



**HAL**  
open science

## “ Connected by the ties of blood ”: Musical Scales in the Quest for the Russian/Asian Identity

Adalyat Issiyeva

### ► To cite this version:

Adalyat Issiyeva. “ Connected by the ties of blood ”: Musical Scales in the Quest for the Russian/Asian Identity. *Revue du CEES : Centre européen d'études slaves*, 2013, *L'imaginaire slave dans la culture, la société et le langage. Imaginaire collectif slave et construction identitaire.*, 2. hal-03355050

**HAL Id: hal-03355050**

**<https://hal.science/hal-03355050v1>**

Submitted on 29 Nov 2021

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

Copyright

## « Connected by the ties of blood »: Musical Scales in the Quest for the Russian/Asian Identity

Par Adalyat Issiyeva

Publication en ligne le 03 juillet 2013

### Résumé

---

Cet article s'intéresse à la manière dont les musicologues russes ont créé différents mythes raciaux au sujet de l'utilisation des gammes musicales en Asie et en sont venus à la conclusion que certains éléments musicaux asiatiques ou aryens faisaient partie intégrante de l'identité musicale russe. Me basant sur les traités théoriques de Sokal'skii, Famintsyn et Petr qui affirment l'existence d'un lien entre les cultures russe et asiatique/aryenne, je défends l'idée que ces traités de la fin du dix-neuvième siècle reflètent l'idéologie de l'aryanisme et du mouvement des *vostotchniki* (orientalistes). Bien que les deux idéologies ne semblent pas porter un message ouvertement politique, elles ont des conséquences profondément politiques en ce qu'elles entretiennent des sentiments nationalistes et renforcent la croyance en la légitimité de l'avancée de la Russie vers l'est.

### Mots-Clés

---

Identité, Aryanisme, Asianisme, théorie musicale, relations culturelles, politique.

---

Table des matières

## Introduction

1. Asianism and Russian identity
2. Myth of Russia's connection to the Aryan world
3. Petr Petrovich Sokal'skii and Russian folk music
4. Famintsyn and Russian melody
5. Viacheslav Petr's theory
6. Conclusion

## Texte intégral

### Introduction

After a humiliating defeat in the Crimean War (1853-56) the tsarist government temporarily withheld its activity in the Balkans and the Middle East and decided to strengthen its presence in Central Asia [1]. In the late 1860s and early 1870s the Bukharian, Kokanese, and Khiva khanates, Russia's southern neighbours, became coveted objects of imperial attention and by the end of the 1870s most of this Central Asian territory was under a different type of Russian control. Out of the three large Central Asian khanates, one (Kokand) had been entirely absorbed and the other two (Bukhara and Khiva) survived as truncated Russian protectorates. Only a few of the Turkmen tribes, living on the northern borders of Iran, and free from incursions by centralized powers, remained immune to Russian influence, but for less than a decade. Irritated by British economic-political interests growing beyond the northern borders of Iran, and troubled by the weakened position of Russia in the Turkmen steppes, occasioned by the Russo-Turkish War (1877-8), the Russians first crushed the nomads of the desert north of Persia and then annexed the entire Merv oasis (1884) [2].

Conquering the land entailed another, probably much more important and decisive task – that of conquering the hearts and minds of the subjugated peoples [3]. Both Russian and Soviet, as well as Western scholars, have pointed out that the pattern of Russia's colonial policy was different from that of Western Europe. Nineteenth-century Russian scholarly discourse on *inorodtsy* often reveals a humane, even generous, attitude towards indigenous peoples, urging them to improve their daily living conditions [4]. Few distinctions were made between natives and Russians in everyday life: many poor Russian peasants worked for rich native landowners. In Russia, such power relationships were not

considered to undermine colonial politics [5]. This particular situation arose due to a set of special instructions issued by the 1865 Steppe Commission, which recognized the Turkestan native peoples as « rural dwellers » of the empire, thereby granting them equality with the emancipated Russian rural population [6]. With the establishment of the colony, certain rights of the Turkestan peoples were preserved: freedom of religious observance, customary and written practices in all marriages, properties and family affairs, freedom from physical punishment, and freedom from conscription [7].

The favourable policies towards the Asian local population were a result of Russia's century-long history of interaction with oriental « others » living either in geographical proximity with Russians or within Russian borders. Unlike European colonies, Russia's others did not live across vast oceans; they rather shared a common land and history with the Russians, which resulted in the incorporation of a number of Asian linguistic and cultural features into Russian identity. Many members of the non-Russian elite were readily absorbed into Russian nobility [8]. As a consequence, Russia's colonization of its immediate neighbours did not cause a clear-cut mental/geographical/cultural separation between the imperialistic West and the subjugated East [9]. For this reason, in the eyes of the Western European community, even at the end of the nineteenth century, Russia was still viewed as « Asiatic ». In *The Heart of Asia* published in 1899, two prominent English orientalist, Francis Skrine and Edward Ross, expressed a common European view of Russians as people internally connected to Asians with « ties of blood ». Skrine and Ross believed that Russia's success in its « civilizing mission » in the East was facilitated by the Russian system's distinct contrast with the English judicial and executive system of administration and by « latent and unconscious sympathy » between the conquerors and conquered [10]. Russians were able to rebuild and control the region because this mutual sympathy « rendered the task of government easy and assured its stability [11] ». Interestingly enough, at the end of their book Skrine and Ross underline a few features that they believed were fundamental to the Russian nation. These include a strong « Oriental strain », low standards of comfort, and social etiquette with a « tinge of barbarism [12] ». Similarly, authors writing from the perspective of Russian Eurasianist ideology positioned Asian « Turanian » (that is nomadic, and, hence, « barbarian ») roots as vital in the formation of the Russian nation [13].

The writings of the Western scholars as well as Russian Eurasianists raise many questions. To begin, how did some Russians come to embrace the Asian identity so passionately at the beginning of the twentieth century? Next, what historical/cultural/musical elements did Russian writers choose to represent their national identity? Furthermore, was the scholarly study of subject peoples different in Russia than in other imperialistic nations? As Jann Pasler has pointed out, late-nineteenth-century French discourse on exotic scales and

instruments seemed to be connected to the colonial discourse of evolution, racial difference, and European superiority [14]. How did Russian music writers negotiate the elements of their not-quite-European and, as some argued, not-quite-Asian identity? Did Russian music writers talk about racial difference/similarity in the music of Russian and newly conquered/acquired Asian people?

In this paper, I will follow up Russian discussions about the provenance of Russian music and consider theoretical treatises that claim a link between Russian and Asian or Aryan cultures on the basis of the analysis of musical scales [15]. In my analysis of Russian late-nineteenth-century works on the provenance of Russian folk music I develop Pasler's argument and suggest that the myth of Russian musical identity closely affiliated with the Asian or Aryan not only helped to defend Russia's place in Europe and feed its national pride. « Finding » Russian Asian or Aryan cultural heritage served to the Empire's expansionist ends in Central Asia at the end of the nineteenth century and validated the colonial actions in the Far East at the beginning of the twentieth century.

## 1. Asianism and Russian identity

To understand why and how Russian musicians created and promoted myths about Russian-Asian cultural connections, it is important to address the ideology of two interrelated intellectual currents that shaped late-nineteenth-century Russian self-identity and musical literature. The first is Aryanism and the second is the « Easterners » or « Asianists » movement (called *Vostochniki*). According to Marlene Laruelle, in the Russian context, Aryanism arose in the mid-nineteenth century as a reaction by Russian intellectuals against German and French ideas about Russia's affiliation with the « Turanian » (nomadic) world. Nineteenth-century Russian thinkers used the connection to Scythians, Russia's eastern neighbours who originated from Central Asia, to prove Russia's Aryan historical and cultural legacy. Paradoxically, the proximity of Asia inspired the Russians to imagine they were more European than the West itself. Unlike German and French writers, who defined Aryanism as racial category, Russians considered Aryanism in the cultural-linguistic terms. As Marlene Laruelle argues, Russians did not develop racial or anti-Semitic ideas of western-European Aryanism and never denied the essential equality of man [16]. Although, as Nathaniel Knight points out, Russian Aryanism « was not a political or intellectual movement in any conventional sense », and none of the Russian music theorists identified themselves as Aryanists, the idea of Russia's musical affiliation with Aryan race was seriously considered and for few decades dominated theoretical discussions about the scale structure [17].

The followers of Asianism also claimed Russia's Aryan legacy, but they possessed a more Asiatic vision of Russian identity [18]. Although the idea about Asian identity had been pronounced in Russian literature earlier in the century, the Asianist current appeared after the 1878 Congress of Berlin, which humiliated Russia by disavowing its victory over the Ottoman Empire in the Russo-Turkish War. Many disappointed Russians (including the followers of the Slavophile movement) turned their heads towards the East and declared that the future of Russia lay in Asia. Some Asianists argued that Russia had to expand into the cradle of the Aryan race in the steppes and mountains of Asia to liberate the remnant Aryan tribes from « Turanians » – « the barbaric and eternally decadent » Asian Islamic and Turkic peoples [19]. Furthermore, Russia imagined it had a moral obligation to free the Aryan Buddhist peoples living in Manchuria, Xinjiang, Mongolia, and Tibet from Western and Chinese oppression [20]. Russians' conviction of ethnic and cultural proximity with Aryans strengthened the belief in Russia's legitimate advance in the East, interpreted, as Laruelle puts it, « as the simple reunifying of different peoples destined to live under the same banner [21] ». As one of the leading Asianists, Prince Esper Ukhtomskii wrote: « We are only tightening the bonds between us and that which in reality was always ours [22] ». Russian liberation discourse about this originally Aryan land was interwoven with a messianic discourse about the « White Tsar » whose arrival was supposedly awaited by several million men in Asia [23]. Thus, both the Aryan and Asianist currents, besides nurturing Russian nationalistic sentiments and fantasies of a direct relationship with the East, provided ideological justification for Russia's imperial advances in Central Asia and the Far East.

## 2. Myth of Russia's connection to the Aryan world

Russian music-theoretical treatises were deeply influenced by the ideological orientations of Aryanism and Asianism. Although not overtly political, they reinforced the myth of Russia's connection to the Aryan world and indeed held significant political implications. One of the earliest pronouncements of Russia's indebtedness to its Aryan roots was made in 1795 by Matthieu Guthrie. In the preface of his *Dissertations sur les antiquités de Russie*, Guthrie refers to William Jones' « discovery » that the common root of all European languages and cultures (including the Greek) was Indo-European: « le berceau de toutes les nations européennes » was the Iranian empire [24]. In spite of Guthrie's claims with respect to the Russian debt to Iranian culture, as mediated via the Greeks, he does not make any effort to prove or provide documentary attestation for his statements [25]. Instead, Guthrie

exhaustively compares Russian and Greek mythologies, analyzing their respective rites, ceremonies, games, weddings, meals, traditional dances, cultural artefacts, and musical instruments.

Throughout the nineteenth century, many Russian writers developed the idea of Russian affiliation to the Aryan race [26]. Rudolph Westphal's article « O russkoi narodnoi pesne » was one of the influential writings that asserted Russia's Aryan inheritance on the basis of the analysis of Russian folksong [27] ». The author claimed that Russians preserved the ancient Aryan cultural foundations with « such integrity and authenticity » that « in the eyes of science » they have to be respected most among all the contemporary Aryan nations [28]. To prove his statement Westphal turns his attention to linguistics, customs and folksongs and claims that the Russian system of conjugation, and its forms of family and social life (the lack of private land or property), as well as the lyrics associated with wedding ceremonies and funerals, whether directly or indirectly mediated (through the Greeks), derive from Aryan roots. The urge to place Russians into the Aryan narrative was so strong that Westphal did not notice some obvious flaws in his argument. As Marina Frolova-Walker points out, Westphal used the same methods and evidence to prove Russian culture's simultaneous Hellenic and Persian provenance [29].

Towards the end of the nineteenth century, the idea that Russian culture has an Asian or Aryan provenance appealed to many Russians of different social milieu. Doctor Vasilii Florinskii, Prince Ukhtomskii, historians Vasilii Kliuchevskii and Sergei Platonov, the essayists and writers Nikolai Danilevskii, Fiodor Dostoevsky and many other representatives of the Russian intellectual elite were attracted to Aryanism or Asianism. Many late nineteenth-century Russian scholars, such as Andrei Snesev, Mikhail Veniukov, and Piotr Semionov-Tian'shanskii, believed the European attitude towards the East to be more racist because Europeans avoided intermingling with the natives (e.g. British colonizers in India). Russians, on the other hand, freely mingled with Asians [30]. Such an attitude towards race relations might explain why some Russian *fin-de-siècle* sources on Russian and Asian cultures assumed the equality or sometimes even superiority of Asian culture [31].

### 3. Petr Petrovich Sokal'skii and Russian folk music

Petr Petrovich Sokal'skii was one of the first to claim and attempt to prove that Russian folk music was an « independent stem grown from a common root : this is the Asian cradle of



humanity, whose other stem led to Southern Europe (Greece and Rome) [32] ». Sokal'skii's work tracing the affinities between Russian and Asian folk music was first published in an article in *Muzykal'noe obozrenie* in 1886, and then as a monograph one year after his death [33]. The idea that certain Russian and Asian/oriental tunes were similar was pronounced well before the *fin de siècle* in a few Russian sources. For instance, Alexander Christianowitsch in his *Esquisse Historique de la musique arabe* noted similarities between an Arabic tune from Nouba *Grib* and a Russian folksong known in the nineteenth-century as « Slava » and used in Russian opera to represent Russian tsardom [34]. Also, Alexander Rittikh, in his study of the people of the Kazan' region, traced the « astounding similarities » between Russian and Tatar folksongs [35]. However, Sokal'skii was the first to construct a theoretical concept to prove this statement.

Without going into a detailed account of Sokal'skii's speculations on how music had developed in ancient times, I will outline the passages in which he discusses when and how Russian folk music became a subject of Asian influence. According to Sokal'skii's theory, the Asian influence occurred in two stages. In the first stage, the ancient « Chinese » or pentatonic scale (*c-d-f-g-a*) was transmitted to Europe via the migration of various peoples from Asia [36]. This scale, according to Sokal'skii, should not be considered the legacy of a « yellow race, » as Alexander Serov had earlier maintained, since it could also be found in old Russian songs, either in its entire form or at least in part [37]. To support his statement Sokal'skii provided a number of examples supposedly with a pentatonic structure, which he found in Russian folk song collections [38]. His theory would have worked if he had been consistent in his analytical approach. However, he completely disregarded passing tones, claiming these « inessential notes » that break the pentatonic structure could have been the result of the « incorrect notation of a tune [39] ». One striking example from Balakirev's collection (N. 31) is a case in point (see Example 1). According to Sokal'skii, the song's scale (*c-d-f-g-a*, with *c* as a tonic) lacks the third and the seventh (*e* and *b*), although the seventh is still « touched » but « only slightly, as a passing note, without which the melody can do [oboitis'] [40] ».

### Example 1

The image shows two staves of musical notation in a 2/4 time signature with a key signature of one flat (B-flat). The melody is written on a treble clef. The lyrics are in Russian and are written below the notes. The first staff contains the lyrics: "Как во го - ро - де ца - рев - на, ца - рев - на, как во". The second staff contains the lyrics: "го - ро - де мла - да - я мла - да - я." The melody consists of eighth and quarter notes, with some notes beamed together. The overall structure is a simple, folk-like melody.



The second stage of Asian influence on Russian folk music, according to Sokal'skii, occurred during the time of the Crusades, when European music still relied on the Church mode system and showed little inclination towards leading tones, whereas the music of eastern peoples regularly included chromaticism and leading notes as part of a melody's ornamentation [41]. Expanding on Helmholtz's argument that Eastern music influenced European music at the time of the Crusades, Sokal'skii claimed that ornamentation in Russian (or Little Russian) songs, especially those involving a leading note, invariably had eastern origins : unlike the European leading note (resolved in the first scale degree), the Russian (Little Russian) leading note has « Asian » characteristics (notably, it is used for expression and therefore resolves to notes other than the first scale degree). These musical traits, Sokal'skii believed, came to the Russians from their oriental (mostly Persian) neighbours, who also brought a number of musical instruments and performance practices with them [42]. The South Russian *bandura*, a plucked string instrument, for example, derived from the Persian-Arabic *tanbur*. The Arabic 'rebab' came to Europe in the twelfth century under the name of 'rebec' and was the ancestor to our violin [43] ». Russian « gusli » were also developed, « if not from the Jewish 'komval', then from the ancient Persian 'kanun' with 75 catguts [44] ».

Sokal'skii's readiness to embrace an Oriental, rather than Western, musical identity is truly striking: near the end of his book on Russian folk music he suggests the presence of Arabic-Persian modes in Little Russian folksongs. Because Little Russian tunes did not fit into any Greek or European modal system, Sokal'skii claimed they were based on the Persian-Arabic mode of *Zirafkand* [45]. Examples 99, 100, 122, 123, and 124 cited from Rubets' and Iosif Artemovskii-Gulag's collections, according to Sokal'skii, are all based on the scale  $c-d-e^b-f-g-a^b-a-b-c$  (or its transposed version) and use the leading note ( $b$ ) as a means of expression since it is not resolved into the first degree and exists alongside its natural version ( $b^b$ ) [46]. Just like in the Persian-Arabic scale *Zirafkand*, claims Sokal'skii, here two modes (major and minor) are mixed, as if there is a major third in the upper tetrachord ( $g-b$ ), while the lower tetrachord consists of a minor third ( $c-e^b$ ) (see Example 2) [47].

### Example 2

Не скоро

Зе - ле - на - я - мо - я - ли ши нонь - ка, шо без со - неч - ка за - вя - ла,  
 вя - ла, шо без со - неч - ка за - вя - ла.

In the following example, Sokal'skii cites a Little Russian tune from Lisenko's collection with two augmented seconds (*e-f-g#-a-b-c-d#-e* with *a* as a tonic) known in the West as the gypsy scale. Even though he does not identify the song's scale as the Arabic mode of *Nawá Athar* (or *Hijāz Kār'*, if *e* is a tonic), he characterizes the tune as being ornamented with « oriental chromaticism [48] ».

### Example 3

The image shows two staves of musical notation in G major, 3/4 time. The first staff begins with a piano (*p*) dynamic and contains the melody for the first line of lyrics: "Ой, по го-рах по до-ли-нах пта-шеч-ки ли-та-ют." The second staff is marked *lamentabile* and contains the melody for the second line of lyrics: "не за-зна-ла я рос-ко-ши, вжс ли-та ми-на-ют." The melody features two augmented seconds (e.g., G-A and B-C#) and a chromatic descent (B-A-G).

Thus, Sokal'skii claims that the chromaticization of diatonic notes in south-Russian music is used for the « intensification of a tune's expression », revealing a number of characteristics intrinsic to the music of the « Asian orient » : « special *tension* », « *clarification* of a minor mode by introducing a major third to the dominant », « *softening* the entry into the tonic with a leading note », and the « *intensification* of lyrical feeling » with the use of two leading notes (to the tonic and the dominant), resulting in a scale with two augmented seconds [49]. Near the end of his book Sokal'skii came to a conclusion that was echoed in a number of other theoretical treatises published at the end of the nineteenth century:

« South-Russian melodies are very close in their melodic profile [sklad] and share intervals with Serbian, Bulgarian, and Moravian melodies. In general, they show an affinity to the melodies of South-Slavic peoples, suggesting their common provenance with Persian *Aryan* roots [...] going back to ancient times when individual differences between Aryan tribes, to which both the Persians and Slavs belong, were not so apparent [50]. »

In sum, Sokal'skii suggests south-Russian music is more « Asianized » than « Europeanized » since it is « tinged, chromaticized [okrasilas', okhramatizirovalas'], something that did not happen with Western-European music from introducing the system of the leading note [51] ». The influence of Asian culture, Sokal'skii believed, did not end with music and musical instruments, but extended to the objects of everyday life: ornaments sewn on clothes, headwear, hairstyles, oriental robes, and kaftans [52].

## 4. Famintsyn and Russian melody

Three years after the publication of Sokal'skii's article, in 1889, Alexander Famintsyn published his famous book *Drevniaia Indo-Kitaiskaia gamma v Azii i Evrope* [*Ancient Hindu-Chinese Scales in Asia and Europe*] [53]. Following Sokal'skii, Famintsyn claimed the pentatonic scale was « the most ancient formation of the general Aryan musical system » and, as such, it was common to the Mongolian as well as the Aryan peoples. After analyzing 137 folk melodies from all the continents identified in his German, French, and Eastern European sources, Famintsyn concluded that the pentatonic scale originated in Central Asia during « prehistoric » times, and was preserved from the influence of Roman Catholic civilization only in the remote regions of Northwest Europe, Asia, and Russia [54].

In order to establish the ancientness of Russian culture and trace its affinities to Aryan culture, Famintsyn strives to find a pentatonic structure in every Russian melody. He « discovers » ninety tunes based on the five-tone major scale in the Pal'chikov collection of Russian melodies, which consists of 124 transcriptions [55]. However, Famintsyn's analysis is inconsistent. Like Sokal'skii, he often deliberately ignores passing or neighbouring tones and argues songs lacking a pentatonic structure are the result of a corrupted or incorrectly transcribed melody [56]. Consider, for instance, Example 4 – a Russian song « Eko serdtse » from Pal'chikov's collection. Famintsyn cites two different variants of this song (variant 1 is on the upper staff and variant 2 is on the lower staff). The author indicates notes that do not belong to a sol-la-si-re-mi scale with an « X ». The « O » designates all of the places where the f#, which does not belong to the pentatonic collection, is avoided [57].

#### Example 4

The image displays four staves of musical notation for a Russian song in G major (one sharp) and 2/4 time. The notation is divided into two variants. Variant 1 (top two staves) consists of a melody with several notes marked with an 'X', indicating they do not belong to the pentatonic scale. Variant 2 (bottom two staves) shows a different melody with notes marked with an 'O', indicating where the f# note is avoided. The notation includes treble clefs, a key signature of one sharp (F#), and a time signature of 2/4. There are also some triplets and slurs indicated in the notation.

It is difficult to understand why Famintsyn insists on the pentatonic structure of variant two of the song. In his example, the notes that do not belong to the pentatonic scale take up approximately 10% of the tune. Just as in any diatonic tune, the notes that do not belong to a tonic triad are repeated less often. A few pages later, Famintsyn explains how to grasp

the pentatonic character of a melody that does not seem pentatonic at first glance. He writes one should « discard from a melody any notes that do not belong to this [pentatonic] scale », and, if the melody still « maintains its essential character, then the existence of the [pentatonic] scale, hidden at first glance, becomes evident [58] ». Thus, Famintsyn's theory reveals his preconceived notion about the scale structure of the Russian folksong. For Famintsyn, all methods of analysis (including the cutting of « useless » notes) are appropriate so far as they confirm his theory.

In order to « prove » the original pentatonic structure of a tune, Famintsyn sometimes compares two variants of the same song from different collections and argues that the version that follows the pentatonic structure is the original one. For instance, Famintsyn considers two versions of the song « Malen'kii mal'chishechka, » one from Pal'chikov's collection and another from Abramychyev's. He claims that the folksongs collected by Pal'chikov in Ufa province, in Nikolaevskii village, which is situated far from the main musical centres, preserved the ancient scale in all of its « integrity ». Abramychyev transcribed another variant of the same tune from Viatka province, which Famintsyn considers derivative and corrupted since it diverges from the pentatonic structure. Thus, Famintsyn suggests that a pentatonic structure can « serve as a criterion for the identification of a greater or lesser antiquity or for the purity of a tune [59] ».

Needless to say, Famintsyn's methodology shapes his view of the lineage of Russian song and allows him to find a great number of « pentatonic » examples in other collections of Russian folksongs. For instance, in analyzing Rimsky-Korsakov's collection of Russian songs, first published in 1877, the theorist suggests a number of corrections that, according to his system, would « recover the flow of a tune » and create « greater smoothness and uniformity ». Songs nos. 71, 88, 92, 97, and 99 from Rimsky-Korsakov's collection would « gain in swing of melody » [v razmakhe melodii], if someone would introduce a « total order » [polnyi poriadok] in their structure [60], while other songs (nos. 71, 72, 75, 76, 77, 84, 88, 89, 92, 94, 97, and 99) would gain « quite an archaic character » [vpolne arkhaicheskii kharakter] [61]. It is difficult to imagine how Famintsyn would « correct » tunes in Rimsky-Korsakov's collection, since the author does not cite a single example from it. How, for instance, would Famintsyn correct tune no. 77 (see example 5 below), in which all notes, except for the 1<sup>st</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> scale degrees, appear an equal number of times ? Or how would he bring « total order » to tune no. 76 (see example 6 below), if it sounds perfectly diatonic [62] ?

### Example 5

**Allegro**

Щуч-ка-рыб-ка, не ме-чи-ся, Жи-ва вру-ки не да-вай-ся.

### Example 6

**Andantino**

Не те-сан те-рем, не те-сан, Толь-ко хо-ро-шо рас-кра-шен,  
Не у-чен Лу-ка, не у-чен Толь-ко хо-ро-шо на-ря-жен.

It is remarkable that in his discussion of the musical examples derived from Russian Asians, Famintsyn does not use any negative or pejorative adjectives. This contrasts with his approach to the music of northern aboriginal peoples, or indigenous Australians, in which he often resorts to adjectives such as « wild » and « semi-cultural », and describes their music as « monotonous », « feeble », and « most elementary [63] ». This probably reflects the Russians' positive attitude towards the Kyrgyz people, who, by the end of the nineteenth-century, had been civilized (hence, were not savage). The Kyrgyz people received an education in Russia (hence, they could not be deemed backward) [64]. Furthermore, because the Kyrgyz and other nomadic Central Asian peoples had been a part of the Russian empire for a long time, calling them « savage » or « uncivilized » would imply that Russia's « civilizing » mission failed. Thus, Famintsyn, like Russians in general, embraced Asian culture as an integral part of Russia's identity as a whole.

Although both Sokal'skii and Famintsyn attempt to prove the same point – that Asian music had an influence on Russian music – their works differ in several key respects. First, Famintsyn disagrees with Sokal'skii's belief that the leading note came from its southern and eastern Russian neighbours, claiming rather that it was introduced to Russian melody via the European music tradition [65]. Second, Famintsyn rejects Sokal'skii's hypothesis regarding the development of music in phases, and proposes yet another theory of musical scale development, also in three stages: 1) « the most ancient stratum » of the general-Aryan musical five-tone system; 2) the newer stratum of the seven-tone system derived from Gregorian chant; and 3) the newest stratum of major-minor music. Third, unlike Sokal'skii, who prefers to stay away from comparative musicology and does not refer to any specific sources of Asian music, Famintsyn appeals to all the sources of musical material that were commonly available during his time, indiscriminately gathering resources from all over the world and presenting cultures from geographically remote areas. For example,



just 15 pages into Chapter 5, describing the «5-tone scale in [the music of the] Mongols, » Famintsyn manages to discuss the modal structure of music in China, Japan, Malay, Siberia, the Urals, the Caspian Sea, and even Papua New Guinea [66]. Throughout the book, alongside examples culled from Central Asian music, Famintsyn also provides « pentatonic » examples from South Asian, Irish, Scottish, Finnish, Moravian, Slovakian, Swiss, Mongol, Chinese, Japanese, Malayan, Greek, Polish, Lithuanian, Breton, Serbian, and Czech traditions (albeit listed in Famintsyn's chosen order) [67]. At this point, he painstakingly telescopes the enormous complexity of the Asian and non-Asian music traditions into a formal discussion on the modal structure of certain tunes, which confirms, in Famintsyn's eyes, his reductive and tendentious theory. Famintsyn's attitude toward the sources he used to produce his text, considered *the* only authoritative sources for his entire knowledge of Asian culture, facilitated his perception of Asians as members of a single race rather than as a collection of different nations. Furthermore, his musical examples are linked to each other, ostensibly through scientifically proven axioms (and yet invariably aimed to fit the evidence to the desired conclusion). Likewise, his speculations about this extraordinary body of music, which he had never actually experienced aurally, firmly places Famintsyn's *Hindu-Chinese* book within the category of fiction.

Nonetheless, because of Famintsyn's equally reductionist treatment of Asian, Russian, or indeed, any other European musical examples, it would be unfair to blame him for promoting an Orientalist attitude. His approach to music as an abstract subject is consistent with his chosen preference for diagrammatic analysis, and as such, was intended to work for all peoples and nations. Thus he cannot be accused of creating undue stereotypes about Asian cultures in particular. In fact, Famintsyn's writing and his approach to music analysis resembles that of early German comparative musicology, one of four subdivisions of systematic musicology, according to Guido Adler's 1885 definition of music science [68]. In his book, Famintsyn adopts the methods of comparative musicology, articulated in Adler's celebrated article of 1885 – « comparing of tonal products, in particular the folksongs of various peoples, countries and territories, with an ethnographic purpose in mind, grouping and ordering these according to the variety of [differences] in their characteristics [69] ». Famintsyn's work also shares two key concerns of comparative musicology: « first, a concern with the origins of musical features »; and second, a belief that such « origins may be revealed through the study of tones, scales and intervals [70] ». Similar to early studies in comparative musicology, Famintsyn's research appears to be an « armchair » study of the second-hand material collected and published primarily by amateur ethnographers, and then analyzed under « laboratory-type conditions [71] ».

Another important element of comparative musicology infiltrates *Hindu-Chinese Scale*. It is a hidden ideological message that emerged in most comparative musicological studies of

this period – the sense of superiority over indigenous cultures. In chapter two, devoted to the discussion of « how the scales of folk tunes come into being and become established », Famintsyn draws a clear line between the music of « primitive », « semi-cultural », or « savage » peoples and the music of presumably more culturally « advanced » peoples. Those who stand on the lowest level of development could only create music with a small range, a limited number of notes in a scale, which resulted in melodic monotony, repetitiveness, and « poorness (limited range) of the intervals used in a tune [72] ». Famintsyn's statements about the link between the number of notes used in a scale and a people's cultural development, in fact, is similar to François-Joseph Fétis' theory that the musical aptitude of people can be judged by the number of notes used in their scales. Like Fétis, one of the most influential nineteenth-century music critics, Famintsyn believed that musical systems can shed light on racial or ethnic origins of music: he connected particular scales with certain peoples or even races [73]. The difference was only in the details of their statements: Famintsyn connected the pentatonic scale to the Aryan musical system, while Fétis believed that the pentatonic scale was used exclusively by members of the « yellow race ». Peoples belonging to the Aryan race, according to Fétis, preferred scales with microtones, since the « nervous sensibility of ancient Aryans [...] needed a multitude of intonations [...] and a great quantity of nuances to express the passionate movements of the soul [74] ».

Among the examples used to characterize music of semi-cultural or savage peoples, Famintsyn includes melodies transcribed from peoples living in the Friendly Islands (now Tonga) and the Caribbean, as well as from « Australian savages » and the « Eskimo [75] ». Conversely, Russians are positioned on the other side of the continuum of cultural development. This is because Russians created a repertoire of « drawn-out tunes » [protiaznaia pesnia], which assumed a more developed melodic and structural form that reflected the « endless wide open space and mirror-like surface of our fields and steppes, the 'wide expanse' of our strong rivers [76] ». The last statement about Russian song being influenced by a particular environment reveals Famintsyn's connection with another important school of thought (particularly that of German tradition) – ethnology [77].

Famintsyn acknowledges his interest in ethnology in his Preface by enthusiastically citing one of the leading figures of the Berlin school of ethnography – Rudolf Virchow [78]. Liberal in politics and anti-Darwinian in biology, Virchow believed in the sameness of all human individuals and their capacity to « realize a potential for intellectual development [79] ». Virchow argued that the physical differences among peoples and their distinguished cultural character was a result of the specific climates in which they lived. Famintsyn too believed that Russian song reflected the natural environment associated with open space, assuming that if Russians resided in a different land, their song would have had a different



character [80]. Another of Virchow's ideas, that « all European people that have Aryan roots, came here from the orient », also runs throughout Famintsyn's book [81].

Besides some obvious references to ethnology and comparative musicology, Famintsyn's work draws on another important theoretical framework developed within the Berlin school of ethnology – diffusionism. German diffusionists believed that civilisation and cultural traits were diffused from a limited number of cultural areas, *Kulturkreise*, rather than being invented independently of one another. The main goal of diffusionists was to uncover the history of mankind through the comparison of traits from different areas and trace their spread. The basic assumption that societies developed due to constant migration and environmental adaptation resulted in diffusionists' treatment of the history of mankind as one unit. They had no objection to attributing similar cultural traits in order to connect people of geographically distant regions [82]. It is not difficult to see that Famintsyn's main preoccupation (tracing the spread of the Aryan scale) as well as his treatment of geographically remote cultures and their music systems, based on the assumption that they come from one source, resembles the diffusionists' approach to cultures. In short, Famintsyn made an error common to all extreme diffusionists : he mistook analogy for homologous features [83].

One last observation about the similarities between Famintsyn's work and diffusionism seems in order. Although later diffusionist theory was affected by the imperialist attitude of European racial superiority, these later colonialist influences, as Woodruff Smith points out, « were not, for the most part, very significant for basic diffusionist theory [84] ». Similarly, although Famintsyn's writing was influenced by the attitude of Russian cultural superiority, it is not, for the most part, the most significant thesis that he proposed. Famintsyn's approach to Asian music culture reflects rather a general Russian attitude towards Asia as a part of Russian Empire with its all-embracing musical and ethnic identity.

## 5. Viacheslav Petr's theory

Sokal'skii's and Famintsyn's ideas about proving that Russian music has Aryan roots with the analogy of the musical scale system became popular at the end of the nineteenth century in Russia [85]. Their books were mentioned in all major articles on music theory of the period, including Viacheslav Petr's highly theoretical work « About the Melodic System of Aryan Song » [O melodicheskom sklade ariiskoi pesni] published in *Russian Musical Newspaper* in 1897 [86]. Although Petr's theory differed in details about how the most ancient scale was formed and developed, its basic premise – the supremacy of (Little) Russian music and its direct connection to Aryan music – becomes clear with the analysis

of musical examples provided by Petr in his Annex. Like Sokal'skii and Famintsyn, Petr believed that the origin of European and Russian scales was in Aryan music culture [87]. However, unlike both Russian theorists, Petr claimed that the system of scales had gradually developed from a simple dichord to a trichord and tetrachord. Thus, according to Petr's theory, the number of notes used within an octave could define the ancientness of the scale: the fewer the notes, the more ancient the scale. The musical features that Famintsyn would consider more « primitive » in Petr's theory turned out to be more ancient, closest to the source, « primordial ».

According to Petr, the first phase of the development of Aryan music involved only two notes of a tetrachord (*c* and *f*). Petr calls this « most ancient epoch of Aryan peoples » the « epoch of a dichord [88] ». In his Appendix, which consists of more than two hundred examples, Petr presents only five tunes based on a dichord or harmonic tetrachord (two dichords joined together – *c-f-g-c*) : one Russian wedding melody from Pal'chikov's collection (no.79), two tunes from the Little Russian melodies in Kolberg's collection (nos. 95 and 328), and two songs from the Lettish collection by Iur'ian (nos. 1 and 2). From Petr's citations of Russian, Little Russian, and Lettish songs as examples of the first and most ancient phase of the development of Aryan music, it is not difficult to see that the author assumed that the Russians stood in a direct line of transmission from an Aryan source.

Petr's work was truly inspired by Famintsyn's *Hindu-Chinese Scale*; he reiterated many ideas that Famintsyn explored one decade earlier. First, Petr's main preoccupation – finding commonalities in musical elements used by peoples whom he believed belonged to the Aryan group – corresponds to Famintsyn's concern of finding the roots of Russian song in the music of the Aryan race. Second, both claimed that Russian folksong was less corrupted by the Western music system and, thus, closer to the original Aryan source. Third, the methodology of both writers resembles that of ethnology, diffusionism, and comparative musicology. In his preface Petr claimed that, using an « archaeologico-musical position », he would like to provide a « new proof » about the ancestral home of the Aryan peoples and « to recover the prototype of Aryan song [89] ». This proof would be in line with discoveries in comparative linguistics, which found that the united Aryan ancestors lived in Asia, on the south slope of the Himalayan Mountains [90]. Such references to archaeology and comparative linguistics (or comparative studies in general) reveal that his work is built on the methodological pillars of ethnology. Furthermore, similar to Famintsyn, Petr claims that the modern system of music (something that Famintsyn refers as « Western » and Petr calls « our major-minor music ») « forced out the ancient folk song and replaced it with operatic arias, art-songs, and chansonnettes (or cabaret songs) [91] ». As a result, the examples of tunes unspoiled by the modern system can be found only in remote regions, mountains, forests, steppes, and presumably among the Russians [92]. And finally, Petr's

and Famintsyn's theoretical studies were based on speculations about the origins of the Aryan musical system which lead the authors to far-reaching conclusions about Russian music and a cultural legacy with Aryan roots. Despite their grandiose claims, neither of the authors experienced direct contact with the Asian music culture [93].

## 6. Conclusion

The analysis of Russian music theoretical treatises reveals that at the end of the nineteenth century there was widespread agreement that Asian culture was very influential in Russia, although opinions were divided as to its line of development. The three music historians that I have just discussed argued that most of the examples of modern European « art music » deviated significantly from its Aryan roots and did not preserve the most original and ancient Aryan musical system. Russian folksong, however, was not corrupted by « high art » (that is, music based on the Roman Catholic major-minor system) and preserved its pure Aryan foundation. All three Russian theorists seem to be especially proud that Russian folksong did not submit to the influence of the Western musical system [94]. Thus, the main idea of Western-European Aryanism – the idea of « racial purity » – was transformed in Russian discourse into the idea of cultural/musical purity, which supposedly could be traced in the structure of Russian folk melody.

The myth about the preservation of the origins of Russian folksong could have been fostered for political reasons. Despite Russia's decisive victory in the 1877-8 Russo-Turkish War, the Congress of Berlin (1878) undermined Russia's reputation in the international arena. Russians were profoundly dissatisfied with how the major European powers divided the map of Eastern Europe, and this resulted in growing tensions between Russia and three other European countries – Great Britain, Germany, and Austro-Hungary. In this context, resistance against the Western powers might have appealed particularly to Russian readers. On the one hand, discourse about the destructive impact of Western « artificial music » helped Russians to give vent to resentment and general indignation caused by the Congress of Berlin (as if everything from the West is destructive for Russia). Russian folksong's ability to resist the influences of the Western musical system and preserve its original Aryan characteristics could have been interpreted as evidence of Russia's political potency and resistance against the West. On the other hand, the myth about Russia's stronger affiliation to the Aryans helped Russians to establish their proximity with Buddhist world, which, in turn, facilitated Russia's justification of further colonial advances into the East. Adding an Asian or Aryan element into the Russian identity seemed to offer Russians more advantages than disadvantages. While Russian theoretical treatises were not overtly

political, in fact they nurtured nationalistic sentiment and had profound political resonance. They inspired fantasies of greatness in the Russian nation – fantasies that in 1904 brought Russia into a disastrous war with Japan [95].

## Bibliographie

---

### Bibliographie

Abraham, Gerald, « Famintsin, Aleksandr Sergeevich », in Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online, Université McGill. Bibliothèque. Site de la Bibliothèque de l'Université McGill, [en ligne], <<http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/09279>>, (consultée le 30 août 2010).

Adler, Guido and Mugglestone, Erica, « Guido Adler's 'The Scope, Method, and Aim of Musicology' (1885): An English Translation with a Historico-Analytical Commentary by Erica Mugglestone », *Yearbook for Traditional Music*, no.13, 1981, p. 1-21.

Agnew, Vanessa, « The Colonialist Beginnings of Comparative Musicology », in Ames, Eric, Klotz, Marcia, and Wildenthal, Lora (eds), *Germany's Colonial Pasts*, Lincoln and London, University of Nebraska Press, 2005, p.41-60.

Allworth, Edward (ed.), *Central Asia: 120 Years of Russian Rule*, Durham and London, Duke University Press, 1989, 606p., ill., maps, ports., facsim.

Bourgault-Ducoudray, Louis-Albert, *Trente mélodies populaires de Grèce et d'Orient*, Paris, Henry Lemoine, 1876, Score, 87 p.

Bourgault-Ducoudray, Louis-Albert, « La Musique primitive conservée par les montagnes », *Annuaire du Club alpin français*, 1884, p. 1-10.

Baskakov, Nikolai, *Russkie familii tiurkskogo proiskhozhdeniia* [Russian Family Names of Turkic Origin], Moscow, Nauka, 1979, 279p.

Bassin, Mark, « Classical Eurasianism and the Geopolitics of Russian Identity », *Ab Imperio*, n2, 2003, p.257-266.

Bassin, Mark, « Russia between Europe and Asia : The Ideological Construction of Geographical Space », *Slavic Review*, n°50/1, 1991, p. 1-17.

Becker, Seymor, *Russia's Protectorates in Central Asia, Bukhara and Khiva, 1865-1924*, Cambridge, Harvard University Press, 1968, 416 p., ill., map.

Bernandt, Grigorii B., Yampol'skii, I.M., *Kto pisal o muzyke* [Who wrote on music], 4 vols., Moscow, Sovetskii kompozitor, 1971-89, index.

Blaut, James M., *The Colonizer's Model of the World. Geographical Diffusionism and Eurocentric History*, New York, The Guilford Press, 1993, 246 p.

Brower, Daniel, *Turkestan and the Fate of the Russian Empire*, London & New York, Routledge Curzon, 2003, 213p., ill., maps.

Christianowitsch, Alexander, *Esquisse historique de la musique arabe aux temps anciens avec dessins d'instruments et 40 mélodies notées et harmonisées par Christianowitsch*, Cologne, Librairie de M. Dumont Schauberg, 1863, xxxii p., 3 pl.

Crews, Robert D., *For Prophet and Tsar: Islam and Empire in Russia and Central Asia*, Cambridge, Mass., Harvard University Press, 2006, 463 p.

Famintsyn, Alexander S., *Drevniaia indo-kitaiskaia gamma v Azii i Evrope* [An Ancient Hindu-Chinese scale in Asia and Europe], St. Petersburg, tip. lu. Schtaufa, 1889, 174 p., music.

Fétis, François-Joseph, « Sur un nouveau mode de classification des races humaines d'après leurs systèmes musicaux », *Bulletins de la Soc. D'Anthrop.*, t. II, Série II, Paris, 1867, p. 134-143.

Fétis, François-Joseph, *Histoire générale de la musique depuis les temps les plus anciens jusqu'à nos jours*, vol. 2, Paris, Typographie Firmin Didot, 1869-1876, 5 vols., ill., music, tabl.

Fisher, Alan W., « Enlightened Despotism and Islam under Catherine II », *Slavic Review*, no.27, 1967, p.542-553.

Frolova-Walker, Marina, *Russian Music and Nationalism from Glinka to Stalin*, New Haven and London, Yale University Press, 2007, 402p., music.

Guthrie, Matthieu, *Dissertations sur les antiquités de Russie*, St. Petersburg, Imprimerie du Corps Impérial des Cadets Nobles, 1795, 239 p., ill.

Haraszti, Émile, « Fétis fondateur de la musicologie comparée. Son étude sur un nouveau mode de classification des races humaines d'après leurs systèmes musicaux. Contribution à l'œuvre de Fétis », *Acta Musicologica*, no. 4, 1932, p. 97-103.

- Helmholtz, Herman von, *Die Lehre von den Tonempfindungen als physiologische Grundlage für die Theorie der Musik*, Braunschweig, F. Vieweg und Sohn, 1863, 600p., ill.
- Karysheva, Tat'iana, Petr Sokal'skii, *Zhizn' i tvorchestvo*, Moscow, Sovetskii kompozitor, 1984, 199p., pl., music, ports.
- Sokal'skii, Petr Petrovich, « Kitaiskaia gamma v russkoi narodnoi muzyke », *Muzykal'noe obozrenie*, n. 26-28, 1886, p. 204-5, 209-11, 217-220.
- Karnovich, Evgenii Petrovich, *Rodovye prozvaniiia i tituly v Rossii i sliianiie inozemtsev s russkimi. Istoricheskii ocherk*, St. Petersburg, A.S. Suvorin, 1886, 250 p.
- Khalfin, N.A., *Politika Rossii v Srednei Azii (1857-1868)*, Moscow, Izdatel'stvo vostochnoi literatury, 1960, 270 p.
- Khalfin, N.A., *Prisoedinenie Srednei Azii k Rossii (60-90-e gody XIXv.)*, Moscow, Nauka, 1965, 466 p., 2 pl.
- Kiesewetter, Raphael Georg, *Die Musik der Araber, nach Originalquellen Dargestellt*, Leipzig, Breitkopf und Härtel, 1842, 96p., ill.
- Kiniapina, Nina, Bliev, Mark, and Degoev, V.V. (eds.), *Kavkaz i Sredniaia Azia vo vneshnei politike Rossii : vtoraiia polovina XVIII-80-e gody XIX v.*, Moscow, Izdat. Mosk. Universiteta, 1984, 328p., ill.
- Klimovich, Liutsian, *Islam v tsarskoi Rossii: Ocherki*, Moscow, Gos. Antireligioznoe izdat., 1936, 406p.
- Knight, Nathaniel, « Science, Empire, and Nationality: Ethnography in the Russian Geographical Society, 1845-1855 », in Jane Burbank and David Ransel, (eds), *Imperial Russia: New Histories for the Empire*, Bloomington, Indiana University Press, 1998, p.108-142.
- Knight, Nathaniel, « Grigor'ev in Orenburg, 1851-1862: Russian Orientalism in the Service of Empire? » *Slavic Review*, no. 59/1, 2000, p.74-100.
- Knight, Nathaniel, Review of Marlene Laruelle's *Mythe aryenne et rêve impérial*, *Slavic Review*, n.66/3, 2007, p.556.
- Laruelle, Marlène, *L'idéologie eurasiste russe ou comment penser l'empire*, Paris, L'Harmattan, 1999, 423 p.

Laruelle, Marlène, *Mythe aryen et rêve impérial dans la Russie du XIX<sup>e</sup> siècle*, Paris, CNRS Éditions, 2005, 223 p.

Laruelle, Marlène, « The Orient in Russian Thought at the Turn of the Century », in Shlapentokh, Dmitry (ed.), *Russia Between East and West: Scholarly Debates on Eurasianism*, Leiden, Boston, Brill, 2007, pp.9-37.

Laruelle, Marlène, « 'The White Tsar': Romantic Imperialism in Russia's Legitimizing of Conquering the Far East », *Acta Slavica Iaponica*, n. 25, 2008, pp. 113-134.

Laqueur, Walter, *Russia and Germany. A Century of Conflict*, New Jersey, Little Brown and Co., 1990, 367p., maps.

Lowie, Robert H., *The History of Ethnological Theory*, New York, Rinehart and Company, 1937, 296p.

Lunin, B.V., *Nauchnye obshchestva Turkestana i ikh progressivnaia deiatel'nost'. Konets XIX-nachalo XX veka*. Tashkent, Izd.AN UzSSR, 1962, 341 p.

Marcus, Scott L., « Modulation in Arab Music : Documenting Oral Concepts, Performance Rules and Strategies », in *Ethnomusicology*, N36/2, 1992, pp.171-195.

Maslov, Alexander, « Narodnye muzykal'nye instrumnety, ikh evoliutsiia i goeograficheskoe rasprostranenie » [Traditional Musical Instruments, Their Evolution and Geographic Spreading], in *Muzyka i zhizn'*, N5-6, 1910, pp.1-21.

Mazurek, Slawomir, « Russian Eurasianism – Historiosophy and Ideology », in *Studies in East European Thought*, N54/1-2, 2002, pp.105-123.

McKenzie, Kermit E., « Chokan Valikhanov : Kazakh Princeling and Scholar », in *Central Asian Survey*, N80/3, 1989, pp.1-30.

Naroll, Raoul and Frada (eds), *Main Currents in Cultural Anthropology*, New York, Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1973, 410p.

Pasler, Jann, « Theorizing Race in Nineteenth-Century France : Music as Emblem of Identity », in *The Musical Quarterly*, Université McGill. Bibliothèque. Site de la Bibliothèque de l'Université McGill, [en ligne], <http://mq.oxfordjournals.org> (consultée le 9 Août 2010).

Penny, H. Glenn, *Objects of Culture : Ethnology and Ethnographic Museums in Imperial Germany*, Chapel Hill [N.C.] and London, University of North Carolina Press, 2002, 281p., ill.



Petr, Viacheslav I. « O melodicheskom sklade ariiskoi pesni. Istoriko-sravnitel'nyi opyt. I. Chast' teoreticheskaia. II. Chast' prakticheskaia » [About a Melodic Structure of Aryan Song. Experience in Comparative History. I. Theoretical Part and II. Practical Part], in *Russkaia muzykal'naia gazeta*, N1, 1897, pp.3-28 and 1897-1898, Annex, pp. 1-56.

Petukhov, Mikhail, *Narodnye instrumenty Sankt-Petersburgskoi konservatorii*, St. Petersburg, Tip. Imperskoi Akademii Nauk, 1884, 56p., ill.

Radlov, V.V. « Sredniaia Zeravshanskaia dolina » [A Middle Zaravshan Valley], in *Zapiski IRGO po otdeleniiu etnografii*, Vol.6/1, 1880, pp. 1-93.

Rittikh, Alexander F., *Materialy dlia etnografii Rossii. Kazanskaia Gubernia* [Russian Ethnographic Materials. Kazan's province], Kazan', Imperatorskii Kazanskii Universitet, 1870, Volumes I and II., ill.

Rybakov, Sergei G., *Muzyka i pesni ural'skikh musul'man s ocherkom ikh byta* [Music and Songs of Ural Muslims with the Essay on their Way of Life], St. Petersburg, Tip. Imperatorskoi Akademii Nauk, 1897, 330 p., ill., fold. col. map.

Savitskii, Petr, Suvchinskii, Petr, Trubetskoi, Nikolai, and Florovskii, Georgii, *Exodus to the East : Forebodings and Events : An Affirmation of the Eurasians, translated and edited by Ilya Vinkovetskii*, Idyllwild, California, Charles Schlacks, Jr. Publisher, 1996 [Iskhod k Vostoku. Predchuvstviia i sversheniia. Utverzhdenie evraziitsev, Sofia, Balkan, 1921], 185p.

Schimmelpenninck van der Oye, David, *Toward the Rising Sun. Russian Ideologies of Empire and the Path to War with Japan*, Dekalb, Northern Illinois University Press, 2001, 329p.

Schimmelpenninck van der Oye, David, « Catherinian Chinoiserie », in *Michael David-Fox, Peter Holquist, and Alexander Martin (eds), Orientalism and Empire in Russia* *Kritika Historical Studies* 3, Columbus, Slavica, 2006, pp.63-86.

Serov, A., « Russkaia narodnaia pesnia kak predmet nauki », in *Muzykal'nyi sezon*, N6 and 18, 1870 and 1871.

Skrine, F.H. and Ross, E. Denison, *The Heart of Asia : A History of Russian Turkestan and the Central Asian Khanates from the Earliest Times*, London, Methuen and Co., 1899, 444p., maps.

Smith, Woodruff D., « Social and Political Origins of German Diffusionist Ethnology », in *Journal of the History of the Behavioral Sciences*, N 14, 1978, pp.103-112.

Smith, Woodruff D., *Politics and the Science of Culture in Germany 1840-1920*, New York and Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1991, 298p.

Sokal'skii, Petr, *Russkaia narodnaia muzyka Velikoruskaia i maloruskaia v ee stroenii melodicheskom i ritmicheskom i otlichii ee ot osnov sovremennoi garmonicheskoi muzyki*, Khar'kov, Tip. Adol'fa Darre, 1888, 396p.

Sokolov, S.M., *Filosofia russkogo zarubezh'ia, Evraziistvo*, Ulan-Ude, VSGTU, 2003, 135p.

Stasov, V.V., « Proiskhozhdenie russkikh bylin », in *Sobranie sochinenii V.V. Stasova 1847-1886*, Vol. 3, St. Petersburg, Tipografiia M.M. Stasiulevicha, 1894, pp.948-1260.

Taruskin, Richard, « Slava! », in *Opera News*, N55/9, 19 Jan., 1991, pp.18-21.

Tolz, Vera, « Russia and the West », in *A History of Russian Thought*, Leatherbarrow, William and Offord, Derek (eds), Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2010, pp.197-216.

Toner, Peter G., « The Gestation of Cross-Cultural Music Research and the Birth of Ethnomusicology », in *Humanities Research*, N14/1, 2007, pp.85-110.

Trubetskoi, Nikolai, « The Upper and Lower Stories of Russian Culture (The Ethnic Basis of Russian Culture) », in *Venkovetskii, Ilya and Schlacks, Charles (eds), Iskhod k Vostoku. Predchuvstviia i sversheniia* [Exodus to the East. Forebodings and Events. An Affirmation of the Eurasians], Idyllwild, Charles Schlacks, Jr., Publisher, 1996, pp.80-94.

Ukhtomskii, Kniaz Esper Esperovich, *Travels in the East of His Imperial Majesty Czar Nicholas II of Russia, when Cesarewitch 1890-1891*, Volumes I et II, Westminster, Constable, 1900.

Uvarov, Sergei, *Projet d'une Académie asiatique*, St. Petersburg, 1810, 50 p.

Whittaker, Cynthia H., « The Impact of the Oriental Renaissance in Russia : The Case of Sergej Uvarov », in *Jahrbücher für Geschichte Osteuropas*, N26, 1978, p.503-524.

Westphal, Rudolf G., « O russkoi narodnoi pesne », in *Russkii vestnik*, N143/9, Sept. 1879, p.111-154.

## Notes

---

[1] On the general history of Russian Central Asia, see N.A. Khalfin, *Politika Rossii v Srednei Azii (1857-1868)*, Moscow, Izdatel'stvo vostochnoi literatury, 1960; N.A. Khalfin, *Prisoedinenie Srednei Azii k Rossii (60-90-e gody XIXv.)*, Moscow, Nauka, 1965; Seymour Becker, *Russia's Protectorates in Central Asia : Bukhara and Khiva, 1865-1924*, Cambridge, Harvard University Press, 1968; N.C. Kiniapina, M.M. Bliev, V.V. Degoev, eds., *Kavkaz i Sredniaia Aziia vo vneshnei politike Rossii : vtoraia polovina XVIII-80-e gody XIX v.*, Moscow, Izdat. Mosk. Universiteta, 1984; Edward Allworth, ed., *Central Asia : 120 Years of Russian Rule*, Durham and London, Duke University Press, 1989; Daniel Brower, *Turkestan and the Fate of the Russian Empire*, London & New York, Routledge Curzon, 2003.

[2] See Becker, « Anglo-Russian Relations and the Pacification of the Turkomans », in *Russia's Protectorates*, pp. 95-121.

[3] In the early nineteenth century, Sergei Uvarov, the President of the Academy of Science (1818-55) and the Minister of Education (1833-49), called for Asia to be conquered not « by fire and sword », but « via enlightenment, to subdue minds with the gentle spirit of religion, the dissemination of science and art, with the education and prosperity of the conquered ». See his *Projet d'une Académie asiatique* (St-Petersburg, 1810), and Cynthia H. Whittaker, « The Impact of the Oriental Renaissance in Russia : The Case of Sergej Uvarov », in *Jahrbücher für Geschichte Osteuropas*, 26, 1978, p. 515.

[4] See for instance, Khalfin, *Politika, op. cit.*, pp. 236, 240; Nathaniel Knight, « Grigor'ev in Orenburg, 1851-1862 : Russian Orientalism in the Service of Empire ? », *Slavic Review*, 59/1, 2000, p. 74-100; Robert D. Crews, *For Prophet and Tsar : Islam and Empire in Russia and Central Asia*, Cambridge, Mass., Harvard University Press, 2006.

[5] Khalfin, *Politika, op. cit.*, pp. 238-39. Based on a Marxist approach to the analysis of social life in Central Asia, Khalfin claims that in the Russian empire, unlike the British, class distinctions were much more likely to be expressed than the issue of ethnic differentiation, since the tsarist government continued to support the emir of Bukhara and the khan of Khiva, and protected their long-established feudal system. *Ibid.*, pp. 243-44. However, Khalfin and other Soviet/Russian historians disregarded some critical aspects of Russian colonization, such as social unrest and bloody revolts, environment destruction, dislocation of population, and health problems.

[6] Brower, *op. cit.*, p. 30.

[7] *Ibid.*, p. 38. Most of these points continued the tradition of governing Russia's eastern peoples established by Catherine the Great. See Alan W. Fisher, « Enlightened Despotism and Islam under Catherine II », in *Slavic Review*, 27, 1967, p. 542-553 ; L. Klimovich, *Islam v*

*tsarskoi Rossii : Ocherki*, Moscow, Gos. Antireligioznoe izdat., 1936. On Catherine II's attitude to the Far East, see David Schimmelpenninck van der Oye, « Catherinian Chinoiserie », in Michael David-Fox, Peter Holquist, and Alexander Martin, eds., *Orientalism and Empire in Russia. Kritika Historical Studies 3*, Columbus, Slavica, 2006, pp. 63-86.

[8] See E.P. Karnovich, *Rodovye prozvaniia i tituly v Rossii i sliianiie inozemtsev s russkimi. Istoricheskii ocherk*, St. Petersburg, A.S. Suvorin, 1886, pp. 231-250; Nikolai Baskakov, *Russkiiie familii tiurkskogo proiskhozhdeniia* [Russian Family Names of Turkic Origin], Moscow, Nauka, 1979.

[9] For instance, for along time Russian geographers and historians could not decide where to put the line dividing Russia's European and Asian sides. Discussions about whether or not the Ural Mountains are the natural geographical border between Europe and Asia filled pages of journals and books until the end of the nineteenth century. See Mark Bassin, « Russia between Europe and Asia : The Ideological Construction of Geographical Space », *Slavic Review*, 50/1, 1991, p. 1-17.

[10] See F.H. Skrine and E. Denison Ross, *The Heart of Asia : A History of Russian Turkestan and the Central Asian Khanates from the Earliest Times*, London, Methuen and Co., 1899, p. 413.

[11] Ibid., p. 414.

[12] Ibid.

[13] See Petr Savitskii, Petr Suvchinskii, Nikolai Trubetskoi, Georgii Florovskii, *Exodus to the East : Forebodings and Events : An Affirmation of the Eurasians*, translated and edited by Ilya Vinkovetskii, Idyllwild, California, Charles Schlacks, Jr. Publisher, 1996 [Iskhod k Vostoku. Predchuvstviia i sversheniia. Utverzhdienie evraziitsev, Sofia, Balkan, 1921]. On Eurasianism, see Marlène Laruelle, *L'idéologie eurasiste russe ou comment penser l'empire*, Paris, L'Harmattan, 1999; Sławomir Mazurek, « Russian Eurasianism – Historiosophy and Ideology », in *Studies in East European Thought*, 54/1-2, 2002, p. 105-123; Mark Bassin, « Classical Eurasianism and the Geopolitics of Russian Identity », in *Ab Imperio*, 2, 2003, p. 257-267; S.M. Sokolov, *Filosofiiia russkogo zarubezh'ia : Evraziistvo*, Ulan-Ude, VSGTU, 2003.

[14] See Jann Pasler, « Theorizing Race in Nineteenth-Century France : Music as Emblem of Identity », in *Musical Quarterly*, 89/4, Winter 2006, p. 459-504.

[15] Russian music writers did not seem to distinguish clearly between Asian and Aryan and freely interchanged both terms.

[16] Laruelle, *Mythe aryen et rêve impérial dans la Russie du XIX<sup>e</sup> siècle*, Paris, CNRS Éditions, 2005, p. 25.

[17] See Nathaniel Knight's review of Marlene Laruelle's *Mythe aryen et rêve impérial*, in *Slavic Review*, 66/3, 2007, p. 556.

[18] On Vostochniki movement, see D. Schimmelpenninck van der Oye, « The Asianist Vision : Esper Ukhtomskii », in *Toward the Rising Sun. Russian Ideologies of Empire and the Path to War with Japan*, Northern Illinois University Press, 2001, pp. 42-60; M. Laruelle, « The Orient in Russian Thought at the Turn of the Century », in Dmitry Shlapentokh, ed. *Russia Between East and West : Scholarly Debates on Eurasianism*, Leiden, Boston, Brill, 2007, pp. 25-26.

[19] E.E. Ukhtomskii, *Ot Kalmykskoi stepi do Bukhary*, St. Petersburg, 1891, p. 63, quoted by Laruelle, « 'The White Tsar' : Romantic Imperialism in Russia's Legitimizing of Conquering the Far East, » in *Acta Slavica Iaponica*, 25, 2008, p. 113-134; here p. 129.

[20] See Laruelle, « Romantic Imperialism », p. 113.

[21] *Ibid.*, p. 134.

[22] Kniaz Esper Esperovich Ukhtomskii, *Travels in the East of His Imperial Majesty Czar Nicholas II of Russia, when Cesarewitch 1890-1891*, 2 vols., Westminster, Constable, 1900, quoted by Schimmelpenninck, *Toward the Rising Sun*, p. 44.

[23] See Laruelle, 'Romantic Imperialism' and her book *Mythe aryen et rêve impérial*.

[24] See Matthieu Guthrie's *Dissertations sur les antiquités de Russie*, St. Petersburg, Imprimerie du Corps Impérial des Cadets Nobles, 1795, p. 6.

[25] Persian culture is mentioned only in the Preface and just twice in the text's footnotes : first, in relation to the Greek *l'Ode de Pindare*, the melody of which, according to Burney, resembles « airs persians apportés en Europe par les missionnaires »; and for a second time, Persian culture is mentioned in the discussion of the Russian cult of the adoration of fire. See Guthrie, pp. 4, 6, 49, and 65.

[26] Marlene Laruelle in her *Myth aryen et rêve impérial* discussed in detail the genealogy of Aryanism in Russia.

[27] R.G. Westphal, « O russkoi narodnoi pesne », in *Russkii vestnik*, 143/9, Sept. 1879, p. 111-54.

[28] See Westphal, p. 112; for the English translation of this passage, see Frolova-Walker, p. 249. In the very last line of his article, Westphal suggests a direct link between Russian and Iranian (Persian) literature, claiming that « Russian meter [razmer stikha] is more original and older than the ancient-German accentual verse [tonicheskii razmer]... it assumes a place of precedence directly after the Avesta meters » Westphal, p. 154. It seems that Westphal's main argument that the Russians were the best among the Aryan tribes in preserving the original Aryan culture resonates with Stasov's claim made a decade earlier : Russians *preserved* rather than *developed* alien traits that derived from Asian literature and art. See V.V. Stasov, « Proiskhozhdenie russkikh bylin », in *Sobranie sochinenii V.V. Stasova 1847-1886*, vol. 3, Saint Petersburg, Tipografiia M.M. Stasiulevicha, 1894, pp. 948-1260.

[29] See M. Frolova-Walker, *Russian Music and Nationalism from Glinka to Stalin*, New Heaven and London, Yale University Press, 2007, p. 249.

[30] See Tolz, « Russia and the West », in *A History of Russian Thought*, ed. William Leatherbarrow and Derek Offord, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2010, pp. 197-216; here p. 208.

[31] Few musical writings from the late nineteenth century and the beginning of the twentieth century take an entirely non-judgmental approach to Asian culture. See, for instance, Mikhail Petukhov's *Narodnye instrumenty Sankt-Petersburgskoi konservatorii*, St. Petersburg, Tip. Imperskoi Akademii Nauk, 1884. An example of a pro-Asian point of view is found in Alexander Maslov's article « Narodnye muzykal'nye instrumenty, ikh evoliutsiia i geograficheskoe rasprostranenie » [« Traditional Musical Instruments, Their Evolution and Geographic Spreading »] in *Muzyka i zhizn'*, 5-6, 1910, p. 1-21.

[32] See Sokal'skii, *Ruskaia narodnaia muzyka Velikorusskaia i maloruskaia v eia stroenii melodicheskom i ritmicheskom i otlichii eia ot osnov sovremennoi garmonicheskoi muzyki*, Khar'kov, Tip. Adol'fa Darre, 1888, p. 366. Piotr Petrovich Sokal'skii (1832-1887) – a composer, chemist (in 1855 graduated from Khar'kov Institute as a Master in chemistry), and music activist. Since 1855 Sokal'skii wrote a number of articles on chemistry, farming, and music published in Russian journals and newspapers, such as *Vremia*, *St-Peterburgskie vedomosti*, *Muzykal'nyi listok*, *Novorossiiski telegraf*, *Odesskii listok*, *Muzykal'noe obozrenie*. From 1856 to 1858 Sokal'skii lived in New York and worked as a private secretary and children's teacher for Russian consul general Notbek. After winning second prize from the Russian Music Society in St. Petersburg in 1861 for his cantata *Pir Petra Velikogo*, Sokal'skii went to the Russian capital to meet with Dargomyzhsky, where he also met Stasov, Balakirev, and Cui. He started studying at the St. Petersburg Conservatoire but never finished his studies because of his poor health. In 1864 Sokal'skii organized an

amateur choir in Odessa. In 1866 Sokal'skii along with other musicians organized « Russian concerts » (performing exclusively music by Russian composers) to gather money for a public music school. During the Russian-Turkish War he served as a military correspondent (1876-78). Besides two operas (Osada Dubno and Maiskaia noch) and one cantata, Sokal'skii wrote art-songs and chamber works. See G.B. Bernandt and I.M. Yampol'skii, *Kto pisał o muzyke* [Who wrote on music], vol. 3, Moscow, Sovetskii kompozitor, 1979, pp. 81-2; T. Karysheva, P. Sokal'skii. Zhizn' i tvorcestvo, Moscow, Sovetskii kompozitor, 1984.

[33] Petr Petrovich Sokal'skii, « Kitaiskaia gamma v russkoi narodnoi muzyke », published in *Muzykal'noe obozrenie*, 26-28, 1886, p. 204-5, 209-11, 217-220; Sokal'skii, *Russkaya narodnaia muzyka*, op. cit.

[34] See A. Christianowitsch, *Esquisse historique de la musique arabe aux temps anciens avec dessins d'instruments et 40 mélodies notées et harmonisées par Christianowitsch*, Cologne, Librairie de M. Dumont Schauberg, 1863, pp. xix-xx. See Taruskin, « Slava! » in *Opera News*, 55/9, 19 Jan. 1991, p. 18-21.

[35] See A.F. Rittikh, « Materialy dlia etnografii Rossii. Kazanskaia Gubernia » [Russian Ethnographic Materials. Kazan's province], Kazan', Imperatorskii Kazanskii Universitet, 1870, pp. 37-8.

[36] Sokal'skii, op. cit., p. 45.

[37] A. Serov, « Russkaia narodnaia pesnia kak predmet nauki », in *Muzykal'nyi sezon*, 6, 1870, p. 2.

[38] Sokal'skii never used the term « pentatonic », and mostly, yet paradoxically, referred to the scale as « Chinese » or « Scottish ».

[39] Sokal'skii, op. cit., p. 40.

[40] *Ibid.*, p. 42.

[41] *Ibid.*, p. 177. Helmholtz, *Die Lehre von den Tonempfindungen*, op. cit., p. 437.

[42] Some earlier Western European writers have drawn parallels between Arab-Persian and European musical instruments. See F.-J. Fétis, *Histoire générale de la musique depuis les temps les plus anciens jusqu'à nos jours*, vol. 2, Paris, Typographie Firmin Didot, 1869.

[43] Sokal'skii, op. cit., p. 156-7. By the time that Sokal'skii wrote this work, statements about the Arabic provenance of the European « rebab » were commonplace. Fétis, op. cit., p. 107. However, unlike Sokal'skii, earlier writers, such as Fétis and Christianowitsch,



considered « kemângeh roumy » (not « rebab ») as the ancestor of the European violin. See Fétis, *Histoire générale*, *op. cit.*, p. 140; Christianowitsch, *op. cit.*, p. 30.

[44] Sokal'skii, *op. cit.*, p. 157. Christianowitsch drew a link between these instruments and various peoples. See, Christianowitsch, *op. cit.*, p. 30.

[45] In relation to *Zirafkand*, Sokal'skii cites R.G. Kiesewetter's, *Die Musik der Araber, nach Originalquellen Dargestellt*, Leipzig, Breitkopf und Härtel, 1842, and H. Helmholtz's *Die Lehre von den Tonempfindungen*. See Sokal'skii, *op. cit.*, p. 155.

[46] Although the leading note eventually does resolve to the first degree via the dominant, Sokal'skii disregards this point.

[47] Sokal'skii, *op. cit.*, pp. 161-162.

[48] *Ibid.*, p. 169. On Arabic modes (maqams) of *Hijāzand Nawá Athar*, see Scott L. Marcus, « Modulation in Arab Music : Documenting Oral Concepts, Performance Rules and Strategies », in *Ethnomusicology*, 36/2, 1992, p. 171-195, here 175.

[49] Sokal'skii, *op. cit.*, p. 174.

[50] *Ibid.*, p. 177.

[51] *Ibid.*, p. 178.

[52] *Ibid.*, p. 177.

[53] See A.S. Famintsyn, *Drevniaia indo-kitaiskaia gamma v Azii i Evrope [An Ancient Hindu-Chinese scale in Asia and Europe]*, Saint Petersburg, tip. Iu. Schtaufa, 1889. Famintsyn, Alexander Sergeevich (1841-96), was a Russian music historian, critic and composer, educated in the natural sciences at St Petersburg University and in music at the Leipzig Conservatory (studying under Moritz Hauptmann, E.F. Richter, Carl Riedel, and I. Mocheles). He was appointed professor of music history and aesthetics at the St. Petersburg Conservatory (1865–72); between 1869 and 1871 he edited the periodical *Muzykal'nyi sezon* and later contributed to Bessel's *Muzykal'nyi listok* and other journals. From 1870 to 1880 he was secretary to the directorate of the Imperial Russian Musical Society. A short biography with a list of his writings is found in G.B. Bernandt and I.M. Yampol'skii, *Kto pisal o muzyke*, vol. 3, pp. 149-151; and Gerald Abraham, « Famints'in, Aleksandr Sergeevich », in *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online*, <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/09279> (accessed August 30, 2010). Famintsyn's education in pure science left a pronounced mark on his approach to Russian music theory and history, for which he was criticized by the members

of Balakirev's circle. Although he was one of Stasov's chief adversaries, and famous for instigating the first musical trial brought against him, Famintsyn, nonetheless, often reiterated Stasov's ideas on the origins of Russian culture. See Stasov's « Po povodu pis'ma Famintsyna », an open letter to the *St-Petersburgskie vedomosti*, in *Sobranie sochinenii V.V. Stasova*, vol. 3, pp. 442-9. Famintsyn's hostility to the music of the Kuchka played the fatal role in research on his life. His theoretical and compositional works have been completely forgotten and until now neither Soviet/Russian nor Western European researchers have investigated this figure.

[54] *Ibid.*, p. 167. Unfortunately, Famintsyn does not provide exact geographical parameters for his conception of Central Asia. From what he writes, however, it seems that Central Asia does not include Persia, nor the Arabic or Mongol worlds.

[55] See Famintsyn, *Hindu-Chinese Scale*, *op. cit.*, p. 115.

[56] *Ibid.*, p. 63.

[57] *Ibid.*, p. 122.

[58] *Ibid.*, p. 130.

[59] *Ibid.*, p. 127.

[60] *Ibid.*, pp. 128-9.

[61] *Ibid.*, p. 127.

[62] Rimsky-Korsakov, *100 Pesen*, p. 159. Famintsyn never talks about the metrical placement of pitches, which would help in understanding his preference of cutting certain scale degrees. Using a similar approach in the analysis of tunes, Famintsyn lists all Russian « pentatonic » melodies in the collection of Balakirev, Abramychev, Mel'gunov, and Prokunin.

[63] Famintsyn, *op. cit.*, pp. 27-9.

[64] S.G. Rybakov, *Muzyka i pesni ural'skikh musul'man s ocherkom ikh byta* [Music and Songs of Ural Muslims with the Essay on their Way of Life], Saint Petersburg, Tip. Imperatorskoi Akademii Nauk, 1897, p. 273; Lunin, *Nauchnye obshchestva Turkestana*, p. 30; Knight, « Grigor'ev in Orenburg », pp. 95; Brower, p. 8. Some members of the Kirkiz-Kaisak tribe in fact were educated in Russian military schools and were recruited by the Russian military intelligence office. For example, Chokan Valikhanov served as an officer of the Russian army and went to Turkestan to gather intelligence on the political situation and

military state of affairs in Central Asia. See Kermit E. McKenzie, « Chokan Valikhanov : Kazakh Princeling and Scholar », in *Central Asian Survey* 80/3, 1989, pp. 1-30. As a famous nineteenth-century Russian orientalist, V. Radlov, observed, many members of nomadic tribes (Kyrgyz, Kara-Kalpaks, and Turkomans) often fought on the Russian side against the Central Asian town population. See V.V. Radlov, « Sredniaia Zeravshanskaia dolina » [A Middle Zaravshan Valley], in *Zapiski IRGO po otdeleniiu etnografii*, 6/1, 1880, pp. 1-93; here p. 73.

[65] Famintsyn, *op. cit.* p. 173.

[66] *Ibid.*, pp. 56-70.

[67] The statement on affinity between music of Greece, Brittany, Ireland, and Russia was pronounced few years earlier by Bourgault-Ducoudray in his *Trente mélodies populaires de Grèce et d'Orient*, Paris, Henry Lemoine, 1876, pp. 14-16, and « La Musique primitive conservée par les montagnes », *Annuaire du Club alpin français*, 1884, p. 9. While Famintsyn believed that pentatonicism was the key element of Aryan musical identity, the French theoretician claimed that the presence of Hypodorian and Hypophrygian modes confirms the hypothesis of shared origins of the Aryan people. *Ibid.*

[68] G. Adler and Erica Mugglestone, « Guido Adler's 'The Scope, Method, and Aim of Musicology' (1885) : An English Translation with a Historico-Analytical Commentary by Erica Mugglestone », in *Yearbook for Traditional Music*, vol. 13, 1981, pp. 1-21. Actually, one can even say that Famintsyn was inclined to German thought not only because he spent two years studying in Leipzig, but also because of the centuries-long Russian-German history of mutual attraction. See Walter Laqueur, « Russian-German Attitudes », in *Russia and Germany. A Century of Conflict*, New Jersey, Little Brown and Co., 1990, pp. 21-37.

[69] Adler, *op. cit.*, p. 13.

[70] See Peter G. Toner, « The Gestation of Cross-Cultural Music Research and the Birth of Ethnomusicology », in *Humanities Research*, 14/1, 2007, pp. 85-110; here p. 91.

[71] See Vanessa Agnew, « The Colonialist Beginnings of Comparative Musicology » in Eric Ames, Marcia Klotz, Lora Wildenthal, eds. *Germany's Colonial Pasts*, Lincoln and London, University of Nebraska Press, 2005, p. 43.

[72] See Famintsyn, *Ancient Hindu-Chinese Scale*, p. 27.

[73] See F.J. Fétis, « Sur un nouveau mode de classification des races humaines d'après leurs systèmes musicaux », in *Bulletins de la Soc. D'Anthrop.*, t. II, Série II, Paris, 1867.

[74] See Jann Pasler, « Theorizing Race in Nineteenth-Century France : Music as Emblem of Identity », in *The Musical Quarterly*, downloaded from <http://mq.oxfordjournals.org> at McGill University Libraries on August 9, 2010, p. 465. On Fétis's work, see Émile Haraszti, « Fétis fondateur de la musicologie comparée. Son étude sur un nouveau mode de classification des races humaines d'après leurs systèmes musicaux. Contribution à l'œuvre de Fétis », in *Acta Musicologica*, 4, 1932, p. 97-103.

[75] In relation to music with simple structure Famintsyn also lists examples from Abyssinia, Moravia, Slovakia, Switzerland, Finland, and the southern Slavic countries, pointing out that the tunes' relative simplicity is due to the influence of musical instruments whose simple melodies became the basis for vocal tunes. Famintsyn, op. cit., pp. 32-35.

[76] Famintsyn, op. cit., p. 37.

[77] On German ethnology and diffusionism, see Robert H. Lowie, *The History of Ethnological Theory*, New York, Rinehart and Company, 1937; Raoul and Frada Naroll, eds., *Main Currents in Cultural Anthropology*, New York, Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1973; Woodruff D. Smith, « Social and Political Origins of German Diffusionist Ethnology », in *Journal of the History of the Behavioral Sciences*, 14, 1978, pp. 103-12; W. D. Smith, *Politics and the Science of Culture in Germany 1840-1920*, New York and Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1991; J.M. Blaut, *The Colonizer's Model of the World. Geographical Diffusionism and Eurocentric History*, New York, The Guilford Press, 1993; H. Glenn Penny, *Objects of Culture : Ethnology and Ethnographic Museums in Imperial Germany*, Chapel Hill (N.C.) and London, University of North Carolina Press, 2002.

[78] Famintsyn refers to his *Die Urberöckerung Europas* (1874).

[79] W. Smith, *Politics*, p. 103.

[80] Some Russian ethnographers of German ancestry, such as Karl von Baer (a leading figure in Russian Geographical Society), also were proponents of geographical determinism, claiming that history is predetermined by geography. See Nathaniel Knight, « Science, Empire, and Nationality : Ethnography in the Russian Geographical Society, 1845-1855 », in Jane Burbank and David Ransel, eds., *Imperial Russia : New Histories for the Empire*, Bloomington, Indiana University Press, 1998, p. 118.

[81] Famintsyn, p. 8.

[82] Lowie, *The History of Ethnological Theory*, p. 184, Smith, *Politics*, p. 142.

[83] See Lowie, *The History of Ethnological Theory*, p. 184.

[84] W. D. Smith, « German Diffusionist Ethnology », p. 108.

[85] At the beginning of the twentieth century, Famintsyn's theory that the pentatonic scale connects music of all Aryan races became central to the Eurasianist theory of Russia's Asian ethnic basis, pronounced by Nikolai S. Trubetskoi. See N. Trubetskoi, « The Upper and Lower Stories of Russian Culture (The Ethnic Basis of Russian Culture) », in *Iskhod k Vostoku. Predchuvstviia i sversheniia* [*Exodus to the East. Forebodings and Events. An Affirmation of the Eurasians*], eds. Ilya Venkovetskii and Charles Schlacks, Idyllwild, Charles Schlacks, Jr., Publisher, 1996, pp. 80-94, here p. 89.

[86] Viacheslav Ivanovich Petr (1848-1923) was born in Opochin (Bohemia) in the family of a music teacher; studied at the Prague University (theory department); served in the army in Odessa, Kamenets-Podol'sk, and Kiev. From 1909 was appointed professor of Nezhinsk History-Philology Institute. See *Kto pisal o muzyke*, vol. 2, p. 277.

[87] V. I. Petr, « O melodicheskom sklade ariiskoi pesni. Istoriko-sravnitel'nyi opyt. I. Chast' teoreticheskaia. II. Chast' prakticheskaia » [About a Melodic Structure of Aryan Song. Experience in Comparative History. I. Theoretical Part and II. Practical Part], in *Russkaia muzykal'naia gazeta* no.1, 1897, pp. 3-28; and 1897-1898, Annex, p. 1-56.

[88] Petr, « O melodicheskom sklade », Part I, pp. 27-28.

[89] *Ibid.*, pp. 1-2.

[90] Petr considered the principle of comparative studies so important to his own work that it bore the subtitle : « history-comparative experiment » [istoriko-sravnitel'nyi opyt].

[91] *Ibid.*, p. 10.

[92] Famintsyn, p. 6. Petr adds islands to the list of places where one should be looking for examples of music uncorrupted by modern civilization. See Petr, Part I, p. 10.

[93] Although Petr could have heard an ensemble of Asian musicians at the 1896 All-Russian Exhibition in Novgorod, he never referred to this event and/or the sound of Asian music *per se*.

[94] According to Famintsyn, only Russian folksongs deserve true attention, as he believes that most of them are unspoiled by the Western constraints imposed by « high art ». Western music, on the other hand, is corrupted by « art music » since any art form « deviates folklore from its original and age-old path » and effaces indigenous

characteristics of a particular folk tradition, « vulgarizing and depersonalizing it ». *Ibid.*, p. 6. Sokal'skii also claims that « Russian folk music was created without any influence of Hellenic-Roman civilization, which became the basis of the Western European culture of higher classes ». Sokal'skii, p. 366.

[95] On Russian history of the ideology that led to the war see Schimmelpenninck van der Oye, *Toward the Rising Sun*.

## Pour citer ce document

---

Par Adalyat Issiyeva, «« Connected by the ties of blood »: Musical Scales in the Quest for the Russian/Asian Identity», *Revue du Centre Européen d'Etudes Slaves* [En ligne], La revue, Numéro 2, Imaginaire collectif slave et construction identitaire, mis à jour le : 03/07/2013, URL : <https://etudesslaves.edel.univ-poitiers.fr/index.php?id=527>.

## Quelques mots à propos de : [Adalyat Issiyeva](#)

---

Adalyat Issiyeva est candidate au doctorat, sous la direction de Steven Huebner, à l'université McGill, où elle travaille sur les implications politiques de la mélodie russe à thème oriental du XIXe siècle. Ses recherches sont financées par le Fonds de recherche du Québec – Société et culture (FRQSC), le Conseil de recherches en sciences humaines du Canada (CRSH) et l'École de musique Schulich. Adalyat Issiyeva a participé à de nombreux colloques, dont ceux de l'American Association for the Adva ...

## Propriété intellectuelle

La reproduction et la représentation sont formellement interdites sauf autorisation expresse du titulaire des droits.