

Determining the geochemical fingerprint of the lead fallout from the Notre-Dame de Paris fire: Lessons for a better discrimination of chemical signatures

Justine Briard, Sophie Ayrault, Matthieu Roy-Barman, Louise Bordier, Maxime L'Héritier, Aurélia Azéma, Delphine Syvilay, Sandrine Baron

▶ To cite this version:

Justine Briard, Sophie Ayrault, Matthieu Roy-Barman, Louise Bordier, Maxime L'Héritier, et al.. Determining the geochemical fingerprint of the lead fallout from the Notre-Dame de Paris fire: Lessons for a better discrimination of chemical signatures. Science of the Total Environment, 2023, 864, pp.160676. 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2022.160676 . hal-03917172

HAL Id: hal-03917172 https://hal.science/hal-03917172v1

Submitted on 16 Nov 2023

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

1	Determining the geochemical fingerprint of the lead fallout from the Notre-Dame de Paris
2	fire: lessons for a better discrimination of chemical signatures
3	Justine Briard ¹ , Sophie Ayrault ^{1,*} , Matthieu Roy-Barman ^{1,†} , Louise Bordier ¹ , Maxime
4	L'Héritier ² , Aurélia Azéma ³ , Delphine Syvilay ³ , Sandrine Baron ⁴
5	1 Laboratoire des Sciences du Climat et de l'Environnement, LSCE UMR 8212, CEA – CNRS -
6	UVSQ, Université Paris Saclay, France
7	² Archéologie et Sciences de l'Antiquité, ArScAn UMR 7041, CNRS, Université Paris 8, France
8	³ Laboratoire de Recherche des Monuments Historiques, CRC USR 3224, Muséum Nationa
9	d'Histoire Naturelle - CNRS - Ministère de la Culture, France
10	⁴ Laboratoire Travaux et Recherches Archéologiques sur les Cultures, les Espaces et les
11	Sociétés, TRACES UMR 5608, CNRS - Université de Toulouse, France.
12	* Corresponding author: Sophie AYRAULT. Address: Laboratoire des Sciences du Climat et de
13	l'Environnement (LSCE), bât 714, Orme des Merisiers, CEA Saclay, 91191 Gif-sur-Yvette, France
14	Phone + 33 1 69 08 40 71; Email: sophie.ayrault@lsce.ipsl.fr
15	ORCID: 0000-0001-8320-6917 (S.A.); 0000-0002-3986-4549 (M. RB.); 0000-0003-3428-2977
16	(M L'H.); 0000-0003-1910-8903 (S.B.)
17	
18 19	
20	

- 21 † Deceased author

- Determining the geochemical fingerprint of the lead fallout from the Notre-Dame de Paris
 fire: lessons for a better discrimination of chemical signatures
- 26

27 Abstract: (300 words max)

On 2019, the fire of Notre-Dame de Paris cathedral ("NDdP") spread an unknown 28 amount of lead (Pb) dust from the roof of the cathedral over Paris. No data describing the 29 geochemical fingerprint of the roof lead, as well as no particle collected during the fire, were 30 available: a post-hoc sampling was performed. To discriminate the potential environmental 31 impact of the fire from multiple Pb sources in Paris, it was mandatory to define unequivocally 32 the fire dust geochemical signature. A dedicated and in hindsight geochemistry-based strategy 33 was developed to eliminate any source of potential contamination due to sampling substrates 34 or previously deposited dust. Radiogenic Pb isotopic signatures (²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb and ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁶Pb 35 36 ratios) and elemental ratios were determined in 23 Pb-rich samples collected inside NDdP. We determined that the dust collected on wood substrates on the first floor was most 37 representative of fire emissions. These samples were the analyzed for the 4 Pb isotopes (204, 38 206, 207, 208) and the fire dust signature is characterized by ratio values of ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb: 1.1669 39 - 1.1685, ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁶Pb: 2.0981-2.1095, ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁴Pb: 38.307 - 38.342, ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁴Pb: 15.633 -40 15.639 and ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁴Pb: 18.242 – 18.275. In addition, the fire dust presents typical element-41 to-Pb ratio. This fingerprint was compared to the signatures of the known local Pb sources. 42 The geochemical fingerprint of the fire is significantly different from that of the dominant 43 44 urban Pb source. This will allow future evaluation of the contribution of the fire to Paris Pb pollution and of the real extent of the area affected by the Pb-containing dust plume. 45 Moreover, the geographical origin of Pb used to for the roof restauration and the spire 46

47	building was identified. These findings open new ways to study the Pb sources in historical
48	monuments for environmental impacts evaluation, as well as for historical perspectives.
49	Keywords: historical monuments; lead isotopes; metals; environmental pollution; tracing
50	pollution
51	

53 1. Introduction

Limiting lead pollution in an urban context is a major societal issue because this 54 neurotoxic metal has significant consequences on health, especially for children (e.g., Laidlaw 55 and Taylor, 2011; Landrigan et al., 2017). Notre-Dame de Paris cathedral (hereafter noted 56 "NDdP"), an emblematic monument of the Gothic architecture, is an iconic French monument. 57 58 The fire that took place on April 15, 2019, destroyed a large part of its lead-made roof and spire. During the following days, citizens and the scientific community took great interest in 59 lead (Pb) pollution in the Parisian environment (Smith et al., 2020; van Geen et al., 2020; Vallée 60 et al., 2021). A tentative estimation suggests that 150 kg of Pb was spread during the fire 61 (Tognet and Truchot, 2019). Another study, based on the analysis of various soil samples, 62 63 estimated that the fire plume deposited one ton of Pb within 1 km of the cathedral, suggesting that most of the fallouts occurred at a short distance of the cathedral (van Geen et al., 2020). 64 A study was performed, involving adults living or working in the nearby of the cathedral, to 65 highlight a variation in blood Pb levels (BLL). No increase in BLL was observed (Vallée et al., 66 67 2021), tending to show that the fire emission did not affect the Parisian population. The reality of an environmental impact of the fire is less clear. The analysis of dusts and soils collected in 68 tree pits, parks and streets surrounding NDdP tends to show higher Pb concentrations for the 69 70 samples collected under the plume (van Geen et al., 2020). Nevertheless, high Pb 71 concentrations around NDdP after the fire do not necessarily mean that the fire is now the main source of Pb to Parisian soil. Indeed, a considerable spatial heterogeneity of the urban 72 73 contamination results from the mixture of sources changing over time and space and from 74 accumulation and erosion mechanisms (van Geen et al., 2020).

75 Lead contamination in Paris is an old story as seen in other major cities even though the drivers of contamination (past use of Pb additives in gasoline, deterioration of exterior 76 paint, industrial emission, water supply) may differ from one city to another depending on its 77 historical development (Delile et al., 2016, Laidlaw et al. 2017; Delile et al, 2017). The ban of 78 leaded gasoline and other lead-containing products (e.g., lead paints) has drastically reduced 79 80 the concentration of Pb worldwide (e.g., Shotyk et al., 2005; Marx et al., 2016). However, 81 pervasive contamination is still observed in urban environments, such as Paris (France) and London (UK) cities, where many sources of Pb still exist (e.g., roofs, paintings, waste 82 incinerators) (Ayrault et al., 2012, 2014; Resongles et al., 2021). To evaluate the potential 83 84 impacts of the NDdP fire, it is therefore essential to accurately define the geochemical fingerprint of the fire by its Pb isotopic signature (Cheng and Hu, 2010; Ayrault et al., 2012; 85 86 Rosca et al., 2018) and by its elemental signature (Font et al., 2015; Lin et al., 2015). Such an 87 extended fingerprint is required in the context of urban environments where the Pb concentration alone cannot demonstrate the environmental impact of leaded roofs, an 88 approach that proved valuable only in rural contexts where no other Pb source is observed 89 (Jørgensen and Willems, 1987). 90

Consequently, the use of Pb isotope ratios is mandatory to identify the origin of the high Pb concentrations. Indeed honey samples were collected in Paris in the months following the fire and their composition (Pb isotopes and elements) was analyzed (Smith et al., 2020). Even though the median Pb isotope ratio of the honey samples (median ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb ratio of 1.157±0.003) similar to the signature of the Pb urban background of Paris (²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb ratio of 1.157±0.003, Ayrault et al., 2014), the Pb content of the honey collected under the plume trajectory was attributed to the NDdP fire (Smith et al., 2020). Such a conclusion cannot be

98 drawn without a comparison of the environmental samples with the fire emission signature.
99 Unfortunately, no atmospheric particle was sampled during the fire.

100 Glorennec et al. (2021) determined the Pb isotope ratio in dust collected during July 2020 with wet wipes on different substrates inside NDdP (n=8) and roof remains (n=8). The 101 sampling method used did not allow any elemental analysis or observations of the collected 102 material, which could better constrain the fire emission signature or eliminate the risk of 103 contamination of the samples with pre-fire dust. The determined fire isotopic signature 104 $(^{206}Pb/^{207}Pb: 1.167 \pm 0.005)$ was considered ambiguous, preventing any evaluation of the 105 106 potential impact of the fire due to the overlapping signature of other Parisian Pb sources. 107 Nevertheless, we notice that this signature is different from today's urban Pb signature, which is distinctly low due to the imprint of leaded gasoline used during the second half of the 20th 108 109 century.

To strip away the ambiguity about the environmental of NDdP fire, we performed a 110 complete geochemical study (elemental and Pb isotope signatures (²⁰⁴Pb, ²⁰⁶Pb, ²⁰⁷Pb, ²⁰⁸Pb)) 111 112 using all the available dust samples collected inside the cathedral. First, (1) we developed an 113 appropriate step-by-step strategy to reveal the samples most representative of the fire emission. In addition, we proposed a robust protocol for future dust sampling in historical 114 monuments. The objective is to be able to compare the data in the future (between 115 116 monuments, after restoration works, and in case of another tragedy). (2) After selecting the samples representative of the dust emitted during the fire, we determined the geochemical 117 signature of the leaded particles emitted by the fire. We compared the NDdP fire fingerprint 118 with the different Pb sources already identified in the Parisian environment, to help with 119 120 future environmental evaluation. (3) The geographical origin of the Pb ores used during the

restauration of the burnt roof and the construction of the spire was established. It is of interest
 for historical studies of Pb circulation during the 19th century.

123 A large range of elements were analyzed on the diverse samples collected in NDdP: the elements commonly analyzed in an urban context, such as Cd, Cu, Sb, and Pb (Le Gall et al., 124 2018; Smith et al., 2019), as well as elements, such as Ag, Sn and Bi, which can be associated 125 with Pb in historical monuments (Sylvilay et al., 2015; L'Héritier et al., 2016; Comite et al., 126 2019). In addition, to document the signature of Pb used during the first stages of NDdP 127 building, the Pb stable isotope ratio was also measured on "construction" Pb samples from 128 129 Sainte-Chapelle and Chartres Cathedral, monuments contemporaneous to NDdP whose roofs have already burnt down (Shelby, 1981; Cohen, 2008). 130

131 2. Historical context

132 NDdP, located on the "Ile de la Cité" in the 4th arrondissement of Paris, is an 133 emblematic monument in France (Figure 1A and 1B). Its construction was initiated in the 134 second half of the 12th century by Maurice de Sully, who designed an exceptional monument 135 that was 127 m long, 40 m wide and 33 m high (Figure 1C) and was the largest Christian 136 monument at that time.



Figure. 1. Geographic context of Notre-Dame de Paris. A. Picture and B. location of this monument in
 Paris city. C. Map of Notre-Dame de Paris cathedral (modified after Aubert, 1920) and location of
 samples collected in this study (illustrated by the letters).

At the time of this study, NDdP was not yet accessible for sampling Pb joints, which are usually implemented in medieval construction to bind stones or seal iron armatures in early NDdP construction campaigns. Two major monuments coeval with original phases of construction of NDdP (late 12th-mid. 13th centuries) and located in the same region were chosen to determine the extent of the medieval Pb isotopic signature: Chartres cathedral (beg. 13th century) and the Sainte-Chapelle of Paris (mid. 13th century).

147 **3. Materials and Methods**

148 3.1 Fire dust and lead metal sampling

No NDdP sample was collected directly in the smoke plume or around the cathedral 149 during or just after the fire. Indeed, intensive washing of the forecourt and roadway was 150 conducted over the following days. In addition, access into the cathedral for scientists for dust 151 152 sampling was denied until June 2019, where access was extremely limited. The fire dust 153 deposited in the cathedral appeared to be the most appropriate material to represent the Pb particles likely to contaminate the environment, rather than sampling metallic remains of the 154 burnt roof, which can exhibit different geochemical signatures depending on their 155 construction and restoration phases (L'Héritier et al., 2016; Glorennec et al., 2021). Ideally, 156 the dust samples should have been collected immediately after the fire and only on dedicated 157 supports previously tested for their low element content. In practice, dust samples were 158 159 collected whenever and wherever it was possible from June 2019 to February 2020 on several substrates (wood, metal, glass, fabric – described in Table S1) at the ground and first floors 160 (Fig. 1). Dust from the vaults falling on the ground with the spire collapse was also collected. 161

Dust was collected with a polypropylene spatula, and the material was stored in a tightly closed polyethylene box. To clarify the comparison with previously published data, Glorennec et al. (2021) further sampled dust by using wet wipes at 8 of the 16 sites in the present study.

Subsequent binocular magnifying glass observations of the collected dusts highlight 165 166 the presence of a "fiber and dust" fraction in 4 samples in addition to the "only dust" fraction 167 present in all samples, e.g., the ND160919-01 sample collected on the stained-glass window revealed dust trapped in a fiber aggregate (Table S1). The two different matrices were 168 analyzed separately. The "fiber and dust" fraction is collected from the original sample box 169 170 with a plastic clamp; the latter is gently shaken to remove as much dust as possible from the fibers, and then the fibrous aggregate is placed in another plastic box. In addition, a paint 171 172 fragment was identified and isolated in the dust of sample ND160919-01 collected on the stained glass window during microscopic observation. Two crusts of melted Pb were sampled 173 using a chisel at 2 sites of the vaults (Table S1). To summarize, 23 samples are analyzed in this 174 study: 16 "dust" samples, 4 "fiber and dust" subsamples, 2 "crust" samples and 1 "painting" 175 176 fragment sample.

Metallic Pb samples of less than 1 cm in size were cut with a chisel on Pb joints directly in the studied buildings: Chartres cathedral (n=14) and the Sainte-Chapelle of Paris (n=8). These Pb samples were first analyzed by LA-ICP–MS to determine their element concentrations (L'Héritier et al., 2016). Then, Pb samples with low Sn contents (< 10 mg kg⁻¹), which are unlikely to come from recycling (Wyttenbach et al., 1973), were selected for Pb isotopic analysis.

183 *3.2. Sample preparation*

184 A total digestion procedure was applied (Le Gall et al., 2018). Samples (~1 to 12 mg) were introduced into closed PTFE beakers heated on a hot block (Digiprep, SCP Science) with 185 ultra-pure concentrated acids (67% HNO₃: Normatom grade, VWR; 34-37% HCl, 47-51% HF, 186 65-71% HClO₄: TraceMetal grade, Fisher Scientific). The first step consisted of adding 4 mL HF 187 188 and 2 mL HClO₄ for 6 hours at 150 °C, followed by evaporation to dryness. Second, aqua regia 189 (5 mL) was added to the beakers heated at 120 °C for 3 hours. One mL of HNO₃ was added to 190 the solution which was evaporated near dryness (3 times) before it was made up to 50 mL in HNO₃ 0.5 N. The accuracy of the measured concentrations was checked using two certified 191 192 reference materials (CRM: IAEA lake sediment SL-1 and IRMM road dust BCR-723) and a 193 chemical blank.

194 Construction Pb samples were first scoured with a scalpel blade to remove the 195 encrustation. A second scalpel blade was used to take 20 to 50 mg of pure Pb. These Pb pieces 196 were cleaned 3 times with 1 mL of 5 N HNO₃ for 10 min. The cleaned pieces were then partly 197 dissolved in 1 mL of 5 N HNO₃ for 10 min, and the solution was collected using a pipette.

198 3.3. Elemental composition analysis

Element concentrations were determined using a Thermo Scientific[™] iCAP[™] TQ ICP− 199 200 MS equipped with a Peltier cooled cyclonic spray chamber, glass concentric nebulizer (400 µL min⁻¹) and 2.5 mm internal diameter quartz torch in Laboratory LSCE (Gif-Sur-Yvette, France). 201 Two different measurement modes were selected in this study depending on the analyte 202 203 analyzed and its interferants (Table S2). The certified riverine water standard SRM-1640a (National Institute for Standard Technology, NIST, USA) is additionally used to judge the 204 calibration curve essential to propose concentration values. The concentration values 205 206 obtained for the CRMs were within 15% of the certified values, and within 10% (except Mg and Al: 30 %) for BCR-723 and SL-1, respectively. The standard deviation (SD) was lower than
5% except for Ag (10 %). For more details, see the Supporting Information.

209 3.4. Lead isotope composition analysis

LSCE: Pb isotope ratios (²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁶Pb and ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb) were analyzed in the solutions that 210 211 were also used for Pb concentration determinations. Analyses were also made with a Thermo 212 Scientific[™] iCAP[™] TQ ICP–MS in Laboratory LSCE (Gif-Sur-Yvette, France). Mass bias and drift of the isotope ratios were corrected based on repeated measurements of the Pb reference 213 214 material NIST SRM-981 that were analyzed between every two samples. The certified values used for the SRM-981 calculation are ${}^{206}Pb/{}^{207}Pb = 1.0933 \pm 0.0004$ and ${}^{208}Pb/{}^{206}Pb = 2.1681$ 215 \pm 0.0008. The 2 σ errors (2SD) of isotope ratios are 0.29% and 0.27% for the ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb and 216 217 ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁶Pb ratios, respectively. The digestion blank was lower than 0.2 ng mL⁻¹, while the analyzed solutions were at 2 ng mL⁻¹ after 100-100000 times dilution of the digestion solution. 218 The ${}^{206}Pb/{}^{207}Pb$ and ${}^{208}Pb/{}^{206}Pb$ ratio measured for the CRM agree with the published values: 219 220 0.13% and 0.09%, 0.16% and 0.16%, for IAEA lake sediment SL-1 and IRMM road dust BCR-221 723, respectively (Table S3).

222 SARM: Among the whole samples batch, 11 were chosen to measure all the Pb isotopic ratios. These aliquots - which contain ~ 4 ng of Pb each - were sent to the SARM laboratory, 223 224 a National Service of CNRS (https://sarm.cnrs.fr). After evaporation, each residue was taken 225 back in bromidic acid (HBr) solution and loaded on anionic resin (AG1X8) to separate Pb from sample matrix (Manhes et al., 1980). Samples were analysed by using an MC-ICP-MS 226 equipment (Neptune+ from Thermo). The NIST SRM 981 and NIST 997 TI reference materials 227 (ratio 1/10) were used to correct the instrumental mass bias (White et al., 2000). Values used 228 229 for both reference materials were taken from Thirlwall (2002). The total procedural blank is

- 230 negligible in the entire session. The NIST-SRM 981 Pb precision and accuracy of all the reported
- isotopic ratios are better than 250 ppm (2SD). The ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁶Pb and ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb ratio results
- obtained at LSCE and SARM are in good agreement (supplement information, Fig S1.1).

233 **4. Results**

234 *4.1. Elemental composition of NDdP samples*

The Pb concentrations of the NDdP samples ranged from 24.6 to 967.9 g kg⁻¹ (median: 160 g kg⁻¹; S3; Figure 2). The concentrations of the samples collected on wood, fabric, stained glass, metal substrates and the painting fragment were very close to the median value compared to the samples collected on crusts and in the vault dusts, where the Pb concentrations were 3 times higher.



240

Fig. 2. Bivariate concentration plots of selected element concentrations versus Pb concentrations for NDdP samples collected from 2019–2020 by the LRMH laboratory (unit: mg kg⁻¹). Each color corresponds to a substrate type where the dust samples were collected (brown = wood; black = vault dusts; yellow = crust; gray = metal; pink = painting; blue = fabric; green = stained glass) and the symbol corresponding to the level of collected substrate in NDdP (square = Ground floor; circle = First floor; hexagon = Vaults). The sample matrix is represented by the outline color of the dots; the black outlines correspond to the dust-only fraction, and the red outlines correspond to the fiber and dust fraction.

248

For the other elements, the concentration depended on the substrate (Figure 2). This

249 was particularly the case for Fe and V, where the most concentrated samples were collected

on the metal substrate. The samples with the highest concentrations in Cu, Cd, Sn and Sb,

were collected on wood substrate. The samples collected on crusts and vault dusts were enriched in Ag and Bi. Moreover, Ti and Zn concentrations were very variable, with a single sample collected on wood rich in titanium and a single sample collected on a crust rich in zinc. Al concentrations are generally higher, especially for the dusts collected on the fabric and on the stained glass and with the exception of the two crust samples. Concentrations of the other measured elements are given in Table S4.

4.2. NDdP samples and other historical monuments lead isotope compositions

258 Each sample analyzed for elements was also measured for radiogenic Pb isotopes to determine the ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁶Pb and ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb ratios at LSCE (Figure 3). The ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb values 259 range between 1.1584 ± 0.0040 and 1.1780 ± 0.0033 (median: 1.1684) and ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁶Pb values 260 ranging between 2.0896 ± 0.0057 and 2.1051 ± 0.0113 (median: 2.0971). The isotopic results 261 262 highlighted two endmembers depending on the substrate. The first isotopic endmember characterized by a high ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁶Pb ratio and a low ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb ratio was represented by the 263 264 samples collected on the outdoor crusts and a sample collected on the wood substrate, while the second isotopic endmember characterized by a low ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁶Pb ratio and a high ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb 265 ratio was represented by the painting fragment and the samples collected on the stained glass 266 window and metal substrate (Figure 3; Table S4). The Pb isotope ratios of samples collected 267





270	Fig. 3. Lead isotopic compositions of all NDdP samples from this study. The symbol corresponds to
271	the level of collected substrate in NDdP (square = ground floor; circle = first floor; hexagon = vaults),
272	and the color corresponds to substrate type where samples were collected in cathedral (brown =
273	wood; black = vault dusts; yellow = crust; gray = metal; pink = painting; blue = fabric; green = stained
274	glass). The sample matrix is represented by the outline color of the dots; the black outlines correspond
275	only to the dust fraction, and the red outlines correspond to the fiber and dust fraction.
276	The samples representative for the NDdP fire dust (n=9, see section 5.1) were also
277	measured for Pb isotopes to determine the ratios 208 Pb/ 204 Pb, 207 Pb/ 204 Pb and 206 Pb/ 240 Pb
278	ratios at SARM. The Pb isotopic signatures average (median values) 18.252 \pm 0.001 for
279	206 Pb/ 204 Pb, 15.634 ± 0.002 for 207 Pb/ 204 Pb and 38.307 ± 0.007 for 208 Pb/ 204 Pb (Table S7).

280 4.3. Lead isotope compositions of lead artifacts from other historical monuments

The Pb isotopic signatures obtained in construction Pb of the Sainte-Chapelle ranged between 1.1760 \pm 0.0089 and 1.1856 \pm 0.0138 (median: 1.1829) for ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb values and between 2.0736 \pm 0.0086 and 2.1011 \pm 0.0259 (median: 2.0828) for ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁶Pb values. They are generally consistent with the Chartres cathedral results, with values ranging between 1.1793 \pm 0.0065 and 1.1882 \pm 0.0103 (median: 1.1858) for ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb ratios and between 2.0616 \pm 0.0202 and 2.0914 \pm 0.0139 (median: 2.0771) for ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁶Pb ratios (Table S5).

287 **5. Discussion**

288 5.1. Defining the dust samples representative of the NDdP fire emissions

289 Knowing that no dust sample could be directly sampled in the plume, our first purpose 290 is thus to select samples representative of the dust emitted during the fire and to propose a 291 sampling scheme that could be applied to historical monuments.

292 The first step of the procedure is the binocular observations, which allowed to separate the mixture of fibers and dust for 4 samples revealed primarily a homogeneity of the Pb 293 isotope ratios (Figure S1) unrelated to the substrate but lower elemental concentrations 294 compared to the "only dust" fraction (Figure S2; Table S6), which may suggest dilution and/or 295 296 contamination of the NDdP fire signature by the presence of fibers. The elemental content and the Pb isotope ratio obtained for the "only dust" fraction with respect to the data 297 298 obtained in the "fiber and dust" fraction are discussed in depth in the Supporting Information. Following this discussion, we will focus on the "only dust" more representative of the NDdP 299 fire for the remainder of this discussion. 300

The second step relies on the elemental analysis data, to infer any contamination from the sampling substrate (Fig. 2). The observed large concentration scattering can be linked to

a potential contamination originating from the substrate. Such contamination is well known,
and for atmospheric particle collection, inert (plastic) substrates are recommended (Amodio
et al., 2014). This is potentially the case for crust samples. SampleND140619-01 was collected
on ridge crest reinforcements and could only represent the local melted Pb. ND140619-04 was
collected on an outdoor upper surface stone where current urban pollution is plausible. Thus,
These two samples were no more considered.

The vault dust (ND080719-02) collected indoor on the pavement of NDdP could be a mixture of the fire emissions with rubble and other various debris coming from the structure of NDdP roof. The elemental composition of the painting fragment isolated in the dust of sample ND160919-01 testifies to a local signature characteristic of one paint used during one of the numerous renovation episodes of NDdP and cannot represent the fire signature.

314 Elemental concentrations lower than the average of content were found for 3 dust samples: sample ND160919-04 collected on iron armatures, sample ND160919-01 collected 315 316 on stained glass and sample ND140619-07 collected fabrics (Fig. 2). The first one presents 317 high Fe concentration while the two later present high Al content (Fig. 2). These high Fe and 318 Al concentrations may evidence contamination by the substrate, implying a less obvious contamination for other elements. Moreover, several Pb sources can originate from the 319 stained glass windows: anti-rust paints of the iron armatures, Pb joints of the window 320 321 masonry and Pb cames. Thus, these three samples were discarded.

To approach the fire signature, it is essential to focus on an inert substrate. Figure 2 shows that the samples collected on wood show very consistent elemental content. Wood is naturally poor in metals, except in areas with high metal contamination (Watmough and Hutchinson, 1996; Yu et al., 2007; Sawidis et al., 2011). Previous studies exhibited

concentrations ranging from 0.1 - 5, 5 - 10, 0.5 - 30 and 1 - 20 mg kg⁻¹ for Pb, Zn, Cu and Ni, respectively, in Scots pine and Norway spruce wood (Harju et al, 1996; Saarela et al., 2005). These values are far lower than the concentrations in NDdP dust. Thus, the potential contamination of the samples by the wood substrate is considered negligible. By estimating that the elemental signature of the NDdP fire corresponds only to the dust fraction of the 9 samples collected on wood furniture, the Pb concentration range was between 70.9 and 281.6 g kg⁻¹ (median: 181 g kg⁻¹), which is the most concentrated element (Fig. 2; Table S4).

333 To refine the choice of the samples most representative of the fire emission, we 334 combined the elemental ratios with the Pb isotopic ratios. To understand the isotopic variability of the dust collected on the wood substrate (Fig. 3), we questioned the impact of 335 336 the dust location in the building; namely the ground floor, the first floor or the vault. We observed that the height of the sample in the cathedral affects the Pb isotopic signature: high 337 isotopic values in ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb for dust sampled at ground level and low isotopic values in 338 ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb for samples collected at the first floor (Fig. 3). A potential contamination by 339 340 preexisting accumulated dust can explain this difference between the samples of the first floor 341 and the ground floor. Indeed, while it is complex to estimate the cleaning frequency of all the substrates, the wood-made furniture (such as the altar or the seats) are frequently dusted. 342 343 This is particularly true for the organist bench (ND140619-06) which is known to be frequently 344 cleaned and the organist was notably performing on the evening of the fire. Furthermore, this 345 isotopic difference could also have been produced by a heterogeneous air flow and dust 346 deposition between upper (first floor) and lower parts (ground floor) during the fire. In 347 particular, the spire fall could have caused the fall of coarser dust (i.e., stone and wood debris) on the lower parts. As a consequence, the dust collected on the cathedral ground floor was 348 349 not composed only of fire dust. Indeed, with the exception of Zn and Al, the samples from the

ground floor seem to have lower Cu, Cd, Sn, Sb, Pb and Bi concentrations than the samples collected on the first floor, although the difference is subtler (Figure 2). These lower element concentrations can be explained by a considerable dilution by the important quantity of coal and rubble in the dust collected at the ground floor. Consistently with the elemental data, the dust collected on the wood substrate of the first floor shows very congruent Pb isotopic measurements.



356

Fig. 4. ²⁰⁶**Pb**/²⁰⁷**Pb** ratio of all analyzed NDdP dusts as a function of the 1/[Pb] ratio (kg mg⁻¹). The symbol corresponds to the level of collected substrate in NDdP (square = ground floor; circle = first floor; hexagon = vaults), and the color corresponds to substrate type where samples were collected in cathedral (brown = wood; black = vault dusts; yellow = crust; gray = metal; pink = painting; blue = fabric; green = stained glass). The sample matrix is represented by the outline color of the dots; the black outlines correspond only to the dust fraction, and the red outlines correspond to the fiber and dust fraction.

364 We conclude that the fire signature can be better approached by the dust collected on

365 the wood substrate of the first floor. Figure 4 shows that these samples (brown circles) design

366 a clearly defined and sharp area with converging Pb isotope ratio and high Pb content. This

367 area is very distinct from the one grouping the other samples collected in NDdP. Those 368 samples, while having a very scattered Pb content, have quite homogeneous Pb isotope ratio 369 which could be interpreted as the signature of the Pb present in the NDdP indoor dust before 370 the fire. The validation of this hypothesis would need a dedicated work, which may rely on a 371 comprehensive comparison of the geochemical signature of dust collected in coeval unburnt 372 monuments such The Sainte Chapelle (Paris).

373 5.2. Identifying and tracing the leaded NDdP fire emissions in the Parisian environment

374 The most appropriate samples (i.e., collected on wood substrate at the first floor) defined the signature of the NDdP fire with values in 206 Pb/ 207 Pb between 1.1655 ± 0.0025 and 375 1.1684 ± 0.0043) and values in ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁶Pb between 2.0961 \pm 0.0042 and 2.0961 \pm 0.0113 with 376 median values at 1.1664 ± 0.0034 and 2.1000 ± 0.0051 respectively. These ratio values are 377 consistent with those proposed by Glorennec et al. (2021) for dust samples ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb ratio: 378 1.167 ± 0.005. Among the 8 dust samples collected by Glorennec et al (2021), 4 are out of the 379 380 area defining the NDdP fire signature because of outliers in the determination of the ratio ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁶Pb (Fig. 5). The here determined signature of the NDdP fire is more accurate, opening 381 the way to a reliable evaluation of its uniqueness among the other sources of Pb in the Parisian 382 environment. 383

During the 20th century, three Pb signatures were identified in Paris city (Ayrault et al., 2012): (1) Pb used during the 19th century for Haussmann's renovation of Paris city, imported from Spain (Lestel, 2012), imprinting the Seine River sediment before 1960 and after 2000 which ${}^{206}Pb/{}^{207}Pb$ ratio is $\approx 1.1650 \pm 0.0025$ and ${}^{208}Pb/{}^{206}Pb$ ratio is $\approx 2.1047 \pm 0.0046$ (Ayrault et al., 2012); (2) Pb used in leaded gasoline (${}^{206}Pb/{}^{207}Pb = 1.08 \pm 0.02$ and ${}^{208}Pb/{}^{206}Pb$ ratio is \approx 2.18 \pm 0.02 (Monna et al., 1997; Véron et al., 1999)), used until its ban on 2000, containing

390 high proportions of Australian Pb from the Broken Hill mine; and (3) the local natural background signature (²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb=1.201 ± 0.001, ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁶Pb=2.0527 ± 0.0020; (Elbaz-391 Poulichet et al., 1986)), which appears negligible in downtown Paris but can be detected in 392 less urbanized areas. A fourth Pb source, the dominant Pb isotopic signature in Paris street 393 dust, called the "urban" Pb, is characterized by relatively high ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁶Pb ratios (range: 2.088– 394 2.115; median: 2.107) and low ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb ratios (range: 1.142–1.166; median: 1.155) (Figs 4 395 and 5) and represents a mixture of urban Pb and leaded gasoline (Ayrault et al., 2014). Indeed, 396 397 the pervasive contamination of the urban environment due to banned leaded gasoline was also observed in London (Resongles et al., 2021). 398

Not surprisingly, the signature of the NDdP fire is far from the geochemical local 399 background. The fire Pb signature of the burnt roof (XIXe) is logically different from the 400 401 construction Pb signatures (Fig. 5). The age of historical monuments whose signatures are showed oscillates between the 12th and 13th centuries (e.g., Sainte-Chapelle in Paris and 402 Chartres Cathedral; Table S5) and the 17th century (Versailles Palace; Pons-Branchu et al., 403 2015) with ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb ratios ranging between 1.1760 ± 0.0089 (Sainte-Chapelle de Paris) and 404 405 1.1882 ± 0.0103 (Chartres Cathedral) (Table S5; Figure 5). Three of the 8 undated Pb artifacts collected by Glorennec et al. (2021) lie in this area drawn by the $12^{th} - 17^{th}$ construction Pbs. 406

Most importantly, the NDdP fire geochemical signature is significantly different from today's urban Pb signature (Fig. 5) represented by municipal solid waste combustors (Widory et al., 2004) and wastewater suspended particle matter (Ayrault et al, 2012). On the opposite, the "urban" signature is found on PM₁₀ fine particles collected in Paris in 2003 (Widory et al., 2004) and in honey produced in Paris and collected within 6 months after the fire (Smith et al., 2020). Despite their high Pb content, it shows that the honey samples did not register the

- 413 NDdP fire emissions but the pervasive urban Pb. Indeed, soils and honeys are potentially likely
- 414 to collect all the urban Pb sources present in Paris before, during and after the fire.

415

416



417

Fig. 5. Lead isotopic composition of all analyzed NDdP samples and historical monuments (SainteChapelle and Chartres Cathedral) from this study compared with local anthropogenic sources, and
other historical monuments. Dust and Pb artifacts from a previous study collected in NDdP are also
shown (purple circles and stars, Glorennec et al., 2021). Other sources include Versailles Palace (PonsBranchu et al., 2015), Paris honey (Smith et al., 2020), fine particles (Widory et al., 2004), municipal
solid waste combustors (Widory et al., 2004), wastewater suspended particle matter (Ayrault et al,
2012)and separate Seine River signatures with ratios obtained between 1920-1960 in 1986 in 2000

(Ayrault et al., 2012) and the Seine River flood in 2016 (Le Gall et al., 2018). The typical errors of NDdP
 samples (this work) are lower than 0.0044 and 0.0078 in ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb and ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁶Pb, respectively.

The NDdP fire Pb isotope signature is close to the isotopic signature of the Seine River 427 sediments collected after 2000 (Ayrault et al., 2012). The Seine River Pb contamination results 428 429 from the Pb used during the construction of the Hausmannian Paris, which is contemporaneous of the last large restauration of the NDdP roof. We hypothesize that the Pb 430 used for the NDdP restauration and its spire construction was of the same origin as Pb used 431 for the Hausmann buildings. Therefore, it will be fundamental to couple the elemental ratios 432 and the Pb isotope ratio, and may be also carbon isotopes (Widory et al, 2004) to evaluate the 433 impact of the NDdP fire on the Seine River sediment contamination. 434

435 The NDdP fire dust concentrations of Pb and some elements are clearly higher than those found in an urban context (Pio et al., 2013; Font et al., 2015; Smith et al., 2019; 2020). 436 Some are companion elements of Pb (Cu, Ag, Sb, Bi). Consistently, the concentration of Pb and 437 the concentrations of these elements are correlated (Table 1). Tin (Sn) presents also high 438 concentrations in the NDdP fire dust. van Geen et al. (2020) also noted high Sn concentration 439 in the soil samples collected at the proximity of the cathedral and suggested that the Sn/Pb 440 441 ratio could be used as a fire marker. Unfortunately, no Sn-Pb correlation was found in the dust 442 samples representative of the NDdP fire, preventing the use of Sn/Pb ratios as a fire marker. 443 The origin of Sn in the NDdP fire dust can be the anti-corrosion coating applied on the Pb tables and/or the use of Sn in solder used for welding. These diverse uses of Sn may explain 444 why Sn and Pb are not correlated. 445

The elemental ratios for the NDdP fire dust are compared to ratios observed in urban environmental atmospheric particle and street dust samples Table 1). In literature, several elemental ratios are used to trace the road traffic signature in urban environments. Indeed,

449	road traffic is an important source of inorganic contaminants to the Parisian environment
450	(Gasperi et al., 2021), and elemental ratios are powerful tools to examine the impact of traffic-
451	related metal and metalloid sources (e.g., Charlesworth et al., 2011). The Sb/Cu ratio, widely
452	used in tunnels (Lin et al., 2015), ranges between 0.08 and 0.88 with an average of 0.16 (Gillies
453	et al., 2001; Pio et al., 2013). The Sb/Cu ratio of NDdP is 0.10±0.02 (0.07 – 0.12), which is not
454	distinct enough from the road traffic signature to be use as a NDdP fire marker. Interestingly,
455	the NDdP Sb/Cu ratio appears to be higher than the Sb/Cu ratio of 0.021 determined from
456	elemental data from the Parisian honey study (Smith et al., 2020), confirming that the honey
457	collected within 6 months after the fire did not register the fire emissions. The Sn/Cu ratio can
458	also be used to trace the road traffic signature.

Table 1. Elemental ratio calculated for the NDdP fire signature obtained for the 9 samples representative of the NDdP fire (Pearson test < 0.05) and values proposed in the literature.

		٦	This study				
Ratio	Median	SD	Range	R²	p value	Parisian honey (Smith et al., 2020)	Tunnel dust (Lin et al., 2015)
Cu/Pb	0.0066	0.001	0.0053 - 0.0084	0.71	0.004	5.16	-
Sb/Pb	0.00069	0.00009	0.00054 - 0.00083	0.70	0.005	0.114	-
Cd/Pb	0.00027	0.00006	0.00022 - 0.00039	0.47	0.042	0.011	-
Bi/Pb	0.00013	0.00001	0.00011 - 0.00015	0.92	< 0.0001	-	-
Ag/Pb	0.00005 7	0.000009	0.000042 - 0.000075	0.82	0.001	-	-
Sb/Cu	0.10		0.07 – 0.12	0.88	0.029	0.021	0.08-0.88

⁴⁶¹

462 To conclude, these findings leave some space to use Pb isotopes as an indicator of the 463 presence or absence of NDdP fire Pb in Parisian environment (streets, playgrounds ...), at least in favorable cases (i.e., low pre-fire Pb contamination). Element (Cu, Sb, Ag, Bi) to Pb
 concentration ratio can be used as additional marker of the fire dust deposition extent.

466 5.3. Locating the ore origin(s) of the burnt roof.

To identify the geographic origin of the Pb of the Notre Dame fire dust, the ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁴Pb 467 versus ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁴Pb ratio and ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁴Pb versus ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁴Pb ratio were performed (Table S7) to 468 refine the characterization by the use of ²⁰⁴Pb, which is stable since the Earth formation's. 469 Ellam et al. (2010) demonstrated that several Pb sources are not distinguished if the ²⁰⁴Pb 470 isotope is not considered in the ratio. Indeed, ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁴Pb ratios coupled with ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁴Pb and 471 ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁴Pb ratios are commonly used in mining and chemical geology but also in 472 archaeometry to determine the lead sources and the exchanges between the different 473 countries over time (Baron et al., 2006; Bode et al., 2009). 474

Pb used during the 19th century - very large quantities of Pb were needed for Haussmann's renovation of Paris city and the restoration of NDdP and Sainte Chapelle's roofs - was largely imported in France from Spain (Lestel, 2012). The isotopic signatures obtained on the selected samples from NDdP were compared with those of Pb ores from southern Spain, the most active Pb mines, currently available in the literature.

The isotopic signatures of the ores plotted on the ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁴Pb versus ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁴Pb diagram (Figure 6) are very heterogeneous, especially for Cartagena mining district. The signatures of the Rio Tinto and La Carolina mining districts are relatively homogeneous, at this scale of study. The La Carolina isotopic signatures overlap one of the three isotopic composition fields of Los Pedroches and the Rio Tinto one. These signatures reflect the complex geological history of these large mining areas in southern Spain. Two different mixing lines are highlighted here. They reflect the signature of two different metallogenic sources. The first

one, which is the most radiogenic, is constituted by the isotopic signatures of a part of the ores from Cartagena. The second one, less radiogenic, is composed by the isotopic signatures of Rio Tinto, La Carolina, Los Pedroches and a part of Cartagena ores. This suggests a common origin of the mineralization fluids, which is different from the first one. The isotopic signatures of the NDdP fire dust are aligned with the second mixing line suggesting that its Pb is coming from Rio Tinto, La Carolina, Cartagena and partially from Los Pedroches ores.

493 Nevertheless, with respect to the ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁴Pb versus ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁴Pb ratios, different isotopic 494 fields are highlighted within a same mining district which is the case for Los Pedroches and 495 Cartagena. This suggests that the mineralization phase occurred in several episodes of 496 mineralization (3 for Los Pedroches and 2 for Cartagena). In the case of Rio Tinto and La 497 Carolina, the ores come from a single phase of mineralization emplacement and also have a 498 common origin.

The isotopic signatures of the NDdP fire dusts are, again, aligned along a mixing line formed by the least radiogenic group of Cartagena ores. The other mining districts of Los Pedroches, La Carolina and Rio Tinto are excluded. One of the phases of Los Pedroches and those of La Carolina and Rio Tinto are almost synchronous. The NDdP fire dust therefore seem to have originated from Cartagena mining district.

In addition, the fire dust signature is more precise and comprehensive using the data obtained at SARM. Finally, the Pb isotope ratio of the leaded particles emitted by the 2019 fire are: ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁷Pb: 1.1669-1.1685, ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁶Pb: 2.0981-2.0995, ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁴Pb ratios: 38.297 -38.342, ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁴Pb: 15.633 - 15.639 and ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁴Pb: 18.242 – 18.275.

508



Figure 6 : ²⁰⁸Pb/²⁰⁴Pb versus ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁴Pb and ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁴Pb versus ²⁰⁶Pb/²⁰⁴Pb diagrams of ores signatures
from Cartagena (Graeser and Friedrich 1970 ; Marcoux et al., 1992 ; Arribas and Tosdal 1994 ; StosGale and Gale 2009 ; Baron et al., 2017), Rio Tinto (Brill and Wampler 1967 ; Brill et al., 1987 ; Marcoux
et al., 1992 ; Marcoux 1998 ; Pomiès et al., 1998 ; Stos-Gale and Gale 2009), La Carolina (Hunt-Ortiz
2003 ; Stos-Gale and Gale 2009 ; Santos-Zalduegui et al., 2004), Los Pedroches (Santos-Zalduegui et al.,
2004) and Notre Dame fire dust (This study).

516 6. Conclusions

We developed an appropriate step-by-step strategy to reveal the samples most 517 representative of the fire emission. A careful and systematic evaluation of the bias due to pre-518 519 and post-sampling contamination is an essential tool to trace potential Pb pollution in a city such as Paris where the Pb comes from multiple sources (road traffic, industries, waste 520 521 incinerators, Pb in habitat and the heritage of the "historical Pb"). In addition, we propose a robust protocol for future dust sampling in historical monuments. The objective is to be able 522 to compare the data in the future (between monuments, after restoration works, and in case 523 of another tragedy). 524

525 A 3-step methodology was developed: (1) binocular observations of the macroscopic heterogeneities and subsequent fractioning of the sample into more homogeneous fractions, 526 527 (2) elemental composition determination for a large range of elements, mainly used to evaluate the impact of the sampling substrate, (3) Pb isotope ratio analysis enabling to reveal 528 more subtle heterogeneities. The smoke plume signature is better represented by the dust 529 530 fraction of the samples collected on wood substrate on the cathedral's first floor. This 531 methodology is applicable to the study of Pb sources in historical monuments, to characterize them in an historical perspective, or to evaluate the impacts of an accidental event. 532

533 The isotopic and elemental fingerprint highlights the distinctive characteristics of the 534 NDdP fire signature, inherited from the long and rich history of the cathedral. Thus, we 535 propose an uncommon geochemical fingerprint of NDdP fire fallout, characterized by ratios based on Pb substantially different from classic urban ratios. Most importantly, the NDdP fire
Pb isotope ratio signature is finely characterized with median values of 206Pb/207Pb ratio:
1.16738±0.00057 and 208Pb/206Pb ratio: 2.09875±0.00049.

In a further step, this signature will be used to trace this major event in the Parisian environment. The fire Pb signature is distinct from today's urban Pb signature, which is imprinted by the leaded gasoline used during the second half of the 20th century. This leaves some space to distinguish the NDdP fire Pb inputs from the urban contamination preexisting the 2019 fire in environmental reservoirs (soils, river sediments, atmospheric particles).

544 Finally, we showed that the Pb contained in the NDdP fire dusts seems to have 545 originated from Cartagena mining district, more precisely from the least radiogenic group of 546 Cartagena ores.

547 Acknowledgments

The authors thank the CNRS, more specifically the "Mission pour les Initiatives Transverses et Interdisciplinaires (MITI)" and the Research Group ReMArch « Remploi et Recyclage des Matériaux de l'Architecture », CNRS (GDR 2063) for their financial support. This work is part of the research conducted by the Group Metals of the Chantier Scientifique de Notre-Dame (CNRS/Ministère de la Culture). The authors thank all its members for the scientific discussions.

- 554 Supporting information:
- 555 Word file:
- 556 Table S1 Location and description of samples collected in NDdP
- 557 Table S3. Elemental composition (mg.kg⁻¹) and lead isotope ratio for the certified reference materials
- 558 Fig. S1. Lead isotopic compositions determined at LSCE and CRPG laboratories.
- 559 Fig. S2. Lead isotopic compositions of heterogeneous samples from this study.

- 560 Fig. S3. Bivariate concentration plots of selected element versus Pb concentrations for
- 561 heterogeneous samples (*i.e.*, presenting a 'dust only' fraction and a 'fiber and dust' fraction')
- 562 Excel Files:
- 563 Table S2. Selected isotopes and analysis modes of elements.
- Table S4. Elemental and lead isotope ratios of NDdP samples.
- 565 Table S5. Lead isotope ratios of the Sainte-Chapelle and Chartres cathedral lead samples.
- Table S6. Composition of the "only dust" and "fiber and dust" fractions for four NDdP samples.
- 567 Table S7. Lead isotope ratios of the dust samples representative of NDdP fire (SARM)
- 568

569 References

- Amodio, M., Catino, S., Dambruoso, P. R., De Gennaro, G., Di Gilio, A., Giungato, P., Laiola, E.,
 Marzocca, A., Mazzone, A., Sardaro, A., & Tutino, M. (2014). Atmospheric deposition:
 sampling procedures, analytical methods, and main recent findings from the scientific
 literature. Advances in Meteorology, 2014. <u>https://doi.org/10.1155/2014/161730</u>.
- Arribas, A., & Tosdal, R. M. (1994). Isotopic composition of Pb in ore deposits of the Betic
 Cordillera, Spain; origin and relationship to other European deposits. Economic
 Geology, 89(5), 1074-1093. https://doi.org/10.2113/gsecongeo.89.5.1074.
- 577 Aubert, M. (1920). Notre-Dame de Paris: sa place dans l'histoire de l'architecture du XIIe au 578 XIVe siècle. H. Laurens.
- Ayrault, S., Roy-Barman, M., Le Cloarec, M. F., Priadi, C. R., Bonté, P., and Göpel, C. (2012).
 Lead contamination of the Seine River, France: geochemical implications of a
 historical perspective. Chemosphere, 87(8), 902-910.
- 582 <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-013-2240-6</u>.
- Ayrault, S., Le Pape, P., Evrard, O., Priadi, C. R., Quantin, C., Bonté, P., & Roy-Barman, M.
 (2014). Remanence of lead pollution in an urban river system: a multi-scale temporal and spatial study in the Seine River basin, France. Environmental Science and
- Pollution Research, 21(6), 4134-4148. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-013-2240-6.
 Baron, S., Carignan, J., Laurent, S., & Ploquin, A. (2006). Medieval lead making on MontLozère Massif (Cévennes-France): tracing ore sources using Pb isotopes. Applied
- geochemistry, 21(2), 241-252. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apgeochem.2005.09.005.
 Baron, S., Rico, Ch., et Antolinos Marín, J. A. (2017) : "Le complexe d'ateliers du Cabezo del Pino (Sierra Minera de Cartagena-La Unión, Murcia) et l'organisation de l'activité
 minière à Carthago Noua à la fin de la République romaine. Apports croisés de l'archéologie et de la géochimie". Archive Español de Argueología. 00, 147, 160.
- l'archéologie et de la géochimie", Archivo Español de Arqueología, 90, 147-169.
 Bode, M., Hauptmann, A., & Mezger, K. (2009). Tracing Roman lead sources using lead
 isotope analyses in conjunction with archaeological and epigraphic evidence—a case
 study from Augustan/Tiberian Germania. *Archaeological and anthropological*sciences, 1(3), 177-194. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12520-009-0017-0.
- 597 sciences, 1(3), 177-194. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12520-009-0017-0.
 598 Brill, R.H. and Wampler, J. M. (1967). Isotope studies of ancient lead. American Journal of
 599 Archaeology 71, 63-77.
- Brill, R.H., Barnes, I.L., Tong, S.C., Joel, E.C., Murtaugh, M.J., 1987. Laboratory studies of
 some European artifacts excavated on San Salvador Island, in: Gerace, D.. (Ed.),
 Columbus and His World: Proceedings of the First San Salvador Conference. San
 Salvador, Bahamian Field Station, pp. 247–292

Charlesworth, S., De Miguel, E., & Ordóñez, A. (2011). A review of the distribution of particulate trace 604 elements in urban terrestrial environments and its application to considerations of risk. 605 606 Environmental geochemistry and health, 33(2), 103-123. 607 Cheng, H., & Hu, Y. (2010). Lead (Pb) isotopic fingerprinting and its applications in lead pollution studies in China: a review. Environmental pollution, 158(5), 1134-1146. 608 609 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2009.12.028. Cohen, M. (2008). An Indulgence for the Visitor: The Public at the Sainte-Chapelle of Paris. 610 Speculum, 83(4), 840-883. https://doi.org/10.1017/S003871340001705X. 611 612 Comite, V., Pozo-Antonio, J. S., Cardell, C., Rivas, T., Randazzo, L., La Russa, M. F., & Fermo, P. (2019, December). Metals distributions within black crusts sampled on the facade of 613 an historical monument: the case study of the Cathedral of Monza (Milan, Italy). In 614 615 IMEKO TC4 International Conference on Metrology for Archaeology and Cultural 616 Heritage, MetroArchaeo: 4 through 6 December (pp. 73-78). International 617 Measurement Federation Secretariat (IMEKO). Delile, H., Keenan-Jones, D., Blichert-Toft, J., Goiran, J. P., Arnaud-Godet, F., Romano, P., & 618 619 Albarède, F. (2016). A lead isotope perspective on urban development in ancient Naples. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 113(22), 6148-6153. 620 https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1600893113. 621 Delile, H., Keenan-Jones, D., Blichert-Toft, J., Goiran, J. P., Arnaud-Godet, F., & Albarède, F. 622 (2017). Rome's urban history inferred from Pb-contaminated waters trapped in its 623 624 ancient harbor basins. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 114(38), 625 10059-10064. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1706334114. 626 Elbaz-Poulichet, F., Holliger, P., Martin, J. M., & Petit, D. (1986). Stable lead isotopes ratios in 627 major French rivers and estuaries. Science of the Total Environment, 54, 61-76. 628 https://doi.org/10.1016/0048-9697(86)90256-1. Ellam, R. M. (2010). The graphical presentation of lead isotope data for environmental source 629 630 apportionment. Science of the Total Environment, 408(16), 3490-3492. 631 Farmer, J. G., Eades, L. J., Atkins, H., & Chamberlain, D. F. (2002). Historical trends in the lead isotopic 632 composition of archival Sphagnum mosses from Scotland (1838-2000). Environmental 633 science & technology, 36(2), 152-157. Font, A., de Hoogh, K., Leal-Sanchez, M., Ashworth, D. C., Brown, R. J., Hansell, A. L., & Fuller, 634 G. W. (2015). Using metal ratios to detect emissions from municipal waste 635 incinerators in ambient air pollution data. Atmospheric environment, 113, 177-186. 636 637 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2015.05.002. 638 Gasperi, J., Le Roux, J., Deshayes, S., Ayrault, S., Bordier, L., Boudahmane, L., ... & Gromaire, M. C. 639 (2022). Micropollutants in Urban Runoff from Traffic Areas: Target and Non-Target Screening 640 on Four Contrasted Sites. Water, 14(3), 394. 641 van Geen, A., Yao, Y., Ellis, T., & Gelman, A. (2020). Fallout of lead over Paris from the 2019 Notre-Dame cathedral fire. GeoHealth, 4(8), e2020GH000279. 642 643 https://doi.org/10.1029/2020GH000279. 644 Gillies, J. A., Gertler, A. W., Sagebiel, J. C., & Dippel, N. W. (2001). On-road particulate matter 645 (PM2. 5 and PM10) emissions in the Sepulveda Tunnel, Los Angeles, California. Environmental science & technology, 35(6), 1054-1063. 646 https://doi.org/10.1021/es991320p. 647 Glorennec, P., Peyr, C., Poupon, J., Oulhote, Y., & Le Bot, B. (2010). Identifying sources of 648 lead exposure for children, with lead concentrations and isotope ratios. Journal of 649 occupational and environmental hygiene, 7(5), 253-260. 650 https://doi.org/10.1080/15459621003648281. 651

652 Graeser, S., Friedrich, G., 1970. Zur Frage der Altersstellung und Genese der Blei-Zink-Vorkommen der Sierra de Cartagena in Spanien. Miner. Depos. 5, 365–374. 653 Hunt-Ortiz, M.A., 2003. Prehistoric Mining and Metallurgy in South West Iberian Peninsula. 654 Britisch Archaeologicla Reports. S1188. 9781841715544 (paperback), 655 9781407325958 (ebook) 656 Harju, L., Lill, J. O., Saarela, K. E., Heselius, S. J., Hernberg, F. J., & Lindroos, A. (1996). Study 657 of seasonal variations of trace-element concentrations within tree rings by thick-658 target PIXE analyses. Nuclear Instruments and Methods in Physics Research Section 659 B: Beam Interactions with Materials and Atoms, 109, 536-541. 660 Jørgensen, Søren Storgaard, and Marta Willems. 1987. "The fate of lead in soils: Lead 661 662 originating from roofs of ancient churches." Ambio:16-19. 663 Laidlaw, M. A., and Taylor, M. P. (2011). Potential for childhood lead poisoning in the inner 664 cities of Australia due to exposure to lead in soil dust. Environmental Pollution, 665 159(1), 1-9. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2010.08.020</u>. Laidlaw, M. A., Filippelli, G. M., Brown, S., Paz-Ferreiro, J., Reichman, S. M., Netherway, P., 666 Truskewycz, A., Ball, A. S., and Mielke, H. W. (2017). Case studies and evidence-based 667 approaches to addressing urban soil lead contamination. Applied Geochemistry, 83, 668 14-30. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apgeochem.2017.02.015. 669 Landrigan, P.J., Fuller, R., Acosta, N. J. R., Adeyi, O., Arnold, R., Basu, N., Balde, A.B., 670 Bertollini, R., Bose-O'Reilly, S., Boufford, J.I., Breysse, P.N., Chiles, T., Mahidol, C., 671 672 Coll-Seck, A.M., Cropper, M.L., Fobil, J., Fuster, V., Greenstone, M., Haines, A., Hanrahan, D., Hunter, D., Khare, M., Krupnick, A., Lanphear, B., Lohani, B., Martin, K., 673 674 Mathiasen, K. V., McTeer, M. A., Murray, C. J. L., Ndahimananjara, J. D., Perera, F., 675 Potocnik, J., Preker, A. S., Ramesh, J., Rockstrom, J., Salinas, C., Samson, L. D., 676 Sandilya, K., Sly, P. D., Smith, K. R., Steiner, A., Stewart, R. B., Suk, W. A., van Schayck, O. C. P., Yadama, G. N., Yumkella, K. , Zhong, M. 2017. The Lancet Commission on 677 pollution and health. Lancet 2018, 391:464–512. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0140-678 679 6736(17)32345-0. 680 Le Gall, M., Ayrault, S., Evrard, O., Laceby, J. P., Gateuille, D., Lefèvre, I., Mouchel, J. M., and 681 Meybeck, M. (2018). Investigating the metal contamination of sediment transported 682 by the 2016 Seine River flood (Paris, France). Environmental Pollution, 240, 125-139. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2018.04.082 683 684 Lestel, Laurence. 2012. "Non-ferrous metals (Pb, Cu, Zn) needs and city development: the 685 Paris example (1815–2009)." Regional Environmental Change 12 (2):311-323. L'Héritier, M., Arles, A., Disser, A., & Gratuze, B. (2016). Lead it be! Identifying the 686 construction phases of gothic cathedrals using lead analysis by LA-ICP-MS. Journal of 687 688 Archaeological Science: Reports, 6, 252-265. 689 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jasrep.2016.02.017. Lin, Y. C., Tsai, C. J., Wu, Y. C., Zhang, R., Chi, K. H., Huang, Y. T., Lin, S. H., & Hsu, S. C. (2015). 690 691 Characteristics of trace metals in traffic-derived particles in Hsuehshan Tunnel, 692 Taiwan: size distribution, potential source, and fingerprinting metal ratio. 693 Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics, 15(8), 4117-4130. https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-694 15-4117-2015. 695 Manhes, G., Allègre, C. J., Dupré, B., & Hamelin, B. (1980). Lead isotope study of basic-696 ultrabasic layered complexes: Speculations about the age of the earth and primitive 697 mantle characteristics. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 47(3), 370-382.

698 Marcoux, E., Leistel, J. M., Sobol, F., Milesi, J. P., & Lescuyer, J. L. (1992). Signature isotopique 699 du plomb des amas sulfurés de la province de Huelva, Espagne. Conséquences 700 métallogéniques et géodynamiques. Comptes rendus de l'Académie des sciences. 701 Série 2, Mécanique, Physique, Chimie, Sciences de l'univers, Sciences de la Terre, 702 314(13), 1469-1476. Marcoux, E., Leistel, J.M., Sobol, J., Milesi, J.P., Lescuyer, J.L., Leca, X., 1992. Signature 703 704 isotopique du plomb des amas sulfurés de la province de Huelva, Espagne. 705 Conséquences métallogéniques et géodynamiques. C.R. Acad. Sci. Paris 314, 1469-706 1476. 707 Marcoux, E., 1998. Lead isotope systematics of the giant massive sulphide deposits in the 708 Iberian Pyrite Belt. Mineralium Deposita, 33, 45–58. Marx, S. K., Rashid, S., & Stromsoe, N. (2016). Global-scale patterns in anthropogenic Pb 709 contamination reconstructed from natural archives. Environmental Pollution, 213, 710 711 283-298. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2016.02.006. 712 Monna, F., Lancelot, J., Croudace, I. W., Cundy, A. B., & Lewis, J. T. (1997). Pb isotopic composition of airborne particulate material from France and the southern United 713 Kingdom: implications for Pb pollution sources in urban areas. Environmental Science 714 715 & Technology, 31(8), 2277-2286. https://doi.org/10.1021/es960870. Pio, C., Mirante, F., Oliveira, C., Matos, M., Caseiro, A., Oliveira, C., Querol, X., Alves, C., 716 717 Martins, N., Cerqueira, M., Camões, F., Silva, H., & Plana, F. (2013). Size-segregated 718 chemical composition of aerosol emissions in an urban road tunnel in Portugal. 719 Atmospheric Environment, 71, 15-25. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2013.01.037. 720 Pomiès, C., Cocherie, A., Guerrot, C., Marcoux, E., & Lancelot, J. (1998). Assessment of the 721 precision and accuracy of lead-isotope ratios measured by TIMS for geochemical 722 723 applications: example of massive sulphide deposits (Rio Tinto, Spain). Chemical Geology, 144(1-2), 137-149. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0009-2541(97)00127-7. 724 Pons-Branchu, E., Ayrault, S., Roy-Barman, M., Bordier, L., Borst, W., Branchu, P., Douville, E., 725 726 & Dumont, E. (2015). Three centuries of heavy metal pollution in Paris (France) 727 recorded by urban speleothems. Science of the total environment, 518, 86-96. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2015.02.071. 728 729 Resongles, E., Dietze, V., Green, D. C., Harrison, R. M., Ochoa-Gonzalez, R., Tremper, A. H., & 730 Weiss, D. J. (2021). Strong evidence for the continued contribution of lead deposited 731 during the 20th century to the atmospheric environment in London of today. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 118(26). 732 https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.2102791118. 733 734 Rosca, C., Tomlinson, E. L., Geibert, W., McKenna, C. A., Babechuk, M. G., & Kamber, B. S. 735 (2018). Trace element and Pb isotope fingerprinting of atmospheric pollution 736 sources: A case study from the east coast of Ireland. Applied Geochemistry, 96, 302-737 326. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apgeochem.2018.07.003. Saarela, K. E., Harju, L., Rajander, J., Lill, J. O., Heselius, S. J., Lindroos, A., & Mattsson, K. 738 (2005). Elemental analyses of pine bark and wood in an environmental study. Science 739 740 of the Total Environment, 343(1-3), 231-241. 741 Santos Zalduegui, J. F., García de Madinabeitia, S., Gil Ibarguchi, J. I., & Palero, F. (2004). A 742 lead isotope database: the Los Pedroches-Alcudia area (Spain); implications for archaeometallurgical connections across southwestern and southeastern Iberia. 743 744 Archaeometry, 46(4), 625-634. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1475-4754.2004.00178.x.

745 Sawidis, T., Breuste, J., Mitrovic, M., Pavlovic, P., & Tsigaridas, K. (2011). Trees as 746 bioindicator of heavy metal pollution in three European cities. Environmental 747 pollution, 159(12), 3560-3570. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2011.08.008. Shelby, L. R. (1981). Review of the book "The contractors of Chartres" by John James, 1979. 748 749 Speculum, 56(2), 395-398. Shotyk, William, Jiancheng Zheng, Michael Krachler, Christian Zdanowicz, Roy Koerner, and 750 David Fisher. 2005. "Predominance of industrial Pb in recent snow (1994–2004) and 751 752 ice (1842–1996) from Devon Island, Arctic Canada." Geophysical Research Letters 32 753 (21). Smith, K. E., Weis, D., Amini, M., Shiel, A. E., Lai, V. W. M., & Gordon, K. (2019). Honey as a 754 755 biomonitor for a changing world. Nature Sustainability, 2(3), 223-232. 756 https://doi.org/10.1038/s41893-019-0243-0. Smith, K. E., Weis, D., Chauvel, C., & Moulin, S. (2020). Honey maps the pb fallout from the 757 758 2019 fire at notre-dame cathedral, paris: A geochemical perspective. Environmental 759 Science & Technology Letters, 7(10), 753-759. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.estlett.0c00485. 760 Stos-Gale, Z. A. and Gale, N. H. (2009). Metal provenancing using isotopes and the Oxford 761 archaeological lead isotope database. Archaeological and anthropological Sciences, 1, 762 195-213. 763 Syvilay, D., Texier, A., Arles, A., Gratuze, B., Wilkie-Chancellier, N., Martinez, L., Serfaty, S., & 764 765 Detalle, V. (2015). Trace element quantification of lead based roof sheets of historical 766 monuments by laser induced breakdown spectroscopy. Spectrochimica Acta Part B: 767 Atomic Spectroscopy, 103, 34-42. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sab.2014.10.013. Thirlwall, M. F. (2002). Multicollector ICP-MS analysis of Pb isotopes using a 207Pb-204Pb 768 double spike demonstrates up to 400 ppm/amu systematic errors in TI-normalization. 769 Chemical Geology, 184(3-4), 255-279. 770 771 Tognet, F., & Truchot, B. (2019). Modélisation de la Dispersion des Particules de Plomb du Panache de L'incendie de Notre Dame. Ineris-200480-879062-v2. 0. 772 773 Vallée, A., Sorbets, E., Lelong, H., Langrand, J., & Blacher, J. (2021). The lead story of the fire at the Notre-Dame cathedral of Paris. Environmental Pollution, 269, 116140. 774 775 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2020.116140. 776 Vanderstraeten, A., Bonneville, S., Gili, S., De Jong, J., Debouge, W., Claeys, P., & Mattielli, N. 777 (2020). First Multi-Isotopic (Pb-Nd-Sr-Zn-Cu-Fe) Characterisation of Dust Reference 778 Materials (ATD and BCR-723): A Multi-Column Chromatographic Method Optimised 779 to Trace Mineral and Anthropogenic Dust Sources. Geostandards and Geoanalytical 780 Research, 44(2), 307-329. 781 Véron, A., Flament, P., Bertho, M. L., Alleman, L., Flegal, R., & Hamelin, B. (1999). Isotopic 782 evidence of pollutant lead sources in Northwestern France. Atmospheric 783 Environment, 33(20), 3377-3388. https://doi.org/10.1016/S1352-2310(98)00376-8. 784 Watmough, S. A., & Hutchinson, T. C. (1996). Analysis of tree rings using inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry to record fluctuations in a metal pollution episode. 785 Environmental Pollution, 93(1), 93-102. https://doi.org/10.1016/0269-786 787 7491(95)00107-7. 788 Widory, D., Roy, S., Le Moullec, Y., Goupil, G., Cocherie, A., & Guerrot, C. (2004). The origin 789 of atmospheric particles in Paris: a view through carbon and lead isotopes. Atmospheric Environment, 38(7), 953-961. 790 791 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2003.11.001.

- Wyttenbach, A., & Schubiger, P. A. (1973). Trace element content of Roman lead by neutron
 activation analysis. Archaeometry, 15(2), 199-207. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.14754754.1973.tb00090.x.
- Yu, K. F., Kamber, B. S., Lawrence, M. G., Greig, A., & Zhao, J. X. (2007). High-precision
 analysis on annual variations of heavy metals, lead isotopes and rare earth elements
 in mangrove tree rings by inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry. Nuclear
 Instruments and Methods in Physics Research Section B: Beam Interactions with
- 799 Materials and Atoms, 255(2), 399-408. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nimb.2006.11.127</u>.
- White, W. M., Albarède, F., & Télouk, P. (2000). High-precision analysis of Pb isotope ratios
 by multi-collector ICP-MS. Chemical Geology, 167(3-4), 257-270.
- 802 803
- 804