

Contribution of the methodology of collective expertise to the mitigation of food safety hazards in low- or medium-income countries

Didier Montet, Jamal Eddine Hazm, Abdelouahab Ouadia, Abdellah Chichi, Mame Samba Mbaye, Michel Bakar Diop, Paul Mobinzo, Apollinaire Biloso, Isaac Diansambu, Joël Scher, et al.

▶ To cite this version:

Didier Montet, Jamal Eddine Hazm, Abdelouahab Ouadia, Abdellah Chichi, Mame Samba Mbaye, et al.. Contribution of the methodology of collective expertise to the mitigation of food safety hazards in low- or medium-income countries. Food Control, 2019, 99, pp.84 - 88. 10.1016/j.foodcont.2018.12.009. hal-03475146

HAL Id: hal-03475146

https://hal.science/hal-03475146

Submitted on 20 Dec 2021

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



1 Contribution of the methodology of Collective Expertise to the mitigation of food

- 2 safety hazards in low- or medium-income countries
- 4 Didier Montet^{1,*}, Jamal Eddine Hazm², Abdelouahab Ouadia³, Abdellah Chichi⁴, Mame
- 5 Samba Mbaye⁵, Michel Diop⁶, Paul Mobinzo⁷, Apollinaire Biloso⁸, Isaac Diansambu⁹,
- 6 Joël Scher¹⁰, Marie-Louise Scippo¹¹, Maria-Teresa Barreto Crespo^{12,13}
- 8 ¹UMR 95 QualiSud/Cirad/Université of Montpellier, TA B-95 /16, 73 rue J-F Breton,
- 9 34398 Montpellier cedex 5, France
- 10 UMR 95 QualiSud, Université de Montpellier, CIRAD, Montpellier SupAgro,
- 11 Université d'Avignon, Université de la Réunion, Montpellier, France
- ²Département de Chimie, Faculté des Sciences et Techniques, Université Sidi
- Mohammed Ben Abdellah, B.P. 2202 Fez, Morocco
- ³Laboratoire Aliments-Environnement-Santé, Faculté des Sciences et Techniques,
- 15 Université Cadi Ayyad, B.P. 511 Marrakech, Morocco
- 16 ⁴Équipe de Recherche en Biotechnologies & Génie des Biomolécules (ERBGB),
- 17 Faculté des Sciences et Techniques de Tanger, Université Abdelmalek Essaãdi, B.P 416
- 18 Tanger, Morocco

3

7

- ⁵Département de Biologie Végétale, Faculté des Sciences et Techniques, Université
- 20 Cheikh Anta Diop de Dakar, BP 5005, Dakar-Fann, Senegal
- 21 ⁶Section de Technologies Agroalimentaires, UFR des Sciences Agronomiques de
- 22 l'Aquaculture et des Technologies Alimentaires, Université Gaston Berger, BP 234,
- 23 Saint-Louis, Sénégal
- ⁷Université de Lubumbashi, Faculté de Médecine Vétérinaire, av. Likasi, Lubumbashi,
- 25 Democratic Republic of Congo
- ⁸Université de Kinshasa, Faculté des Sciences Agronomiques, BP. 117 Kin XI, Mont-
- 27 Amba, Kinshasa, Democratic Republic of Congo
- ⁹ERAIFT, Campus UNIKIN, BP 15373, Kinshasa, Lemba, Democratic Republic of
- 29 Congo.
- 30 ¹⁰LIBio ENSAIA, Université de Lorraine, 2, avenue de la Forêt de Haye BP 172,
- 31 54505 Vandoeuvre, France
- 32 ¹¹Université de Liège, Département des Sciences des Denrées alimentaires, Quartier
- Vallée 2, Avenue de Cureghem, 10, 4000 Liège, Belgique

- 34 ¹²iBET, Instituto de Biologia Experimental e Tecnológica, Apartado 12, 2780-901
- 35 Oeiras, Portugal
- 36 ¹³ITQB NOVA, Instituto de Tecnologia Química e Biológica António Xavier,
- 37 Universidade Nova de Lisboa, Av. da Republica-EAN, 2780-157 Oeiras, Portugal

- *Corresponding author: UMR 95 QualiSud/Cirad, TA B-95 /16, 73 rue J-F Breton,
- 40 34398 Montpellier cedex 5, France
- 41 Email adress: didier.montet@cirad.fr

42

43

Abstract

- 44 Food safety and quality is a major political topic due to numbers of deaths and
- 45 hospitalizations all over the world due to food contamination, due to the increasing
- 46 concern of consumers with public health related issues, due to increasing complexity of
- 47 internationalization of food chains, along with the stronger sanitary standards set for
- 48 international trade. Many constraints can explain the delays in the establishment of
- 49 measures to prevent and control of food contaminants throughout the food value chains.
- Therefore, the availability of simplified tools that can be used to mitigate food safety
- 51 hazards in low- and middle-income countries is a high priority internationally. The
- 52 proposal addressed in this manuscript is to use the existing knowledge in local
- universities, private companies, citizen's organizations and to translate its proposals and
- scientific / technical advices to the national authorities, in a low cost manner. This
- 55 translation is done by what is described here as Collective Expertise. Collective
- Expertise, can be a very powerful way to develop local strategies to solve problems and
- 57 face the challenges of food safety and food security.

58 59

Key words

- 60 Food safety; Food safety authorities; Collective expertise; Microbial and chemical
- 61 contamination, Food safety management systems

62

63

64

65

66

Highlights

- Analysis of the situation of food safety in low- and middle-income countries
- Proposal of collective expertise to analyse the food safety hazards
 - Creation of food safety expertise in low- and middle-income countries

69

70

71

72

73

74

75

76

77

78

79

80

81

82

83

84

85

86

87

88

89

90

91

92

93

94

95

96

97

98

99

1. Introduction

Availability of food should be sufficient to nourish the global population. Nevertheless, according to international institutions (FAO, IFAD, UNICEF, WFP & WHO, 2017), people with hunger appear to be augmenting, affecting 11% of the global population. In addition, the number of undernourished people globally was 815 million in 2015, against 777 million in former year. Several factors, interconnected and variable, emerging and re-emerging, can explain and at the same time can intensify this continuous problem of food insecurity. Examples of these factors are fragility and conflict, civil insecurity, large-scale displacement, climate-change (i.e. with drought conditions), natural resources degradation, distribution and lack of awareness in the field of healthy nutrition. Having food must also mean that people are nourished with safe food, so the links between food security and food safety are inextricable anywhere in the world (Jones et al., 2013; King et al., 2017). Internal data on deaths and hospitalizations caused by food do not show that everybody is eating safe food. Recent data reveal that of the 56.4 million deaths worldwide in 2015, more than half (54%) were due to the following 10 causes: ischemic heart disease, stroke, lower respiratory infections, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, trachea and bronchus cancers, diabetes mellitus, Alzheimer disease, diarrheal disease, tuberculosis, road injury. However, these causes of death differ according to the level of country income. Infectious diseases account for 43% of deaths in low-income countries compared to 1% in high-income countries. In particular, the diarrheal diseases cause 550 million people to fall ill and 230 000 to die every year (WHO, 2017a). Children under 5 years of age carry 40% of the foodborne disease burden, with 125 000 deaths every year. Moreover, when looking at the data, it has to be taken into consideration that these numbers are only estimates. If in high-income countries statistical institutes collect information on deaths, causes of deaths and on people hospitalized, in many low- and middle-income countries no statistical institute exists, or, when they exists, institutes they are not entirely reliable, consequently the numbers of deaths from specific causes have to be estimated from incomplete data. Statistics on the causes of death and of hospitalizations can help the health authorities to determine the direction of their public health actions, not only because hospitalizations are very expensive for health care

systems, but also foodborne diseases and food contamination can cause huge problems in tourism, trade and on families that do not have health care protection.

Regarding food related health hazards, it is important to have presented some contextual elements of food chains around the world such as, the globalization of the food supply; the increased complexity of those chains; the impact of contaminated food on human health and the impact on the economic well-being of the agri-food industry. It is therefore necessary to assess the hazards and risks associated with food products, throughout the food chains, from production to consumption. Indeed, at each stage, the risks of contamination are significant, when considering the diversity of production systems, the transformation systems, the transport and conservation systems and conditions and the preparation and consumption modes, all in the new context of climate change.

Foodborne illnesses are usually infectious or toxic in nature and caused by microbiological/biological agents or chemical substances through the consumption of contaminated food or water.

The notion of toxicity is a function of a complex relationship between the doses and the effects of an agent but time of exposure and the category of exposed population (i.e children, elderly people and sick people) are also important parameters to consider. In developed countries, it is usual to work on risks to protect population from the hazards. In low- and middle-income countries, risk management is very weak and the population suffers from different food associated hazards. African situation will be the main focus of this article, although some of the problems mentioned here can be extrapolated to other continents.

Food hazards

Microbiological contamination

Among the more than 250 foodborne diseases, the most frequent ones are infectious diseases that are caused by the contamination of food with bacteria, fungi, virus and parasites (WHO, 2015). The most relevant biological contaminants are bacteria (Campylobacter jejuni, Clostridium botulinum and Clostridium perfringens, six Escherichia coli pathotypes (Shiga toxin-producing E. coli (STEC)—STEC also referred as Verocytotoxin-producing E. coli (VTEC) or enterohemorrhagic E. coli

- 133 (EHEC); Enterotoxigenic E. coli (ETEC); Enteropathogenic E. coli (EPEC);
- Enteroaggregative E. coli (EAEC); Enteroinvasive E. coli (EIEC) and diffusely adherent
- 135 E. coli (DAEC)), Listeria monocytogenes, Salmonella spp., Shigella spp.,
- 136 Staphylococcus aureus, Vibrio spp.; viruses (such as Norovirus, Astrovirus, Rotavirus,
- Enterovirus, Hepatitis A and E), parasites (protozoa such as Giardia duodenalis,
- 138 Cryptosporidium parvum, Cyclospora cayetanensis, Toxoplasma gondii, Trichinella
- 139 spiralis and amoeboid parasites such as Entamoeba histolytica) (CDC, 2018;
- 140 Koopmans, 2012; Hikal & Said-Al Ahl, 2017). Filamentous fungi (molds) produce
- mycotoxins that can cause acute or chronic toxicity in human and animals. Mycotoxins
- can accumulate in maturing corn, cereals, soybeans, sorghum, peanuts, and other food
- and feed crops in the field and in grain during transportation. Members of three fungal
- genera, Aspergillus, Fusarium, and Penicillium, are the major mycotoxin producers
- (Alshannaq & Yu, 2017). The most common mycotoxins found in food are aflatoxins,
- trichothecenes, zearalenone, fumonisins, ochratoxins, and patulin, all of them posing
- ongoing food safety problems worldwide and in special in Africa (Yacine Ware et al.,
- 148 2017; Manizan et al., 2018). Other toxicologically important mycotoxins, are such as
- 149 ergot alkaloids, enniatins, alternaria toxins, moniliformin, citrinin, beauvericin,
- 150 cyclopiazonic acid, roquefortin C, mycophenolic acid, penitrems, verruculogen,
- griseofulvin or citreoviridin.
- 152 Food poisoning can be due to other types of toxins such as ciguatoxins produced by
- benthic eukaryotic dinoflagellates of the genus *Gambierdiscus*, mycotoxins produced by
- molds, or toxins produced by bacteria such as Staphylococcus aureus, Clostridium
- 155 perfringens, Clostridium botulinum or Bacillus cereus (Friedman et al. 2017;
- 156 Martinović, et al., 2016; Liu et al., 2018).
- 157 Microbial resistance to antibiotics is another type of food safety hazard because
- 158 foodborne infections caused by antibiotic resistant bacteria can face possible treatment
- failure (Lammie & Hughes, 2016; Founou et al., 2018).
- 160 Chemical contamination
- Because of their usefulness, the chemicals used are diverse but can be dangerous. The
- chemicals used are very diverse because of their usefulness but can be dangerous. These
- 163 chemicals can be: 1-products added or generated by food; 2-residues of veterinary
- drugs, 3-industrial and agricultural pollutants; 4-food contact materials (example of
- plastic materials migration products) (Rather et al., 2017).

Some of the chemical contaminants are compounds that accumulate in the body, and in the environment, they can be named Persistent organic pollutants. Examples of this type of compounds are dioxins or polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs). Dioxins for instance cause reproductive and developmental problems, damage the immune system, interfere with hormones and cause cancer. Heavy metals as lead, cadmium and mercury cause neurological and kidney damage.

172

166

167

168

169

170

171

Legislation and Codex Alimentarius

- 173 Due to several food crisis in the 90's of 20th century, the European Union re-accessed 174 completely the food and feed paradigm, with the creation of an integrated approach 175 from production, to transformation and commercialization of either food or feed, the 176 177 "farm to fork" approach. In 2002, the European Parliament and the Council adopted the Regulation (EC) No 178/2002 laying down the general principles and requirements of 178 179 food law (General Food Law Regulation, European Commission, 2002a). It also set up an independent agency responsible for scientific advice and support, the European Food 180 181 Safety Authority (EFSA). Moreover, it created the main procedures and tools for the management of emergencies and crises and also the Rapid Alert System for Food and 182 Feed (RASFF). 183 The idea behind this overarching and coherent framework for the development of food 184 and feed legislation in each EU country and the EU as a whole was to provide safe food 185 for human and animal consumption, but letting the market act by giving responsibility 186 187 to stakeholders.
- 188 The main set of EU legislation produced for microbiological hazards Regulations are Commission Regulation (EC) No 2073/2005 (European Commission, 2005a) including 189
- 190 all its amendments.
- 191 The main EU regulatory texts relating to chemical hazards are Regulation (EC) No 1881/2006 on the setting of maximum levels for certain contaminants in foodstuffs 192 (European Commission, 2006), Regulation (EC) No 470/2009 laying down Community 193 procedures for the establishment of residue limits for pharmacologically active 194 substances in food of animal origin (European Commission, 2009a), Regulation (EU) 195 196 No 37/2010 on pharmacologically active substances and their classification with regard 197 to the limits maximum residue levels in food of animal origin (European Commission, 198 2010), Regulation (EC) No 396/2005 concerning the maximum limits for pesticide

residues in products of plant and animal origin (European Commission, 2005b), 199 Regulation (EC) No 1107/2009 concerning the placing of products on the 200 phytopharmaceutical market (European Commission, 2009b), Regulation (EC) No 201 1935/2004 on materials and articles intended to come into contact with foodstuffs 202 203 (European Commission, 2004), Regulation (EU) No 10/2011 concerning plastic 204 materials and articles intended to enter in contact with foodstuffs (European 205 Commission, 2011), Regulation (EC) No. 1333/2008 on food additives (European Commission, 2008). To these texts which concern foodstuffs is added Directive 32/2002 206 207 / EC concerning undesirable substances in animal feed (European Commission, 2002b). All these regulatory documents are regularly updated since their first publication, 208 209 meaning that all amendments have to be considered as well. The main route of exposure to these environmental contaminants is food from animal origin for dioxins and PCBs 210 211 (Malisch & Kotz, 2014), marine fish for mercury (EFSA, 2010a), and food from both animal and vegetal origin for lead and cadmium (EFSA, 2009, 2010b). Furthermore, the 212 213 combined exposure to mixtures of chemicals, which can act synergically, is highly suspected to induce negative health effects worst that the effect expected from the 214 215 exposure to a single chemical, as it is done currently in toxicological studies (Bopp et al, 216 2018). In low- and middle-income countries if a coherent body of legislation concerning food 217 218 safety is not in place, as the one from EU mentioned above, the countries use *Codex* Alimentarius. Codex Alimentarius seeks to provide tools for people to have "safe and 219 220 good food for everyone - everywhere", especially in the actual context of globalized food distribution and consumption. The Codex has international food standards, 221 222 guidelines and codes of practice contribute to the safety, quality and fairness of this international food trade. Codex standards are based on sound science provided by 223 224 independent international risk assessment bodies or ad-hoc consultations organized by FAO and WHO so they can adopted with trust (*Codex Alimentarius*). 225

WHO along the years has published numerous and very different types of documents that deal with food safety. Those guides, posters, or fact sheets on food safety are all publically available, as well as strategic plans to attack the problem of having unsafe food been eaten by the populations (WHO, 2012; WHO, 2107b; WHO, 2018a-c).

Moreover, training on basic principles of food hygiene on production, distribution, and retailing and even at home have been extensity promoted all over the world by NGOs, governments, universities, and other stakeholders.

233

234

235

2. The challenge

236 *deaths?*237 Still in many African countries, the people eat unsafe food and die daily, especially
238 children, due to foodborne diseases. Foods contaminated with microbiological,
239 chemical, physical or other hazards are more prone to be eaten in situations of food
240 insecurity. Numerous reasons can be given for foodborne diseases continue to kill and

Reasons for continuing situation of existence of foodborne diseases and consequent

- sent people to the hospitals. Some of them, not pretending to be exhaustive are presented below.
- The first one is the lack of data on the identification of the microbial agent or chemical agent that provoked the disease; limited data on severe or minor outbreaks of foodborne diseases. The data would allow a clearer public health policy for treatment and prevention of diseases. A solution to this nonexistence could be the creation of a health statistic agency/department at the government level and preferentially in the Ministries of health.
- The second one is the importance of water. Safety of water is critical for drinking and to be used in the production, transformation and preparation process of food. Foodborne and waterborne diseases can be regarded as associated or as separated issues; nevertheless the hazards associated are in many cases the same.
- 253 Another very important problem is the public vs. private medical assistance in some of 254 low- and middle-income countries. Public hospitals are poorly equipped and are not 255 many; on the contrary, private hospitals have all conditions to provide good treatment. Data from Eurostat (European Union, 2016) on the public expenditure on health (% of 256 257 budget), an indicator that is expressed as a proportion of total general government 258 expenditure (for European countries, it has been calculated as the proportion of general government health expenditure in total general government expenditure), indicate that 259 260 in 2013 and 2014, the values in EU countries can be the double or more of values in 261 some African countries (i.e. Morocco 6.0 (2013), Senegal 8.0 (2013), France 14.3

- 262 (2014)). Moreover, populations that do have social security, as in EU, access at fair
- price to health care. So, treating the disease rests in the responsibility of the families, if
- they have or not resources to go to private hospitals. The problem is more acute in rural
- areas where people can be very far away from hospitals, have no resources and so are
- left untreated (Pariyo et al., 2009).
- The sensibility of the authorities is also a big problem because of the cost of the social
- 268 insurances in low-income countries. Many consider that working on food safety has a
- 269 cost and the return money is negligent simply because the human cost is linked directly
- 270 to its level of insurance. In high-income countries, the human cost follows a complex
- 271 calculation linked to the cost of the social security for sick people and the cost of
- insurances for death people. It is also possible to think to the culture of deaths in Africa
- that permit to link family (ITUC-Africa, 2012; Ekore & Lanre-Abass, 2016).
- 274 Also, the fact that different approaches to food safety are done by academics and by
- 275 politicians can slow down the improvement of the situation. Academics rely, to study
- food safety issues, on microbiological and chemical analysis and on the interpretation of
- 277 those analyses. They are the ones that master the interpretation and such can have
- 278 knowledge on the hazards and risks faced by the population. Governments and
- 279 government officials have to decide on food safety issues but do not know how to
- interpret data in real time.
- There is need for the creation of national entities that manage food safety at national
- level. Manage means, in this context, risks analysis and expertise, proposition to deal
- the risks and risks communication.
- Last, but no least, to face these constraints and ensure prevention and control of food
- contaminants, it is essential to implement Food Quality Management Systems (FQMS)
- and Food Safety Management Systems (FSMS), based on the application of the Hazard
- 287 Analysis and Critical Control Points (HACCP) method and its prerequisites (Good
- Practices) throughout the food value chains. This has been the strategy of EU and
- several other countries (USA, Japan, Australia...) that already have these systems in
- 290 place.
- 291 In some countries, namely African countries, where there is a lack of a structured
- organization and/or legislation for food quality management's systems, as mentioned,
- 293 the implementation of *Codex Alimentarius* is the first resource for food safety

assurance. But the implementation of some of the proposals, is not always straightforward for SME of the food sector, for local producers and local retailers. The problem is that in some countries most of the enterprises are in fact micro enterprises and people do not have information and formation or skills to establish HACCP systems, do not have financial capacity to perform analysis and national authorities do not have enough resources to accompany so many enterprises. Therefore, there is an urgent need for a systematic/proactive, cost-effective approach towards the control of biological and chemical hazards along the agri-food chains in low- and middle-income countries. Efficient FSMS should take into account the socio-economic context along with the organizational and technological capabilities of the chain stakeholders, including farmers, seed producers, cooperatives, storage and transportation infrastructures, SMEs, as well as market intermediaries and actors.

The implementation of a food safety management system turns out to be a difficult process for many food businesses managers because of the complexity of the available documents and methods. The eastern Mediterranean countries have already pinpointed the deficiencies in their systems and the need to update food safety laws and regulations, food standards and control management, effective food inspection and enforcement services, food monitoring and surveillance systems with adequate laboratory resources, foodborne disease surveillance systems, food safety education and training, and timely information and communications (Alwan & Elmi, 2015). These deficiencies can be extended to many other African and non-African countries.

3. Using Collective Expertise as a methodology to promote food safety

In low- and middle-income countries, knowledge on microbial and chemical contaminants in food chains exists in universities and public or private research institutes. Researchers have, for most of them, done graduate studies, post-docs or advanced training studies outside their countries around the world. Analysis that were done, even if they are not numerous, can be interpreted by those researchers/teachers and then be turned into data that can feed political decisions. Moreover, due to international scientific contacts, internet connection, agricultural and food big data and scientific literature the data from other countries and similar situations can be the source of data that can be related to local situations and analysis of local situations.

- So, the proposal is to use as tool the knowledge translation. Transferring the knowledge
- 327 already existing in local universities, private companies, citizen's organizations, to
- authorities involved in managing food safety, can be a powerful way to develop local
- 329 strategies to solve problems and face the challenges of food safety and food security.
- 330 Transfer could be made through the use of Collective Expertise.
- 331 Collective expertise in the scope of this work consists in collecting, sharing and
- highlighting information available in the universities, in experts working in the field of
- food safety in private companies and other stakeholders.
- Teachers by their function are confronted with all the problems related to these fields.
- 335 They supervise the internships of the students in relation with the socio-economic
- world, they are asked to give opinions, or to take part in the resolution of the problems
- of food safety, as well as various specialized (in charge specifically of the concerned
- domains) or not specialized institutions (local authorities, companies, NGOs). As a
- result, they have an informed opinion on all major challenges in the areas concerned.
- Even if this approach is not based on actual studies, it has the merit of valuing a wealth
- 341 of information and, precisely, makes it possible to circumvent the requirements of
- 342 country-wide studies, which are inherently cumbersome, expensive and long.
- 343 If gathered and being consulted in groups, teachers from several universities in a
- 344 country as well as the other stakeholders, become experts belonging to a Collective
- Expertise panel. These groups of experts due to their different geographical origins and
- scientific and technical background, will have an accurate idea of the state of food
- safety in the country. Such a panels will represent, for authorities, a mean of having
- 348 proposals and scientific / technical advices of interest for the mitigation of the national
- problems, with minimal costs.
- 350 Collective Expertise can be implemented by organizing meeting of experts in different
- areas related to food safety like, chemistry, microbiology, social sciences, law, and so
- on. The experts should be around 20-25, being divided in two groups and for two days
- come up with a list of the major challenges of a country in terms of food safety that can
- 354 be reported as:
- Identification of the challenge;
- Brief description of challenge;
- The impact socio-economic, health, science, legal...

- The needs associated research, equipment, analysis, training and training levels, legislation...
- The use of Collective Expertise will allow the country authorities to respond to different challenges such as:
- Increase food safety for local and outside (exports) consumers;
- Develop or improve a local food safety policy and plan of action;
- Share responsibilities between industry, consumers and government;
- Inform consumers to help them make the best choice of food and prepare their food properly;
- Sensitize consumers to be more demanding about the quality of food;
- Strengthen the food control system from farm to table with the participation of stakeholders;
- Increase the level of credibility and competence of regulatory authorities;
- Increase industry and consumer awareness and participation in food safety.
- 372 The utilization of Collective Expertise was tested in the scope of the EU project
- 373 Erasmus+ project (EU) entitled "Societal Challenges and Governance of African
- Universities: the case of ALIments in Morocco, the Democratic Republic of the Congo
- and Senegal (DAfrAli)", seeks to strengthen the governance capacity of African Higher
- 376 Education Institutions to mobilize their resources in order to respond to major societal
- 377 challenges in relation to external stakeholders. The results of using the methodology
- 378 Collective Expertise pilot exercises are detailed in a second article untitled: Analysis of
- 379 societal challenges in food safety by collective expertise in Morocco, the Democratic
- 380 Republic of Congo and Senegal.

Acknowledgements

- 383 This work was supported by the European Union, through the funding of the Eramus+,
- 384 Key Action No2, project DAFRALI "Défis sociétaux et gouvernance des universités
- 385 AFRicaines: le cas des ALIments au Maroc, en République démocratique du Congo et
- au Sénégal, No 2015/C 347/06. This project is coordinated by AUF Belgium.
- 387 MTBCrespo acknowledges iNOVA4Health Research Unit (LISBOA-01-0145-FEDER-
- 388 007344), which is cofunded by Fundação para a Ciência e Tecnologia / Ministério da

- Ciência e do Ensino Superior, through national funds, and by FEDER under the PT2020
- 390 Partnership Agreement.

392

393 References

- 394 Alshannaq, A. & Yu, J.-H. (2017). Occurrence, Toxicity, and Analysis of Major
- 395 Mycotoxins in Food. International Journal of Environmental Research and Public
- 396 *Health*, 14(6), 632-651. https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph1406063.
- 397 Alwan, A. & Elmi, M. (2015). Food safety in the Eastern Mediterranean region: time to
- 398 act. Eastern Mediterranean Health Journal, 21, 153-154.
- Bopp, S.K., Barouki, R., Brack, W., Dalla Costa, S., Dorne, J.C.M., Drakvik. P.E.,
- 400 Faust. M., Karjalainen, T.K., Kephalopoulos, S., van Klaveren, J., Kolossa-Gehring. M.,
- 401 Kortenkamp, A., Lebret, E., Lettieri, T., Nørager, S., Rüegg, J., Tarazona, J.V., Trier,
- 402 X., van de Water, B., van Gils, J., & Bergman, Å. (2018). Current EU research activities
- on combined exposure to multiple chemicals. *Environment International*, 120, 544-562.
- 404 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2018.07.037.
- 405 CDC (Center for Disease Control and Prevention). Available on line:
- 406 https://www.cdc.gov/ecoli/general/index.html (acessed on 17 May 2018).
- 407 Codex Alimentarius. Joint FAO/WHO Food Standards Programme, Rome, Italy.
- 408 EFSA. (2009). Cadmium in food. Scientific Opinion of the Panel on Contaminants in
- the Food Chain. EFSA Journal, 980, 1-139.
- 410 EFSA. (2010a). Scientific Opinion on the risk for public health related to the presence
- of mercury and methylmercury in food. *EFSA Journal*, 10(12): 2985.
- 412 EFSA. (2010b). Scientific Opinion on Lead in Food. EFSA Journal, 8(4), 1570.
- Ekore, R. I. & Lanre-Abass, B. (2016). African Cultural Concept of Death and the Idea
- of Advance Care Directives. *Indian Journal of Palliative Care*, 22(4), 369–372.
- 415 https://doi.org/10.4103/0973-1075.191741.
- 416 European Commission. (2002a). Commission Regulation (EC) No 178/2002 of the
- European Parliament and of the Council of 28 January 2002 laying down the general
- 418 principles and requirements of food law, establishing the European Food Safety

- 419 Authority and laying down procedures in matters of food safety. Official Journal L 31,
- 420 1.2.2002, 1–24.
- European Commission. (2002b). Directive 2002/32/EC of the European Parliament and
- of the Council of 7 May 2002 on undesirable substances in animal feed. *Official Journal*
- 423 L 140, 30.5.2002, 10–22.
- 424 European Commission. (2004). Commission Regulation (EC) No 1935/2004 of the
- European Parliament and of the Council of 27 October 2004 on materials and articles
- 426 intended to come into contact with food and repealing Directives 80/590/EEC and
- 427 89/109/EEC. Official Journal L 338, 13.11.2004, 4–17.
- 428 European Commission. (2005a). Commission Regulation (EC) No 2073/2005 of 15
- 429 November 2005 on microbiological criteria for foodstuffs. Official Journal L 338,
- 430 22.12.2005, 1–26.
- European Commission. (2005b). Commission Regulation (EC) No 396/2005 of the
- European Parliament and of the Council of 23 February 2005 on maximum residue
- 433 levels of pesticides in or on food and feed of plant and animal origin and amending
- 434 Council Directive 91/414/EEC. Official Journal L 70, 16.3.2005, 1–16.
- European Commission. (2006). Commission Regulation (EC) No 1881/2006 of 19
- December 2006 setting maximum levels for certain contaminants in foodstuffs. *Official*
- 437 Journal L 364, 20.12.2006, 5-24.
- European Commission. (2008). Commission Regulation (EC) No 1333/2008 of the
- European Parliament and of the Council of 16 December 2008 on food additives.
- 440 *Official Journal* L 354, 31.12.2008, 16–33.
- European Commission. (2009a). Commission Regulation (EC) No 470/2009 of the
- European Parliament and of the Council of 6 May 2009 laying down Community
- 443 procedures for the establishment of residue limits of pharmacologically active
- substances in foodstuffs of animal origin, repealing Council Regulation (EEC) No
- 445 2377/90 and amending Directive 2001/82/EC of the European Parliament and of the
- 446 Council and Regulation (EC) No 726/2004 of the European Parliament and of the
- 447 Council. Official Journal L 152, 16.6.2009, 11–22.

- European Commission. (2009b). Commission Regulation (EC) No 1107/2009 of the
- European Parliament and of the Council of 21 October 2009 concerning the placing of
- 450 plant protection products on the market and repealing Council Directives 79/117/EEC
- and 91/414/EEC. Official Journal L 309, 24.11.2009, 1–50.
- 452 European Commission. (2010). Commission Regulation (EU) No 37/2010 of 22
- 453 December 2009 on pharmacologically active substances and their classification
- regarding maximum residue limits in foodstuffs of animal origin. Official Journal L 15,
- 455 20.1.2010, 1–72.
- 456 European Commission. (2011). Commission Regulation (EU) No 10/2011 of 14
- January 2011 on plastic materials and articles intended to come into contact with food.
- 458 *Official Journal* L 12, 15.1.2011, 1–89.
- 459 European Union. (2016). The European Union and the African Union A statistical
- 460 portrait 2016 edition. Statistical Books, Publications Office of the European Union,
- 461 Luxembourg.
- 462 FAO, IFAD, UNICEF, WFP and WHO. (2017). The State of Food Security and
- Nutrition in the World 2017. Building resilience for peace and food security. Rome,
- 464 FAO.
- 465 Founou, L. L., Amoako, D. G., Founou, R. C., Essack, S. Y. (2018). Antibiotic
- 466 Resistance in Food Animals in Africa: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis.
- 467 *Microbial Drug Resistance*. https://doi.org/10.1089/mdr.2017.0383.
- 468 Friedman, M. A., Fernandez, M., Backer, L. C., Dickey, R. W., Bernstein, J., Schrank,
- 469 K., Kibler, S., Stephan; W., Gribble, M. O., Bienfang, P., Bowen, R. E., Degrasse, S.,
- 470 Flores Quintana, H. A., Loeffler, C. R., Weisman, R., Blythe, D., Berdalet, E., Ayyar,
- 471 R., Clarkson-Townsend, D., Swajian, K., Benner, R., Brewer, T., & Fleming, L. E.
- 472 (2017). An Updated Review of Ciguatera Fish Poisoning: Clinical, Epidemiological,
- Environmental, and Public Health Management. Marine Drugs, 15 (3), 72-113.
- 474 https://doi.org/10.3390/md15030072.
- 475 Hikal, W. M. & Said-Al Ahl, H. A. H. (2017). Food Related Parasitic Infection: A
- 476 Review. *American Journal of Food Science and Health*, 3, 30-34.

- 477 ITUC-Africa. (2012). Social Protection Schemes in Africa. Trywell Kalusopa, Rudi
- 478 Dicks & Clara Osei-Boateng, Editors. Togo.
- Jones, A. D., Ngure, F. M., Pelto, G., & Young, S. L. (2013). What Are We Assessing
- 480 When We Measure Food Security? A Compendium and Review of Current Metrics.
- 481 *Advances in Nutrition*, 4, 481–505. https://doi.org/10.3945/an.113.004119.
- 482 King, T., Cole, M., Farber, J. M., Eisenbrand, G., Zabaras, D., Fox, E. M. & Hill, J. P.
- 483 (2017). Food safety for food security: Relationship between global megatrends and
- developments in food safety. Trends in Food Science & Technology, 68, 160-175.
- 485 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tifs.2017.08.014.
- 486 Koopmans, M. (2012). Food-borne viruses from a global perspective. In Improving
- food safety through a one health approach. Eileen R. Choffnes, E. R., Relman, D. A.,
- 488 LeighAnne, O., Hutton, R., & Alison Mack, Rapporteurs. The national Academies
- 489 Press, Washington DC, USA.
- 490 Lammie, S. L. & Hughes, J. M. (2016). Antimicrobial Resistance, Food Safety, and One
- 491 Health: The Need for Convergence. *Annual Review of Food Science and Technology*, 7,
- 492 287-312. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-food-041715-033251.
- Liu, J. M., Wang, Z. H., Ma, H. & Wang, S. (2018). Probing and Quantifying the Food-
- 494 Borne Pathogens and Toxins: from in vitro to in vivo. Journal of Agricultural and Food
- 495 *Chemistry*, 66, 1061-1066. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.jafc.7b05225.
- 496 Malisch, R & Kotz, A. (2014). Dioxins and PCBs in feed and food--review from
- 497 European perspective. Science of the Total Environment. 491-492, 2-10. doi:
- 498 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2014.03.022.
- 499 Manizan, A. L., Oplatowska-Stachowiak M., Piro-Metayer, I., Campbell, K., Koffi-
- Nevry, R., Elliott, C., Akaki, D., Montet, D. & Brabet, C. (2018). Multi-mycotoxin
- determination in rice, maize and peanut products most consumed in Cote d'Ivoire by
- 502 UHPLC-MS/MS. *Food Control*, 87, 22-30.
- 503 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2017.11.032.
- Martinović, T., Andjelković, U., Gajdošik, M. Š., Rešetar, D. & Josić, D. (2016).
- Foodborne pathogens and their toxins. 2016. Journal of Proteomics, 147, 226-235.
- 506 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jprot.2016.04.029.

- Pariyo, G. W., Ekirapa-Kiracho, E., Okui, O., Rahman, M. H., Peterson, S., Bishai, D.
- 508 M., Lucas, H. & Peters, D. H. (2009). Changes in utilization of health services among
- poor and rural residents in Uganda: are reforms benefitting the poor? *International*
- *Journal for Equity in Health*, 8, 39. https://doi.org/1010.1186/1475-9276-8-39.
- Rather, I. A., Koh, W. Y., Paek, W. K. & Lim, J. (2017). The Sources of Chemical
- 512 Contaminants in Food and Their Health Implications. Frontiers in Pharmacology, 8,
- 513 830. https://doi.org/10.3389/fphar.2017.00830.
- 514 WHO. (2012). Five keys to growing safer fruits and vegetables: promoting health by
- decreasing microbial contamination. WHO, Geneva, Switzerland.
- 516 WHO. (2015). WHO estimates of the global burden of foodborne diseases: foodborne
- disease burden epidemiology reference group 2007-2015. WHO, Geneva, Switzerland.
- 518 WHO. (2017a). The top 10 causes of death. Fact sheet. Geneve, Switzerland.
- 519 WHO. (2017b). Food safety. Fact sheet. WHO, Geneva, Switzerland.
- 520 WHO. (2018a). Campylobacter. Fact sheet. WHO, Geneva, Switzerland.
- 521 WHO. (2018b). E. coli. Fact sheet. WHO, Geneva, Switzerland.
- 522 WHO. (2018c). Listeriosis. Fact sheet. WHO, Geneva, Switzerland.
- Yacine Ware, L., Durand, N., Augustini Nikiema, P., Alter, P., Fontana A., Montet, D.
- & Barro, N. (2017). Occurrence of mycotoxins in commercial infant formulas locally
- 525 produced in Ouagadougou (Burkina Faso), Food Control, 73, 518-523.
- 526 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2016.08.047.