

Diving into micro-and macroscopic properties of eggtempera paint based on Sienna pigment

Floriane Gerony, Côme Thillaye Du Boullay, Laurence de Viguerie, Fabrice Gaslain, Bruno Lanson, Camille Colin, Laurent Michot, Anne-Laure Rollet, Guillaume Mériguet, Maguy Jaber

▶ To cite this version:

Floriane Gerony, Côme Thillaye Du Boullay, Laurence de Viguerie, Fabrice Gaslain, Bruno Lanson, et al.. Diving into micro-and macroscopic properties of eggtempera paint based on Sienna pigment. Applied Clay Science, 2024, 249, pp.107236. 10.1016/j.clay.2023.107236. hal-04443938

HAL Id: hal-04443938 https://hal.science/hal-04443938v1

Submitted on 7 Feb 2024

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

¹ Diving into micro-and macroscopic properties of egg-

tempera paint based on Sienna pigment

- 3 Floriane Gerony^{a,b}, Laurence de Viguerie^a, Côme Thillaye du Boullay^a, Fabrice Gaslain^c, Bruno Lanson^d, Camille Colin^a, Laurent Michot^b, Anne-Laure Rollet^b, Guillaume Mériquet^b, 4 Maguy Jaber^{a,e}* 5 ^a Sorbonne Université, CNRS UMR 8220, LAMS, case courrier 225, 4 pl. Jussieu 75252 Paris cedex 6 7 05, France 8 ^b Sorbonne Université, CNRS UMR 8234, PHENIX, case courrier 51, 4 pl. Jussieu 75252 Paris cedex 05, France 9 10 c MinesParis, UniversitéPSL,CentredesMatériaux(MAT), UMR7633 CNRS, 91003 Evry, France 11 d Univ. Grenoble Alpes, CNRS, Univ. Savoie Mont Blanc, IRD, Univ. Gustave Eiffel, ISTerre, F-38000 12 Grenoble, France 13 ^eInstitut Universitaire de France, Paris, France 14 *Corresponding author, e-mail: maguy.jaber@sorbonne-universite.fr 15 Abstract 16
- 17 Egg-tempera painting was a pictorial technique widespread in the Middle Ages. In this work, Sienna earth and yolk have been used to formulate tempera paints according to historical recipes. Micro- and 18 19 macroscopic properties were investigated to understand the interactions between the pigment and the 20 binder. The pigment, inorganic part of the paint, was characterized by X-Ray Diffraction (XRD), thermal analysis (TG-DTA), Fourier Transform Infrared (FT-IR) Spectroscopy, granulometry, as well as 21 22 Scanning Electron Microscopy (SEM). Then lecithin adsorption onto pigment particles was probed to 23 understand yolk interaction with Sienna earth, pure kaolinite and goethite particles. NMR-Relaxometry 24 was used to investigate the behavior and accessibility of the mineral surfaces to yolk and water. 25 Macroscopic rheological properties of the paint systems were finally investigated.
- 26 Keywords: tempera paint; Sienna earth; yolk; lecithin; relaxometry; rheology

27 Introduction

2

Until the end of the 15th century, the predominant painting technique was *tempera*, *i.e.* a mixture of a colored pigment with an aqueous binder. In Western Europe, between the 13th and 15th centuries, the most commonly used aqueous binder was egg yolk and many artists therefore painted with an egg-tempera technique. Some tempera binder recipes are reported in medieval manuscripts. 32 For instance, in the famous manuscript "Libro Del Arte", the apprentice painter Cennino Cennini (1390-33 1437) described the mixing of egg yolk and pigments, and mentioned that such a mixture could be 34 used to paint a wide range of materials : walls, panels, or iron among others (Cennini and Broecke, 35 2015). Numerous pigments both synthetic and natural were employed by artists at that time. Among 36 them, as mentioned in several medieval manuscripts (Mayer and Sheehan, 1991; Merrifield, 1999; 37 Clarke, 2011; Cennini and Broecke, 2015), natural earths and ochres were particularly popular, as 38 they were used to form the base of the first paint layers of flesh tones. Sienna earth is a typical 39 example of this family of pigments. Most of these pigments are complex mineral mixtures. Sienna 40 earth mainly contains goethite, various clay minerals (kaolinite, smectite, illite....), and additional 41 accessory minerals, the nature of which depends on the geological setting (Helwig, 1998; Grygar et 42 al., 2003; Hradil et al., 2003).

43 Identification techniques classically used on tempera artworks and mock-ups do not provide 44 any information about the interactions between pigments and binders, even though these interactions 45 are of prime importance since they govern the final properties of the paints. Still, some spectroscopic 46 analyses have been carried out in mock-ups after drying (Meilunas et al., 1990; Mazzeo et al., 2008; 47 Navas et al., 2010; Romero-Pastor et al., 2011; Manea et al., 2012). In the case of egg-tempera paint 48 with Sienna, some interactions between the pigments and egg yolk could be evidenced from the 49 spectral evolution of the aliphatic and aromatic C-H regions of aromatic amino acids (Romero-Pastor 50 et al., 2011). Fanost and coworkers studied green earth tempera paints (Fanost, 2019; Fanost et al., 51 2022) and showed that the combination of NMR-relaxometry and rheology measurements on fresh 52 paints provides fruitful information on the binder-pigment network that controls to a large extent the 53 rheological properties of paints and consequently the way they flow and spread on canvases (Salvant 54 Plisson et al., 2014) which often explains why painters chose specific formulations.

The present paper deals with egg-tempera painting with Sienna earth as pigment. After characterizing in details the structural and morphological properties of Sienna by various techniques (XRD, FTIR, Laser diffraction, Gas adsorption, Thermo Gravimetric Analysis, Scanning Electron Microscopy), we focused on the interactions between the pigment and the binder, analyzing the adsorption of lecithin, one of the main components of egg yolk, on the pigments and probing interfaces between binder and pigment with NMR relaxometry. Sienna earth being a complex natural system, we also investigated the possibility to use a mixture of pure minerals as a synthetic Sienna. The rheological properties of 62 natural Sienna tempera paint were then compared to the ones of tempera paints based on the 63 reconstituted Sienna as well as its individual components. Model systems are often employed in 64 physicochemical studies but, to the best of our knowledge, it is the first use of a model pigment in the 65 cultural heritage field.

66 Materials and methods

67 Materials

Italian raw Sienna (#40400) and synthetic goethite (#48000, purity >99.4%) were supplied by Kremer Pigmente (Germany). Clay minerals kaolinite (KGa-1b, purity kaolin 95-100%, quartz 1-2%) and montmorillonite (Texas STx-1, purity montmorillonite 95-100%, quartz 1-5%) were purchased from The Clay Minerals Society (USA). Calcite (purity >99%) was obtained from Sigma-Aldrich.

72 Reconstituted Sienna is the mix of the pure minerals with proportions by weight of 37% kaolinite, 27%

- 73 goethite, 14% montmorillonite and 22% calcite.
- 74 Fresh organic hen eggs were purchased from a local store.

Soybean L-α-Lecithin (CAS 8002-43-5 – Calbiochem®) was obtained from Sigma-Aldrich and was
solubilized in ethanol denatured ≥96% (CAS 64-17-5, GPR RECTAPUR®) from VWR BDH Chemicals.
The headgroup area of lecithin (a0 = 0.58 nm²) was determined with Avogadro software (Version
1.2.0) using Universal Force Field (UFF) and is consistent with literature values (Brouillette et al.,
1982; Israelachvili, 2011).

80

81 Sample preparation

82 Adsorption isotherms

As lecithin is not soluble in water, it was solubilized into ethanol. 20 mL of lecithin/ethanol solutions (at concentrations in the range 2-100 mM for Sienna and kaolinite and 2-350 mM for goethite) were added to 300 mg of powder in closed flasks and stirred for 24h. Dispersions were then centrifuged at 4000 *g* during 15 min. Solid substrates were analyzed by thermogravimetric analysis coupled with differential thermal analysis (TG-DTA) to determine the charge *Q* (mass of lecithin adsorbed per gram of powder). For Sienna and goethite isotherms, lecithin charge was not directly measurable by TGA analysis because lecithin decomposition and goethite to hematite transition occur in the same temperature range (Figure 2 and Figure S2). We estimated the loss of weight due to iron oxides
transformation and the remaining loss of weight was assigned to lecithin decomposition.

92 Paint reconstruction protocol

93 Paints were formulated after selecting recipes from medieval manuscripts and more recent manuals 94 (Laurie, 1926; Thompson and York, 1962; De L'escalopier, 1977; Mayer and Sheehan, 1991; 95 Merrifield, 1999; Clarke, 2011; Cennini and Broecke, 2015) and further discussion with restorers. A 96 simplified preparation protocol was elaborated to be applicable and reproducible in the laboratory. 97 Pure yolk was obtained by rolling the yolk from one hand to another to remove the white, and by piercing the yolk to eliminate the membrane (Mayer and Sheehan, 1991). In order to improve 98 99 reproducibility, 3 fresh organic hen egg yolks from the same box were mixed. Tempera binder was 100 prepared by mixing egg yolk (75 wt%) with ultra-pure water (25 wt%).

For rheology measurements, tempera paints were prepared as follows: 3 g of pigment were manually ground into 2 g of ultra-pure water during 2 min with a glass muller. Then 4 g of tempera binder were added to the pigment paste and mixed again with the glass muller during 4 min. In the end, paint systems correspond to $\frac{1}{3}$ pigment, $\frac{1}{3}$ water and $\frac{1}{3}$ egg yolk.

For relaxometry measurements, ¹/₃ of pigment was dispersed in water or in tempera binder and ground
with a glass muller.

107 Analytical techniques

108 X-ray diffraction (XRD) and Rietveld refinement

109 XRD patterns were collected on natural Sienna using a Bruker D8 diffractometer equipped with Co 110 radiation (λ = 1.78897 Å) operated at 40 kV and 40 mA. Intensities were measured with a Vortex 60EX silicon drift detector (Hitachi High-Tech America) for 8 s per 0.026° 20 step over the 5-90° 20 Co Ka 111 112 angular range. Divergence slit, the two Soller slits, the antiscatter, and resolution slits were fixed at 113 0.3°, 2.3°, 0.3°, and 0.2°, respectively. Quantitative phase analysis was performed from the Rietveld refinement of XRD data using the Profex software (Doebelin and Kleeberg, 2015). Quantification of the 114 115 sample amorphous content was also performed from the Rietveld refinement of XRD data after 116 addition of an internal standard (~20 wt% of corundum – α -Al₂O₃) to the sample and careful mixing 117 and homogenization.

118 Scanning electron microscopy (SEM)

119 Analyses were carried out with a FEI Nova NanoSEM 450 microscope equipped with a FEG source

120 and an immersion lens. Secondary electron imaging was performed with a through-the-lens detector

121 (TLD) between 2 and 5 kV.

122 Laser diffraction particle size analyser

Size measurements were performed with a Mastersizer 3000 laser diffraction particle size analyzer with Hydro EV accessory (Malvern Panalytical). Powders were dispersed in water. 3 measurements were made per sample and the values are reported as volume and number distributions.

126 Gas adsorption

N₂ adsorption-desorption isotherms of natural Sienna and goethite were carried out at 77 K on a
 Micromeritics ASAP 2010 gas analyzer. Prior to the analysis, the samples were outgassed under
 vacuum at 200°C for 6 h. Specific surface areas were determined using the BET model.

130 Thermogravimetric Analysis (TGA)

Thermal analyses were performed with a SDT-Q600 (TA Instruments). Approximatively 20 mg of powder were placed in an alumina crucible and a temperature ramp of 5°C/min was applied from 25 to 1000°C. Measurements were conducted with an air flow of 75 mL/min.

134 NMR-Relaxometry

Measurements of the water ¹H longitudinal relaxation rates $R_1=1/T_1$ were performed using a 135 136 SpinMaster Field Cycling relaxometer (Stelar) in the 0.01-30 MHz frequency range. From 10 kHz to 10 137 MHz a pre-polarized sequence was used whereas a non-polarized sequence was employed between 10 MHz and 30 MHz (Anoardo et al., 2001). The magnetization curves, built with 16-time increments, 138 139 exhibit a mono-exponential dependency. Samples were conditioned in glass tubes (10 mm external 140 diameter, 38 mm length) closed by a silicon cap (Fanost et al., 2020). 30wt% suspensions of mineral 141 were prepared by grinding the powder in a water with a glass muller. For calcite suspension, which is 142 not very stable, measurements were taken point by point and samples were shaken between each 143 measurement. The sample almost completely filled the tube to prevent evaporation during the 144 experiments. Samples were thermostated at 298 K using regulated air flux.

145 FT-IR spectroscopy

Fourier-transform infrared (FT-IR) spectra were acquired on a Bruker Tensor 27 spectrometer. Transmission measurements were performed using KBr (CAS 7758-02-3 – Uvasol®, for IR spectroscopy, Merck, Germany) transparent pellets that were obtained by applying a weight of 10 tons on mixtures of about 2 mg of powder and 100 mg of anhydrous KBr previously crushed and homogenized in an agate mortar. A 32-scan average spectrum was recorded from 4000 to 400 cm⁻¹ with a resolution of 4 cm⁻¹. Baseline subtraction and peak indexation were performed using OriginPro 9.0 software.

153 Rheology

154 Rheological measurements were carried out using a Thermo Scientific HAAKE MARS 40 rheometer. A 155 sandblasted titanium 35 mm-diameter and 2°-angle cone/plate geometry was used. Tests were 156 performed at 25°C using a plastic hood to avoid drying of the paint during the measurements. All tests 157 were carried out at least twice on the same paint and on the same day. Error bars were computed as 158 the standard deviation of these measurements.

Flow measurements were performed by increasing and decreasing the shear rate between $\dot{\gamma} = 0.01$ and 1000 s⁻¹. Because back and forth measurements were almost superimposed (i.e. thixotropic effects are negligible), only the downward ramp is plotted in the following; exception for kaolinite where the upward ramp is shown because the low viscosity of the suspension caused sedimentation during the measurement.

164 Strain sweep measurements were performed at increasing stresses from τ = 0.01 to 100 Pa at a 165 constant oscillatory frequency of 1 Hz.

166 Frequency sweep measurements were carried out at constant stress τ =0.1 Pa (value chosen in the 167 linear viscoelastic regime) with decreasing frequency from 100 to 0.1 Hz.

168 Results and discussion

169 Natural Sienna characterization and reconstruction:

The X-ray diffraction pattern of natural Sienna (Figure 1) reveals the presence of numerous mineral
phases, the relative proportions of which were deduced from a Rietveld refinement of XRD data (Table
1).



Figure 1: Rietveld refinement results (experimental pattern in black, calculated pattern in red, difference in grey) of natural
Sienna. Rp = 7.77%, Rwp = 10.12%, Rexp = 8.41%, GoF = 1.20.

176 Natural Sienna is mainly composed of clay minerals (~33% kaolinite and ~12% smectite) and iron oxide (~24% goethite). A significant amount of calcite (~13%) is also present in the pigment. The 177 178 systematic presence of broad and sharp lines corresponding to goethite (Figure S1) indicated the coexistence of two goethite populations in natural Sienna. Positions of sharp lines are typical of ideal 179 180 goethite whereas broad lines are systematically shifted towards higher angle (Figure S1) most likely 181 owing to common Al-for-Fe substitutions in goethite (Schulze, 1984; Schwertmann and Cornell, 2000). 182 The associated decrease of volume unit cell (from 0.1387 nm³ in ideal goethite to 0.1366 nm³ in Alsubstituted goethite) indicates the presence of 10-15 mol% AI in the prevailing (~75% of the total 183 goethite content in natural Sienna) Al-substituted goethite (Schwertmann and Carlson, 1994). Peak 184 185 broadening associated to Al-for-Fe substitution in goethite indicates a decrease of the average 186 coherent scattering domain size from ~80 nm to ~15 nm.

187

Table 1: Quantitative phase analysis of natural Sienna determined by Rietveld refinement.

Minerals	%wt
Kaolinite	32.7(5)
Goethite	23.5(4)
Calcite	12.9(2)
Smectite	12.1(5)
Anatase	2.7(1)

Quartz	1.6(1)
Gypsum	0.7(1)
Amorphous	13.8(11)

188

208

189 The IR spectrum of natural Sienna is presented in Figure 2a. Vibration bands corresponding to 190 kaolinite, goethite and calcite can be identified in this spectrum. The presence of kaolinite is evidenced by the Si-O stretching band at 1034 cm⁻¹ and the Si-O-Al band at 1011 cm⁻¹. The two OH stretching 191 bands at 3695 and 3620 cm⁻¹ that correspond to structural hydroxyls can also be linked to the 192 presence of kaolinite. Bands corresponding to goethite are also observed particularly in the low 193 wavenumber region where signals at 538, 469 and 430 cm⁻¹ correspond to Fe-O, in addition of those 194 at 3423 and 3238 cm⁻¹ assigned to the hydroxyl groups. However, the latter bands could also be 195 196 related to the presence of smectite. Finally, the presence of calcite in the sample is evidenced by the occurrence of the carbonate stretching vibration band at 1425 cm⁻¹ (Helwig, 1998; Bikiaris et al., 2000; 197 198 Genestar and Pons, 2005; Manasse and Mellini, 2006).

199 The TG-DTA curve of natural Sienna (Figure 2b) displays various weight losses. The features below 200 150°C can be assigned to the outgassing of physisorbed water. The event around 285°C corresponds 201 to the goethite/hematite transition (Manasse and Mellini, 2006). In quantitative terms, this event 202 corresponds to a weight loss of 2.5% of the initial mass. The weight loss for pure goethite would 203 correspond to 10%, leading to an estimation of 25% of goethite in natural Sienna, a value extremely 204 close to the one deduced from the Rietveld refinement. The weight losses around 465°C and 675°C 205 can be assigned to respectively kaolinite dehydroxylation and calcite decomposition (Genestar Juliá 206 and Pons Bonafé, 2004). There again the quantitative results are consistent with mineral proportions 207 deduced from the Rietveld analysis.





The particle size distribution of Sienna was determined by laser diffraction (Figure 3). The volume distribution (dashed line) exhibits a wide range of sizes and is centered around 25 μ m. However, such a representation of the results tends to favor the larger particles and it is relevant to plot the number distribution (solid line). This shows that most particles in Sienna are submicronic in size with a distribution centered around 1 μ m. It must be recalled however that laser diffraction results assume the presence of spherical objects, which is obviously not the case here as shown by SEM images (Figure 4). The sizes determined should then be considered as indicative rather than a precise value.





Figure 3: Size distribution in volume and in number of Sienna particles in water.

219 Scanning Electron Microscopy (SEM) micrographs of natural Sienna (Figure 4) reveal two main crystal 220 morphologies. Indeed, platy particles and needle-like ones can be observed. EDX analyses (not 221 shown) reveal that the platy particles contain mainly silicon, aluminum and/or calcium whereas the 222 needle-like ones are iron-rich. It then appears that the platelets can be assigned to clay minerals and 223 the needles to goethite. In terms of size, the goethite particles are about 1µm long and 0.1 µm wide 224 whereas the platelets have a diameter (d) of about 100 nm and a thickness (e) of about 20 nm, i.e. an 225 aspect ratio d/e of 0.2. Literature reports that natural Sienna can contain low amounts of manganese oxide, giving it a brownish hue (Hradil et al., 2003), and that arsenic is sometimes present in Sienna 226 227 samples (Manasse and Mellini, 2006). These two elements were not observed in the Sienna used in 228 the present study.



229

The specific surface area (SSA) of natural Sienna determined by gas adsorption is 45.8 m².g⁻¹, a large value that appears consistent with the submicron size of most particles deduced from SEM images and laser diffraction results.

Sizes and morphological properties of pure goethite and pure kaolinite later used as model systems in this study have also been characterized. Size measurements of both minerals are compared to those obtained for natural Sienna in Figure 5. The range of sizes of both goethite and kaolinite is similar to that of natural Sienna, most particles being submicronic (Figure 5 right).



Figure 5: Size distribution in volume (left) and in number (right) of particles in Sienna (brown curve), pure kaolinite (green curve)
 and pure goethite (purple curve) in water.

SEM images of pure minerals goethite and kaolinite are presented on Figure 6. The shape and size of goethite particles are similar to those of the needle-like grains observed in natural Sienna (about 1 μ m \times 0.1 μ m), whereas the pure kaolinite appears to be formed of slightly larger particles (about 1 μ m in the layer plane for the largest) than those observed in natural Sienna.



245 246

238

Figure 6: SEM photos of pure goethite and pure kaolinite.

230

The specific surface area of pure goethite was measured as $14.7 \text{ m}^2.\text{g}^{-1}$ and the SSA of pure kaolinite is reported by the supplier as $10.1 \text{ m}^2.\text{g}^{-1}$, whereas for STx-1 montmorillonite a SSA of 83.8 m².g⁻¹ is indicated.

At first sight, in terms of morphological features, pure kaolinite and pure goethite thus appear as proper models for understanding the properties of natural Sienna employed as pigment in tempera paint.

253 Adsorption of the binder on the pigment

254 In order to get more insight into the effect of binder in egg yolk-based tempera paints, it seems 255 relevant to examine the adsorption of binder molecules onto pigment particles. Egg yolk is mainly 256 composed of water (around 50%), lipids (around 30%), and proteins (around 15%). The remaining 5% 257 correspond to carbohydrates, minerals, colored molecules and vitamins (Phenix, 1997; Anton, 2007, 258 2013; Xiao et al., 2020). The main phospholipid present in yolk, phosphatidylcholine, generally 259 referred to as lecithin accounts for 12% of dry matter of yolk (Phenix, 1997). We therefore chose in a 260 first step to use lecithin and studied its adsorption onto natural Sienna and some of its component 261 minerals.



262

Figure 7: Adsorption isotherms of lecithin on natural Sienna (brown squares), on goethite (purple circles) and on kaolinite (green
 triangles): evolution of the adsorbed charge of lecithin Q in function of the equilibrium concentration of lecithin C_{eq}.

265 The isotherm adsorption of lecithin on natural Sienna (brown squares in Figure 7) exhibits a sharp increase at low equilibrium concentration followed by a plateau at Q_{Sienna} = 0.16 g/g for lecithin 266 267 concentration > 10 mmol/L. Such a shape is indicative of a high affinity of lecithin towards Sienna 268 earth. Looking at the individual components, it appears that the isotherm corresponding to kaolinite 269 displays a similar shape with a plateau around Q_{kaolinite} = 0.03 g/g (green triangles in Figure 7), 270 whereas the isotherm for goethite exhibits a low adsorbed amount at low equilibrium concentration 271 followed by a steady increase of the amount adsorbed. This latter result is rather surprising, as 272 goethite is known to have a strong affinity towards phosphate groups (Chitrakar et al., 2006; Luengo et 273 al., 2006; Zhong et al., 2007), even in natural materials (Torrent, 1992). However, when looking at the 274 structure of lecithin, it appears that the phosphate groups in lecithin may not be easily accessible since 275 the phosphate is bound to a choline and a glycerol moieties. Furthermore, lecithin is positively charged 276 on the choline group (Li et al., 2023), which could explain its low affinity for goethite that has an 277 isoelectric point around 7.0. Still, adsorption isotherms here were carried out in ethanol and that such 278 reasoning may not fully apply.

279 All these results tend to show that lecithin adsorption on natural Sienna is likely dominated by 280 adsorption onto clay fractions. Such an interpretation is reinforced by the fact that the specific surface area ratio between pure kaolinite ($\approx 10 \text{ m}^2.\text{g}^{-1}$) and natural Sienna ($\approx 50 \text{ m}^2.\text{g}^{-1}$) is very close to the 281 282 adsorbed amount ratio of lecithin between the two systems. Furthermore, the shape of the adsorption 283 isotherm with a plateau highlights saturation of the adsorbed lecithin charge. Considering a surface 284 headgroup of the lecithin molecule of 0.58 nm², the saturation value corresponds to the charge of 285 almost two layers of lecithin molecules absorbed on Sienna and kaolinite. This would suggest a bilayer 286 adsorption, which has been reported in the literature for intercalation between bentonite sheets (Li et 287 al., 2023).". Still, it is rather difficult to obtain a full quantitative picture of lecithin adsorption on natural 288 Sienna considering that the surface areas of the various components in the complex system is not 289 known. Moreover, goethite in natural Sienna is not equivalent to the pure goethite used in our study. 290 Indeed, detailed analysis of the diffractogram have shown that most of the goethite present in natural 291 Sienna earth was in fact microcrystalline Al-substituted goethite (Figure S1).

292 Solvent accessibility to mineral: NMR relaxometry

As presented above, Sienna earth is composed of several minerals, whose precise chemical composition and proportions vary according to their provenance. We thus decided to prepare a 295 synthetic Sienna by mixing pure minerals (goethite, kaolinite, montmorillonite and calcite) in 296 proportions similar to those determined from the Rietveld refinement of natural Sienna (Table 1) and to 297 compare their behavior as paints, as well as those of the individual minerals. For montmorillonite, we 298 chose to use the STx-1 sample from the Clay Minerals Society as it is a classical representative of a 299 Ca^{2+} exchanged montmorillonite. Amorphous phases were replaced by calcite.

An important feature to understand paint behavior is to assess the proportion of pigment surfaces that are actually accessible to solvent molecules, i.e. in this case mainly water and lipoprotein molecules. NMR relaxometry is a perfectly suited tool for probing such phenomena as it provides information on the multiscale dynamics of molecules (Kimmich, 1997; Korb, 2018). In particular, measuring the NMR relaxation rate $R_1=1/T_1$ of ¹H at Larmor frequency spanning from 0.01 to 30 MHz, provide insights into the dynamics of water and lipoproteins in the vicinity of mineral surfaces, and into their interactions with surface atoms (Cooper et al., 2013; Yuan et al., 2017; Fanost et al., 2021).

Figure 8 shows the ¹H NMR relaxation dispersion (NMRD) profiles of tempera paints pigmented with 307 308 the main mineral components of Sienna (goethite, kaolinite, montmorillonite), and of both natural and 309 reconstituted Sienna earths. The relaxation rate R_1 at each frequency is determined by the fitting of 310 the magnetization curves by exponential decays. Here, two populations of protons have been 311 identified, a fast relaxation rate named $R_{1_{\text{fast}}}$ and a slow one named $R_{1_{\text{slow}}}$. The profiles of the fast population of the five minerals differ from each other. Peaks are visible at 2-4 MHz corresponding to 312 ¹H-¹⁴N quadrupolar peaks (Kimmich, 1977; Fanost et al., 2022) assessing the presence of poorly 313 mobile proteins. Conversely, R_{1_slow} curves are similar for all mineral components. Quadrupolar peaks 314 315 are also present assessing the presence of more mobile proteins. $R_{1 \text{ fast}}$ represent 70% of the signal 316 relaxation and $R_{1 \text{ slow}}$ the remaining 30% which is close to the proportions respectively of water ¹H and of lipoproteins ¹H contained in the tempera binder. Consequently, $R_{1 \text{ fast}}$ can be attributed to the 317 318 relaxation rates of water ¹H in the vicinity of proteins and $R_{1 \text{ slow}}$ to the lipoproteins ¹H.

To go further in the understanding of the interactions between the solvent and the pigment, NMRD profiles of aqueous dispersions of the mineral components have been recorded without egg yolk (Figure S5). Similarly to Fanost et al. (2022), magnetization curves have mono-exponential dependence. The shape of the NMRD profiles of aqueous dispersions is very similar to the $R_{1_{inter}}$ curves (corresponding to interactions with water ¹H) in tempera dispersions. This is a strong confirmation that $R_{1_{inter}}$ corresponds to water in the vicinity of mineral in the tempera paint. Again, the 325 different suspensions display significantly different NMRD profiles that seem to be mineral-specific, as 326 reported by Fanost et al. (2021) in the case of green earth pigments. The curve corresponding to 327 goethite is the one that exhibits the highest R_1 values over the whole frequency range. This is linked to 328 the presence in this sample of high amounts of paramagnetic species, mainly Fe(III). The more Fe(III) 329 is present in a mineral, the higher its R₁ value (Helm, 2006). Furthermore, in the case of goethite, the 330 magnetic moment of Fe(III) are aligned yielding to a super magnetic moment with a strong magnetic 331 anisotropy (magnetic moment blocked on the structural axis of the particle) (Mørup et al., 1983; 332 Dekkers, 1989; Bocquet et al., 1992). The NMRD profile of goethite (Figure 8 and Figure S5) is 333 characteristic of such magnetic particles. Curves corresponding to clay minerals, i.e. kaolinite and 334 montmorillonite display a significantly different shape with a smooth and steady decreases of R_1 with 335 frequency. Furthermore, the profile corresponding to montmorillonite is located at higher R_1 values 336 than that of kaolinite. Such a difference can be assigned to the difference in surface area between 337 those two phyllosilicates. Indeed, R_1 is sensitive to the amount of surface accessible to water (the 338 higher the surface, the higher R_1).

339 In multicomponent systems, the NMRD profiles of a suspension formed with a mixture of minerals is 340 equal to the sum of the NMRD profiles of each component weighted by its proportion in the mixture (Fanost et al., 2021). This is indeed the case for the profile of the reconstituted Sienna up to 3 MHz. 341 342 Comparing the latter with that of natural Sienna, both profiles are almost superimposed at low 343 frequencies. This is even more evident considering the NMRD profiles in tempera binder (Figure 8). 344 However, for frequencies higher than 3 MHz, a marked difference in shape can be observed. Indeed, 345 the R_1 curve corresponding to natural Sienna exhibit a slighter decrease of R_1 at high frequency than reconstituted Sienna which shows a goethite-like shape. Such a difference could be assigned to a 346 347 non-accessibility of water to goethite in the natural sample but, in view of the morphological features 348 described above, this appears rather unlikely. Another explanation could be found in the crystal-349 chemistry of goethite revealed by X-ray diffraction, most of which being Al-substituted. Such crystal 350 chemistry significantly decreases the amount of structural paramagnetic atoms, which could explain 351 the observed difference in profile shapes (Figure 8 and Figure S5). In any case, this shows that 352 defining proper model systems able to reproduce natural samples requires a thorough mineralogical, 353 crystal-chemical, and morphological characterization of the natural samples as subtle variations in 354 crystal chemistry or texture may have a significant impact on some properties.



Figure 8: Relaxation rates (R₁) for tempera paints. Left: R_{1_fast} and right: R_{1_slow}, obtained from biexponential fit of the
 magnetization decays.

358 Formulation of tempera paints: effect of the mineral on rheological properties of

359 paints

Rheological properties give insights into the consistency and texture of paints from low solicitation to high deformation, corresponding to the flow under the painter's brush. Tempera paints prepared with natural Sienna are stable in time as no significant sedimentation is observed during the time of use, which may be due to swelling clays present in natural Sienna, such as montmorillonite.

364 Figure 9a displays the flow curves of tempera prepared with kaolinite and goethite, and those of both 365 natural and reconstituted Siennas. The flow curve of pure egg yolk is also plotted as a reference. Egg 366 yolk exhibits a low viscosity (\approx 1 Pa s) and a moderate shear thinning in agreement with previous 367 studies (Fanost, 2019). Kaolinite and goethite-based tempera formulae both display a much more 368 pronounced shear thinning behavior. For the same mass fraction, and despite a lower volume fraction, 369 goethite suspension exhibits a viscosity much higher than that of the kaolinite suspension. This 370 difference may be due to the differences in size and shape between both samples (Mueller et al., 371 2010; Puisto et al., 2012), goethite being smaller and more anisotropic (Figure 5 and Figure 6). 372 Tempera paints based on both natural and reconstituted Siennas exhibit a flow behavior intermediate 373 between those of their two main components, i.e. kaolinite and goethite. Furthermore, the viscosity of 374 the natural sample is slightly higher than that of its reconstituted counterpart, which can be due to the 375 higher specific surface area of natural Sienna that possibly allows for more interactions between the 376 pigment and the binder. It is worth pointing out the fact that shear thinning is a required property for 377 industrial paints, and can therefore be a feature of interest for artists. Indeed, for low shear rates, a 378 high viscosity is needed to prevent settling and dripping after application, while for shear rates between 100 and 1000 s⁻¹, corresponding to the shear rates exerted by a painter's brush, the viscosity 379 380 should be low enough to allow easy flow and spreading (Larson et al., 2022). Dynamic oscillatory 381 measurements confirm a different behavior between pure binder and paint formulations (Figure 9b and 382 10c). The strain sweep measurements of pure egg yolk (Figure 9b) reveal a liquid-like behavior 383 whatever the applied strain with a viscous modulus (G") higher than the elastic one (G'). Conversely, 384 at low strain (from 0.1 to 1%), tempera paints prepared with both natural and reconstituted Siennas 385 display viscoelastic properties with G' values significantly higher than G". The Linear Visco-Elastic Region (LVER) extends up to strains of 1%. G' and G'' intersect at the critical strain (for $\gamma \approx 20\%$), 386 387 which is a characteristic behavior of suspension pastes and a feature common to numerous paint formulations (Salvant Plisson et al., 2014). In agreement with flow measurements, for the same volume fraction, the elastic and viscous moduli of formulae based on natural Sienna are slightly higher than those of the reconstituted sample.

Frequency sweep measurements (Figure 9c) were carried out in the LVER for an applied stress of 0.1 Pa, i.e. a strain of $\gamma \approx 0.1\%$. Whereas both G' and G" increase with frequency for pure egg yolk, the curves corresponding to natural and reconstituted Sienna samples exhibit constant G' and G" values independent of the applied frequency, which tends to a gel-like behavior. All these experiments suggest that the main rheological features of tempera based on natural Sienna are well captured by using a model system, despite the imperfection of the present one.





Figure 9: Rheological measurements of egg yolk and tempera paints with natural Sienna and reconstituted Sienna. For
comparison with pure minerals, flow measurements of paint preparations with goethite and kaolinite are plotted. Flow
measurements (a), strain sweep (b) and frequency sweep (c). G' in full circles and G" in empty circles. Error bars for 2
measurements of the same paint.

404 CONCLUSION

405 This paper proposes a detailed investigation of egg-tempera paint based on Sienna earth, a very 406 common pigment of complex composition, focusing first on the pigment composition, then probing its 407 physico-chemical properties in interaction with the binder. Different systems were monitored, 408 considering either historical reconstructions (natural Sienna earth and egg yolk), simplified model 409 systems (with lecithin and a synthetic Sienna earth) or even the pure components of the pigment. 410 Interactions between lecithin and Sienna or its main constituents were studied. The high amount of the 411 surfactant adsorbed on Sienna compared to kaolinite and goethite highlighted probably the synergy 412 between all minerals constituting natural Sienna. Relaxation rates measured on the different minerals in water pointed out that Sienna is a complex microstructure that cannot result from a simple physical 413 414 mix of pure minerals, even though the rheological properties might suggest the opposite. Due to the 415 complexity of modelling the behavior of tempera paint, the relevance of the models proposed depends 416 on the scale of the properties studied: for macroscopic properties, it seems that reconstituted Sienna fits well with the natural one while at the mesoscopic scale, systems should be chosen carefully. All in 417 418 all, the composition of the pigment is of great importance while mixing with the binder, allowing the 419 artist to give the desired texture to its paint based on rheological properties.

- 420
- 421
- 422
- 423

424 Bibliography

- Anoardo, E., Galli, G., Ferrante, G., 2001. Fast-field-cycling NMR: Applications and instrumentation.
 Appl. Magn. Reson. 20, 365–404. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF03162287
- 427 Anton, M., 2013. Egg yolk: structures, functionalities and processes: Egg yolk: structures,
- 428 functionalities and processes. J. Sci. Food Agric. 93, 2871–2880.
- 429 https://doi.org/10.1002/jsfa.6247
- Anton, M., 2007. Composition and Structure of Hen Egg Yolk, in: Huopalahti, R., López-Fandiño, R.,
 Anton, M., Schade, R. (Eds) Bioactive Egg Compounds. Berlin, pp. 1–6.
- Bikiaris, D., Daniilia, S., Sotiropoulou, S., Katsimbiri, O., Pavlidou, E., Moutsatsou, A.P., Chryssoulakis,
 Y., 2000. Ochre-differentiation through micro-Raman and micro-FTIR spectroscopies:
 application on wall paintings at Meteora and Mount Athos, Greece. Spectrochim. Acta. A.
 Mol. Biomol. Spectrosc. 56, 3–18. https://doi.org/10.1016/S1386-1425(99)00134-1
- Bocquet, S., Pollard, R.J., Cashion, J.D., 1992. Dynamic magnetic phenomena in fine-particle goethite.
 Phys. Rev. B 46, 11657–11664. https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevB.46.11657

438 Brouillette, C.G., Segrest, J.P., Ng, T.C., Jones, J.L., 1982. Minimal size phosphatidylcholine vesicles: 439 effects of radius of curvature on head group packing and conformation. Biochemistry 21, 440 4569-4575. https://doi.org/10.1021/bi00262a009 441 Cennini, C., Broecke, L., 2015. Cennino Cennini's Il libro dell'arte: a new English translation and 442 commentary with Italian transcription. Archetype Publications, London. 443 Chitrakar, R., Tezuka, S., Sonoda, A., Sakane, K., Ooi, K., Hirotsu, T., 2006. Phosphate adsorption on 444 synthetic goethite and akaganeite. J. Colloid Interface Sci. 298, 602–608. 445 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcis.2005.12.054 446 Clarke, M., 2011. Mediaeval painters' materials and techniques: the Montpellier Liber diversarum 447 arcium. Archetype, London. 448 Cooper, C.L., Cosgrove, T., van Duijneveldt, J.S., Murray, M., Prescott, S.W., 2013. The use of solvent 449 relaxation NMR to study colloidal suspensions. Soft Matter 9, 7211. 450 https://doi.org/10.1039/c3sm51067k 451 De L'escalopier, C., 1977. Théophile Prètre et Moine, Essai Sur Divers Arts, Libr. des Arts et métiers-452 Ed. J. Laget. ed. 453 Dekkers, M.J., 1989. Magnetic Properties of Natural Goethite-I. Grain-Size Dependence of Some Low-454 and High-Field Related Rockmagnetic Parameters Measured At Room Temperature. 455 Geophys. J. Int. 97, 323–340. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-246X.1989.tb00504.x 456 Doebelin, N., Kleeberg, R., 2015. Profex: a graphical user interface for the Rietveld refinement 457 program BGMN. J. Appl. Crystallogr. 48, 1573–1580. 458 https://doi.org/10.1107/S1600576715014685 459 Fanost, A., 2019. Formulation et propriétés physico-chimiques de peintures a tempera à base de 460 jaune d'œuf et de terres vertes (Ph.D. dissertation). Sorbonne Université, Paris. 461 Fanost, A., de Viguerie, L., Ducouret, G., Mériguet, G., Walter, P., Glanville, H., Rollet, A.-L., Jaber, M., 462 2022. Connecting Rheological Properties and Molecular Dynamics of Egg-Tempera Paints 463 based on Egg Yolk. Angew. Chem. Int. Ed. 61, e202112108. 464 https://doi.org/10.1002/anie.202112108 465 Fanost, A., Jaber, M., de Viguerie, L., Korb, J.-P., Levitz, P.E., Michot, L.J., Mériguet, G., Rollet, A.-L., 466 2021. Green earth pigments dispersions: Water dynamics at the interfaces. J. Colloid 467 Interface Sci. 581, 644–655. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcis.2020.07.085 468 Fanost, A., Jaber, M., de Viguerie, L., Korb, J.-P., Levitz, P.E., Michot, L.J., Mériguet, G., Rollet, A.-L., 469 2020. Green Earth pigments aqueous dispersions: NMR relaxation rates dataset. Data Brief 470 32, 106270. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.dib.2020.106270 471 Genestar, C., Pons, C., 2005. Earth pigments in painting: characterisation and differentiation by 472 means of FTIR spectroscopy and SEM-EDS microanalysis. Anal. Bioanal. Chem. 382, 269–274. 473 https://doi.org/10.1007/s00216-005-3085-8 474 Genestar Juliá, C., Pons Bonafé, C., 2004. The use of natural earths in picture: study and 475 differentiation by thermal analysis. Thermochim. Acta 413, 185–192. 476 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tca.2003.10.016 477 Grygar, T., Hradilová, J., Hradil, D., Bezdička, P., Bakardjieva, S., 2003. Analysis of earthy pigments in 478 grounds of Baroque paintings. Anal. Bioanal. Chem. 375, 1154–1160. 479 https://doi.org/10.1007/s00216-002-1708-x 480 Helm, L., 2006. Relaxivity in paramagnetic systems: Theory and mechanisms. Prog. Nucl. Magn. 481 Reson. Spectrosc. 49, 45–64. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pnmrs.2006.03.003 Helwig, K., 1998. The characterisation of iron earth pigments using infrared spectroscopy. IRUG² VA 482 483 Postprints 83-92. Hradil, D., Grygar, T., Hradilová, J., Bezdička, P., 2003. Clay and iron oxide pigments in the history of 484 485 painting. Appl. Clay Sci. 22, 223–236. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0169-1317(03)00076-0 486 Israelachvili, J.N., 2011. Intermolecular and surface forces, 3rd ed. ed. Academic press, Burlington 487 (Mass.). 488 Kimmich, R., 1997. NMR. Springer Berlin Heidelberg, Berlin, Heidelberg. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-489 3-642-60582-6

490 Kimmich, R., 1977. Nuclear Magnetic Relaxation in the Presence of Quadrupole Nuclei. Z. Für 491 Naturforschung A 32, 544–554. https://doi.org/10.1515/zna-1977-0604 492 Korb, J.-P., 2018. Multiscale nuclear magnetic relaxation dispersion of complex liquids in bulk and 493 confinement. Prog. Nucl. Magn. Reson. Spectrosc. 104, 12–55. 494 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pnmrs.2017.11.001 495 Larson, R.G., Van Dyk, A.K., Chatterjee, T., Ginzburg, V.V., 2022. Associative thickeners for 496 waterborne paints: Structure, characterization, rheology, and modeling. Prog. Polym. Sci. 497 129, 101546. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.progpolymsci.2022.101546 498 Laurie, A.P. (Arthur P., 1926. The painter's methods & materials : the handling of pigments in oil, 499 tempera, water-colour & in mural painting, the preparation of grounds & canvas, & the 500 prevention of discolouration, together with the theories of light & colour applied to the 501 making of pictures. London : Seeley, Service & Co. Ltd. 502 Li, Q., Berraud-Pache, R., Yang, Y., Souprayen, C., Jaber, M., 2023. Biocomposites based on bentonite 503 and lecithin: An experimental approach supported by molecular dynamics. Appl. Clay Sci. 504 231, 106751. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clay.2022.106751 505 Luengo, C., Brigante, M., Antelo, J., Avena, M., 2006. Kinetics of phosphate adsorption on goethite: 506 Comparing batch adsorption and ATR-IR measurements. J. Colloid Interface Sci. 300, 511-507 518. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcis.2006.04.015 508 Manasse, A., Mellini, M., 2006. Iron (hydr)oxide nanocrystals in raw and burnt sienna pigments. Eur. 509 J. Mineral. 18, 845-853. https://doi.org/10.1127/0935-1221/2006/0018-0845 510 Manea, M.M., Moise, I.V., Virgolici, M., Negut, C.D., Barbu, O.-H., Cutrubinis, M., Fugaru, V., 511 Stanculescu, I.R., Ponta, C.C., 2012. Spectroscopic evaluation of painted layer structural 512 changes induced by gamma radiation in experimental models. Radiat. Phys. Chem. 81, 160-513 167. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.radphyschem.2011.09.015 514 Mayer, R., Sheehan, S., 1991. The artist's handbook of materials and techniques, 5th ed., 515 rev.updated. ed. Viking, New York, N.Y., U.S.A. Mazzeo, R., Prati, S., Quaranta, M., Joseph, E., Kendix, E., Galeotti, M., 2008. Attenuated total 516 517 reflection micro FTIR characterisation of pigment-binder interaction in reconstructed paint 518 films. Anal. Bioanal. Chem. 392, 65–76. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00216-008-2126-5 519 Meilunas, R.J., Bentsen, J.G., Steinb, A., 1990. Analysis of Aged Paint Binders by FTIR Spectroscopy 20. 520 Merrifield, M.P. (Ed.), 1999. Medieval and Renaissance treatises on the arts of painting: original texts 521 with English translations. Dover Publications, Mineola, N.Y. 522 Mørup, S., Bo Madsen, M., Franck, J., Villadsen, J., Koch, C.J.W., 1983. A new interpretation of Mössbauer spectra of microcrystalline goethite: "Super-ferromagnetism" or "super-spin-523 524 glass" behaviour? J. Magn. Magn. Mater. 40, 163–174. https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-525 8853(83)90024-0 526 Mueller, S., Llewellin, E.W., Mader, H.M., 2010. The rheology of suspensions of solid particles. Proc. 527 R. Soc. Math. Phys. Eng. Sci. 466, 1201–1228. https://doi.org/10.1098/rspa.2009.0445 Navas, N., Romero-Pastor, J., Manzano, E., Cardell, C., 2010. Raman spectroscopic discrimination of 528 529 pigments and tempera paint model samples by principal component analysis on first-530 derivative spectra. J. Raman Spectrosc. 41, 1486–1493. https://doi.org/10.1002/jrs.2646 531 Phenix, A., 1997. The composition and chemistry of eggs and egg tempera, in: Early Italian Paintings : 532 Techniques and Analysis. Maastricht, pp. 11–20. 533 Puisto, A., Illa, X., Mohtaschemi, M., Alava, M.J., 2012. Modeling the viscosity and aggregation of 534 suspensions of highly anisotropic nanoparticles. Eur. Phys. J. E 35, 6. 535 https://doi.org/10.1140/epje/i2012-12006-1 536 Romero-Pastor, J., Cardell, C., Manzano, E., Yebra-Rodríguez, Á., Navas, N., 2011. Assessment of 537 Raman microscopy coupled with principal component analysis to examine egg yolk-pigment 538 interaction based on the protein C-H stretching region (3100-2800 cm⁻¹): Multivariate 539 Raman study of egg yolk-pigment interaction. J. Raman Spectrosc. 42, 2137–2142. 540 https://doi.org/10.1002/jrs.2977

- Salvant Plisson, J., de Viguerie, L., Tahroucht, L., Menu, M., Ducouret, G., 2014. Rheology of white
 paints: How Van Gogh achieved his famous impasto. Colloids Surf. Physicochem. Eng. Asp.
 458, 134–141. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.colsurfa.2014.02.055
- Schulze, D.G., 1984. The Influence of Aluminum on Iron Oxides. VIII. Unit-Cell Dimensions of Al Substituted Goethites and Estimation of Al From Them. Clays Clay Miner. 32, 36–44.
 https://doi.org/10.1346/CCMN.1984.0320105
- Schwertmann, U., Carlson, L., 1994. Aluminum Influence on Iron Oxides: XVII. Unit-Cell Parameters
 and Aluminum Substitution of Natural Goethites. Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J. 58, 256–261.
 https://doi.org/10.2136/sssaj1994.03615995005800010039x
- Schwertmann, U., Cornell, R.M. (Eds.), 2000. Iron Oxides in the Laboratory: Preparation and
 Characterization. Wiley-VCH Verlag GmbH, Weinheim, Germany.
- https://doi.org/10.1002/9783527613229
 Thompson, D.V., York, L.E., 1962. The practice of tempera painting: materials and methods,
 unabridged republication of the work originally published in 1936. ed, Dover books on art
 instruction, anatomy. Dover, New York.
- instruction, anatomy. Dover, New York.
 Torrent, J., 1992. Fast and Slow Phosphate Sorption by Goethite-Rich Natural Materials. Clays Clay
 Miner. 40, 14–21. https://doi.org/10.1346/CCMN.1992.0400103
- Xiao, N., Zhao, Y., Yao, Y., Wu, N., Xu, M., Du, H., Tu, Y., 2020. Biological Activities of Egg Yolk Lipids: A
 Review. J. Agric. Food Chem. 68, 1948–1957. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.jafc.9b06616
- Yuan, L., Chen, L., Chen, X., Liu, R., Ge, G., 2017. *In Situ* Measurement of Surface Functional Groups
 on Silica Nanoparticles Using Solvent Relaxation Nuclear Magnetic Resonance. Langmuir 33,
 8724–8729. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.langmuir.7b00923
- Zhong, B., Stanforth, R., Wu, S., Chen, J.P., 2007. Proton interaction in phosphate adsorption onto
 goethite. J. Colloid Interface Sci. 308, 40–48. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcis.2006.12.055