

High prevalence of PRDM9-independent recombination hotspots in placental mammals

Julien Joseph, Djivan Prentout, Alexandre Laverré, Théo Tricou, Laurent

Duret

▶ To cite this version:

Julien Joseph, Djivan Prentout, Alexandre Laverré, Théo Tricou, Laurent Duret. High prevalence of PRDM9-independent recombination hotspots in placental mammals. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America, 2024, 121 (23), pp.e2401973121. 10.1073/pnas.2401973121. hal-04604269

HAL Id: hal-04604269 https://hal.science/hal-04604269

Submitted on 7 Jun2024

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

HIGH PREVALENCE OF PRDM9-INDEPENDENT

RECOMBINATION HOTSPOTS IN PLACENTAL MAMMALS

J. Joseph¹^(b), D. Prentout²^(b), A. Laverré^{3,4}^(b), T. Tricou¹^(b), L. Duret¹^(b)

¹Laboratoire de Biométrie et Biologie Evolutive, Université Lyon 1, CNRS, UMR 5558, Villeurbanne, France

²Department of Biological Sciences, Columbia University, New York, NY 10027, USA

³Department of Ecology and Evolution, University of Lausanne, Lausanne, Switzerland

⁴Swiss Institute of Bioinformatics (SIB), Lausanne, Switzerland

julien.joseph@ens-lyon.fr

June 6, 2024

Abstract

In many mammals, recombination events are concentrated into hotspots directed by a se-1 quence specific DNA-binding protein named PRDM9. Intriguingly, PRDM9 has been lost 2 several times in vertebrates, and notably among mammals, it has been pseudogenized in 3 the ancestor of canids. In absence of PRDM9, recombination hotspots tend to occur in 4 promoter-like features such as CpG islands. It has thus been proposed that one role of 5 PRDM9 could be to direct recombination away from those PRDM9-independent hotspots. 6 However, the ability of PRDM9 to direct recombination hotspots has been assessed only in a 7 handful of species, and a clear picture of how much recombination occurs outside of PRDM9-8 directed hotspots in mammals is still lacking. In this study, we derived an estimator of past q recombination activity based on signatures of GC-biased gene conversion in substitution pat-10 terns. We applied it to quantify recombination activity in PRDM9 independent hotspots in 11 52 species of boreoeutherian mammals. We observed a wide range of recombination rate at 12 these loci: several species (such as mice, humans, some felids or cetaceans) show a deficit 13 of recombination, while a majority of mammals display a clear peak of recombination. Our 14 results demonstrate that PRDM9-directed and PRDM9-independent hotspots can co-exist 15 in mammals, and that their co-existence appears to be the rule rather than the exception. 16 Additionally, we show that the location of PRDM9-independent hotspots is relatively stable 17 compared to that of PRDM9-directed hotspots, but that it nevertheless evolves slowly in 18 concert with DNA hypomethylation. 19

21 Significance statement

Meiotic recombination is a key process both to produce gametes and to generate genetic diversity. In many Eukaryotes, recombination tends to occur at specific loci (recombination hotspots). Two types of hotspots have been described so far: in humans and mice, hotspots are directed by the protein PRDM9, whereas in species that lack this gene, hotspots tend to occur in promoter-like features ("default hotspots"). In this study, we demonstrate that despite possessing a functional PRDM9, most mammals also use default hotspots, sometimes as much as in PRDM9-lacking species. Interestingly, the widespread coexistence of redundant recombination-directing systems might explain why Prdm9 has been recurrently lost across animals.

29 Introduction

Meiotic recombination is a crucial step in the production of gametes for a large majority of eukaryotes. It is 30 initiated by programmed double-strand breaks (DSBs), that can be resolved in two types of recombination 31 events, using the homolog as a template: crossovers (COs), where there is a reciprocal exchange of chromo-32 some arms, and non crossovers (NCOs), where DSB repair leads to gene conversion around the DSB site 33 without reciprocal exchange. In most eukaryotes, at least one CO per chromosome is necessary to ensure 34 correct segregation between homologs and is therefore mandatory for meiosis success (Page and Hawley, 35 2003; Gerton and Hawley, 2005). In many vertebrates, recombination events are not uniformly distributed 36 along the genome (reviewed in Stapley et al. (2017); Zelkowski et al. (2019)). Instead, they tend to be 37 concentrated in so-called recombination hotspots (Lichten and Goldman, 1995; Tock and Henderson, 2018). 38

In many mammals, the position of recombination hotspots is determined by the zinc-finger protein 39 PRDM9, which binds specific DNA motifs and recruits the DSB machinery through histone methylation 40 (Baudat et al., 2010; Myers et al., 2010; Parvanov et al., 2010; Diagouraga et al., 2018). This gene is highly 41 42 polymorphic and hundreds of alleles have been reported in mice and humans (Buard et al., 2014; Kono et al., 2014; Alleva et al., 2021). Most allelic diversity is concentrated on residues of the zinc fingers that interact 43 with the DNA, leading to changes in DNA sequence specificity. Therefore, the position of recombination 44 hotspots varies within a population and between species (Auton et al., 2012; Smagulova et al., 2016; Alleva 45 et al., 2021). Additionally, PRDM9 tends to erode its targets through gene conversion (Baker et al., 2015; 46 Smagulova et al., 2016). As the available targets for a given PRDM9 allele become scarce, its ability to 47 generate enough COs for meiosis to succeed is compromised. A new allele with more targets will then 48 be positively selected leading to a red-queen dynamic accelerating the turnover of recombination hotspots 49 (Ubeda and Wilkins, 2011; Latrille et al., 2017; Baker et al., 2022; Genestier et al., 2023). It has also been 50 proposed that when PRDM9 binds symmetrically both homologs, it facilitates the repair of DSBs as COs 51 and thereby contributes to the success of meiosis (Davies et al., 2016; Li et al., 2019; Hinch et al., 2019). 52 Indeed, experiments in mice and rats showed that an inactivation of this protein drastically reduces fertility 53 (Mihola et al., 2019, 2021; Brick et al., 2012). 54

Despite its central role in recombination, PRDM9 has been repeatedly lost in vertebrates. (Baker et al., 2017; Cavassim et al., 2022). Among amniotes, one loss occurred in the ancestor of archosaurs (crocodiles and

birds) (Singhal et al., 2015; Cavassim et al., 2022), and another one in the ancestor of canids (dogs, wolves 57 and foxes) (Oliver et al., 2009; Axelsson et al., 2012; Auton et al., 2013). In dogs and several passerines. 58 studies based on linkage disequilibrium (LD) showed that recombination hotspots tend to occur in CpG 59 islands, and more specifically in hypomethylated ones in dogs (Auton et al., 2013; Berglund et al., 2015; 60 Singhal et al., 2015; Kawakami et al., 2017). Likewise, the DSB hotspots of a mouse whose PRDM9 has 61 been inactivated through a knock-out (PRDM9^{-/-}) also occur in promoter-like features (Brick et al., 2012). 62 Interestingly, an increase of recombination rate near promoters has also been observed in dogs, birds, plants 63 and yeasts, which lack PRDM9 (Petes, 2001; Marand et al., 2017). 64

Those observations led to the conclusion that there exist two types of recombination landscapes in 65 vertebrates. The first one is PRDM9-dependent, fast evolving with recombination targeted away from 66 promoter-like features, while the second is relatively stable, with recombination occurring in promoter-like 67 feature such as CpG islands. However, a recent finding in snakes challenged this binary view. In rattle snakes 68 and corn snakes, which still possess a functional PRDM9, some hotspots are directed by PRDM9, but others 69 are directed toward CpG islands (Schield et al., 2020; Hoge et al., 2023). It was first proposed that PRDM9 70 could have a different role in rattle snake and direct recombination towards CpG islands (Schield et al., 71 2020), but other observations suggest that the recombination landscapes in these snakes rather reflects the 72 inefficiency of their PRDM9-dependent pathway to direct DSBs away from CpG islands (Hoge et al., 2023). 73 Altogether, the two studies concur on the fact that the recombination landscape in snakes differs from what 74 is observed in mammals, despite the presence of PRDM9 (Schield et al., 2020; Hoge et al., 2023). 75

Most of our knowledge about PRDM9 function and evolution has been acquired in a handful of mammals 76 (mostly human and mice). In mice, Smagulova and colleagues analyzed the position of DSB hotspots 77 obtained by ChIP-seq of DMC1 in strains carrying different PRDM9 alleles They measured the otherlap of 78 these hotspots with the ones of a strain knocked out for Prdm9 (PRDM9-independent hotspots) (Smagulova 79 et al., 2016). Those strains showed differences in their capacity to target DSBs away from the hotspots of 80 the Prdm9^{-/-} mouse (hereafter referred to as 'MDH', for 'Mouse Default Hotspots'). Some strains show a 81 significant deficit of DSB hotspots at MDH loci, while others, carrying less dominant PRDM9 alleles, show 82 up to a 6-fold DSB hotspot enrichment at these loci, even though they represent a small proportion of all 83 recombination hotspots ($\sim 7\%$) (Smagulova et al., 2016). This shows that even when PRDM9 is present, 84 PRDM9-independent hotspots can be active in mammals. However, this activity could just be the reflection 85 of a specific PRDM9 deficiency in some mice strains and overall, we still have no clear idea on how prevalent 86 the usage of PRDM9-independent hotspots is in mammals. A comprehensive understanding would require 87 measures of fine-scale variations in recombination rate for a wide range of mammalian species, and ideally 88 across long periods of time. 89

Recombination hotspots can be mapped directly in meiotic cells (e.g. by chromatin immunoprecipitation with antibodies to DMC1 in spermatocytes (Brick et al., 2012; Pratto et al., 2014; Smagulova et al., 2016; Alleva et al., 2021)), but these molecular approaches are tedious and only amenable for a few model organisms. High-resolution recombination maps can also be inferred from patterns of linkage disequilibrium (LD). This approach is more scalable and provides information on sex-averaged historical recombination activity at the population scale. However, this approach remains laborious and expensive (it requires the sequencing
of at least 10 individuals per species (Auton and McVean, 2007; Chan et al., 2012)), and it is sensitive to
various sources of errors (Spence and Song, 2019; Samuk and Noor, 2022; Raynaud et al., 2023). Hence, for

⁹⁸ now, such LD-based recombination maps are available only for a very limited number of species.

Alternatively, substitution patterns have been found to be informative about past recombination rates. 99 In particular, it has been shown in mammals that recombination induces a transmission bias of GC alleles 100 through the process of GC-biased gene conversion (gBGC). This eventually leads to an elevation of the WS 101 (AT to GC) substitution rate, and a decrease of the SW (GC to AT) substitution rate (Nagylaki, 1983; 102 Duret and Arndt, 2008; Glémin, 2010). The substitution rate matrix can be conveniently summarized by a 103 single parameter, the equilibrium GC-content (hereafter noted GC^*), which corresponds to the GC-content 104 that sequences would reach if the pattern of substitution observed in that branch remained constant over 105 time (Duret and Arndt, 2008). GC^* correlates well with the strength of DSB hotspots in mice (Clément 106 and Arndt, 2013), with the LD-based recombination rates in humans (Munch et al., 2014; Glémin et al., 107 2015), and with the LD-based strength of recombination hotspots in dogs (Axelsson et al., 2012; Auton 108 et al., 2013). Moreover, GC^* reflects the recombination activity along the entire branch where substitution 109 patterns are analyzed, and hence can inform about past recombination events that are no longer detectable 110 with methods measuring recombination in individuals or populations (Leseque et al., 2014; Munch et al., 111 2014). This provides insights on the long term use of PRDM9-independent hotspots, integrated over long 112 periods of time, probably encompassing the rise and fall of several PRDM9 alleles. However, variation in 113 GC^* between species cannot be directly interpreted as variations in recombination rates alone, since GC^* 114 also depends on the mutation bias towards AT, the repair bias towards GC, the effective population size and 115 the mean length of the conversion tracts (Eyre-Walker, 1999; Glémin, 2010). 116

In this study, we present an estimator of relative recombination rates based on substitution patterns that 117 allows us to directly compare fine-scale recombination rate variations in a wide range of species using only 118 3 genomes (one focal genome, a sister species and an outgroup). We then use it to assess the recombination 119 activity at MDH loci in 52 species spanning the diversity of boreoeutherians. We reveal a high heterogeneity 120 in the use of these PRDM9-independent hotspots. We show that PRDM9 alleles in humans and mice 121 have been particularly efficient at directing DSBs away from PRDM9-independent hotspots but that these 122 two species are not representative of all mammals. Finally, we show that three species, namely the southern 123 elephant seal, the ring-tailed lemur and the daurian ground squirrel, have used PRDM9-independent hotspots 124 as much as PRDM9-deficient canids. This shows that the two kinds of hotspots-regulation mechanisms that 125 have been described so far in vertebrates are not mutually exclusive and that the fine-scale recombination 126 landscapes of many mammals are much closer to those of birds and other PRDM9-lacking amniotes than 127 previously thought. We further show that the recombination activity observed at MDH loci in PRDM9-128 containing mammals depends on the conservation of their DNA methylation pattern, which suggests a link 129 between the evolution of DNA methylation and of PRDM9-independent recombination landscapes. 130

131 Results

¹³² Conservation of recombination hotspots between PRDM9-deficient mammals

In finches and flycatchers, the fine-scale recombination landscape has been shown to be stable through time, 133 as a large proportion of hotspots are shared between closely related species (Singhal et al., 2015; Kawakami 134 et al., 2017). To test whether loci corresponding to PRDM9-independent hotspots are also evolutionary stable 135 in mammals, we analyzed the overlap between recombination hotspots detected in dogs, which naturally lack 136 PRDM9, and those identified in the Prdm9^{-/-} mutant mouse (MDH) (Smagulova et al., 2016). Among the 137 30,929 MDH, 15,009 (49%) could be assigned to one-to-one orthologous loci in the dog genome. Among the 138 7008 dog hotspots identified in the LD-based recombination map of dogs (Auton et al., 2013), 34% overlap 139 with MDH loci (Suppfig. S1)(compared to 0.06% expected by chance, given that dog hotspots and MDH 140 loci cover respectively 2% and 3% of the dog genome). Although this enrichment is very strong, it should be 141 noted that 42% of the dog hotspots that could be mapped on the mouse genome occur outside of MDH loci 142 (1809/3109) (Suppfig. S1). This number is difficult to interpret because it has been shown that LD-based 143 methods can produce a high number of false positives (Raynaud et al., 2023). Moreover, DSB hotspots are 144 obtained on males only, while LD maps are sex-averaged. It is also possible that some MDH loci have not 145 been identified as hotspots in dogs simply because they did not meet the threshold criteria to be defined as 146 such. To avoid the problem of the arbitrary threshold, we computed the LD-based recombination rate in dogs 147 (from Auton et al. (2013)) as a function of the distance to the closest MDH loci (Fig. 1A&B) (Auton et al., 148 2013). We divided the 30,929 mouse $Prdm9^{-/-}$ hotspots into three equally sized categories of strength, based 149 on DMC1 ChIP-seq read counts (Smagulova et al., 2016). Respectively 5,266 strong MDH, 4,961 medium 150 MDH and 4,781 weak MDH could be mapped on the dog genome. There is a sharp peak of recombination 151 centered on MDH loci in dogs. This peak is higher for strong MDH and weaker for medium and weak ones 152 (Fig. 1A). This confirms that many recombination hotspots are conserved between Prdm9^{-/-} mice and dogs, 153 but it does not rule out the existence of species-specific recombination hotspots. To explore factors that 154 might drive the evolution of PRDM9-independent hotspots, we analyzed their DNA methylation level in the 155 germline. Indeed, indirect evidences suggested that recombination hotspots in dogs are associated to germline 156 hypomethylated regions (HMRs) (Berglund et al., 2015). Using HMRs identified by bi-sulfite sequencing in 157 dog sperm (Qu et al., 2018), we observed that 74% of dog hotspots are located inside HMRs, which represent 158 only 3.7% of the dog genome. In mice, the overlap is even stronger: using HMRs identified in mouse sperm 159 (Hammoud et al., 2014), we observed that out of the 30.929 hotspots found in the Prdm9^{-/-} mutant, 93%160 are located within HMRs, which cover only 4.6% of the mouse genome (see methods for details). This 161 indicates that PRDM9-independent hotspots are associated with DNA hypomethylation both in Prdm9^{-/-} 162 mutant mice and in canids. Interestingly, 48% of MDH loci are methylated in dog sperm if we restrict the 163 definition of hotspots to their midpoint (7,186/15,009). This shows that many MDH loci are specifically 164 hypomethylated in mice but not in dogs. This is consistent with previous observations showing that murid 165 genomes have accumulated many new HMRs compared to other mammals (Qu et al., 2018). To test whether 166 these shifts in methylation levels are associated with changes in recombination activity, we computed the 167 LD-based recombination rate in dogs as a function of the distance to the closest MDH locus, separating 168

those whose midpoints overlap a HMR in dogs (7,186), and those that do not (7,283)(Fig. 1B). There is a

¹⁷⁰ high and pronounced recombination peak at MDH loci that are hypomethylated in dog sperm (Fig. 1B). In

contrast there is almost no elevation of recombination at MDH loci that are methylated in dogs (Fig. 1B).

¹⁷² This confirms that methylation is clearly associated to recombination hotspots in the absence of PRDM9,

and that many PRDM9-independent recombination hotspots are species-specific.

¹⁷⁴ Equilibrium GC content is a good predictor of past recombination activity

To assess whether equilibrium GC content could be used as a proxy of recombination rate in other species, we repeated the above analyses using GC^* instead of LD-based recombination rate (Fig. 1C&D). Strikingly, the profile of GC^* perfectly mirrors the LD-based recombination rate profile. It should however be noticed that the GC^* peaks are slightly sharper than the LD-based ones (Fig. 1C&D), as are the peaks of DMC1 ChIP-seq read coverage in the Prdm9^{-/-} mouse (Suppfig. S2). This suggests that GC^* is able to capture signals of past recombination with a higher spatial resolution than LD.

181 Estimation of the relative recombination rate in PRDM9-independent hotspots

Following a large body of literature, we showed that GC^* can be very informative on intra-genomic recom-182 bination rate variations (Pessia et al., 2012; Auton et al., 2013; Clément and Arndt, 2013; Lartillot, 2013; 183 Munch et al., 2014; Glémin et al., 2015; Singhal et al., 2015; Figuet et al., 2015; Bolívar et al., 2016; Galtier 184 et al., 2018; Charlesworth et al., 2020). However, the height of the GC^* peak in hotspots is difficult to 185 interpret in term of recombination rate because it is also affected by other parameters (the length of gene 186 conversion tracts, the mutation bias towards AT, the mismatch repair bias towards GC and the effective 187 population size), which can vary between species (Lartillot, 2013; Galtier et al., 2018; Galtier, 2021). We 188 thus derived an estimator that can capture the relative recombination rate at PRDM9-independent hotspots 189 that controls for those parameters and is therefore comparable between species. Using the probability of 190 fixation of AT and GC alleles in presence of gBGC derived by Nagylaki (1983), we obtained an expression 191 of the ratio of the recombination rate within hotspots relative to their flanking regions (see details in the 192 Methods). This relative recombination rate only depends on GC^* inside hotspots and in flanking regions, 193 and on the mutation bias (GC^{μ}) . 194

$$\frac{r_{hot}}{r_{flank}} = \frac{logit(GC^*_{hot}) - logit(GC^{\mu})}{logit(GC^*_{flank}) - logit(GC^{\mu})}$$
(1)

where r_{hot} is the recombination rate in hotspots, r_{flank} the recombination rate in flanking regions and GC^{μ} the GC content expected under mutation only. It should be noted that r_{hot} and r_{flank} encompass all recombination events that can lead to gBGC (potentially COs and/or NCOs).

For the rest of the study, hotspots are defined as the 400 bp regions centered on their midpoint, and flanking regions as those spanning from 5 to 8 kb upstream and downstream of the hotspots (Fig. 2B).

Using the three values GC^*_{hot} , GC^*_{flank} and GC^{μ} , it is possible to compute a measure of the relative recombination rate within hotspots compared to their flanking regions, which can then be compared between



Figure 1: A) Dog LD-based recombination rate as a function of the distance to the closest MDH locus. MDH were divided in three equally sized categories of strength: strong hotspots in red (10-190 FPKM), medium hotspots in orange (5-10 FPKM) and weak hotspots in blue (0-5 FPKM). The line corresponds to the mean value of LD-based recombination rate in a 100 bp window. B) Same as A but MDH loci were divided in two categories depending on their methylation level in dog sperm. MDH loci that are found outside hypomethylated regions in dogs are in grey and those found inside hypomethylated regions are in black. C) & D) Equilibrium GC content in dogs as a function of the distance to the closest MDH locus. Using the same partitions of hotspots as A) and B). Points correspond to the mean value of GC^* in a 100 bp window. The line corresponds to a smoothing of the data with a loess function.

species. Equation 1 holds true under the assumption that the other four parameters affecting the strength of gBGC (effective population size, mismatch repair bias, length of the conversion tract and the mutation bias) do not differ between the hotspots and their flanking regions (see Methods). As shown in the previous section, PRDM9-independent hotspots are often hypomethylated. This implies that the mutation rate from CpG to TpG or CpA in hotspots is lower than in the flanking regions, which violates our assumption of a constant mutation bias. To avoid this problem, we excluded CpG sites from all the analyses.

 GC_{hot}^* and GC_{flank}^* can easily be computed from the substitutions in PRDM9-independent hotspots and their flanking region but GC^{μ} is more difficult to estimate. Interestingly, it has been shown that genomewide variations of GC^* are mainly the result of gBGC, and that GC^{μ} is quite constant along chromosomes,



Figure 2: Overview of the method for inferring relative recombination rates in PRDM9-independent hotspots. A) We call substitutions using parsimony on trios of closely related species after having masked CpG dinucleotides. B) We compute GC^* in 400 bp windows centered on the midpoint of the PRDM9independent hotspots, and GC^* in the flanking regions (from 5 to 8 kb upstream and downstream of the center of the PRDM9-independent hotspot. C) We compute the genome-wide distribution of GC^* in 200 kb windows and take the 1^{st} percentile as the GC^* of new mutations. D) Using the probability of fixation of AT and GC alleles in presence of gBGC derived by Nagylaki (1983), we compute the relative recombination rate as a function of the three values of GC^* (see methods).

despite large-scale variation in mutation rates (Smith et al., 2018). An approach to estimate GC^{μ} consists in measuring variation in substitution patterns along the genome, and to consider the regions of the genome with the lowest GC^* as a proxy for GC^{μ} (Lartillot, 2013). Following this logic, we divided the genome of each species in windows of 200kb, and defined GC^{μ} as the value of the first percentile of the distribution of GC^* to avoid outliers (Fig. 2B) (see methods for detailed justifications). This method allows us to estimate GC^{μ} for a wide range of species, simply based on substitution patterns in the terminal branch.

217 PRDM9-independent recombination hotspots are active in most mammals

Using this estimator of relative recombination rate, we assessed whether MDH loci showed an enrichment of recombination in other mammals. We identified MDH orthologous loci in the genome of 51 other mammals and estimated the relative recombination rates at these loci using the method described above (gBGCbased relative recombination rates). Around 75% of the species (39/52) show a significant enrichment of recombination in MDH loci compared to flanking regions (Fig. 3).



Figure 3: Relative recombination rates at loci orthologous to mouse $Prdm9^{-/-}$ DSB hotspots (MDH loci) in 52 mammals. MDH loci were binned in 3 equally sized categories of strength based on the number of DMC1 Chip-seq reads of $Prdm9^{-/-}$ DSB hotspots. The number of MDH loci for each category varied from ~4,000 in *Myotis brandtii* to ~9,000 in *Mus spretus* (see details in Supplementary Table 1). The tree has been retrieved from TimeTree5 (Kumar et al., 2022). Species with a complete PRDM9 are written in black, in grey species for which we failed to find a complete PRDM9 in the reference genome assembly, and in red the 5 canids (where PRDM9 is a pseudogene). Error bars correspond to a 95% confidence interval obtained by bootstrapping the substitutions for computing GC_{flank}^* and GC_{hot}^* . We considered the recombination enrichment to be significant if the confidence interval is above one.

In 77% of those species (30/39), the recombination activity at MDH loci is conserved, with strong MDH 223 loci showing a significantly higher recombination enrichment than weak ones (Fig. 3). The remaining 23% of 224 species (9/39) show a lower recombination activity in PRDM9-independent hotspots. Therefore, we might be 225 lacking statistical power to confirm a conservation of hotspot strength in those species (Fig. 3). Interestingly, 226 in 10% of species (5/52), including mice, there is less recombination in strong PRDM9-independent hotspots 227 compared to weak ones, which is consistent with the active deviation of recombination away from those sites 228 observed in those mice having the most dominant PRDM9 alleles (Smagulova et al., 2016). The causes for 229 this active deviation are however still not clear (Smagulova et al., 2016). 230

To test whether as in dogs, methylation plays a role in determining hotspots in other mammals, we separated MDH loci in two subsets: loci for which the hypomethylation pattern is conserved between mice and dogs (and thus likely to be consistently hypomethylated in other mammals as shown in Qu et al. (2018)), and loci that are hypomethylated in mouse but not dogs (a majority of which corresponding to mouse-specific HMRs (Qu et al., 2018)). For MDH loci whose hypomethylation pattern is not conserved, we observed a very weak increase in recombination in all species (Suppfig. S4).

Conversely, MDH loci with a conserved hypomethylation pattern, show contrasting levels of recombina-237 tion activity: 25% of species (13/52, including mice and humans) show a deficit of recombination at these 238 loci, 12% (6/52) show no elevation of recombination, whereas 63% (33/52) show a strong recombination 239 activity. This indicates that DNA hypomethylation is associated with a deficit of recombination in some 240 species (such as mice and humans), while it is associated with recombination hotspot in others. This latter 241 group includes the 5 canids (which all lack Prdm9), but also many other mammals with an intact Prdm9. 242 This shows that DNA hypomethylation can be associated with recombination hotspots even in the presence 243 of Prdm9. 244

To get further insight into the evolution of PRDM9-independent hotspots in mammals, we measured the relative activity at loci orthologous to dog LD-based recombination hotspots (DRH for 'Dog Recombination Hotspots') in the 51 other mammals. We observed a strong correlation between the recombination activity at MDH loci and DRH loci (Suppfig S5), which is expected since they largely overlap. Nevertheless, species that are phylogenetically closer to dogs show higher recombination activity in DRH loci whereas those phylogenetically closer to mouse show higher recombination activity in MDH loci (Suppfig S5). This confirms that despite a general conservation, PRDM9-independent hotspots are still evolving in mammals.

Canids, which all lack PRDM9, dominate the list of species that exhibit the highest recombination levels at MDH loci, holding top ranks out of 52 (Fig. 4A). This finding both shows that the recombination landscape is stable in canids as it is in passerines, and validates our relative recombination rate estimator (Fig. 4A). Interestingly, there are several other mammals that show a similar enrichment of recombination activity at MDH loci. Notably, three species show a recombination activity at MDH loci significantly higher than some of the canids: ring-tailed lemurs (*Lemur catta*), southern elephant seals (*Mirounga leonina*) and daurian ground squirrels (*Spermophilus dauricus*) (Fig. 4A).

It should be noted that these three species encode a full-length PRDM9, encompassing the four protein domains (KRAB, SSXRD, SET and the zinc finger array). The PRDM9 allele represented in the reference genome assembly contains 11 zinc fingers in daurian ground squirrels, and 14 zinc fingers in ring-tailed lemurs. For the southern elephant seal, there is only one complete zinc finger represented in the reference genome because of an assembly gap within the array. In ring-tailed lemurs and daurian ground squirrels, the comparison of zinc finger sequences showed an excess of amino-acid changes relative to the neutral expectation, particularly at positions -1, 3, and 6 that are involved in DNA binding, (SuppFig. S6).

This suggests that PRDM9 has been subject to positive selection in these two lineages, which is suggestive of the red-queen dynamic that is expected when PRDM9 determines the location of recombination hotspots. Thus, PRDM9 does not show any sign of pseudogenization or functional change in these three species where

²⁶⁹ PRDM9-independent hotspots appear to have been particularly active.



Figure 4: (A): Sorted relative recombination rate in strong DSB hotspots (>10 FPKM) of a PRDM9 -/mouse in 52 mammals. Error bars correspond to a 95% confidence interval obtained by bootstrapping the substitutions for computing GC^*_{flank} and GC^*_{hot} . (B): GC^* as a function of the distance to the center of the closest MDH locus for humans, mice, dogs, and the three outlier species. Each point corresponds to an estimation of GC^* in a 100 bp window.

As an illustration of our substitution-based approach, we plotted GC^* as a function of the distance to the closest strong MDH loci in dogs, humans, mice and the three outlier species (Fig. 4B). We observed no elevation of GC^* in humans and mice in strong MDH loci, confirming that very little recombination occurred in their lineage (Fig. 4B). In dogs, ring-tailed lemurs, southern elephant seals and daurian ground squirrels, there is a pronounced peak of GC^* at strong MDH loci (Fig. 4B).

275 Discussion

The current paradigm is that vertebrates either possess a full-length functional PRDM9, recombine away from promoter-like features, and display a fast evolving recombination landscape, or they lack a functional

PRDM9 in which case they consistently recombine in CpG islands (e.g. in canids, birds or the swordtail fish)

(Baker et al., 2017). Our results revealed that there is a continuum between these two types of recombination

landscapes and that despite the presence of PRDM9, some species use PRDM9-independent hotspots as much
as canids. We showed that the activity of those PRDM9-independent hotspots is highly dependent on DNA
hypomethylation. This implies that despite a general conservation, PRDM9-independent recombination
hotspots are evolving slowly, in concert with germline DNA hypomethylation (Qu et al., 2018; Berglund
et al., 2015).

From a methodological perspective, while signatures of gBGC have been commonly used in studies of 285 recombination landscapes (Axelsson et al., 2012; Auton et al., 2013; Munch et al., 2014; Leseque et al., 286 2014; Singhal et al., 2015; Charlesworth et al., 2020; Hoge et al., 2023), the approach presented here allows 287 to quantify gBGC-based relative recombination rates along a branch that are comparable between species. 288 The analysis of gBGC signatures only requires the genome of three closely related species, and is able to 289 detect recombination activity at a given set of loci with a very high spatial resolution, even better than LD-290 based methods (compare Fig. 2D and 2B). It thus offers the possibility for large-scale comparative studies 291 of fine-scale recombination landscapes. However, this approach requires a large number of substitutions to 292 estimate GC^* precisely and is therefore not appropriate to measure recombination at a single locus. 293

Moreover, it should be noted that our estimation of recombination activity using gBGC does not allow one 294 to conclude on the nature of recombination events (COs or NCOs) that we detect at PRDM9-independent 295 hotspots. In humans, there is evidence that both COs and NCOs induce gBGC but in mice, only NCOs 296 appear to do so (Williams et al., 2015; Arbeithuber et al., 2015; Halldorsson et al., 2016; Li et al., 2019). 297 This suggests that the type of recombination events triggering gBGC can vary among mammals. Thus, it 298 is possible that while a large number of DSB occur at PRDM9-independent hotspots in our three outlier 299 species, COs still tend to be associated to PRDM9-directed hotspots. Altogether, while the enrichment of 300 recombination events in PRDM9-independent hotspots is very clear in numerous mammals, the way they 301 are repaired remains to be explored. 302

³⁰³ On the maintenance of a default hotspot regulation mechanism

It had been previously demonstrated that both PRDM9-dependent and PRDM9-independent pathways coexist in two snakes genera (Hoge et al., 2023). The authors suggested that a change in the binding affinity of a gene which operates downstream of PRDM9 could explain this coexistence and that selection might be operating on these genes to fine-tune the usage of PRDM9-independent hotspots in vertebrates (Hoge et al., 2023).

In placental mammals we revealed that the coexistence of both PRDM9-dependent and PRDM9-309 independent pathways to direct DSBs is pervasive. We showed that those pathways determine recombination 310 hotspots with varying proportions across species. Interestingly, these variations do not show a strong phylo-311 genetic structure, suggesting that this evolution can be very rapid. Furthermore, the species with the highest 312 levels of PRDM9-independent hotspot usage have quite contrasted life history traits, which they mostly share 313 with sister species with lower PRDM9-independent hotspot usage. Thus, it is difficult to imagine that dif-314 ferences of PRDM9-independent usage depend on reproductive life history traits. Moreover, in mice, even if 315 the usage of PRDM9-independent hotspots is quite low overall, there exist substantial variations that seem 316

to depend only on PRDM9 alleles (Smagulova et al., 2016). A plausible explanation for the maintenance of the PRDM9-independent pathway in placental mammals would be that variation in PRDM9-independent hotspots usage depends on the efficacy of PRDM9 alleles to recruit the DSB machinery.

Overall, proper chromosome pairing can be achieved through the two different pathways mentioned 320 above (PRDM9-dependent or PRDM9-independent). When the efficiency of one pathway is altered, better 321 chromosome pairing can be restored either by a mutation restoring the efficiency of the altered pathway, 322 or by a mutation increasing the efficiency of the other pathway. For the PRDM9 pathway, we know that 323 alleles inevitably decrease in efficiency due to the erosion of their high affinity targets, which reduces the 324 probability of symmetrical binding, and thus impairs efficient chromosome pairing (Baker et al., 2015, 2022; 325 Latrille et al., 2017; Genestier et al., 2023). This efficiency can be restored either by a new PRDM9 allele 326 inducing a red-queen dynamic (Úbeda and Wilkins, 2011; Latrille et al., 2017; Baker et al., 2022; Genestier 327 et al., 2023), but also by a mutation increasing the efficiency of the PRDM9-independent pathway. Every 328 mutation increasing the efficiency of the PRDM9-independent pathway lessens the deleterious effect of a 329 mutation that reduces PRDM9 efficiency. Conversely, new efficient PRDM9 alleles will lessen the deleterious 330 effect of a mutation that decreases the efficiency of the PRDM9-independent pathway. 331

Of note, if this dynamic reaches a point where the PRDM9-independent pathway becomes sufficient for 332 correct chromosome pairing, PRDM9 can be lost without strong fitness consequences. Under this model, 333 PRDM9 is lost through the accumulation of small effect mutations which reduce its utility, rather than a 334 sudden loss that would imply very inefficient selection. The continuum in the use of PRDM9-independent 335 hotspots we observe in mammals could reflect different stages along this path, and despite still having a 336 fully functional PRDM9, the three outlier species could be on their way of losing it. It is also possible that 337 their PRDM9 have only been going through a temporary inefficient phase compensated by the PRDM9-338 independent pathway, but has now been rescued by a new efficient PRDM9 allele. 339

340 The recombination landscape of amniotes

Overall, our results suggest that in addition to PRDM9-directed hotspots, many mammals share some 341 of their recombination hotspots with other amniotes, (Axelsson et al., 2012; Singhal et al., 2015; Schield 342 et al., 2020; Hoge et al., 2023), and therefore the fine-scale recombination landscapes of mammals, birds and 343 snakes is probably more similar than previously thought (Baker et al., 2017). However, the determinants of 344 PRDM9-independent hotspots usage remain unclear. Interestingly DNA methylation has also been found 345 to be a suppressor of recombination in a fungi hotspot (Maloisel and Rossignol, 1998), in plants (He et al., 346 2017; Choi et al., 2018), and in honey bees (Wallberg et al., 2015), which suggests that local hypomethyla-347 tion is a common determinant of recombination hotspots in eukaryotes. However, the association between 348 hypomethylation and recombination has not been formally established in non-mammalian amniotes and 349 remains to be tested. Moreover, this association need not be causal, as the potentially diverse molecular 350 mechanisms of PRDM9-independent recombination in amniotes remain largely unknown. In particular, the 351 results presented here suggest that despite having lost PRDM9, red foxes (Vulpes vulpes) and african wild 352 dogs (Lycaon pictus) have only a mild recombination enrichment in PRDM9-independent hotspots compared 353 to other canids. It has been previously noted that the number of recombination hotspots varies between 354

PRDM9-deficient amniotes. Notably in finches and flycatchers, only few LD-based hotspots have been reported compared to dogs (Auton et al., 2013; Singhal et al., 2015; Kawakami et al., 2017). Altogether, it is still not clear what drives the concentration of recombination events in absence of PRDM9, and why some species have numerous hotspots and others less.

Finally, the widespread use of PRDM9-independent recombination hotspots demonstrated in the present study is likely to have important consequences for genome evolution. In particular, the fact that gBGC is stronger in hypomethylated regions in numerous mammals and in several passerines provides a convincing explanation for the widespread GC-richness of CpG islands in amniotes.

363 Material & Methods

³⁶⁴ PRDM9-independent hotspots and DNA methylation datasets

Data on the location of DSB hotspots in Prdm9^{-/-} knock-out mice, detected by DMC1 ChIP-seq experiment, were retrieved from the study by Smagulova et al. (2016). The dog LD-based recombination map and the position of hotspots were retrieved from the study of Auton et al. (2013). We excluded hotspots that were larger than 20 kb as they do not fit the definition of hotspots. Data sets of hypomethylated regions in mouse and dog sperm (identified using Bi-sulfite sequencing) were retrieved from the literature (Hammoud et al., 2014; Qu et al., 2018). Even though methylation data on spermatocytes would have been more fit for the task at hand, only sperm is available in the literature for dogs.

372 Whole genome alignments

For most mammals except canids, felids and phocids, whole genome alignments (WGAs) were obtained from 373 Genereux et al. (2020). In order to get further phylogenetic resolution in canids, and in closely related 374 outgroups, we generated a WGA of high quality genomes for 19 carnivores downloaded from NCBI (Supple-375 mentary Table 1), using the Progressive Cactus aligner (v1.3.0) (Armstrong et al., 2020). We first defined a 376 "guide" species tree using the topology obtained from TimeTree5 (Kumar et al., 2022). To streamline the 377 computational process, we ran Progressive Cactus separately for canids, felids and phocids species, using 378 different "-root" options on the same guide tree. We created a root alignment by running Progressive Cactus 379 with the inferred ancestral genome of each of the three clades. We obtained the final WGA using the "ha-380 AppendSubtree" command to iteratively include the three sub-alignments at the corresponding ancestral 381 nodes (Hickey et al., 2013). 382

383 Defining orthologous regions

To find the orthologous regions of the PRDM9-independent hotspots in the genomes of other mammals we used halLiftover (Hickey et al., 2013). We first made a liftover from the mouse/dog genome to the target genome using the midpoint of each feature and removed multi-mapping features. Then we lifted back the single-mapping features from the target genome to the dog/mouse genome and again removed multi-mapping features. This approach ensures that all orthologous loci were one-to-one.

389 Hotspots overlap

We considered hotspots to be overlapping if their midpoint was at less than 5 kb one from another. This is equivalent to a strict overlap for hotspots defined as 5 kb windows centered on their midpoint. Using this approach, we calculated the percentage of the genome covered by the hotspots by multiplying the number of hotspots by 5,000, and dividing by the assembly size. For the overlap with HMRs we defined hotspots as the 5 kb windows centered on their midpoint and kept the size of HMRs defined in the study of Qu et al. 2018 (Qu et al., 2018). The percentage of the genome covered by HMRs was computed as the sum of all HMR sizes divided by the assembly size.

397 Substitution mapping

We selected trios of closely related species such that the divergence between the three species was low enough 398 to avoid double substitutions, but with an outgroup distant enough to avoid incomplete lineage sorting based 399 on the guide tree used in the Zoonomia WGA (Genereux et al., 2020). We tried to take trios spanning the 400 diversity of boreoeutherians, avoiding over-sampling of disproportionately represented groups (primates and 401 artiodactyles). A complete list of the trios used are available in Supplementary table 3. A posteriori, it 402 appeared that there were substantial variations between the branch lengths used to map substitutions, but 403 we showed that the divergence was still low enough (< 2.5%) and did not influence our result (Suppfig. 404 S7). Genome quality was very variable. We thus controlled that genome quality (approximated by the 405 N50 statistics) did not influence our results (Suppfig. S8). To call substitutions, we retrieved multispecies 406 alignment using hal2maf (Hickey et al., 2013). We excluded alignment blocks which size was inferior to 50 407 bp to avoid poorly aligned regions, and duplicated regions. We then excluded CpG sites (sites for which at 408 least one of the three species has a CpG) to avoid convergent mutations. Finally, we called substitutions 409 using parsimony as depicted in Fig. 2. 410

411 Measures of equilibrium GC content

⁴¹² We compute the equilibrium GC content as follows:

$$GC^* = \frac{WS/W}{WS/W + SW/S} \tag{2}$$

With W the AT content of the region (CpG masked), S the GC content of the region (CpG masked), WS the number of Weak to Strong substitutions and SW the number of Strong to Weak substitutions.

415 LD-based recombination rate and GC* profiles around hotspots

We cut the genome in windows of 100 bp. We extracted the LD-based recombination rate for each window. We also computed the distance between the midpoint of the window and the closest midpoint of a hotspot using bedtools closest (Quinlan and Hall, 2010). We then made bins of distances to the closest hotspot every 100 bp. For GC^* , we repeated the same procedure, but we computed the counts of WS and SW substitution for each window, and then computed GC^* using the total substitutions count for all windows in each distance bin as described in the previous section.

422 Estimation of the mutation bias

Germline mutations rates have been measured by sequencing parent-offspring trios in 36 mammalian species 423 (Bergeron et al., 2023). However, for most species, the number of detected mutations is too limited (typically 424 less than 100 de novo mutations) to estimate GC^{μ} accurately. Thus, measures of GC^{μ} based on empirical 425 data are associated with very large confidence intervals (Wong et al., 2016; Milholland et al., 2017; Wang 426 et al., 2020). Even when there is enough statistical power, the results vary substantially between different 427 datasets (Wong et al., 2016; Milholland et al., 2017). In addition to the issue of reproducibility, it has been 428 demonstrated that the mutation spectra can vary rapidly within human populations (Harris and Pritchard, 429 2017). Therefore, GC^{μ} estimated from living individuals may not necessarily reflect the average GC^{μ} in 430 the terminal branch. We therefore took a similar approach to Lartillot (2013). We divided the genomes in 431 windows of 200 kb and took the value of the first percentile of GC^* as an estimate of GC^{μ} . To ensure that 432 our results were not sensitive to our estimation of GC^{μ} , we used different thresholds to compute it (Suppfig. 433 S3B&C), and recovered the same results. We also controlled that our gBGC-based relative recombination 434 rates were not correlated to our estimations of GC^{μ} (Suppfig. S3A). 435

436 Estimation of relative recombination rates from GC*

⁴³⁷ Using a Wright-Fischer diffusion approximation and assuming that mutations are selectively neutral, the
⁴³⁸ rate of Weak-to-Strong substitution in a given branch can be written as follows (Nagylaki, 1983)

$$q_{WS} = 2Ne\mu_{WS} \frac{2b}{1 - e^{-4Neb}}T$$
(3)

where μ_{SW} is the mutation rate per generation from W to S, b the gBGC coefficient, T the divergence time from the ancestral node in generations, and Ne the effective population size.

The gBGC coefficient is directly linked to the recombination rate, with $b = b_0 r l$ where r is the recombination rate per base pair per meiosis, b_0 the repair bias, and l the length of the conversion tract in base pair. It should be noted that r encompasses all recombination events that can lead to gBGC (CO and/or NCO)

Similarly, the rate of Strong-to-Weak substitutions can be written as follows:

$$q_{SW} = 2Ne\mu_{SW}\frac{2b}{e^{4Neb} - 1}T\tag{4}$$

⁴⁴⁵ The equilibrium GC content can be written as follows:

$$GC^* = \frac{q_{WS}}{q_{WS} + q_{SW}} \tag{5}$$

446 Thus, we can write:

$$\frac{GC^*}{1 - GC^*} = \frac{q_{WS}}{q_{SW}} \tag{6}$$

447 Simplifying the previous equations we obtain:

$$\frac{GC^*}{1 - GC^*} = \frac{\mu_{WS}}{\mu_{SW}} e^{4Neb} \tag{7}$$

Thus, the population-scaled gBGC coefficient. (B = 4Neb) can be written as:

$$B = log(\frac{GC^*}{1 - GC^*}) - log(\frac{\mu_{WS}}{\mu_{SW}})$$
(8)

449 or:

$$B = logit(GC^*) - logit(GC^{\mu}) \tag{9}$$

450 where GC^{μ} is the equilibrium GC content under the mutational bias only $(GC^{\mu} = \frac{\mu_{WS}}{\mu_{SW} + \mu_{WS}})$.

451 Let us note B_{hot} the population-scaled gBGC coefficient within hotspots:

$$B_{hot} = logit(GC^*_{hot}) - logit(GC^{\mu}_{hot})$$
⁽¹⁰⁾

And B_{flank} the population-scaled gBGC coefficient in their flanking regions (defined here as 3kb-long segments, located at 5-kb of the hotspot center, Fig. 2A)

$$B_{flank} = logit(GC^*_{flank}) - logit(GC^{\mu}_{flank})$$
(11)

⁴⁵⁴ B depends on b_0 , N_e , land r ($B = 4Nerb_0l$). The first three parameters (b_0 , N_e , l) are not expected to ⁴⁵⁵ differ between the hotspot and their flanking regions. Thus, the ratio between the recombination rate within ⁴⁵⁶ hotspot (r_{hot}) over the recombination rate in their flanking regions (r_{flank}) can be written as:

$$\frac{r_{hot}}{r_{flank}} = \frac{B_{hot}}{B_{flank}} \tag{12}$$

And thus, under the assumption that the mutational bias does not differ between hotposts and their flanking regions (i.e. $GC^{\mu}_{hot} = GC^{\mu}_{flank} = GC^{\mu}$)

$$\frac{r_{hot}}{r_{flank}} = \frac{logit(GC^*_{hot}) - logit(GC^{\mu})}{logit(GC^*_{flank}) - logit(GC^{\mu})}$$
(13)

459 Annotation of PRDM9 in mammals

We investigated the presence of PRDM9 homologs in each of the 52 species analyzed. The full-length PRDM9 isoform encompasses four domains (KRAB, SSXRD, SET and the zinc finger array). It is encoded by 10 exons (corresponding to exons 2 to 11 of human PRDM9, exon 1 being within the 5'UTR): exons 3 and 4 encode the KRAB domain, exon 7 encodes the SSXRD domain, exons 8-10 encode the SET domain, and exon

11 encodes the zinc finger array. We first searched for PRDM9 homologs by sequence similarity (Camacho 464 et al., 2009) against mammalian proteins annotated in RefSeq (https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/blast/), using 465 the human protein (NP_001363829.1) as a query. We performed a multiple alignment of the strongest hits, 466 to assess their completeness: homologs where considered as complete if they encompassed the 10 protein-467 coding exons, from the start codon, up to the beginning of the zinc finger array. By this approach, we 468 identified complete PRDM9 homologs in 16 species (Supplementary Table 2). For the 36 other species, we 469 further analyzed the corresponding reference genome to identify potential PRDM9 homologs. We performed 470 a TBLASTN search against reference genomes, using the 16 previously identified PRDM9 as queries, and 471 extracted loci presenting hits with the zinc finger domain and with at least 2 other PRDM9 exons, within 472 less than 100 kb. Then, for each candidate genomic fragment, we used GeneWise (Birney et al., 2004) to 473 annotate protein-coding regions by similarity with a representative complete PRDM9 protein taken from a 474 closely related species. Of note, GeneWise does take frameshifts into account, and is therefore appropriate to 475 annotate both genes and pseudogenes. In most species we identified one single candidate locus per genome. 476 When several loci were found, we retained the one(s) encoding the most complete protein. By this approach, 477 we identified PRDM9 loci in all 36 species, 25 of which encode a complete PRDM9 protein. Thus, in 478 total, we identified complete PRDM9 proteins in 41 of the 52 species analyzed. In agreement with previous 479 reports ((Axelsson et al., 2012; Auton et al., 2013)), we found PRDM9 to be pseudogenized in the 5 canids 480 (Lycaon pictus, Canis lupus familiaris, Vulpes lagopus, Vulpes vulpes, Nyctereutes procyonoides). In the 6 481 remaining cases, we failed to annotate a complete PRDM9 protein: either several exons were missing (Myotis 482 lucifugus, Myotis brandtii, Leptonychotes weddellii, Colobus angolensis), or the gene contained one exon with 483 a frameshifting mutation (respectively in exon 8 in Saimiri boliviensis and in exon 10 in Lipotes vexillifer). 484 In absence of data from more individuals, it is difficult to state whether these cases result from sequencing 485 errors or assembly artefacts or if they correspond to bona fide pseudogenes. We therefore tentatively annotate 486 these 6 cases as 'partial' Prdm9. The number of zinc fingers in the annotated proteins vary from 0 to 14. 487 This number should however be considered with caution because the zinc finger array is encoded by a highly 488 polymorphic minisatellite repeat, which is prone to errors during genome assembly. The detailed list of 489 PRDM9 sequences is given in Supplementary Table 2 and the corresponding protein multiple alignment can 490 be found at https://zenodo.org/records/10149667. 491

492 Acknowledgments

We wish to thank Nicolas Lartillot, Carina Farah Mugal, and Bernard de Massy for very useful reviews on a previous version of this manuscript, and Anaïs Duhamel for help with the figures. This work was performed using the computing facilities of the CC LBBE/PRABI. **Funding:** Agence Nationale de la Recherche, Grant ANR-19-CE12-0019 / HotRec. **Author contributions:** Original idea: J.J.; Model conception: J.J.; Code: J.J., D.P, A.L, T.T and L.D; Data analyses: J.J., D.P, A.L, T.T and L.D; Interpretation: J.J., D.P, A.L, T.T and L.D; First draft: J.J.; Editing and revisions: J.J., D.P, A.L, T.T and L.D; Funding: L.D. **Competing interests:** The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

500 Data availability

documentation for whole alignments available Analysis scripts and genome are at501 https://github.com/AlexandreLaverre/CANCGI-WGA/ The hal file of the Carnivore WGA, along 502 with analysis scripts and documentation for PRDM9 annotation and the study of positive selection can 503 be found at https://zenodo.org/records/10149667. The remaining analysis scripts and documentation are 504 accessible at https://gitlab.in2p3.fr/julien.joseph/defhot. 505

506 References

- Alleva, B., Brick, K., Pratto, F., Huang, M., and Camerini-Otero, R. D. (2021). Cataloging Human PRDM9
 Allelic Variation Using Long-Read Sequencing Reveals PRDM9 Population Specificity and Two Distinct
 Groupings of Related Alleles. *Frontiers in Cell and Developmental Biology*, 9.
- Arbeithuber, B., Betancourt, A. J., Ebner, T., and Tiemann-Boege, I. (2015). Crossovers are associated with
- ⁵¹¹ mutation and biased gene conversion at recombination hotspots. *Proceedings of the National Academy of* 512 *Sciences*, 112(7):2109–2114.
- 513 Armstrong, J., Hickey, G., Diekhans, M., Fiddes, I. T., Novak, A. M., Deran, A., Fang, Q., Xie, D., Feng,
- 514 S., Stiller, J., Genereux, D., Johnson, J., Marinescu, V. D., Alföldi, J., Harris, R. S., Lindblad-Toh,
- 515 K., Haussler, D., Karlsson, E., Jarvis, E. D., Zhang, G., and Paten, B. (2020). Progressive Cactus is a
- ⁵¹⁶ multiple-genome aligner for the thousand-genome era. *Nature*, 587(7833):246–251.
- Auton, A., Fledel-Alon, A., Pfeifer, S., Venn, O., Ségurel, L., Street, T., Leffler, E. M., Bowden, R., Aneas,
 I., Broxholme, J., Humburg, P., Iqbal, Z., Lunter, G., Maller, J., Hernandez, R. D., Melton, C., Venkat,
 A., Nobrega, M. A., Bontrop, R., Myers, S., Donnelly, P., Przeworski, M., and McVean, G. (2012). A
- 520 Fine-Scale Chimpanzee Genetic Map from Population Sequencing. Science, 336:7.
- Auton, A. and McVean, G. (2007). Recombination rate estimation in the presence of hotspots. *Genome Res.*, 17(8):1219–1227.
- Auton, A., Rui Li, Y., Kidd, J., Oliveira, K., Nadel, J., Holloway, J. K., Hayward, J. J., Cohen, P. E., Greally,
 J. M., Wang, J., Bustamante, C. D., and Boyko, A. R. (2013). Genetic Recombination Is Targeted towards
 Gene Promoter Regions in Dogs. *PLoS Genet*, 9(12):e1003984.
- 526 Axelsson, E., Webster, M. T., Ratnakumar, A., Consortium, T. L., Ponting, C. P., and Lindblad-Toh, K.
- (2012). Death of PRDM9 coincides with stabilization of the recombination landscape in the dog genome.
 Genome Res., 22(1):51–63.
- Baker, C. L., Kajita, S., Walker, M., Saxl, R. L., Raghupathy, N., Choi, K., Petkov, P. M., and Paigen, K.
 (2015). PRDM9 Drives Evolutionary Erosion of Hotspots in Mus musculus through Haplotype-Specific
 Initiation of Meiotic Recombination. *PLOS Genetics*, 11(1):e1004916.
- Baker, Z., Przeworski, M., and Sella, G. (2022). Down the Penrose stairs: How selection for fewer recombi nation hotspots maintains their existence.

- Baker, Z., Schumer, M., Haba, Y., Bashkirova, L., Holland, C., Rosenthal, G. G., and Przeworski, M. (2017).
 Repeated losses of PRDM9-directed recombination despite the conservation of PRDM9 across vertebrates.
 eLife, 6:e24133.
- Baudat, F., Buard, J., Grey, C., Fledel-Alon, A., Ober, C., Przeworski, M., Coop, G., and de Massy, B.
 (2010). PRDM9 Is a Major Determinant of Meiotic Recombination Hotspots in Humans and Mice. *Science*,
- ⁵³⁹ 327(5967):836–840.
- Bergeron, L. A., Besenbacher, S., Zheng, J., Li, P., Bertelsen, M. F., Quintard, B., Hoffman, J. I., Li, Z.,
- 541 St. Leger, J., Shao, C., Stiller, J., Gilbert, M. T. P., Schierup, M. H., and Zhang, G. (2023). Evolution of
- the germline mutation rate across vertebrates. *Nature*, pages 1–7.
- Berglund, J., Quilez, J., Arndt, P. F., and Webster, M. T. (2015). Germline Methylation Patterns Determine
 the Distribution of Recombination Events in the Dog Genome. *Genome Biology and Evolution*, 7(2):522–
 530.
- 546 Birney, E., Clamp, M., and Durbin, R. (2004). GeneWise and Genomewise. Genome Res., 14(5):988–995.
- ⁵⁴⁷ Bolívar, P., Mugal, C. F., Nater, A., and Ellegren, H. (2016). Recombination Rate Variation Modulates
 ⁵⁴⁸ Gene Sequence Evolution Mainly via GC-Biased Gene Conversion, Not Hill–Robertson Interference, in an
 ⁵⁴⁹ Avian System. *Mol Biol Evol*, 33(1):216–227.
- ⁵⁵⁰ Brick, K., Smagulova, F., Khil, P., Camerini-Otero, R. D., and Petukhova, G. V. (2012). Genetic recombi-
- nation is directed away from functional genomic elements in mice. *Nature*, 485(7400):642–645.
- ⁵⁵² Buard, J., Rivals, E., Segonzac, D. D. d., Garres, C., Caminade, P., Massy, B. d., and Boursot, P. (2014).
- Diversity of Prdm9 Zinc Finger Array in Wild Mice Unravels New Facets of the Evolutionary Turnover of
 this Coding Minisatellite. *PLOS ONE*, 9(1):e85021.
- Camacho, C., Coulouris, G., Avagyan, V., Ma, N., Papadopoulos, J., Bealer, K., and Madden, T. L. (2009).
 BLAST+: architecture and applications. *BMC Bioinformatics*, 10(1):421.
- ⁵⁵⁷ Cavassim, M. I. A., Baker, Z., Hoge, C., Schierup, M. H., Schumer, M., and Przeworski, M. (2022). PRDM9
 ⁵⁵⁸ losses in vertebrates are coupled to those of paralogs ZCWPW1 and ZCWPW2. *Proceedings of the National* ⁵⁵⁹ Academy of Sciences, 119(9):e2114401119.
- Chan, A. H., Jenkins, P. A., and Song, Y. S. (2012). Genome-Wide Fine-Scale Recombination Rate Variation
 in Drosophila melanogaster. *PLOS Genetics*, 8(12):e1003090.
- ⁵⁶² Charlesworth, D., Zhang, Y., Bergero, R., Graham, C., Gardner, J., and Yong, L. (2020). Using GC Content
- to Compare Recombination Patterns on the Sex Chromosomes and Autosomes of the Guppy, Poecilia
- reticulata, and Its Close Outgroup Species. *Molecular Biology and Evolution*, 37(12):3550–3562.
- 565 Choi, K., Zhao, X., Tock, A. J., Lambing, C., Underwood, C. J., Hardcastle, T. J., Serra, H., Kim, J.,
- 566 Cho, H. S., Kim, J., Ziolkowski, P. A., Yelina, N. E., Hwang, I., Martienssen, R. A., and Henderson,
- ⁵⁶⁷ I. R. (2018). Nucleosomes and DNA methylation shape meiotic DSB frequency in Arabidopsis thaliana
- transposons and gene regulatory regions. *Genome Res.*, 28(4):532–546.
- ⁵⁶⁹ Clément, Y. and Arndt, P. F. (2013). Meiotic Recombination Strongly Influences GC-Content Evolution in
- 570 Short Regions in the Mouse Genome. *Molecular Biology and Evolution*, 30(12):2612–2618.

- 571 Davies, B., Hatton, E., Altemose, N., Hussin, J. G., Pratto, F., Zhang, G., Hinch, A. G., Moralli, D., Biggs,
- 572 D., Diaz, R., Preece, C., Li, R., Bitoun, E., Brick, K., Green, C. M., Camerini-Otero, R. D., Myers,
- 573 S. R., and Donnelly, P. (2016). Re-engineering the zinc fingers of PRDM9 reverses hybrid sterility in mice.
- ⁵⁷⁴ *Nature*, 530(7589):171–176.
- 575 Diagouraga, B., Clément, J. A. J., Duret, L., Kadlec, J., de Massy, B., and Baudat, F. (2018). PRDM9
- 576 Methyltransferase Activity Is Essential for Meiotic DNA Double-Strand Break Formation at Its Binding
- 577 Sites. *Molecular Cell*, 69(5):853–865.e6.
- Duret, L. and Arndt, P. F. (2008). The Impact of Recombination on Nucleotide Substitutions in the Human
 Genome. *PLOS Genetics*, 4(5):e1000071.
- Eyre-Walker, A. (1999). Evidence of Selection on Silent Site Base Composition in Mammals: Potential
 Implications for the Evolution of Isochores and Junk DNA. *Genetics*, 152(2):675–683.
- Figuet, E., Ballenghien, M., Romiguier, J., and Galtier, N. (2015). Biased Gene Conversion and GC-Content
- Evolution in the Coding Sequences of Reptiles and Vertebrates. Genome Biology and Evolution, 7(1):240–
 250.
- Galtier, N. (2021). Fine-scale quantification of GC-biased gene conversion intensity in mammals. Peer
 Community Journal, 1.
- Galtier, N., Roux, C., Rousselle, M., Romiguier, J., Figuet, E., Glémin, S., Bierne, N., and Duret, L. (2018).
- Codon Usage Bias in Animals: Disentangling the Effects of Natural Selection, Effective Population Size,
 and GC-Biased Gene Conversion. *Molecular Biology and Evolution*, 35(5):1092–1103.
- Genereux, D. P., Serres, A., Armstrong, J., Johnson, J., Marinescu, V. D., Murén, E., Juan, D., Bejerano,
 G., Casewell, N. R., Chemnick, L. G., Damas, J., Di Palma, F., Diekhans, M., Fiddes, I. T., Garber,
- M., Gladyshev, V. N., Goodman, L., Haerty, W., Houck, M. L., Hubley, R., Kivioja, T., Koepfli, K.-P.,
- Kuderna, L. F. K., Lander, E. S., Meadows, J. R. S., Murphy, W. J., Nash, W., Noh, H. J., Nweeia, M.,
- Pfenning, A. R., Pollard, K. S., Ray, D. A., Shapiro, B., Smit, A. F. A., Springer, M. S., Steiner, C. C.,
- 595 Swofford, R., Taipale, J., Teeling, E. C., Turner-Maier, J., Alfoldi, J., Birren, B., Ryder, O. A., Lewin,
- H. A., Paten, B., Marques-Bonet, T., Lindblad-Toh, K., Karlsson, E. K., and Zoonomia Consortium (2020).
- A comparative genomics multitool for scientific discovery and conservation. *Nature*, 587(7833):240–245.
- Genestier, A., Duret, L., and Lartillot, N. (2023). Bridging the gap between the evolutionary dynamics and
 the molecular mechanisms of meiosis: a model based exploration of the PRDM9 intra-genomic Red Queen.
- Gerton, J. L. and Hawley, R. S. (2005). Homologous chromosome interactions in meiosis: diversity amidst
- conservation. Nat Rev Genet, 6(6):477-487.
- 602 Glémin, S. (2010). Surprising Fitness Consequences of GC-Biased Gene Conversion: I. Mutation Load and
- ⁶⁰³ Inbreeding Depression. *Genetics*, 185(3):939–959.
- Glémin, S., Arndt, P. F., Messer, P. W., Petrov, D., Galtier, N., and Duret, L. (2015). Quantification of
- GC-biased gene conversion in the human genome. *Genome Res.*, 25(8):1215–1228.
- 606 Halldorsson, B. V., Hardarson, M. T., Kehr, B., Styrkarsdottir, U., Gylfason, A., Thorleifsson, G., Zink,
- 607 F., Jonasdottir, A., Jonasdottir, A., Sulem, P., Masson, G., Thorsteinsdottir, U., Helgason, A., Kong, A.,

- Gudbjartsson, D. F., and Stefansson, K. (2016). The rate of meiotic gene conversion varies by sex and 608 age. Nat Genet, 48(11):1377-1384. 609
- Hammoud, S. S., Low, D. H. P., Yi, C., Carrell, D. T., Guccione, E., and Cairns, B. R. (2014). Chromatin 610 and Transcription Transitions of Mammalian Adult Germline Stem Cells and Spermatogenesis. Cell Stem 611 Cell, 15(2):239-253. 612
- Harris, K. and Pritchard, J. K. (2017). Rapid evolution of the human mutation spectrum. *eLife*, 6:e24284. 613
- He, Y., Wang, M., Dukowic-Schulze, S., Zhou, A., Tiang, C.-L., Shilo, S., Sidhu, G. K., Eichten, S., Bradbury, 614
- P., Springer, N. M., Buckler, E. S., Levy, A. A., Sun, Q., Pillardy, J., Kianian, P. M. A., Kianian, S. F., 615
- Chen, C., and Pawlowski, W. P. (2017). Genomic features shaping the landscape of meiotic double-strand-616 break hotspots in maize. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 114(46):12231–12236.

617

- Hickey, G., Paten, B., Earl, D., Zerbino, D., and Haussler, D. (2013). HAL: a hierarchical format for storing 618 and analyzing multiple genome alignments. Bioinformatics, 29(10):1341-1342. 619
- Hinch, A. G., Zhang, G., Becker, P. W., Moralli, D., Hinch, R., Davies, B., Bowden, R., and Donnelly, P. 620
- (2019). Factors influencing meiotic recombination revealed by whole-genome sequencing of single sperm. 621 Science, 363(6433):eaau8861. 622
- Hoge, C. R., Manuel, M. d., Mahgoub, M., Okami, N., Fuller, Z. L., Banerjee, S., Baker, Z., Mcnulty, M., 623 Andolfatto, P., Macfarlan, T. S., Schumer, M., Tzika, A. C., and Przeworski, M. (2023). Patterns of 624 recombination in snakes reveal a tug of war between PRDM9 and promoter-like features. 625
- Kawakami, T., Mugal, C. F., Suh, A., Nater, A., Burri, R., Smeds, L., and Ellegren, H. (2017). Whole-626 genome patterns of linkage disequilibrium across flycatcher populations clarify the causes and consequences 627 of fine-scale recombination rate variation in birds. Mol Ecol, 26(16):4158–4172. 628
- Kono, H., Tamura, M., Osada, N., Suzuki, H., Abe, K., Moriwaki, K., Ohta, K., and Shiroishi, T. (2014). 629 Prdm9 Polymorphism Unveils Mouse Evolutionary Tracks. DNA Research, 21(3):315–326. 630
- Kumar, S., Suleski, M., Craig, J. M., Kasprowicz, A. E., Sanderford, M., Li, M., Stecher, G., and Hedges, 631
- S. B. (2022). TimeTree 5: An Expanded Resource for Species Divergence Times. Molecular Biology and 632 Evolution, 39(8):msac174. 633
- Lartillot, N. (2013). Phylogenetic Patterns of GC-Biased Gene Conversion in Placental Mammals and the 634 Evolutionary Dynamics of Recombination Landscapes. Molecular Biology and Evolution, 30(3):489–502. 635
- Latrille, T., Duret, L., and Latrillot, N. (2017). The Red Queen model of recombination hot-spot evolu-636 tion: a theoretical investigation. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences, 637 372(1736):20160463. 638
- Lesecque, Y., Glémin, S., Lartillot, N., Mouchiroud, D., and Duret, L. (2014). The Red Queen Model of 639 Recombination Hotspots Evolution in the Light of Archaic and Modern Human Genomes. PLOS Genetics, 640 10(11):e1004790. 641
- Li, R., Bitoun, E., Altemose, N., Davies, R. W., Davies, B., and Myers, S. R. (2019). A high-resolution map 642 of non-crossover events reveals impacts of genetic diversity on mammalian meiotic recombination. Nat 643 Commun, 10(1):3900.644
 - 22

- Lichten, M. and Goldman, A. S. H. (1995). Meiotic recombination hotspots. Annu. Rev. Genet., 29(1):423-645 444. 646
- Maloisel, L. and Rossignol, J.-L. (1998). Suppression of crossing-over by DNA methylation in Ascobolus. 647 Genes & Development, 12(9):1381–1389. 648
- Marand, A. P., Jansky, S. H., Zhao, H., Leisner, C. P., Zhu, X., Zeng, Z., Crisovan, E., Newton, L., 649 Hamernik, A. J., Veilleux, R. E., Buell, C. R., and Jiang, J. (2017). Meiotic crossovers are associated with 650 open chromatin and enriched with Stowaway transposons in potato. Genome Biol, 18(1):1–16. 651
- Mihola, O., Landa, V., Pratto, F., Brick, K., Kobets, T., Kusari, F., Gasic, S., Smagulova, F., Grey, C., 652
- 653 Flachs, P., Gergelits, V., Tresnak, K., Silhavy, J., Mlejnek, P., Camerini-Otero, R. D., Pravenec, M.,
- Petukhova, G. V., and Trachtulec, Z. (2021). Rat PRDM9 shapes recombination landscapes, duration of 654
- meiosis, gametogenesis, and age of fertility. BMC Biol, 19(1):1–20. 655
- Mihola, O., Pratto, F., Brick, K., Linhartova, E., Kobets, T., Flachs, P., Baker, C. L., Sedlacek, R., Paigen, 656 K., Petkov, P. M., Camerini-Otero, R. D., and Trachtulec, Z. (2019). Histone methyltransferase PRDM9 657
- is not essential for meiosis in male mice. Genome Res., 29(7):1078–1086. 658
- Milholland, B., Dong, X., Zhang, L., Hao, X., Suh, Y., and Vijg, J. (2017). Differences between germline 659 and somatic mutation rates in humans and mice. Nat Commun, 8(1):15183. 660
- Munch, K., Mailund, T., Dutheil, J. Y., and Schierup, M. H. (2014). A fine-scale recombination map of the 661 human-chimpanzee ancestor reveals faster change in humans than in chimpanzees and a strong impact of 662 GC-biased gene conversion. Genome Res., 24(3):467-474. 663
- Myers, S., Bowden, R., Tumian, A., Bontrop, R. E., Freeman, C., MacFie, T. S., McVean, G., and Donnelly, 664 P. (2010). Drive Against Hotspot Motifs in Primates Implicates the PRDM9 Gene in Meiotic Recombi-665 nation. Science, 327(5967):876-879. 666
- Nagylaki, T. (1983). Evolution of a finite population under gene conversion. Proceedings of the National 667 Academy of Sciences, 80(20):6278–6281. 668
- Oliver, P. L., Goodstadt, L., Bayes, J. J., Birtle, Z., Roach, K. C., Phadnis, N., Beatson, S. A., Lunter, 669 G., Malik, H. S., and Ponting, C. P. (2009). Accelerated Evolution of the Prdm9 Speciation Gene across 670 Diverse Metazoan Taxa. PLOS Genetics, 5(12):e1000753.
- Page, S. L. and Hawley, R. S. (2003). Chromosome Choreography: The Meiotic Ballet. 672

671

- Science. 301(5634):785-789. 673
- Parvanov, E. D., Petkov, P. M., and Paigen, K. (2010). Prdm9 Controls Activation of Mammalian Recom-674 bination Hotspots. Science, 327(5967):835-835. 675
- Pessia, E., Popa, A., Mousset, S., Rezvoy, C., Duret, L., and Marais, G. A. (2012). Evidence for widespread 676 GC-biased gene conversion in eukaryotes. Genome biology and evolution, 4(7):675–682. 677
- Petes, T. D. (2001). Meiotic recombination hot spots and cold spots. Nat Rev Genet, 2(5):360–369. 678
- Pratto, F., Brick, K., Khil, P., Smagulova, F., Petukhova, G. V., and Camerini-Otero, R. D. (2014). Recom-679
- bination initiation maps of individual human genomes. Science, 346(6211):1256442–1256442. 680

- Qu, J., Hodges, E., Molaro, A., Gagneux, P., Dean, M. D., Hannon, G. J., and Smith, A. D. (2018).
 Evolutionary expansion of DNA hypomethylation in the mammalian germline genome. *Genome Res.*, 28(2):145–158.
- Quinlan, A. R. and Hall, I. M. (2010). BEDTools: a flexible suite of utilities for comparing genomic features.
 Bioinformatics, 26(6):841–842.
- Raynaud, M., Gagnaire, P.-A., and Galtier, N. (2023). Performance and limitations of linkage-disequilibriumbased methods for inferring the genomic landscape of recombination and detecting hotspots: a simulation
 study. *Peer Community Journal*, 3.
- Samuk, K. and Noor, M. A. F. (2022). Gene flow biases population genetic inference of recombination rate.
 G3 Genes|*Genomes*|*Genetics*, 12(11):jkac236.
- Schield, D. R., Pasquesi, G. I. M., Perry, B. W., Adams, R. H., Nikolakis, Z. L., Westfall, A. K., Orton,
 R. W., Meik, J. M., Mackessy, S. P., and Castoe, T. A. (2020). Snake Recombination Landscapes Are
- ⁶⁹³ Concentrated in Functional Regions despite PRDM9. *Molecular Biology and Evolution*, 37(5):1272–1294.
- 694 Singhal, S., Leffler, E. M., Sannareddy, K., Turner, I., Venn, O., Hooper, D. M., Strand, A. I., Li, Q., Raney,
- B., Balakrishnan, C. N., Griffith, S. C., McVean, G., and Przeworski, M. (2015). Stable recombination
 hotspots in birds. *Science*, page 6.
- Smagulova, F., Brick, K., Pu, Y., Camerini-Otero, R. D., and Petukhova, G. V. (2016). The evolutionary
 turnover of recombination hot spots contributes to speciation in mice. *Genes Dev.*, 30(3):266–280.
- Smith, T. C. A., Arndt, P. F., and Eyre-Walker, A. (2018). Large scale variation in the rate of germ-line de
 novo mutation, base composition, divergence and diversity in humans. *PLoS Genet*, 14(3):e1007254.
- Spence, J. P. and Song, Y. S. (2019). Inference and analysis of population-specific fine-scale recombination
 maps across 26 diverse human populations. *Science Advances*, 5(10):eaaw9206.
- Stapley, J., Feulner, P. G. D., Johnston, S. E., Santure, A. W., and Smadja, C. M. (2017). Variation in
 recombination frequency and distribution across eukaryotes: patterns and processes. *Phil. Trans. R. Soc. B*, 372(1736):20160455.
- Tock, A. J. and Henderson, I. R. (2018). Hotspots for Initiation of Meiotic Recombination. Front. Genet.,
 9:521.
- Wallberg, A., Glémin, S., and Webster, M. T. (2015). Extreme Recombination Frequencies Shape Genome
 Variation and Evolution in the Honeybee, Apis mellifera. *PLoS Genet*, 11(4):e1005189.
- Vang, R. J., Thomas, G. W. C., Raveendran, M., Harris, R. A., Doddapaneni, H., Muzny, D. M., Capitanio,
- J. P., Radivojac, P., Rogers, J., and Hahn, M. W. (2020). Paternal age in rhesus macaques is positively associated with germline mutation accumulation but not with measures of offspring sociability. *Genome*
- 713 Res., 30(6):826–834.
- Williams, A. L., Genovese, G., Dyer, T., Altemose, N., Truax, K., Jun, G., Patterson, N., Myers, S. R.,
 Curran, J. E., Duggirala, R., Blangero, J., Reich, D., and Przeworski, M. (2015). Non-crossover gene
- conversions show strong GC bias and unexpected clustering in humans. *eLife*, 4:e04637.

- Wong, W. S. W., Solomon, B. D., Bodian, D. L., Kothiyal, P., Eley, G., Huddleston, K. C., Baker, R.,
 Thach, D. C., Iyer, R. K., Vockley, J. G., and Niederhuber, J. E. (2016). New observations on maternal
 age effect on germline de novo mutations. *Nat Commun*, 7(1):10486.
- 720 Zelkowski, M., Olson, M. A., Wang, M., and Pawlowski, W. (2019). Diversity and Determinants of Meiotic
- 721 Recombination Landscapes. Trends in Genetics, 35(5):359–370.
- ⁷²² Úbeda, F. and Wilkins, J. F. (2011). The Red Queen theory of recombination hotspots. Journal of Evolu-
- *tionary Biology*, 24(3):541–553.