

Elemental effects on the oxidation of refractory compositionally complex alloys

Kai-Chi Lo, Hideyuki Murakami, Uwe Glatzel, Jien-Wei Yeh, Stéphane

Gorsse, An-Chou Yeh

► To cite this version:

Kai-Chi Lo, Hideyuki Murakami, Uwe Glatzel, Jien-Wei Yeh, Stéphane Gorsse, et al.. Elemental effects on the oxidation of refractory compositionally complex alloys. International Journal of Refractory Metals and Hard Materials, 2022, 108, pp.105918. 10.1016/j.ijrmhm.2022.105918. hal-03719376

HAL Id: hal-03719376 https://hal.science/hal-03719376

Submitted on 11 Jul2022

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

1	Elemental Effects on the Oxidation of Refractory
2	Compositionally Complex Alloys
3	Kai-Chi Lo ^{a, b*} , Hideyuki Murakami ^{c, d**} , Uwe Glatzel ^e , Jien-Wei Yeh ^{a, b} , Stéphane
4	Gorsse ^f , An-Chou Yeh ^{a, b***}
5	^a Department of Materials Science and Engineering, National Tsing Hua University,
6	101, Sec. 2, Kuang-Fu Road, Hsinchu, 300044, Taiwan, R. O. C.
7	^b High Entropy Materials Center, National Tsing Hua University, 101, Sec. 2,
8	Kuang-Fu Road, Hsinchu, 300044, Taiwan, R. O. C.
9	^c Research Center for Structural Materials, National Institute for Materials Science,
10	1-2-1 Sengen, Tsukuba, 305-0047, Japan.
11	^d Department of Nanoscience and Nanoengineering, Waseda University, 3-4-1 Okubo,
12	Shinjuku Tokyo, 169-8555, Japan.
13	^e Metals and Alloys, University of Bayreuth, ProfRüdiger-Bormann-Str. 1, 95447,
14	Bayreuth, Germany
15	^f Univ. Bordeaux, CNRS, Bordeaux INP, ICMCB, UMR 5026, F-33600 Pessac,
16	France
17	
18	*Corresponding author: <u>kaichi.lo@mx.nthu.edu.tw</u>
19	**Corresponding author: MURAKAMI.Hideyuki@nims.go.jp
20	***Corresponding author: yehac@mx.nthu.edu.tw
21	
22	Abstract
23	The oxidation of refractory compositionally complex alloys (RCCAs) is one of
24	the most critical subjects for their high temperature applications. In this work, several
25	RCCAs were systematically designed and isothermally oxidised at 1000 °C for up to
26	24 hours; the elemental effects of Al, Cr, Mo, Nb Ta, Ti, V, and Zr on the oxidation of
27	the RCCAs were studied. It was found that Al, Cr, Ti could enhance the oxidation
28	resistance of the RCCAs by promoting the formation of rutile-type AlTaO ₄ , CrTaO ₄ ,
29	and their related oxides, while Zr and V formed non-protective oxides such as
30	$Nb_2Zr_6O_{17}$, $Ta_2Zr_6O_{17}$, $ZrTiO_4$, and VTa_9O_{25} , resulting in severe internal oxidation.
31	Mo appeared to be effective in suppressing internal oxidation, but it could form
32	non-protective MoTiTa $_8O_{25}$. Ta was slightly more beneficial than Nb for reducing the
33	oxidation mass gain. This study provides insights on the elemental effects on the
34	oxidation and guidelines for improving the oxidation resistance of RCCAs.
35	

Keywords: Refractory alloys; Compositionally complex alloys; Oxidation.

38 1. Introduction

39 The development of materials for turbine engine is crucial for reducing fossil fuel 40 consumption and global warming, since the increase in operation temperature of 41 turbine engine can enhance its efficiency, potential materials with higher temperature 42 capability than that of superalloys are intensively studied. Nowadays, Ni-based 43 superalloys are widely used in the hottest sections of a gas turbine owing to their 44 outstanding mechanical properties and surface stability. However, the temperature 45 capability of the Ni-based superalloys has reached its limit due to the melting point of the solvent element Ni, which is 1455 °C. Therefore, developing new alloys with even 46 higher melting points than Ni-based superalloys is important. Recently, RCCAs have 47 been proposed as potential candidates for advanced high temperature applications. By 48 combining multiple refractory elements, such as W, Ta, Mo, Nb, etc., in similar 49 50 atomic ratio, RCCAs can exhibit extraordinary strength at extremely high temperature [1-7]. Although the high temperature strength of RCCAs is promising, they show poor 51 52 environmental resistance in general owing to the inability to form a protective oxide scale at high temperature. While an advanced Ni-based superalloy containing Al 53 54 content as low as 8.7 at% could possess excellent surface stability by forming a 55 protective Al₂O₃ scale [8-12], RCCAs do not show such property even with 20 at% of Al content [13-27]. One of the latest developments in enhancing the oxidation 56 57 resistance of RCCAs is attributed to the formation of CrTaO₄-based oxide scale, which has been studied at the temperature range of 900 to 1500 °C and up to 200 58 hours [20, 21, 23, 24, 28]; the formation of continuous CrTaO₄-based oxide scale 59 60 could decrease oxidation mass gain [21, 23], but the substrate beneath it still shows certain degree of internal oxidation, which is not observed in the Al₂O₃-forming 61 62 substrate [10, 11, 29-31]. Detailed examination on the internally oxidised region in the 63 CrTaO₄-based-oxide-forming substrate shows strong presence of nitrides in addition to oxides [20, 21, 23, 24], indicating such oxide scale might not stop nitrogen intake 64 65 and thus the nitridation of the substrate, which usually leads to its embrittlement [32]. 66 For an advanced Ni-based superalloy, the formation of a protective Al_2O_3 scale can be achieved by means of alloying, such as adding Al, Cr, and Si [33-36]. While the 67 alloying strategy for tuning the surface stability of Ni-based superalloys have already 68 been well-established, the alloying effects on oxidation behaviour for RCCAs is still 69 70 scarce. In this study, the oxidation behaviours of several RCCAs have been designed 71 and analysed with respect to compositions and thermodynamic simulation. The aim of this study is to provide an understanding on the compositional effects on the oxidation 72 73 of RCCAs and guidelines for designing oxidation-resistant RCCAs.

75 2. Material and methods

76 2.1 Alloy design

77 To have an overview of alloying strategy, the oxidation mass gain curves based 78 on literature data of several representative RCCAs and a Ni-based superalloy 79 CMSX-4 at 1000 °C were plotted and shown in Figure 1(a) [14, 16, 19, 20, 25, 26, 37-39]. The oxidation mass gain curves of RCCAs with short testing duration [25, 38] 80 or microalloying [18, 40] were not included. According to composition and mass gain, 81 82 these RCCAs could be divided into 3 groups: RCCAs with only Zr and other 83 non-protective-oxide-forming elements (black lines), RCCAs with both Al and Zr (red 84 lines), and RCCAs with Al but no Zr (blue lines).

The general trends deduced from Figure 1(a) indicate that the Al-bearing RCCAs 85 have reduced oxidation mass gain, while Zr-bearing RCCAs have increased oxidation 86 mass gain. In order to further elucidate the compositional effects of individual 87 88 elements on the oxidation behaviour of RCCAs, new compositions were designed based on quasi-binary technique in this work: Al content was fixed at 20 at%, while 89 90 the rest of the components were selected refractory elements combined in equi-molar 91 ratio. The Al content was specifically controlled since it was considered the reference 92 element for the formation of Al₂O₃. The deduction of compositional effects for a specific element was done by adding or removing that element from a mother 93 94 composition, then comparing the results of these two alloys. Figure 1(b) shows the compositions and designations of the new alloys. NbTaTiZr was the base alloy since 95 this composition contains frequently used elements for RCCAs [7, 41-46]. 96 Additionally, Al, Cr, Mo, V were selected since these elements are commonly used for 97 enhancing either the oxidation resistance [45-48] or mechanical properties [2, 4, 5, 41, 98 99 43, 44, 48-50] of RCCAs. New compositions that were investigated in order to elucidate elemental effects could be categorized into Group A, Group B and Group C. 100





Figure 1 (a) The oxidation mass gain curves or the terminal oxidation mass gain of
the selected RCCAs reported in the literature and (b) the flow chart for the design of
the studied RCCAs in this work.

106

107 2.2 Experimental procedures

108 The ingots of the alloys of interest shown in Figure 1(b) were prepared by 109 arc-melting high purity elements (> 99.9 wt%) under Ti-gettered pure argon atmosphere on a water-cooled copper hearth according to their nominal compositions. 110 111 The as-cast compositions of the ingots are listed in Table 1. Each button-shaped, 112 20-gram ingot was flipped and re-melted 4 times to ensure the chemical homogeneity. 113 The ingots had shiny surfaces and showed no sign of oxidation after the melting process. The ingots were subsequently electric-discharge-machined into $6 \times 5 \times 5$ mm 114 blocks of specimens. The top surfaces of all specimens were ground with #1200 SiC 115 abrasive paper prior to any subsequent tests. Isothermal oxidation was performed with 116 a muffle furnace at 1000 °C for various duration. The specimens were spaced 10 mm 117 apart from each other in an Al₂O₃ boat crucible and positioned into the furnace after 118 119 the furnace interior was heated to 1000 °C and furnace-cooled to ambient temperature 120 upon reaching the desired testing duration. At least 2 specimens were used per alloy 121 for the isothermal oxidation test to ensure the repeatability of the testing results. Here, 2-hour isothermal oxidation was mainly for observation on the cross-sectional 122 123 microstructure, while 24-hour isothermal oxidation was mainly for X-ray diffraction 124 (XRD) of the oxidised specimens, which was carried out with Bruker D2 Phaser 125 equipped with Cu target. Goniometer scanning was performed between $2\theta = 20^{\circ} \sim$ 100° with a scanning rate of 5.7° per minute. The oxide scales of the specimens were 126 127 either ground into fine powder (for specimens oxidised for 24 hours) or kept on the top surfaces of the specimens (for specimens oxidised for 2 hours) for XRD analysis. 128

Thermogravimetric analysis (TGA) was also carried out in flowing dry air at 1000 °C 129 130 for up to 2 hours with SETARAM TAG 24- 18S simultaneous symmetrical 131 thermoanalyser to investigate the oxidation kinetics of the studied RCCAs. Specimens for TGA had dimensions of $6 \times 3 \times 2 \text{ mm}^3$ with each surface ground with #1200 SiC 132 abrasive paper. Each specimen was carefully placed in a micro Al₂O₃ cylindrical 133 134 crucible to minimize its contact with the crucible, then the crucible with specimen was hung by a Pt wire vertically. The mass gain of the specimen was recorded 135 136 automatically every 0.02 minute up to 2 hours with an accuracy of 0.023 µg. Each tested TGA specimen was compared with that of isothermal oxidation tests to ensure 137 138 the consistency between the results. The mass of the tested TGA specimen itself and the total mass of the tested TGA specimen with the crucible were also measured to 139 140 evaluate the spallation of the specimens. The specimens were polished with 0.02 µm 141 colloidal silica prior to metallographic observation with a JEOL-JSM 7610F scanning 142 electron microscope (SEM) equipped with back-scattered electron (BSE) and 143 energy-dispersive X-ray spectroscopy (EDS) detectors. Image analysis for estimating the porosity of the external oxide scale was carried out with ImageJ software by 144 averaging the area fraction of the porosity in 3 random regions which covered over 145 $800 \ \mu m^2$ area each within the external oxide scale. 146

147

148 **Table 1**

149 Compositions (in at%) of the studied alloy samples determined by EDS.

Alloy	Al	Cr	Mo	Nb	Та	Ti	V	Zr
R0	-	-	-	24.9±0.6	27.1±1.4	22.8±1.2	-	25.3±1.2
R1	18.0±1.1	-	-	21.0±0.0	20.1±2.1	19.3±0.2	-	22.1±1.5
R1-Nb	19.0±0.8	-	-	-	25.6±2.3	25.7±0.5	-	29.8±1.5
R1-Ta	18.1±0.4	-	-	27.2±0.4	-	26.4±0.5	-	28.3±0.3
R1-Ti	19.3±0.9	-	-	24.0±0.8	24.9±0.2	-	-	31.8±0.1
R2	21.4±1.6	-	-	26.4±0.4	27.9±0.7	24.4±0.5	-	-
R2+Cr	19.5±0.0	19.5±0.4	-	20.2±0.1	21.4±0.4	19.5±0.3	-	-
R2+Mo	20.1±2.9	-	20.4±1.1	19.9±0.7	20.7±0.7	19.0±0.5	-	-
R2+V	18.7±0.4	-	-	20.9±0.3	22.2±0.4	19.0±0.2	19.2±0.1	-

150

151 **3. Results**

152 3.1 Microstructures prior oxidation

According to Figure 2(a), XRD analysis indicated that all alloys of interest in as-cast state have mainly body-centred-cubic (BCC) structure. Minor intermetallic phases, including C14 Laves and tetragonal Zr₂Al phases, are observed in R2+Cr and R1-Ti, respectively. Additionally, diffraction peaks from B2 phase are detected in
R1-Nb, R1-Ta, R2+Cr, R2+Mo, and R2+V, suggesting that chemical ordering may
occur in these alloys.

159 SEM microstructures are shown in Figure 2(b)~(j) and EDS analysis are 160 summarized in Table 2. It is evident that elements with high melting point, such as Ta, 161 Mo, and Nb, tend to segregate toward dendrite arms (Region 1, 3, 6, 8, 10, 13, 15, 18, 20), while those with relatively low melting points, such as Zr, Ti, and Al, prefer to 162 163 segregate toward inter-dendritic regions (Region 2, 4, 7, 9, 12, 14, 17, 19, 21). Region 11 in Table 2 shows an example of compositions in-between the dendrite arms and 164 165 inter-dendritic regions of R1-Ti. Further examination showed that in addition to the tetragonal Zr₂Al (Region 12) and C14 Laves phase (Region 16) detected by XRD, (Zr, 166 167 Al)-rich phase existed in the inter-dendritic regions of R1, Region 5. The low volume 168 fraction of such phase is likely the reason why it was not detected by XRD.





(b) (d) (c)1 2 1 6 7 4 .† 1 3 5 170 (f) (e)(g) † 13 1 10 î 9 † 12 1 8 **†** 11 1 14 171



Figure 2 (a) XRD patterns of all studied RCCAs and microstructural BSE images of
the as-cast (b) R0 (c) R1 (d) R1-Nb (e) R1-Ta (f) R1-Ti (g) R2 (h) R2+Cr (i) R2+Mo
(j) R2+V.

Table 2

178 Chemical compositions (in at%) of the indicated regions in Figure 2(b)~(j).

Region	Al	Cr	Mo	Nb	Та	Ti	V	Zr
1 (R0)	-	-	-	28.8±0.5	36.9±0.3	18.1±0.3	-	16.3±0.5
2 (R0)	-	-	-	24.0±1.3	20.6±2.6	23.4±1.0	-	32.1±3.0
3 (R1)	11.0±0.6	-	-	26.5±0.3	33.3±1.2	18.5±0.6	-	10.7±0.2
4 (R1)	26.4±0.2	-	-	12.0±1.9	6.0±2.2	19.4±1.0	-	36.3±3.8
5 (R1)	34.2±0.4	-	-	8.3±0.5	3.4±0.4	10.6±0.4	-	43.6±1.1
6 (R1-Nb)	12.2±0.6	-	-	-	44.5±0.1	26.7±0.3	-	16.7±0.2
7 (R1-Nb)	22.5±0.2	-	-	-	14.8±1.0	25.2±0.0	-	37.6±0.8
8 (R1-Ta)	16.9±0.9	-	-	30.1±0.9	-	27.0±0.8	-	26.0±0.7
9 (R1-Ta)	18.1±0.4	-	-	27.2±0.4	-	26.4±0.5	-	28.3±0.3
10 (R1-Ti)	8.1±0.3	-	-	35.3±0.3	46.4±0.3	-	-	10.3±0.5
11 (R1-Ti)	24.0±1.7	-	-	21.5±1.7	11.4±2.4	-	-	43.0±3.9
12 (R1-Ti)	35.3±0.4	-	-	13.0±0.5	5.7±0.0	-	-	46.0±0.5
13 (R2)	18.6±0.4	-	-	27.1±0.0	33.7±0.8	20.6±0.7	-	-
14 (R2)	21.7±1.1	-	-	26.4±0.3	26.6±2.1	25.5±1.1	-	-
15 (R2+Cr)	16.1±0.0	13.4±0.1	-	23.4±0.6	31.1±0.2	16.0±0.3	-	-
16 (R2+Cr)	19.4±0.3	33.8±2.1	-	15.4±0.6	15.3±0.9	16.3±1.7	-	-
17 (R2+Cr)	24.4±1.0	13.3±2.5	-	20.4±1.1	12.4±2.0	29.5±2.9	-	-
18 (R2+Mo)	11.5±1.9	-	24.8±1.0	20.6±0.2	28.8±2.1	14.3±1.2	-	-
19 (R2+Mo)	22.3±2.1	-	17.6±1.4	20.7±0.4	15.6±2.1	23.8±1.7	-	-
20 (R2+V)	17.8±0.2	-	-	21.0±0.2	25.5±0.7	17.4±0.5	18.4±0.3	-
21 (R2+V)	19.7±0.2	-	-	20.5±0.2	19.0±0.8	20.8±0.3	20.0±0.3	-

180 3.2 *Thermogravimetric analysis*

181 Figure 3 illustrates the oxidation kinetics of the studied RCCAs at 1000 °C for up to 2 hours. The TGA for R1-Ti and R2+V was waived owing to heavy oxidation or 182 183 contamination of these alloys that could damage the instrument. The oxidation mass 184 gain after 2 hours of isothermal oxidation at 1000 °C was 33.4, 19.3, 17.0, 12.2, 5.7, 1.8, and 1.0 mg/cm² for R0, R1-Ta, R1-Nb, R1, R2, R2+Mo, and R2+Cr, respectively. 185 All tested RCCAs showed no noticeable spallation, except R0 had spallation from the 186 extruding oxide formed along the corners of the specimen. But since the 187 188 metallographic observation was carried out at the flat surfaces of the specimen, such 189 spallation is not expected to affect the observation and measurement in the following 190 sections.



191

192 Figure 3 Oxidation mass gain curves of the studied RCCAs measured at 1000 °C for
193 120 minutes.

194

195 3.3 Oxidation: R0 and R1 alloys (Group A)

Comparing XRD results of both R0 and R1 after 2 and 24 hours of isothermal 196 oxidation at 1000 °C, all conditions appeared to render the same oxide products, 197 198 Figure 4(a). Based on the relative intensity of the diffraction peaks, the main oxide 199 product for R0 was TiNb₂O₇, while that for R1 were (Al_{0.2}Nb_{0.2}Ti_{0.6})O₂ and Nb₂Zr₆O₁₇ under both oxidation condition. Ta₂O₅ was also found in both alloys, while TiO₂ and 200 AlNbO₄ were identified in R0 and R1, respectively. Figure 4(b)(c) and Table 3 show 201 202 both alloys were oxidised prominently in the manner of internal oxidation since the 203 morphology and chemical profile of the metallic substrate were preserved within the 204 oxidised region, while no obvious external oxide scale was observed. Interestingly, the scales of the oxidised regions were significantly different between these alloys: 205 The thickness of internal oxidation region (t_{IO}) was ~358 µm for R0, which was over 206 twice as large as ~168 μ m t_{IO} of R1, Figure 4(b)(c). 207



Figure 4 (a) XRD patterns of R0 and R1 after 2 and 24 hours of isothermal oxidation
and cross-sectional BSE images of (b) R0 and (c) R1 after 2 hours isothermal
oxidation at 1000 °C. The red lines in (b)(c) represent t_{IO}.

50 µm

213

214 **Table 3**

215 Chemical compositions (in at%) of the indicated regions in Figure 4(b)(c). Region 1,

216 3 and 2, 4 are respectively the oxidised dendrite arms and inter-dendritic regions of

Region	0	Al	Nb	Та	Ti	Zr
1 (R0)	66.8±0.9	-	8.9±0.4	10.5±0.5	7.2 ± 0.7	6.6 ± 0.2
2 (R0)	69.1±0.5	-	7.7±0.6	6.6±0.6	$7.0{\pm}0.8$	9.6±0.8
3 (R1)	67.1±0.5	3.0±0.5	8.4±0.6	11.0±1.2	5.3±0.4	5.2±1.5
4 (R1)	61.8±1.5	8.4±0.8	6.0±0.7	4.7±1.0	7.5±1.0	11.6±1.5

217 Group A alloys.

218

219 3.4 Oxidation: R1-Nb, R1-Ta, R1-Ti, and R2 alloys (Group B)

Similar to that of R0 and R1, XRD analysis suggested that oxide products
appeared to be the same after 2 and 24 hours of isothermal oxidation at 1000 °C for

9

50 µm

222 R1-Nb, R1-Ta, R1-Ti, and R2, Figure 5(a). It is noteworthy that rutile-type oxides, such as AlTaO₄, were absent in the oxide scale of R1-Ti, which was thoroughly 223 224 oxidised without any metallic part left after 24 hours of isothermal oxidation at 1000 225 °C. For R1-Nb, diffraction peaks of AlTaO₄ and Ta₂O₅ were prominent, while that of 226 Ta₂Zr₆O₁₇ and ZrTiO₄ were also identified; for R1-Ta, TiO₂ and Nb₂Zr₆O₁₇ exhibited 227 the highest diffraction peaks, while that of Nb₂O₅ and AlNbO₄ were also present. For R1-Ti, Nb₂Zr₆O₁₇ was the dominant oxide since its diffraction peaks were the highest 228 229 among all other detected oxides. TiO₂ and Ta₂O₅ were found with high diffraction 230 intensity for the oxide scale of R2, while Ti₂Nb₁₀O₂₉ was also observed.

231 Cross-sectional SEM-EDS analysis revealed R2 was the least oxidized, while 232 R1-Ti was the most affected by oxidation at 1000 $^{\circ}$ C, Figure 5(b)~(e) and Table 4. Furthermore, Zr-containing alloys, such as R1-Nb, R1-Ta, and R1-Ti, were mainly 233 234 oxidised internally while R2 showed a visible external oxidation scale and greatly 235 reduced internal oxidation region, Figure 5(b)~(e). This could be confirmed by the strong correlation of chemical profiles between the metallic substrates and oxidised 236 237 regions for R1-Nb, R1-Ta, and R1-Ti, as well as the Ti-lean external oxide scale 238 comparing to the composition of the metallic substrate for R2, Table 2 and 4.



239







Figure 5 (a) XRD patterns of R1-Nb, R1-Ta, R1-Ti, and R2 after 2 and 24 hours of isothermal oxidation and cross-sectional BSE images of (b) R1-Nb (c) R1-Ta (d) R1-Ti (e) R2 after 2 hours of isothermal oxidation at 1000 °C. The yellow line in (e) marks the thickness of external oxide scale (t_{EO}) while red lines in (b)~(e) mark t_{IO} . The width of the cracks (magenta arrowheads in (c)(d)) was excluded during the thickness measurement.

249 **Table 4**

Chemical compositions (in at%) of the indicated regions in Figure 5(b)~(e). Region 1,
3, 5 and 2, 4, 7 are respectively the oxidised dendrite arms and inter-dendritic regions
of R1-Nb, R1-Ta, and R1-Ti, while Region 6 and 8 are respectively the oxidised
inter-diffusion zone of R1-Ti and the external oxide scale of R2.

Region	0	Al	Nb	Ta	Ti	Zr
1 (R1-Nb)	48.7±2.4	5.4 ± 0.7	-	25.9±2.3	12.5±0.6	7.4 ± 0.4
2 (R1-Nb)	61.2±1.6	9.2±0.9	-	5.9±1.6	9.2±1.4	14.4±0.9
3 (R1-Ta)	55.8±1.4	8.5±0.5	13.0±1.2	-	11.1±0.2	11.5±0.3
4 (R1-Ta)	57.5±2.2	8.7±0.4	9.9±2.0	-	9.2±1.6	14.8±1.7
5 (R1-Ti)	68.9±0.1	0.7±0.3	11.2±0.2	15.8±0.2	-	3.4±0.1
6 (R1-Ti)	65.0±0.4	8.5±0.5	7.0±0.3	4.5±0.4	-	15.0±0.5
7 (R1-Ti)	62.4±1.6	12.9±1.3	4.2±1.0	1.8 ± 0.7	-	18.8±1.3
8 (R2)	68.5 ± 0.7	6.9±1.1	9.1±0.8	10.2±0.9	5.3±0.5	-

254

255 3.5 Oxidation: R2+Cr, R2+Mo, and R2+V alloys (Group C)

256 XRD analysis indicated that R2+Mo formed MoTaTi₈O₂₅, AlTiTaO₆, and 257 AlNbO₄ after both 2 and 24 hours of isothermal oxidation, while the oxides observed 258 in R2+Cr and R2+V were slightly different under these oxidation conditions, Figure 259 6(a). For R2+Cr, diffraction peaks of AlTaO₄ were pronounced under both conditions, 260 while that of Ta₂O₅ were only found after 2 hours of isothermal oxidation. In the case of R2+V, only the diffraction peaks from AlNbO₄ were identified after 2 hours, while that of VTa_9O_{25} and AlTaTiO₆ were detected after 24 hours of isothermal oxidation.

263 Cross-sectional SEM-EDS analysis showed all alloys in this group formed 264 external oxide scale within 2 hours at 1000 °C, Figure 6(b)(d)(f) and Table 5. In 265 addition to minor Al-rich oxide (Region 1) and Ta₂O₅ (Region 2), the external oxide scale of R2+Cr contained AlTaO₄ (Region 3) with CrTaO₄ dispersion (Region 4) and 266 it was ~14 μ m in thickness, which was the thinnest t_{EO} in this group. The external 267 268 oxide scale of R2+Mo was ~48 µm thick and mainly composed of AlTiTaO₆ (Region 5) and MoTiTa₈O₂₅ (Region 6), while that of R2+V was 267 µm thick and consisted 269 270 of AlNbO₄ (Region 7), VTa₉O₂₅ (Region 8), and AlTiTaO₆ (Region 9), Figure 6(c)(e)(g). In terms of internal oxidation, R2+Mo showed only ~4 µm of t_{IO}, which 271 272 was the thinnest t_{IO} in all studied alloys.



273



276



Figure 6 (a) XRD patterns of R2+Cr, R2+Mo, and R2+V after 2 and 24 hours of isothermal oxidation and cross-sectional BSE images of (b)(c) R2+Cr (d)(e) R2+Mo (f)(g) R2+V after 2 hours of isothermal oxidation at 1000 °C. The yellow and red lines in (b)(d)(f) respectively mark t_{EO} and t_{IO} , while the magenta arrowheads in (d)~(g) indicate the pores caused by evaporation of volatile oxides in the external oxide scale.

283 **Table 5**

284 Chemical compositions (in at%) of the indicated regions in Figure 6(c)(e)(g).

Region	0	Al	Cr	Mo	Nb	Та	Ti	V
1 (R2+Cr)	69.9±1.9	13.7±1.6	6.5±0.6	-	1.5±0.2	1.0±0.2	7.3±1.7	-
2 (R2+Cr)	69.4±0.3	5.4±0.5	1.3±0.0	-	8.8±0.2	9.3±0.3	5.8±0.5	-
3 (R2+Cr)	67.1±0.9	6.9±0.7	6.2±0.5	-	6.6±0.4	7.4±0.2	5.8±0.3	-
4 (R2+Cr)	66.1±1.1	7.0±0.3	8.7±0.8	-	6.1±0.4	7.9±0.6	4.3±0.6	-
5 (R2+Mo)	65.9±0.6	12.6±0.7	-	0.5±0.2	7.5±0.9	6.3±0.4	7.1±1.3	-
6 (R2+Mo)	69.0±0.8	3.9±1.0	-	2.8±0.5	10.6±0.8	9.7±0.6	4.0±0.7	-
7 (R2+V)	58.5±5.0	14.1±1.1	-	-	10.1±1.3	6.9±1.0	6.7±1.1	3.8±0.7
8 (R2+V)	66.7±2.4	0.4±0.3	-	-	15.0±1.7	12.0±0.7	1.9±0.2	4.0±0.5
9 (R2+V)	62.1±1.6	9.8±0.4	-	-	4.8±0.3	7.4±0.2	10.8±0.9	5.2±0.8

286 4. Discussion

Experimental results suggest that TGA and the total thickness of 287 288 oxidation-affected region ($t_0 = t_{EO} + t_{IO}$) measurement generally show good 289 agreement with each other, Figure 3 and 7. The addition of Al decreases, while Zr 290 addition could increase both oxidation mass gain and t_0 in this work. For Group A, t_0 291 of R1 was 53 % thinner and oxidation mass gain was 63 % lower than that of R0 following Al addition; for Group B, to of R2 was 53 % thinner and oxidation mass 292 293 gain was 53 % lower than that of the other Zr-bearing RCCAs following the removal 294 of Zr. Furthermore, the results suggest that Ti might be crucial for the oxidation 295 resistance of RCCAs since R1-Ti, which was the only Ti-free RCCA in this study, thoroughly oxidised with no metallic part left after 24 hours of isothermal oxidation at 296 297 1000 °C. The results of R2+Mo and R2+V further reveal that Mo addition might 298 suppress internal oxidation but form an external oxide scale with porosity, while V 299 addition was clearly devastating for oxidation resistance. Cr addition appeared to greatly improve oxidation resistance since R2+Cr showed the lowest oxidation mass 300 301 gain and t_O among all studied alloys. The oxides observed in the present study rarely possessed simple compositions, such as Al₂O₃ and Cr₂O₃. Since current understanding 302 303 on the properties of these complex oxides is still strictly limited, it is important to 304 examine and deduce the characteristics of these oxides that could be important for 305 future alloy design.



Figure 7 t_{EO} , t_{IO} , and t_O of the studied RCCAs after 2 hours of isothermal oxidation at 1000 °C.

- 309
- 310 4.1 The effects of Al, Cr, Nb, Ta, and Ti addition

311 Traditionally, the surface stability of an alloy can be related to the formation of a continuous and protective oxide scale [8, 33, 34], which can be achieved by alloying 312 with protective-oxide-forming elements or modified matrix properties, such as the 313 oxygen solubility [8, 33, 51]. For Al and Cr, both elements are frequently added to 314 enhance oxidation resistance, since Al_2O_3 and Cr_2O_3 scales have been proven to be 315 316 effective barriers [34]. However, in the present study, both protective oxide scales 317 were not observed. Instead, rutile-type Al- and Cr- bearing complex oxides, such as AlTaO₄ and CrTaO₄ or their related oxides, were observed in most of the studied 318 319 alloys.

320 Despite the absence of Al_2O_3 and Cr_2O_3 , these complex oxides seem to provide 321 reasonable protection against oxidation, especially in the case of R2+Cr, since it 322 formed a continuous rutile-type complex oxide scale, Figure 6 and 7. The prominent 323 peak intensity of rutile-type (Al_{0.2}Nb_{0.2}Ti_{0.6})O₂ for R1 also corresponded with its 324 greatly reduced t_0 and oxidation mass gain comparing to R0, Figure 4(a) and 7. This 325 observation agrees with that observed in previous literatures [20, 21, 23, 24], in which 326 the formation of rutile-type CrTaO₄-based oxide could improve the oxidation 327 resistance of RCCAs. It is also proposed that while Cr addition could promote 328 formation of rutile-type oxides such as CrNbO₄ and CrTaO₄, the formation of CrTaO₄ 329 would be more favourable than that of CrNbO₄ owing to its more negative formation 330 free energy [21]. But since other factors, such as the kinetics of oxide growth and 331 oxygen permeability of the oxide, are also essential for the formation of a protective 332 oxide layer, whether CrTaO₄ is preferable to CrNbO₄ as the protective oxide layer 333 requires further study to be clarified.

334 Interestingly, while the oxidation of R1-Nb and R1-Ta showed no noticeable difference in terms of t_{EO} , t_{IO} , and t_O , the mass gain of R1-Nb was 2.3 mg/cm² lower 335 than that of R1-Ta after isothermally oxidised at 1000 °C for 2 hours, Figure 3 and 7. 336 It appears that the Ta-rich dendrite arms in R1-Nb had reduced oxygen intake, while 337 338 its interdendritic regions had similar oxygen intake comparing to that of the dendrite 339 arms and interdendritic regions of R1-Ta, Table 4. Given both RCCAs had similar to, 340 R1-Nb would ingest less oxygen and thus have lower oxidation mass gain than R1-Ta. 341 While Ta and Nb are usually considered similar in terms of their chemical properties 342 owing to their adjacent locations in the Periodic Table, Ta was found to have more 343 pronounced effect on reducing the oxidation mass gain of TiAl-based intermetallics at 1000 °C comparing to Nb by decreasing the diffusion rate of oxygen [52]. These 344

observations suggest that the addition of Ta could be slightly superior to Nb in termsof oxidation resistance.

347 Furthermore, it appears that the formation of rutile-type oxides, including TiO₂, 348 AlTaO₄, CrTaO₄ and their related oxides is generally beneficial for oxidation 349 resistance since R1-Ti did not form rutile-type oxide and was severely oxidised within 350 2 hours at 1000 °C. While the positive effects of rutile-type oxides have been reported previously [20, 21, 23, 24, 53-56], the origin for the formation of the rutile-type 351 352 oxides remains an intriguing subject for further investigation. TiO₂ is one of the most 353 common oxides that possesses rutile-type crystal structure; when more than 2 354 refractory elements are co-oxidised, Ti can also be solutioned in rutile-type complex oxides [20, 24]. While Al and Ta can form rutile-type AlTaO₄ when their oxides react 355 356 with each other [57], rutile-type oxide was not detected in the oxide scale of R1-Ti. 357 Therefore, the presence of Ti could benefit the oxidation resistance of RCCAs by 358 promoting the formation of rutile-type oxide.

359

360 4.2 *The effects of Mo addition*

Since MoO₃ would sublimate at 800 °C and above [58], the oxidation of Mo is 361 362 definitely not the reason behind the reduced to of R2+Mo. Since R2+Mo showed the 363 thinnest t_{IO} among all tested RCCAs in the present study, it could be postulated that the internal oxidation was suppressed due to the presence of Mo. Considering a binary 364 alloy system M-Al, in which M is an oxygen-soluble arbitrary metal nobler than Al 365 and Al is a dilute solute. Here, if Al₂O₃ is thermodynamically very stable and the 366 diffusivity of Al is significantly lower than that of oxygen, the time (t) dependency for 367 368 the depth of internal oxidation (ξ) of such alloy can be described as [8]:

369
$$\xi(t) \propto \sqrt{N_0^{(s)}t}$$
.....(1)

In which $N_0^{(s)}$ is the oxygen solubility of the alloy substrate. Such relationship 370 indicates that reduced $N_0^{(s)}$ would suppress internal oxidation. Generally, the internal 371 oxidation is not desirable for the oxidation resistance of an alloy since the protective 372 373 oxide scale is formed via external oxidation. Upon the formation of a continuous external oxide scale, it could act as a barrier and retard the oxidation of the alloy. 374 375 Although the capabilities of such barrier depend on several factors, such as its 376 integrity, gas permeability, and gas diffusivity, the formation of an external oxide 377 scale and reduced internal oxidation are beneficial for the oxidation resistance of the 378 alloy. Previous study suggested Mo possesses extremely low oxygen and nitrogen solubility as pure element [16] and it could improve the surface stability of 379 380 TiAl-based alloys by decreasing the solubility of oxygen and nitrogen in the alloy substrate [59, 60]. Consequently, the reduced internal oxidation of R2+Mo might 381

result from the decreased $N_{0}^{(s)}$ caused by Mo addition. On the other hand, the 382 external oxide scale of R2+Mo was relatively thick and full of rounded pores 383 384 comparing to that of R2+Cr, indicating the former oxidised more severely than the 385 later and might suffer from the formation and evaporation of volatile oxides, Figure 6. The area fraction of the rounded pores was estimated to be 2.4 % according to the 386 image analysis. Since R2+Mo contains 20 at% of Mo, it is possible that volatile 387 oxides, such as MoO₃, would form during the isothermal oxidation at 1000 °C. 388 Furthermore, the tetragonal MoTiTa₈O₂₅ was present in the oxide scale of R2+Mo 389 390 alloy. Despite its presence was mentioned in the oxidation of CrMo_{0.5}NbTa_{0.5}TiZr [47], 391 no further description regarding to its properties was discussed. In this work, the formation of MoTiTa₈O₂₅ could result from a reaction among MoO₃, TiO₂, and Ta₂O₅ 392 393 in Ta₂O₅-rich environment:

394

$MoO_3 + TiO_2 + 4Ta_2O_5 = MoTiTa_8O_{25}$(2)

395 Since MoTiTa₈O₂₅ is largely preserved while MoO₃ is not found in the oxide scale of R2+Mo after the isothermal oxidation at 1000 °C, the thermal stability of 396 397 MoTiTa₈O₂₅ should be superior to that of MoO₃. It appears that MoTiTa₈O₂₅ prevented heavy evaporation of MoO₃ by forming an external oxide scale since there 398 399 was no obvious MoO₃ residue in the crucible after the oxidation test. Therefore, the 400 oxidation mass loss caused by MoO₃ in the present study could be neglectable at least up to 2 hours of isothermal oxidation at 1000 °C. But considering the relatively thick 401 oxide scale of R2+Mo comparing with that of R2+Cr, such oxide is not likely to be an 402 403 efficient oxygen barrier. These could be the reasons why R2+Mo has thicker and more porous external oxide scale comparing to that of R2+Cr. 404

405

406 4.3 *The effects of Zr and V addition*

According to the oxidation behaviours of Zr- and V-bearing RCCAs, it appears 407 that both alloying additions were detrimental since they are associated with large 408 oxidation mass gain or to for RCCAs, Figure 1 and 7. While Zr is a common 409 410 constituent in ductile RCCAs [41, 42, 44, 45, 61], ZrO₂, which is a common form of 411 Zr-related oxide, is known for its detrimental effects due to its polymorphism properties across a wide range of temperature [62, 63]. However, since ZrO₂ was not 412 detected in this work, its role on oxidation might not be so direct. Alternatively, ZrO₂ 413 could react with other refractory oxides, such as TiO₂ and Nb₂O₅, to form complex 414 415 refractory oxides, such as ZrTiO₄ [63-66] and Nb₂Zr₆O₁₇ [37]. Interestingly, Ta₂Zr₆O₁₇ 416 was additionally found in the present study, presumably it was formed due to a 417 reaction between ZrO_2 and Ta_2O_5 . Despite there has been no literature specifically 418 describing the properties of these Zr-related complex refractory oxides, it is not likely that these oxides are protective against oxidation since these Zr-bearing alloys show 419

420 poor oxidation resistance [37, 63]. RCCAs containing Zr as main constituent could suffer from heavy internal oxidation owing to the high affinity and solubility with 421 oxygen and nitrogen of Zr [67], which agrees with the observation in the present study, 422 423 Figure 3 and 7. On the other hand, although V has high solubility for oxygen [67, 68], 424 V_2O_5 could melt and become volatile at above 690 °C [69]. In this work, the Al₂O₃ 425 crucible used as the container for R2+V was heavily contaminated after the 24 hours of isothermal oxidation at 1000 °C. Along with large pores shown in Figure 6, which 426 427 were 8.2 % in area fraction within the oxide scale of R2+V, it is reasonable to assume 428 that the formation and melting of V_2O_5 occurred during the test. Another noticeable 429 V-related oxide found in R2+V was the tetragonal VTa₉O₂₅, which has not been reported in the literature regarding to the oxidation of RCCAs. While its impact on the 430 surface stability of RCCAs is unknown, it has been suggested that VTa₉O₂₅ is a stable 431 oxide at the Ta₂O₅-rich end of V₂O₅-Ta₂O₅ quasi-binary phase diagram and it could 432 433 melt at around 1800 °C [70]. Therefore, it is likely that some of the V_2O_5 reacted with 434 Ta₂O₅ and formed VTa₉O₂₅ instead of melting away during the oxidation of R2+V at 435 1000 °C via the following reaction:

436

$$1/2 V_2 O_5 + 9/2 T a_2 O_5 = V T a_9 O_{25} \dots \dots (3)$$

437 Since VTa_9O_{25} possesses much higher melting point than that of V_2O_5 , the 438 formation of VTa_9O_{25} might be less harmful to the surface stability of RCCAs than 439 that of V_2O_5 .

440

441 4.4 *The characteristics of complex oxides*

The other group of complex oxides identified in this work includes AlNbO₄, 442 443 TiNb₂O₇, and Ti₂Nb₁₀O₂₉. In previous studies, these oxides were found when Nb content was high enough to reach its solubility limits in TiO₂ for TiAl-based alloys 444 [71, 72] or when Nb₂O₅ could react with Al_2O_3 in Nb-based alloys [56, 73]. 445 Interestingly, the effects of these oxide on the surface stability of the reported alloys 446 447 can be either positive or negative. For TiAl-based alloys, the formation of TiNb₂O₇ 448 could deteriorate oxidation resistance by interrupting the Nb-doped TiO₂ scale, which 449 could have assisted the formation of a continuous Al_2O_3 scale [71, 72]; on the other hand, the formation of AlNbO₄ could enhance oxidation resistance of Nb-based alloys 450 by increasing the integrity of the oxide scale [56]. While the role of $Ti_2Nb_{10}O_{29}$ on the 451 452 surface stability has not been specifically described in the literature, it is frequently 453 found in the oxide scale of Ti-bearing and Nb-based alloys and could decompose into 454 $TiNb_2O_7$ [74, 75]. It is evident that these oxides would not be effective oxygen 455 barriers comparing to Al₂O₃, Nb-doped TiO₂, or rutile-type oxide like CrNbO₄ [71, 72, 456 76]. Therefore, the formation of these oxides should be avoided when designing RCCAs that form protective oxide scale at high temperature, and this could be 457

458 achieved by limiting Nb content in RCCAs.

459 Multiple complex refractory oxides have been observed instead of simple 460 oxides, such as Al₂O₃ and ZrO₂, in the present study. Here, the simple oxides might 461 react with each other and form complex oxides rather than existing independently, or 462 the complex oxides were directly formed as the stable oxides in the studied system. In 463 both cases, the formation free energy of the complex oxides could be more negative than that of the simple oxides. However, such data cannot be retrieved from current 464 thermodynamic databases despite they do contain the constituents of the present 465 alloys. This is because these databases have been developed for a particular alloy 466 467 family, so each database can only accurately describe the corner region of the phase diagram containing the main element. Although thermodynamic databases dedicated 468 to high entropy alloys has been intensively developed, they currently contain a very 469 limited number of assessed ternaries with oxygen. Still, the TCOX11 database for 470 471 Thermo-Calc Software dedicated to the thermodynamic simulation of oxides allows the clarification to the formation of the intermediate oxide ZrTiO₄ in Ti-O-Zr bearing 472 alloys. As shown in Figure 8, three ternary oxides adjacent to both phase fields with 473 ZrO₂ and TiO₂ exist with different stability range. Above 1150 °C, the disordered 474 475 \Box -Zr_xTi_{1-x}O₄ crystallizes in an orthorhombic structure. At lower temperatures, it 476 undergoes two ordering transitions to α -ZrTiO₄, and α '-ZrTiO₄ below 1050 °C. This could help explaining the presence of $ZrTiO_4$ in the oxide layer of some (Zr, 477 478 Ti)-bearing alloys [63, 65, 66], including R1-Nb in this study.

479 In summary, the content of Al, Cr, and Ti in RCCAs could benefit the oxidation resistance by forming rutile-type complex oxides, while Zr and V contents could 480 deteriorate surface stability by forming non-protective oxides and enhancing internal 481 oxidation; Mo addition could greatly suppress internal oxidation of the substrate, but 482 483 the formation of non-protective MoTiTa₈O₂₅ might lead to reduced resistance against 484 oxidation; Ta addition could be slightly more beneficial than Nb addition in terms of oxidation resistance owing to reduced oxygen intake of the alloy bulk. The properties 485 486 and the parent alloys of the observed oxides in the present study are summarized in 487 Table 6. The formation of oxides and their growth kinetics are heavily composition dependent, thus changing the alloying amount of each element could lead to different 488 oxidation kinetics. These results and discussions present in this article could provide 489 490 guidelines for the design of RCCA with improved oxidation resistance in the future.





492 Figure 8 ZrO₂-TiO₂ ternary phase diagram calculated with Thermo-Calc Software
493 equipped with TCOX11 database.

495 **Table 6**

496 The constituents, crystal structures, and the parent alloys of the observed oxides in497 this work.

Element	Combination	Oxide	Crystal Structure	Alloy(s)
				R1
		AlNbO ₄		R1-Ta
	Nb		Monoclinic	R1-Ti
				R2+Mo
4.1				R2+V
AI	Та	AlTaO ₄	Tetragonal (rutile)	R2+Cr
	Nb, Ti	$(Al_{0.2}Nb_{0.2}Ti_{0.6})O_2$	Tetragonal (rutile)	R 1
				R1-Nb
	Ta, Ti	AlTaTiO ₆	Tetragonal (rutile)	R2+Mo
				R2+V
Cr	Та	CrTaO ₄	Tetragonal (rutile)	R2+Cr
Мо	Ta, Ti	MoTiTa ₈ O ₂₅	Tetragonal	R2+Mo
V	Та	VTa ₉ O ₂₅	Tetragonal	R2+V
				R1
Zr	Nb	$Nb_2Zr_6O_{17}$	Orthorhombic	R1-Ta
				R1-Ti

	Та	$Ta_2Zr_6O_{17}$	Orthorhombic	R1-Nb	
	Ti	ZrTiO ₄	Orthorhombic	R1-Nb	
	T	TiNb ₂ O ₇	Moncolinio	R0	
Nb	11	$Ti_2Nb_{10}O_{29}$	Wionochine	R2	
	-	Nb ₂ O ₅	Monoclinic	R1-Ta	
	-			R0	
				R1	
To		TacO	Orthorhombia	R1-Nb	
Ia		18205	Ormonionoic	R1-Ti	
				R2	
				R2+Cr	
				R0	
Ti	-	TiO_2	Tetragonal (rutile)	R1-Ta	
					R2

499 **5.** Conclusions

Several RCCAs have been designed by systematic change in composition with 500 501 respect to Al, Cr, Mo, Nb, Ta, Ti, V, Zr and subjected to isothermal oxidation for up to 502 24 hours at 1000 °C in order to examine the effects of the individual elements on oxidation. It is found that the addition of Al, Cr, and Ti could benefit the oxidation 503 resistance by forming rutile-type complex oxides instead of their individual oxides, 504 505 while the addition of Zr and V degraded the oxidation resistance by forming non-protective oxides or promoting internal oxidation. Mo addition appeared to 506 suppress the internal oxidation, yet the formation of non-protective MoTiTa₈O₂₅ might 507 undermine the surface stability. Ta addition showed slightly reduced oxidation mass 508 509 gain comparing with Nb addition owing to the reduced oxygen intake of the alloy 510 bulk in the present study. This work has presented the effects of multiple elements on 511 the oxidation of RCCAs and their associated oxides formation, and it may provide 512 guidelines to design future RCCAs with enhanced oxidation resistance.

513

514 Declaration of Competing Interest

515 The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal 516 relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

517

518 Acknowledgements

519 This work was financially supported by the "High Entropy Materials Centre" 520 from The Featured Areas Research Centre Program within the framework of the

Higher Education Sprout Project by the Ministry of Education (MOE) and from the 521 522 Project MOST107-2923-E-007-010-MY3, MOST109-2221-E-007-057, MOST110-2634-F-007-024, 523 MOST110-2224-E-007-001, 524 MOST110-2221-E-007-020-MY3 by Ministry of Science and Technology (MOST) in 525 gratefully acknowledge the support by the Deutsche Taiwan. UG Forschungsgemeinschaft through the Priority Programme SPP 2006 "Compositionally 526 527 Complex Alloys - High Entropy Alloys (CCA - HEA)". SG gratefully acknowledge 528 the support by the CNRS through the 80 PRIME programme.

529

530 **References**

[1] O.N. Senkov, G.B. Wilks, D.B. Miracle, C.P. Chuang, P.K. Liaw, Refractory
high-entropy alloys, Intermetallics 18 (2010) 1758-1765.
http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.intermet.2010.05.014.

- 534 [2] O.N. Senkov, G.B. Wilks, J.M. Scott, D.B. Miracle, Mechanical properties of
- 535 Nb25Mo25Ta25W25 and V20Nb20Mo20Ta20W20 refractory high entropy alloys,
- 536 Intermetallics 19 (2011) 698-706. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.intermet.2011.01.004.
- 537 [3] O.N. Senkov, C.F. Woodward, Microstructure and properties of a refractory
 538 NbCrMo0.5Ta0.5TiZr alloy, Materials Science and Engineering: A 529 (2011)
 539 311-320. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.msea.2011.09.033.
- 540 [4] O.N. Senkov, S.V. Senkova, C. Woodward, Effect of aluminum on the
 541 microstructure and properties of two refractory high-entropy alloys, Acta Materialia
 542 68 (2014) 214-228. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.actamat.2014.01.029.
- 543 [5] O.N. Senkov, C. Woodward, D.B. Miracle, Microstructure and Properties of
 544 Aluminum-Containing Refractory High-Entropy Alloys, JOM 66 (2014) 2030-2042.
 545 http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s11837-014-1066-0.
- 546 [6] H. Chen, A. Kauffmann, B. Gorr, D. Schliephake, C. Seemüller, J.N. Wagner, H.J.
- 547 Christ, M. Heilmaier, Microstructure and mechanical properties at elevated
 548 temperatures of a new Al-containing refractory high-entropy alloy Nb-Mo-Cr-Ti-Al,
 549 Journal of Alloys and Compounds 661 (2016) 206-215.
 550 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jallcom.2015.11.050.
- [7] N.O. Senkov, D. Isheim, N.D. Seidman, L.A. Pilchak, Development of a
 Refractory High Entropy Superalloy, Entropy 18 (2016), e18030102.
 https://doi.org/10.3390/e18030102.
- [8] J. Smialek, G.M. Meier, High-temperature oxidation, in: C.T. Sims, N.S. Stoloff,
- 555 W.C. Hagel (Eds.) Superalloys II, Wiley-Interscience, John Wiley and Sons, United
- 556 States of America, 1987, pp. 293-326.
- [9] L. Huang, X. Sun, H. Guan, Z. Hu, Oxidation behavior of a single-crystal Ni-base
 superalloy in air at 900, 1000 and 1100° C, Oxidation of Metals 65 (2006) 207-222.

559 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11085-006-9016-z.

560 [10] M. Bensch, A. Sato, N. Warnken, E. Affeldt, R.C. Reed, U. Glatzel, Modelling of

High Temperature Oxidation of Alumina-Forming Single-Crystal Nickel-Base
Superalloys, Acta Materialia 60 (2012) 5468-5480.
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.actamat.2012.06.036.

564 [11] K. Kawagishi, A.-C. Yeh, T. Yokokawa, T. Kobayashi, Y. Koizumi, H. Harada,

565 Development of an oxidation-resistant high-strength sixth-generation single-crystal

superalloy TMS-238, Superalloys 12 (2012) 189-196.

567 [12] B.A. Pint, K.L. More, I.G. Wright, The use of two reactive elements to optimize

oxidation performance of alumina-forming alloys, Materials at High Temperatures 20
(2003) 375-386. https://doi.org/10.1179/mht.2003.044.

(2003) 3/5-380. https://doi.org/10.11/9/mni.2003.044.

570 [13] C.M. Liu, H.M. Wang, S.Q. Zhang, H.B. Tang, A.L. Zhang, Microstructure and
571 oxidation behavior of new refractory high entropy alloys, Journal of Alloys and
572 Compounds 583 (2014) 162-169. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jallcom.2013.08.102.

- 573 [14] B. Gorr, M. Azim, H.-J. Christ, T. Mueller, D. Schliephake, M. Heilmaier, Phase
- equilibria, microstructure, and high temperature oxidation resistance of novel
 refractory high-entropy alloys, Journal of Alloys and Compounds 624 (2015) 270-278.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jallcom.2014.11.012.
- 577 [15] B. Gorr, F. Mueller, H.-J. Christ, T. Mueller, H. Chen, A. Kauffmann, M. 578 Heilmaier, High temperature oxidation behavior of an equimolar refractory metal-based alloy 20Nb 20Mo 20Cr 20Ti 20Al with and without Si addition, Journal 579 580 of 468-477. Alloys Compounds 688 (2016)and 581 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jallcom.2016.07.219.
- [16] B. Gorr, F. Müller, M. Azim, H.-J. Christ, T. Müller, H. Chen, A. Kauffmann, M.
 Heilmaier, High-Temperature Oxidation Behavior of Refractory High-Entropy Alloys:
 Effect of Alloy Composition, Oxidation of Metals 88 (2017) 1-11.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11085-016-9696-y.
- [17] C.H. Chang, M.S. Titus, J.W. Yeh, Oxidation Behavior between 700 and 1300° C
 of Refractory TiZrNbHfTa High- Entropy Alloys Containing Aluminum, Advanced
 Engineering Materials 20 (2018), 1700948. https://doi.org/10.1002/adem.201700948.
- [18] F. Müller, B. Gorr, H.-J. Christ, H. Chen, A. Kauffmann, M. Heilmaier, Effect of
 microalloying with silicon on high temperature oxidation resistance of novel
 refractory high-entropy alloy Ta-Mo-Cr-Ti-Al, Materials at High Temperatures 35
 (2018) 168-176. https://doi.org/10.1080/09603409.2017.1389115.
- [19] Y.-k. Cao, Y. Liu, B. Liu, W.-d. Zhang, J.-w. Wang, M. Du, Effects of Al and Mo
 on high temperature oxidation behavior of refractory high entropy alloys,
 Transactions of Nonferrous Metals Society of China 29 (2019) 1476-1483.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/S1003-6326(19)65054-5.

- [20] K.-C. Lo, Y.-J. Chang, H. Murakami, J.-W. Yeh, A.-C. Yeh, An oxidation resistant
 refractory high entropy alloy protected by CrTaO 4-based oxide, Scientific reports 9
 (2019), 7266. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-019-43819-x.
- 600 [21] F. Müller, B. Gorr, H.-J. Christ, J. Müller, B. Butz, H. Chen, A. Kauffmann, M.
- Heilmaier, On the oxidation mechanism of refractory high entropy alloys, Corrosion
 Science 159 (2019), 108161. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.corsci.2019.108161.
- 603 [22] P. Zhang, Y. Li, Z. Chen, J. Zhang, B. Shen, Oxidation response of a vacuum arc
- melted NbZrTiCrAl refractory high entropy alloy at 800–1200 °C, Vacuum 162 (2019)
 20-27. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.vacuum.2019.01.026.
- 606 [23] B. Gorr, F. Müller, S. Schellert, H.-J. Christ, H. Chen, A. Kauffmann, M.
- Heilmaier, A new strategy to intrinsically protect refractory metal based alloys at ultra
 high temperatures, Corrosion Science 166 (2020), 108475.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.corsci.2020.108475.
- 610 [24] K.-C. Lo, H. Murakami, J.-W. Yeh, A.-C. Yeh, Oxidation behaviour of a novel
- refractory high entropy alloy at elevated temperatures, Intermetallics 119 (2020),
 106711. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.intermet.2020.106711.
- 613 [25] O.A. Waseem, H.J. Ryu, Combinatorial synthesis and analysis of
 614 AlxTayVz-Cr20Mo20Nb20Ti20Zr10 and Al10CrMoxNbTiZr10 refractory
 615 high-entropy alloys: Oxidation behavior, Journal of Alloys and Compounds 828
 616 (2020), 154427. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jallcom.2020.154427.
- [26] T.M. Butler, K.J. Chaput, Native oxidation resistance of Al20Nb30Ta10Ti30Zr10
 refractory complex concentrated alloy (RCCA), Journal of Alloys and Compounds
 787 (2019) 606-617. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jallcom.2019.02.128.
- [27] N. Yurchenko, E. Panina, S. Zherebtsov, G. Salishchev, N. Stepanov, Oxidation
 Behavior of Refractory AlNbTiVZr0.25 High-Entropy Alloy, Materials 11 (2018),
 2526. https://doi.org/10.3390/ma11122526.
- [28] S. Sheikh, L. Gan, A. Ikeda, H. Murakami, S. Guo, Alloying effect on the
 oxidation behavior of a ductile Al0.5Cr0.25Nb0.5Ta0.5Ti1.5 refractory high-entropy
 alloy, Materials Today Advances 7 (2020), 100104.
- 626 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mtadv.2020.100104.
- 627 [29] J. Litz, A. Rahmel, M. Schorr, Selective carbide oxidation and internal nitridation
- 628 of the Ni-base superalloys IN 738 LC and IN 939 in air, Oxidation of Metals 30 (1988) 629 05 105 https://doi.org/10.1007/DE00656646
- 629 95-105. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00656646.
- 630 [30] C.H. Konrad, L. Fuhrmann, R. Völkl, U. Glatzel, Internal oxidation with 631 significant contribution of oxygen diffusion through the oxide phase, Corrosion
- 632 Science 63 (2012) 187-192. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.corsci.2012.06.003.
- 633 [31] C.H. Konrad, R. Völkl, U. Glatzel, Determination of Oxygen Diffusion Along
- 634 Nickel/Zirconia Phase Boundaries by Internal Oxidation, Oxidation of Metals 77

635 (2012) 149-165. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11085-011-9278-y.

[32] U. Krupp, H.-J. Christ, Selective oxidation and internal nitridation during
high-temperature exposure of single-crystalline nickel-base superalloys, Metallurgical
and Materials Transactions A 31 (2000) 47-56.

639 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11661-000-0051-0.

[33] M.P. Brady, I.G. Wright, B. Gleeson, Alloy design strategies for promoting
protective oxide-scale formation, JOM 52 (2000) 16-21.
https://doi.org/10.1007/s11837-000-0109-x.

643 [34] B.A. Pint, J.R. DiStefano, I.G. Wright, Oxidation resistance: One barrier to

- moving beyond Ni-base superalloys, Materials Science and Engineering: A 415 (2006)
 255-263. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.msea.2005.09.091.
- 646 [35] X. Wang, Y. Zhou, High-temperature oxidation behavior of Ti 2 AlC in air,
- 647 Oxidation of Metals 59 (2003) 303-320. https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1023092027697.
- [36] Y. Hua, Z. Rong, Y. Ye, K. Chen, R. Chen, Q. Xue, H. Liu, Laser shock
 processing effects on isothermal oxidation resistance of GH586 superalloy, Applied
 Surface Science 330 (2015) 439-444. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apsusc.2015.01.033.
- [37] T.M. Butler, K.J. Chaput, J.R. Dietrich, O.N. Senkov, High temperature oxidation
 behaviors of equimolar NbTiZrV and NbTiZrCr refractory complex concentrated
 alloys (RCCAs), Journal of Alloys and Compounds 729 (2017) 1004-1019.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jallcom.2017.09.164.
- [38] O.A. Waseem, U. Auyeskhan, H.M. Lee, H.J. Ryu, A combinatorial approach for
 the synthesis and analysis of AlxCryMozNbTiZr high-entropy alloys: Oxidation
 behavior, Journal of Materials Research 33 (2018) 3226-3234.
 https://doi.org/10.1557/jmr.2018.241.
- [39] M. Göbel, A. Rahmel, M. Schütze, The isothermal-oxidation behavior of several
 nickel-base single-crystal superalloys with and without coatings, Oxidation of Metals
 39 (1993) 231-261. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00665614.
- [40] F. Müller, B. Gorr, H.-J. Christ, H. Chen, A. Kauffmann, M. Heilmaier, Effect of
 Y Additions on the Oxidation Behaviour of Novel Refractory High-Entropy Alloy
 NbMoCrTiAl at 1000 °C in Air, Oxidation of Metals 94 (2020) 147-163.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11085-020-09983-6.
- [41] O.N. Senkov, J.M. Scott, S.V. Senkova, D.B. Miracle, C.F. Woodward,
 Microstructure and room temperature properties of a high-entropy TaNbHfZrTi alloy,
 Journal of Alloys and Compounds 509 (2011) 6043-6048.
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jallcom.2011.02.171.
- 670 [42] Y.D. Wu, Y.H. Cai, T. Wang, J.J. Si, J. Zhu, Y.D. Wang, X.D. Hui, A refractory
- 671 Hf25Nb25Ti25Zr25 high-entropy alloy with excellent structural stability and tensile
- 672 properties, Materials Letters 130 (2014) 277-280.

- 673 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.matlet.2014.05.134.
- 674 [43] C.-C. Juan, M.-H. Tsai, C.-W. Tsai, C.-M. Lin, W.-R. Wang, C.-C. Yang, S.-K.
- 675 Chen, S.-J. Lin, J.-W. Yeh, Enhanced mechanical properties of HfMoTaTiZr and
- HfMoNbTaTiZr refractory high-entropy alloys, Intermetallics 62 (2015) 76-83.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.intermet.2015.03.013.
- 678 [44] C.-C. Juan, K.-K. Tseng, W.-L. Hsu, M.-H. Tsai, C.-W. Tsai, C.-M. Lin, S.-K.
- 679 Chen, S.-J. Lin, J.-W. Yeh, Solution strengthening of ductile refractory
- 680 HfMoxNbTaTiZr high-entropy alloys, Materials Letters 175 (2016) 284-287.
- 681 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.matlet.2016.03.133.
- 682 [45] S. Sheikh, M.K. Bijaksana, A. Motallebzadeh, S. Shafeie, A. Lozinko, L. Gan,
- T.-K. Tsao, U. Klement, D. Canadinc, H. Murakami, S. Guo, Accelerated oxidation in
 ductile refractory high-entropy alloys, Intermetallics 97 (2018) 58-66.
- 685 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.intermet.2018.04.001.
- [46] S. Sheikh, L. Gan, T.-K. Tsao, H. Murakami, S. Shafeie, S. Guo, Aluminizing for
 enhanced oxidation resistance of ductile refractory high-entropy alloys, Intermetallics
 103 (2018) 40-51. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.intermet.2018.10.004.
- [47] O.N. Senkov, S.V. Senkova, D.M. Dimiduk, C. Woodward, D.B. Miracle,
 Oxidation behavior of a refractory NbCrMo0.5Ta0.5TiZr alloy, J Mater Sci 47 (2012)
 6522-6534. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10853-012-6582-0.
- [48] C.M. Lin, C.C. Juan, C.H. Chang, C.W. Tsai, J.W. Yeh, Effect of Al addition on
 mechanical properties and microstructure of refractory AlxHfNbTaTiZr alloys,
 Journal of Alloys and Compounds 624 (2015) 100-107.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jallcom.2014.11.064.
- 696 [49] O.N. Senkov, S.V. Senkova, D.B. Miracle, C. Woodward, Mechanical properties of low-density, refractory multi-principal element alloys of the Cr-Nb-Ti-V-Zr 697 698 Materials Science and Engineering: А 565 (2013) system. 51-62. 699 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.msea.2012.12.018.
- [50] N. Guo, L. Wang, L. Luo, X. Li, Y. Su, J. Guo, H. Fu, Microstructure and
 mechanical properties of refractory MoNbHfZrTi high-entropy alloy, Materials &
 Design 81 (2015) 87-94. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.matdes.2015.05.019.
- 703 [51] C. Wagner, Reaktionstypen bei der Oxydation von Legierungen, Zeitschrift für
- 704 Elektrochemie, Berichte der Bunsengesellschaft für physikalische Chemie 63 (1959)
 705 772-782. https://doi.org/10.1002/bbpc.19590630713.
- 706 [52] D. Vojtěch, T. Popela, J. Kubásek, J. Maixner, P. Novák, Comparison of Nb- and
- Ta-effectiveness for improvement of the cyclic oxidation resistance of TiAl-based
 intermetallics, Intermetallics 19 (2011) 493-501.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.intermet.2010.11.025.
- 710 [53] D. Nilsson, N. Stavlid, M. Lindquist, S. Hogmark, U. Wiklund, The role of

- aluminum additions in the oxidation and wear of a TaC: C low-friction coating,
 Surface and Coatings Technology 203 (2009) 2989-2994.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.surfcoat.2009.03.008.
- 714 [54] W. Ren, F. Ouyang, B. Ding, Y. Zhong, J. Yu, Z. Ren, L. Zhou, The influence of

715 CrTaO4 layer on the oxidation behavior of a directionally-solidified nickel-based

- superalloy at 850–900° C, Journal of Alloys and Compounds 724 (2017) 565-574.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jallcom.2017.07.066.
- 718 [55] K.S. Chan, Cyclic oxidation response of multiphase niobium-based alloys,
- 719 Metallurgical and Materials Transactions A 35 (2004) 589-597.
 720 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11661-004-0370-7.
- 721 [56] S.Y. Qu, Y.F. Han, J.X. Song, Y.W. Kang, Effects of Cr and Al on High
- 722 Temperature Oxidation Resistance of Nb-Si System Intermetallics, Materials Science

723 Forum 546-549 (2007) 1485-1488.

- 724 https://doi.org/10.4028/www.scientific.net/MSF.546-549.1485.
- [57] B. Jasper-Toennies, H. Mueller-Buschbaum, Synthesis and structure of AlTaO4,
- Zeitschrift fuer Anorganische und Allgemeine Chemie (1950), (1983) 113-116.
 https://doi.org/10.1002/zaac.19835040914.
- [58] E.A. Gulbransen, K.F. Andrew, F.A. Brassart, Oxidation of Molybdenum 550° to
 1700°C, Journal of The Electrochemical Society 110 (1963) 952-959.
 https://doi.org/10.1149/1.2425918.
- [59] Y. Shida, H. Anada, The effect of various ternary additives on the oxidation
 behavior of TiAl in high-temperature air, Oxidation of Metals 45 (1996) 197-219.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/BF01046826.
- [60] P. Pérez, J.A. Jiménez, G. Frommeyer, P. Adeva, Oxidation behaviour of a
 Ti-46Al-1Mo-0.2Si alloy: the effect of Mo addition and alloy microstructure,
 Materials Science and Engineering: A 284 (2000) 138-147.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0921-5093(00)00755-3.
- [61] O.N. Senkov, J.M. Scott, S.V. Senkova, F. Meisenkothen, D.B. Miracle, C.F.
 Woodward, Microstructure and elevated temperature properties of a refractory
 TaNbHfZrTi alloy, J Mater Sci 47 (2012) 4062-4074.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s10853-012-6260-2.
- [62] R.N. Patil, E.C. Subbarao, Axial thermal expansion of ZrO2 and HfO2 in the
 range room temperature to 1400°C, Journal of Applied Crystallography 2 (1969)
 281-288. https://doi.org/10.1107/S0021889869007217.
- [63] M. Yoshihara, Influence of Zr Addition on Oxidation Behavior of TiAl-Based
 Alloys, Materials Science Forum 696 (2011) 360-365.
 https://doi.org/10.4028/www.scientific.net/MSF.696.360.
- [64] R.E. Newnham, Crystal Structure of ZrTiO4, Journal of the American Ceramic

- 749 Society 50 (1967) 216-216. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1151-2916.1967.tb15085.x.
- 750 [65] D.-C. Tsai, Z.-C. Chang, L.-Y. Kuo, T.-J. Lin, T.-N. Lin, M.-H. Shiao, F.-S. Shieu,
- 751 Oxidation resistance and structural evolution of (TiVCrZrHf)N coatings, Thin Solid
- 752 Films 544 (2013) 580-587. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tsf.2012.12.064.
- [66] E.B. Kashkarov, M.S. Syrtanov, A.E. Shevelev, A.V. Kurochkin, S.K. Pavlov,
 High-temperature oxidation resistance of Ti-implanted E110 alloy, IOP Conference
 Series: Materials Science and Engineering 597 (2019), 012059.
 https://doi.org/10.1088/1757-899x/597/1/012059.
- 757 [67] B. Gorr, S. Schellert, F. Müller, H.-J. Christ, A. Kauffmann, M. Heilmaier,
- Current Status of Research on the Oxidation Behavior of Refractory High Entropy
 Alloys, Advanced Engineering Materials 23 (2021), 2001047.
 https://doi.org/10.1002/adem.202001047.
- 761 [68] B.A. Pint, J.R. DiStefano, The Role of Oxygen Uptake and Scale Formation on
- 762 the Embrittlement of Vanadium Alloys, Oxidation of Metals 63 (2005) 33-55.
- 763 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11085-005-1950-7.
- [69] D. Feng, J. Zhang, M. Li, M. Chen, B. Zhao, Phase Equilibria of the SiO2–V2O5
 system, Ceramics International 46 (2020) 24053-24059.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ceramint.2020.06.183.
- 767 [70] H. Schadow, H. Oppermann, B. Wehner, Investigations on the Quasi-binary
 768 System V2O5-Ta2O5, Crystal Research and Technology 27 (1992) 691-695.
 769 https://doi.org/10.1002/crat.2170270520.
- 770 [71] G. Chen, Z. Sun, X. Zhou, Oxidation of Intermetallic Alloys in Ti-Al-Nb Ternary
- 771 System, CORROSION 48 (1992) 939-946. https://doi.org/10.5006/1.3315897.
- [72] M. Yoshihara, K. Miura, Effects of Nb addition on oxidation behavior of TiAl,
 Intermetallics 3 (1995) 357-363. https://doi.org/10.1016/0966-9795(95)94254-C.
- 774 [73] J. Chen, Q. Chen, S.J. Qu, H.P. Xiang, C. Wang, J.B. Gao, A.H. Feng, D.L. Chen,
- 775 Oxidation mechanisms of an intermetallic alloy at high temperatures, Scripta
 776 Materialia 199 (2021), 113852. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scriptamat.2021.113852.
- [74] Z. Hong, H. Zhang, J.-F. Weng, L.-F. Su, Z. Li, L.-N. Jia, Oxidation behavior of
- 778 Nb-24Ti-18Si-2Al-2Hf-4Cr and Nb-24Ti-18Si-2Al-2Hf-8Cr hypereutectic alloys 779 at 1250 °C, Rare Metals 36 (2017) 168-173.
- 780 https://doi.org/10.1007/s12598-015-0600-8.
- 781 [75] J.A. Ventura, B.I. Portillo, S.K. Varma, R.N. Mahapatra, Oxidation Behavior of
- 782 Nb-20Mo-15Si-5B-20Cr and Nb-20Mo-15Si-5B-20Ti Alloys Up To 1300°C, ECS
- 783 Transactions 16 (2019) 157-166. https://doi.org/10.1149/1.3224752.
- [76] B. Portillo, P. Kakarlapudi, S.K. Varma, The possible application of Nb-W-Cr
 alloys in high-temperature air, JOM 59 (2007) 46-49.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11837-007-0078-4.