

Multi-isotope zooarchaeological investigations at Abri du Maras: The paleoecological and paleoenvironmental context of Neanderthal subsistence strategies in the Rhône Valley during MIS 3

Kate Britton, Elodie-Laure Jimenez, Mael Le Corre, Sarah Pederzani, Camille Daujeard, Klervia Jaouen, Delphine Vettese, Thomas Tütken, Jean-Jacques Hublin, Marie-Hélène Moncel

▶ To cite this version:

Kate Britton, Elodie-Laure Jimenez, Mael Le Corre, Sarah Pederzani, Camille Daujeard, et al.. Multi-isotope zooarchaeological investigations at Abri du Maras: The paleoecological and paleoenvironmental context of Neanderthal subsistence strategies in the Rhône Valley during MIS 3. Journal of Human Evolution, 2023, 174, pp.103292. 10.1016/j.jhevol.2022.103292. hal-03831561

HAL Id: hal-03831561 https://hal.science/hal-03831561v1

Submitted on 27 Oct 2022

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

- 1 Multi-isotope zooarchaeological investigations at Abri du Maras: The paleoecological
- 2 and paleoenvironmental context of Neanderthal subsistence strategies in the Rhône
- 3 Valley during MIS 3

4

- 5 Kate Britton^{a,b,*}, Elodie-Laure Jimenez^{a,c}, Mael Le Corre^a, Sarah Pederzani^{b,d}, Camille
- 6 Daujeard^e, Klervia Jaouen^{b,f}, Delphine Vettese^{d,h}, Thomas Tütkenⁱ, Jean-Jacques Hublin^{b,} and
- 7 Marie-Hélène Moncel^d

8

- 9 a Department of Archaeology, University of Aberdeen, Aberdeen, AB24 3UF, United
- 10 Kingdom
- 11 b Department of Human Evolution, Max Planck Institute for Evolutionary Anthropology,
- 12 04103, Leipzig, Germany
- ^c Royal Belgian Institute of Natural Sciences, 29 Vautier Street, 1000 Brussels, Belgium
- 14 d'Instituto Universitario de Bio-Orgánica Antonio González, Universidad de La Laguna,
- 15 Avda. Astrofísico Francisco Sánchez 2, 38206 La Laguna, Tenerife, Spain
- 16 e UMR 7194, Histoire Naturelle de l'Homme Préhistorique (HNHP), CNRS, Muséum
- 17 National d'Histoire Naturelle, Département Homme et Environnement, Institut de
- 18 Paléontologie Humaine, 1 Rue René Panhard, 75013, Paris, France
- 19 ^f Géosciences Environnement Toulouse, Observatoire Midi Pyrénées, UMR 5563, CNRS, 14
- 20 avenue Edouard Belin, 31400 Toulouse, France
- 21 g Universita degli Studi di Ferrara, Dipartimento degli Studi Umanistici, Sezione di Scienze
- 22 Preistoriche e Antropologiche, Corso Ercole I d'Este 32, 44121, Ferrara, Italy
- 23 h Grupo de I+D+i EVOADAPTA (Evolución Humana y Adaptaciones Económicas y
- 24 Ecológicas durante la Prehistoria), Dpto. Ciencias Históricas, Universidad de Cantabria,
- 25 Av/Los Castros 44, 39005, Santander, Spain
- ¹ Arbeitsgruppe für Angewandte und Analytische Paläontologie, Institut für
- 27 Geowissenschaften, Johannes Gutenberg-Universität Mainz, J.-J. Becherweg 21, 55128
- 28 Mainz, Germany
- 29 ^j Collège de France, 11, place Marcelin Berthelot, 74005 Paris

30

31 *Corresponding author.

E-mail address: k.britton@abdn.ac.uk (K. Britton).

Acknowledgments

- 35 This research was funded by the Leverhulme Trust (RPG-2017-410 and PLP-2019-284 to KB),
- 36 Muséum National d'Histoire Naturelle and the Max Planck Society. K.J. thanks ERC Grant
- 37 ARCHEIS (grant number 803676) and E.L.J. thanks Belspo BRAIN-be ICHIE for salary
- 38 support during production of this manuscript. Thanks to Ciara Gigleux (Aberdeen), Juan Marin
- 39 (Muséum National d'Histoire Naturelle), Sven Steinbrenner (MPI-EVA) and Kerry Sayle
- 40 (SUERC) for assistance during sample selection, preparation and analysis.

Abstract

The exploitation of mid- and large-sized herbivores (ungulates) was central to hominin subsistence across Late Pleistocene Europe. Reconstructing the paleoecology of prey-taxa is key to better understanding procurement strategies, decisions and behaviors, and the isotope analysis of faunal bones and teeth found at archaeological sites represent a powerful means of accessing information about past faunal behaviors. These isotope zooarchaeological approaches also have a near-unique ability to reveal environmental conditions contemporary to the human activities that produced these remains. Here, we present the results of a multi-isotope, multi-tissue study of ungulate remains from the Middle Paleolithic site of Abri du Maras, southern France, providing new insights into the living landscapes of the Rhône Valley during MIS 3 (level $4.2 = 55 \pm 2$ to 42 ± 3 ka; level $4.1 = 46 \pm 3$ to 40 ± 3 ka. Isotope data (carbon, nitrogen) reveal the dietary niches of different ungulate taxa, including the now-extinct giant deer (*Megaloceros*). Oxygen isotope data are consistent with a mild seasonal climate during level 4.2, where horse (*Equus*), bison (*Bison*), and red deer (*Cervus elaphus*)

were exploited year-round. Strontium and sulphur isotopes, provide new evidence for behavioral plasticity in Late Pleistocene European reindeer (*Rangifer*) between level 4.2 and level 4.1, indicating a change from the migratory to the sedentary ecotype. In level 4.1, the strong seasonal nature of reindeer exploitation, combined with their non-migratory behavior, are consistent with a seasonally-restricted use of the site by Neanderthals at that time or the preferential hunting of reindeer when in peak physical condition during the autumn.

- **Keywords:** Middle Paleolithic; Collagen; Enamel; Dietary niche; Biogeography;
- 65 Paleotemperatures

1. Introduction

68 1.1. Context

The exploitation of mid- and large-sized herbivores was a key adaptive behavior of both Neanderthal and early *H. sapiens* across north-west Europe throughout the Middle and Late Pleistocene (Discamps et al., 2011; Kuntz and Costamagno, 2011; Rendu et al., 2012; Marín et al., 2020). Reconstructing the paleoecology of prey-taxa is vital to better understanding hominin procurement strategies, decisions and behaviors. While the Last Glaciation (Marine Isotope Stage [MIS] 4–2; ~74–12 ka) was marked by climate fluctuations, MIS 3 (~57–29 ka) was a period of profound climatic instability, characterized by short-term and acute climatic oscillations (Voelker, 2002; Barron et al., 2003; Lisiecki and Raymo, 2005; Clement and Peterson, 2008; Kindler et al., 2014). While long-term species distribution and turnover is generally well characterized in the Late Pleistocene (Kahlke, 2014; Puzachenko et al., 2020), the impact contemporary climatic changes would have had on the behaviors of ungulate species is less well known, and the relationships between rapid climatic shifts and the dietary and migratory behaviors of ungulate species are poorly characterized. In turn, the interactions

between changes in prey-species behavior and hominin subsistence strategies can be difficult to elucidate. There is a clear need for site-specific approaches, where the reconstruction of local environmental and paleoecological conditions can be contrasted to archaeological evidence in order to gain more nuanced interpretations of the inter-actions between environmental dynamism, the behaviors of prey-species and the subsistence strategies and landscape use of early human groups. In recent decades, the stable isotope analysis of zooarchaeological assemblages has emerged as a leading means of reconstructing past faunal paleoecology, environments and paleotemperatures. Carbon and nitrogen isotope ratios of bone collagen derive from diet, and in modern ecosystems and recent-historic case studies have been shown to reflect both broad environmental conditions and also the niche feeding behaviors of different taxa of large herbivores over the period of tissue formation (e.g., Ben-David et al., 2001; Drucker et al., 2001, 2012; Feranec, 2007; Hofman-Kamińska et al., 2018). Sulphur isotope ratios measured in bone collagen can also prove useful in food web studies but when considering ungulate species are of most use as a tool for reconstructing geographical range use, with values corresponding to local soils and lithological unit, rainfall and coastal proximity (see review in Nehlich, 2015). As strontium isotope ratios of skeletal tissues relate directly to that of local lithology, soils and plants, these techniques can provide more direct evidence of movement histories (see Britton, 2020, for an overview). When combined with the serial-sampling of incrementally-developing tissues that do not undergo subsequent remodeling (Hillson 2005), such as tooth enamel, these can provide evidence of time-series (i.e., seasonal) movement information, as demonstrated in modern migratory North American caribou (Britton et al., 2009). Given the relationship between temperature and the δ^{18} O of local precipitation, and the near-linear relationship between the $\delta^{18}O$ of body water and that of mineralized tissues, the oxygen isotope analysis of mammalian skeletal tissues can provide valuable insights into past

82

83

84

85

86

87

88

89

90

91

92

93

94

95

96

97

98

99

100

101

102

103

104

105

thermal conditions (see Pederzani and Britton, 2019, for an overview). When obligate drinking species, such as horses or bison, are targeted and sequential sampling approaches are employed (i.e., of molariform teeth), these approaches can provide evidence of local seasonal climatic conditions (Fricke et al., 1998; Kohn et al., 1998; Sharp and Cerling, 1998). These techniques have successfully been applied to European Middle and Late Pleistocene sites, reconstructing paleoclimate and paleoenvironmental change, faunal niche feeding behaviors and migratory habits, and through this better understanding hominin subsistence strategies (e.g., Bocherens, 2003; Richards and Hedges, 2003; Stevens and Hedges, 2004; Pellegrini et al., 2008; Stevens et al., 2008; Bernard et al., 2009; Britton et al., 2011; Fabre et al., 2011; Britton et al., 2012; Price et al., 2017; Drucker et al., 2018; Jones et al., 2018; Britton et al., 2019; Jones et al., 2019; Schwartz-Narbonne et al., 2019; Drucker, 2022).

1.2. Reconstructing faunal paleoecology and paleoenvironmental conditions using isotope

zooarchaeology

The isotopic compositions of preserved faunal tissues found at archaeological and paleontological sites, including dental enamel and collagen extracted from bones, are a complex product of isotopic inputs during life and the biological process that occur within an organism. Given the variation inherent in many different isotopic systems across landscapes and between (and within) biomes, isotopic inputs obtained through food and water ingested reflect feeding behaviors but also prevailing environmental conditions and geospatial histories, as well as an organism's physiology. Understanding these issues, and the fundamental principles, assumptions and caveats inherent behind the application of these isotopic techniques to mammalian tissues, is essential in order to be able to interpret isotopic data from zooarchaeological and paleontological remains.

Carbon isotopes Carbon isotope techniques are based around the principle that animal body tissues (e.g., bone collagen) reflect the isotopic composition of the food ingested throughout life. The relative abundance of the stable isotopes of carbon, 13 C and 12 C (δ^{13} C), varies characteristically between different biomes—e.g., between plants of different photosynthetic pathways (Smith and Epstein, 1971; DeNiro and Epstein, 1978) or between terrestrial and marine ecosystems (Schoeninger and DeNiro, 1984). Studies of resource partitioning and niche feeding ecology have generally focused on environments where both C₃ and C₄ plants can be found, such as sub-tropical Africa (e.g., Koch, et al., 1995; Cerling, et al., 1999) and North America (e.g., Gadbury, et al., 2000; MacFadden, 2008). These plants have different photosynthetic pathways, selecting against ¹³C to different degrees, and therefore display large differences in their δ^{13} C. However, studies have demonstrated the effectiveness of carbon isotope analysis to reveal resource partitioning among modern (e.g., Feranec et al., 2007; Hofman-Kamińska et al., 2018) and Late Pleistocene (e.g., Britton et al., 2012; Schwartz-Narbonne et al., 2019) ungulates in purely C₃ environments. Such variations stem from intraecosystems variations in carbon isotope values of different plant communities and reflect dietary choices of herbivores living within C₃ environments (see Bocherens, 2003; Drucker, 2022, for an overview). Lichens, for example, exhibit less negative $\delta^{13}C$ values than other terrestrial plants incorporated into the diet of Northern ungulates (Ben-David et al., 2001, Maguas and Brugnoli, 1996, Park and Epstein, 1960). This has been demonstrated to raise ¹³C amounts in the blood and dentine of modern Rangifer (Ben-David, et al., 2001, Drucker, et al., 2001), and is often reflected in bone collagen δ^{13} C values of Late Pleistocene European Rangifer (e.g., Fizet et al., 1995). Closed forest systems, including temperate woodlands (Bonafini et al., 2013), can feature anomalously ¹³C-depleted vegetation, a so-called 'canopy effect'. Anticipated differences between the bone collagen δ^{13} C of a species regularly feeding on lichens or in dense forest have therefore formed the basis of investigations in cervid feeding

132

133

134

135

136

137

138

139

140

141

142

143

144

145

146

147

148

149

150

151

152

153

154

155

ecology in Late Pleistocene Europe, inferring both niche partitioning but also broader environmental conditons (e.g., Drucker et al., 2008; Immel et al., 2015). It should also be noted that the δ^{13} C of bodily proteins can also reflect physiological differences, such as ruminant digestion and methane production, which leads to tissue 13 C enrichment (e.g., Cerling and Harris, 1999).

While δ^{13} C values can also be obtained from the carbonate component of dental enamel, where preservation permits, bone collagen is often the favored analyte in studies of faunal dietary paleoecology as (due to remodeling and renewal) it reflects averaged dietary isotopic intake over a number of years (e.g., Hedges et al., 2007) and the preservation and isotopic integrity of bone collagen can be assessed by means of a number of quality indicators (DeNiro, 1985; van Klinken, 1999). Furthermore, analysis of bone collagen often permits the co-generation of nitrogen and, increasingly, also sulphur isotope data which can aid in the inference of other aspects of faunal paleoecology.

Nitrogen isotopes The $\delta^{15}N$ value of ungulate bone collagen depends on a number of factors, most notably the $\delta^{15}N$ values of the plants at the base of the food chain. A range of variables can lead to depletion or enrichment in plant ^{15}N , which, in turn could affect the tissue $\delta^{15}N$ values of animal feeders. Plant $\delta^{15}N$ values depend on nitrogen availability, the source of nitrogen that is incorporated into the plant, the characteristics of nitrogen cycling in the soils at any given location, as well the plant's physiology in terms of how they uptake nitrogen (Högberg 1997; Amundson et al., 2003; Hobbie and Högberg, 2012). Plants which obtain their nitrogen with the assistance of mycorrhizae, for example, tend to have lower $\delta^{15}N$ values than plants that lack these symbionts (Högberg 1997). This means that in contemporary arctic and boreal ecosystems, grasses—which do not obtain their nitrogen with the assistance of these

fungal associations—are normally ¹⁵N enriched relative to shrubs and trees that do (see data collated in Bocherens, 2003: 61, Figure 3). In environments that are extremely nutrient-poor, such as tundra environments, competitive partitioning of the overall nitorgen pool by plants through a variety of mehanisms can lead to variations in $\delta^{15}N$ values of plant species (Nadelhoffer et al., 1996). In light of these variations, selective feeding on particular plant species, can lead to variation in bone collagen $\delta^{15}N$ amongst large herbivores, interpretted as evidence of niche partitioning in Late Pleistocene studies (e.g., Bocherens, 2003; Britton et al., 2012; Schwartz-Narbonne et al., 2019) Large scale studies of soil $\delta^{15}N$ have observed trends in $\delta^{15}N$ with both temperature and precipitation (e.g., Amundson et al., 2003), and it is thought that these likely influence soil (and therefore plant) δ^{15} N values in nonagricultural (i.e., unmanaged) primarily through influencing the loss mechanisms which are part of the natural cycling of nitrogen within soils (Houlton and Bai, 2009). In contemporary ecosystems, cooler and wetter conditions influence nitrogen cycling in soils, leading to less ¹⁴N being lost through leaching, denitrification, and ammonia volatilization, and thus decreasing plant $\delta^{15}N$ values (Amundson et al., 2003). Soil maturity has also been linked to ¹⁵N enrichment in plants, and plants growing on pioneer soils may have lower δ^{15} N values due to the inhibition of microbial activity (e.g., Hobbie et al., 1998). It is largely on the basis of these broad relationships between climatic conditions and precipitation, and the pattern of glacial-interglacial successions in the Quaternary, that long-term changes in the $\delta^{15}N$ of archaeological herbivore collagen throughout the Late Pleistocene of north-west Europe have been explained (e.g., Richards and Hedges, 2003; Stevens and Hedges, 2004; Stevens, et al., 2008). However, in modern ecosystems, while there are general trends with climate, correlations between soil/plant δ^{15} N and climate on a global level are poor (Hobbie and Högberg, 2012). It is likely that confounding factors, such as mycorrhizal association and type, along with

182

183

184

185

186

187

188

189

190

191

192

193

194

195

196

197

198

199

200

201

202

203

204

205

precipitation are perhaps the most important influences (Hobbie and Högberg, 2012). Other extraneous influences are also known to influence soil $\delta^{15}N$, such as grazing pressure, which can serve to raise $\delta^{15}N$ values in soils and therefore plants, in a complex cycle of nitrogen transfer between herbivores and their forage (e.g., Sjögersten et al., 2010). Bone collagen $\delta^{15}N$ of large herbivores from the Late Pleistocene is therefore a product of multiple influences, from soil maturity and broad-scale climatic influences, to precipitation patterns, through to the individual plant communities and density of animals grazing regularly at a specific location. Furthermore, when considering the $\delta^{15}N$ of large herbivores, potential influences of their adaptive biology and physiology on tissue $\delta^{15}N$ must also be considered. For example, modern studies have demonstrated that ^{15}N -enrichment from diet to tissue is dependent on the protein content of graze and forage consumed, with low protein diets leading to lower diet-tissue offsets and thus (potentially) lower tissue $\delta^{15}N$ values (Sponheimer et al., 2003). Furthermore, physiological variations, such as pregnancy, lactation, and malnutrition have also been demonstrated to influence ^{15}N -enrichment in contemporary forming tissues (e.g., Fuller, et al., 2004; Fuller et al., 2005; Mekota, et al., 2006).

Sulphur isotope analysis Although data are also typically obtained from bone collagen in archaeological case studies, compared to carbon and nitrogen isotope studies there have been comparatively few applications of sulphur isotope analysis (δ^{34} S) to Late Pleistocene materials, although applications are increasing. While useful in archaeology for exploring other aspects of personal life history, such as diet (see review in Nehlich 2015), when applied to Late Pleistocene ungulate remains, sulphur isotope analysis is perhaps most useful as a means of investigating geographical range use and, by inference, faunal spatial paleoecology and even the hunting territories of human groups (e.g., Jones et al., 2019).

At the base of the food-chain, the sulphur incorporated into food-webs originates from sulphates in groundwater and rain, as well as from atmospheric deposition, leading to variations in plant, and therefore herbivore, δ^{34} S. Other sources of sulphur also contribute to the bioavailable pool (that which is incorporated into biomolecules), however, notably due to the weathering of sulphur-bearing minerals into soils from different rock types which can introduce additional variation in terrestrial contexts (see discussion in Nehlich 2015: 4, Figure 3). Another major source of variability in sulphur 'isoscapes' is coastal proximity. Sea spray sulphates result in rain and aerosols with δ^{34} S values of ~20 % (Nielsen, 1974), a uniform and relatively high value that is distinct from the more variable values found in terrestrial and freshwater ecosystems (Peterson and Fry, 1987; Nehlich 2015). The influence of these oceanic sulphates on the δ^{34} S of soils, plants and animals can extend tens of kilometers in land—the 'sea spray effect' (e.g., Richards et al., 2001; Zazzo et al., 2011). While there have been comparatively few applications (to either modern or ancient ecosystems), δ^{34} S has been applied to faunal tissues to explore migratory behavior. For example, given the distinctions between terrestrial and marine sulphates, δ^{34} S of otoliths has been used to differentiate between anadromous and non-anadromous ecotypes of fish (e.g., Godbout et al., 2010). The sampling of modern mammalian bodily proteins such as keratin has also demonstrated strong geographical trends, especially with coastal proximity, suggesting spatial variation in sulphur isotopes may prove a useful means of exploring past faunal spatial ecology in certain contexts (e.g., Zazzo et al., 2011). Few modern studies have incorporated the analysis of sulphur isotopes in bone collagen to explore the usefulness of this approach in inferring faunal movements, although limited work on modern North American Rangifer and Bison has demonstrated differences between migratory and non-migratory individuals, and correlations between δ^{34} S and strontium isotope ratios (Britton 2010).

231

232

233

234

235

236

237

238

239

240

241

242

243

244

245

246

247

248

249

250

251

252

253

Applications to Late Pleistocene faunal samples have indicated the potential of these techniques to infer (at least relative) differences in range use by different species in the same region (e.g., Wißing et al., 2019: 4, Figure 2) and possible changes in human hunting range utilized and/or the spatial paleoecology of prey-species through time (e.g., Jones et al., 2019). However, other studies of Late Pleistocene fauna have also indicated that faunal δ^{34} S values, via the δ^{34} S of soils and plants, may (like δ^{15} N) be strongly influenced by prevailing climatic conditions. This includes temperature and the presence of permafrost, both of which may serve to influence the rate of mineralization and volatilization of sulphur in soils, altering soil δ^{34} S (e.g., Drucker et al., 2011; Reade et al., 2020). While work is required to characterize this relationship, variability in soil δ^{34} S induced by climatic change poses a challenge to the further development of this method as a tracer of past faunal spatial behaviors, especially in diachronic studies. The potential for baseline variability through time with climatic change, coupled with modern environmental sulphur contamination, also renders the production of the isoscapes necessary for the spatial assignment of sulphur isotope data in archaeological case studies difficult. Despite this, isoscapes built around archaeological datasets can provide useful approximations of anticipated geographical variability in environmental $\delta^{34}S$ (e.g., Bataille et al., 2021). Furthermore, at any given site, it is still possible to interpret δ^{34} S values of faunal bone collagen from broadly contemporary samples within a relative framework, allowing the identification of individuals or particular taxa/groups that may deviate from the range of δ^{34} S values typically measured in fauna at that site and therefore identifying them as having inhabited a distinct area or range during life. In studies seeking to directly reconstruct seasonal movement habits or identify the use of particular areas of the landscape, however, alternative methods such as strontium isotope analysis are required.

255

256

257

258

259

260

261

262

263

264

265

266

267

268

269

270

271

272

273

274

275

276

277

278

Strontium isotope analysis The ⁸⁷Sr/⁸⁶Sr ratio of herbivore enamel (bioapatite) is directly related to the ⁸⁷Sr/⁸⁶Sr ratio of ingested plants. This, in turn, is a product of the soils and water available to the plants and ultimately correlates with underlying lithologies, with the relative content of ⁸⁷Sr to ⁸⁶Sr being a function of the age of the rock as well as it's mineral composition and original chemical content (Capo et al., 1998; Bentley 2006). Generally, higher ⁸⁷Sr/⁸⁶Sr values are demonstrated in older rocks, and lower values in younger rocks. When combined with serial-sampling, the strontium isotope analysis of can permit the reconstruction of seasonal movements. A small number of archaeological studies have utilized these methods to explore the spatial paleoecology and migratory behavior of Late Pleistocene fauna, including members of the extinct genus Mammut (e.g., Hoppe et al., 2009; Wooller et al., 2021) and Late Pleistocene European Rangifer (e.g., Britton et al., 2011; Price et al., 2017). Significantly, the use of modern materials has recently allowed an assessment of the relationship between movement histories and the isotopic values exhibited in Rangifer enamel—confirming the relationship between environmental and geological conditions, known movements, and dental isotope chemistry (Britton et al., 2009; Britton 2010). There are, however, a number of caveats and considerations related to the use of strontium isotope analysis in inferring animal movements. The careful selection of samples is imperative, requiring teeth that form over a period sufficient to capture at least a year of isotopic inputs. This may, in some cases, mean multiple teeth are required from the same animals, for example in Rangifer (Britton et al., 2009). Data is typically then obtained via the sequential sampling of enamel as horizontal bands down the crown followed by ion-exchange column chemistry to isolate the strontium in the sample, prior to mass spectrometry (e.g., Britton et al., 2011; Funck et al., 2020), or via the direct laser ablation of the enamel (e.g., Wooller et al., 2021). The selection of which technique has implications for data precision, sample destruction, and the resolution achievable (see discussion in Boethius et al., 2022 for a recent summary), but studies

279

280

281

282

283

284

285

286

287

288

289

290

291

292

293

294

295

296

297

298

299

300

301

302

of modern animals of known movements have established both techniques as an effective means of reconstructing movements during the period of tooth formation (e.g., wild migratory Rangifer, Britton et al., 2009; domestic sheep, Lazzerini et al., 2021). The analysis of different individuals from the same herd in both these modern cases has also allowed an assessment of the expected level of intra-herd variability. Finally, in order to interpret intra-tooth strontium data and assess mobility patterns, the establishing of local predicted environmental bioavailable strontium is required, ideally within the framework of a wider isoscape. The deviations between ⁸⁷Sr/⁸⁶Sr variability predicted purely from geological maps, and 'bioavailable' strontium found in soils has been discussed extensively in the literature (see reviews in Capo et al., 1998; Bentley 2006; Britton 2020). Instead of relying on geological maps, isoscapes of 'bioavailable' strontium are typically developed through the determination of ⁸⁷Sr/⁸⁶Sr in modern rock or soil leachates, local waters, plant or faunal samples to generate source data, with the selection of analyte potentially influencing the isoscape produced (see discussion in Britton et al., 2020). These source data are then combined to produce spatial maps of strontium isotopic variation across landscapes using a variety of GIS-based or spatial aggregation techniques (see review in Holt et al., 2021).

323

324

325

326

327

328

304

305

306

307

308

309

310

311

312

313

314

315

316

317

318

319

320

321

322

tools (e.g., Ma et al., 2020).

Oxygen isotope analysis There a number of different applications for oxygen isotope analysis in archaeology and paleoecology, all based on the relationship between the oxygen isotope composition (δ^{18} O) of an animal's body tissues and that of water consumed (Iacumin et al., 1996; Kohn, 1996; Longinelli, 1984; Luz et al., 1984). The oxygen isotope composition of environmental water is closely related to the δ^{18} O values of precipitation, reflecting local

The inference of movement can then be made through visual comparison of variation in data

with variation within those isoscapes, or with the assistance of spatial assignment software

temperatures and other factors (Clark and Fritz, 1997; Dansgaard, 1964; Gat, 1980; Yurtsever, 1975). Although hydrological processes such as water movement, water mixing, groundwater recharge and the formation (and evaporation) of surface water bodies can all influence the oxygen isotope composition of local environmental water (and, by inference, drinking water), broad correlations between groundwater, mean annual precipitation, and climate at specific locales are universally apparent (see review in Pederzani and Britton, 2019). In obligate drinking mammals, where local environmental waters are the primary source of fluids imbibed, the relationship between the δ^{18} O of local environmental water and the δ^{18} O of an animal's body tissues is mediated by the $\delta^{18}O$ of body water. Homeothermic mammals have a metabolically-controlled, relatively constant body temperature (~37°C), and therefore the bioapatite (a carbonated hydroxyapatite) in their mineralized tissues precipitates in oxygen isotope equilibrium with body water at this temperature (Levinson et al., 1987; Longinelli, 1984; Luz et al., 1984). There is, therefore, a roughly linear relationship between the δ^{18} O of ingested water, body water, and bioapatite and this relationship has led to the application of δ¹⁸O to archaeological and paleontological remains as a means of reconstructing past climatic conditions. While some variation in this relationship has been noted between species, fractionation factors have been established for a number of different taxa based on modern experimental studies (e.g., Delgado Huertas et al., 1995 [horses]), allowing the development of these techniques on faunal remains from archaeological sites as a means of reconstructing past paleotemperatures. Paleothermic reconstructions using the oxygen isotope analysis of faunal remains from European Late Pleistocene sites have focused on a range of different mammalian species, and have employed analyses of both the carbonate (CO₃) and phosphate (PO₄) components of tooth enamel, using a range of different Pleistocene mammals (e.g., Delgado Huertas et al., 1997; Fabre et al., 2011; Skrzypek et al., 2011; Kovács et al., 2012). As obligate drinkers with

329

330

331

332

333

334

335

336

337

338

339

340

341

342

343

344

345

346

347

348

349

350

351

352

significant daily water requirements, and taxa found in both glacial and interglacial faunal assemblages, equids and large bovids are particularly useful for mapping past δ^{18} O precipitation patterns and paleoclimate conditions. The analyses of these taxa from anthropogenically-derived (archaeofaunal) assemblages have the potential to generate terrestrial paleoclimate proxy data near-synchronous to human site-use, enabling estimates of mean annual temperatures when dental tissues are bulk sampled (e.g., Britton et al., 2019) and of seasonal paleotemperatures when hypsodont teeth are incrementally sampled (e.g., Pederzani et al., 2021). In addition to the in-built assumptions inherent in the reconstruction of paleotemperatures detailed above, a number of other factors can influence data produced and thus paleotemperature estimates. For example, the choice of tooth sampled is important. Early forming teeth, in general, should be avoided due to a known enrichment in ¹⁸O in the body water (and thus tissues) of juvenile animals during nursing compared to adult individuals (see review in Pederzani and Britton 2019). Sampling strategy therefore must incorporate knowledge of likely age-at-weaning for species targeted. As well as tooth selected, method of sampling can influence data generated (Reade et al., 2015). In the determination of bioapatite δ¹⁸O different moieties can be targeted, influencing data obtained. In paleotemperature reconstructions using older Paleolithic materials, the phosphate is often the favored analyte as it is generally considered to be more resistant to post-depositional alteration compared to the carbonate component (Iacumin et al., 1996; Zazzo et al., 2004). Furthermore, the vast majority of modern calibration data for converting bioapatite δ^{18} O to predicted δ^{18} O drinking water has so far been generated from phosphate data and the use of carbonate $\delta^{18}O$ ($\delta^{18}O_{CO3}$) for paleotemperature estimation would therefore require an additional conversion step to predicted δ^{18} O of bioapatite phosphate (δ^{18} O_{PO4}) prior to paleotemperature calculations, which can increase uncertainty. Conversion equations themselves, which are required to convert $\delta^{18}O_{PO4}$

354

355

356

357

358

359

360

361

362

363

364

365

366

367

368

369

370

371

372

373

374

375

376

377

to estimates of the $\delta^{18}O$ of drinking water ($\delta^{18}O_{dw}$) and then to estimates of temperature, also include inherent assumptions and introduce (often large) compound uncertainties (Pryor et al., 2014). These conversions, and the uncertainties introduced, are discussed at length in a number of papers (e.g., Pryor et al., 2014) and are detailed here in the Supplementary Online Material (SOM) S3.

384

385

386

387

388

389

390

391

392

393

394

395

396

397

398

399

400

401

402

403

379

380

381

382

383

1.3. The site of Abri du Maras

The site of Abri du Maras is located on the west bank of the Rhône River, in a small valley at the confluence of the Ardèche River (Fig. 1). The site is all that remains of a vast southeast facing rock shelter, situated today 70 m above the river itself at the outer edge of the gorge. The Rhône Valley lies between mountainous regions—the Massif Central to the west and the foothills of the Alps to the east—with the valley itself connecting more northerly parts of France to the Mediterranean. Many tributaries, including the Ardèche River, connect the Rhône River to the Massif Central. Archaeological and zooarchaeological evidence from the region's caves and rock shelters suggest a farsighted circulating subsistence model closely associated with the regional micro-topography, interactions with non-human carnivores and the estimated availability of (seasonal) resources including prey-species, biotopes and raw material outcrops (Daujeard and Moncel 2010; Daujeard et al., 2016). Monospecific prey assemblages, characterized by the high dominance of remains of a single species represented by a large (minimum) number of individuals (Gaudzinski, 2006), are found at some Middle Paleolithic sites in the region, including at Abri du Maras with Rangifer (Daujeard and Moncel, 2010; Daujeard et al., 2012; Moncel and Daujeard, 2012; Daujeard et al., 2019; Marin et al., 2020; Moncel et al., 2021). Monospecific faunal assemblages increase significantly all over Europe from MIS 5 onwards, and when involving animals that live in large herds, such as reindeer, are often linked to cooperative and planned mass hunting strategies, and flexible resource

utilization against a background of increasing climatic instability (Gaudzinkski, 2006). In such 404 405 contexts, understanding the spatial paleoecology of the prey taxa can be key to interpreting 406 these human hunting practices (e.g., interception hunting; Britton et al., 2011). 407 Since 2009, excavations of the site have focused on Middle Paleolithic deposits, including 408 stratigraphic unit 5 (bottom of the currently documented sequence at the site, dating to the end of MIS 5) and overlying unit 4, which contains two archaeological levels in its upper part 409 410 (levels 4.1 and 4.2) which both date to MIS 3. The site has been dated by electron spin 411 resonance (ESR) and Uranium-Thorium (U-Th) methods, with level 4.1 dating to between 46 412 \pm 3 ka and 40 \pm 3 ka and level 4.2 yielding dates ranging between 55 \pm 2 to 42 \pm 3 ka (Richard 413 et al., 2015). Further analyses of two enamel hydroxyapatite samples from level 4.2 using these 414 same methods have yielded ages of 42 ± 3 and 42 ± 6 , which together with an infrared 415 stimulated luminescence (IRSL) age of 46 ± 4 ka confirm the attribution of this site to MIS 3 416 (Richard et al., 2021). Both of these levels contain the well-preserved evidence of hominin 417 occupation, including abundant lithic artefacts, rare cordage remains, traces of combustion and 418 diffuse ash lenses, and anthropogenically-modified faunal remains. The lithic assemblage 419 comprises Levallois products and other core technologies, and includes retouched flakes, 420 blades projectile tips and points largely made of local and semi-local flint (Hardy et al., 2013; 421 Moncel et al., 2014; Daujeard et al., 2019; Hardy et al., 2020; Ruebens et al., 2022). Despite 422 being close in date (or even sub-contemporaneous), levels 4.1 and 4.2 have yielded very different faunal and seasonality-indicator data, along with slightly different patterns of 423 424 butchery which may suggest site use by two distinct groups with contrasting traditions (Vettese 425 et al., 2022). The faunal spectrum in 4.2 is varied and comprises, in order of abundance, 426 Rangifer tarandus, Equus ferus cf. germanicus, Bison priscus, Cervus elaphus and 427 Megaloceros giganteus, with spring-summer and autumn human occupations. Level 4.1 is 428 largely dominated by Rangifer which, combined with indicators of selective butchery and autumn season of death mortality profile, is suggestive of seasonally-restricted, cooperative and planned mass *Rangifer* hunting strategy and short-term occupations (Daujeard et al., 2019; Moncel et al., 2021; Vignes, 2021; SOM Table S1). Understanding potential differences in the paleoecology of species exploited, particularly the spatial ecology of Rangifer, would be an important step in better understanding Neanderthal subsistence strategies in these different levels. Aside from the (macro-) faunal remains, paleoenvironmental studies have been limited for levels 4.1 and 4.2 of the site. Micromammals are scarce, largely due to poor preservation, although the presence of a single sample of *Microtus* ex gr. arvalis-agrestis found in level 4.1 is consistent with a rather open environment (Daujeard et al., 2019). Dental microwear analysis of reindeer from level 4.1 has indicated grass-dominated mixed feeding, which is also consistent with an open environment, complementing the results of a small isotopic pilot study on faunal material from the same level indicating a lack of dense forest cover (Daujeard et al., 2019). Charcoal identified in both levels 4.1 and 4.2, however, suggest the presence of at least some woodland and taxonomic analyses has identified *Pinus sylvestris* type in both levels 4.1 and 4.2, along with Betula in level 4.1 only (Daujeard et al., 2019). While Pinus sylvestris grow in dry and cold conditions, Betula require higher soil humidity rates, which may indicate that, in level 4.1 at least, conditions may have been relatively humid/milder (which is in agreement with the results of sedimentological analysis for the site, see Daujeard et al., 2019; Moncel et al., 2021). These data may seem somewhat contradictory to the presence of *Rangifer*, which are often considered a cold-adapted species and therefore inferring a harsh or steppic environment. However, it should be noted that there are multiple ecotypes of Rangifer today (Festa-Bianchet et al., 2011) and the behaviors and habitat preferences of Late Pleistocene European Rangifer (and variation therein) should not be assumed. Furthermore, it has long been recognized that the environments of northern Europe during MIS 3 (and at other phases

429

430

431

432

433

434

435

436

437

438

439

440

441

442

443

444

445

446

447

448

449

450

451

452

of the Late Pleistocene) were non-analogous to any modern environment, that is, characterized by combinations of animals (and plants) living together that are not found in sympatry today (see Stewart 2005 for discussion of Europe as a whole, and Foury et al., 2016 for discussion of the Rhône valley specifically). Therefore, given the limited paleoenvironmental data available from Abri du Maras, the diversity of species present (i.e., Rangifer with two other cervids, including the extinct Megaloceros) at the site, and the differences in prey-selection and seasonality of site use indicated from past zooarchaeogical studies between levels 4.1 and 4.2, elucidating further information about the paleoecology of the species exploited, or the broader paleoenvironmental suite, using isotope zooarchaeological approaches is of key interest. Here, we present the results of a multi-isotope, multi-tissue study of herbivore remains from level 4.1 (46 \pm 3 to 40 \pm 3 ka) and level 4.2 (55 \pm 2 to 42 \pm 3 ka) at the Middle Paleolithic site of Abri du Maras (Ardèche, France), with the goal of providing new insights into the paleoenvironmental and paleoecological context of Neanderthal activity in the Rhône Valley during MIS 3. The specific aims of this study are: 1) to provide evidence of local paleothermic conditions; 2) to assess niche feeding behaviors and landscape use by key subsistence species; 3) to examine potential relationships between herbivore ecology and/or seasonal biogeography at the site, the paleoenvironment, and the subsistence behaviors of contemporary hominin groups.

472

473

475

476

477

478

471

454

455

456

457

458

459

460

461

462

463

464

465

466

467

468

469

470

2. Materials and methods

474 2.1. Sample selection

Ungulate bone and teeth from the recent excavations at Abri du Maras (levels 4.1 and 4.2) were selected for destructive sampling and isotope analysis, including teeth of *Equus* and *Rangifer* for oxygen and strontium isotope analysis respectively, and *Bison*, *Cervus*, *Equus*, *Megaloceros* and *Rangifer* bone for carbon, nitrogen and sulphur isotope analysis (see Table 1

for all samples involved in this study). These samples are part of collections currently housed at the Institut de Paléontologie Humaine (IPH), Paris, for their ongoing study following taxonomic identification. Due to sample availability, two complete Equus mandibular second premolars were sampled and analyzed for oxygen (δ^{18} O) isotope analyses for climate reconstruction from level 4.2 only. Depending on the extent of tooth wear, horse second premolar enamel mineralizes between the ages of ~13 and 31 months, allowing the inference of more than a year of isotopic inputs (Hoppe et al., 2004). Weaning in horses generally takes place before the start of second premolar development, meaning that any nursing effects on δ^{18} O are avoided by choosing this tooth type (Hoppe et al., 2004). A third Equus tooth, a third molar, suitable for analyses was recovered from level 4.1, but was only analyzed for $^{87}Sr/^{86}Sr$ (see below) but not $\delta^{18}O$. As different tooth positions exhibit different enamel mineralization rates throughout tooth growth, they are not exactly comparable in their seasonal δ^{18} O patterns, a concern particularly in horses (Bendrey et al., 2015). As this M3 was the only available *Equus* tooth specimen from level 4.1 any inter-level difference in δ^{18} O could not be securely assigned to environmental differences but could also be an artefact from comparing different tooth positions. For this reason, we decided not to sample this tooth for δ^{18} O. No bone was sampled from these individuals due to them being loose teeth. In order to explore the seasonal mobility of Rangifer, two mandibular teeth (second and third molars) were selected from four *Rangifer* for strontium (87Sr/86Sr) isotope analyses. Due to the availability of material, samples included three individuals from level 4.1, but only a single individual from level 4.2. While intra-tooth δ^{18} O can be helpful in 'anchoring' 87 Sr/ 86 Sr within a seasonal context, given that Rangifer are non-obligate drinkers and long-distance and/or altitudinal migrations can cause intra-tooth δ^{18} O profiles to deviate substantially from a classic seasonal sinusoid (Britton et al., 2009), coupled with the need for minimally-destructive intra-

479

480

481

482

483

484

485

486

487

488

489

490

491

492

493

494

495

496

497

498

499

500

501

502

tooth sampling, the decision was made not to sample the Rangifer teeth for oxygen isotope analysis. However, in the absence of oxygen isotope data, the periodicity of Rangifer tooth crown formation and mineralization, and thus the seasonality of intra-tooth ⁸⁷Sr/⁸⁶Sr can still be approximated based on previous studies, including a single radiograph study (Wu et al., 2012) and from comparable datasets from other cervid species. For example, Brown and Chapman (1991: 373) determined that formation of the second and third molar crowns of *Dama* dama commence at <3.5 and 9 months of age and complete at 9 and <18 months respectively. While intra-tooth oxygen isotope studies on *Rangifer* are not straight forward for the reasons stated above, the scant intra-tooth oxygen isotope data from modern migratory and nonmigratory individuals (Britton et al., 2009; Britton 2010) suggest these estimates of enamel mineralization time are appropriate. Therefore, sampling of the se second and third molars can (depending on extent of wear) provide evidence of calving grounds, summer and winter range during the first year of life, and summer/autumn range during the second year of life (Britton et al., 2009). It must be noted, however, that any intra-tooth isotope study using archaeological materials has unavoidable assumptions inbuilt with regards to both the growth rate/mineralization time and birth seasonality of ancestral species being similar to extant individuals today. Anticipated to be a likely non-migratory species, an *Equus* third molar was selected from level 4.1 for strontium isotope analyses as a comparator to the *Rangifer*. Following on from a previous pilot study of stable carbon (δ^{13} C) and nitrogen (δ^{15} N) isotopic niche variability in Equus (n = 3), Megaloceros (n = 2) and Rangifer (n = 3) from level 4.1 (Daujeard et al., 2019), further bone samples from five ungulate taxa were selected for collagen extraction and analyses from level 4.2, including Equus (n = 5), Megaloceros (n = 2), Rangifer (n = 1), Bison (n = 2) and Cervus elaphus (n = 5). It should be noted that, with the exception of the Rangifer sample from level 4.2 (M10-121) from which both mandibular teeth and bone were sampled, bone samples and the teeth sampled for strontium and oxygen described did not

504

505

506

507

508

509

510

511

512

513

514

515

516

517

518

519

520

521

522

523

524

525

526

527

(to our knowledge) originate from the same individuals. While, ideally, these different isotope analyses would be undertaken from the same individuals, the horse teeth were all loose and it was not possible to sample the mandibles from the reindeer from which teeth were selected in level 4.1 due to their poor preservation/friability. Conversely, while bone was successfully sampled from other *Rangifer* mandibles in level 4.1, their teeth were insufficient for strontium isotope analyses (e.g., lacking in a complete and relatively unworn second and/or third molar, both of which are required to reconstruct a full year of movement history).

536

537

538

539

540

541

542

543

544

545

546

547

548

549

550

551

552

553

529

530

531

532

533

534

535

2.2. Tooth and bone sampling protocols

For all teeth, the buccal face of the anterior loph was selected for sampling as it tends to have thicker enamel than the lingual side. The whole face was abraded (using air abrasion) to remove superficial enamel. Each complete tooth was then ultrasonicated in Milli-Q ultrapure water for 5 mins. Incremental enamel samples were taken as horizontal bands, perpendicular to the tooth growth axis, using a diamond-coated tungsten carbide cutter point (NTI-Kahla) from the enamel-root junction (ERJ) to the occlusal surface. Sampling increments were 1-2 mm, measured as distances from the ERJ in each specimen using digital calipers. For the Equus from level 4.2, between 25 and 28 samples of fine enamel powder, ranging in weight from ~5 to \sim 15 mg, were collected from each tooth. For the *Rangifer*, between 5 and 10 serial samples of fine enamel powder, ranging in weight between ~3 and ~8 mg (albeit with a single sample, SEVA32976IX, weighing ~1mg) were collected from each tooth depending on crown height available to sample/extend of wear. A single sample of dentine, presumed to be diagenetically altered and therefore reflecting of local soil values, was taken from the molar roots of each of the Rangifer teeth samples in order to provide a secondary indicator of local environmental strontium ⁸⁷Sr/⁸⁶Sr at the site. For the single *Equus* tooth from level 4.1, three samples, spaced evenly down the crown (~12–14 mm apart), were taken in a similar way. Bone (~1–2 g) was

sampled for collagen extraction using rotary stainless-steel cutting implements and cleaned using air abrasion.

556

557

558

559

560

561

562

563

564

565

566

567

568

569

570

571

572

573

574

554

555

2.3. Oxygen isotope analysis

Silver phosphate precipitations and mass spectrometry Serial samples of *Equus* tooth enamel (~10 mg) were prepared for phosphate oxygen isotope analysis in the Archaeological Chemistry Laboratories, Department of Archaeology, University of Aberdeen following methods described in Britton et al. (2019) using a rapid precipitation method, after Tütken et al. (2006) and based on O'Neil et al. (1994) and Dettmann et al. (2001: Appendix, GSA Data Repository item 20018), with minor modifications. Phosphate δ^{18} O values were determined by continuous flow isotope ratio mass spectrometry (CF-IRMS), measured with a Thermo-Fisher thermal conversion elemental analyzer (TC-EA) connected to a Finnigan Delta Plus XL mass spectrometer, at the Department of Geochemistry, University of Tübingen, Germany. Mean values and standard deviations (1 SD) were provided by the analyzing laboratory, calculated from the analysis of each sample in triplicate (SOM Table S2). In some instances, mean values were provided from duplicate measurements, due to small sample size, sample loss, loss of sample integrity or through internal data quality control checks in Tübingen (SOM Table S2). Long-term laboratory reproducibility was reported as $\pm 0.3\%$ (1 SD), while mean reproducibility for the samples analyzed in this study was \pm 0.2% (1 SD) or better. A detailed description of silver phosphate precipitation, and the calibration of mass spectrometry data and standards can be found in SOM S1.

575

576

577

578

Modelling of intra-tooth oxygen isotope data, conversion equations and air temperature estimations. The extended process of tooth enamel growth and mineralization of ungulate teeth causes a predictable damping of the seasonal amplitude of oxygen isotopic change expressed

tooth enamel compared to the seasonal amplitude in consumed environmental water (Kohn et al., 1996; Passey and Cerling, 2002; Kohn, 2004; Blumenthal et al., 2014; Green et al., 2017; Trayler and Kohn, 2017). Therefore, a correction procedure is necessary in order to obtain faithful paleotemperature reconstructions on a seasonal time scale, which can be achieved using an inverse model (Passey et al., 2005; Green et al., 2018). Such models take into account the sampling geometry and species-specific characteristics of tooth enamel formation to estimate the original δ^{18} O input. In this study, horse tooth enamel δ^{18} O seasonal curves were inverse modelled following methods in Passey et al. (2005) using R v.4.1.2 (R Core Team, 2021) and an R code translation of the originally published MATLAB code. Details of the modelling procedure are described in SOM S2 and we provide all code and data necessary to reproduce this step in the SOM File S1. Corrected summer peak and winter trough δ^{18} O values were extracted from the most likely model solutions and used to estimate summer and winter paleotemperatures following methods in Pryor et al. (2014), and are described in more detail in SOM S2. Mean δ^{18} O values were computed as the mean of unmodeled summer peak and winter trough values, rather than as annual averages, following comparisons in Pederzani et al. (2021) showing that summer/winter means and year-long averages of modelled or unmodeled $\delta^{18}O$ sinusoidal curves yield essentially identical results. However, to indicate that these values don't represent averages of complete annual cycles, we refer to them as 'midpoints' to avoid confusion. Details of the temperature estimation procedure are provided in SOM S2, and we provide the spreadsheets

600

601

579

580

581

582

583

584

585

586

587

588

589

590

591

592

593

594

595

596

597

598

599

2.4. Bone collagen extraction and analysis

that were used for all estimations in SOM File S1.

Collagen was extracted using the Longin (1971) method, with modifications based on the recommendations of Collins and Galley (1998), and with the addition of an ultrafiltration step

(Brown, et al., 1988), as described in Britton et al. (2012). Collagen samples were analyzed (in duplicate) for stable carbon (δ^{13} C) and nitrogen (δ^{15} N) isotope ratios at the Department of Human Evolution, Max Planck Institute for Evolutionary Anthropology (MPI-EVA, Leipzig, Germany), on a Delta XP mass spectrometer coupled to a Flash EA 2112 elemental analyzer, with an analytical precision of \pm 0.3% (1 SD) or better based on replicate analyses of an inhouse methionine standard. See SOM S3 for details of data normalization and standards (inhouse and international). An additional aliquot of collagen was analyzed for stable sulphur (δ^{34} S) isotopes at the Scottish Universities Research Centre (SUERC) for all collagen extracts, including those from which δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N data have been previously presented (Table 1; Daujeard et al., 2019). This was conducted on a Delta V Advantage continuous-flow isotope ratio mass spectrometer coupled via a ConfloIV to an IsoLink elemental analyzer (Thermo Scientific, Bremen), a system which enables the co-measurement of carbon, nitrogen and sulphur stable isotope ratios (Sayle et al., 2019), generating additional δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N measurements as well as δ^{34} S with an analytical precision of \pm 0.3% (1 SD) or better for each isotope (see SOM S2 for method statement and details of normalization of data and standards). As multiple sets of δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N measurements were obtained from each sample (see SOM Table S3 and Table S4 for MPI-EVA and SUERC data, respectively), for the purposes of this study the calculated mean of all measurements is used for each sample (SOM Table S5), which slightly modifies the values reported for some of the same samples from level 4.1 previously reported in Daujeard et al. (2019). However, across the two laboratories, the average standard deviation (1 SD) about the mean for the measurement of all individual aliquots was lower than the largest long-term reproducibility/analytical error reported by either laboratory. Thus, the data are considered comparable. No subsequent statistical treatments were applied to the carbon and nitrogen isotope data, beyond the descriptive statistics in the text below (mean, standard deviation, etc.). However, we explored

604

605

606

607

608

609

610

611

612

613

614

615

616

617

618

619

620

621

622

623

624

625

626

627

the partition of the samples according to their $\delta^{34}S$ values using hierarchical clustering ('hclust' base function, R v.4.1.2). We used the 'average' agglomeration method to define the clusters as it provided the highest cophenetic correlation coefficient for our dataset (c = 0.896) among the different agglomeration methods (Legendre and Legendre 1998).

2.5. Strontium isotope analysis

Sample preparation and mass spectrometry All samples of *Rangifer* tooth enamel (plus the dentine, and three sub-samples of *Equus* tooth enamel from level 4.1) were analyzed for strontium isotope ratios using the ion-exchange solution method described in Copeland et al. (2008) and Britton et al. 2009, a modification of the method from Deniel and Pin (2001). 87 Sr/ 86 Sr ratios were determined using a Thermo Fisher (Thermo Fisher Scientific, Bremen, Germany) Neptune multi-collector inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometer (MC-ICP-MS) in the Department of Human Evolution at the Max Planck Institute for Evolutionary Anthropology. Strontium concentrations of the enamel samples were determined using the method described in Copeland et al. (2008), which is accurate to within \pm 31 ppm. Analytical precision was \pm 0.00003 (2 SD) or better, based on the repeat analysis of external and in-house standards. For detailed descriptions of sample preparation, correction of mass spectrometry data and details of standards and blanks see SOM S5.

Spatial assignment For the four *Rangifer*, in addition to the generation of individual intra-tooth profiles (see below, 'Results'), and one *Equus*, spatial assignment of strontium isotope data from three points during tooth growth in each individual tooth-pair was undertaken using the 'assignR' package v.2.2.0 in R (Ma et al., 2020). Assignment of the *Equus* samples were done as a reference for a (presumably) local, non-migratory species. The 'assignR' package permits the inference of geographical origin from isotope data, with assignments in the case of ⁸⁷Sr/⁸⁶Sr

based on variability of environmental ⁸⁷Sr/⁸⁶Sr across the landscape (the strontium isoscape; Fig. 2). We used the global bioavailable ⁸⁷Sr/⁸⁶Sr isoscape, and the associated spatial error raster produced by Bataille et al. (2020). The three sample locations in each *Rangifer* sampled selected for spatial assignment include: 1) the sample closest to the occlusal surface of the second molar (the earliest forming section of the intra-tooth profiles obtained, expected to broadly correspond with location during the first summer of life); 2) the sample closest to the ERJ of the second molar (broadly corresponding to location during the first winter of life); and 3) the sample closest to the ERJ of the third molar (broadly corresponding to location during the second summer/autumn of life). For *Equus*, the three samples were taken from the M3, close to the occlusal surface, at the midpoint, and close to the ERJ. For each sample, treated as sample of unknown origin, we generated the posterior probability surface of origin rescaled to 1, then we extracted the area corresponding to 80% of the posterior probability density. R code is provided in SOM File 2.

3. Results

3.1 Intra-tooth enamel oxygen isotope data from level 4.2 Equus

Oxygen isotope data generated from two *Equus* teeth (lower second premolars) from level 4.2 demonstrate sinusoidal intra-tooth patterns, with values ranging from 16.3 to 19.3% with a midpoint (mean of summer and winter extremes) of 17.8% (N6-767) and 15.2 to 18.9% with a midpoint of 17.1% (N6-687; Fig. 3, and full data in SOM Table S2 and summary of seasonal extrema in SOM Table S6). This results in a seasonal δ^{18} O amplitude of ~ 3%. Given the well documented linear relationship between *Equus* sp. enamel δ^{18} O and drinking water δ^{18} O (Bryant et al., 1994; Sánchez Chillón et al., 1994; Delgado Huertas et al., 1995), we take the characteristic sinusoidal δ^{18} O curves seen here in sequentially sampled tooth enamel to be reflective of seasonal changes in δ^{18} O of environmental water consumed by these individuals,

that most likely in turn reflect seasonal temperature changes. Based on the linear relationship between $\delta^{18}O$ of enamel ($\delta^{18}O_{enamel}$) and $\delta^{18}O$ of drinking water ($\delta^{18}O_{dw}$) and in turn with $\delta^{18}O$ of precipitation, as described in SOM S3, we estimated $\delta^{18}O_{dw}$ and paleotemperatures in order to facilitate comparisons with other paleoclimate information and with modern climates. This approach relies on some inherent assumptions including a certain degree of physiological similarity between modern and Pleistocene animals, a broadly comparable system of atmospheric circulation, and that drinking water sources of the studied animals isotopically reflect precipitation inputs. These are mostly thought to be justified for European Late Pleistocene settings, although local hydrotopography and drinking water sources need to be studied on a case-by-case basis. Additionally, it should be noted that they introduce a certain unavoidable (and mathematically not fully captured) degree of uncertainty to paleotemperature estimations (see Pryor et al., 2014 and SOM S2 for details on error sources that are accounted for). An overview of unmodelled summer, mean and winter $\delta^{18}O_{enamel}$, inverse modelled summer and winter δ^{18} O, and corresponding δ^{18} O_{dw} and paleotemperature estimates is provided in SOM Table S6. Drinking water δ^{18} O estimates fall at -0.6 \pm 2.1% for summer, -7.6 \pm 2.1% for annual means, and at $-16.2 \pm 2.2\%$ for winter (Fig. 4). In comparison, interpolated estimates of modern precipitation δ^{18} O indicate that current precipitation at the site exhibits δ^{18} O values of -1.5% in July and -9.9% in January and mean annual δ^{18} O of -6.3 \pm 0.1% (95% CI; Bowen and Revenaugh, 2003; Bowen et al., 2005; Bowen, 2022), Paleotemperature conversions for the two individuals from level 4.2 indicate summer temperatures of 31 ± 4.8°C, winter temperatures of -10 ± 4.3 °C and mean annual temperatures of 12 ± 4.0 °C (Fig. 4), where error ranges indicate the compound error of the paleotemperature estimation as described in Pryor et al. (2014). This compares to modern day (1981-2009) temperatures of 4.3 ± 1.6 °C in January,

679

680

681

682

683

684

685

686

687

688

689

690

691

692

693

694

695

696

697

698

699

700

701

703 23.3 ± 1.1 °C in July and an annual average of 13.4 ± 0.5 °C estimated for the site using the

704 ClimateEU model (Marchi et al., 2020).

705

721

722

723

724

725

726

3.2. Bone collagen carbon, nitrogen and sulphur isotope data of ungulates from level 4.1 and

707 4.2

708 Full results of the faunal bone collagen extracted and analyzed from Abri du Maras can be found in the SOM (SOM Table S3 [Leipzig], SOM Table S4 [SUERC], and SOM Table S5 709 [means]), including all quality (%C, %N, %S, C:N, C:S and N:S) data. δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N of all 710 specimens are shown in Figure 5, and corresponding δ^{34} S data of all samples with sufficient 711 712 remaining collagen for that analysis are shown in Figure 6. Although approximately half of the 713 samples have %C and %N marginally lower than that of modern collagen (i.e. less than \sim 35 \pm 714 8.8 wt% for C, and 11–16 wt% for N; van Klinken 1999), their atomic C:N ratios are between 715 3.2 and 3.5, and are therefore within the expected range for well-preserved bone (DeNiro, 1985; Ambrose, 1990; van Klinken, 1999; Dobberstein et al., 2009). Furthermore, δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N 716 717 values are not significantly correlated with %C or %N respectively, or with C:N ratios (see 718 SOM Figs. S1–S4). The atomic C:S ratios range from 545 to 827 and the N:S ratios range from 719 157 to 250, and are therefore within the range expected for modern mammalian bone collagen

720 (C:S = 600 ± 300 and N:S = 200 ± 100 ; Nehlich and Richards, 2009).

Mean δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N values (\pm 1 SD) for horses (n = 8) are -20.3 \pm 0.2‰ and 3.3 \pm 0.8‰, and values are similar within both levels. Mean values from the *Bison* samples (n = 2), both level 4.2, are elevated relative to the horses with being -19.7 \pm 0.0‰ and 5.6 \pm 0.0‰ for carbon and nitrogen respectively. The three cervid taxa all have similar mean δ^{13} C (*Megaloceros*: -19.5 \pm 0.1‰ [n = 4]; *Rangifer*: -19.9 \pm 0.2‰ [n = 4]; *Cervus elaphus*: -19.8 \pm 0.2‰ [n = 5]), but differ in their δ^{15} N, with *Cervus elaphus* (all from level 4.2) having the lowest values (3.9 \pm 0.4‰),

727 Megaloceros have the most elevated values $(5.5 \pm 0.1\%)$ and Rangifer displaying the greatest 728 range of values from 3.9 to 6.0% (mean = 4.8 ± 0.9 %). 729 Of the 23 bone collagen extractions, 19 yielded sufficient material for the measurement of sulphur isotope ratios. While species δ^{34} S means (± 1 SD) are similar in some species (e.g., 730 731 *Megaloceros*: $5.2 \pm 0.6\%$ [n = 3]; *Bison*: $5.5 \pm 0.2\%$ [n = 2]; as well as between *Rangifer*: 3.7732 $\pm 2.8\%$ [n = 4] and Cervus elaphus: $3.3 \pm 1.2\%$ [n = 4]), there are notable differences between 733 species and, in some cases, between levels. Rangifer and Cervus elaphus display a greater range 734 of values than other species, including an outlier value of 0% in the single Rangifer sampled 735 from level 4.2 (Fig. 6). Of the samples that have sulphur data, both Cervus elaphus (n = 4; level 4.2 only) and Equus (n = 6) have a fairly wide range of δ^{34} S values (from 2.0% to 4.9%; and 736 737 2.3% to 6.8% respectively), although not as large as the range of sulphur isotope ratios shown 738 in the Rangifer (which varies from 0.0% to 6.0%). With the exception of the single Rangifer 739 sample from level 4.2, according to the hierarchical cluster analysis, the animals at Abri du 740 Maras fall into two broad groups with regards to sulphur: group 1) 4.8–6.8‰ and group 2) ~2– 741 3.2% (SOM Fig. S3). All species analyzed are present in group 1, and Equus, Rangifer and 742 Cervus can be found in group 2, with animals from both levels found in each of the groups. A 743 recently produced sulphur isoscape for the region (based on bone collagen data from the Mesolithic to the modern day) suggests that $\delta^{34}S$ values around Abri du Maras could be 744 745 expected to range from 4 to 7‰ (SOM Fig. S4, based on data from Bataille et al., 2021). Thus, 746 individuals from sulphur group 1 are consistent with this local range, but those in group 2 are 747 comparatively low, and not consistent with values found within the immediate region.

748

749

750

751

3.3. Intra-tooth strontium isotope data from Rangifer and Equus from level 4.1 and 4.2

Tooth enamel strontium (Sr) concentrations of archaeological Rangifer samples ranged from

86–200 ppm (SOM Table S7), which are similar to those measured in modern caribou (Britton

et al., 2009) and in domestic cattle (Evans et al., 2007). Strontium concentrations of Equus enamel were higher (~250 ppm), but also in line with values expected from archaeological herbivore teeth (Evans et al., 2007; Groot et al., 2020). Data from the M₂ and M₃ of intra-tooth samples of all three individual *Rangifer* sampled from level 4.1 bear similar isotope values (Fig. 7; SOM Table S7), ranging from 0.7085 to 0.7101 with a mean of 0.7089 \pm 0.0003. This average is a little higher than the mean of three samples of horse tooth enamel sampled from a single horse from the same level, close to the occlusal surface, mid-crown and at the enamel root junction (0.7086 \pm 0.0001). The strontium isotope values measured in all dentine samples from Rangifer from both level 4.1 and level 4.2 range from 0.7086 and 0.7092 (mean = 0.7088 \pm 0.0003), are a secondary confirmation of the expected range of local values (see Fig. 2 for a predicted strontium isoscape of the region). In contrast, the intra-tooth values of the single reindeer individual sampled from level 4.2 shows a different trend to the reindeer from level 4.1, with a higher degree of intra-tooth variability, the values ranging from 0.7090 to 0.7125 (mean = 0.7112 ± 0.0012). The raw posterior probability distribution maps assessed from the ⁸⁷Sr/⁸⁶Sr spatial assignment from the three different locations on the crowns of four Rangifer and one Equus are provided in SOM Figures S7, S8, and S9. Based on the spatial assignment of the samples closest to the occlusal surface of both the M₂ and the M₃, we determined the areas where the samples have an 80% chance of originating, and considered these areas respectively as the winter and summer areas potentially used by each Rangifer (Fig. 8). For the Equus we determined the potential areas corresponding to the highest and the lowest 87Sr/86Sr values of its profile, respectively the sample closest to the M₃ ERJ (0.7086) and the sample closest to the occlusal surface (0.7085), which are almost entirely overlapping (91.8% of overlap; Fig. 8). The three Rangifer from level 4.1, as well as the Equus, show potential use of areas within of ~50 km of Abri du Maras in both winter and summer but also areas on the eastern side of the Rhône Valley

752

753

754

755

756

757

758

759

760

761

762

763

764

765

766

767

768

769

770

771

772

773

774

775

or southwest of Abri du Maras (Fig. 8). Summer and winter ranges of *Rangifer* J6-306 almost overlap entirely (88.4% of overlap) and show a strong agreement with the *Equus*' range. A similar pattern is observed for *Rangifer* 80/133 while the overlap between potential summer and winter ranges is less pronounced (48.6%). *Rangifer* N6-178 seems to show a higher segregation in its seasonal range use (21.4% of overlap) but both potential summer and winter ranges can still be found close to Abri du Maras. Spatial assignment also highlighted for this individual potential areas in summer slightly further north of Abri du Maras (Fig. 8). *Rangifer* M10-121 from level 4.2, shows a complete separation between the potential summer and winter areas (0% of overlap, Fig. 8). Summer assignment highlights areas similar to the ones used by the *Equus* and the *Rangifer* from level 4.1, in the vicinity of Abri du Maras. However, winter assignment suggests the use of areas away from Abri du Maras with potential areas located 150-200 km from the site, in the northern most parts of the Rhône valley or further to the east, or even more distant, in the southwest direction (Fig. 8).

4. Discussion

792 4.1. Paleoclimatic context

Seasonal paleotemperatures at Abri du Maras Based on the oxygen isotope data from level 4.2, and compared to modern day temperatures at the study site (Fig. 4), the MIS 3 climate at Abri du Maras seems to have been similar, if perhaps slightly colder to modern day conditions in terms of mean annual averages, but substantially more seasonal than today (i.e. with warmer summers, and cooler winters). It should be noted that seasonal paleotemperature reconstructions are substantially less reliable than mean annual paleotemperature estimates, due to the necessity of using an inverse model in order to try and remove the effect of time averaging from the tooth enamel mineralization process. While we believe seasonal temperatures to be particularly relevant to reconstructing environments and human-climate

interactions, this limitation means that temperature seasonality can at most be discussed in relatively broad terms, or when supported by direct isotopic comparisons, and we discuss this in more detail below (section 4.2). The number of individuals analyzed here is relatively small, which increases the uncertainty around paleotemperature estimates. However, both individuals are remarkably similar in their δ^{18} O seasonal curves, indicating a consistent reflection of environmental parameters across individuals. At the same time, sinusoidal δ^{18} O curves with a pronounced seasonal amplitude in both individuals indicates that they were unlikely to have obtained much drinking water from a seasonally buffered water source such as large rivers or springs fed from groundwater. This further indicates that Equus at Abri du Maras most likely reflect climatic impacts on δ^{18} O of local environmental water sourced from precipitation. Impacts of slight differences in habitat and water source use on enamel $\delta^{18}O$ between animals drinking water from the Rhône River compared to those drinking precipitation-fed water sources on the local limestone plateaus have been suggested for the data set from Payre (Ecker et al., 2013; Bocherens et al., 2016), a site located on a similar hydrotopographic setting in close proximity to the Rhône ~50 km upstream of Abri du Maras. A similar scenario could potentially also be envisaged for Abri du Maras, which is also situated only a few hundred of meters from the Rhône River. However, the seasonally pronounced δ^{18} O variation in the level 4.2 horses does not support this. As larger rivers generally exhibit low seasonal δ^{18} O variability due to higher water residence times, and incorporate snow melt and mixing of water from different locations/altitudes (Rank et al., 2018), a year-round consumption of Rhône River water would most likely result in a lack of seasonal variation in δ^{18} O, which is not observed here. Indeed, estimates of δ^{18} O_{dw} show stronger seasonal differences than expected from local precipitation, rather than an attenuated amplitude that could be expected if animals were sourcing from a strongly buffered water source. A substantial contribution of river water to the drinking water of the Abri du Maras

802

803

804

805

806

807

808

809

810

811

812

813

814

815

816

817

818

819

820

821

822

823

824

825

Equus sampled here therefore seems unlikely, and we instead suggest that their δ^{18} O values reflect local climatic conditions. This also means that comparatively low winter $\delta^{18}O_{dw}$ values observed in the archaeological specimens compared to modern δ^{18} O values of precipitation are in our view unlikely to be related to wintertime drinking from low δ^{18} O river water. Instead, winter may have exhibited more cold/wet conditions compared to today. Finally, one aspect of the local paleoenvironment that remains unknown and may have had the potential to influence faunal δ^{18} O values is aridity. High aridity induces 18 O-enrichment compared to local precipitation in plants and stagnant open water bodies and therefore in some herbivores, with leaf water or open water signatures superimposing (and therefore obscuring) relationships with precipitation δ^{18} O (e.g., Ayliffe and Chivas, 1990; Cormie et al., 1994; Levin et al., 2006). However, in contrast to evaporation sensitive species (including cervids and caprines), obligate drinkers, such as equids and large bovids, are considered evaporation insensitive and the δ^{18} O of their body tissues are unlikely to be strongly influenced by leaf water changes given their dependency on drinking for meeting their water requirements (Levin et al., 2006). At the same time, drinking from evaporatively enriched water bodies such as large lakes, similarly to larger rivers, would result in a lack of seasonal δ^{18} O variation in animal teeth, which is not observed. It is therefore unlikely the phosphate $\delta^{18}O$ of the horses included in this study, and the seasonal enrichment observed, is reflecting high aridity. There are few other sitespecific indicators of paleoenvironment beyond the faunal suite and isotopic data generated in this study, with the exception of charcoal analysis which has identified wood species include Pinus sylvestris type and Betula, the latter of which has been found in level 4.1 (Daujeard et al., 2019; Moncel et al., 2021). While *Pinus sylvestris* grow in dry and cold conditions, *Betula* require higher soil humidity rates. This may indicate that, in level 4.1 at least, conditions were not overly arid. Future studies at the site could incorporate the oxygen isotope analysis of nonobligate drinking species, such as Cervus elaphus, as a comparison to the obligate drinking

827

828

829

830

831

832

833

834

835

836

837

838

839

840

841

842

843

844

845

846

847

848

849

850

species in order to establish water deficiency and, through this, establish an aridity index for the site (e.g., Levin et al., 2006). Future paleoclimatic studies using oxygen isotopes would ideally incorporate strontium isotope analyses, at the very least for serial-samples corresponding to seasonal δ^{18} O peaks and troughs. Although studies of Late Pleistocene European horses have not indicated migratory behavior (e.g., Pellegrini et al., 2008), and the 87 Sr/ 86 Sr data from the level 4.1 horse analyzed here is also consistent with sedentary behavior, conservation of this behavior in all phases of the Late Pleistocene cannot be assumed. Furthermore, other species, such as red deer, which could be useful comparators in calculating aridity index, may undertake seasonal movements.

Comparison with other Late Pleistocene paleoclimate proxy datasets from France Due to the uncertainty inherent in the conversion of oxygen isotope delta values of tooth enamel to drinking water isotope values and paleotemperature estimates, a direct comparison with other enamel δ^{18} O values of Pleistocene horses represents the most robust way of contextualizing these data (Pryor et al., 2014; Skrzypek et al., 2016). A limited amount of published δ^{18} O data from *Equus* tooth enamel is available for Late Pleistocene southern France, and not all of this data has been obtained as sequential samples. Out of the published data, results from Abri du Maras level 4.2 most closely resemble bulk sampled MIS 3 data from La Baume de Gigny Cave in the French Jura (Fabre et al., 2011) and Combe Grenal in the Dordogne (Richards et al., 2017; Fig. 9). La Baume de Gigny Cave is located approximately 280 km northeast of Abri du Maras, while Combe Grenal is located \sim 350 km west of Abri du Maras. At La Baume Gigny Cave, *Equus* tooth enamel from Level VIII exhibits a δ^{18} O value of 17.2‰, almost identical to the midpoint values from Abri du Maras, although these deposits are somewhat younger than Abri du Maras level 4.2 at \sim 33 ka (Fabre et al., 2011). Sequentially sampled δ^{18} O data from a single *Equus* tooth from the immediately underlying but undated Level IX shows

similar winter δ^{18} O values, but comparatively lower summer and mean annual δ^{18} O values than at Abri du Maras. δ^{18} O values from Combe Grenal were bulk sampled from tooth fragments of varying lengths from a variety of tooth types, which may contribute to a relatively large scatter of δ^{18} O values (Richards et al., 2017). Individuals that most closely resemble Abri du Maras level 4.2 stem from Layer 10 (18.1%), Layer 12 (17.3%) and Layer 14 (18.1%), which have been tentatively assigned to early MIS 3. Based on these comparisons, the $\delta^{18}O$ results from Abri du Maras level 4.2 fall comparatively high in the range of published δ^{18} O values for MIS 3 southern France, with relatively high summer peak values and a comparatively pronounced seasonal summer/winter difference. This may indicate relatively warm mean annual climatic conditions with warm summers, compared to other sites from MIS 3. Oxygen isotope data from Equus teeth from the geographically closest site of Payre (Ecker et al., 2013; Bocherens et al., 2016) unfortunately predate the data from Abri du Maras that are discussed here making direct comparison difficult. Predicted phosphate $\delta^{18}O$ values (converted from carbonate $\delta^{18}O$) from samples from Levels D, F and G at Payre fall noticeably below the results from Abri du Maras (Fig. 9). Given the close spatial proximity to Abri du Maras, it is likely that the *Equus* from Payre either experienced far colder climatic conditions in this region during MIS 6 and earlier (Richard et al., 2021) than those at Abri du Maras during MIS 3, or sourced a larger amount of drinking water from rivers of alpine origin, as was proposed by Ecker et al. (2013) and Bocherens et al. (2016). In order to compare the Abri du Maras δ^{18} O results more extensively to other climatic data, the conversions to paleotemperature estimates have to be used, as $\delta^{18}O$ values themselves incorporate species specific offsets from drinking water (Iacumin et al., 1996; Kohn, 1996). Paleotemperature estimates for annual means are for instance similar to the mean annual temperature estimates of ~ 9-14°C generated from Bison δ^{18} O for Layer 5 of La Ferrassie in the Dordogne (Pederzani et al., 2021). However, summer temperature estimates from Abri du

877

878

879

880

881

882

883

884

885

886

887

888

889

890

891

892

893

894

895

896

897

898

899

900

Maras are ~5 °C higher and winter temperatures ~ 10 to 15 °C lower than temperature estimates from La Ferrassie. As a consequence, the Equus δ^{18} O data from Abri du Maras seems to indicate stronger summer-winter differences in climate. La Ferrassie Layer 5 is similar in age to Abri du Maras level 4.2, but is located ~ 350 km west of Abri du Maras and closer to the Atlantic rather than the Mediterranean coast. Climatic differences between the two sites may also stem from slight differences in age, as chronometric dates for both deposits show a considerable uncertainty that is typical for this time period. On the other hand, geographic differences in climate and circulation may also play a role. Given that the modern-day climate at both locations is very comparable, this means that either age related climatic differences are a more likely explanation or that geographic climate gradient between the Dordogne and the Ardèche were more pronounced during MIS 3. While these options are difficult to distinguish based on available data, comparisons with both other Pleistocene data and modern-day climatic data indicates that the Equus from Abri du Maras level 4.2 lived in a relatively mild climate in terms of mean annual temperature but with a pronounced seasonal temperature difference. The latter is perhaps of most significance when considering past animal (and human) experience of climate in the region. Seasonal temperature extremes may have impacted the seasonality of Neanderthal landscape use, particularly of higher altitude areas in this region. Indeed, a framework of strong seasonal mobility that has been hypothesized on the basis of archaeological, zooarchaeological and material culture evidence for this region of southeastern France between the plains of the Rhone Valley and the mid-mountains of the Massif Central from MIS 7 to MIS 3 (Daujeard et al., 2012). However, it must be noted that the seasonal temperature estimations in the current study bear unavoidably large errors of between 4 and 5°C. Although the lower end of these estimations would still result in cooler winters and warmer summers than are found in the region today, these estimations (and conclusions drawn from them) must be considered with appropriate caution.

902

903

904

905

906

907

908

909

910

911

912

913

914

915

916

917

918

919

920

921

922

923

924

925

927

928

929

930

931

932

933

934

935

936

937

938

939

940

941

942

943

944

945

946

947

948

949

950

951

4.2. Faunal dietary ecology and broader paleoenvironment

Despite the modest size of the dataset, as shown in Figure 5, interspecies differences, particularly in δ^{15} N are clear. Equus exhibit both the lowest mean δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N values. While these values are typical of grazers living in temperate (C3) ecosystems (e.g., Fizet et al., 1995; Bocherens, 2003), given that grasses are normally ¹⁵N enriched relative to shrubs in contemporary arctic and boreal ecosystems (see Bocherens, 2003: 61) it is interesting that the Bison are elevated in both $\delta^{15}N$ and $\delta^{13}C$ relative to Equus. These differences are similar to those measured in equids and bovids at the older Eemian site of Neumark-Nord 2, Germany (~126 ka; Britton et al., 2012) and the (broadly) contemporary French site of Marillac (45–40 ka; Fizet et al., 1995). Differences in δ^{13} C are likely attributable to differences in the production levels of methane between these different species. Ruminant methane has negative δ^{13} C values (Metges et al., 1990), potentially leading to tissue enrichment in ¹³C (e.g., Cerling and Harris, 1999), and similar patterns have been determined in a range of isotopic studies of European Late Pleistocene fauna (see discussion and Britton et al., 2012: Figure 3). However, there is less compelling evidence for a consistent 'offset' in $\delta^{15}N$ between equids and bovids and the factors influencing δ^{15} N values in herbivores are complex. Given that modern European bison are mixed/intermediate feeders (Merceron et al., 2014) and shrubs are often depleted in ¹⁵N relative to grasses, one may expect collagen $\delta^{15}N$ values of potential mixed feeders should also be lower. However, another factor known to influence collagen $\delta^{15}N$ values of herbivores is the protein content of the diet, with the consumption of higher protein plants leading to increased diet-tissue offsets and ¹⁵N-enrichment (Sponheimer et al., 2003). Horses are generally considered to be adapted to live on high fiber, low quality forage (Duncan et al., 1990), which could influence diet-tissue offsets and lead to lower $\delta^{15}N$ tissue values. In contrast, the elevated δ^{15} N values of *Bison* seen here may indicate the incorporation of higher nutrient food such as short grasses, sedges, forbs and leaves. It should be noted, however, that lower δ^{15} N values are not always observed in European Pleistocene horses relative to other herbivore species, suggesting that the selection of low quality forage by horses is not necessarily habitual and may be plastic, shaped by local habitat structure (see discussion in Britton et al., 2012). At Abri du Maras, however, grazing on low quality forage may indeed account for the $\delta^{15}N$ determined in the equids, whereas *Bison* were likely able to feed more flexibly and here are occupying a similar isotopic niche to *Megaloceros*. At Abri du Maras Rangifer δ^{13} C values are also similar to other intermediate/mixed feeders, including Bison and Cervus elaphus. This is unusual as elevated δ^{13} C values are commonly measured in Pleistocene Rangifer compared to other large herbivore taxa and this is often attributed to lichen consumption (e.g., Fizet et al., 1995; Bocherens, 2003), due to the higher δ^{13} C values observed in modern lichens (e.g., Park and Epstein, 1960; Teeri, 1981). In the Abri du Maras dataset, the most elevated δ^{13} C (and δ^{15} N) values are exhibited in the four Megaloceros samples, which are similar both within and between levels. Values exhibited differ from previous isotope studies of pre-LGM *Megaloceros* bone collagen from south-west France which have indicated that this species occupied a similar isotopic niche to Cervus elaphus (Immel et al., 2015), with both taxa exhibiting lower δ^{13} C (relative to Rangifer) which has been associated with leaf feeding in forested environments, a so-called 'canopy effect' (e.g., Drucker et al., 2008). However, at Abri du Maras differences in δ^{13} C between the different cervid species are not as pronounced. There is no indication of a canopy effect in the δ^{13} C for either *Cervus elaphus* or *Megaloceros*, and the similar δ^{13} C of the reindeer does not suggest lichen was a major dietary component. The slightly elevated δ^{13} C in Megaloceros may be related to the consumption of plants such as forb species or sedges, which typically exhibit less negative δ^{13} C values, as has been concluded for *Megaloceros* dental enamel samples from Ireland (Chritz et al., 2009: 142).

952

953

954

955

956

957

958

959

960

961

962

963

964

965

966

967

968

969

970

971

972

973

974

975

The isotope values exhibited in the different deer species at Abri du Maras perhaps reflect the contemporary environmental and ecological suite of this part of France at the time (i.e., that woodland environments may have been mosaic and not extensive/dense). This is consistent with other paleoenvironmental proxy evidence from the site, including charcoal evidence, which is consistent with open forests or forest groves and also with the characterization of mosaic environments in the Rhône valley and along its tributaries, and other parts of central and southern France, and northern Iberia, during MIS 3 (see discussion in Daujeard et al., 2019). The higher δ^{15} N values seen in *Megaloceros* at Abri du Maras could also be consistent with this, and the similarity between δ^{13} C in Rangifer, Cervus and Megaloceros may indicate that lichen did not comprise any significant part of Rangifer diet in this period and—by inference—that lichen coverage may have been lower during these mild phases (as indicated by the oxygen isotope data from level 4.2 at least). Lichen declines are common described in the context of modern global warming and long-term vegetation-specific studies in the Arctic have demonstrated that warmer, and especially more humid conditions, favor mosses and vascular plants and lead to the physiological impairment of lichens and their subsequent decline (Olthof et al., 2008). When comparing the cervid data from Abri du Maras to that from cooler periods of the Late Pleistocene (e.g., Drucker, 2022), it may be that niche spacing between these species was reduced in this earlier phase of MIS 3. A similar pattern has been seen in deer species during the Lateglacial interstadial and has been attributed to milder and more humid conditions and a decrease in niche partitioning that may have resulted in greater competition between different herbivore species (Drucker, 2022; Drucker et al., 2018; Immel et al., 2015). However, it is important to note that isotopic data do not strictly correspond to niche space but instead to isotopic niche space, and isotopic differences between species are dependent not only on consistently different feeding behaviors but also on the availability of isotopically diverse graze

977

978

979

980

981

982

983

984

985

986

987

988

989

990

991

992

993

994

995

996

997

998

999

1000

and browse. It may be, that in the absence of either dense forest or abundant lichens, carbon isotopic variability in herbivore food sources was reduced overall.

1002

1003

1004

1005

1006

1007

1008

1009

1010

1011

1012

1013

1014

1015

1016

1017

1018

1019

1020

1021

1022

1023

1024

1025

1026

Despite similarities in δ^{13} C, a comparatively large range of δ^{15} N values are shown within and between different species, however (from 2.3% to 6.0%). This likely reflect different feeding behaviors within this environment and, through this, implies local environmental variability in δ¹⁵N. Multiple factors influence nitrogen isotope values in soils and plants and, along with an animal's physiology, can lead to isotopic diversity in animals otherwise occupying the same broader trophic positions (Sponheimer et al., 2003; Szpak, 2014). Bone collagen δ^{15} N of large herbivores thus reflects both isotopic variability within local plant communities (which in the past may reflect very different environmental conditions than today) and differences in dietary niche and feeding behavior, the latter of which relates to both the types of plants/plant component consumed (in terms of its isotopic ratio), as well as their nutritional content and digestibility. The range of δ^{15} N values observed between the different herbivore species at Abri du Maras is evidence for differences in feeding behaviors between taxa. While niche partitioning is commonly seen in other isotope paleoecological studies of herbivores in Western Europe (see reviews in Bocherens, 2003; Drucker, 2022), the data from Abri du Maras highlights that niche feeding behaviors and resource partitioning varied throughout different phases of MIS 3, as well as geographically (e.g., Drucker, 2022; Schwartz-Narbonne et al., 2019). This emphasizes the need to recognize plastic and/or non-analogous behaviors (and the role of isotope analyses in revealing these) when considering the non-analogous animal and plant communities of MIS 3 in northern Europe. In the case of Abri du Maras, given that these differences are far less apparent in δ^{13} C than δ^{15} N, the value of combining these two isotopic systems in reconstructing Late Pleistocene herbivore feeding behaviors in particular is also highlighted. Finally, another factor that is not often considered alongside dietary isotopic data in studies of faunal paleoecology but could play a part in the large range of nitrogen isotope values observed in this study could be differences in the habitat use/spatial ecology of different individuals, different species and through time, in this region.

1029

1030

1031

1032

1033

1034

1035

1036

1037

1038

1039

1040

1041

1042

1043

1044

1045

1046

1047

1048

1049

1050

1051

1027

1028

4.3. Evidence for interspecific differences in spatial ecology

While more than half of the samples (group 1 = 12/19, across all species and both levels) have δ^{34} S consistent with anticipated local environmental values (Fig. 6; SOM Fig. S4), six of the remaining seven (group 2) have lower δ^{34} S values and therefore may have spent a proportion of their lives in a more remote region, and possibly further inland (e.g., along the Rhône Valley where values ~ 3\% can be found). In addition to highlighting potential differences in faunal geographical range, this may also indicate that the resource catchment for the site (i.e., areas from which homining using the site took prey) went beyond the immediate locale of the site. A further individual, the single Rangifer individual from level 4.2 (M10-121), displayed a far lower value than all other samples analyzed, with a value of 0.0%. This may hint at a very different biogeographical range for this earlier individual compared to the individuals sampled from level 4.1, perhaps far north of the Ardèche region. Indeed, the strontium isotope data from this same individual (see Section 4.4) support this as the likely explanation. Although two groups are evident in the sulphur isotope data, and the majority do align with predicted local values, it must be borne in mind that sulphur isotope variability in this region in the Late Pleistocene may have been very different compared to more recent periods and could have incorporated lower (or higher) overall environmental δ^{34} S. For example, southern France is a region heavily exposed to dust aerosol deposition from the Sahara, one of the main drivers of the δ^{34} S isoscape, leading to 34 S enrichment in the environment (Bataille et al., 2021). The lower values observed for group 2 could be due to differences in dust deposal rates between the Late Pleistocene and more recent periods as the most recently published sulphur isoscape was established using more recent samples from the Mesolithic to the 20th century (Bataille et al., 2021). A strong correspondence between sulphur isotope values of bone collagen and environmental conditions (in particular, temperature or the extent of permafrost) has also been highlighted by other studies (Drucker et al., 2011; Reade et al., 2020), suggesting that environmental δ^{34} S not only varies spatially but can vary temporally at the same location. No clear trend in δ^{34} S was observed through time between level 4.1 and level 4.2 at Abri du Maras and differences observed between animals therefore likely do reflect relative differences in individual biogeography. However, differences in the presence and extent of permafrost across this mountainous region in the past, or other environmental variables, may have produced a more varied sulphur isoscape compared to the present day that could encompass all the values in this study. While there may be relative trends, including two statistically-distinguishable groups (including a larger group of ungulates of all taxa matching the local predicted values) and an individual reindeer with a distinct δ^{34} S value compared to all other individuals, given uncertainties surrounding the Late Pleistocene sulphur isoscape these patterns are difficult to relate to specific geographical areas and in order to explore the biogeography of species more closely (particularly *Rangifer*), strontium isotope data are required.

4.4. Rangifer migratory behavior at Abri du Maras

Evidence for plasticity in behavior of *Rangifer* between levels 4.1 and 4.2 The agreement in strontium isotope values in the earliest forming parts of the second molar for the three *Rangifer* from level 4.1 points to a period spent on a similar lithology to one another during the middle of the first summer of life (~0.709), consistent with bioavailable strontium isotope values found within ~50 km of the site (including areas on eastern side of the Rhône Valley, and slightly further north; SOM Fig. S7). This may be consistent with the calving grounds and summer range for the *Rangifer* in level 4.1 being relatively close to the site, in the eastern part of the Rhône Valley or even the Prealps area. Strontium isotope ratios from the later forming parts of

the second molar (corresponding with the first winter of life) of the three individuals from level 4.1, and values from the majority of their third molars (largely forming in the second year of life), are again similar to one another—albeit with a greater intra-tooth variation in the third molar between these three individuals compared to the second molar. This is consistent with modern ecological observations and experimental isotope studies on modern herds which show increased dispersals across the herd range during in the second half of the first year of life, and into the second year of an animal's life (Britton et al., 2009; Britton, 2010). However, despite slight intra-tooth variation, values do not deviate considerably or outside of the range of bioavailable strontium within ~50 km of the site and, significantly, do not demonstrate any clear seasonally-cyclical trend in the second and/or third molar. With the exception of a fidelity to calving ground (and thus summer range during the first months of life), the data from level 4.1 Rangifer do not suggest regular, targeted seasonal migrations during this period. Potential winter and summer ranges identified from the samples closest to the enamel-root junction in both the M₂ and the M₃ can be found in the vicinity of Abri du Maras and show a substantial overlap and continuity. This range may also have incorporated areas to the east, towards the Prealps, or to the south towards the Mediterranean, although it should be noted that (given the sea-spray effect) the absence of δ^{34} S values greater than 6% may indicate the latter is unlikely. In modern caribou populations, sedentary behavior is observed in the forest and mountain ecotypes (Festa-Bianchet et al., 2011). However, while modern sedentary caribou do not undertake migrations, they may utilize fairly large home ranges exceeding 1400 km², especially where human environmental disturbance is low (Wilson et al., 2019). At Abri du Maras, a non-migratory ecotype, equivalent to the modern forest ecotype would be consistent with the charcoal analysis in level 4.1, the only level yielding an association of *Betula* and *Pinus*, showing that the environment at the time, was probably humid with open forest or forest groves (Daujeard et al., 2019; Moncel et al., 2021). The δ^{13} C values

1077

1078

1079

1080

1081

1082

1083

1084

1085

1086

1087

1088

1089

1090

1091

1092

1093

1094

1095

1096

1097

1098

1099

1100

from the reindeer and other cervids in this study (see section 4.2), however, make it unlikely that this contemporary woodland would have been extensive (i.e. there is no 'canopy effect'). The strontium isotope values from the single *Equus* sampled from this level and the associated assignment maps are also consistent with living in the region close to the site, at least during the period of formation of this tooth, and may indicate both these species may have been regionally available during much of the year during this later phase of site occupation. In comparison to the individuals from level 4.1, the intra-tooth strontium isotope profile of the individual from level 4.2 demonstrates a strong seasonal variability (from lower values to higher values, before a return to lower values). While values in the latest forming parts of the third molar (SOM Fig. S9; Rangifer M10-121) do overlap with local biosphere values (and with the values measured in the three *Rangifer* from level 4.1), the values from earlier phases in this individual's life are much higher, particularly in the latest forming parts of the second molar. The complete separation between potential summer and winter ranges inferred from the spatial assignment strongly suggests a migratory behavior. While the potential summer range is very similar to the range used by the individuals from level 4.1, incorporating the area immediately surrounding Abri du Maras, the Rangifer from level 4.2 occupied winter areas distinct from the region surrounding the site and completely different from the Rangifer from level 4.1. Intra-tooth values closest to the enamel-root junction in the M₂ of this individual are instead consistent with long distance movements between the northern and the southern part of the Rhône valley, or east-west movements, as bioavailable values matching those within the teeth can be found only in excess of 150-200 km from the site. Even areas detected further away, in the southwest France, could be considered as potential winter range habitats, as these are still within the range of distances traveled by modern migratory caribou populations. The distinct sulphur isotope values in the bone collagen of this individual, compared to other

1102

1103

1104

1105

1106

1107

1108

1109

1110

1111

1112

1113

1114

1115

1116

1117

1118

1119

1120

1121

1122

1123

1124

herbivores analyzed from the site supports the idea of a distinct total range size, incorporating, perhaps a larger and more (isotopically) diverse area than any of the other animals.

1128

1129

1130

1131

1132

1133

1134

1135

1136

1137

1138

1139

1140

1141

1142

1143

1144

1145

1146

1147

1148

1149

1150

1127

1126

Implications for understanding site and resource use at Abri du Maras These findings provide tentative evidence of differences in ranging behavior in Rangifer in the Rhône Valley during MIS 3, and have implications for our understanding of faunal paleoecology and exploitation at Abri du Maras. The data from level 4.2 and 4.1 infer that both migratory reindeer and less mobile/sedentary ecotypes of reindeer could have been found in Late Pleistocene Europe at this time and/or that this behavior was plastic over time. This was also determined to be the case at Jonzac, where Rangifer in Quina Mousterian levels (73 \pm 7 ka) were revealed to be migratory using strontium isotope analysis, but that Rangifer from Denticulate Mousterian levels (56 ± 3 ka) were likely non-migratory (Britton et al., 2011; Britton, 2010; Britton, 2018). If the Rangifer were indeed non-migratory in level 4.1 or undertook only very restricted seasonal movements over a small home range, this may suggest that Rangifer—like the Equus—may have been a year-round local resource at that time in the Rhône Valley. However, the zooarchaeological evidence from this level suggests they were not exploited all year round and instead were hunted exclusively in autumn-winter (Daujeard et al., 2019). This may be consistent with seasonally restricted use of the site by Neanderthals during the accumulation of deposits in level 4.1. Indeed, a subsistence base centred on strongly seasonal movements has been hypothesized for this region more broadly (Daujeard et al., 2012). Targeted autumnwinter hunting may also be consistent with the deliberate selection of this prey taxa only during peak condition. Autumn is a period where female and young reindeer/caribou in particular are in good physical condition (Miller, 1974), with typically higher average body masses (and body fat percentages) in autumn than in spring and summer (Gerhart et al., 1996; Couturier et al., 2009). Autumn may also have been the optimal period to hunt reindeer for their winter coats

(i.e., for clothing; e.g., Binford, 1978; Stenton, 1991; Issenman, 2011). Thus, in the presence of other available local resources—such as horse—reindeer may not have been an appealing option at other points of the year. In contrast, zooarchaeological data from level 4.2 point to a more mixed profile, comprising multiple ungulate species without a strong seasonality. Here, intra-tooth samples from a single Rangifer indicate a seasonally-repeating mobility pattern, indicating they may have only been found in the immediate region at certain points of the year (i.e., summer). The investigation of Rangifer exploitation, and particularly the seasonality of that exploitation at other sites surrounding Abri du Maras and those sites on the eastern side of the Rhône Valley, may allow the further exploration of the relationship between Neanderthal landscape use and the seasonal biogeography of reindeer. In addition to the strontium isotope data from the *Rangifer* samples, the results of other analyses undertaken here also have implications for our understanding of Neanderthal activities at the site. The presence of two statistically significant groups revealed by hierarchical cluster analysis of sulphur isotope data may suggest that Neanderthals at the site were extracting their prey from at least two isotopically-distinct areas (in terms of δ^{34} S), including locally as well as perhaps further inland along the Rhône valley. This hints at the potential for isotope zooarchaeological approaches to reveal such aspects of landscape use in subsistence behaviors. However, such a pattern could also be produced through the hunting of animals close to site that had more extensive ranges than others, and thus incorporated a more diverse range of δ^{34} S values. Further work, incorporating strontium isotope analysis of multiple species would be required to characterize this, ideally in comparison with similar data from other archaeological sites in the region. Comparison with data derived from fauna from non-anthropogenic contexts (e.g., natural accumulations) could be helpful in characterizing variability due to differences in faunal spatial behaviors from variability due to differences in human hunting ranges.

1151

1152

1153

1154

1155

1156

1157

1158

1159

1160

1161

1162

1163

1164

1165

1166

1167

1168

1169

1170

1171

1172

1173

Finally, the oxygen isotope data generated from level 4.2 suggest that, in this phase at least, the climate was comparatively mild for the period, albeit with a pronounced seasonality, with higher and lower seasonal extremes in temperature than experienced in the region today. On the basis of zooarchaelogical data, occupations in level 4.2 at Abri du Maras were restricted to spring-summer, and to autumn (Vignes, 2021). While sample size, and the lack of comparative data from level 4.1 necessitates caution in data interpretation, this may indicate a preference for other sites and/or areas during cooler winter months. The collection of similar data from other sites in the region, combined with site-seasonality data, would help us to better understand the relationship between the seasonal climate and the seasonal use of sites and resources by Neanderthals in the Rhône valley during MIS 3.

5. Conclusions

The data presented in this paper provide evidence for both environmental conditions during MIS 3 in southeastern France, but also for the ecology of key species that Neanderthal groups depended upon. Oxygen isotope analysis of horse teeth from level 4.2 evidence mild climatic conditions, albeit with a seasonality more pronounced than today. Carbon and nitrogen isotope analysis of bone collagen suggest different niche feeding behaviors amongst herbivore species at the site, mostly expressed through variability in δ^{15} N. Carbon isotope data from *Rangifer* are similar to other taxa studied, which is unusually for Late Pleistocene case studies, particular from later (colder) phases of MIS 3, which indicate that lichens were not making up a significant component of *Rangifer* diet in this area at this time. This may also therefore provide indirect evidence for a lack of contemporary lichen cover, which could be consistent with milder and also moister climatic conditions, notably during level 4.1. Conversely, the δ^{13} C values from the reindeer and other cervids in this study, however, do not indicate woodland was extensive (i.e. there is no 'canopy effect') and may have been restricted to groves as part

of a moasic environment, which is in agreement with the limited contemporary paleoenvironmental data (Daujeard et al., 2019). The strontium and sulphur isotope data from Rangifer provide direct evidence for both migratory and non-migratory ecotypes at the site, correlating with differences in seasonal exploitation between the two levels. While environmental strontium values surrounding Abri du Maras are most consistent with those observed in the winter-forming parts of Rangifer teeth in level 4.1, environmental values matching other periods of the level 4.1 individuals' lives can be found within ~50 km of the site. Thus, in this part of the Rhône Valley, reindeer may have represented a year-round resource. In light of this, we can infer perhaps that the targeted hunting of reindeer in autumn during this phase of site use may be consistent with seasonally-restricted use of the site by Neanderthals and/or the selection of Rangifer in prime condition rather than their seasonallyrestricted availability. In contrast, a single Rangifer sampled from level 4.2 demonstrates a very different trend in intra-tooth strontium and bulk bone collagen sulphur isotope data, suggesting a distinct biogeographical range incorporating other regions and also different seasonal mobility. Data from this individual suggests reindeer may only have been found in the area seasonally (in spring/summer). Thus, the integration of isotope data with the zooarchaeological analyses and other paleoenvironmental proxy data at Abri du Maras evidence not only diversity in animal behavior and ecology during MIS 3, but also demonstrate the inter-relationships between the dynamic ecosystem and Neanderthal land use and hunting strategies. The determination of seasonality of site use and hunting at different archaeological sites in the eastern and western areas of the southern Rhône Valley, combined with further analysis of faunal biogeography and seasonal paleoenvironmental conditions, may help to further illuminate these relationships.

1223

1224

1200

1201

1202

1203

1204

1205

1206

1207

1208

1209

1210

1211

1212

1213

1214

1215

1216

1217

1218

1219

1220

1221

1222

References

- 1225 Ambrose, S.H., 1990. Preparation and characterization of bone and tooth collagen for isotopic
- 1226 analysis. J. Archaeol. Sci. 17, 431-451.
- 1227 Amundson, R., Austin, A.T., Schuur, E.A.G., Yoo, K., Matzek, V., Kendall, C., Uebersax, A.,
- Brenner, D., Baisden, W.T., 2003. Global patterns of the isotopic composition of soil and
- plant nitrogen. Global Biogeochem. Cycles 17.
- 1230 Ayliffe, L., Chivas, A.R., 1990. Oxygen isotope composition of bone phosphate of Australian
- kangaroos: Potential as a palaeoenvironmental recorder. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 54,
- 1232 2603-2609.
- Barron, E., van Andel, T.H., Pollard, D., 2003. Glacial environments II: Reconstructing the climate
- of Europe in the last glaciation. In: Van Andel, T.H., Davies, W. (Eds.), Neanderthals and
- Modern Humans in the European Landscape During the Last Glaciation. McDonald
- 1236 Institute for Archaeological Research, Cambridge, pp. 57-78.
- 1237 Bataille, C.P., Crowley, B.E., Wooller, M.J., Bowen, G.J., 2020. Advances in global bioavailable
- strontium isoscapes. Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol. 555, 109849.
- Bataille, C.P., Jaouen, K., Milano, S., Trost, M., Steinbrenner, S., Crubézy, É., Colleter, R., 2021.
- 1240 Triple sulfur-oxygen-strontium isotopes probabilistic geographic assignment of
- archaeological remains using a novel sulfur isoscape of western Europe. PLoS One 16,
- 1242 e0250383.
- Ben-David, M., Shochat, E., Adams, L.G., 2001. Utility of stable isotope analysis in studying
- foraging ecology of herbivores: examples from moose and caribou. ALCES 37, 421-434.
- Bendrey, R., Vella, D., Zazzo, A., Balasse, M., Lepetz, S., 2015. Exponentially decreasing tooth
- growth rate in horse teeth: implications for isotopic analyses. Archaeometry 57, 1104-1124.

1247 Bentley, R.A., 2006. Strontium isotopes from the earth to the archaeological skeleton: a review. J 1248 Archaeol Method Theory 13, 135-187. Bernard, A., Daux, V., Lécuyer, C., Brugal, J.-P., Genty, D., Wainer, K., Gardien, V., Fourel, F., 1249 Jaubert, J., 2009. Pleistocene seasonal temperature variations recorded in the δ^{18} O of *Bison* 1250 1251 priscus teeth. Earth. Planet. Sci. Lett. 283, 133-143. Binford, L.R., 1978. Nunamiut Ethnoarchaeology. Academic Press, New York. 1252 1253 Blumenthal, S.A., Cerling, T.E., Chritz, K.L., Bromage, T.G., Kozdon, R., Valley, J.W., 2014. Stable isotope time-series in mammalian teeth: in situ δ^{18} O from the innermost enamel 1254 1255 layer. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 124, 223-236. 1256 Bocherens, H., 2003. Isotopic biogeochemistry and the palaeoecology of the mammoth steppe 1257 fauna. DEINSEA Annual of the Natural History Museum Rotterdam 9, 57-76. 1258 Bocherens, H., Díaz-Zorita Bonilla, M., Daujeard, C., Fernandes, P., Raynal, J.-P., Moncel, M.-H., 1259 2016. Direct isotopic evidence for subsistence variability in Middle Pleistocene Neanderthals (Payre, southeastern France). Ouat. Sci. Rev. 154, 226-236. 1260 1261 1262 Boethius, A., Ahlström, T., Kielman-Schmitt, M., Kjällquist, M., Larsson, L., 2022. Assessing laser 1263 ablation multi-collector inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry as a tool to study 1264 archaeological and modern human mobility through strontium isotope analyses of tooth 1265 enamel. Archaeol. Anthropol. Sci. 14, 97.

3

the isotope ecology of temperate woodlands. J. Archaeol. Sci. 40, 3926-3935.

Bonafini, M., Pellegrini, M., Ditchfield, P., Pollard, A., 2013. Investigation of the 'canopy effect'in

1266

- 1268 Bowen, G.J., 2022. OIPC: The online isotopes in precipitation calculator, Version 3.1.
- 1269 <u>http://waterisotopes.org</u>.
- 1270 Bowen, G.J., Wassenaar, L., Hobson, K.A., 2005. Global application of stable hydrogen and
- oxygen isotopes to wildlife forensics. Oecologia 143, 337–348.
- Bowen, G.J., Revenaugh, J., 2003. Interpolating the isotopic composition of modern meteoric
- precipitation. Water Resour. Res. 39, 1–13.Britton, K., 2010. Multi-isotope analysis and the
- reconstruction of prey species palaeomigrations and palaeoecology. Ph.D. Dissertation,
- 1275 Durham University.
- 1276 Britton, K., 2018. Prey species movements and migrations in ecocultural landscapes:
- reconstructing late Pleistocene herbivore seasonal spatial behaviours. In: Pilaar-Birch, S.
- 1278 (Ed.), Multi-Species Archaeology. Routledge, London, pp. 347-367.
- Britton, K., 2020. Isotope analysis for mobility and climate studies. In: Britton, K., Richards, M.
- 1280 (Eds.), Archaeological Science: An Introduction. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge,
- 1281 pp. 99-124.
- Britton, K., Gaudzinski-Windheuser, S., Roebroeks, W., Kindler, L., Richards, M.P., 2012. Stable
- isotope analysis of well-preserved 120,000-year-old herbivore bone collagen from the
- Middle Palaeolithic site of Neumark-Nord 2, Germany reveals niche separation between
- bovids and equids. Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol. 333-334, 168-177.
- 1286 Britton, K., Grimes, V., Dau, J., Richards, M.P., 2009. Reconstructing faunal migrations using
- intra-tooth sampling and strontium and oxygen isotope analyses: a case study of modern
- 1288 caribou (*Rangifer tarandus granti*). J. Archaeol. Sci. 36, 1163-1172.

- Britton, K., Grimes, V., Niven, L., Steele, T., McPherron, S., Soressi, M., Kelly, T.E., Jaubert, J.,
- Hublin, J.-J., Richards, M.P., 2011. Strontium isotope evidence for migration in late
- Pleistocene Rangifer: Implications for Neanderthal hunting strategies at the Middle
- Palaeolithic site of Jonzac, France. J. Hum. Evol. 61, 176-185.
- 1293 Britton, K., Pederzani, S., Kindler, L., Roebroeks, W., Gaudzinski-Windheuser, S., Richards, M.P.,
- Tütken, T., 2019. Oxygen isotope analysis of Equus teeth evidences early Eemian and early
- Weichselian palaeotemperatures at the Middle Palaeolithic site of Neumark-Nord 2,
- 1296 Saxony-Anhalt, Germany. Quat. Sci. Rev. 226, 106029.
- 1297 Britton, K., Willmes, M., Moffat, I., Grün, R., Mannino, M.A., Woodward, S., Jaouen, K., 2020.
- Sampling Plants and Malacofauna in 87Sr/86Sr Bioavailability Studies: Implications for
- 1299 Isoscape Mapping and Reconstructing of Past Mobility Patterns. Front. Ecol. Evol. 8,
- 1300 579473.
- 1301 Brown, W.A.B., Chapman, N.G., 1991. Age assessment of fallow deer (Dama dama): from a
- scoring scheme based on radiographs of developing permanent molariform teeth. J. Zool.
- 1303 224, 367-379.
- 1304 Brown, T.A., Nelson, D.E., Vogel, J.S., Southon, J.R., 1988. Improved collagen extraction by
- modified Longin method. Radiocarbon 30, 171-177.
- 1306 Bryant, J.D., Luz, B., Froelich, P.N., 1994. Oxygen isotopic composition of fossil horse tooth
- phosphate as a record of continental paleoclimate. Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.
- 1308 107, 303-316.
- 1309 Capo, R.C., Stewert, B.W., Chadwick, O.A., 1998. Strontium isotopes as tracers of ecosystem
- processes: Theory and methods, Geoderma 82, 197-225.

- 1311 Cerling, T.E., Harris, J.M., 1999. Carbon isotope fractionation between diet and bioapatite in
- ungulate mammals and implications for ecological and paleoecological studies. Oecologia
- 1313 120, 337-363.
- 1314 Cerling, T., Harris, J.M., Leakey, M.G., 1999. Browsing and grazing in elephants: the isotope
- record of modern and fossil proboscideans. Oecologia 120, 364-374.
- 1316 Chritz, K.L., Dyke, G.J., Zazzo, A., Lister, A.M., Monaghan, N.T., Sigwart, J.D., 2009.
- Palaeobiology of an extinct Ice Age mammal: Stable isotope and cementum analysis of
- giant deer teeth. Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol. 282, 133-144.
- 1319 Clark, I., Fritz, P., 1997. Environmental isotopes in Hydrogeology. Lewis Publishers, New York.
- 1320 Clement, A.C., Peterson, L.C., 2008. Mechanisms of abrupt climate change of the last glacial
- 1321 period. Rev. Geophys. 46, RG4002.
- 1322 Collins, M.J., Galley, P., 1998. Towards an optimal method of archaeological collagen extraction:
- the influence of pH and grinding. Anc. Biomol. 2, 209-222.
- 1324 Copeland, S.R., Sponheimer, M., le Roux, P.J., Grimes, V., Lee-Thorp, J.A., de Ruiter, D.J., P.,
- 1325 R.M., 2008. Strontium isotope ratios (87Sr/86Sr) of tooth enamel: comparison of solution
- and laser ablation multicollector inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry methods.
- 1327 Rapid Commun. Mass Spectrom. 22, 3187-3194
- 1328 Cormie, A.B., Luz, B., Schwarcz, H.P., 1994. Relationship between the hydrogen and oxygen
- isotopes of deer bone and their use in the estimation of relative humidity. Geochim.
- 1330 Cosmochim. Acta 58, 3439-3449.
- 1331 Couturier, S., Côté, S.D., Huot, J., Otto, R.D., 2009. Body-condition dynamics in a northern
- ungulate gaining fat in winter. Can. J. Zool. 87, 367-378.

- Dansgaard, W., 1964. Stable isotopes in precipitation. Tellus 16, 436-468.
- Daujeard, C., Abrams, G., Germonpré, M., Le Pape, J.-M., Wampach, A., Di Modica, K., Moncel,
- M.-H. 2016. Neanderthal and animal karstic occupations from southern Belgium and south-
- eastern France: Regional or common features? Quat. Int. 411, 179-197.
- Daujeard, C., Fernandes, P., Guadelli, J.-L., Moncel, M.-H., Santagata, C., Raynal, J.-P., 2012.
- Neanderthal subsistence strategies in Southeastern France between the plains of the Rhone
- Valley and the mid-mountains of the Massif Central (MIS 7 to MIS 3). Quat. Int. 252, 32-
- 1340 47.
- Daujeard, C., Moncel, M.-H., 2010. On Neanderthal subsistence strategies and land use: a regional
- focus on the Rhone Valley area in southeastern France. J. Anthropol. Archaeol. 29, 368-
- 1343 391.
- Daujeard, C., Vettese, D., Britton, K., Béarez, P., Boulbes, N., Crégut-Bonnoure, E., Desclaux, E.,
- Lateur, N., Pike-Tay, A., Rivals, F., Allué, E., Chacón, M.G., Puaud, S., Richard, M.,
- 1346 Courty, M.-A., Gallotti, R., Hardy, B., Bahain, J.J., Falguères, C., Pons-Branchu, E.,
- Valladas, H., Moncel, M.-H., 2019. Neanderthal selective hunting of reindeer? The case
- study of Abri du Maras (south-eastern France). Archaeol. Anthrop. Sci. 11, 985-1011.
- 1349 Delgado Huertas, A., Iacumin, P., Longinelli, A., 1997. A stable isotope study of fossil mammal
- remains from the Paglicci cave, southern Italy, 13 to 33 ka BP: palaeoclimatological
- 1351 considerations. Chem. Geol. 141, 211-223.
- 1352 Delgado Huertas, A., Iacumin, P., Stenni, B., Sánchez Chillón, B.S., Longinelli, A., 1995. Oxygen
- isotope variations of phosphate in mammalian bone and tooth enamel. Geochim.
- 1354 Cosmochim. Acta 59, 4299-4305.

- Deniel, C., Pin, C., 2001. Single-stage method for the simultaneous isolation of lead and strontium
- from silicate samples for isotopic measurements. Anal. Chim. Acta 426, 95-103.
- DeNiro, M.J., 1985. Postmortem preservation and alteration of in vivo bone collagen isotope ratios
- in relation to palaeodietary reconstruction. Nature 317, 806-809.
- DeNiro, M.J., Epstein, S., 1978. Influence of diet on the distribution of carbon isotopes in animals.
- 1360 Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 42, 495-506.
- 1361 Dettman, D.L., Kohn, M.J., Quade, J., Ryerson, F.J., Ojha, T.P., Hamindullah, S., 2001. Seasonal
- stable isotope evidence for a strong Asian monsoon throughout the past 10.7 m.y. Geology
- 1363 29, 31-34.
- 1364 Discamps, E., Jaubert, J., Bachellerie, F., 2011. Human choices and environmental constraints:
- deciphering the variability of large game procurement from Mousterian to Aurignacian
- times (MIS 5-3) in southwestern France. Quat. Sci. Rev. 30, 2755-2775.
- Dobberstein, R.C., Collins, M.J., Craig, O.E., Taylor, G., Penkman, K.E.H., Ritz-Timme, S., 2009.
- Archaeological collagen: Why worry about collagen diagenesis? Archaeol. Anthrop. Sci.
- 1369 1, 31-42.
- 1370 Drucker, D.G., 2022. The Isotopic Ecology of the Mammoth Steppe. Ann. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci.
- 1371 50, 395-418.
- Drucker, D., Bocherens, H., Pike-Tay, A., Mariotti, A., 2001. Isotopic tracking of seasonal dietary
- change in dentine collagen: preliminary data from modern caribou. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.
- 1374 333, 303-309.
- Drucker, D.G., Bridault, A., Cupillard, C., Hujic, A., Bocherens, H., 2011. Evolution of habitat and
- environment of red deer (*Cervus elaphus*) during the Late-glacial and early Holocene in

- eastern France (French Jura and the western Alps) using multi-isotope analysis (δ13C,
- 1378 δ 15N, δ 18O, δ 34S) of archaeological remains. Quat. Int. 245, 268-278.
- 1379 Drucker, D.G., Bridault, A., Hobson, K.A., Szuma, E., Bocherens, H., 2008. Can carbon-13 in
- large herbivores reflect the canopy effect in temperate and boreal ecosystems? Evidence
- from modern and ancient ungulates. Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol. 266, 69-82.
- Drucker, D.G., Hobson, K.A., Münzel, S.C., Pike-Tay, A., 2012. Intra-individual variation in stable
- carbon (δ^{13} C) and nitrogen (δ^{15} N) isotopes in mandibles of modern caribou of Qamanirjuaq
- 1384 (Rangifer tarandus groenlandicus) and Banks Island (Rangifer tarandus pearyi):
- Implications for tracing seasonal and temporal changes in diet. Int. J. Osteoarchaeol. 22,
- 1386 494-504.
- 1387 Drucker, D.G., Stevens, R.E., Germonpré, M., Sablin, M.V., Péan, S., Bocherens, H., 2018.
- 1388 Collagen stable isotopes provide insights into the end of the mammoth steppe in the central
- East European plains during the Epigravettian. Quat. Res. 90, 457-469.
- 1390 Duncan, P., Foose, T.J., Gordon, I.J., Gakahu, C.G., Lloyd, M. 1990. Comparative nutrient
- extraction from forages by grazing bovids and equids: a test of the nutritional model of
- equid/bovid competition and coexistence. Oecologia 84, 411-418.
- Ecker, M., Bocherens, H., Julien, M.-A., Rivals, F., Raynal, J.-P., Moncel, M.-H., 2013. Middle
- Pleistocene ecology and Neanderthal subsistence: Insights from stable isotope analyses in
- Payre (Ardèche, southeastern France). J. Hum. Evol. 65, 363-373.
- 1396 Evans, J.A., Tatham, S., Chenery, S.R., Chenery, C.A., 2007. Anglo-Saxon animal husbandry
- techniques revealed though isotope and chemical variations in cattle teeth. Appl. Geochem.
- 1398 22, 1994-2005.

- 1399 Fabre, M., Lecuyer, C., Brugal, J.P., Amiot, R., Fourel, F., Martineau, F., 2011. Late Pleistocene
- climatic change in the French Jura (Gigny) recorded in the delta O-18 of phosphate from
- ungulate tooth enamel. Quat. Res. 75, 605-613.
- 1402 Feranec, R.S., 2007. Stable carbon isotope values reveal evidence of resource partitioning among
- ungulates from modem C3-dominated ecosystems in North America. Palaeogeogr.
- Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol. 252, 575-585.
- 1405 Festa-Bianchet, M., Ray, J.C., Boutin, S., Côté, S.D., Gunn, A., 2011. Conservation of caribou
- 1406 (*Rangifer tarandus*) in Canada: an uncertain future. Can. J. Zool. 89, 419-434.
- 1407 Fizet, M., Mariotti, A., Bocherens, H., Langebadre, B., Vandermeersch, B., Borel, J.P., Bellon, G.,
- 1408 1995. Effect of diet, physiology and climate on carbon and nitrogen stable isotopes of
- 1409 collagen in a late Pleistocene anthropic palaeoecosytem Marillac, Charente, France. J.
- 1410 Archaeol. Sci. 22, 67-79.
- 1411 Fricke, H.C., Clyde, W.C., O'Neil, J.R., 1998. Intra-tooth variations in δ¹⁸O (PO₄) of mammalian
- tooth enamel as a record of seasonal variations in continental climate variables. Geochim.
- 1413 Cosmochim. Acta 62, 1839-1850.
- 1414 Fuller, B.T., Fuller, J.L., Sage, N.E., Harris, D.A., O'Connell, T.C., Hedges, R.E.M., 2005.
- Nitrogen balance and δ 15N: why you're not what you eat during nutritional stress., Rapid
- 1416 Commun. Mass Spectrom. 19, 2497-2506.
- 1417 Fuller, B.T., Fuller, J.L., Sage, N.E., Harris, D.A., O'Connell, T.C., Hedges, R.E.M., 2004.
- Nitrogen balance and δ15N: why you're not what you eat during pregnancy, Rapid
- 1419 Commun. Mass Spectrom. 18, 2889-2896.

- 1420 Funck, J., Heintzman, P.D., Murray, G.G.R., Shapiro, B., McKinney, H., Huchet, J.-B., Bigelow,
- N., Druckenmiller, P., Wooller, M.J., 2020. A detailed life history of a Pleistocene steppe
- bison (*Bison priscus*) skeleton unearthed in Arctic Alaska. Quat. Sci. Rev. 249, 106578.
- 1423 Gadbury, C., Todd, L., Jahren, A.H., Amundson, R., 2000. Spatial and temporal variations in the
- isotopic composition of bison tooth enamel from the Early Holocene Hudson-Meng Bone
- Bed, Nebraska. Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol. 157, 79-93.
- 1426 Gat, J.R., 1980. The isotopes of hydrogen and oxygen in precipitation, in: Fritz, P., Fontes, J.-C.
- 1427 (Eds.), Handbook of Environmental Isotope Geochemistry, vol. 1: The Terrestrial
- Environment. Elsevier, Amsterdam, pp. 21-42.
- 1429 Gaudzinski, S., 2006. Monospecific or species-dominated faunal assemblages during the Middle
- Paleolithic in Europe. In: Hovers, E., Kuhn, S.L, (Eds), Transitions before the Transition:
- Evolution and Stability in the Middle Paleolithic and Middle Stone Age. Springer, New
- 1432 York, pp. 137-147.
- 1433 Gerhart, K.L., White, R.G., Cameron, R.D., Russell, D.E., 1996. Body composition and nutrient
- reserves of arctic caribou. Can. J. Zool. 74, 136-146.
- Godbout, L., Trudel, M., Irvine, J.R., Wood, C.C., Grove, M.J., Schmitt, A.K., McKeegan, K.D.,
- 1436 2010. Sulfur isotopes in otoliths allow discrimination of anadromous and non-anadromous
- ecotypes of sockeye salmon (Oncorhynchus nerka). Environ. Biol. Fishes 89, 521-532.
- 1438 Green, D.R., Green, G.M., Colman, A.S., Bidlack, F.B., Tafforeau, P., Smith, T.M., 2017.
- Synchrotron imaging and Markov Chain Monte Carlo reveal tooth mineralization patterns.
- 1440 PLoS One 12, e0186391.

- 1441 Green, D.R., Smith, T.M., Green, G.M., Bidlack, F.B., Tafforeau, P., Colman, A.S., 2018.
- 1442 Quantitative reconstruction of seasonality from stable isotopes in teeth. Geochim.
- 1443 Cosmochim. Acta 235, 483-504.
- 1444 Groot, M., Evans, J., Albarella, U., 2020. Mobility of cattle in the Iron Age and Roman
- Netherlands. J. Archaeol. Sci. Rep. 32, 102416.
- 1446 Hardy, B.L., Moncel, M.-H., Daujeard, C., Fernandes, P., Béarez, P., Desclaux, E., Navarro,
- 1447 M.G.C., Puaud, S., Gallotti, R., 2013. Impossible Neanderthals? Making string, throwing
- projectiles and catching small game during Marine Isotope Stage 4 (Abri du Maras, France).
- 1449 Quat. Sci. Rev. 82, 23-40.
- 1450 Hardy, B.L., Moncel, M.H., Kerfant, C., Lebon, M., Bellot-Gurlet, L., Mélard, N., 2020. Direct
- evidence of Neanderthal fibre technology and its cognitive and behavioral implications.
- 1452 Sci. Rep. 10, 4889.
- 1453 Hedges, R.E.M., Clement, J.G., Thomas, C.D.L., O'Connell, T.C., 2007. Collagen turnover in the
- adult femoral mid-shaft: modeled from anthropogenic radiocarbon tracer measurements.
- 1455 Am. J. Phys. Anthropol. 133, 808-816.
- 1456 Hillson, S., 2005. Teeth (2nd edition). Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.
- Hobbie, E.A., Högberg, P., 2012. Nitrogen isotopes link mycorrhizal fungi and plants to nitrogen
- dynamics. New Phytologist 196, 367-382.
- Hobbie, E.A., Macko, S.A., H. Shugart, H., 1998. Patterns in N dynamics and N isotopes during
- primary succession in Glacier Bay, Alaska. Chem. Geol. 152, 3-11.

- 1461 Hofman-Kamińska, E., Bocherens, H., Borowik, T., Drucker, D.G., Kowalczyk, R., 2018. Stable
- isotope signatures of large herbivore foraging habitats across Europe. PLoS One 13,
- 1463 e0190723.
- 1464 Högberg, P., 1997. Tansley Review No. 95 15N natural abundance in soil-plant systems. New
- 1465 Phytologist 137, 179-203.
- 1466 Holt, E., Evans, J.A., Madgwick, R., 2021. Strontium (87Sr/86Sr) mapping: A critical review of
- methods and approaches. Earth-Sci. Rev. 216, 103593.
- Hoppe, K.A., Koch, P.L., Carlson, R.W., Webb, D.S., 1999. Tracking mammoths and mastodons:
- Reconstruction of migratory behaviour using strontium isotope ratios. Geology 27, 439-
- 1470 442.

- Hoppe, K.A., Stover, S.M., Pascoe, J.R., Amundson, R., 2004. Tooth enamel biomineralization in
- extant horses: implications for isotopic microsampling. Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol.
- 1473 Palaeoecol. 206, 355-365.
- Houlton, B.Z., Bai, E., 2009. Imprint of denitrifying bacteria on the global terrestrial biosphere.
- 1475 Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 106, 21713-21716.
- 1476 Iacumin, P., Bocherens, H., Mariotti, A., Longinelli, A., 1996. Oxygen isotope analyses of co-
- existing carbonate and phosphate in biogenic apatite: a way to monitor diagenetic alteration
- of bone phosphate? Earth. Planet. Sci. Lett. 142, 1-6.
- 1480 Immel, A., Drucker, D.G., Bonazzi, M., Jahnke, T.K., Münzel, S.C., Schuenemann, V.J., Herbig,
- 1481 A., Kind, C.-J., Krause, J., 2015. Mitochondrial genomes of giant deers suggest their late
- survival in Central Europe. Sci. Rep. 5, 10853.

- 1483 Issenman, B.K., 2011. Sinews of Survival: The Living Legacy of Inuit Clothing. UBC Press,
- 1484 Vancouver.
- Jones, J.R., Richards, M.P., Reade, H., de Quirós, F.B., Marín-Arroyo, A.B., 2019. Multi-isotope
- investigations of ungulate bones and teeth from El Castillo and Covalejos caves (Cantabria,
- Spain): Implications for paleoenvironment reconstructions across the Middle-Upper
- 1488 Palaeolithic transition. J. Archaeol. Sci. Rep. 23, 1029-1042.
- 1489 Jones, J.R., Richards, M.P., Straus, L.G., Reade, H., Altuna, J., Mariezkurrena, K., Marín-Arroyo,
- 1490 A.B., 2018. Changing environments during the Middle-Upper Palaeolithic transition in the
- eastern Cantabrian Region (Spain): direct evidence from stable isotope studies on ungulate
- 1492 bones. Sci. Rep. 8, 14842.
- 1493 Kahlke, R.-D., 2014. The origin of Eurasian Mammoth Faunas (Mammuthus-Coelodonta Faunal
- 1494 Complex). Quat. Sci. Rev. 96, 32-49.
- 1495 Kindler, P., Guillevic, M., Baumgartner, M.F., Schwander, J., Landais, A., Leuenberger, M., 2014.
- Temperature reconstruction from 10 to 120 kyr b2k from the NGRIP ice core. Clim. Past
- 1497 10, 887-902.
- 1498 Koch, P.L., Heisinger, J., Moss, C., Carlson, R.W., Fogel, M.L., Behrensmeyer, A.K., 1995.
- 1499 Isotopic tracking of change in diet and habitat use in African Elephants. Science 267, 1340-
- 1500 1343.
- 1501 Kohn, M.J., 1996. Predicting animal δ^{18} O: Accounting for diet and physiological adaptation.
- 1502 Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 60, 4811-4829.

- 1503 Kohn, M.J., 2004. Comment: Tooth enamel mineralization in ungulates: Implications for
- recovering a primary isotopic time-series, by B. H. Passey and T. E. Cerling (2002).
- 1505 Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 68, 403-405.
- 1506 Kohn, M.J., Schoeninger, M.J., Valley, J.W., 1996. Herbivore tooth oxygen isotope compositions:
- effects of diet and physiology. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 60, 3889-3896.
- 1508 Kohn, M.J., Schoeninger, M.J., Valley, J.W., 1998. Variability in oxygen isotope compositions of
- herbivore teeth: reflections of seasonality or developmental physiology? Chem. Geol. 152,
- 1510 97-112.
- 1511 Kovács, J., Moravcová, M., Újvári, G., Pintér, A.G., 2012. Reconstructing the paleoenvironment
- of East Central Europe in the Late Pleistocene using the oxygen and carbon isotopic signal
- of tooth in large mammal remains. Quat. Int. 276, 145-154.
- Kuntz, D., Costamagno, S., 2011. Relationships between reindeer and man in southwestern France
- during the Magdalenian. Quat. Int. 238, 12-24.
- 1516 Lazzerini, N., Balter, V., Coulon, A., Tacail, T., Marchina, C., Lemoine, M., Bayarkhuu, N.,
- Turbat, T., Lepetz, S., Zazzo, A., 2021. Monthly mobility inferred from isoscapes and laser
- ablation strontium isotope ratios in caprine tooth enamel. Sci. Rep. 11, 2277.
- 1519 Legendre, P., Legendre, L., 1998. Numerical ecology. Elsevier, Amsterdam.
- 1520 Levin, N.E., Cerling, T.E., Passey, B.H., Harris, J.M., Ehleringer, J.R., 2006. A stable isotope
- aridity index for terrestrial environments. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 103, 11201-11205.
- Levinson, A.A., Luz, B., Kolodny, Y., 1987. Variations in oxygen isotopic compositions of human
- teeth and urinary stones. Appl. Geochem. 2, 367-371.

- Lisiecki, L.E., Raymo, M.E., 2005. A Pliocene-Pleistocene stack of 57 globally distributed benthic
- δ^{18} O records. Paleoceanography 20, PA1003.
- Longin, R., 1971. New method of collagen extraction for radiocarbon dating. Nature 230, 241-242.
- 1527 Longinelli, A., 1984. Oxygen isotopes in mammal bone phosphate: a new tool for
- paleohydrological and paleoclimatological research? Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 48, 385-
- 1529 390.
- Luz, B., Kolodny, Y., Horowitz, M., 1984. Fractionation of oxygen isotopes between mammalian
- bone-phosphate and environmental drinking water. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 48, 1689-
- 1532 1693.
- 1533 Ma, C., Vander Zanden, H.B., Wunder, M.B., Bowen, G.J., 2020. assignR: An R package for
- isotope-based geographic assignment. Methods Ecol. Evol. 11, 996-1001.
- 1535 MacFadden, B.J., 2008. Geographic variation in diets of ancient populations of 5-million-year-old
- 1536 (early Pliocene) horses from southern North America. Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol.
- 1537 Palaeoecol. 266, 83-94.
- 1538 Maguas, C., Brugnoli, E., 1996. Spatial variation in carbon isotope discrimintation across the thalli
- of several lichen species. Plant Cell Environ. 19, 437-446.
- 1540 Marchi, M., Castellanos-Acuña, D., Hamann, A., Wang, T., Ray, D., Menzel, A., 2020. ClimateEU,
- scale-free climate normals, historical time series, and future projections for Europe.
- Scientific Data 7, 428.
- Marin, J., Daujeard, C., Saladié, P., Rodríguez-Hidalgo, A., Vettese, D., Rivals, F., Boulbes, N.,
- 1544 Crégut-Bonnoure, E., Lateur, N., Gallotti, R., 2020. Neanderthal faunal exploitation and

- settlement dynamics at the Abri du Maras, level 5 (south-eastern France). Quat. Sci. Rev. 243, 106472.

 Mekota, A.M., Grupe, G., Ufer, S., Cuntz, U., 2006. Serial analysis of stable nitrogen and carbon
- isotopes in hair: monitoring starvation and recovery phases of patients suffering from anorexia nervosa. Rapid Commun. Mass Spectrom. 20, 1604-1610.
- Merceron, G., Hofman-Kamińska, E., Kowalczyk, R., 2014. 3D dental microwear texture analysis of feeding habits of sympatric ruminants in the Białowieża Primeval Forest, Poland. For. Ecol. Manag. 328, 262-269.
- Metges, C., Kempe, K., Schmidt, H.-L., 1990. Dependence of the carbon-isotope contents of breath
 carbon dioxide, milk, serum and rumen fermentation products on the δ¹³C value of food in
 dairy cows. Br. J. Nutr. 63, 187-196.
- Miller, F.L., 1974. Biology of the Kaminuriak population of barren-ground caribou. Part 2.

 Dentition as an indicator of age and sex; composition and socialization of the population.
- 1558 Can. Wildl. Serv. Rep. 31, 1-87.
- Moncel, M.-H., Chacón, M.G., La Porta, A., Fernandes, P., Hardy, B., Gallotti, R., 2014.

 Fragmented reduction processes: Middle Palaeolithic technical behaviour in the Abri du
- Maras shelter, southeastern France. Quat. Int. 350, 180-204.
- Moncel, M.-H., Chacón, M.G., Vettese, D., Courty, M.-A., Daujeard, C., Eixea, A., Fernandes, P.,
 Allué, E., Hardy, B., Rivals, F., Béarez, P., Gallotti, R., Puaud, S., 2021. Late Neanderthal
 short-term and specialized occupations at the Abri du Maras (South-East France, level 4.1,
- 1565 MIS 3). Archaeol. Anthropol. Sci. 13, 45.

- 1566 Moncel, M.-h., Daujeard, C., 2012. The variability of the Middle Palaeolithic on the right bank of
- the Middle Rhône Valley (southeast France): Technical traditions or functional choices?
- 1568 Quat. Int. 247, 103-124.
- 1569 Nadelhoffer, K., Shaver, G., Fry, B., Giblin, A., Johnson, L., McKane, R., 1996. 15N natural
- abundances and N use by tundra plants. Oecologia 107, 386-394.
- 1571 Nehlich, O., 2015. The application of sulphur isotope analyses in archaeological research: A
- 1572 review. Earth-Sci. Rev. 142, 1-17.
- 1573 Nehlich, O., Richards, M.P., 2009. Establishing collagen quality criteria for sulphur isotope
- analysis of archaeological bone collagen. Archaeol. Anthrop. Sci. 1, 59-75.
- Nielsen, H., 1974. Isotopic composition of the major contributors to atmospheric sulfur. Tellus 26,
- 1576 213-221.
- Olthof, I., Pouliot, D., Latifovic, R., Chen, W. 2008. Recent (1986-2006) vegetation-specific NDVI
- trends in northern Canada from satellite data. Arctic 61, 381-394.
- 1579 O'Neil, J.R., Roe, L., Reinhard, E., Blake, R.E., 1994. A rapid and precise method of oxygen
- isotope analysis of biogenic phosphate. Isr. J. Earth Sci. 43, 203-212.
- 1581 Park, R., Epstein, S., 1960. Carbon isotope fractionation during photosynthesis. Geochim.
- 1582 Cosmochim. Acta 21, 110-126.
- 1583 Passey, B.H., Cerling, T.E., 2002. Tooth enamel mineralization in ungulates: implications for
- recovering a primary isotopic time-series. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 66, 3225-3234.

- 1585 Passey, B.H., Cerling, T.E., Schuster, G.T., Robinson, T.F., Roeder, B.L., Krueger, S.K., 2005.
- 1586 Inverse methods for estimating primary input signals from time-averaged isotope profiles.
- 1587 Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 69, 4101-4116.
- 1588 Pederzani, S., Aldeias, V., Dibble, H.L., Goldberg, P., Hublin, J.-J., Madelaine, S., McPherron,
- S.P., Sandgathe, D., Steele, T.E., Turq, A., Britton, K., 2021. Reconstructing Late
- Pleistocene paleoclimate at the scale of human behavior: an example from the Neandertal
- occupation of La Ferrassie (France). Sci. Rep. 11, 1419.
- 1592 Pederzani, S., Britton, K., 2019. Oxygen isotopes in bioarchaeology: Principles and applications,
- challenges and opportunities. Earth-Sci. Rev. 188, 77-107.
- Pellegrini, M., Donahue, R.E., Chenery, C., Evans, J., Lee-Thorp, J., Montgomery, J., Mussi, M.,
- 1595 2008. Faunal migration in late-glacial central Italy: implications for human resource
- exploitation. Rapid Commun. Mass Spectrom. 22, 1714-1726.
- 1597 Peterson, B.J., Fry, B., 1987. Stable isotopes in ecosystem studies. Annu. Rev. Ecol. Evol. Syst.
- 1598 18, 293-320.
- 1599 Price, T.D., Meiggs, D., Weber, M.-J., Pike-Tay, A., 2017. The migration of Late Pleistocene
- reindeer: isotopic evidence from northern Europe. Archaeol. Anthropol. Sci. 9, 371-394.
- 1601 Pryor, A.J.E., Stevens, R.E., O'Connell, T.C., Lister, J.R., 2014. Quantification and propagation of
- errors when converting vertebrate biomineral oxygen isotope data to temperature for
- palaeoclimate reconstruction. Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol. 412, 99-107.
- Puzachenko, A.Y., Titov, V.V., Kosintsev, P.A., 2020. Evolution of the European regional large
- mammals assemblages in the end of the Middle Pleistocene The first half of the Late
- 1606 Pleistocene (MIS 6–MIS 4). Quat. Int. 20, 155-191.

- Rank, D., Wyhlidal, S., Schott, K., Weigand, S., Oblin, A., 2018. Temporal and spatial distribution
- of isotopes in river water in Central Europe: 50 years experience with the Austrian network
- of isotopes in rivers. Isotopes Environ. Health Stud. 54, 115-136.
- 1610 R Core Team, 2021. R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing. R Foundation for
- Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. https://www.r-project.org/
- Reade, H., Stevens, R.E., Barker, G., O'Connell, T.C., 2015. Tooth enamel sampling strategies for
- stable isotope analysis: Potential problems in cross-method data comparisons. Chem. Geol.
- 1614 404, 126-135.
- Reade, H., Tripp, J.A., Charlton, S., Grimm, S.B., Leesch, D., Müller, W., Sayle, K.L., Fensome,
- A., Higham, T.F.G., Barnes, I., Stevens, R.E., 2020. Deglacial landscapes and the Late
- 1617 Upper Palaeolithic of Switzerland. Quat. Sci. Rev. 239, 106372.
- 1618 Rendu, W., Costamagno, S., Meignen, L., Soulier, M.-C., 2012. Monospecific faunal spectra in
- Mousterian contexts: Implications for social behavior. Quat. Int. 247, 50-58.
- 1620 Richard, M., Falguères, C., Pons-Branchu, E., Bahain, J.J., Voinchet, P., Lebon, M., Valladas, H.,
- Dolo, J.M., Puaud, S., Rué, M., Daujeard, C., Moncel, M.H., Raynal, J.P., 2015.
- 1622 Contribution of ESR/U-series dating to the chronology of late Middle Palaeolithic sites in
- the middle Rhône valley, southeastern France. Quat. Geochronol. 30, 529-534.
- Richard, M., Pons-Branchu, E., Genuite, K., Jaillet, S., Joannes-Boyau, R., Wang, N., Genty, D.,
- 1625 Cheng, H., Price, G.J., Pierre, M., Dapoigny, A., Falguères, C., Tombret, O., Voinchet, P.,
- Bahain, J.-J., Moncel, M.-H., 2021. Timing of Neanderthal occupations in the southeastern
- margins of the Massif Central (France): A multi-method approach. Quat. Sci. Rev. 273,
- 1628 107241.Richards, M.P., Fuller, B.T., Hedges, R.E.M., 2001. Sulphur isotopic variation in

- 1629 ancient bone collagen from Europe: implications for human palaeodiet, residence mobility, 1630 and modern pollutant studies. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 191, 185-190. 1631 Richards, M.P., Hedges, R.E.M., 2003. Variations in bone collagen delta C-13 and delta N-15 1632 values of fauna from Northwest Europe over the last 40 000 years. Palaeogeogr. 1633 Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol. 193, 261-267. 1634 Richards, M.P., Pellegrini, M., Niven, L., Nehlich, O., Dibble, H., Turq, A., McPherron, S.J.P., 1635 2017. Temporal variations in Equus tooth isotope values (C, N, O) from the Middle 1636 Paleolithic site of Combe Grenal, France (ca. 150,000 to 50,000BP). J. Archaeol. Sci. Rep. 1637 14, 189-198. 1638 Ruebens, K., Sinet-Mathiot, V., Talamo, S., Smith, G.M., Welker, F., Hublin, J.-J., McPherron, 1639 S.P., 2022. The Late Middle Palaeolithic Occupation of Abri du Maras (Layer 1, Neronian, 1640 Southeast France): Integrating Lithic Analyses, ZooMS and Radiocarbon Dating to 1641 Reconstruct Neanderthal Hunting Behaviour. J. Paleo. Archaeol. 5, 4. 1642 Sayle, K.L., Brodie, C.R., Cook, G.T., Hamilton, W.D., 2019. Sequential measurement of δ^{15} N,
- 1642 Sayle, K.L., Blodie, C.R., Cook, G.T., Hallinton, W.D., 2019. Sequential measurement of 6 N,
 1643 δ¹³C and δ³⁴S values in archaeological bone collagen at the Scottish Universities
 1644 Environmental Research Centre (SUERC): A new analytical frontier. Rapid Commun.
 1645 Mass Spectrom. 33, 1258-1266.
- Oxygen isotopic composition of fossil equid tooth and bone phosphate: An archive of difficult interpretation. Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol. 107, 317-328.

Sánchez Chillón, B., Alberdi, M.T., Leone, G., Bonadonna, F.P., Stenni, B., Longinelli, A., 1994.

1646

Schoeninger, M.J., DeNiro, M.J., 1984. Nitrogen and carbon isotopic composition of bone collagen from marine and terrestrial animals. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 48, 625-639.

- 1651 Schwartz-Narbonne, R., Longstaffe, F.J., Kardynal, K.J., Druckenmiller, P., Hobson, K.A., Jass,
- 1652 C.N., Metcalfe, J.Z., Zazula, G., 2019. Reframing the mammoth steppe: Insights from
- analysis of isotopic niches. Quat. Sci. Rev. 215, 1-21.
- Sharp, Z.D., Cerling, T.E., 1998. Fossil isotope records of seasonal climate and ecology: straight
- from the horse's mouth. Geology 26, 219-222.
- 1656 Sjögersten, S., Kuijper, D.P.J., van der Wal, R., Loonen, M.J.J.E., Huiskes, A.H.L., Woodin, S.J.,
- 1657 2010. Nitrogen transfer between herbivores and their forage species. Polar Biol. 33, 1195-
- 1658 1203.
- 1659 Skrzypek, G., Sadler, R., Wiśniewski, A., 2016. Reassessment of recommendations for processing
- mammal phosphate δ^{18} O data for paleotemperature reconstruction. Palaeogeogr.
- Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol. 446, 162-167.
- 1662 Skrzypek, G., Wiśniewski, A., Grierson, P.F., 2011. How cold was it for Neanderthals moving to
- 1663 Central Europe during warm phases of the last glaciation? Quat. Sci. Rev. 30, 481-487.
- Smith, A.B., Epstein, S., 1971. Two categories of 13C/12C ratios for higher plants. Plant Physiol.
- 1665 47, 380-384.
- 1666 Sponheimer, M., Robinson, T., Ayliffe, L., Roeder, B., Hammer, J., Passey, B., West, A., Cerling,
- T., Dearing, D., Ehleringer, J., 2003. Nitrogen isotopes in mammalian herbivores: Hair δ^{15} N
- values from a controlled feeding study. Int. J. Osteoarchaeol. 13, 80-87.
- 1669 Stenton, D.R., 1991. The adaptive significance of caribou winter clothing for arctic hunter-
- gatherers. Études Inuit Studies 15, 3-28.

- 1671 Stevens, R.E., Hedges, R.E.M., 2004. Carbon and nitrogen stable isotope analysis of northwest
- European horse bone and tooth collagen, 40,000 BP-present: Palaeoclimatic interpretations.
- 1673 Quat. Sci. Rev. 23, 977-991.
- 1674 Stevens, R.E., Jacobi, R., Street, M., Germonpre, M., Conard, N.J., Munzel, S.C., Hedges, R.E.M.,
- 1675 2008. Nitrogen isotope analyses of reindeer (*Rangifer tarandus*), 45,000 BP to 900 BP:
- Palaeoenvironmental reconstructions. Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol. 262, 32-
- 1677 45.
- 1678 Stewart, J.R., 2005. The ecology and adaptation of Neanderthals during the non-analogue
- environment of Oxygen Isotope Stage 3. Quat. Int. 137, 35-46.
- 1680 Szpak, P., 2014. Complexities of nitrogen isotope biogeochemistry in plant-soil systems:
- implications for the study of ancient agricultural and animal management practices. Front.
- 1682 Plant Sci. 5, 288.
- 1683 Teeri, J.A., 1981. Stable carbon isotope analysis of mosses and lichens growing in xeric and moist
- habitats. The Bryologist 84, 82-84.
- 1685 Trayler, R.B., Kohn, M.J., 2017. Tooth enamel maturation reequilibrates oxygen isotope
- 1686 compositions and supports simple sampling methods. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 198, 32-
- 1687 47.
- 1688 Tütken, T., Vennemann, T.W., Janz, H., Heizmann, H.E.P., 2006. Palaeoenvironment and
- palaeoclimate of the Middle Miocene lake in the Steinheim basin, SW Germany, a
- reconstruction from C, O, and Sr isotopes of fossil remains. Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol.
- 1691 Palaeoecol. 241, 457-491.

- 1692 van Klinken, G.J., 1999. Bone collagen quality indicators for palaeodietary and radiocarbon
- 1693 measurements. J. Archaeol. Sci. 26, 687-695.
- Vettese, D., Borel, A., Blasco, R., Chevillard, L., Stavrova, T., Thun Hohenstein, U., Arzarello,
- 1695 M., Moncel, M.-H., Daujeard, C., 2022. New evidence of Neandertal butchery traditions
- through the marrow extraction in southwestern Europe (MIS 5–3). PLoS One 17, e0271816.
- 1697 Vignes, M.-P., 2021. Approche multidisciplinaire des stratégies de subsistance des Néandertaliens
- à l'Abri du Maras (Ardèche): Archéozoologie, taphonomie et analyse spatiale de la grande
- faune du niveau 4.2 (MIS 3). M.Sc. Dissertation, Muséum national d'Histoire naturelle.
- 1700 Voelker, A.H.L., 2002. Global distribution of centennial-scale records for Marine Isotope Stage
- 1701 (MIS) 3: a database. Quat. Sci. Rev. 21, 1185-1212.
- 1702 Wilson, K.S., Pond, B.A., Brown, G.S., Schaefer, J.A., 2019. The biogeography of home range
- size of woodland caribou Rangifer tarandus caribou. Divers. Distrib. 25, 205-216.
- Wißing, C., Rougier, H., Baumann, C., Comeyne, A., Crevecoeur, I., Drucker, D.G., Gaudzinski-
- Windheuser, S., Germonpré, M., Gómez-Olivencia, A., Krause, J., Matthies, T., Naito, Y.I.,
- Posth, C., Semal, P., Street, M., Bocherens, H., 2019. Stable isotopes reveal patterns of diet
- and mobility in the last Neandertals and first modern humans in Europe, Scientific Reports
- 1708 9, 4433.
- Wooller, M.J., Bataille, C., Druckenmiller, P., Erickson, G.M., Groves, P., Haubenstock, N., Howe,
- T., Irrgeher, J., Mann, D., Moon, K., Potter, B.A., Prohaska, T., Rasic, J., Reuther, J.,
- 1711 Shapiro, B., Spaleta, K.J., Willis, A.D., 2021. Lifetime mobility of an Arctic woolly
- 1712 mammoth. Science 373, 806-808.
- Wu, J.P., Veitch, A., Checkley, S., Dobson, H., Kutz, S.J., 2012. Linear enamel hypoplasia in
- caribou (*Rangifer tarandus groenlandicus*): A potential tool to assess population health.
- 1715 Wildl. Soc. Bull. 36, 554-560.

1716	Foury, Y., Desclaux, E., Daujeard, C., Defleur, A., Moncel, MH., Raynal, JP., 2016. Evolution
1717	des faunes de rongeurs en moyenne vallée du Rhône (rive droite, Ardèche, France) au cours
1718	du pléistocène moyen final et du pléistocène supérieur ancien, du mis 6 au mis 4.
1719	Quaternaire 27, 55-79.
1720	Yurtsever, Y., 1975. Worldwide survey of stable isotopes in precipitation, Report of the Isotope
1721	Hydrology Section. International Atomic Energy Agency, Vienna, p. 40.
1722	Zazzo, A., Lécuyer, C., Mariotti, A., 2004. Experimentally-controlled carbon and oxygen isotope
1723	exchange between bioapatites and water under inorganic and microbially mediated
1724	conditions. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 68, 1-12.
1725	Zazzo, A., Monahan, F.J., Moloney, A.P., Green, S., Schmidt, O., 2011. Sulphur isotopes in animal
1726	hair track distance to sea. Rapid Commun. Mass Spectrom. 25, 2371-2378.
1727	
1728	

1729 Figure captions 1730 Figure 1. Elevation map of the Rhône Valley (southeast France) showing the location of Abri 1731 du Maras and other key Middle Paleolithic sites in the region. 1732 1733 Figure 2. Strontium isoscape of the Rhône Valley (based on Bataille et al., 2020). 1734 **Figure 3.** Measured oxygen isotope signal (δ^{18} O_{enamel}; blue dots) from Abri du Maras for two 1735 1736 Equus teeth (both lower second premolars, Maras 687 and Maras 767) from level 4.2, and 1737 inverse modelled isotopic input (grey line) with 95% confidence interval (grey shaded area). 1738 Abbreviation: VSMOW = Vienna standard mean ocean water. 1739 1740 Figure 4. Estimated mean annual, summer and winter oxygen isotope values of drinking water $(\delta^{18}O_{dw})$ and estimated paleotemperatures for the study site, calculated from archaeological 1741 δ¹⁸O_{enamel} data, with associated compound errors shown as error bars. Lines represent modern 1742 δ¹⁸O_{precip} data (left) and modern temperatures (right) for the area of the study site, with 1743 associated standard deviations shown as shaded ribbons. δ^{18} O_{precip} data was obtained from the 1744 1745 OIPC (Bowen, 2022; Bowen and Revenaugh, 2003; Bowen et al., 2005) and temperature data 1746 from the ClimateEU model and averaged for 1981–2009 (Marchi et al., 2020). 1747 1748 **Figure 5.** Bivariate plot of δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N of bone collagen from *Bison*, *Cervus elaphus*, *Equus*, 1749 Rangifer and Megaloceros from Abri du Maras (levels 4.1 and 4.2). Analytical error (± 1 SD) 1750 is also shown.

Figure 6. Stable sulphur isotope data of bone collagen from *Bison*, *Cervus elaphus*, *Equus*, *Rangifer* and *Megaloceros* from Abri du Maras (levels 4.1 and 4.2). Analytical error (± 1 SD) is shown.

Figure 7. Sequential strontium isotope data from incrementally-sampled dental enamel of second and third molars from four *Rangifer* from Abri du Maras. The mean strontium isotope value of dentine sampled is shown (\pm 1 SD) as well as the range of strontium values observed in the third molar of a *Equus* from the site. Analytical error is within the data points. Abbreviation: ERJ = enamel-root junction.

Figure 8. Spatial assignment of strontium isotope data from the enamel sampled closest to the enamel-root junction (ERJ) of the second and third molars of four *Rangifer* (level 4.1 and level 4.2) from Abri du Maras, corresponding broadly to the potential ranges use by the individuals in winter and summer respectively, based on anticipated enamel mineralization times. Potential seasonal areas correspond to the minimal areas where each sample have 80% chance to originate, and were assessed using the assignR package in R (Ma et al., 2020). Assignments of the samples from close to the occlusal surface and close to the ERJ of the M₃ from one *Equus* are also provided as a reference for an expected local individual.

Figure 9. Summer, winter and mean annual $\delta^{18}O$ data points from Abri du Maras (ADM; Marine Isotope Stage [MIS] 3) level 4.2 exhibit similar values to previously published $\delta^{18}O$ horse enamel data from MIS 3 deposits in southern France (Combe Grenal [CG], La Baume Gigny [BG]), with relatively high summer values and more pronounced seasonality. Values are substantially higher than those reported at the much older site of Payre (MIS 6 and MIS 7–8). Individual data points and error bars represent individual measurements and one standard

deviation of replicate measurements (ADM, CG, BG) or Layer means and standard deviations around the mean (Payre, number of teeth per mean are 3, 5 and 6 for levels D, F and G, respectively). Comparative data obtained from Fabre et al. (2011; for BG), Richards et al. (2017; for CG) and Ecker et al. (2013; for Payre). Note that the large spread in CG data may be related to the large number of different layers representing MIS 3 at the site, the sampling of unidentified tooth fragments of differing lengths and the relatively uncertain chronology of the site. Abbreviation: VSMOW = Vienna standard mean ocean water.