

Sensitivity of Alpine glaciers to anthropogenic atmospheric forcings: case study of the Argentière glacier

Léo Clauzel, Adrien Gilbert, Ménégoz Martin, Olivier Gagliardini, Delphine Six, Guillaume Gastineau

▶ To cite this version:

Léo Clauzel, Adrien Gilbert, Ménégoz Martin, Olivier Gagliardini, Delphine Six, et al.. Sensitivity of Alpine glaciers to anthropogenic atmospheric forcings: case study of the Argentière glacier. 2022. hal-03764448

HAL Id: hal-03764448 https://hal.science/hal-03764448v1

Preprint submitted on 30 Aug 2022

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés. Léo Clauzel¹, Adrien Gilbert¹, Martin Ménégoz¹, Olivier Gagliardini¹, Delphine Six¹,
Guillaume Gastineau²

Sensitivity of Alpine glaciers to anthropogenic atmospheric

forcings: case study of the Argentière glacier

⁶ ¹Univ. Grenoble Alpes, CNRS, IRD, Grenoble INP, IGE, 38000 Grenoble, France

7 ²UMR LOCEAN, Sorbonne Université/CNRS/IRD/MNHN, IPSL, 4 place Jussieu,

- 8 75005, Paris, France
- 9

11 12

13

14

15

16

1

2

10 Key points (140 character par key points, pas d'abréviation, 3 max)

- Ice flow simulations forced with climate model outputs are used to explore natural and anthropogenic imprints on the Argentière glacier.
 - Statistical downscaling needs to ensure a conservation of the trends and the physical relationship between temperature and precipitation.
- The anthropogenic imprint on the Argentière glacier mass emerged from internal variability in 2003, 30 years after that on temperature.
- 17 18

19 Key words (6 max)

statistical adjustment - glacier modelling - external climate forcings - detection-attribution - time
 of emergence

22

23 Abstract (150 words < 150)

24

25 This study aims at quantifying the contribution of external climate forcings on the retreat of the 26 Argentière glacier (Mont-Blanc area). Its evolution is simulated over 1850-2014 following 27 retrospective scenarios produced with the IPSL-CM6-LR climate model, excluding and 28 including natural and anthropogenic forcings. These scenarios are statistically adjusted at the 29 local scale, ensuring a preservation of the long-term trends and a physical consistency 30 between precipitation and temperature, to finally force an ice flow model coupled with a 31 surface mass balance scheme. The regional aerosol cooling partly counteracted the 32 greenhouse gases warming, delaying the time of emergence of anthropogenic signals: The 33 anthropogenic influences emerged from the natural variability in 1979 for temperature and in 34 2008 for the mass of the glacier, whereas its snout position in 2014 remains compatible with 35 natural variability. We found that 66% [20-112%] of the total mass loss in 2014 since 1850 36 can be attributed to anthropogenic activities.

37

38 Plain Language Summary (200 words max sans acronymes)

39

This work aims at quantifying the anthropogenic imprint on the Argentière glacier with respect to its changes related to climate natural variability. It is based on a detection-attribution approach used to produce retrospective ensemble simulations of the climate and the glaciers, including and excluding greenhouse gases and aerosol forcings over 1850-2014. The time of emergence of the anthropogenic signal, i.e. the date when it becomes statistically incompatible with climate internal variability, occurs in 1979 for temperature in the Argentière location, with a warming reaching 1.35 °C in 2014. It occurs later for the glacier changes, in particular for 47 the snout position that is still compatible with internal variability in 2014. For the glacier mass, 48 it occurred in 2008, ~30 years after those of the temperature. In 2014, 66% [20-112%] of the 49 total mass loss since 1850 can be attributed to anthropogenic activities. This result is sensitive 50 to the internal variability estimate from the climate model, and it should be completed in further 51 studies including both the cooling of the aerosols when they are located in the atmosphere 52 and the melt increase when they are deposited onto the snow. This study highlights a 53 strengthening of the current glacier retreat.

54

55 1. Introduction

56

57 Mountain glaciers around the world retreated dramatically over the last decades. Appart being 58 an iconic symbol of the ongoing climate change, this retreat has strong environmental and 59 societal impacts: over 1971-2018, the mass loss of mountain glaciers is the second contributor to sea level rise, with a 22% contribution, coming after the 50% related to the thermal 60 61 expansion of the ocean and before the 20% explained by the ice caps melting (IPCC, 2021). 62 The retreat of glaciers is also a threat for water availability in particular where they play the role of fresh water reservoirs essential for biodiversity and human societies (Kaser et al., 2010; 63 64 Milner et al., 2017; Laurent et al., 2020).

65

66 Alpine glacier extensions reached a maxima at the end of the little ice age (LIA; Zumbühl and 67 Nussbaumer, 2018). The LIA covers approximately 1400-1700, a cold period induced by 68 strong volcanic activity and a minimum of solar activity (Mann et al., 2009). After the LIA, the 69 18th century is considered as a temperature constant reference period without any strong 70 external forcing (Hawkins et al., 2017), whereas low temperature has been observed again 71 during the period 1800-1850, in relation to volcanic eruptions and changes of solar activity that 72 favoured large glacier extensions in the Alps (Zumbühl and Nussbaumer, 2018). The retreat 73 of Alpine glaciers started in 1850, simultaneously with the beginning of anthropogenic 74 emissions of greenhouse gases (GHGs). The exact causes of this retreat are still debated, 75 since the temperature increase was relatively small during the end of the XIXth century, and 76 other factors like decadal variability of precipitation (Vincent et al., 2005) and deposition of 77 absorbing aerosols on snow (Painter et al., 2013) might have also affected glaciers. Future 78 glacier projections need to be considered carefully because the glacier sensitivity to external 79 forcing and climate internal variability is still uncertain (Marzeion et al, 2020).

80

81 Detection-attribution studies have been used to estimate the climate response to external 82 forcings, using both climate models and observations of surface air temperature. Such studies typically estimate that the global warming of +1.2°C (+/-0.15°C), observed in 2010-2020 as 83 84 compared to the pre-industrial era, can be decomposed in +1.5°C (+/-0.3°C) related to GHGs and -0.4°C (+/-0.3°C) related to other forcings (Haustein et al., 2017; Gillett et al., 2021; Ribes 85 86 et al., 2021; Eyring et al. 2021). These other forcings mainly reflect the effect of anthropogenic 87 aerosols that cool the atmosphere. Detection-attribution methods allow to highlight the climate 88 response to external forcings with respect to internal variability. Following such an approach, 89 Roe et al. (2017; 2021) suggested that 100% of the glacier global mass loss from the pre-90 industrial era is explained by anthropogenic forcings. However, such approaches do not allow to accurately quantify the emergence of the anthropogenic signals at the local scale and 91 92 cannot be used to differentiate the role of GHGs and aerosols, because they are based on 93 idealised depictions of the climate and the glacier systems. More physical approaches are

94 used to quantify separately the natural and anthropogenic imprints on glaciers with global 95 models (e.g. Marzeion et al., 2014; Maussion et al., 2019) and their contribution to sea level 96 changes (e.g. Huss and Hock, 2015). These approaches are inevitably strongly idealised for 97 global applications, in particular because of the complexity of the physical processes at play 98 that cannot be verified due to the impossibility to get observational data for all the glaciers on 99 the Earth. To be fully reliable, physical approaches would require: (1) a realistic atmospheric 100 forcing, that is generally obtained from the statistical adjustment of atmosphere-ocean general 101 circulation models (AOGCMs) outputs, used to extrapolate the local observations when they 102 are not available. Several adjustment techniques has been proposed to ensure a conservation 103 of the trends and the interannual variability of atmospheric variables, as well as a physical consistency between themselves (Latombe et al., 2018; Luo et al., 2018, Gutierrez et al., 2019, 104 105 Vaittinada et al., 2021); (2) a model allowing to simulate the 3D glacier flow and its geometry 106 evolution, that needs local observations for calibration; (3) an adequate initialisation of the 107 glacier model, a crucial step since climate internal variability might induce strong decadal 108 variations of glaciers, even in a non-perturbed climate.

109

The aim of this study is to investigate the drivers of the Argentière glacier changes in the Alpine area over 1850-2014 by quantifying separately the impacts of GHGs, aerosols and climate internal variability. After a presentation of the data and the methods in Section 2, the results are described in Section 3, before a discussion and a conclusion in Section 4.

114

115 **2. Data and Methods**

117 **2.1 Local observations and climate forcing**

118

116

Located in the Mont-Blanc massif, the Argentière Glacier (45°57'N, 6°58'E) is the second largest glacier in the French Alps, covering an area of 11.3 km² in 2019, extended over ~10km from 1550 to 3500 m a.s.l. (Six and Vincent, 2014). Stake measurements, geodetic observations, GPS survey and radar observations (Rabatel et al., 2018; Vincent et al, 2009) are used to monitor this glacier within the framework of the GLACIOCLIM observatory (<u>https://glacioclim.osug.fr/</u>).

125

126 Atmospheric data is extracted here from experiments produced with the IPSL-CM6A-LR 127 AOGCM (Boucher et al., 2020), in the context of the Detection and Attribution Model Intercomparison Project (DAMIP, Gillett et al., 2016) panel of CMIP6 (Coupled Model 128 129 Intercomparison Phase 6). DAMIP aims at quantifying separately the imprint of natural and 130 anthropogenic external climate forcing. We use here a subset of the IPSL-CM6A-LR 131 experiments: (i) a 10-member historical experiment (hist) that includes all natural and 132 anthropogenic forcings and 3 sets of 6-member experiments, including (ii) only the natural 133 (nat), only the anthropogenic aerosol (aer) and only the anthropogenic greenhouse gas (ghg) 134 forcings. The hist simulations also include the effect of changing stratospheric ozone and land 135 use, but these two effects should only play a minor role at the local scale in the Mont-Blanc 136 area. The natural external forcings designate here the volcanic and the solar activities. The 137 simulations are available over 1850-2014 and member-experiments differ between themselves only by their initial conditions that have been sampled from a 1000-year pre-138 139 industrial control experiment. Corresponding members from one experiment to another one 140 have the same initial conditions. Hereafter, the internal variability designates the variability

141 sampled with the different ensemble members. The SAFRAN reanalysis available for the 142 different French Alpine regions with a 300m vertical resolution (Vernay et al., 2022) is used 143 here to statistically adjust the AOGCM data extracted from the gridpoint containing the 144 Argentière Glacier.

145

146 2.2 Statistical downscaling of climate data

The daily AOGCM temperature and precipitation are simultaneously bias corrected and downscaled with a monthly statistical adjustment, considering the difference between the *hist* experiment and the SAFRAN reference at 2400m a.s.l., i.e. close to the glacier mean altitude. The adjustment is calibrated over 1975-2014 with the 10 *hist* members and is then applied to the whole set of ensemble experiments hist, *nat*, *aer* and *ghg*, considering the correction stationary over 1850-2014.

153 The simple quantile mapping (SQM, Panofsky and Brier, 1968) is used here to fit the 154 cumulative distributive function of the model variables on the observation ones. However, this 155 method induces a spurious amplification of the long term temperature trend (Figure 1a) and 156 an underestimation of snow accumulation as the precipitation distribution over the temperature 157 1°C-width bins is shifted to warmer days (Figure 1b). To overcome these issues, the Quantile 158 Delta Mapping (QDM, Cannon et al., 2015), that ensures a conservation of trends, is first used to adjust temperature. The 2D-variable successive conditional approach of Piani and Haerter 159 160 (2012) is then followed by applying the SQM methods for precipitation separately for 5 161 quantiles of temperature, to keep the physical consistency between the two variables. The temperature-quantile bins are defined on 40-year moving sub-periods to avoid any impact of 162 temperature trends on the precipitation adjustment. This combination of these two statistical 163 adjustments is defined here as the Coupled Delta Quantile Mapping (CDQM). 164

The CDQM method ensures a conservation of the temperature trend simulated with the AOGCM that is in accordance with the HISTALP reconstruction (Böhm et al., 2010; Figure 1a), a physical precipitation-temperature relationship consistent with the SAFRAN reanalysis (Figure 1b) as well as realistic seasonal cycles, daily and interannual variability for these two

- 169 variables (Figure S1).
- 170



Figure 1. (a) 30-year running mean temperature anomaly with respect to the 1975-2014 mean, averaged over members. Blue line is the historical simulations, red and green lines are respectively their SQM and CDQM adjustments. The HISTALP data is denoted with the black dotted line and SAFRAN with the dashed line. The Δ given in brackets is the difference between the 1850-1875 and the 1975-2014 means; (b) cumulative distribution function of precipitation over 1°C-wide bins of temperature, averaged over members ; (c) cumulated SMB and (d) length change from 1850. Dashed lines are individual members and solid lines are the 10-member mean in (cd). The glaciological simulation forced with SAFRAN corresponds to the black line, the GLACIOCLIM in-situ data appears in brown, the estimate from Zemp et al. (2019) in cyan, geodetic data are denoted with blue crosses and proxies with the black points. Proxies are derived from moraine isotopic analysis (Protin et al., 2019).

171

179

172 2.3 Glaciological model

173 2.3.1 Ice flow model

The glacier response to climate forcing is simulated using a coupled surface mass balance -3D ice flow model based on the Elmer/Ice finite element code (Gagliardini et al., 2013). The ice flow model solves the Stokes equations adopting Glen's flow law for viscous isotropic temperate ice (Cuffey & Paterson, 2010). The basal boundary condition is given by a Weertman-type friction law (Weertman, 1957):

$$A_s \tau_b{}^m = u_b \quad (1)$$

180 where τ_b is the basal shear stress (*MPa*), u_b the sliding velocity (*m yr*¹), A_s the friction 181 coefficient (*m yr*¹ *MPa*^{-*m*}) and *m* an exponent fixed to m = 3 for Argentière glacier (Gimbert et 182 al., 2021). The friction coefficient A_s is assumed to be uniform and constant in time. The 183 evolution of the ice thickness is computed at a 1/20 year time step (~18 days) through the resolution of the free surface equation for the given surface mass balance and ice velocityfield (Gagliardini et al., 2013).

186 2.3.2 Surface Mass Balance scheme

187 The mass balance scheme computes the daily distributed surface mass balance (SMB) from 188 daily precipitation and temperature which is then cumulated over the 1/20 year simulation 189 timestep to force the ice flow model. The local net daily SMB (m w.eq. d⁻¹) is determined by:

$$SMB = A - M \qquad (2)$$

191 where *A* and M are respectively the local daily snow accumulation and surface melting 192 $(m w_{eq} d^{-1})$. The amount of melt *M* is computed from the available energy for melt following 193 Oerlemans (2001):

194
$$Q_m = (1 - \alpha)rI_{pot} + k_1T + k_0$$
(3)

195 where α is the local surface albedo, I_{pot} is the potential incoming short-wave radiation (Hock, 196 1999), *r* a corrective factor and $k_1T + k_0$ is the sum of the long-wave radiation balance and 197 the turbulent heat exchange linearized around the melting point with k_0 and k_1 as constant 198 parameters, and T the air temperature. If Q_m is positive, the melt rate is obtained with the 199 latent heat of fusion *L*:

200
$$M = Q_m / (L \times \rho_{water})$$
 (4)

The local surface albedo is estimated from the state of the surface that can be either snow or ice. Snow and firn thickness evolution is computed at daily time step to determine if $\alpha = \alpha_{ice}$ or $\alpha = \alpha_{snow}$ (Gilbert et al., 2020). The local snow accumulation *A* is determined from local daily precipitation according to a snow/rain temperature threshold fixed to 1°C.

Temperature and precipitation data provided at 2400m are distributed to the glacier surface according to altitudinal lapse rates such as:

- 207 $T(z,t) = T_{ref}(t) + \frac{dT}{dz} \left(z z_{ref} \right)$ (5)
- 208 $P(x, y, z, t) = M_a(x, y) P_{ref}(t) \left(1 + P_z(z z_{ref})\right)$ (6)

where *z* is the elevation of the surface (*m*), $T_{ref}(t)$ and $P_{ref}(t)$ are air temperature (°C) and precipitation (m w.eq.) at the elevation $z_{ref} = 2400m$, $\frac{dT}{dz}$ is the temperature lapse rate (°C m⁻ 1), P_z is the precipitation lapse rate and $M_a(x, y)$ is a spatial correction factor for precipitation (Table S1).

213

214

215 2.4 Modelling strategy

216

217 2.4.1 Model calibration

218

In-situ stake measurement of seasonal mass balance performed since 1975 combined to
 SAFRAN temperature and precipitation are used to constrain the SMB scheme. The extensive
 monitoring of the glacier over a long period allowed a good calibration of the multiple

parameters. The SMB scheme is calibrated on a fixed surface topography (1998) such that the ice flow model is not needed for this step. We verify a posteriori that the SMB remains in good accordance with the observations when the model is coupled with the ice flow model. Precipitation correction factor and lapse rate were first calibrated using winter SMB data in which little melting happened. The observed SMB altitude dependency strongly constraints k_1 , α_{ice} and α_{snow} whereas the total mass change over the whole measurement period constraints *r* and k_0 . The adopted model parameters values are summarised in Table S1.

229

230 2.4.2 Initial state and spin up

231

232 The 1820 steady-state glacier geometry is obtained by running the SMB scheme coupled to 233 the ice flow model forced with the 1975-2015 SAFRAN data, assuming a shift of temperature ΔT_0 and supposing unchanged precipitation rates. A value of -1.30°C for ΔT_0 is required to 234 obtain a glacier length that matches the 1820 moraine observation, a period when the glacier 235 236 was supposed to be in equilibrium with the climate for several decades (Protin et al., 2019). A 237 30-year spin up over 1820-1850 is then performed separately for the 10 members, allowing to 238 adjust the glacier shape to the climate internal variability that might induce large interannual 239 to decadal changes of temperature and precipitation. These spin-ups are forced with the 240 statistically adjusted atmospheric data produced in the DAMIP spin-up experiments 241 themselves, covering the same period.

242

243 3. Results244

245 **3.1 Observed versus simulated glacier changes**

246 By construction, there is a good consistency between the SMB estimated from stakes 247 observations and those simulated with the SAFRAN data over the reference period 1975-248 2014, both in terms of mean and trends (Figure S2). The interannual variability of the SMB is 249 slightly overestimated in the adjusted model (Figures S2). The ensemble mean of the 250 experiment is close to the observed SMB. The cumulative SMB shows stabilised values during 251 the 1970's followed by a dramatic retreat from the middle of the 1980's that reached a 252 cumulated change of -35m.w.eq. (Fig. 1c) and a length change of -1700m in 2014 (Fig. 1d) as 253 compared to the 1850 levels. The consistency between the model and the observations before 254 1975 demonstrates that the glaciological model is able to accurately simulate both the SMB 255 and the glacier flow (Figure 1c,1d). This also confirms the realism of the adjusted AOGCMs 256 outputs applied to the glaciological model. The large spread in the ensemble members 257 suggests that internal climate variability can induce large low-frequency variations of the 258 glacier mass and length (Figure 1c,1d). This might reflect the large centennial variability 259 simulated in this model (Jiang et al. 2021).

260

261 **3.2 Pre-industrial conditions**

The experiments are spinuped from an initial steady state imposed by the 1820 moraine, that can be simulated with a temperature decrease $\Delta T0=-1.30^{\circ}C$ (Section 2.4.2). This $\Delta T0$ is close to, albeit slightly cooler, the ΔT estimated from the AOGCM outputs that reached -1.15°C in the 10-member historical experiment and -1.17°C in the corresponding adjusted values (CDQM, Figure 1a). This slight difference explains that even with constant forcing levels during 1820-1850 (Figure 2ab), there is a negative trend of SMB for all the members during this spin up period (Figure 2c). This negative trend is visible in the different positions of the glacier front in Figure 3a, where all the members show a retreat, with a spread centred on the 1850
 position. This spread highlights the different positions that could have reached the glacier front
 with stable external forcings during this 30-year period.

272

273 **3.3 Forced versus climate internally driven signals**

274 For a strict comparison with the 6-member DAMIP IPSL experiments ghg, aer and nat, only 275 the 6 corresponding members are retained in hist, as shown in Figures 2 and 3. Figure 2a 276 highlights the local warming simulated at the Argentière Glacier in hist, starting in 1850. intensifying in the 1980's and reaching +1.42°C in 2014. This warming is mainly related to 277 GHGs as evidenced in ghg (+1.56°C) and is partly compensated by the cooling effect of 278 279 anthropogenic aerosols, as evidenced in aer (-0.74°C). The warming found in hist does not 280 reach exactly aer+ghg+nat. Precipitation rates are stable and similar in all the experiments, 281 suggesting a minor impact of external forcings on this variable, except in ghg for which 282 precipitation is slightly strengthened and in aer for which precipitation is slightly decreased. 283 Although the temperature increase due to GHGs is twice larger than the decrease due to 284 aerosols, the GHGs and aerosols effects on precipitation nearly cancel each other. These 285 precipitation changes are related to the radiative changes driven by greenhouse gases and aerosols, as well as potential atmospheric circulation changes (Myrhe et al. 2017). The 286 287 resulting precipitation rates remain nearly unchanged in both hist and nat.

288

289 The cumulated SMBs show larger member spread as compared to those of temperature in all 290 the experiments, highlighting a large imprint of climate internal variability on SMB (Figure 2c). 291 As for temperature, the cumulated SMB simulated in 2014 under hist (~ -45m.weg) is 292 explained by the combined but no-additive trends found in aer (~ -5m.weg), nat (~ -22m.weg) 293 and in ghg (~ -60m.weg). SMB is decreasing in all the experiments, even in nat (~ -22m.weg). 294 This suggests that the glacier retreat that would have occurred even without any 295 anthropogenic forcing is related to the end of the LIA. The interannual variability of SMB is 296 relatively high in both the observations and the model (Figure 2d), and positive values never 297 occurred in the observations after the 2000's. The spread of the ensemble experiment is larger 298 for the glacier length than for the SMB (Figure 2), probably explained by non-linear dynamical 299 processes. According to geomorphologic observations (Leclercg et al., 2014), the position of 300 the Argentière Glacier front varied between -800m and 0m over 1600-1820, reaching its maximum in 1820 (Figure 2e). In 2014, it reached -2000m in the observations, a pattern 301 302 reproduced in the hist configuration that corresponds to an equilibrium between the ghg (-303 2800m), the nat (-1000m) and the aer (-300m) configurations.

304

305 The time of emergence is defined here as the time at which the signal of climate change 306 emerges from the noise of natural climate variability (Hawkins and Sutton, 2012; IPCC, 2021). 307 Here, it is estimated by computing annually the probability that the glacier is bigger than those 308 simulated in the nat experiment after a 1000-time bootstrap resampling over the members. 309 The vertical bars in Figure 2abcef highlight the date when this probability is very unlikely (P<0.1). In the ghg experiment, the time of emergence occurs in 2001 for the glacier length, 310 311 in 1987 for SMB and in 1970 for temperature(orange vertical bars in Figure 2ace). The 312 anthropogenic signal has not emerged significantly before 2014 in the hist configuration 313 (P=0.13), whereas it emerged in 2008 for SMB and in 1979 for temperature (blue vertical bars 314 in Figure 2ace).

315

316 The ensemble mean of glacier extents is shown in Figure 3b: the hist configuration leads to 317 an extent close to the 2014 observation; the nat configuration suggests a glacier retreat less pronounced than in the hist one; the aer configuration induces a growing of the glacier that 318 319 comes back to the levels observed during the middle of the 19th century, and the ghg 320 configuration leads to a retreat more pronounced than the hist one. The spatial impact of 321 climate internal variability on the extent of the Argentière Glacier is depicted for the four 322 sensitivity experiments in Figure 3abcd. Most of the hist members are concentrated close to 323 the 2014 observation except one that retreated more. The nat ensemble shows a large spread, 324 with members extending from the 1850 moraine to areas located at higher elevation than the 325 2014 observation. The entire ghg ensemble show extensions located at higher elevation than 326 the 2014 observation, whereas all the members of the aer ensemble extend until the bottom 327 of the valley, around the LIA moraines.

- 328
- 329
- 330



Figure 2. 30-year running mean of (a) adjusted temperature and (b) adjusted precipitation ; (c) cumulated SMB from 1820 ; (d) annual SMB ; (e) length change from 1820 and (f) empirical probability of having a larger glacier length than *nat* computed by comparing experiment distributions based on 1000-time bootstrap resampling. Solid lines are 6-

member means, shading corresponds to the 1- σ member range, vertical black lines show the spin up end. Vertical coloured dashed lines indicate the year by which it is very likely or very unlikely to have a higher temperature or a lower value for SMB and glacier length than in *nat* as computed in (f). Steady 1820 in (a) and (b) refers to the mean climate conditions used for constructing the 1820 steady state.

331







Figure 3. (a) Glacier extent observed in 1820 and 1850 and simulated under pre-industrial climate conditions after a 30-year spinup experiment. (b) 6-member mean of the whole glacier area for the different experiments in 2014 and their corresponding individual members in the front area in (c) *hist*, (d) *nat*, (e) *ghg* and (f) *aer*. The black dashed line is

the observed glacier extent in 2014.

332

333 4. Discussion and conclusions

334

335 The time of emergence of anthropogenic signals in the Argentière Glacier has been 336 investigated using the adjusted IPSL-CM6 AOGCM to force an ice-flow model coupled with a 337 SMB scheme. The effects of GHGs, anthropogenic aerosols and natural forcings are 338 disentangled using dedicated detection-attribution AOGCM runs. The unavoidable adjustment 339 required to bias-correct and downscale the AOGCM outputs to the local scale needs to be 340 considered with caution. Here, we use a method that preserves the temperature trends from 341 the climate model as well as the physical consistency between temperature and precipitation. 342 Other simple statistical adjustment might result in spurious trends and erroneous accumulation 343 rates.

344 The temperature change simulated with the AOGCM over 1850-2014 (-1.19°C) is similar to 345 those found in HISTALP (-1.17°C) and the glacier length simulated in 1820-1850 is consistent 346 with the morain observations. This gives credence in our modelling strategy, demonstrating 347 that: (i) the 1850 glacier extension was an extreme state in the pre-industrial climate 348 conditions, reached at the end of the LIA and (ii) a part of the retreat of the Argentière Glacier 349 would have likely occurred even without any anthropogenic forcing. When excluding 350 anthropogenic forcing, the more likely extension would have been located at an intermediate 351 elevation between the 1850 and 2014 positions (Figure 3d). However, both the 1850 extension 352 and positions higher than those observed in 2014 are compatible with natural variability over 353 this period. This result is dependent on the strong multidecadal internal variability simulated in 354 the IPSL-CM6-LR (Parsons et al., 2020). Ensemble spreads are larger in nat than in hist and 355 ghg, suggesting that GHGs anthropogenic forcings reduced the interannual to interdecadal 356 variability of temperature, SMB and glacier lengths over the last decades in the Alps, a 357 hypothesis demonstrated at the global scale for the IPSL-CM6-LR model in Bonnet et al. 358 (2021).

359 By comparing the hist and the nat experiments, the cumulative mass loss of the Argentière 360 glacier due to anthropogenic forcing over 1850-2014 is estimated to 66% [20-112%]. This 361 local estimation is lower than the global estimate of Roe et al. (2021), ranging between 85% 362 and 180%, and higher than those reported by Marzeion et al. (2014), reaching 25%. Using a 363 physical approach highly constrained by observations, we assume that the uncertainty 364 provided here is mainly the result of climate internal variability whereas global estimates do not disentangle internal variability from model uncertainties. The similar evolution of the 365 366 Argentière glacier as compared to the other Alpine glaciers over the previous centuries (Figure 367 1c) suggests that its response to anthropogenic forcings provide a general view of the glacier 368 changes in the Alps.

369 Overall, the length of glaciers is an interesting proxy of the decadal to centennial climate variability, because it is easy to observe and acts as climate integrators, smoothing the 370 371 variability of the atmosphere at higher frequencies. Conversely, glacier lengths show a larger 372 spread of response to climate internal variability as compared to temperature and SMB. 373 Indeed, the front position is largely influenced by the local topographic conditions such as 374 valley shape and slope distribution. Applying such a physical model chain allows to accurately 375 simulate the glacier length dependency to complex terrain. The next step in the ice-flow model 376 development concerns the basal sliding related to subglacial hydrological processes that could 377 further enhance the spread of member experiments for glacier length.

378 The warming simulated in hist in the Mont-Blanc area does not reach the sum of the aer, ghg 379 and nat temperature signals. The land use or stratospheric ozone that are not considered separately here could drive changes of local temperature, but these ones are expected to be 380 381 small (Eyring et al. 2021). We suggest that this non-additivity results from nonlinear processes 382 related to local feedbacks, atmospheric circulation changes and residual internal climate 383 variability. In addition, further research using a multi-model DAMIP approach would allow a 384 better estimation of uncertainty, since climate signals, regional circulation changes and 385 internal variability can vary widely from one AOGCM to another one (Myrhe et al. 2017). 386 Finally, these experiments should be repeated in further study taking into account both the 387 cooling effect of atmospheric aerosols and the melt increase related to the deposition of 388 absorbing aerosols, a process known for its strong impact on the cryosphere (Reveillet et al., 389 in press) that has been neglected here. This would allow to quantify exactly the contributions 390 of all the external forcings that affected the cryosphere from the beginning of the industrial era. 391

392 5. Acknowledgment

393 The CMIP6 project at IPSL used the HPC resources of TGCC under the allocations 2016-A0030107732, 2017-R0040110492 and 2018-R0040110492 (project gencmip6) provided by 394 395 GENCI (Grand Équipement National de Calcul Intensif). This study benefited from the ESPRI (Ensemble de Services Pour la Recherche à l'IPSL) computing and data center 396 397 (https://mesocentre.ipsl.fr) which is supported by CNRS, Sorbonne Université, École 398 Polytechnique and CNES and through national and international grants. All the glaciological simulations presented in this paper were performed using the GRICAD infrastructure 399 400 (https://gricad.univ- grenoble-alpes.fr), which is supported by Grenoble research communities. 401 This work is supported by the French ANR project SAUSSURE (ANR-18-CE01-0015-01).

402 403

404 6. Open research

- 405 Observational data from GLACIOCLIM observatory are available at the following link : 406 <u>https://glacioclim.osug.fr/</u>.
- 407 CMIP6 and DAMIP data is available on the Earth System Grid Federation (ESGF, 408 <u>https://esgf.llnl.gov/</u>).
- 409 The modelling code is based on the open-source code Elmer/Ice available at 410 <u>http://elmerice.elmerfem.org/wiki/doku.php</u>
- 411 The glacier meshing file, the glaciological model configurations, the datasets generated and
- 412 analyzed and the python jupyter notebook used in the current study are available on the
- repository platform Zenodo at the following link : <u>https://zenodo.org/deposit/6786833</u> (to be
 published soon)
- 415

416 **7. References**

- 417 Allan, R.P., Cassou, C., Chen, D., Cherchi, A., Connors, L., Doblas-Reyes, F.J.,
- 418 Douville, H., Driouech, F., Edwards, T.L., Fischer, E., Flato, G.M., Forster, P.,
- 419 AchutaRao, K.M., Adhikary, B., Aldrian, E., Armour, K., n.d. IPCC, 2021 : Summary
 420 for Policymakers 32.
- Böhm, R., Jones, P.D., Hiebl, J., Frank, D., Brunetti, M., Maugeri, M., 2010. The early
 instrumental warm-bias: a solution for long central European temperature series

423 1760-2007. Climatic Change 101, 41-67. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10584-009-424 9649-4 425 Bonnet, R., Boucher, O., Deshayes, J., Gastineau, G., Hourdin, F., Mignot, J., 426 Servonnat, J., Swingedouw, D., 2021. Presentation and Evaluation of the IPSL-427 CM6A-LR Ensemble of Extended Historical Simulations. Journal of Advances in 428 Modeling Earth Systems 13, e2021MS002565. 429 https://doi.org/10.1029/2021MS002565 430 Boucher, O., Servonnat, J., Albright, A.L., Aumont, O., Balkanski, Y., Bastrikov, V., 431 Bekki, S., Bonnet, R., Bony, S., Bopp, L., Braconnot, P., Brockmann, P., Cadule, 432 P., Caubel, A., Cheruy, F., Codron, F., Cozic, A., Cugnet, D., D'Andrea, F., Davini, 433 P., de Lavergne, C., Denvil, S., Deshayes, J., Devilliers, M., Ducharne, A., 434 Dufresne, J.-L., Dupont, E., Éthé, C., Fairhead, L., Falletti, L., Flavoni, S., Foujols, M.-A., Gardoll, S., Gastineau, G., Ghattas, J., Grandpeix, J.-Y., Guenet, B., Guez, 435 436 E., Lionel, Guilyardi, E., Guimberteau, M., Hauglustaine, D., Hourdin, F., Idelkadi, 437 A., Joussaume, S., Kageyama, M., Khodri, M., Krinner, G., Lebas, N., Levavasseur, 438 G., Lévy, C., Li, L., Lott, F., Lurton, T., Luyssaert, S., Madec, G., Madeleine, J.-B., 439 Maignan, F., Marchand, M., Marti, O., Mellul, L., Meurdesoif, Y., Mignot, J., Musat, 440 I., Ottlé, C., Peylin, P., Planton, Y., Polcher, J., Rio, C., Rochetin, N., Rousset, C., 441 Sepulchre, P., Sima, A., Swingedouw, D., Thiéblemont, R., Traore, A.K., Vancoppenolle, M., Vial, J., Vialard, J., Viovy, N., Vuichard, N., 2020. Presentation 442 443 and Evaluation of the IPSL-CM6A-LR Climate Model. Journal of Advances in 444 Modeling Earth Systems 12, e2019MS002010. 445 https://doi.org/10.1029/2019MS002010 Cannon, A.J., Sobie, S.R., Murdock, T.Q., 2015. Bias Correction of GCM Precipitation 446 447 by Quantile Mapping: How Well Do Methods Preserve Changes in Quantiles and 448 Extremes? Journal of Climate 28, 6938–6959. https://doi.org/10.1175/JCLI-D-14-449 00754.1 450 Court, A., 1958. Review of Some Applications of Statistics to Meteorology. Bulletin of 451 the American Meteorological Society 39, 502-503. 452 Cuffey, K.M., Paterson, W.S.B., 2010. The Physics of Glaciers. Academic Press. Eyring, V., Mishra, V., Griffith, G.P., Chen, L., Keenan, T., Turetsky, M.R., Brown, S., 453 Jotzo, F., Moore, F.C., van der Linden, S., 2021. Reflections and projections on a 454 455 decade of climate science. Nat. Clim. Chang. 11, 279–285. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41558-021-01020-x 456 457 Gagliardini, O., Zwinger, T., Gillet-Chaulet, F., Durand, G., Favier, L., de Fleurian, B., Greve, R., Malinen, M., Martín, C., Råback, P., Ruokolainen, J., Sacchettini, M., 458 459 Schäfer, M., Seddik, H., Thies, J., 2013. Capabilities and performance of Elmer/Ice, 460 a new-generation ice sheet model. Geoscientific Model Development 6, 1299-461 1318. https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-6-1299-2013 462 Gilbert, A., Sinisalo, A., Gurung, T.R., Fujita, K., Maharjan, S.B., Sherpa, T.C., Fukuda, 463 T., 2020. The influence of water percolation through crevasses on the thermal

464	regime of a Himalayan mountain glacier. The Cryosphere 14, 1273–1288.
465	https://doi.org/10.5194/tc-14-1273-2020
466	Gillett, N.P., Kirchmeier-Young, M., Ribes, A., Shiogama, H., Hegerl, G.C., Knutti, R.,
467	Gastineau, G., John, J.G., Li, L., Nazarenko, L., Rosenbloom, N., Seland, Ø., Wu,
468	T., Yukimoto, S., Ziehn, T., 2021. Constraining human contributions to observed
469	warming since the pre-industrial period. Nat. Clim. Chang. 11, 207–212.
470	https://doi.org/10.1038/s41558-020-00965-9
471	Gillett, N.P., Shiogama, H., Funke, B., Hegerl, G., Knutti, R., Matthes, K., Santer, B.D.,
472	Stone, D., Tebaldi, C., 2016. The Detection and Attribution Model Intercomparison
473	Project (DAMIP v1.0) contribution to CMIP6. Geoscientific Model Development 9,
474	3685–3697. https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-9-3685-2016
475	Gimbert, F., Gilbert, A., Gagliardini, O., Vincent, C., Moreau, L., 2021. Do Existing
476	Theories Explain Seasonal to Multi-Decadal Changes in Glacier Basal Sliding
477	Speed? Geophysical Research Letters 48, e2021GL092858.
478	https://doi.org/10.1029/2021GL092858
479	Gutiérrez, J.M., Maraun, D., Widmann, M., Huth, R., Hertig, E., Benestad, R., Roessler,
480	O., Wibig, J., Wilcke, R., Kotlarski, S., San Martín, D., Herrera, S., Bedia, J.,
481	Casanueva, A., Manzanas, R., Iturbide, M., Vrac, M., Dubrovsky, M., Ribalaygua,
482	J., Pórtoles, J., Räty, O., Räisänen, J., Hingray, B., Raynaud, D., Casado, M.J.,
483	Ramos, P., Zerenner, T., Turco, M., Bosshard, T., Štěpánek, P., Bartholy, J.,
484	Pongracz, R., Keller, D.E., Fischer, A.M., Cardoso, R.M., Soares, P.M.M.,
485	Czernecki, B., Pagé, C., 2019. An intercomparison of a large ensemble of statistical
486	downscaling methods over Europe: Results from the VALUE perfect predictor
487	cross-validation experiment. International Journal of Climatology 39, 3750–3785.
488	https://doi.org/10.1002/joc.5462
489	Haustein, K., Allen, M.R., Forster, P.M., Otto, F.E.L., Mitchell, D.M., Matthews, H.D.,
490	Frame, D.J., 2017. A real-time Global Warming Index. Sci Rep 7, 15417.
491	https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-017-14828-5
492	Hawkins, E., Ortega, P., Suckling, E., Schurer, A., Hegerl, G., Jones, P., Joshi, M.,
493	Osborn, T.J., Masson-Delmotte, V., Mignot, J., Thorne, P., Oldenborgh, G.J. van,
494	2017. Estimating Changes in Global Temperature since the Preindustrial Period.
495	Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society 98, 1841–1856.
496	https://doi.org/10.1175/BAMS-D-16-0007.1
497	Hawkins, E., Sutton, R., 2012. Time of emergence of climate signals. Geophysical
498	Research Letters 39. https://doi.org/10.1029/2011GL050087
499	Hock, R., 1999. A distributed temperature-index ice- and snowmelt model including
500	potential direct solar radiation. Journal of Glaciology 45, 101–111.
501	https://doi.org/10.3189/S0022143000003087
502	Huss, M., Hock, R., 2015. A new model for global glacier change and sea-level rise.
503	Frontiers in Earth Science 3.

504	Jiang, W., Gastineau, G., Codron, F., 2021. Multicentennial Variability Driven by Salinity
505	Exchanges Between the Atlantic and the Arctic Ocean in a Coupled Climate Model.
506	Journal of Advances in Modeling Earth Systems 13, e2020MS002366.
507	https://doi.org/10.1029/2020MS002366
508	Kaser, G., Großhauser, M., Marzeion, B., 2010. Contribution potential of glaciers to
509	water availability in different climate regimes. Proceedings of the National Academy
510	of Sciences 107, 20223–20227. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1008162107
511	Latombe, G., Burke, A., Vrac, M., Levavasseur, G., Dumas, C., Kageyama, M.,
512	Ramstein, G., 2018. Comparison of spatial downscaling methods of general
513	circulation model results to study climate variability during the Last Glacial
514	Maximum. Geoscientific Model Development 11, 2563–2579.
515	https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-11-2563-2018
516	Laurent, L., Buoncristiani, JF., Pohl, B., Zekollari, H., Farinotti, D., Huss, M., Mugnier,
517	JL., Pergaud, J., 2020. The impact of climate change and glacier mass loss on the
518	hydrology in the Mont-Blanc massif. Sci Rep 10, 10420.
519	https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-67379-7
520	Leclercq, P.W., Oerlemans, J., Basagic, H.J., Bushueva, I., Cook, A.J., Le Bris, R.,
521	2014. A data set of worldwide glacier length fluctuations. The Cryosphere 8, 659-
522	672. https://doi.org/10.5194/tc-8-659-2014
523	Li, C., Wang, Z., Zwiers, F., Zhang, X., 2021. Improving the Estimation of Human
524	Climate Influence by Selecting Appropriate Forcing Simulations. Geophysical
525	Research Letters 48, e2021GL095500. https://doi.org/10.1029/2021GL095500
526	Luo, M., Liu, T., Meng, F., Duan, Y., Frankl, A., Bao, A., De Maeyer, P., 2018.
527	Comparing Bias Correction Methods Used in Downscaling Precipitation and
528	Temperature from Regional Climate Models: A Case Study from the Kaidu River
529	Basin in Western China. Water 10, 1046. https://doi.org/10.3390/w10081046
530	Mann, M.E., Zhang, Z., Rutherford, S., Bradley, R.S., Hughes, M.K., Shindell, D.,
531	Ammann, C., Faluvegi, G., Ni, F., 2009. Global Signatures and Dynamical Origins
532	of the Little Ice Age and Medieval Climate Anomaly. Science 326, 1256–1260.
533	https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1177303
534	Marzeion, B., Cogley, J.G., Richter, K., Parkes, D., 2014. Attribution of global glacier
535	mass loss to anthropogenic and natural causes. Science 345, 919–921.
536	Marzeion, B., Hock, R., Anderson, B., Bliss, A., Champollion, N., Fujita, K., Huss, M.,
537	Immerzeel, W.W., Kraaijenbrink, P., Malles, JH., Maussion, F., Radić, V., Rounce,
538	D.R., Sakai, A., Shannon, S., van de Wal, R., Zekollari, H., 2020. Partitioning the
539	Uncertainty of Ensemble Projections of Global Glacier Mass Change. Earth's
540	Future 8, e2019EF001470. https://doi.org/10.1029/2019EF001470
541	Maussion, F., Butenko, A., Champollion, N., Dusch, M., Eis, J., Fourteau, K., Gregor, P.,
542	Jarosch, A.H., Landmann, J., Oesterle, F., Recinos, B., Rothenpieler, T., Vlug, A.,
543	Wild, C.T., Marzeion, B., 2019. The Open Global Glacier Model (OGGM) v1.1.

544 Geoscientific Model Development 12, 909–931. https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-12-545 909-2019 546 Milner, A.M., Khamis, K., Battin, T.J., Brittain, J.E., Barrand, N.E., Füreder, L., Cauvy-Fraunié, S., Gíslason, G.M., Jacobsen, D., Hannah, D.M., Hodson, A.J., Hood, E., 547 548 Lencioni, V., Ólafsson, J.S., Robinson, C.T., Tranter, M., Brown, L.E., 2017. Glacier 549 shrinkage driving global changes in downstream systems. Proceedings of the 550 National Academy of Sciences 114, 9770-9778. 551 https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1619807114 Myhre, G., Forster, P.M., Samset, B.H., Hodnebrog, Ø., Sillmann, J., Aalbergsjø, S.G., 552 553 Andrews, T., Boucher, O., Faluvegi, G., Fläschner, D., Iversen, T., Kasoar, M., 554 Kharin, V., Kirkevåg, A., Lamarque, J.-F., Olivié, D., Richardson, T.B., Shindell, D., 555 Shine, K.P., Stjern, C.W., Takemura, T., Voulgarakis, A., Zwiers, F., 2017. 556 PDRMIP: A Precipitation Driver and Response Model Intercomparison Project-557 Protocol and Preliminary Results. Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society 558 98, 1185–1198. https://doi.org/10.1175/BAMS-D-16-0019.1 559 Oerlemans, J., 2001. Glaciers and Climate Change. CRC Press. 560 Painter, T.H., Flanner, M.G., Kaser, G., Marzeion, B., VanCuren, R.A., Abdalati, W., 561 2013. End of the Little Ice Age in the Alps forced by industrial black carbon. Proc. 562 Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 110, 15216–15221. 563 https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1302570110 564 Panofsky, H. A., & Brier, G. W. (1968). Some applications of statistics to meteorology. Earth and Mineral Sciences Continuing Education, College of Earth and Mineral 565 566 Sciences 567 Parsons, L.A., Brennan, M.K., Wills, R.C.J., Proistosescu, C., 2020. Magnitudes and Spatial Patterns of Interdecadal Temperature Variability in CMIP6. Geophysical 568 569 Research Letters 47, e2019GL086588. https://doi.org/10.1029/2019GL086588 570 Piani, C., Haerter, J.O., 2012. Two dimensional bias correction of temperature and 571 precipitation copulas in climate models. Geophysical Research Letters 39. 572 https://doi.org/10.1029/2012GL053839 573 Protin, M., Schimmelpfennig, I., Mugnier, J.-L., Ravanel, L., Le Roy, M., Deline, P., 574 Favier, V., Buoncristiani, J.-F., Aumaître, G., Bourlès, D.L., Keddadouche, K., 2019. 575 Climatic reconstruction for the Younger Dryas/Early Holocene transition and the 576 Little Ice Age based on paleo-extents of Argentière glacier (French Alps). 577 Quaternary Science Reviews 221, 105863. 578 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2019.105863 Rabatel, A., Sanchez, O., Vincent, C., Six, D., 2018. Estimation of Glacier Thickness 579 580 From Surface Mass Balance and Ice Flow Velocities: A Case Study on Argentière 581 Glacier, France. Frontiers in Earth Science 6. 582 Reveillet, M., Dumont, M., Gascoin, S., Lafaysse, M., Nabat, P., Ribes, A., Nheili, R., Tuzet, F., Menegoz, M., Morin, S., Picard, G., Ginoux, P., 2021. Black carbon and 583

584	dust alter the response of mountain snowcover under climate change (preprint). In
585	Review. https://doi.org/10.21203/rs.3.rs-800501/v1
586	Ribes, A., Qasmi, S., Gillett, N., 2021. Updated attribution of GSAT changes and
587	implications EGU21-16112. https://doi.org/10.5194/egusphere-egu21-16112
588	Roe, G.H., Baker, M.B., Herla, F., 2017. Centennial glacier retreat as categorical
589	evidence of regional climate change. Nature Geosci 10, 95–99.
590	https://doi.org/10.1038/ngeo2863
591	Roe, G.H., Christian, J.E., Marzeion, B., 2021. On the attribution of industrial-era glacier
592	mass loss to anthropogenic climate change. The Cryosphere 15, 1889–1905.
593	https://doi.org/10.5194/tc-15-1889-2021
594	Six, D., Vincent, C., 2014. Sensitivity of mass balance and equilibrium-line altitude to
595	climate change in the French Alps. J. Glaciol. 60, 867–878.
596	https://doi.org/10.3189/2014JoG14J014
597	Vaittinada Ayar, P., Vrac, M., Mailhot, A., 2021. Ensemble bias correction of climate
598	simulations: preserving internal variability. Sci Rep 11, 3098.
599	https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-021-82715-1
600	Vernay, M., Lafaysse, M., Monteiro, D., Hagenmuller, P., Nheili, R., Samacoïts, R.,
601	Verfaillie, D., Morin, S., 2022. The S2M meteorological and snow cover reanalysis
602	over the French mountainous areas: description and evaluation (1958–2021). Earth
603	System Science Data 14, 1707–1733. https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-14-1707-2022
604	Vincent, C., Le Meur, E., Six, D., Funk, M., 2005. Solving the paradox of the end of the
605	Little Ice Age in the Alps. Geophysical Research Letters 32.
606	https://doi.org/10.1029/2005GL022552
607	Vincent, C., Peyaud, V., Laarman, O., Six, D., Gilbert, A., Gillet-Chaulet, F., Berthier, E.,
608	Morin, S., Verfaillie, D., Rabatel, A., Jourdain, B., Bolibar, J., 2019. Déclin des deux
609	plus grands glaciers des Alpes françaises au cours du XXI e siècle : Argentière et
610	Mer de Glace. La Météorologie.
611	Vincent, C., Soruco, A., Six, D., Meur, E.L., 2009. Glacier thickening and decay analysis
612	from 50 years of glaciological observations performed on Glacier d'Argentière, Mont
613	Blanc area, France. Annals of Glaciology 50, 73–79.
614	https://doi.org/10.3189/172756409787769500
615	Weertman, J., 1957. On the Sliding of Glaciers. Journal of Glaciology 3, 33–38.
616	https://doi.org/10.3189/S0022143000024709
047	