



HAL
open science

An overview of the Tocharian B fragments pertaining to the Yogalehrbuch

Athanaric Huard

► **To cite this version:**

Athanaric Huard. An overview of the Tocharian B fragments pertaining to the Yogalehrbuch. Online conference, May 2021, Heidelberg, France. hal-03356440

HAL Id: hal-03356440

<https://hal.science/hal-03356440v1>

Submitted on 28 Sep 2021

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



An overview of the Tocharian B fragments pertaining to the *Yogalehrbuch*

Heidelberg, 30th May 2021 (revised version)

Athanaric Huard (EPHE, PSL / ERC HisTochText¹)

This publication belongs to the research conducted under the HisTochText project. This project has received funding from the European Research Council (ERC) under the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme (grant agreement No. 788205).

- The *Yogalehrbuch* is a meditation manual found in Kučā, edited and reconstructed by Schlingloff 1964 from a main manuscript, which proposes a series of meditation exercises. The plan of the work is quite classical and corresponds to what one might find in a manual like the *Visuddhimagga*: meditation on the breath (*ānāpānasamṛti*), on the impure (*aśubha*), etc. But instead of the usual content, the text substitutes for them a series of quite extraordinary visions: The yogin thus sees a jewel woman appear, a young boy diving into a pool, streams of Buddha, etc. This prevalence of the visual register can be found in a certain number of Chinese texts dating from the 5th century and referred to as *Chan jing*. Several elements, both from external sources and in these texts themselves suggest that they were written and/or compiled in Central Asia, and the existence of the YL, whose manuscripts have been found primarily in the Kučā region, provides an important anchor for locating this particular meditation tradition (Yamabe 1999a and 1999b). The existence of a local tradition in Tocharian, the subject I will discuss today, helps to confirm this hypothesis.
- As this is an exploratory work, one has to address two fundamental questions: 1) the relationship between these Tocharian fragments and the Sanskrit text: is it a simple translation? a translation of other texts related to the YL? Or is it a development of the meditation exercises detailed in the YL? 2) Do these texts correspond to an actual practice of meditation in the Tocharian monasteries? And if so, how can this be demonstrated?

¹ This publication belongs to the research conducted under the HisTochText project. This project has received funding from the European Research Council (ERC) under the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme (grant agreement No. 788205).

I. Presentation of the corpus

Manuscripts	Frgmts	Leaf numb.	Spot	Heighth	Interl. spacing	Lines	Script
THT 2377	4		Qizil ?	NA	0,9	NA	NTBa1
IOL Toch 250	1		NA	9,2	1,7-1,8	5	NTBa1
IOL Toch 158	1		NA	8,8	1,4	6	NTBa2
THT 563-566	4	211	Šorčuq	13,6	1,5	9	NTBa2
PK AS 19	ca. 30	80-84, 1 ^{xx}	Dul. Akh.	6,2	1,2	5	NTBa3
IOL Toch 27	1	13	NA	6	1,1-1,2	5	NTBa3
PK NS 135	3		Dul. Akh.		1,1	NA	NTBa3
THT 567-570	3		Qizil	6,8	1,4-1,5	4	NTBb1
THT 580-581	2		Siŋgim	7,5	1,4-1,5	5	NTBb1
IOL Toch 10	1		NA	5	0,9	5	NTBb2
Or.15007/231, etc.			NA	6,5	1	6	arch./NTBa1
PS Rouge 9.1-6			Dul. Akh.	6,6	0,8	7	NTBa1
SHT 150 (YL)			Qizil	7,5	1,1-1,2	6	NTBa1
SHT 407a		[8]5	Šorčuq	5,6	1	5	NTBa1
SHT 164a		64	Qizil	8,7	1,4-1,5	6	NTBa2
SHT 183a			Qizil	9	1	6	NTBa2-3
Or.15002/28		29	Kučā	4,2	0,9	4	NTBa2-3
Or.15003/257			NA	5		5	NA

- I.1 Importance compared to the corpus of Tocharian manuscripts:** So far, these fragments belong to 10 different manuscripts that belong to this YL tradition. This number is quite large for Tocharian sources, if one compares it to the number of manuscripts known for the *Udānālankāra* (7 manuscripts) or the *Udānastotra* (8 or 9 manuscripts), which suggests that these texts correspond to a certain practice.
- I.2 Temporal and spatial extension of the manuscripts:** Two Tocharian manuscripts in the corpus gathered here (IOL Toch 250 and THT 2377), although written in classical script, belong to the archaic language. If it means that they are copied from archaic manuscripts, this allows us to place the writing of meditation texts in Tocharian at least from the 5th century (Malzahn 2007, 277). On the other hand, we have manuscripts, up to the most recent stratum known for the manuscripts of the Kučā region (~ 8th century). One of these manuscripts (THT 580) is from the Turfan region.
- I.3 Practical format.** The very number of manuscripts suggests that this kind of text enjoyed some popularity among the monks of the Kučā and Turfan region. This can be confirmed by the format of the manuscripts themselves, which points to a "practical" orientation of these texts. This point has already been noted by Hartmann 2006b, 320, in relation to the manuscript Or. 15002/28+20, whose dimensions are very small (4.2 cm. high). This also applies for several manuscripts of the Tocharian corpus: Pelliot Sanscrit Rouge, and PK AS 19. Because of its paleographic features (NTBa3), it belongs to a fairly recent stratum among the Duldur Akhur manuscripts. However, these manuscripts are generally larger than the classical ones, or have fewer lines. It could be that the choice of birchbark for the SHT 150 manuscript is also to be explained by the usual character of the text, as to my knowledge the

only other example of manuscripts written on birchbark written in Tocharian Brāhmī is the *Karmavācanā* manuscript edited by Schmidt 2018, a text with an evidently practical destination since it was used for the recitation of ordination rituals.

II. Translations from Sanskrit?

- **II.1 Variation in Sanskrit manuscripts:** Hartmann (1996 = 2006) observed that the London manuscripts Or. 15009/485 the recto corresponds to the text of YL 144 R6-145V4 while the version finds a correspondent only later in the text, in YL 146R5-6, while the text of the YL manuscript is sufficiently well preserved to exclude that this corresponds to a gap, suggesting that shorter version of text may exist. Yamabe (1999b =2006) observed that in the Pelliot Sanskrit Rouge 9.1 manuscript, lines R3-6 had similar content to a passage in the exercise on the elements of the body (*dhātuprayoga*) in the YL (129V6-R2), but with differences in the phrasing of the text. On the other hand, the rest of the text has no parallel in the *dhātuprayoga* while this chapter is sufficiently well preserved in the YL to rule out the possibility that the text corresponds to a gap. Nevertheless, since there are some similarities with the exercise on the impurity (*aśubhaprayoga*), which is very poorly preserved, Yamabe also raises the possibility that Pelliot Sanskrit rouge 9.1 also corresponds to this exercise. According to this other alternative, we would have only one reference text for this kind of meditation in Kučā.
- **II.2 The phrasing in the Tocharian text** The most salient singularity of the Tocharian fragments is the variety of verbal forms employed. The main structure found in the Tocharian texts is an alternation between present tense for the verbs "to see" and "to appear" (*lkāṣṣām* "he sees" and *pākri māskētār* "he appears") and gerund for the other verbs. In Sanskrit, both actions are described with present indicative or with absolutive in sentence with a main verb in the present indicative:

punar bhrumadhyād ekaḥ pravāho nirgacchati "Weiterhin geht der Strom vom Mittelpunkt zwischen [seinen] Brauen aus" (YL 129 3R ; éd. et tr. Schlingloff 1964, 88)

tato (bhrumadhyā) dhar nimnapradeśāt kṣīrapravāho nirgatya [...] mūrdhnā praviśati "Dann geht von der vertieften Stell unter (dem Mittelpunkt [zwischen seinen] Brauen) ein Milchstrom aus [...] und tritt wieder durch das Haupt ein " (YL 146 R6-147 V1; éd. et tr. Schlingloff 1964, 132)

- On the contrary the Tocharian will use a verbal adjective here:

(e)piñte pārwāne palsko (s)t(amā)ṣle: tumem mälkwerṣṣa tsarāko tārkanalya
"One should establish one's mind between one's two eyebrows; then one should eject a stream of milk" (PK AS 19.5 b1)
→ **bhrumadhye cittah sthāpitavyah. Tatah kṣīrapravāho utsraṣṭavyah.*

- But for the verb "to see", the present is used:

śwālyai (pai)yyeññe mokocintse āntene tuciyai tanākkai lkāṣṣām
"He sees a yellow grain on the top of the big toe of the right foot..." (THT 580 b2)

- Variations in wording: while the Sanskrit text mentions only the appearance of object in the yogin's consciousness with the present (*abhimukhī bhavati*), one finds in the Tocharian text the formula *pākri māsketār* "it appears" which should correspond to it, but also the corresponding active turn with the verb "to do", *pākri yām-* "to make appear":

uppā<l>-(pyāpyo) pākri mäs(ketār) "A lotus (flower) appears" (19.6 a2)
 → **utpālapuṣpo abhimukhī bhavati*

ysāṣṣa caknik pākri yamaṣlya "a golden *caknik* must be made to appear" (19.6 b1)
 → **sauvarṇā caknik abhimukhīkartvyā*

- Later in the same text, for the repetition of a same formula, the text uses two different constructions: first the present tense, then the verbal adjective:

askācānā yneṣ yamastrā "He pictures before his eyes the *kuśa* herbs" (PK AS 19.22 b2)
 → **kuśām sākṣīkaroti*

askāci arkwin(a) yneṣ yamaṣṣāllona "One should picture before one's eyes the *kuśa* herbs as white" (PK AS 19.1 b3)
 → **kuśā avadatāḥ sākṣīkartavyāḥ*

- Hence the Tocharian is structurally different from the Sanskrit text, and shows that the content of the text should be understood as a sequence of instructions. Nevertheless it is remarkable that the verb "to see" is always used in the present tense. This distribution obviously has consequences for the interpretation of the extraordinary visions of the YL.
- Other enunciation structures: we also find texts that are addressed to a second person and are presented as instructions from a master to his disciple:

/// tyāgānusmṛti || ṅake lāmat śwālyai ālyine īme śwā(lyai) ///
/// tsaksentār śwālyai ālyine naumyeṣṣe kṣātre l(k)ās(t) ///

"... Recollection of liberality: Now, when/if you sit down, [settle] [your] attention in the right palm ... [in the] ... right ... they burn. You see a parasol of gems in your right palm." (THT 567 a1-a2)

→ **tyāgānusmṛti || tatra niṣaṅṅo dakṣiṇe hastatale smṛtiṃ vam. ///*
 → **dyotante dakṣiṇe padatale ratnachatraṃ paśyasi ///*

- The phrasing of this text is all the more strange because even the visions are expressed in the second person, which seems to give a performative meaning to the verb "to see." But one cannot exclude that it should be understood as a conditional, if *krwi* should be restored after the verb.

- **II.3 Editorial process in Tocharian texts** In Tocharian texts, one finds several times numbering of images, as in the fragment IOL Toch 10, where visions of stars representing the different aspects of the path of liberation *sarvāstivādin* are numbered up to 10, and it is in the next line about 25 sections (*pātakānta*). PK AS 19 bear mention of "aspects" or "items intended to oppose anger:

pärweſſe klautke māntalñentse wrāntsaitse "the first aspect opposed to malice [vyāpādapratipakṣa]" PK AS 19.18 b3).

- This numbering extends to at least to nine. Now this numbering is problematic insofar as in the YL, which here follows a fairly widespread system, it is the exercise on the *maitrī* as a whole that is the counter-agent to malevolence (*vyāpāda*). One can then formulate two hypotheses: either the Tocharian text has developed a series of exercises against malevolence that goes beyond the traditional framework of meditation manuals, or it is a simple numbering of the exercise on *maitrī*. Unfortunately, the fragment are very poorly preserved, but we have a fragment that points to the second alternative:

/// *klautkentsa tsänkoſ māntalñe wīkāssi se o/tu - lle poſa - ſāmna skwas(s)o(nt) –*
"to eliminate malevolence arisen according to *x*-aspects ... (the north is filled?)
with completely happy men." (PK AS 19.18 a4)

- Hence the Tocharian version of these meditation exercises present many several features that point to the development of Kucheian tradition of meditation texts.

• **II.4 *Prabhahu*, an evidence for translation ?**

/// *(tu)meṃ prabhahu tārkanalle kelene* ///
"Then one must eject *prabhahu*, into the navel". (IOL Toch 158 a6)

- This passage should be a translation of one of the most frequent formulas in the Sanskrit YL where the yogin ejects streams from his navel:

nābhyāś cāsyā puṣpapravāho niḥsṛtaḥ caturdhā gacchati "from his navel comes out a stream of flowers and goes in the four directions" (YL 131 V2)

ante sarvaṃ nābhyāṃ nirudhyate "In the end everything disappears into his navel" (YL 129R5)

- Therefore, it is likely that behind *prabhahu* lies the Sanskrit *pravāha* "flow," which is translated as *tsarāk(k)o* in the other texts (PK AS 19.5 b1; THT 566 a8). But such a form for a borrowing from Sanskrit is quite anomalous, since from *pravāha*, one would expect in TB ***pravāh*, ***prāvah*, or possibly ***prāwa(h)* if one assumes a form completely adapted to Tocharian phonology. Several alternatives: 1) A reading error? 2) a loan from a Middle Indic form of *pravāha* ?
- The graphic explanation is less convincing. As for the Middle Indic explanation, it is interesting to note that in most Middle Indic languages, aspirated consonants, including *bh*, generally end in *-h-* in intervocalic position (99-100 [§184-191]; Pischel 1900, 137 [§188]) whereas *-v-* is, depending on the language, preserved or replaced by a hiatus (Hinüber 2001, 109 [§215]). Nevertheless, in Gāndhārī, *-bh-* yields a consonant that is written *-vh-* /β/, as in *prabhā* > *pravha* or *-prava*, and there are several examples of confusion between *-bh-* and *-v-* in Gilgit manuscripts, such as *pratibhiratā* for *prativiratā*, *dharmavāṇaka* for *dharmabhāṇaka* (Hinüber 2001, 101 [§191]). Hence such confusion suggests a northwest Indian origin. This is further confirmed by the final vowel of *prabhahu*, since in Gāndhārī, the final vowel of the

nominative singular of the thematic declension results in a weak vowel /ə/, most often noted as -u or -o.

- In Tocharian this cannot be a phonetic borrowing. First because the /β/ of the Gāndhārī should have been rendered as -w- or -p- in Tocharian, and second because there are no other instances to my knowledge of words that would have retained the spelling of the final vowel /ə/ of Middle Indian words. This form suggests a Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit *prabhahu*, and hence a written transmission of Sanskrit text written in the North-West of India.
- Despite this counter-example, it is remarkable that the Tocharian texts show a higher degree of variation in their phraseology than one would expect from texts translated or adapted from a Sanskrit original: they thus seem to be the result of their own local development and to emanate from a specific meditation tradition. But, it is not excluded that some of these novelties in comparison to the YL are to be explained by translations of other texts from northwest India. In order to try to distinguish between these two alternatives, it is necessary to study in detail the content and images of the texts. We will hence study whether they can be interpreted as a development from the Skt. texts we have, or they deal with radically new themes and images.

III. Kuchean development of the YL: a close reading of leaves 80-84 of PK AS 19

- Most of the texts are either too fragmentary or too short to make general statements. Nevertheless one of them is worth mentioning, because it presents an exercise that has been omitted in the *Yogalehrbuch*. It is THT 567 which fortunately contains the title of the exercise "recollection of liberality" (*tyāgānusmṛti*). The existence of this exercise is intriguing because it has been excluded from the list of recollections in the YL, or has been moved contrary to the usual order.
- The longest preserved Tocharian text consists of five successive leaves, PK AS 19.21, 19.6, 19.5, 19.22, and 19.1 (separately edited by Pinault in CEToM), which correspond to leaves 80 to 84 of the manuscript PK AS 19. Thanks to the repetitive character of the text, one can however have a general idea of its content, even if certain points remain difficult to elucidate.

III.1 Visit of the underground and the human world

[x b6] ·r· su – (–) – – – – – – – – – – ke l· (ai)ś(a)mñ(e)ṣṣ(e) ke – (re)ki takoy te – ke(ṃ)
tal(p)im – p· ///

[19.21 a1] ·ṃ – k· – ·e – – – – – – – – wermem k/nai (–) pi – t/ne kn· – – et(t)e preti mäskem(trä)
klereṣṣa kem – – ///

[a2] ta – – (l)kāṣṣām • tumem ette we – – nme • tum(em) ette nrainta ok(t) o· ·e m· ·s· y(·)ai p(·)iṣṣe
me – ś(a)k ṣk/t· rä – – ///

(kāncanaca)_[a3]kkārṣṣa ke(ṃ) t(ā)_u telpām tusa ñor war warsa ñor ye(n)t(e) ce – tumem ·em – l· •
tumem lkāṣṣām ka· skw(a)ss(ot) ///

(*śtṵwāra tma*)_[a4]*ne kwārsarwa orotstse śtṵwāra tmane kwārsarwa wartse • tumem kauc sumer šale –
– n· n· – ššem šale· – – ·em l· ///*

[a5] *k(u)s)e omte onolmi lwāsa cenām lkāššām || űake śtṵwāra dvipanmaššem onol(m)em – – – ·e – – ši
o – – ///*

(*aparagodānīye*)_[b1]*ššaṃts kraitara-rūpām uttaragaurapāššemts śtwer kautkem rup{ām} orocci
kektseñtsa : (– – – – –) ///*

[x b6] ... the ... of wisdom ... let the word be: "May I cross the earth ..."

[19.21 a1] ... having ... there are below pretas. The clay soil ...

[a2] ... he sees. Then, below Then below the eight hells ... ten ...

[a3] He crosses the earth [forming] a golden circle. Then below that, [the disk] of water; below [the
disk] of water, the [disk of] wind ... Then ... Then he sees ... happy (?) ...

[a4] ... elevated by (four) myriads [= 40,000] leagues, wide by four myriads [= 40,000] leagues.
Then upward, Mount Sumeru ... the mountains of ...

[a5] He sees the men [and] the beasts that [are] in that place. Now [he sees] the men of the four
continents ...

[b1] Among [the inhabitants] of the Aparagodānīya, [the beings] have circular faces. Among [the
inhabitants] of the Uttarakuru, [the beings] have quadrangular faces [and are] physically tall [lit.
according to the body].

Comments

- The beginning of the text fits well with something we know in the Sanskrit YL, when the yogin sends streams to the lowest point of the world:

*tasm(āt pravāho nirgataḥ) pṛthivīmaṇḍalaṃ bhivā narakāṃ pretā(m)ś cāvabh(āsyā
pṛthivīmaṇḍalaṃ bhiv āpmaṇḍalaṃ vāyumaṇḍalam ākāsadhātum avabhāsyā*

"Von diesem geht ein Strom aus, durchbricht den Erdkreis, erleuchtet die Höllen und
die Gespenster[welten], durchbricht die Goldscheiben, erleuchtet den Wasserkreis, den
Windkreis und das Element Äther" (YL 129 R1-3 ; Schlingloff 1964, 88).

- This motif corresponds to the beginning of the *abhiṣeka* "consecration" in the Yogalehrbuch, when, o, the model of the royal consecration the yogin's body is filled with waters to signify that he has reached a state of purity. Usually in the YL, at the beginning of this motif, the yogin first sends water down to the world, then up to the world which finally comes to fill his body (for the *maitrī*, YL 146R6-147V1, Schlingloff 1964, 132). But if the first two lines of this part agree with the YL, lines a4-b1 have no parallel: the Tocharian text seems to complete the Sanskrit with a full description of the world.

III.2 Drinking of the flower essence

[b2]-sa yatsi prayokānta weñau • ñake päpāna kektseñī sār sārśa taṣṣallona — — — k_use — ·l· mäkte kau(c) ///

(ya)_[b3]maṣälle cwi no kos raittse ysāṣṣa āśce tūne kauc pals(k)o yal(l)e— (tä)ñtsi s· — — — — ///

[b4] — ñi — (kauc) yatsi 2 || ñake ys(ā)ṣṣa kunti yneś yamasträ • — — — n· tu ña s· — — ·e r·ā — — — — ///

[b5] <o>ṣ· (— ṣe)me päken(e) — -li tāṣälya kelesa wat y(ä)l(l)ontsa — — parna tärk(a)n(a)ll(ya) ///

[19.6 a1] — <au>ṣṣe (— —) — — v· mal(k)we<r k(u)>ṣalle (tso)r<y>(iṃ)ne lyautai(ṃ)<ne> k<uṣal(l)e tu(meṃ) kek(t)señe tākaṃ (ite) — — — — — t· —> ///

[a2] — — (—) kelesa malkwer tūne prukāṣṣalle tumeṃ uppā<l>-(pyāpyo) pākri mäs(ketār tuk pa)<lsko>(ne yamaṣṣalle) ///

(tu)_[a3]meṃ ma(n)t palskone yamaṣ(ṣ)älle • pyapyaiṣṣana śukenta ñi (āline kārpoyeṃ) ///

[a4] -ytār-ñ pälskoṣṣa ṣpā • cai kreñc on<o>lmi pelaiknenta aiksante śārsāre • — ///

(kmu)_[a5]tāntameṃ k_use wriyana pyapyainmeṃ : k_use tune śukenta po ñi āline kārpo(yeṃ) ///

[...]

[a3] k<a>(r)p<o>yeṃ tū päst yokalle 2 || tumeṃ stwāra dhyananmaṣṣ(ana śukenta ñi a)line (kārpoyeṃ tu päst yokalle 3)

(|| tumeṃ stwāra ompalsko)_[a4]ñeṃntaṣṣe śuke cek yāknesa mäkt<e nau(ṣ)> 4 || tumeṃ okt wimokṣāntaṣṣe ś(uke ñi) (ā)l(y)ine (kārpo) ///

[a5] ñake pratīyasamutpātāṣṣana śukenta karsoym yośim ce_u kreṃnt pel(aikneṣṣe malkwer) ///

[b2] I will explain the exercises to go by.... Now one should place stinking bodies on top of each other ... which ... like upwards ...

[b3]... It is necessary to do it until certainly (?) [his] head [is] golden. One should raise one's mind within ... until ...

[b4] ...to go upward 2. Now he imagines before his eyes a golden vessel. ...

[b5] ... In the first part, one should place the ... It should be emitted through the navel or through the openings of the senses/the pores ...

[19.6 a1] ... Milk should be poured ... it should be poured into the apertures and holes [of his body]. Then if [his] body becomes (full), [it should be emitted]...

[a2] ... milk should be poured out of the navel into this [a basin?]. Then (a flower) of lotus appears; (one should apply) [one's] attention to it...

[a3] Then one should bring to [one's] mind [*manasikr-*] [the following wishes]: "[May] the juices of the flowers (descend into) my (palm). ...

[a4] and ... may the ... of my mind be These good beings knew and understood the law ...

[a5] [all the juices that are drawn] from the water flowers, from the lotus, all the juices [that are] inside, let them descend into my palm...".

[b1] Then all the remedies and juices should be brought down into [one's] palm, and one should [drink them]. The body ...

[...]

[a3] that [the juices] of ... go down. One should drink it completely. 2. Then let (the juices) of the four dhyāna (descend into my) palm. (One should [drink them] completely. 3.)

(Then) [a4] [for] the juice of the (four) [higher = *samāpatti?*] meditations, one should do as before.

[a4] Then (may) the juice of the eight liberations [*vimokṣa*] (descend) into (my) palm.

[a5] May I now understand and drink the juices of the *pratītyasamutpāda* [and] this [milk?] of the Good Law ...

Comments

- From 19.21 b2 onwards, a new part begins, since the author of the treatise intervenes to indicate that he is going to explain a new type of exercise: *-sa yatsi prayokānta weñau* "I am going to explain to you the exercises to go with". So probably this is a new part, because in the YL it is exclusively in the transitions between the different ones that the term *prayoga* intervenes, as in *ato 'nantaraṃ dhātuyogaḥ yogaśāstropadiṣṭo 'nusartavyaḥ iha tu prayogamātraṃ darśayiṣyāmaḥ* (YL 128 R3). But what is troubling is that the verb *yatsi* "to go," cannot correspond to any of the exercises listed in the YL. Unfortunately the beginning of the sentence is truncated, and this is what makes the interpretation of the text difficult. I will return to this problem later.
- After this introduction, the next part can be divided into two sections: first a sequence of various actions to be performed by the yogin, who has to start by piling up putrid bodies, then filling his body with milk. A flower then appears. The second section is much longer, but very repetitive: in this one, the treatise tells the yogin that he must make a wish that the juice (*śuke*) of this flower (sometimes the plural is used) will descend into his palm and he must drink it. This juice represents several elements of Buddhist doctrine, such as *pratītyasamutpāda*, the eight liberations (*vimokṣa*), etc.
- This passage is very interesting because it is difficult to find a parallel in the YL and it points to the fact that the Tocharian text presents something new compared to the tradition transmitted in Sanskrit, for while the text does indicate that it is something to be imagined by the yogin, it has a strong ritualistic component. TB *śuke* is the regular correspondent of Sanskrit *rasa* in all its meanings "taste; juice; essence". Hence *pyapyaiṣṣe śuke* "juice of flower" should correspond to *puṣparasa*, and indeed, we find this compound twice in the YL, see the first occurrence:

/// *sarvāṃś ca satvāṃ nārakāṃ paśyati | puṣparasadhārābhiḥ siṃcyamānān* ///
"He sees all the beings of the underworld. Sprinkled with flower essence" (YL 149R2-3; ed. Schlingloff 1964, 140).

- Elsewhere, there is the idea of a stream coming back from the sky with the essence of the four *dhyāna*:

tato bhrumadhye cittopanibandhaḥ [...] mūrdhnā nirgaty āvyucchinnaṃ yāvad aghaniṣṭhāṃ devān avabhāsyā cat(u)r(dh)yānārasam ādāya mūrdhnā punaḥ praviśati |

"Dann [erfolgt] die Konzentration des Geistes auf den Mittelpunkt zwischen den Brauen [...] Ein [Strom] geht durch das Haupt aus, leuchtet ungeteilt bis zu den Aghaniṣṭha-Göttern und tritt mit der Essenz der vier Versenkungssphären wieder durch das Haupt ein" (YL 129 R1-4 ; Schlingloff 1964, 88 : voir aussi Or.15002/28 R2, éd. Hartmann 2006, 320)

- The compound *puṣparasa* and the Tocharian *pyapyaiṣṣana śukenta* "the juices of flowers" compound can just be understood as simply the juice or an infusion made from a lotus flower. But, since we have seen that the beginning of the text seems to signal a sequence of consecration, it is interesting to point out that among the liquids prescribed for "anointing" the king in the ritual of royal consecration in the Vedic texts, we find honey, which is called essence of flowers:

apām oṣadhīnāṃ rasa iti madhunaḥ

"17. Honey: "Ye are the sap of the waters, of the plants" (*Apastamba śrautasūtra*, 18, 13, 18; tr. Heesterman 1957, 85).

- This meaning "honey" for *puṣparasa* is quite appropriate for the other attestation of *puṣparasa* in the YL, which also falls under a sequence of *abhiṣeka* because all the liquids listed come to fill the yogin's body:

tasmāt puṣpa-rasa-nadyaḥ kṣīra-ghṛta-navanīta-nadyaḥ nānā-varṇa-ratna-nakṣatra-candra-maṇḍala-nadyaḥ pravilīnā y(o)gācārā(śrayaṃ pūrayanti)

"Aus diesem [= mountain filled with the essence of four colors] [kommen] Blumenessenzflüsse, Milch-, Butterschmalz-, und Butterflüsse und Flüsse aus Edelsteinen in verschiedenen Farben, aus Sternen und Mondscheiben [hervor und] (erfüllen) zerschmelzend (die Gestalt) des Yogin. "(YL 130 R3-4; ed. and tr. Schlingloff 1964, 91).

- These other products are found among the liquids used to anoint the king during the *abhiṣeka*:

viśvabhṛta iti payasaḥ. anabhṛta iti dadhnaḥ. agnestejasyā iti ghṛtasya

"14. milk : "Ye are all-supporters" ; 15. curd "Ye are supporters of men" ; 16. ghee "Ye have the brilliance of Agni" (Ap 18,13, 15-17 ; tr. Heesterman 1957, 85).

- The very idea of a liquid embodying the essence of the good and truth coming down from the sky and which must be drunk, recalls the consumption of ambrosia and soma. See for example how Gonda describes the symbolism of Soma:

"Soma was considered the best of beverages and often (presumably also because it had replaced the old mead, which was prepared from honey) was called honey: like it, it is the essence of all plant juices. [...] But it is especially the juice that prolongs life, the elixir of life (amṛtam) that the gods need as much as men: *yāsya te dyumnāvat páyaḥ pávamānābhṛtaṃ divāḥ téna no mṛḷa jīvāse'* Soma that decants, whose sparkling milk has been brought from heaven, grant us life' (9, 66, 30)" (Gonda 1979, 83).

- For the mention of the hand, see also:

*yuvābhyāṃ devī dhiṣāṇā mādāya
tāv aśvinā bhadrastā supānī
apsú*

*īndrāgnī sómam uśatī sunoti
ā dhāvatam mādhunā pṛṅktām*

For you two, o Indra and Agni, for your exhilaration, the goddess, the Holy Place, eagerly presses the soma. / You two, o Aśvins, with your auspicious hands and lovely palms—rinse it with honey, infuse it in the waters. (RV I, 101, 4 ; Jamison and Brereton, 257)

- Of course, I do not claim that this passage is designed according the *R̥gveda*, but it could be a distant echo of its symbolic world. An intermediary is yet to be found.

III.3 Visit to the worlds of the gods

(e)_[19.5 b1] *piñte pārwāne palsko (s)t(amā)ṣle : tumem mālkwērṣṣa tsarāko tārkanalya kauss(i) ///*

_[b2] *tṣa śtwer lāntāṃṣa warñai yātalñentasa karsatsi ñāṣṣalle || tumem tapatriśne (palsko aśalle) ///*

(yama)_[b3] *ṣ(a)lle || tumem yāmne palsko aśalle • k_ase omp ñāktem(ts) — — yā(talñenta karsatsi ñāṣṣalle 3 || tumem tuṣitne palsko aśalle •) ///*

[...]

_[19.22 a3] *kektse(ñ) lkāṣṣā(m) pārweṣṣe dhyānne tarya ykenta skente • tumem n(ano) kau(c yamaṣā)lya t/kāñ-i*

_[a4] *nta tumem nano kauc yalle trice dhyānāśc omte pwi-yok takarṣke lkātsi omte (tarya ykenta skente) ///*

(cā)_[a5] *ñicare lkātsi tarya ykenta • te tāñtsi prathagjani yanem • tumem mante śuddhavāsānta(ne) ///*

_[b1] *mā no tūne trenkaskenträ • n(ai)vasa(m)jñāṃṣa warñai //*

[b1] One should establish his mind between the two eyebrows. Then one should eject [through this place] a stream of milk to pour it ...

[b2] one should seek to understand ... through the powers to the four kings [of the directions]. Then [one should lead one's mind] to the thirty-three gods [Trāyastriṃśa].

[b3] One should do Then one should lead one's mind to [the gods] Yama. The powers ... of the gods that are there, (one should seek to) understand [them]. 3. Then one should lead one's mind to [the gods of] Tuṣita) ...

[...]

[a3] He sees [his] body In the first dhyāna, there are three regions [those of Brahmakāyika, Brahmāpurohita, and Mahābrahmā]. Then one should raise the ...

[a4] Then again he has to go upwards to the third dhyāna. There [all] that is seen is clear [*prasanna*], light blue. There [there are three regions [that of the Śubhakṛtsna, the Aprāmaṇasubha, and the Parīttasubha)] ...

[a5][It is pleasant to see [these] three regions. The common men go only so far. Then higher up, among the Śuddhāvāsa [the skies associated with the 4th dhyāna] ...

[b1] But they do not attach themselves to that [the dhyāna of the formless world]. [It is so] until the dhyāna of neither perception nor non-perception [naivasamjñānāsamjñāyatana].

Comments

- While we have seen that the text seems to initiate a ritual of consecration, after the absorption of the "flower juices", the text returns to the yogin and enjoins him to concentrate on the point between his two eyebrows, and to streams of milk, which is quite normal and have many parallel in the YL, such as:

*tato bhrumadhye cittopanibandhaḥ [...] mūrdhnā nirgaty āvyucchinnaṃ yāvad
aghaniṣṭhāṃ devān avabhāsyā cat(u)r(dh)yānārasam ādāya mūrdhnā punaḥ praviśati |*

"Dann [erfolgt] die Konzentration des Geistes auf den Mittelpunkt zwischen den Brauen [...] Ein [Strom] geht durch das Haupt aus, leuchtet ungeteilt bis zu den Aghaniṣṭha-Göttern und tritt mit der Essenz der vier Versenkungssphären wieder durch das Haupt ein" (YL 129 R1-4 ; Schlingloff 1964, 88 : voir aussi Or.15002/28 R2, éd. Hartmann 2006, 320)

- One should not however that usually the stream to the bottom of the world before ascending the sky. But what is more striking is that the text takes an unprecedented turn from the YL, in that the yogin visits all the groups of gods one by one. On this point, we can clearly see how the text develops what is contained in one formula in the Sanskrit text.

III.4 The *kuśa* grass and the four *dhyāna*

[1st *dhyāna*] [19.22 a3] *tumeṃ ṅake śtwāra dhyananma bhavi- ///*

[b2] *rmeṃ askācānā yneś yamastrā pārśai pre<man>e <k>aum-pirkoś nauṣ toṃ • yamastrā yne(ś)
///*

[b3] *ywārś(k)ane makte – ṣaṃ • śār śārsa as(k)āci • taṣallona mā stauk(k)atsi (– – – –) [n] – ///*

[b4] – (*pārwe*)ṣṣe *dh(yanmaṣṣa)na paramāṇunt(a) y(neś) yamaṣāllona • tumeṃ ke- – – – – – – – –
///*

[b5] – (– –) *n· tūne p(a)<l(sk)o> (ya)m(a)ṣāl(le) k_s(e) o(mp) wā(antarwa) t· – w/l· – mo (–) – – – – –
– – ///*

[2nd *dhyāna*] [19.1 a1] (–) *ālyaucesa śār (ā)ly(auce) <t(a)ṣ(a)l(le) – (–) – rā – we m· – (–) – – – – – – – –
– – > ///*

[a2] *ll<au> – meṃ ṣpel pinaṣl(e) tum<(eṃ) s· m· k· m(a) k(au)c –> ·y·tār tumeṃ śtwār(a)
dhyananma) ///*

(*ysāṣṣa caknik pākri yama*)_[a3]*ṣly(a) tr(ai)-ppewāññ(a) tune wace dhyanaṣṣana paramāṇunta ///*

(*kektse*)_[a4]ñe ïte tākam-ne kelesa parna tārkanalle *kuse omp wā(n)t(arwa)* ///

[3rd *dhyāna*] (*a*)_[a5]skāci • *pwi yokāññana yamaṣṣāllona • tumem po päst tsapanallona • ///*

(*śu*)_[b1]kenta *yam(ast)rā • wars(a) śār ywā(r)śk(a)ne śmalle ysāṣṣa caknik pākri yamaṣṣya trai p(p)e(wāñña tune trice dhyanaṣṣana paramāñunta)* ///

_[b2] *kektse(ñ)ne yapāṣāllona ïte tākam nano parna tārkanallona • kelesa ke ///*

[4th *dhyāna*] _[b3] ·e – ·r· *m(ā)ñ(ñ)en(e) askāci arkwin(a) yneś yamaṣṣāllona tu(mem po päst tsapanallona •)* ///

_[b4] *r(a śu)kenta (yneś) yamaṣle warpa(l)le (t)ū (ś)ā(r) śmalle tumem ysāṣṣa caknik (pākri yamaṣṣya)* ///

Then now the development (?) of the four *dhyāna* ...

[1st *dhyāna*] _[b2] having ... he imagines under [his] eyes *kuśa* herbs. Carrying before a torch, toward the East, he imagines them before his eyes ...

_[b3] he ... himself in the middle ... The *kuśa* herbs should be placed on top of each other, so as not to swell ...

_[b4] ... One should imagine before his eyes the atoms of the first *dhyāna*. Then ...

_[b5] ... One should put [one's] mind inside, the things inside ...

[2nd *dhyāna*]... [19.1 a1] one has to [place them] on top of each other ...

_[a2] one should blow a bubble of ..., then ... upwards ... Then the four ...

(A golden) three-footed (*caknik* should be made to appear) _[a3]. Inside, the atoms of the second *dhyāna* ...

_[a4] If one's body is full [of atoms?], one should send forth [them] through the navel. The things that here ...

[3rd *dhyāna*] _[a5] The *kuśa* herbs should be made light blue: then they should be crushed completely

_[b1] ... he makes juices [or: portions]. He should sit in the middle above the water. The golden three-footed *caknik* should be made to appear ...

_{b2]} One should make them [the atoms?] enter the body; if it is full, one should send forth them again, through the navel ...

[4th *dhyāna*] _[b3] One should imagine the *kuśa* herbs (in a pavilion?); then (one should crush them completely.) ...

_[b4] one should imagine the juices, one should receive them; one should sit above it. Then (one should make) the golden *caknik* (appear) ...

Comments

- The last part is much richer, and we seem to return to something more ritual-like and more distant from the YL skt. In fact, one would be at odds to cite an element of the Tocharian text that has a parallel in the Sanskrit text. Nevertheless, as we shall see, it follows the same conceptual structure. By connecting fragments of sentences, one can tentatively reconstitute the process as follows:
 - 1) The yogin conjures up *kuśa* herbs of different colors and grinds them (19.1 a5, b3);
 - 2) stacks the *kuśa* herbs (19.22 b3)/ he stacks ... (19.1 a1); **[hiatus, ½ line?]**
 - 3) he visualizes/obtains juices (? , if restored as (*śu*)*ke*) (19.1 b1), he visualizes/obtains and receives juices (?) (19.1 b4);
 - 4) he has to sit in the middle above (the water [sic], 19.1 b1) and has to bring out the *caknik*- (19. 1 b4)/ the *caknik*-tripod (19.1 b1);
 - 5) (he should put?) inside the atoms of the 2nd *dhyāna* ... (19.1 a3); **[hiatus, less than ½ line]**
 - 6) He brings them (the atoms of *dhyāna*?) into his body (19. 1 b2), when his body is full, they must be ejected through the navel (19.1 b2; a4);
 - 7) one should remember a sentence (19.22 b5) "all things that ..." (19.22 b5; 19.1 a4).
- Meaning of *caknik* (19.1 b1). The word *trai-ppewāññe* "provided with three feet" is probably its epithet. Therefore, it should be probably translated as "three-legged pot/container". Perhaps from Middle Indic **jhāyanīyā* or **jhāyanīkā* 'burner', cf. Pāli *jhāyana*- n. 'burning, cremation'; Lahndā *jhāñī* m. 'cremation ground' (Turner 1966, 297)?
- Enthronement ritual? It is specified at the outset that the yogin should face the East, and it is mentioned that he should sit, and since the *kuśa* herbs are mentioned beforehand, it is possible that they provide his seat. In the royal rite of *abhiṣeka* as described in the Vedic texts, the king also faces east, but he stands, on a tiger skin, the moment when he sits only comes later in a enthronement ceremony (Heesterman 1957, 114). The same elements are found in the Tantric texts, for example in the *Mañjuśrī-mūla-kalpa*:

tataḥ kuśaviṇḍakopaviṣṭaḥ pūrvābhimukhaḥ maṃ + + + .
 "He then sits on a bundle of *kuśa* grass, facing east, looking at the maṇḍala, and remains there for a while" (Vaidya 1964, 35; tr. Macdonald 1962, 132).
- Hence it seems that the whole process we read should be a long ritual of consecration, which is described in the YL as the filling of the meditator's body by diverse liquids that represent the quintessence of Buddhist truths and states of purity. This long sequence definitely answers the question of how these Tocharian texts relate to the YL: the Tocharian text seems to follow the structure of the YL while extending certain parts enormously. Sometimes the relationship between the Tocharian text and the YL is relatively easy to identify, as in the case of the "visit" to the different floors of heaven. Other motifs are thoroughly transformed such as the absorption of flower essence. Finally, there are many details that are totally absent of YL, such as the two elements of the *abhiṣeka* that I just mentioned. But what is most striking; whereas the Sanskrit text presents a series of visions, the Tocharian text seems to describe some kind of mental ritual, the most mysterious part being the last one. Now I will propose some ideas to interpret it.

III.5 The colors of the dhyāna

- Whatever the exact meaning of the ritual, it seems clear that through this process the yogin brings something of the *dhyāna* back into his body. This recalls a part of the sentence we quoted earlier where the YL says that the yogin returns from the highest heaven "with the essence/juice of the dhyāna" :

mūrdhnā nirgaty āvyucchinnaṃ yāvad aghaniṣṭhāṃ devān avabhāsyā

cat(u)r(dh)yānarasam ādāya mūrdhnā punaḥ praviśati |

"Ein [Strom] geht durch das Haupt aus, leuchtet ungeteilt bis zu den Aghaniṣṭha-Göttern und tritt mit der Essenz der vier Versenkungssphären wieder durch das Haupt ein" (YL 129 R3-4; Schlingloff 1964, 88:)

- In a variation on the same formula (of *abhiṣeka*) in the YL, it is said that the yogin sends a stream up to the 4th dhyāna and "separates the colors" (*tadvarṇam evāvasthāpya*) :

+ + + + + *eva pravāhaḥ adho yā(vad vāyumaṇḍalam) ūrdhva(m) yāvaca*

caturthaṃ dhyānam iti tadvarṇam evāvasthāpya punar mūrdhnā praviśya bhruvivarāṃ nirgato dviṭīyaś ca nābhyāḥ sthitim āpū(rayati)

"geht ein Strom abwärts bis zum Windkreis und aufwärts bis zur vierten Versenkungssphäre. Nachdem er deren Farbe abgetrennt hat, tritt er wieder durch das Haupt ein und geht von dem Zwischenraum [zwischen] den Brauen aus [...] (YL 152V1; Schlingloff 1964, 144)

- The meaning of "to separate" for *avasthā-* in the YL is secured by the use of the image of a knife separating the body into several parts (YL 160 V2; V5). Hence in the context of the "colors of dhyāna", one could be understood as analytical work in meditation: the yogin has to picture mentally the colors of the dhyāna one by one, as he seems to be doing in his ascent in the Tocharian text. But the most frequent meaning of causative is "to make hold, fix, establish" in Buddhist texts. If this formula is more or less synonymous with *cat(u)r(dh)yānarasam ādāya*, as the context seems to indicate, we might understand the yogin to "fix" the juice of the dhyāna and bring them into his body. This interpretation would be confirmed by another *abhiṣeka* passage, where the streams of the four colors come to fill the yogin's body:

t(a)taḥ n(ī)lapītalohitāvad(ātāḥ pravāhāḥ) + + + + + gatā āśrayaṃ prīṇayanti

"Dann gehen blaue, gelbe, rote, und weiße (Ströme) ... und beglücken die Gestalt [des Yogins]" (YL 133R4; ed. and tr. Schlingloff 1964, 102; see also: *evam*

suvarṇanīlapītalohitāvadātarasābhiṣekaiḥ YL 145V4).

- Based on the variations in the formula of *abhiṣeka* in YL, one could therefore draw a connection between the formula *caturdhyānarasa ādāya* and the descriptions where the yogin's body is filled with streams or the essence of four colors. To put it more clearly: to each *dhyāna* would correspond a color.
- This hypothesis finds support in the Tocharian text because it assigns a specific color to the dhyāna. But the problem if we want to establish our equation is the color *pwi-yok* is not

attested elsewhere than in this text. But we can find further external support for this hypothesis in Buddhasena's **Yogācārabhūmi* (*Dámóduōluó chán jīng* 達摩多羅禪經)²:

	PK AS 19	<i>Dámóduōluó chán jīng</i> 達摩多羅禪經 (T 618 (XV) 318c-319a)	"Primary colors"
1 ^{er} <i>dhyāna</i>		如鍊真金像 "like a statue of pure and refined gold" (c29)	<i>pīta</i> "yellow"
2 ^e <i>dhyāna</i>		如真珊瑚 "like real coral" (a5)	<i>lohita</i> "red"
3 ^e <i>dhyāna</i>	<i>pwi-yok takarṣke</i> "of pwi color, pure" (PK AS 19.22 a4); <i>pwi-yokāññana yamaṣṣāllona</i> "of pwi color" (PK AS 19.1 a5)	青琉璃, 清淨甚微妙; "blue-green beryl [vaidūrya], pure and wonderfully subtle" (a8)	<i>nīla</i> "dark blue-green"
4 ^e <i>dhyāna</i>	/// (<i>cä</i>)ñcare <i>lkātsi</i> "pleasing to behold" (PK AS 19.22 a5); <i>arkwin(a)</i> "white" (PK AS 19.1 b3)	極淳白 "very pure [and] white" (a13)	<i>avadāta</i> "white"

- A double principle prevails for the assignment of colors to the *dhyāna*: 1) the transposition of "primary" colors into brilliant colors evoking precious materials; 2) the higher one goes, the more translucent the colors are and the closer they are to transparency.
- Therefore, *pwi-yok* must denote a light shade of blue. The monosyllabic nature of the word and the fact that it is a color term (cf. TB *tsem* "blue-green" < EMC. *ts^hey* 青 (> Mandarin *qīng*)) suggests a borrowing from Chinese, perhaps *bì* 碧 "green jade; bluish green, blue" < LMC *piajk* < EMC *piajk* (Pulleyblank 1991, 34), although the phonological equation is far from perfect.³
- Now that it is clear that these "colors" correspond to the four *dhyāna*, therefore it seems that the process described in the Tocharian text, as in the YL *abhiṣeka* cited above, is aimed at integrating something of the nature of the *dhyāna* into one's body. Since this process involves objects and various actions on the part of the yogin, it seems to be modeled on a ritual or a technical process. Since the starting point seems to be the colors of the *dhyāna*, the underlying metaphor is perhaps that of dyeing.

III.5 The identification of the topic

2 Here is the whole passage: 色界相似種, 微妙相顯現; / 深樂求出離, 增進厭患想。 / 有覺亦有觀, 離欲生喜樂; / 寂然入初禪, 內外悉清淨。 / 所依及境界, 如鍊真金像; / 自身處梵世, 於中極娛樂。 / 又見五支相, 身及境界現; / 第二滅覺觀, 內淨心一處。 / 從定生喜樂, 四支身內現; / 所依及境界, 譬如真珊瑚。 / 第三處離喜, 行捨念慧除; / 身受樂三昧, 五支相明了。 / 所依青琉璃, 清淨甚微妙; / 緣少身無量, 諸相次第起。 / 第四斷苦樂, 憂喜先已滅; / 不苦不樂捨, 念淨三摩提。 / 如是四支相, 現身及境界; / 出息入息滅, 所依極淳白。(T 618 (XV) 318c22-319a13).

3 Here I would like to thank Ching Chao-jung for her helpful advices on the problem of *pwi*.

- PK AS 19.8, a leaf that definitely belongs to *maitrī*, is numbered at more than 100, whereas the series of texts we have just studied is numbered from 80 to 84. So this excludes that this exercise is about *maitrī*. The only element that could point to a particular exercise is the very beginning of the text. Here one should fill up stinking bodies:

[b2]-sa yatsi prayokānta weñau • ñake päpana kektseñī śār śārsa taşşallona — — — k_use —
·l· mäkte kau(c) ///

I will explain the exercises to go by.... Now one should place stinking bodies on top of each other ... which ... like upwards ...

- In the YL, the "streams" that the yogin emits are modified according to the object on which he meditates. We could therefore have here a meditation on the impure (*aśubha*) or the *dhātu*. But, one would expect something like **dhatuṣṣana prayokānta weñau* "I will explain the exercises on the dhātu". Now we find this rather enigmatic formula: *-sa yatsi prayokānta weñau* "I will explain the exercises to go ..." (→ **-eṇa itum prayogāni vadiṣyāmi*). The sequence *-sa yatsi* recalls the *raddhisa yatsi* formula "to move with supernatural power" (→ **ṛddhyā itum*), which is the usual formula for magical movement in Tocharian texts, see for example:

*kwri no āñme tākaṃ-ne raddhisa yatsi war nässait yamaṣle iprerne pärsnälle
raddhisa yaṃn*

"But if one has the desire to move in a supernatural way, one [has] to cast [lit. make] a spell over water [and] sprinkle [it] in the sky, [and] one goes in a supernatural way." (PK AS 8C b6-b7; tr. Pinault in CEToM)

- Besides, there are several elements in the text that point to the *abhijñā*, the superhuman powers of the yogin:
 - 1) Description of the gods: the text specifies that the yogin goes to each of these skies to "see the power" (*yātalñe lkātsi*) of these gods. The term used for "power," *yātalñe*, is the regular correspondent of *ṛddhi* or *prātihārya* in TB, both of which refer to the "miracles" that Buddhist saints can perform, see for example: (*ṛddhiprātihārye*)ṇa - *yātalñeṣṣe paryarīsa* (THT 527 b2, cf. Couvreur 1968, 277); *orotstse yāt(al)ñ(e)cci cai yakṣī* "of the Yakṣa with great power [*maharddhika*]"; *ś(tw)er yā(t)alñe ///* "The four [bases] of psychic power [*ṛddhipāda*]" (IOL Toch60 b4). Finally the formula *rāddhiṣṣe yātalñe* corresponds to *ṛddhiprātihārya* in THT 108 b8, cf. Pinault 2008, 167), but in another passage, as it occurs in contexts of mere magical flight, it is probably a double translation of *ṛddhi*: (*m*)*usāt sām rāddhiṣiṃ cam yātlun(eyo)* "he rose by his power of *ṛddhi*" (A 222 b1).
 - 2) The fact that the yogin seems to drag the fine material of *dhyāna* within his body in the last part of the text. This recalls several passage of the *Abhidharmakośa*, where special powers are explained by the ability of ascetics to master the material of the world of fine matter (*rūpadhātu*), which corresponds to the four *dhyāna*:
- The divine eye and the divine ear are "pure material form" [*rupa-prasāda*] in the domain of the meditations (*dhyāna*).

Because of the preparatory practice (prayoga) consisting of meditation (*bhāvanā*) on light (*āloka*) and on sound (*śabda*), i.e., the practitioners relying on the meditations

(*dhyāna*), a subtle and excellent "pure material form" (*rūpaprasāda*)-matter derived from the fundamental material elements (*bhautika*)-of the stage of the meditation that has been taken as basis, is attracted in the eye and the ear of the practitioners, i.e., the eye and ear that are of the realm of desire (ii. 10a). This material form (*rūpa*) constitutes the eye and the ear; it sees and hears; it constitutes what is called divine ear and divine eye. Arising because of matter (*rūpa*) of the stage of the meditations (*dhyāna*), the sense-faculties are divine in the literal sense (*Abhidharmakośa*, VII, 54, Pradhan, 429 ; tr. Sangpö III, 2260).⁴

- As the Tantric text from which this quotation is taken shows, it is considered perfectly possible for ascetics or others to move by magic in Tocharian Buddhism as well as in Buddhism in general. It is therefore theoretically possible that the text proposes a method for obtaining the ability to move by magic, but this is rather problematic if one compares the Tocharian text to the YL or related Chinese texts, because none of these propose worldly goals for the yogin. One could also consider that this formula is to be understood from a symbolic point of view: since the text has just described the lower levels of the world and the continents inhabited by humans, and after the transition marked by *prayokānta*, one finds only gods, it is possible that the formula alludes to the yogin's elevation to the high spheres of the world, which would be conceived as a kind magical flight.
- Thus the link between meditative visions and supernatural power explored by Schlingloff 2015, can be reweven in another way: instead of the representations of supernatural powers originating in the visions of the meditators, we see the supernatural powers integrated into the meditation process itself.

IV Conclusion

One of the most interesting points on which the Tocharian texts can contribute is the interpretation of the visions that the yogin receives. In some part, the text resembles a kind of mental ritual, which is due to the massive use of gerunds but also to the repetitive character of the text. All this seems to mean that we have very controlled visualization exercises here. But nevertheless, the verbs designating the view remain in the present indicative tense, as if the yogin was passively receiving the visions.

References

Gonda, Jan. 1962. *Les Religions de l'Inde , 1 : Védisme et hindouisme ancien*. Translated by Laurent Jospin. Paris: Payot.

4 Actually this a translation, through La Vallée Poussin, of the Chinese translation of Xuanzang: 論曰。此言唯因天眼耳根。即四靜慮所生淨色。謂緣光聲修加行故。依四靜慮於眼耳邊引起彼地微妙大種所造淨色眼耳二根。見色聞聲名天眼耳。(T 1558 (XXIX) 144c9-10). The Sanskrit is slightly different: *dhyānasamāpanasya śabdālokābhogaprayogeṇa dhyānabhūmikāni bhūtāny upādāya rūpaprasādau nirvartete cakṣuḥśrotasāmantake rūpasabdyaor darśanaśravaṇaḥetū iti dhyānabhūmikavāt divye eva te cakṣuḥśrotre*.

Hartmann, Jens-Uwe. 1996. "Neue Fragmente aus dem 'Yogalehrbuch.'" In *Festschrift Dieter Schlingloff: zur Vollendung des 65. Lebensjahres dargebracht von Schülern, Freunden und Kollegen*, edited by Friedrich Wilhelm, 127–35. Reinbek: Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München.

———. 2006. "Neue Fragmente aus dem 'Yogalehrbuch.'" In *Ein buddhistisches Yogalehrbuch, Unveränderter Nachdruck der Ausgabe von 1964 unter Beigabe aller seither bekannt gewordenen Fragmente*, edited by Jens-Uwe Hartmann and H.-J. Röllicke, 309–18. München: Iudicium.

Heesterman, Johannes Cornelius. 1957. *The Ancient Indian Royal Consecration: The Rājasūya Described According to the Yajus Texts and Annotated.* 'S-Gravenhage: Mouton.

Hinüber, Oskar von. 2001. *Das ältere Mittelindisch im Überblick.* 2., Erweiterte Auflage. Wien: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften.

Jamison, Stephanie W., and Joel P. Brereton. 2014. *The Rigveda: The Earliest Religious Poetry of India.* Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press.

Lodrö Sangpo. 2012. *Abhidharmakośa-Bhāṣya of Vasubandhu: The Treasury of the Abhidharma and Its (Auto) Commentary.* Translated into French by Louis de La Vallée Poussin ; Annotated English Translation by Gelong Lodrö Sangpo ; with a New Introduction by Bhikkhu KL Dhammajoti. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass.

Pulleyblank, Edwin G. 1991. *Lexicon of Reconstructed Pronunciation in Early Middle Chinese, Late Middle Chinese and Early Mandarin.* Vancouver: UBC Press.

Macdonald, Ariane. 1962. *Le maṇḍala du Mañjuśrīmūlakalpa.* Paris: A. Maisonneuve.

Sadakata, Akira. 1997. *Buddhist cosmology: philosophy and origins.* Tokyo: Kōsei.

Sander, Lore. 1968. *Paläographisches zu den Sanskrithandschriften der Berliner Turfansammlung.* Steiner.

Schlingloff, Dieter. 1964. *Ein buddhistisches Yogalehrbuch.* Berlin: Akademie Verlag.

———. 2015. *Die übermenschlichen Phänomene: visuelle Meditation und Wunderscheinung [sic] in buddhistischer Literatur und Kunst : ein religionsgeschichtlicher Versuch.* Düsseldorf: EKÖ-Haus der Japanischen Kultur e.V.

Yamabe, Nobuyoshi. 1999a. "The Significance of the 'Yogalehrbuch' for the Investigation into the Origin of Chinese Meditation Texts." *Buddist Culture* 9: 1–74.

———. 1999b. "The Sūtra on the Ocean-like Samādhi of the Visualization of the Buddha: The Interfusion of the Chinese and Indian Cultures in Central Asia as Reflected in a Fifth Century Apocryphal Sūtra." PhD. Dissertation. Yale University.

———. 2006. "Fragments of the Yogalehrbuch in the Pelliot Collection." In *Ein Buddhistisches Yogalehrbuch, Unveränderter Nachdruck Der Ausgabe von 1964 Unter Beigabe Aller Seither Bekannt Gewordenen Fragmente*, edited by Jens-Uwe Hartmann and H.-J. Röllicke, 325–41. München: Iudicium.