

# Variability of bone preservation in a confined environment: the case of the catacomb of Sts Peter and Marcellinus (Rome, Italy)

Salesse Kevin, Élise Dufour, Matthieu Lebon, Chris M Wurster, Dominique Castex, Jaroslav Bruzek, Antoine Zazzo

## ▶ To cite this version:

Salesse Kevin, Élise Dufour, Matthieu Lebon, Chris M Wurster, Dominique Castex, et al.. Variability of bone preservation in a confined environment: the case of the catacomb of Sts Peter and Marcellinus (Rome, Italy). Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 2014. hal-03677853

## HAL Id: hal-03677853 https://hal.science/hal-03677853v1

Submitted on 25 May 2022

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

1	Variability of bone preservation in a confined environment: the case of the
2	catacomb of Sts Peter and Marcellinus (Rome, Italy)
3	
4	Salesse K. <sup>1*</sup> , Dufour E. <sup>2</sup> , Lebon M. <sup>3</sup> , Wurster C. <sup>4</sup> , Castex D. <sup>1</sup> , Bruzek J. <sup>1,5</sup> , Zazzo A. <sup>2</sup>
5	
6	<sup>1</sup> Univ. Bordeaux, CNRS, UMR 5199: "PACEA – De la Préhistoire à l'Actuel: Culture,
7	Environnement et Anthropologie", Bâtiment B8, Allée Geoffroy St Hilaire, CS 50023, F-
8	33615 Pessac cedex, France.
9	<sup>2</sup> Muséum national d'Histoire naturelle, CNRS, Département Ecologie et Gestion de la
10	Biodiversité, USM 303/UMR 7209: "Archéozoologie, Archéobotanique : Sociétés, Pratiques
11	et Environnements", CP 56, 55 rue Buffon, F-75231 Paris cedex 05, France.
12	<sup>3</sup> Muséum national d'Histoire naturelle, CNRS, Département de Préhistoire, UMR 7194:
13	"Histoire naturelle de l'Homme préhistorique", CP 57, 57 rue Cuvier, F-75231 Paris cedex
14	05, France.
15	<sup>4</sup> Centre for Tropical Environmental and Sustainability Science, School of Earth and
16	Environmental Sciences, James Cook University, Cairns QLD 4870, Australia.
17	<sup>5</sup> Department of Anthropology and Human Genetics, Faculty of Science, Charles University,
18	Viničná 7, 128 43 Praha 2, Czech Republic.
19	
20	*corresponding author: K. Salesse, Tel: +33 (0)5-40-00-37-39, Email: kevin.salesse@u-bordeaux.fr
21	
22	Keywords: diagenesis; stable isotopes, collagen; apatite; radiocarbon; Fourier-transform
23	infrared spectroscopy
24	
25	Abstract

Most of the studies investigating the diagenetic trajectory of fossil bones focus on 26 open-air sites and very little work have been published in confined environments such as 27 catacombs. While the stable thermal history of catacombs should favor bone preservation, the 28 accumulation of corpses over a short period of time could favor their destruction. The aim of 29 this study is to describe the diagenetic trajectory of 128 human bone samples coming from six 30 different burial chambers of the catacomb of Sts Peter and Marcellinus (SSPM, Rome, Italy). 31 A multi-proxy approach was undertaken to provide an assessment of the molecular 32 preservation as well as a direct record of the isotopic composition itself. Collagen yield, 33 carbon and nitrogen abundances, C:N ratio, FT-IR based collagen and carbonate contents and 34 35 crystallinity index, radiocarbon dating and stable isotope analysis of bone collagen and carbonate indicate that both the mineral and the organic fractions are impacted by diagenesis 36 to various degrees, and that bones originating from the small burial chambers are more 37 affected than those coming from the large ones. While some of the bones were strongly 38 recrystallized, the impact of bone diagenesis on the stable isotope values of bone carbonate 39 was limited. Comparison with contemporary sites from the Latium showed that conditions 40 prevailing in catacombs seem overall to favor, rather than disadvantage bone preservation. 41

42

43

#### 44 **1. Introduction**

Excavations conducted from 2004 to 2010 in the central area of the catacomb of Sts Peter and Marcellinus (hereafter the SSPM catacomb) located in the south-east of Rome revealed several mass graves dated to between the first and the third century AD based on radiocarbon and artefact (coins) dating (Castex et al., 2007; Castex et al., 2011). They contained tens to hundreds of articulated human skeletons laid together according to wellreasoned management (Blanchard et al., 2007; Castex et al., 2007; Castex et al., 2009; Castex

et al., 2011). A significant number of these individuals received a specific funerary treatment 51 52 characterized, in particular, by the use of gypsum to partially or entirely cover the corpses (Castex and Blanchard, 2011; Castex et al., 2009; Devièse et al., 2010; Vanhove, 2006). A 53 mortality crisis following an epidemic episode is thought to be at the origin of these mass 54 graves suggesting that they have been used for a relatively limited period of time (Blanchard 55 et al., 2007; Castex and Blanchard, 2011; Castex et al., 2009; Castex et al., 2011; Kacki et al., 56 2013). Unfortunately, the study of the biological identity (sex, age at death, stature, non-57 metric traits, pathological conditions, etc.) of the individuals was restricted due to the state of 58 skeletal preservation (Blanchard et al., 2007; Castex and Blanchard, 2011; Castex et al., 2007; 59 Castex et al., 2009). Many bones and teeth have lost their anatomical integrity even though 60 the preservation quality differs strongly among burial chambers, different deposit levels 61 within a chamber, and different skeletons within the same level (Blanchard et al., 2007; 62 Castex and Blanchard, 2011; Castex et al., 2007; Castex et al., 2009). Stable isotope 63 approaches offer invaluable assistance when the macroscopic anthropological observations 64 are limited by the poor quality of skeletal preservation (e.g. Katzenberg et al., 2009; Oelze et 65 al., 2012; Wright et al., 2010). Measurements of the stable isotope composition of the SSPM 66 population would allow us to better understand their life history, provided that in vivo isotopic 67 68 compositions are preserved.

69 Checking whether the original isotope compositions of biomineral fractions are not 70 altered by diagenesis is an essential prerequisite to interpret isotope analyses (Bocherens et 71 al., 2005; Bocherens et al., 2008; Brady et al., 2008; Shin and Hedges, 2012). Most of the 72 studies investigating the diagenetic trajectory of fossil bones focus on open-air sites. To our 73 knowledge, very little work has been published in confined environments. The advantage of 74 such an approach was demonstrated by Bocherens et al. (2008) in Chauvet cave. In this 75 Palaeolithic site, the authors showed that the preservation of bear bones exposed on the floor 76 of the cave varied widely probably due to spatial variation in local conditions. The Chauvet cave results cannot be directly translated to man-made cavities such as catacombs because the 77 age and taphonomic contexts are quite different. Like in caves, the thermal history of 78 catacombs is more stable than in open-air sites which should *a priori* favor their preservation. 79 On the other hand, the accumulation of corpses over a short period of time in catacombs could 80 have an effect on the soil pH and therefore favor the destruction of human bones. The aim of 81 this study is to describe the diagenetic trajectory of the human bone samples from the SSPM 82 catacomb in order to assess their preservation and compare it with the preservation observed 83 in contemporary open-air sites from the region of Rome. A multi-proxy approach 84 (measurement of classical collagen preservation indicators; Fourier-transform infrared 85 spectroscopy (FT-IR) based collagen preservation indicators, carbonate content and 86 crystallinity, <sup>14</sup>C measurements, and stable isotope analysis of the collagen and carbonate 87 fractions) was undertaken to provide a record of the preservation of the molecules. Our results 88 show that both the mineral and the organic fractions are affected by diagenesis to various 89 degrees, and that bones originating from the small burial chambers are the most diagenetically 90 altered. While some of the bones were strongly recrystallized, the stable isotope values of 91 92 bone carbonate remained reliable. Comparison with contemporary sites from the Latium 93 showed that conditions prevailing in catacombs seem overall to favor, rather than disadvantage bone preservation 94

95

## 96 2. Study area and material

A total of 128 individuals were selected for this study. The material comes from six of the seven burial chambers discovered in 2003 in a previously unexplored area (region X) of the SSPM catacomb (Blanchard et al., 2007; Castex et al., 2007) (Figure 1). These burial chambers are part of a vast funerary complex that covers approximately 3 ha with 4.5 km of

underground galleries (Guyon, 1987). Four of them (X78/T15, X80/T16, X81 and X82/T18) 101 are small in size ( $< 7m^2$ ), while the remaining two (X83 and X84) are larger in size ( $> 9m^2$ ) 102 (Castex et al., 2007; Castex et al., 2009). Different phases of multiple deposits separated by a 103 layer of sediment were identified in the small chambers (Blanchard et al., 2007; Castex et al., 104 2011; Kacki et al., 2013; Sachau-Carcel et al., 2013). At least three phases were recognized in 105 X78/T15 (Pagni and Burdassi, 2004) whereas 9 and 12 phases were distinguished in X80/T16 106 and X82/T18, respectively (Blanchard et al., 2007; Castex et al., 2007). In contrast, no 107 stratum of soil was discovered between the skeletons in X81, X83 and X84 (Castex and 108 Blanchard, 2011; Castex et al., 2009; Castex et al., 2011). 109

110 For each individual, a fragment of long (*i.e.* humerus, radius, ulna, metacarpus, femur 111 and tibia), flat (i.e. cranial vault, rib and hip bone), irregular (i.e. mandible and maxilla) or short (calcaneus) bone was sampled. Due to the poor skeletal representation of bone remains 112 of five individuals from the burial chamber X82/T18, several fragments of different skeletal 113 parts were selected in order to obtain enough material to achieve the required analyses 114 (hereafter named miscellaneous samples). Modern reference material required for FT-IR 115 analysis was composed of bones of modern ox, calf, horse and sheep in order to take into 116 117 account variation due to species and age at death.

118

#### **3. Methods**

#### 120 <u>3.1. Bone carbonate preparation and analysis</u>

Between 30 and 36 mg of bone powder (grain size < 0.3 mm) was first soaked in 2 to 3% sodium hypochlorite at room temperature for 48 h to remove organic matter then rinsed five times with distilled water. The remaining fraction was treated with 1 M acetic acid for 1 h to remove exogenous carbonate then rinsed five times with distilled water. Sodium hypochlorite and acetic acid solutions were renewed half-way through each process. Samples

were oven-dried for 18 h at 65°C following pretreatment. The purification process resulted in 126 a weight loss comprising between 10 and 80%. Bone carbonate  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O values were 127 measured at the Service de Spectrométrie de Masse Isotopique of the MNHN (SSMIM). 128 Samples weighing from 580 to 630 mg were reacted for 360 s with 100% phosphoric acid at 129 70°C in individual vessels in an automated cryogenic distillation system (Kiel IV device), 130 interfaced with a ThermoScientific Delta V Advantage isotope ratio mass spectrometer. The 131 stable isotope results are reported in per mil (‰) relative to VPDB. Over the period of 132 analysis, the analytical precision calculated based on repeated measurements of our internal 133 carbonate standard (Marble LM) was 0.02‰ for  $\delta^{13}C_{carb}$  and 0.05‰ for  $\delta^{18}O_{carb}$  values. 134

135

## 136 <u>3.2. Bone collagen extraction and analysis</u>

Bone collagen extraction followed Longin's (1971) protocol modified by DeNiro and 137 Epstein (1981) and Bocherens et al. (1988; 1991). Between 0.1 and 1.1 g of bone powder 138 139 (grain size comprised between 0.3 and 0.7 mm) was soaked in 40 ml of 1 M hydrochloric acid for 20 min at room temperature then filtered for decalcification using 5 µm cellulose filters. 140 The residue was soaked into 0.125 M sodium hydroxide for 20 h at room temperature to 141 oxidize fulvic and humic acids then filtered. The gelatin was then solubilized in 0.01 M 142 143 hydrochloric acid at 100°C for 17 h, and filtered again to remove impurities. The solubilized collagen was then freeze-dried for 48 to 72 h and extraction yields calculated. Stable isotope 144 145 composition was measured at the environmental isotope laboratory at James Cook University's Advanced Analytical Centre (Cairns, Australia) using samples weighing between 146 200 and 400 µg. Carbon and nitrogen abundance and isotope composition ( $\delta^{13}C_{col}$  and  $\delta^{15}N_{col}$ 147 values) were determined using a Costech Elemental Analyzer 4010 fitted with a zero-blank 148 auto-sampler coupled via a ConFlo IV to a Thermo Scientific Delta V<sup>PLUS</sup> using Continuous-149 Flow Isotope Ratio Mass Spectrometry. The  $\delta^{13}C_{col}$  and  $\delta^{15}N_{col}$  values are reported in per mil 150

151 (‰) deviation relative to VPDB and AIR, respectively. Over the period of analysis, the 152 carbon and nitrogen abundances were  $\pm 5\%$  of the value for laboratory internal standards and 153 the analytical precision for  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{15}$ N was better than  $\pm 0.1\%$  and  $\pm 0.2\%$ , respectively. 154 Weight percent carbon and nitrogen were used to calculate atomic C:N ratios.

155

#### 156 <u>3.3. FT-IR analysis</u>

Attenuated total reflexion mode (ATR) FT-IR analysis was performed on bone powder 157 (grain size < 0.3 mm) before and after pretreatment. Infrared spectra were collected by 158 accumulation of 64 scans with a spectral resolution of 2 cm<sup>-1</sup> on a Bruker Vector 22 FT-IR 159 160 spectrometer equipped with a diamond-ATR accessory (Specac Golden Gate). Spectral data analyses were performed using OPUS software (Bruker). Crystallinity was evaluated using 161 the Infrared Splitting Factor (IRSF) (Figure 2). The sum of the two V 4PO4 bands at 565 and 162 600 cm<sup>-1</sup> were divided by the valley at 590 cm<sup>-1</sup> following the protocol described by Weiner 163 (1990). Relative carbonate content was measured by the intensity ratio of the  $V_3CO_3$  band at 164 1415 cm<sup>-1</sup> over the V<sub>4</sub>PO<sub>4</sub> band at 600 cm<sup>-1</sup> (adapted from Wright and Schwarcz 1996). 165 Relative collagen content was measured by the intensity ratio of the Amide I band at 1660 cm<sup>-</sup> 166 <sup>1</sup> over the  $V_4PO_4$  band at 600 cm<sup>-1</sup> (adapted from Trueman et al., 2004). The precipitation of 167 secondary calcite was monitored by the presence of its specific band at 712 cm<sup>-1</sup>. 168

169

## 170 <u>3.4. Radiocarbon dating</u>

The collagen and apatite fraction of five individuals from burial chambers X80/T16, X82/T18 and X83 were radiocarbon dated. An aliquot of collagen (between 8 and 13 mg) was combusted for 15 to 60 min at 800°C. Carbonate was purified following a modified version of Krueger et al. (1991). About 2 g of bone powder (grain size < 0.1 mm) was first soaked in 2

to 3% sodium hypochlorite at room temperature for six days to oxidize the organic matter. 175 Bone powder was then rinsed several times with distilled water and dried for 3 h at 100°C. It 176 was then placed in 100 ml of 2 M acetic acid for 24 h at room temperature under weak 177 vacuum. The evolution of fine gas bubbles usually slows down drastically after 1 h, and stops 178 after 10+ h, suggesting that all secondary calcite as well as the smallest apatite crystals had 179 been dissolved. The acetic acid treatment resulted in weight losses between 40 and 80%. An 180 aliquot of purified bioapatite weighing between 220 and 280 mg was then reacted in 181 orthophosphoric acid for 12 min at 70°C under vacuum. CO<sub>2</sub> derived from the collagen and 182 apatite samples was cryogenically trapped and about 1 mg C was sealed in a glass tube for 183 184 radiocarbon dating. Graphitization and AMS measurement were conducted at Queen's University's <sup>14</sup>Chrono Centre (Belfast, Northern Ireland). 185

186

#### 187 **4. Bone diagenesis evaluation**

### 188 <u>4.1. Macroscopic preservation</u>

Bone samples were classified into three categories according to their macroscopic characteristics as well as their strength and resistance when cutting: (1) "good preservation" characterizes a solid and heavy bone difficult to cut and crush; (2) "poor preservation" corresponds to a bone which is fragile, soft and easy to cut and crush; and finally (3) "medium preservation" refers to a bone with intermediate characteristics (Figure 3).

194

## 195 <u>4.2. Collagen quality</u>

Bone collagen preservation was evaluated based on three criteria: bone collagen extraction yield (wt%), carbon and nitrogen abundances in collagen (%), and atomic C:N ratio (Table 1). Collagen concentration in modern bone is around 20.4 wt% (SD  $\pm 3.9$  wt%) (Bocherens et al., 1991), and values <1 wt% are usually considered as being unreliable

(Dobberstein et al., 2009; van Klinken, 1999). In modern bones, carbon and nitrogen 200 abundances range from 13 to 47% and from 4.8 to 17.3% respectively (Ambrose, 1990), and 201 values below or above these thresholds indicate alteration or contamination (Garvie-Lok, 202 2001; Iacumin et al., 1998; Reitsema, 2012, van Klinken, 1999). Average atomic C:N ratio in 203 modern bones is 3.2 to 3.3 (Ambrose, 1990; van Klinken, 1999), and vary between 2.9 and 204 3.6 (DeNiro, 1985). Atomic ratios below or above these thresholds indicate alteration or 205 contamination (Ambrose, 1990; DeNiro and Weiner, 1988; Grupe et al., 2001). Samples that 206 207 fail to pass any of these three criteria were considered to be poorly-preserved.

208

## 209 <u>4.3. Infrared spectroscopy</u>

Bone recrystallization promotes the formation of a more stable mineral phase 210 characterized by a higher crystallinity (i.e. crystal size and lattice perfection) and lower 211 carbonate content. These changes are related to both microbial activities (bioerosion) and 212 interaction of bone mineral with the burial environment (i.e. pH) that control dissolution-213 recrystallization processes (Berna et al., 2004; Hedges and Millard, 1995; Smith et al., 2007). 214 Crystallinity and carbonate content can be evaluated by FT-IR using the IRSF and CO<sub>3</sub>/PO<sub>4</sub> 215 ratio, respectively. IRSF values vary between 2.5 and 3.3 for modern bones (Stiner et al., 216 217 1995; Wright and Schwarcz, 1996; Nielsen-Marsh and Hedges, 2000; Berna et al., 2004; Munro et al., 2007; Asscher et al., 2011) and usually reaches values between 3.4 and 4.5 for 218 archaeological samples (Weiner and Bar-Yosef, 1990; Stiner et al., 1995; Wright and 219 220 Schwarcz, 1996; Munro et al., 2007). Bones are usually considered altered for values above 3.8 to 4.0 (Shemesh, 1990; Stiner et al., 1995; Berna et al., 2004). In moderrn animal bones, 221 CO<sub>3</sub>/PO<sub>4</sub> ratio is comprised between 0.7 and 1.0. This ratios decreases to less than 0.2 for 222 altered samples (Lebon, 2008). The fate of the mineral phase is mainly dependent on the 223 degradation of the organic phase (Collins et al., 2002; Lebon et al., 2011; Trueman et al., 224

2008). FT-IR analyses offer also the ability to measure the relative collagen content of a bone
by measuring the AmideI/PO<sub>4</sub> ratio. This ratio is comprised between 0.9 and 1.2 for modern
bones and decreases as collagen decays. The AmideI/PO<sub>4</sub> and CO<sub>3</sub>/PO<sub>4</sub> ratios are usually
correlated (Lebon, 2008; Lebon et al., 2011).

229

## 230 <u>4.4. Radiocarbon dating of bone collagen-carbonate pairs</u>

The  ${}^{14}C/{}^{12}C$  and  ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$  ratios differ by several orders of magnitude. This results in a 231 higher sensitivity of the  ${}^{14}C/{}^{12}C$  ratio over the  ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$  ratio to post-mortem isotope exchange. 232 Therefore, <sup>14</sup>C is a useful proxy to assess the influence of diagenesis on the carbon stable 233 234 isotope composition of carbonate in apatite (Shin and Hedges, 2012; Zazzo, in press). To quantify carbon isotope exchange between bone carbonate and dissolved inorganic carbon 235 during diagenesis, we measured the radiocarbon age difference between the collagen and 236 carbonate fraction (<sup>14</sup>C<sub>col-carb</sub>) from the same bone. If bone collagen passes the three tests 237 outlined above, any deviation should be the result of carbon isotope exchange in the carbonate 238 fraction. This difference can then be transformed in percent of carbon isotope exchange 239 assuming that exchange takes place with modern carbon (Hedges et al., 1995a). This is 240 probably a reasonable approximation as an extensive review of the literature and a recent <sup>14</sup>C 241 242 dating program of several archaeological sites worldwide demonstrated that diagenetically altered apatites are always younger than the reference age for the site (Zazzo, in press; Zazzo 243 and Saliège, 2011). Radiocarbon ages are presented as BP and fraction modern (Fm). 244

245

#### 246 **5. Results**

## 247 <u>5.1. Collagen preservation</u>

Collagen preservation varies greatly between different samples (Table 2). Collagenyields differ according to bone location within the catacomb, the anatomical part category and

the macroscopic aspect (Figure 4). In total, 29 (23%) bone collagen samples do not pass at 250 251 least one of the three tests defined (collagen yield, carbon and nitrogen abundances, and C:N ratio (Table 3). Within this group, all but two were classified as macroscopically poorly-252 preserved (Table 3). These samples all originate from three of the the four lowest levels of the 253 chamber X80/T18 and from all the levels of the chamber X82/T18 (Table 3). They consist 254 largely of long and flat bones (31 and 38%, respectively). Additionally, 46% of the flat bones 255 and 100% of the miscellaneous samples have poorly-preserved collagen (Table 3). 256 Macroscopic preservation was variable among the 99 (77%) bone collagen samples with 257 reliable collagen (e.g. see Figure 5 for the variations of atomic carbon and nitrogen 258 259 abundances). Poor scores were obtained for macroscopically poorly-preserved specimens 260 coming from two small chambers (X80/T16 and X82/T18).

261

#### 262 <u>5.2. FT-IR</u>

The modern animal reference samples have relatively low IRSF values (Mean = 3.4; 263 SD  $\pm 0.1$ ) and high CO<sub>3</sub>/PO<sub>4</sub> ratios (Mean = 0.85; SD  $\pm 0.10$ ), consistent with values 264 previously published (Lebon et al., 2010). With the exception of three samples, all the 265 archaeological human bone samples present higher IRSF values and lower CO<sub>3</sub>/PO<sub>4</sub> ratios 266 than modern animal reference samples (Figure 6). IRSF values measured on the 267 archaeological samples before pretreatment range from 3.6 to 5.1 (Mean = 4.3; SD  $\pm 0.4$ ), 268 while CO<sub>3</sub>/PO<sub>4</sub> ratios vary between 0.15 and 1.01 (Mean = 0.49; SD  $\pm 0.20$ ). IRSF values are 269 negatively correlated with bone  $CO_3/PO_4$  ratios ( $R^2 = 0.75$ ) (Figure 6). No trace of calcite was 270 detected (detection limit 1.5 %) in bone samples before pretreatment. Amide I/PO4 ratios vary 271 from 0.07 to 0.86 (Mean = 0.35; SD  $\pm 0.25$ ) and are lower for the archaeological bones than 272 for the modern animal reference samples (Figure 7). Carbonate and collagen relative contents 273 are positively correlated ( $R^2 = 0.76$ ) (Figure 7). Small chamber samples are significantly 274

different from large chambers samples with respect to IRSF values, CO<sub>3</sub>/PO<sub>4</sub> and Amide I/PO<sub>4</sub> ratios (Mann-Whitney U tests; p-values < 0.03). Samples from small chambers have lower relative carbonate content, lower relative collagen content, and higher IRSF values compared to samples from larger chambers. Following chemical pretreatment of bone carbonate, IRSF values increase (Mean = 4.6; SD  $\pm$ 0.3) and relative carbonate content decrease (Mean = 0.28; SD  $\pm$ 0.10). CO<sub>3</sub>/PO<sub>4</sub> ratios remain negatively correlated to IRSF values (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.59) (Figure 8).

282

#### 283 <u>5.3. Stable isotope analysis</u>

Bone collagen carbon and nitrogen isotope values were measured for all specimens 284 that yielded a collagen extract (Table 2). There was no significant difference in  $\delta^{13}C_{col}$ 285 between the well-preserved and the poorly-preserved collagen samples (Mann-Whitney U 286 test; p-value = 0.52). In contrast, the well- and poorly-preserved collagen samples have 287 significantly different  $\delta^{15}N_{col}$  values (Mann-Whitney U test; p-value = 0.00). There was no 288 relationship between the  $\delta^{13}C_{col}$  or  $\delta^{15}N_{col}$  values and the collagen yield (R<sup>2</sup> < 0.05), the 289 atomic carbon and nitrogen abundances ( $R^2 < 0.2$ ) or the atomic C:N ratios ( $R^2 < 0.07$ ). There 290 was no significant difference between the isotope values and the burial chambers, the skeletal 291 292 part categories, or the macroscopic appearances when either one of the two groups or the totality of the corpus is considered (Mann-Whitney U tests; p-values >> 0.05). We found one 293 exception, however. When samples with well-preserved collagen were considered (n = 99), 294  $\delta^{15}N_{col}$  values measured in macroscopically poorly- and well-preserved samples differed 295 significantly (Mann-Whitney U test; p-value = 0.04). 296

Bone carbonate carbon and oxygen stable isotope values were measured for the 128 individuals (Table 2). Bone  $\delta^{18}O_{carb}$  values in X82/T18 differed significantly from bone  $\delta^{18}O_{carb}$  values in X80/T16 and X84 (Mann-Whitney U test; p-value = 0.01). When the totality

of the corpus was considered,  $\delta^{13}C_{carb}$  values of irregular and flat bones, irregular and long 300 bone, and long and miscellaneous bones differed significantly (Mann-Whitney U tests; p-301 values < 0.04). The same conclusion was reached (excepted for long vs. miscellaneous bones) 302 when only samples with well-preserved collagen were considered (Mann-Whitney U tests; p-303 values < 0.04). Moreover, when the totality of the corpus was considered bone 304 macroscopically identified as well-preserved had  $\delta^{13}C_{carb}$  and  $\delta^{18}O_{carb}$  values that differed 305 significantly from those measured in medium and poorly-preserved bones, respectively 306 (Mann-Whitney U tests; p-values = < 0.015). The samples which yielded well- (n = 99) and 307 poorly-preserved (n = 29) collagen samples also had significantly different  $\delta^{13}C_{carb}$  and 308  $\delta^{18}$ O<sub>carb</sub> values (Mann-Whitney U test; p-value = 0.01 and 0.02, respectively). There was no 309 relationship between the  $\delta^{13}C_{carb}$  or  $\delta^{18}O_{carb}$  values and the IRSF values (R² < 0.01), the 310 CO<sub>3</sub>/PO<sub>4</sub> ratio ( $R^2 < 0.01$ ) or the AmideI/PO<sub>4</sub> ratio ( $R^2 < 0.01$ ) before or after bone carbonate 311 pretreatment. 312

313

#### 314 <u>5.4. Radiocarbon dating</u>

The  ${}^{14}C_{col}$  ages range from 1779  $\pm$  27 BP to 1965  $\pm$  31 BP whereas the  ${}^{14}C_{carb}$  ages 315 range from  $1690 \pm 27$  BP to  $1848 \pm 22$  BP for the five individuals (Table 4). The <sup>14</sup>C<sub>col-carb</sub> age 316 differences vary between  $-1 \pm 40$  and  $153 \pm 46$  <sup>14</sup>C yr (Table 4). Except for one individual in 317 chamber X83 where the age measured in the two fractions are identical, the <sup>14</sup>C<sub>carb</sub> age is 318 always younger than the  ${}^{14}C_{col}$  age. The  ${}^{14}C_{col}$  ages are positively correlated with the  $\delta^{13}C_{col}$ 319 values (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.95), negatively correlated with the  $\delta^{13}C_{carb}$  values (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.68) but are not 320 correlated with the  $\delta^{15}N_{col}$  values ( $R^2 = 0.24$ ). The  ${}^{14}C_{carb}$  ages are negatively correlated with 321 the  $\delta^{13}C_{carb}$  values (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.86) but are not correlated with the  $\delta^{18}O_{carb}$  values (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.01). The 322  $^{14}C_{col-carb}$  age difference is not correlated with the  $\delta^{13}C_{col}$ ,  $\delta^{13}C_{carb}$ , or  $\delta^{18}O_{carb}$  values (R<sup>2</sup> < 323 0.42), but is negatively correlated with bone  $\delta^{15}N_{col}$  values (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.88). In terms of <sup>14</sup>C 324

activity, Fm values of bone collagen varies between  $78.30 \pm 0.31$  and  $80.13 \pm 0.26$  pMC while bone apatite is about 1% more active on average and varies between  $79.45 \pm 0.22$  and  $81.02 \pm 0.27$  pMC (Table 4).

328

#### 329 **6. Discussion**

### 330 <u>6.1. Diagenetic trajectory</u>

The high IRSF values displayed by bone apatite from the SSPM catacomb, ranging 331 between 3.6 and 5.1, are indicative of a moderate to high degree of recrystallization for these 332 samples (Table 2, Figure 6). The presence of a PO<sub>4</sub> peak at 1093 cm<sup>-1</sup>, and of shoulders at 333 3570 cm<sup>-1</sup> and 630 cm<sup>-1</sup> in the most severely altered samples argue for a partial 334 recrystallization in hydroxylapatite. The inverse relationship between mineral crystallinity and 335 carbonate content is typical of dissolution/recrystallization processes that take place following 336 burial (Nielsen-Marsh and Hedges, 2000). Such an alteration of the mineral phase is 337 frequently linked to the loss of the organic matter. This is confirmed by the correlation 338 observed between collagen and carbonate relative contents (Figure 7). This relationship can 339 be explained by the intimate association of the apatite crystals and collagen fibrils at the 340 nanoscale in the bone structure. Mineral dissolution exposes the collagen to microbial or 341 342 physico-chemical alterations while, in turn, the loss of the organic matter increases microporosities and interactions of bone minerals with surrounding water (Collins et al., 2002). The 343 combination of collagen loss, decrease in carbonate content and increase in crystallinity could 344 have been driven by collagen hydrolysis and/or microbial activity (Smith et al., 2007). 345 Bacterial attacks generally result in a loss of the chemical integrity of collagen and a loss of 346 collagen in bone (Balzer et al., 1997; Child, 1995; Grupe, 2001; Harbeck and Grupe, 2009) 347 and begin quickly following burial (Hedges, 2002). Chemical hydrolysis of collagen is 348 another, slower mechanism (Child, 1995; Smith et al., 2002). The lack of data regarding the 349

histological preservation and the porosity of samples does not allow us to distinguish between 350 351 the two processes. However, archaeological evidence suggests that both could have occurred. The simultaneous or quasi-simultaneous decomposition of the high number of bodies in the 352 mass graves from the SSPM catacomb could have been conducive to microorganism 353 development. Moreover, the burial chambers from the SSPM catacomb were carved in a 354 pozzolan (Funiciello et al., 2008), which presents an alkaline pH ranging from 7.5 to 7.9 355 (measurements carried out by Zitelli (2013) on samples from ceiling of X82/T18 and X83). 356 These results are consistent with the pH of environmental water recorded in other catacombs 357 in Rome varying between 7.5 and 7.8 (Sánchez-Moral et al., 2005a). However, a much lower 358 359 pH ranging from 5.9 to 6.4 has been found at the floor level of the X82/T18 and X83 chambers (Zitelli 2013). This decrease of the rock pH at the bottom of the stratigraphic 360 sequences could be caused by the decomposition fluids (principally organic acids; Vass et al. 361 (2002)) released from the corpses in putrefaction (Carter and Tibbett, 2008; Gill-King, 1997; 362 Schotsmans et al., 2014). In addition, the gypsum used as part of the funerary practices inside 363 these graves could have also contributed to the acidification of the burial environment. In 364 environmental management, gypsum is frequently incorporated alone or with other 365 amendments in alkaline soils in order to reduce soil pH (Carter, 1986; Courtney and Kirwan, 366 367 2012; Kordlaghari and Rowell, 2006; Wong et al., 2009). Bone apatite is known to have a low solubility in alkaline environments (pH > 7.5) while its solubility becomes relatively high in 368 acidic environments (pH < 6.5) (Berna et al., 2004; Nielsen-Marsh and Hedges, 2000; Pate et 369 370 al., 1989). The drop in pH of the burial environment in the chambers could have favored dissolution/recrystallization processes leading to the high IRSF values that we have measured. 371 Finally, the high porosity of the pozzolan (Sánchez-Moral et al., 2005a; Sánchez-Moral et al., 372 2005b) could have facilitated water drainage. These particular conditions, associated with the 373 absence of sediments between the different strata of corpses in certain burial chambers may 374

have limited the capacity of the burial environment to buffer water and increase interaction of
bone with groundwater (Nielsen-Marsh et al., 2007; Smith et al., 2002). These conditions
could then have accelerated the recrystallization of bone apatite and the subsequent alteration
of the collagen matrix.

379

## 380 <u>6.2. Spatial heterogeneity of bone preservation</u>

Bone preservation in the SSPM catacomb is highly variable. While some of the 381 archaeological samples present IRSF values and CO<sub>3</sub>/PO<sub>4</sub> ratios very close to those observed 382 for the modern samples, most of them display higher IRSF values and lower CO<sub>3</sub>/PO<sub>4</sub> ratios. 383 384 Collagen extraction yields are also variable (from 0 to 100%). Time, burial environment (temperature, hydrogeology, soil pH, etc.) and taphonomic processes (inhumation type, filling 385 of the grave, anthropogenic or animal disturbance, etc.) are the three main parameters 386 controlling the state of preservation of bones in archaeological contexts (Collins et al., 2002; 387 Hedges, 2002). These different parameters interplay in a complex manner between and within 388 archaeological sites (Hedges et al., 1995b; Nielsen-Marsh and Hedges, 2000; Pestle and 389 Colvard, 2012). In the SSPM catacomb the organization and taphonomic evolution of the 390 deposition levels suggests massive accumulation of corpses (Castex et al., 2007; Castex et al., 391 392 2009; Castex et al., 2011). Despite the fact that contemporary inhumation of 2000-3000 corpses stricto senso is unlikely given the dimensions of the burial chambers (Sachau-Carcel, 393 2012; Sachau-Carcel et al., 2013), sepulchral areas appear to have been used during a 394 395 relatively short period of time (Castex and Blanchard, 2011; Kacki et al., 2013). Therefore, time cannot be invoked to account for the strong heterogeneity of the conservation of the 396 remains and other parameters need to be discussed. 397

The heterogeneity of bone preservation is not randomly distributed. With the exception of the small chamber X81 in which bone samples were well-preserved, most of the

well-preserved samples come from the large chambers (X83 and X84) while the poorly-400 401 preserved samples are found mostly in the small chambers (X80/T16 and X82/T18). In chamber X78/T15, the limited sampling (n=2) did not allow us to conclude on the quality of 402 collagen preservation in this room. This result is in keeping with anthropological observations 403 performed during the excavation although local variations can occur depending on the 404 disposition of the bones within a chamber (see below). Like in other great Roman catacombs, 405 the SSPM catacomb has a relatively stable climate throughout the year. Sánchez-Moral et al. 406 (2005a) reported a number of micro-environmental parameters in the catacombs of Domitilla 407 and St. Callistus that can easily be extrapolated to the SSPM catacomb given the similar 408 409 characteristics and geographical proximity (a few kilometers away) between these sepulchral complexes. A high humidity close to saturation ( $\geq 97\%$ ) and a constant temperature of 15-410 17°C were recorded in the two catacombs. Given the small size of the central sector of the 411 412 SSPM catacomb and the existence of large openings between chambers, differences in microclimate between rooms are highly unlikely. During the excavation, visual inspection of 413 bones in the large chambers indicated that bones close to the chamber walls were more altered 414 than in the center (Castex et al., 2009). We propose that runoff against the walls and higher 415 416 humidity locally could explain this difference in preservation between the center and the 417 periphery of the large chambers. In the smaller chambers, all the bones remain relatively close to the walls and would be equally affected by the water runoff. In the large chambers, 418 buffering conditions (constant humidity and temperature) would have favored exceptional 419 420 bone collagen preservation for bones situated further away from the walls. Due to its central position, the small chamber X81 has several openings (Figure 1). This has probably restricted 421 422 runoff against the walls, which could explain the better preservation of the bones in this chamber in general. Finally, trampling of the human remains by the grave diggers, families of 423 the deceased and/or pilgrims along the walls of the burial chambers, especially in the large 424

ones, could be another explanation. A circulation area along the west wall of the chamber
X83 has been identified causing the loss of the anatomical integrity of the bone in this sector
of the chamber (Castex et al., 2009).

428

429 <u>6.3. Testing for the preservation of the isotopic composition of bone apatite using radiocarbon</u>
 430 <u>dating</u>

A crucial point for the use of bone apatite isotope values to infer diet and mobility 431 patterns of past populations is to establish whether bone recrystallization was associated with 432 carbon and oxygen isotope exchange. We found apatite to be slightly more <sup>14</sup>C active 433 (between 0 and 1.5 pMC) than collagen from the same individual. This is in keeping with 434 differences calculated for bones in archaeological sites ranging in age between 0 and 9.5 kyr 435 BP (Zazzo, in press). The positive <sup>14</sup>C<sub>col-carb</sub> age difference together with the correlation 436 between  ${}^{14}C_{carb}$  and  $\delta^{13}C_{carb}$  values, indicate that carbon isotope exchange between bone 437 438 apatite and dissolved inorganic carbon took place with a younger source of carbon with higher  $\delta^{13}C$  values. The  $^{14}C_{col}$  age offset can be used to calculate a percent contamination of the 439 carbonate fraction with modern carbon if this value represents the true age of an individual. 440 However, the positive correlation found between  $\delta^{13}C_{col}$  and  ${}^{14}C_{col}$  values suggests that the 441 individuals with the highest  $\delta^{13}$ C values could have consumed marine foods as these usually 442 have more positive  $\delta^{13}$ C values than terrestrial foods (Craig et al., 2013; Richards et al., 2005; 443 Schoeninger et al., 1983). The lack of correlation between the  $\delta^{15}N_{col}$  values and the  ${}^{14}C_{col}$ 444 ages could be explained by the consumption of low trophic level fish (e.g., anchovies, 445 sardines, mackerel, etc.) or bivalves (e.g., oysters, cockles, clams, etc.) (Carlier et al., 2007; 446 Garvie-Lok, 2001). This result is coherent with the significant (ca. 15-20%) proportion of 447 marine food found in the diet of the victims of the 79 AD Vesuvius eruption at Herculaneum 448 (Craig et al., 2013). According to the equation in Figure 3A from Craig et al. (2013),  $\delta^{13}C_{col}$ 449

values measured for the five individuals could correspond to <sup>14</sup>C age excesses between 60 (for 450 Individual US216/Mand1) and 133 (for Individual 64) <sup>14</sup>C yr. This would affect the collagen 451 age more than the apatite age because collagen records the protein fraction of the diet, while 452 apatite carbon records the whole diet, leading to an overestimation of the age differences 453 between the two fractions. A large dependence on marine food in individual 64 could explain 454 the large age difference (180  $\pm$  40 <sup>14</sup>C yr) measured between the two individuals dated in the 455 burial chamber X82/T18 (Table 4). This hypothesis is also supported by the fact that in 456 chamber X80/T16, the lack of <sup>14</sup>C<sub>col</sub> age difference between individuals 24 and 79 457 corresponds to identical  $\delta^{13}C_{col}$  values for these specimens, suggesting a similar amount of 458 marine food in their diet. For these reasons, the value of 1.5 pMC contamination must be 459 460 considered as a maximum estimate.

The central area of the entire SSPM catacomb and numerous others roman catacombs 461 (e.g. the Domitilla and St Callixtus catacombs) is carved through pozzolan, a tuff layer of the 462 Villa Senni formation resulting from an eruptive event of the Colli Albani volcano 463 (Funicielllo et al., 2008; Giordano, 2010). Bulk measurements on samples coming from the 464 Domitilla and St Callixtus catacombs indicate that pozzolan can contain 1-5% calcite 465 (Sánchez-Moral et al., 2005a; Sánchez-Moral et al., 2005b). To our knowledge, there is no 466 published stable isotope data for this ignimbrite. However,  $\delta^{13}C$  of carbonate in lavas and 467 ejecta from the same volcanic complex have been measured and range from -19.8 to 3.5‰ 468 (Fornaseri and Turi, 1969). If we use the highest  $\delta^{13}$ C value as an estimate for the diagenetic 469 endmember, a simple mass balance calculation taking into account the intra-individual 470 differences in <sup>14</sup>C activity allows us to estimate a  $\delta^{13}$ C values shift between 0.00‰ (SD 471  $\pm 0.07\%$ ) and 0.27‰ (SD  $\pm 0.08\%$ ) as a result of diagenesis. Therefore, the intake of 472 exogenous carbon in bone carbonate is limited and does not modify its carbon isotope 473 474 composition to any great extent. This is in keeping with the slightly acidic conditions in the

475 SSPM catacomb. As previously mentioned, the correction corresponds to a maximum 476 estimate. Thus, the isotopic composition of the carbonate fraction of bone can be considered 477 as reliable as that of the collagen fraction and can be used to reconstruct the life histories of 478 the individuals buried in the central area of the catacomb. This is beyond the scope of this 479 study and will be the focus of another article.

Finally, the significant carbon and oxygen isotope difference of apatite found between 480 samples whose collagen was well- and poorly-preserved is intriguing and deserves attention. 481 Samples which did not pass the collagen preservation tests had  $\delta^{13}C_{carb}$  values 0.3% lower 482 and  $\delta^{18}$ O<sub>carb</sub> 0.3‰ higher on average than those with well-preserved collagen (Table 2). The 483 difference between the two groups, although small, was significant for  $\delta^{13}C_{carb}$  and  $\delta^{18}O_{carb}$ 484 (Mann-Whitney U tests; p-values << 0.05). Because of the negative correlation found 485 between <sup>14</sup>C<sub>carb</sub> ages and  $\delta^{13}$ C<sub>carb</sub> values, lower  $\delta^{13}$ C<sub>carb</sub> are an unlikely result of a contaminant 486 with a more negative  $\delta^{13}$ C value. We propose a different interpretation for the difference 487 found between the two groups. It is striking that the direction and magnitude of the isotopic 488 shifts that we observed are similar to those measured by Koch et al. (1997) between untreated 489 and acetic-acid treated modern enamel and bone samples. The two sub-groups of bones from 490 the SSPM mimic the untreated and treated samples from the Koch et al. (1997) experiment. 491 492 Moreover, bones with low collagen yields are also highly recrystallized and have lost part of their structural carbonate. Carbonates in apatite are present in two different positions, A and 493 B, A-bonds being the weakest. We found OH- ions in some of the spectra, possibly 494 substituting for A-carbonates. As postulated by Koch et al. (1997) it is plausible to assume 495 that these two sites with different chemical bonds discriminate stable isotopes differently. 496 Since A/B type carbonate ratios are likely different in recrystallized and preserved apatites, 497 the slight isotopic difference measured at the population level could well reflect this 498

difference in isotope fractionation. This difference would then result from recrystallization,not isotope exchange.

501

## 502 <u>6.4. Regional variability in bone preservation: catacombs vs. open-air sites</u>

Rutgers et al. (2009) hypothesized that the microclimate of catacombs affects 503 negatively bone collage preservation. To further investigate this issue, we compared bone 504 collagen preservation in the catacombs and in contemporary open air sites from Italy (Figure 505 9). The choice of sites included in this comparison is dependent on the collagen extraction 506 protocol used on each site. Some methods, such as ultra-filtration, are known to drastically 507 508 reduce collagen extraction yields. Because of this possible methodological bias, our comparison only includes sites from central Italy - all located in Rome's region, also known 509 as Latium - (Killgrove and Tykot, 2013; Prowse et al., 2004; Prowse, 2001; Prowse et al., 510 511 2007; Prowse et al., 2005; Rutgers et al., 2009), but excludes sites from southern Italy (Craig et al. 2009; Craig et al. 2013). With an average collagen extraction yield close to 50%, bones 512 from the SSPM appear to be better preserved than most of the contemporary sites of the 513 Latium. Comparison indicates that the quantity of extracted collagen is similar (50% or 514 515 below) in the small chambers (with the exception of X81) but much higher (between 60-90% 516 on average) in the large chambers. It is also interesting to note that the two sites presenting the highest (although highly variable) average extraction yields in the Latium are catacombs. 517 Despite the limitations described above, the relatively stable climatic conditions prevailing in 518 catacombs seem overall to have favored, rather than disadvantaged bone collagen 519 preservation and therefore contradicts Rutgers et al. (2009)'s assumption. However, an 520 opposite pattern seems to emerge if one looks at the mineral fraction of bone. The comparison 521 of the crystallinity values calculated for the bone samples from the SSPM catacomb with 522 those published for open air sites from different Roman Empire provinces clearly shows that 523

the mineral phase of bones is much more altered in the SSPM catacomb than in the other sites 524 (Figure 10). Although we are aware that the comparison of IRSF values reported in different 525 studies can be problematic due to variances in sample preparation protocols and measurement 526 methods (KBr vs. ATR mode), the IRSF values calculated for the SSPM catacomb are similar 527 to those observed for highly degraded bones (Berna et al., 2004; Lebon et al., 2010). Overall, 528 bones found in catacomb contexts seem to present a Janus face<sup>1</sup>, showing both a well-529 preserved organic and a poorly-preserved mineral phase. But as previously shown, this high 530 degree of recrystallization is not correlated with isotope exchange of the mineral phase with 531 the surrounding environment, possibly due to the relatively low pH reigning in the catacomb. 532 Based on this extensive study, we can conclude that it will be possible to examine traits of the 533 534 life history of the individuals buried in the catacomb based on the combined analysis of bone collagen (when preserved) and apatite isotope values. 535

536

## 537 7. Conclusion

This study - the first focusing on diagenesis in a catacomb context - illustrates the 538 effect of post-depositional processes on bone preservation. Our multi-proxy approach showed 539 540 that extreme differences in preservation can be found between contemporary individuals 541 within a small area, highlighting the influence of localized variations on taphonomy. We found that the heterogeneity of bone preservation was not randomly distributed in the SSPM 542 catacomb and that bone was better preserved in the large chambers than in the small ones. 543 This is in keeping with anthropological observations performed during the excavation and we 544 propose that the combination of acidic conditions, together with condensation of air humidity 545 and runoff against the walls could explain this differential preservation. Comparison with 546 contemporary sites from the Latium indicates the two sites presenting the highest (although 547

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> named after the Roman deity Janus who had two faces, one looking forward, the other looking backward. By extension, this term refers to a deceitful person or an object having or containing contrasting characteristics.

highly variable) average extraction yields are catacombs, and that bone collagen in large chambers is much better preserved than in other open air contemporary sites. Therefore, the relatively stable climatic conditions prevailing in catacombs seem overall to have favored, rather than disadvantaged bone preservation.

Despite high rates of recrystallization observed for some of the bone samples, coherent 552 radiocarbon ages measured in the carbonate and collagen fractions of several individuals 553 554 demonstrates a lack of significant (>1%) isotopic exchange. We noticed a slight (0.3‰) difference in both  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O values between the well-preserved and the most severely 555 556 recrystallized samples. This difference is similar in magnitude and direction with differences observed on modern samples pretreated with acetic acid and could be due to selective 557 leaching of A vs. B-type carbonate in apatite during recrystallization. This shift is close to 558 analytical precision and does not preclude reliable reconstructions of the individual history of 559 these specimens based on stable isotope analysis of the carbonate fraction. Therefore, further 560 561 dietary reconstructions can include all the individuals of the population, even those for which bone collagen is no longer preserved. 562

563

#### 564 8. Acknowledgements

The authors wish to express their gratitude to R. Giuliani, chief inspector of the 565 Vatican's Pontifical Commission for Sacred Archaeology. The study has profited largely from 566 extensive discussions with the members of the scientific team of the SSPM catacomb project, 567 P. Blanchard, G. Sachau-Carcel, S. Kacki and E. Schotsmans. We thank O. Tombret (Labex 568 569 BCDiv) and J. Ughetto-Monfrin (SSMIM) for their help with the FT-IR and stable isotope analysis. Analyses benefited from the financial help of the Action Thématique du Muséum 570 (ATM) "Biomineralization" and from Archeosphère Inc. (Bordeaux, France) thanks to F. 571 572 Lacrampe-Cuyaubère and C. Beauval. We are also grateful to the Maison des Sciences de

573	l'Homme d'Aquitaine for their support. K. Salesse benefitted from a scholarship by the
574	Ministère de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de la Recherche allocated to Bordeaux University.
575	Finally, we thank the Guest Editor V. Balter and the two anonymous reviewers for their
576	constructive criticism and their help to clarify several points of this manuscript.

577 578

#### ----

593

## 579 9. References

- Alfano, D., Albunia, A.R., Motta, O., Proto, A., 2009. Detection of diagenetic alterations by
  spectroscopic analysis on archaeological bones from the necropolis of Poseidonia
  (Paestum): a case study. Journal of Cultural Heritage 10, 509-513.
- Ambrose, S.H., 1990. Preparation and characterization of bone and tooth collagen for isotopic
  analysis. Journal of Archaeological Science 17, 431-451.
- Asscher, Y., Weiner, S., Boaretto, E., 2011. Variations in atomic disorder in biogenic
  carbonate hydroxyapatite using the infrared spectrum grinding curve method. Advanced
  Functional Materials 21, 3308-3313.
- Balzer, A., Gleixner, G., Grupe, G., Schmidt, H.L., Schramm, S., Turban-Just, S., 1997. In
  vitro decomposition of bone collagen by soil bacteria: the implications for stable isotope
  analysis in archaeometry. Archaeometry 39, 415-429.
- Berna, F., Matthews, A., Weiner, S., 2004. Solubilities of bone mineral from archaeological
  sites: the recrystallization window. Journal of Archaeological Science 31, 867-882.
- from the catacomb of Saints Peter and Marcellinus in Rome, second-third century AD.Antiquity 81, 989-998.

Blanchard, P., Castex, D., Coquerelle, M., Giuliani, R., Ricciardi, M., 2007. A mass grave

Bocherens, H., Drucker, D., Billiou, D., Moussa, I., 2005. Une nouvelle approche pour
évaluer l'état de conservation de l'os et du collagène pour les mesures isotopiques

(datation au radiocarbone, isotopes stables du carbone et de l'azote). L'Anthropologie109, 557-567.

- Bocherens, H., Drucker, D.G., Billiou, D., Geneste, J.M., Kervazo, B., 2008. Grotte Chauvet
  (Ardèche, France): a "natural experiment" for bone diagenesis in karstic context.
  Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 266, 220-226.
- Bocherens, H., Fizet, M., Cuif, J.P., Jaeger, J.-J., Michard, J.-G., Mariotti, A., 1988.
  Premières mesures d'abondances isotopiques naturelles en <sup>13</sup>C et en <sup>15</sup>N de la matière
  organique fossile de dinosaure. Application à l'étude du régime alimentaire du genre *Anatosaurus (Ornithischia, Hadrosauridae*). Comptes Rendus de l'Académie des
  Sciences 306, 1521-1526.
- Bocherens, H., Fizet, M., Mariotti, A., Lange-Badre, B., Vandermeersch, B., Borel, J.P.,
  Bellon, G., 1991. Isotopic biogeochemistry (<sup>13</sup>C, <sup>15</sup>N) of fossil vertebrate collagen:
  application to the study of a past food web including Neandertal man. Journal of Human
  Evolution 20, 481-492.
- Brady, A.L., White, C.D., Longstaffe, F.J., Southam, G., 2008. Investigating intra-bone
  isotopic variations in bioapatite using IR-laser ablation and micromilling: implications
  for identifying diagenesis? Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 266,
  190-199.
- Carlier, A., Riera, P., Amouroux, J.-M., Bodiou, J.-Y., Grémare, A., 2007. Benthic trophic
  network in the Bay of Banyuls-sur-Mer (northwest Mediterranean, France): an
  assessment based on stable carbon and nitrogen isotopes analysis. Estuarine, Coastal
  and Shelf Science 72, 1-15.
- Carter, D.O., Tibbett, M., 2008. Cadaver decomposition and soil: processes, in: Tibbett, M.,
  Carter, D.O. (Eds.), Soil analysis in forensic taphonomy. CRC Press, Boca Raton, pp.
  29-52.

- 623 Carter, M.R., 1986. Microbial biomass and mineralizable nitrogen in solonetzic soils:
  624 influence of gypsum and lime amendments. Soil Biology and Biochemistry 18, 531625 537.
- Castex, D., Blanchard, A., 2011. Témoignages archéologiques de crise(s) épidémique(s) : la
  catacombe des Saints Marcellin et Pierre (Rome, fin I<sup>er</sup>-III<sup>e</sup> s.), in: Castex, D., Courtaud,
  P., Duday, H., Le Mort, F., Tillier, A.-M. (Eds.), Le regroupement des morts. Genèse et
  diversité archéologique. Maison des Sciences de l'Homme d'Aquitaine, Bordeaux, pp.

**630** 281-293.

- Castex, D., Blanchard, A., Giuliani, R., Ricciardi, M., 2007. Les ensembles funéraires du
  secteur central de la catacombe des Saints Pierre et Marcellin (Rome, I<sup>er</sup>-III<sup>e</sup> siècle) :
  caractérisation, hypothèses d'interprétations et perspectives de recherches. Mélanges de
  l'École française de Rome Antiquité 119, 274-282.
- Castex, D., Blanchard, A., Réveillas, H., Kacki, S., Giuliani, R., 2009. Les sépultures du
  secteur central de la catacombe des Saints Pierre-et-Marcellin (Rome). État des analyses
  bio-archéologiques et perspectives Mélanges de l'École française de Rome Antiquité
  121, 287-297.
- Castex, D., Blanchard, P., Kacki, S., Réveillas, H., Giuliani, R., 2011. Le secteur central de la
  catacombe des Sts Pierre-et-Marcellin (Rome, I<sup>er</sup>-III<sup>e</sup> siècle). Indices archéologiques
  d'une crise brutale de mortalité. Mélanges de l'École Française de Rome Chronique
  123, 274-280.
- 643 Child, A.M., 1995. Towards an understanding of the microbial decomposition of
  644 archaeological bone in the burial environment. Journal of Archaeological Science 22,
  645 165-174.

- Collins, M.J., Nielsen-Marsh, C.M., Hiller, J., Smith, C.I., Roberts, J.P., Prigodich, R.V.,
  Weiss, T.J., Csapo, J., Millard, A.R., Turner-Walker, G., 2002. The survival of organic
  matter in bone: a review. Archaeometry 44, 383-394.
- 649 Courtney, R., Kirwan, L., 2012. Gypsum amendment of alkaline bauxite residue Plant
  650 available aluminium and implications for grassland restoration. Ecological Engineering
  651 42, 279-282.
- Craig, O.E., Biazzo, M., O'Connell, T.C., Garnsey, P., Martinez-Labarga, C., Lelli, R.,
  Salvadei, L., Tartaglia, G., Nava, A., Renò, L., Fiammenghi, A., Rickards, O., Bondioli,

654

655 (1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> Centuries AD) in southern Italy. American Journal of Physical
656 Anthropology 139, 572-583.

L., 2009. Stable isotopic evidence for diet at the imperial Roman coastal site of Velia

- Craig, O.E., Bondioli, L., Fattore, L., Higham, T., Hedges, R., 2013. Evaluating marine diets
  through radiocarbon dating and stable isotope analysis of victims of the AD79 eruption
  of Vesuvius. American Journal of Physical Anthropology 152, 345-352.
- DeNiro, M.J., 1985. Postmortem preservation and alteration of in vivo bone collagen ratios in
  relation to palaeodietary reconstruction. Nature 317, 806-809.
- DeNiro, M.J., Epstein, S., 1981. Influence of diet on the distribution of nitrogen isotopes in
  animals. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 45, 341-351.
- DeNiro, M.J., Weiner, S., 1988. Chemical, enzymatic and spectroscopic characterization of
  "collagen" and other organic fractions from prehistoric bones. Geochimica et
  Cosmochimica Acta 52, 2197-2206.
- 667 Devièse, T., Vanhove, C., Chapoulie, R., Blanchard, P., Colombini, M.P., Regert, M., Castex,
- 668 D., 2010. Détermination et fonction des substances organiques et des matières minérales
  669 exploitées dans les rites funéraires de la catacombe des Saints Pierre-et-Marcellin à
- 670 Rome (Ier-IIIe siècle), in: Cartron, I., Castex, D., Georges, P., Vivas, M., Charageat, M.

- 671 (Eds.), De corps en corps. Traitement et devenir du cadavre. Maison des Sciences de
  672 l'Homme d'Aquitaine, Bordeaux, pp. 115-139.
- 673 Dobberstein, R.C., Collins, M.J., Craig, O.E., Taylor, G., Penkman, K.E.H., Ritz-Timme, S.,
- 674 2009. Archaeological collagen: why worry about collagen diagenesis? Archaeological675 and Anthropological Sciences 1, 31-42.
- Dupras, T.L., 1999. Dining in the Dakhleh Oasis, Egypt: determination of diet using
  documents and stable isotope analysis, Department of Anthropology. McMaster
  University, Hamilton, p. 345.
- Dupras, T.L., Schwarcz, H.P., 2001. Strangers in a strange land: stable isotope evidence for
  human migration in the Dakhleh Oasis, Egypt. Journal of Anthropological Archaeology
  28, 1199-1208.
- Fornaseri, M., Turi, B., 1969. Carbon and oxygen isotopic composition of carbonates in lavas
  and ejectites from the Alban Hills, Italy. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology 23,
  244-256.
- Funicielllo, R., Praturlon, A., Giordano, G., 2008. La geologia di Roma dal centro storico alla
  periferia. S.E.L.C.A., Firenze, p. 660.
- Garvie-Lok, S.J., 2001. Loaves and fishes: a stable isotope reconstruction of diet in medieval
  Greece, Department of Archaeology. University of Calgary, Calgary, p. 525.
- 689 Gill-King, H., 1997. Chemical, ultrastructural aspects of decomposition, in: Haglund, W.D.,
- Sorg, M.H. (Eds.), Forensic taphonomy: the post-mortem fate of human remains. CRC
  Press, Boca Raton, pp. 93-108.
- Giordano, A., 2010. Stratigraphy, volcano tectonics and evolution of the Colli Albani
  volcanic field, in: Funicielllo, R., Giordani, A. (Eds.), The Colli Albani volcano.
  Geological Society, London, pp. 43-98.

- Grupe, G., 2001. Archaeological microbiology, in: Brothwell, D.R., Pollard, A.M. (Eds.),
  Handbook of archaeological sciences. Wiley, New York, pp. 351-363.
- Grupe, G., Balzer, A., Turban-Just, S., 2001. Modeling protein diagenesis in ancient bone:
  towards a validation of stable isotope data, in: Ambrose, S.H., Katzenberg, M.A. (Eds.),
  Biogeochemical approaches to paleodietary analysis. Kluwer Academic, Plenum
  Publishers, New York, pp. 173-188.
- Guyon, J., 1987. Le cimetière aux deux lauriers. Recherches sur les catacombes romaines.
  École française de Rome, Rome, p. 556.
- Harbeck, M., Grupe, G., 2009. Experimental chemical degradation compared to natural
  diagenetic alteration of collagen: implications for collagen quality indicators for stable
  isotope analysis. Archaeological and Anthropological Sciences 1, 43-57.
- Hare, P.E., Estep, M.L.F., 1982. Carbon and nitrogen isotopic composition of amino acids in
  modern and fossil collagens. Carnegie Institute of Washington Yearbook 82, 410-414.
- Hare, P.E., Fogel, M.L., Stafford Jr, T.W., Mitchell, A.D., Hoering, T.C., 1991. The isotopic
- composition of carbon and nitrogen in individual amino acids isolated from modern and
  fossil proteins. Journal of Archaeological Science 18, 277-292.
- Hedges, R.E.M., 2002. Bone diagenesis: an overview of processes. Archaeometry 44, 319328.
- Hedges, R.E.M., Lee-Thorp, J.A., Tuross, N.C., 1995a. Is tooth enamel carbonate a suitable
  material for radiocarbon dating? Radiocarbon 37, 285-290.
- Hedges, R.E.M., Millard, A.R., 1995. Bones and groundwater: towards the modelling of
  diagenetic processes. Journal of Archaeological Science 22, 155-164.
- Hedges, R.E.M., Millard, A.R., Pike, A.W.G., 1995b. Measurements and relationships of
  diagenetic alteration of bone from three archaeological sites. Journal of Archaeological
  Science 22, 201-209.

- Iacumin, P., Bocherens, H., Chaix, L., Mariotti, A., 1998. Stable carbon and nitrogen isotopes
  as dietary indicators of ancient Nubian populations (northern Sudan). Journal of
  Anthropological Archaeology 25, 293-301.
- Kacki, S., Réveillas, H., Sachau-Carcel, G., Giuliani, R., Blanchard, P., Castex, D., 2013.
  Réévaluation des arguments de simultanéité des dépôts de cadavres: l'exemple des sépultures plurielles de la catacombe des Saints Pierre-et-Marcellin (Rome). Bulletins et Mémoires de la Société d'Anthropologie de Paris, 1-10.
- Katzenberg, M.A., Goriunova, O., Weber, A., 2009. Paleodiet reconstruction of Bronze age
  Siberians from the mortuary site of Khuzhir-Nuge XIV, Lake Baikal. Journal of
  Archaeological Science 36, 663–674.
- Keenleyside, A., Schwarcz, H.P., Stirling, L., Ben Lazreg, N., 2009. Stable isotopic evidence
  for diet in a Roman and late Roman population from Leptiminus, Tunisia. Journal of
  Archaeological Science 36, 51-63.
- Killgrove, K., 2010. Migration and mobility in imperial Rome, Department of Anthropology.
  University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, p. 390.
- Killgrove, K., Tykot, R.H., 2013. Food for Rome: a stable isotope investigation of diet in the
   Imperial period (1<sup>st</sup>-3<sup>rd</sup> centuries AD). Journal of Anthropological Archaeology 32, 28 38.
- Koch, P.L., Tuross, N., Fogel, M.L., 1997. The effects of sample treatment and diagenesis on
  the isotopic integrity of carbonate in biogenic hydroxylapatite. Journal of
  Archaeological Science 24, 417-429.
- Kordlaghari, M.P., Rowell, D.L., 2006. The role of gypsum in the reactions of phosphate with
  soils. Geoderma 132, 105-115.
- Krueger, H.W., 1991. Exchange of carbon with biological apatite. Journal of Archaeological
  Science 18, 355-361.

- Lebon, M., Muller, K., Bahain, J.-J., Frohlich, F., Falgueres, C., Bertrand, L., Sandt, C.,
  Reiche, I., 2011. Imaging fossil bone alterations at the microscale by SR-FTIR
  microspectroscopy. Journal of Analytical Atomic Spectrometry 26, 922-929.
- Lebon, M., 2008. Caractérisation par spectroscopie infrarouge à transformée de Fourier des
  ossements chauffés en contexte archéologique Comparaison entre référentiel moderne
  et matériel fossile. Implications diagénétiques, Spécialité : Préhistoire. Muséum
  National d'Histoire Naturelle, Paris, p. 334.
- Lebon, M., Reiche, I., Bahain, J.J., Chadefaux, C., Moigne, A.M., Fröhlich, F., Sémah, F.,
  Schwarcz, H.P., Falguères, C., 2010. New parameters for the characterization of
  diagenetic alterations and heat-induced changes of fossil bone mineral using Fourier
  transform infrared spectrometry. Journal of Archaeological Science 37, 2265-2276.
- Longin, R., 1971. New method of collagen extraction for radiocarbon dating. Nature 230,
  241-242.
- Munro, L.E., Longstaffe, F.J., White, C.D., 2007. Burning and boiling of modern deer bone:
  effects on crystallinity and oxygen isotope composition of bioapatite phosphate.
  Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 249, 90-102.
- Nielsen-Marsh, C.M., Hedges, R.E.M., 2000. Patterns of Diagenesis in Bone I: the Effects of
  Site Environments. Journal of Archaeological Science 27, 1139-1150.
- 763 Nielsen-Marsh, C.M., Smith, C.I., Jans, M.M.E., Nord, A., Kars, H., Collins, M.J., 2007.
- Bone diagenesis in the European Holocene II: taphonomic and environmental
  considerations. Journal of Archaeological Science 34, 1523-1531.
- Oelze, V.M., Koch, J.K., Kupke, K., Nehlich, O., Zauner, S., Wahl, J., Weise, S.M.,
  Rieckhoff, S., Richards, M.P., 2012. Multi-isotopic analysis reveals individual mobility
  and diet at the early Iron age monumental tumulus of Magdalenenberg, Germany.
  American Journal of Physical Anthropology 148, 406-421.

- Pagni, G., Burdassi, L., 2004. Gli inumati nella catacomba dei SS Pietro e Marcellino.
  Intervento di scavo antropologico. Excavation report, p. 10.
- Pate, F.D., Hutton, J.T., Norrish, K., 1989. Ionic exchange between soil solution and bone:
  toward a predictive model. Applied Geochemistry 4, 303-316.
- Pestle, W.J., Colvard, M., 2012. Bone collagen preservation in the tropics: a case study from
  ancient Puerto Rico. Journal of Archaeological Science 39, 2079-2090.
- Prowse, T., Schwarcz, H.P., Saunders, S., Macchiarelli, R., Bondioli, L., 2004. Isotopic
  paleodiet studies of skeletons from the imperial Roman-age cemetery of Isola Sacra,
  Rome, Italy. Journal of Archaeological Science 31, 259-272.
- Prowse, T.L., 2001. Isotopic and dental evidence for diet from the necropolis of Isola Sacra
  (1<sup>st</sup>-3<sup>rd</sup> centuries AD), Italy, Department of Anthropology. McMaster University,
  Hamilton, p. 356.
- Prowse, T.L., Schwarcz, H.P., Garnsey, P., Knyf, M., Macchiarelli, R., Bondioli, L., 2007.
  Isotopic evidence for age-related immigration to imperial Rome. American Journal of
  Physical Anthropology 132, 510-519.
- Prowse, T.L., Schwarcz, H.P., Saunders, S., Macchiarelli, R., Bondioli, L., 2005. Isotopic
  evidence for age-related variation in diet from Isola Sacra, Italy. American Journal of
  Physical Anthropology 128, 2-13.
- Reitsema, L.J., 2012. Stable carbon and nitrogen isotope analysis of human diet change in
  prehistoric and historic Poland, Department of Anthropology. The Ohio State
  University, Columbus, p. 377.
- Richards, M.P., Jacobi, R., Cook, J., Pettitt, P.B., Stringer, C.B., 2005. Isotope evidence for
  the intensive use of marine foods by late Upper Palaeolithic humans. Journal of Human
  Evolution 49, 390-394.

- Rutgers, L.V., van Strydonck, M., Boudin, M., van der Linde, C., 2009. Stable isotope data
  from the early Christian catacombs of ancient Rome: new insights into the dietary habits
  of Rome's early Christians. Journal of Archaeological Science 36, 1127–1134.
- 797 Sachau-Carcel, G., 2012. Apport de la modélisation tridimensionnelle à la compréhension du
- 798fonctionnement des sépultures multiples. L'exemple du secteur central de la catacombe799des Saints Pierre-et-Marcellin (Rome, Italie). (Ier-milieu IIIe s. ap. J.-C.), Spécialité :
- 800 Histoire ancienne. Université Bordeaux 3, Bordeaux, p. 505.
- Sachau-Carcel, G., Castex, D., Vergnieux, R., 2013. Sites à stratification complexe et
  modélisation tridimensionnelle : vers une nouvelle approche des sépultures multiples.
  ArchéoSciences 37, 89-104.
- Sánchez-Moral, S., Luque, L., Cañaveras, J.-C., Soler, V., Garcia-Guinea, J., Aparicio, A.,
  2005a. Lime–pozzolana mortars in Roman catacombs: composition, structures and
  restoration. Cement and Concrete Research 35, 1555-1565.
- Sánchez-Moral, S., Luque, L., Cuezva, S., Soler, V., Benavente, D., Laiz, L., Gonzalez, J.M.,
  Saiz-Jimenez, C., 2005b. Deterioration of building materials in Roman catacombs: the
  influence of visitors. Science of the Total Environment 349, 260-276.
- Schoeninger, M.J., DeNiro, M.J., Tauber, H., 1983. Stable nitrogen isotope ratios of bone
  collagen reflect marine and terrestrial components of Prehistoric human diet. Science
  220, 1381-1383.
- Schotsmans, E.M.J., Fletcher, J.N., Denton, J., Janaway, R.C., Wilson, A.S., 2014. Long-term
  effects of hydrated lime and quicklime on the decay of human remains using pig
  cadavers as human body analogues: field experiments. Forensic Science International
  238, 141.e1–141.e13.
- Shemesh, A., 1990. Crystallinity and diagenesis of sedimentary apatites. Geochimica et
  Cosmochimica Acta 54, 2433-2438.

- Shin, J.Y., Hedges, R.E.M., 2012. Diagenesis in bone and enamel apatite carbonate; the
  potential of density separation to assess the original composition. Journal of
  Archaeological Science 39, 1123-1130.
- Smith, C.I., Nielsen-Marsh, C.M., Jans, M.M.E., Collins, M.J., 2007. Bone diagenesis in the
  European Holocene : patterns and mechanisms. Journal of Archaeological Science 34,
  1485-1493.
- Smith, C.I., Nielsen–Marsh, C.M., Jans, M.M.E., Arthur, P., Nord, A.G., Collins, M.J., 2002.
  The strange case of Apigliano: early 'fossilization' of medieval bone in southern Italy.
  Archaeometry 44, 405-415.
- Stafford, J.T.W., Hare, P.E., Currie, L., Jull, A.J.T., Donahue, D.J., 1991. Accelerator
  radiocarbon dating at the molecular level. Journal of Archaeological Science 18, 35-72.
- Stiner, M.C., Kuhn, S.L., Weiner, S., Bar-Yosef, O., 1995. Differential burning,
  recrystallization, and fragmentation of archaeological bone. Journal of Archaeological
  Science 22, 223-237.
- Trueman, C.N.G., Behrensmeyer A.K., Tuross, N., Weiner, S., 2004. Mineralogical and
  compositional changes in bones exposed on soil surfaces in Amboseli National Park,
  Kenya: diagenetic mechanisms and the role of sediment pore fluids. Journal of
  Archwaeological Science 31, 721-739.
- Trueman, C.N.G., Privat, K., Field, J., 2008. Why do crystallinity values fail to predict the
  extent of diagenetic alteration of bone mineral? Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology,
  Palaeoecology 266, 160-167.
- van Klinken, G.J., 1999. Bone collagen quality indicators for palaeodietary and radiocarbon
  measurements. Journal of Archaeological Science 26, 687-695.
- 842 Vanhove, C., 2006. Pratiques et rites funéraires du monde romain méditerrannéen aux II<sup>ème</sup> et
- 843 III<sup>ème</sup> siècles de notre ère. Caractérisation du matériel de la catacombe des Saints Pierre

- et Marcellin à Rome. Master's thesis directed by R. Chapoulie (IRAMAT-CRP2A).
  Université Bordeaux Montaigne, Bordeaux, p. 36.
- Vass, A.A., Barshick, S.-A., Sega, G., Caton, J., Skeen, J.T., Love, J.C., Synstelien, J.A.,
  2002. Decomposition chemistry of human remains: a new methodology for determining
- the postmortem interval. Journal of Forensic Sciences 47, 542-553.
- Weiner, S., Bar-Yosef, O., 1990. States of preservation of bones from prehistoric sites in the
  Near East: a survey. Journal of Archaeological Science 17, 187-196.
- Wong, V.N.L., Dalal, R.C., Greene, R.S.B., 2009. Carbon dynamics of sodic and saline soils
  following gypsum and organic material additions: a laboratory incubation. Applied Soil
  Ecology 41, 29-40.
- Wright, L.E., Schwarcz, H.P., 1996. Infrared and isotopic evidence for diagenesis of bone
  apatite at Dos Pilas, Guatemala: palaeodietary implications. Journal of Archaeological
  Science 23, 933-944.
- Wright, L.E., Valdés, J.A., Burton, J.H., Douglas Price, T., Schwarcz, H.P., 2010. The
  children of Kaminaljuyu: isotopic insight into diet and long distance interaction in
  Mesoamerica. Journal of Anthropological Archaeology 29, 155-178.
- Zazzo, A., in press. Bone and enamel carbonate diagenesis: a radiocarbon prospective.
  Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, DOI:
  10.1016/j.palaeo.2014.05.006
- Zazzo, A., Saliège, J.F., 2011. Radiocarbon dating of biological apatites: a review.
  Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 310, 52-61.
- Zitelli, F., 2013. Étude de la cinétique de dépôt de corps par analyses physico-chimiques des
  parois de tombes. Cas de la catacombe des Saints Pierre et Marcellin (Rome Ier-IIIème
- s. ap. J.-C.). ENSCBP internship report directed by R. Chapoulie (IRAMAT-CRP2A).
- 868 Université Bordeaux Montaigne, Bordeaux, p. 30.
- 869

870	Figure	Captions
		1

871

Figure 1: Plan of the burial chambers in the region X from the SSPM catacomb. After M.Ricciardi, modified.

874

Figure 2: FT-IR spectrum of a fresh bone showing the regions of interest as well as the IRSFcalculation procedure.

877

**Figure 3:** Photographs showing examples of good (A), medium (B) and poor (C) preservation

879 of the SSPM bones, based on their macroscopic characteristics

880

Figure 4: Collagen yield of the SSPM bone samples grouped by the burial chamber, skeletal part category and macroscopic appearance. Boxplots represent the 25<sup>th</sup>, 50<sup>th</sup> (median) and 75<sup>th</sup> percentiles in the distribution of scores. Whiskers indicate the variability outside the upper and lower quartiles. Outliers are identified by individual points. The shaded area corresponds to the collagen yield measured in modern bones (after Bocherens et al. 1991).

886

**Figure 5:** Carbon and nitrogen abundances of the SSPM bone samples. Samples which fail one of the collagen preservation criteria defined in Table 1 are considered poorly-preserved (closed symbols) while those passing all the preservation criteria are considered wellpreserved (open symbols).

891

Figure 6: IRSF plotted against CO<sub>3</sub>/PO<sub>4</sub> ratio of the SSPM bone samples. Modern bone
samples are shown for reference.

Figure 7: CO<sub>3</sub>/PO<sub>4</sub> ratio plotted against Amide1/ PO<sub>4</sub> ratio of the SSPM bone samples.
Modern bone samples are shown for reference.

897

Figure 8: IRSF plotted against Amide1/ PO4 ratio of the SSPM bone samples. Modern bonesamples are shown for reference.

900

Figure 9: Inter-site comparison of the collagen extraction yields measured on contemporary 901 human bone samples from the Latium. The Isola Sacra necropolis is located near Ostia and 902 Portus Romae and dated from the 1<sup>st</sup> to 3<sup>rd</sup> c. AD (Prowse et al., 2004; Prowse, 2001; Prowse 903 et al., 2007; Prowse et al., 2005). The ANAS cemetery is located between Ostia and Rome 904 and dated from the 1<sup>st</sup> to 3<sup>rd</sup> c. AD (Prowse et al., 2004; Prowse, 2001). The necropolises of 905 Casal Bertone and Castellaccio Europarco are located in Rome and dated from the 2nd to 3rd 906 and from the 1<sup>st</sup> to 2<sup>nd</sup> c. AD, respectively (Killgrove, 2010; Killgrove and Tykot, 2013). The 907 St Callixtus catacomb is located in Rome and dated from the 3<sup>rd</sup> to 5<sup>th</sup> c. AD (Rutgers et al., 908 2009). Boxplots represent the 25<sup>th</sup>, 50<sup>th</sup> (median) and 75<sup>th</sup> percentiles in the distribution of 909 scores. Whiskers indicate the variability outside the upper and lower quartiles. Outliers are 910 identified by individual points. The shaded area corresponds to the collagen yield measured in 911 912 modern bones (after Bocherens et al. 1991). OAS stands for open air site and SS stands for subterranean site. 913

914

Figure 10: Inter-site comparison of the IRSF values measured on human bone apatite
samples from the Roman Empire. The Kellis 2 cemetery is located near Mut in the Dakhleh
Oasis in Egypt and dated from the 1<sup>st</sup> to 5<sup>th</sup> c. AD (Dupras, 1999; Dupras and Schwarcz,
2001). The Leptiminus cemeteries are located in the modern day town of Lamta in Tunisia
and dated from the 2<sup>nd</sup> to 6<sup>th</sup> century AD (Keenleyside et al. 2009). The Poseidonia

920	necropolises are located near Capaccio-Paestum in Italy and dated from the 7 <sup>th</sup> c. BC to the
921	2 <sup>nd</sup> c. AD (Alfano et al. 2009). The Isola Sacra necropolis is located near Ostia and Portus
922	Romae and dated from the 1 <sup>st</sup> to 3 <sup>rd</sup> c. AD (Prowse et al., 2004; Prowse, 2001; Prowse et al.,
923	2007; Prowse et al., 2005). Boxplots represent the 25 <sup>th</sup> , 50 <sup>th</sup> (median) and 75 <sup>th</sup> percentiles in
924	the distribution of scores. Whiskers indicate the variability outside the upper and lower
925	quartiles. Outliers are identified by individual points. The hatched area corresponds to the
926	IRSF values found for modern bones. The shaded area corresponds to the samples mildly and
927	highly recrystallized. OAS stands for open air site and SS for subterranean site.