

Vitrimer composites: current status and future challenges

Vincent Schenk, Karine Labastie, Mathias Destarac, Philippe Olivier, Marc

Guerre

▶ To cite this version:

Vincent Schenk, Karine Labastie, Mathias Destarac, Philippe Olivier, Marc Guerre. Vitrimer composites: current status and future challenges. Materials Advances, 2022, 10.1039/d2ma00654e. hal-03826938

HAL Id: hal-03826938 https://hal.science/hal-03826938

Submitted on 28 Oct 2022

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

REVIEW

Vitrimer composites: current state and future challenges

Vincent Schenk,^{a,b,c} Karine Labastie,^a Mathias Destarac,^{a,c} Philippe Olivier^{b,*} and Marc Guerre^{c,*}

Received 00th January 20xx, Accepted 00th January 20xx

DOI: 10.1039/x0xx00000x

Thermosets dominate the composites industry owing to their outstanding stiffness to weight ratio and fatigue resistance. Nevertheless, the possibilities of recycling these materials are limited due to the irreversible chemical bonds created during the curing process which cause the material to be set in its final form. The available recycling strategies generally degrade the polymer matrix either by burning off (pyrolysis) or chemically dissolving (solvolysis) the resins in order to recover the fibres. But methodologies to reprocess or fully recycle (i.e. resin + fibres) these composite materials are rare. Thus, the development of more sustainable approaches is now increasing importantly and is seen as a decisive challenge for the further development of composite materials. Vitrimer materials, which combine the mechanical resilience of thermosets with reprocessability of "glass" at high temperature, appears as a very promising alternative towards recyclable thermoset composites. This review gathers the recent progress in the domain of vitrimer composites and point out the next future challenges to be tackled. A brief section discussing the first industrial initiatives is also presented.

1. Introduction

Industry uses more and more thermoset matrix composites for highdemand applications (e.g. from wind turbines to structural parts of aircrafts such as fuselage or wings) owing to their outstanding mechanical properties, good fatigue and creep resistance and ease of production.¹ Nevertheless, these important materials raise a major problem regarding their recyclability as they are intrinsically insoluble and infusible. Even if these properties are considered as major assets for thermoset matrix composites during their lifetime, they become important drawbacks at the end of their life as there are very difficult to recycle.²

To improve the mechanical properties, thermoset polymers are generally combined with reinforcements such as carbon or glass fibres, carbon nanotubes, graphene or many others. As a result, thermoset composites are even more difficult to reprocess, reshape or recycle. One of the challenges regarding the recycling process consists in separating the reinforcement from the matrix. Current processes use thermolysis (the matrix is degraded at high temperature)^{3,4}, solvolysis⁵ or other methods⁶ enabling reinforcements recovery (carbon or glass fibre-focused) but mostly with altered mechanical properties. Therefore, these fibres cannot be recycled several times and used for the same applications they were initially designed for.^{5,7,8}

The most popular reinforcement in the aeronautic industry is carbon fibre and the reasons are simple: low weight to strength ratio, high tensile strength, high chemical resistance and many others.⁹ For these reasons, carbon fibre reinforced thermoset polymers are also increasingly used for a wide range of other applications including land and sea vehicles, storage tanks, wind turbines and sports equipment. This soaring demand for carbon fibre reinforced polymers (CFRPs) is driven by new targets for lower CO₂ emissions and the need for light-weighting and high strength vehicular structures. Therefore, the production of CFRPs is expected to grow drastically with an estimated projection of more than 190 kt by 2050. Concerning global CFRP wastes comprising both thermosets and thermoplastics, it is important to notice that this will increase up to 20 kt annually by 2025 and even more by the end of 2030 especially because around 8000 commercial aircrafts will reach their end-oflife.⁷ This is in part why there is a clear need for an economicallysustainable waste management and recycling techniques for composites (Fig. 1).¹⁰

An interesting way to recycle thermoset composites would be to customize the chemical structure of the thermoset polymer matrix before they are produced in their final form. Many efforts have been made in the past two decades to produce reprocessable, healable and recyclable thermosets. For instance, reversible bonds were introduced into polymeric networks, including reversible non-covalent interactions (e.g. ionic interaction¹¹, hydrogen bonding¹² and metal-ligand coordination¹³) and reversible covalent exchanges. Thermosets issued from non-covalent interactions often exhibit weak mechanical characteristics and could not withstand large stress making them not suitable for structural applications.

 ^{a.} IRT Saint Exupéry, bâtiment B612 3 rue Tarfaya, 31405 Toulouse cedex 4, France.
 ^{b.} ICA, Université de Toulouse, UT3, CNRS UMR 5312, Espace C. Ader, 3 Rue Caroline Aigle, 3140 Toulouse France. Email : philippe.olivier@iut-tlse3.fr

^{c.} Laboratoire des IMRCP, Université de Toulouse, CNRS UMR 5623, Université Paul Sabatier, 118 route de Narbonne, 31062 Toulouse Cedex 9, France. Email : marc.guerre@cnrs.fr

⁺ Footnotes relating to the title and/or authors should appear here.

Electronic Supplementary Information (ESI) available: [details of any supplementary information available should be included here]. See DOI: 10.1039/x0xx00000x



Fig. 1. Classification of the major recycling methods of traditional composites with possible alternatives offered by vitrimer composites.

Alternatively, polymer networks with reversible covalent bonds, known as covalent adaptable networks (CANs), offer an attractive way to make thermosets with good mechanical integrity combined with thermoplastics-like behaviour at high temperature.^{14,15} CANs are generally divided into two groups depending on their exchange mechanism: dissociative CANs and associative CANs. The first group, dissociative CANs, are constituted of reversible chemical reactions based on dissociative exchange mechanisms, meaning that the crosslink bonds break upon heating and reform at lower temperature resulting in a decrease of network connectivity and modification of the cross-linking degree during network rearrangement.¹⁶ Hence, such exchange reactions lead to networks that cannot maintain their dimensional integrity at high temperature. The second group, associative CANs, keep their cross-link density constant with an constant number of chemical bonds during reprocessing.¹⁷

In 2011, Leibler and co-workers coined this new type of polymeric material based on associative CANs, "vitrimer".18 The first vitrimer was obtained by adding a transesterification catalyst into an epoxy/acid polyester network. This catalyst promoted the transesterification reactions with control possible over the exchange kinetics by varying the quantity of catalyst initially introduced. Vitrimers are now commonly considered as the third class of polymer materials alongside thermoplastics and thermosets. At service temperature, vitrimers behave like traditional thermosets, with good mechanical characteristics. However, when heated above a specific temperature, the exchangeable reaction (such as transesterification) occurs. In the past decade, various chemistries have been implemented for vitrimers purposes including transesterification^{19,20}, transamination of vinylogous urethanes^{21,22}, transalkylation^{23,24}, disulfide exchange^{25,26} or imine exchange^{27,28}, to name a few.17,29-31

These vitrimers have quickly been picked up by the composites community and studied as matrices in different classes of materials.^{32,33} By replacing thermoset matrices with vitrimer counterparts, new capabilities arose such as healability, reprocessability and recyclability (Fig. 1).³³ This review reports an

overview of vitrimer composites with an emphasis on the type of reinforcement, composite manufacturing processes and recyclability potential. A brief description of the used chemistries, composite processing techniques and recent industry-oriented developments in the field of vitrimer composite materials are also presented.

2. Vitrimer chemistries in composite materials

Since the seminal work of Leibler on vitrimers, various chemical platforms have been developed. The reader will find detailed information on the chemistry of vitrimers in recent review and perspective articles.^{29,31} Among the many chemistries, only few were selected for composites purposes.32 The reasons for this poor diversity are likely related to the limited quantities available of dynamic chemical precursors. Composite manufacturing requires large quantities of matter restraining the possibilities to use precursors from multi-step syntheses or sophisticated chemical platforms. The selected dynamic chemistry must be integrated in the overall chemical crosslinking procedure with preferably no release of volatile molecules forming defects, such as water. The processing parameters such as viscosity must be compatible with the manufacturing process spread across the composites industry such as resin transfer moulding, infusion and impregnation. Finally, the selected chemistry should withstand high temperatures as these conditions can be regularly met during structural composite manufacturing or during their use in real applications. For all these reasons, only few chemical platforms were used for preparing vitrimer composites.

2.1. Transesterification

In the pioneering works of Leibler and co-workers, ¹⁹ a zinc acetate $[Zn(ac)_2]$ catalyst was used to promote transesterification reactions (Fig. 2*i*). In conventional epoxy/acid polymer networks, the abundance of both free hydroxyl and ester functions is guaranteed by simply mixing stoichiometric amounts of monomers. However, in off-stoichiometric conditions, the polymerisation is more complex as anionic ring opening polymerization occurs simultaneously with acidepoxy addition requiring a careful design of the stoichiometry so that free hydroxyls are still available throughout the network.³⁴

Another interesting feature of transesterification-based vitrimers is the relatively straightforward control of the exchange reaction kinetics through catalysis. By changing the amount or the nature of the catalyst, the activation energy can be easily tuned.^{35,36} Moreover, it has been demonstrated that light can also accelerate the reprocessing of epoxy/acid-based transesterification vitrimers by dispersing 1 w/w% of carbon nanotubes into the polymer matrix. Indeed, carbon nanotubes absorb light at almost all wavelengths and transform the energy into heat, resulting in fast and precise local heating.³⁷ Vitrimers based on transesterification reactions have also been prepared with isocyanate chemistry as an alternative to epoxybased transesterification vitrimers, offering other advantages such as remarkably short relaxation times.³⁸

Journal Name



Fig. 2. (*i*)(*a*) Exchange between alcohol and ester occurs at high temperature with the need of a catalyst. (*b*) The reaction of acid with epoxy generates an exchangeable ester moiety with a 6-hydroxy function. (*ii*)(*a*) Imine exchanges occur through free-amine and imine metathesis. (*b*) The formation of imine results from the condensation reaction of amine and aldehyde. The release of water must be carefully controlled to prevent the formation of internal defects. (*iii*)(*a*) Catalyst free vinylogous urethane/urea exchanges proceed via Michael addition of free primary amines. (*b*) the formation of vinylogous urethane can be obtained through condensation reaction of amine and acetoacetate functionalities or addition of amine onto alkyne esters (The latter is particularly interesting as it prevents the formation of water). (*iv*)(*a*) Disulfide moieties can exchange through [2+1] radical-mediated mechanism without catalyst and at relatively moderate temperature. (*ii*)(*b*) 4-aminophenyl disulphide is a very convenient difunctional molecule which can be directly used as hardener in epoxy or urethane formulations. (*v*)(*a*) Transcarbamoylation exchange is achieved under mild conditions based on reversible urethane bonds formed between steric phenol hydroxyls and isocyanates in relatively, high quantity.

Finally, transesterification vitrimers and especially epoxy-based ones, have readily available monomers and are relatively easy to synthesise, which makes them readily up scalable and applicable in an industrial composite context. Although, fast processing might require high catalyst loading and high temperatures.¹⁷

2.2. Imine exchange

Imine bonds exhibit a good stability owing to the high bond dissociation energy of 147 kcal.mol⁻¹ compared to 87.9 kcal.mol⁻¹ for regular H₃C-CH₃ bond.²⁷ They can be formed by simple condensation reaction of an amine with an aldehyde (Fig. 2ii). This dynamic moiety can undergo rapid degenerative bond exchange with free amine through a hemi-aminal intermediate or via two different imines following a metathesis mechanism (Fig. 2iia). Overall, the chemistry is robust with little or no side reactions except a possible oxidation of free amines (if present) at high temperature or hydrolysis in presence of water. Reports on polymer networks composed of imine linkages are abundant considering the diverse range of primary amines and aldehydes that are readily available. Some recent studies showed the excellent mechanical and dynamical properties of thermosets consisting of imine linkages. Other studies of small model imine compounds in solution showed that the imine bond exchange is catalysed by the presence of primary amine and the rate of exchange is dependent on the solvent, temperature, and imine

structure making this chemistry very much dependent of the chemical environment. However, the release of water during imine formation (Fig. 2*ii*) leads to material defects requiring a preliminary step with water elimination or post-reprocessing procedure.³⁹ This chemistry has been combined with different reinforcements that will be described in the following sections.

2.3. Vinylogous urethane/urea

Du Prez and co-workers^{21,40,41} developed a new chemistry based on transamination of vinylogous urethane moieties. They can be prepared via a bulk polymerisation using the spontaneous condensation reaction between acetoacetate and amine monomers with the release of water, or via direct addition of amine onto alkyne ester function (Fig. 2iiib).²¹ The dynamic exchanges are catalyst-free and can exchange through two distinct mechanisms: activated iminium intermediate or direct Michael addition.40,41 These mechanisms can be selectively triggered using an external catalyst offering important control over dynamic exchanges. From a thermodynamic point of view, the exchangeable vinylogous urethane bond is comparable to an urethane bond. Thus, vinylogous urethanes are more stable than imine linkages towards hydrolysis and can even be formed quantitatively in water as solvent. The presence of free amines is mandatory to allow swift exchange reactions, but this can easily be done using slightly off-stoichiometric

conditions. Overall, the resulting materials presented good stability similar to those of epoxy/acid vitrimers described previously but with shorter relaxation times. Despite these interesting features, the stability of the small quantity of amines throughout the network needs to be considered for long-term applications, in view of possible oxidative damages.²¹

Similarly to imines, the formation of vinylogous urethanes releases water which can be considered as an important drawback although this has been partially circumvented in a recent paper.⁴² A pre-curing step can be conducted or the use of alkyne esters functions could replace acetoacetate moieties (Fig. 2*iiib* bottom).

2.4. Disulfide exchange

Disulfide exchange (Fig. 2*iv*) is a well-known chemistry which shows many advantages such as an easy implementation and relatively easy access to precursors which make this chemistry very popular.^{25,43–46} Furthermore, this chemistry has been extensively studied as it is commonly used in the chemical industry of vulcanized rubbers. Recent reports show that the behaviour of covalently exchanging disulfide bonds is a rather complex process, and involves several mechanisms with the most likely to happen being [2+1] radical-mediated mechanism which depends on the used conditions and substitution patterns of the disulfides.⁴⁷ Although it is a widespread chemistry, oxidation of free thiols easily occurs under air often showing marked deterioration of dynamic properties over time. In addition, the thermal stability of S-S bond needs to be monitored as this bond is sensitive to temperature, also leading to the deterioration of dynamic properties.

2.5. Transcarbamoylation

Transcarbamoylation of urethanes can occur with both aliphatic or aromatic polyurethanes. The main advantage of aromatic structure is that the reaction can occur without the need of a catalyst between phenols and urethanes (Fig. 2*va*). Urethane bonds can be formed under mild conditions using commercial hydroxyl compounds and isocyanate in high quantity (Fig. 2*vb*).^{48,49}

3. Processing techniques in composites manufacturing

From a composite part manufacturer viewpoint, the use of vitrimer matrices for composite manufacturing depends on the ability of these matrices to be compliant with composite manufacturing processes requirements and parameters.¹ To date, the focus was put on the preparation of vitrimer composites and these processing parameters were often not investigated. In order to help the reader, you will find hereafter a brief introduction of main industrial processes for composite part manufacturing.

The choice of a manufacturing process for the production of composite parts depends of several criteria such as (i) constitutive materials (fibres and matrix) forms (roving, short fibres, unidirectional fibres, textile, ...), (ii) expected mechanical performances, (iii) production rates (e.g. one part a day, one thousand part a day, ...) and (iv) costs⁵⁵. As a function of their technological level, manufacturing processes enable various parameters such as time, temperature, vacuum, pressure, draping rate to be controlled.

3.1. Contact moulding

Used for decades owing to its ease in implementation, contact moulding also called open moulding is divided into two processes: hand lay-up and spray-up. Both are straightforward processes used to manufacture reinforced polymers of various sizes and complexities difficult to reach with other composites manufacturing processes. The process requires a single mould usually coated by a release agent and a gelcoat to obtain smooth surfaces. Afterwards, successive layers of polymer resin and fibre fabric are placed into the mould and cured at a specific temperature. Fibres network impregnation occurs under the pressure manually applied by the operator owing to a debulking roll.

3.2. Pultrusion

Similarly, pultrusion process starts with the reinforcement conditioned in roving which are impregnated with thermoset resin; then pulled through a long-heated die controlling the resin content and the shape of the section. The semi-product is cured then cut at the desired length to obtain the final part. The alignment of the reinforcement in the die is extremely important as it will condition the final mechanical properties of the part produced. This fast and continuous manufacturing process is limited regarding the shapes available; indeed, the section is identical alongside the parts. Fibres impregnation occurs at atmospheric pressure.

3.3. Resin Transfer Moulding (RTM)

Widely used in Aeronautics, RTM process is comprised of a closed mould containing reinforcements where a low viscosity resin is injected under pressure at one or more points, depending on the size of the mould. To enhance resin flow in the cavity, vacuum assistance can also be used. The part is then cured in the heated mould and fast cycle times can be achieved from simple to highly automated process. Conventional RTM process uses injection pressure lower than 1 MPa.

3.4. Infusion

Vacuum infusion process also called infusion uses vacuum to infuse the resin into the mould and to impregnate the fibres. This manufacturing process, easy to implement and affordable consists in placing the fibres into the mould sealed using a vacuum bag or a counter mould; then the resin is infused into the mould cavity only owing to the vacuum created by a high vacuum pump. Critical parameters must be determined before infusion such as the resin viscosity and reactivity or the location of the vacuum ports to obtain satisfactory composite parts without any dry spots.

3.5. Prepegging

Prepegging process enables to obtain pre-impregnated fibres (prepregs) which are partially cured composite materials widely used in the manufacturing of composite structural parts. They are usually prepared by an in-line impregnation of fibres into a liquid polymer matrix followed by partial curing. This results into handleable tacky materials which can be used through a lay-up procedure to design particular parts. The partial curing foresees two advantages: it avoids the resin from leaking from the reinforcement fibres and still provide enough mobility for functional groups to complete the curing and achieve consolidation in the desired shape. Nonetheless, prepregs have some disadvantages since they must be stored at low temperature (with limited shelf-life) to slow down the curing reaction and they must be separated from each other to prevent glueing issues. In this regard, vitrimers could be a very promising alternative as they will result into non-sticky semiproducts with unlimited shelf time if fully cured.

3.6. Vacuum bagging and autoclave curing

Parts made with prepregs are usually autoclave-cured under vacuum at high temperature and pressures around 0.7 MPa.

3.7. Out-of-autoclave curing

In the case of out-of-autoclave curing, prepreg materials are designed to enable the manufacturing of good quality parts (i.e. with low content of defects) using only a vacuum bag and thus a fraction of atmospheric pressure during the curing of the thermoset matrix.

4. Reinforcements in vitrimer matrix composites

4.1. Carbon fibres

Carbon fibres have been used for decades in the industry thanks to their high stiffness, high tensile strength, high chemical resistance and high strength to weight ratio, etc. Nevertheless, they are relatively expensive compared to glass or plastic fibres and therefore mainly used for high performance and structural applications.

The pioneering paper on CFRP vitrimers was reported with bisphenol A diglycidyl ether (DGEBA), a common epoxy resin which was cured with 4-aminophenyl disulfide (4AFD) as dynamic crosslinker (Fig. 2*iv*, *b*). Compared to conventional epoxy systems, the dynamic network (i.e. with vitrimer curing agent) exhibited similar mechanical characteristics except for the degradation temperature which decreased from 350°C down to 300°C. The resulting matrix was then used to prepare thin carbon fibres/vitrimer matrix laminates either by manual impregnation or RTM. The CFRP vitrimer showed equivalent mechanical properties as the epoxy reference, while showing new features such as (re)processability, reparability and recyclability. For instance, a thin carbon fibre/vitrimer matrix laminated plate was reshaped by compression moulding in order to get a thermoformed zig-zag-shaped part (Fig. 3).



Fig. 3. Thermoforming of a cured composite laminate. A 2mm thick carbon fibre reinforced dynamic epoxy laminate (a) was compression-moulded in a zig-zag shaped mould (b), rendering a thermoformed wavy 3D part (c). Reproduced with permission from ref. ⁴⁵. Copyright 2016 Royal Society of Chemistry.

CFRPs were also fully recycled using two different methods: (i) chemical recycling with disruption and dissolution of the matrix network in a thiol-containing solution in order to reuse the carbon fibres; (ii) mechanical recycling by grinding the carbon/vitrimer composites and transferring the powder into a mould subjected to a 20 MPa pressure at 210°C. The carbon/vitrimer composites presented here were obtained using standard manufacturing processes (cf. section 3) by simply substituting the conventional hardener with industrially available 4AFD. Thus, such system constitutes a step towards the implementation of vitrimers in industrial applications, and offers the possibility of obtaining a new generation of recyclable CFRP materials.⁴⁵ Following the same chemistry, Aranberri et al. formulated an epoxy vitrimer matrix suitable for pultrusion.⁵⁰ The substitution of anhydride crosslinker with 4AFD slowed down the polymerization kinetics, modifying the overall curing process. Nonetheless, the pultruded profile exhibited competitive thermomechanical properties and could be successfully reprocessed and reshaped by thermoforming.

The reprocessing time is very often long or requires high temperature. To reduce this drawback, Si et al. introduced higher content of exchangeable aromatic disulfide crosslinks. To do so, a bis-epoxy with embedded S-S bond was synthesised and used with 4AFD as crosslinker, increasing the global number of dynamic exchanges within the network²⁴. The dual disulfide vitrimer released stress more rapidly in comparison to the reference with only 4AFD as dynamic hardener. The resulting materials were thus reprocessable and malleable at lower temperature and it could be more easily degraded by dithiothreitol (DTT) solution (Fig. 4).

(a) Embedding Original fiber BGPDS, AFD (f) Reusing Recycled fiber (e) Washing (d) Dissolving 90 °C, <1h DTT dilute solution

Fig. 4. The recycling process of CFRP composites based on dual disulfide vitrimer: (a) embedding the carbon fibres in the epoxy matrix; (b) obtaining CFRP composites by curing; (c) immersing the CFRP composites in DTT dilute solution (0.1 mg/ml); (d) dissolving the epoxy matrix at 90°C during 1h; (e) washing and drying the recovered carbon fibres; (f) reusing the recycled carbon fibres to form new composites. Reproduced with permission from ref. ⁵¹. Copyright 2020 Elsevier Ltd.

After removing the epoxy matrix efficiently, the carbon fibres were successfully recycled and reused to form new CFRP composites. This study is particularly interesting as it illustrates the influence of disulfide bond contents over recycling kinetics.

Another fabrication method of fibre-reinforced polymer composites based on heat pressing woven carbon fibres and vitrimer powder was also reported.⁵² It is inspired by the powder-based reprocessing of vitrimers and they demonstrated that vitrimer matrix composite samples can be fabricated within a few minutes (as short as 1 min) under different temperatures and pressures, which is remarkably shorter than the time required for typical liquid-state manufacturing methods with conventional thermoset matrices (Fig. 5).



Fig. 5. Fabrication process of composite vitrimers from vitrimer powder. (a) Vitrimer powder (matrix) and carbon fibre mat (filler) are deposited in the mould. (b) Pressure and heat are applied for a prescribed duration to induce fusion of vitrimer powder. (c) A composite sample is extracted from the mould after the heat press process. Reproduced with permission from ref. ⁵². Copyright 2019 American Chemical Society.

The cured vitrimer matrix composed of DGEBA with transesterification as dynamic chemistry was converted into powder through mechanical abrasion. The malleability of the vitrimer composites was also evaluated with possibilities for the material to be reprocessed through thermoforming, which can greatly expand the manufacturing capability of fibre-reinforced composites. The effect of processing conditions such as temperature and pressure were key factors to obtain good mechanical properties. Although it seems that microstructure is a really important parameter which has not been investigated, the presented fabrication method seems to have the potential to enable high volume manufacturing of fibrereinforced composites in industrial sectors. Nonetheless, the relative high viscosity of vitrimers might constrain the further development of this technique. For instance, the thermoformability of vitrimer composites was also compared to carbon/PA66 composite (known to offer good thermoformability). The carbon/vitrimer composite showed ply wrinkling and delamination occurring during the thermoforming process due to the high viscosity of the vitrimer matrix above its T_g compared to PA66 matrix. Indeed, low viscosity is an important process prerequisite to obtain better thermoforming behaviour.53 This feature was also evidenced in vanillin-based CFRP composites prepared by conventional hot-press process. Two different vitrimer matrix composite materials were prepared and strictly compared: (i) CFRP-1 fabricated with soft and tacky prepreg as typically used for thermosetting prepregs; (ii) CFRP-2 prepared from stacked fully cured prepregs which have been consolidated together by hot press. The mechanical tests showed lower flexural strength and modulus for CFRP-2 compared to CFRP-1 (Fig. 6).



Fig. 6. Schematic fabrication of CFRP-1 and CFRP-2 composites (a); Comparison of the flexural strength (b) and modulus (c) of CFRC-1 and CFRC-2 composites. Modified with the permission of ref. ⁵⁴. Copyright 2020 Elsevier Ltd.

This decrease of properties is likely due to the restrained mobility arising from carbon fibres preventing sufficient bond exchanges at the prepreg interface. As a result, the polymer chains entanglement at the interface might not be sufficient to compete with the mechanical properties resulting from a tacky prepreg. Besides, the

epoxy vitrimer matrix enabled the carbon fibre reinforced composites to be repairable as evidenced by 92% strength recovery after interlaminar shear failure. Carbon fibres were recovered from composites by degrading the matrix resin in an amine solvent, and the degradation products can be reused to prepare new vitrimers, thus achieving a full recycling process. Those results highlight the possible limitation of CFRP prepared from fully cured prepregs, although this limitation could be potentially overpassed with further investigation.⁵⁴

Recently, the interlaminar properties of CFR epoxy-dicarboxylic acid vitrimer have been studied in detail, through mode I interlaminar fracture toughness and flexural experiments. Different CFR vitrimers were prepared with various epoxy:acid ratios and manually laid-up and hot-pressed. While the flexural stiffness and strength were comparable to conventional anhydride epoxy CFRP, interlaminar fracture energy under mode I loading outperformed the latter at the initiation and propagation stages. Furthermore, SEM micrographs of fracture surfaces after double cantilever beam test showed matrix residues onto the carbon fibres indicating a satisfying interfacial adhesion.⁵⁵

Considering the societal invectives towards bio-based resins, the use and development of such matrices in combination with vitrimers also attracted considerable attention.⁵⁶ Liu et al reported the use of a vanillin-based imine crosslinker with epoxidized soybean oil.57 The bio-based epoxy vitrimer showed good malleability, recyclability, and mechanical properties, making it suitable as matrix to fabricate CFRP composites. The vanillin-based composites have been recycled by depolymerization of the Schiff base bond under acidic conditions and using temperature through traditional processing techniques such as compression moulding. Lately, the soybean epoxy resin was replaced by glycerol triglycidyl ether. Similarly to the soybean resin, the CF fabric could be recycled after degrading the matrix in an amine solution.⁵⁸ Then, after recombining the degraded resin with recycled CF fabric, a "regenerated" CF vitrimer matrix composite with similar mechanical properties to the original composite could be obtained, achieving full recycling of the CF vitrimer matrix composite.

Fully bio-based catalyst-free epoxy vitrimers for CFRPs were synthesized from bio-based itaconic acid-based epoxy monomer, maleic anhydride and glycerine.⁵⁹ The dynamic behaviour based on transesterification reactions is occurring readily without catalyst thanks to the large number of carboxylate and hydroxyl groups, accelerating the matrix relaxation and degradation times. The CF vitrimers were recycled and reprocessed several times without degradation of the mechanical properties.

4.2. Carbon nanotubes (CNT)

Carbon nanotubes can exhibit remarkable electrical conductivity, tensile strength and thermal conductivity thanks to their nanostructure. Therefore, CNTs are valuable in many areas like electronics, composite materials and nanotechnology. Additionally, CNTs absorb light of almost all wavelengths and transform the energy into heat, resulting in fast and precise local heating which could be really useful for vitrimer matrix composites.

As example, Yang et al.³⁷ raised the problem that assembling classical epoxy materials by welding with remote control was extremely difficult as epoxies cannot melt or be dissolved. They presented a simple but highly efficient strategy by exploring the photothermal effect of CNTs to manipulate the transesterification reaction in vitrimers. The epoxy vitrimer was synthesized by reacting DGEBA resin with adipic acid in the presence of triazobicyclodecene as transesterification catalyst and a concentration of 1 wt% of CNT. The resulting CNT-filled epoxy vitrimer could be welded by light within a few minutes. Indeed, transmission welding could be used to weld CNT vitrimers with different kinds of epoxy or thermoplastic polymers, which is not applicable to welding by direct heating. Thus, CNT vitrimer composites were successfully welded with non-CNT vitrimers via irradiation with an infrared laser (Fig. 7).



Fig. 7. Transmission welding (a) joining a non-CNT vitrimer with a CNT– vitrimer. (b) Joining two pieces of non-CNT vitrimer using CNT–vitrimer as an "adhesive". (c) Joining normal epoxy with CNT–vitrimer. (d) Joining thermoplastic PE with CNT–vitrimer. Reproduced with permission from ref. ³⁷. Copyright The Royal Society of Chemistry 2014.

Their results have demonstrated that the photo-thermal effect of CNTs is strong enough to activate the transesterification reaction. This makes it possible to weld covalently cross-linked epoxy networks using light, with versatile remote control on the selected areas at any time as required. Such photo-modulating welding without glues and moulds could be suitable for processing complex contours or the in situ joining and repairing of epoxy networks that have been integrated into high value sensitive objects. CNT can also convert electric or magnetic energy into heat. With appropriate modification of the composite reported in this article, electrical and magnetic fields could also be employed to manipulate the welding and healing of epoxy vitrimer composites.³⁷

CNTs were also implemented in conductive polymers to facilitate the transesterification and endow vitrimers with enhanced electrical conductivity. It is important to mention that transesterification rates and electrical properties of standard vitrimers are inadequate for many practical applications. The transesterification reaction performance has been evaluated by stress relaxation and showed 3.6 times faster relaxation rate after doping it with only 3 wt% of CNT/Polypyrrole (PPy). The improved transesterification in stress relaxation benefited from the upper thermal conductivity of CNTs and the interfacial interaction between CNT/PPy and vitrimer matrix. Unlike CNT/PPy vitrimer matrix composites, pure CNTs as dopant resulted in little enhancement suffering from strong agglomeration in the matrix. In addition, CNT/PPy doping improved the conductivity by several orders of magnitude.²⁰

Polyimine vitrimers containing multiwalled carbon nanotube (MWCNT) fillers that allows bending, stretching, healing, and closedloop recycling were also reported. Those composites have been prepared by dispersing less than 10 wt% MWCNTs in a solution of terephthalaldehyde (top left), diethylenetriamine (top middle) and the cross-linker tris(2-aminoethyl)amine (top right) (Fig. 8).



Fig. 8. Polyimine-MWCNTs composite for flexible electronics. Reproduced with permission from ref. ⁶⁰. Copyright 2020 American Chemical Society.

The resulting composites combine both advantages of the polyimine vitrimer (i.e. dynamic covalent bond exchange) and carbon nanotubes (i.e. electron conducting) but the MWCNTs also improved the mechanical properties. Moreover, after bending, reshaping, breaking/healing and reuse, the electrical conductivity of the composite could remain almost the same thus making it a potential good candidate for flexible electronics. In addition, thin films polyimine composites could also be fully recycled, which would reduce the overall production cost and the generation of environmentally hazardous electronic waste.⁶⁰

The increase of exchangeable aromatic disulfide content as previously reported in CFRP⁵¹ were also used in the context of MWCNTs.⁶¹ The relaxation time of the composites at 200°C was approximately 9 s without any catalyst, which is remarkably low and 3 cycles of continuous breaking/ compression moulding did not alter the properties (Fig. 9). The electric resistance of

MWCNTs/PPy/vitrimer composites was decreased from 10^{16} down to $10^9 \Omega$ with only 1%wt MWCNTs, which could be a promising candidate as self-repairing materials in the field of antistatic materials as it requires to have a surface resistance $\leq 10^9 \Omega$ for antistatic coatings but also for electromagnetic shielding and microwave absorption.



Fig. 9. Recycling of the grinded polymer network by hot pressing. (b) Stress–strain curves of the recycled samples demonstrated full recovery of the mechanical properties. Reproduced with permission from ref. ⁶¹. Copyright 2018 Elsevier Ltd.

4.3. Graphene

Graphene is a single layer of carbon atoms (single layer of graphite) arranged in a two-dimensional honeycomb lattice. It is considered to be the world's strongest material and can be used to enhance the strength of other materials (e.g. polymers). It also has a good capability to conduct electricity and heat, making it very valuable for specific applications such as energy storage or electronics.

In order to fully exploit the potential of graphene in polymer composites, its alignment is a key factor. Nevertheless, it is still a challenge to orientate graphene in thermosets due to its insoluble and infusible character. To do so, Chen et al. reported an easy and scalable hot press method to fabricate aligned graphene nanoplate (GnP)/epoxy composites by utilizing the dynamic character of epoxy vitrimers. The bond exchange and topological rearrangement associated with the viscous flow of the epoxy vitrimer during hot pressing process allowed spontaneous orientation of GnP in the vitrimer matrix because of the graphite 2D structure and volume exclusion effect (Fig. 10).



Fig. 10. Chemical structure of the monomers and the fabrication process of aligned and healable graphene/epoxy composites. Reproduced with permission from ref. ⁶². Copyright 2019 Frontiers in Chemistry.

The correct orientation of GnP was confirmed by SEM images and tensile tests revealed the significantly increased reinforcement effect of GnP. The dynamic reactions within the epoxy vitrimer matrix

conferred a good healability and recyclability to the aligned composites as confirmed by the nearly fully recovered mechanical properties of the healed sample after cutting and the recycled sample after grinding.⁶²

To introduce good malleability, enhanced mechanical properties and multi-stimuli response, graphene was introduced in a styrenebutadiene rubber (SBR). The crosslinked networks were able to modify their topologies via transimination reactions in both the bulk network and SBR-graphene interphase in the absence of catalyst, enabling them to be recycled and reshaped under heating or IR irradiation. The incorporation of graphene in the SBR network improved the mechanical properties of vitrimer composites. Also, the mechanical properties of the samples (containing different percentages of graphene) after multiple generations of recycling (cut and hot-pressed) were almost identical to those for the first reprocessing samples (Fig. 11).



Fig. 11. (a) Optical images showing the recycling of SBR-3G, and the scale bar represents 1 cm; (b) Recovery ratio of mechanical performance for SBR-xG between the first and second generations of recycling; (c) Stress-strain curves of SBR-3G after multiple cycles of recycling. Reproduced with permission from ref. ⁶³. Copyright 2018 Elsevier Ltd.

The incorporation of graphene could allow the vitrimer to be readily wrought to geometrically complex shapes under heating or IR irradiation.⁶³

Following the same strategy, Krishnakumar et al. designed a catalystfree self-healable vitrimer/graphene oxide (GO) nanocomposites, based on disulfide exchanges. This study found that the GO nanosheets enhanced the self-healing properties but also the shape memory and flexural strength of the vitrimer composites. The vitrimer nanocomposites demonstrate an 88% and 80% self-healing for the first and second cycle in comparison to the neat epoxy vitrimers which resulted into 73% and 60% self-healing recovery, respectively (Fig. 12).⁶⁴



Fig. 12. a) Optical images of uncut, cut and healed EP-1% specimen. b) Healing represented stress-strain curves for i) EP-pristine ii) EP-0.5% and iii) EP-1%. c) Flexural modulus changes after healing cycles for different samples. Reproduced with permission from ref. ⁶⁴. Copyright 2019 Elsevier Ltd.

The enhancing effect of graphene was recently confirmed by molecular dynamics simulations between a GO/vitrimer nanocomposites and pristine vitrimers using a self-healing simulation.⁶⁵ The simulations were based on DGEBA epoxy and 2-AFD as hardener. The results revealed that the incorporation of GO reduced the Tg of vitrimers. Also, the nanocomposites self-healing properties were found to be better than those of vitrimers at all temperature ranges, in accordance to a previous article on GO vitrimers.⁶⁴ In addition, atomistic investigations demonstrated that the number of new disulfide bonds that exchange during the selfhealing simulation increased in GO/vitrimer nanocomposites, which confirmed that adding GO to the vitrimer stimulated the bond exchange reaction. It is interesting to note that the T_g reduction in polymeric nanocomposites is a general phenomenon observed in various filler/matrix compositions and these simulations results imply that diverse nanofillers could be adopted for the same purpose.

4.4. Carbon nanodots and activated carbons

Carbon nanodots and activated carbons were also used as fillers to prepare vitrimer composites. Niu et al used an epoxidized polyisoprene (EPI) and carboxylated carbon nanodots (CNDs, carbon nanoparticles less than 10 nm in size) used as both cross-linker and reinforcement for the construction of the dynamic network with exchangeable β -hydroxyl ester bonds. Those dynamic exchanges at the interface between EPI and CNDs improved mechanical properties and dispersion of CNDs in the rubber matrix (Fig. 13). The CND vitrimer composite could be reshaped and reprocessed, showing also good shape memory performance.⁶⁶



Fig. 13. CND vitrimer composite network. Reproduced with permission from ref. ⁶⁶. Copyright 2021 Elsevier Ltd.

A vitrimer composite using conventional DGEBA epoxy resin with a biomass-derived activated carbon (AC) filler to achieve enhanced thermal and mechanical properties were also reported. The fact that AC was prepared from sugarcane refuses makes it therefore sustainable. Adding AC to the epoxy vitrimers enabled to the self-healing temperature of the material to be decreased. The main advantage of AC is its high surface area which allows progressive chain exchanges with the matrix. The healing properties of the vitrimer composite were evaluated during flexural tests and showed for a 1 wt % AC a recovery of 85% and 70% respectively after the first and second healing. In the future, it would be interested to use a biomass-derived epoxy matrix in order to synthesize a fully sustainable vitrimer composite.⁶⁷

4.5. Glass fibres

ARTICLE

For almost a century, glass fibres have been widely used to manufacture composite parts for applications in energy (wind turbines) or transports (boats). According to the JEC Observer, they represent more than 90% of the reinforcement fibres world market.⁵⁴ Although they exhibit weaker mechanical performance in comparison to carbon fibres, there are still commonly used for structural applications because of their cost which is much more affordable. They also exhibit superior insulating features and high chemical resistance but with drawbacks to be considered such as low tensile modulus, relatively high density and low fatigue resistance compared to carbon fibres.⁹

In addition to CFR vitrimers, Luzuriaga et al. also described the use of glass fibres to produce vitrimer composites.⁴⁵ Single prepreg sheets were prepared using epoxy vitrimer matrices and glass fibre fabrics, then laid up and hot pressed. This manufacturing process led to the formation of a perfectly compact multilayer composite with better mechanical properties compared to the manual lay-up. A question arises regarding the welding ability of the matrix when it is reinforced with a high content of fibres. Soon after, Chabert et al. studied the welding property of vitrimer composites with a fibre volume content greater than 50 vol%.⁶⁸ Glass fibre reinforced epoxy vitrimers based on transesterification reactions were produced using RTM and they could be repeatedly welded, allowing joining of composite parts without fasteners nor adhesives.

More recently and following a similar approach, single glass fibre sheets were manually impregnated with vinylogous urea vitrimers based on dynamic amine exchanges. Next, they were fully cured and used to prepare multilayer composites by stacking and hot-pressed. Pressing parameters such as pressure and temperature are crucial to reach the desired properties and to avoid porosities within the multilayered composite. The mechanical properties obtained were similar to the reference glass fabric epoxy composite displaying the efficiency of fully cured vitrimer prepregs.⁶⁹

Another aspect concerning the high flammability of epoxy resins was investigated by Markwart et al. They synthesized glass fibre reinforced vitrimers containing a phosphonate-based flame-retardant additive. Pyrolysis combustion flow calorimetry measurements were conducted proving the flame-retardant effect and they demonstrated the reprocessability of the vitrimer composites.⁷⁰

Post et al. reported the development of a healing glass fibre reinforced polymer (GFRP) composite based on a disulphidecontaining organic-inorganic thermoset matrix.⁷¹ Owing to the vitrimer properties, multiple thermally induced healing delamination was possible between 70 and 85°C. Regarding the composite processing, they have been prepared by conventional vacuum assisted resin infusion molding. Afterwards, the vitrimer composite mechanical properties and the extent of healing were determined by flexural, fracture and low-velocity impact testing. Small sized (< cm²) damage could be partially healed multiple times using a minimal healing pressure (0.02 MPa) to ensure a good alignment of the damaged interfaces (Fig. 14).



Fig. 14. Image analysis of the healing of low-velocity impact for 3 different levels of impact energy. Healing is performed at 85°C and 0.02 MPa for 16 h. Top images show the real damaged composite whereas the bottom pictures show the same pictures treated with a binary filter to facilitate the characterization. Reproduced with permission from ref. ⁷¹. Copyright 2017 Elsevier Ltd.

In addition, the level of healing could be enhanced even for large (> cm²) damages, by increasing the healing pressure onto the location of the primary damage if concentrated in the matrix phase. Overall, this study showed a healable vitrimer with mechanical properties adequate for medium-tech applications and opens the path towards the development of intrinsic low-temperature healing composites with high performance applications.⁷¹

4.6. Cellulose-based reinforcements

The crystalline regions extracted from cellulose microfibrils, mainly by strong acid hydrolysis at elevated temperature, are called cellulose nanocrystals (CNCs). CNCs possess the properties of high aspect ratio, high surface area and high mechanical strength making them low-cost, sustainable and eco-friendly materials for various applications.

A novel concept of converting permanently crosslinked networks of thermoset polymers into dynamic exchangeable networks, called "vitrimerization", recently emerged.⁷² The concept is based on a planetary ball mill processing of thermosets with are mechanochemically grinded with a catalyst allowing recycling and reprocessing. The hydroxyl functions at the interface achieve proper dynamic exchange transforming the initial permanently crosslinked network into a vitrimer.

Yue et al. demonstrated that introducing CNCs as feedstock of external hydroxyl groups in the mechanochemical vitrimerization process could improve the exchange reaction rate as well as the thermomechanical properties of the epoxy vitrimer.⁷³ After being processed, the new epoxy vitrimer exhibited typical features of vitrimer polymers such as network topology rearrangement. Network reforming and property recovery are based on the transesterification exchange reaction-induced welding. In addition to the enhanced transesterification exchange reactions, the bio-based CNCs allowed better thermomechanical properties of the nanocomposites but also mechanical repair and recycling (Fig. 15). Instead of synthesizing recyclable vitrimers, this method enables the fabrication of vitrimer polymers from thermoset wastes and could be suitable for industrial applications.⁷³



Fig. 15. (a) Stress relaxation curves of reprocessed epoxy/CNC nanocomposites at 200 °C. (b) Force-displacement curves (lap-shear test) of repaired epoxy/CNC nanocomposites after 30 min of welding at 200 °C. (c) Reshaping of V-15CNC subjected to different deformations at 200 °C for 10 min. (d) Repairing of broken epoxy/CNC nanocomposites after 30 min of welding at 200 °C. (e) Recycling of epoxy/CNC. Reproduced with permission from ref. ⁷³. Copyright 2021 American Chemical Society.

Regenerated cellulose (RC) was also reported as reinforcement to improve the mechanical properties of the vitrimer composites (tensile, flexural and impact strengths, scratch healing and reprocessability). ⁷⁴ Cellulose paper was used in combination with vitrimers introducing a series of properties such as shape-memory, reshaping, self-healing, and reprocessing.⁷⁵

4.7. Silica and aluminium-oxide-based fillers

In addition to fibres, typical fillers such as silica (SiO₂) or aluminium oxide (Al₂O₃) were implemented. This is particularly true for

elastomers and they were extensively studied as one of the first reinforcements in vitrimers. The influence of silica nanoparticles (NPs) on the mechanical and viscoelastic properties of vitrimer nanocomposites was investigated by Soulié-Ziakovic et al.⁷⁶ Results showed the silica NPs had a negative effect on the stress relaxation compared to an unfilled epoxy vitrimer matrix, although it could relax completely while achieving higher tensile modulus. Later, the interactions between the filler surface and the matrix network which can influence the dynamic exchanges were investigated in polyhydroxyurethane nanocomposites.⁷⁷ Similarly, the non-reactive nanofillers slowed the stress relaxation but the vitrimer nanocomposite could still fully recover its initial properties. On the contrary, the insertion of reactive NPs within the vitrimer matrix resulted in faster stress relaxation compared to non-reactive NPs but with a loss of the initial properties, likely due to side-reactions between silica functionalities and the vitrimer chemistry affecting also the cross-link density.

The modification of cross-link density was reported in nanocomposites in comparison to non-reinforced networks, such as the gradual decrease of stress relaxation related to the amount of added covalently bound fillers. An increase of the concentration of silica NPs induces a denser network preventing the overall macroscopic flow which decreases the stress relaxation time.⁷⁸ More recently, Spiesschaert et al. demonstrated that adding silica or aluminium oxide-based fillers to polydimethylsiloxane (PDMS) vinylogous urethane vitrimers can be a good solution to control the viscoelastic properties of vitrimers.⁷⁹

In another paper, surface modified silica was dynamically crosslinked in vinylogous urethane vitrimers.⁸⁰ The introduction of Zn (II) ions could enhance the mechanical properties of composites significantly by sacrificial bonds. Regarding the healing and reprocessing of vitrimers, samples have been cut on the edge partially in the width direction with 2mm (50% of the width) then healed at 110°C and 150°C during 30 min. Also, vitrimers have been cut into pieces then remolded in order to assess their reprocessability (Fig. 16).



Fig. 16. (a) Optical microscope photographs showing a crack surface (i) before healing, (ii) after healing at 110°C for 30 min, and (iii) after healing at 150°C for 30 min. The bar is 100 μ m. (b) Photographs showing the reprocessing of a vitrimer composite. The sample was cut into pieces and reprocessed by hot-pressing (150°C, 10 MPa) for 30 min. (c) Typical stress-strain curves of original and healed composite under different healing

conditions. (d) Typical stress-strain curves of original and reprocessed composite after different cycles of reprocessing (150°C, 10 MPa, 30 min). Reproduced with permission from ref. ⁸⁰. Copyright 2020 Elsevier Ltd.

Liu et al. used Al_2O_3 particles to produce vitrimer composites based on phenolic resin matrix with dynamic urethane bonds promoting transcarbamoylation reactions. Al_2O_3 particles could be well dispersed due to hydroxyl groups located at the surface of the particles and their affinity with isocyanates contained in the crosslinking agent. Different percentages of Al_2O_3 increased the breaking strength and flexural strength although after breaking and hot pressed only 60% of its original flexural strength could be recovered. It did not fully recover probably because of irreversible covalent bonds forming between Al_2O_3 particles and the released isocyanates during the dynamic exchange. Hence, Al_2O_3 particles can also have a negative effect on the dynamic properties of vitrimers depending on the selected chemistry.⁴⁹

4.8. POSS fillers

Polyhedral oligomeric silsesquioxane nanostructures, also known as POSS, are very promising materials for several applications from biomedical to aerospace technologies. For instance, they can be used as reinforcing agents in polymer nanocomposites so those composites exhibit lower mass densities and greater stiffness, and are also capable to withstand high temperatures as well as high levels of radiation. Regarding their composition, they have a cage nanostructure comprised of siloxane motifs Si-O-Si with a possibility to insert functional groups inside the cage.

In their paper, Hajiali et al developed vitrimers with a relatively high biosourced content. Those vitrimers are catalyst-free and based on vinylogous urethane chemistry.⁸¹ Different loadings (0, 5, 10 and 20%wt) of NH₂-functionalized POSS were incorporated and mechanical and thermal analysis on those nanocomposites showed that the POSS reinforcement improved the tensile modulus and strength but also the degradation temperature compared to the parent vitrimer (Fig. 17).



Fig. 17. (c) tensile stress-strain curves and (d) TGA curves of Vitrimer-S and nanocomposites. Reproduced with permission from ref. ⁸¹. Copyright 2020 Elsevier Ltd.

In addition, POSS reinforcement slowed down the relaxation rate and increased apparent activation energy of stress relaxation. Finally, they demonstrated the recyclability and reprocessability of their vitrimers by hot press at 125°C. Then, they showed that the vitrimers

studied and the nanocomposites containing vinylogous urethane cross-linking networks could be un-cross-linked by dissolving in excess monofunctional amine at 65°C or recycled by grinding and remoulding at 125°C without compromising the mechanical properties

Those catalyst-free vinylogous urethane bio-based vitrimers and nanocomposites have potential applications in coatings and insulating materials. However, in order to further improve the mechanical properties of their materials in the future, the authors could target higher T_g s for the synthesized polymer as well as using multifunctional amines or multifunctional POSS in the vitrimer.

More recently, silicon elastomer vitrimer composites for thermal conductivity was investigated, also using POSS. This silicon vitrimer using 4AFD as cross-linking agent was used with octaglycidyl POSS to increase the mechanical properties and functionalized boron nitride nanosheets (fBNNS) to enhance thermal conductivity. The repairing efficiency was slightly reduced with the addition of 66 wt% of fBNNS but had no negative effect on the thermal conductivity even after 6 healing cycles. The main application for these materials could be thermal interface for electronic devices.⁸²

5. Emerging actions towards industry

Many laboratories across the world developed their research activities around vitrimers since their discovery one decade ago. Nevertheless, researchers are just at the start of a new age on vitrimer composites, many aspects of which still remain to be discovered.

Over the years, vitrimer composites have awoken an increasing interest in industry, this trend being reflected in a growing number of industrial R&D activities, public-private research partnerships and start-up companies. In the following sections, the dynamism of this emerging sector will be illustrated with the activities of two start-up companies and two EU-funded projects.

5.1. 2 start-ups: ATSP Innovations and Mallinda

ATSP Innovations was founded in 2010 at the University of Illinois (UIUC) to design and produce new resin systems for demanding applications in severe thermal, mechanical, and tribological environments. There commercialized the first discovered vitrimers based on aromatic thermosetting copolyesters that was reported by James Economy's group at UIUC already in the 1990's.^{83,84}

These new so-calles Aromatic Thermosetting coPolyesters (ATSP) Estherm[™] resins combine many benefits such as high modulus (>3 GPa), high working temperature (T_g > 250°C), low moisture pickup, non-flammability among others.⁸⁵ The dynamic exchanges of this vitrimer are based on transesterification reactions. Estherm[™] can be bought in different forms such as resin, bulk sheets or composite laminates (Fig 18).



Fig 18. Various available forms of Estherm[™].⁸⁶

The vitrimers developed by ATSP Innovations are focused on structural composites applications ranging from launch vehicles to commercial automobiles, as well as rigid structural foams, ablative material for re-entry vehicles (space applications) and fast-bonding high temperature adhesives.^{86,87}

Mallinda was created in 2014 at the University of Colorado (CU-Boulder). The company develops vitrimer formulations based on dynamic imine chemistry with T_gs ranging from 20°C up to 240°C. They launched two vitrimer resins named VITRIMAX[™]T100 and T130 (corresponding to T_gs of 100 and 130°C, respectively). As the imine chemistry is based on a condensation reaction, Mallinda circumvented this issue by formulating NH₂-terminated oligomers with embedded imines used as dynamic harderner. This strategy is an effective technical solution to prevent the release of water during network formation enabling the formation of porosity-free networks. Mallinda's patented^{88,89} vitrimer resin platform is used to manufacture vitrimer composites and eliminates the slow infusion and long curing cycles of today's resins which enables compressionmoulding of products in a few minutes for high-throughput and highvolume production of structural composites. Additionally, their prepreg is pre-cured, shelf-stable and therefore does not require any refrigeration for transport or storage. This platform is designed for fibre reinforced vitrimer production using rapid compression moulding techniques with similarities to sheet metal stamping (Fig 19).



Fig 19. Pre-cured vitrimer matrix composite in mould consolidation cycle.⁹⁰

Another advantage of Mallinda's resin is that it can be recovered using reagents utilized in the resin synthesis although this require an isolation step to enable full reusability. In addition, the vitrimer matrix may also be ground into a powder and reformed into new shapes with heat and pressure (Fig. 20).



Fig. 20. Recycling of Mallinda's CFRP vitrimer.⁹⁰

Those recycling methods increase the input lifetime recycling and reduces the energy required during reprocessing. Finally, Mallinda's ability to implement solid state thermoforming could really improve the production of powder-based composite materials.^{90–92}

5.2. EU-funded projects

AIRPOXY project (2018-2022) is a European collaborative project (11 partners in 6 countries) funded by the EU Framework Programme for Research and Innovation. AIRPOXY stands for thermoformable, repairable and bondable smart epoxy-based composites for aero structures. The aim is to replace epoxy thermoset matrices currently used in composites with vitrimer matrices in order to make the new composites Reprocessable, Reparable and Recyclable (3R)., CIDETEC, a Basque private non-profit organization for applied research which developed and patented^{93–96} aromatic disulfide dynamic crosslinkers (e.g. 4AFD), acts as coordinator of the project.

The primary objectives for the new generation of 3R epoxy vitrimer composites are:

- High production rates thanks to the new 3Rthermoforming processes
- Easy cost-efficient repairing methods for damaged or rejected composite parts
- Reprocessability and recyclability in order to achieve true sustainability

Their thermoforming processes should reduce the manufacturing cost of CFRP parts by 35% compared to autoclave manufacturing and also reduce processing times from hours to minutes thanks to the dynamic chemistry of vitrimers.^{97,98} Recently, a recent paper was reported in which a resin especially designed for aeronautics with low viscosity suitable for RTM processes was studied. The report was mainly technical and mechanical properties of the CFR epoxy vitrimer presented there were comparable to those of reference CFR epoxy thermosets.⁹⁹



Fig 21. AIRPOXY 3R resin.98

ECOXY project (2017-2020)¹⁰⁰ was a consortium of 13 partners from 8 different European countries that has been formed to develop new thermosets and sustainable materials. The project was coordinated by CITEDEC and thus based on disulfide exchanges. The objectives were manifold and oriented towards 3R bio-based materials for construction and transportation industries. The main objectives were the following:

- Development of bio-based fibers and vitrimer resin with the ambition to manufacture composites
- Evaluation of different composite manufacturing processes such as pultrusion and RTM.
- Technical, economic and environmental assessment

The investigation has concluded that bio-based materials with competitive advantages such as repairability, reprocessability and recyclability can be prepared. The composite materials were successfully manufactured using two processes: pultrusion and wet compression moulding. The project members published numerous articles but only one dealing with composites.¹⁰¹ Flax fibers or poly(lactic acid) woven were used as reinforcement in various epoxidized vegetable oils thermosets.

6. Conclusion and Perspectives

Owing to their numerous advantages including reprocessability, reparability and recyclability, the development of vitrimers composites is continually growing. Although the chemical developments surrounding the concept of vitrimers is already well reported, this review aimed at providing a specific focus onto vitrimer composites. The manufacturing methods are especially discussed as only few composite manufacturing processes have been studied including compression moulding/hot-press, RTM, pultrusion, hot-press of prepregs and ball-milling. All those processes resulted into composite materials with good characteristics, but the processing parameters were often not optimized especially in view of potential industrial prospects. Yet, this aspect is crucial as it could restrain the further development of vitrimer composites. This gap is currently being filled by emerging reports fully dedicated to the implementation of vitrimers into industrial manufacturing process.^{50,102} The introduction of vitrimers properties in a well-known resin may induce considerable

modifications of intrinsic parameters such as viscosity, gel time, curing procedure, to name a few. These aspects are often overlooked or not fully applicable towards industrial manufacturing. The chosen dynamic chemistry must be carefully selected to be perfectly compatible with the chemistry of curing and should fulfilled all processing specifications. As also discussed in the review, the fibres may positively or negatively interact with the dynamic chemistry and this should be carefully taken into consideration. The introduction of dynamic chemistry very often decreases the thermal stability of materials which could potential restrain vitrimer composites from certain applications. For all these reasons, every system (resin + fibres + dynamic chemistry) is different and must be carefully examined. Despite all these drawbacks, vitrimer composites represent an important alternative toward durable and recyclable thermoset composites with expected bright future for industrial applications. There are still many challenges for the researchers to explore and the successful development of market-competitive products for real-world applications will need extensive collaborative efforts from scientists and engineers in chemistry, materials science and engineering.

Conflicts of interest

There are no conflicts to declare.

Acknowledgements

The authors thank IRT Saint Exupéry for funding the Ph.D thesis of V.S.

Notes and references

- 1 D. Ratna, in *Recent Advances and Applications of Thermoset Resins (Second Edition)*, ed. D. Ratna, Elsevier, 2022, pp. 371– 418.
- 2 S. Utekar, S. V k, N. More and A. Rao, *Compos. Part B Eng.*, 2021, **207**, 108596.
- 3 M. Boulanghien, M. R'Mili, G. Bernhart, F. Berthet and Y. Soudais, in ICCM 19 -19th International Conference on Composite Materials, Montreal, Canada, 2013, p. p.9087-9094.
- 4 M. Boulanghien, M. R'Mili, G. Bernhart, F. Berthet and Y. Soudais, *Adv. Mater. Sci. Eng.*, 2018, **2018**, e8630232.
- 5 G. Oliveux, J.-L. Bailleul, A. Gillet, O. Mantaux and G. A. Leeke, *Compos. Sci. Technol.*, 2017, **139**, 99–108.
- 6 S. Jlassi, F. Berthet and G. Bernhart, in *ECCM18 18th European Conference on Composite Materials*, 2018, vol. hal-01862432.
- 7 J. Zhang, V. S. Chevali, H. Wang and C.-H. Wang, *Compos. Part B Eng.*, 2020, **193**, 108053.
- 8 S. Verma, B. Balasubramaniam and R. K. Gupta, *Curr. Opin. Green Sustain. Chem.*, 2018, **13**, 86–90.
- S. A. Mirdehghan, in *Engineered Polymeric Fibrous Materials*, ed. M. Latifi, Woodhead Publishing, 2021, pp. 1–58.
- 10 L. Giorgini, T. Benelli, G. Brancolini and L. Mazzocchetti, *Curr. Opin. Green Sustain. Chem.*, 2020, **26**, 100368.

- J. N. Hunt, K. E. Feldman, N. A. Lynd, J. Deek, L. M. Campos, J. M. Spruell, B. M. Hernandez, E. J. Kramer and C. J. Hawker, *Adv. Mater.*, 2011, 23, 2327–2331.
- 12 K. Chino and M. Ashiura, *Macromolecules*, 2001, **34**, 9201–9204.
- 13 Z. Tang, J. Huang, B. Guo, L. Zhang and F. Liu, *Macromolecules*, 2016, **49**, 1781–1789.
- 14 C. J. Kloxin, T. F. Scott, B. J. Adzima and C. N. Bowman, Macromolecules, 2010, **43**, 2643–2653.
- 15 C. J. Kloxin and C. N. Bowman, *Chem. Soc. Rev.*, 2013, **42**, 7161–7173.
- 16 Y. Cao, M. Z. Rong and M. Q. Zhang, *Compos. Part Appl. Sci. Manuf.*, 2021, **151**, 106647.
- 17 W. Denissen, J. M. Winne and F. E. D. Prez, *Chem. Sci.*, 2015, **7**, 30–38.
- 18 D. Montarnal, M. Capelot, F. Tournilhac and L. Leibler, Science, 2011, 334, 965–968.
- 19 M. Capelot, D. Montarnal, F. Tournilhac and L. Leibler, *J. Am. Chem. Soc.*, 2012, **134**, 7664–7667.
- 20 H. Zhang and X. Xu, *Compos. Part Appl. Sci. Manuf.*, 2017, **99**, 15–22.
- 21 W. Denissen, G. Rivero, R. Nicolaÿ, L. Leibler, J. M. Winne and F. E. Du Prez, *Adv. Funct. Mater.*, 2015, **25**, 2451–2457.
- 22 J. Tellers, R. Pinalli, M. Soliman, J. Vachon and E. Dalcanale, Polym. Chem., 2019, **10**, 5534–5542.
- 23 M. M. Obadia, B. P. Mudraboyina, A. Serghei, D. Montarnal and E. Drockenmuller, J. Am. Chem. Soc., 2015, 137, 6078– 6083.
- 24 B. Hendriks, J. Waelkens, J. M. Winne and F. E. Du Prez, ACS Macro Lett., 2017, **6**, 930–934.
- 25 I. Azcune and I. Odriozola, Eur. Polym. J., 2016, 84, 147–160.
- 26 M. Chen, L. Zhou, Y. Wu, X. Zhao and Y. Zhang, ACS Macro
- Lett., 2019, 255–260.
 A. Chao, I. Negulescu and D. Zhang, Macromolecules, 2016, 49, 6277–6284.
- 28 S. Zhao and M. M. Abu-Omar, *Macromolecules*, 2018, **51**, 9816–9824.
- 29 N. J. Van Zee and R. Nicolaÿ, Prog. Polym. Sci., 2020, 104, 101233.
- 30 W. Alabiso and S. Schlögl, *Polymers*, 2020, **12**, 1660.
- J. Zheng, Z. M. Png, S. H. Ng, G. X. Tham, E. Ye, S. S. Goh, X. J.
 Loh and Z. Li, *Mater. Today*, ,
 DOI:10.1016/j.mattod.2021.07.003.
- 32 Y. Zhang, L. Zhang, G. Yang, Y. Yao, X. Wei, T. Pan, J. Wu, M. Tian and P. Yin, *J. Mater. Sci. Technol.*, 2021, **92**, 75–87.
- 33 Y. Yang, Y. Xu, Y. Ji and Y. Wei, Prog. Mater. Sci., 2020, 100710.
- 34 Q.-A. Poutrel, J. J. Blaker, C. Soutis, F. Tournilhac and M. Gresil, Polym. Chem., 2020, **11**, 5327–5338.
- 35 M. Capelot, M. M. Unterlass, F. Tournilhac and L. Leibler, ACS Macro Lett., 2012, 1, 789–792.
- 36 J. L. Self, N. D. Dolinski, M. S. Zayas, J. Read de Alaniz and C. M. Bates, ACS Macro Lett., 2018, 7, 817–821.
- Y. Yang, Z. Pei, X. Zhang, L. Tao, Y. Wei and Y. Ji, *Chem. Sci.*, 2014, 5, 3486–3492.
- 38 J. P. Brutman, P. A. Delgado and M. A. Hillmyer, ACS Macro Lett., 2014, 3, 607–610.
- 39 P. Taynton, K. Yu, R. K. Shoemaker, Y. Jin, H. J. Qi and W. Zhang, Adv. Mater., 2014, 26, 3938–3942.
- 40 W. Denissen, M. Droesbeke, R. Nicolay, L. Leibler, J. M. Winne and F. E. Du Prez, *Nat. Commun.*, 2017, 8, 14857.
- 41 C. Taplan, M. Guerre, J. M. Winne and F. E. D. Prez, *Mater. Horiz.*, 2020, **7**, 104–110.

- Y. Spiesschaert, J. Danneels, N. Van Herck, M. Guerre, G. Acke, J. Winne and F. Du Prez, *Macromolecules*, 2021, 54, 7931– 7942.
- 43 Z. Q. Lei, H. P. Xiang, Y. J. Yuan, M. Z. Rong and M. Q. Zhang, *Chem. Mater.*, 2014, **26**, 2038–2046.
- 44 A. Rekondo, R. Martin, A. Ruiz de Luzuriaga, G. Cabanero, H. J. Grande and I. Odriozola, *Mater. Horiz.*, 2014, **1**, 237–240.
- A. R. de Luzuriaga, R. Martin, N. Markaide, A. Rekondo, G.
 Cabañero, J. Rodríguez and I. Odriozola, *Mater. Horiz.*, 2016, 3, 241–247.
- 46 I. Azcune, A. Huegun, A. Ruiz de Luzuriaga, E. Saiz and A. Rekondo, *Eur. Polym. J.*, 2021, **148**, 110362.
- 47 J. M. Matxain, J. M. Asua and F. Ruipérez, *Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys.*, 2016, **18**, 1758–1770.
- 48 P. Yan, W. Zhao, X. Fu, Z. Liu, W. Kong, C. Zhou and J. Lei, *RSC Adv.*, 2017, 7, 26858–26866.
- 49 X. Liu, Y. Li, X. Xing, G. Zhang and X. Jing, *Polymer*, 2021, **229**, 124022.
- 50 I. Aranberri, M. Landa, E. Elorza, A. M. Salaberria and A. Rekondo, *Polym. Test.*, 2021, **93**, 106931.
- 51 H. Si, L. Zhou, Y. Wu, L. Song, M. Kang, X. Zhao and M. Chen, *Compos. Part B Eng.*, 2020, **199**, 108278.
- 52 L. Yu, C. Zhu, X.-H. Sun, J. Salter, H. Wu, Y. Jin, W. Zhang and R. Long, *ACS Appl. Polym. Mater.*, 2019, **1**, 2535–2542.
- 53 S. Weidmann, P. Volk, P. Mitschang and N. Markaide, *Compos. Part Appl. Sci. Manuf.*, 2022, **154**, 106791.
- 54 H. Memon, Y. Wei, L. Zhang, Q. Jiang and W. Liu, *Compos. Sci. Technol.*, 2020, **199**, 108314.
- 55 K. Tangthana-umrung and M. Gresil, *Compos. Commun.*, 2022, **32**, 101182.
- 56 T. Vidil and A. Llevot, *Macromol. Chem. Phys.*, 2022, n/a, 2100494.
- 57 Y.-Y. Liu, J. He, Y.-D. Li, X.-L. Zhao and J.-B. Zeng, *Compos. Commun.*, 2020, **22**, 100445.
- 58 Y.-Y. Liu, G.-L. Liu, Y.-D. Li, Y. Weng and J.-B. Zeng, *ACS Sustain. Chem. Eng.*, 2021, **9**, 4638–4647.
- 59 Y. Liu, B. Wang, S. Ma, T. Yu, X. Xu, Q. Li, S. Wang, Y. Han, Z. Yu and J. Zhu, *Compos. Part B Eng.*, 2021, **211**, 108654.
- 60 J. Zhang, Z. Lei, S. Luo, Y. Jin, L. Qiu and W. Zhang, ACS Appl. Nano Mater., 2020, 3, 4845–4850.
- F. Zhou, Z. Guo, W. Wang, X. Lei, B. Zhang, H. Zhang and Q. Zhang, *Compos. Sci. Technol.*, 2018, **167**, 79–85.
- 62 J. Chen, H. Huang, J. Fan, Y. Wang, J. Yu, J. Zhu and Z. Hu, Front. Chem., , DOI:10.3389/fchem.2019.00632.
- 63 Y. Liu, Z. Tang, Y. Chen, S. Wu and B. Guo, *Compos. Sci. Technol.*, 2018, **168**, 214–223.
- B. Krishnakumar, R. V. S. Prasanna Sanka, W. H. Binder, C.
 Park, J. Jung, V. Parthasarthy, S. Rana and G. J. Yun, *Compos. Part B Eng.*, 2020, **184**, 107647.
- 65 C. Park, G. Kim, J. Jung, B. Krishnakumar, S. Rana and G. J. Yun, *Polymer*, 2020, **206**, 122862.
- 66 Z. Niu, R. Wu, Y. Yang, L. Huang, W. Fan, Q. Dai, L. Cui, J. He and C. Bai, *Polymer*, 2021, **228**, 123864.
- 67 B. Krishnakumar, D. Bose, M. Singh, R. V. S. P. Sanka, V. V. S. S. Gurunadh, S. Singhal, V. Parthasarthy, L. Guadagno, P. Vijayan P, S. Thomas and S. Rana, *Int. J. Polym. Sci.*, 2021, 2021, e5561755.
- 68 E. Chabert, J. Vial, J.-P. Cauchois, M. Mihaluta and F. Tournilhac, Soft Matter, 2016, 12, 4838–4845.
- 69 W. Denissen, I. De Baere, W. Van Paepegem, L. Leibler, J. Winne and F. E. Du Prez, *Macromolecules*, 2018, **51**, 2054– 2064.

- 70 J. C. Markwart, A. Battig, T. Urbaniak, K. Haag, K. Koschek, B. Schartel and F. R. Wurm, *Polym. Chem.*, 2020, **11**, 4933–4941.
- 71 W. Post, A. Cohades, V. Michaud, S. van der Zwaag and S. J. Garcia, *Compos. Sci. Technol.*, 2017, **152**, 85–93.
- 72 L. Yue, H. Guo, A. Kennedy, A. Patel, X. Gong, T. Ju, T. Gray and I. Manas-Zloczower, *ACS Macro Lett.*, 2020, **9**, 836–842.
- 73 L. Yue, M. Amirkhosravi, K. Ke, T. G. Gray and I. Manas-Zloczower, *ACS Appl. Mater. Interfaces*, 2021, **13**, 3419–3425.
- 74 B. Huang, H. He, A. Dufresne, X. He and S. Wang, *Ind. Crops Prod.*, 2021, **170**, 113804.
- 75 W. Zhao, Z. Feng, Z. Liang, Y. Lv, F. Xiang, C. Xiong, C. Duan, L. Dai and Y. Ni, ACS Appl. Mater. Interfaces, 2019, **11**, 36090–36099.
- 76 A. Legrand and C. Soulié-Ziakovic, *Macromolecules*, 2016, **49**, 5893–5902.
- 77 X. Chen, L. Li, T. Wei, D. C. Venerus and J. M. Torkelson, ACS Appl. Mater. Interfaces, 2019, **11**, 2398–2407.
- 78 Y. Liu, Z. Tang, Y. Chen, C. Zhang and B. Guo, *ACS Appl. Mater. Interfaces*, 2018, **10**, 2992–3001.
- 79 Y. Spiesschaert, M. Guerre, L. Imbernon, J. M. Winne and F. Du Prez, *Polymer*, 2019, **172**, 239–246.
- 80 L. Bai and J. Zheng, Compos. Sci. Technol., 2020, 190, 108062.
- 81 F. Hajiali, S. Tajbakhsh and M. Marić, *Polymer*, 2021, **212**, 123126.
- 82 C. Yue, L. Zhao, L. Guan, X. Zhang, C. Qu, D. Wang and L. Weng, J. Colloid Interface Sci., 2022, 620, 273–283.
- 83 D. Frich, K. Goranov, L. Schneggenburger and J. Economy, Macromolecules, 1996, 29, 7734–7739.
- 84 P. A. O'Connell and G. B. McKenna, *Polym. Eng. Sci.*, 1997, **37**, 1485–1495.
- J. L. Meyer, M. Bakir, P. Lan, J. Economy, I. Jasiuk, G.
 Bonhomme and A. A. Polycarpou, *Macromol. Mater. Eng.*, 2019, **304**, 1800647.
- 86 ATSP, https://www.atspinnovations.com/, (accessed 30 August 2021).
- 87 J. L. Meyer, Z. Parkar and P. Lan, *Reinf. Plast.*, , DOI:10.1016/j.repl.2020.08.007.
- W. Zhang, P. Taynton, Univerity of Colorado a Body Corporate, WO2015138804 (A1), 2015.
- 89 P. Taynton, Y. Luo, H. Rubin, D. Kissounko, S. Loob, S. Sadowski, Mallinda, WO2020051506 (A1), 2020.
- 90 ABOUT | Mallinda.com | United States, https://www.mallinda.com/the-technology, (accessed 30 August 2021).
- 91 P. Taynton, H. Ni, C. Zhu, K. Yu, S. Loob, Y. Jin, H. J. Qi and W. Zhang, *Adv. Mater.*, 2016, **28**, 2904–2909.
- 92 D. A. Kissounko, P. Taynton and C. Kaffer, *Reinf. Plast.*, 2018, 62, 162–166.
- 93 I. Odriozola, A. Rekondo, R. Martin, G. Cabanero, Fundacion Cidetec, WO2013127989 (A1), 2013.
- 94 I. Odriozola, A. Rekondo, R. Martin, D. Ruiz, G. Cabanero, H-J. Grande, Fundación Cidetec, WO2015127981 (A1), 2015.
- 95 I. Odriozola, D. Ruiz, A. Rekondo, R. Martin, N. Markaide, G. Cabanero, H-J. Grande, Fundación Cidetec, WO2015181054 (A1), 2015.
- 96 I. Odriozola, D. Ruiz, A. Rekondo, R. Martin, G. Cabanero, H-J. Grande, Fundación Cidetec, WO2016046135 (A1), 2016.
- 97 Cidetec, AIRPOXY | Cidetec, https://www.cidetec.es/en/projects/surface-engineering-6/airpoxy-2, (accessed 2 September 2021).
- 98 AIRPOXY Smart Epoxy-based Composites for Aeronautics, https://www.airpoxy.eu/, (accessed 2 September 2021).

- 99 C. Builes Cárdenas, V. Gayraud, M. E. Rodriguez, J. Costa, A. M. Salaberria, A. Ruiz de Luzuriaga, N. Markaide, P. Dasan Keeryadath and D. Calderón Zapatería, *Polymers*, 2022, **14**, 1223.
- 100 Ecoxy Project Biobased, reciclable, reshapable & repairable fiber, https://ecoxy.eu/, (accessed 3 June 2022).
- 101 C. Di Mauro, A. Genua, M. Rymarczyk, C. Dobbels, S. Malburet, A. Graillot and A. Mija, *Compos. Sci. Technol.*, 2021, **205**, 108678.
- 102 C. Builes Cárdenas, V. Gayraud, M. E. Rodriguez, J. Costa, A. M. Salaberria, A. Ruiz de Luzuriaga, N. Markaide, P. Dasan Keeryadath and D. Calderón Zapatería, *Polymers*, 2022, 14, 1223.