



HAL
open science

Discussion on radioactive iodine treatment of hyperthyroidism and the risk of induced cancer

E. Hindié, K.B. Ain, S. Zerdoud, A.M. Avram

► To cite this version:

E. Hindié, K.B. Ain, S. Zerdoud, A.M. Avram. Discussion on radioactive iodine treatment of hyperthyroidism and the risk of induced cancer. *Médecine Nucléaire - Imagerie Fonctionnelle et Métabolique*, 2020, 44, pp.287 - 289. 10.1016/j.mednuc.2020.06.002 . hal-03493966

HAL Id: hal-03493966

<https://hal.science/hal-03493966v1>

Submitted on 17 Oct 2022

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution - NonCommercial 4.0 International License

Discussion on Radioactive Iodine Treatment of Hyperthyroidism and The Risk of Induced cancer

Traitement par iode-131 des hyperthyroïdies et risque de cancer : mythe ou réalité

Elif Hindié¹, Kenneth B. Ain², Slimane Zerdoud³, and Anca M. Avram⁴

¹ Department of Nuclear Medicine, Bordeaux University Hospitals, Hôpital Haut-Lévêque, 33604 Pessac, France; elif.hindie@chu-bordeaux.fr

² Department of Internal Medicine, Thyroid Oncology Program, University of Kentucky, Lexington, 40536 Kentucky, USA; kenneth.ain@uky.edu

³ Department of Nuclear Medicine, Institut Universitaire du Cancer de Toulouse - Oncopole, 31059 Toulouse, France; zerdoud.slimane@iuct-oncopole.fr

⁴ Department of Radiology, Division of Nuclear Medicine and Molecular Imaging, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, 48109, Michigan, USA; ancaa@umich.edu

The authors declare they have no conflicts of interest that relate to the current manuscript.

Corresponding Author: Elif Hindié

¹ Department of Nuclear Medicine, Bordeaux University Hospitals, Hôpital Haut-Lévêque, 33604 Pessac, France; elif.hindie@chu-bordeaux.fr

Abstract

Iodine-131 (^{131}I , radioiodine) has been used for over eight decades for the treatment of Graves' disease, either as initial therapy or following failure of thionamides, as well as for the treatment of autonomous thyroid nodules. ^{131}I treatment is simple to administer, effective, and relatively inexpensive. Recently, there has been some turmoil after a study published in JAMA Internal Medicine reported an increased risk of cancer from ^{131}I treatment. The impact was of short duration however, as the paper received severe criticisms from many nuclear medicine physicians as well as from endocrinologists. Here we explain why that paper's conclusions are doubtful. We also review the major data on the topic of ^{131}I therapy of hyperthyroidism and the risk of cancer.

Hyperthyroidism, ^{131}I , radioactive iodine, cancer, secondary cancer, radioiodine therapy

Résumé

L'iode-131 est utilisé depuis presque huit décennies dans le traitement de l'hyperthyroïdie liée à une maladie Basedow ou à une pathologie nodulaire toxique. Le traitement par ^{131}I est simple à administrer, efficace, et relativement peu onéreux par rapport aux autres alternatives thérapeutiques. Récemment, il y a eu une certaine turbulence suite à une publication dans « JAMA Internal Medicine » signalant un excès de cancer lié au traitement par ^{131}I . L'impact a toutefois été de courte durée, cette étude ayant essuyé un grand nombre de critiques méthodologiques de médecins nucléaires à travers le monde mais aussi d'endocrinologues. Dans ce papier nous expliquons les faiblesses de cette étude et résumons les données de diverses autres études sur le sujet.

Hyperthyroïdie, ^{131}I , « irathérapie », cancer, cancer radio-induit

Concerns on whether iodine-131 (^{131}I , radioactive iodine, RAI) treatment for hyperthyroidism confers an increased risk of cancer have always been a subject of high interest. Recently there has been a transient decline in the number of patients referred for ^{131}I after a paper published in a major journal “JAMA Internal Medicine” reported an increased risk of cancer [1]. This trend was of short duration, however; here we explain why that paper’s conclusions are doubtful.

The study by Kitahara et al. was a new analysis of the Cooperative Thyrotoxicosis Therapy Follow-up Study (CTTFS) which was last updated in 1998 [2]. In this new analysis, Kitahara et al introduced a biokinetic model of multi-organ dosimetry to retrospectively estimate patient-specific radiation doses at organ level and projected that ^{131}I therapy was responsible for 14% of the breast cancer deaths and 7% of deaths from other solid cancers [1]. Their analysis included 18805 patients (mean study entry age 49 years; 78% women; 93.7% had Graves’ disease; 34.1% had multiple ^{131}I treatments). The mean total administered ^{131}I activity was 391 MBq (~10.6 mCi) (tertiles: 160, 289, and 724 MBq). In a projection of their findings, considering patients receiving 370-555 MBq ^{131}I for Graves’ disease, the authors concluded that for every 1000 patients treated with ^{131}I at the age of 50, an estimated lifetime excess of 18 to 31 solid cancer deaths would occur (including 4 to 6 breast cancers) and that the majority of them (~80%) would occur more than 20 years after treatment [1].

Although the publication received extreme attention from the media, with an Altmetric score exceeding 300, many nuclear physicians around the world, having scrutinized the data, raised skepticism as to the method and conclusions, with many letters and editorials rapidly appearing in the main nuclear medicine journals [3-6].

In an Invited Commentary published in the Journal of Endocrinology and Metabolism we called attention to significant design flaws in the Kitahara et al. study highlighting the following points [7].

- The analysis assessed whether greater absorbed radiation doses to specific organs were associated with increased mortality risk from specific cancers; however, because this analysis was negative for haematological cancers and for the 16 analyzed solid cancers (except borderline significance for breast cancer), the authors decided to sum-up all solid cancers, while arbitrarily using the dose to stomach as the reference [1]. The rationale for this additional analysis, which is not based on the initially planned analysis of absorbed organ dose, is unclear and unjustified [7].
- CTTFS included patients treated between 1946 and 1964 with clinical follow-up to 1968, and many patients were lost to follow-up, with no information available for a large percentage of patients in this last analysis [1,7].
- The CTTFS study was initially designed to compare cancer risk between RAI-treated patients and those treated differently. The last report of the CTTFS data by Ron et al. [2], with 21 years mean follow-up, concluded that RAI was not linked to cancer deaths (except thyroid cancer, with the underlying thyroid disease appearing to play a role). In 1998 Ron et al. found increased risk of breast and lung cancer in patients treated with surgery (most of them had also received thionamides), but not in those treated with RAI [2]. Surprisingly, Kitahara et al. decided not to report data on patients who were not treated with ^{131}I , which constituted the control groups of the CTTFS study [1,7].
- The CTTFS study used data collected in the 1960s, when even smoking was not a known confounder of cancer risk and severity of Graves' disease. When studying cancer incidence, the risk of confounding factors in Graves' disease and

hyperthyroidism in general is now well recognized [8]. Establishing dose-response relationships does not fully protect against this risk. Confounding factors can be associated with the severity of hyperthyroidism and also with the total administered ¹³¹I activity [7].

- In addition to CTTFS, there are other major studies that also concluded that RAI does not contribute to increased cancer risk [8,9]. We also raise concern on the absence of analysis or discussion of the increased morbidity that would be caused by alternative therapies for hyperthyroidism [7].

Interestingly, two of the co-authors of the study by Kitahara et al., later published data showing that the increase in standardized mortality ratio (SMR) for breast cancer was higher for patients treated only with anti-thyroid drugs (SMR 1.86; CI 1.29-2.58) than in patients treated with ¹³¹I (SMR 1.11; CI 0.94-1.3) [10]. This finding of higher mortality with the use of thionamides was also reported in the previous report by Ron et al. [2].

Concomitant with our Commentary in JCEM, the British Thyroid Association and the Society for Endocrinology published a joint statement in the journal “Clinical Endocrinology”, where they expressed concerns that the article by Kitahara et al may lead patients to reject the use of RAI therapy to manage hyperthyroidism [11]. They stated: “Recent observations have shown the importance of achieving good control of hyperthyroidism in a timely fashion to improve long-term cardiovascular and mortality outcomes. In this context, it would be unfortunate if patients were deprived of the option of rapid, effective control of their hyperthyroidism with radioiodine, due to concerns of cancer risk” [11].

When considering diverse confounding factors, it is important to recognize that hyperthyroidism itself increases the risk of several solid malignancies, including breast cancer [12-15].

Because thyroid cancer patients receive higher radioiodine activities as adjuvant therapy than those used for the treatment of hyperthyroidism, it would be helpful to also point out that results of a recent systematic review were also reassuring concerning risks of second cancers after radioiodine therapy [16]. We need to be careful, however, because the comparison between hyperthyroidism and thyroid cancer is not straightforward, requiring consideration of, not only the administered activities, but also the effective half-life of ^{131}I , the area under the activity curve in the whole body and specific organs, and additional other parameters. Furthermore, thyroid cancer patients can have increased underlying genetic risk for developing other cancers. The timely publication of the systematic review by Yu et al. dispelled the conclusions of two papers from one team that tried to cast doubt on the risk-benefit from adjuvant ^{131}I therapy in low and intermediate-risk thyroid cancer [17,18]; again based on biased data and incomplete analysis [15,19].

Attesting to the safety and effectiveness of RAI treatment in patients with hyperthyroidism, the UK National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE) published new guidelines recommending ^{131}I for first line therapy “Radioactive iodine is recommended as first line treatment for thyrotoxicosis with hyperthyroidism unless antithyroid drugs are likely to achieve remission or it is unsuitable” [20]. At present, the use of RAI for a first episode of hyperthyroidism varies widely from one country to another; being somewhat higher in the United States than in many European countries and rather low in Asian countries, as summarized in one recent report [21].

Importantly, a novel study by Gronich et al., reported on 16,637 patients treated for hyperthyroidism with ^{131}I or thionamides (propylthiouracil, thiamazole), with 123,166 person-years of follow-up [22]. While the Kitahara et al. findings were based on a hypothetical model and derived cancer mortality, Gronich reported on actual observed cancer rates. With long-term follow-up, there was no association between radioiodine treatment and increased risk of overall cancer in univariate analysis (HR = 0.99, $p = 0.91$) or in multivariate analysis (HR = 1.01, $p = 0.95$) [22]. In an analysis of specific cancer types, an association with non-Hodgkin lymphoma was noted on univariate analysis, but not in multivariate analysis. The univariate analysis finding was not significant as a statistical (Bonferroni) correction was not performed for analysis of 20 cancer types (requiring a P value of < 0.0025 to gain statistical significance).

In summary, ^{131}I has been used for over eight decades for the treatment of Graves' disease, either as initial therapy or following failure of thionamides, as well as for the treatment of autonomous thyroid nodules. ^{131}I treatment is simple to administer, effective, and relatively inexpensive [20,23]. Besides classical contraindications (i.e., pregnancy, breastfeeding), it is important to identify patients at risk for exacerbating Graves' orbitopathy and to use appropriate preventive measures [23,24]. Major studies have concluded that ^{131}I therapy does not contribute to increased cancer risk [2,8,9,22]. Also, when discussing potential risks from ^{131}I therapy, it is important to take into account risks from alternative treatments, including: cardiac and neurological consequences from uncontrolled thyrotoxicosis [25-28], surgical complications from increased use of thyroidectomies, marrow suppression (agranulocytosis) or hepatotoxicity from increased use of thionamides as well as small risks of thionamide-associated vasculitis and pancreatitis [29]. A study by Boelaert et al. on hyperthyroid patients

aged ≥ 40 yrs showed that mortality was increased during periods of thionamide treatment and after radioiodine not resulting in hypothyroidism, but not during follow-up after radioiodine-induced hypothyroidism [25]. It is only in understanding specific and related risks that clinicians can formulate the best therapeutic choices [7,30,31]. It is also important that we deliver valid information, for the patient to have a fully informed role in the choice of therapy [7]. This can be organized at an international level through a multidisciplinary work involving representatives of various medical specialties and patients' associations.

References:

- [1] Kitahara CM, Berrington de Gonzalez A, Bouville A, Brill AB, Doody MM, Melo DR, et al. Association of Radioactive Iodine Treatment With Cancer Mortality in Patients With Hyperthyroidism. *JAMA Intern Med* 2019;179:1034-42. Erratum in: *JAMA Intern Med* 2019;179:1152.
- [2] Ron E, Doody MM, Becker DV, Brill AB, Curtis RE, Goldman MB, et al. Cancer mortality following treatment for adult hyperthyroidism. Cooperative Thyrotoxicosis Therapy Follow-up Study Group. *JAMA* 1998;280:347-55.
- [3] Zhang X, Shan G, Liu Q, Lin Y. Regarding the manuscript entitled "Association of Radioactive Iodine Treatment With Cancer Mortality in Patients With Hyperthyroidism". *Eur J Nucl Med Mol Imaging* 2019;46:2410-11.
- [4] Giovanella L, Verburg FA. Use of anti-thyroid drugs in patients with hyperthyroidism: a case for shared decision-making. *Eur J Nucl Med Mol Imaging* 2019;46:2408-9.
- [5] Greenspan BS, Siegel JA, Hassan A, Silberstein EB. There Is No Association of Radioactive Iodine Treatment with Cancer Mortality in Patients with Hyperthyroidism. *J Nucl Med* 2019 Nov;60(11):1500-1.
- [6] Chen W, Dilsizian V. Radioactive Iodine Treatment and Cancer Mortality in Hyperthyroid Patients: Questioning Standard Clinical Practice Requires Indisputable Scientific Data. *J Nucl Med* 2019;60:1502-3

[7] Hindié E, Ain KB, Zerdoud S, Avram AM. Association of Radioactive Iodine Treatment of Hyperthyroidism With Cancer Mortality: An Unjustified Warning? *J Clin Endocrinol Metab* 2020;105:dgz305. doi: 10.1210/clinem/dgz305.

[8] Ryödi E, Metso S, Jaatinen P, Huhtala H, Saaristo R, Välimäki M, et al. Cancer Incidence and Mortality in Patients Treated Either With RAI or Thyroidectomy for Hyperthyroidism. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab* 2015;100:3710-7.

[9] Franklyn JA, Maisonneuve P, Sheppard M, Betteridge J, Boyle P. Cancer incidence and mortality after radioiodine treatment for hyperthyroidism: a population-based cohort study. *Lancet*. 1999;353(9170):2111-5.

[10] Tulchinsky M, Brill AB. Spotlight on the Association of Radioactive Iodine Treatment With Cancer Mortality in Patients With Hyperthyroidism is Keeping the Highest Risk From Antithyroid Drugs in the Blind Spot. *Clin Nucl Med* 2019;44:789-91.

[11] Taylor PN, Okosieme OE, Chatterjee K, Boelaert K; Executive Committees of the Society for Endocrinology and the British Thyroid Association. Joint statement from the Society for Endocrinology and the British Thyroid Association regarding 'Association of Radioactive Iodine Treatment with cancer mortality in patients with hyperthyroidism'. *Clin Endocrinol (Oxf)* 2020;92:266-7.

[12] Søgaard M, Farkas DK, Ehrenstein V, Jørgensen JO, Dekkers OM, Sørensen HT. Hypothyroidism and hyperthyroidism and breast cancer risk: a nationwide cohort study. *Eur J Endocrinol* 2016;174:409-14.

[13] Davis PJ, Lin HY, Hercbergs AA, Keating KA, Mousa SA. How thyroid hormone works depends upon cell type, receptor type, and hormone analogue: implications in cancer growth. *Discov Med* 2019;27:111-7. Review.

[14] Krashin E, Piekietko-Witkowska A, Ellis M, Ashur-Fabian O. Thyroid Hormones and Cancer: A Comprehensive Review of Preclinical and Clinical Studies. *Front Endocrinol (Lausanne)* 2019;10:59.

[15] Verburg FA, Hoffmann M, Iakovou I, Konijnenberg MW, Mihailovic J, Gabina PM, et al. Errare humanum est, sed in errare perseverare diabolicum: methodological errors in the assessment of the relationship between I-131 therapy and possible increases in the incidence of malignancies. *Eur J Nucl Med Mol Imaging* 2020;47:519-22.

[16] Yu CY, Saeed O, Goldberg AS, Farooq S, Fazelzad R, Goldstein DP, et al. A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis of Subsequent Malignant Neoplasm Risk After Radioactive Iodine Treatment of Thyroid Cancer. *Thyroid* 2018;28:1662-73.

[17] Molenaar RJ, Sidana S, Radivoyevitch T, Advani AS, Gerds AT, Carraway HE, et al. Risk of Hematologic Malignancies After Radioiodine Treatment of Well-Differentiated Thyroid Cancer. *J Clin Oncol* 2018;36:1831-9.

[18] Molenaar RJ, Pleyer C, Radivoyevitch T, Sidana S, Godley A, Advani AS, et al. Risk of developing chronic myeloid neoplasms in well-differentiated thyroid cancer patients treated with radioactive iodine. *Leukemia* 2018;32:952-9.

- [19] Hindié E, Récher C, Zerdoud S, Leenhardt L, Avram AM. Risk of Hematologic Malignancies After Radioactive Iodine Treatment of Thyroid Cancer: An Unjustified Warning. *J Clin Oncol* 2018;36:1881-2.
- [20] Vasileiou M, Gilbert J, Fishburn S, Boelaert K; Guideline Committee. Thyroid disease assessment and management: summary of NICE guidance. *BMJ* 2020;368:m41. doi: 10.1136/bmj.m41.
- [21] Sriphrapadang C. Diagnosis and Management of Graves' Disease in Thailand: A Survey of Current Practice. *J Thyroid Res* 2020 May 11;2020:8175712. doi: 10.1155/2020/8175712. eCollection 2020.
- [22] Gronich N, Lavi I, Rennert G, Saliba W. Cancer Risk After Radioactive Iodine Treatment for Hyperthyroidism: A Cohort Study. *Thyroid* 2020;30:243-50.
- [23] Ross DS, Burch HB, Cooper DS, Greenlee MC, Laurberg P, Maia AL, et al. 2016 American Thyroid Association Guidelines for Diagnosis and Management of Hyperthyroidism and Other Causes of Thyrotoxicosis. *Thyroid* 2016;26:1343-421. Erratum in: *Thyroid* 2017;27:1462.
- [24] Kahaly GJ, Bartalena L, Hegedüs L, Leenhardt L, Poppe K, Pearce SH. 2018 European Thyroid Association Guideline for the Management of Graves' Hyperthyroidism. *Eur Thyroid J* 2018;7:167-86.

- [25] Boelaert K, Maisonneuve P, Torlinska B, Franklyn JA. Comparison of mortality in hyperthyroidism during periods of treatment with thionamides and after radioiodine. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab* 2013;98:1869-82.
- [26] Lillevang-Johansen M, Abrahamsen B, Jørgensen HL, Brix TH, Hegedüs L. Excess Mortality in Treated and Untreated Hyperthyroidism Is Related to Cumulative Periods of Low Serum TSH. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab* 2017;102:2301-9.
- [27] Okosieme OE, Taylor PN, Evans C, Thayer D, Chai A, Khan I, et al. Primary therapy of Graves' disease and cardiovascular morbidity and mortality: a linked-record cohort study. *Lancet Diabetes Endocrinol* 2019;7:278-87.
- [28] Folkestad L, Brandt F, Lillevang-Johansen M, Brix TH, Hegedüs L. Graves' Disease and Toxic Nodular Goiter, Aggravated by Duration of Hyperthyroidism, Are Associated with Alzheimer's and Vascular Dementia: A Registry-Based Long-Term Follow-Up of Two Large Cohorts. *Thyroid* 2020;30:672-80
- [29] Brix TH, Lund LC, Henriksen DP, Folkestad L, Bonnema SJ, Hallas J, et al. Methimazole and risk of acute pancreatitis. *Lancet Diabetes Endocrinol* 2020;8:187-9.
- [30] Giovanella L, Verburg FA, Ovčariček PP, Iakovou I, Mihailovic J, Vrachimis A, et al. "Quid autem vides festucam in oculo fratris tui et trabem in oculo tuo non vide" on the hyperthyroidism-induced mortality and antithyroid drug-induced side effects in the era of radioiodine fake news. *Eur J Nucl Med Mol Imaging* 2020;47:1342-4.

[31] Francis N, Francis T, Lazarus JH, Okosieme OE. Current controversies in the management of Graves' hyperthyroidism. *Expert Rev Endocrinol Metab* 2020;15:159-69.