benthamiana. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **115**:E10979–E10987.
- **Radhakrishnan, G. V., Keller, J., Rich, M. K., Vernié, T., Mbadinga Mbaginda, D. L., Vigneron, N., Cottret, L., San Clemente, H., Libourel, C., Cheema, J., et al.** (2020). An ancestral signalling pathway is conserved in plant lineages forming intracellular symbioses. *Nat Plants* **6**:280–289.
- **Radutoiu, S., Madsen, L. H., Madsen, E. B., Felle, H. H., Umehara, Y., Grønlund, M., Sato, S., Nakamura, Y., Tabata, S., Sandal, N., et al.** (2003). Plant recognition of symbiotic bacteria requires two LysM receptor-like kinases. *Nature* **425**:585–592.
- **Reboledo, G., Agorio, A. d., Vignale, L., Batista-García, R. A., and Ponce De León, I.** (2021). Transcriptional profiling reveals conserved and species-specific plant defense responses during the interaction of Physcomitrium patens with Botrytis cinerea. *Plant Mol Biol* **107**:365–385.
- **Redkar, A., Gimenez Ibanez, S., Sabale, M., Zechmann, B., Solano, R., and Di Pietro, A.** (2021). Marchantia polymorpha model reveals conserved infection mechanisms in the vascular wilt fungal pathogen Fusarium oxysporum. *New Phytologist* **234**:227–241.
- **Redkar, A., Sabale, M., Schudoma, C., Zechmann, B., Gupta, Y. K., López-Berges, M. S., Venturini, G., Gimenez-Ibanez, S., Turrà, D., Solano, R., et al.** (2022). Conserved secreted effectors contribute to endophytic growth and multihost plant compatibility in a vascular wilt fungus. *Plant Cell* **34**:3214–3232.
- **Remy, W., Taylor, T. N., Hass, H., and Kerp, H.** (1994). Four hundred-million-year-old vesicular arbuscular mycorrhizae. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **91**:11841–11843.
- **Rich, M. K., Vigneron, N., Libourel, C., Keller, J., Xue, L., Hajheidari, M., Radhakrishnan, G. V, Le Ru, A., Diop, S. I., Potente, G., et al.** (2021). Lipid exchanges drove the evolution of mutualism during plant terrestrialization. *Science* **372**:864–868.
- **Richter, D. J., and Levin, T. C.** (2019). The origin and evolution of cell-intrinsic antibacterial defenses in eukaryotes. *Curr Opin Genet Dev* **58–59**:111–122.
- **Rieseberg, T. P., Dadras, A., Fürst-Jansen, J. M. R., Dhabalia Ashok, A., Darienko, T., de Vries, S., Irisarri, I., and de Vries, J.** (2023). Crossroads in the evolution of plant specialized metabolism. *Semin Cell Dev Biol* **134**:37–58.
- **Rowland, O., Ludwig, A. a, Merrick, C. J., Baillieul, F., Tracy, F. E., Yoshioka, H., Durrant, W. E., Fritz-laylin, L., Nekrasov, V., Sjo, K., et al.** (2005). Functional Analysis 1397 of Avr9 / Cf-9 Rapidly Elicited Genes Identifies a Protein Kinase, ACIK1, That Is Essential for Full Cf-9 – Dependent Disease Resistance in Tomato. *Plant Cell* **17**:295– 310.
- **Rubinstein, C. V., Gerrienne, P., de la Puente, G. S., Astini, R. A., and Steemans, P.** (2010). Early Middle Ordovician evidence for land plants in Argentina (eastern Gondwana). *New Phytologist* **188**:365–369.
- **Rush, T. A., Puech-Pagès, V., Bascaules, A., Jargeat, P., Maillet, F., Haouy, A., Maës, A. Q. M., Carriel, C. C., Khokhani, D., Keller-Pearson, M., et al.** (2020). Lipo- chitooligosaccharides as regulatory signals of fungal growth and development. *Nat Commun* **11**:3897.
- **Saile, S. C., Jacob, P., Castel, B., Jubic, L. M., Salas-Gonzalez, I., Backer, M., Jones, J. D. G., Dangl, J. L., and Kasmi, F. El** (2020). Two unequally redundant "helper" immune
- receptor families mediate Arabidopsis thaliana intracellular "sensor" immune receptor functions. *PLoS Biol* **18**:e3000783.
- **Santner, A., and Estelle, M.** (2007). The JAZ proteins link jasmonate perception with transcriptional changes. *Plant Cell* **19**:3839–3842.
- **Saucet, S. B., Esmenjaud, D., and Van Ghelder, C.** (2021). Integrity of the Post-LRR Domain Is Required for TIR-NB-LRR Function. *Molecular Plant-Microbe Interactions* **34**:286–296.
- **Saupe, S. J.** (2020). Amyloid Signaling in Filamentous Fungi and Bacteria. *Annu Rev Microbiol* **74**:673–691.
- **Schornack, S., and Kamoun, S.** (2023). EVO-MPMI: From fundamental science to practical applications. *Curr Opin Plant Biol* **76**:102469.
- **Scott, A. D., Zimin, A. V., Puiu, D., Workman, R., Britton, M., Zaman, S., Caballero, M., Read, A. C., Bogdanove, A. J., Burns, E., et al.** (2020). A Reference Genome Sequence for Giant Sequoia. *G3 Genes|Genomes|Genetics* **10**:3907–3919.
- **Shao, Z.-Q., Xue, J.-Y., Wu, P., Zhang, Y.-M., Wu, Y., Hang, Y.-Y., Wang, B., and Chen, J.- Q.** (2016). Large-scale analyses of angiosperm nucleotide-binding site-leucine-rich repeat genes reveal three anciently diverged classes with distinct evolutionary patterns. *Plant Physiol* **170**:2095–2109.
- **Shao, Z.-Q., Xue, J. Y., Wang, Q., Wang, B., and Chen, J. Q.** (2018). Revisiting the Origin of Plant NBS-LRR Genes. *Trends Plant Sci* **24**:9–12.
- **Shimizu, T., Nakano, T., Takamizawa, D., Desaki, Y., Ishii-Minami, N., Nishizawa, Y., Minami, E., Okada, K., Yamane, H., Kaku, H., et al.** (2010). Two LysM receptor molecules, CEBiP and OsCERK1, cooperatively regulate chitin elicitor signaling in rice. *The Plant Journal* **64**:204–214.
- **Shiu, S. H., and Bleecker, A. B.** (2001). Receptor-like kinases from Arabidopsis form a monophyletic gene family related to animal receptor kinases. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **98**:10763–10768.
- **Shiu, S. H., and Bleecker, A. B.** (2003). Expansion of the Receptor-Like Kinase/Pelle Gene Family and Receptor-Like Proteins in Arabidopsis. *Plant Physiol* **132**:530–543.
- **Singh, S., Davies, K. M., Chagné, D., and Bowman, J. L.** (2023). The fate of sex chromosomes during the evolution of monoicy from dioicy in liverworts. *Current Biology* **33**:3597-3609.e3.
- **Smith, S. E., and Read, D.** (2008). *Mycorrhizal Symbiosis, Third Edition*. Elsevier.
- **Stevenson, J. A.** (1945). Ferns and Fungi. *Am Fern J* **35**:97–104.
- **Strullu-Derrien, C., Kenrick, P., and Knoll, A. H.** (2019). The Rhynie chert. *Current biology* **29**:R1218–R1223.
- **Strullu-Derrien, C., Goral, T., Spencer, A. R. T., Kenrick, P., Catherine Aime, M., Gaya, E., and Hawksworth, D. L.** (2023). A fungal plant pathogen discovered in the Devonian Rhynie Chert. *Nat Commun* **14**:7932.
- **Takeda, K., and Akira, S.** (2015). Toll-Like Receptors. *Curr Protoc Immunol* **109**:14.12.1- 14.12.10.
- **Tamborski, J., and Krasileva, K.** (2020). Evolution of Plant NLR Immune Receptors: From Natural History to Precise Modifications. *Annu Rev Plant Biol* **71**:335–378.
- **Taylor, A. T. N., Remy, W., Hass, H., Kerp, H., Mycologia, S., and Aug, N. J.** (1995). Mycological Society of America Fossil Arbuscular Mycorrhizae from the Early Devonian. *Mycologia* **87**:560–573.
- **Thaler, J. S., Humphrey, P. T., and Whiteman, N. K.** (2012). Evolution of jasmonate and salicylate signal crosstalk. *Trends Plant Sci* **17**:260–270.
- **Tong, Z. Bin, Gold, L., Pfeifer, K. E., Dorward, H., Lee, E., Bondy, C. A., Dean, J., and Nelson, L. M.** (2000). Mater, a maternal effect gene required for early embryonic development in mice. *Nat Genet* **26**:267–268.
- **Toome, M., Ohm, R. A., Riley, R. W., James, T. Y., Lazarus, K. L., Henrissat, B., Albu, S., Boyd, A., Chow, J., Clum, A., et al.** (2014). Genome sequencing provides insight into 1462 the reproductive biology, nutritional mode and ploidy of the fern pathogen Mixia osmundae. *New Phytologist* **202**:554–564.
- **Tran, D. T. N., Chung, E. H., Habring-Müller, A., Demar, M., Schwab, R., Dangl, J. L., Weigel, D., and Chae, E.** (2017). Activation of a Plant NLR Complex through Heteromeric Association with an Autoimmune Risk Variant of Another NLR. *Current Biology* **27**:1148–1160.
- **Upson, J. L., Zess, E. K., Białas, A., Wu, C.-H., and Kamoun, S.** (2018). The coming of age of EvoMPMI: evolutionary molecular plant–microbe interactions across multiple timescales. *Curr Opin Plant Biol* **44**:108–116.
- **Urbach, J. M., and Ausubel, F. M.** (2017). The NBS-LRR architectures of plant R-proteins and metazoan NLRs evolved in independent events. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **114**:1063–1068.
- **Valanne, S., Wang, J.-H., and Rämet, M.** (2011). The Drosophila Toll Signaling Pathway. *The Journal of Immunology* **186**:649–656.
- **Van Der Biezen, E. A., and Jones, J. D. G.** (1998). Plant disease-resistance proteins and the gene-for-gene concept. *Trends Biochem Sci* **23**:454–456.
- **van Velzen, R., Holmer, R., Bu, F., Rutten, L., van Zeijl, A., Liu, W., Santuari, L., Cao, Q., Sharma, T., Shen, D., et al.** (2018). Comparative genomics of the nonlegume Parasponia reveals insights into evolution of nitrogen-fixing rhizobium symbioses. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **115**:E4700–E4709.
- **Wan, T., Liu, Z. M., Li, L. F., Leitch, A. R., Leitch, I. J., Lohaus, R., Liu, Z. J., Xin, H. P., Gong, Y. B., Liu, Y., et al.** (2018). A genome for gnetophytes and early evolution of seed plants. *Nat Plants* **4**:82–89.
- **Wan, L., Essuman, K., Anderson, R. G., Sasaki, Y., Monteiro, F., Chung, E.-H., Osborne Nishimura, E., DiAntonio, A., Milbrandt, J., Dangl, J. L., et al.** (2019). TIR domains of plant immune receptors are NAD+-cleaving enzymes that promote cell death. *Science* **365**:799–803.
- **Wan, T., Liu, Z., Leitch, I. J., Xin, H., Maggs-Kölling, G., Gong, Y., Li, Z., Marais, E., Liao, Y., Dai, C., et al.** (2021). The Welwitschia genome reveals a unique biology underpinning extreme longevity in deserts. *Nat Commun* **12**:4247.
- **Wang, Y., Zhang, Y., Wang, Z., Zhang, X., and Yang, S.** (2013). A missense mutation in CHS1, a TIR-NB protein, induces chilling sensitivity in Arabidopsis. *The Plant Journal* **75**:553–565.
- **Wang, J., Hu, M., Wang, J., Qi, J., Han, Z., Wang, G., Qi, Y., Wang, H.-W., Zhou, J.-M., and Chai, J.** (2019a). Reconstitution and structure of a plant NLR resistosome conferring immunity. *Science* **364**:eaav5870.
- **Wang, J., Wang, J., Hu, M., Qi, J., Wang, G., Han, Z., Qi, Y., Wang, H.-W., Zhou, J.-M., and Chai, J.** (2019b). Ligand-triggered allosteric ADP release primes a plant NLR complex. *Science* **364**:eaav5868.
- **Westerveld, G. H., Korver, C. M., van Pelt, A. M. M., Leschot, N. J., van der Veen, F., Repping, S., and Lombardi, M. P.** (2006). Mutations in the testis-specific NALP14 gene in men suffering from spermatogenic failure. *Human Reproduction* **21**:3178–3184.
- **Wickell, D., Kuo, L. Y., Yang, H. P., Dhabalia Ashok, A., Irisarri, I., Dadras, A., de Vries, S., de Vries, J., Huang, Y. M., Li, Z., et al.** (2021). Underwater CAM photosynthesis elucidated by Isoetes genome. *Nat Commun* **12**:6348.
- **Winter, P. S., Bowman, C. E., Villani, P. J., Dolan, T. E., and Hauck, N. R.** (2014). Systemic Acquired Resistance in Moss: Further Evidence for Conserved Defense Mechanisms in Plants. *PLoS One* **9**:e101880.
- **Woudstra, Y., Tumas, H., Van Ghelder, C., Hung, T. H., Ilska, J. J., Girardi, S., Hara, S. A. ', Mclean, P., Cottrell, J., Bohlmann, J., et al.** (2023). Conifers concentrate large numbers of NLR immune receptor genes on one chromosome. *bioRxiv* doi:10.1101/2023.10.20.563305.
- **Wroblewski, T., Spiridon, L., Martin, E. C., Petrescu, A.-J., Cavanaugh, K., Jose-Truco, M., Xu, H., Gozdowski, D., Pawłowski, K., Michelmore, R. W., et al.** (2018). Genome- wide functional analyses of plant coiled – coil NLR-type pathogen receptors reveal essential roles of their N-terminal domain in oligomerization, networking, and immunity. *PLoS Biol* **16**:e2005821.
- **Wu, Z., Li, M., Dong, O. X., Xia, S., Liang, W., Bao, Y., Wasteneys, G., and Li, X.** (2019). Differential regulation of TNL-mediated immune signaling by redundant helper CNLs. *New Phytologist* **222**:938–953.
- **Wu, X., Zhang, L., Wang, X., Zhang, R., Jin, G., Hu, Y., Yang, H., Wu, Z., Ma, Y., Zhang, C., et al.** (2023). Evolutionary history of two evergreen Rhododendron species as revealed by chromosome-level genome assembly. *Front Plant Sci* **14**:1123707.
- **Xiao, S., Ellwood, S., Calis, O., Patrick, E., Li, T., Coleman, M., and Turner, J. G.** (2001). Broad-spectrum mildew resistance in Arabidopsis thaliana mediated by RPW8. *Science* **291**:118–120.
- **Xie, D. X., Feys, B. F., James, S., Nieto-Rostro, M., and Turner, J. G.** (1998). COI1: An Arabidopsis gene required for jasmonate-regulated defense and fertility. *Science* **280**:1091–1094.

 **Xue, J.-Y., Zhao, T., Liu, Y., Liu, Y., Zhang, Y.-X., Zhang, G.-Q., Chen, H., Zhou, G.-C., Zhang, S.-Z., and Shao, Z.-Q.** (2020). Genome- Wide Analysis of the Nucleotide Binding Site Leucine-Rich Repeat Genes of Four Orchids Revealed Extremely Low Numbers of Disease Resistance Genes. *Front Genet* **10**:10.3389/fgene.2019.01286.

- **Yotsui, I., Matsui, H., Miyauchi, S., Iwakawa, H., Melkonian, K., Schlüter, T., Michavila, S., Kanazawa, T., Nomura, Y., Stolze, S. C., et al.** (2023). LysM-mediated signaling in Marchantia polymorpha highlights the conservation of pattern-triggered immunity in land plants. *Current Biology* **33**:3732-3746.e8.
- **Yu, D., Song, W., Tan, E. Y. J., Liu, L., Cao, Y., Jirschitzka, J., Li, E., Logemann, E., Xu, C., Huang, S., et al.** (2022a). TIR domains of plant immune receptors are 2′,3′- cAMP/cGMP synthetases mediating cell death. *Cell* **185**:2370-2386.e18.
- **Yu, J., Cai, Y., Zhu, Y., Zeng, Y., Dong, S., Zhang, K., Wang, S., Li, L., Goffinet, B., Liu, H., et al.** (2022b). Chromosome-Level Genome Assemblies of Two Hypnales (Mosses) Reveal High Intergeneric Synteny. *Genome Biol Evol* **14**:evac020.
- **Yu, J. G., Tang, J. Y., Wei, R., Lan, M. F., Xiang, R. C., Zhang, X. C., and Xiang, Q. P.** (2023). The first homosporous lycophyte genome revealed the association between the recent dynamic accumulation of LTR-RTs and genome size variation. *Plant Mol Biol* **112**:325–340.
- **Yuan, M., Jiang, Z., Bi, G., Nomura, K., Liu, M., He, S. Y., Zhou, J. M., and Xin, X. F.** (2021). Pattern-recognition receptors are required for NLR-mediated plant immunity. *Nature* doi:10.1101/2020.04.10.031294.
- **Yuen, B., Bayes, J. M., and Degnan, S. M.** (2014). The characterization of sponge NLRs provides insight into the origin and evolution of this innate immune gene family in animals. *Mol Biol Evol* **31**:106–120.
- **Zdrzałek, R., Stone, C., De la Concepcion, J. C., Banfield, M. J., and Bentham, A. R.** (2023). Pathways to engineering plant intracellular NLR immune receptors. *Curr Opin Plant Biol* **74**:102380.
- **Zhang, X., Dong, W., Sun, J., Feng, F., Deng, Y., He, Z., Oldroyd, G. E. D., and Wang, E.** (2015). The receptor kinase CERK1 has dual functions in symbiosis and immunity signalling. *The Plant Journal* **81**:258–267.
- **Zhang, J., Fu, X. X., Li, R. Q., Zhao, X., Liu, Y., Li, M. H., Zwaenepoel, A., Ma, H., Goffinet, B., Guan, Y. L., et al.** (2020). The hornwort genome and early land plant evolution. *Nat Plants* **6**:107–118.
- **Zhao, Y. P., Fan, G., Yin, P. P., Sun, S., Li, N., Hong, X., Hu, G., Zhang, H., Zhang, F. M., Han, J. D., et al.** (2019). Resequencing 545 ginkgo genomes across the world reveals the evolutionary history of the living fossil. *Nat Commun* **10**:4201.
- **Zipfel, C., and Oldroyd, G. E. D.** (2017). Plant signalling in symbiosis and immunity. *Nature* **543**:328–336.
- **Zipfel, C., Kunze, G., Chinchilla, D., Caniard, A., Jones, J. D. G., Boller, T., and Felix, G.** (2006). Perception of the Bacterial PAMP EF-Tu by the Receptor EFR Restricts Agrobacterium-Mediated Transformation. *Cell* **125**:749–760.
- 
- 
- **Figure legends**
- **Figure 1**: STANDS are diverse in plants, other eukaryotes and bacteria

 This figure displays some NLRs mentioned in this review. Some other domains not discussed in the text but mentioned in the literature cited in this review are indicated below the cartoons for each clade. '… ?' indicates that other domains may exist for a given clade, but their diversity has not been fully explored yet. In plants, α-β hydrolase (Hyd.) and kinase (Kin.) signalling domains are specific to bryophytes. General domains terms are: CC (coiled-coil), G10 (G10 coiled-coil), Kin. (kinase), Hyd. (hydrolase), Nuc. (nuclease). Domains with an 1582 InterPro entry [\(www.ebi.ac.uk/interpro\)](http://www.ebi.ac.uk/interpro) are: RPW8 [\(IPR008808\)](https://www.ebi.ac.uk/interpro/entry/InterPro/IPR008808/), [\(IPR000157\)](https://www.ebi.ac.uk/interpro/entry/InterPro/IPR000157/), CARD [\(IPR001315\)](https://www.ebi.ac.uk/interpro/entry/InterPro/IPR001315/), PYD [\(IPR004020\)](https://www.ebi.ac.uk/interpro/entry/InterPro/IPR004020/), BIR [\(IPR001370\)](https://www.ebi.ac.uk/interpro/entry/InterPro/IPR001370/), PLP (patatin-like phospholipase, [IPR002641\)](https://www.ebi.ac.uk/interpro/entry/InterPro/IPR002641/), HET [\(IPR031351\)](https://www.ebi.ac.uk/interpro/entry/InterPro/IPR031351/), CHAT [\(IPR024983\)](https://www.ebi.ac.uk/interpro/entry/InterPro/IPR024983/), NACHT [\(IPR007111\)](https://www.ebi.ac.uk/interpro/entry/InterPro/IPR007111/), NB-ARC [\(IPR002182\)](https://www.ebi.ac.uk/interpro/entry/InterPro/IPR002182/), LRR (IPR032675), TPR [\(IPR011990\)](https://www.ebi.ac.uk/interpro/entry/InterPro/IPR011990/), WD40 [\(IPR036322\)](https://www.ebi.ac.uk/interpro/entry/InterPro/IPR036322/), HEAT [\(IPR000357\)](https://www.ebi.ac.uk/interpro/entry/InterPro/IPR000357/), ANK [\(IPR036770\)](https://www.ebi.ac.uk/interpro/entry/InterPro/IPR036770/) and MORN [\(IPR003409\)](https://www.ebi.ac.uk/interpro/entry/InterPro/IPR003409/). Silhouette images are from [www.phylopic.org.](http://www.phylopic.org/) This figure is not exhaustive. For example in plants, non-canonical STANDs exist, such as truncated domains or extra Integrated Domains (ID) not displayed on this figure. It is expected that genome mining will reveal more diversity in the future.

**Figure 2**: TIR are conserved protein domain often involved in immunity

 TIR domains are present in the whole tree of life as singleton or protein domain. They are often involved in immunity but can also fulfil other functions such as neurone degeneration. They generally function as NADase but can also be adaptors in the case of Toll-like Receptors. Orange indicates supersecondary structure-forming tandem repeat domain. Yellow indicates oligomerization domain. Dark blue indicates other protein domains. Light blue indicates a TIR domain. For the figure, the crystal structure of a monomeric TIR domain of L6 (NLR from the flax plant, PDB: 3OZI) was used.

**Figure 3**: Cell surface immune receptors evolved in archeoplasids

 Phylogenetic tree of archeoplastids displaying major events of two types of cell surface immune receptors: LysM and LRR. Other types of cell surface immune receptors are not displayed on this figure. Estimated lineage divergence dates are from (Cheng et al., 2019). Besides tracheophytes, only a few genomes have been explored and it is likely that future genome comparisons will reveal a more ancient date for the events displayed, with subsequent lost in the other lineages. For example, LysM-RK were thought to be land plant specific, but a recent analyse revealed that they exit in *Charophyceae* and are lost in *Zygnematophyceae* (Yotsui et al., 2023). Light blue represents a cell from *Glaucophyta*, red from *Rhodophyta* and green from *Viridiplantae*. Silhouette images are from [www.phylopic.org.](http://www.phylopic.org/)