

# Review of "Plasticity and ductility of an anisotropic recrystallized AA2198 Al-Cu-Li alloy in T3 and T8 conditions during proportional and non-proportional loading paths: simulations and experiments"

Xiang Kong, Jianqiang Chen, Yazid Madi, Djamel Missoum-Benziane, Jacques Besson, Thilo F. Morgeneyer, Thomas Pardoen, L.S. Toth

## ▶ To cite this version:

Xiang Kong, Jianqiang Chen, Yazid Madi, Djamel Missoum-Benziane, Jacques Besson, et al.. Review of "Plasticity and ductility of an anisotropic recrystallized AA2198 Al-Cu-Li alloy in T3 and T8 conditions during proportional and non-proportional loading paths: simulations and experiments". 2022. hal-03889903

# HAL Id: hal-03889903 https://hal.science/hal-03889903

Submitted on 1 Mar 2023  $\,$ 

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License

#### Identifiers

Open Review OAI hal-03889903 Reviewed Article DOI 10.46298/jtcam.8913

#### History

Review 6 Feb, 2022 Rebuttal 23 Jun, 2022

> Licence CC BY 4.0 ©The Authors

# Review of "Plasticity and ductility of an anisotropic recrystallized AA2198 Al-Cu-Li alloy in T3 and T8 conditions during proportional and non-proportional loading paths: simulations and experiments"

<sup>(D</sup>Xiang Kong<sup>1</sup>, Jianqiang CHEN<sup>1,2</sup>, <sup>(D</sup> Yazid MADI<sup>1</sup>, <sup>(D</sup> Djamel MISSOUM-BENZIANE<sup>1</sup>,
 <sup>(D</sup> Jacques Besson<sup>1</sup>, <sup>(D</sup>Thilo F. Morgenever<sup>1</sup>, <sup>(D</sup> Thomas PARDOEN<sup>3,R</sup>, and <sup>(D</sup> Lazslo TOTH<sup>4,E</sup>

<sup>1</sup> MINES Paris, PSL University, Centre des Matériaux, CNRS UMR 7633, Evry, France

<sup>2</sup> Pratt & Whitney Canada, 1000 Boul. Marie-Victorin, Longueuil, QC J4G 1A1 Canada

<sup>3</sup> Institute of Mechanics, Materials and Civil Engineering, UC Louvain, 1348 Louvain-la-Neuve, Belgium

<sup>4</sup> Physical Metallurgy Metal-forming and Nanotechnology Institute, University of Miskolc, Hungary

<sup>R</sup> Reviewer

<sup>E</sup> Editor

### **Review of version 1**

Permalink: hal-03497233v1

Author We thank the reviewer for his nice comments and suggestions.

### **Reviewer 1 (Thomas PARDOEN)**

- **Reviewer** This study on the ductile fracture of the alloy Al AA2198 is at the forefront of the research in the field. It combines really original mechanical tests, the question related to non proportional loadings that is not sufficiently treated in literature, a modern alloy and well executed FE plasticity simulations and a robust identification strategy of plasticity parameters.
  - Author We thank the reviewer for his rewarding comment.

### **Reviewer** My only comments that deserve a minor revision are the following:

The discussion would be strenghtened by a figure providing the variation of accumulated equivalent plastic strain as a function of stress triaxiality for all tests on a single graph, with the final point being the true accumulated fracture strain. This would allow showing in a clear graphical way the impact of some of the non proportional loads more clearly than what is currently shown in the current version.

- **Author** We have now added two figures that show the accumulated strain fields and that indicate the location at which the strain to fracture was determined in the simulation. The second figure shows the strain as a function of stress triaxiality for the entire loading history for the T<sub>3</sub> and T8 materials. The results are commented in this section.
- **Reviewer** Although the list of references has many relevant papers, it misses some key papers in the field that could be also used in the introduction and discussion. I'm thinking for instance of a paper by A. Benzerga on non radial loading (using void cell simulations) which very well makes the point on the effect (here related to void shape effects).
  - **Author** We have now added this reference.

Reviewer Please indicate and justify the number of elements chosen over the thickness in the FE models.Author We made this change.

**Reviewer** there are several typos to correct :

ii: axisymmteric
vi: "in the fe software xx" change as "using the xxx"
several improper uses of past tense : ex. ix-line 4 "was" must become "is", xv "it showed" must become "It shows"
xii: "results for last strain field" add a "the"
xiv: "more close" - "closer"
xix: "Deschamps found a Bauschinger test" ???
xix: "reduction on ductility" prefer "of"
xix: "identified in in situ" prefer "from"

Author We made all the changes.

### Editor's assessment (Lazslo Тотн)

This manuscript went through the review process very smoothly: both Reviewers proposed to accept it. The first Referee was asking for minor modifications: he proposed to add a figure in order to have more information on the variation of the accumulated equivalent plastic strain as a function of stress triaxiality. Then the Authors added two figures. One shows the accumulated strain fields and indicates the location at which the strain to fracture was determined in the simulation. The second figure shows the strain as a function of stress triaxiality for the entire loading history for the T<sub>3</sub> and T<sub>8</sub> materials. These results were also commented in the revised version. The second Referee was perfectly satisfied with the quality of the work and proposed to accept the paper as it was.

**Open Access** This review is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or



format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons license, and indicate if changes were made. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article's Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article's Creative Commons license and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the authors–the copyright holder. To view a copy of this license, visit creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.o.