

Rhizobium leguminosarum symbiovar viciae strains are natural wheat endophytes that can stimulate root development

Claudia Bartoli, Stéphane Boivin, Marta Marchetti, Carine Gris, Virginie Gasciolli, Mégane Gaston, Marie-Christine Auriac, Frédéric Debellé, Ludovic Cottret, Aurélien Carlier, et al.

▶ To cite this version:

Claudia Bartoli, Stéphane Boivin, Marta Marchetti, Carine Gris, Virginie Gasciolli, et al.. Rhizobium leguminosarum symbiovar viciae strains are natural wheat endophytes that can stimulate root development. Environmental Microbiology, 2022, 24 (11), pp.5509-5523. 10.1111/1462-2920.16148 . hal-04204399v1

HAL Id: hal-04204399 https://hal.science/hal-04204399v1

Submitted on 12 Sep 2023 (v1), last revised 22 Aug 2024 (v2)

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution - NonCommercial - NoDerivatives 4.0 International License

1 Article type: Regular Manuscript

Rhizobium leguminosarum symbiovar *viciae* strains are natural wheat endophytes and can stimulate root development and colonization by arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi

- 4 Claudia Bartoli^{1,2*}, Stéphane Boivin^{3*}, Marta Marchetti², Carine Gris², Virginie Gasciolli²,
- 5 Mégane Gaston², Marie-Christine Auriac^{2,4}, Ludovic Cottret², Aurélien Carlier², Catherine
- 6 Masson-Boivin², Marc Lepetit³ and Benoit Lefebvre²
- 7
- ¹ IGEPP, INRAE, Institut Agro, Univ Rennes, 35653, Le Rheu, France
- 9 ² LIPM, Université de Toulouse, INRAE, CNRS, 31326 Castanet-Tolosan, France
- ³ Laboratoire des Symbioses Tropicales et Méditerranéennes (LSTM) INRAE, IRD, CIRAD,
- 11 University of Montpellier, Montpellier SupAgro 34398, Montpellier cedex 5, France
- ⁴ FRAIB-TRI Imaging Platform Facilities, Université de Toulouse, CNRS, 24 chemin de
- 13 Borderouge, 31320 Castanet-Tolosan, France
- 14

15 *These authors contributed equally to the work

- 16 Author for correspondence:
- 17 Benoit Lefebvre
- 18 Tel: +33 5 61 28 53 22
- 19 Email: benoit.lefebvre@inrae.fr
- 20
- 21 Total word count for:
- 22 -Summary: 194
- -Main body of the text: 6,131
- -Introduction: 732
- 25 -Materials and Methods: 1,788
- 26 -Results: 1,994
- 27 -Discussion: 1,611
- 28 -Acknowledgements: 121
- 29 -Author Contributions: 56
- 30 -Figures: 8

bioRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.08.07.241844; this version posted August 7, 2020. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

- 31 -Tables: 4
- 32 -Supporting Figures: 8
- 33 -Supporting Tables: 16
- 34 -Supporting Methods: 1

36 Summary

- Although rhizobia establishing a nitrogen-fixing symbiosis with legumes are also known
 to promote growth in non-legumes, studies on rhizobia association with wheat roots are
 scarce.
- We searched for *Rhizobium leguminosarum* symbiovar *viciae* (*Rlv*) strains naturally
 competent for wheat roots colonization. We isolated 20 strains and tested the ability of a
 subset for wheat roots colonization when co-inoculated with other *Rlv*. We also measured
 the effect of these strains on wheat root architecture and Arbuscular Mycorrhizal Fungal
 (AMF) colonization.
- We found a low diversity of *Rlv* in wheat roots compared to that observed in the *Rlv*species complex. Only a few strains, including those isolated from wheat roots, and one
 strain isolated from pea nodules, were efficient to colonize wheat roots in co-inoculation
 conditions. These strains had a high ability for endophytic colonization of wheat root and
 were able to stimulate root development and AMF colonization in single strain inoculation
 conditions.
- These results suggest that wheat is an alternative host for some Rlv; nevertheless, there is a strong competition between Rlv strains for wheat root colonization. Furthermore, our study suggests that the level of endophytic colonization is critical for Rlv ability to promote wheat growth.

Key words: *Triticum aestivum* and *Triticum turgidum* (wheat), *Rhizobium leguminosarum*symbiovar *viciae* (*Rlv*), Endophyte, Root development, Arbuscular Mycorrhiza (AM),
Competitiveness, Cooperation, Plant Growth-Promoting Rhizobacteria (PGPR).

59 Introduction

60 Plant roots interact with microorganisms that play key roles in their development, 61 nutrition and protection against pathogens (Ortíz-Castro et al., 2009). Under the influence of 62 root exudates, microbes multiply in the rhizosphere, i.e. the soil portion in proximity to the 63 roots (Haichar et al., 2014: Baetz & Martinoia, 2014; Hu et al., 2018; Huang et al., 2019). 64 Microorganisms inhabiting the rhizosphere are known to play important roles in plant 65 nutrition through various properties such as biological nitrogen fixation, phosphate 66 solubilization or siderophore secretion (de Souza et al., 2015). Among the extremely abundant 67 diversity of soil/rhizospheric microorganisms, only a small fraction is able to colonize the 68 inner part of the plant root system. Several of these endophytic microbes have been shown to 69 offer important benefits to their hosts displaying Plant Growth-Promoting (PGP) activities or 70 protection against pathogens (Santoyo et al., 2016). Mechanisms including: i) facilitation in 71 acquiring nutriments, ii) interference with plant hormone (auxin, cytokinin or ethylene) 72 homeostasis, iii) pathogen control via antibiosis (Santoyo et al., 2016; Carrión et al., 2019) 73 have been related to these beneficial activities.

74 Among the endophytic microorganisms, some, such as the Arbuscular Mycorrhizal 75 Fungi (AMF) interacting with most of plant species, have the ability to massively colonize 76 plant roots (Bonfante & Genre, 2010). This colonization relies on AMF recognition by plants 77 that is, at least in part, mediated by the perception of fungal LipoChitoOligosaccharide (LCO) 78 signals (Girardin et al., 2019). Non-legume LCO receptors are poorly specific for LCO 79 structural variations (Buendia et al., 2019a; Girardin et al., 2019). Consistently, Arbuscular 80 Mycorrhiza (AM) display poor host-specificity as almost all AMF species are able to colonize 81 most of the terrestrial plants. The LCO perception machinery and the downstream signaling 82 pathway have been recruited in legumes to allow recognition of nitrogen fixing bacteria called 83 rhizobia that are accommodated in root organs called nodules (Girardin et al., 2019). Rhizobia 84 also produce LCOs called Nod factors that are recognized by legume hosts (Gough & 85 Cullimore, 2011). Rhizobia are polyphyletic and belong to various bacterial genera. Indeed, 86 the Nod factor synthesis genes (nod genes) are frequently located on a plasmid (the symbiotic 87 plasmid), which can be horizontally transferred within or across rhizobia species (Boivin et 88 al., 2020a). In contrast with the AM, the rhizobium-legume symbiosis is generally host-89 specific and symbiovars designate bacteria able to nodulate the same host(s). For example, 90 pea, faba bean, vetch and lentil plants are nodulated by Rhizobium leguminosarum bacteria of 91 the symbiovar (sv) viciae (Rlv), while clover is nodulated by Rhizobium leguminosarum sv.

92 trifolii. Other legumes such as alfalfa and soybean are nodulated by rhizobia from other 93 genera, Ensifer (formerly called Sinorhizobium) and Bradyrhizobium respectively. Nod factor 94 structural variations are associated to this host-specificity (Gough & Cullimore, 2011). In 95 addition, in natural soils, multiple rhizobia of the same symbiovar coexist but display 96 contrasted Competitiveness to Form Nodules (CFN) depending on their host genotype 97 (Boivin et al, 2020a; Boivin et al., 2020b). Together with the host-specificity associated with 98 Nod factor specificity, CFN contribute to determine partner choices during the rhizobium-99 legume symbiosis.

100 Several studies have shown that rhizobia can also interact with non-legumes. *Rlv* were 101 previously isolated from soils under wheat monoculture (Depret et al., 2004) suggesting that 102 *Rlv* can be maintained in absence of rotation with compatible legumes. Rhizobia belonging to 103 various genera were isolated and/or shown to have PGP activities in rice (Biswas et al., 2000; 104 Chaintreuil et al., 2000; Peng et al., 2002; Yanni & Dazzo, 2010). R. leguminosarum sv. 105 trifolii (isolated from legumes, rice or wheat) were also shown to colonize and have PGP 106 activities on wheat (Höflich et al., 1995; Webster et al., 1997; Hilali et al., 2001; Yanni et al., 107 2016). Although mechanisms involved in AM and rhizobial symbiosis establishment share 108 similarities, there is little information on the rhizobia-AMF interaction, particularly in wheat. 109 Nevertheless, recently Raklami and coworkers showed that rhizobia inoculation in open fields increase wheat colonization by AMF and yield (Raklami et al., 2019). 110

Here we performed a functional ecology study on the wheat-Rlv interaction. We investigated whether: i) wheat is a natural host for Rlv strains, by isolating bacteria from wheat grown in open fields in the southwest of France ii) there is partner choice in the wheat-Rlv interaction, by co-inoculating strains representative of the known Rlv diversity iii) there is diversity in Rlv for colonization and stimulation of responses in wheat roots, by measuring Rlvepiphytic/endophytic colonization, root development and AMF colonization.

118 Material and Methods

119 Wheat sampling from open fields

120 Wheat plants (Triticum aestivum ssp. aestivum and Triticum turgidum ssp. turgidum) were 121 collected in the CREABio experimental station de la Hourre in Auch (southwest of France; (43°37'17.7"N 0°34'20.6"E) in February 2014. Plants were collected in 2 experimental field 122 123 plots: LH1 under rotation with pea (Pisum sativum) and fertilized with 80 kg/ha of organic 124 fertilizer and LH7 under rotation with soybean (Glycine max) and fertilized with 100 kg/ha of 125 organic fertilizer. Both plots were characterized by a limestone clay soil with a pH of 8.1 and 126 8.4 for LH7 and LH1 respectively. Specific soil composition for the field plots are reported in 127 Fig. S1. Sixteen wheat varieties, 8 from LH1 and 8 from the LH7, were collected (Table S1). 128 Six plants per variety were sampled and transported in sterilized plastic bags.

129 Strain isolation and characterization

130 To isolate *Rhizobium leguminosarum* symbiovar (sv) viciae (Rlv) strains, 2 methods were 131 employed: nodule-trapping method and direct root plating. Prior to bacterial isolation, wheat 132 roots of each variety were pooled and surface-sterilized. Roots were first rinsed in sterile 133 water to remove soil, and incubated 10 min in a 1.2 % sodium hypochlorite solution, 10 min 134 in a spiramycine 30 mg/ml solution and 1 min in 70% ethanol, followed by 3 rinses in sterile 135 water. Surface-sterilized roots were mixed in 5 ml of phi liquid medium (10 g/L bacto 136 peptone, 1 g/L Casimino acids and 1 g/L yeast extract) and root mixtures were stored in 50% 137 of glycerol at -80°C prior to bacterial isolation. For the nodule-trapping experiment pea 138 (Pisum sativum) and vetch (Vicia sativa) plantlets were used as specific hosts. Seeds were 139 sterilized and germinated as described in Methods S1. Seedlings were grown in 110 ml glass tubes containing Farhäeus agar medium (Catoira et al., 2000). After 10 days, plantlets were 140 141 inoculated with wheat root homogenates and incubated for 4 weeks at 22°C. For each of the 142 16 wheat root homogenates, 3 plants of each legume host were inoculated. After 4 weeks, 143 plants were scored for the presence/absence of nodules (Table S1). Each nodule was collected 144 with a scalpel, homogenized and stored in 50% glycerol at -80°C prior to bacterial isolation. 145 Serial dilutions of nodule homogenates were spread on TY agar medium (16 g/L peptone, 10 146 g/L yeast extract and 5 g/L NaCl) supplemented with 2 mM CaCl₂. For direct isolation of 147 culturable bacteria, root homogenates were diluted and spread on TY agar medium supplemented with 2 mM CaCl₂. All purified colonies were first stored in 30% of glycerol/TY 148 149 medium at -80°C. Bacteria isolated from nodules or by direct plating were tested for presence

150 of the *nodD* gene. We used the Y5 and Y6 primer set developed by Zeze *et al.*, (2001) 151 amplifying a 850bp nodD fragment from Rlv, Rhizobium leguminosarum sv. trifolii and 152 *Ensifer meliloti*. Strains showing an amplification were then used for gyrB amplification by 153 using primers and protocols already described (Martens et al., 2008). Sequences (Table S2) 154 were trimmed and aligned with DAMBE version 6 (Xia, 2017) and neighbor-joining 155 phylogeny in comparison with other *Rhizobium* species (sequences retrieved from GenBank 156 https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/genbank/; Table S3), was inferred with MEGA 5 (Tamura et 157 al., 2011) with p-distance model. Three strains isolated from wheat roots, FWPou15, 158 FWPou32 and FW Pou38 were selected for further analysis and their genomes were 159 sequenced and analyzed as described in Methods S2. Genomes are available in GenBank 160 under the accession numbers JACBGR00000000, JACBGQ000000000 and JACBGP000000000, respectively. Phenotypic assays were performed on the 3 strains in 161 162 comparison with the A34 strain used as control (Götz et al., 1985; Oono & Denison, 2010).

163 Metabolic pathways and comparative genomics analyses

164 A metabolic reconstruction in SBML format (Hucka et al., 2003) was built for each strain 165 with the Carveme software (Machado et al., 2018), a binary matrix containing the 166 presence/absence information for each metabolic reaction in each strain was created from 167 SBML files using ad-hoc Java programs. A correspondence analysis was performed with the dudi.coa method of the R ade4 package (Dray et al., 2015). The correspondence analysis 168 169 result was then plotted using the scatterD3 R package. Tryptophan metabolism was analyzed 170 with the kbase platform (Artkin et al., 2018) and by using the RAST annotation pipeline (Brettin et al., 2015) and the Model Seed metabolic reconstruction pipeline (Henry et al., 171 172 2010). Orthology search was performed with OrthoFinder with default settings (Emms & Kelly, 2019). Functional category assignments and annotations of orthologous groups were 173 174 done by selecting a representative of each group and annotating with eggNOG-Mapper 175 (Huerta-Cepas et al., 2017).

176 Nodulation tests

Three selected strains FWPou15, FWPou32 and FWPou38 and the A34 strain were tested for their ability to nodulate pea, faba bean, vetch and clover plants. For pea and vetch plants, germ-free seedlings (Methods S1) were placed into 110 ml glass tubes filled with attapulgite and watered with 10 mL Farhäeus liquid medium supplemented with 1 mM NH₄NO₃, and an aluminum foil was placed around the bottom of the tube. Seedlings were incubated for one

week before inoculation with 2 ml of 10^8 /ml bacterial suspension of each strain (12 plant 182 183 replicates / plant species). For faba bean and clover plants, germ-free seedlings were 184 transferred in containers (250 ml of volume) filled with a mix of 50% perlite/50% sand and humidified with 300 ml of sterilized water. Seedlings were inoculated by adding 150 ml of 185 10^{7} /ml bacterial suspension and cultivated in a growth chamber (20° C and 16h/8h light/dark 186 187 period). Nodules were counted 6 weeks after inoculation. Microscopy analysis was performed 188 on 3 randomly selected nodules for each nodulated plant species (Methods S3) to confirm that 189 nodules were colonized by bacterial cells.

190 Wheat root colonization in co-inoculation assays

191 Seven-day old germ-free wheat seedlings (Methods S1) of the Energo variety, individually 192 grown in 110 ml glass tubes filled with 70 ml of Fahraeus agar medium (Fig. S2; Methods S4) 193 were inoculated with FWPou15 strain alone or with bacterial mixtures containing either the 194 FWPou15, FWPou32 or FWPou38 strains plus 22 strains of the Rlv core collection representing the known genomic Rlv diversity (Table S3; Boivin et al., 2020b). Each strain 195 196 present in the mixture was characterized by a unique 309 bp sequence of the *nodD* coding 197 region and were therefore easily unambiguously identified by DNA metabarcoding. Each 198 modality consisted in an inoculation of 6 plants; 3 independent replicates (3 temporal blocks) 199 were performed. In total 18 plants were inoculated with each bacterial mixtures. Each wheat 200 plantlet was co-inoculated with 2 ml of each mixture containing all bacterial strains at the final $OD_{600nm} = 0.01$ (see Table S4 for initial OD_{600nm} of each strain) and incubated in a growth 201 202 chamber at 20°C and a light/dark period of 16h/8h. Roots were collected after 7 days. Half of 203 the roots were surface-sterilized using the following successive treatments: 1 min in pure 204 ethanol, sterilized water, 3 min in 1.2% sodium hypochlorite solution, 3 times in sterilized 205 water, 1 min in pure ethanol and 3 times in sterilized water. The other half was directly 206 analyzed without surface sterilization. For each temporal block, the plant roots of each 207 modality were pooled prior to DNA extraction with the DNeasy Plant Mini Kit following the 208 manufacturer's instructions (Table S4). To characterize the relative abundance of the Rlv 209 bacteria in the wheat roots, the 309 bp sequence of the *nodD* coding region was amplified by 210 PCR from the DNA extractions and the PCR products were sequenced by Illumina MiSeq 211 2x250 bp technology as described in Methods S5. Abundance of each strain was estimated by 212 the number of reads corresponding to its unique *nodD* sequence (Methods S5, Table S5). 213 Hierarchical clustering and heatmaps were built using the pheatmap R package (clustering 214 "maximum", method "wardD").

215 Wheat root colonization in single strain inoculation assays

216 To test the colonization level in single-inoculation conditions, experiments were performed as 217 described for co-inoculation assays except that plantlets were inoculated with 2 ml of each 218 bacterial suspension ($OD_{600nm} = 0.08$). The number of independent replicates (temporal 219 blocks) and the total number of plants analyzed for each strain and conditions are reported in 220 Table S6. Roots were excised 7 dpi and weighed (fresh weight). Bacterial isolation from roots 221 was performed by chopping the entire root system using a scalpel and by dilution plating on 222 TY plates with the addition of 2 mM CaCl₂. To estimate the endophytic growth wheat roots were surface-sterilized as described for the co-inoculation assay. Plates were incubated 3 days 223 224 at 24°C before colony counting. The number of Colony-Forming Units (cfu) was normalized

by the root fresh weight.

226 Wheat root colonization by the FWPou15 GFP-expressing strain

227 Construction of the GFP expressing strain is described in Methods S6 and microscopy228 analysis is detailed in Methods S3.

229 Wheat root development assays

230 Three-days old germ-free wheat seedlings (Methods S1) were placed on 20x20 cm plates 231 containing Fahraeus agar medium (Fig. S2, Methods S4). Plantlets were grown 4 days prior to 232 inoculation with 1 ml of bacterial suspension (OD_{600nm}= 0.08) of each strain. Control plants 233 were inoculated with 1 ml of sterilized water. The number of experiments (temporal blocks) and plant replicates are shown in Table S7. Plants were grown at 20°C with a light/dark 234 235 period of 16h/8h. Roots were removed from the plates 12 dpi, washed with water to remove 236 traces of agar, and imaged with an Epson Expression 10000XL scanner. Total root length was 237 estimated by using WINRhizo software (Pouleur S, 1995) and the number of lateral roots was counted manually on the scanned roots. 238

239 Mycorrhiza assays

Three-day old germ-free wheat seedlings (Methods S1) were transferred in 50 ml containers filled with attapulgite supplemented with 20 ml of 1/2 modified Long Ashton liquid medium (containing 7.5 μ M NaH₂PO₄) and 200 *Rhizophagus irregularis* DAOM197198 spores (purchased at Agronutrition, Carbonne, France) were inoculated on each plant. The number of experiments (temporal blocks) and plant replicates are shown in Table S8. After 3 days at 23°C with a 16/8h light/dark regime, 1 ml of each bacterial suspension (OD_{600nm}= 0.08) was inoculated and plants were further grown for 21 days. Roots were then washed and
permeabilized in a 10% KOH solution for 10 min at 95°C and stained with a 5% ink-vinegar
solution for 3 min at 95°C.

249 Statistical analysis

250 All the statistical analyses performed in the manuscript were carried out in the R environment.

251 Scripts used for the analyses and for the construction of the graphs are detailed in Methods

252 S7. Raw data that were used to run the statistical models are available in: i) Table S9 for the

relative abundances of the *Rlv* strains in roots during the co-inoculation assays, ii) Table S10

for the numbers of cfu in the root colonization assays, iii) Table S11 for the total root lengths

and lateral root numbers obtained in the root development assays, iv) Table S12 for the

256 number of colonization sites in the mycorrhiza assays.

258 Results

259 Rhizobium leguminosarum sv. viciae (Rlv) strains are associated with wheat roots

260 In order to determine whether *Rlv* strains naturally interact with wheat, we collected wheat 261 roots from plants under rotation with pea or soybean in open fields located in the southwest of 262 France. We surface-sterilized and macerated them to extract bacterial endophytes. Several 263 wheat varieties belonging to 2 species (Triticum aestivum ssp. aestivum and Triticum 264 turgidum ssp. turgidum, Table S1) were compared. Rlv were isolated from these root samples 265 by two approaches. First, pea and vetch seedlings, which are known legume Rlv hosts, were 266 inoculated with the endophyte bacterial suspensions. The nodules formed were individually 267 collected and bacterial clones occupying these nodule were isolated ("nodule trapping"). 268 Second, surface-sterilized macerates from wheat roots were directly plated. Bacteria collected 269 by both methods were PCR screened by using primers that specifically amplify a fragment of 270 the nodD gene from Rlv, and a few other rhizobial species (Zeze et al., 2001). We succeeded 271 in isolating 20 strains from plants in rotation with pea (Table S1). Phylogenetic analysis based 272 on a portion of the chromosomal gyrB gene demonstrated that these 20 strains cluster in 2 273 closely-related clades of the *R. leguminosarum* species complex (Fig. 1a). The first clade 274 includes the Rlv strains TOM, FRF1D12, Vaf10 and CCBAU83268 belonging to genospecies 275 gsF-1 (Boivin et al., 2020a) and the second clade includes the Rlv strain SL16 belonging to 276 the genospecies gsF-2 (Boivin et al., 2020a). Three strains (FWPou15, FWPou32 and 277 FWPou38) randomly selected from the most predominant clade, were further characterized. 278 Sequencing a large portion of the *nodD* coding region confirmed that they belong to R. 279 *leguminosarum* symbiovar viciae (Fig. S3). Phylogeny of the nodD gene suggested that the 280 symbiotic plasmid of these strains are closely related to that of the reference *Rlv* strain 3841 281 and the control strain A34 (Oono & Denison, 2010). The 3 strains (FWPou15, FWPou32 and 282 FWPou38) were found to nodulate pea, faba bean and common vetch but not clover plants 283 (Fig. 1b-1e, Fig. S4-S5), confirming that they belong to symbiovar viciae.

284 Wheat-associated *Rlv* do not display specific genomic and metabolic signatures

Whole genome sequencing was performed on FWPou15, FWPou32 and FWPou38. Genomes of these strains were compared to genomes of *Rlv* isolated from legumes and representative of the gsB, gsC, gsE and gsF-1/2 genospecies (Boivin *et al.*, 2020a). Sequences of the 3 strains shared a ca. 100% Average Nucleotide Identity (ANI) and few SNPs were detected between the strains. Genomic phylogeny confirmed that the 3 wheat strains cluster with the 290 representatives of genospecies gsF-1 (Fig. 2). Phylogeny on 11 concatenated nod genes 291 located on the symbiotic plasmid, showed that the 3 wheat strains cluster with the Nod group 292 B1 that includes the 3841 and FRF1D12 strains isolated from faba bean and pea respectively 293 (Fig. 3; Boivin et al., 2020a). The genomes of strains FWPou15, FWPou32 and FWPou38 294 encode 301 orthologous genes, which are not shared with other Rlv representatives. A 295 majority of these genes (200/301) were not assigned to a specific Clusters of Orthoulogous 296 Groups (COG) functional category. We could not identify functions with an obvious link to 297 symbiotic or endophytic growth among the remaining genes. We further inferred and 298 compared the metabolic potential of the 3 wheat strains and 22 strains isolated from legume 299 nodules, representing the *Rlv* genetic diversity (Table S3, Boivin *et al.*, 2020b). We found that 300 all the strains shared most of the metabolic reactions (1,967 reactions, >87%; Fig. S6a) and 301 only 13% of the reactions were specific to a subset of strains. Correspondence Analysis (CA) 302 constructed on the presence/absence of the metabolic reactions, showed a hierarchical 303 clustering similar to that observed for the ANI (Fig. S6b; Fig. 2), in which the wheat isolates 304 group with the TOM strain. In conclusion, wheat-isolated *Rlv* do not display specific genomic 305 and metabolic signatures when compared with *Rlv* isolated from legume nodules.

306 *Rlv* strains colonize wheat roots with different degrees of success in co-inoculation assays

307 We then tested whether there is diversity among the Rlv complex species for wheat root 308 colonization ability. For this, we compared the colonization success of wheat isolates with 309 that of strains isolated from legume nodules in a co-inoculation experiment. We inoculated in 310 gnotobiotic conditions, plantlets of the *T. aestivum* Energo variety with 3 mixtures containing 311 an equal concentration of 23 strains, each mixture consisting of the 22 strains representing the 312 genetic diversity of *Rlv* (Table S3) and either FWPou15, FWPou32 or FWPou38. In each 313 replicate, plantlets were also inoculated with FWPou15 alone to verify the efficacy and 314 specificity in detecting the *Rlv* strains. We quantified the relative abundance of each strain 7 315 days post inoculation (dpi) by Illumina MiSeq sequencing of a *nodD* gene fragment (Methods 316 S5, Boivin et al., 2020b) on DNA extracted after surface-sterilization of the roots (treatment 317 S) or without root surface-sterilization (treatment NS). In the control plants inoculated with 318 FWPou15 alone, on average 95% of the total reads corresponded to this bacterium (Fig. S5) 319 confirming its ability to colonize wheat roots and suggesting little contamination in the 320 experiment. In the co-inoculated plants, thirteen strains were either not detected (no reads, 321 CZP3H6, GD25 and CCBAU03058, Table S5) or had a relative abundance lower than 1% 322 (BLR195, CCBAU10279, FRP3E11, GB51, GLR2, GLR17, P1NP2K, SL16, TOM,

323 UPM1134; Fig. 4, Table S5), suggesting there are either not able to colonize wheat roots or 324 poor competitors. The other strains including ten strains isolated from legumes as well as the 325 wheat strains were detected both in NS and S roots, revealing wheat root epiphytic and 326 endophytic colonization abilities are widely distributed among the *Rlv* diversity. However, 327 strong differences in the relative abundance of these strains were observed. A generalized 328 mixed-linear model (glmm) on the relative abundances of the strains in the 3 mixtures showed 329 a significant effect of the 'strain' factor, but not of the 'sterilization' factor, on the 330 colonization success (Table 1). The IAUb11 strain isolated from pea nodules was significantly 331 more abundant than all the other strains in both root compartments (Table S13), with a mean 332 relative abundance of 63% and 45% in NS and S roots, respectively (Fig. 4, Table S5). The 333 wheat strains FWPou32 and FWPou38 showed intermediate colonization abilities, with a 334 mean relative abundance of 13 and 4% in NS roots and 19 and 22 % in S roots (Fig. 4, Table 335 S5). Significant differences in their abundance compared to other strains (except IAUb11) 336 were only found in the S roots (Table S13). Interestingly, the strain TOM, belonging to the 337 same gsF-1 genospecies as the wheat strains, had very low ability to colonize wheat roots in 338 this assay (read abundance <1%) suggesting that the genospecies does not predict wheat 339 colonization ability.

The colonization success of each *Rlv* strain in the mixtures is globally equivalent in S and NS roots, suggesting that epiphytic colonization success drives the endophytic colonization success. However, the strains FWPou32 and particularly FWPou38 were more successful in colonizing S roots than NS roots, suggesting a stronger endophytic ability compared to most of the *Rlv* strains isolated from legumes.

345 *Rlv* strains are wheat root endophytes

346 We then quantified the endophytic and epiphytic wheat root colonization abilities of a few 347 individual strains. We selected the strains IAUb11, FWPou38 and FWPou15 displaying 348 respectively the high, intermediate and low degree of colonization in co-inoculation 349 conditions. We included in the analysis the commonly used *Rlv* strain A34 as a control. We 350 performed single strain inoculations in gnotobiotic conditions on two T. aestivum varieties, 351 Energo and Numeric, and colonization was assessed by measuring cfu of strains isolated from 352 wheat roots 7 dpi and following surface-sterilization (treatment S) or not (NS) of the wheat 353 root system.

bioRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.08.07.241844; this version posted August 7, 2020. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

A linear-mixed model (*lmm*) on the cfu /mg of root fresh weight showed a significant effect of the 'sterilization' and 'strains' factors (Table 2). No significant effect was observed for the 'variety' factor, however, significant nested 'sterilization \times variety' factor and 'strain \times variety' effects were observed (Table 2).

All strains colonized the root surface of the 2 wheat varieties $(10^6 \text{ to } 10^7 \text{ cfu/mg}, \text{Fig. 5})$ and no significant difference was observed between strains and between the wheat varieties in the NS roots (Table S14). By contrast, bacteria differed in their endophytic colonization abilities. FWPou38 and IAUb11 were the most efficient in both varieties $(10^3 \text{ to } 10^4 \text{ cfu/mg})$, while A34 was the least efficient root endophyte $(10^2 \text{ cfu/mg}, \text{Fig.5})$ on Numeric. FWPou15, which behaved similarly to A34 on the Energo variety, displayed an intermediate endophytic colonization ability on Numeric $(10^3 \text{ cfu/mg}, \text{Fig. 5}, \text{Table S14})$.

To confirm the epiphytic and the endophytic capacities of *Rlv* through microscopy observation, we constructed a GFP-tagged version of FWPou15 and observed its *in vitro* root colonization on the cultivar Energo 7 dpi. Confocal microscopy showed that FWPou15 massively colonized the surface of wheat roots (Fig. 5c). A few bacteria were also observed inside the roots, at least around the outer cortical cells (Fig. 5d), confirming their endophytic colonization ability.

371 *Rlv* can stimulate wheat root development

372 We then tested whether *Rlv* strains show differences in their ability to induce plant responses. 373 We first investigated whether Rlv strains have different effects on root architecture. We 374 inoculated A34, FWPou15, FWPou38 or IAUb11 on both Energo and Numeric varieties in 375 gnotobiotic conditions, measured the number of lateral roots and the total root length at 12 376 dpi. *lmm* on both variables showed significant effects of the 'strain' and 'variety' factors as 377 well as a significant nested 'strain x variety' effect (Table 3). Despite that for each wheat variety the total root lengths and the lateral root numbers were correlated ($R^2 \sim 0.7$, Fig. S7). 378 these traits responded differently to inoculation (Fig. 6). FWPou38 and IAUb11 induced a 379 380 significant increase in the lateral root number (on average + 35% each; Fig. 6d, Table S15), 381 while FWPou15 induced a weak but significant effect on the total root length (on average +12382 %; Fig. 6a, Table S15) in the Energo variety. In contrast, FWPou15 induced a significant increase of both total root length (on average +29%; Fig. 6a, Table S15) and lateral root 383 384 number (on average +52%; Fig. 6b, Table S15) in the Numeric variety; while FWPou38 385 induced a significant, although weak, decrease in the total root length (on average -18 %; Fig.

386 6d, Table S11). Inoculation by A34 did not affect root architecture in either wheat variety.

387 Interestingly, on the Energo variety, strains with the highest level of endophytic colonization

388 (FWPou38 and IAUb11) showed the strongest effect on wheat root architecture. FWPou15

displayed a root-growth activity mostly on the Numeric variety in which it showed a higher

level of endophytic colonization compared to the Energo variety (Fig. 4).

391 *Rlv* can enhance colonization of wheat roots by arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi

We then investigated whether *Rlv* strains have different effects on wheat root colonization by AMF. For this, we co-inoculated Energo and Numeric roots with the *Rhizophagus irregularis* isolate DAOM197198 and one of the 4 *Rlv* strains (FWPou15, FWPou38, IAUb11 or A34). We measured the number of AMF colonization sites 24 dpi and compared it to wheat plantlets inoculated only with *R. irregularis*.

397 *Imm* showed a significant effect of the 'strain' factor only on the Energo variety (Table 4). 398 More specifically, when compared to the control, inoculation with the FWPou38 and IAUb11 399 strains resulted in significantly more fungal colonization sites (on average +55% and +31% 400 respectively; Fig. 7b; Table S16). Similarly, roots inoculated with either FWPou38 or IAUb11 401 displayed significantly more fungal colonization sites than roots inoculated with A34 (on 402 average +77% and +50% respectively; Table S16). Only FWPou38 induced significantly 403 more fungal colonization sites than FWPou15 (on average +33%; Table S16). On the 404 Numeric variety, inoculation with any of Rlv strain did not result in a significant change in the 405 number of fungal colonization sites (Fig. 7c and d; Table S16) reinforcing the influence of the 406 wheat genotype on the response induced by *Rlv*. Taken together, these results suggest that the 407 *Rlv* strains stimulating AMF colonization in wheat roots are those able to stimulate the lateral 408 root number.

410 Discussion

411 Wheat might participate in shaping *Rlv* populations in agronomical soils

412 *Rhizobium leguminosarum* sy. *viciae* strains are known to nodulate legume hosts such as pea 413 and faba bean and have PGP activities on wheat. Here we show that wheat is an alternative 414 natural host for Rlv. Yet, in our study we only isolated Rlv strains from root samples of wheat 415 plants cultivated in rotation with pea plants (Rlv host), while we did not succeed in isolating 416 *Rlv* from wheat plants in rotation with soybean (non-*Rlv* host). This suggests an enrichment of 417 *Rlv* in wheat roots through rotation with a legume host. On the other hand, a previous study 418 described *Rlv* strains in soils under wheat monoculture (Depret *et al.*, 2004). Although the *Rlv* 419 species complex had been currently described to contain 5 genospecies, only members of two 420 of them (gsF-1 and gsF-2) were identified among the 20 wheat isolated strains. The limited 421 diversity of Rlv found in our wheat samples might be explained through three non-exclusive 422 hypotheses. Firstly, the sampling we performed was not saturated. Secondly, we cannot 423 exclude that soils in which wheat have been grown were deprived of other *Rlv* genospecies. 424 However, this is not in accordance with previous results showing a high Rlv diversity in 425 European soils including in the southwest of France (Boivin et al., 2020a). Thirdly, the low 426 Rlv diversity is related to partner choice in wheat-Rlv interactions. Nevertheless, through co-427 inoculation assays, we demonstrated that Rlv strains isolated from legume plants and 428 belonging to other genospecies (i.e. IAUb11, gsE) can efficiently colonize wheat roots while 429 other members of gsF-1/2 genospecies were not efficient wheat root colonizers suggesting 430 that wheat partner choice is not related to Rlv genospecies. However, the co-inoculation assays resulted in a reduced diversity associated with the wheat roots compared to the 431 432 inoculum, supporting the hypothesis of partner choice. Such partner choice was also observed 433 in the legume-Rlv interaction (Boivin et al., 2020b). Interestingly, the pattern of colonization 434 success we found for the Rlv strains in the wheat roots was different to that observed with the 435 same 22 Rlv for colonization in various legumes during nodulation (Fig. 8; Boivin et al., 436 2020b), suggesting that *Rlv* strains might carry different competitiveness abilities to colonize 437 legume nodules, wheat roots or other putative hosts. By consequence, multiplicity of plant 438 hosts in fields can participate in maintaining Rlv diversity in soils. Field campaigns at a 439 broader geographical scale to investigate the diversity of *Rlv* in wheat roots, legume nodules 440 and in the surrounding soils, should help to validate these hypotheses.

441 Different mechanisms could influence *Rlv* competitiveness for endophytic and epiphytic 442 wheat root colonization

443 The colonization success of a given strain could be due to its ability to colonize the host 444 and/or to compete with other microorganisms. Although we have not tested individually all 445 the Rlv strains used in the co-inoculation assays, we have not found any difference for epiphytic growth between the 4 strains we have tested individually. This suggests that the 446 447 differences observed for the epiphytic growth in the co-inoculation assay are due to 448 differences in competitiveness. Competition for nutrient resources is the most common 449 mechanism underlying variations in bacterial root colonization, as strains/species carrying 450 resource-specific pathways are often those able to rapidly grow and dominate niches (Simons 451 et al., 1996; Pieterse et al., 2014; Yang et al., 2019). Other hypotheses to explain different 452 bacterial abilities to compete for root colonization include antagonism *via* the production of 453 secondary metabolites (Weller et al., 2002). However, the minor differences found in this 454 study among the Rlv strains in term of metabolic pathways (Fig. S6) did not correlate with the 455 differences observed for wheat root colonization in the co-inoculation assays. Comparative 456 genomics revealed that a cluster of 4 genes annotated as a putative sulfide/taurine transporter 457 was only found in the genomes of the strains FWPou15, FWPou32, FWPou38 and IAUb11 458 and not in the 21 other strains (gene identifiers in strain IAUb11: RLVIAUB1145.7 -RLVIAUB1145.10). It is possible that this transporter is involved in competitiveness of the 459 460 FWPou32, FWPou38 and IAUb11 strains by facilitating export of sulfate or sulfite 461 (Weinitschke et al., 2007).

462 Overall, in the co-inoculation assays performed in this study, the competitiveness pattern for 463 epiphytic colonization is similar to the pattern found for endophytic colonization. This 464 indicates that Rlv multiplication on the root surface is an important factor underlying the 465 endophytic success of *Rlv* strains. Nevertheless, mechanisms underlying competitiveness of 466 the Rlv strains in colonizing the inner part of wheat roots might be different to those regulating the epiphytic growth. First, we found differences for endophytic colonization 467 468 between the strains we tested individually. Secondly, the endophytic/epiphytic colonization 469 ratio were higher for wheat strains FWPou32 and FWPou38 than for the pea strain IAUb11. 470 The ability of strains to escape recognition by host and to avoid plant defenses might also 471 account for the ability to multiply inside the roots (Pieterse et al., 2014). A combination of 472 mechanisms might thus modulate the ability of Rlv strains to endophytically colonize wheat 473 roots and explain adaptation of some Rlv strains to wheat.

474 Surprisingly, while almost clonal, FWPou15 and FWPou38 strains showed contrasted ability 475 to colonize wheat roots. Based on short read Illumina genome sequencing, we found only one 476 non-synonymous mutation between FWPou15 and FWPou38 strains, which occurs in a gene 477 encoding a DNA polymerase IV involved in DNA repair. It is known in bacteria, that in 478 response to stress DNA polymerase can synthesize error-containing DNA leading to the 479 formation of genetic variants and different phenotypes of the progeny (Foster, 2005). This 480 process called phenotypic plasticity also leads to bacterial cells showing different responses 481 when inoculated in a plant host (i.e. loss of pathogenicity or decrease of epiphytic growth; 482 Bartoli et al., 2015). Further experiments are required to determine whether this mutation, 483 genome re-arrangements and/or epigenetic modifications are responsible for these phenotypic 484 differences. Moreover, these variants represent a promising material to decipher the molecular 485 mechanisms controlling the ability of *Rlv* strains to colonize wheat roots.

486 Common molecular mechanisms might be involved in the stimulation of wheat root 487 development and AMF colonization

488 Several bacteria displaying PGP activity, including rhizobia, have been shown to enhance 489 wheat interaction with AMF (Germida & Walley, 1996; Russo et al., 2005; Pivato et al., 490 2009). Soil microorganisms can modulate the auxin-dependent root developmental program 491 leading to lateral root formation in both monocots and dicots (Contreras-Cornejo et al., 2009; 492 Pieterse et al., 2014). Indeed many PGP bacteria, including rhizobia, produce auxins 493 (Camerini et al., 2008; Spaepen & Vanderleyden, 2011; Boivin et al., 2016). The effect of Rlv 494 on wheat roots development could be attributed to auxin produced by Rlv strains. In support 495 of this hypothesis, key enzymes of 3 of the known bacterial auxin synthesis pathways using 496 tryptophan as substrate, the indole acetamide, the indole pyruvate and the tryptamine 497 pathways (Spaepen & Vanderleyden, 2011), are encoded in the FWPou15, FWPou38 and 498 IAUb11 genomes (Fig. S8). Alternatively, rhizobial LCOs can also affect root development both in legumes and non-legumes through the regulation of the plant auxin homeostasis 499 500 (Herrbach et al., 2017; Buendia et al., 2019a). Stimulation of AMF colonization by *Rlv* can be 501 indirectly favored by the increase in the number of lateral roots, preferential sites for AMF 502 colonization (Gutjahr et al., 2013). LCOs and auxin have been also both shown to stimulate 503 AMF colonization in legumes and non-legumes plants (Maillet et al., 2011; Etemadi et al.,

2014; Buendia *et al.*, 2019b) and may also directly affect AM. Effects of exogenous application of either auxin or LCO on root development are dependent on their concentration (Herrbach *et al.*, 2017; Buendia *et al.*, 2019a). Different levels of auxin and/or LCO production could, at least partially, explain the difference between *Rlv* strains on root development and AMF colonization.

Levels of endophytic colonization rather than epiphytic colonization might be critical for *Rlv* ability to induce plant responses

511 Both co-inoculation and single strain inoculation assays showed that FWPou38 and IAUb11 are efficient wheat endophytic colonizers with $\sim 10^4$ cfu/mg of root tissues on both Energo and 512 Numeric varieties. The bacterial population sizes found in wheat roots for these strains are 513 similar to those previously reported for PGP rhizobia colonizing rice roots (Chaintreuil et al., 514 515 2000; Mitra et al., 2016). Both strains can increase the number of lateral roots and stimulate 516 AMF colonization in Energo. This was not observed on the Numeric variety, suggesting that bacterial effects are plant genotype dependent. The effect of wheat genotype on the 517 518 colonization by PGP rhizobacteria has been described, for example for bacteria of the genus 519 Pseudomonas (Valente et al., 2020). Here, we show that beside the colonization level, host 520 responses also vary depending on the plant genotype. Interestingly, FWPou15, had a 521 stimulation activity on Numeric root architecture in which it is an intermediate endophytic colonizer with $\sim 10^3$ cfu/mg, while not in Energo in which it is a poor endophytic colonizer 522 with $\sim 10^2$ cfu/mg. Similarly, the poorest endophytic colonizer in both Energo and Numeric, 523 524 A34, did not induce any root architecture or AMF colonization responses. In this regard, we 525 can hypothesize that *Rlv* strains with the best endophytic colonization ability were able to 526 reach an endophytic population size sufficient for production of auxins, LCOs or other PGP 527 molecules at concentrations required for stimulating lateral root development and AMF 528 colonization. Further analysis with a larger number of strains should establish whether there is 529 a correlation between endophytic colonization ability and stimulation of plant responses and 530 its genotype-genotype dependency.

In conclusion, our study suggest that *Rlv* competitiveness and level of endophytic colonization are critical for potential PGP activities. These novel concepts will help in understanding and/or design microbial consortia based on beneficial bacteria for improving wheat yield/quality in a context of reducing the use of inputs. bioRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.08.07.241844; this version posted August 7, 2020. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

537 Acknowledgements

538 We thank Adrien Jallais, Thomas Py and Camille Ribeyre for their support during the wheat 539 phenotypic assays, Dr. Dorian Guetta, who initiated the in vitro wheat root colonization 540 studies, and the CREABio Research Station (Auch, France) / Enguerrand Burel and Laurent 541 Escalier who allowed us to sample wheat and provided data about soil composition of the field plots. We also thank Cecile Pouzet from the FR AIB imaging platform for her technical 542 support in analyzing wheat roots colonized with GFP-tagged strains and Julie Cullimore for 543 544 critical reading of the manuscript. This work was supported by the projects IDEX UNITI 545 "RHIZOWHEAT", INRAE Department of Plant Health and Environment (SPE) "DIBAM", ANR "WHEATSYM" (ANR-16-CE20-0025-01), ANR GRaSP (ANR-16-CE20-0021-03) 546 547 and Laboratoire d'Excellence (LABEX) TULIP (ANR-10-LABX-41).

548

549 Author Contributions

550 Conceptualization of the project: CB, SB, BL, ML and CMB. Experimental design: CB, SB,

551 BL and ML. Field sampling and microbiology: CG and CB. Wheat phenotyping: CB, VG and

552 MG. Molecular analysis: CB and MG. Statistical Analysis: CB. Microscopy: MM and MCA.

⁵⁵³Bio-informatic analysis: SB, AC and LC. Manuscript writing: CB, SB, BL, ML and CMB.

555 **References**

- 556 Arkin AP, RW, Henry CS, Harris NL, Stevens RL, Maslov S, Dehal P, Ware D, Perez F
- 557 et al. 2018. KBase: the united states department of energy systems biology knowledgebase.
- 558 *Nature biotechnology* **36**: 566–569.
- 559 Barker D, Pfaff T, Moreau D, Groves E, Ruffel R, Lepetit M, Whiteh S, Maillet F,
- 560 Ramakrishnan MN, Journet EP. 2006. Growing M. truncatula: choice of substrates and
- 561 growth conditions. In: *Medicago truncatula handbook*. (eds U. Mathesius, E. Journet, & L.
- 562 Sumner), pp. http://www.noble.org/MedicagoHandbook/. ISBN 0-9754303-1-9.
- 563 **Bartoli C, Lamichhane JR, Berge O, Varvaro L, Morris CE. 2015**. Mutability in 564 *Pseudomonas viridiflava* as a programmed balance between antibiotic resistance and 565 pathogenicity. *Molecular Plant Pathology* **16**: 860–869.
- Beringer JE. 1974. R factor transfer in *Rhizobium leguminosarum*. *Microbiology* 84: 188–
 198.
- 568 Biswas JC, Ladha JK, Dazzo FB, Yanni YG, Rolfe BG. 2000. Rhizobial inoculation
- influences seedling vigor and yield of rice. *Agronomy Journal* **92**: 880–886.
- 570 Boivin S, Fonouni-Farde C, Frugier F. 2016. How auxin and cytokinin phytohormones
- 571 modulate root microbe interactions. *Frontiers in Plant Science* **7**: 1240.
- 572 Boivin S, Ait Lahmidi N, Sherlock D, Bonhomme M, Dijon D, Heulin-Gotty K, Le-Quer,
- 573 A, Pervent M, Tauzin M et al. 2020a. Host specific competitiveness to form nodules in
- 574 *Rhizobium leguminosarum* symbiovar viciae. New Phytologist **266**: 555–568
- 575 Boivin S, Mahé F, Pervent M, Tancelin M, Tauzin M, Wielbo J, Mazurier S, Young PJ,
- 576 Lepetit M. 2020b. Genetic variation in host-specific competitiveness of the symbiont
- 577 Rhizobium leguminosarum symbiovar viciae. Authorea. doi:
- 578 10.22541/au.159237007.72934061.
- Bonfante P, Genre A. 2010. Mechanisms underlying beneficial plant–fungus interactions in
 mycorrhizal symbiosis. *Nature Communications* 1: 48.
- 581 Brettin T, Davis JJ, Disz T, Edwards RA, Gerdes S, Olsen GJ, Olson R, Overbeek R,

582 Parrello B, Pusch GD et al. 2015. RASTtk: A modular and extensible implementation of the

583 RAST algorithm for building custom annotation pipelines and annotating batches of genomes.

584 Scientific Reports 5: 8365.

- 585 Buendia L, Maillet F, O'Connor D, van de-Kerkhove Q, Danoun S, Gough C, Lefebvre
- 586 B, Bensmihen S. 2019a. Lipo-chitooligosaccharides promote lateral root formation and
- 587 modify auxin homeostasis in *Brachypodium distachyon*. *New Phytologist* **221**: 2190–2202.
- 588 Buendia L, Ribeyre C, Bensmihen S, Lefebvre B. 2019b. Brachypodium distachyon
- tar2lhypo mutant shows reduced root developmental response to symbiotic signal but
- 590 increased arbuscular mycorrhiza. *Plant Signaling and Behavior* **14**: e1651608.
- 591 Camerini S, Senatore B, Lonardo E, Imperlini E, Bianco C, Moschetti G, Rotino GL,
- 592 Campion B, Defez R. 2008. Introduction of a novel pathway for IAA biosynthesis to rhizobia
- alters vetch root nodule development. *Archives of Microbiology* **190**: 67–77.
- 594 Catoira R, Galera C, de Billy F, Penmetsa RV, Journet E-P, Maillet F, Rosenberg C,
- 595 Cook D, Gough C, Dénarié J. 2000. Four genes of Medicago truncatula controlling
- components of a Nod factor transduction pathway. Plant Cell **12**: 1647–1666.
- 597 Chaintreuil C, Giraud E, Prin Y, Lorquin J, Bâ A, Gillis M, de Lajudie P, Dreyfus B.
- 598 2000. Photosynthetic bradyrhizobia are natural endophytes of the african wild rice Oryza
- *breviligulata. Applied and Environmental Microbiology* **66**: 5437–5447.
- 600 Contreras-Cornejo HA, Macías-Rodríguez L, Cortés-Penagos C, López-Bucio J. 2009.
- *Trichoderma virens*, a plant beneficial fungus, enhances biomass production and promotes
 lateral root growth through an auxin-dependent mechanism in *Arabidopsis*. *Plant Physiology* **149**: 1579–1592.
- 604 Depret G, Houot S, Allard MR, Breuil MC, Nouaïm R, Laguerre G. 2004. Long-term
- effects of crop management on *Rhizobium leguminosarum* biovar *viciae* populations. *FEMS Microbiology Ecology* 51: 87–97.
- **Dray S, Dufour A. 2007**. The ade4 package: implementing the duality diagram for ecologists. *Journal of Statistical Software* 22: 1–20.
- Emms DM, Kelly S. 2019. OrthoFinder: phylogenetic orthology inference for comparative
 genomics. Genome Biology 20: 238.
- 611 Etemadi M, Gutjahr C, Couzigou JM, Zouine M, Lauressergues D, Timmers A, Audran
- 612 C, Bouzayen M, Bécard G, Combier JP. 2014. Auxin perception is required for arbuscule
- development in arbuscular mycorrhizal symbiosis. *Plant Physiology* **166**: 281–292.
- 614 Foster PL. 2005. Stress responses and genetic variation in bacteria. *Mutation Research* 569:

- 615 3–11.
- 616 Germida JJ, Walley FL. 1996. Plant growth-promoting rhizobacteria alter rooting patterns
- and arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi colonization of field-grown spring wheat. Biology and
- 618 *Fertility of Soils*. **23**: 113–120.
- 619 Girardin A, Wang T, Ding Y, Keller J, Buendia L, Gaston M, Ribeyre C, Gasciolli V,
- 620 Auriac MC, Vernié T, et al. 2019. LCO receptors involved in arbuscular mycorrhiza are
- functional for rhizobia perception in legumes. *Current Biology* **29**: 4249-4259.e5.
- 622 Götz R, Evans IJ, Downie JA, Johnston AWB. 1985. Identification of the host-range DNA
- 623 which allows *Rhizobium leguminosarum* strain TOM to nodulate cv. Afghanistan peas.
- 624 *Molecular and General Genetics* **201**: 296-300.
- 625 **Gutjahr C, Paszkowski U. 2013**. Multiple control levels of root system remodeling in arbuscular mycorrhizal symbiosis. *Frontiers in Plant Science* **4**: 204.
- Haichar F el Z, Santaella C, Heulin T, Achouak W. 2014. Root exudates mediated
 interactions belowground. *Soil Biology and Biochemistry* 77: 69–80.
- 629 Henry CS, DeJongh M, Best AA, Frybarger PM, Linsay B, Stevens RL. 2010. High-
- 630 throughput generation, optimization and analysis of genome-scale metabolic models. *Nature*
- 631 *Biotechnology* **28**: 977–982.
- 632 Herrbach V, Chirinos X, Rengel D, Agbevenou K, Vincent R, Pateyron S, Huguet S,

633 Balzergue S, Pasha A, Provart N, et al. 2017. Nod factors potentiate auxin signaling for

transcriptional regulation and lateral root formation in Medicago truncatula. Journal of

- 635 *Experimental Botany* **68**: 569–583.
- Hilali A, Prevost D, Broughton WJ, Antoun H. 2001. Effects of inoculation with *Rhizobium leguminosarum* biovar *trifolii* on wheat cultivated in clover crop rotation
 agricultural soil in Morocco. *Canadian Journal of Microbiology* 47: 590–593.
- Höflich G, Wiehe W, Hecht-Buchholz C. 1995. Rhizosphere colonization of different crops
 with growth promoting *Pseudomonas* and *Rhizobium* bacteria. *Microbiological Research* 150:
 139–147.
- Hogland DR, Arnon DI. 1950. The water culture method for growing plants without soil.
 1950. University of California, College of Agriculture, Agricultural Experiment Station.
 Berkeley, California. Vol.347 No.2nd edit pp.32 pp.

- 645 Hucka M, Finney A, Sauro HM, Bolouri H, Doyle JC, Kitano H, Arkin AP, Bornstein
- 646 BJ, Bray D, Cornish-Bowden A, et al. 2003. The systems biology markup language
- 647 (SBML): a medium for representation and exchange of biochemical network models.
- 648 *Bioinformatics* **19**: 524–531.
- 649 Huerta-Cepas J, Forslund K, Coelho LP, Szklarczyk D, Jensen LJ, von Mering C, Bork
- 650 P. 2017. Fast genome-wide functional annotation through orthology assignment by eggNOG-
- 651 Mapper. *Molecular Biology and Evolution* **34**: 2115–2122.
- 652 Machado D, Andrejev S, Tramontano M, Patil KR. 2018. Fast automated reconstruction of
- 653 genome-scale metabolic models for microbial species and communities. Nucleic Acids
- 654 *Research* **46**: 7542–7553.
- 655 Maillet F, Poinsot V, André O, Puech-Pagès V, Haouy A, Gueunier M, Cromer L,
- 656 Giraudet D, Formey D, Niebel A, et al. 2011. Fungal lipochitooligosaccharide symbiotic
- 657 signals in arbuscular mycorrhiza. *Nature* **469**: 58–63.
- 658 Martens M, Dawyndt P, Coopman R, Gillis M, De Vos P, Willems A. 2008. Advantages
- of multilocus sequence analysis for taxonomic studies: a case study using 10 housekeeping
- 660 genes in the genus Ensifer (including former Sinorhizobium). International Journal of
- 661 *Systamaic and Evolutionary Microbiology* **58**: 200–214.
- 662 Mitra S, Mukherjee A, Wiley-Kalil A, Das S, Owen H, Reddy PM, Ané J-M, James EK,
- 663 Gyaneshwar P 2016 A rhamnose-deficient lipopolysaccharide mutant of Rhizobium Sp.
- 664 IRBG74 is defective in root colonization and beneficial interactions with its flooding-tolerant
- hosts Sesbania cannabina and wetland rice. Journal of Experimental Botany 67: 5869–5884.
- Oono R, Denison RF. 2010. Comparing symbiotic efficiency between swollen versus
 nonswollen rhizobial bacteroids. *Plant Physiology* 154: 1541–1548.
- 668 Ortíz-Castro R, Contreras-Cornejo HA, Macías-Rodríguez L, López-Bucio J. 2009. The
- role of microbial signals in plant growth and development. *Plant Signaling and Behavior* 4:
 701–712.
- Peng S, Biswas JC, Ladha JK, Gyaneshwar P, Chen Y. 2002. Influence of rhizobial
 inoculation on photosynthesis and grain yield of rice. *Agronomy Journal* 94:925–929.
- 673 Pieterse CMJ, Zamioudis C, Berendsen RL, Weller DM, Van Wees SCM, Bakker
- 674 PAHM. 2014. Induced systemic resistance by beneficial microbes. Annual Review of

675 *Phytopathology* **52**: 347–375.

676 Pivato B, Offre P, Marchelli S, Barbonaglia B, Mougel C, Lamanceau P, Berta G. 2009.

Bacterial effects on arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi and mycorrhiza development as influenced
by the bacteria, fungi, and host plant. *Mychorriza* 19: 81–90.

- 679 Pouler S. 1995. Accuracy of measurements with Mac/WinRhizo. Reagent
 680 Instrumentstechnical note N°3.
- 681 Raklami A, Bechtaoui N, Tahiri AI, Anli M, Meddich A, Oufdou K. 2019. Use of
- rhizobacteria and mycorrhizae consortium in the open field as a strategy for improving crop
- nutrition, productivity and soil fertility. *Frontiers in Microbiology* **10**: 1106.
- 684 Russo A, Felici C, Toffanin A, Götz M, Collados C, Barea JM, Moënne-Loccoz Y,

Smalla K, Vanderleyden J, Nuti M. 2005. Effect of *Azospirillum* inoculants on arbuscular
mycorrhiza establishment in wheat and maize plants. *Biology and Fertility of Soils* 41: 301–
309.

- 688 Santoyo G, Moreno-Hagelsieb G, del Carmen Orozco-Mosqueda M, Glick BR. 2016.
- 689 Plant growth-promoting bacterial endophytes. *Microbiological Research* **183**: 92–99.
- 690 Simons M, Van Der Bij AJ, Brand I, De Weger LA, Wijffelman CA, Lugtenberg BJJ.
- 691 **1996**. Gnotobiotic system for studying rhizosphere colonization by plant growth-promoting
- 692 *Pseudomonas* bacteria. *Molecular Plant-Microbe Interactions* **9**: 600–607.
- Spaepen S, Vanderleyden J. 2011. Auxin and plant-microbe interactions. *Cold Spring Harbor Perspectives in Biology* 3: a001438.
- 695 Tamura K, Peterson D, Peterson N, Stecher G, Nei M, Kumar S. 2011. MEGA5:
- 696 Molecular evolutionary genetics analysis using maximum likelihood, evolutionary distance,
- and maximum parsimony methods. *Molecular Biology and Evolution* **28**: 2731–2739.
- 698 Valente J, Gerin F, Le Gouis J, Moënne-Loccoz Y, Prigent-Combaret C. 2020. Ancient
- 699 wheat varieties have a higher ability to interact with plant growth-promoting rhizobacteria.
- 700 *Plant Cell and Environment* **43**: 246–260.
- 701 Webster G, Gough C, Vasse J, Batchelor CA, O'Callaghan KJ, Kothari SL, Davey MR,
- 702 Dénarié J, Cocking EC. 1997. Interactions of rhizobia with rice and wheat. Plant and Soil
- 703 **194**: 115–122.

- 704 Weinitschke S, Denger K, Cook AM, Smits THM. 2007. The DUF81 protein TauE in
- Cupriavidus necator H16, a sulfite exporter in the metabolism of C₂ sulfonates. *Microbiology*
- **153**: 3055–3060.
- 707 Weller DM, Raaijmakers JM, Gardener BBM, Thomashow LS. 2002. Microbial
- 708 populations responsible for specific soil suppressiveness to plant pathogens . Annual Review
- 709 *of Phytopathology* **40**: 309–348.
- 710 Xia X. 2017. DAMBE6: New tools for microbial genomics, phylogenetics, and molecular
- evolution. *Journal of Heredity* **108**: 431–437.
- 712 Yang C, Dong Y, Friman VP, Jousset A, Wei Z, Xu Y, Shen Q. 2019. Carbon resource
- richness shapes bacterial competitive interactions by alleviating growth-antibiosis trade-off.
- 714 *Functional Ecology* **33**: 868–875.
- 715 Yanni YG, Dazzo FB, 2010. Enhancement of rice production using endophytic strains of
- 716 Rhizobium leguminosarum by. trifolii in extensive field inoculation trials within the Egypt
- 717 Nile delta. *Plant and Soil* **366**: 129–141.
- 718 Zeze A, Mutch LA, Young PW. 2001. Direct amplification of *nodD* from community DNA
- 719 reveals the genetic diversity of *Rhizobium leguminosarum* in soil. *Environmental*
- 720 *Microbiology* **3**: 363–370.
- 721

722 Figure Legends

723 Fig. 1. Functional *Rhizobium leguminosarum* sy. viciae (Rlv) are associated with wheat 724 roots. (a) Neighbor-Joining tree based on a portion of the chromosomic gyrB gene from the 725 20 wheat-isolated strains (indicated in blue), a set of Rlv strains representative of the diversity 726 of the species complex (Boivin et al., 2020b), and the strain A34. Ensifer meliloti was used as outgroup. The *Rlv* strains isolated from wheat roots cluster with strains from genospecies gsF-727 728 1 (TOM, FRF1D12, Vaf10, CCBAU83268) or gsF-2 (SL16). (b-g) Sections of pea nodules colonized by (b) FWPou15, (c) FWPou32, (d) FWPou38 and (e) A34. Scale bars correspond 729 730 to 100 µm.

Fig. 2. Selected *Rlv* strains for functional analyses belong to genospecies gsF-1. Hierarchical clustering and heat map based on the Average Nucleotide Identity (ANI) values between each couple of the 3 wheat strains, FWPou15, FWPou32 and FWPou38 (indicated in blue), and a set of *Rlv* strains representative of the diversity of the species complex (Boivin *et al.*, 2020b). Genospecies (gs) have been defined using an ANI threshold of 95%. Star indicates phylogenetically distant isolates that do not cluster with any of the genospecies.

Fig. 3. Selected *Rlv* strains for functional analyses belong to the Nod group B1. NeighborJoining tree based on concatenated *nodABCDEFIJLMN* gene sequences of the 3 wheat
strains, FWPou15, FWPou32 and FWPou38 (indicated in blue), and *Rlv* strains representative
of the Nod groups (Boivin et al., 2020b). WSM1689 (*R. leguminosarum* symbiovar *trifolii*)
and *E. meliloti* 1021 were used as outgroups.

742 Fig. 4. *Rlv* strains colonize wheat roots with varying degrees of success in co-inoculation assays. (a-c) Least-Squares-Means (Ismeans) of the *Rlv* strain abundance in wheat roots when 743 744 co-inoculated in an *in vitro* assay. Co-inoculation of 22 *Rlv* strains representing the diversity of Rlv (Table S3) together with the wheat strains FWPou15 (a), FWPou32 (b) or FWPou38 745 746 (c). Each mixture was inoculated in a total of 18 wheat plant root systems in 3 independent 747 replicates. Total DNA was extracted from pools of 3 roots systems, with or without surfacesterilization, at 7 dpi, and a nodD amplicon was sequenced by MiSeq Illumina. Mean 748 abundance was inferred by normalizing the number of reads corresponding to each strain with 749 750 the total number of reads obtained in the run. Dark grey bars indicate results obtained from 751 surface-sterilized (S) roots and light grey bars indicate results obtained from non-sterilized 752 (NS) roots. The S and NS treatments allow estimating respectively the relative endophytic and 753 epiphytic abundance of each inoculated strain since endophytic bacteria are in negligible

amounts compared to epiphytic bacteria. Three *Rlv* strains GD25, CCBAU03058 and CZP3H6 were not detected by MiSeq sequencing, thus, they are not reported in the barplots.

756 Fig. 5. *Rlv* strains are wheat root endophytes. (a-b) Barplots representing the endophytic 757 (surface-sterilized: S; dark grey bars) and epiphytic (non-sterilized: NS; light grey bars) 758 bacterial abundance in roots of the wheat varieties Energo (a) or Numeric (b). Strain name is 759 reported in the x-axis. Least-Squares-Means (lsmeans) and standard deviation of bacterial 760 abundance 7 dpi is expressed as \log_{10} of cfu (colony-forming units)/mg of root fresh weight. 761 Total number of plants analyzed (≥ 6 for NS treatment and 12 for S treatment, in at least 2 762 independent replicates) are indicated in Table S6. Significant differences were found in the surface-sterilized roots. P values (corrected for FDR) ≤ 0.05 are indicated by *, ≤ 0.005 by ** 763 and ≤ 0.0005 by *** (See Table S14). (c-d) Confocal microscope images of Energo wheat 764 roots inoculated with the FWPou15 GFP-tagged strain. 3D reconstruction of a cleared root 765 766 fragment (c). Root median focal plan (central) and transversal section reconstructions (bottom 767 and right) of a root fragment in absence of clearing (d). Green fluorescence corresponds to 768 FWPou15-GFP. Red and blue fluorescence correspond to root cell wall auto fluorescence. 769 Arrows indicate the presence of endophytic bacteria between epidermal and cortical cells. 770 Scale bars corresponds to $20 \,\mu m$.

Fig. 6. *Rlv* can stimulate wheat root development in a genotype-dependent manner. Boxplots representing the variation in wheat total root length (a, c; cm) and lateral root number (b, d) 12 dpi in 2 wheat varieties (Energo and Numeric) inoculated with the strains A34 or FWPou15 (a, b), FWPou38 or IAUb11 (c, d). Controls (ctr) are non-inoculated plants. Total numbers of plants analyzed (\geq 30, in at least 2 independent replicates) are indicated in Table S7. *P* values (corrected for FDR) \leq 0.05 are indicated by *, \leq 0.005 by ** and \leq 0.0005 by *** (See Table S15).

Fig. 7. Rlv can stimulate wheat root colonization by AMF in a genotype-dependent 778 779 manner. (a-c) Boxplots representing the variability in the number of colonization sites by the 780 AMF R. irregularis isolate DAOM197198, 24 dpi, when inoculated alone (ctr) or in 781 combination with Rlv strains. Two wheat varieties, Energo (a, b) and Numeric (c, d) were co-782 inoculated with the strains A34 or FWPou15 (a, c), FWPou38 or IAUb11 (b, d). Total 783 numbers of plants analyzed (\geq 31, in at least 2 independent replicates) are indicated in Table S8. *P* values (corrected for FDR) \leq 0.005 are indicated by ** and \leq 0.0005 by *** (See Table 784 S16). Significant differences, not represented on the boxplots, were also found in the Energo 785

variety between A34 vs FWPou38 (P < 0.0001) or IAUb11 (P = 0.0007), and FWPou15 vs

787 FWPou38 (P = 0.0062).

788 Fig. 8. Success of wheat and legume plant colonization in the *Rlv* co-inoculation assays.

- 789 Hierarchical clustering and heatmap based on the relative abundance values (log2) of each *Rlv*
- found in the wheat roots and legume nodules during co-inoculation assays (Table S2 and
- 791 Boivin et al., 2020b). FWPou38 or 3841 strains were used in the co-inoculation assays in
- wheat or legumes respectively as they are undistinguishable by Illumina *nodD* sequencing.
- 793 Wheat cv. 'Energo', Lentil cv. 'Rosana', Pea cv. 'Kayanne', and Fababean cv. 'Diva'.

795 Supporting information

- Fig. S1. Soil composition of field plots in which wheat varieties were sampled.
- Fig. S2. Images of wheat plantlets grown in gnotobiotic conditions.
- Fig. S3. *Rlv* Neighbor-Joining tree based on a portion of the *nodD* gene.
- Fig. S4. Nodule sections obtained from vetch plants inoculated with Rlv strains isolated from wheat roots.
- Fig. S5. Nodulated faba bean root systems inoculated with Rlv strains isolated from wheat roots.
- Fig. S6. *Rlv* metabolic pathway reconstructions.
- Fig. S7. Correlation between the total root length and the lateral root number measured in
- 805 wheat plantlets inoculated by *Rlv* strains.
- Fig. S8. Metabolic reactions of bacterial tryptophan metabolism found in the FWPou15,FWPou38 and IAUb11 strains.
- Table S1. List of the wheat varieties sampled and the *Rlv* strains isolated.
- Table S2. gyrB sequences obtained for strains isolated from wheat roots and the A34 strain.
- 810 Table S3. List of the *Rlv* strains used in the co-inoculation assays.
- Table S4. Quality information on the co-inoculation assays.
- 812 Table S5. Results of the co-inoculation assays.
- Table S6. Experimental design for the root colonization in single strain inoculation assays.
- Table S7. Experimental design for the root development assays.
- Table S8. Experimental design for the mycorrhiza assays.
- Table S9. Relative abundances (from linear-mixed model) of the *Rlv* strains in roots during the co-inoculation assays.
- Table S10. Numbers of colony-forming units (cfu) in the single strain inoculation assays.
- Table S11. Total root lengths and lateral root numbers in the root development assays.
- Table S12. Number of colonization sites in the mycorrhiza assays.

- Table S13. Statistical analysis of the co-inoculation assays.
- Table S14. Statistical analysis of the in the single strain inoculation assays.
- Table S15. Statistical analysis of the root development assays.
- Table S16. Statistical analysis of the mycorrhiza assays.
- 825 Supplementary methods (S1-S9).

827 Tables

Table 1. Analysis of Deviance on the variation of the strain relative abundance inferred from the total
number of reads obtained by Illumina MiSeq sequencing of a *nodD* fragment in the co-inoculation
assays. Chisq: value of the type II Wald chi squared, Df: degree of freedoms. Significant results
obtained after FDR correction are reported in bold.

FWP	FWPou32 mix				FWPou38 mix					
Factors	Chisq	Df	P value	Chisq	Df	P value	-	Chisq	Df	P value
Sterilization	0.08	1	0.7775	0.0012	1	0.945		0.0012	1	0.9727
Strain	545.25	19	<2e-16	482.07	19	<2e-16		605.93	19	<2e-16
Treatment : Strain	27.05	19	0.1035	26.57 19	19	0.1151		24.83	19	0.1662

832 Table 2. Analysis of Deviance on the variation of bacterial colony-forming units (cfu) / mg of wheat

roots obtained after inoculation with the A34, FWPou15, FWPou38 or IAUb11 *Rlv* strains. Chisq:

value of the type II Wald chi squared, Df: degree of freedoms. Significant results obtained after FDR

835 correction are reported in bold.

Energo and Numeric								
Factors	Chisq	Df	P value					
Sterilization	1121.6401	1	2.20E-16					
Variety	0.0047	1	0.97533					
Strain	53.9235	3	1.17E-11					
Sterilization : Variety	4.2279	1	0.03976					
Sterilization : Strain	32.7774	3	3.59E-07					
Variety : Strain	9.8637	3	0.01976					

Table 3. Analysis of Deviance on the variation of the total root length and number of lateral roots obtained after inoculation with the A34, FWPou15, FWPou38 or IAUb11 *Rlv* strains. Analysis was performed on two datasets: A34-FWPou15 and IAUb11-FWPou38, as values for controls (plantlets inoculated with water) were different in the two datasets. Chisq: value of the type II Wald chi squared, Df: degree of freedoms. Significant results obtained after FDR correction are reported in bold.

	Energo & Numeric							Energo & Numeric						
	Tota	al root length N° lateral roots				Total root length			N° lateral roots		roots			
	A34 & FWPou15						IAUb11 & FWPou38							
Factors	Chisq	Df	P value	Chisq	Df	P value	Factors	Chisq	Df	P value	Chisq	Df	P value	
Strain	27.897	2	8.76E-07	24.119	2	5.7910E-06	Strain	1.6147	2	0.446028	11.8746	2	0.002639	
Variety	23.397	1	1.32E-06	230.02	1	< 2.2e-16	Variety	47.047	1	6.93E-12	128.79	1	< 2.2e-16	
Strain : Variety	7.2163	2	0.0271	21.132	2	2.58E-05	Strain : Variety	10.218	2	0.006041	7.5968	2	2.24E-02	

Table 4. Analysis of Deviance on the variation of the number of AMF colonization sites after inoculation with the A34, FWPou15, FWPou38 or IAUb11 *Rlv* strains. Chisq: value of the type II Wald chi squared; Df: degrees of freedom. Strain refers to wheat roots inoculated with the four *Rlv* strains or sterilized water (control). Significant result is reported in bold corresponding to P-value after FDR correction.

		Ener	go	Numeric			
Factor	Chisq	Df	P value	Chisq	Df	P value	
Strain	60.733	4	2.04E-12	3.5748	2	0.1674	









С

b







