

# IsoArcH.eu: an open-access and collaborative isotope database for bioarchaeological samples from the Graeco-Roman World and its margins Authors

Kevin Salesse, Ricardo Fernandes, Xavier de Rochefort, Jaroslav Brůžek,

Dominique Castex, Élise Dufour

## ▶ To cite this version:

Kevin Salesse, Ricardo Fernandes, Xavier de Rochefort, Jaroslav Brůžek, Dominique Castex, et al.. IsoArcH.eu: an open-access and collaborative isotope database for bioarchaeological samples from the Graeco-Roman World and its margins Authors. Journal of Archaeological Science: Reports, 2018, 19, 10.1016/j.jasrep.2017.07.030. hal-03677852

# HAL Id: hal-03677852 https://hal.science/hal-03677852v1

Submitted on 25 May 2022

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

IsoArcH.eu: an open-access and collaborative isotope database for 1 bioarchaeological samples from the Graeco-Roman World and its margins 2 3 4 Authors Kevin Salesse<sup>1,2</sup>\*, Ricardo Fernandes<sup>3,4\*</sup>, Xavier de Rochefort<sup>5</sup>, Jaroslav Brůžek<sup>2,6</sup>, Dominique Castex<sup>2</sup>, 5 6 Élise Dufour<sup>7</sup> 7 <sup>1</sup>Université Libre de Bruxelles, Unité d'Anthropologie et de génétique humaine, CP192, avenue F.D. Roosevelt 50, 1050 8 Bruxelles, Belgique. 9 <sup>2</sup>Université de Bordeaux, CNRS, UMR 5199 : "PACEA - De la Préhistoire à l'Actuel : Culture, Environnement et 10 Anthropologie", bâtiment B8, allée Geoffroy St. Hilaire, CS 50023, F-33615 Pessac cedex, France. 11 <sup>3</sup>Max Planck Institute for the Science of Human History Kahlaische Strasse 10 D-07745 Jena, Germany 12 <sup>4</sup>McDonald Institute for Archaeological Research, University of Cambridge, Cambridge CB2 3ER, United Kingdom <sup>5</sup>Independent scholar, 4 le bourg, F-47200 Marcellus, France. 13 14 <sup>6</sup>Charles University, Department of Anthropology and Human Genetics, Viničná 7, 128 43 Praha 2, Czech Republic. 15 <sup>7</sup>Archéozoologie, Archéobotanique: sociétés, pratiques et environnements (UMR 7209), Sorbonne Universités, Muséum 16 national d'Histoire naturelle, CNRS, CP55, 55 rue Buffon, 75005 Paris, France. 17 18 \*Corresponding authors: ksalesse@ulb.ac.be (K. Salesse) and rf385@cam.ac.uk (R. Fernandes)

## 19

### 20 Abstract

21 This paper describes IsoArcH, a new web-based database of isotopic data for bioarchaeological 22 samples from the Graeco-Roman World and its margins. IsoArcH was designed as a cooperative platform for the dissemination of isotopic data and associated archaeological information. IsoArcH 23 24 follows the open access model and is freely accessible online (http://www.isoarch.eu). Created for 25 paleodietary, paleomobility and paleoenvironmental reconstruction research purposes, IsoArcH 26 compiled to this day published isotopic data for human, animal, and plant remains, as well as organic 27 residues, from nearly 300 sites. All data have been georeferenced allowing for their display on 28 ancient world maps and placement into their contemporaneous geopolitical background. In this 29 paper, several data-driven examples are shown to illustrate the research potential offered by 30 IsoArcH.

31

#### 32 Keywords

1. Classical Antiquity, 2. Iron age, 3. Diet, 4. Mobility, 5. Paleoenvironments, 6. Georeferenced
 database, 7. Isotopic proxies

- 35
- 36 **1. Introduction**

37 Isotopic proxies are widely recognized as a powerful tool to improve knowledge of past human 38 and animal diet and mobility patterns, to ascertain ancient crop and animal management practices, 39 and to reconstruct paleoenvironments (Drucker et al. 2012; Knudson et al. 2012; Boogard et al. 2013; 40 Müldner 2013; Touzeau et al. 2013; Knipper et al. 2016; De Cupere et al. 2017). Within 41 archaeological studies isotopic data has allowed for a better understanding of the social structure, 42 political organisation, economy, technology, and environmental contexts of past human groups (e.g. Prowse et al. 2004; Craig et al. 2009; Crowe et al. 2010; Pollard et al. 2011; Mays and Beavan 2012; 43 44 Salesse et al. 2013, 2014; Salesse 2015; Killgrove and Tykot 2017). The number of archaeological 45 publications containing isotopic data has surged during the past 20 years (Pestle et al. 2014; Szpak et al. 2017). However, the number of isotope web databases remains surprisingly low. There are several 46 47 databases of radiocarbon data (e.g. RADON, Kneisel et al. 2013; CARD, Martindale et al. 2016), 48 databases of modern environmental samples (e.g. IsoMAP, Bowen et al. 2017; IRHUM, Willmes et al. 49 2014) or archaeological artefacts (e.g. OXALID, Stos-Gale and Gale 2009). However, only a few 50 databases have gathered bioarchaeological isotope data, and even less include data from human 51 remains (e.g. KIK-IRPA, van Strydonck and de Roock 2011; dIANA, Etu-Shivola et al. 2015; IsoMemo, 52 Fernandes et al. 2017).

With a particular interest in isotopic studies concerning the Greco-Roman world *sensu lato*, we build IsoArcH, a web isotope database covering a wide chronological range (12<sup>th</sup> c. BCE - 8<sup>th</sup> c. CE) for bioarchaeological samples from European, Middle Eastern and North African contexts. IsoArcH is also a member of the IsoMemo initiative (Fernandes *et al.* 2017). The IsoMemo initiative follows a collaborative model for data sharing and project building that brings together different isotope databases within the research fields of ecology, environmental sciences, and archaeology.

IsoArcH is the first and main isotope web database fully dedicated to the Greco-Roman world and its margins. Furthermore, IsoArcH offers unique features, such as data display on ancient world maps, which are not available elsewhere and are of special research interest in the study of the focus region and time period.

63

#### 64 **2. Description of IsoArcH**

IsoArcH was designed as a web-based isotope database for bioarchaeological samples from Iron Age, Classical Antiquity and Late Antiquity (i.e. 12th c. BCE to 8th c. CE). It is hosted on a server relying entirely on open-source software solutions and implemented following a relational database model. The database structure of IsoArcH is divided according to four different types of bioarchaeological samples: human, animal, plant, and organic residues. Isotopic ratios ( $\delta D$ ,  $\delta^{13}C$ ,  $\delta^{15}N$ ,  $\delta^{18}O$ ,  $\delta^{34}S$  and  ${}^{87}Sr/{}^{86}Sr$ ) and associated quality control indicators are recorded following two main divisions: organic or mineral fractions on different kinds of samples (*e.g.* bone, tooth, hair, 72 calculus, etc.). The isotopic data is supplemented by archaeological and chronological information 73 relative to the sample (e.q. identification number, date range, description of archaeological context, 74 etc.). The selection of data fields for supporting information depends on the type of sample. For 75 example, for human samples supporting information includes the description of sex, age at death, 76 stature, and type of burial. Full citation details are provided for collected published data. IsoArcH 77 compiled to this day isotopic data for 4,000+ humans, 2,000+ animals, 100+ plants, and 10+ organic 78 residues from nearly 300 archaeological sites. Detailed information on database organisation and 79 web database architecture is provided in supplementary files 1 and 2.

IsoArcH is a collaborative database accessible to both researchers and the non-academic audience. Users can freely query the database and download the resulting output. Furthermore, users can contribute to expand IsoArcH by uploading complied or their own generated data. IsoArcH administrators check each new submission to ensure the maintenance of data consistency and quality. Once newly submitted data is approved, it is then added to the database and made available online. More information on database collaborative platform is given in supplementary file 3.

86 As a spatial database dedicated to the Graeco-Roman world and its margins (i.e. Europe, Near 87 and Middle East, and North Africa), all stored isotopic data is georeferenced. Using a web-mapping 88 capability, samples can be framed within the contemporary geopolitical context through their display 89 on ancient world maps. Available ancient world maps include those for the Persian, Alexander's, 90 Roman and Byzantine empires, plus for many other chrono-cultural entities. These maps serve as 91 backgrounds on which archaeological sites are projected (Figure 1). In addition, the projected maps 92 are interactive and can be used to explore the database with or without an initial query. Through the 93 selection of a site, users can have a summary of available data for that site (e.g. site name, number of 94 referenced individuals, population means for isotope values, and references). Detailed information 95 on web-mapping tool architecture is provided in supplementary file 4.

96 An open-access database policy is followed by IsoArcH which means that data is made available 97 free of restrictions on both access and use. IsoArcH is a public website, accessible at http://www.isoarch.eu, with no login requirement for data visualisation. However, a login is required 98 99 for database querying and data downloading. The content of IsoArcH is licensed under the Creative 100 Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International License (CC BY-NC-SA 4.0). Users 101 are free to copy and redistribute the data from IsoArcH in any medium or format. They can also 102 modify and build upon available data but they must distribute their contributions under the same 103 license as the original. The licensor cannot revoke these freedoms as long as the license terms are 104 followed. Under the previous terms, users must give in their productions 1) appropriate credits (*i.e.* 105 this publication and "Salesse, K., Fernandes, R., de Rochefort X., Brůžek J., Castex D., Dufour É., (2017), www.isoarch.eu (v.1.0), accessed mm/dd/yyyy"), 2) provide a link to the license 106

107 (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/4.0/), and 3) indicate if any changes were made.
108 Material obtained from IsoArcH cannot be used for commercial purposes.

109 The full advantages of the database are expected to arise from its collaborative approach. IsoArcH plans to become a new efficient tool at the service of the scientific community to provide an 110 overview of the state of paleodiet, paleomobility, and paleoenvironmental research in the ancient 111 Mediterranean. IsoArcH is part of a broadly-based concept of data centralization that should elicit 112 113 new discussions and encourage stronger interdisciplinary collaboration. The online interface provides 114 easy access to a library of embedded data organized in multiple layers that facilitates the building of 115 local isotopic baselines plus regional and temporal comparisons of data. Finally, IsoArcH will monitor 116 the release of publications pertaining to the Greco-Roman world and collect newly available isotopic 117 data.

118



119 120 121 122

123

Figure 1. Example of a map generated through IsoArcH showing the distribution of Roman archaeological sites where isotopic data from human and non-humans samples are available. The used map overlay is available from DARMC and shows the Roman provinces between 303 and 324 CE.

### **3. Research applications**

125 Isotopic data, together with associated chronological and other supporting information, 126 collected at IsoArcH allows for numerous research applications. These may include large scale 127 comparative studies of human diet or mobility following multiple selection criteria (e.g. chronology, 128 region, social variables). Whereas stored animal isotopic data can contribute to the reconstruction of 129 local environmental and human impact histories. For instance, herbivore collagen carbon or nitrogen stable isotope values can be used as proxies to establish past vegetation types ( $C_3$  or  $C_4$ ), levels of 130 131 aridity, and forest density (Schwarcz et al. 1999; Kelly 2000; Bonafini et al. 2013). IsoArcH can also be 132 used to identify data gaps for certain regions, time periods, or sample types. Concerning the latter, 133 there is presently a clear insufficiency of published plant isotopic data although this has a great 134 research potential. Carbon and nitrogen stable isotope data for cultivated plants can be used to 135 assess water availability and soil fertility which are also determined by human farming practices such 136 as irrigation and manuring (Aguilera et al. 2008; Szpak 2014; Styring et al. 2016). In addition, both 137 plant and animal isotopic data are required to define temporal and regional baselines for the 138 accurate quantification of human diets in isotope-based studies (Fernandes et al. 2015).

139 Within this section a few illustrative examples are given and briefly discussed to demonstrate 140 research uses for the data made available at IsoArcH. Oxygen isotopes measured in human teeth 141 and bone chiefly reflect the isotopic composition of drinking water and have been frequently used in 142 Roman mobility studies (see Killgrove & Montgomery 2016 and references therein). A simple 143 temporal comparison was made of human oxygen isotopic data from the Italian peninsula. Selected for comparison was tooth  $\delta^{18}$ O data (a single tooth per individual, mostly third molars) from human 144 145 remains dating between 400 BCE and 400 CE. The selection was further limited to individuals for 146 which the difference between the upper and lower limit of the assigned chronological boundaries 147 was lower than 200 years. The individuals were grouped into two broad chronological groups (<~ 200 CE and  $\geq$  ~200 CE) using as criterion the median of the chronological boundaries assigned to each 148 individual. Different types or reported measurements and units of reported  $\delta^{18}O$  tooth data ( $\delta^{18}O$ 149 150 carbonate or phosphate relative to VPDB or VSMOW standards) were subjected to necessary calculations to report these as  $\delta^{18}$ O precipitation values relative to the VSMOW standard (Chenery *et* 151 *al.*2012). Boxplots for selected human data  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{precip}}$  are shown in Figure 2a. 152



154Figure 2. a) Comparison of  $\delta^{18}O_{precip}$  values calculated from tooth  $\delta^{18}O$  data for Roman individuals from the Italian peninsula.155b) Comparison of Romano-British male and female human bone collagen  $\delta^{13}C_{coll}$  (b1) and  $\delta^{15}N_{coll}$  (b2) values. c) Comparison156of Roman British, Italian, and Egyptian herbivore bone collagen  $\delta^{13}C_{coll}$  (c1) and  $\delta^{15}N_{coll}$  (c2) values. Box edges represent 25<sup>th</sup>157and 75<sup>th</sup> percentiles (inter quartile range or IQR) while the horizontal line is the 50<sup>th</sup> percentile (median). Whiskers are the158minimum and maximum values that do not exceed a distance of 1.5 times the IQR. Beyond this distance single points159represent outliers.

The inter quartile ranges of  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{precip}}$  values shown in Figure 2a for the younger and older 160 chronological groups are contained within modern day ranges of  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{precip}}$  values observed for the 161 162 Italian peninsula (Lightfoot & O'Connell 2016). However, both chronological groups show a wide range of  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{precip}}$  values, larger for the younger group, which is indicative of a high degree of 163 mobility. The  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{precip}}$  mean for the younger group (mean  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{precip}} = -6.8 \pm 1.7\%$ ) is slightly smaller 164 than that of the older group (mean  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{precip}}$  = -6.3±1.6‰) but the difference is not statistically 165 166 significant (Welch two sample t-test: t = 1.1863, df = 41.56, p-value = 0.2422). The chronology of the 167 individuals from the younger group roughly coincides with a broadly warmer period (from ca. 250 to 168 400 CE) for which higher  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{precip}}$  values are observed relative to the previous centuries (McCormick 169 et al. 2012). Since the opposite trend is observed for  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{precip}}$  values in Figure 2a, it suggests a larger degree of mobility during the second half of the Imperial period which would possibly include a 170 171 larger proportion of individuals from northern regions. It would be interesting to place this within the context of the 3<sup>rd</sup> century crisis and a possibly greater connectivity with the northern regions of the 172 173 Roman Empire. Nonetheless, some interpretative caution is necessary since the isotopic dataset is 174 limited, both in total numbers and spatial representatively, and the chronological resolution is poor.

Human bone collagen  $\delta^{13}C_{coll}$  and  $\delta^{15}N_{coll}$  signals are proxies for dietary sources of protein 175 (Fernandes 2016). A comparison of these isotopic signals is shown in Figure 2b for Romano-British 176 177 adult male and female individuals. The difference between male (mean  $\delta^{13}C_{coll}$  = -19.5±0.7‰) and female (mean  $\delta^{13}C_{coll}$  = -19.6±0.6 ‰) mean  $\delta^{13}C_{coll}$  values is small and not statistically significant 178 179 (Welch two sample t-test: t = 1.6429, df = 319.89, p-value = 0.1014). There is a larger difference between male (mean  $\delta^{15}N_{coll}$  = 10.4±1.2‰) and female (mean  $\delta^{15}N_{coll}$  = 9.5±1.3‰) mean  $\delta^{15}N_{coll}$ 180 values that is statistically significant (Welch two sample t-test: t = 4.785, df = 269.89, p-value = 181 182 2.818e-06). The difference in  $\delta^{15}N_{coll}$  values is likely due to a higher consumption by men of terrestrial domesticated animal protein having  $\delta^{15}N$  values higher than plant protein. Differentiated 183 consumption of marine fish protein, having elevated  $\delta^{15}N$  and  $\delta^{13}C$  values compared to terrestrial 184 185 protein sources, is unlikely given the similarity in  $\delta^{13}C_{coll}$  values for both genders. The energetic cost 186 of producing animal protein is greater than that of plant protein making access to animal protein 187 typically more limited. This could imply that men had a higher social status than women, although other hypotheses for observed isotopic gender differences have also been previously put forward 188 (Craig et al. 2009). Furthermore, possible differences in social status were certainly not only gender-189 190 based as females show a larger variability in  $\delta^{15}N_{coll}$  values compared to men.

191 The impact of regional climatic and environmental variability in herbivore bone collagen 192  $\delta^{13}C_{coll}$  and  $\delta^{15}N_{coll}$  signals is illustrated in Figure 2c through a comparison of Roman herbivore data 193 from the United Kingdom, Italy, and Egypt. There are large differences in the number of available 194 records for the three regions with Egypt represented by a single location (Kellis). However, large 195 isotopic differences can be observed between Egypt and European regions. Higher Egyptian herbivore  $\delta^{15}N_{coll}$  values reflect higher plant  $\delta^{15}N$  values resulting from lower levels of precipitation in 196 197 Egypt compared to European regions (Schwarcz et al. 1999). The more arid environment of Egypt 198 also results in a larger abundance of  $C_4$  plants which are better adapted than  $C_3$  plants to such environments and have more elevated  $\delta^{13}$ C values (Tiezen 1991). There is a statistically significant 199 difference between the  $\delta^{13}C_{coll}$  values of British and Italian samples (Welch two sample t-test: t = -200 201 2.5301, df = 21.885, p-value = 0.01911). Herbivores from Roman Italy have a larger mean  $\delta^{13}C_{coll}$ value (mean  $\delta^{13}C_{coll}$  = -21.1±1.0‰), and also a larger amount of variability, compared to Romano-202 British herbivores (mean  $\delta^{13}C_{coll}$  = -21.6±0.5‰). Plant  $\delta^{13}C$  values decrease with higher mean annual 203 204 precipitation and higher forest density (canopy effect) (Aguilera et al. 2008; Bonafini et al. 2013). 205 Both of these parameters have, in general, higher values in Britain than in Italy. There was also a 206 statistically significant difference between  $\delta^{15}N_{coll}$  values from British and Italian samples (Welch two 207 sample t-test: t = 2.7093, df = 22.67, p-value = 0.01261). Romano-British herbivores have a larger mean  $\delta^{15}N_{coll}$  value (mean  $\delta^{15}N_{coll}$  = 5.3±1.7‰) compared to herbivores from Roman Italy (mean 208 209  $\delta^{15}N_{coll}$  = 4.3±1.7‰). This suggests that British soils accessible to local herbivores were more fertile 210 than Italian soils and that Italian herbivores did not have a significant access to manured fields 211 (Aguilera et al. 2008; Szpak 2014).

212 One of the significant repercussions of observed animal isotopic variability across different 213 regions is the need to establish a local and contemporary isotopic baseline when doing isotope-based 214 human diet reconstruction. This is illustrated through a simple example in which the diet of Roman 215 adult individuals from the Egyptian site of Kellis was quantitatively reconstructed from published tooth (M3 molar) dentin isotopic data (mean  $\delta^{13}C_{coll}$  = -18.8±0.3‰ and mean  $\delta^{15}N_{coll}$  = 17.7±1.0‰) 216 217 using the Bayesian mixing model FRUITS (Dupras & Tocheri 2007; Fernandes et al. 2014). The adopted modelling approach is essentially the same as employed for individuals from the Roman city 218 219 of Herculaneum (Italy) in which protein contributions (marine vs. terrestrial) were quantified 220 (Fernandes 2016). The accuracy of model estimates for the Herculaneum individuals was assessed by 221 comparing individual model estimates with observed human dietary radiocarbon reservoir effects 222 showing an excellent agreement. Two isotopic baselines were considered to estimate the group 223 protein contributions for the adults from Kellis. One relying on Italian herbivore isotopic data as 224 described in Fernandes (2016) and a second relying on Egyptian herbivore isotopic data as shown in 225 Figure 2c. For both baselines the same isotopic values of Mediterranean marine fish were taken as 226 reference. Model estimates are shown in Figure 3 and demonstrate the differences in protein 227 estimates generated under the two isotopic baselines. Also included in Figure 3 is the estimated 228 group protein contribution for adults from Herculaneum (filled circles). Estimates generated using an 229 Egyptian isotopic baseline result in similar group dietary estimates for Kellis and Herculaneum adults.



231

230

Figure 3. Comparison of dietary protein Bayesian group estimates for adults from Kellis under two isotopic baselines (Italian and Egyptian). Filled circles represent estimated mean protein contribution for Herculaneum group boxes represent a 68% credible interval while the whiskers represent a 95% credible interval. The horizontal continuous line indicates the average while the horizontal discontinuous line indicates the median.

236

## 237 4. Conclusions and future developments

The few research examples shown in this paper illustrated how data stored at IsoArcH allows for multi-scale analysis and extensive studies on topics related to paleodiet, paleomobility and paleoenvironment. The task of defining contemporary and local baselines necessary for the study of subsistence strategies and mobility patterns of past humans and animals becomes greatly simplified. Database querying also highlights existing data gaps for certain sample types, time periods, and regions which motivate future isotopic research.

244 IsoArcH database will be expanded in the future by adding new data and entities (e.g. additional 245 isotopic proxies, new archaeological parameters, etc.). This will follow from the feedback provided by 246 the users of IsoArcH. A forum addressed to researchers using the website is envisaged for discussions 247 on IsoArcH related topics. Tutorials, possibly in the form of a video, will be available on the website to describe to users how to use IsoArcH. We also plan to implement free statistical tools online (e.g. 248 249 Shiny, a web application framework for R) as well as implement the capability to export the ancient 250 world maps generated on IsoArcH. Automatic submission tools are planned to be developed so that 251 batch data submissions might become easier. Moreover, user session will be expanded to allow 252 members to operate IsoArcH using their own unpublished works and make use of online tools (e.g. 253 digital maps, datasets, baselines) without being compelled to share their data publicly.

- 254
- 255

#### 256 Acknowledgements

257 We would like to thank Dr. Arwa Kharobi for her help and her constructive criticism on IsoArcH. 258 We wish to express his special gratitude to Mr. Romain Leguay, Mr. Nicolas Filippi as well as Ms. Mi 259 Wu for their technical counsel and assistance with IT tasks. In addition, Ms. Christine Bergmann and 260 M. Aurélien Tafani are thanked for the English editing of this paper and the website. Dr Kevin Salesse 261 would like to express his gratitude to Dr. Martine Vercauteren for hosting in her research unit of 262 Anthropology and Human genetics at the Université Libre de Bruxelles in Belgium. Data gathering has 263 been mainly carried out by Dr Kevin Salesse during his PhD (Université de Bordeaux, Pessac; Muséum 264 national d'Histoire naturelle, Paris) and post-doctoral positions (University of South Florida, Tampa). 265 He was financed by a scholarship of the Ministère de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de la Recherche 266 (2010-2015) as well as the Shohet Scholars Program of the International Catacomb Society (2015-267 2016). The development of the web database and the website was performed in parallel to his main 268 research activities and was totally self-financed.

269

270

#### 271 References

Aguilera M., Araus, JL., Voltas, J., Rodríguez-Ariza, MO., Molina, F., Rovira, N., Buxó, R., Ferrio, JP.,
2008. Stable carbon and nitrogen isotopes and quality traits of fossil cereal grains provide clues on
sustainability at the beginnings of Mediterranean agriculture. Rapid Communications in Mass
Spectrometry, 22(11), 1653-1663.

276

Bogaard, A., Fraser, R., Heaton, T.H.E., Wallace, M., Vaiglova, P., Charles, M., Jones, G., Evershed,
R.P., Styring, A.K., Andersen, N.H., Arbogast, R.-M., Bartosiewicz, L., Gardeisen, A., Kanstrup, M.,
Maier, U., Marinova, E., Ninov, L., Schäfer, M., Stephan, E., 2013. Crop manuring and intensive land
management by Europe's first farmers, Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 110, 1258912594.

282

Bonafini, M., Pellegrini, M., Ditchfield, P., Pollard, A.M. 2013. Investigation of the "canopy effect" in
the isotope ecology of temperate woodlands. Journal of Archaeological Science, 40 (11), 3926-3935.

285

Bowen, G. J., West, J.B., Miller, C. C., Zhao, L., Zhang, T., 2017. IsoMAP: Isoscapes Modeling, Analysis
and Prediction (version 1.0). http://isomap.org, accessed 12/02/2017.

Chenery, C.A., Pashley, V., Lamb, A.L., Sloane, H.J., Evans, J.A., 2012. The oxygen isotope relationship
between the phosphate and structural carbonate fractions of human bioapatite. Rapid
Communications in Mass Spectrometry, 26(3), 309-319.

292

Craig, O.E., Biazzo, M., O'Connell, T.C., Garnsey, P., Martinez-Labarga, C., Lelli, R., Salvadei, L.,
Tartaglia, G., Nava, A., Renò, L., Fiammenghi, A., Rickards, O., Bondioli, L., 2009. Stable isotopic
evidence for diet at the imperial Roman coastal site of Velia (1st and 2nd Centuries AD) in southern
Italy, American Journal of Physical Anthropology 139, 572-583.

297

Crowe, F., Sperduti, A., O'Connell, T.C., Craig, O.E., Kirsanow, K., Germoni, P., Macchiarelli, R.,
Garnsey, P., Bondioli, L., 2010. Water-related occupations and diet in two Roman coastal
communities (Italy, first to third century AD): correlation between stable carbon and nitrogen isotope
values and auricular exostosis prevalence, American Journal of Physical Anthropology 142, 355-366.

- 303 Dupras, T.L., Tocheri, M.W., 2007. Reconstructing infant weaning histories at Roman period Kellis,
  304 Egypt using stable isotope analysis of dentition. American Journal of Physical Anthropology, 134 (1),
  305 63–74.
- 306

De Cupere, B., Frémondeau, D., Kaptijn, E., Marinova, E., Poblome, J., Vandam, R., Van Neer, W.,
2017. Subsistence economy and land use strategies in the Burdur province (SW Anatolia) from
prehistory to the Byzantine period, Quat. Int. 436, 4-17.

310

Etu-Sihvola, H., Arppe, L., Junno, A., Uusitalo, J., Oinonen, M., 2015. dIANA: Dietary isotopic baseline
for the ancient north. http://oasisnorth.org/diana, accessed 12/02/2017.

313

Fernandes, R., 2016. A Simple(R) Model to Predict the Source of Dietary Carbon in Individual
Consumers. Archaeometry, 58 (3), 500-512.

316

Fernandes, R., Millard, A.R., Brabec, M., Nadeau, M.J., Grootes, P., 2014. Food Reconstruction Using
Isotopic Transferred Signals (FRUITS): a Bayesian model for diet reconstruction. PLOS ONE, 9(2), p.e
87436.

320

Fernandes, R., Grootes, P., Nadeau, M.J., Nehlich, O., 2015. Quantitative diet reconstruction of a
Neolithic population using a Bayesian mixing model (FRUITS): The case study of Ostorf (Germany).
American journal of physical anthropology, 158, 325-340.

324 325 Fernandes, R., Larsen, T., Knipper, C., Feng, F., Wang, Y., 2017, IsoMemo.com: A database of isotopic 326 data for ecology, archaeology, and environmental sciences, http://www.isomemo.com, accessed 327 12/02/2017 328 329 Kelly, J.F., 2000. Stable isotopes of carbon and nitrogen in the study of avian and mammalian trophic 330 ecology. Canadian Journal of Zoology, 78 (1), 1–27. 331 332 Killgrove, K., Montgomery, J., 2016. All Roads Lead to Rome: Exploring Human Migration to the 333 Eternal City through Biochemistry of Skeletons from Two Imperial-Era Cemeteries (1<sup>st</sup>-3<sup>rd</sup> c AD). PLOS 334 ONE, 11(2).1-30. 335 336 Killgrove, K., Tykot, R.H., 2017. Diet and collapse: A stable isotope study of Imperial-era Gabii (1<sup>st</sup>-3<sup>rd</sup> 337 centuries AD), Journal of Archaeological Science: Reports, this issue. 338 339 Kneisel, J., Hinz, M., Rinne, C., 2013. Radon-B. http://radon-b.ufg.uni-kiel.de, accessed 12/02/2017. 340 341 Knipper, C., Pichler, S.L., Rissanen, H., Stopp, B., Kühn, M., Spichtig, N., Röder, B., Schibler, J., Lassau, 342 G., Alt, K.W., 2016. What is on the menu in a Celtic town? Iron Age diet reconstructed at Basel-343 Gasfabrik, Switzerland, Archaeological and Anthropological Sciences, 1-20. 344 345 Knudson, K.J., O'Donnabhain, B., Carver, C., Cleland, R., Price, T.D., 2012. Migration and Viking 346 Dublin: paleomobility and paleodiet through isotopic analyses, Journal of Archaeological Science 39, 347 308-320. 348 349 Lightfoot, E., O'Connell, T.C., 2016. On the Use of Biomineral Oxygen Isotope Data to Identify Human 350 Migrants in the Archaeological Record: Intra-Sample Variation, Statistical Methods and Geographical 351 Considerations. PLOS ONE, 11(4), p.e0153850. 352 353 Martindale, A., Morlan, R., Betts, M., Blake, M., Gajewski, K., Chaput, M., Mason, A, Vermeersch P., 354 2016. Canadian Archaeological Radiocarbon Database (CARD 2.1), http://canadianarchaeology.ca, 355 accessed 12/02/2017.

Mays, S., Beavan, N., 2012. An investigation of diet in early Anglo-Saxon England using carbon and
nitrogen stable isotope analysis of human bone collagen, Journal of Archaeological Science 39, 867874.

360

McCormick, M., Büntgen, U., Cane, M.A., Cook, E.R., Harper, K., Huybers, P., Litt, Th., Manning., S.W.,
Mayewski, P.A., More, A.F.M., Nicolussi, K., Tegel, W., 2012. Climate Change during and after the
Roman Empire: Reconstructing the Past from Scientific and Historical Evidence. Journal of
Interdisciplinary History, 43 (2), 169-220.

365

366 Müldner, G., 2013. Stable isotopes and diet: their contribution to Romano-British research, Antiquity367 87, 137-149.

368

Pestle, W.J., Crowley, B.E., Weirauch, M.T., 2014. Quantifying inter-laboratory variability in stable
isotope analysis of ancient skeletal remains, PLoS ONE 9, e102844.

371

Pollard, A.M., Ditchfield, P., McCullagh, J.S.O., Allen, T.G., Gibson, M., Boston, C., Clough, S.,
Marquez-Grant, N., Nicholson, R.A., 2011. "These boots were made for walking": The isotopic
analysis of a C4 Roman inhumation from Gravesend, Kent, UK, American Journal of Physical
Anthropology 146, 446-456.

376

Prowse, T., Schwarcz, H.P., Saunders, S., Macchiarelli, R., Bondioli, L., 2004. Isotopic paleodiet studies
of skeletons from the Imperial Roman-age cemetery of Isola Sacra, Rome, Italy, Journal of
Archaeological Science 31, 259-272.

380

Salesse, K., Dufour, É., Castex, D., Velemínský, P., Santos, F., Kuchařová, H., Jun, L., Brůžek, J., 2013. Life history of the individuals buried in the St. Benedict cemetery (Prague,  $15^{th}-18^{th}$  Centuries): Insights from <sup>14</sup>C dating and stable isotope ( $\delta^{13}$ C,  $\delta^{15}$ N,  $\delta^{18}$ O) analysis, American Journal of Physical Anthropology 151, 202-214.

385

Salesse, K., Dufour, E., Lebon, M., Wurster, C., Castex, D., Bruzek, J., Zazzo, A., 2014. Variability of
bone preservation in a confined environment: The case of the catacomb of Sts Peter and Marcellinus
(Rome, Italy), Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 416, 43-54.

389

Salesse, K., 2015. Archéo-biogéochimie isotopique, reconstitutions des régimes alimentaires et des
schémas de mobilité, et interactions bio-culturelles. Les sépultures plurielles de la région X de la

392	catacomb Saints Pierre-et-Marcellin (Rome, I <sup>er</sup> -III <sup>e</sup> s. ap. JC.), Université de Bordeaux, Bordeaux, p.
393	352.
394	
395	Schwarcz, H.P., Dupras, T.L., Fairgrieve, S.I., 1999. 15N Enrichment in the Sahara: In Search of a
396	Global Relationship. Journal of Archaeological Science, 26 (6), 629-636.
397	
398	Styring, A.K., Ater. M., Hmimsa, Y., Fraser, R., Miller, H., Neef, R., Pearson, J.A., Bogaard, A., 2016.
399	Disentangling the effect of farming practice from aridity on crop stable isotope values: A present-day
400	model from Morocco and its application to early farming sites in the eastern Mediterranean. The
401	Anthropocene Review, 3 (1), 2-22.
402	
403	Szpak, P., 2014. Complexities of nitrogen isotope biogeochemistry in plant-soil systems: implications
404	for the study of ancient agricultural and animal management practices. Frontiers in Plant Science, 5,
405	p.288.
406	
407	Szpak, P., Metcalfe, J.Z., Macdonald, R.A., 2017. Best practices for calibrating and reporting stable
408	isotope measurements in archaeology, Journal of Archaeological Science: Reports 13, 609-616.
409	
410	Stos-Gale, Z.A., Gale, N.H., 2009. Metal provenancing using isotopes and the Oxford archaeological
411	lead isotope database (OXALID), Archaeological and Anthropological Sciences 1, 195-213.
412	
413	Tieszen, L.L., 1991. Natural variations in the carbon isotope values of plants: Implications for
414	archaeology, ecology, and paleoecology. Journal of Archaeological Science, 18 (3), 227–248.
415	
416	Touzeau, A., Blichert-Toft, J., Amiot, R., Fourel, F., Martineau, F., Cockitt, J., Hall, K., Flandrois, JP.,
417	Lécuyer, C., 2013. Egyptian mummies record increasing aridity in the Nile valley from 5500 to 1500 yr
418	before present, Earth and Planetary Science Letters 375, 92-100.
419	
420	van Strydonck, M., de Roock, E., 2011. Royal Institute for Cultural Heritage web-based radiocarbon
421	database, Radiocarbon 53, 367–370.
422	
423	Willmes, M., McMorrow, L., Kinsley, L., Armstrong, R., Aubert, M., Eggins, S., Falguères, C., Maureille,
424	B., Moffat, I., Grün, R., 2013. The IRHUM (Isotopic Reconstruction of Human Migration) database –
425	bioavailable strontium isotope ratios for geochemical fingerprinting in France, Earth System Science
426	Data 6, 761-777.