

Responses of early life stages of European abalone (Haliotis tuberculata) to ocean acidification after parental conditioning: Insights from a transgenerational experiment

Stéphanie Auzoux-Bordenave, Apolline Ledoux, Sophie Martin, Carole Di Poi, Marc Suquet, Aïcha Badou, Fanny Gaillard, Arianna Servili, Nelly Le Goïc, Sylvain Huchette, et al.

▶ To cite this version:

Stéphanie Auzoux-Bordenave, Apolline Ledoux, Sophie Martin, Carole Di Poi, Marc Suquet, et al.. Responses of early life stages of European abalone (Haliotis tuberculata) to ocean acidification after parental conditioning: Insights from a transgenerational experiment. Marine Environmental Research, 2022, 181, pp.105753. 10.1016/j.marenvres.2022.105753 . hal-03797346

HAL Id: hal-03797346 https://hal.science/hal-03797346v1

Submitted on 24 Oct 2023

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

Responses of early life stages of European abalone (*Haliotis tuberculata*) to ocean acidification after parental conditioning: Insights from a transgenerational experiment

Auzoux-Bordenave Stéphanie ^{1, 2, *}, Ledoux Apolline ³, Martin Sophie ^{2, 4}, Di Poi Carole ³, Suquet Marc ³, Badou Aïcha ⁵, Gaillard Fanny ⁴, Servili Arianna ³, Le Goïc Nelly ³, Huchette Sylvain ⁶, Roussel Sabine ⁷

¹ UMR "Biologie des Organismes et Ecosystèmes Aquatiques" (BOREA), MNHN/CNRS/SU/IRD, Muséum national d'Histoire naturelle, Station marine de Concarneau, 29900, Concarneau, France ² Sorbonne Université, 4, place Jussieu, 75005, Paris, France

³ IFREMER, Université de Brest, CNRS, IRD, LEMAR, F-29280, Plouzané, France

⁴ UMR 7144 "Adaptation et Diversité en Milieu Marin" (AD2M), CNRS/SU, Station Biologique de Roscoff, 29680, Roscoff Cedex, France

⁵ Direction Générale Déléguée à la Recherche, l'Expertise, la Valorisation et l'Enseignement (DGD REVE), Muséum national d'Histoire naturelle, Station marine de Concarneau, 29900, Concarneau, France

⁶ Ecloserie France Haliotis, Kerazan, 29880, Plouguerneau, France

⁷ Université de Brest, CNRS, IRD, Ifremer, LEMAR, F-29280, Plouzané, France

* Corresponding author : Stéphanie Auzoux-Bordenave, email address : stephanie.auzoux-bordenave@mnhn.fr

Abstract :

CO2 absorption is leading to ocean acidification (OA), which is a matter of major concern for marine calcifying species. This study investigated the effects of simulated OA on the reproduction of European abalone Haliotis tuberculata and the survival of its offspring. Four-year-old abalone were exposed during reproductive season to two relevant OA scenarios, ambient pH (8.0) and low pH (7.7). After five months of exposure, abalone were induced to spawn. The gametes, larvae and juveniles were then exposed for five months to the same pH conditions as their parents. Several biological parameters involved in adult reproduction as well as in larval, post-larval and juvenile fitness were measured. No effects on gametes, fertilisation or larval oxidative stress response were detected. However, developmental abnormalities and significant decreases in shell length and calcification were observed at veliger stages. The expression profile of a GABA A receptor-like gene appeared to be regulated by pH, depending on larval stage. Larval and post-larval survival was not affected by low pH. However, a lower survival and a reduction of growth were recorded in juveniles at pH 7.7. Our results confirm that OA negatively impacts larval and juvenile fitness and suggest the absence of carry-over effects on abalone offspring. This may compromise the survival of abalone populations in the near future.

Highlights

► Abalone has experienced severe population decline worldwide due to overfishing, disease and climate change. ► OA effects were evaluated on reproduction and early life stages of H.*tuberculata* through a transgenerational experiment. ► No carry-over effects were observed on abalone offspring following parental exposure to OA. ► Larval and juvenile fitness were affected by a pH decrease of 0.3 unit. ► Species dispersion and survival may be compromised in the near future, with potential negative consequences for European abalone populations.

Keywords : European abalone, Haliotis tuberculata, ocean acidification, carry-over effects, developmental abnormality, shell growth, calcification, gene expression

2

1 1. Introduction

2 The absorption of anthropogenic carbon dioxide emissions by seawater is responsible for a decrease in the pH of the global ocean, a process known as ocean acidification (Doney et al., 3 4 2009; Gattuso et al., 2015; IPPC, 2014). Current projections suggest that, by the year 2100, 5 seawater pH will have decreased by 0.1 to 0.3 units, threatening marine calcifiers such as corals, molluscs and echinoderms (Hendricks et al., 2010; Hofmann et al., 2010; Kroeker et al., 2013; 6 7 Widdicombe and Spicer, 2008; Wittmann and Pörtner, 2013). Molluscs are among the invertebrates considered the most vulnerable to OA, with pronounced sensitivity at larval and 8 juvenile stages (Beniash et al., 2010; Gazeau et al., 2013; Melzner et al., 2009; Orr et al., 2005; 9 Przeslawski et al., 2015; Ross et al., 2011). In marine shelled molluscs, OA has been shown to 10 11 reduce larval survival, lengthen development time, alter morphology and/or impair shell formation and calcification (Byrne et al., 2011; Byrne and Fitzer, 2019; Duquette et al., 2017; 12 13 Ellis et al., 2009; Fitzer et al., 2014; Gazeau et al., 2010; Kurihara 2008; Noisette et al., 2014). Since many mollusc species are sources of commercially important foods, the negative impacts 14 of OA may also result in significant economic losses (Ekstrom et al., 2015; Gazeau et al., 2007). 15

Abalone are ecologically and economically important shelled gastropods, which are grazers in the marine ecosystem and a delicacy for human consumers (Cook, 2016; Huchette and Clavier 2004). Many abalone species worldwide have experienced severe population decline due to overfishing, disease and environmental perturbations such as global warming (Cook, 2016; Nicolas et al., 2002; Travers et al., 2009). Understanding the effects of climate change on abalone physiology is an important issue for the management of abalone populations in natural and aquaculture environments (Aalto et al., 2020; Morash and Alter, 2015).

The European abalone *Haliotis tuberculata* (Linnaeus, 1758) is a commercially important species in Europe, for which rearing over the whole life cycle is controlled in aquaculture (Courtois de Viçose et al., 2007). The impacts of OA on several stages of *H. tuberculata* have been well examined by experimental studies (Auzoux-Bordenave et al., 2020; Avignon et al.,

27 2020; Wessel et al. 2018). As with most marine molluscs, abalone have a pelago-benthic life 28 cycle with a larval planktonic stage followed by a critical metamorphosis into benthic juveniles, making them highly sensitive to environmental changes (Byrne et al., 2011). Several studies have 29 30 also focused on early life stages of abalone, especially larvae, demonstrating adverse effects of 31 elevated CO₂, such as reduced survival, developmental delay, body and shell abnormalities and reduced mineralization (Byrne et al., 2011; Crim et al., 2011; Guo et al., 2015; Kimura et al., 32 2011; Onitsuka et al., 2018; Wessel et al., 2018; Zippay and Hofmann 2010). More recently, 33 Kavousi et al. (2021) investigated the combined effects of OA and ocean warming on H. 34 35 tuberculata larvae in a full factorial experiment. Despite no interaction between elevated temperature and low pH being observed, the results provided additional evidence for the 36 37 sensitivity of abalone larvae to OA (Kavousi et al., 2021). Only one study has yet reared abalone 38 embryos in acidified conditions from the fertilisation stage (Byrne et al., 2011); this demonstrated that resulting larvae were more severely affected by OA than those exposed at a later stage. In 39 all the above-mentioned papers, experiments were carried out on a single life-history stage using 40 short-term or acute exposure to pH decrease, that provided information on the vulnerabilities of 41 embryos and larvae (Parker et al., 2015; Ross et al., 2016). More recently, a multigenerational 42 43 experiment conducted on the red abalone Haliotis rufescens (Swezey et al., 2020) demonstrated that larval mortality under OA was strongly correlated with differences in lipid provisioning and 44 metabolism. The differences were linked to population-specific variation in the maternal 45 46 provisioning of lipids with a positive correlation between lipid concentrations and survival under lower pH. This relationship also persisted in experiments on second-generation animals (Swezey 47 et al., 2020), confirming the importance of parental exposure when studying the effects of OA. 48

To better understand the effects of OA on abalone reproduction and the survival of its offspring, we carried out a 10-month transgenerational experiment exposing adult abalone to two climatically relevant OA scenarios. Four-year-old abalone *H. tuberculata* were exposed during reproductive season to ambient seawater pH (8.0) or to a lower pH value (7.7) corresponding to the decrease of -0.3 pH units expected for the end of the century (RCP 8.5 climate change

scenario, Gattuso *et al.*, 2015; IPCC, 2014). The offspring resulting from the reproduction of these adults were then kept in the same conditions and studied until the age of 5.5 months. Several biological parameters involved in adult reproduction (gamete evaluation and fertilisation rate) as well as larval, post-larval and juvenile fitness (survival, growth, calcification) were measured throughout the experimental period. To our knowledge, this is the first study that examines the acclimation potential of European abalone to simulated OA, considering carry-over effects being transmitted from adults to their offspring.

61

62 2. Material and Methods

63 2.1. Abalone collection and conditioning

Adult *H. tuberculata* (n = 260, 48.5 \pm 4.2 mm shell length) were selected at random from an offshore sea-cage structure at the France Haliotis abalone farm (48°36'50N, 4°36'3W; Plouguerneau, Brittany, France) in January 2017, as previously described in Avignon et al. (2020). These abalone were distributed without any selection among ten 45-L open-circuit aquaria (n = 26 abalone per aquarium) supplied with a minimum of 15 L/h of 3 µm filtered seawater at ambient temperature. They were conditioned for three weeks in the laboratory under ambient pCO₂/pH conditions and fed *ad libitum* with the macroalgae *Palmaria palmata*.

71

72 2.2. Experimental set-up

The experimental system used to test the two pH treatments (ambient pH 8.0 and reduced pH 74 7.7) on adult abalone was previously described in detail in Avignon et al. (2020). Briefly, each 75 experimental aquarium (n = 10) was supplied from a separate header tank where pCO₂ was 76 adjusted by bubbling CO₂ (Air liquid, France) through electro-valves controlled by a pH-stat 77 system (IKS Aquastar, Germany). Five replicate aquaria, were used per pH condition. The adult 78 experiment was conducted for five months between January and June 2017, during reproductive 79 conditioning.

80 The maturity of the broodstock was checked during routine hatchery operations before induction of spawning. After four months of exposure, 10 abalone per pH treatment were 81 sacrificed for the assessment of gonad maturity (Avignon et al. 2020). Experimental animals 82 83 were maintained for one additional month before spawning induction. At maturity (i.e. after five 84 months of exposure to pH treatments), adult abalone were induced to spawn using a temperature shock of +4°C and UV-irradiated seawater. For ambient pH, 18 males and 19 females were used; 85 for reduced pH, 18 males and 16 females were used (n = 3-4 abalone of each sex per aquarium). 86 Abalone were placed individually in 1 L buckets with continuous water renewal at ambient pH 87 and allowed a maximum of 5:30 h from the start of the spawning induction in which to spawn. 88 spawning induction, the рН was adjusted, 89 During not due to the small volume of the buckets and to minimise the stress for abalone during spawning. 90 An experimenter continuously observed spawning behaviour to spot the onset of gamete 91 emission. Once the spawning started, the water renewal was halted to avoid gamete loss. When 92 they had finished spawning, the adults were removed from the buckets. The water containing the 93 gametes was gently stirred to ensure homogeneous distribution through the water column. Two 94 replicate samples of 0.4 ml were taken to estimate the number of gametes released by females 95 and males and to determine spermatozoon morphology. Oocytes were fixed in 70% ethanol and 96 spermatozoa in 2% glutaraldehyde. Furthermore, for analysis of spermatozoon movement, a 97 sample of 0.5 ml of male gametes was taken, placed in a microcentrifuge tube and transferred to 98 99 the Argenton laboratory within 45 min. Male gametes of abalone are known to be resistant to transport, even without oxygenation (Pereira et al., 2007). 100

A full factorial fertilisation was carried out per aquarium. Gametes of each female were transferred to 5-L buckets (two to four buckets of gametes per female depending on the number of males from the same aquarium that spawned), which were topped up with seawater at pH 8.0 or pH 7.7 once the adults stopped spawning. Spermatozoa of each male were added to the buckets containing the oocytes of the females from the same aquarium. To avoid spermatic competition,

this was done at an optimal ratio of approximately 100 000 spermatozoa / oocyte (Huchette et 106 al., 2004). Because oocytes are fragile, a maximum of 30 min was allowed between spawning 107 108 and fertilisation. Two minutes after fertilisation, three aliquots of 0.5 ml were taken per family 109 after gentle homogenisation of the bucket and placed in 12-well plates to study the percentage of 110 fertilisation per female. Ethanol (final concentration 70%) was added to the well after two hours to block egg development until later analysis. Two hours after fertilisation, the 5-L egg buckets 111 of females from the same aquarium were pooled and placed in food-safe polystyrene boxes, 112 containing seawater of appropriate pH, until the eggs reached the hatching stage at about 18 hours 113 post fertilisation (hpf). To avoid flushing away any eggs, no water renewal was done during this 114 period. The pH was registered in the hatching boxes for the two pH treatments (n= 5 per pH 115 treatment). At 18 hpf, all swimming larvae were transferred through a pipe to 350-L larval tanks 116 117 supplied with filtered seawater (n = 5 tanks per pH treatment). Samples of larvae were taken from the tanks at three key stages: (1) the trochophore stage (20 hpf), which is characterised by the 118 formation of the larval shell, to evaluate the initial number of swimming larvae; (2) the veliger 119 stage (48 hpf); and (3) the pre-metamorphic veliger stage (96 hpf), which is the last pelagic life 120 stage before larval settlement (Auzoux-Bordenave et al., 2010; Jardillier et al., 2008). At each 121 key stage, three 10-mL replicates were sampled per tank to measure the total number of 122 swimming larvae in each. In addition, 10–15 L of seawater were collected from the tank water 123 columns to study larval development and birefringence of larval shell. Collection of swimming 124 125 larvae in the water column allowed us to sample only live larvae from the tank. The larval samples were then filtered through a 40-µm sieve and aliquoted into 15-mL tubes. Larvae were 126 concentrated at the bottom of each tube by adding a few drops of 70% ethanol. The samples were 127 128 then fixed and stored in 70% ethanol until analysis.

Since abalone larvae are lecithotrophic, they were not fed during the experiment. At the end of the planktonic phase (96 hpf), when the veliger larvae reached the pre-metamorphic stage, all swimming larvae were collected from the 350 L tanks using a syphon and a 40-µm sieve and

132 placed in buckets containing 5 L of seawater adjusted to the same pH as in their respective treatments. The larval density at 96 hpf was calculated from eight 1-mL replicate samples per 133 bucket. After density evaluation, a total of 10 000 larvae was collected using a pipette and gently 134 135 poured into ten 45-L aquaria. These larvae were allowed to settle on 10 plastic plates covered with the green alga *Ulvella lens*, which is a major inductive cue for the settlement of abalone 136 larvae (Courtois de Viçose et al. 2012; Daume et al., 2004). Post-larvae were sampled at 5 and 9 137 days after larval fixation on the plates and juveniles were collected at the mid-term (2.5 mo) and 138 end of the experiment (5.5 mo). By using this overall procedure, the juveniles sampled in one 139 aquarium corresponded to the offspring of the abalone of the same treatment conditioned in the 140 141 same aquarium.

142

143 2.3. pH and carbonate parameters

The desired low pH value was obtained by adjusting the pH to be 0.3 units lower than the 144 ambient pH value, which was characterised by natural pH fluctuations reported for coastal 145 seawater of northern Brittany (pH_T range of 7.9–8.2; Qui-Minet et al., 2018). The pH-stat system 146 values were adjusted from daily electromotive force measurements in the header tanks using a 147 pH meter (Metrohm 826 pH mobile, Metrohm AG, Herisau, Switzerland) with a glass electrode 148 149 (Metrohm, Primatrode, Switzerland). The electromotive force values were converted to pH units on the total scale (pH_T) after calibration with Tris-HCl and 2-aminopyridine-HCl (AMP) buffers 150 151 (Dickson et al., 2007). Temperature and salinity were measured daily using a portable conductivity meter (ProfiLine Cond 3110, WTW, Oberbayern, Germany). 152

Total alkalinity (AT) was measured monthly on 50-mL samples taken from each experimental aquarium (n = 5 per pH treatment). Seawater samples were filtered through 0.7- μ m Whatman GF/F membranes, immediately poisoned with mercury chloride, and stored in a dark place at room temperature for later analysis. Values of AT were then determined from approximately 50 g of weighed samples using a potentiometric titration at 25°C with 0.1 M HCl and an automatic

titrator (Titrino 847 plus, Metrohm). The balance point was determined by the Gran method (Gran, 1952), according to Haraldsson et al. (1997). The accuracy of this method was ± 2 µmol·kg⁻¹ and was verified using Certified Reference Material 182, provided by A. Dickson (Scripps Institute of Oceanography, University of South California, San Diego, United States). The seawater carbonate chemistry analysis included dissolved carbonate (CO₃^{2–}), bicarbonate (HCO₃⁻), dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC), pCO₂, aragonite saturation state ($\Omega_{aragonite}$) and

164 calcite saturation state ($\Omega_{calcite}$). These values were determined by entering the values of pH_T, AT, 165 temperature and salinity into CO₂SYS software (Pierrot et al., 2006) using constants from 166 Mehrbach et al. (1973) as refitted by Dickson and Millero (1987).

167 The effects of reduced pH were examined at different sampling times corresponding to the 168 different life stages of abalone: gametes, eggs, larvae, post-larvae and juveniles. Several 169 biological parameters were measured at each life stage and compared between the pH treatments.

170

171 2.4. Number of gametes released and spermatozoon shape

Oocytes were counted under a photonic microscope (Zoom 2000, Leica, Germany). For the 172 spermatozoon samples, SYBR Green fluorescent dye (4 µl, Molecular Probes, 10⁻³ dilution of 173 the commercial stock solution) was added before flow cytometry (Guava EasyCyte Plus 174 equipped with a 488-nm laser). Data were analysed using the Guava ExpressPro program. The 175 total number of spermatozoa was estimated as was their volume (Forward Scatter, FSC) and 176 177 complexity (Side Scatter, SSC). Duplicates were averaged per male (n = 12 males for pH 7.7; n = 15 males for pH 8.0) and per female (n = 14 females for each pH level). Fecundity was 178 calculated as the number of oocytes and spermatozoa released per gram of abalone (wet weight) 179 180 that spawned (Bilbao et al., 2010).

181

182

183 **2.5.** Spermatozoon motility

Aliquots of 5 μ L of spermatozoon suspension were diluted in 500 μ L of activating solution (1- μ m fresh seawater, 0.3% pluronic acid, 15 mM Tris, pH 8.0., Boulais et al., 2018). Then, 12 μ L of this diluted suspension were transferred to a Fast-Read 102 cell (Biosigma, Italy), and spermatozoon movement was triggered under a microscope (Olympus BX51, X200 magnification) connected to a camera (Qicam Fasr 1394) as described in Boulais et al. (2015). Two aliquots per male were analysed, with an average of 200 spermatozoa tracked (minimum of 56 spermatozoa observed per male).

The percentage of motile spermatozoa and their velocity (VAP: velocity of the average path) 191 were quantified using a CASA plug-in developed for ImageJ software adapted to Pacific oyster 192 spermatozoa (Boulais et al., 2015) and averaged per male. Calibration settings were defined as 193 follows: minimum spermatozoon size (pixels) = 1; minimum track length (frames) = 15; 194 maximum spermatozoon velocity between frames (pixels) = 8; minimum straight-line velocity 195 for motile spermatozoa (μ m sec⁻¹) = 5; minimum VAP for motile spermatozoa (μ m sec⁻¹) = 10; 196 minimum curvilinear velocity for motile spermatozoa (μ m sec⁻¹) = 13; low VAP speed (μ m sec⁻¹) 197 ¹) = 2; maximum percentage of path with zero VAP = 1; low VAP speed 2 (μ m sec⁻¹) = 12; low 198 curvilinear velocity speed ($\mu m \sec^{-1}$) = 15; and frame rate (frames sec⁻¹) = 25. 199

200

201 **2.6.** Fertilisation percentage

The number of eggs at 1-cell (non-fertilised eggs), 2-cell and 4-cell stages were counted with a photonic microscope (Zoom 2000, Leica, Germany). The percentage of fertilisation corresponds to the total number of cells at the 2- or 4-cell stages divided by the total number of eggs counted. The fertilisation percentage was calculated for each female by averaging the value obtained with the different males from the same aquarium (n = 12 for pH 7.7; n = 15 for pH 8.0).

207

209 **2.7.** *Larval survival*

The developmental timing was verified under a binocular microscope at 20, 48 and 96 hpf before sampling the larvae. At each sampling time, the total number of swimming larvae was estimated by counting the number of larvae under a binocular microscope. Larval survival at 48 hpf and 96 hpf was calculated with the following formula:

214 Larval survival = (total number of swimming larvae at t+1) / 100 x (total number of 215 swimming larvae at t)

216

217 **2.8.** Slide preparation for larval morphometry and birefringence

218 Larval samples were ethanol-fixed and whole-mounted on microscope slides for morphometry 219 and birefringence analysis. Microscope slides were prepared with ethanol-fixed larvae from the different pH conditions, following the method described in Wessel et al. (2018). Larvae were 220 whole-mounted in about 500 µL of glycerol, keeping the amount of ethanol transferred to a 221 minimum. The slides were kept at room temperature for 5 to 10 min allowing the ethanol to 222 evaporate and the larvae to settle. Six spots of vacuum gel were deposited at the corners and 223 middle edges of a square coverslip to prevent the larvae from being crushed. After the coverslip 224 was placed over the larval samples, the slides were gently sealed with clear nail varnish. Each 225 slide contained approximately 100 larvae per treatment per larval stage. 226

Approximately 40 larvae per tank (n = 200 larvae per pH condition), regardless of their 227 orientation, shape and development were photographed with an Olympus binocular microscope 228 (Olympus, Hamburg, Germany) under phase contrast and polarized light. The same microscope 229 230 was equipped with polarizing filters for the birefringence analysis. Microscopic observations were fully blinded to prevent bias arising from any a priori knowledge of larval treatment. All 231 images were taken with a digital camera (DS-Ri1, Nikon, Japan) at 20X magnification and 40-232 ms exposure. Images were acquired with NIS-element and analysed using ImageJ software (v 233 234 1.52a).

235 2.9. Morphometric analysis

Tissue morphogenesis, shell formation and shell size were analysed on larvae lying laterally on their sides (n = 200 larvae per pH condition). A qualitative categorisation was used to assess larval morphology and growth according to the method previously developed for *H. tuberculata* larval assessment (Wessel et al., 2018). The phenotype of each larva was scored according to the following degrees of soft tissue morphogenesis and shell formation (see **Fig. 2** for more details):

- *Normal tissue development/ normal shell = normal phenotype*
- 242 Abnormal or partially developed tissues/ partial or no shell = altered phenotype

The maximum larval length at 20 hpf and total shell length of fully shelled larvae at 48 and 96 hpf were measured using ImageJ software and used as indicators of larval size, according to the method described in Kavousi et al. (2021) (**Fig. 1**). The mean larval length was calculated based on 40 larvae per tank (n = 200 per pH treatment).



Fig. 1. Measurements of larval length at 20 hpf (A), and shell length at 48 hpf (B) and 96 hpf (C). Scale bar: 50µm

247 2.10. Birefringence analysis

Birefringence intensity has been previously used as a proxy for the assessment of CaCO₃ mineralisation within the larval abalone shell (Kavousi et al., 2021; Wessel et al., 2018). Birefringence was measured on cross-polarized images taken of 48 and 96 hpf larval stages (n = 200 per pH treatment). The younger 20 hpf larvae were not considered because the shell at this stage lacks sufficient crystallized CaCO₃ to calculate birefringence (Wessel et al., 2018). The mean greyscale level (0–255 pixels) was determined for each area of the larval shell showing birefringence (i.e. 2 to 3 areas per larval shell). The values recorded for each area were averaged
into a global mean greyscale value, providing the birefringence intensity (in %) for each larval
shell.

257 2.11. Oxidative stress

Since OA and warming can cause significant alterations in cellular antioxidant responses (Grilo et al., 2018; Zhang et al., 2021), three parameters related to oxidative stress, i.e. lipid peroxidation, superoxide dismutase (SOD) and catalase, were measured in abalone larvae.

261 About 4000 larvae per tank (n = 5 tanks per treatment) were sampled at 96 hpf. The samples, composed of larvae and seawater (200-300 µL per tube), were flash frozen in liquid nitrogen and 262 263 then stored until analyses. These larval samples were then sonicated in two volumes of lysis buffer (50 mM NaCl, 10 mM Tris, 1 mM EDTA, 1 mM EGTA, 1% Triton X-100, 0.5% Igepal, 264 1 tablet of complete EDTA-free protease inhibitor cocktail in 25 ml of buffer, phosphatase 265 inhibitor cocktail III) and centrifugated (45 min, 10 000 rpm, 4°C). The same lysates were used 266 for quantification of total proteins and parameters related to oxidative stress, i.e. lipid 267 268 peroxidation, superoxide dismutase (SOD) and catalase.

All enzyme assays were performed in triplicate in 96-well microplates (Nunc[™], Thermo
Scientific) and read using a microplate reader (Bio-Tek® SynergyTM HT). Total proteins, MDA
and SOD were quantified using Gen5 software to compare the results with the calibration curves
provided with the respective assay kits. Total protein contents were quantified in each lysate (i.e.
1/10 dilution) according to Lowry et al. (1951) using the DC protein assay (Bio-Rad, Hercules,
CA, USA). Results are expressed in mg/mL.

Lipid peroxidation was approximated by MDA contents, quantified in the lysates (i.e. pure samples) using the *Oxis*ResearchTM commercial kit (BIOXYTECH[®] MDA-586, TebuBio, Le Perray-en-Yvelines, France) following the manufacturer's instructions. Results are expressed in nmol per mg protein. Superoxide dismutase contents were quantified in the lysates (i.e. 1/10 dilution) using a CAS No. RN 905-89-1 commercial kit (S7446, Sigma Aldrich, Saint-Louis, MI,

280 USA) following the manufacturer's instructions. Results are expressed in units per mg protein (U/mg), where 1 U of SOD is the amount of enzyme necessary to inhibit the formation of 281 xanthine/XO complex by 50%. Catalase activity was quantified in lysates at room temperature 282 283 following the method of Curd et al. (2019). Briefly, 10 µL of pure samples were added to 195 µL 284 of hydrogen peroxide solution (10 mM) to initiate the reaction. Absorbance was immediately recorded every 15 s for 4 min using a Synergy HT microplate reader (BioTek, Winooski VT, 285 USA). CAT activity is expressed in mU/mg proteins, where 1 U is the amount of enzyme 286 necessary to catalyse 1 μ mole of H₂O₂ per minute (using ϵ H₂O₂, 39.4 mM⁻¹ cm⁻¹). 287

288

289 2.12. Gene expression analysis

The expression profiles of selected genes were analysed in the abalone larvae at 48 and 96 hpf 290 291 (pooled per treatment from 5 tanks and corresponding to about 50 000 larvae/sample). The genes were chosen with respect to their putative functions in shell biomineralization (lustrin A; carbonic 292 anhydrase 1, CA1; carbonic anhydrase 2, CA2) and neurosensory transmission (GABA A 293 receptor-like; serotonin receptor, 5HTR; Table 1). 18S-rRNA (18S) and elongation factor 1 294 (EF1) were chosen as reference genes. Specific primers for each gene were designed as detailed 295 in Table 1. To search for potential candidate hits for the GABA A receptor in Haliotis 296 tuberculata, tblastx (Basic Local Alignment Search Tool, NCBI) research was carried out using 297 the GABA A receptor sequence of *Haliotis asinina* (EF222254.1) as a query sequence against 298 the unfiltered transcriptome of *H. tuberculata* published by Harney et al. (2016). Then, blastx 299 (Basic Local Alignment Search Tool, NCBI) research against the non-redundant protein 300 sequences database was performed with all 38 candidate sequences previously obtained. The 301 302 sequence TR57267_c2_g1 (GenBank accession number GEAU01240864.1) was chosen as the GABA A receptor-like sequence of H. tuberculata based on sequence similarities to the GABA 303 304 A receptor sequence of Aplysia californica (XP005111291.2). The H. tuberculata serotonin receptor sequence (GEAU01264085.1) was identified by using serotonin receptor sequences 305 available in Haliotis against the unfiltered transcriptome of H. tuberculata (Harney et al., 2016). 306

307 The PCR products obtained with the primers targeting the serotonin receptor and the GABA A receptor-like were sequenced to verify potential errors in the predicted sequences and primers. 308 The same primers were subsequently used in RT-qPCR to target the specific genes of the H. 309 310 tuberculata serotonin receptor and GABA A receptor-like sequence. Total RNA was extracted 311 from pools of larvae using Extract-all reagent (Eurobio, Courtaboeuf, Essonne, France) followed by chloroform phase separation and isopropanol precipitation, including a step of DNase 312 treatment (RTS DNase Kit, MoBio). The concentration and quality of RNA were evaluated using 313 an ND-1000 NanoDrop® spectrophotometer (Thermo Scientific Inc., Waltham, MA, USA) and 314 315 an Agilent Bioanalyzer 2100 (Agilent Technologies Inc., Santa Clara, CA, USA). cDNA synthesis was performed by reverse transcription (RT) using an iScript[™] cDNA Synthesis kit 316 (Bio-Rad Laboratories Inc., Hercules, CA, USA) strictly following recommendations from the 317 supplier. Negative RT controls were performed for all samples (RT reaction without retro-318 transcriptase enzyme). Transcript expression was quantified using the CFX96 Touch Real-Time 319 PCR Detection system (Bio-Rad Laboratories Inc.) according to the protocol previously 320 described by Mazurais et al. (2020). The relative quantity of messenger was normalized with the 321 Δ Ct method using the same CFX Manager software (Bio-Rad Laboratories Inc.). 322

323

324 **2.13.** Evaluation of post-larvae and juveniles

Survival at settlement was evaluated at 9 days and 2 months after settlement. Biometric 325 measurements of juvenile abalone were performed at 2.5 and 5.5 mo of exposure to the different 326 327 pH conditions. At 2.5 months, 2-3 juveniles were sampled per aquarium. To avoid experimenter bias during collection, a first individual was randomly observed on the plate. The next closest 328 329 one was then sampled, and images were taken with a digital camera (DS-Ri1, Nikon) and size was analysed using ImageJ software (1.52a) with 0.01 mm precision. At the end of the 330 experiment (i.e. at 5.5 months of age), all the surviving abalone were photographed and sized 331 using digital imaging. The shells were weighed to the nearest 0.01 mg using an analytical balance. 332

Gene	Accession number	Sequence 5'-3'	References
Lustrin A	HM852427.2	F-ATCTGTCCGGCAGTTCCTAC R-CTGGGGCACTGTAAGTTGGT	Gaume <i>et al</i> (2014)
Carbonic anhydrase 1	HQ845770.1	F-ATGGCAGCTGATAAAGCAAC R-AGGGAAATGAGTGTGCATGT	Avignon et al. (2020)
Carbonic anhydrase 2	HQ845771.1	F-CGCCGACTTTATCTGAGAGC R-GTCTCCCACGAAGTGGTTGT	Le Roy et al. (2012)
185	AF120511.1	F-GGTTCCAGGGGAAGTATGGT R-AGGTGAGTTTTCCCGTGTTG	Gaume et al. (2014)
EFI	FN566842.1	F-ATTGGCCACGTAGATTCTGG R-GCTCAGCCTTCAGTTTGTCC	Gaume <i>et al.</i> (2014)
GABA A receptor-like sequence	GEAU01240864.1	F-GCACACCGAGTGTGAGAAGA R-CAACACTGAATGTGGCGAAC	Designed for this study
Serotonin receptor	GEAU01264085.1	F-GCTACCACGACGACCATATC R- CCTTTCACGCTTTAGTTCCA	Designed for this study

Table 1. Specific	primers	used for	gene	expression	analysis	of	Haliotis	tuberculata	larvae:	GenBank
accession number,	primer s	equences	and 1	references.						

333

334 2.14. Statistical analysis

All statistical analyses were performed with R software (R Core Team, 2015). Differences in 335 336 fertilisation rate, larval survival, total length, shell birefringence, and juvenile length, width and weight were tested using the linear mixed model (LMM) with the lmerTest package (Kuznetsova 337 et al., 2017) based on the method described by Winter (2013). This model used pH as a fixed 338 339 factor and aquarium as a random factor nested within pH. The normality of residuals and homogeneity of variances were verified using Shapiro-Wilk tests and Levene tests based on 340 medians, respectively. When assumptions of homogeneity of variances and normal distribution 341 of residuals were not confirmed, the data were log or inverse transformed before analysis. If these 342 assumptions were not validated, generalized linear mixed models were applied using the GLMM 343 package with gamma inverse family for continuous data (Knudson et al., 2021) with Wald Chi-344 345 squared tests. If the GLMM model failed to converge, a non-parametric Welch test was

performed using the mean value per aquarium. To compare MDA, enzyme activities, gene expression and juvenile survival between the two pH treatments, Student t-tests were used. A Wilcoxon test was applied to 9-day post-larvae survival because non-normality of data was observed. The morphological parameters of the larvae were evaluated using a Chi-squared (χ^2) homogeneity test. Differences were considered significant at *p* < 0.05. Data are presented as least square means of squares ± standard error of means unless otherwise indicated.

352 **3. Results**

353 **3.1.** Seawater parameters

Mean seawater carbonate chemistry parameters for the different periods (i.e. the reproductive period and the larval and juvenile period) of abalone exposure to the pH treatments are given in **Table 2.**

During the reproductive conditioning (January to June 2017), seawater temperature followed 357 natural variations and ranged from $12.6^{\circ}C \pm 0.7^{\circ}C$ at the start of the experimental period to 358 $19.2^{\circ}C \pm 0.2^{\circ}C$ at the end. Salinity was 34.6 ± 0.6 in all experimental aquaria and remained stable 359 over the experiment. Total alkalinity (AT) measured in the experimental tanks was $2355 \pm 9 \mu Eq$. 360 kg^{-1} and remained stable throughout the experiment and among all aquaria. The seawater pH_T 361 was maintained close to the nominal value throughout the experiment, with 8.01 \pm 0.05 (pCO₂ 362 $439 \pm 57 \mu$ atm) in the ambient pH aquaria and $7.71 \pm 0.06 (pCO_2 951 \pm 138 \mu$ atm) in the low pH 363 aquaria. In pH 8.0 and pH 7.7 conditions, $\Omega_{aragonite}$ was 2.30 ± 0.31 and 1.25 ± 0.19 and $\Omega_{calcite}$ 364 was 3.59 ± 0.46 and 1.95 ± 0.28 , respectively (**Table 2**). 365

³⁶⁶ During the larval and juvenile period (July to December 2017), the seawater temperature ³⁶⁷ ranged from $19.2^{\circ}C \pm 0.2^{\circ}C$ at the start to $10.5^{\circ}C \pm 0.05^{\circ}C$ at the end of the experiment. Salinity ³⁶⁸ over the larval/juvenile period was 35.2 ± 0.2 in all experimental aquaria and remained stable ³⁶⁹ throughout the experiment. Total alkalinity (AT) was $2323 \pm 19 \mu$ Eq. kg⁻¹ and remained stable ³⁷⁰ throughout the experiment and among all aquaria. The mean pH_T was 8.10 ± 0.06 (pCO₂: $351 \pm$

- 371 54 μ atm) in ambient pH aquaria and 7.71 \pm 0.03 (pCO₂: 951 \pm 138 μ atm) in low pH aquaria. In
- 372 pH 8.0 and pH 7.7, $\Omega_{aragonite}$ was 2.78 ± 0.41 and 1.26 ± 0.13 and $\Omega_{calcite}$ was 4.32 ± 0.63 and 1.97
- ± 0.19 conditions, respectively (**Table 2**).

Table 2. Seawater pH_T temperature and parameters of the carbonate system in each pH treatment (i.e., pH 8.0. and pH 7.7, n = 25 per pH treatment). Seawater pH on the total scale (pH_T), temperature, salinity and total alkalinity (AT) were used to calculate CO₂ partial pressure (pCO₂; µatm), dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC; µmol/kg), HCO₃⁻ (µmol/kg), CO₃²⁻ (µmol/kg), aragonite saturation state ($\Omega_{aragonite}$) and calcite saturation state ($\Omega_{calcite}$) by using the CO₂SYS program. Values are means ± s.d.

Experimental period	Nominal pH	рН _т	Temperature (°C)	AT (μmol·kg ⁻¹)	pCO₂ (µatm)	DIC (μmol·kg ⁻¹)	HCO₃⁻ (µmol·kg⁻¹)	CO₃² - (µmol·kg⁻¹)	$\Omega_{aragonite}$	$\Omega_{calcite}$
Reproductive period ¹	8.0	8.01 ± 0.05	14.4 ± 1.4	2355 ± 9	439 ± 57	2150 ± 28	1984 ± 48	151 ± 20	2.30 ± 0.31	3.59 ± 0.46
(5 months)	7.7	7.71 ± 0.06	14.4 ± 1.5	2355 ± 9	951 ± 138	2277 ± 25	2154 ± 30	82 ± 12	1.25 ± 0.19	1.95 ± 0.28
Larval and juvenile	8.0	8.10 ± 0.06	15.4 ± 2.2	2323 ± 19	351 ± 54	2069 ± 41	1875 ± 64	181 ± 26	2.78 ± 0.41	4.32 ± 0.63
period² (5.5 months)	7.7	7.71 ± 0.03	15.3 ± 2.1	2323 ± 19	966 ± 69	2237 ± 15	2119 ± 20	83 ± 8	1.26 ± 0.13	1.97 ± 0.19

¹Data from Avignon *et al.* 2020; ²5 time points per month (n = 25 per treatment)

374 **3.2.** Gametes and fertilisation

The number of gametes released (oocytes and spermatozoa) per gram of abalone was not different between individuals exposed to pH 8.0 and pH 7.7 (**Table 3**). No significant differences in spermatozoon characteristics (i.e. SSC, FSC, percentage of motile spermatozoa and velocity) were observed between abalone exposed to pH 8.0 and pH 7.7 (p > 0.05, **Table 3**). In addition, fertilisation success was not significantly different between low and ambient pH (p > 0.05, **Table 3**).

381

382 3.3. Larval survival

Survival did not differ between larvae exposed to pH 8.0 and 7.7 at 48 hpf or 96 hpf (survival at 48 h for pH 8.0 vs pH 7.7: $9.3 \pm 1.69\%$ vs $12.7 \pm 2.32\%$, t = 1.165, df = 8, p = 0.2778; survival

385 at 96 h for pH 8.0 vs pH 7.7: 78.8 \pm 17.83% vs 56.2 \pm 11.74%, t = -1.057, df = 8, p = 0.321,

386 Student t-test, mean \pm s.e.).

387

Table 3. Number of gametes released, spermatozoon characteristics and percentage of fertilisation of abalone *H. tuberculata* after 5 months of low (7.7) or ambient (8.0) pH exposure. ^{α} Linear mixed model analysis with the Satterthwaite method otherwise stated. ^{β}GLMM analysis fit by maximum likelihood (Laplace approximation) with gamma inverse family and Wald Chi-squared test with no over-dispersion. Least square mean \pm s.e.m. presented.

	pH 8.0	рН 7.7	F	p-value		
Number of gametes released						
Number of oocytes released/g α	4187 ± 623	3708 ± 625	$F_{1, 10.7} = 0.295$	0.598		
Millions of spermatozoa released/g $^{\alpha}$	885 ± 164.7	857 ± 163.4	F _{1, 9.0} = 0.015	0.906		
Spermatozoa shape and motility						
SSC (complexity) $^{\alpha}$	326 ± 10.3	315 ± 10.0	$F_{1,9.0} = 0.628$	0.449		
FSC (volume) $^{\alpha}$	180 ± 2.9	179 ± 2.9	$F_{1, 8.9} = 0.045$	0.836		
Percentage of motile spermatozoa (%) $^{\alpha}$	64.0 ± 0.03	56.9 ± 0.03	$F_{1,26} = 2.241$	0.146		
Velocity (μ m/s) $^{\alpha}$	75.6 ± 1.44	74.0 ± 1.44	$F_{1,26} = 0.626$	0.436		
Gamete fertilisation success						
Fertilisation percentage $(\%)^{\beta}$	53.1 ± 5.55	62.9 ± 6.26	$\chi^2 = 0.814, df = 1$	0.361		

388 3.4. Larval morphology

At 20 hpf, larvae exposed to pH 7.7 showed less alteration of tissue organogenesis than those exposed to pH 8.0 (25% for pH 7.7 vs 43% for pH 8.0, $\chi^2 = 15.2$, p < 0.001, Pearson Chi-squared test). On the contrary, 20 hpf-larvae showed a significant increase in shell abnormalities at pH 7.7 compared with larvae reared in ambient conditions (69% for pH 7.7 vs 59% for pH 8.0, $\chi^2 =$ 4.31, p = 0.038, Pearson Chi-squared test, **Fig. 2A**).

394 At 48 hpf, larvae exposed to pH 7.7 showed more tissue abnormalities than larvae exposed to

395 pH 8.0 (75% for pH 7.7 vs 64% for pH 8.0, $\chi^2 = 6.27$, p = 0.012, Pearson Chi-squared test). In

addition, larvae exposed to pH 7.7 showed a significant increase in shell abnormalities compared

- 397 with those reared in ambient pH conditions (97% for pH 7.7 vs 83% for pH 8.0, $\chi^2 = 20.7$, $p < 10^{-10}$
- 398 0.001, Pearson's Chi-squared test, **Fig. 2B**).
- 399 At 96 hpf, larvae exposed to pH 7.7 had more tissue abnormalities than those exposed to pH
- 400 8.0 (8.5% for pH 7.7 vs 3% for pH 8.0, $\chi^2 = 5.58$, p = 0.018, Pearson Chi-squared test). Shell
- 401 formation was also affected by lower pH, with a significant increase in shell alterations at pH 7.7
- 402 compared with larvae reared in ambient pH conditions (97% for pH 7.7 vs 85% for pH 8.0, $\chi^2 =$
- 403 16.56, *p* < 0.001, Pearson Chi-squared test, **Fig. 2C**).

A. 20 hpf larvae







B. 48 hpf larvae

Larval body

contracted

SHELL

SOFT TISSUES Tissues normally developed (velum, foot, operculum) and full larval body





100%



*

*** Shell surrounding the entire larval 100% Normal body $\chi^{\text{2}}=20.7$ 80% *p* < 0.001 60% 40% Shell residual Altered or absent 20% (severely or mildly) 0% pH 8 pH 7.7

C. 96 hpf larvae



Fig. 2. Percentage of larvae (%) presenting either normal (white squares) or altered phenotypes (black squares) based on the degree of soft tissue morphogenesis and shell formation after exposure to two pH conditions (8.0 and 7.7). (A) 20 hpf, (B) 48 hpf and (C) 96 hpf (n = 200 larvae per pH treatment, Chi-squared test). Arrowheads in the pictures indicate body or shell abnormalities. Scale bar: $50 \,\mu\text{m}$.

404 3.5. Larval length

- 405 No differences were observed in larval length at 20 hpf or shell length at 48 hpf between larvae
- 406 exposed to pH 8.0 and pH 7.7 (20 hpf: $\chi^2 = 0.197$, df = 1, p = 0.657; 48 hpf: $\chi^2 = 0.250$, df = 1,
- 407 p = 0.617, GLMM analysis with gamma inverse family). However, larvae exposed to pH 7.7 had
- 408 a smaller shell length at 96 hpf than larvae exposed to pH 8.0 ($\chi^2 = 10.13$, df = 1, p = 0.001,
- 409 GLMM analysis with gamma inverse family) (**Fig. 3**).
- 410



Fig. 3. Length of *H. tuberculata* larvae reared under ambient (pH 8.0) and low pH (7.7) at (A) 20 hpf, (B) 48 hpf and (C) 96 hpf (n = 200 larvae per pH treatment, n = 5 tanks per treatment). Larvae were exposed to the same pH as their parents. Ls mean \pm s.e.m. * p < 0.05 (GLMM analysis with gamma inverse family).

411 3.6. Birefringence analysis

Α

The mean birefringence (corresponding to shell calcification level) of the larval shell at 48 h did not differ significantly between individuals from the two pH treatments ($F_{1, 10} = 3.28$, p =0.099, LMM analysis, **Fig. 4A**). However, shell birefringence at 96 hpf was significantly lower in the pH 7.7 treatment than in control larvae in ambient conditions at pH 8.0 ($F_{1, 10} = 7.46$, p =0.021, LMM analysis, **Fig. 4B**).

B

417



Fig. 4. Mean shell birefringence (number of greyscale pixels) of *H. tuberculata* larvae reared under ambient (pH 8.0) and low pH (7.7) at (A) 48 hpf and (B) 96 hpf. Larvae were exposed to the same pH as their parents. Ls mean \pm s.e.m. * p < 0.05 (LMM analysis).

418 3.7. Oxidative stress

419	No difference in catalase activity was observed between 96hpf-larvae exposed to pH 8.0 and
420	pH 7.7 (2.25 \pm 0.428 vs 2.09 \pm 0.408 mU/mg prot, respectively, t = -2.26, df = 8, p = 0.800,
421	Student t-test, mean \pm s.e.), MDA (1.14 \pm 0.181 vs 1.28 \pm 0.152 nmol/mg prot, respectively, t =
422	-0.549, df = 8, p = 0.598, Student's t-test, mean ± s.e.) or SOD activity (5.78 ± 1.370 vs 6.48 ±
423	0.139 U/mg prot, respectively, t = 0.370, df = 5, $p = 0.727$, Student t-test, mean \pm s.e.). Due to
424	the small number of larvae contained in the samples, SOD could not be analysed for two samples
425	from pH 7.7 and one sample from pH 8.0.

426

427 3.8. Gene expression

428 At 48 hpf, larvae exposed to pH 7.7 tended to have higher GABAAR-like gene expression 429 than larvae exposed to pH 8.0 (t = -2.29, df = 8, p = 0.051, Student t-test). No difference was 430 observed for 5HTR or CA2 gene expression between larvae exposed to the two pH treatments (t 431 = -0.209, df = 8, p = 0.840 and t = -0.46111, df = 5, p = 0.6641, respectively, Student t-test; **Fig.** 432 **5A**).

At 96 hpf, larvae exposed to pH 7.7 showed a downregulation of GABAAR-like gene expression (t = 2.43, df = 7, p = 0.046, Student t-test) and tended to have lower 5HTR gene expression (t = -2.16, df = 7, p = 0.068, Student t-test) compared with larvae exposed to pH 8.0. No significant difference was observed in CA2 gene expression levels (t = -0.38, df = 7, p = 0.712, Student ttest, **Fig. 5B**). The expression levels quantified for CA1 and lustrin A genes were below the detection limit for both larval stages.



Fig. 5. Expression patterns of CA2, GABAAR-like and 5HTR genes of abalone larvae exposed to ambient (pH 8.0) and low pH (7.7). A: 48 hpf and B: 96 hpf. Larvae were exposed to the same pH as their parents. Mean \pm s.e. * p < 0.05, ° p < 0.10 (Student t-test).

3.9. Post-larval and juvenile evaluation

439 The main characteristics of abalone post-larvae at 9 days after settlement are shown in **Fig. 6**.

- 440 After metamorphosis, the post-larval shell shows a well-defined transition between protoconch
- 441 (pr) and newly deposited sculptured, juvenile shell (js).



Fig. 6. Microscopic image of post-larval abalone *H. tuberculata* **9 days after settlement**. The postlarval shell shows a well-defined transition between the protoconch (pr) and the newly deposited juvenile shell (js). Eyes (e) and mantle (m) are visible through the thin protoconch shell (pr). Scale-bar: 50 µm.

No significant difference in abalone survival was observed between the two pH treatments 9 days after settlement (W= 17, p = 0.42, Wilcoxon test, **Fig. 7A**). However, the survival of postlarvae two months after settlement was significantly lower for individuals grown at pH 7.7 compared with those grown at pH 8.0. (13% and 46%, respectively, t = -3.02, df = 8, p = 0.017, Student t-test; **Fig. 7B**).



Fig. 7. Survival of abalone post-larvae 9 days (A) and 2 months after settlement (B) in the two pH treatments (pH 8.0 and 7.7). Post-larvae were exposed to the same pH as their parents. Mean \pm s.e. * p < 0.05 (Student t-test).

- 447 At 2.5 months, juveniles exposed to pH 7.7 had a lower length ($F_{1, 9.9} = 5.89$, p = 0.036, LMM
- 448 analysis), tended to have a lower width ($F_{1, 9.6} = 4.34$, p = 0.065, LMM analysis) and were lighter
- in weight (F_{1, 5.2} = 6.94, p = 0.045, log transformation, LMM analysis) compared with juveniles
- 450 kept at ambient pH (**Fig. 8 A–C**). At 5.5 months, shell length ($F_{1,21} = 16.56$, p < 0.001, LMM
- 451 analysis), width ($F_{1,20} = 19,78, p < 0.001$, LMM analysis) and weight ($F_{1,3,9} = 21.33, p < 0.001$,

LMM analysis) were also significantly lower in juvenile abalones exposed to pH 7.7 than in those

```
453 exposed to ambient pH (Fig. 8 D–F).
```

```
454
```

2.5 months



Fig. 8. Shell length (A, D), width (B, E) and weight (C, F) of 2.5-month-old and 5.5-month-old abalones *H. tuberculata* in the two pH treatments (pH 8.0 and 7.7). Juveniles were exposed to the same pH as their parents. Ls mean \pm s.e.m. * p < 0.05; ° p < 0.10

455 **4. Discussion**

This study investigated for the first time the effect of ocean acidification on the European abalone *Haliotis tuberculata* by following transgenerational exposure to two relevant OA scenarios (ambient pH and -0.3 pH unit decrease). Although the gametes and the fertilisation rate appeared unaffected by the decreased pH, several biological parameters involved in larval and juvenile fitness (survival at settlement, growth and calcification) were reduced at pH 7.7, suggesting a high sensitivity of abalone offspring exposed to the same pH conditions as their parents.

In adult *H. tuberculata*, no significant differences in gamete quantity or quality were found 463 between the two pH treatments after five months of reproductive conditioning. In the same way, 464 the fertilisation rate was not affected by this pH difference, suggesting that fertilisation success 465 and resulting embryos are tolerant of OA. Such tolerance to pH stress in the early life stages has 466 already been reported for many other species, including abalones (Byrne et al., 2010, 2011; 467 Przeslawski et al., 2015). In early embryos of sea urchins, it has been suggested that the resilience 468 469 to acidification stress might be due to protective proteins accumulated in the egg during 470 embryonic development (Hamdoun and Epel, 2007). In H. tuberculata, the magnitude of OA (-0.3 pH units) is probably below the tolerance threshold of abalone embryo physiology. 471

472 Furthermore, our results reveal that the survival of abalone larvae was not affected by a 0.3 pH unit decrease, as previously shown in 30 hpf H. tuberculata (Wessel et al., 2018). A recent 473 multigenerational study on the red abalone H. rufescens demonstrated that larval mortality under 474 OA was strongly correlated with differences in the maternal provisioning of lipids with a positive 475 476 correlation between lipid concentration and survival under OA (Swezey et al., 2020). This relationship was maintained in experiments on second-generation animals. Our results agree with 477 478 previous studies showing that early embryonic and larval stages are less vulnerable to pH stress than later stages (Przesławski et al., 2015; Swezey et al., 2020). Indeed, later veliger stages (48 479 and 96 hpf) of *H. tuberculata* exhibited a higher sensitivity to lower pH (7.7) with an increase of 480

developmental abnormalities, a decrease in length and reduced calcification, as previously shown
in single-stage experiments on *H. tuberculata* larvae (Kavousi et al., 2021; Wessel et al., 2018).
Such effects of OA have been already reported in marine mollusc larvae, as differences in
sensitivity to pH stress according to stage of development (Gazeau et al., 2013; Przeslawski et
al., 2015).

Our results did not, however, reveal any induction of oxidative stress response in 96 hpf 486 veliger larvae exposed to the lowest pH, which overall showed no change in lipid peroxidation 487 or similar antioxidant enzyme activities compared to control larvae. Yet, it has previously been 488 demonstrated that ocean acidification and warming can cause significant alterations in cellular 489 parameters related to antioxidant responses in marine gastropods (Grilo et al., 2018; Zhang et al., 490 2021). Here, the lack of antioxidant response highlights the ability of abalone larvae to counteract 491 potential oxidative stress induced by OA, even though they showed developmental artefacts at 492 493 96 hpf. Nevertheless, few studies have considered oxidative stress parameters as key factors in assessing the susceptibility of mollusc larvae to near-future OA. There are only, to our 494 knowledge, two studies of this kind, which were done on clams (Gurr et al., 2021; Munari et al., 495 2016). 496

Although responses vary among marine organisms, the expression of genes involved in 497 calcification, ion regulation, metabolism and behaviour have been shown to be influenced by 498 decreased pH (Strader et al., 2020). To better understand the molecular processes involved in 499 500 larval responses to OA, the present study investigated the expression profiles of genes involved 501 in shell biomineralization (carbonic anhydrases CA1, CA2 and shell matrix lustrin A) on two larval stages (48 and 96 hpf). Only CA2 expression levels could be quantified in larval extracts 502 503 and these did not show any regulation by pH treatment at the two larval stages studied. These results are consistent with those previously reported in adult H. tuberculata, where CA 504 expression in the mantle did not vary across pH treatments (Avignon et al., 2020). In their study 505 506 on larval red abalone *Haliotis rufescens*, Zippay and Hofmann (2010) also found that decreased

507 pH did not affect the expression pattern of two shell formation genes in any abalone larval stages. 508 Although calcification gene expression showed no significant changes between pH treatments, 509 larval shells showed significant alterations or a delay in development in individuals reared at low 510 pH. These results support the hypothesis that the effects on shell formation may be mainly due 511 to a direct effect of low pH on shell dissolution, as previously shown in juvenile and adult stages 512 of *H. tuberculata* (Auzoux-Bordenave et al., 2020; Avignon et al., 2020).

As in vertebrates, GABA and serotonin signalling are major players in the nervous systems of 513 gastropod molluscs, where they are involved in the control of motor activity and cognitive 514 515 processes such as memory and learning (Aonuma et al. 2020; Miller, 2019;), but their specific 516 role during larval development has not been clarified in abalone. GABA A receptors have often been proposed as responsible for the disruption of sensory transduction at the central level 517 observed in fish exposed to OA (Nilsson et al., 2012). This hypothesis has only recently been 518 extended to invertebrate species (Thomas et al., 2020). GABA is a ligand-gated ion channel 519 permeable to chloride and bicarbonate ions and acts as a major inhibitory neurotransmitter in the 520 central nervous system. In acidified seawater, because of the alteration of chloride and 521 522 bicarbonate concentrations across the neuronal cells, GABA would act as stimulatory 523 neurotransmitter (Nilsson et al., 2012). In the present study, the expression profile of two genes 524 involved in neurotransmission and behaviour (GABA A receptor-like and serotonin receptors) were also analysed in abalone larvae exposed to OA conditions. Interestingly, the results showed 525 526 that GABA A receptor-like was upregulated in 48 hpf larvae under lower pH but was downregulated in 96 hpf larvae in the same conditions. This could indicate that the genetic 527 response of abalone to OA changes with ontogenetic stage. In several gastropod species, GABA 528 signalling is involved in the induction of settlement and metamorphosis (Hatakeyama and Ito, 529 2000; Hernádi, 1994; Jing et al., 2003; Lerusalimsky and Balaban, 2001). In our experimental 530 531 conditions (temperature 15–16°C), the settlement of *H. tuberculata* larvae occurred around 96 hpf, which is consistent with the opposite regulation shown for GABA A receptor-like at 48 and 532

533 96 hpf. Interestingly, the expression pattern of the serotonin receptor gene in abalone larvae 534 broadly follows the one described for the GABA A receptor-like gene, at least at 96 hpf. This is 535 in line with the observation that certain invertebrates possess a serotonin-gated chloride channel 536 that may respond to an increase of pCO_2 in the same way as the GABA A receptor (Thomas et 537 al., 2020).

Our results also showed that pH decrease did not have any impact on post-larval settlement 9 538 days after fertilisation. These results are consistent with previous findings in H. tuberculata 539 (Kavousi et al., 2021) and H. kamtschatkana (Crim et al., 2011), but contrast with two other 540 541 studies, in the New Zealand abalone H. iris and the donkey's ear abalone, H. asinina, both of which showing a lower settlement rate of larval abalone under low pH conditions (Espinel-542 Velasco et al., 2021; Tahil and Dy, 2016). These contrasting effects among *Haliotis* species may 543 be due either to differences in larval sensitivity or to other indirect effects of decreased pH on the 544 settlement substrate, as previously shown in abalone larvae (O'Leary et al., 2017). 545

Juveniles maintained at pH 7.7 showed an increase of mortality at 2.5 months and significant 546 reductions in total length, width and weight at 5.5 months. These results are consistent with those 547 previously obtained on farmed abalone species including H. tuberculata (Auzoux-Bordenave et 548 al., 2020; Cunningham et al., 2016; Li et al., 2018). In juvenile H. iris, Cunningham et al. (2016) 549 550 reported significant effects on shell length and wet weight at lower pH_T (0.3 to 0.5 units below ambient pH). Similarly, shell growth and shell weight were significantly decreased in juvenile 551 H. discus hannai (Li et al., 2018) after 3 months of exposure to lower seawater pH (0.2 units 552 below ambient pH). In six-month-old H. tuberculata, our previous studies revealed significant 553 reductions in juvenile shell length, weight and strength in a pH 7.6 treatment (0.5 units below 554 ambient pH) after three months of exposure (Auzoux-Bordenave et al., 2020). Furthermore, the 555 decrease in shell strength and changes in texture and porosity of the biomineral layers suggested 556 that low pH induced both general effects on growth mechanisms and corrosion of the carbonated 557 shell in *H. tuberculata*. 558

559 Transgenerational experiments, in which parents are exposed to low pH conditions during reproductive conditioning, are currently performed to measure how this parental exposure may 560 influence the responses of the offspring (Parker et al., 2015). For most of the species studied to 561 562 date, especially bivalves, transgenerational exposure to OA resulted in positive carry-over effects being transmitted from adults to their offspring, influencing the resilience of molluscs to OA 563 (Fitzer et al., 2014; Parker et al., 2015; Ross et al., 2016; Swezey et al., 2020). In the oyster S. 564 glomerata, the exposure of adults to reduced pH (0.3 unit below ambient pH) during reproductive 565 conditioning resulted in positive carry-over effects on larvae, including faster development and 566 increased growth, compared with larvae spawned from adults reared at ambient pH (Parker et al., 567 2012). When the transgenerational exposure was repeated on the next generation (F2), an 568 increase in the resilience of the larval and juvenile offspring was observed (Parker et al., 2015). 569 570 These experiments demonstrate that marine molluscs may have the ability to acclimate or adapt to future acidification of seawater through transgenerational pathways. 571

In the present study, the adverse effects of seawater acidification on larval and juvenile F1 572 abalone are in the range of those already observed in previous single-stage experiments (Auzoux-573 574 Bordenave et al., 2020; Kavousi et al., 2021; Wessel et al., 2018). The absence of significant carry-over effects on the offspring following parental exposure to OA suggests that larval 575 dispersion of *H. tuberculata* in the natural environment may be at greater risk under pH stress, 576 with potential negative consequences for abalone populations. However, considering the short 577 duration of the abalone larval stage (5 days) and the huge morphological and physiological 578 changes that occur concomitantly, it cannot be excluded that some transgenerational mechanisms 579 580 may mitigate the adverse effects of OA on abalone larvae by acting on other biological variables or developmental processes that were not investigated in the present study. 581

582

583

584 In conclusion, this study demonstrated that OA may have detrimental consequences for abalone populations in natural and aquaculture environments. Because abalone is a slow-growing 585 gastropod with a long transgenerational period, the possibility for this species to adapt to OA is 586 587 probably lower than that of fast-growing molluscs with rapid life cycles. Consequently, wild 588 abalone populations that are already weakened by anthropogenic pressure (e.g. pollution, overfishing and diseases), will probably be the most at risk over the next decades. In abalone 589 aquaculture, various strategies could be developed to mitigate the effects of OA and help farmers 590 to overcome the challenges posed by climate change. For example, the introduction of macroalgal 591 culture into abalone farming (through IMTA system, Bolton et al., 2009) might be helpful to 592 increase pCO₂ in seawater intake and control the pH in nursery tanks, enabling an upstream 593 protection of the most vulnerable stages. In parallel, the identification of heritable traits involved 594 in resilience to OA, and the subsequent selection of tolerant broodstock may be exploited in the 595 future to ensure the sustainable development of abalone aquaculture. 596

597

598 Acknowledgements

This work was partially supported by the program Acidification des Océans (ICOBio project) 599 funded by the Fondation pour la Recherche sur la Biodiversité (FRB) and the Ministère de la 600 601 Transition Ecologique et Solidaire (MTES), the French LabexMER program (OASYS project) and the ATM program IMADO of the MNHN funded by the Ministère délégué à l'Enseignement 602 603 Supérieur et à la Recherche (Paris, France). We are grateful to all the staff of the France Haliotis farm (Plouguerneau) for hosting the experiment, to Manon Coheleach (University of Western 604 Brittany, Brest) and Thomas Bisch (AgroParisTech, Paris) for their help during abalone rearing 605 and measurements, and to Claudie Quéré (IFREMER, University of Western Brittany CNRS, 606 607 IRD, LEMAR) for biochemical analyses. Finally, we thank the Translation Bureau of the 608 University of Western Brittany for improving the English of this manuscript.

609

610	Author	contrib	utions

- 611 Stéphanie Auzoux-Bordenave, Sophie Martin, Sabine Roussel, Sylvain Huchette:
- 612 Conceptualization, Methodology, Validation;
- 613 Sabine Roussel, Sylvain Huchette: Investigation, Abalone breeding;
- 614 Stéphanie Auzoux-Bordenave, Apolline Ledoux, Sophie Martin, Aïcha Badou: Carbonate

615 chemistry analysis, Abalone sampling, Biological measurements;

- 616 Apolline Ledoux, Carole Di Poi : Oxidative stress measurements;
- 617 Carole Di Poi, Nelly Le Goïc, Marc Suquet : Gamete analysis;
- 618 Arianna Servili and Fanny Gaillard: mRNA extraction and gene expression
- 619 Stéphanie Auzoux-Bordenave, Sabine Roussel: Formal analysis, Visualization, Supervision,
- 620 Funding, Writing-Original Draft, Reviewing and Editing

621

622 **Declaration of competing interest.** The authors have no conflicts of interest to declare.

623

624 **References**

- Aalto, E.A., Barry, J.P., Boch, C.A., Litvin, S.Y., Micheli, F., Woodson, C.B., De Leo, G.A.,
 2020. Abalone populations are most sensitive to environmental stress effects on adult
 individuals. Marine Ecology Progress Series, 643:75-85. https://doi.org/10.3354/meps13320
 Aonuma, H., Mezheritskiy, M., Boldyshev, B., Totani, Y., Vorontsov, D., Zakharov, I., Etsuro,
 I., Dyakonova, V., 2020. The Role of Serotonin in the Influence of Intense Locomotion on
- 630 the Behavior Under Uncertainty in the Mollusc *Lymnaea stagnalis*. Frontiers in Physiology,
- 631 11:221. doi:10.3389/fphys.2020.00221
- 632 Auzoux-Bordenave, S., Badou, A., Gaume, B., Berland, S., Helléouet, M.-N., Milet, C.,
- Huchette, S., 2010. Ultrastructure, chemistry and mineralogy of the growing shell of the

- European abalone *Haliotis tuberculata*. Journal of Structural Biology, 171: 277-290.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jsb.2010.05.012
- Auzoux-Bordenave, S., Wessel, N., Badou, A., Martin, S., M'Zoudi, S., Avignon, S., Roussel,
 S., Huchette, S., Dubois, P., 2020. Ocean acidification impacts growth and shell
 mineralization in juvenile abalone (*Haliotis tuberculata*). Marine Biology, 167:11.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s00227-019-3623-0
- 640 Avignon, S., Auzoux-Bordenave, S., Martin, S., Dubois, P., Badou, A., Coheleach, M., Richard,
- N., Di Giglio, S., Malet, L., Servili, A., 2020. An integrated investigation of the effects of
- 642 ocean acidification on adult abalone (*Haliotis tuberculata*). ICES Journal of Marine Science,
- 643 77: 757-772. https://doi.org/10.1093/icesjms/fsz257
- Beniash, E., Ivanina, A., Lieb, NS., Kurochkin, I., Sokolova, I.M., 2010. Elevated level of carbon
 dioxide affects metabolism and shell formation in oysters *Crassostrea virginica*. Marine
 Ecology Progress Series, 419: 95–108. doi: 10.3354/meps08841.
- 647 Bilbao, A., Tuset, V., Viera, M., Courtois de Viçose, G., Fernandez-Palacios, H., Haroun, R.,
- 648 Izquierdo, M., 2010. Reproduction, fecundity, and growth of abalone (*Haliotis tuberculata*
- *coccinea*, Reeve 1846), in the Canary Islands. Journal of Shellfish Research, 29 : 959-967.
 doi:10.2983/035.029.0430.
- 651 Bolton, J.J., Robertson-Andersson, D.V., Shuuluka, D., Kandjengo, L., 2009. Growing Ulva
- 652 (Chlorophyta) in integrated systems as a commercial crop for abalone feed in South Africa:
- a SWOT analysis. Journal of Applied Phycology, 21: 575–583. doi:10.1007/s10811-008-
- 654 9385-6
- Boulais, M., Soudant, P., Le Goïc, N., Quéré, C., Boudry, P., Suquet, M., 2015. Involvement of
- 656 mitochondrial activity and OXPHOS in ATP synthesis during the motility phase of
- 657 spermatozoa in the pacific oyster, *Crassostrea gigas*. Biology of Reproduction, 93: 1–7. doi:
- 658 10.1095/biolreprod.115.128538
- Boulais, M., Suquet, M., Arsenault-Pernet, E. J., Malo, F., Queau, I., Pignet, P., Ratiskol, D., Le
- 660 Grand, J., Huber, M., Cosson, J., 2018. pH controls spermatozoa motility in the Pacific

- oyster (*Crassostrea gigas*). Biology Open, 7: bio031427. Company of Biologists Ltd.
 doi:10.1242/bio.031427
- Byrne, M., Soars, N.A., Ho, M.A., Wong, E., McElroy, D., Selvakumaraswamy, P., Dworjanyn,
- 664 S. A., Davis, A.R., 2010. Fertilisation in a suite of coastal marine invertebrates from SE
- Australia is robust to near-future ocean warming and acidification. Marine Biology, 157 :
- 666 2061–2069. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s00227-010-1474-9.</u>
- Byrne, M., Ho, M., Wong, E., Soars, N.A., Selvakumaraswamy, P., Shepard-Brennand, H.,
 Dworjanyn, S.A., Davis, A.R., 2011. Unshelled abalone and corrupted urchins: development
- of marine calcifiers in a changing ocean. Proceedings of the Royal Society B, Biological
- 670 Sciences, 278, 2376-2383. doi: 10.1098/rspb.2010.2404.
- Fitzer, S., 2019. environmental acidification 671 Byrne, M., The impact of on 672 the microstructure and mechanical integrity of marine invertebrate Conservation Physiology. ://doi.org/10.1093/ 673 skeletons. https ys/coz062 conph 674
- Cook, P.A., 2016. Recent trends in worldwide abalone production. Journal of Shellfish Research,
 35: 581–583. https://doi.org/10.2983/035.035.0302
- Courtois de Viçose, G., Viera, M. P., Bilbao, A., Izquierdo, M. S., 2007. Embryonic and larval
 development of *Haliotis tuberculata coccinea* Reeve: an indexed micro-photographic
 sequence. Journal of Shellfish Research, 26: 847-854. https://doi.org/10.2983/07308000(2007)26[847:EALDOH]2.0.CO;2
- Courtois de Viçose G., Viera, M.P., Huchette, S., Izquierdo, M.S., 2012. Larval settlement, early
 growth and survival of *Haliotis tuberculata coccinea* using several algal cues. Journal of
 Shellfish Research, 31: 1189-1198. doi: 10.2983/035.031.0430.
- 684 Crim, R.N., Sunday, J.M., Harley, C.D.G., 2011. Elevated seawater CO₂ concentrations impair
 685 larval development and reduce larval survival in endangered northern abalone (*Haliotis*)
- *kamtschatkana*). Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology, 400 :272-277. doi:
- 687 10.1016/j.jembe.2011.02.002.

- 688 Cunningham, S.C., Smith, A.M., Lamare, M.D., 2016. The effects of elevated pCO₂ on growth,
- shell production and metabolism of cultured juvenile abalone, *Haliotis iris*. Aquaculture
 Research, 47:2375–2392. doi: 10.1111/are.12684.
- 691 Curd, A., Pernet, F., Corporeau, C., Delisle L., Firth, L. B., Nunes, F.L.D., Dubois, S.F., 2019.
- 692 Connecting organic to mineral: How the physiological state of an ecosystem-engineer is
- 693 linked to its habitat structure, Ecological Indicators, 98: 49-60.
 694 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2018.10.044.
- Daume, S., Huchette, S., Ryan, S., Day, R.W., 2004. Nursery culture of *Haliotis rubra*: the effect
- of cultured algae and larval density on settlement and juvenile production. Aquaculture, 236:
- 697 221-239. doi: 10.1016/j.aquaculture.2003.09.035.
- Dickson, A.G., Millero, F.J., 1987. A comparison of the equilibrium constants for the
 dissociation of carbonic acid in seawater media. Deep Sea Research Part A. Oceanographic
 Research Papers 34, 1733-1743. doi: 10.1016/0198-0149(87)90021-5.
- Dickson, A.G., Sabine, C.L., Christian, J.R. (Eds), 2007. Guide to Best Practices for Ocean CO₂
 measurements. PICES Special Publication 3. 191pp. doi: 10.25607/OBP-1342
- Doney, S.C., Fabry, V.J., Feely, R.A., Kleypas, J.A., 2009. Ocean acidification: The other CO₂
 problem. Annual Review of Marine Science 1, 169-192.
 doi:10.1146/annurev.marine.010908.163834.
- Duquette, A., McClintock, J.B., Amsler, C.D., Pérez-Huerta, A., Milazzo, M., Hall-Spencer, 706 J.M., 2017. Effects of ocean acidification on the shells of four Mediterranean gastropod 707 708 species Marine Pollution Bulletin, 124 917-928. near a CO_2 seep. • https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2017.08.007. 709
- 710 Ekstrom, J.A., Suatoni, L., Cooley, S.R., Pendleton, LH., Waldbusser, G.G., Cinner, J.E., Ritter,
- J. Langdon, C., van Hooidonk, R., Gledhill, D., Wellman, K., Beck, M., Brander, L., Rittschof,
 D., Doherty, C., Edwards, P., Portela, R., 2015. Vulnerability and adaptation of US
 shellfisheries to ocean acidification. Nature Climate Change, 5:207–214. doi:
 10.1038/nclimate2508.

- 715 Ellis, R.P., Bersey, J., Rundle, S.D., Hall-Spencer, J.M., Spicer, J.I., 2009. Subtle but significant
- effects of CO₂ acidified seawater on embryos of the intertidal snail, *Littorina obtusata*.
 Aquatic Biology, 5:41–48. doi: 10.3354/ab00118.
- Espinel-Velasco, N., Lamare, M., Kluibenschedl, A., Moss, G., Cummings, V., 2021. Ocean
- acidification induces carry-over effects on the larval settlement of the New Zealand abalone,
- *Haliotis iris.* ICES Journal of Marine Science, 78 (1), 340-348. doi:10.1093/icesjms/fsaa086.
- Fitzer, S.C., Phoenix, V.R., Cusack, M., Kamenos, N.A., 2014. Ocean acidification impacts
 mussel control on biomineralisation. Science Report, 4: 6218. doi: 10.1038/srep06218.

723 Gattuso, J.-P., Magnan, A., Billé, R., Cheung, W.W., Howes, E.L., Joos, F., Allemand, D., Bopp,

L., Cooley, S.R., Eakin, C.M., Hoegh-Guldberg, O., 2015. Contrasting futures for ocean and

- society from different anthropogenic CO₂ emissions scenarios. Science, 349, aac4722. doi:
 10.1126/science.aac4722.
- Gaume, B., Denis, F., Van Wormhoudt, A., Huchette, S., Jackson, D. J., Avignon, S., AuzouxBordenave, S., 2014. Characterisation and expression of the biomineralising gene Lustrin A
 during shell formation of the European abalone *Haliotis tuberculata*. Comparative
 Biochemistry and Physiology Part B: Biochemistry and Molecular Biology, 169: 1–8.
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.cbpb.2013.11.010
- Gazeau, F., Gattuso, J-P., Dawber, C., Pronker, A.E., Peene, F., Peene, J., Heip C.H.R,
 Middelburg, J.J., 2010. Effect of ocean acidification on the early life stages of the blue
 mussel *Mytilus edulis*. Biogeosciences, 7: 2051–2060. doi: 10.5194/bg-7-2051-2010
- 735 Gazeau, F., Parker, L.M., Comeau, S., Gattuso, J-P., O'Connor, W.A., Martin, S., Pörtner, H-O.,
- Ross, P.M., 2013. Impacts of ocean acidification on marine shelled molluscs. Marine
 Biology, 160: 2207–2245. doi: 10.1007/s00227-013-2219-3.
- Gran, G., 1952. Determination of the equivalence point in potentiometric titrations. Part II.
 Analyst, 77: 661–671.

- 740 Grilo, T.F., Lopes, A.R., Sampaio, E., Rosa, R., Cardoso, P.G., 2018. Sex differences in oxidative
- stress responses of tropical topshells (*Trochus histrio*) to increased temperature and high
 pCO₂. Marine Pollution Bulletin, 131, A: 252-259, doi:10.1016/j.marpolbul.2018.04.031.
- Guo, X., Huang, M., Pu, F., You, W., Ke, C., 2015. Effects of ocean acidification caused by
- rising CO₂ on the early development of three molluscs. Aquatic Biology, 23: 147-157. doi:
 10.3354/ab00615.
- Gurr, SJ., Trigg, S.A., Vadopalas, B., Roberts, S.B., Putnam, H.M., 2021. Repeat exposure to
 hypercapnic seawater modifies growth and oxidative status in a tolerant burrowing clam.
 Journal of Experimental Biology, 224(13): jeb233932. doi: 10.1242/jeb.233932.
- Hamdoun, A., Epel, D., 2007. Embryo stability and vulnerability in an always changing world.
- Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA, 104: 1745-1750. doi:
 10.1073/pnas.0610108104.
- Haraldsson, C., Anderson, L. G., Hassellöv, M., Hulth, S., Olsson, K., 1997. Rapid, highprecision potentiometric titration of alkalinity in ocean and sediment pore waters. Deep Sea
 Research, Part I, Oceanography Research Paper, 44: 2031-2044. doi: 10.1016/S09670637(97)00088-5.
- Harney, E.D., Dubief, B., Boudry, P., Basuyaux, O., Schilhabel, M.B., Huchette, S.,
 Paillard, C., Nunes, F.L.D., 2016. De novo assembly and annotation of the
 European abalone *Haliotis tuberculata* transcriptome. Marine Genomics, 28: 11–16.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.margen.2016.03.002.
- 760 Hatakeyama, D., Ito, E., 2000. Distribution and developmental changes in GABA-like
- immunoreactive neurons in the central nervous system of pond snail, *Lymnaea stagnalis*.
- Journal of Comparative Neurology, 418(3): 310-322. <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/(SICI)1096-</u>
- 763 <u>9861(20000313)418:3<310::AID-CNE6>3.0.CO;2-A</u>
- Hendriks, I. E., Duarte, C. M., Álvarez, M., 2010. Vulnerability of marine biodiversity to ocean
 acidification: A meta-analysis. Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science, 86: 157–164.
- 766 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecss.2009.11.022

- Hernádi, L., 1994. Distribution and anatomy of GABA-like immunoreactive neurons in the
 central and peripheral nervous system of the snail *Helix pomatia*. Cell and Tissue Research,
 277(1): 189-198.
- Hofmann, G. E., Barry, J. P., Edmunds, P. J., Gates, R. D., Hutchins, D. A., Klinger, T., Sewell,
- 771 M. A., 2010. The effect of ocean acidification on calcifying organisms in marine ecosystems:
- An organism-to-ecosystem perspective. Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution and
- 773 Systematics, 41: 127–147. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.ecolsys.110308.120227
- Huchette, S., Soulard, J.P., Koh, C.S., Day, R., 2004. Maternal variability in the blacklip abalone,
- 775 *Haliotis rubra* leach (Mollusca: Gastropoda): effect of egg size on fertilisation success.
- 776 Aquaculture, 231: 181-195. doi: 10.1016/j.aquaculture.2003.08.027.
- Huchette, S., Clavier, J., 2004. Status of the ormer (*Haliotis tuberculata* L.) industry in Europe.
 Journal of Shellfish Research, 23: 951-956.
- 779 IPCC, 2014. Summary for Policymakers. In: Climate Change 2014: Impacts, Adaptation, and
- 780 Vulnerability. Part A: Global and Sectoral Aspects. Contribution of Working Group II to the
- 781 Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. Cambridge
- 782 University Press, Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA, 1132 pp.
- Jardillier, E., Rousseau, M., Gendron-Badou, A., Fröhlich, F., Smith, D.C., Martin, M.,
 Helléouet, M.-N., Huchette, S., Doumenc, D., Auzoux-Bordenave, S., 2008. A
 morphological and structural study of the larval shell from the abalone *Haliotis tuberculata*.
- 786 Marine Biology, 154 (4): 735-744. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00227-008-0966-3
- Jing, J., Vilim, F. S., Wu, J. S., Park, J. H., Weiss, K. R., 2003. Concerted GABAergic actions
- 788 of Aplysia feeding interneurons in motor program specification. Journal of Neuroscience,
- 789 23(12): 5283-5294. doi: <u>10.1523/JNEUROSCI.23-12-05283.2003</u>
- Kavousi, J., Roussel, S., Martin, S., Gaillard, F., Badou, A., Di Poi, C., Huchette, S. Dubois P.,
 Auzoux-Bordenave S., 2021. Combined effects of ocean warming and acidification on the
- 792larval stages of the European abalone Haliotis tuberculata. Marine Pollution Bulletin, 175:
- 793 11313. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2021.113131.</u>

- Kimura, R.Y.O., Takami, H., Ono, T., Onitsuka, T., Nojiri, Y., 2011. Effects of elevated pCO₂
- on the early development of the commercially important gastropod, Ezo abalone *Haliotis discus hannai*. Fisheries Oceanography, 20: 357-366. doi: 10.1111/j.13652419.2011.00589.x.
- Knudson, C., Benson, S., Geyer, C., Jones, G., 2021. Likelihood-based Inference for Generalized
 Linear Mixed Models: Inference with the R Package glmm." Stat, 10 (1). [e339].
 https://doi.org/10.1002/sta4.339.
- Kroeker, K.J., Kordas, R.L., Crim, R., Hendriks, I.E., Ramajo, L., Singh, G.S., Duarte, C.M.,
 Gattuso, J.-P., 2013. Impacts of ocean acidification on marine organisms: quantifying
 sensitivities and interaction with warming. Global Change Biology, 19: 1884-1896. doi:
 10.1111/gcb.12179.
- Kurihara H., 2008. Effects of CO₂-driven ocean acidification on the early developmental stages
 of invertebrates. Marine Ecology Progress Series, 373:275–284. doi: 10.3354/meps07802.
- Kuznetsova, A., Brockhoff, P. B., Christensen, R. H. B., 2017. LmerTest Package: Tests in
 Linear Mixed Effects Models. Journal of Statistical Software, 82(13): 1-26.
 doi:10.18637/jss.v082.i13.
- Le Roy, N., Marie, B., Gaume, B., Guichard, N., Delgado, S., Zanella-Cléon, I., Becchi, M.,
 Auzoux-Bordenave S., Sire J.-Y., Marin F., 2012. Identification of two carbonic anhydrases
 in the mantle of the European abalone *Haliotis tuberculata* (Gastropoda, Haliotidae):
 Phylogenetic implications. Journal of Experimental Zoology, Part B: Molecular and
 Developmental Evolution, 318: 353–367. doi: <u>10.1002/jez.b.22452.</u>
- Lerusalimsky, V. N., Balaban, P. M., 2001. Ontogenesis of the snail, *Helix aspersa*:
 embryogenesis timetable and ontogenesis of GABA-like immunoreactive neurons in the
 central nervous system. Journal of Neurocytology, 30(1):73-91.doi: 10.1023/a:1011921525359
- Li, J., Mao, Y., Jiang, Z., Zhang, J., Fang, J., Bian, D., 2018. The detrimental effects of CO₂-
- 819 driven chronic acidification on juvenile Pacific abalone (Haliotis discus hannai).
- 820 Hydrobiologia, 809: 297-308. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10750-017-3481-z.

- Lowry, O. H., Rosebrough, N. J., Farr, A. L., Randall, R. J., 1951. Protein measurement with the
 Folin phenol reagent. Journal of Biological Chemistry, 193(1):265-75.
- Mazurais, D., Servili, A., Le Bayon, N., Gislard, S., Madec, L., Zambonino-Infante, J. L., 2020.
- 824 Long-term exposure to near-future ocean acidification does not affect the expression of
- 825 neurogenesis- and synaptic transmission-related genes in the olfactory bulb of European sea
- bass (*Dicentrarchus labrax*). Journal of Comparative Physiology, Part B, 190(2): 161-167.
- 827 https://doi.org/10.1007/s00360-019-01256-2
- Mehrbach, C., Culberson, C.H., Hawley, J.E., Pytkowicx, R.M., 1973. Measurement of the
 apparent dissociation constants of carbonic acid in seawater at atmospheric pressure.
 Limnology and Oceanography, 18:897–907. doi: 10.4319/lo.1973.18.6.0897.
- Melzner, F., Gutowska, M.A., Langenbuch, M., Dupont, S., Lucassen, M., Thorndyke, M.C.,
 Bleich M., Pörtner, H-O., 2009. Physiological basis for high CO₂ tolerance in marine
 ectothermic animals: pre-adaptation through lifestyle and ontogeny? Biogeosciences
 6:2313–2331. https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-6-2313-2009
- Miller, M. W., 2019. GABA as a Neurotransmitter in Gastropod Molluscs. Biological Bulletin,
 236(2): 144-156. doi:10.1086/701377.
- Morash, A.J., Alter, K., 2015. Effects of environmental and farm stress on abalone physiology:
 perspectives for abalone aquaculture in the face of global climate change. Reviews in
 Aquaculture 7:1–27. https://doi.org/10.1111/raq.12097
- 840 Munari, M., Chemello, G., Finos, L., Ingrosso, G., Giani, M., Marin, M.G., 2016. Coping with
- seawater acidification and the emerging contaminant diclofenac at the larval stage: A tale from
 the clam *Ruditapes philippinarum*. Chemosphere, 160: 293-302,
 doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2016.06.095.
- Nicolas, J-L., Basuyaux, O., Mazurié, J., Thébault, A., 2002. *Vibrio carchariae*, a pathogen of
 the abalone *Haliotis tuberculata*. Diseases of Aquatic Organisms, 50:35–43. doi:
 10.3354/dao050035

- 847 Nilsson, G. E., Dixson, D. L., Domenici, P., McCormick, M. I., Sørensen, C., Watson, S-A.,
- Munday, P. L., 2012. Near-future carbon dioxide levels alter fish behaviour by interfering
 with neurotransmitter function. Nature Climate Change, 2(3): 201-204.
 doi:10.1038/nclimate1352.
- Noisette, F., Comtet, T., Legrand, E., Bordeyne, F., Davoult, D., Martin, S., 2014. Does
 encapsulation protect embryos from the effects of ocean acidification? The example of *Crepidula fornicata*. PLos ONE 9(3): e9321. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0093021.
- 854 O'Leary, J.K., Barry, J.P., Gabrielson, P.W., Rogers-Bennett, L., Potts, D.C., Palumbi, S.R.,
- Micheli, F., 2017. Calcifying algae maintain settlement cues to larval abalone following
 algal exposure to extreme ocean acidification. Science Report, 7: 1-10.
 https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-017-05502-x
- Onitsuka, T., Takami, H., Muraoka, D., Matsumoto, Y., Nakatsubo, A., Kimura, R., Ono, T.,
 Nojiri, Y., 2018. Effects of ocean acidification with pCO₂ diurnal fluctuations on survival
 and larval shell formation of Ezo abalone, *Haliotis discus hannai*. Marine Environmental
 Research, 134: 28-36. doi: 10.1016/j.marenvres.2017.12.015.
- 862 Orr, J.C., Fabry, V.J., Aumont, O., Bopp, L., Doney, S.C., Feely, R.A., Gnanadesikan, A.,
- Gruber, N., Ishida, A., Joos, F., Key, R.M, Lindsay, K., Maier-Reimer, E., Matear, R.,
- 864 Monfray, P., Mouchet, A., Najjar, R.G., Plattner, G.K, Rodgers, K.B., Sabine, C.L.,
- 865 Sarmiento, J.L., Schlitzer, R., Slater, R.D., Totterdell, I.J., Weirig, M.F., Yamanaka, Y.,
- 866 Yool, A., 2005. Anthropogenic ocean acidification over the twenty-first century and its
- impact on calcifying organisms. Nature, 437:681–686. doi: 10.1038/nature04095
- 868 Parker, L.M., Ross, P.M., O'Connor, W.A., Borysko, L., Raftos, D.A., Pörtner, H-O., 2012. Adult
- 869 exposure influences offspring response to ocean acidification in oysters. Global Change
 870 Biology 18: 82-92. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2011.02520.x
- 871 Parker, LM., O'Connor, WA., Raftos, DA., Pörtner, H-O., Ross, P.M., 2015. Persistence of
- 872 Positive Carryover Effects in the Oyster, *Saccostrea glomerata*, following Transgenerational

- 873 Exposure to Ocean Acidification. PLos ONE, 10 (7): e0132276.
- doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0132276
- Pereira, L., Lagos, J., Araya, F., 2007. Evaluation of three methods for transporting larvae of the
 red abalone *Haliotis rufescens* Swainson for use in remote settlement. Journal of Shellfish
- 877 Research, 26(3): 777-781. doi:10.2983/0730-8000(2007)26[777:eotmft]2.0.co;2.
- 878 Pierrot, D.E., Lewis, E., Wallace, D. W. R., 2006. MS Excel program developed for CO₂ system
- 879 calculations. ORNL/CDIAC-105a. Carbon Dioxide Information Analysis Center. Oak Ridge
- National Laroratory, US Department of Energy, Oak Ridge, Tennessee. doi:
 10.3334/CDIAC/otg.CO2SYS_XLS_CDIAC105a
- 882 Przesławski, R., Byrne, M., Mellin, C., 2015. A review and meta-analysis of the effects of
- multiple abiotic stressors on marine embryos and larvae. Global Change Biology, 21: 2122-
- 884 2140. https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.12833
- 885 Qui-Minet, Z.N., Delaunay, C., Grall, J., Six, C., Cariou, T., Bohner, O., Legrand, E., Davoult,
- D., Martin, S., 2018. The role of local environmental changes on maerl and its associated
- 887 non-calcareous epiphytic flora in the Bay of Brest. Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science,
- 888 208: 140-152. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecss.2018.04.032
- R Core Team, 2015. R Core Team: A language and environment for statistical computing.
 Vienna, Austria, version 3.6.2. https://www.R-project.org.
- 891 Ross, P.M., Parker, L.M., O'Connor, W.A., Bailey, EA., 2011. The impact of ocean acidification
- on reproduction, early development and settlement of marine organisms. Water 3: 1005–
 1030. doi: 10.3390/w3041005.
- 894 Ross, P. M., Parker, L.M., Byrne, M., 2016. Transgenerational responses of molluscs and
- 895 echinoderms to changing ocean conditions. ICES Journal of Marine Science, 73: 537–549.
 896 <u>https://doi.org/10.1093/icesjms/fsv254</u>
- 897 Strader, M.E., Wong, J.M., Hofmann, G.E., 2020. OA promotes broad transcriptomic responses
- in marine metazoans: a literature survey. Frontiers in Zoology, 17: 7. doi:10.1186/s12983-
- 899 020-0350-9.

- 900 Swezey, D.S., Boles, S.E., Aquilino, K.M., Stott, H.K., Bush, D., Whitehead, A., Rogers-
- Bennett, L., Hill, T.M., Sanford, E., 2020. Evolved differences in energy metabolism and
 growth dictate the impacts of ocean acidification on abalone aquaculture. Proceedings of the
- 903 National Academy of Sciences, USA, 117: 26513-26519. doi: <u>10.1073/pnas.2006910117</u>
- Tahil, A.S., Dy, D.T., 2016. Effects of reduced pH on the early larval development of hatchery-
- 905 reared Donkey's ear abalone, *Haliotis asinina* (Linnaeus 1758). Aquaculture, 459: 137-142.
- 906 doi: 10.1016/j.aquaculture.2016.03.027.
- Thomas, J. T., Munday, P. L., Watson, S.-A., 2020. Toward a Mechanistic Understanding of
 Marine Invertebrate Behavior at Elevated CO₂. Frontiers in Marine Science 7: 345. doi:
 10.3389/fmars.2020.00345.
- 910 Travers, M.-A., Basuyaux, O., Le Goïc, N., Huchette, S., Nicolas, J.-L., Koken, M., Paillard, C.,

911 2009. Influence of temperature and spawning effort on *Haliotis tuberculata* mortalities

- caused by *Vibrio harveyi*: an example of emerging vibriosis linked to global warming.
 Global Change Biology, 15: 1365-1376. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2486.2008.01764.x.
- 914 Wessel, N., Martin, S., Badou, A., Dubois, P., Huchette, S., Julia, V., Nunes, F., Harney E.,
- 915 Paillard C., Auzoux-Bordenave S., 2018. Effect of CO₂–induced ocean acidification on the
- 916 early development and shell mineralization of the European abalone (*Haliotis tuberculata*).
- 917 Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology, 508: 52-63. doi:
 918 10.1016/j.jembe.2018.08.005.
- Widdicombe, S., Spicer, J.I., 2008. Predicting the impact of ocean acidification on benthic
 biodiversity: What can animal physiology tell us? Journal of Experimental Marine Biology
 and Ecology, 366:187–197. doi: 10.1016/j.jembe.2008.07.024.
- Wittmann, A.C., Pörtner, H.-O., 2013. Sensitivities of extant animal taxa to ocean acidification.
 Nature Climate Change 3: 995-1001. doi: 10.1038/NCLIMATE1982.
- Winter, B., 2013. Linear models and linear mixed effects models in R with linguistic applications.

925 arXiv:1308.5499.

- 26 Zhang, T., Qu, Y., Zhang, Q., Tang, J., Cao, R., Dong, Z., Wang, Q., Zhao, J., 2021. Risks to the
- 927 stability of coral reefs in the South China Sea: An integrated biomarker approach to assess
- 928 the physiological responses of *Trochus niloticus* to ocean acidification and warming. Science
- 929 of The Total Environment, 782: 146876. doi: <u>10.1016/J.SCITOTENV.2021.146876</u>
- 230 Zippay, M.L., Hofmann, G.E., 2010. Effect of pH on gene expression and thermal tolerance of
- 931 early life history stages of red abalone (*Haliotis rufescens*). Journal of Shellfish Research,
- 932 29: 429-439. doi: 10.2983/035.029.0220.

Journal Prevention

• Abalone has experienced severe population decline worldwide due to overfishing, disease and climate change

• The effects of simulated OA were evaluated on reproduction and early life stages of European abalone (*Haliotis tuberculata*) through a transgenerational experiment.

• No carry-over effects were observed on abalone offspring following parental exposure to OA

• Larval and juvenile fitness were affected by low pH

• Species dispersion and survival may be compromised under future conditions, with potential negative consequences for European abalone populations.

Journal Pression

Declaration of interests

☑ The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

□ The authors declare the following financial interests/personal relationships which may be considered as potential competing interests:

Journal Presson