

# Immunobiodiversity: Conserved and specific immunity across land plants and beyond.

Baptiste Castel, Karima El Mahboubi, Christophe Jacquet, Pierre-Marc

Delaux

# ► To cite this version:

Baptiste Castel, Karima El Mahboubi, Christophe Jacquet, Pierre-Marc Delaux. Immunobiodiversity: Conserved and specific immunity across land plants and beyond.. Molecular Plant, 2024, 17 (1), pp.92-111. 10.1016/j.molp.2023.12.005 . hal-04700244

# HAL Id: hal-04700244 https://hal.science/hal-04700244v1

Submitted on 17 Sep 2024

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

# 1 Title

2 Immunobiodiversity: conserved and specific immunity across land plants and beyond.

# 3 Authors

4 Baptiste CASTEL, Karima EL MAHBOUBI, Christophe JACQUET, Pierre-Marc DELAUX

# 5 Affiliations

- 6 Laboratoire de Recherche en Sciences Végétales (LRSV), Université de Toulouse, CNRS,
- 7 UPS, Toulouse INP, Castanet-Tolosan, France.
- 8 Contact
- 9 PMD: pierre-marc.delaux@cnrs.fr

# 10 Running title

11 Diversity of immunity mechanisms

# 12 Short summary

13 Interactions between plants and microbes have been shaped by millions of years of 14 evolution. Here, we compare molecular mechanisms known in extant plant lineages, other 15 eukaryotes and bacteria, to evaluate the history of the plant immune system. We conclude 16 that our knowledge is biased toward angiosperms and propose that studying other lineages 17 will enable the discovery of novel immune mechanisms.

#### 18 Abstract

19 Angiosperms represent most of plants that human cultivate, grow and eat. However, 20 angiosperms are only one of five major land plant lineages. As a whole lineage, plants also 21 include algal groups. All these clades represent a tremendous genetic diversity, that can be 22 investigated to reveal the evolutionary history of any given mechanism. In this review, we 23 describe the current model of the plant immune system, discuss its evolution based on the 24 recent literature and propose future directions for the field. In angiosperms, plant-microbe 25 interactions have been intensively studied, revealing essential cell surface and intracellular 26 immune receptors, as well as metabolic and hormonal defence pathways. Exploring diversity 27 at the genomic and functional levels demonstrated the conservation of theses pathways 28 across land plants, and for some of them beyond plants. From the conserved mechanisms, 29 lineage-specific variations have occurred leading to diversified reservoirs of immune 30 mechanisms. In rare cases, this diversity has been harnessed and successfully transferred to 31 other species, by integration of wild immune receptors or engineering of novel forms of 32 receptors, for improved resistance to pathogens. We propose that exploring further the 33 diversity of immune mechanisms in the whole plant lineage will reveal completely novel 34 sources of resistance to be deployed in crops.

35

#### 36 Key words

37 Evolution; MPMI; immunity; plant; evoMPMI; symbiosis

#### 38 Introduction

39 During the Cambrian (542-488 million years ago, MYA), plant colonised lands, during the socalled plant terrestrialization, and rapidly split in two main lineages: the tracheophytes and 40 41 the bryophytes (Harris et al., 2022). Plant macrofossils from this time have not been 42 discovered yet. The oldest land plant macrofossils are from the Rhynie Chert in Scotland and 43 date back to the Early Devonian (420-393 MYA) (Strullu-Derrien et al., 2019; Donoghue et 44 al., 2021). These remarkably well-conserved relics represent tracheophytes, some of which 45 interacting with micro-organisms. Aglaophyton major was capable of arbuscular mycorrhizal 46 symbiosis (Taylor et al., 1995), a type of mutualistic symbiotic interaction which promotes 47 plant growth through nutrient exchanges between the plant and Glomeromycota fungi (Harrison, 2005; Smith and Read, 2008). Arbuscular mycorrhizal symbiosis is believed to 48 49 have contributed to plant terrestrialization (Rich et al., 2021). In extant plants, other types of 50 symbiotic interactions are also described including diverse mycorrhizal forms (Delaux and 51 Schornack, 2021) or the nitrogen-fixing root nodule symbiosis with diazotrophic bacteria (Oldroyd, 2013). The Rhynie Chert macrofossils of Asteroxylon mackiei display a cellular 52 53 response to filamentous pathogens (Strullu-Derrien et al., 2023), indicating that plants have 54 co-evolved with pathogenic microbes at least since the Devonian. Plants were flourishing on lands even before, as attested by the discovery of cryptospores from the Dapingian (470-467 55 56 MYA) in Argentina (Rubinstein et al., 2010). More fossils would help filling in the missing gaps 57 and better understand the biology of these ancient plants.

58 Extant land plants can be categorized in seven lineages. Three are bryophytes: 59 anthocerotophytes (horworts), bryophytes sensu stricto (mosses) and marchantiophytes (liverworts); and four are tracheophytes: lycophytes, monilophytes (ferns), gymnosperms, 60 61 and angiosperms (Morris et al., 2018). Each lineage contains diverse species, making it 62 possible to infer the history of traits. (Rich et al., 2021). The field of evolution of the molecular 63 basis of plant-microbe interaction (evoMPMI) aims at comparing immunity and symbiosis between lineages to understand their evolution (Upson et al., 2018; Delaux and Schornack, 64 65 2021; Schornack and Kamoun, 2023). One interest is eventually to describe the immune system of the first land plant. Another one is to identify the diversity of immunity mechanisms 66 and potentially transfer novel mechanisms into crop species to improve their resistance to 67 68 pests.

Angiosperms diverged from others tracheophytes during the Triassic and underwent massive
radiation during the Late Jurassic and Early Cretaceous to become the most diverse plant
lineage (Li et al., 2019). Today they represent ~450,000 of the ~500,000 land plant species,
including most of our crops (Corlett, 2016). Hence, huge efforts have been put in place to

73 understand the angiosperm immune system to propose genetic resistance in agriculture, with 74 the aim to limit the need for costly and controversial chemicals (Ngou et al., 2022a). 75 Angiosperm immunity is based on two types of receptors: some at the cell surface called Pattern-Recognition Receptors (PRRs) and some intracellular called Nucleotide-Binding (NB) 76 77 and Leucine-Rich Repeats (LRR) receptors (NLRs) (lakovidis et al., 2023). Upon activation, they trigger two signalling pathways called Pattern-Triggered Immunity (PTI) for PRR and 78 79 Effector-Triggered Immunity (ETI) for NLRs. Several mechanisms are markers of ETI and 80 PTI. They include a burst of Reactive Oxygen Species (ROS), accumulation of hormones 81 such as Salicylic Acid (SA), activation of calcium channels and calcium-dependent protein 82 kinases, which trigger in turn the phosphorylation of mitogen activated protein kinases, 83 specific transcriptional reprogramming, induction of pathogenesis-related proteins including 84 antimicrobial peptides, callose deposition or phytoalexin synthesis. The plant response might 85 eventually culminate in triggering a form of localised cell death called hypersensitive 86 response.

87 The evolution of these receptors and of the signalling pathways they drive has been studied 88 in recent years, in particular in the light of the large diversity of non-flowering plant genomes 89 which are now available, including ferns (Li et al., 2018a; Fang et al., 2022; Marchant et al., 90 2022; Huang et al., 2022b), gymnosperms (Wan et al., 2018; Zhao et al., 2019; Scott et al., 91 2020; Wan et al., 2021; Liu et al., 2022), lycophytes (Banks et al., 2011; Wickell et al., 2021; Yu et al., 2023), hornworts (Li et al., 2020), liverworts (Montgomery et al., 2020; Rich et al., 92 2021; Singh et al., 2023) and mosses (Lang et al., 2018; Yu et al., 2022b). These genomes 93 94 are essential tools to assess the evolution of known immune mechanisms and to discover 95 novel ones at the genetic level. Beyond prediction on the conservation of immunity 96 mechanisms based on genome comparisons, the research field of evoMPMI has recently put 97 efforts to describe pathosystems in bryophytes, going down to the mechanistic details (Davey 98 and Currah, 2006; Oliver et al., 2009; Carella and Schornack, 2018; Carella et al., 2019; 99 Gimenez-Ibanez et al., 2019; Matsui et al., 2019; Redkar et al., 2021; Reboledo et al., 2021; 100 Redkar et al., 2022; Moner-Ros et al., 2023). Studying the diversity of immune mechanisms, 101 genetically and functionally, also revealed similarities with other eukaryotic clades. In this 102 review, we first describe the current knowledge on plant immunity. Then we discuss the 103 conservation of these mechanisms in plants and contrast to other lineages. We also propose 104 directions to discover novel, lineage-specific, immune mechanisms that could represent 105 opportunities for improved disease resistance in crops.

# Angiosperm NLRs are major actors of the plant immune system and generally display a conserved architecture

During the 20<sup>th</sup> century, Flor proposed the gene-for-gene model to describe the genetic basis 108 109 of plant resistance to pathogens. It postulates that 'for each gene that conditions reaction in 110 the host there is a corresponding gene in the parasite that conditions pathogenicity' (Flor, 111 1971). Flor called the host factor 'resistance gene' (*R*-gene in the rest of the text) and the 112 pathogen factor 'avirulence gene'. The concept of avirulence gene is somehow incompatible 113 with the concepts of adaptive evolution, as factors promoting host immunity are predicted to 114 be eliminated over time from pathogen populations. The simplest hypothesis to explain 115 maintenance of avirulence genes is that they contribute to pathogenicity in the absence of 116 the cognate *R*-gene. This led to the hypothesis that R-proteins not necessarily monitor the 117 presence of their cognate avirulence factor, but could also guard their virulence target, in the 118 so-called 'guard model' (Van Der Biezen and Jones, 1998). These working models motivated 119 genetic screens for plant R-genes. Several of these screens pinpointed proteins from the 120 NLR family. More than 140 NLRs with their cognate effectors have been characterised so far 121 (Kourelis and Van Der Hoorn, 2018), revealing in most cases a canonical tripartite 122 architecture with conserved domains. Plant NLRs are indeed part of the bigger Signal 123 Transduction ATPase with Numerous Domains (STAND) superfamily (Jones et al., 2016). 124 STANDs are tripartite proteins consisting of (i) a variable N-terminal signalling domain (ii) a 125 central ATPase domain for activation switch and (iii) a C-terminal recognition domain forming 126 super-secondary structures (Figure 1). In plants, the C-terminal super-secondary structure is 127 often an LRR domain. NLR specifically defines STANDs with C-terminal LRRs although this 128 term is sometimes used to describe proteins with other types of C-terminal super-secondary 129 structure repeats. For plant NLRs, the central switch domain is always an NB adaptor shared 130 by Apaf-1, some *R*-gene products, and CED-4 (NB-ARC). The N-terminal signalling domain 131 can be a Toll, Interleukin-1 and some plant *R*-gene products (TIR) or a Coiled-Coil (CC), leading to diverse modes of action. TIRs are enzymes that consume oxidised Nicotinamide 132 133 Adenosine Dinucleotide (NAD+) or dsDNA/RNA to form immune signalling molecules (Yu et 134 al., 2022a; Jia et al., 2023). CCs can be classified into three monophyletic groups: 135 Resistance to Powdery mildew 8 (RPW8), G10 and others CC (referred as CC in the rest of 136 the text) (Kourelis et al., 2021). The RPW8 group specialised to function downstream of 137 others NLRs (Bonardi et al., 2011; Qi et al., 2018; Castel et al., 2019a; Wu et al., 2019). 138 Particularly, TIR-NLRs enzymatic product is recognised by the receptor Enhanced Disease 139 Susceptibility 1 (EDS1), in complex with Senescence-Associated Carboxylesterase 101 (SAG101) or phytoalexin dependent 4 (PAD4), which activates the RPW8-NLR N 140 141 Requirement Gene 1 (NRG1) or Activated Disease Resistance 1 (ADR1) respectively 142 (Feehan et al., 2020). G10-NLRs specialisation is not known yet, but they work as singletons (Lee et al., 2020). Both RPW8-NLRs and CC-NLRs can form calcium ion (Ca<sup>2+</sup>) channels at 143

the plasma membrane (Bi et al., 2021; Jacob et al., 2021). TIR and CC domains are
functional only as oligomers (Maekawa et al., 2011; Duxbury et al., 2020).

146 In their pre-activation state, NLRs are monomeric in the cytoplasm and safeguard the cell. 147 The NB-ARC is maintained in an off-state condition by binding to an ADP. When 148 encountering a cognate pathogenic effector, the NLR turns on. This activation leads to a 149 switch from adenosine diphosphate (ADP) to an adenosine triphosphate (ATP), causing 150 allosteric conformational changes. Four or five ATP-bound NLRs oligomerise and form a 151 structure called resistosome (Wang et al., 2019a; Ma et al., 2020; Martin et al., 2020). 152 Formation of the resistosome brings the TIR or CC domains into close proximity, enabling 153 signalling and initiating ETI.

154 The mechanism of NLR activation has been elucidated through research in angiosperms155 (Ngou et al., 2022a). Its conservation across the green lineage remains to be studied.

#### 156 Growing genomic knowledge reveals the range of NLR diversity

157 The sequencing and analysis of diverse plant genomes demonstrated that plant NLRs are as 158 ancient as the green lineage itself. They are found in streptophyte green algae and 159 chlorophytes and specialised as TIR-, CC- and RPW8-NLRs before the diversification of the 160 Viridiplantae (Shao et al., 2018). Besides defining the conservation of some domains, these 161 genomic analyses lead to the identification of variations in the NLR architecture. To date, 481 162 plant NLRs have been at least partly characterised, and they are not always canonical 163 (Kourelis et al., 2021). In fact, several NLRs diverge from the tripartite structure (Meyers et 164 al., 2003). Some contain extra integrated domains (Marchal et al., 2022). A common one is 165 the C-terminal jelly roll and Ig-like (C-JID), previously known as "post-LRR", found after the 166 LRR of many TIR-NLRs (Saucet et al., 2021). It is a structurally defined domain required for 167 effector recognition (Lapin et al., 2022). Other extra domains can be Kinases, WRKY, BEAF-168 and DREF-type zinc finger (BED), Heavy Metal Associated (HMA), Lin-11, Isl-1, and Mec-3 169 (LIM), or even extra TIR or extra NB-ARC. Some are thought to play a role in effector 170 recognition, acting sometimes as decoys for effectors, but it cannot be excluded that others 171 may contribute to signalling (Meyers et al., 2003; Marchal et al., 2022). Besides, some NLRs 172 lack one of the three domains. For instance, Chilling Sensitive 1 (CHS1) and TIR-NB 2 (TN2) 173 are TIR-NB only proteins, they lack an LRR, but they are functional, signalling with the full 174 TIR-NLR suppressor of chs1-2 3 (SOC3) (Liang et al., 2018). There are even functional TIR-175 only proteins, lacking NB-ARC and LRR, such as Response to HopBA1 (RBA1) that 176 contributes to immunity through EDS1-dependent HR and enzymatic activity, similarly to 177 canonical TIR-NLRs (Nishimura et al., 2016; Wan et al., 2019). RPW8 domains exist alone 178 and confer resistance to the powdery mildew fungus (after which they get named) (Xiao et 179 al., 2001), the rice blast fungus (Li et al., 2018b), the downy mildew oomycete (Ma et al., 180 2014) and some pathogenic bacteria (Li et al., 2018b; Castel et al., 2019b). Others CC, CC-181 NB, and NB-ARC alone have been identified but they are rare and their function in immunity 182 has not been tested yet (Wroblewski et al., 2018). STANDs associated with C-terminal super-183 secondary structure-forming tandem repeats others than LRR also exist in plants. For 184 instance, TNPs (short for TIR-NB-ARC-TPR) are proteins with a TIR and a NB-ARC domains 185 associated with Tetratricopeptide Repeats (TPR), instead of the canonical LRRs (Lapin et al., 186 2022). They can induce a hypersensitive response when transiently expressed in *Nicotiana* 187 tabacum leaves, a typical NLR phenotype. They do so via a signalling pathway different than 188 classic TIR-NLRs; their role in immunity requires further investigation (Johanndrees et al., 189 2023).

190 Genome comparisons across land plants revealed new structural organisations among the 191 NLR families. If genome analyses showed a strong conservation of NLR in tracheophytes, 192 there is an enhanced diversity in this family among bryophytes. Bryophytes, ferns, 193 gymnosperms and lycophytes also contain TIR-, CC- and RPW8-NLRs, just like angiosperms 194 (Liu et al., 2023). However, bryophytes also harbour specific features. They encode for NLR 195 associated with atypical N-terminal domains such as -kinases or  $\alpha/\beta$  hydrolase. They fall into 196 the same phylogenetic clade as TIR-NLRs (Gao et al., 2018; Andolfo et al., 2019). This 197 monophyly suggests that they evolved after a signalling domain swap in the TIR-NLR of 198 bryophytes. One typical response of angiosperm NLRs is a TIR-, CC- or RPW8-mediated cell 199 death activation. This feature is conserved for many tested TIR, CC and RPW8 domains of 200 NLRs from non-vascular plants such as Marchantia polymorpha, ferns and lycophytes (Chia 201 et al., 2022). In particular, a conserved group of CC-NLR, called MAEPL, is present in the 202 genome of many non-flowering plant, and triggers responses analogous to the angiosperms 203 CC-NLRs responses: hypersensitive response, transcriptional reprogramming and growth 204 inhibition (Chia et al., 2022).

#### 205 Immunity (almost) without NLR in ecologically peculiar plants

206 A survey of NLR diversity in plants revealed that their repertoire is reduced in the aquatic and 207 floating angiosperm duckweed (Lemnoideae) (Baggs et al., 2020). As duckweeds are 208 monophyletic, this NLR contraction could be a clade specificity linked to the adaptation to the 209 aquatic lifestyle. The genomes of aquatic and floating ferns also contain few NLRs compared 210 to terrestrial ferns (Liu et al., 2021). This suggests that NLR contraction is associated with 211 evolutionary distinctiveness of aquatic and floating plants. Similarly, carnivorous and parasitic 212 plant genomes encode for a low number of NLRs (Liu et al., 2021; Ngou et al., 2022b). One 213 hypothesis for the reduction of the NLR repertoires in these clades could be that aquatic

214 plants cannot be infected by aerial pathogens, reducing the spectrum of potential pathogens, 215 and thus the need for a diverse immune system. However, there are yet no evidence that 216 aquatic plants face fewer parasites than terrestrial plants. Moreover, carnivorous and 217 parasitic plants are not aquatic, so this lifestyle is not sufficient to explain the loss of NLRs. 218 An interesting hypothesis is that evolutionary distinctiveness prevents rapid host jump from 219 closely related species (Huang et al., 2015). In the case of duckweed, it would mean that 220 their floating and aquatic lifestyle prevents host jump from related terrestrial Araceae. 221 Pathogen of a given terrestrial Araceae can evolve new effectors to become compatible with 222 another terrestrial Araceae, expanding its host range. But to turn compatible with aquatic 223 Araceae, it would also require aerial to aquatic adaptation, which represents an extra step in 224 term of genetic adaptation. This hinders host jump, reducing the need for ETI in duckweed. 225 This hypothesis could be tested by comparing the microbiome of duckweeds and a closely 226 related terrestrial Araceae and assess whether gene-flow is higher within terrestrial than 227 between terrestrial and aquatic microbes. Duckweeds, carnivorous and parasitic plants also 228 share a reduction of their root system, decreasing exposure to root microbes. One can 229 imagine that it lowers the need for a diversified NLR repertoire. Conversely, it could be that 230 these plants still encounter pathogens but evolved an immune system less dependent on 231 NLRs. For example, in duckweed, the antimicrobial peptide family MiAMP1 has expanded 232 and is upregulated upon pathogen inoculation (Baggs et al., 2022). Kiwi, papaya and maize also contains fewer NLRs (Baggs et al., 2017). Here the explanation could be domestication, 233 234 dioecy, or both. Orchids also present a small number of NLRs, despite being the most 235 diverse angiosperm family (Xue et al., 2020). Orchids engage in a particular type of 236 mycorrhizal interaction (Dearnaley, 2007). For some orchids, this fungal interaction became 237 so important that the plant became achlorophyllous and myco-heterotrophic (Gebauer et al., 238 2016). The loss of NLR could be explained by the accommodation of this particular symbiont. 239 but this trend is not observed in other plant lineages that have evolved diverse mycorrhizal 240 forms (Wu et al., 2023). Understanding how orchids, duckweeds and other plant lineages 241 with limited NLR repertoire resist to pest will reveal unexplored aspect of plant immunity.

#### 242 When NLRs drive plant speciation

It is well known in agriculture that a cross between two plants can result in a bigger and more productive F1 progeny. This phenomenon is called hybrid vigour or heterosis (Lewontin et al., 2010). But the opposite can also happen, when the F1 progeny is stunted due to hybrid necrosis or hybrid incompatibility (Bomblies and Weigel, 2007). These phenomena are explained by dysregulation of the immune system. For heterosis, the defence-related hormone salicylic acid is down-regulated (Groszmann et al., 2015). For hybrid incompatibility, genetic approaches revealed that a single locus from each parent explains the stunted 250 phenotype (Chae et al., 2014). The causal genes are often alleles encoding NLR immune 251 receptors, which, when co-expressed in the same plant, cause growth detrimental effect. For 252 example, in Arabidopsis thaliana, incompatibility between accessions Uk-1 and Uk-3 is 253 explained by alleles of the NLRs Resistance to Peronospora Parasitica 1 (RPP1) in Uk-1 and 254 Suppressor of Salicylic acid Insensitive 4 (SSI4) in Uk-3 (Tran et al., 2017). Incompatibility 255 between accessions Lerik-1 and KZ10 is explained by an allele of the NLR Resistance to Peronospora Parasitica 7 (RPP7) in Lerik-1 and the atypical R-protein RPW8 in KZ10 256 257 (Barragan et al., 2019). It illustrates a simple model for allopatric speciation proposed during the early 20<sup>th</sup> century by Dobzhansky, Muller and Bateson (Orr, 1996). These authors 258 259 proposed that sexual incompatibility between two related organisms is driven by only two 260 genes, one from each parent. From an *aabb* genotype, two population evolve: to *aAbb* on the 261 one population and *aabB* on the other population. The A and the B allele are incompatible: 262 when they get expressed in the same plant, for example in an aAbb x aabB cross, the 263 resulting progeny is either dead or stunted. Over time, the two populations become 264 independent species. This model explains the presented cases of hybrid incompatibility, 265 suggesting that NLRs not only regulate plant-microbe interactions, but can also contribute to 266 the evolution of plants (Calvo-Baltanás et al., 2021).

#### 267 NLRs beyond plants

268 Although originally discovered in plants, NLRs are not specific to this lineage, and even play 269 important roles in human (Bent et al., 1994; Harton et al., 2002). In animal research, NLRs 270 stands for Nod-Like Receptors, but anyway describes STANDs with LRR. Like plant NLRs, 271 they form ADP-bound monomer, sense nonself molecules via a C-terminal LRR and, upon 272 ADP to ATP switch, form ring-shape oligomers (Duxbury et al., 2021). These oligomers are 273 called inflammasomes instead of resistosomes, as such oligomers cause caspase-1 274 inflammation in animals (Wang et al., 2019a). The central NB domain, called NACHT (named 275 after NAIP, CIITA, HET-E and TP1), is similar to the NB-ARC domain. Structurally, they are 276 both made of an NB domain, a helical domain 1 and a winged helix domain. The only 277 difference is that NACHTs also contain a second helical domain (Hu et al., 2013), lacking in 278 NB-ARCs (Wang et al., 2019b). Animal NLRs have different N-terminal signalling domains, 279 such as a caspase recruitment domain (Poyet et al., 2001) or a pyrin domain (Martinon et al., 280 2001) (Figure 1) which directly or indirectly activate caspases (Chou et al., 2023). Just like 281 plant resistosomes, animal inflammasomes sense pathogens (Miao et al., 2006) and can be 282 involved in autoimmune symptoms (Hoffman et al., 2001). Some also regulate other 283 biological functions such as embryogenesis (Tong et al., 2000) and spermatogenesis 284 (Westerveld et al., 2006). The presence of NLRs, among other STANDs, in sponges (Yuen et 285 al., 2014), the sister lineage of all other animals, indicates that they originated at least in the

286 first animal, during the Precambrian. NLR-like are also present in other eukaryotes. Genome 287 mining in fungi revealed an even greater diversity in STANDs (Dyrka et al., 2014; Loquet and 288 Saupe, 2017; Daskalov et al., 2020). They are referred as NLRs in the literature, but their C-289 terminal repeats are not LRR, unlike plants and animals. Instead, they display TPR, ankyrin 290 or WD40 repeats (Figure 1). The central domain can either be the plant-type NB-ARC or the 291 (almost identical) animal NACHT. Fungal STANDs, such as Patatin-Like Phospholipase-1 292 (PLP-1) and NACHT and WD repeat domain containing 2 (NWD2), control nonself 293 recognition to prevent hyphae fusion between incompatible strains (Heller et al., 2018; 294 Saupe, 2020). Their role in immunity is yet to be explored (Daskalov, 2023). Besides plants, 295 animals and fungi, STANDs have been mostly overlooked in other lineages. There are 296 putative genes encoding LRR-, TPR- and WD40-associated STANDs in the TSAR 297 supergroup (Telonemia, Rhizaria, Alveolata and Stramenopila) and Caspase HetF 298 Associated with TPRs (CHAT) domain with NB-ARC and LRR in Haptista and diatom 299 (Richter and Levin, 2019). In particular, brown algae, that belong to the Stramenopila, have 300 NB-TPRs, and red algae, a sister clade of the green lineage, have NB-WD40 (Andolfo et al., 301 2019) (Figure 1). These observations indicate that STANDs were already present in the 302 eukaryote most recent common ancestor. It seems that CC-NLRs and TIR-NLRs evolved 303 specifically in the green lineage. In angiosperms, TIR-NLRs were lost in monocots, while they 304 expanded in rosids. CC-NLRs instead are present in all lineages and expanded in asterids 305 (Shao et al., 2016). In bryophytes, TIR-NLRs underwent a domain swap leading to kinase-306 NLRs and  $\alpha/\beta$  hydrolase-NLRs (Andolfo et al., 2019). The evolutionary history of the other 307 eukaryotic STANDs presented here remains to be explored.

308 The recent discovery of NLR in bacteria and archaea repositions our view of NLR evolution 309 (Gao et al., 2022; Kibby et al., 2023). Bacteria can be attacked by pathogens such as viral 310 bacteriophages. The description of an antiphage system, clustered and regularly interspaced 311 palindromic repeats (CRISPR), led to a revolutionary genome editing tool. In this context, 312 Gao et al. looked for NLR homologues in bacterial genomes (Gao et al., 2022). They found 313 four classes that they called antiviral STAND (Avs): Avs1, Avs2, Avs3 and Avs4. They all have 314 a central ATPase domain homologous to NACHT and NB-ARC, C-terminal TPR domains and 315 a N-terminal enzymatic domains. The N-terminal domain is most often a nuclease, but 316 sometimes a protease, a TIR, a CMP-hydrolase, transmembrane helixes or a sirtuin. Avs can 317 form oligomeric structures upon recognition of specific viral proteins, similar to 318 inflammasomes and resistosomes. Each class likely evolved independently as they are 319 phylogenetically distant (Gao et al., 2022). Independently, Kibby et al. searched for novel 320 antiphage systems by looking at uncharacterised genes from "defence island" loci in bacteria 321 (Kibby et al., 2023). They found a gene encoding for a NACHT-containing protein in

322 Klebsiella pneumoniae inducing phage resistance in Escherichia coli. Therefore, they 323 conducted a systematic mining for NACHT in bacteria and found ~15,000 of them. These 324 domains are ultimately quite common, particularly among cyanobacteria, actinobacteria and 325 deltaproteobacteria (Kibby et al., 2023). There is co-evolution between the central NACHT 326 and the C-terminal sensor, but not the N-terminal signalling domain. At the C-terminus, they 327 carry super-secondary structure-forming tandem repeats such as LRR, TPR like in plants, 328 but also HEAT (for Huntingtin, elongation factor 3 [EF3], protein phosphatase 2A [PP2A], and 329 the yeast kinase TOR1) repeats (Kibby et al., 2023). At the N-terminus, they contain TIRs like 330 in plants, but also nucleases, peptidases, sirtuins and domains of unknown function (Figure 331 1). Some of these domains could be involved in protein-protein interactions rather than acting 332 as enzymes. This corroborates the role of NACHT / NB-ARC as adaptors between C-terminal 333 sensor repeats and N-terminal immune signalling domains.

334 Fusion of a C-terminal super-secondary structure and an N-terminal signalling domain to a 335 central NB domain, the characteristic of STANDs, occurred several times independently in 336 the tree of life (Dyrka et al., 2014; Urbach and Ausubel, 2017; Gao et al., 2022). Besides, 337 they can play a role in defence against non-self (Figure 1). Hence, we propose that they 338 emerged at early stage of life diversification to protect from biotic stress. Plant NLRs (as 339 STANDs with LRR) are monophyletic and they share a different origin than other plants 340 STANDs, such as TPRs or armadillo (ARM)-associated STANDs (Andolfo et al., 2019; 341 Johanndrees et al., 2023). They also share a different origin than metazoan NLRs (Urbach 342 and Ausubel, 2017). We discuss here many STANDs characterised as immune signaller but 343 they can regulate other functions. Some human NLRs regulate embryogenesis (NLR-pyrin 5, 344 NRLP5) and spermatogenesis (NLR-pyrin 14, NRLP14) (Tong et al., 2000; Westerveld et al., 345 2006; Chou et al., 2023). Some plant NLRs could regulate tolerance to abiotic stress, as 346 mutants of the TIR-NLR encoding genes White Rust Resistance 4A (WRR4A)/Activated 347 Disease Resistance 2 (ADR2) and CHS1 are more resistant to UV stress (Piofczyk et al., 348 2015) and cold temperature respectively (Wang et al., 2013). In addition, STANDs often 349 regulate programmed cell death (Tamborski and Krasileva, 2020), but there are exceptions. 350 For example, in A. thaliana, ADR1 is required for immunity upon recognition of the bacterial 351 effector AvrRps4 but not for cell death (Castel et al., 2019a). Extrapolating from the current 352 state of research, the common feature of STANDs is to sense modifications of the 353 environment through a C-terminal super-secondary structure, and to bring in close proximity 354 several N-terminal signalling domains for execution of a response. The thorough description 355 of more STANDs will highlight the specialisation and convergent evolution of these proteins.

#### 356 TIRs are present across the tree of life and often regulate immunity

357 TIR is the signalling domain of many NLRs, from prokaryotes to eukaryotes (Figure 2). It 358 plays a central role in immunity, even beyond NLRs. TIRs were discovered in the 1990s. A 359 striking ~200 amino acids homologous region was observed between Toll, Interleukin-1 and 360 some plant R-gene products, and was subsequently named TIR (Parnet et al., 1996; 361 Hammond-Kosack and Jones, 1997). It happens that these three proteins regulate immunity. 362 Toll was first identified in Drosophila as a regulator of embryogenesis; its main role in 363 defence against fungi was later revealed (Valanne et al., 2011). It is a transmembrane protein 364 with an extracellular LRR sensing domain and an intracellular TIR signalling domain. Its 365 homologues in human are Toll-like Receptors (TLRs), which sense non-self through their 366 extracellular variable domain and induce immune response through their intracellular TIR 367 domain (Akira and Takeda, 2004). In plants, TIR are mostly found as the N-terminus 368 signalling domain of some NLRs, particularly in Rosids (Shao et al., 2016). For a long time, 369 the major known features of plant TIRs were that they can dimerize and signal via the protein 370 EDS1 (Parker et al., 1996; Bernoux et al., 2011). A breakthrough in TIR research was the 371 discovery that Sterile Alpha and TIR Motif-containing protein 1 (SARM1), a TIR-containing 372 regulator of neuron degeneration, is an enzyme capable of hydrolysing NAD+ (Essuman et 373 al., 2017). This piece of research enabled to demonstrate that plant TIR can also catalyse 374 NAD+ degradation (Horsefield et al., 2019; Wan et al., 2019). In parallel, it was shown that 375 effector recognition induces TIR-NLR tetramerization and assembles the four TIRs in 376 proximity (Ma et al., 2020; Martin et al., 2020). They associate to form two asymmetric 377 homodimers, creating two composite catalytic sites. EDS1, in heterodimer with PAD4 or 378 SAG101, is the receptor of some TIR catalytic products: pRib-AMP or pRib-ADP for EDS1-379 PAD4 (Huang et al., 2022a), and di-ADPR or ADPr-ATP for EDS1-SAG101 (Jia et al., 2022). Ligand-bound EDS1-PAD4 or EDS1-SAG101 activate the RPW8-NLRs ADR1 or NRG1 380 381 respectively, resulting in a similar transcriptional response as one observed upon CC-NLR 382 activation (Saile et al., 2020). Bacteria also have a defence system based on TIR: Thoeris 383 (Ths). It relies on two TIR-containing proteins: ThsB and ThsA. Upon phage infection, ThsB 384 converts NAD+ to an isomer of cADPR. This product activates ThsA leading to depletion of 385 NAD+, and ultimately cell death (Ofir et al., 2021). NAD+ depletion is also the cause of 386 SARM1-mediated cell death, but it is not required for plant TIR-mediated cell death (Duxbury 387 et al., 2020). Some phages can inactivate Thoeris by sequestering the TIR molecular 388 product, through the viral encoded protein Tad1 (Leavitt et al., 2022). Similarly, the plant 389 pathogen effectors HopAM1 and HopBY contain TIRs that can highjack the NAD metabolism 390 to suppress host TIR-mediated immunity (Eastman et al., 2022; Hulin et al., 2023). By 391 contrast, some animal TIRs, such as TLRs, function as adaptor for protein-protein interaction 392 rather than enzymes (Takeda and Akira, 2015). The ancient TIR domain shows conserved

- and divergent function and perfectly illustrates the concept that starting with identical building
- blocks, immunity has evolved in different directions leading to diversified mechanisms.

#### **Pikobodies: introgression of the animal adaptive immunity into plants**

396 Customizing NLR receptors to enhance their recognition spectra represents an opportunity to 397 improve crop resistance (Zdrzałek et al., 2023). One elegant approach proposed to equip 398 plant with a part of the animal adaptive immune system, leading to the development of the 399 pikobodies (Kourelis et al., 2023). By contrast with plants that rely solely on genetically 400 encoded immune receptors, each generally conferring resistance to a limited range of 401 pathogens, vertebrates evolved a singular adaptive immune system: it generates a myriad of 402 antibodies capable of recognising virtually any antigen (Cooper and Alder, 2006). Antibodies 403 are combinations of protein chains defined by their length and their degree of conservation. 404 Heavy chain-only Antibodies (HcAb) were isolated from camelids and triggered interest for 405 their simple structure (Bao et al., 2021). They contain constant heavy chains and a variable 406 domain binding the antigen: the nanobody. Pikobodies are fusions between Pikm-1 and 407 nanobodies. Pikm-1 is an NLR immune receptor from rice with an HMA recognition domain 408 (De la Concepcion et al., 2021). This HMA binds effectors from the rice blast fungus 409 Magnaporthe oryzae, causing Pikm-1 to form a complex with a related NLR: Pikm-2. The 410 effector-Pikm-1-Pikm-2 complex then initiates immune signalling. Kourelis et al. had the 411 brilliant idea to replace the HMA by a nanobody to test if it could recognise its cognate 412 antigen (Kourelis et al., 2023). NLRs are sensitive to even subtle changes, and many 413 constructs were auto-active, or loss-of-function. After several trials, Kourelis et al. finally 414 engineered pikobodies with nanobodies binding Green Fluorescent Protein (GFP) or 415 mCherry, that were able to induce an immune response specifically in the presence of GFP 416 or mCherry respectively (Kourelis et al., 2023). These pikobodies were expressed in 417 Nicotiana benthamiana and the plants turned indeed resistant to viruses expressing GFP or 418 mCherry.

Plants evolved immune receptors with integrated domains capable of both recognising effectors and triggering an immune response. There is a relatively high diversity of integrated domains (Marchal et al., 2022), but still limited compared to the billions of human antibodies (Alberts et al., 2002). Pikobodies illustrate that scientists can combine knowledge on the divergent evolution of the immune systems from two lineages to engineer novel pathogen recognition capabilities in plants.

#### 425 Some immune receptors are at the cell surface

426 Cells harbour at their surface proteins that can sense and respond to their environment, such 427 as a pathogen invasion. In most eukaryotes, they are generally G protein-coupled receptors 428 (GPCRs) (Hanlon and Andrew, 2015). In plants, the most diversified plant cell surface 429 receptors belong to the receptor-kinase (RK, also known as Receptor-Like Kinase, RLK) and 430 receptor-protein (RP also known as Receptor-Like Protein, RLP) families (Bender and Zipfel, 431 2023). These receptors combine an extracellular sensor domain and a single transmembrane 432 domain. The extracellular domain is often an LRR but other domains have been identified 433 such as S-domain, cell-Wall Associated Kinase (WAK), Cysteine-Rich Repeat (CRR, also 434 known as DUF26), L-Lectin, Malectin, extensin, Lysin Motif (LysM), C-lectin, thaumatin, 435 tumor necrosis factor receptor, NHL (NCL-1, HT2A and Lin-41) repeats, WD40 repeats, U 436 Box, and Pathogenesis-Related (PR-1) domains (Dievart et al., 2020; Gong and Han, 2021). 437 In addition, RKs also carry an intracellular kinase domain, while RPs do not. RPs and RKs 438 which are specialised in pathogen detection often recognise conserved pathogen molecules 439 known as Pathogen-Associated Molecular Patterns (PAMPs). Therefor they are also referred 440 as Pattern Recognition Receptors (PRRs). These receptors activate an immune signalling 441 pathway, known as Pattern Triggered Immunity (PTI) (Jones and Dangl, 2006). In 1994, the 442 RP Cladosporium fulvum 9 (Cf-9) was the first cell surface receptor identified as an immune 443 receptor (Jones et al., 1994). Cf-9 harbours an extracellular LRR domain and confers 444 resistance to the fungus *Cladosporium fulvum* in tomato. Since this first discovery, more than 445 60 RPs/RKs from diverse plant species have been shown to participate in sensing varieties 446 of pathogens (Dievart et al., 2020; Ngou et al., 2022a). For instance, the LRR-RKs Flagellin 447 Sensing 2 (FLS2) and Elongation Factor Tu Recognition (EFR) recognise flagellin and a 448 bacterial elongation factor epitope respectively (Gómez-Gómez and Boller, 2000; Zipfel et al., 449 2006), the LysM-RK Chitin Elicitor Receptor Kinase 1 (CERK1) recognises the fungal cell 450 wall constituent chitin (Shimizu et al., 2010) while the LRR-RP Receptor-Like Protein 23 451 (RLP23) recognises epitopes from a superfamily of proteins from bacteria, fungi and 452 oomycetes known as Necrosis- and ethylene-inducing peptide 1-Like Protein (NLP) (Albert et 453 al., 2015). Although many of these PRRs vary across linages, some of them seem to have 454 experienced strong purifying selection during plant evolution, as they are maintained across 455 diverse plant lineages (Figure 3). The best studied example is the LysM-RK CERK1 which 456 recognises chitin, leading to immune responses, in angiosperms (Miya et al., 2007; Bozsoki 457 et al., 2017) and bryophytes (Bressendorff et al., 2016; Yotsui et al., 2023). RPs, which lack a 458 kinase, can associate with an RK for signalling. For instance, LRR-RPs (such as RLP23) 459 generally associate with Suppressor Of [[Brassinosteroid Insensitive 1 (BRI1)]-associated 460 kinase 1 (BAK1)]-Interactive RK 1 (SOBIR1) to form a complete signalling unit (Albert et al., 461 2015). Interestingly, glaucophytes, rhodophytes and many green algae lineages encode for 462 diverse LRR-RPs but lack SOBIR1, suggesting that other mechanisms exist (Ngou et al., 463 2023).

464 PRRs generally recruit RK coreceptors to form an active signalling complex. For example, 465 FLS2, EFR or RLP23-SOBIR1 associate with the LRR-RK BAK1 (also known as Somatic 466 Embryogenesis Receptor Kinase 3, SERK3) (Chinchilla et al., 2009), and CERK1 associates 467 with the LysM-RP Chitin Elicitor Binding Protein (CEBiP) in rice or LysM-RK 5 (LYK5) in A. 468 thaliana (Shimizu et al., 2010; Cao et al., 2014). The combinatorial nature of these receptor 469 complexes suggests that a large diversity of associations may occur in response to diverse 470 environmental triggers and might be spatially and temporally controlled. As an example, the 471 FLS2 receptor leads to different behaviour when its expression pattern is disturbed in a 472 spatial manner (Emonet et al., 2021). It can be anticipated that each plant lineage also 473 evolved diverse combinations of receptors, regulated in a multitude of ways. We thus 474 propose that an exponential number of complexes will be discovered when exploring the 475 entire plant diversity. This diversification, driven by coevolution, represents a source of 476 biotechnology potential for the transfer of resistance, as exemplified by the increased 477 resistance of Solanaceae to a range of pathogenic bacteria following the transfer of the EFR 478 receptor from A. thaliana (Lacombe et al., 2010).

479 Upon activation at the cell surface, it has been demonstrated in several angiosperms that 480 PRR complexes phosphorylate intracellular Receptor-Like Cytoplasmic Kinases (RLCKs), 481 particularly those of the subfamily RLCK VII such as Avr9/Cf-9 Induced Kinase 1 (ACIK1) or 482 Botrytis-Induced Kinase (BIK1) (Rowland et al., 2005; Lu et al., 2010a). RLCKs are a large 483 sub-group of RKs that lack ectodomains, and in most cases the transmembrane domain too, 484 and are considered cytoplasmic. Specific phosphorylation of RLCKs activates downstream immune signalling such as callose deposition, Ca<sup>2+</sup> flux, ROS burst and a PTI-specific 485 486 transcriptional reprogramming (Couto and Zipfel, 2016). Particularly, flg22-recognition by the 487 RK FLS2 results in (1) formation of a complex between FLS2 and BAK1 (Chinchilla et al., 488 2007), (2) activation by FLS2-BAK1 of the RLCK BIK1 (Lu et al., 2010b) and (3) activation by 489 BIK1 of the NADPH oxidase Respiratory Burst Oxidase Homologue D (RBOHD) responsible 490 for the ROS burst (Kadota et al., 2014). Although part of these responses is PAMP-specific, 491 such as PAMP perception itself which is receptor-dependent, most of them are similar and 492 converge from diverse pathways on conserved integrators, such as BIK1 (Bjornson et al., 493 2021). A recent breakthrough in our understanding of the evolution of this pathway was the 494 discovery that BIK1-RBOHD-mediated PTI is a conserved and ancient immune pathway, as it 495 is present in both A. thaliana and M. polymorpha, which diverged 450 million years ago 496 during land plant colonisation (Chu et al., 2023; Yotsui et al., 2023). This conserved activation 497 of immunity responses following PAMP activation is also described in the moss 498 Physcomitrium patens indicating a wide conservation (Bressendorff et al., 2016). In addition 499 to its positive activation, negative feedback loops acting on PTI have been described in A.

500 *thaliana*, such as the phosphorylation of BIK1 by Calcium-dependent Protein Kinase 28 501 (CPK28) which regulates its turnover (Monaghan et al., 2015). As auto-immunity imposes a 502 significant fitness cost to plants, one may speculate that the conservation of these immune 503 homeostasis mechanisms has been essential during plant evolution, although this concept 504 remains to be tested. This hypothesis can be tested in the future using reverse genetics in 505 model bryophytes, such as in *Marchantia sp.* in which the immune function of BIK1-RBOHD 506 has been demonstrated (Chu et al., 2023).

#### 507 Genomes of extant plants shed light on the evolution of RK and RP

508 The ectodomain of PRRs is variable (Dievart et al., 2020; Gong and Han, 2021). Because of 509 this domain diversity, reconstructing the evolutionary history of this superfamily has proven 510 challenging. By contrast, the more conserved kinase domain is suitable to elucidate the 511 evolution of RKs. Plant genomes encode for hundreds of RKs (e.g. ~615 in A. thaliana), 512 which can be classified into 46 subfamilies (Shiu and Bleecker, 2003). Twelve subfamilies (I 513 to XII) encompass RLCKs, while 34 encompass kinases associated with specific ectodomains (including 15 with LRR). The specificities between the kinases and the 514 515 ectodomains phylogenies indicate that coevolution, more than domain shuffling, drives the 516 specialisation of RKs (Man et al., 2023).

517 A presence / absence analysis of each family in plant genomes has enabled dating the 518 emergence of the diverse clades known in angiosperms (Dievart et al., 2020). The presumed 519 absence of RKs in chlorophytic algae suggests that RKs diversified during the radiation of 520 the streptophytes (Dievart et al., 2020). One alternative hypothesis would be that RKs pre-521 dated the diversification of the Viridiplantae and were subsequently lost specifically in 522 chlorophytes. Dievart et al. proposed that LRR-RKs and LysM-RKs evolved before the split 523 between streptophyte algae and embryophytes, a hypothesis supported by phylogenetic 524 analyses (Delaux et al., 2015; Nishiyama et al., 2018). In contrast, they proposed that WAK-525 RKs emerged along the colonisation of land, in embryophytes (Dievart et al., 2020). A recent 526 study challenges this last assumption, identifying WAK-RPs in chlorophytes. The authors 527 suggest that WAK-RKs predated terrestrialization but were lost multiple times in streptophyte 528 algae, and expanded in tracheophytes (Ngou et al., 2023). These observations indicate that 529 a mix of ancestral and convergent gains followed by lineage-specific losses occurred in this 530 complex family. How these gains originated is an exciting question in the field. One possible 531 model for the gain of RPs and RKs is that (1) intracellular receptor domains pre-exist, (2) 532 gain a transmembrane domain and (3) gain an intracellular kinase domain by chromosome 533 rearrangement. RPs still co-exist with RKs in many plants (Figure 3) indicating that this 534 putative model is not going from a 'less evolved' toward a 'better evolved' mechanism.

Instead, both intracellular receptor domains, RPs and RKs can undergo various modifications
resulting in the extant diversity (Ngou et al., 2023). This evolutionary model implies that other
type of RKs probably evolved in each plant lineage, including chlorophytes, and remain to be
discovered and described by exploring a wider diversity of Viridiplantae genomes.

#### 539 **PTI and ETI are part of an integrated and conserved immunity pathway**

540 ETI and PTI were first conceptualized as separate pathways, but it appears that they 541 potentiate each other and can be considered as two parts of a single immunity pathway. This 542 novel concept comes from two observations (Ngou et al., 2021; Yuan et al., 2021). On the 543 one hand, effector recognition by NLR is not sufficient to trigger hypersensitive response, the 544 hallmark of ETI. It also requires PTI elicitors. On the other hand, effector-activated NLRs can 545 enhance flg22-induced ROS burst, a hallmark of PTI. The way ETI potentiates PTI is by 546 boosting the expression of BAK1 and BIK1, as well as sustaining the activation of RBOHD 547 (Ngou et al., 2021). The exact mechanism linking PTI and ETI is not known yet. This 548 crosstalk between NLR and PRR signalling led to the hypotheses that these separate 549 receptors could have co-evolved. Genome comparison in spermatophytes revealed that 550 indeed NLRs expanded or contracted in concert with RKs and RPs. Particularly, the 551 subfamilies VII\_1, VIII\_2, Xa and XII of RKs are specifically expended in genomes where 552 NLRs are expanded, while others RPs/RKs are not (Ngou et al., 2022b). Well-described 553 PRRs, including FLS2 and EFR, belong to these families. The drivers of this putative 554 coevolution are not known yet, and the fact that some PRRs, such as CERK1, do not show 555 evidence of coevolution with NLRs (Ngou et al., 2022c) indicates specificity in this 556 coevolution process. In the future, accumulating more details on NLR and PRR crosstalk in 557 diverse plant lineages, in various environmental conditions, including on their shared targets 558 (such as RBOHD and BIK1) will shed light on the mechanisms and ecological drivers of the 559 coevolution between these two classes of immune receptors.

#### 560 PRRs show similarities with receptors from other eukaryotes

561 We described above that PRRs have expanded in all known streptophyte lineages, and 562 presumed that the same occurred in chlorophytes, indicating that they have been the 563 standard cell surface sensing mechanism since the beginning of plant diversification (Dievart 564 et al., 2020) (Figure 3). Homologous receptors also exist in metazoans. Some homologs of plant RKs are animal Receptor Tyrosine Kinases (RTKs), sharing a similar architecture with 565 566 an extra-cellular, a transmembrane and an intracellular kinase domain (Shiu and Bleecker, 567 2001). RTKs differ from RKs in that they phosphorylate tyrosine, instead of serine/threonine 568 for plant RKs. Moreover, they contribute to cell homeostasis, rather than stress sensing 569 (Lemmon and Schlessinger, 2010). Based on sequence identity, plant RKs are more closely

570 related to Pelle/IRAKs proteins found in animals and alveolate (Shiu and Bleecker, 2001; 571 Dievart et al., 2020). It suggests a common origin in early eukaryotes, pre-dating the 572 emergence of plants, alveolates and animals. Mammalian IRAKs do not harbour a 573 transmembrane domain. Instead, they form a complex with the TLR transmembrane immune 574 receptors and Myd88 adaptor, forming the myddosome (Figure 2) (Balka and De Nardo, 575 2019). This myddosome can be seen as a structural homolog of a plant RK containing an 576 extracellular sensing domain and a kinase in a single protein. In the myddosome, binding 577 between TLR and Myd88 is mediated by a TIR-TIR interaction. Here, TIR functions as 578 adaptor rather than enzyme, a function we discussed in the paragraph related to plant TIRs.

The different diversification of RPs and RKs observed between plants and mammals are the result of two distinct evolutionary trajectories. In animals, this pathway has not diversified, instead cell surface surveillance is mediated mainly by G-Protein-Coupled Receptors GPCR (Hanlon and Andrew, 2015), biochemically unrelated to RPs/RKs. This exemplifies that eukaryotes select non-homologous pathway to sustain analogous functions. Beyond plants and mammals, one can hypothesize that studying immunity mechanisms in other eukaryotes will reveal yet other pathways.

#### 586 **Conserved and divergent immunity functions for phytohormones across land plants**

587 Phytohormones control diverse processes including immunity. Salicylic Acid (SA) and 588 Jasmonic Acid (JA) are the main hormones involved in plant immunity. In angiosperms, 589 infection with (hemi)-biotrophic pathogens induce SA biosynthesis while JA is important 590 against necrotrophic pathogens (Berens et al., 2017). In most plant species, increase of SA 591 levels occurs upon infection with pathogens (Klessig et al., 2018). SA accumulation has also 592 been described in the moss P. patens infected with the fungus Botrytis cinerea (Ponce De 593 León et al., 2012). Infection with Pseudomonas syringae also triggers SA biosynthesis in M. 594 polymorpha (Gimenez-Ibanez et al., 2019). SA is also essential for the establishment of a 595 broad spectrum and long-lasting resistance, named Systemic Acquired Resistance (SAR) 596 (Durrant and Dong, 2004). In SAR, a signal is transmitted via the phloem throughout the 597 plant, priming the plant for subsequent infections. Despite the absence of vascular tissue, Winter et al., described a SAR-like response in the moss Amblystegium serpens upon 598 599 inoculation with the oomycete Pythium irregulare (Winter et al., 2014). Yet, presence of SAR 600 in *M. polymorpha* has not been described.

Hormone detection by receptors is necessary to initiate their signalling pathway. In *A. thaliana*, Non-expressors of PR1 (NPRs): NPR1, NPR3 and NPR4 are SA receptors (Ding et al., 2018). While NPR1 is a positive regulator of SA signalling, NPR3/NPR4 act as repressors
(Ding et al., 2018). The liverwort *M. polymorpha* presents a single NPR ortholog (Bowman et al., 2018).

605 al., 2017). Its recent characterization showed that MpNPR can complement Atnpr1 mutant 606 but not *Atnpr3-npr4* mutants (Jeon et al., 2022). Similarly, the single NPR protein of the moss 607 Physcomitrium patens can partially complement the Atnpr1 mutant but not Atnpr3-npr4 608 mutants (Peng et al., 2017). Thus, NPR biochemical functions are likely at least partially 609 conserved between bryophytes and tracheophytes. However, Mpnpr is more resistant to P. 610 syringae than Tak-1 (wild-type background, WT), while an Atnpr1 mutant is more susceptible 611 than the wild-type background (Cao Hui et al., 1994). This indicates that unlike A. thaliana 612 NPR1, MpNPR acts as a negative regulator of immunity in *M. polymorpha* (despite MpNPR 613 being able to complement an A. thaliana npr1 mutant, as we saw earlier). Paradoxically, 614 Mpnpr1 is hypersensitive to SA exogenous treatment, as compared to WT, but Mpnpr and 615 WT share the same transcriptional pattern after treatment with SA (Jeon et al., 2022). Taken 616 together, there recent data show both conservation and specialisation of NPR in land plants. 617 In addition, NPR orthologues have been lost in hornworts, while SA is still produced in this 618 lineage (Li et al., 2020; Zhang et al., 2020; Rieseberg et al., 2023). It seems that NPR is 619 generally contributing to immunity, by regulating SA signalling in A. thaliana and by an 620 unknown mechanism in bryophytes. If NPR is not a receptor for SA in *M. polymorpha* and in 621 hornwort, it could be that other proteins bind SA - as do other angiosperm proteins (Pokotylo 622 et al., 2019) - explaining the persistence of SA in bryophytes. Further characterization of 623 NPR in *M. polymorpha*, *A. thaliana* and other plant clades is now required to understand how 624 the biological function of NPR in land plants, while maintaining the ability to complement 625 mutants between bryophytes and tracheophytes.

626 In angiosperms, JA biosynthesis is important for inducing responses against necrotrophic 627 pathogens. After pathogen attack, JA-Isoleucine (JA-Ile) and the precursor 12-oxo-628 phytodienoic acid (OPDA) accumulate in angiosperms and bryophytes respectively (Ponce 629 De León et al., 2012; Berens et al., 2017; Chini et al., 2023). In fact, tracheophytes can use 630 both OPDA and JA-Ile. But the JA-Ile pathway is favoured in angiosperms while the OPDA 631 pathway is favoured in ferns, and even more in lycophytes (Fang et al., 2022). It is not known 632 if the JA-IIe synthesis pathway existed in the first land plant but was lost or reduced in 633 bryophytes, lycophytes and ferns, or if it is an innovation of tracheophytes which became 634 fundamental in angiosperms. In A. thaliana, JA is perceived by the complex coronatine 635 insensitive 1 (COI1) (Xie et al., 1998) and requires the transcription activator complex 636 Jasmonate ZIM-domain (JAZ)-Myelocytomatosis oncogenes (MYC) (Santner and Estelle, 637 2007). These proteins are conserved in bryophytes and tracheophytes (Monte et al., 2018). 638 Nevertheless, the ligands perceived by COI1 differ across land plants. In bryophytes and 639 lycophytes, two isomers of dn-OPDA served as ligands (Chini et al., 2023) while 640 angiosperms and ferns perceive JA-Ile (Chini et al., 2023). This is in line with the absence of 641 ortholog of Jasmonate Resistant 1 (JAR1), which conjugates lle to JA, in bryophytes and

642 lycophytes (Monte et al., 2018). It has been shown that ligand specificity is due to a variation 643 of a single amino acid in the binding pocket (Ala in *A. thaliana*vs Val/Ile in bryophytes) and 644 two residues of the loop region in JAZ (Monte et al., 2018; Monte et al., 2022). The lycophyte 645 *Selaginella moellendorffii* synthesizes both dn-OPDA and JA-Ile (Chini et al., 2023). It 646 constitutes a good model to discriminate the role of both ligands in JA-mediated responses. 647 Development of pathosystems involving lycophytes will help to decipher the evolution of JA-648 related molecules in plant immunity.

In tracheophytes, with few exceptions, the signalling pathways mediated by SA and JA antagonize(Thaler et al., 2012; Berens et al., 2017). Antagonism between SA and JA signalling pathways is also described in *M. polymorpha* (Matsui et al., 2019). Indeed, when treated with SA, *M. polymorpha* is more susceptible to the necrotrophic fungus *Irpex lacteus*. This is reversed by co-treatment with OPDA (Matsui et al., 2019). Also, treatment with OPDA increases susceptibility to *P. syringae*.

The study of the interaction between SA and JAs pathways in additional plant species are needed to support the conservation of the antagonism. Further investigation of non-seed plants species, notably lycophytes and ferns, is necessary for understanding evolution of plant hormones signalling during immunity.

#### 659 Specialized metabolism illustrates non-angiosperm immune specificities

660 One strategy against pathogens is the accumulation of metabolites that have antimicrobial 661 activities (Compean and Ynalvez, 2014), such as glucosinolates from the Brassicales 662 (Bischoff, 2016) or flavonoids and anthocyanins from the phenylpropanoid pathway (Agar 663 and Cankaya, 2020). As in angiosperms, the phenylpropanoids pathway is activated upon 664 pathogen infection in bryophytes, with the example of auronidins in *M. polymorpha* (Berland 665 et al., 2019; Davies et al., 2022). Phythophtora palmivora, a plant pathogen with broad host 666 range, can infect *M. polymorpha* (Carella et al., 2018). It enters the thallus via air pores and 667 activates the expression of pathogenesis-related proteins, and a Myb14-dependent 668 accumulation of flavonoid and phenylpropanoids important to limit the spread of infection 669 (Carella et al., 2019). This response is conserved in the angiosperm Nicotiana benthamiana 670 inoculated with the same pathogen (Carella et al., 2019). Thus, as for receptor-based 671 immunity, the role of phenylpropanoids in defence described in angiosperms can be 672 expanded to the land plants.

Terpenes metabolism is also important in plant defence (Osbourn, 1996). Bryophytes are well-known for their wide array of metabolites, with the terpene pathway being the main source (Chen et al., 2018). Some bryophyte terpenes are rare as they only occur in a few species, while others appear to be specific to liverworts, as they have not been detected in 677 any other living organisms (Chen et al., 2018). For example, pinguisanes are a noteworthy 678 type of terpenes specific to liverworts (Asakawa, 2004). Terpene synthases (TPS) drive this 679 diversity (Chen et al., 2018). Interestingly, bryophytes have two types of TPS: typical ones 680 (also found in tracheophytes) and Microbial TPS like (MTPSL). MTPSL share similarities with 681 TPS from bacteria and fungi (Jia et al., 2016). M. polymorpha encode 39 TPS genes, of which 32 are MTPSL genes. In contrast, no MTPSL has been identified in P. patens. The 682 683 genomes of the hornworts Anthoceros agrestis and Anthoceros punctatus contain 6 and 7 684 MTPSLs respectively (Jia et al., 2016). To date, MTPSLs from bryophytes and ferns have 685 been biochemically characterized as mono and sesquiterpene synthases (Jia et al., 2018). 686 Such diversity of terpenes likely played a crucial role in the adaptation of plants to land and 687 during the diversification of bryophytes, but their actual role in plant adaptation to stress 688 remains to be determined. This might reveal lineage-specific immune mechanisms absent 689 from angiosperms. In its natural environment, M. polymorpha interacts with many bacteria 690 and fungi (Nelson et al., 2018; Alcaraz et al., 2018; Matsui et al., 2019). They include many 691 Proteobacteria, Xylariaceae, Glomerellaceae, Irpicaceae and Phanerochaetaceae. Some of 692 these microbes, such as Irepex lacteus and Xylaria cubensis, induce disease symptoms. As 693 exemplified for NLRs, PRRs and specialized metabolism, studying the evolution of immune 694 mechanisms in bryophytes delivered a broader understanding of plant immunity. The 695 development of new pathosystems and the use of forward genetics will complement the 696 existing reverse genetic based approaches to reveal the bryophyte immunity toolkit. 697 However, shifting the focus from angiosperm to only liverworts and mosses does not allow 698 understanding diversity at the scale of the land plants.

#### 699 Immunity in non-angiosperm vascular plants

700 Beyond bryophytes, assessing immunity mechanisms in gymnosperms, ferns and lycophytes 701 is the next obvious, and essential, step to get the full picture of plant immunity. In that 702 respect, ferns have an interesting potential. It is a diverse group, with evolutionary 703 distinctiveness. They undergo a macroscopic gametophytic phase and reproduce by spores, 704 which distinguish them from gymnosperms and angiosperms. They have megaphylls (multi-705 vessel leaves), which distinguish them from lycophytes having microphylls (single-vein leaves). 18<sup>th</sup> century naturalist Miles Joseph Berkeley noticed that ferns where less infected 706 707 by pathogens than angiosperms (Berkeley, 1862). However, many fungi have been observed 708 on ferns (Stevenson, 1945; Kirschner et al., 2019), making questionable the statement that 709 ferns are more resistant to pests than angiosperms. The best described fern pathogen so far 710 is Mixia osmunda, isolated from the fern Osmunda japonica. Its genome is 13 Mb, the 711 smallest of plant pathogenic basidiomycetes, and encodes about 500 secreted proteins 712 (Toome et al., 2014). The host response is not known, as the fern immune system, in part

713 due to complex genomes. To date, five genomes including two aquatic floating ferns (Azolla 714 filiculoides, 0.75 Gb, n = 22, and Salvinia cucullata, 0.25 Gb, n = 9) (Li et al., 2018a), one 715 semi-aquatic fern (Ceratopteris richardii, 9.6 Gb, n = 39) (Marchant et al., 2022), one tree 716 fern (Alsophila spinulosa, 6.23 Gb, n = 69) (Huang et al., 2022b) and one terrestrial fern 717 (Adiantum capillus-veneris, 5 Gb, n = 30) (Fang et al., 2022) have been sequenced. The 718 large genome sizes are not explained by a high number of genes, but instead by large 719 introns, and more repetitive regions and transposons than other plant lineages. The genomes 720 of the two aquatic floating ferns are reduced due to gene losses and gene family 721 contractions, reminiscent of duckweeds in angiosperms that shares an analogous lifestyle 722 and genome reduction (An et al., 2018). Exploring these additional lineages, from ferns, 723 lycophytes to the massive diversity observed in gymnosperms (Woudstra et al., 2023) could 724 reveal the conservation and innovations for immunity in these lineages.

#### 725 Managing pathogenic and mutualistic interactions

726 In this review article, we have focussed on the diversity of mechanisms plants have evolved 727 to fight against the pathogens present in their microbiota. Beyond the pathogens, more and 728 more studies have identified genetic components involved in modulating the interactions 729 between plants and their microbiota as a whole (Paasch and He, 2021), identifying 730 mechanisms shared with plant immunity (Chen et al., 2020, Rey and Jacquet 2018) but also 731 more general physiological processes such as the phosphate-starvation response (Finkel et 732 al., 2019). Among the microbiota members, specific groups of microorganisms co-evolved 733 with plants to form mutualistic symbioses (Delaux and Schornack, 2021). The mutualistic 734 associations include for instance the nitrogen-fixing root-nodule symbiosis between plant 735 species from the Fabales, Fagales, Cucurbitales and Rosales clades and rhizobia or Frankia 736 bacteria, which evolved 100 MYA (Griesmann et al., 2018; van Velzen et al., 2018; Libourel 737 et al., 2023), the arbuscular mycorrhizal symbiosis that evolved between the first land plants 738 and Glomeromycota fungi (Remy et al., 1994; Rich et al., 2021) or ectomycorrhizal symbiosis 739 that evolved in a convergent manner in several tracheophyte lineages (Genre et al., 2020). 740 The co-occurrence of pathogenic and mutualistic microorganisms within the same microbial 741 communities, and their similarities – they are for instance fungi or bacteria – led the research 742 field to ask a simple question: How do plant lineages discriminate between pathogens and 743 mutualists (Zipfel and Oldroyd, 2017)?

One satisfying hypothesis came early on from the work carried on the symbionts. Rhizobia, which induce nodule formation and colonize *Fabaceae* during the nitrogen-fixing root nodule symbiosis, produce blends of lipochitooligosaccharides (LCOs) which are essential for the symbiosis to occur and are perceived by the host plants with high level of specificity (Lerouge 748 et al., 1990). This specific symbiotic signal explained both the discrimination between 749 pathogens and symbionts because pathogenic bacteria do not produce these molecules, and 750 the specificity of this particular symbiosis. Indeed, the blends of specific LCOs produced by a 751 given bacteria correlates with its host range (Dénarié et al., 1996). Two additional discoveries 752 corroborated this view. First, Fabaceae, such as Lotus japonicus or Medicago truncatula 753 have specific LysM-RK receptors that recognize these molecules with high affinity, and these 754 receptors are essential for symbiosis with rhizobia to occur (Radutoiu et al., 2003; Limpens et 755 al., 2003; Bozsoki et al., 2020). Second, Arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi also produce these 756 compounds (Maillet et al., 2011). This link between LCOs and mutualism was even expanded 757 to the ectomycorrhizal symbiosis in poplar (Cope et al., 2019). The hypothesis that LCOs are 758 the key to initiate symbiosis lasted for three decades, and probably holds true in the context 759 of the nitrogen-fixing root nodule symbiosis that has evolved high-affinity receptors (Bozsoki 760 et al., 2020). However, its extension to all mutualistic symbiosis is now compromised. On the 761 plant side, the LysM-RKs chitin receptors were found to be essential for both immunity but 762 also symbiotic signalling (Rey et al., 2013; Zhang et al., 2015; Feng et al., 2019; Giblin-Viala 763 et al., 2019), and small and large chitin fragment were as potent as LCOs to triggering 764 symbiotic responses (Genre et al., 2013; Feng et al., 2019). Expanding the range of 765 organisms analysed for their ability to produce LCOs, it was found that the vast majority of 766 the fungi, either symbiotic, pathogen or saprotrophs, produce LCOs (Rush et al., 2020). If 767 LCOs are the universal symbiotic signals, the question of discriminating pathogens and 768 symbionts remains unresolved. Two main hypotheses can be proposed. First, additional 769 signalling components, possibly downstream the LysM-RKs may channel the chitin/LCO 770 perception toward symbiosis or immunity. What leads to the switch from one to the other 771 pathway remains to be discovered, but the general, or local, physiological status of the host 772 is the leading candidate (Li et al., 2022). Indeed, phosphate starvation seems to reduce the 773 immune response while at the same time favouring the interaction with the microbiota and 774 symbionts (Finkel et al., 2019; Li et al., 2022; Paries and Gutjahr, 2023). The second 775 hypothesis would be that other symbiotic signals, either generic or symbiosis-specific, exist 776 and have yet to be characterized. Expanding the breadth of symbioses explored at the 777 mechanistic level, and the diversity of covered plant lineages should improve our 778 understanding of this complex process. The recent finding that *M. polymorpha* LysM-RKs are 779 essential for chitin-triggered immunity (Yotsui et al., 2023) indicates that this function, at 780 least, is conserved across land plants. Whether the symbiotic pathway is also conserved is a 781 question to be addressed in the near future. This could be achieved for instance using 782 Marchantia paleacea, the sister species to M. polymorpha. By contrast to M. polymorpha, M. 783 paleacea retains the association with arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi. Genomic and genetic tools have been recently developed for that species, making it an ideal model liverwort to
study symbiosis (Radhakrishnan et al., 2020; Rich et al., 2021; Kodama et al., 2022a).

#### 786 Concluding remarks and perspective

787 Decades of genetics in angiosperms has revealed layers of immune mechanisms, from 788 surface-localized to intracellular receptors. From this angiosperm-centred view of plant 789 immunity, the sequencing of many plant genomes in non-flowering plants has allowed the 790 description of variations in the plant immune repertoire. Development of pathosystems in 791 model bryophytes such as the liverwort *M. polymorpha*, is now allowing the evoMPMI 792 community to test assumptions defined based on genomic comparisons. From these 793 extensive comparative studies, three main conclusions can be reached. First, immunity in 794 plants relies on highly conserved components. Chitin perception, the BIK1-RBOH module or 795 the biosynthesis of phenylpropanoids are conserved across all land plants studied so far. 796 This is reminiscent of other highly conserved pathways, the ones allowing association with 797 symbiotic fungi (Rich et al., 2021; Kodama et al., 2022b). Plants have thus evolved for 450 798 million years with pathways for accommodating or protecting against microorganisms. One 799 can propose that mechanisms to negatively regulate these pathways and selecting one over 800 the other depending on the context must have co-evolved with them. Future investigation of 801 conserved, yet undeciphered, gene networks should shed light on these mechanisms, and 802 possibly resolve the question of how plants distinguish and adapt their responses to 803 symbionts and pathogens. A second conclusion is that immune mechanisms have diversified 804 from these conserved pathways. This is exemplified by PRRs and STANDs, shared by most 805 plants, yet showing extremely diverse repertoire and architecture. Increasing the set of 806 explored genomes and lineages should lead to the discovery of even more diverse sets of 807 receptors. From this diversity to be described, biotechnological options to augment immunity 808 in crops may emerge. The use of pikobodies to engineer resistance is the perfect 809 demonstration that diversifying the sets of immune receptors can contribute to improved crop 810 resilience. The last, and possibly most important conclusion, is that despites the massive 811 effort in describing and dissecting immune mechanisms, our understanding remains limited 812 to very few lineages. The discovery of plants with an almost absent repertoire of STANDs, 813 such as carnivorous or aquatic species, exemplifies this limitation. In the future, the 814 development of additional pathosystems in all the five main land plants lineages, coupled 815 with forward genetics and genome-wide association studies, will finally enable the community 816 to grasp the diversity of immunity mechanisms in plants.

817 Funding

- 818 BC, KEM, CJ and PMD are funded by the ANR Level-up (ANR-21-CE20-0010-01). Research
- 819 performed at LRSV is supported by the 'Laboratoires d'Excellence (LABEX)' TULIP (ANR-10-
- 820 LABX-41).
- 821

# 822 **Declaration of interests**

- 823 The authors declare no competing interests.
- 824

# 825 References

- Agar, O. T., and Cankaya, I. I. T. (2020). Analysis of phenylethanoids and their glycosidic
   derivatives. In *Recent Advances in Natural Products Analysis*, Chapter 5. Elsevier Inc.
- Akira, S., and Takeda, K. (2004). Toll-like receptor signalling. *Nat Rev Immunol* **4**:499–511.
- Albert, I., Böhm, H., Albert, M., Feiler, C. E., Imkampe, J., Wallmeroth, N., Brancato, C.,
   Raaymakers, T. M., Oome, S., Zhang, H., et al. (2015). An RLP23-SOBIR1-BAK1
   complex mediates NLP-triggered immunity. *Nat Plants* 1:15140.
- Alberts, B., Johnson, A., Lewis, J., Raff, M., Roberts, K., and Walter, P. (2002). The
  generation of antibody diversity. In *Molecular Biology of the Cell. 4th edition*, Chapter
  24. Garland Science.
- Alcaraz, L. D., Peimbert, M., Barajas, H. R., Dorantes-Acosta, A. E., Bowman, J. L., and
   Arteaga-Vázquez, M. A. (2018). Marchantia liverworts as a proxy to plants' basal
   microbiomes. *Sci Rep* 8:12712.
- An, D., Li, C., Zhou, Y., Wu, Y., and Wang, W. (2018). Genomes and transcriptomes of
   duckweeds. *Front Chem* 6:doi.org/10.3389/fchem.2018.00230.
- Andolfo, G., Di Donato, A., Chiaiese, P., De Natale, A., Pollio, A., Jones, J. D. G.,
   Frusciante, L., and Ercolano, M. R. (2019). Alien domains shaped the modular
   structure of plant NLR proteins. *Genome Biol Evol* 11:evz248.
- 843 Asakawa, Y. (2004). Chemosystematics of the Hepaticae. *Phytochemistry* **65**:623–669.
- Baggs, E., Dagdas, G., and Krasileva, K. V. (2017). NLR diversity, helpers and integrated
   domains: making sense of the NLR IDentity. *Curr Opin Plant Biol* 38:59–67.
- Baggs, E., Monroe, J. G., Thanki, A. S., O'Grady, R., Schudoma, C., Haerty, W., and
  Krasileva, K. V (2020). Convergent Loss of an EDS1/PAD4 Signaling Pathway in
  Several Plant Lineages Reveals Co-evolved Components of Plant Immunity and
  Drought Response. *Plant Cell* 32:2158–2177.
- Baggs, E. L., Tiersma, M. B., Abramson, B. W., Michael, T. P., and Krasileva, K. V.
  (2022). Characterization of defense responses against bacterial pathogens in duckweeds lacking EDS1. *New Phytologist* 236:1838–1855.
- Balka, K. R., and De Nardo, D. (2019). Understanding early TLR signaling through the
   Myddosome. *J Leukoc Biol* 105:339–351.

- Banks, J. A., Nishiyama, T., Hasebe, M., Bowman, J. L., Gribskov, M., DePamphilis, C.,
  Albert, V. A., Aono, N., Aoyama, T., Ambrose, B. A., et al. (2011). The selaginella
  genome identifies genetic changes associated with the evolution of vascular plants. *Science* 332:960–963.
- Bao, G., Tang, M., Zhao, J., and Zhu, X. (2021). Nanobody: a promising toolkit for
  molecular imaging and disease therapy. *EJNMMI Res* 11:doi.org/10.1186/s13550-02100750-5.
- Barragan, C. A., Wu, R., Kim, S.-T., Xi, W., Habring, A., and Hagmann, J. (2019). RPW8 /
   HR Repeats Predict NLR-dependent Hybrid Performance. *PLoS Genet* 15:e1008313.
- Bender, K. W., and Zipfel, C. (2023). Paradigms of receptor kinase signaling in plants.
   *Biochemical Journal* 480:835–854.
- Bent, A. F., Kunkel, B., Dahlbeck, D., Brown, K., Schmidt, R., Giraudat, J., Leung, J.,
   and Staskawicz, B. (1994). RPS2 of Arabidopsis thaliana a leucine rich repeat class
   of plant disease resistance genes. *Science* 265:1856–1860.
- Berens, M. L., Berry, H. M., Mine, A., Argueso, C. T., and Tsuda, K. (2017). Evolution of
   Hormone Signaling Networks in Plant Defense. *Annual Review of Phytopathology* 55:401–425.
- Berland, H., Albert, N. W., Stavland, A., Jordheim, M., McGhie, T. K., Zhou, Y., Zhang, H.,
  Deroles, S. C., Schwinn, K. E., Jordan, B. R., et al. (2019). Auronidins are a
  previously unreported class of flavonoid pigments that challenges when anthocyanin
  biosynthesis evolved in plants. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*116:20232–20239.
- Bernoux, M., Ve, T., Williams, S., Warren, C., Hatters, D., Valkov, E., Zhang, X., Ellis, J.
  G., Kobe, B., and Dodds, P. N. (2011). Structural and functional analysis of a plant
  resistance protein TIR domain reveals interfaces for self-association, signaling, and
  autoregulation. *Cell Host Microbe* 9:200–211.
- Bi, G., Su, M., Li, N., Liang, Y., Dang, S., Xu, J., Hu, M., Wang, J., Zou, M., Deng, Y., et al.
  (2021). The ZAR1 resistosome is a calcium-permeable channel triggering plant immune
  signaling. *Cell* 184:doi.org/10.1016/j.cell.2021.05.003.
- Bischoff, K. L. (2016). Glucosinolates. In *Nutraceuticals: Efficacy, Safety and Toxicity*, pp.
   551–554. Elsevier Inc.
- Bjornson, M., Pimprikar, P., Nürnberger, T., and Zipfel, C. (2021). The transcriptional
   landscape of Arabidopsis thaliana pattern-triggered immunity. *Nat Plants* 7:579–586.
- 888 **Bomblies, K., and Weigel, D.** (2007). Hybrid necrosis: Autoimmunity as a potential gene-889 flow barrier in plant species. *Nat Rev Genet* **8**:382–393.
- Bonardi, V., Tang, S., Stallmann, A., Roberts, M., Cherkis, K. A., and Dangl, J. L. (2011).
   Expanded functions for a family of plant intracellular immune receptors beyond specific
   recognition of pathogen effectors. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 108:16463–16468.
- Bowman, J. L., Kohchi, T., Yamato, K. T., Jenkins, J., Shu, S., Ishizaki, K., Yamaoka, S.,
   Nishihama, R., Nakamura, Y., Berger, F., et al. (2017). Insights into Land Plant
   Evolution Garnered from the Marchantia polymorpha Genome. *Cell* 171:287-304.e15.

- Bozsoki, Z., Cheng, J., Feng, F., Gysel, K., Vinther, M., Andersen, K. R., Oldroyd, G.,
   Blaise, M., Radutoiu, S., and Stougaard, J. (2017). Receptor-mediated chitin
   perception in legume roots is functionally separable from Nod factor perception.
   *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 114:E8118–E8127.
- Bozsoki, Z., Gysel, K., Hansen, S. B., Lironi, D., Krönauer, C., Feng, F., de Jong, N.,
   Vinther, M., Kamble, M., Thygesen, M. B., et al. (2020). Ligand-recognizing motifs in
   plant LysM receptors are major determinants of specificity. *Science* 369:663–670.
- Bressendorff, S., Azevedo, R., Kenchappa, C. S., de León, I. P., Olsen, J. V.,
  Rasmussen, M. W., Erbs, G., Newman, M. A., Petersen, M., and Mundy, J. (2016).
  An Innate Immunity Pathway in the Moss Physcomitrella patens. *Plant Cell* 28:1328–
  1342.
- 908 Calvo-Baltanás, V., Wang, J., and Chae, E. (2021). Hybrid Incompatibility of the Plant
   909 Immune System : An Opposite Force to Heterosis Equilibrating Hybrid Performances.
   910 Front Plant Sci 11:576796.
- 911 Cao, Y., Liang, Y., Tanaka, K., Nguyen, C. T., Jedrzejczak, R. P., Joachimiak, A., and
   912 Stacey, G. (2014). The kinase LYK5 is a major chitin receptor in Arabidopsis and forms
   913 a chitin-induced complex with related kinase CERK1. *Elife* 3:e03766.
- 914 Cao Hui, Bowling, S. A., Gordon, A. S., and Dong Xinnian (1994). Characterization of an
   915 Arabidopsis mutant that is nonresponsive to inducers of systemic acquired resistance.
   916 Plant Cell 6:1583–1592.
- 917 Carella, P., and Schornack, S. (2018). Manipulation of Bryophyte Hosts by Pathogenic and
   918 Symbiotic Microbes. *Plant Cell Physiol* 59:651–660.
- 919 Carella, P., Gogleva, A., Tomaselli, M., Alfs, C., and Schornack, S. (2018). Phytophthora
   920 palmivora establishes tissue-specific intracellular infection structures in the earliest
   921 divergent land plant lineage. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 922 115:E3846–E3855.
- 923 Carella, P., Gogleva, A., Hoey, D. J., Bridgen, A. J., Stolze, S. C., Nakagami, H., and
   924 Schornack, S. (2019). Conserved Biochemical Defenses Underpin Host Responses to
   925 Oomycete Infection in an Early-Divergent Land Plant Lineage. *Current Biology* 29:2282 926 2294.e5.
- 927 Castel, B., Ngou, P. M., Cevik, V., Kim, D. S., Yang, Y., Ding, P., and Jones, J. D. G.
  928 (2019a). Diverse NLR immune receptors activate defence via the RPW8-NLR NRG1.
  929 New Phytologist 222:966–980.
- 930 Castel, B., Wu, Y., Xiao, S., and Jones, J. D. G. (2019b). An rpw8 quadruple mutant of
   931 Arabidopsis Col-0 is partially compromised in bacterial and fungal resistance. *bioRxiv.* 932 *doi.org/10.1101/839308*.
- 933 Chae, E., Bomblies, K., Kim, S.-T., Karelina, D., Zaidem, M., Ossowski, S., Martín 934 Pizarro, C., Laitinen, R. A. E., Rowan, B. A., Tenenboim, H., et al. (2014). Species 935 wide genetic incompatibility analysis identifies immune genes as hot spots of deleterious
   936 epistasis. *Cell* 159:1341–1351.
- 937 Chen, F., Ludwiczuk, A., Wei, G., Chen, X., Crandall-Stotler, B., and Bowman, J. L.
  938 (2018). Terpenoid Secondary Metabolites in Bryophytes: Chemical Diversity,
  939 Biosynthesis and Biological Functions. *Crit Rev Plant Sci* 37:210–231.

- 940 Chen, T., Nomura, K., Wang, X., Sohrabi, R., Xu, J., Yao, L., Paasch, B. C., Ma, L.,
  941 Kremer, J., Cheng, Y., et al. (2020). A plant genetic network for preventing dysbiosis in
  942 the phyllosphere. *Nature* 580:653–657.
- 943 Cheng, S., Xian, W., Fu, Y., Marin, B., Keller, J., Wu, T., Sun, W., Li, X., Xu, Y., Zhang, Y.,
  944 et al. (2019). Genomes of Subaerial Zygnematophyceae Provide Insights into Land
  945 Plant Evolution. *Cell* **179**:1057-1067.e14.
- 946 Chia, K.-S., Kourelis, J., Vickers, M., Sakai, T., Kamoun, S., and Carella, P. (2022). The
   947 N-terminal executioner domains of NLR immune receptors are functionally conserved
   948 across major plant lineages. *bioRxiv*, doi:doi.org/10.1101/2022.10.19.512840.
- 949 Chinchilla, D., Zipfel, C., Robatzek, S., Kemmerling, B., Nürnberger, T., Jones, J. D. G.,
   950 Felix, G., and Boller, T. (2007). A flagellin-induced complex of the receptor FLS2 and
   951 BAK1 initiates plant defence. *Nature* 448:497–500.
- Chinchilla, D., Shan, L., He, P., de Vries, S., and Kemmerling, B. (2009). One for all: the
   receptor-associated kinase BAK1. *Trends Plant Sci* 14:535–541.
- 954 Chini, A., Monte, I., Zamarreño, A. M., García-Mina, J. M., and Solano, R. (2023).
  955 Evolution of the jasmonate ligands and their biosynthetic pathways. *New Phytologist*956 238:2236–2246.
- 957 Chou, W. C., Jha, S., Linhoff, M. W., and Ting, J. P. Y. (2023). The NLR gene family: from
   958 discovery to present day. *Nat Rev Immunol* 23:635–654.
- 959 Chu, J., Monte, I., DeFalco, T. A., Köster, P., Derbyshire, P., Menke, F. L. H., and Zipfel,
  960 C. (2023). Conservation of the PBL-RBOH immune module in land plants. *Current*961 *Biology* 33:1130-1137.e5.
- 962 Compean, K. L., and Ynalvez, R. A. (2014). Antimicrobial activity of plant secondary
   963 metabolites: A review. *Research Journal of Medicinal Plant* 8:204–213.
- 964 Cooper, M. D., and Alder, M. N. (2006). The evolution of adaptive immune systems. *Cell* 965 124:815–822.
- Cope, K. R., Bascaules, A., Irving, T. B., Venkateshwaran, M., Maeda, J., Garcia, K.,
   Rush, T. A., Ma, C., Labbé, J., Jawdy, S., et al. (2019). The ectomycorrhizal fungus
   laccaria bicolor produces lipochitooligosaccharides and uses the common symbiosis
   pathway to colonize populus roots. *Plant Cell* 31:2386–2410.
- 970 Corlett, R. T. (2016). Plant diversity in a changing world: Status, trends, and conservation
   971 needs. *Plant Divers* 38:10–16.
- 972 Couto, D., and Zipfel, C. (2016). Regulation of pattern recognition receptor signalling in
   973 plants. *Nat Rev Immunol* 16:537–552.
- 974 Daskalov, A. (2023). Emergence of the fungal immune system. *iScience* 26:106793.
- Daskalov, A., Dyrka, W., and Saupe, S. J. (2020). NLR Function in Fungi as Revealed by
   the Study of Self/Non-self Recognition Systems. In *Genetics and Biotechnology*, pp.
   123–141.
- Davey, M. L., and Currah, R. S. (2006). Interactions between mosses (Bryophyta) and fungi.
   *Canadian Journal of Botany* 84:1509–1519.

- Davies, K. M., Landi, M., Van Klink, J. W., Schwinn, K. E., Brummell, D. A., Albert, N. W.,
   Chagné, D., Jibran, R., Kulshrestha, S., Zhou, Y., et al. (2022). Evolution and function
   of red pigmentation in land plants. *Ann Bot* 130:613–636.
- De la Concepcion, J. C., Vega Benjumea, J., Bialas, A., Terauchi, R., Kamoun, S., and
   Banfield, M. J. (2021). Functional diversification gave rise to allelic specialization in a
   rice NLR immune receptor pair. *Elife* 10:e71662.
- 986 Dearnaley, J. D. W. (2007). Further advances in orchid mycorrhizal research. *Mycorrhiza* 987 17:475–486.
- 988 **Delaux, P.-M., and Schornack, S.** (2021). Plant evolution driven by interactions with 989 symbiotic and pathogenic microbes. *Science* **371**:eaba6605.
- Delaux, P. M., Radhakrishnan, G. V., Jayaraman, D., Cheema, J., Malbreil, M.,
   Volkening, J. D., Sekimoto, H., Nishiyama, T., Melkonian, M., Pokorny, L., et al.
   (2015). Algal ancestor of land plants was preadapted for symbiosis. *Proceedings of the* National Academy of Sciences 112:13390–13395.
- 994 Dénarié, J., Debellé, F., and Promé, J. C. (1996). Rhizobium lipo-chitooligosaccharide
   995 nodulation factors: Signaling molecules mediating recognition and morphogenesis.
   996 Annu Rev Biochem 65:503–535.
- Dievart, A., Gottin, C., Peacuterin, C., Ranwez, V., and Chantret, N. (2020). Origin and
   Diversity of Plant Receptor-Like Kinases. *Annu Rev Plant Biol* 71:131–156.
- Ding, Y., Sun, T., Ao, K., Peng, Y., Zhang, Y., Li, X., and Zhang, Y. (2018). Opposite Roles
   of Salicylic Acid Receptors NPR1 and NPR3/NPR4 in Transcriptional Regulation of
   Plant Immunity. *Cell* 13:191–202.
- Donoghue, P. C. J., Harrison, C. J., Paps, J., and Schneider, H. (2021). The evolutionary
   emergence of land plants. *Current Biology* 31:R1281–R1298.
- 1004 Durrant, W. E., and Dong, X. (2004). Systemic Acquired Resistance. Annu Rev Phytopathol
   1005 42:185–209.
- Duxbury, Z., Wang, S., Mackenzie, C. I., Tenthorey, J. L., Zhang, X., Huh, S. U., Hu, L.,
   Hill, L., Ngou, P. M., Ding, P., et al. (2020). Induced proximity of a TIR signaling domain on a plant-mammalian NLR chimera activates defense in plants. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 117:18832–18839.
- Duxbury, Z., Wu, C., and Ding, P. (2021). A Comparative Overview of the Intracellular
   Guardians of Plants and Animals: NLRs in Innate Immunity and Beyond. *Annu Rev Plant Biol* 72:14.1–14.30.
- Dyrka, W., Lamacchia, M., Durrens, P., Kobe, B., Daskalov, A., Paoletti, M., Sherman, D.
   J., and Saupe, S. J. (2014). Diversity and variability of NOD-like receptors in fungi.
   Genome Biol Evol 6:3137–3158.
- Eastman, S., Smith, T., Zaydman, M. A., Kim, P., Martinez, S., Damaraju, N., DiAntonio,
   A., Milbrandt, J., Clemente, T. E., Alfano, J. R., et al. (2022). A phytobacterial TIR
   domain effector manipulates NAD+ to promote virulence. *New Phytologist* 233:890–904.
- Emonet, A., Zhou, F., Vacheron, J., Heiman, C. M., Tendon, V. D., Ma, K.-W., Schulze Lefert, P., Keel, C., and Geldner, N. (2021). Spatially Restricted Immune Responses
   Are Required for Maintaining Root Meristematic Activity upon Detection of Bacteria.
   *Current Biology* 31:1012-1028.e7.

- Essuman, K., Summers, D. W., Sasaki, Y., Mao, X., DiAntonio, A., and Milbrandt, J.
   (2017). The SARM1 Toll/Interleukin-1 Receptor Domain Possesses Intrinsic NAD+
   Cleavage Activity that Promotes Pathological Axonal Degeneration. *Neuron* 93:1334 1343.e5.
- Fang, Y., Qin, X., Liao, Q., Du, R., Luo, X., Zhou, Q., Li, Z., Chen, H., Jin, W., Yuan, Y., et
  al. (2022). The genome of homosporous maidenhair fern sheds light on the
  euphyllophyte evolution and defences. *Nat Plants* 8:1024–1037.
- Feehan, J. M., Castel, B., Bentham, A. R., and Jones, J. D. G. (2020). Plant NLRs get by
   with a little help from their friends. *Curr Opin Plant Biol* 56:99–108.
- Feng, F., Sun, J., Radhakrishnan, G. V., Lee, T., Bozsóki, Z., Fort, S., Gavrin, A., Gysel,
   K., Thygesen, M. B., Andersen, K. R., et al. (2019). A combination of
   chitooligosaccharide and lipochitooligosaccharide recognition promotes arbuscular
   mycorrhizal associations in Medicago truncatula. *Nat Commun* 10:5047.
- Finkel, O. M., Salas-González, I., Castrillo, G., Spaepen, S., Law, T. F., Teixeira, P. J. P.
   L., Jones, C. D., and Dangl, J. L. (2019). The effects of soil phosphorus content on
   plant microbiota are driven by the plant phosphate starvation response. *PLoS Biol* 17:e3000534.
- Flor, H. H. (1971). Current status of the gene-for-gene concept. *Annual Review Phytopathology* 9:275–296.
- Gao, Y., Wang, W., Zhang, T., Gong, Z., Zhao, H., and Han, G.-Z. (2018). Out of Water: The
   Origin and Early Diversification of Plant R-Genes. *Plant Physiol* 177:pp.00185.2018.
- Gao, L. A., Wilkinson, M. E., Strecker, J., Makarova, K. S., Macrae, R. K., Koonin, E. V,
   and Zhang, F. (2022). Prokaryotic innate immunity through pattern recognition of
   conserved viral proteins. *Science* 377:10.1126/science.abm4096.
- Gebauer, G., Preiss, K., and Gebauer, A. C. (2016). Partial mycoheterotrophy is more
   widespread among orchids than previously assumed. *New Phytologist* 211:11–15.
- Genre, A., Chabaud, M., Balzergue, C., Puech-Pagès, V., Novero, M., Rey, T., Fournier,
   J., Rochange, S., Bécard, G., Bonfante, P., et al. (2013). Short-chain chitin oligomers
   from arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi trigger nuclear Ca2+ spiking in Medicago truncatula
   roots and their production is enhanced by strigolactone. *New Phytologist* 198:190–202.
- 1053 Genre, A., Lanfranco, L., Perotto, S., and Bonfante, P. (2020). Unique and common traits
   1054 in mycorrhizal symbioses. *Nat Rev Microbiol* 18:649–660.
- Gimenez-Ibanez, S., Zamarreño, A. M., García-Mina, J. M., and Solano, R. (2019). An
   Evolutionarily Ancient Immune System Governs the Interactions between Pseudomonas syringae and an Early-Diverging Land Plant Lineage. *Current Biology* 29:2270-2281.e4.
- 1058 Gómez-Gómez, L., and Boller, T. (2000). FLS2: An LRR Receptor–like Kinase Involved in
   1059 the Perception of the Bacterial Elicitor Flagellin in Arabidopsis. *Mol Cell* 5:1003–1011.
- Gong, Z., and Han, G. Z. (2021). Flourishing in water: the early evolution and diversification
   of plant receptor-like kinases. *Plant Journal* 106:174–184.
- Griesmann, M., Chang, Y., Liu, X., Song, Y., Haberer, G., Crook, M. B., BillaultPenneteau, B., Lauressergues, D., Keller, J., Imanishi, L., et al. (2018).
  Phylogenomics reveals multiple losses of nitrogen-fixing root nodule symbiosis. *Science*361:eaat1743.

- Groszmann, M., Gonzalez-Bayon, R., Lyons, R. L., Greaves, I. K., Kazan, K., Peacock,
   W. J., and Dennis, E. S. (2015). Hormone-regulated defense and stress response
   networks contribute to heterosis in *Arabidopsis* F1 hybrids. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 112:E6397–E6406.
- Hammond-Kosack, K. E., and Jones, J. D. G. (1997). Plant Disease Resistance Genes.
   Annu Rev Plant Physiol Plant Mol Biol 48:575–607.
- Hanlon, C. D., and Andrew, D. J. (2015). Outside-in signaling A brief review of GPCR
   signaling with a focus on the Drosophila GPCR family. *J Cell Sci* 128:3533–3542.
- Harris, B. J., Clark, J. W., Schrempf, D., Szöllősi, G. J., Donoghue, P. C. J.,
   Hetherington, A. M., and Williams, T. A. (2022). Divergent evolutionary trajectories of
   bryophytes and tracheophytes from a complex common ancestor of land plants. *Nat Ecol Evol* 6:1634–1643.
- Harrison, M. J. (2005). Signaling in the arbuscular mycorrhizal symbiosis. *Annu Rev Microbiol* 59:19–42.
- Harton, J. A., Linhoff, M. W., Zhang, J., and Ting, J. P.-Y. (2002). Cutting Edge:
   CATERPILLER: A Large Family of Mammalian Genes Containing CARD, Pyrin,
   Nucleotide-Binding, and Leucine-Rich Repeat Domains. *The Journal of Immunology* 169:4088–4093.
- Heller, J., Clavé, C., Gladieux, P., Saupe, S. J., and Glass, N. L. (2018). NLR surveillance
   of essential SEC-9 SNARE proteins induces programmed cell death upon
   allorecognition in filamentous fungi. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 115:E2292–E2301.
- Hoffman, H. M., Mueller, J. L., Broide, D. H., Wanderer, A. A., and Kolodner, R. D. (2001).
   Mutation of a new gene encoding a putative pyrin-like protein causes familial cold autoinflammatory syndrome and Muckle–Wells syndrome. *Nat Genet* 29:301–305.
- Horsefield, S., Burdett, H., Zhang, X., Manik, M. K., Shi, Y., Chen, J., Qi, T., Gilley, J., Lai,
   J.-S., Rank, M. X., et al. (2019). NAD+ cleavage activity by animal and plant TIR
   domains in cell death pathways. *Science* 365:793–799.
- Hu, Z., Yan, C., Liu, P., Huang, Z., Ma, R., Zhang, C., Wang, R., Zhang, Y., Martinon, F.,
   Miao, D., et al. (2013). Crystal structure of NLRC4 reveals its autoinhibition mechanism.
   Science 341:172–175.
- Huang, S., Drake, J. M., Gittleman, J. L., and Altizer, S. (2015). Parasite diversity declines
   with host evolutionary distinctiveness: A global analysis of carnivores. *Evolution* 69:621–
   630.
- Huang, S., Jia, A., Song, W., Hessler, G., Meng, Y., Sun, Y., Xu, L., Laessle, H.,
  Jirschitzka, J., Ma, S., et al. (2022a). Identification and receptor mechanism of TIRcatalyzed small molecules in plant immunity. *Science* 337:10.1126/science.abg3297.
- Huang, X., Wang, W., Gong, T., Wickell, D., Kuo, L.-Y., Zhang, X., Wen, J., Kim, H., Lu, F.,
  Zhao, H., et al. (2022b). The flying spider-monkey tree fern genome provides insights
  into fern evolution and arborescence. *Nat Plants* 8:500–512.
- Hulin, M. T., Hill, L., Jones, J. D. G., and Ma, W. (2023). Pangenomic analysis reveals plant
   NAD+ manipulation as an important virulence activity of bacterial pathogen effectors.
   *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 120:e2217114120.

- 1109 lakovidis, M., Chung, E. H., Saile, S. C., Sauberzweig, E., and El Kasmi, F. (2023). The
   1110 emerging frontier of plant immunity's core hubs. *FEBS Journal* 290:3311–3335.
- Jacob, P., Kim, N. H., Wu, F., El-kasmi, F., Walton, W. G., Furzer, O. J., Lietzen, A. D.,
  Sunil, S., Kempthorn, K., Redinbo, M. R., et al. (2021). Plant "helper" immune
  receptors are Ca2+-permeable nonselective cation channels. *Science* 373:420–425.
- Jeon, H.-W., Iwakawa, H., Naramoto, S., Herrfurth, C., Gutsche, N., Schlueter, T.,
  Kyozuka, J., Miyauchi, S., Feussner, I., Zachgo, S., et al. (2022). Contrasting and
  conserved roles of NPR proteins in diverged land plant lineages. *bioRxiv*doi:10.1101/2022.07.19.500630.
- Jia, Q., Li, G., Köllner, T. G., Fu, J., Chen, X., Xiong, W., Crandall-Stotler, B. J., Bowman,
   J. L., Weston, D. J., Zhang, Y., et al. (2016). Microbial-type terpene synthase genes
   occur widely in nonseed land plants, but not in seed plants. *Proceedings of the National* Academy of Sciences 113:12328–12333.
- Jia, Q., Köllner, T. G., Gershenzon, J., and Chen, F. (2018). MTPSLs: New Terpene
   Synthases in Nonseed Plants. *Trends Plant Sci* 23:121–128.
- Jia, A., Huang, S., Song, W., Wang, J., Meng, Y., Sun, Y., Xu, L., Laessle, H., Jirschitzka,
   J., Hou, J., et al. (2022). TIR-catalyzed ADP-ribosylation reactions produce signaling
   molecules for plant immunity. *Science* 377:10.1126/science.abq8180.
- Jia, A., Huang, S., Ma, S., Chang, X., Han, Z., and Chai, J. (2023). TIR-catalyzed
   nucleotide signaling molecules in plant defense. *Curr Opin Plant Biol* **73**:102334.
- Johanndrees, O., Baggs, E. L., Uhlmann, C., Locci, F., Läßle, H. L., Melkonian, K.,
   Käufer, K., Dongus, J. A., Nakagami, H., Krasileva, K. V., et al. (2023). Variation in
   plant Toll/Interleukin-1 receptor domain protein dependence on ENHANCED DISEASE
   SUSCEPTIBILITY 1. *Plant Physiol* 191:626–642.
- 1133 Jones, J. D. G., and Dangl, J. L. (2006). The plant immune system. *Nature* 444:323–329.
- Jones, D. A., Thomas, C. M., Hammond-Kosack, K. E., Balint-Kurti, P. J., and Jones, J.
   D. G. (1994). Isolation of the tomato Cf-9 gene for resistance to Cladosporium fulvum by transposon tagging. *Science* 266:789–793.
- Jones, J. D. G., Vance, R. E., and Dangl, J. L. (2016). Intracellular innate immune
   surveillance devices in plants and animals. *Science* 354.
- Kadota, Y., Sklenar, J., Derbyshire, P., Stransfeld, L., Asai, S., Ntoukakis, V., Jones, J.
  D. G., Shirasu, K., Menke, F., Jones, A., et al. (2014). Direct Regulation of the NADPH
  Oxidase RBOHD by the PRR-Associated Kinase BIK1 during Plant Immunity. *Mol Cell*54:43–55.
- Kibby, E. M., Conte, A. N., Burroughs, A. M., Nagy, T. A., Vargas, J. A., Whalen, L. A.,
  Aravind, L., and Whiteley, A. T. (2023). Bacterial NLR-related proteins protect against
  phage. *Cell* 186:2410-2424.e18.
- Kirschner, R., Lee, P. H., and Huang, Y.-M. (2019). Diversity of fungi on Taiwanese fern
   plants: review and new discoveries. *Taiwania* 64:163–175.
- Klessig, D. F., Choi, H. W., and Dempsey, D. A. (2018). Systemic acquired resistance and
  salicylic acid: Past, present, and future. *Molecular Plant-Microbe Interactions* 31:871–
  888.

- Kodama, K., Rich, M. K., Yoda, A., Shimazaki, S., Xie, X., Akiyama, K., Mizuno, Y.,
   Komatsu, A., Luo, Y., Suzuki, H., et al. (2022a). An ancestral function of strigolactones as symbiotic rhizosphere signals. *Nat Commun* 13:3974.
- Kodama, K., Rich, M. K., Yoda, A., Shimazaki, S., Xie, X., Akiyama, K., Mizuno, Y.,
  Komatsu, A., Luo, Y., Suzuki, H., et al. (2022b). An ancestral function of strigolactones as symbiotic rhizosphere signals. *Nat Commun* 13:3974.
- Kourelis, J., and Van Der Hoorn, R. A. L. (2018). Defended to the Nines: 25 years of
   Resistance Gene Cloning Identifies Nine Mechanisms for R Protein Function. *Plant Cell* 30:285–299.
- Kourelis, J., Sakai, T., Adachi, H., and Id, S. K. (2021). RefPlantNLR is a comprehensive
   collection of experimentally validated plant disease resistance proteins from the NLR
   family. *PLoS Biol* 19:e3001124.
- Kourelis, J., Marchal, C., Posbeyikian, A., Harant, A., and Kamoun, S. (2023). NLR
  immune receptor–nanobody fusions confer plant disease resistance. *Science* 379:934–
  939.
- Lacombe, S., Rougon-Cardoso, A., Sherwood, E., Peeters, N., Dahlbeck, D., Van Esse,
   H. P., Smoker, M., Rallapalli, G., Thomma, B. P. H. J., Staskawicz, B., et al. (2010).
   Interfamily transfer of a plant pattern-recognition receptor confers broad-spectrum
   bacterial resistance. *Nat Biotechnol* 28:365–369.
- Lang, D., Ullrich, K. K., Murat, F., Fuchs, J., Jenkins, J., Haas, F. B., Piednoel, M.,
  Gundlach, H., Van Bel, M., Meyberg, R., et al. (2018). The Physcomitrella patens
  chromosome-scale assembly reveals moss genome structure and evolution. *The Plant Journal* 93:515–533.
- Lapin, D., Johanndrees, O., Wu, Z., Li, X., and Parker, J. E. (2022). Molecular innovations
   in plant TIR-based immunity signaling. *Plant Cell* 34:1479–1496.
- Leavitt, A., Yirmiya, E., Amitai, G., Lu, A., Garb, J., Herbst, E., Morehouse, B. R., Hobbs,
   S. J., Antine, S. P., Sun, Z.-Y. J., et al. (2022). Viruses inhibit TIR gcADPR signaling to
   overcome bacterial defense. *Nature* 611:326–331.
- Lee, H.-Y., Oh, S., Mang, H., Choi, E., Seo, Y.-E., Kim, M.-S., Oh, S., Kim, S.-B., and Choi,
   D. (2020). Genome-wide functional analysis of hot pepper immune receptors reveals an
   autonomous NLR clade in seed plants. *New Phytologist* 229:532–547.
- Lemmon, M. A., and Schlessinger, J. (2010). Cell Signaling by Receptor Tyrosine Kinases.
   *Cell* 141:1117–1134.
- Lerouge, P., Roche, P., Faucher, C., Maillet, F., Truchet, G., Promé, J. C., and Dénarié, J.
  (1990). Symbiotic host-specificity of Rhizobium meliloti is determined by a sulphated
  and acylated glucosamine oligosaccharide signal. *Nature* 344:781–784.
- 1187 Lewontin, R. C., Ginzburg, L. R., and Tuljapurkar, S. D. (2010). Heterosis. *Plant Cell* 22:2105–2112.
- Li, F. W., Brouwer, P., Carretero-Paulet, L., Cheng, S., De Vries, J., Delaux, P.-M., Eily, A.,
   Koppers, N., Kuo, L. Y., Li, Z., et al. (2018a). Fern genomes elucidate land plant
   evolution and cyanobacterial symbioses. *Nat Plants* 4:460–472.
- Li, Y., Zhang, Y., Wang, Q. X., Wang, T. T., Cao, X. L., Zhao, Z. X., Zhao, S. L., Xu, Y. J.,
   Xiao, Z. Y., Li, J. L., et al. (2018b). RESISTANCE TO POWDERY MILDEW8.1 boosts

- pattern-triggered immunity against multiple pathogens in Arabidopsis and rice. *Plant Biotechnol J* 16:428–441.
- Li, H. T., Yi, T. S., Gao, L. M., Ma, P. F., Zhang, T., Yang, J. B., Gitzendanner, M. A.,
   Fritsch, P. W., Cai, J., Luo, Y., et al. (2019). Origin of angiosperms and the puzzle of
   the Jurassic gap. *Nat Plants* 5:461–470.
- Li, F. W., Nishiyama, T., Waller, M., Frangedakis, E., Keller, J., Li, Z., Fernandez-Pozo,
   N., Barker, M. S., Bennett, T., Blázquez, M. A., et al. (2020). Anthoceros genomes
   illuminate the origin of land plants and the unique biology of hornworts. *Nat Plants* 6:259–272.
- Li, X. R., Sun, J., Albinsky, D., Zarrabian, D., Hull, R., Lee, T., Jarratt-Barnham, E., Chiu,
   C. H., Jacobsen, A., Soumpourou, E., et al. (2022). Nutrient regulation of
   lipochitooligosaccharide recognition in plants via NSP1 and NSP2. *Nat Commun* 13:10.1038/s41467-022-33908–3.
- Liang, W., van Wersch, S., Tong, M., and Li, X. (2018). TIR-NB-LRR immune receptor
   SOC3 pairs with truncated TIR-NB protein CHS1 or TN2 to monitor the homeostasis of
   E3 ligase SAUL1. New Phytologist 221:2054–2066.
- Libourel, C., Keller, J., Brichet, L., Cazalé, A. C., Carrère, S., Vernié, T., Couzigou, J. M.,
   Callot, C., Dufau, I., Cauet, S., et al. (2023). Comparative phylotranscriptomics reveals
   ancestral and derived root nodule symbiosis programmes. *Nat Plants* 9:1067–1080.
- Limpens, E., Franken, C., Smit, P., Willemse, J., Bisseling, T., and Geurts, R. (2003).
   LysM Domain Receptor Kinases Regulating Rhizobial Nod Factor-Induced Infection.
   Science 302:630–633.
- Liu, Y., Zeng, Z., Zhang, Y. M., Li, Q., Jiang, X. M., Jiang, Z., Tang, J. H., Chen, D., Wang,
   Q., Chen, J. Q., et al. (2021). An angiosperm NLR Atlas reveals that NLR gene
   reduction is associated with ecological specialization and signal transduction component
   deletion. *Mol Plant* 14:2015–2031.
- Liu, Y., Wang, S., Li, L., Yang, T., Dong, S., Wei, T., Wu, S., Liu, Y., Gong, Y., Feng, X., et
   al. (2022). The Cycas genome and the early evolution of seed plants. *Nat Plants* 8:389–
   401.
- Liu, Y., Zhang, Y. M., Tang, Y., Chen, J. Q., and Shao, Z. Q. (2023). The evolution of plant
   NLR immune receptors and downstream signal components. *Curr Opin Plant Biol* 73:102363.
- Loquet, A., and Saupe, S. J. (2017). Diversity of amyloid motifs in NLR signaling in fungi.
   *Biomolecules* 7:38.
- Lu, D., Wu, S., Gao, X., Zhang, Y., Shan, L., and He, P. (2010a). A receptor-like cytoplasmic kinase, BIK1, associates with a flagellin receptor complex to initiate plant innate immunity. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 107:496–501.
- Lu, D., Wu, S., Gao, X., Zhang, Y., Shan, L., and He, P. (2010b). A receptor-like cytoplasmic kinase, BIK1, associates with a flagellin receptor complex to initiate plant innate immunity. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 107:496–501.
- Ma, X. F., Li, Y., Sun, J. L., Wang, T. T., Fan, J., Lei, Y., Huang, Y. Y., Xu, Y.-J., Zhao, J. Q.,
   Xiao, S., et al. (2014). Ectopic expression of RESISTANCE to POWDERY MILDEW8.1

- 1236 Confers resistance to fungal and oomycete pathogens in arabidopsis. *Plant Cell Physiol*1237 55:1484–1496.
- Ma, S., Lapin, D., Liu, L., Sun, Y., Song, W., Zhang, X., Logemann, E., Yu, D., Wang, J.,
   Jirschitzka, J., et al. (2020). Direct pathogen-induced assembly of an NLR immune
   receptor complex to form a holoenzyme. *Science* 370:eabe3069.
- Maekawa, T., Cheng, W., Spiridon, L. N., Töller, A., Lukasik, E., Saijo, Y., Liu, P., Shen,
   Q. H., Micluta, M. A., Somssich, I. E., et al. (2011). Coiled-coil domain-dependent
   homodimerization of intracellular barley immune receptors defines a minimal functional
   module for triggering cell death. *Cell Host Microbe* 9:187–199.
- Maillet, F., Poinsot, V., André, O., Puech-Pagés, V., Haouy, A., Gueunier, M., Cromer, L.,
   Giraudet, D., Formey, D., Niebel, A., et al. (2011). Fungal lipochitooligosaccharide
   symbiotic signals in arbuscular mycorrhiza. *Nature* 469:58–63.
- Man, J., Harrington, T., Lally, K., and Bartlett, M. E. (2023). Asymmetric evolution of
   protein domains in the leucine-rich repeat receptor-like kinase (LRR-RLK) family of plant
   developmental coordinators. *Mol Biol Evol* doi:10.1093/MOLBEV/MSAD220.
- Marchal, C., Michalopoulou, V. A., Zou, Z., Cevik, V., and Sarris, P. F. (2022). Show me
   your ID: NLR immune receptors with integrated domains in plants. *Essays Biochem* 66:527–539.
- Marchant, D. B., Chen, G., Cai, S., Chen, F., Schafran, P., Jenkins, J., Shu, S., Plott, C.,
   Webber, J., Lovell, J. T., et al. (2022). Dynamic genome evolution in a model fern. *Nat Plants* 8:1038–1051.
- Martin, R., Qi, T., Zhang, H., Liu, F., King, M., Toth, C., and Staskawicz, B. J. (2020).
   Structure of the activated Roq1 resistosome directly recognizing the pathogen effector
   XopQ. Science 370:eabd9993.
- Martinon, F., Hofmann, K., and Tschopp, J. (2001). The pyrin domain: A possible member
   of the death domain-fold family implicated in apoptosis and inflammation. *Current Biology* 11:R118–R120.
- Matsui, H., Iwakawa, H., Hyon, G. S., Yotsui, I., Katou, S., Monte, I., Nishihama, R.,
   Franzen, R., Solano, R., and Nakagami, H. (2019). Isolation of Natural Fungal
   Pathogens from Marchantia polymorpha Reveals Antagonism between Salicylic Acid
   and Jasmonate during Liverwort-Fungus Interactions. *Plant Cell Physiol* 61:265–275.
- Meyers, B. C., Kozik, A., Griego, A., Kuang, H., and Michelmore, R. W. (2003). Genome Wide Analysis of NBS-LRR Encoding Genes in Arabidopsis. *Plant Cell* 15:809–834.
- Miao, E. A., Alpuche-Aranda, C. M., Dors, M., Clark, A. E., Bader, M. W., Miller, S. I., and
   Aderem, A. (2006). Cytoplasmic flagellin activates caspase-1 and secretion of
   interleukin 1β via Ipaf. *Nat Immunol* **7**:569–575.
- Miya, A., Albert, P., Shinya, T., Desaki, Y., Ichimura, K., Shirasu, K., Narusaka, Y.,
  Kawakami, N., Kaku, H., and Shibuya, N. (2007). CERK1, a LysM receptor kinase, is
  essential for chitin elicitor signaling in Arabidopsis. *Proceedings of the National*Academy of Sciences 104:19613–19618.
- Monaghan, J., Matschi, S., Romeis, T., and Zipfel, C. (2015). The calcium-dependent
   protein kinase CPK28 negatively regulates the BIK1-mediated PAMPinduced calcium
   burst. *Plant Signal Behav* 10:e1018497.

- Moner-Ros, E., Jiménez-Góngora, T., Villar-Martín, L., González-Miguel, V. M., Kutnjak,
   D., and Rubio-Somoza, I. (2023). Conservation of molecular responses upon viral
   infection in the non-vascular plant Marchantia polymorpha. *bioRxiv* doi:10.1101/2023.11.06.565823.
- Monte, I., Ishida, S., Zamarreño, A. M., Hamberg, M., Franco-Zorrilla, J. M., GarcíaCasado, G., Gouhier-Darimont, C., Reymond, P., Takahashi, K., García-Mina, J. M.,
  et al. (2018). Ligand-receptor co-evolution shaped the jasmonate pathway in land
  plants. *Nat Chem Biol* 14:480–488.
- Monte, I., Caballero, J., Zamarreño, A. M., Fernández-Barbero, G., García-Mina, J. M.,
   and Solano, R. (2022). JAZ is essential for ligand specificity of the COI1/JAZ co receptor. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 119:e2212155119.
- Montgomery, S. A., Tanizawa, Y., Galik, B., Wang, N., Ito, T., Mochizuki, T., Akimcheva,
   S., Bowman, J. L., Cognat, V., Maréchal-Drouard, L., et al. (2020). Chromatin
   Organization in Early Land Plants Reveals an Ancestral Association between
   H3K27me3, Transposons, and Constitutive Heterochromatin. *Current Biology* 30:573 588.e7.
- Morris, J. L., Puttick, M. N., Clark, J. W., Edwards, D., Kenrick, P., Pressel, S., Wellman,
   C. H., Yang, Z., Schneider, H., and Donoghue, P. C. J. (2018). The timescale of early
   land plant evolution. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 115:E2274–
   E2283.
- Nelson, J. M., Hauser, D. A., Hinson, R., and Shaw, A. J. (2018). A novel experimental
  system using the liverwort Marchantia polymorpha and its fungal endophytes reveals
  diverse and context-dependent effects. *New Phytologist* 218:1217–1232.
- Ngou, B. P. M., Ahn, H. K., Ding, P., and Jones, J. D. G. (2021). Mutual potentiation of
   plant immunity by cell-surface and intracellular receptors. *Nature* 592:110–115.
- Ngou, B. P. M., Ding, P., and Jones, J. D. G. (2022a). Thirty years of resistance: Zig-zag
   through the plant immune system. *Plant Cell* 34:1447–1478.
- Ngou, B. P. M., Heal, R., Wyler, M., Schmid, M. W., and Jones, J. D. G. (2022b).
  Concerted expansion and contraction of immune receptor gene repertoires in plant genomes. *Nat Plants* 8:1146–1152.
- Ngou, B. P. M., Heal, R., Wyler, M., Schmid, M. W., and Jones, J. D. G. (2022c).
  Concerted expansion and contraction of immune receptor gene repertoires in plant genomes. *Nat Plants* 8:1146–1152.
- Ngou, B. P. M., Wyler, M., Schmid, M. W., Kadota, Y., and Shirasu, K. (2023). Evolutionary
   Trajectory of Pattern Recognition Receptors in Plants. *bioRxiv* doi:10.1101/2023.07.04.547604.
- Nishimura, M. T., Anderson, R. G., Cherkis, K. A., Law, T. F., Liu, Q. L., and Machius,
  Mischa. (2016). TIR-only protein RBA1 recognizes a pathogen effector to regulate cell
  death in Arabidopsis. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 114:E2053–
  E2062.
- Nishiyama, T., Sakayama, H., de Vries, J., Buschmann, H., Saint-Marcoux, D., Ullrich, K.
   K., Haas, F. B., Vanderstraeten, L., Becker, D., Lang, D., et al. (2018). The Chara
   Genome: Secondary Complexity and Implications for Plant Terrestrialization. *Cell* 174:448-464.e24.

- Ofir, G., Herbst, E., Baroz, M., Cohen, D., Millman, A., Doron, S., Tal, N., Malheiro, D. B.
   A., Malitsky, S., Amitai, G., et al. (2021). Antiviral activity of bacterial TIR domains via signaling molecules. *Nature* 600:116–120.
- Oldroyd, G. E. D. (2013). Speak, friend, and enter: Signalling systems that promote
   beneficial symbiotic associations in plants. *Nat Rev Microbiol* 11:252–263.
- Oliver, J. P., Castro, A., Gaggero, C., Cascón, T., Schmelz, E. A., Castresana, C., and
   Ponce De León, I. (2009). Pythium infection activates conserved plant defense
   responses in mosses. *Planta* 230:569–579.
- 1331 Orr, H. A. (1996). Dobzhansky, Bateson, and the genetics of speciation. *Genetics* 144:1331–
   1332 1335.
- 1333 Osbourn, A. E. (1996). Preformed Antimicrobial Compounds and Plant Defense against
   1334 Fungal Attack. *Plant Cell* 8:1821–1831.
- Paasch, B. C., and He, S. Y. (2021). Toward understanding microbiota homeostasis in the
   plant kingdom. *PLoS Pathog* 17:e1009472.
- Paries, M., and Gutjahr, C. (2023). The good, the bad, and the phosphate: regulation of
   beneficial and detrimental plant–microbe interactions by the plant phosphate status.
   *New Phytologist* 239:29–46.
- Parker, J. E., Holub, E. B., Frost, L. N., Falk, A., Gunn, N. D., and Daniels, M. J. (1996).
  Characterization of eds1, a mutation in Arabidopsis suppressing resistance to
  Peronospora parasitica specified by several different RPP genes. *Plant Cell* 8:2033–
  2046.
- Parnet, P., Garka, K. E., Bonnert, T. P., Dower, S. K., and Sims, J. E. (1996). IL-1Rrp is a
  novel receptor-like molecule similar to the type I interleukin-1 receptor and its
  homologues T1/ST2 and IL-1R AcP. *Journal of Biological Chemistry* 271:3967–3970.
- Peng, Y., Sun, T., and Zhang, Y. (2017). Perception of salicylic acid in Physcomitrella
   patens. *Front Plant Sci* 8:318389.
- Piofczyk, T., Jeena, G., and Pecinka, A. (2015). Arabidopsis thaliana natural variation
   reveals connections between UV radiation stress and plant pathogen-like defense
   responses. *Plant Physiology and Biochemistry* 93:34–43.
- Pokotylo, I., Kravets, V., and Ruelland, E. (2019). Salicylic acid binding proteins (SABPs):
   The hidden forefront of salicylic acid signalling. *Int J Mol Sci* 20:4377.
- Ponce De León, I., Schmelz, E. A., Gaggero, C., Castro, A., Álvarez, A., and Montesano,
   M. (2012). Physcomitrella patens activates reinforcement of the cell wall, programmed
   cell death and accumulation of evolutionary conserved defence signals, such as salicylic
   acid and 12-oxo-phytodienoic acid, but not jasmonic acid, upon Botrytis cinerea
   infection. *Mol Plant Pathol* 13:960–974.
- Poyet, J. L., Srinivasula, S. M., Tnani, M., Razmara, M., Fernandes-Alnemri, T., and
   Alnemri, E. S. (2001). Identification of Ipaf, a Human Caspase-1-activating Protein
   Related to Apaf-1. *Journal of Biological Chemistry* 276:28309–28313.
- Qi, T., Seong, K., Thomazella, D. P. T., Kim, J. R., Pham, J., Seo, E., Cho, M.-J.,
   Schultink, A., and Staskawicz, B. J. (2018). NRG1 functions downstream of EDS1 to
   regulate TIR-NLR-mediated plant immunity in Nicotiana benthamiana. *Proceedings of* the National Academy of Sciences 115:E10979–E10987.

- Radhakrishnan, G. V., Keller, J., Rich, M. K., Vernié, T., Mbadinga Mbaginda, D. L.,
   Vigneron, N., Cottret, L., San Clemente, H., Libourel, C., Cheema, J., et al. (2020).
   An ancestral signalling pathway is conserved in plant lineages forming intracellular
   symbioses. *Nat Plants* 6:280–289.
- Radutoiu, S., Madsen, L. H., Madsen, E. B., Felle, H. H., Umehara, Y., Grønlund, M.,
   Sato, S., Nakamura, Y., Tabata, S., Sandal, N., et al. (2003). Plant recognition of
   symbiotic bacteria requires two LysM receptor-like kinases. *Nature* 425:585–592.
- 1373 Reboledo, G., Agorio, A. d., Vignale, L., Batista-García, R. A., and Ponce De León, I.
   1374 (2021). Transcriptional profiling reveals conserved and species-specific plant defense
   1375 responses during the interaction of Physcomitrium patens with Botrytis cinerea. *Plant* 1376 *Mol Biol* 107:365–385.
- 1377 Redkar, A., Gimenez Ibanez, S., Sabale, M., Zechmann, B., Solano, R., and Di Pietro, A.
   1378 (2021). Marchantia polymorpha model reveals conserved infection mechanisms in the
   1379 vascular wilt fungal pathogen Fusarium oxysporum. New Phytologist 234:227–241.
- Redkar, A., Sabale, M., Schudoma, C., Zechmann, B., Gupta, Y. K., López-Berges, M. S.,
   Venturini, G., Gimenez-Ibanez, S., Turrà, D., Solano, R., et al. (2022). Conserved
   secreted effectors contribute to endophytic growth and multihost plant compatibility in a
   vascular wilt fungus. *Plant Cell* 34:3214–3232.
- 1384 Remy, W., Taylor, T. N., Hass, H., and Kerp, H. (1994). Four hundred-million-year-old
  1385 vesicular arbuscular mycorrhizae. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*1386 91:11841–11843.
- 1387 Rich, M. K., Vigneron, N., Libourel, C., Keller, J., Xue, L., Hajheidari, M., Radhakrishnan,
  1388 G. V, Le Ru, A., Diop, S. I., Potente, G., et al. (2021). Lipid exchanges drove the
  1389 evolution of mutualism during plant terrestrialization. *Science* 372:864–868.
- Richter, D. J., and Levin, T. C. (2019). The origin and evolution of cell-intrinsic antibacterial
   defenses in eukaryotes. *Curr Opin Genet Dev* 58–59:111–122.
- Rieseberg, T. P., Dadras, A., Fürst-Jansen, J. M. R., Dhabalia Ashok, A., Darienko, T., de
   Vries, S., Irisarri, I., and de Vries, J. (2023). Crossroads in the evolution of plant
   specialized metabolism. Semin Cell Dev Biol 134:37–58.
- Rowland, O., Ludwig, A. a, Merrick, C. J., Baillieul, F., Tracy, F. E., Yoshioka, H.,
   Durrant, W. E., Fritz-laylin, L., Nekrasov, V., Sjo, K., et al. (2005). Functional Analysis
   of Avr9 / Cf-9 Rapidly Elicited Genes Identifies a Protein Kinase, ACIK1, That Is
   Essential for Full Cf-9 Dependent Disease Resistance in Tomato. *Plant Cell* 17:295–310.
- Rubinstein, C. V., Gerrienne, P., de la Puente, G. S., Astini, R. A., and Steemans, P.
  (2010). Early Middle Ordovician evidence for land plants in Argentina (eastern
  Gondwana). New Phytologist 188:365–369.
- Rush, T. A., Puech-Pagès, V., Bascaules, A., Jargeat, P., Maillet, F., Haouy, A., Maës, A.
  Q. M., Carriel, C. C., Khokhani, D., Keller-Pearson, M., et al. (2020). Lipochitooligosaccharides as regulatory signals of fungal growth and development. *Nat Commun* 11:3897.
- Saile, S. C., Jacob, P., Castel, B., Jubic, L. M., Salas-Gonzalez, I., Backer, M., Jones, J.
   D. G., Dangl, J. L., and Kasmi, F. El (2020). Two unequally redundant "helper" immune

- receptor families mediate Arabidopsis thaliana intracellular "sensor" immune receptor
   functions. *PLoS Biol* **18**:e3000783.
- Santner, A., and Estelle, M. (2007). The JAZ proteins link jasmonate perception with
   transcriptional changes. *Plant Cell* 19:3839–3842.
- Saucet, S. B., Esmenjaud, D., and Van Ghelder, C. (2021). Integrity of the Post-LRR
  Domain Is Required for TIR-NB-LRR Function. *Molecular Plant-Microbe Interactions*34:286–296.
- Saupe, S. J. (2020). Amyloid Signaling in Filamentous Fungi and Bacteria. *Annu Rev Microbiol* 74:673–691.
- Schornack, S., and Kamoun, S. (2023). EVO-MPMI: From fundamental science to practical
   applications. *Curr Opin Plant Biol* 76:102469.
- Scott, A. D., Zimin, A. V., Puiu, D., Workman, R., Britton, M., Zaman, S., Caballero, M.,
   Read, A. C., Bogdanove, A. J., Burns, E., et al. (2020). A Reference Genome
   Sequence for Giant Sequoia. *G3 Genes/Genomes/Genetics* 10:3907–3919.
- Shao, Z.-Q., Xue, J.-Y., Wu, P., Zhang, Y.-M., Wu, Y., Hang, Y.-Y., Wang, B., and Chen, J. Q. (2016). Large-scale analyses of angiosperm nucleotide-binding site-leucine-rich
   repeat genes reveal three anciently diverged classes with distinct evolutionary patterns.
   *Plant Physiol* 170:2095–2109.
- Shao, Z.-Q., Xue, J. Y., Wang, Q., Wang, B., and Chen, J. Q. (2018). Revisiting the Origin
   of Plant NBS-LRR Genes. *Trends Plant Sci* 24:9–12.
- Shimizu, T., Nakano, T., Takamizawa, D., Desaki, Y., Ishii-Minami, N., Nishizawa, Y.,
   Minami, E., Okada, K., Yamane, H., Kaku, H., et al. (2010). Two LysM receptor
   molecules, CEBiP and OsCERK1, cooperatively regulate chitin elicitor signaling in rice.
   The Plant Journal 64:204–214.
- Shiu, S. H., and Bleecker, A. B. (2001). Receptor-like kinases from Arabidopsis form a
   monophyletic gene family related to animal receptor kinases. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 98:10763–10768.
- Shiu, S. H., and Bleecker, A. B. (2003). Expansion of the Receptor-Like Kinase/Pelle Gene
   Family and Receptor-Like Proteins in Arabidopsis. *Plant Physiol* 132:530–543.
- Singh, S., Davies, K. M., Chagné, D., and Bowman, J. L. (2023). The fate of sex
  chromosomes during the evolution of monoicy from dioicy in liverworts. *Current Biology*33:3597-3609.e3.
- 1441 Smith, S. E., and Read, D. (2008). Mycorrhizal Symbiosis, Third Edition. Elsevier.
- 1442 **Stevenson, J. A.** (1945). Ferns and Fungi. *Am Fern J* **35**:97–104.
- Strullu-Derrien, C., Kenrick, P., and Knoll, A. H. (2019). The Rhynie chert. *Current biology*29:R1218–R1223.
- Strullu-Derrien, C., Goral, T., Spencer, A. R. T., Kenrick, P., Catherine Aime, M., Gaya,
  E., and Hawksworth, D. L. (2023). A fungal plant pathogen discovered in the Devonian
  Rhynie Chert. *Nat Commun* 14:7932.
- 1448 Takeda, K., and Akira, S. (2015). Toll-Like Receptors. *Curr Protoc Immunol* 109:14.12.1 14.12.10.

- Tamborski, J., and Krasileva, K. (2020). Evolution of Plant NLR Immune Receptors: From
   Natural History to Precise Modifications. *Annu Rev Plant Biol* **71**:335–378.
- Taylor, A. T. N., Remy, W., Hass, H., Kerp, H., Mycologia, S., and Aug, N. J. (1995).
   Mycological Society of America Fossil Arbuscular Mycorrhizae from the Early Devonian.
   Mycologia 87:560–573.
- Thaler, J. S., Humphrey, P. T., and Whiteman, N. K. (2012). Evolution of jasmonate and salicylate signal crosstalk. *Trends Plant Sci* 17:260–270.
- Tong, Z. Bin, Gold, L., Pfeifer, K. E., Dorward, H., Lee, E., Bondy, C. A., Dean, J., and
   Nelson, L. M. (2000). Mater, a maternal effect gene required for early embryonic
   development in mice. *Nat Genet* 26:267–268.
- Toome, M., Ohm, R. A., Riley, R. W., James, T. Y., Lazarus, K. L., Henrissat, B., Albu, S.,
  Boyd, A., Chow, J., Clum, A., et al. (2014). Genome sequencing provides insight into
  the reproductive biology, nutritional mode and ploidy of the fern pathogen Mixia
  osmundae. New Phytologist 202:554–564.
- Tran, D. T. N., Chung, E. H., Habring-Müller, A., Demar, M., Schwab, R., Dangl, J. L.,
  Weigel, D., and Chae, E. (2017). Activation of a Plant NLR Complex through
  Heteromeric Association with an Autoimmune Risk Variant of Another NLR. *Current*Biology 27:1148–1160.
- Upson, J. L., Zess, E. K., Białas, A., Wu, C.-H., and Kamoun, S. (2018). The coming of
   age of EvoMPMI: evolutionary molecular plant–microbe interactions across multiple
   timescales. *Curr Opin Plant Biol* 44:108–116.
- 1471 Urbach, J. M., and Ausubel, F. M. (2017). The NBS-LRR architectures of plant R-proteins
   1472 and metazoan NLRs evolved in independent events. *Proceedings of the National* 1473 Academy of Sciences 114:1063–1068.
- Valanne, S., Wang, J.-H., and Rämet, M. (2011). The Drosophila Toll Signaling Pathway.
   *The Journal of Immunology* 186:649–656.
- 1476 Van Der Biezen, E. A., and Jones, J. D. G. (1998). Plant disease-resistance proteins and
   1477 the gene-for-gene concept. *Trends Biochem Sci* 23:454–456.
- van Velzen, R., Holmer, R., Bu, F., Rutten, L., van Zeijl, A., Liu, W., Santuari, L., Cao, Q.,
   Sharma, T., Shen, D., et al. (2018). Comparative genomics of the nonlegume
   Parasponia reveals insights into evolution of nitrogen-fixing rhizobium symbioses.
   *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 115:E4700–E4709.
- Wan, T., Liu, Z. M., Li, L. F., Leitch, A. R., Leitch, I. J., Lohaus, R., Liu, Z. J., Xin, H. P.,
  Gong, Y. B., Liu, Y., et al. (2018). A genome for gnetophytes and early evolution of
  seed plants. *Nat Plants* 4:82–89.
- Wan, L., Essuman, K., Anderson, R. G., Sasaki, Y., Monteiro, F., Chung, E.-H., Osborne
   Nishimura, E., DiAntonio, A., Milbrandt, J., Dangl, J. L., et al. (2019). TIR domains of
   plant immune receptors are NAD+-cleaving enzymes that promote cell death. *Science* 365:799–803.
- Wan, T., Liu, Z., Leitch, I. J., Xin, H., Maggs-Kölling, G., Gong, Y., Li, Z., Marais, E., Liao,
   Y., Dai, C., et al. (2021). The Welwitschia genome reveals a unique biology
   underpinning extreme longevity in deserts. *Nat Commun* 12:4247.

- Wang, Y., Zhang, Y., Wang, Z., Zhang, X., and Yang, S. (2013). A missense mutation in
  CHS1, a TIR-NB protein, induces chilling sensitivity in Arabidopsis. *The Plant Journal*75:553–565.
- Wang, J., Hu, M., Wang, J., Qi, J., Han, Z., Wang, G., Qi, Y., Wang, H.-W., Zhou, J.-M.,
  and Chai, J. (2019a). Reconstitution and structure of a plant NLR resistosome
  conferring immunity. *Science* 364:eaav5870.
- Wang, J., Wang, J., Hu, M., Qi, J., Wang, G., Han, Z., Qi, Y., Wang, H.-W., Zhou, J.-M.,
  and Chai, J. (2019b). Ligand-triggered allosteric ADP release primes a plant NLR
  complex. Science 364:eaav5868.
- Westerveld, G. H., Korver, C. M., van Pelt, A. M. M., Leschot, N. J., van der Veen, F.,
  Repping, S., and Lombardi, M. P. (2006). Mutations in the testis-specific NALP14 gene
  in men suffering from spermatogenic failure. *Human Reproduction* 21:3178–3184.
- Wickell, D., Kuo, L. Y., Yang, H. P., Dhabalia Ashok, A., Irisarri, I., Dadras, A., de Vries,
  S., de Vries, J., Huang, Y. M., Li, Z., et al. (2021). Underwater CAM photosynthesis
  elucidated by Isoetes genome. *Nat Commun* 12:6348.
- Winter, P. S., Bowman, C. E., Villani, P. J., Dolan, T. E., and Hauck, N. R. (2014). Systemic
   Acquired Resistance in Moss: Further Evidence for Conserved Defense Mechanisms in
   Plants. *PLoS One* 9:e101880.
- Woudstra, Y., Tumas, H., Van Ghelder, C., Hung, T. H., Ilska, J. J., Girardi, S., Hara, S. A.
  ', Mclean, P., Cottrell, J., Bohlmann, J., et al. (2023). Conifers concentrate large
  numbers of NLR immune receptor genes on one chromosome. *bioRxiv*doi:10.1101/2023.10.20.563305.
- Wroblewski, T., Spiridon, L., Martin, E. C., Petrescu, A.-J., Cavanaugh, K., Jose-Truco,
   M., Xu, H., Gozdowski, D., Pawłowski, K., Michelmore, R. W., et al. (2018). Genome wide functional analyses of plant coiled coil NLR-type pathogen receptors reveal
   essential roles of their N-terminal domain in oligomerization, networking, and immunity.
   *PLoS Biol* 16:e2005821.
- Wu, Z., Li, M., Dong, O. X., Xia, S., Liang, W., Bao, Y., Wasteneys, G., and Li, X. (2019).
   Differential regulation of TNL-mediated immune signaling by redundant helper CNLs.
   *New Phytologist* 222:938–953.
- Wu, X., Zhang, L., Wang, X., Zhang, R., Jin, G., Hu, Y., Yang, H., Wu, Z., Ma, Y., Zhang,
  C., et al. (2023). Evolutionary history of two evergreen Rhododendron species as
  revealed by chromosome-level genome assembly. *Front Plant Sci* 14:1123707.
- Xiao, S., Ellwood, S., Calis, O., Patrick, E., Li, T., Coleman, M., and Turner, J. G. (2001).
   Broad-spectrum mildew resistance in Arabidopsis thaliana mediated by RPW8. *Science* 291:118–120.
- Xie, D. X., Feys, B. F., James, S., Nieto-Rostro, M., and Turner, J. G. (1998). COI1: An
   Arabidopsis gene required for jasmonate-regulated defense and fertility. *Science* 280:1091–1094.

Xue, J.-Y., Zhao, T., Liu, Y., Liu, Y., Zhang, Y.-X., Zhang, G.-Q., Chen, H., Zhou, G.-C.,
 Zhang, S.-Z., and Shao, Z.-Q. (2020). Genome- Wide Analysis of the Nucleotide
 Binding Site Leucine-Rich Repeat Genes of Four Orchids Revealed Extremely Low
 Numbers of Disease Resistance Genes. *Front Genet* 10:10.3389/fgene.2019.01286.

- Yotsui, I., Matsui, H., Miyauchi, S., Iwakawa, H., Melkonian, K., Schlüter, T., Michavila,
   S., Kanazawa, T., Nomura, Y., Stolze, S. C., et al. (2023). LysM-mediated signaling in
   Marchantia polymorpha highlights the conservation of pattern-triggered immunity in land
   plants. *Current Biology* 33:3732-3746.e8.
- Yu, D., Song, W., Tan, E. Y. J., Liu, L., Cao, Y., Jirschitzka, J., Li, E., Logemann, E., Xu,
  C., Huang, S., et al. (2022a). TIR domains of plant immune receptors are 2',3'cAMP/cGMP synthetases mediating cell death. *Cell* 185:2370-2386.e18.
- Yu, J., Cai, Y., Zhu, Y., Zeng, Y., Dong, S., Zhang, K., Wang, S., Li, L., Goffinet, B., Liu,
  H., et al. (2022b). Chromosome-Level Genome Assemblies of Two Hypnales (Mosses)
  Reveal High Intergeneric Synteny. *Genome Biol Evol* 14:evac020.
- Yu, J. G., Tang, J. Y., Wei, R., Lan, M. F., Xiang, R. C., Zhang, X. C., and Xiang, Q. P.
  (2023). The first homosporous lycophyte genome revealed the association between the recent dynamic accumulation of LTR-RTs and genome size variation. *Plant Mol Biol*112:325–340.
- Yuan, M., Jiang, Z., Bi, G., Nomura, K., Liu, M., He, S. Y., Zhou, J. M., and Xin, X. F.
  (2021). Pattern-recognition receptors are required for NLR-mediated plant immunity. *Nature* doi:10.1101/2020.04.10.031294.
- Yuen, B., Bayes, J. M., and Degnan, S. M. (2014). The characterization of sponge NLRs
   provides insight into the origin and evolution of this innate immune gene family in
   animals. *Mol Biol Evol* 31:106–120.
- Zdrzałek, R., Stone, C., De la Concepcion, J. C., Banfield, M. J., and Bentham, A. R.
   (2023). Pathways to engineering plant intracellular NLR immune receptors. *Curr Opin Plant Biol* 74:102380.
- 1558 Zhang, X., Dong, W., Sun, J., Feng, F., Deng, Y., He, Z., Oldroyd, G. E. D., and Wang, E.
  1559 (2015). The receptor kinase CERK1 has dual functions in symbiosis and immunity
  1560 signalling. *The Plant Journal* 81:258–267.
- 1561 Zhang, J., Fu, X. X., Li, R. Q., Zhao, X., Liu, Y., Li, M. H., Zwaenepoel, A., Ma, H.,
  1562 Goffinet, B., Guan, Y. L., et al. (2020). The hornwort genome and early land plant
  1563 evolution. Nat Plants 6:107–118.
- Zhao, Y. P., Fan, G., Yin, P. P., Sun, S., Li, N., Hong, X., Hu, G., Zhang, H., Zhang, F. M.,
  Han, J. D., et al. (2019). Resequencing 545 ginkgo genomes across the world reveals
  the evolutionary history of the living fossil. *Nat Commun* 10:4201.
- 1567 Zipfel, C., and Oldroyd, G. E. D. (2017). Plant signalling in symbiosis and immunity. *Nature* 1568 543:328–336.
- Zipfel, C., Kunze, G., Chinchilla, D., Caniard, A., Jones, J. D. G., Boller, T., and Felix, G.
   (2006). Perception of the Bacterial PAMP EF-Tu by the Receptor EFR Restricts
   Agrobacterium-Mediated Transformation. *Cell* **125**:749–760.
- 1572
- 1573
- 1574 Figure legends
- 1575 **Figure 1**: STANDS are diverse in plants, other eukaryotes and bacteria

1576 This figure displays some NLRs mentioned in this review. Some other domains not discussed 1577 in the text but mentioned in the literature cited in this review are indicated below the cartoons 1578 for each clade. '... ?' indicates that other domains may exist for a given clade, but their diversity has not been fully explored yet. In plants,  $\alpha$ - $\beta$  hydrolase (Hyd.) and kinase (Kin.) 1579 1580 signalling domains are specific to bryophytes. General domains terms are: CC (coiled-coil), 1581 G10 (G10 coiled-coil), Kin. (kinase), Hyd. (hydrolase), Nuc. (nuclease). Domains with an InterPro entry (www.ebi.ac.uk/interpro) are: RPW8 (IPR008808), 1582 (IPR000157), CARD 1583 (IPR001315), PYD (IPR004020), BIR (IPR001370), PLP (patatin-like phospholipase, 1584 IPR002641), HET (IPR031351), CHAT (IPR024983), NACHT (IPR007111), NB-ARC 1585 (IPR002182), LRR (IPR032675), TPR (IPR011990), WD40 (IPR036322), HEAT (IPR000357), 1586 ANK (IPR036770) and MORN (IPR003409). Silhouette images are from www.phylopic.org. This figure is not exhaustive. For example in plants, non-canonical STANDs exist, such as 1587 1588 truncated domains or extra Integrated Domains (ID) not displayed on this figure. It is 1589 expected that genome mining will reveal more diversity in the future.

1590 **Figure 2**: TIR are conserved protein domain often involved in immunity

TIR domains are present in the whole tree of life as singleton or protein domain. They are often involved in immunity but can also fulfil other functions such as neurone degeneration. They generally function as NADase but can also be adaptors in the case of Toll-like Receptors. Orange indicates supersecondary structure-forming tandem repeat domain. Yellow indicates oligomerization domain. Dark blue indicates other protein domains. Light blue indicates a TIR domain. For the figure, the crystal structure of a monomeric TIR domain of L6 (NLR from the flax plant, PDB: 30ZI) was used.

1598 Figure 3: Cell surface immune receptors evolved in archeoplasids

1599 Phylogenetic tree of archeoplastids displaying major events of two types of cell surface 1600 immune receptors: LysM and LRR. Other types of cell surface immune receptors are not 1601 displayed on this figure. Estimated lineage divergence dates are from (Cheng et al., 2019). 1602 Besides tracheophytes, only a few genomes have been explored and it is likely that future 1603 genome comparisons will reveal a more ancient date for the events displayed, with 1604 subsequent lost in the other lineages. For example, LysM-RK were thought to be land plant 1605 specific, but a recent analyse revealed that they exit in Charophyceae and are lost in 1606 Zygnematophyceae (Yotsui et al., 2023). Light blue represents a cell from Glaucophyta, red 1607 from Rhodophyta and green from Viridiplantae. Silhouette images from are 1608 www.phylopic.org.