

Assessment of a regional physical–biogeochemical stochastic ocean model. Part 1: Ensemble generation

Vassilios D Vervatis, Pierre de Mey-Frémaux, Nadia Ayoub, John Karagiorgos, Malek Ghantous, Marios Kailas, Charles-Emmanuel Testut, Sarantis Sofianos

▶ To cite this version:

Vassilios D Vervatis, Pierre de Mey-Frémaux, Nadia Ayoub, John Karagiorgos, Malek Ghantous, et al.. Assessment of a regional physical-biogeochemical stochastic ocean model. Part 1: Ensemble generation. Ocean Modelling, 2021, 160, pp.101781. 10.1016/j.ocemod.2021.101781. hal-03441625

HAL Id: hal-03441625 https://hal.science/hal-03441625

Submitted on 22 Nov 2021

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

Assessment of a regional physical-biogeochemical stochastic ocean model. Part 1: Ensemble generation

Vassilios D. Vervatis, Pierre De Mey-Frémaux, Nadia Ayoub, John Karagiorgos, Malek Ghantous, Marios Kailas, Charles-Emmanuel Testut, Sarantis Sofianos



PII:	\$1463-5003(21)00031-7
DOI:	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ocemod.2021.101781
Reference:	OCEMOD 101781
To appear in:	Ocean Modelling
Received date :	18 May 2020
Revised date :	19 January 2021
Accepted date :	20 February 2021

Please cite this article as: V.D. Vervatis, P. De Mey-Frémaux, N. Ayoub et al., Assessment of a regional physical-biogeochemical stochastic ocean model. Part 1: Ensemble generation. *Ocean Modelling* (2021), doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ocemod.2021.101781.

This is a PDF file of an article that has undergone enhancements after acceptance, such as the addition of a cover page and metadata, and formatting for readability, but it is not yet the definitive version of record. This version will undergo additional copyediting, typesetting and review before it is published in its final form, but we are providing this version to give early visibility of the article. Please note that, during the production process, errors may be discovered which could affect the content, and all legal disclaimers that apply to the journal pertain.

© 2021 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

1 Assessment of a regional physical-biogeochemical stochastic ocean model. Part 1: ensemble 2 generation

- 3 Vassilios D. Vervatis (1), Pierre De Mey-Frémaux (2), Nadia Ayoub (2), John Karagiorgos (1), Malek
- 4 Ghantous (3), Marios Kailas (1), Charles-Emmanuel Testut (4), and Sarantis Sofianos (1)
- 5 (1) University of Athens, Department of Physics, Athens, Greece. (2) LEGOS/CNRS, Toulouse, France.
- 6 (3) Météo France, Toulouse, France. (4) Mercator Ocean International, Ramonville St. Agne, France.
- 7 Correspondence to: Vassilios D. Vervatis (vervatis@oc.phys.uoa.gr)

8 Abstract. In this article, Part 1 of a two-part series, we run and evaluate the skill of a regional physical-9 biogeochemical stochastic ocean model based on NEMO. The domain covers the Bay of Biscay at 1/36° 10 resolution, as a case study for open-ocean and coastal shelf dynamics. We generate ensembles of 11 uncertainties from assumptions related to errors in the atmospheric forcing, the ocean model 12 parameterizations and in the sources and sinks of the biogeochemical variables. The resulting errors are 13 found to be mainly driven by the wind forcing uncertainties, with the rest of the perturbed forcing and 14 parameters locally influencing the ensemble spread. Biogeochemical uncertainties arise from intrinsic 15 ecosystem model errors and from errors in the physical state. Uncertainties in physical forcing and 16 parameterization are found to have a larger impact on chlorophyll spread than uncertainties in ecosystem 17 sources and sinks. The ensembles undergo quantitative verification with respect to observations, focusing 18 on upper-ocean properties. Despite a tendency for ensembles to be generally under-dispersive, they 19 appear to be reasonably consistent with respect to sea surface temperature data. The largest statistical sea-20 level biases are observed in coastal regions. These biases hint at the presence of high-frequency error 21 sources currently unaccounted for, and suggest that the ensemble-based uncertainties are unfit to model 22 error covariances for assimilation. Model ensembles for chlorophyll appear to be consistent with ocean 23 colour data only at times. The stochastic model is qualitatively evaluated by analysing its ability at generating consistent multivariate incremental model corrections. Corrections to physical properties are 24 25 associated with large-scale biases between model and data, with diverse characteristics in the open-ocean 26 and the shelves. Mesoscale features imprint their signature on temperature and sea-level corrections, as 27 well as on chlorophyll corrections due to the vertical velocities associated with vortices. Small scale local 28 corrections are visible over the shelves. Chlorophyll information has measurable impact on physical 29 variables.

- 30 Keywords: ensemble modelling, model uncertainties, stochastic physics-biogeochemistry, ocean colour,
- 31 data assimilation, Bay of Biscay

32 1 Introduction

33 For a while now, the oceanographic community has been aware that regional and coastal ocean models have some quite specific requirements for both the methods and the observational data used for an 34 35 effective data assimilation scheme (see extensive reviews e.g. in De Mey-Frémaux, 2000; Edwards et al., 36 2015; Pinardi et al., 2017; Fujii et al., 2019). But the success of data assimilation in a particular case will 37 depend not only on the power of the methodology and data themselves, but on how realistic our estimates of observational errors and model errors are (Oke and Sakov, 2008). Error processes in a model constitute 38 39 a subspace of the complete space spanned by all of its variables as the model is integrated. Important 40 sources of model errors in coastal domains are the presence of the coast and shallower water, strong 41 bathymetry gradients, inputs from rivers, and are forced by (among other things) pressure and current fields from ocean-scale mass balances, circulation, tides and eddies, winds and air pressure variations, 42 43 and non-uniform density (Kourafalou et al., 2015a; 2015b).

In addition to the effects of local geography mentioned above, the dynamics of coastal (nested) models are largely controlled by the open boundary conditions (*Ghantous et al.*, 2020). *Thacker et al.* (2012) presented how model uncertainties in the open boundaries manifest as model sea-level uncertainties in the Gulf of Mexico. The Bay of Biscay's dynamics are influenced by the North East Atlantic circulation, especially along the southern slope, with the seasonal reversal of the Iberian poleward current. At depth, the entrance of Mediterranean water masses from the south has been shown to influence the Bay of Biscay's hydrology between 600m and 1500m depth (*Koutsikopoulos and Le Cann*, 1996), and 51 potentially the circulation through interactions between eddies and deep, salty lenses (see for instance

52 *Carton et al.*, 2013).

53 One common approach to realistically represent error processes and their time evolution is stochastic

54 modelling (e.g. *Adhler et al.*, 1996; and recent studies for regional configurations in *Melsom et al.*, 2012;

- 55 Sakov et al., 2012; Quattrocchi et al., 2014; Vandenbulcke and Barth, 2015, 2019; Vervatis et al., 2016).
- 56 Lucas et al. (2008) generated ensembles using NEMO (Nucleus for European Modelling of the Ocean;
- 57 <u>http://www.nemo-ocean.eu/;</u> Madec, 2012), based on a configuration for the North Atlantic at 1/4°
- 58 resolution and multivariate EOF modes. The ensemble capabilities of NEMO have been discussed in the
- 59 literature following the SANGOMA (<u>http://www.data-assimilation.net/</u>) and OCCIPUT projects (*Penduff*
- *et al.*, 2014), focusing on global and regional academic configurations spanning from 2° to 1/4° resolution and from seasonal to decadal time scales (*Brankart*, 2013; *Brankart et al.*, 2015; *Candille et al.*, 2015;
- 62 *Garnier et al.*, 2016; *Bessières et al.*, 2017).
- In this paper, we configure, run and assess a stochastic ocean model in the Bay of Biscay, consisting of 63 physical-biogeochemical ensemble simulations with the NEMO-PISCESv2 model (Pelagic Interactions 64 65 Scheme for Carbon and Ecosystem Studies volume 2; Aumont et al., 2015), as a step towards coastal and regional data assimilation. The work is based on recent advances in NEMO explicitly simulating the 66 effects of model uncertainties using an "ensemble generator" (e.g. the same as a scalar time-stepping 67 numerical model can be seen as a "state generator"), modified here specifically for stochastic 68 parameterizations in high-resolution configurations. Our "classic" stochastic modelling approach is based 69 70 on introducing stochastic degrees of freedom of forcings and model parameterizations (the model 71 response to those stochastic degrees of freedom being the so-called "system errors" whose second-order 72 moments are usually modelled as the Q matrix in a data assimilation context). This stochastic model 73 undergoes validation in Parts 1 and 2 of this study.
- A generic perturbation approach based on first-order autoregressive processes AR(1) is proposed for the coupled physical and biogeochemical models. Autoregressive processes are based on statistical models operating under the hypothesis that the past state has an effect on the present state. First-order denotes that the current value is based on the immediately preceding value. A comprehensive analysis for the stochastic formulation of NEMO is given in *Brankart* (2013) and *Brankart et al.* (2015). Some theoretical background for probabilistic ocean modelling, with technical details on implementation strategies based on NEMO (e.g. online ensemble diagnostics, connection with observation operators and
- 81 data assimilation systems) is provided by *Bessières et al.* (2017).
- 82 Brankart et al. (2015) introduced two approaches for ensemble ocean modelling: the first is the stochastic 83 perturbed parameterized tendencies (SPPT; Buizza et al., 1999) and the second is the stochastic 84 parameterization of unresolved fluctuations (SPUF). The SPPT implementation, which we use in this 85 study, aims to generate perturbations on the models' parameterized tendencies (referred to here as the models' time derivative) and implements Monte-Carlo techniques to obtain a probability density function 86 87 (pdf) of these tendencies. The stochastically derived parameterized tendencies are added to the models' 88 non-parameterized tendencies (the latter assumed free of uncertainties). The SPUF implementation (not 89 used in this study) is based on random walks sampling gradients from the state vector and adding them 90 to the models' solution. In another study, Ollinaho et al. (2017) proposed a stochastic perturbed 91 parameters (SPP) scheme, perturbing a number of model parameters whose values are presumed to 92 contain errors. As in their work, model errors of physical parameters are introduced in this study, by 93 applying spatiotemporally varying perturbations.
- 94 Marine biogeochemical data assimilation is increasingly being used in operational platforms as a tool to 95 improve ocean forecasting systems. However, the subject is still immature with several challenges 96 remaining, as for example using multivariate increments and validating non-assimilated variables in 97 biogeochemical models. The Ensemble Kalman Filter (EnKF; Evensen, 2003) was first used with a simple 98 1D ecosystem model by Eknes and Evensen (2002), and later, by Allen et al. (2003), to control the 99 evolution of zooplankton and nutrients by assimilating chlorophyll. Simon and Bertino (2009) extended 100 the EnKF to include a Gaussian anamorphosis transformation, accounting for non-Gaussian 101 biogeochemical distributions. Ciavatta et al. (2014), instead of assimilating chlorophyll, adapted the

- 102 EnKF to assimilate the SeaWiFS (https://oceancolor.gsfc.nasa.gov/SeaWiFS/) light attenuation
- 103 coefficient incorporating a bio-optical model. Biogeochemical data assimilation mostly relies on satellite
- 104 chlorophyll a. Recent studies have shed light on the assimilation of ocean colour plankton functional
- 105 types, further improving marine ecosystem simulations (*Ciavatta et al.*, 2016, 2018).

106 In light of these advances, the ocean modelling and data assimilation communities have put significant 107 effort in improving the predictive skill of biogeochemical models (Song et al., 2016; Mattern et al., 2017; 108 Mattern et al., 2018; Kaufman et al., 2018; Yu et al., 2018; Ford, 2019; Goodliff et al., 2019). Meanwhile, 109 there is an increasing interest in biogeochemical model optimization (Wang et al., 2020), as well as for 110 coupled probabilistic systems and methods for their evaluation (Candille et al., 2015; Garnier et al., 2016; Santana-Falcón et al., 2020). Errors in biogeochemical models stem from parameterizations and 111 112 unresolved scales, and can be investigated by uncertainties in initial and atmospheric conditions (Verdy and Mazloff, 2017; Fransner et al., 2020), in biogeochemical tracers and their sources and sinks (Brankart 113 114 et al., 2015), and model parameters (e.g. nutrient limitations, growth and mortality rates, grazing etc.; 115 Garnier et al., 2016; Gharamti et al., 2017). Moreover, biogeochemical model performance is strongly 116 dependent on ocean dynamics and on choices made in the assimilation scheme. The use of (pre-) operational biogeochemistry data assimilation is of vital importance to assess these systems and their 117

118 products, and advance on the management of marine ecosystems (Gehlen et al., 2015).

119 The most useful statistical properties of ensembles include their mean, spread, and - especially for data

assimilation - their covariances. Higher order moments can also sometimes prove useful (e.g. *Quattrocchi et al.*, 2014). Where observations are available the ensemble mean can reveal biases, while the ensemble

spread can measure model sensitivity to perturbed quantities used to generate the ensemble. When data

are available and their uncertainties reasonably well known, consistency analyses can be performed

between ensemble-based uncertainties and observational errors (*Edwards et al.*, 2015), using differences

125 between modelled and observed variable values (the innovation vectors).

We use the above techniques to validate our ensembles, and hence the underlying stochastic model. We describe and implement consistency analysis methods to produce a quantitative assessment of the

- 128 stochastic modelling of coupled physical and biogeochemical processes. Two other methods to assess the
- 129 empirical consistency of ensembles will be discussed in a companion article (Vervatis et al., 2021). We
- 130 complement this quantitative assessment with a qualitative approach, in which the stochastic model is
- evaluated by exploring its ability to generate consistent multivariate incremental model corrections. We illustrate this by means of multivariate representers and "stochastic" EnKF incremental analyses for a few
- 132 illustrate this by means of multivariate represen133 members.
 - 134 The scientific objectives of this paper focus on the generation of ensembles in high-resolution coastal and

regional models. The study aims at guiding future ensemble-based modelling strategies, in support of data assimilation and probabilistic forecasting approaches. On the basis of prior knowledge in the literature for stochastic approaches and on what is feasible in terms of computational resources, we investigate physical-biogeochemical model uncertainties and what the impacts of the choice of different sets of

139 perturbations and observational networks are on the analysed ocean state. In Section 2, we begin by

- describing the coupled physical-biogeochemical model and the methods to evaluate the stochastic model
- with respect to satellite observations. The ensembles and the model-data consistency assessment are
 discussed in the results section (Section 3). A discussion and concluding remarks are presented in Section
- 143 4.

144 2 Methods and data

145 2.1 The coupled physical-biogeochemical deterministic ocean model

We use the release 3.6 of the NEMO ocean model in a regional configuration encompassing the Bay of Biscay and the western part of the English Channel (Fig. 1). The configuration, named BISCAY36, is a subgrid of the operational Copernicus Marine Environment Monitoring Service (CMEMS) Iberia-Biscay-

149 Ireland (IBI) configuration (*Sotillo et al.*, 2015) previously applied and validated (*Quattrocchi et al.*,

150 2014; *Vervatis et al.*, 2016). The horizontal resolution is 1/36° (about 3 km and 2 km in the meridional 151 and zonal directions respectively). For a complete description of the original BISCAY36 configuration,

and zonal directions respectively). For a complete description of the original and for validation details, the reader is referred to *Maraldi et al.* (2013).

153 In our BISCAY36 implementation, the NEMO ocean engine OPA (Océan Parallélisé) is coupled on-line

154 with the passive tracer package TOP2 and the biogeochemical model PISCESv2. The model solves for

155 24 prognostic variables simulating the biogeochemical cycles of oxygen, carbon and the main nutrients 156 controlling phytoplankton growth: nitrate, ammonium, phosphate, silicic acid and iron. The model

distinguishes four plankton functional types based on size, including two phytoplankton compartments

- 158 (nanophytoplankton and diatoms) and two zooplankton classes (microzooplankton and
- 159 mesozooplankton. The distinction of the two phytoplankton size classes, along with the description of
- 160 multiple nutrient co-limitations, allows the model to represent ocean productivity across different
- 161 biogeographic ocean provinces (Longhurst, 1998).

162 The biogeochemical model tracks phytoplankton biomass in units of carbon, iron, silicon (the latter only

163 for diatoms) and chlorophyll. The ratios between carbon and the latter three variables can change, which

allows for a more accurate conversion from phytoplankton to chlorophyll concentrations, which is of great importance for comparisons with ocean colour satellite data. The ratio between carbon, nitrogen and

phosphorus is kept constant at the Redfield values of 122:16:1 following *Takahashi et al.* (1985).

167 PISCESv2 also distinguishes three non-living pools for organic carbon: small Particulate Organic Matter

- (sPOM), big Particulate Organic Matter (bPOM; different settling velocities from sPOM) and semi-labile
- 169 Dissolved Organic Carbon (DOC).
- 170 The physical and biogeochemical models are coupled on-line, using a high coupling frequency for the
- conservation of tracers of once every two time-steps, i.e. 150 s for physics and 300 s for biogeochemistry.
 The coupling is one-way, so that the ocean forcing is applied to the biogeochemical model but there is no
- 172 feedback. The primitive equations and the tracer transport model are discretized on the same 1/36°
- 175 curvilinear Arakawa C-grid. The TOP2 package controls the advection-diffusion equations of the passive

and biogeochemical tracers. The numerical scheme for the biogeochemical processes is forward in time

176 (Euler) and differs from the classical leap-frog scheme used for the physics. The advection scheme is the

same as for the physics, i.e. QUICKEST (*Leonard*, 1979), but using the limiter of *Zalesak* (1979). These

178 options have been tested by *Gutknecht et al.* (2016) and are now used in the IBI-MFC operational system

179 (<u>http://marine.copernicus.eu/</u>).

180 The meteorological fields are provided by the ECMWF (European Center for Medium-Range Weather 181 Forecasts). The initial state and open boundary conditions are acquired from the daily archives of the 182 CMEMS infrastructure for physics, and the weekly archives for biogeochemistry. Details of the physical 183 model set-up are described in *Vervatis et al.* (2016). The open boundaries of the biogeochemical model 184 are forced by the global system BIOMER4V1R1 (resolution: 1/2°; <u>http://www.mercator-ocean.fr/</u>), which

185 provides (via the CMEMS archives) a 3D global weekly mean analysis for dissolved iron, nitrate,

phosphate, silicate, oxygen, chlorophyll and phytoplankton concentrations expressed as their carbon
 contents.

188 **2.2 The stochastic model**

189 The main issues to be faced when building a stochastic model is first to identify and select the relevant

quantities to perturb (depending on the dynamics and on the objectives of the stochastic model) and secondly to generate the perturbations. This is what we propose to investigate in this study, the general

192 context being an operational system assimilating satellite data in coastal and regional domains.

- 193 The ensembles of simulations are generated by perturbing some quantities that are considered as major 194 sources of errors for the model. These quantities consist of forcing fields at the boundaries, parameters 195 and state variables; these are referred to as "parameterized tendencies" (see Buizza et al., 1999), in the 196 sense that the time evolution of the model state variables can be written as follows: $\partial_t M(x, u, p, t) =$ 197 $D(\mathbf{x},t) + P(\mathbf{x},\mathbf{u},\mathbf{p},t)$, where $\partial_t M(\mathbf{x},\mathbf{u},\mathbf{p},t)$ is the time derivative of the model $M(\mathbf{x},\mathbf{u},\mathbf{p},t)$, as a 198 function of the model state vector \boldsymbol{x} (e.g. temperature, salinity or currents), the forcing \boldsymbol{u} and the vector 199 of the model parameters p. D(x, t) is the dynamics tendency of the ocean state for well-resolved, non-200 parameterized processes, equal to the advection term $-\nabla \cdot (\mathbf{x}\mathbf{U})$, where \mathbf{U} the vector of the Eulerian 201 velocity, and P(x, u, p, t) is the tendency of parameterized processes. The latter is perturbed based on
- assumptions on the amplitude and space-time structure of atmospheric forcing uncertainties, model errors
- 203 in physical parameterizations and sources-minus-sinks (SMS) biogeochemical model errors (state

- variables are not explicitly perturbed in our experiments); the scientific basis of these assumptions is discussed in the next sections.
- In this study, the perturbations, hereafter noted ξ , are computed using the stochastic perturbed parameterized tendencies (SPPT; *Buizza et al.*, 1999) and the stochastic perturbed parameters (SPP; *Ollinaho et al.*, 2017) schemes. Assuming that the past value of the uncertainties affects the present one, the ξ are modelled as first-order auto-regressive processes. In practice, at every time-step, Gaussian AR(1) processes are generated following the expression defining:

211
$$\xi_{k+1} = e^{-\frac{1}{\tau}} \cdot \xi_k + \left(\sigma \cdot \sqrt{1 - e^{-\frac{2}{\tau}}}\right) \cdot w + \mu \cdot \left(1 - e^{-\frac{1}{\tau}}\right)$$
(1)

where k is the model time-step, w is white Gaussian noise, μ , σ and τ the mean, standard deviation (uncertainty amplitude) and correlation timescale, respectively. Here, we assume the errors are unbiased, so μ is set to zero. The perturbation fields are different for each perturbed tendency or parameter, and vary under the assumption of spatial and temporal correlated scales. Also, the fields are bounded $\xi \in$ [-1 1] to retain the sign of the tendency (*Palmer et al.*, 2009).

- 217 Brankart et al. (2015) generated independent Gaussian autoregressive processes at every model grid point 218 and introduced spatial dependence in the ξ 2D or 3D fields, by applying a Laplacian filtering operator $\mathcal{F}[]$ to the white noise w in Eq. (1) as $\hat{\xi} \propto \mathcal{F}[w]$. The Laplacian filter implemented in NEMO is equivalent 219 to the five-point smoothing operator described by Shapiro (1970). This is a low-pass, first-order Shapiro 220 221 filter used to remove small scale grid noise. When applied to white noise on a coarse-resolution domain 222 (typically of a few tens of kilometres), a few Laplacian passes are sufficient to introduce correlation at 223 scales of a few hundreds of kilometres. In this context, the Laplacian-Shapiro filter acts to "blur" the 224 white noise at every model grid point and is computationally efficient (Brankart et al., 2015; Garnier et 225 al., 2016). By contrast, in high-resolution configurations of a few kilometres (e.g. BISCAY36), the 226 Laplacian-Shapiro filter is not an optimal approach to attenuate noise and produce long-range correlations 227 (cf. Appendix A; Fig. A1); therefore, another approach is required.
- Here, long-range spatial correlations (on the order of 10 to 100 km) are explicitly calculated by applying a 2D Gaussian function to estimate iso-correlation contours with a pdf given by the mathematical expression:

231
$$p(\boldsymbol{X}|\boldsymbol{\overline{X}},\boldsymbol{\Sigma}) \propto exp(-\frac{1}{2}(\boldsymbol{X}-\boldsymbol{\overline{X}})^T\boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1}(\boldsymbol{X}-\boldsymbol{\overline{X}}))$$
 (2)

where X = (x, y) represents the whole model domain, $\overline{X} = (\overline{x}, \overline{y})$ is the central grid point of the 232 233 distribution (the mode) and $\Sigma = diag[\sigma_x^2, \sigma_y^2]$ is the bivariate diagonal covariance kernel controlling the length scales of the perturbation. The spatial covariance kernel has anisotropic (important in coastal 234 domains) e-folding length scale variances in the meridional σ_x^2 and zonal σ_y^2 directions, varying randomly 235 236 around a typical correlation length per variable and across the ensemble members. In order to generate a 237 multimodal pattern (with two or more local maxima; $m \ge 2$), we recursively implement the Gaussian function at m random central grid points $\overline{X}^{(i)}$ in the model domain, resulting in a finite sum of Gaussian distributions $p(X|\overline{X}^{(m)}, \Sigma^{(m)}) \propto p(X|\overline{X}^{(m)}, \Sigma^{(m)}) + \sum_{i=1}^{m-1} p(X|\overline{X}^{(i)}, \Sigma^{(i)})$. The recursive 238 239 240 implementation of the function further increases the perturbation's anisotropy. The number of recursive 241 iterations i = 1, ..., m (and therefore the number of modes) depends on the correlation length within a 242 given model domain. For instance, a correlation length half the size of the model domain yields approximately a bimodal distribution. The Gaussian function in Eq. (2), is used as a squared exponential 243 (apodization) covariance function, so instead of the normalization factor $1/2\pi |\Sigma|^{1/2}$ we used the 244 245 perturbation uncertainty amplitude defined by σ in Eq. (1). Stochastic perturbations are generated by substituting the Laplacian convolutions in the white noise w in Eq. (1), with a multimodal Gaussian 246 pattern spanning the whole model domain i.e. $\mathcal{F}[w] \to p(X|\overline{X}^{(m)}, \Sigma^{(m)})$. AR(1) processes estimated by 247 248 Eq. (1), are performed at every model grid point shifting and altering the Gaussian modes in space and 249 time. The implementation is compatible with the NEMO MPI double parallelization environment in the

spatial domain and across an ensemble (*Bessières et al.*, 2017). The algorithm is available from the open source software platform Zenodo with <u>doi:10.5281/zenodo.2556530</u>.

252 **2.2.1** Atmospheric forcing uncertainties

The atmospheric forcing in coastal and regional applications constitutes a major source of ocean model uncertainty and is likely to lead to large-scale biases (*Vervatis et al.*, 2016). We investigate here uncertainties in the wind velocities $U_{air} = (u_{air}, v_{air})$, the sea level pressure (*SLP*) and the air temperature (T_{air}), i.e. $u \in \{U_{air}, SLP, T_{air}\}$. The ECMWF atmospheric fields u are multiplied by AR(1) stochastic processes ξ (Figs. 2a-f) following the SPPT scheme:

258
$$u_k \rightarrow (1 + \alpha \cdot \xi_k) \cdot u_k$$

(3)

at every time-step k, where α is an optional tapering value in the interval [0 1] (*Buizza et al.*, 1999). To calculate the AR(1) stochastic parameterization ξ using Eq. (1), we select representative values for the uncertainty amplitude σ , the average spatial correlation length $\sigma_{x,y}$ used in Eq. (2) and the correlation timescale τ for each tendency.

263 Output diagnostics from a one-year control run are analysed to estimate the distribution of *pdfs* (not shown) and tune the stochastic parameterizations for all atmospheric variables of interest. Wind velocity 264 265 U_{air} and SLP are distributed normally, whereas the distribution T_{air} is bimodal due to the seasonal cycle. 266 We assume that uncertainties are related to synoptic timescales, e.g. atmospheric phenomena such as 267 storms, and we set a temporal correlation length of a few days for all atmospheric variables. The synoptic timescales are also verified by time-lagged autocorrelation methods applied to the control run. The spatial 268 269 scales of the atmospheric fluctuations are determined over synoptic timescales. The signal-to-noise ratio 270 is assigned according to the statistical laws of the pdfs. These stochastic parameterizations for Eq. (1) are 271 in agreement with other studies in the literature (e.g. Palmer et al., 2009).

272 2.2.2 Model uncertainties in physical parameterizations

273 Fluxes of momentum, heat and mass are the key quantities linking the air and sea. The physical processes 274 related to them are parameterized in terms of bulk coefficients, which are deduced from empirical laws, 275 incorporating wind speed dependent coefficients and feedback from the sea state. In this study, we assume that model errors are in part due to limitations of these parameterizations of air-sea interaction. Stochastic 276 277 perturbations varying spatiotemporally are imposed on the models' momentum drag c_d , latent heat c_e and 278 sensible heat c_h coefficients. The AR(1) distribution and temporal scales are the same as those we 279 prescribed for the wind; the spatial scales on the other hand, are assumed to be that of the ocean state and 280 are set to a few Rossby radii of deformation. The same stochastic pattern is applied to all coefficients in 281 the CORE bulk formulae (Large and Yeager, 2004). The positiveness of the coefficients is verified by 282 tapering methods and for different stability conditions and wind speed regimes in the bulk formulae. Like 283 Eq. (3), the SPP scheme introduces spatiotemporal perturbations following a normal distribution of AR(1)284 processes (other options may include simpler perturbations of white noise uncorrelated in space and time), 285 expressed as:

$$286 \qquad p_k \to (1 + \alpha \cdot \xi_k) \cdot p_k$$

(4)

In order to represent model uncertainties for tidal mixing over the shelves, stochastic fluctuations based 287 288 on flux boundary conditions are also imposed at the bottom layer. The bottom drag parameterizations c_{h} 289 are based on model assumptions for the vertical shear, the mixing scheme and the nature of the seabed 290 (rocky, sandy or muddy), when known, which modify the bottom boundary layer. Because in many ocean 291 models the bottom drag is approximated as a permanent feature (e.g. constant minimum values in the 292 abyssal plain as in *Maraldi et al.*, 2013), large temporal scales up to one month are imposed in Eq. (1). 293 The true nature of the seabed is unknown and consequently so are the dominant scales in the bottom layer, 294 so we simply apply white noise and Laplacian filtering to introduce AR(1) spatial scales. The formulation 295 of the bottom drag follows a quadratic log law, with minimum positive values clamped at 2.5×10^{-3} in 296 the abyssal plain and maximum values observed in the shallow areas of the English Channel.

297 2.2.3 Biogeochemical sources-minus-sinks model uncertainties

298 Marine biogeochemical models encompass many sources of uncertainty stemming from unresolved 299 model processes and poorly constrained parameterizations. These uncertainties fall into two broad 300 categories: unresolved biodiversity and unresolved scales. The first category refers to the biodiversity 301 restriction of only a few tens of species resolved by the model in an effort to reduce state variables (Le 302 *Ouéré et al.*, 2005). This category also includes errors in the parameterization or missing biogeochemical 303 processes, those that control the feedback between sub-systems (ecosystem, chemistry, oxygen and 304 carbonate models; Gehlen et al., 2011). These errors emerge from having a limited number of 305 compartments, which often leads to a crude parameterization of their processes. The second category -306 errors due to unresolved scales - includes errors related to the model resolution and the species included 307 in the model (e.g. lack of diurnal migration in the model), and the method for handling them is similar to 308 that for small scale unresolved physical processes.

309 The SPUF scheme appears to be the most natural method to simulate uncertainties for both categories. 310 However, one must consider that performing random walks with a large state vector could be 311 computationally expensive. Hence, as with the other sources of error, unresolved biodiversity is here 312 explored via the SPPT AR(1) scheme (*Brankart et al.*, 2015; *Garnier et al.*, 2016), introducing 313 uncertainties in the sources-minus-sinks terms for each of the 24 biogeochemical tracers *C*, using the 314 stochastic field ξ described in Eq. (1) at every time step *k*, as

315
$$SMS_k(C) \to SMS_k(C) \cdot e^{\left(\xi_k - \frac{\sigma^2}{2}\right)}$$

(5)

316 As an example of this term, phytoplankton sources and sinks are photosynthesis, respiration, death and 317 grazing. The biogeochemical model parameters themselves are not perturbed.

318 Garnier et al. (2016) used SeaWIFS at 1/12° resolution to assess the unresolved scales of a coarser 1/4° 319 model and tune the AR(1) stochastic parameterizations. In this study, we are unable to assess the 320 unresolved scales of the high-resolution BISCAY36 model, with respect to a dense observational 321 network. Therefore, stochastic parameterizations are deduced from a one-year control run, mainly 322 focusing on the statistical properties of chlorophyll. The sources-minus-sinks perturbations are assumed 323 to have a lognormal distribution and large uncertainty amplitude σ of up to 60%. The bias correction term 324 $\sigma^2/2$ (Simon and Bertino, 2009) is part of the model tuning, implying that the ensemble mean is equal to 325 the unperturbed SMS term. The spatial scales are representative of a few Rossby radii of deformation and the correlation time-scale is set to 10 days, typical for the underlying mesoscale dynamics and associated 326 327 upwelling patterns. We perturb the state of the sources-minus-sinks terms in all three dimensions and 328 across all vertical levels with the same stochastic pattern. Sensitivity experiments showed that this 329 approach yielded uncertainty regimes with an ensemble spread increasing in time. We did test alternatives 330 by applying different stochastic patterns per level or per tracer but these degraded the impact of the 331 method.

332 2.3 Experimental design

In order to test which error sources are most significant for the biogeochemical uncertainties, and to better understand the couplings within the stochastic model, we designed three ensemble experiments: perturbing only the physics (EnsP), only the biogeochemistry (EnsB), and perturbing both simultaneously

(EnsPB). In the coupled simulation, the evolution of the biogeochemical tracers is described by theadvection-diffusion equation:

338
$$\partial_t C = \overbrace{-\nabla(u \cdot C) - K_h \nabla_h^2 C + \partial_z(K_z \partial_z C)}_{advection} + \overbrace{-borizontal}_{diffusion} \underbrace{EnsP}_{vertical} \underbrace{EnsB}_{biology}$$
(6)

where on the right hand of Eq. (6) the first term represents the advective transport of tracers along isopycnals, and the second and third terms the 3D parameterized diffusion processes. The last term denotes all biological processes affecting the concentration of tracers C, due to the sources-minus-sinks terms SMS(C). The three experiments defined above are indicated schematically in Eq. (6).

343 In Table 1, we summarize our settings for the stochastic parameterizations in the sensitivity experiments

- 344 perturbing individual sources of model uncertainty and the seasonal-range ensembles EnsP, EnsB, EnsPB.
- 345 We also include a reference ensemble (Ens0) and a control run (CR). A detailed presentation of the Ens0

346 ensemble is given by Vervatis et al. (2016), but it suffices to say here that it differs fundamentally from

- 347 the EnsP, EnsB, EnsPB ensembles in that it was generated by performing stochastic modelling of the
- 348 wind forcing based on empirical orthogonal functions (EOF); there is no other variable perturbed in Ens0.

349 A major challenge in ensemble forecasting is to identify the most important sources of model error and 350 properly configure the stochastic parameterizations. In order to tackle this, we adopted the following two-351 step procedure: firstly, we identified which error sources the model was most sensitive to in the Bay of 352 Biscay, by running medium-range ensembles of 20 members for one month during the spring bloom, 353 namely April, 2012 (S1-5, SP, SB, SPB experiments in Table 1). Several stochastic parameterizations, 354 deduced from the output diagnostics of a one-year control run, were tested on a case-by-case basis for 355 each sensitivity experiment. A final selection of perturbations was established, based on their impact on 356 the spread of upper-ocean variables as well as on their computational efficiency (e.g. the requirement that 357 no members blow up during the ensemble run). Based on these experiments, we decided not to perturb 358 variables and parameters that the model in this configuration is insensitive to, such as, for example the 359 photosynthetically active radiation coefficient k_{PAR} for the penetrative solar radiation (sensitivity 360 experiments not shown). Results from the sensitivity experiments are discussed in Section 3.1. For the second step, we used these perturbations to run seasonal-range ensembles of 40 members each (EnsP, 361 362 EnsB, EnsPB experiments in Table 1). The stochastic model skill of the seasonal-range ensembles is evaluated with respect to observations in Sections 3.2 and 3.3. 363

364 Figure 2 shows examples of AR(1) stochastic patterns drawn for several variables of the coupled system, 365 in order to introduce model errors. We generate wind uncertainties with smaller spatial scales, varying 366 around an average of $\sigma_{x,y} \sim 1^{\circ}$ (Figs. 2a-d), compared to the work presented by Vervatis et al. (2016), who used in their study broader patterns based on dominant EOF modes (cf. Appendix A; Fig. A2). Figures 367 368 2a-c depict the spatial variations of the wind stochastic pattern for member-001, over a temporal 369 correlation period of three days. In the same simulation stochastic patterns with larger spatial scales can be applied to other atmospheric variables: for example, scales of $\sigma_{x,y} \sim 2^{\circ}$ and $\sigma_{x,y} \sim 3^{\circ}$ have been adopted 370 371 for the air temperature and sea level pressure respectively (Figs. 2e-f). Figure 2h illustrates the effect of 372 the Laplacian filtering after 100 iterations in BISCAY36. It shows noisy spatial patterns, not representative of most oceanic processes. 373

374 In the same vein as Vervatis et al. (2016), a free run (i.e. the CR in Table 1) is carried out with no stochastic 375 parameterizations. Starting from the PSY2V4R2 analysis (1/12° resolution; Lellouche et al., 2013; 376 http://www.mercator-ocean.fr/) the free run is used to generate a five-month spin-up, from July to 377 November 2011, to allow the ocean model to develop coherent structures and represent the main physical 378 processes in the Bay of Biscay. The same period is used for the spin-up of the on-line coupled 379 biogeochemical model. The post spin-up solution is used as the initial conditions for all other experiments. 380 The free run is then extended from December 2011 to June 2012 and serves as a reference for the above-381 mentioned ensemble experiments; hence, we refer to it as the one-year control run. In Fig. 3, we present 382 the ocean state of the control run on April 30, 2012, for a number of surface variables: sea surface height 383 (SSH), sea surface temperature (SST), sea surface salinity (SSS), total chlorophyll, and 384 nanophytoplankton and diatom concentrations. In supplementary material, we verify the model's skill to 385 simulate subsurface nutrient conditions compared to world ocean atlas climatology (Garcia et al., 2018).

386 The seasonal-range ensembles were run from December 2011 to June 2012. The computational resources 387 for the ensemble experiments are presented in Appendix B. All sensitivity (S1-5, SP, SB, SPB) and 388 seasonal-range (EnsP, EnsBB, EnsPB) ensembles were initialized by using the ocean and the 389 biogeochemical states of the control run, with the exact same initial conditions. No data was assimilated 390 and the perturbation mechanism remains at work throughout the whole simulation period. A total number 391 of 40 ensemble restarts was archived, where pseudo-random seed numbers (with different random 392 sequences) were saved for all stochastic parameterizations. These ensemble restarts were used to ensure 393 the reproducibility of the stochastic patterns upon initialization of the ensembles. This capability allowed 394 us to investigate the growth rate of model uncertainties, with the same forecast lead time, under different 395 atmospheric and ocean states.

396 2.4 Datasets

We focus on upper-ocean properties for sea level anomaly (SLA), SST and surface total chlorophyll. The observational networks were accessed via the CMEMS infrastructure (<u>http://marine.copernicus.eu/</u>) and are summarized in Table 2. The observational errors include both measurement and representativity errors, and are usually unknown. Here, the observational errors were taken from those reported at CMEMS and averaged to create a single representative value for each product (Table 2).

High-resolution SST observations are necessary when it comes to validating ensembles at eddy-resolving scales, such as in BISCAY36 at 1/36° resolution. We use the OSTIA SST L4 gap-free gridded dataset which is a near-real-time daily-mean product of foundation SST free of diurnal variability. The data set is provided with an estimate of their uncertainty which is 0.5°C on average. The model proxy for the foundation SST has been chosen to be the temperature interpolated at 10 metres depth.

- For the sea-level, we use the CMEMS L3 along-track product based on several altimetry missions and which provides SLA at a resolution of 14 km with uncertainties of 0.05 m. Both data and model include tides and both observed and simulated SLA are detided. The model includes pressure forcing, and therefore an inverted barometer correction is applied to the model and observations (a dynamic atmospheric correction is applied to the sea-level observations). In order to calculate the SLA model equivalent, we use the mean dynamic topography of the parent model IBI36 (Benkiran, pers. comm.).
- 413 Of central importance to this work is the consistency analysis of biogeochemical ensembles, where 414 physics and biogeochemistry are both perturbed, against ocean colour products. The ocean colour method
- 415 exploits different radiation wavelengths and reflectances emitted from the sea surface, affected by
- 416 phytoplankton and corresponding to different water types. In this study, we use surface total chlorophyll
- produced for the Global Ocean in the framework of the ESA ocean colour climate change initiative (OC CCI), made available through CMEMS. This is a merged data records product collected from multiple
- 419 sensors and ocean satellite passages provided in gridded format at 4 km resolution. The ocean colour L4
- 420 product is reconstructed from L3 reprocessed daily composites applying 8-day temporal averaging to fill
- 421 in missing data, though some gaps remain.
- 422 The satellite chlorophyll a data are provided with a scaled (%) observational error in comparison to the 423 signal and therefore, the error has spatial distribution. We decided not to use this information because it 424 would be harder to interpret pattern-consistency and because here we mostly focus on the investigation 425 of model errors. Instead, we estimated a static error at 0.3 mg/m³, which is moderately larger (smaller) in 426 the abyssal plain (shelf areas) compared with the scaled error. The ocean colour chlorophyll proxy in 427 models is often taken as an average of chlorophyll over the top 10% of the euphotic layer (Prunet et al., 428 1996). In our case, estimating a euphotic layer of approximately 50 m, we decided to tune the observation 429 operator to return a model proxy as the mean value of the first 5 m of the water column. This is in agreement also with calculations based on $1/k_{PAR}$. 430

431 **2.5 Consistency analysis framework**

432 2.5.1 Ensemble-based innovation metrics

In Section 3.2, we evaluate the stochastic model, by quantifying the ability of the ensembles at representing the model's errors with respect to observations. Our method assesses the statistical consistency of the following distributions: (a) ensemble-based uncertainties, and (b) empirically-based uncertainties for upper-ocean properties. As the system is dynamically heterogeneous, the consistency is checked locally.

438 The empirically-based uncertainties are represented by an ensemble of observations for each dataset. The

439 observations are perturbed with a Gaussian random number to generate data distributions with the proper

440 error standard deviation for each network. All observational errors are considered independent (no cross-

441 correlations) for each dataset so that their error covariance matrix is diagonal (a useful, but not entirely

true assumption). For the consistency analysis of EnsP perturbing only the physics, we used the SST and

443 SLA observational networks. The chlorophyll a product is used for the consistency check of EnsB and 444 EnsPB biogeochemical model uncertainties. The statistical consistency between the simulated and 445 empirical ensembles is evaluated by comparing the shape of the ensemble envelopes locally and as a 446 function of time. For each dataset, we also compute the innovation vector, that is the model-data misfits, and compare the second-order moments: the innovation variance across the ensemble is the result of 447 448 uncertainties in both the model and observations. Under the assumption that errors in the model and in 449 observations are uncorrelated, the innovation variance should be close to the sum of the model uncertainty 450 variance (estimated from the ensemble variance) and the observational error variance. The diagnosis proposed by Desroziers et al. (2005) for data assimilation is based on a similar assumption. 451

452 Denoting $y_{j,n}^o$ the measured value of observation *n* for ensemble member *j*, and $y_{j,n}^f$ the model forecast 453 equivalent for observation *n* for member *j*, the following ensemble-based consistency statistics in data 454 space may be calculated:

455
$$OmE_{bias} = \overline{y_{j,n}^{o} - y_{j,n}^{f}}^{j,n}$$
 (7)
456 $OmE = \sqrt{\left(\overline{y_{j,n}^{o} - y_{j,n}^{f}}\right)^{2}}^{j,n}$ (8)

457
$$DOmE = \sqrt{\left(\overline{y_{j,n}^{o} - y_{j,n}^{f}}\right)^{2} - \left(\overline{y_{j,n}^{o} - y_{j,n}^{f}}\right)^{2}}$$
(9)

458 where the *j*-overbar averages are taken over the ensemble members j = 1, ..., N and the *n*-overbar 459 averages are taken over all observations n = 1, ..., p of a given type within a given region, and the combined j, n –overbar denotes a double average taken first over the ensemble and second over all 460 observations of a given type within a given region. OmE stands for Observation minus Ensemble metric 461 (it is an ensemble-wide extension of the so-called Norm of the innovation vector used in data 462 463 assimilation). DOME stands for Debiased OME metric defining the mean spread of innovation, which should be larger than the ensemble spread, and can be used even if the OmE_{bias} is not small. For an 464 unbiased system, i.e. no biases between observations $y_{j,n}^o$ and model $y_{j,n}^f$, $\forall n$, we get $OmE_{bias} = 0$ and 465 DOmE = OmE. In Appendix C, we provide a detailed description of the notation for the ensemble-based 466 467 innovation metrics.

468 In addition, we calculate the ensemble spread and the quantiles in data space to assess the ensemble 469 median Q2(50%), the mid-spread Q1(25%)-Q3(75%) and the ensemble outermost quantiles Q0(1%)-470 Q4(99%).

471 Let us also define the support of a probability density function (pdf) as the smallest closed set outside of

which the *pdf* vanishes. For a *pdf* defined in \mathbb{R} , the *pdf* envelope is defined as the range between the minimum and maximum values of the support.

In order to illustrate the dependency of assessment results on geographic region, we focus on two distinct areas in the Bay of Biscay, namely the abyssal plain and the Armorican shelf. Both areas exhibit strong spatiotemporal variability, governed by diverse physical-biogeochemical open-ocean and coastal shelf processes, respectively.

478 2.5.2 Multivariate incremental analysis

The stochastic model skill is qualitatively evaluated by means of multivariate representers (defined below) and EnKF-type incremental analyses (*Evensen*, 2003). The incremental analysis corresponds to

the correction step in the sequential data assimilation scheme; in other words, at a given date, we compute

- the correction to the controls using an estimate of the model and data errors and assuming a given value
- for the innovations, but then we do not restart the model from the corrected state. This is what makes it
- 484 different from a data assimilation experiment. A by-product will be to illustrate the potential impact of

485 our ensemble-modelled uncertainties on data assimilation at analysis time. In all cases, we investigate the 486 impact of observations on unobserved variables, such as other data types or subsurface variables. The 487 novelty in this exercise is to showcase how stochastic modelling of different components in the coupled physical-biogeochemical system contributes to incremental analyses. We emphasize the fact that 488 489 biogeochemical model errors in Eq. (6) have been generated in simulation experiments of increasing 490 complexity, perturbing separately the physics and biogeochemistry. The calculations are conducted with 491 SDAP (Sequoia Data Assimilation Platform, https://sourceforge.net/projects/sequoia-dap/), whose 492 functions were expanded to interface with the NEMO platform and its biogeochemical component 493 PISCESv2.

- 494 Let us define H to be the observational operator and P^{f} the error covariance matrix of the prior controls.
- In this study, the controls are the following state variables: *SSH*, *T*, *S*, *Chl*. In an ensemble-based context,
- the prior error covariance matrix is approximated by N samples (i.e. members) in a decomposed form as $Pf = Sf Sf^T$ where

49/
$$P^{7} = 5^{7} 5^{7}$$
, where

498
$$S^{f} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{N-1}} \prod_{j=1}^{N} (x_{j}^{f} - \overline{x^{f}})$$
 (10)

499 is the square root matrix of the error-subspace, with ensemble mean

500
$$\overline{\boldsymbol{x}^f} = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{j=1}^N \boldsymbol{x}_j^f,$$

501 x^f being the control vector.

The representers are the influence functions of single observations: the correction added to the forecast during the analysis step can be written as a linear combination of representers weighted by the innovation (*Bennett et al.*, 1996). The matrix of representers is $HP^{f}H^{T}$. In Section 3.3, we analyze zero-lag representers, i.e. where observations and controls are at the same time (operator H has no time component).

(11)

507 The corrections are computed from the Kalman gain matrix

508
$$\boldsymbol{K} = (\boldsymbol{\varrho} \circ \boldsymbol{P}^{f}) \boldsymbol{H}^{T} [\boldsymbol{H} (\boldsymbol{\varrho} \circ \boldsymbol{P}^{f}) \boldsymbol{H}^{T} + \boldsymbol{R}]^{-1}$$
(12)

multiplied by the member-dependent innovation vector $d = y^o - H(x^f)$, where y^o denotes the (member-509 independent) observation vector. The symbol ° denotes the Schur (element-wise) product of two matrices 510 and ρ is the localization function (Gaspari and Cohn, 1999). Here, unlike the analysis step of a 511 "stochastic" EnKF (and from the previous Section 2.5.1), we chose not to perturb the observations (i.e. 512 513 as in a "deterministic" EnKF, cf. Sakov and Oke, 2008; Yu et al., 2018). There is a trade-off - using 514 unperturbed observations does lead to the loss of statistical consistency for the second-order moments 515 and forbids calculating innovation-based diagnostics, but properly calculated EnKF increments for 516 individual members would be harder to interpret physically because of the observation noise. Convolution with a localization function in Eq. (12) constrains spurious long-distance correlations resulting from the 517 518 small ensemble size. We used a localization Gaussian function with cut-off radius 3° and e-folding scale 0.2°. Vertical localization is not applied to make results as "raw" and easy to interpret as possible. 519

In Section 3.3, we compute and analyse the multivariate EnKF-type incremental analyses $\mathbf{K} \cdot \mathbf{d}$ for the first two members (001/002) of the three long-range ensembles (EnsP, EnsB and EnsPB), as well as for different subsets and seasons, using multiple observations together. Thinning techniques are applied to high density SST and ocean colour L4 observational networks (*Zuo et al.*, 2019), in order to reduce the computational time and optimize data assimilation performance.

We define specific criteria to assess the skill of the multivariate representers and the incremental analyses, in the context of different perturbation methods (i.e. Ens0 and EnsP, EnsB, EnsPB). First, we examine whether the increment correction is large constraining the model ensemble. A subsequent criterion is whether the increment (regardless of its magnitude) has a physical-biogeochemical meaning attributed to specific dynamical processes in the area, showing also potential to constrain the ensemble. Additional criteria are used to investigate the consistency of the increments (a) when calculated from a smaller

531 number of members (testing whether we have convergence of covariances), (b) for different periods (e.g.

flow dependent errors relevant to different seasons), (c) when assimilating different datasets (e.g. SST and chlorophyll *a*) and (d) their impact on unobserved variables (e.g. SSS).

5343Results

535 **3.1** Ensemble sensitivity experiments

To assess error patterns prior to the seasonal-range ensemble simulations, we ran a series of mediumrange ensemble simulations. These small ensembles are useful for tuning the stochastic parameterizations and to verify that their spreads are moderate compared to the seasonal-range ensembles with longer spinup period.

540 In Fig. 4, we present maps for April 30, 2012, of model uncertainties for all medium-range ensembles, 541 S1-5, SP, SB and SPB, after a one-month spin-up. If we compare the effect on SST of wind perturbations alone (Fig. 4a) to all perturbations together (Fig. 4f) we see little difference; likewise, for the SSH (Figs. 542 4g, 1). This implies that error regimes for SST and SSH are mainly driven by the wind forcing. Wind 543 544 uncertainties have a large impact on upper-ocean uncertainties for both the geostrophic and the Ekman 545 components, defined by Sverdrup dynamics. Imposing the same perturbation field for both u and v wind 546 velocities, i.e. not changing the wind azimuth, results in similar uncertainties for the vorticity and Ekman 547 pumping, further enhancing model errors.

548 The rest of the perturbed variables locally augment the ensemble spread in filament-like patterns in the 549 periphery of eddies, near river plumes and over the shelf slope due to energy trapping (cf. Fig. 4 with 550 respect to Fig. 3). After the wind, air temperature uncertainties have the next greatest impact on SST (Fig. 551 4b) and chlorophyll (Fig. 5b). Uncertainties in the wind drag coefficient have moderate impact on the 552 wind stress and consequently on the spread of surface variables. Compared to the spread associated with 553 uncertainties in the wind forcing they are approximately an order of magnitude smaller (Figs. 4d, j). This 554 is because the expression for the wind drag coefficient c_d has a correction dependency based on the 555 different wind speed regimes (i.e. discrete c_d values that the perturbation may be ineffective to change 556 the class of these values). The ocean response to SLP forcing has two components: the first-order Inverse 557 Barometer (IB), which is isostatic and dominant at large scales, and the second-order non-IB, which 558 depends mostly on the geographic region. The IB response to SLP perturbations has spatial scales that 559 are equal to or larger than the external Rossby radius and the IB pumping on the abyssal plain (Tai, 1993). Subtracting the IB response from the SSH leaves us with the non-IB, which in our case has a limited 560 561 impact on SST and SSH (Figs. 4c, i). Uncertainties in the bottom drag coefficient amplify error regimes, 562 mostly for SST and less for SSH, along the shelf break and on the shelves, and especially on the macrotidal 563 area of the English Channel dynamically controlled by strong tidal currents and fronts (Figs. 4e, k).

Biogeochemical uncertainties arise from the ecosystem model's intrinsic errors and from errors in the 564 565 physical state variables (Fig. 5). All sensitivity experiments perturbing the physics leave an imprint on 566 chlorophyll uncertainties, which are sometimes significant compared to the values of the control run and 567 to other model variables, like for instance the SSH and SST. When perturbing only the biogeochemical model, we implement an identical stochastic pattern across all variables and vertical levels in order to 568 569 increase the impact of the method. Since the physics are not perturbed, the biogeochemical uncertainties 570 are passively advected via the ocean circulation. In all cases, physical model errors are found to have a 571 larger impact on chlorophyll spread than those of the biogeochemical perturbations. It is straightforward to see why: if the ocean physics are identical for all members (as is the case for the SB ensemble) it 572 behaves as a strong dynamical attractor for the system; vertical nutrient fluxes are of course sensitive to 573 574 the velocity field and in particular its divergence, the latter scaling over the continental shelf break 575 (Karagiorgos et al., 2020), a process which might dominate other sources of uncertainty, such as those of the SMS of the biogeochemical model. In general, the spread is largest in SPB where both physics and 576 577 biogeochemical perturbations are applied simultaneously. Biogeochemical uncertainties resulting from 578 errors in the coupled system depend on the geographic location as well. An example is the chlorophyll 579 uncertainties in the English Channel compared to the mesoscale field in the abyssal plain.

580 There is a stark geographic difference in spread between nanophytoplankton chlorophyll and diatom 581 chlorophyll (Figs. 5i-n). This is expected from the different model parameters of the phytoplankton

- 582 classes and the additional requirements in nutrient supply of Si for the primary production of diatoms.
- 583 Larger uncertainties are observed for the nanophytoplankton, especially in the open-ocean, whilst diatoms
- have larger uncertainties over the shelves and in the English Channel, where errors are dynamically
- 585 controlled by tides. It is evident that the uncertainty regimes for each class follow the different size class
- chlorophyll abundance patterns in the region (cf. Fig. 5 with respect to Fig. 3), especially during the spring
- 587 bloom.

Interestingly, even though model uncertainties are in general larger when both physical and 588 589 biogeochemical models are perturbed, a small decrease in chlorophyll spread may be observed over the 590 abyssal plain in the presence of coherent eddies. This effect is attributed to two facts: (i) the ensembles 591 are not constrained by data assimilation and therefore model errors with long forecast lead time from 592 different periods, may partially overlap or even cancel each other with "flow-dependent" errors (also 593 called "errors of the day"); (ii) sub-mesoscale physical and biogeochemical processes with length scales 594 smaller than 10 km can be resolved in the abyssal plain (Levy et al., 2012a; 2012b; Charria et al., 2017), 595 therefore not contributing to the mesoscale error patterns being different in EnsB and EnsPB. This does 596 not change the fact that the dominant spatial scales in the abyssal plain are characteristic of the underlying 597 quasigeostrophic mesoscale features, due to the mesoscale vertical velocity field.

598 **3.2** Quantitative evaluation of stochastic model skill

599 3.2.1 SST L4 gap-free gridded observations

Figure 6 shows examples of consistency metrics, as defined in Section 2.5.1, based on daily innovation samples. An ensemble of OSTIA SST is compared with EnsP (Figs. 6a, c). The EnsPB ensemble is statistically identical, since there is no feedback from the biogeochemical model into the circulation model. The calculations are carried out through the whole period of the seasonal-range ensemble. For the SP ensemble in Figs. 6b, d, calculations are performed for April 2012.

- 605 The model and data ensembles in both regions are consistent with each other since the supports of the 606 pdfs overlap (Figs. 6a, c). Assimilating these observations, with these error estimates, with an ensemble 607 or Bayesian filter would probably be well-posed, at least in data space (additional criteria to the pdf 608 supports may need to be verified). In both regions, the model error estimate is lower than the innovation spread DOmE, and the ensemble mean innovation vector OmE_{bias} is mostly contained within the 609 610 observational error interval ±0.5 °C (Figs. 6b, d), showing that the ensemble is consistent. The spread 611 indicator slowly evolves in time, mainly increasing, consistently with the fact that the perturbation mechanism remains active throughout the period. However, there are occasions where the EnsP spread is 612 reduced and the ensemble envelope is under-dispersive and sometimes biased with respect to the 613 614 observational pdf. This occurs over a short period during the spring shoaling of the thermocline and 615 mainly over the Armorican continental margin. This model overconfidence could be associated with 616 missing re-stratification processes in our stochastic protocol, such as the vertical subgrid scale physics 617 like the vertical eddy viscosity and diffusivity coefficients calculated in the turbulent closure scheme, 618 which are not perturbed.
- 619 An interesting feature when comparing the seasonal-range EnsP and medium-range SP ensembles, is that 620 the SST model errors over the abyssal plain increase with similar rates given a forecast lead time of a few 621 days (Fig. 6d), despite the fact that they have different numbers of members and initial conditions (i.e. 622 December 2011 for EnsP and April 2012 for SP). The stochastic restarts in these two experiments are 623 identical and therefore the stochastic fields applied in the perturbed variables and parameters are alike. 624 However, after this initial period of a few days' forecast lead time the model errors appear to increase 625 with different rates, pertaining to the different ocean-atmosphere states during December for EnsP and 626 April for SP. The latter is more apparent in the Armorican margins area (Fig. 6b).
- 627 In Figs. 6b, d, we compare the EnsP SST spread with the reference ensemble Ens0 (*Vervatis et al.*, 2016).
- 628 Both stochastic approaches in Ens0 and EnsP ensembles can be considered as variants of the perturbed
- 629 tendency scheme. In the case of the AR(1) processes we have the option to perturb several variables in
- EnsP, compared to the stochastic modelling of only the wind forcing in Ens0. Therefore, the former yields
- 631 a larger SST spread during winter and at the end of the run, with their differences ranging between about
- 632 0.05 °C to 0.1 °C, and with larger differences observed in the open-ocean. At the end of the run, both

633 ensembles become biased with respect to the observations (more so over the shelves; cf. also Vervatis et

634 *al.*, 2016 for Ens0 and Figs. 6b, d for EnsP), since they are not constrained by data assimilation. During

- 635 spring, in the presence of a strong thermocline, the spread is reduced in both ensembles and regions
- 636 (though more over the shelf), suggesting that there are missing error processes in both stochastic protocols
- 637 (i.e. in addition to the wind for Ens0 and all variables perturbed in EnsP).

638 3.2.2 SLA L3 along-track observations

The data space consistency analysis for EnsP SSH is carried out with the sea-level L3 along-track product 639 in Table 2. Figure 7a shows the distributions corresponding to averages of all SLA along track 640 641 observations crossing the BISCAY36 domain, as well as the EnsP and Ens0 supports of pdfs in data space. 642 Both model ensembles appear to have more energy at the weekly timescale, occasionally at shorter 643 timescales, and overall at the seasonal timescale compared to the observations. The minimum levels of 644 spread in both model and data are reached in mid-February, 2012; for the rest of the simulation the SLA 645 model equivalent shows larger variability than the data. There is a notable difference in spread between 646 the EnsP and Ens0 ensembles, with the former's being greater possibly because of the SLA response to 647 SLP perturbations, as well as the different stochastic approaches in the wind perturbations. EnsP model 648 uncertainties are comparable with those of the observational error at 0.05 m, reaching a few cm in 649 magnitude.

650 We also find that in about one-third of cases the OmE_{bias} stays within the observational error interval 651 (Fig. 7b). The most consistent configuration is over the abyssal plain, where the spread is increased due 652 to mesoscale decorrelation of eddies after spin-up. In contrast, the largest statistical biases are observed in coastal regions and in the English Channel. This is also confirmed by the box-and-whisker plots that 653 654 are plotted for several regions (Figs. 7c-e). These serve as a means to visualize both the distributions and their consistency. There are many cases where the joint uncertainty associated with both sources of 655 656 information is clearly nonzero. However, several instances of strong bias are evident in two of the regions, sometimes to the point that the supports of the *pdfs* become disjoint, e.g. during the week between 06 to 657 658 12 March, 2012 (Figs. 7c-e). If those *pdfs* are used in an Ensemble filter, disjoint supports will lead to ill-659 posed assimilation problems, meaning that a solution will be obtained since all analysis schemes are 660 convex, but the result will be meaningless.

661 When inconsistencies occur, it is generally because other error processes are active in the model in 662 addition to the ones generated by the range of EnsP perturbations. This is more apparent in Ens0, since in this particular ensemble there are no perturbations in SLP. Both ensembles appear to be occasionally 663 664 under-dispersive. In the English Channel, there are missing error processes such as the residual tidal error, which is enhanced by the presence of local tidal fronts and occasional Kelvin waves propagating along 665 666 the coasts, and the non-isostatic response to atmospheric pressure (e.g. the non-IB response). The missing 667 error sources are also particularly evident in the English Channel, hinting at the presence of high-668 frequency errors currently unaccounted for, although we cannot currently identify them with the tools at 669 hand. Another possible reason for the observed statistical inconsistency is the low coverage of altimeter 670 observations. This is exacerbated by the larger errors which altimetric data are subject to in coastal areas, which leads to less available data there. Future wide-swath altimetry products (e.g. SWOT, 671 672 https://swot.jpl.nasa.gov/) are likely to provide better coverage in coastal regions and stronger constraints on models overall. 673

674 3.2.3 Ocean colour L4 gridded observations

675 Figure 8 shows results of biogeochemical ensembles and innovation statistics in the data space assuming 676 an observational error of 0.3 mg/m³. Innovation statistics are calculated in log space applying an anamorphosis function to transform chlorophyll lognormal distributions into Gaussian distributions. The 677 678 lognormal assumption for chlorophyll a has shown advantages in data assimilation systems (Song et al., 679 2012). Among the seasonal-range ensembles the EnsPB exhibits the largest chlorophyll spread, with EnsB 680 being the least dispersive, as seen in the medium-range ensembles (Fig. 5). The model ensemble in the 681 Armorican shelf shows a strong bias with respect to the ocean colour data, with disjoint pdfs supports that 682 may lead to an ill-posed assimilation problem if those error estimates were used in a data assimilation 683 system. On the other hand, in Fig. 8c, the EnsPB model-data samples appear to be marginally compatible

684 with each other over the abyssal plain (also for EnsP and EnsB, not shown). There are also periods with 685 disjoint *pdfs* supports with the most prominent in late March. During this period, observations show a 686 strong phytoplankton bloom in the open-ocean, weakly present in all ensemble members (but with the correct phase), resulting in disjoint *pdfs*. Subsequent, less intense blooms in the open-ocean just before 687 688 and after this event are also found in both model and data samples, and in those cases the *pdfs* overlap 689 partially. Just as with the previously discussed SST and SLA networks, assimilating these ocean colour 690 observations with these error estimates in the open-ocean would probably be marginally well-posed, in 691 the sense that the joint probability associated with both sources of information appears to be nonzero only 692 at times. The most consistent configuration for EnsPB after the spin-up period appears to be May-June 693 and only for the abyssal plain.

694 In Figs. 8b, d, we illustrate the innovation metrics defined in Section 2.5.1. All biogeochemical model 695 ensembles are under-dispersive during the first three months of the simulation, associated also with the 696 fact that primary production is low in winter. After this period dispersion slowly increases over time. 697 Towards the end of the run chlorophyll uncertainties in the Armorican shelf exceed 0.15 mg/m³ (Fig. 8b). 698 These model errors are small compared with the chosen observational error and with ocean colour data measured by satellite, often yielding a model-data misfit at about $\sim 1 \text{ mg/m}^3$. However, considering that 699 700 chlorophyll has a lognormal distribution with near-zero positive values, they are not small with respect 701 to the model's overall chlorophyll concentration of about 0.3 mg/m³. In the abyssal plain, the model-data 702 ensemble mean misfit expressed by the OmE_{bias} metric, is well defined within the observational error 703 interval for most of the period, except during the phytoplankton bloom observed in spring (Fig. 8d). In 704 general, the control run underestimates chlorophyll abundance compared with ocean colour data and 705 subsequently leads to under-dispersive biogeochemical model ensembles. Inconsistency is mostly attributed to the low bias. An examination of the temporal evolution of the spread resulting from different 706 707 stochastic protocols, reveals that chlorophyll uncertainty variations are mainly controlled by physical processes and their errors. Biogeochemical processes and their uncertainties have only a moderate impact 708 709 on model errors, one reason could be the unaccounted errors in nutrient initial conditions (cf. 710 supplementary material using the world ocean atlas nutrient climatology; Garcia et al., 2018), except 711 during periods of phytoplankton blooms where both components of the coupled system are important. In 712 line with this, biogeochemical model errors are higher during periods of high biological productivity, than 713 in periods of low biological productivity (e.g. comparison of EnsPB and SPB in Figs. 8b, d).

Examining the mean model spread for all ensembles against the *mean spread of the innovation DOmE*, the former is always contained within the latter (Figs. 8b, d). However, this is not sufficient to verify consistency. This is because there is a constant bias of greater amplitude than the model dispersion, especially in coastal regions.

718 3.3 Qualitative assessment of stochastic model skill through its impact on multivariate 719 incremental analysis

720 **3.3.1** Ensemble-based single observation representers

721 In Figs. 9a-f, we illustrate examples of zero-lag representers for three individual observations in different 722 locations on May 07, 2012. In order to address the qualitative criteria in Section 2.5.2, the representers 723 are calculated from 40 members of EnsP (Figs. 9a-d), also from a 20-member subset of EnsP (Fig. 9e) 724 and finally from 40 members of Ens0 (Fig. 9f), and are shown as correlations between SST and other 725 surface variables of the control vector. The correlation structures reveal differences between the abyssal 726 plain and coastal areas, as well as between variables. In the English Channel and over the south Armorican shelf, the filament-shaped structures for SST, SSS and surface chlorophyll are linked to near-shore 727 728 features, such as river discharges (e.g. Loire river plume), mid-shelf thermal fronts and tidal fronts. The 729 SSS pattern is dipolar, which could be explained by meridional plume displacement (Fig. 9b). Spring 730 bloom is suggested by the negative correlation between SST and chlorophyll over the shelf (Fig. 9d). As 731 the surface layers heat up during spring plankton depletion follows the bloom.

SST and SSH are largely decorrelated in the domain, probably because of the large-scale atmospheric
 forcings directly influencing SST in the spring, as well as low-frequency mesoscale variability (Fig. 9c).

734 Due to the mixed conditions over the inner shelf at that time of year, the SSH response is relatively large-

scale as it is associated with barotropic processes at the scale of the external Rossby radius. In the case of

smaller ensembles, i.e. 20 members (Fig. 9e) or under-dispersive ensembles, i.e. SSH in Ens0 (Fig. 9f),

correlations due to partially-converged statistics increasingly contaminate the pattern of representers.
 These patterns are however not very different from those of larger or more dispersive ensembles, at least

in their general shapes and signs, and mostly the correlations or negative correlations are amplified.

- 740 Similar results of rather broad and symmetrical structures are also found in the case of SSH single
- observation representers (not shown). Model errors associated with SST and SSH, at that time of the year
- and for those ensembles, may have a limited impact on the ensemble model skill.

743 Zero-lag representers of single-observation ocean colour data are calculated from EnsPB. The most 744 important finding is that correlations behave differently in the open-ocean and over the shelves (Figs. 9g-745 i). Chlorophyll autocorrelation structures appear broad and symmetrical (with respect to the single-746 observation location) in the open-ocean, with scales dictated by the vertical velocity field of the 747 underlying mesoscale features. This is in agreement with the biogeochemical model error regimes for the 748 medium-range ensembles depicted in Fig. 5. Over the shelves, chlorophyll correlations are more dipolar 749 in nature, when calculated for instance with respect to the SST and SSS fields, representing smaller-scale 750 local conditions. Filament-shaped structures of negative correlations between chlorophyll and SST are 751 seen again with the EnsPB stochastic protocol, indicating that model errors in primary production are 752 mainly controlled by model uncertainties in physical processes, implying once again the possibility to 753 improve ecosystem model skill performance by perturbing the physics alone.

754 **3.3.2** Incremental analysis using SST L4

755 In this section, we qualitatively assess the data assimilation impact of the stochastic model in correcting 756 the surface variables at analysis time. In Figs. 10a, b, we illustrate the SST correction of the first two 757 members 001 and 002 on May 07, 2012, using the prior error covariance matrix P^{f} (in a decomposed 758 form of the square root matrix S^{f} as in Eq.(10)) from all 40 members of EnsP and assimilating the OSTIA SST dataset. SST corrections are consistent between members, suggesting that they are meaningful and 759 760 that they could enhance model skill. The increments reveal a large-scale north-south pattern, which is 761 consistent with the dynamics of the region and the model's cold bias with respect to the observations for 762 this period over the Irish shelf and the English Channel. They also correct mesoscale processes over the abyssal plain and shelf processes near the river plumes. An interesting feature is the correction of the Bay 763 of Biscay sub-gyre located between 4°-6°W and 44°-46°N, confirmed by consistent increments in SSH, 764 765 SSS and especially in surface total chlorophyll, this last hinting at sub-gyre scale changes in the vertical 766 velocity (Figs. 10c-e). Increments of opposite signs for SST and chlorophyll indicate that physical processes in the Bay of Biscay, such as tidal mixing, slope currents, river plumes and open-ocean 767 768 mesoscale activity, play an important role in the biological productivity of the area. Nonzero chlorophyll 769 corrections, calculated by cross-covariances of the coupled system, offer potential for improving 770 ecosystem model skill, even if only physical data are assimilated.

771 In order to qualitatively evaluate the impact of EnsP on the 3D temperature, salinity and chlorophyll 772 model update, we examine the increment profiles for the first member 001 at two specific locations over 773 the abyssal plain and the Armorican shelf (Fig. 11). The increments are able to capture the region's 774 spatiotemporal variability over two different seasons and in areas with different characteristics, 775 suggesting that model skill performance depends on flow-dependent errors in the physics and 776 biogeochemistry. The correction profiles reflect a fairly deep mixed layer in winter and a shallower mixed 777 layer in spring, with chlorophyll changes at sub-surface layers hinting at ongoing bloom-related changes. 778 The increments are associated with the shallow thermocline depth during spring ($\sim 10-30$ m) and with the 779 depth of the euphotic layer (~40-50 m) influencing the sub-surface vertical corrections of chlorophyll. 780 Over the abyssal plain, at depths greater than 1000 m the vertical T/S corrections are possibly linked to 781 the upper-ocean low-frequency mesoscale circulation, which affects the deep vortex dynamics. This is an 782 intriguing result showing that deep model errors can be controlled by ensemble-based data assimilation 783 methods, in which model ensembles are generated by perturbing surface variables and assimilating data 784 of near-surface ocean properties.

785 **3.3.3** Incremental analysis using ocean colour L4

786 In Fig. 12, we see that most of the total chlorophyll correction on May 07, 2012, as seen from the 787 increments of the first member, arises from uncertainties in the physics (i.e. EnsP and EnsPB), though 788 biogeochemical model uncertainties in most areas in the domain are still significant. We focus on that 789 specific date, because of the good spatial data coverage (ensembles are projected in data space in Figs. 790 12d-f), in order the analysis to be meaningful. When the physics are not perturbed (i.e. EnsB) one can see 791 coherent mesoscale features in the correction (e.g. over the abyssal plain), since the physics and hence 792 the dynamics are the same for all members. At 15 m depth, a signature of the ocean bottom relief can be 793 seen in the correction fields, perpendicularly to the seabed features (resulting in a parallel crest signal) 794 over the Celtic shelf near 7°-8°W and 48°-49°N. Biogeochemical processes and consequently ecosystem 795 model performance are sensitive to bottom Ekman flow transport due to nutrient upwelling, especially in 796 shallow shelf regions, and possibly to internal tides and waves induced by barotropic tides and winds.

797 High positive increments over the shelves for all three ensembles suggest that chlorophyll abundance is 798 underestimated in those areas during subsequent spring blooms (Figs. 12a-c). This holds true over the 799 continental shelf break near 3°-4°W and 46°-47°N, an area dynamically controlled by both barotropic 800 and baroclinic tidal processes, which contribute to vertical mixing and enhance primary production. It is 801 worth noting that in some coastal areas where the coupled system appears to underestimate chlorophyll 802 abundance, a very small correction is applied instead, due to model overconfidence (i.e. under-dispersive 803 ensembles lacking model skill) with respect to observational errors. In order to qualitatively assess the 804 ensemble model skill, we may compare the chlorophyll increments contributed by different observational 805 networks. Figure 10e and Fig. 12a present different correction patterns when different observations are 806 assimilated, hinting at dissimilar processes captured by the prior error covariance matrices in combination 807 with each network, in these cases by SST or ocean colour respectively. Here the chlorophyll correction is 808 rather small when ocean colour is not assimilated, possibly because of weak cross-covariances between ocean physics and biogeochemical properties. Interestingly, we observe different signs in the increments, 809 e.g. over the Celtic shelf, as calculated from the different model ensembles of the coupled system (Figs. 810 811 12a-c), and in particular between EnsP perturbing only physics and EnsB perturbing only 812 biogeochemistry sources and sinks. In the present configuration, we conclude that the assimilation of 813 ocean colour is important, and the specific stochastic method less so, when we seek to enhance model performance in marine ecosystems. 814

815 3.3.4 Incremental analysis using both SST L4 and ocean colour L4

In this section, we qualitatively assess the multivariate impact of the stochastic model in both temperature and total chlorophyll, from two different observational networks assimilated simultaneously, namely the OSTIA SST L4 and the ocean colour L4 (cf. Table 2). The changes that the extra observation network brings to the analyses vary from moderate to locally large for all variables. In Figs. 13a-d, we depict the correction fields for May 07, 2012 of the state vector surface variables for the first member, based on ensemble covariances of EnsPB with 40 members.

822 The north-south SST correction pattern is not as distinct as that when assimilating only OSTIA SST, 823 especially in the English Channel area (Fig. 13a vs. Fig. 10a). In addition, the increments are greater, 824 especially over the Irish shelf. This last aspect is also true for other surface variables, such as the SSH 825 and SSS (Figs. 13b-c vs. Figs. 10c-d). We attribute this effect to the presence of ocean colour data in a 826 situation where error *pdfs* might be disjoint, even when the data assimilation problem is convex, which suggests weak ensemble model skill. In these situations, the analysis scheme possibly impacts 827 828 biogeochemical properties more than the ocean physics do. Similarly, chlorophyll correction values are 829 moderately decreased when both observational networks are assimilated, compared to the analysis when 830 assimilating only ocean colour (Fig. 13d vs. Fig. 12c). Compared to the correction of physical properties, 831 the chlorophyll increments seem to be less sensitive to changes when multivariate observing networks 832 are brought together. Thus, the ensemble ecosystem model skill appears to be less sensitive compared to 833 the ocean model skill when ocean colour is assimilated, along with other more traditional networks like 834 SST.

835 We investigated the convergence of covariances and its impact on the incremental analysis to assess 836 model performance, incorporating different ensembles and ensemble sizes (i.e. how effective are the 837 ensembles EnsP vs. EnsPB and 10 vs. 40 members at extracting reliable covariances; Figs. 13a, d, e-h). 838 Differences in the SST analyses between EnsPB and EnsP with 40 members in a multivariate context are 839 minor (Fig. 13a vs. Fig. 13e). If we use fewer ensemble members, the analyses for both ocean physics 840 and biogeochemistry properties resemble the correction patterns of larger ensembles. However, the 841 increments are noticeably less smooth because covariances are calculated from partially converged 842 statistics (Figs. 13e-f vs. Figs. 13g-h). As a final remark, we note that when chlorophyll is assimilated in 843 conjunction with OSTIA SST, the analysis scheme moderately affects small scale processes for all 844 variables, augmenting the increment values around coherent ocean dynamical features; this is suggestive 845 of good stochastic model skill.

846 4 **Discussion and conclusions**

847 In this paper, Part 1 of a two-part series, we evaluated the skill of a NEMO-based physical-848 biogeochemical stochastic model. To build this stochastic model, existing NEMO stochastic modules 849 were complemented by integrating a 2D Gaussian function to introduce spatial correlations in the 850 stochastic perturbations. Brankart et al. (2015) generated correlations by applying a spatial filter in global 851 and regional coarse domains. Here, the correlations have variable and anisotropic spatial scales, which is 852 of particular importance in high-resolution coastal configurations. Another option would have been to use 853 a tensor form that would make those patterns coast-aware (Barth et al., 2009). We decided not to follow that route here, since this would have added significant complexity while, we felt, not being critical for 854 855 the specific BISCAY36 configuration (e.g. there are not many islands and islets) and for the variables we 856 chose to perturb (e.g. atmospheric forcing). Recursive filters and Gaussian functions have been used in 857 the literature to calculate correlation lengths, but most of them focused on large spatial scales in coarse 858 global domains and few of them have been used recently for biogeochemistry (Storto et al., 2014; Kuhn 859 et al., 2019).

Our stochastic implementation was based on the SPPT and SPP schemes, and first-order autoregressive processes (*Brankart et al.*, 2015; *Ollinaho et al.*, 2017), applied to several sources of model uncertainties in the coupled system. These uncertainties emerge mainly from atmospheric forcing uncertainties, model errors in physical parameterizations and biogeochemical model sources and sink term uncertainties. Wind uncertainties were found to dominate all other atmosphere-ocean sources of model errors. Biogeochemical model uncertainties resulting from perturbations in physics were greater than those perturbing the *SMS* concentration of the biogeochemical tracers.

867 Sensitivity studies of the stochastic model, e.g. with respect to (1) initial and boundary conditions (biases 868 in this stochastic context), (2) parameter lognormal perturbations (*Ollinaho et al.*, 2017), and (3) 869 perturbations of the unresolved scales, would be an ulterior step and are not included in this study.

870 The quantitative assessment of ensembles with respect to the gridded gap-free OSTIA SST L4, assuming an observational Gaussian error of 0.5 °C standard deviation, suggests that the seasonal-range ensembles 871 872 where only the physics were perturbed are fairly consistent with the data distribution. Analysing the 873 consistency of the ensembles with respect to the along-track SLA L3 CMEMS product (observational 874 Gaussian error of 0.05 m standard deviation), we could see the presence of strong biases between the 875 model and along-track data distributions. All ensembles were under-dispersive for sea-level, especially 876 in coastal regions. The sea-level model-data misfits were found to be associated with strong SSH spatial 877 gradients, in particular in the shelf regions such as the English Channel and Celtic Sea. High-frequency 878 error processes are currently unaccounted for in the English Channel (e.g. open boundary conditions in 879 the English Channel, which do not deal properly with high-frequency processes). Probabilistic attribution 880 approaches (see e.g. Hannart et al., 2016), in addition to the quantitative assessment presented in this 881 study, may provide more insight.

- 882 Our consistency analysis in log-space showed a statistical spin-up time for chlorophyll on the order of 3
- 883 months. During this spin-up period the biogeochemical model ensembles EnsP, EnsB and EnsPB were
- under-dispersive and biased with respect to gridded ocean colour L4 data to which a log-transformed, observational Gaussian error of 0.3 mg/m^3 standard deviation was applied. Statistical consistency was not
- always maintained for chlorophyll as it was for SST and, to a lesser extent, for SSH. It is difficult to
- attribute those error patterns to specific physical or biogeochemical processes, without a further

888 probabilistic attribution analysis. The investigation of uncertainty regimes for other state variables of

889 PISCESv2 is beyond the scope of this study, however we mention in passing that the observed error

890 patterns in upper-ocean ecosystem properties, for instance for zooplankton and nutrients, are similar to

those of chlorophyll (not shown). 891

892 The low chlorophyll bias may be a sign that the biogeochemical model's initial conditions for our 893 ensembles (after the 5-month control run spin-up) are incorrect (cf. supplementary material using the 894 world ocean atlas nutrient climatology; Garcia et al., 2018). Perturbing the physical forcing and the 895 biogeochemical SMS terms cannot properly account for uncertainties in the initial biogeochemical state. 896 These initial uncertainties could lead to unrealistic adjustments in the properties that are being perturbed.

Finally, we used the stochastic model output to generate multivariate increments, by means of representers 897 898 and EnKF-type analyses with the aim to provide a qualitative assessment step towards developing an 899 assimilation scheme. One objective was to assess the impact of observations on unobserved variables, 900 such as other data types or subsurface variables. Specific qualitative criteria were used to assess the 901 stochastic model skill at analysis time.

902 Based on these qualitative criteria, we summarize here the most important findings in the incremental 903 analysis, arranging them into three broad categories. (i) Concerning the physics alone: corrections to 904 physical properties are associated with large-scale biases between the open-ocean and the shelves; small 905 scale local corrections are mainly visible over the shelves in near-shore coastal areas, which may be 906 explained by meridional river plume migration, mid-shelf thermal fronts, barotropic tides and possibly 907 baroclinic tides. (ii) Concerning the vertical profiles: incremental analysis on the water column structure 908 reveals vertical changes linked to seasonal variability of the thermocline, such as for example the extended 909 mixed layer depth in winter and the spring shoaling of the thermocline; increments are also observed at 910 depths near the euphotic layer (~40-50 m) controlling the sub-surface vertical corrections of chlorophyll. 911 (iii) Concerning the interplay between the physics and the biogeochemical model: the scales of the 912 correction patterns in the abyssal plain are often characteristic of the underlying quasigeostrophic 913 mesoscale features associated with vortices; most of the chlorophyll correction arises from uncertainties 914 in the physics, but biogeochemical model errors tend to enhance this effect; as expected, assimilating 915 chlorophyll has a measurable impact on physical variables, e.g. when assimilating both ocean colour and

916 SST datasets, the increments are larger than when assimilating SST only.

917 Results from the two assessment approaches in Sections 3.2 and 3.3 are analysed together in an attempt 918 to evaluate the model skill in physics and biogeochemistry. The skill of the perturbation method at 919 properly estimating model errors is in general improved for physics, though data assimilation performance 920 to correct these errors depends strongly on the multivariate analysis. The biogeochemical model is not as 921 sensitive as the physical model to the multivariate analysis and its skill is mainly defined by the 922 assimilation of chlorophyll. The biogeochemical model errors appear to be complementary to those of the 923 dynamical model alone and they contribute moderately to the incremental analysis. However, both 924 increments derived from stochastic physics and biogeochemistry have marked differences in their spatial 925 patterns. In some specific areas, the stochastic perturbations in physics and biogeochemistry lead to an 926 under-dispersive spread. This is a weakness of the stochastic model which results in a limited impact of 927 data assimilation in these areas, especially on the biogeochemical variables.

928 As our ensembles were sometimes found to be under-dispersive, for future efforts additional approaches 929 should be envisaged to augment ensemble spread, in particular for biogeochemical variables; to list just 930 a few: (a) inflation techniques (Hamill et al., 2001; Anderson, 2009) in the initial conditions may open 931 some degrees of freedom in the first few time-steps of the model run, (b) perturbing the biogeochemical 932 parameters (see also Garnier et al., 2016) in addition to SMS concentrations, (c) activation of the feedback 933 of biology onto the physics in the NEMO-PISCESv2 coupled system, and (d) incorporating atmospheric 934 ensembles, such as the ECMWF Ensemble Prediction System (https://apps.ecmwf.int/archive-

935 catalogue/).

936 Uncertainties in the open boundary conditions, either in the numerical scheme or in the prescribed values 937

for active boundaries, are expected to contribute significantly to the model error budget (see also Kim et 938 al., 2011). So, it is natural to consider perturbing the open boundary conditions. This would very likely

939 lead to an increase in the ensemble spread from the surface to at least 1500 m. However, perturbing the

open boundaries is not straightforward: first because of the need to ensure physical consistency between
the perturbed variables, and second because the errors in the prescribed fields at the open boundaries are
usually unknown. A favorable solution is when an ensemble of nesting (or parent) solutions is available
and provides an estimate of open boundary uncertainties to the child model (*Ghantous et al.*, 2020).
However, in the absence of a larger-scale ensemble to force the boundaries, a boundary error would

- appear to the stochastic model as a systematic error (bias) across all members, which was beyond the
- scope of this paper, but will be important to address in the future.

947 The success of physical-biogeochemical data assimilation will also depend on different observational 948 networks brought together, e.g. remote sensing in synergy with in-situ observations, and their multivariate 949 nature (Song et al., 2016; Verdy and Mazloff, 2017; Mattern et al., 2017; Mattern et al., 2018; Kaufman 950 et al., 2018; Ford, 2019; Goodliff et al., 2019). Regarding in-situ observations, the increasing availability 951 of high-resolution profiles provided by Biogeochemical-Argo floats (http://biogeochemical-argo.org), 952 enables us to investigate the ocean interior across a wide range of spatiotemporal scales. The development 953 of the Biogeochemical-Argo network is expected to substantially improve the quality of biogeochemical 954 models, by incorporating vigorous validation, improved parameterizations (Wang et al., 2020), and novel

955 data assimilation techniques, including ensemble-based methods (Yu et al., 2018).

956 Acknowledgments. This work was carried out as part of the Copernicus Marine Environment Monitoring 957 Service (CMEMS) "Stochastic Coastal/Regional Uncertainty Modelling (SCRUM)" Service Evolution 958 project. CMEMS is implemented by Mercator Ocean International in the framework of a delegation 959 agreement with the European Union. Part of this research was also made possible through the IKY 960 Scholarships Programme and co-financed by the European Union (European Social Fund-ESF) and Greek 961 national funds through the action entitled "Reinforcement of Postdoctoral Researchers", in the framework 962 of the Operational Programme "Human Resources Development Programme, Education and Lifelong 963 Learning" of the National Strategic Reference Framework (NSRF) 2014-2020. The contribution of P. De Mey-Frémaux and N. Ayoub is supported by the Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique (CNRS). 964 965 We acknowledge the use of the ECMWF's computing and archive facilities in this research. This work 966 was also supported by computational time granted from the Greek Research & Technology Network 967 (GRNET) in the National HPC facility – ARIS – under project ID PA002007. We thank four anonymous 968 reviewers for their constructive comments.

969 Appendix A: Spatial correlation length scales

The response function of the first-order Shapiro filter (Shapiro, 1970) measures the skill of the filter to 970 971 attenuate noise and is given by the equation $R^m = cos^{2 \cdot m} (\pi \cdot dx/L)$, where dx the mesh grid resolution 972 and L the correlation length scale produced after repeated iterations m. Figure A1 shows the performance 973 of the Laplacian-Shapiro filter to attenuate noise for two different mesh grid resolutions. Figure A1a refers 974 to a coarse-resolution domain at $1/4^{\circ}$ (e.g. ORCA025, $dx \sim 25$ km) and Fig. A1b refers to a high-975 resolution domain at $1/36^{\circ}$ (e.g. BISCAY36, $dx \sim 2.5$ km). For the coarse-resolution domain the Shapiro 976 filter is able to attenuate noise efficiently (e.g. in most cases more than 50%) and produce long-range 977 correlations of a few hundreds of kilometres. For the high-resolution domain the Shapiro filter may 978 introduce length scales of a few tens of kilometres, but the noise is not attenuated for the large scales (cf. 979 also Fig. 2h).

Figure A2 shows the first and second order statistical moments of two different methods for performing stochastic modelling of the wind forcing. In this study, we introduced wind uncertainties by means of SPPT AR(1) processes and a 2D Gaussian function with length scales $\sigma_{x,y} \sim 1^{\circ}$ (Fig. A2a). In a previous study, we used EOF modes to generate wind forcing uncertainties (*Vervatis et al.*, 2016). The most important attribute of both methods is that they have similar ensemble means (and their ensemble means are also similar to the unperturbed wind; not shown), whilst there are marked differences in their ensemble spreads.



987

991

988 **Figure A1** Response function R^m (no units) and noise attenuation (%) of the Laplacian-Shapiro filter 989 for different number of iterations *m*, as a function of the correlation length scale L (km) and for different 990 model resolutions: (a) $dx \sim 25$ km, (b) $dx \sim 2.5$ km.



992Figure A2(a, b) EnsP and Ens0 wind ensemble spread, and (c, d) wind ensemble mean on May 07,9932012. Stochastic modelling in EnsP is by means of SPPT AR(1) using a 2D Gaussian function with length994scales $\sigma_{x,v} \sim 1^{\circ}$ and in Ens0 by using EOF modes (*Vervatis et al.*, 2016). Colorbar units in m/s.

995 Appendix B: Computational resources and performance

We briefly present here the most recent setup compiling and running the code at ECMWF HPCF. The model ensembles were generated on CCA and CCB clusters, which are Cray XC40 systems integrating Intel Broadwell nodes, with 36 cores per node and 128 GB (2400 MHz DDR4) memory per node. The code was compiled under the Intel Broadwell software environment using the Cray Development Toolkit (CDT) cdt/17.03, with intel/17.0.3.053 compiler, and the following libraries: cray-netcdfhdf5parallel/4.4.1.1 and cray-hdf5-parallel/1.10.0.1. The same environment was used for the compilation of XIOS version 2.0. We used -O3 optimization in the FCFLAGS of the compilation architecture file.

- 1003 The model output consists of daily files of the ocean state vector and the two classes of chlorophyll, as 1004 well as three-day averages of 14 3D-biogeochemical variables.
- 1005 We made used of NEMO's enhanced MPI strategy whose features allow for parallelization in both the
- 1006 spatial domain and across ensemble members (Bessières et al., 2017). Ensemble simulations were then
- 1007 carried out by just one call of the executable of the coupled NEMO-PISCESv2 system. BISCAY36 scales
- out using 96 processor cores of domain decomposition per ensemble member, excluding land processors.
 The configuration used the NEMO I/O and was connected to an external server (i.e. XIOS controlled by
- an XML file), thus increasing the total number of processors for the ensemble simulations, including
- 1011 those handling the I/O specifications (i.e. model variables, domains, grid, output frequencies etc.). Our
- 1012 ensemble experiments were designed to fit the scalability limits encountered in current operational
- 1013 systems. Vervatis et al. (2016) showed that with increasing ensemble size, results for BISCAY36
- 1014 converge in the range of 20 to 40 members. We used the same range of members resulting in a scalability
- 1015 problem of the order of 10^3 cores.
- 1016 Taking into account the ECMWF's hardware and software specifications, we tested the following resource 1017 geometries: (a) for 10 members, we used 960 NEMO processors and 48 XIOS servers filling a total of 28 1018 nodes, and (b) for 20 members, we used 1920 NEMO processors and 24 XIOS servers filling a total of 1019 54 nodes. The ensemble simulations were submitted as batch jobs for a 30-day run. For these examples, 1020 the ECMWF's job epilogue during production indicated a runtime average of about 489 minutes, with
- 1021 runtime standard deviation of approximately 29 minutes, including the first and last reading and writing
- 1022 time-steps.

1023 Appendix C: Notation for ensemble-based innovation metrics

1024 Let us note
$$Y_n = y_{j,n}^o - y_{j,n}^{f'}$$
 the ensemble mean of the innovation for observation *n* as:

1025
$$Y_n = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{j=1}^{N} (y_{j,n}^o - y_{j,n}^f)$$
(C1)

1026 where j = 1, ..., N the size of the ensemble and n = 1, ..., p the number of observations. With this 1027 notation, OmE_{bias} in Eq. (7) writes:

1028
$$OmE_{bias} = \frac{1}{p} \sum_{n=1}^{p} Y_n$$
(C2)

1029 as the sum over p observations of the ensemble mean of the innovation. From Eq. (8) the square of OmE1030 writes:

1031
$$OmE^2 = \frac{1}{p} \sum_{n=1}^{p} \left[\frac{1}{N} \sum_{j=1}^{N} (y_{j,n}^o - y_{j,n}^f)^2 \right]$$
 (C3)

1032 We now take the square of *DOmE* from Eq. (9) using the Y_n notation in (C1) as:

1033
$$DOmE^2 = \frac{1}{p} \sum_{n=1}^{p} \left[\frac{1}{N} \sum_{j=1}^{N} (y_{j,n}^o - y_{j,n}^f)^2 - Y_n^2 \right]$$
 (C4)

1034 This can be written:

1035
$$DOmE^2 = \frac{1}{p} \sum_{n=1}^{p} \left[\frac{1}{N} \sum_{j=1}^{N} (y_{j,n}^o - y_{j,n}^f)^2 \right] - \frac{1}{p} \sum_{n=1}^{p} Y_n^2$$
 (C5)

1036 and using Eq. (C3) we get:

1037
$$DOmE^2 = OmE^2 - \frac{1}{p} \sum_{n=1}^p Y_n^2$$
 (C6)

1038 If $OmE_{bias} = 0$ then from Eq. (C2) we get $\frac{1}{p}\sum_{n=1}^{p}Y_n = 0$. In general, this yields $\frac{1}{p}\sum_{n=1}^{p}Y_n^2 \neq 0$ and 1039 subsequently $DOmE \neq OmE$ as seen from Eq. (C6), unless we have an unbiased system, i.e. no biases 1040 between model and observations with $Y_n = 0$, $\forall n$.

1041 References

Allen, J. I., Eknes, M., and Evensen, G., 2003. An Ensemble Kalman Filter with a complex marine
 ecosystem model: hindcasting phytoplankton in the Cretan Sea. Annales Geophysicae, 21, 399-411.

- Anderson, J.L., 2009. Spatially and temporally varying adaptive covariance inflation for ensemble filters.
 Tellus A, 61: 72-83. doi:10.1111/j.1600-0870.2008.00361.x.
- Adler, R., P. Müller and B.L. Rozovskii, 1996. Stochastic Modelling in Physical Oceanography. Progress
 in Probability series, vol. 39. Birkhaüser, 466pp.
- Aumont, O., Ethé, C., Tagliabue, A., Bopp, L., and Gehlen, M., 2015. PISCES-v2: an ocean
 biogeochemical model for carbon and ecosystem studies. Geosci. Model Dev. 8, 2465-2513.
- Barth, A., Alvera-Azcárate, A., Beckers, J.-M., Weisberg, R. H., Vandenbulcke, L., Lenartz, F., and
 Rixen, M., 2009. Dynamically constrained ensemble perturbations-application to tides on the West
 Florida Shelf, Ocean Sci., 5, 259-270, https://doi.org/10.5194/os-5-259-2009.
- Bennett, A.F., Chua B.S., and Leslie, L.M., 1996. Generalized inversion of a global numerical weather
 prediction model. Meteor. Atmos. Physics, 60, 165-178.
- Bessières, L., Leroux, S., Brankart, J.M., Molines, J.M., Moine, M.P., Bouttier, P.A., Penduff, T., Terray,
 L., Barnier, B., and Sérazin, G., 2017. Development of a probabilistic ocean modelling system based
 on NEMO 3.5: Application at eddying resolution. Geosci. Model Dev., 10, 1091–1106.
- Brankart, J.-M., 2013. Impact of uncertainties in the horizontal density gradient upon low resolution global ocean modelling. Ocean Modell., 66, 64–76, http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ocemod.2013.02.004.
- Brankart, J.-M., Candille, G., Garnier, F., Calone, C., Melet, A., Bouttier, P.-A., Brasseur, P., and Verron,
 J., 2015. A generic approach to explicit simulation of uncertainty in the NEMO ocean model. Geosci.
 Model Dev. 8, 1285-1297.
- Buizza, R., Miller, M., and Palmer, T.N., 1999. Stochastic representation of model uncertainties in the
 ECMWF ensemble prediction system. Quart. J. Roy. Meteor. Soc., 125, 2887-2908,
 doi:10.1002/gi.49712556006.
- Candille, G., Brankart, J.-M., and Brasseur, P., 2015. Assessment of an ensemble system that assimilates
 Jason-1/Envisat altimeter data in a probabilistic model of the North Atlantic ocean circulation. Ocean
 Science 11, 425–438.
- Carton, X., Le Cann, B., Serpette, A., and Dubert, J., 2013. Interactions of surface and deep anticyclonic
 eddies in the Bay of Biscay, J. of Mar. Sys., 109-110, doi:10.1016/j.jmarsys. 2011.09.014.
- Charria, G., Theetten, S., Vandermeirsch, F., Yelekçi, Ö., and Audiffren, N., 2017. Interannual evolution
 of (sub)mesoscale dynamics in the Bay of Biscay, Ocean Sci., 13, 777–797, https://doi.org/10.5194/os 13-777-2017.
- Ciavatta, S., Brewin, R. J. W., Sk_akala, J., Polimene, L., de Mora, L., Artioli, Y., and Allen, J.I., 2018.
 Assimilation of oceancolor plankton functional types to improve marine ecosystem simulations.
 Journal of Geophysical Research: Oceans, 123, 834–854. https://doi.org/10.1002/2017JC013490.
- 1077 Ciavatta, S., S. Kay, S. Saux-Picart, M. Butenschön, and Allen, J.I., 2016. Decadal reanalysis of
 1078 biogeochemical indicators and fluxes in the North West European shelf-sea ecosystem, J. Geophys.
 1079 Res. Oceans, 121, 1824–1845, doi:10.1002/2015JC011496.
- Ciavatta, S., Torres, R., Martinez-Vicente, V., Smyth, T., Dall'Olmo, G., Polimene, L., and Allen, J.I.,
 2014. Assimilation of remotely-sensed optical properties to improve marine biogeochemistry
 modelling. Progress in Oceanography, 127, 74-95.
- 1083 De Mey, P., 2000. Scientific Feasibility of Data Assimilation in MERCATOR. MERCATOR report,
 1084 reference MOO-ST-431-8-MER, Sept. 2000.
- Desroziers, G., Berre, L., Chapnik, B., Poli, P., 2005. Diagnosis of observation, background and analysiserror statistics in observation space. Q. J. R. Meteorol. Soc. 131, 3385–3396.
 https://doi.org/10.1256/qj.05.108.
- Edwards, C. A., A. M. Moore, I. Hoteit, and Cornuelle, B. D., 2015. Regional Ocean Data Assimilation.
 Annual Review of Marine Science, 7:1, 21-42.

- 1090 Eknes, M., and Evensen, G., 2002. An ensemble Kalman filter with a 1-D marine ecosystem model.
 1091 Journal of Marine Systems, 36(1), 75-100.
- Evensen, G., 2003. The Ensemble Kalman Filter: theoretical formulation and practical implementation.
 Ocean Dyn. 53, 343-367.
- Ford, D., 2019. Assessing the role and consistency of satellite observation products in global physical biogeochemical ocean reanalysis. Ocean Sci. Discuss. 1–25. https://doi.org/10.5194/os-2019-118.
- Fransner, F., Counillon, F., Bethke, I., Tjiputra, J., Samuelsen, A., Nummelin, A., Olsen, A., 2020. Ocean
 Biogeochemical Predictions—Initialization and Limits of Predictability. Front. Mar. Sci. 7.
 https://doi.org/10.3389/fmars.2020.00386.
- Fujii Y, Rémy E, Zuo H, Oke P, Halliwell G, Gasparin F, Benkiran M, Loose N, Cummings J, Xie J, Xue
 Y, Masuda S, Smith GC, Balmaseda M, Germineaud C, Lea DJ, Larnicol G, Bertino L, Bonaduce A,
 Brasseur P, Donlon C, Heimbach P, Kim Y, Kourafalou V, Le Traon P-Y, Martin M, Paturi S,
 Tranchant B and Usui N, 2019. Observing System Evaluation Based on Ocean Data Assimilation and
 Prediction Systems: On-Going Challenges and a Future Vision for Designing and Supporting Ocean
 Observational Networks. Front. Mar. Sci. 6:417. doi: 10.3389/fmars.2019.00417.
- Garcia, H. E., K. Weathers, C. R. Paver, I. Smolyar, T. P. Boyer, R. A. Locarnini, M. M. Zweng, A. V.
 Mishonov, O. K. Baranova, D. Seidov, and J. R. Reagan, 2018. World Ocean Atlas 2018, Volume 4:
 Dissolved Inorganic Nutrients (phosphate, nitrate and nitrate+nitrite, silicate). A. Mishonov Technical
 Ed.; NOAA Atlas NESDIS 84, 35 pp.
- Garnier, F., Brankart, J.M., Brasseur, P., and Cosme, E., 2016. Stochastic parameterizations of
 biogeochemical uncertainties in a 1/4° NEMO/PISCES model for probabilistic comparisons with
 ocean color data. Journal of Marine Systems, 155, 59–72.
- Gaspari, G., and S. E. Cohn, 1999. Construction of correlation functions in two and three dimensions.
 Quart. J. Roy. Meteor. Soc., 125, 723–757.
- Gehlen, M., Gruber, N., Gangstø, R., Bopp, L., and Oschlies, A., 2011. Biogeochemical consequences of
 ocean acidification and feedbacks to the earth system, Ocean Acidification, 1, 230–248.
- Ghantous, M., Ayoub, N., De Mey-Frémaux, P., Vervatis, V., and Marsaleix, P., 2020. Ensemble
 downscaling of a regional ocean model. Ocean Modell., 145,
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ocemod.2019.101511.
- Gharamti, M. E., J. Tjiputra, I. Bethke, A. Samuelsen, I. Skjelvan, M. Bentsen, and L. Bertino, 2017.
 Ensemble data assimilation for ocean biogeochemical state and parameter estimation at different sites,
 Ocean Modelling, 112, 65-89, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ocemod.2017.02.006.
- Goodliff, M., Bruening, T., Schwichtenberg, F., Li, X., Lindenthal, A., Lorkowski, I., Nerger, L., 2019.
 Temperature assimilation into a coastal ocean-biogeochemical model: assessment of weakly and strongly coupled data assimilation. Ocean Dyn. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10236-019-01299-7.
- Gutknecht, E., Reffray, G., Gehlen, M., Triyulianti, I., Berlianty, D., and Gaspar, P., 2016. Evaluation of
 an operational ocean model configuration at 1/12 spatial resolution for the Indonesian seas
 (NEMO2.3/INDO12)–Part 2: Biogeochemistry, Geosci. Model Dev., 9, 1523–1543,
 doi:10.5194/gmdd-9-1523-2016.
- Hamill, T. M., J. S. Whitaker, and C. Snyder, 2001. Distance-Dependent Filtering of Background Error
 Covariance Estimates in an Ensemble Kalman Filter. Mon. Wea. Rev., 129, 2776–2790, https://doi.org/10.1175/1520-0493(2001)129<2776:DDFOBE>2.0.CO;2.
- Hannart, A., Carrassi, A., Bocquet, M., Ghil, M., Naveau, P., Pulido, M., et al., 2016. DADA: data
 assimilation for the detection and attribution of weather and climate-related events. Climatic Change,
 Springer Verlag, 136 (2), pp.155-174.
- Karagiorgos, J., V. Vervatis, and S. Sofianos, 2020. The Impact of Tides on the Bay of Biscay Dynamics.
 J. Mar. Sci. Eng., 8, 617.

- Kaufman, D. E., Friedrichs, M. A. M., Hemmings, J. C. P., and Smith Jr., W. O., 2018. Assimilating biooptical glider data during a phytoplankton bloom in the southern Ross Sea, Biogeosciences, 15, 73–
- 1139 90, https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-15-73-2018.
- Kim, S., Samelson, R.M., and Snyder, C., 2011. Toward an uncertainty budget for a coastal ocean model,
 Mon. Wea. Rev., 139, doi: 10.1175/2010MWR3352.1.
- Kourafalou, V.H., P. De Mey, M. Le Hénaff, G. Charria, C.A. Edwards, R. He, M. Herzfeld, A. Pascual,
 E.V. Stanev, J. Tintoré, N. Usui, A.J. van der Westhuysen, J. Wilkin and X. Zhu, 2015. Coastal Ocean
 Forecasting: system integration and evaluation, Journal of Operational Oceanography, 8:sup1,s127s146, DOI: 10.1080/1755876X.2015.1022336.
- Kourafalou, V.H., P. De Mey, J. Staneva, N. Ayoub, A. Barth, Y. Chao, M. Cirano, J. Fiechter, M. Herzfeld, A. Kurapov, A.M. Moore, P. Oddo, J. Pullen, A. van der Westhuysen & R.H. Weisberg, 2015. Coastal Ocean Forecasting: science foundation and user benefits, Journal of Operational Oceanography, 8:sup1, s147-s167, DOI: 10.1080/1755876X.2015.1022348.
- Koutsikopoulos, C. and Le Cann, B., 1996. Physical processes and hydrological structures related to the
 Bay of Biscay anchovy, Scientia Marina., 60 (Supl.2), 9-19.
- Kuhn, A. M., Dutkiewicz, S., Jahn, O., Clayton, S., Rynearson, T. A., Mazloff, M. R., and Barton, A. D.
 (2019). Temporal and spatial scales of correlation in marine phytoplankton communities. Journal of Geophysical Research: Oceans, 124, 9417–9438, https://doi.org/10.1029/2019JC015331.
- Large, W. and Yeager, S., 2004. Diurnal to decadal global forcing for ocean and sea-ice models: the data
 sets and flux climatologies, CGD Division of the National Center for Atmospheric Research, NCAR
 Technical Note: NCAR/TN-460+STR.
- 1158 Lévy, M., D. Iovino, L. Resplandy, P. Klein, G. Madec, A.-M. Tréguier, S. Masson, and K. Takahashi,
 2012a. Large-scale impacts of submesoscale dynamics on phytoplankton: Local and remote effects,
 Ocean Modelling, Vol. 43-44, pp. 77-93, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ocemod.2011.12.003.
- 1161 Lévy, M., L. Resplandy, P. Klein, X. Capet, D. Iovino, and C. Ethé, 2012b. Grid degradation of
 submesoscale resolving ocean models: Benefits for offline passive tracer transport, Ocean Modelling,
 1163 Vol. 48, pp. 1-9, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ocemod.2012.02.004.
- Lellouche, J.-M., Le Galloudec, O., Drévillon, M., Régnier, C., Greiner, E., Garric, G., Ferry, N.,
 Desportes, C., Testut, C.-E., Bricaud, C., Bourdallé-Badie, R., Tranchant, B., Benkiran, M., Drillet,
 Y., Daudin, A., and De Nicola, C., 2013. Evaluation of global monitoring and forecasting systems at
 Mercator Océan, Ocean Sci., 9, 57-81, https://doi.org/10.5194/os-9-57-2013.
- Leonard, B.P., 1979. A stable and accurate convective modelling procedure based on quadratic upstream
 interpolation. Computer Methods in Applied Mechanics and Engineering, 19, 59-98.
- Le Quéré, C., Harrison, S.P., Prentice, I.C., Buitenhuis, E.T., Aumont, O., Bopp, L., Claustre, H., Da
 Cunha, L.C., Geider, R., Giraud, X., Klaas, C., Kohfeld, K.E., Legendre, L., Manizza, M., Platt, T.,
 Rivkin, R.B., Sathyendranath, S., Uitz, J., Watson, A.J., and Wolf-Gladrow, D., 2005. Ecosystem
 dynamics based on plankton functional types for global ocean biogeochemistry models, Glob. Change
 Biol., 11, 2016–2040.
- 1175 Longhurst, A.R., 1998. Ecological Geography of the Sea, 398 pp. Academic, San Diego, Calif.
- Lucas M., N. Ayoub, B. Barnier, T. Penduff and De Mey, P., 2008. Stochastic study of the temperature
 response of the upper ocean to uncertainties in the atmospheric forcing in an Atlantic OGCM, Ocean
 Modell., Vol.20, 1, 90-113, doi: 10.1016/j.ocemod.2007.07.006.
- 1179 Madec, G., 2012. Nemo ocean engine, Tech. rep., NEMO team.
- 1180 Maraldi, C., B. Levier, N. Ayoub, J. Chanut, P. De Mey, F. Lyard, G. Reffray, S. Cailleau, M. Drévillon,
- 1181 E. A. Fanjul, M. Garcia Sotillo, P. Marsaleix, and the Mercator Team, 2013. NEMO on the shelf:
- 1182 Assessment of the Iberia–Biscay–Ireland configuration. Ocean Science 2013/9, 745-771.

- Mattern, J.P., Edwards, C.A., and Moore, A.M., 2018. Improving Variational Data Assimilation through
 Background and Observation Error Adjustments. Mon. Wea. Rev., 146, 485–501,
 https://doi.org/10.1175/MWR-D-17-0263.1.
- Mattern, J.P., Song, H., Edwards, C.A., Moore, A.M., Fiechter, J., 2017. Data assimilation of physical and chlorophyll a observations in the California Current System using two biogeochemical models. Ocean Model. 109, 55–71. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ocemod.2016.12.002.
- Melsom, A., Counillon, F., LaCasce, J. H. and Bertino, L., 2012. Forecasting search areas using ensemble
 ocean circulation modeling, Ocean Dyn., 62(8), 1245–1257, doi:10.1007/s10236-012-0561-5.
- Oke, P. R., and P. Sakov, 2008. Representation Error of Oceanic Observations for Data Assimilation. J.
 Atmos. Oceanic Technol., 25, 1004–1017, https://doi.org/10.1175/2007JTECH0558.1.
- Ollinaho, P., S. Lock, M. Leutbecher, P. Bechtold, A. Beljaars, A. Bozzo, R. M. Forbes, T. Haiden, R. J.
 Hogan and Sandu, I., 2017. Towards process-level representation of model uncertainties: stochastically perturbed parametrizations in the ECMWF ensemble. Q.J.R. Meteorol. Soc., 143:408-422, doi:10.1002/qj.2931.
- Palmer, T.N., R. Buizza, F. Doblas-Reyes, T. Jung, M. Leutbecher, G.J. Shutts, M. Steinheimer, and
 Weisheimer, A., 2009. Stochastic Parameterization and Model Uncertainty, ECMWF, pp. 1-42
 Technical Memorandum No. 598.
- Penduff, T., B. Barnier, L. Terray, G. Sérazin, S. Gregorio, J.-M. Brankart, M.-P. Moine, J.-M. Molines,
 and Brasseur, P., 2014. Ensembles of eddying ocean simulations for climate, CLIVAR Exchanges No.
 65, Vol. 19, No. 2.
- Pinardi, N., L. Cavaleri, G. Coppini, P. De Mey, C. Fratianni, J. Huthnance, P.F.J. Lermusiaux, A.
 Navarra, R. Preller, and Tibaldi, S., 2017. From weather to ocean predictions: an historical viewpoint.
 Journal of Marine Research, 75, 103-159.
- Prunet, P., Minster, J.-F., Ruiz-Pino, D., and Dadou, I., 1996. Assimilation of surface data in a onedimensional physical-biogeochemical model of the surface ocean: 1. Method and preliminary results, Global Biogeochem. Cycles, 10(1), 111–138, doi:10.1029/95GB03436.
- Quattrocchi, G., P. De Mey, N. Ayoub, V. Vervatis, C.-E. Testut, G. Reffray, J. Chanut and Drillet, Y.,
 2014. Characterisation of errors of a regional model of the Bay of Biscay in response to wind
 uncertainties: a first step toward a data assimilation system suitable for coastal sea domains. Journal
 of Operational Oceanography, Volume 7, Number 2, August 2014, pp. 25-34(10).
- Sakov, P., and Oke, P. R., 2008. A deterministic formulation of the ensemble Kalman Filter: an alternative to ensemble square root filters. Tellus A 60, 361–371, http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-0870.2007.00299.x.
- Sakov, P., Counillon, F., Bertino, L., Lisæter, K. A., Oke, P. R. and Korablev, A., 2012. TOPAZ4: an
 ocean-sea ice data assimilation system for the North Atlantic and Arctic, Ocean Sci., 8(4), 633–656,
 doi:10.5194/os-8-633-2012.
- Santana-Falcón, Y., Brasseur, P., Brankart, J. M., and Garnier, F., 2020. Assimilation of chlorophyll data
 into a stochastic ensemble simulation for the North Atlantic ocean, Ocean Sci. Discuss.,
 https://doi.org/10.5194/os-2020-6, accepted.
- Shapiro, R., 1970. Smoothing, filtering, and boundary effects, Rev. Geophys., 8(2), 359-387, doi:10.1029/RG008i002p00359.
- Simon, E., and Bertino, L., 2009. Application of the Gaussian anamorphosis to assimilation in a 3-D
 coupled physical-ecosystem model of the North Atlantic with the EnKF: a twin experiment. Ocean
 Sci. 5, 495-510.
- Song, H., Edwards, C.A., Moore, A.M., Fiechter, J., 2012. Incremental four-dimensional variational data assimilation of positive-definite oceanic variables using a logarithm transformation, Ocean Modell., 54-55, 1-17, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ocemod.2012.06.001.

- Song, H., Edwards, C.A., Moore, A.M., Fiechter, J., 2016. Data assimilation in a coupled physicalbiogeochemical model of the California current system using an incremental lognormal 4-dimensional
 variational approach: Part 3—Assimilation in a realistic context using satellite and in situ observations.
 Ocean Model. 106, 159–172. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ocemod.2016.06.005.
- $1255 \qquad \text{Ocean Model. 100, } 159-172. \text{ https://doi.org/10.1010/j.ocemod.2010.00.0}$
- Sotillo, M. G., S. Cailleau, P. Lorente, B. Levier, R. Aznar, G. Reffray, A. Amo-Baladrón, J. Chanut, M.
 Benkiran, and Alvarez-Fanjul, E., 2015. The MyOcean IBI Ocean Forecast and Reanalysis Systems:
 operational products and roadmap to the future Copernicus Service, Journal of Operational
 Oceanography, 8:1, 63-79, DOI: 10.1080/1755876X.2015.1014663.
- Storto, A., S. Masina, and S. Dobricic, 2014. Estimation and impact of nonuniform horizontal correlation
 length scales for global ocean physical analyses. Journal of Atmospheric and Oceanic Technology,
 Volume 31, pp. 2330-2349, doi: 10.1175/JTECH-D-14-00042.1.
- Takahashi, T., Broecker, W. S., and Langer, S., 1985. Redfield ratio based on chemical data from
 isopycnal surfaces, J. Geophys. Res., 90, 6907–6924.
- Tai, C.K., 1993. On the Quasigeostrophic oceanic response to atmospheric pressure forcing: the Inverted
 Barometer pumping. NOAA Techinacal Memorandum NOS OES 005.
- Thacker, W.C., A. Srinivasan, M. Iskandarani, O.M. Knio, and Le Hénaff, M., 2012. Propagating
 boundary uncertainties using polynomial expansions, Ocean Modelling, Vol. 43–44, pp. 52-63,
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ocemod.2011.11.011.
- Vandenbulcke, L., and Barth, A., 2015. A stochastic operational forecasting system of the Black Sea:
 Technique and validation. Ocean Modell., 93, 7-21.
- Vandenbulcke, L. and Barth, A., 2019. Upscaling of a local models into a larger-scale models, Ocean
 Sci., 15, 291-305, https://doi.org/10.5194/os-15-291-2019.
- Verdy, A. and M. R. Mazloff, 2017. A data assimilating model for estimating Southern Ocean
 biogeochemistry, J. Geophys. Res. Oceans, 122, 6968-6988, doi:10.1002/2016JC012650.
- 1254 Vervatis, V. D., C.E. Testut, P. De Mey, N. Ayoub, J. Chanut, and Quattrocchi, G., 2016. Data 1255 assimilative twin-experiment in a high-resolution Bay of Biscay configuration: 4D EnOI based on 1256 stochastic modelling of the wind forcing. Ocean Modell., 100, 1-19. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ocemod.2016.01.003. 1257
- Vervatis, V. D., P. De Mey-Frémaux, N. Ayoub, J. Karagiorgos, S. Ciavatta, R. Brewin, and Sofianos.
 S., 2021. Assessment of a regional physical-biogeochemical stochastic ocean model. Part 2: empirical
 consistency. Ocean Modell., under review.
- Wang, B., Fennel, K., Yu, L., and Gordon, C., 2020. Assessing the value of biogeochemical Argo profiles
 versus ocean color observations for biogeochemical model optimization in the Gulf of Mexico.
 Biogeosciences, 17, 4059-4074, https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-17-4059-2020.
- Yu, L., Fennel, K., Bertino, L., Gharamti, M.E., Thompson, K.R., 2018. Insights on multivariate updates
 of physical and biogeochemical ocean variables using an Ensemble Kalman Filter and an idealized
 model of upwelling. Ocean Model. 126, 13–28. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ocemod.2018.04.005.
- Zalesak, S.T., 1979. Fully multidimensional flux corrected transport algorithms for fluids. J. Comput.
 Phys., 31.
- Zuo, H., Balmaseda, M. A., Tietsche, S., Mogensen, K., and Mayer, M., 2019. The ECMWF operational
 ensemble reanalysis–analysis system for ocean and sea ice: a description of the system and assessment,
 Ocean Sci., 15, 779–808, https://doi.org/10.5194/os-15-779-2019.
- 1272 **Table 1.** Table of simulations: control run (CR), ensemble medium-range sensitivity experiments (S1-5,
- 1273 SP, SB, SPB) and seasonal-range ensembles (EnsP, EnsB, EnsPB). The table shows the stochastic
- 1274 parameterizations of first-order autoregressive processes AR(1), deduced from the statistical properties
- 1275 of the one-year CR. Spatial correlations are explicitly calculated by applying a 2D Gaussian function with
- 1276 variable anisotropic length scales (1std: $\sigma_{x,y}$ in degrees), temporal correlations (τ in days) and uncertainty

1277 amplitude (1std: σ no units) of the 2D Gaussian distributions (prior to the anamorphosis function if

applied). The spatial correlation value for the bottom drag coefficient c_b is an approximation after 100 passes of the Laplacian operator. Ens0 is a seasonal-range ensemble performing stochastic modelling of the wind forcing based on EOF modes (*Vervatis et al.*, 2016).

experiment	perturbed variables	uncertainty amplitude (σ)	correlation timescales (τ)	spatial scales $(\sigma_{x,y})$	distribution		
CR	one-year unperturbed free run (July 2011-June 2012)						
Ens0	wind perturbations based on EOF modes (Vervatis et al., 2016)						
	atmospheric forcing						
S1	U _{air}	0.3	3 days	1°	Gaussian		
S2	T _{air}	0.1	15 days	2°	Gaussian		
S3	SLP	0.01	5 days	3°	Gaussian		
	ocean model parameterizations						
S4	C_d, C_e, C_h	0.1	3 days	0.5°	Gaussian		
S5	C _b	0.2	30 days	0.2°	Laplace flt*		
	synthesis of ocean-atmosphere model uncertainties						
SP	S1-5 medium range ens (April 2012; 20 mem)						
EnsP	SP seasonal range ens (December 2011–June 2012; 40 mem)						
	biogeochemical state						
		ocean-atmosphere state identical to the CR for all members					
		0.6	10 days	0.5°	Lognormal**		
SB	SMS(C)	MS(C) medium range ens (April 2012; 20 mem)					
EnsB	SB	seasonal range ens (December 2011–June 2012; 40 mem)					
	synthesis of coupled ocean-biogeochemical model uncertainties						
SPB	SP+SB medium range ens (April 2012; 20 mem)						
EnsPB	EnsP+EnsB	seasonal range ens (December 2011–June 2012; 40 mem)					

abbreviations: flt-filter; ens-ensemble; mem-members; U_{air} -u, v wind velocities; T_{air} -air temperature; SLP-sea level pressure; c_d, c_e, c_h -wind drag and turbulent coefficients; c_b -bottom drag; SMS(C)-sources

minus sinks of biogeochemical tracers C. *100 passes of the Laplacian filter in a Gaussian distribution

1284 per model grid point (spatial scales estimated by the response function of the first-order Shapiro filter).

1285 **A lognormal anamorphosis function is applied to the SMS(C) of the 24 PISCESv2 prognostic variables.

Table 2. CMEMS observation product identifiers (<u>http://marine.copernicus.eu/</u>).

daily frequency		Error
SST gridded 0.05°	SST_GLO_SST_L4_NRT_OBS_010_001	0.5 °C
SLA along track 14 km	SEALEVEL_GLO_PHY_L3_REP_OBS_008_062	0.05 m
8-day frequency	C .	
Chl a gridded 4 km	OCEANCOLOUR_GLO_CHL_L4_REP_OBS_009_093	0.3 mg/m ³





1288

BISCAY36 model domain and bathymetry (m). Black line denotes the 200 m isobath.







1296 pattern $e^{\left(\xi_k - \frac{\sigma^2}{2}\right)}$ as in Eq. (5) of sources-minus-sinks biogeochemical tracers.



1298Figure 3Control run ocean model surface variables on April 30, 2012: (a) SSH (m), (b) SST (°C),1299(c) SSS, (d-f) left to right: total surface chlorophyll, nanophytoplankton and diatoms (mg/m³).



Figure 4 Model uncertainties (i.e. 1std ensemble spread) of medium-range ensembles S1-5 and SP on April 30, 2012: (a-f) SST spread (°C) and (g-l) SSH spread (m) perturbing the (a, g) wind, (b, h) air temperature, (c, i) sea level pressure, (d, j) wind drag and turbulent coefficients, (e, k) bottom drag coefficient, (f, l) all variables together. Note the different colorbars with units varying up to 0.2 °C in SST and up to 0.02 m in SSH.



1307Figure 5(a-f) S1-5 and SP model uncertainties (i.e. 1std ensemble spread) of total surface1308chlorophyll (mg/m³) perturbing physics (PHY), (g) SB chlorophyll spread perturbing SMS(C), (h) SPB1309chlorophyll spread perturbing all physical-biogeochemical variables. (i-k) and (l-n) are the same as (f-h)1310but for nanophytoplankton and diatom spread.



Figure 6 (a, c) OSTIA SST L4 (°C) observation distribution and EnsP ensemble inter-quantile ranges in data space averaged over the Armorican shelf and the abyssal plain, (b, d) innovation statistics and spread for the two regions, respectively; the thin horizontal line denotes the observational error 0.5 °C (the legend is split across two subplots).



1317Figure 7(a) SLA along track L3 observation distribution (m) and EnsP and Ens0 ensembles in data-1318space, (b) OmE_{bias} map using EnsP for the period starting on February 25, 2012 and for three consecutive1319weeks, (c) EnsP box-whisker plots and observation error bars averaged over the abyssal plain, (d) the1320Armorican shelf and (e) the English Channel.



Figure 8 Same as Fig. 6 for ocean colour L4 total surface chlorophyll observations and biogeochemical model ensembles, with innovation statistics calculated in log space. Observational error:
0.3 mg/m³.





Zero-lag single observation representers for three different surface locations (black 1326 Figure 9 1327 markers) in the abyssal plain [9°W 45.6°N], the Armorican shelf [2.6°W 46.3°N] and the English Channel [2.9°W 49.9°N], calculated as correlations between OSTIA SST L4 and all surface variables in the control 1328 1329 vector, derived from 40 members of EnsP ensemble on May 07, 2012: (a) cor(SST,SST), (b) cor(SST,SSS), (c) cor(SST,SSH), (d) cor(SST,CHL), (e) same as (d) for 20 members, (f) same as (c) for 1330 1331 Ens0. Correlations between ocean colour L4 chlorophyll observations and surface variables in EnsPB control vector: (g) cor(CHL,SST), (h) cor(CHL,SSS) and (i) cor(CHL,CHL). A localization Gaussian 1332 function is applied with cut-off radius 3° and e-folding scale 0.2°. 1333





1335 Figure 10 Incremental analysis using OSTIA SST L4 on May 07, 2012 and EnsP 40 members: (a, b)

- 1336 SST correction (°C) for the first two members 001 and 002, (c-e) correction for the first member for SSH
- 1337 (m), SSS and surface total chlorophyll (mg/m³); (a) two locations illustrated in Fig. 11 for the abyssal
- 1338 plain (green square [7°W 45°N]) and the Armorican shelf (green rhombus [2.6°W 46.3°N]).





1340 Figure 11 Incremental analysis using OSTIA SST L4 on February 01, 2012 (grey lines) and on May

- 1341 07, 2012 (black lines), using EnsP 40 members; (a-c) vertical correction of member 001 on, respectively,
 1342 T (°C), salinity and total chlorophyll (mg/m³) over the Armorican shelf, and (d-f) the same for the abyssal
- 1343 plain (cf. Fig. 10a).





1345 Figure 12 Incremental analysis using ocean colour L4 on May 07, 2012 and ensemble covariances

from 40 members for three different ensembles, EnsP, EnsB, and EnsPB (left to right): (a-c) correction of the first member for total chlorophyll (mg/m³) at a depth of 15 m, (d-f) prior model ensemble spread

1348 in data space of total chlorophyll (mg/m^3) , as a mean value of the first 5 m of the water column.



1350Figure 13Incremental analysis using OSTIA SST L4 and ocean colour L4 on May 07, 2012: (a-d)1351ensemble covariances are calculated from EnsPB with 40 members; correction of member 001 on (from1352left to right) SST (°C), SSH (m), SSS, and surface total chlorophyll (mg/m³), (e, f) same as (a) and (d)1353calculated from EnsP with 40 members, (g, h) same as (e, f) calculated from EnsP with 10 members.

Highlights

- Ocean model errors are mainly driven by wind forcing uncertainties
- Uncertainties on physical forcing have a large impact on ecosystem model errors
- Data assimilation on physics largely depends on multivariate analysis
- The biogeochemical model skill is mainly defined by the assimilation of chlorophyll
- Most of the chlorophyll correction arises from uncertainties in the physics

Authors' contribution statement using CRediT

- 1) Vassilios D. Vervatis: conceptualization, methodology, software, visualization, formal analysis, investigation, writing original draft, writing review and editing.
- 2) Pierre De Mey-Frémaux: conceptualization, methodology, software, formal analysis, writing original draft, writing review and editing.
- 3) Nadia Ayoub: conceptualization, formal analysis, writing original draft, writing review and editing.
- 4) John Karagiorgos: software, visualization, formal analysis.
- 5) Malek Ghantous: writing original draft, writing review and editing.
- 6) Marios Kailas: software, formal analysis.
- 7) Charles-Emmanuel Testut: conceptualization, methodology.
- 8) Sarantis Sofianos: conceptualization, resources.

The corresponding author,

Vassilios Vervatis

Declaration of interests

 \boxtimes The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

□The authors declare the following financial interests/personal relationships which may be considered as potential competing interests:

974 Supplementary material

Fig. S1 presents the temporal variability of the PFT data in the Bay of Biscay, during the period December, 2011 to June, 2012. We also show the ocean colour L4 total chlorophyll product used in the Part 1 article (*Vervatis et al.*, 2021) and we verify that concentrations are of the same order to those of the PFT total chlorophyll. According to this, we categorised the four satellite PFT (pico, nano, diatoms and dino) into the two broad size groups in PISCES (nano or diatoms), in a manner most representative, ensuring that the total biomass (chlorophyll) from the model and satellite data can be compared like-for-like.

982 PFT diatoms and nanophytoplankton contribute together approximately more than 80% in total 983 chlorophyll, whereas picoplankton contributes at about 10% and dinoflagellates less than 10% 984 (Fig. S1). PFT diatom chlorophyll concentration is an order of magnitude larger compared with 985 dinoflagellates and nanophytoplankton is about three times larger than picoplankton 986 chlorophyll concentration (Fig. S1). In Fig. S2, we show the spatial distribution of the four 987 satellite PFT and the total chlorophyll during the peak of the spring bloom on March 28, 2012. 988 We confirm that the satellite micro class (i.e. diatoms and dino) is driven primarily by diatoms, 989 far more abundant in the satellite data, with the two functional types being highly correlated in 990 spatial. Fig. S3 presents scatter plots of combined vs. non-combined PFT chlorophyll, verifying 991 the close relationship between functional types in a size class-based approach.

992 We also present results from one-on-one comparisons between model and PFT data, as opposed 993 to the size class-based categorization merging different functional types. Figure S4 shows 994 Hovmöller plot of rank histograms between EnsPB and PFT, in the same way as Figs. 5b-c, 995 with one main difference: in Figs. S4a-b we do not combine the nano functional type with pico, 996 nor we combine diatoms with dino. Rank histogram results for the nano class are degraded 997 when pico and nano PFT data are not combined together in late-winter and early-spring when 998 a primary bloom occurs (Fig. 5b vs. Fig. S4a). The latter may suggest that PISCES nano can 999 be representative of a broader phytoplankton community, accounting also for smaller size 1000 classes. Rank histogram results are almost identical throughout the whole period for the micro 1001 class, regardless of whether dino and diatoms are combined together or not (Fig. 5c vs. Fig. 1002 S4b). Model-data one-on-one array mode consistency results (not shown) are in practice 1003 indistinguishable by visual inspection with the results presented in Figs. 10 and 11, confirming 1004 the validity of the size class-based approach.



1005

1006Figure S1Ocean colour L4 (8-day frequency) and PFT (daily) chlorophyll concentration1007 (mg/m^3) in the Bay of Biscay from December, 2011 to June, 2012.



1009 Figure S2 Spatial distribution of (a) PFT total chlorophyll and (b) pico, (c) nano, (d) 1010 diatoms, (e) dino concentrations (mg/m^3) on March 28, 2012.





1012 **Figure S3** Scatter plots of chlorophyll concentrations in mg/m^3 on March 28, 2012: (a) 1013 PFT (nano and pico) vs. only nano, (b) PFT (diatoms and dino) vs. only diatoms. r is the 1014 correlation coefficient, RMSE the root mean square error (mg/m^3) and with red the 1:1 line.





