



HAL
open science

Response to Kalchhauser et al.: Inherited Gene Regulation Is not Enough to Understand Nongenetic Inheritance

Pim Edelaar, Russell Bonduriansky, Anne Charmantier, Etienne Danchin,
Benoit Pujol

► **To cite this version:**

Pim Edelaar, Russell Bonduriansky, Anne Charmantier, Etienne Danchin, Benoit Pujol. Response to Kalchhauser et al.: Inherited Gene Regulation Is not Enough to Understand Nongenetic Inheritance. *Trends in Ecology & Evolution*, 2021, 36 (6), pp.475-476. 10.1016/j.tree.2021.03.002 . hal-03414513

HAL Id: hal-03414513

<https://hal.science/hal-03414513>

Submitted on 8 Nov 2021

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

**RESPONSE TO KALCHHAUSER ET AL.: INHERITED GENE REGULATION IS NOT
ENOUGH TO UNDERSTAND NON-GENETIC INHERITANCE**

Pim Edelaar^{*1}, Russell Bonduriansky², Anne Charmantier³, Etienne Danchin⁴, Benoit Pujol^{5,6}

*: corresponding author; remaining authors in alphabetical order

1: Dept. Molecular Biology and Biochemical Engineering, University Pablo de Olavide, 41013 Seville, Spain (edelaar@upo.es; @Pim_Edelaar)

2: School of Biological, Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of New South Wales, Sydney NSW 2052 Australia (r.bonduriansky@unsw.edu.au)

3: CEFÉ, Univ Montpellier, CNRS, EPHE, IRD, Univ Paul Valéry Montpellier 3, Montpellier, France (anne.charmantier@cefe.cnrs.fr ; @AnneCharmantier)

4: Laboratoire évolution and Diversité Biologique (EDB UMR 5174), Université de Toulouse Midi-Pyrénées, CNRS, IRD, UPS, 118 route de Narbonne, Bat 4R1, 31062 Toulouse cedex 9, France (etienne.danchin@univ-tlse3.fr).

5: PSL Université Paris: EPHE-UPVD-CNRS, USR 3278 CRIOBE, Université de Perpignan, 52 Avenue Paul Alduy, 66860, Perpignan Cedex, France (benoit.pujol@univ-perp.fr)

6: Laboratoire d'Excellence 'CORAIL', 58 avenue Paul Alduy, F-66360 Perpignan, France

Key words: non-genetic inheritance, inherited gene regulation, epigenetics

22 In their Opinion article Adrian-Kalchhauser et al. [1] discussed the diverse molecular
23 mechanisms underlying certain forms of non-genetic inheritance (see Box 1 for
24 terminology). They propose embracing these mechanisms under the unifying concept of
25 ‘inherited gene regulation’ (IGR). We think the article provides a valuable overview of
26 several forms of non-genetically inherited gene regulation and their interactions with
27 genetic variation. However, we are concerned that this article might lead readers to
28 conclude that all forms of non-genetic inheritance boil down to inherited gene
29 regulation -- a conclusion that we regard as inconsistent with known features of many
30 forms of non-genetic inheritance. Below, we clarify our concerns, and explain why we
31 believe that non-genetically inherited variation cannot be understood solely in terms of
32 variation in gene expression.

33 Several sentences in Adrian-Kalchhauser et al. [1] imply that non-genetic inheritance
34 can be reduced to IGR, including: “*We provide a more precise basis for integrating*
35 *'non-genetic' modes of inheritance into evolutionary and ecological studies. The key*
36 *shared features of these mechanisms can be clarified by the unifying concept of IGR*”,
37 and “*Recognizing the common effect of highly diverse molecular mechanisms as IGR is*
38 *a first step toward identifying general features of non-genetic inheritance systems*”.
39 While specific interpretation of these quotes is open for discussion and they are taken
40 out of context, we do think they could give readers the idea that non-genetic inheritance
41 equates to inherited gene regulation. We argue that non-genetic inheritance is much
42 broader than that.

43 The salient issue here is that many forms of non-genetic inheritance cannot be
44 meaningfully understood as only involving changes in gene regulation. For instance,
45 many behaviours are learned by offspring from watching their parents [2]. A culturally

46 transmitted behaviour such as a preference for a given food might be associated with
47 altered gene expression, but this does not mean that it is useful to redefine culture in
48 terms of variation in gene expression: cultural inheritance is better understood as the
49 transmission of behavioural traditions via social learning [3].

50 Similarly, parental microbiomes can be inherited by offspring [4,5], and so can other
51 aspects of the environment (e.g. physical constructions, food stores, chosen habitats,
52 territories, hosts, social environments), known as ecological inheritance [6]. Even at the
53 molecular level, prions and chaperone molecules can be transmitted and have
54 phenotypic effects, while not operating via gene regulation [7,8]. Likewise, structural
55 inheritance involves template-like processes that operate during cell division but do not
56 depend on changes in gene expression [9]. All these other forms of non-genetic
57 inheritance might be associated with changes in gene expression, but there is no reason
58 to assume that gene expression plays a causal role in these processes: they cannot be
59 usefully boiled down to inherited variation of gene regulation because changes in gene
60 expression need not give rise to the variation in question nor mediate its transmission
61 across generations.

62 While Adrian-Kalchhauser et al. are most certainly aware of these additional forms of
63 non-genetic inheritance, their paper unfortunately does not explicitly mention that their
64 concept of inherited gene regulation does not cover these additional forms. We agree
65 with the authors that “*A key contemporary research challenge is incorporating*
66 *inheritance mechanisms beyond DNA sequence into evolutionary and ecological*
67 *investigations*”, and even that “*Some simplification of these dauntingly diverse and*
68 *functionally complex mechanisms is reasonable and indeed necessary for this effort*”.
69 However, if our aim is “Understanding Non-genetic Inheritance: ...” (their title), we

70 argue that this cannot be wholly done by focussing exclusively on the gene-regulatory
71 aspects of non-genetic inheritance. Instead, a broader (inclusive) view of heredity is
72 necessary [2-12].

73 There is no doubt that genes are involved in epigenetics (see Box 1 for terminology).
74 However, limiting ourselves solely to the study of genes would not allow us to grasp the
75 full complexity of epigenetics [8,11,12]. The same holds for inherited gene regulation:
76 although it is likely that it is involved in most non-genetic inheritance processes, the
77 study of inherited gene regulation would not by itself allow us to grasp the full
78 complexity of non-genetic inheritance. This is because although genes and epigenetic
79 states are involved, non-genetic inheritance can nonetheless vary independently and be
80 shaped by alternate mechanisms (e.g., ecological, social, etc.). Thus, reducing the study
81 of epigenetics and non-genetic inheritance to inherited gene regulation would mean
82 perpetuating the very limitation that we and many other biologists are now working to
83 correct – limiting the study of inheritance to the study of genes only.

84

85 References:

86 1: Adrian-Kalchhauser, I. *et al.* (2020) Understanding 'Non-genetic' Inheritance:

87 Insights from Molecular-Evolutionary Crosstalk. *Trends Ecol. Evol.*

88 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tree.2020.08.011>

89 2:

90 2: Whiten A. (2019) Cultural evolution in animals. *Annu. Rev. Ecol. Evol. Syst.* 50, 27–

91 48

- 92 3: Creanza, N. *et al.* (2017) Cultural evolutionary theory: how culture evolves and why
93 it matters. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 114,7782-7789
- 94 4: Fellous, S. *et al.* (2011) Adaptation due to symbionts and conflicts between heritable
95 agents of biological information. *Nat. Rev. Genet.* 12, 663–663
- 96 5: Brucker, R.M. and Bordenstein, S.R. (2013) The hologenomic basis of speciation:
97 gut bacteria cause hybrid lethality in the genus *Nasonia*. *Science* 341,667-669
- 98 6: Pontarotti, G. (in press) Environmental inheritance: conceptual ambiguities and
99 theoretical issues. *Biological Theory* [https://doi.org/10.1007/s13752-020-00348-](https://doi.org/10.1007/s13752-020-00348-5)
100 5
- 101 7: Jablonka, E. and Lamb, M.J. (2005) *Evolution in Four Dimensions. Genetic,*
102 *Epigenetic, Behavioural, and Symbolic Variation in the History of Life.*
103 Cambridge Massachusetts: MIT Press
- 104 8: Bonduriansky, R. and Day, T. (2018) *Extended Heredity: A New Understanding of*
105 *Inheritance and Evolution.* Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press
- 106 9: Beisson, J. (2008) Preformed cell structure and cell heredity. *Prion* 2,1-8
- 107 10: Danchin, É. *et al.* (2011) Beyond DNA: integrating inclusive inheritance into an
108 extended theory of evolution. *Nat. Rev. Genet.* 12, 475-486
- 109 11 : Danchin, É. *et al.* (2019a) Early in life effects and heredity: reconciling neo-
110 Darwinism with neo-Lamarckism under the banner of the inclusive evolutionary
111 synthesis. *Phil. Trans. R. Soc.B* 374, 20180113
- 112 12 : Danchin, É. *et al.* (2019b) Epigenetically-facilitated mutational assimilation:
113 epigenetics as a hub within the Inclusive Evolutionary Synthesis. *Biol.Rev.* 94,
114 259-282

115

116 **Box 1: Genetic and non-genetic inheritance terminology**

117

118 We use “inheritance” to mean the transmission of something from parent to offspring,
119 contributing to parent-offspring resemblance. “Genetic inheritance” is the transmission
120 of DNA sequence during reproduction. “Non-genetic inheritance” is then the
121 transmission of anything else from parent to offspring. This might also occur during
122 reproduction (e.g. small RNAs present in gametes), but other aspects like behaviour,
123 microbiomes and physical structures can be transmitted after reproduction and without
124 the involvement of gametes.

125 "Epigenetic inheritance" has historically been used in many different ways. We adhere
126 to the predominating narrow-sense use that refers to certain inherited molecular factors
127 that regulate gene expression. However, as explained above and in the text, these
128 molecular factors are only a sub-set of the kinds of elements that can mediate non-
129 genetic inheritance. Thus, the IGR framework encompasses only those forms of non-
130 genetic inheritance that involve parent-offspring transmission of narrow-sense
131 epigenetic factors, and leaves out other non-genetically inherited elements. Non-genetic
132 inheritance is broader than inherited gene regulation.

133