



HAL
open science

Belgian Governmental Superior Health Council advises against the use of the DSM categories and promotes contextualising psychiatric diagnosis

Stijn Vanheule, P. Adriaens, Ariane Bazan, P. Bracke, I. Devisch, J-L. Feys, B. Froyen, S. Gerard, D. Nieman, J. van Os, et al.

► To cite this version:

Stijn Vanheule, P. Adriaens, Ariane Bazan, P. Bracke, I. Devisch, et al.. Belgian Governmental Superior Health Council advises against the use of the DSM categories and promotes contextualising psychiatric diagnosis. *The Lancet. Psychiatry*, 2019, 6 (9), 10.1016/S2215-0366(19)30284-6 . hal-03452394

HAL Id: hal-03452394

<https://hal.science/hal-03452394>

Submitted on 4 Feb 2022

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

- 1 Johns MM, Lowry R, Andrzejewski J, et al. Transgender identity and experiences of violence victimization, substance use, suicide risk, and sexual risk behaviors among high school students—19 states and large urban school districts, 2017. *MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep* 2019; **68**: 67–71.
- 2 Medley G, Lipari RN, Bose J, Cribb DS, Kroutil LA, McHenry G. Sexual orientation and estimates of adult substance use and mental health: results from the 2015 National Survey on Drug Use and Health. Substance Abuse and Mental Health Services Administration. October, 2016. [https://www.samhsa.gov/data/sites/default/files/NSDUH-SexualOrientation-2015/NSDUH-SexualOrientation-2015.htm](https://www.samhsa.gov/data/sites/default/files/NSDUH-SexualOrientation-2015/NSDUH-SexualOrientation-2015/NSDUH-SexualOrientation-2015.htm) (accessed July 19, 2019).
- 3 Robinson M. LGBTQ people, drug use & harm reduction. Rainbow Health Ontario. 2014. https://www.rainbowhealthontario.ca/wp-content/uploads/woocommerce_uploads/2015/06/RHO_FactSheet_LGBTDRUGUSEHARMREDUCTION_E.pdf (accessed March 26, 2019).
- 4 Waite S, Denier N. A research note on Canada's LGBT data landscape: where we are and what the future holds. *Can Rev Sociol* 2019; **56**: 93–117.
- 5 Girouard MP, Goldhammer H, Keuroghlian AS. Understanding and treating opioid use disorders in lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, and queer populations. *Subst Abuse* 2019; **13**: 1–5.

Belgian Superior Health Council advises against the use of the DSM categories

Worldwide, the DSM is, much like the ICD, a frequently used classificatory diagnostic instrument. However, questions have been raised about its pragmatic and scientific status.^{1–3} Therefore, in 2016, the Belgian Governmental Superior Health Council set up an expert group comprised of academics and practitioners in psychiatry, clinical psychology, sociology, and philosophy as well as a service user to evaluate relevant literature and evidence.⁴

Epistemologically, the expert group concluded that mental disorder categories should not be treated as natural kind categories but as constructs that have a causal impact on those who are classified. Sociologically, the group observed that diagnostic classifications tend to legitimise organisational structures

and protect psychiatry from pressures to change. Moreover, the literature suggests that a biomedical approach does not, as hoped, reduce stigma and discrimination. Clinically, the group concluded that common diagnostic categories lack validity, reliability, and predictive power. Additionally, these do not tally with new conceptions of health, defined by the ability to adapt despite biopsychosocial obstacles.⁵

The Council observed that multilayered clinical case formulation provides a useful alternative. Thus, symptoms, complaints, and suffering can best be contextualised in terms of biographical information, existential challenges, contextual-interactive functioning, mental processes, and biological considerations. Classification can still occur but on the basis of a small number of general syndromes (eg, psychotic syndrome or depression syndrome), which stimulates personal diagnostic formulation. These should be discussed in terms of a continuum from crisis to recovery to assess the need for care and support.

The report ends with recommendations that encourage contextualised patient-centred psychiatry. These recommendations include the advice to refrain from using the DSM categories for organising and reimbursing interventions and for organising prevention and promoting mental health literacy.

The report has five key recommendations aimed at clinicians, policy makers, and the general public: (1) default non-problematizing and non-medicalising approaches to mental complaints or crises because they might express existential and social problems; (2) careful listening to subjective experiences; (3) providing help and support for mental complaints or crises without a formal diagnosis as a precondition; (4) taking the perspective of people with mental complaints or crises and the way in which they give meaning as central to diagnosis and treatment; and (6) when formulating a case, paying close attention to the

person-specific way in which, among other things, mental, existential (giving and losing meaning), biological, social, and cultural factors take shape.

To our knowledge, this is the first time a public body has drawn such an explicit conclusion about how psychiatric diagnosis might best be used in clinical and public health practice.

JVO was member of the DSM-5 work group on psychotic disorders. This Correspondence is published with the approval of the Belgian Superior Health Council. The authors thank the members of the panel DSM (5): The use and status of diagnosis and classification of mental health problems.

**Stijn Vanheule, Pieter Adriaens, Ariane Bazan, Piet Bracke, Ignaas Devisch, Jean-Louis Feys, Brenda Froyen, Sylvie Gerard, Dorien H. Nieman, Jim Van Os, Marc Calmeyer*
stijn.vanheule@ugent.be

Belgian Superior Health Council, Brussels, Belgium (PA, AB, PB, MC, ID, J-LF, BF, SG, DN, SV); Department of Psycho-analysis and Clinical Consulting (SV), Department of Sociology (PB), and Department of Public Health and Family Medicine (ID), Ghent University, B-9000 Ghent, Belgium; Institute of Philosophy, KU Leuven, Belgium (PA); Research Center for Clinical Psychology, Psychopathology and Psychosomatics, Université libre de Bruxelles, Brussels, Belgium (AB); Psychiatric Hospital Onze-Lieve-Vrouw, Bruges, Belgium (MC); Psychiatric Hospital St Bernard, Manage, Belgium (J-LF); Department of Psychiatry, Amsterdam University Medical Centers, Netherlands (DN); Department of Psychiatry, UMC Utrecht Brain Center, Utrecht, Netherlands (JVO); Department of Psychiatry and Psychology, School for Mental Health and Neuroscience, Maastricht University Medical Centre, Maastricht, Netherlands (JVO); and Department of Psychosis Studies, Institute of Psychiatry, Psychology, and Neuroscience, King's College London, London, UK (JVO)

- 1 Hyman SE. The diagnosis of mental disorders: the problem of reification. *Annu Rev Clin Psychol* 2010; **6**: 155–79.
- 2 Vanheule S. Psychiatric diagnosis revisited: from DSM to clinical case formulation. Cham: Palgrave Macmillan, 2017.
- 3 Cosgrove L, Krinsky S, Wheeler EE. Tripartite conflicts of interest and high stakes patent extensions in the DSM-5. *Psychother Psychosom* 2014; **83**: 106–13.
- 4 Superior Health Council. DSM (5): the use and status of diagnosis and classification of mental health problems. June, 2019. <https://www.health.belgium.be/en/advisory-9360dsm> (accessed July 10, 2019).
- 5 Huber M, Knottnerus A, Green L et al. How should we define health? *BMJ* 2011; **343**: d4163.