

# **On how we got here** Florinda de Simini, Csaba Kiss

## ▶ To cite this version:

Florinda de Simini, Csaba Kiss. On how we got here. Unior<br/>Press Napoli. Studies on the history of Śaivism, 2021, 9788867192281. hal-04139752

# HAL Id: hal-04139752 https://hal.science/hal-04139752v1

Submitted on 23 Jun 2023

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés. *Śivadharmāmṛta* Essays on the Śivadharma and its Network

#### Università di Napoli L'Orientale Dipartimento Asia, Africa e Mediterraneo

The Śivadharma Project

Studies on the History of Śaivism II

> *Editor-in-Chief* Florinda De Simini

Editorial & Scientific Board

Peter C. Bisschop (Universiteit Leiden), Dominic Goodall (École Française d'Extrême-Orient), Kengo Harimoto (Università di Napoli L'Orientale), Csaba Kiss (Università di Napoli L'Orientale), Krishnaswamy Nachimuthu (École Française d'Extrême-Orient), Annette Schmiedchen (Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin), Judit Törzsök (École Pratique des Hautes Études), Margherita Trento (Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique), Yuko Yokochi (Kyoto University)





### Università di Napoli L'Orientale Dipartimento Asia, Africa e Mediterraneo

The Śivadharma Project

Studies on the History of Śaivism II

## *Śivadharmāmṛta* Essays on the Śivadharma and its Network

Florinda De Simini & Csaba Kiss (eds)



UniorPress Napoli 2021

UniorPress

Via Nuova Marina, 59 - 80133, Napoli uniorpress@unior.it



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License

ISBN 978-88-6719-228-1

Stampato in Italia

Il presente volume è stato sottoposto al vaglio di due revisori anonimi

# Table of Contents

On how we got here, by Florinda De Simini and Csaba Kiss	vii
Diversity and organisation in early Śaivism, by Hans Bakker	1
The mantra in six syllables of the Śivadharma and its place in the early history of Śaivism, by Florinda De Simini	19
On mantrasamhitā, śivaikādaśikā and related expressions: A note on awareness of mantras of the Mantramārga	(1
<i>in the Śivadharma corpus</i> , by Dominic Goodall	61
Śaiva cosmography in the Śivadharmottara, by Yuko Yokochi	73
Translating the Dharma of Śiva in sixteenth-century Chidambaram: Maṟaiñāṉa Campantar's Civatarumōttaram	
With a preliminary list of the surviving manuscripts, by Margherita Trento	101
An enquiry into the authorship of the Tamil	
Civatarumōttaram and its commentary, by Krishnaswamy Nachimuthu	145
'…not satisfied with the Mahābhārata…' (śrutvā bhāratasaṃhitām atṛptaḥ): The function of the Vṛṣasārasaṃgraha in the Śivadharma corpus, by Csaba Kiss	183
1	165
Bāṇa is blessed, Kṛṣṇa is cursed: Instances of lay Śaiva devotion in Kashmir, by Judit Törzsök	203
The Umāmaheśvarasaṃvāda of the Śivadharma	
and its network, by Nirajan Kafle	233
The dharma of gleaners in the Umāmaheśvarasamvāda: Studies	
<i>on the Śivadharma and the Mahābhārata 2</i> , by Kenji Takahashi	255
A first look at an unpublished commentary	
<i>on the Bhikṣāṭanakāvya</i> , by Alessandro Battistini	285
Bibliography	311
Index	339

### On how we got here

by Florinda De Simini and Csaba Kiss

This volume is a collection of articles that have come to fruition in the course of the first year of the SHIVADHARMA and DHARMA projects<sup>1</sup> and thus reflect the starting point of our work on the textual tradition included under the umbrella category of the 'Dharma of Śiva' and its wide sphere of influence. The first idea to conceive such a volume came on the occasion of the Kickoff Workshop of the Śivadharma Project, held in Naples from the 30th September to 2nd October 2019, during which several scholars—both project members and advisors on the project-gave presentations that we felt contained important seeds for future research developments. Therefore, despite the early stage of research the project was in back then, we almost immediately decided that we should preserve those ideas in a volume, in which those seeds could develop into full-fledged articles. In addition to that, we have included in this volume other contributions from project members that were presented and discussed on other occasions, such as the two-week reading workshop of the SHIVADHARMA project in February 2020 at the EFEO in Pondicherry, the first in a planned series of gatherings between Naples, Pondicherry and Bologna. Little did we know that our research group, along with the entire world, would soon go down a different path, and everyone would be forced to retreat from the *laukika* experience,

<sup>1</sup> European Research Council projects nos. 803624 ('Translocal Identities. The Śivadharma and the Making of Regional Religious Traditions in Premodern South Asia') and 809994 ('The Domestication of Hindu Asceticism and the Religious Making of South and South-East Asia'). like tortoises into their shells, according to a famous metaphor attested in classical Indian texts (among which our *Śivadharmottara*, 10.151).

However, in spite of (or perhaps precisely due to) the circumstances, we kept working together as usual, doubling our efforts to connect, and read and discuss each other's work, through all the means provided by technology. We feel that this continuous endeavour has paid off in several ways. On the practical side, we have made the most out of editing and studying our texts as a form of group enterprise, and our work has benefited enormously from the possibility of looking at things from different angles, and from joining our diverse expertise. We feel that this kind of group approach is enabling us to produce results that are not just the sum of individual research lines, but rather a new entity emerging from our exchange.

The 'nectar of the Śivadharma' (*śivadharmāmṛta*) that we now present to the readers mostly focuses on research around the texts that form the socalled 'Sivadharma Corpus.' It is only a fragment of the scholarship recently produced around a topic attracting increasing attention. Only very recently there has been a blossoming of studies on this subject, particularly on the Śivadharmaśāstra and the Śivadharmottara, the most widely attested texts out of the eight that we regard as the Śivadharma corpus. The first fully critical editions of chapters of the Śivadharmaśāstra appeared in Bisschop 2018 and Bisschop, Kafle and Lubin 2021, the volume that starts off the present monograph series, while editions with no apparatus (or a very basic one) of the Śivadharmaśāstra and the Śivadharmottara, with Hindi and Nepali paraphrases respectively, appeared in 2014 (Jugnū and Sarmā) and 2018 (Śarmā and Jñavālī). In 1933 the *Śivopanisad* was printed by the Adyar Library in a volume of 'unpublished' Upanisads (aprakāsitā upanisadah, under the supervision of Kunhan Raja). More recently, Kafle published a collation of two manuscripts of chapters five to nine of the Sivadharmasamgraha in the appendix to his work on the Niśvāsamukha (2020).

In the past ten years, a number of studies focusing on specific topics regarding these texts and their important manuscript tradition have appeared in relatively rapid succession: Goodall 2011, De Simini 2013\*, 2016a, 2016b and 2017, Kafle 2013 and 2019, Bisschop 2014, 2018a, 2018b, 2019a and 2019b, De Simini and Mirnig 2017, Mirnig 2019, Barois 2020. As a matter of fact, the seeds for this first harvest of Sivadharma-focused publications were sown by Alexis Sanderson, who has always generously shared his unpublished materials with students and other scholars, and highlighted the importance of the Śivadharma texts in several conversations, teaching sessions and talks. One may find some of his thoughts on the Śivadharma already being expressed in his publications as early as in Sanderson 2003-2004, and then in 2014 and 2019. A further contribution towards the

growing of *Śivadharma*-research was made by Hans Bakker and the Skandapurāņa project team members—many of whom are now working on the *Śivadharma*—thanks to their efforts of illuminating the historical context of early Śaivism in Northern India.

The work of collecting and cataloguing images of Śivadharma manuscripts spread through archives in South Asia and Europe, continuously carried out by De Simini since 2011, has certainly been one of the catalysts for research in this field. A scholar who now wants to get acquainted with the Sivadharma can do so on the basis of a relatively substantial number of identified and catalogued manuscripts and scientific contributions, to which we now add the present volume, digging even deeper into this body of literature and its vast network. The picture was certainly very different ten years ago in 2012 when De Simini was required to write the catalogue entries for the Śivadharma manuscript holdings of the Cambridge University Library and provide a bibliography on the topic. Apart from sections in the aforementioned Sanderson 2003-2004 and Goodall 2011, and some learned footnotes in Goodall 1998 and Bisschop 2006, all that was available in print were two pioneering articles by Hazra on the contents of the Śivadharmaśāstra and the Śivadharmottara, based on his reading of the Kolkata manuscripts (1954 and 1956). These articles present detailed overviews of the two texts and transcriptions of some keypassages, jointly with a table of identifications of some of their reuses in Sanskrit literature. In hindsight, Hazra's preliminary work on these texts aptly prepared the ground for what followed. Some other, less useful surveys of the contents of these works have been produced since then by Bonazzoli (1993) and Magnone (2005).

The numerous and early manuscripts of the Śivadharma are always the most reliable way to access these texts, considering that only two chapters have so far been critically edited. At a time when no printed versions of the Śivadharma corpus were available, with the notable exception of the *Śivopaniṣad*, reading manuscripts was the only way to have any understanding of what these texts were about. This was the case until 1998, when Yogi Naraharinath put together a book containing a transcription of the eight texts of the Śivadharma corpus, probably based on one of the many manuscripts preserved in Kathmandu, accompanied by his glosses in Nepali (and some politically motivated materials). This transcription contains many silent emendations, random mistakes and intentional alterations. In spite of all this, access to it has enormously helped scholars of the past two decades to get acquainted more easily with all the texts of the corpus: all of us have used Naraharinath's edition as a starting point, and this book is no exception.

Thus in 2020 we felt that the time was ripe to prepare a collected volume, consisting of contributions entirely based on primary sources and deeply rooted in previous research. Some of our articles represent pioneering research on individual texts of the Śivadharma corpus: Kafle's analysis of aspects of the Umāmaheśvarasamvāda, and Kiss' assessment of the role of the Vrsasārasamgraha in the corpus are the first contributions to ever appear on these two works. Both articles confirm the slowly emerging picture of these texts as unique mixtures of Saiva and Vaisnava (and less evidently Buddhist) teachings, possibly reflecting the religious milieu in which they were composed. Bakker outlines the historical background of the early works of the corpus by offering a compelling hypothesis on the history of the Pāśupata tradition and the emergence of the Śaiva Siddhānta and the Śivadharma therefrom. Other authors offer contributions on specific aspects of slightly better-known texts of the corpus and also of texts related to it. De Simini addresses the question of what the mantric teachings of the Sivadharmottara can reveal about the affiliations and history of that text, while Goodall, starting from a similar point, i.e., an analysis of the use of mantras in the *Śivadharmaśāstra* and the *Śivadharmottara*, investigates the possibility of the presence of any tantric, Mantramārgic influence. Yokochi studies two chapters of the *Śivadharmottara* describing Śaiva cosmography in order to strengthen the view that the target audience of the text was lay devotees. Takahashi choses the topic of the *dharma* of gleaners to examine possible links between the Umāmaheśvarasamvāda of the Śivadharma corpus and the sections of the *Mahābhārata* conventionally called the same. Törzsök shares an edition, translation and study of chapter twenty-one of the Haracaritacintāmaņi—a work profoundly related to the Śivadharma. She illustrates how the Kashmirian version of a story on *bānalingas* transformed a Krsnaite myth into a Śaiva one. Battistini presents his findings on a commentary on Utpreksāvallabha's *Bhiksātanakāvya*, a recent discovery by him, analysing historical phenomena concerning Saivism through Kāvya.

At the start of our project in December 2018, we had a relatively solid footing when it came to the Sanskrit texts of the Śivadharma; this, however, was just one side of the story. Thanks to Ganesan (2009), we knew that the *Śivadharmottara* had been translated into Tamil in the sixteenth century, and then commented upon in Tamil, but nothing more was known about that work (the *Civatarumottaram*) and its impact on Tamil Śaivism. De Simini gained access to the two rare nineteenth-century printed editions of this text and its commentary in 2015 at the Institut Français de Pondichéry; these editions (1867 and 1888) became the starting point for the work of the members of the Śivadharma Project who focus on Tamil texts. Since 2019, they have been uncovering an extensive wealth of knowledge about these

and other related Tamil texts, by reading and translating several chapters of the *Civatarumõttaram*, as well as identifying and photographing more manuscripts of our Tamil texts. We are therefore finally getting a better understanding of both the nature of this Tamil translation and the environment in which it was conceived and circulated until recent times. Trento's and Nachimuthu's contributions to our volume are the first articles to ever appear on this topic, paving the way for further scholarship.

We hope that the reader will enjoy tasting this fresh nectar of the Śivadharma that we prepared from the fruits of our work as much as we have enjoyed the process of growing and picking them. In our plans, more such works will follow, in which we aim to climb to still higher branches of the Śivadharma tree, to pluck new fruits for an even richer distillate.

#### Acknowledgements

We would like to thank all the colleagues who acted as 'blind' reviewers on the articles of this volume: Peter Bisschop, Whitney Cox, Lucas den Boer, Csaba Dezső, Marco Franceschini, Kengo Harimoto, James Hegarty, Timothy Lubin, Dorotea Operato, Ofer Peres, Francesco Sferra, and Raffaele Torella. Furthermore, we are thankful to the scholars at the EFEO-Pondicherry who provided us with materials and insights, such as SAS Sarma, R. Sathyanarayanan, T. Rajarethinam, S. Saravanan, Indra Manuel and G. Vijayavenugopal.

We are grateful for the help we always receive at the National Archives, Kathmandu, from Saubhagya Pradhananga, Jyoti Neupane, Kumar Shrestha, Manita Neupane, Rubin Shrestha, Sahan Ranjitka and others. Additionally, we want to express our gratitude to the Government Oriental Manuscript Library in Chennai, for allowing us to take pictures of previously unstudied manuscripts of the *Civatarumōttaram*, as well as to Emmanuel Francis and Eva Wilden, for sharing with our project members pictures of three manuscripts of the *Civatarumōttaram* kept at the Bibliothèque nationale de France, Paris.

We thank the European Research Council for having funded our work and making this publication possible. We acknowledge the ERC starting grant project 'Translocal Identities: The Śivadharma and the Making of Regional Religious Traditions in Premodern South Asia' (SHIVADHARMA; project no. 803624) for publishing and distributing the book. Several authors who contributed to this volume—Florinda De Simini, Dominic Goodall, Margherita Trento, Krishnaswamy Nachimuthu, Nirajan Kafle, Alessandro Battistini—are team members of the SHIVADHARMA Project, working at its three partner institutions. Csaba Kiss, co-editor of the volume and author of an article, is a team member of the DHARMA project ('The Domestication of Hindu Asceticism and the Religious Making of South and South-East Asia,' no. 809994), under Task-force D, along with Dominic Goodall and Florinda De Simini. Hans Bakker, Judit Törzsök and Yuko Yokochi are members of the advisory board of the SHIVADHARMA project; we would like to express all our gratitude to them for playing an active role in our workshops, publications and reading sessions. We would also like to use this opportunity to thank Kenji Takahashi for having been a very active collaborator of the SHIVADHARMA project during his two-year JSPS-sponsored fellowship at the University of Naples (2019-2021), and for continuing his work with us.

Our gratitude also goes to our project-coordinator, Daniela Cappello, for easing the difficult paths of administration for us; to Michael Brendan Bluett and Antonella Santoro for their editorial work on the volume, and to Mariano Cinque for typesetting the articles.

#### An updated bibliography on Śivadharma research

- Āchārya, Anil Kumār. 2014. Śivadharmasangrahah: Ādyādhyāyatrayasya Samīksātmakapāṭhasampādanam Adhyayanañca = Śivadharmasangrahah: A Critical Edition and Study of First Three Chapters. New Delhi: Eksis Books.
- Barois, Christèle. 2020. 'The Dharmaputrikā Samhitā. Preliminary Notes on an Early Text on Yoga.' Journal Of Yoga Studies 3: 5–76.
- Bisschop, Peter 2006a. *Early Śaivism and the Skandapurāņa: Sects and Centres*. Groningen Oriental Studies 21. Groningen: Forsten.
  - ——. 2014. 'Invoking the Powers That Be: The Śivadharma's Mahāśānti Mantra'. South Asian Studies 30 (2): 133–41.
    - 2015. 'Review of "Vincent Eltschinger, Buddhist Epistemology as Apologetics: Studies on the History, Self-Understanding and Dogmatic Foundations of Late Indian Buddhist Philosophy". *Indo-Iranian Journal* 58: 263–68.
  - 2018a. 'Buddhist and Śaiva Interactions in the Kali Age. The Śivadharmaśāstra as a Source of the Kāraṇḍavyūhasūtra'. *Indo-Iranian Journal* 61 (4): 396–410.

—. 2018b. Universal Śaivism: The Appeasement of All Gods and Powers in the Śāntyadhyāya of the Śivadharmaśāstra. Gonda Indological Studies 18. Leiden & Boston: Brill.

— 2019a. 'Vyāsa's Palimpsest: Tracking Processes of Transmission and Re-Creation in Anonymous Sanskrit Literature.' In *Perspective on Lived Religion. Practices – Transmission – Landscape*, edited by Nico Staring, Huw Twiston Davies, and Lara Weiss, 165–72. Papers on Archaeology of the Leiden Museum of Antiquities 21. Leiden: Sidestone Press.

— 2019b. 'Inclusivism Revisited: The Worship of Other Gods in the Sivadharmaśāstra, the Skandapurāņa, and the Niśvāsamukha'. In *Tantric Communities in Context*, edited by Nina Mirnig, Vincent Eltschinger, and Marion Rastelli, 511–37. Sitzungsberichte der Philosophisch-Historischen Klasse, 899 — Beiträge zur Kulture- und Geistesgeschichte Asiens, 99. Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften.

- Bisschop, Peter C., Nirajan Kafle, and Timothy Lubin. 2021. A Śaiva Utopia. The Śivadharma's Revision of Brahmanical Varņāśramadharma. Critical Edition, Translation & Study of the Śivāśramādhyāya of the Śivadharmaśāstra. Studies in the History of Śaivism, I. Napoli: Università degli Studi di Napoli L'Orientale, Dipartimento Asia, Africa e Mediterraneo.
- Bonazzoli, Giorgio. 1993. 'Introducing Sivadharma and Sivadharmottara'. Altorientalische Forschungen 20 (2): 342–49.
- De Simini, Florinda. 2013. \* 'Ritual Aspects and Manuscript Transmission in Premodern India: A Historical Study of Vidyādāna Through Textual Sources. With a First Critical Edition and English Translation of Śivadharmottara's Chapter Two "On the Gift of Knowledge". Torino: Università di Torino, Facoltà di Studi Orientali.
  - 2016a. Of Gods and Books: Ritual and Knowledge Transmission in the Manuscript Cultures of Premodern India. Studies in Manuscript Cultures 8. Berlin: De Gruyter.
  - —. 2016b. 'Šivadharma Manuscripts from Nepal and the Making of a Šaiva Corpus'. In One Volume Libraries: Composite and Multiple Text Manuscripts, edited by Michael Friedrich and Cosima Schwarke, 233–86. Studies in Manuscript Cultures 9. Berlin: De Gruyter.

—. 2017. 'When Lachmann's Method Meets the Dharma of Siva: Common Errors, Scribal Interventions, and the Transmission of the Sivadharma Corpus'. In *Indic Manuscript Cultures through the Ages*, edited by Vincenzo Vergiani, Daniele Cuneo, and Camillo Alessio Formigatti, 505–47. Studies in Manuscript Cultures 14. Berlin: De Gruyter.

- De Simini, Florinda, and Nina Mirnig. 2017. 'Umā and Śiva's Playful Talks in Detail (Lalitavistara): On the Production of Śaiva Works and Their Manuscripts in Medieval Nepal. Studies on the Śivadharma and the Mahābhārata 1'. In *Indic Manuscript Cultures through the Ages. Material, Textual, and Historical Investigations*, edited by Vincenzo Vergiani, Daniele Cuneo, and Camillo Alessio Formigatti, 587–653. Studies in Manuscript Cultures 14. Berlin: De Gruyter.
- Ganesan, Thiagarajan. 2009. Two Śaiva teachers of the sixteenth century: Nigamajñāna I and his disciple Nigamajñāna II. IFP-Publications Hors Série 9. Pondicherry: Institut français de Pondichéry.
- Goodall, Dominic. 1998. Bhatța Rāmakaņtha's commentary on the Kiraņatantra. vol. I, chapters 1–6 = Bhatțarāmakaņthaviracitā kiraņavrttih. Pondicherry: Institut français de Pondichéry.
- ——. 2011. 'The Throne of Worship. An Archaeological Tell of Religious Rivalries'. Studies in History 27 (2): 221–50.
- Hazra, Rajendra C. 1954. 'The Śiva-Dharma'. Journal of the Ganganatha Jha Research Institute 13: 1–20. [1952–53, issued in 1954; republished as 1983a. 'The Śiva-Dharma'. Purāņa 27 (1): 282–99.]

—. 1956. 'The Śiva-Dharmottara'. Journal of the Ganganatha Jha Research Institute 13: 19–50. [republished as 1983b. 'The Śivadharmottara'. Purāņa 27 (1): 181–210]

- Kafle, Nirajan. 2013. 'The Lingodbhava Myth in Early Śaiva Sources'. In Puspikā. Tracing Ancient India through Texts and Tradition. Contributions to Current Research in Indology. Vol. 1, edited by Nina Mirnig, Péter-Dániel Szántó, and Michael Williams, 1: 214–63. Proceedings of the First International Graduate Research Symposium (September 2009, Oxford). Oxford and Philadelphia: Oxbow Books.
  - —. 2019. 'The Krşnāşţamīvrata in the Śivadharmaśāstra: A Comparative Edition and Study.' *Indo-Iranian Journal* 62 (4): 340–83.
  - —. 2020. *Niśvāsamukhatattvasamhitā. A Preface to the Earliest Surviving Śaiva Tantra*. Collection Indologie 145. Pondicherry: Institut français de Pondichéry; École française d'Extrême-Orient.
- Kunhan, Raja Chittenjoor. 1933. Un-Published Upanisads. Adyar: The Adyar Library.
- Magnone, Paolo. 2005. 'Šivadharmottarapurāņa: A Survey.' In Epics, Khilas and Purāņas: Continuities and Ruptures. Proceedings of the Third Dubrovnik Conference on the Sanskrit Epics and Purāņas, September 2002. edited by Petteri Koskikallio, 575–96. Zagreb: Croatian Academy of Sciences and Arts.
- Mirnig, Nina. 2019. ""Rudras on Earth" on the Eve of the Tantric Age: The Śivadharmaśāstra and the Making of Śaiva Lay and Intiatory Communities'. In *Tantric Communities in Context*, edited by Nina Mirnig, Marion Rastelli, and Vincent Eltschinger, 471–510. Sitzungsberichte der Philosophisch-Historischen Klasse, 899 — Beiträge zur Kultur- und Geistesgeschichte Asiens, 99. Wien: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften.
- Naraharinath, Yogin. 1998. Śivadharma Paśupatimatam Śivadharmamahāśāstram Paśupatināthadarśanam. Kathmandu.
- Jugnū, Śrīkrṣṇa, and Bhamvar Śarmā. 2014. Śrīmadśivadharmapurāṇam (Śaivadharmasammata Upapurāṇa) (Mūlapāṭh Aur Mohanbodhinī Hindī Ṭīkā Sahit). Varanasi: Chowkhamba Sanskrit Series Office.
- Raghavan, Venkataraman. 1960. 'Tamil Versions of the Purāņas.' Purāņa, 2: 225-42.
- Śarmā, Bhāgavataprasāda, and Rītā Jňavālī. 2018. *Śivadharmottara (Śivadharma Purāņa Dvitīyakhaņḍa)*. Kathmandu: Rashtriya Abhilekhalaya.
- Sanderson, Alexis. 2003-2004. 'The Śaiva Religion among the Khmers. Part I.' *Bulletin de l'École Française'Extrême-Orient*, no 90–91: 349–462.
  - —. 2014. 'The Śaiva Literature'. *Journal of Indological Studies*, no 24 & 25 (2012-2013): 1–113.
  - —. 2019. 'How Public Was Śaivism?' In *Tantric Communities in Context*, edited by Nina Mirnig, Marion Rastelli, and Vincent Eltschinger, 1–46. Sitzungsberichte Der Philosophisch-Historischen Klasse, 899 — Beiträge zur Kultur- und Geistesgeschichte Asiens, 99. Wien: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften.
- Schwartz, Jason. 2012. 'Caught in the Net of Śāstra: Devotion and Its Limits in an Evolving Śaiva Corpus'. *Journal of Hindu Studies*, no 5.2: 210–31.

On how we got here

- Tirunelvēli Cālivāţīcuvara Ōtuvā Mūrttikaļ. 1867. Maraiňāņa Campantanāyaņār Aruļicceyta Civatarumõttaram Mūlamum Uraiyum. Tirunelvēli: Ampalavāņaņ Kavirājaravarkaļ, Ku. Civarāma Mutaliyāravarkaļ, Putūr Vaļļināyakam Piļļaiyavarkaļ.
- Tirumayilai Vittuvān Caņmukam Pilļaiyavarkaļ. 1888. Caivākamam Irupattețtiņuļ 24-Vatu Cantāna Carvõttamattin Upapētam Pati<u>nonrinu</u>ļ 8-Vatu Civatarumõttaram, Vațamoļiyi<u>ninr</u>um Maraiñāna Campantanāyanār Moļipeyarttatu. Cennai: Pu. Appācāmi Mutaliyāratu Mīnāțciyammai Kalāniti accukkūțam.