

# Relation between low latitude insolation and $\delta$ 18 O change of atmospheric oxygen for the last 200 kyrs, as revealed by Mediterranean sapropels

M.-A. Mélières, M. Rossignol-Strick, B. Malaizé

### ► To cite this version:

M.-A. Mélières, M. Rossignol-Strick, B. Malaizé. Relation between low latitude insolation and  $\delta$  18 O change of atmospheric oxygen for the last 200 kyrs, as revealed by Mediterranean sapropels. Geophysical Research Letters, 1997, 24 (10), pp.1235-1238. 10.1029/97GL01025 . hal-03335010

## HAL Id: hal-03335010 https://hal.science/hal-03335010v1

Submitted on 5 Sep 2021

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

# Relation between low latitude insolation and $\delta^{18}O$ change of atmospheric oxygen for the last 200 kyrs, as revealed by Mediterranean sapropels

#### M.-A. Mélières

Laboratoire de Glaciologie et Géophysique de l'Environnement, CNRS, Université Joseph Fourier de Grenoble, St-Martin d'Hères, France

#### M. Rossignol-Strick

Laboratoire de Paléontologie et Stratigraphie, Université Pierre et Marie Curie, Paris, France

#### B. Malaizé

Laboratoire de Modélisation du Climat et de l'Environnement, CEA/DSM, Gif sur Yvette, France

Abstract. The isotopic ratio of atmospheric  $O_2$ ,  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$ , deduced from ice cores, displays large fluctuations during climatic cycles. These are caused principally by changes in the oxygen isotopic ratio of sea-water,  $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$ , and changes in the biosphere and in the hydrological cycle. As both  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$  and  $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$  coincide closely over the last 135 kyr BP, it is generally believed that  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$  is driven mainly by  $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$ . Here we focus on the major discrepancy, which arises between those two signals during the prior isotopic glacial stage 6, around 175 kyr BP, discrepancy which calls into question the role of changes in  $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$  as the driving mechanism for  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$ . We present arguments, based on the occurrence and pollen content of Mediterranean sapropels, for another source of the  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$  change: insolation at low latitudes via hydrosphere/biosphere activity.

#### Introduction

The changes in isotopic ratio of atmospheric oxygen,  $\delta^{18}O_{atm},$  have been recorded by analysing air trapped in icecores [Bender et al., 1985; Horibe et al., 1985; Sowers et al., 1991; Sowers et al., 1993; Jouzel et al., 1993; Bender et al., 1994a]. These are caused principally by changes in the isotopic composition of sea-water,  $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$ , and changes in the biosphere and in the hydrological cycle [Bender et al, 1994b]. Over the last 135 kyr BP,  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$  displays variations similar to those of  $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$  [Sowers et al., 1993; Bender et al., 1994a]. During the Quaternary  $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$  oscillates in response to the glacial-interglacial climatic oscillations reflecting primarily the volume in continental ice [Shackelton, 1987]. The isotopic ratio of atmospheric oxygen,  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$  is related, but not equal, to that of sea water, the difference being the Dole effect. The mechanism of this effect has recently been the subject of detailed investigations by Bender et al., [1994b]. On the basis of the similarity between the two signals over the last 135 kyrs, Sowers et al. [1993], and Bender et al. [1994b] concluded that the atmospheric change is driven mainly by the sea water change and noted the existence of secondary factors associated with biosphere activity and hydrological cycle. In this scenario, variations in  $\delta^{18}$ O of sea-water are transferred to atmospheric oxygen through the atmosphere-biosphere coupling. This coupling involves the O2 cycle through biospheric processes (photosynthesis, respiration, decay), with a turnover time for  $O_2$  through the biosphere of the order of 1,2 kyr [Bender et al., 1994b].

Copyright 1997 by the American Geophysical Union.

Paper number 97GL01025. 0094-8534/97/97GL-01025\$05.00

Recently published analyses of the deeper part of the Vostok ice-core [Jouzel et al., 1993; Bender et al., 1994a; Jouzel et al., 1996] provide data that are inconsistent with the above interpretation. It covers the isotopic stages 6 and 7. During stage 6, the high and practically constant recorded value of  $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$  (Figure 1a) indicates that the climate was fully glacial, with the ice caps at maximum extension. In the Vostok record only minor fluctuations are recorded (Figure1e). In the interpretation of Bender et al.[1994b], a constant value of  $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$  implies that no large amplitude variation in the  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$  signal is expected during that stage. During early glacial stage 6, however,  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$  displays a strong variation with a conspicuous minimum similar to that of interglacial stages (Figure 1f). The most direct approach to compare these two signals would be to analyse their difference. Since, however, the chronology of the two records is independent, either time scale can lead or lag by a few kyrs, and their absolute difference is hence uncertain. This question was investigated by Bender et al. [1994b]. It is not, in fact, necessary to know in detail the absolute chronology in order to grasp the basic mechanism: the first requirement is to know to which climatic stage a given variation belongs. In this part of the ice-core the deuterium record [Vostok project members, 1995, Jouzel et al., 1996], which reflects temperature changes, together with the dust record [Jouzel et al., 1996] which reflects full glacial stage maxima, allow stage 7.1 to be unambiguously attributed at the depth of 2,500 m (Figure 1e). This allows one to relate the occurence of the conspicuous  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$  minimum at 2,300 m to the substage 6.5 occuring at 176 kyr BP [Imbrie et al., 1984]. If this minimum really occurs in a glacial period, it contrasts strongly with later minima, all of which arise during warm interglacials /interstadials. In that case, the presence of this strong oscillation would show that, during stage 6, the change in  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$  is not caused by marine isotopic variations, since the latter were weak or absent during that period: the cause must be looked for elsewhere.

Here we confirm that early stage 6 was indeed fully glacial, as confirmed by the pollen content of sapropel in marin sediment of the eastern Mediterranean. We then go on to investigate another possible cause of the  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$  variation: the change in low latitude insolation.

#### Discussion

Glacial stages are concomitant with low eustatic sea level, which correspond to high values of  $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$ . However, estimates of  $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$  are indirectly obtained from  $\delta^{18}O$  in

for aminifera tests, which can be subject to other influences such as temperature and salinity. These uncertainties are illustrated by the difficulty of establishing the mean  $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$ , and therefore of reconstructing the absolute variation of the

Figure 1. 1a: The  $\delta^{18}$ O deep-sea record from SPECMAP Stack curve, SPECMAP time scale developed by *Imbrie et al.* [1984], based on normalized planktonic records. The corresponding isotopic stages are indicated.

1b: Sequence of sapropel in the Eastern Mediterranean sea sediment. The stratigraphic position is defined by the isotopic curve in the same cores where they are observed [Vergnaud-Grazzini, 1977; Cita, 1977; Fontugne, 1992]. Climate of the Mediterranean northern borderland during sapropel deposition (see Figure 2) was warm and humid (w), intermediate (int) or cold and arid (c) [Rossignol-Strick et al., 1971; Rossignol-Strick 1973; Rossignol-Strick, 1985; Cheddadi et al.; 1995].

1c: Northern Hemisphere insolation in June at low latitude (23,5°N) expressed as a deviation,  $\Delta I$ , from the 1950 value [*Berger*, 1978].

1d: Position and magnitude of Monsoon Index maxima as defined by *M. Rossignol Strick* [1983]. They express the strength of the African Monsoon. The threshold for sapropels is indicated.

le: Vostok (Antarctica) isotope temperature ( $\delta D_{ice}$ ) as a function of the depth [*Vostok project members*; 1995]. The corresponding isotopic stages are indicated.

1f:  $\delta^{18}$ O of atmospheric oxygen [*Jouzel*, 1993] measured as function of depth in air bubbles trapped in the Vostok ice core (*M. Bender*, private communication). As the bubbles close at about 100 m depth, a time delay exists between the two records (1e and 1f), ranging from 2.5 to 6 kyrs depending of the climatic conditions [*Barnola*, 1991]. During stage 1 the  $\delta^{18}$ O minimum arise around 7-8 kyrs BP [*Bender*, 1994a; *Bender*, 1994b]. sea level, or the intensity of the glacial stages. It is therefore of importance for our argument to ascertain that the oscillation of  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$  around 175 kyr BP really corresponds to glacial conditions. Mediterranean sapropel deposits provide the required confirmation.

Sapropels are discrete, black, organic-rich thin layers that were deposited basin-wide in Eastern Mediterranean sea sediments at intermittent intervals throughout the Quaternary. In these anoxic sediments, pollens are far better preserved than in the other parts of the core, and thus yield unequalled insight into the climate around the Mediterranean basin. Their sequence (labelled S1, S3, S4, S5, S6 and S7, see Figure 1b) has been correlated stratigraphically with the  $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$  curve established for foraminifera in the same core [Vergnaud-Grazzini, 1977; Cita, 1977; Fontugne, 1992]. According to this stratigraphy in the last 200 kyrs all deposits of sapropels except one (S6) occurred during isotopically interglacial/ interstadial stages (i. e. warm stages). The outstanding sapropel S6 was formed during early isotopic glacial stage 6 around 175 kyr BP in the marine chronology. Pollen records of the sapropels reveal the climate of the Mediterranean northern borderland at the time of their deposition [Rossignol-Strick et al., 1971; Rossignol-Strick 1973; Rossignol-Strick, 1985; Cheddadi et al., 1995]. In core RC9-191 (Figure 2), this record confirms that the climate was warm and humid during S1, S5 and S7 (corresponding to interglacial 1, 5.5, and 7.1) moderately warm during S3 and S4 (corresponding to interstadial 5.1, 5.3) and cold and dry during S6 (corresponding to early glacial stage 6) (Figure 1b). Thus the pollen record establishes conclusively that early isotopic stage 6 displayed cold, arid, glacial conditions in the Mediterranean region during the deposition of sapropel S6. Glacial conditions for S6 are also supported from the foraminiferal assemblages in other eastern Mediterranean sediment cores [Cita et al. 1977]. The pollen content and foraminifera of sapropel S6 thus show that glacial conditions prevailed during early stage 6, which confirms that  $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$ stays high at the same time as  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$  displays a strong variation. We can thus conclude that the variation of  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$ is not caused by marine isotopic variations during that stage.

A possible cause for the atmospheric variation is a change in insolation via hydro/biospheric activity, which is a mechanism of isotopic separation [Bender, 1994b]. Insofar as the hydro/biosphere at mean and high latitudes remains glacial during stage 6, significant changes in activity can occur only at low latitudes. The variation in hydro/biospheric activity is therefore connected to insolation changes at low latitudes only. Throughout the whole period under consideration, within the chronological uncertainty, the maxima of summer insolation at Northern Low Latitude (NLL) [Berger, 1978] coincide with the minima of  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$  (Figure 1). In particular, a strong maximum of summer insolation arises at 176 kyr BP during early isotopic stage 6 where the unexplained minimum in  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$  occurs. This corroborates the hypothesis that the variations in  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$  stem from low latitude hydro/biospheric changes via low latitude insolation.

Further support for this hypothesis comes from the sequence of sapropels, which, as discussed below, are indicators of enhanced hydrological activity at low latitudes. The link between sapropel formation and enhanced hydrological activity was first suggested by the co-occurrence of the most recent sapropel, S1, and the most humid recent phase in intertropical Africa [Rossignol-Strick et al., 1982]. Radiocarbon dates for the initiation of S1, established on 50 cores [Fontugne, 1994] are around 9 Kyr bp (10.3 Kyr BP calendar years [Bard, 1993]). The close coincidence of this initiation with the maximum of summer NLL insolation at 11 Kyr BP, calendar years [Cheddadi et al., 1995] corroborates the



scenario proposed by M. Rossignol-Strick et al.[1982]. The African monsoon feeds the Ethiopian highland rainfall, which the Nile river then channels into the Mediterranean sea. Modelling has shown that high insolation at low latitudes in



Figure 2. Pollen diagram of Late Quaternary sapropels, numbered according to ref. 11, in a deep-sea core from the Ionian sea, Eastern Mediterranean (sapropel 2 is absent). Sapropels are identified and dated (see Figure 1) by their stratigraphic position in agreement with cores with isotopic stratigraphy [*Imbrie*, 1984; *Vergnaud-Grazzini*, 1977; *Cita*, 1977] The pollen sum in each sample is 300 to 500 (Pinus pollen excluded) [*Rossignol-Strick et al.*, 1989].

A - Percentage of tree (Pinus excluded) and herb pollen. Dominance of tree pollen (S1, S3, S4, S5 and S7) indicates that the pollen source area, here the southern slopes of Italy and the Balkan peninsula, was forested at all altitudes, in response to warm and humid regional conditions (interglacial). Dominance of herb pollen (S6) indicates an open landscape, in response to dry and cold conditions (glacial period). These conditions are confirmed by the isotopic stratigraphy and comparison with pollen diagrams from Greece [Bottema, 1974; Wijmstra; 1969] and Italy [Follieri, 1988].

B - Percentage of pollen for two dominant taxa, the tree Quercus (oak), the grass Artemisia (sage-brush), and of the sum of other mesic (thriving in temperate, humid/warm conditions) trees excluding Quercus (Ulmus, Tilia, Corylus, Alnus, Carpinus, Ostrya, Zelkova, Fagus, Acer, Betula, Abies), that further document tree/herb categories. Sapropel 1 forms during the early part of the present interglacial: frostfree winters and drought-free summers in the Mediterranean domain, at least at mid-altitudes. Sapropel 3, during isotopic stage 5.1, and sapropel 4, in stage 5.3, form under interstadial climate. Sapropel 5, in stage 5.5, is clearly interglacial. In glacial stage 6, sapropel 6 reveals a regionally cold and dry climate. The vegetal cover is a sparse, sage-brush semi-desert at most elevations. Mesic trees are eliminated from mid-high elevation by low temperatures, and from low elevation by drought. Sapropel 7, in stage 7.1, displays high percentage of tree pollen (Quercus + other mesic trees), as do sapropels 1 and 5. During the most favourable interglacial conditions of high available moisture and warmth, the source area is forested.

the Northern summer induces heavier Asian and African monsoon precipitation [Kutzbach, 1984]. In the East Mediterranean heavy Nile discharge appears as a sudden dramatic input of a large volume of fresh water. Such water forms a low salinity surface layer that inhibits deep convection and ventilation of bottom water, which then becomes anoxic. Unoxidised refractory biodetritus thus accumulates in the sediment, which becomes a sapropel. Sapropels are thus the result of increased monsoon activity through strong summer insolation. The link between sapropel formation and variation of insolation has been extended to the sapropels of the last 400 kyrs [Rossignol-Strick, 1983]. Absence of sapropels at 33, 61 and 151 kyr BP reflects lower than threshold values of the insolation maxima [Rossignol-Strick, 1983; Rossignol-Strick, 1985] (Figure 1c and 1d). Observation of Mediterranean sapropels over the last 200 kyrs is of interest for two reasons. First the sequence of sapropels is coeval with the strongest  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$  minima (Figure 1). This is consistent with our hypothesis that the minima in  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$ are driven by low latitude hydro/biospheric activity, which is a mechanism for isotopic separation, and which is illustrated by the sapropel deposits. Second, sapropels are the only physical record proving that summer NLL insolation maxima can be decoupled from the glacial/interglacial stages. Although most sapropels do coincide with a warm stage, the existence of the glacial sapropel S6 is a demonstration that a strong maximum in summer NLL insolation can coexist with a glacial stage. The same behaviour is found for the  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$ oscillations, which are decoupled from the glacial condition during early stage 6. The reason that the insolation maximum did not trigger deglaciation, an event unique in the last 200 kyrs, is a complex phenomenon that lies outside the scope of this article.

#### Conclusion

Since  $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$  in the oceanic reservoir remains glacial we concluded that this reservoir did not make significant contribution to the observed strong oscillation in  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$ . Thus for this period, the previous interpretation that atmospheric change is mainly driven by sea water change, is not tenable. Consequently the minimum observed in  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$ around 176 kyr BP has another origin. As middle and northern latitudes do not experience during that stage any drastic change (climate stays glacial as revealed by sea-level and sapropel pollen content) we suggest that this minimum can plausibly be attributed to a change in biospheric and /or hydrologic activities at low latitudes - a change which is driven by insolation. Furthermore, insolation could be the driving mechanism of the other minima, both earlier and later, since both the minima in  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$  and the sapropels all coincide with high summer northern low latitude insolation. However, the interpretation of these other minima may be more complicated, because they may also include the change of  $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$  in the oceanic reservoir which can no longer be neglected as during stage 6. This leads to the final question: to what extent  $\delta^{18}O_{sw}$  which is not the cause of the large change in  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$  during stage 6 is, as previously believed, the dominant factor in the variations of  $\delta^{18}O_{atm}$  during the other periods? The low latitude hydro/biospheric activity, which has a potential impact as already mentioned by Bender et al., [1994b], could have an important contribution.

Acknowledgments. This research has been performed in the frame of the PNEDC (Programme National d'Etude de la Dynamique du Climat) and of the Environment and Climate Programme of the European Commission. Core RC-191 has been kindly made available to one of us (M. Rossignol-Strick) by the Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory Core Repository supported by the VS National Science Foundation. Its study was also supported by NSF. We thank M. Bender, L. Labeyrie, J. Jouzel, J.-M. Barnola, J. Chapellaz, I. Basile and E. Geissler for their encouragement and comments. Special thanks to W. B. F. Ryan for critically reviewing the manuscript.

#### References

- Bard, E., M. Arnold, R.C. Fairbank and B. Hamelin, <sup>220</sup>Th, <sup>234</sup>U and <sup>14</sup>C age obtained by mass spectrometry on corals, Radiocarbon, 35, 191, 1993.
- Barnola, J. M., P. Pimienta, D. Raynaud and Y. S. Korotkevich, CO2 climate relationship as deduced from the Vostok ice core: reexamination based on new measurements and reevaluation of the air dating, *Tellus*, 43b, 83-90, 1991. Bender, M.,L. Labeyrie, D. Raynaud, C. Lorius, Isotopic composition of
- atmospheric  $O_2$  in ice linked with deglaciation and global primary productivity, Nature, 318, 349-352, 1985.
- Bender, M., T. Sowers, M.-L. Dickson, J. Orchardo, P. Grootes, P. A. Mayeswsky and D. A. Meese, Climate correlations between Greenland and Antarctica during the past 100,000 years, *Nature*, 372, 663-666, 1994a. Bender, M., T.Sowers and L. Labeyrie, The Dole effect and its
- variations during the last 130,000 yeras as measured in the Vostok ice core, Global Biogeochem. Cycles, 8, 363-376, 1994b.
- Climatic change. J. Atmos. Sci., 35, 2362-2367, 1995.
- climatic change. J. Aimos. Sci., 53, 2502-2567, 1995.
  Bottema, S., Late Quaternary vegetation history of NW Greece, Ph. D. thesis, 190p., Univ. of Groningen, the Netherlands, 1974.
  Cheddadi, R. and M. Rossignol-Strick, Eastern Mediterranean quaternary paleoclimates from pollen and isotope records of marine cores in the Nile cone area, *Paleoceanography*, 10, 291-300, 1995.
  Cita, M. B., C. Vergnaud-Grazzini, C. Robert, H. Chamley, N. Ciaranfi and S. DUOnofio Paleoclimate from pollen long data area from the product of the page of the page of the page of the page of the page.

- Cita, M. B., C. Vergnaud-Grazzini, C. Robert, H. Chamley, N. Ciaranti and S. D'Onofrio, Paleoclimatic record of a long deep-sea core from the eastern Mediterranean, *Quat. Res.*, 8, 205-235, 1977.
  Follieri, M., D.Magri and L. Sadori, 250,000-year pollen record from Valle di Castiglione (Roma), *Pollen Spores*, 30, 329-356, 1988.
  Fontugne, M., M. Arnold, L. Labeyrie, M. Paterne, S. Calvert and J.-C. Duplessy, Paleoenvironnment, sapropel chronology and Nile river discharge during the last 20,000 years as indicated by deep-sea sediment records in the eastern mediterranean, in *Late Quaternary Chronology and Paleoclimates of the Fastern Meditergagen* (eds) Chronology and Paleoclimates of the Eastern Mediteranean (eds Bar-Yosef O. and Kra R. S.) 75-88 (Radiocarbon 1994).
- Fontugne, M. R., S. E.Calvert, Late pleistocene variability of the carbon isotopic composition of organic matter in the eastern mediterranean: monitor of changes in carbon sources and atmopsheric CO2
- concentrations, *Paleoceanography*, 7, 1-20, 1992. Horibe, Y., Shigehara, and C. Langway, Chemical and isotopic composition of an inclusion in a greenland ice core, *EPSL*, 73, 207-210, 1985.
- Imbrie, J., J. D. Hays, D. G. Martinson, A. Mc Intyre, A. C. Mix, J. J. Morley, N. G. Pisias, W. L; Prell, and N. J. Shackelton, The orbital theory of Pleistocene climate: support from a revised chronology of the marine <sup>18</sup>O record in *Milankovitch and climate*, ed. by A. Berger, J. Imbrie, J. Hays, G. Kukla, and B.Saltzman, pp.269-305, D. Reidel, Hingham, Mass., 1984.
- Jouzel, J., N. I. Barkov, J. M. Barnola, M. Bender, J. Chappellaz, C. genthon, V. M. Kotlyakov, V. Liupenkov, C. Lorius, J. R. petit, D. Raynaud, G. Raisbeck, C. Ritz, T. Sowers, M. Stievenard, F. Yiou and

- P. Yiou, Extending the Vostok ice core record of paleoclimate to the peniltumate glacial period, *Nature*, 364, 407-412, 1993. Juzel, J., C. Waelbroeck, B. Malaize, M. Bender, J. R. Petit, M. Stievenard, N. I. Barkov, J. M. Barnola, T. King, V. M. Kotllyakov, V. Lipenkov, C. Lorius, D. Raynaud, C. Ritz, and T. Sowers, Climatic Jouzel, J., C. interpretation of the recently extended Vostok ice records, Climate Dynamics, 12, 513-521, 1996.
- Kutzbach, J. E., and P. J. Guetter, The sensitivity of monsoon climates to orbital parameter changes for 9000 years BP: Experiments with NCAR general circulation model, in Milankovitch and climate, edited by A. Berger, J. Imbrie, J. Hays, G. Kukla and B.Saltzman, pp.801-820, D. Reidel, Hingham, Mass., 1984.
- Rossignol-Strick, M. and L. Pastouret, Analyse pollinique des niveaux sapropelliques post-glaciaires dans une carotte en Méditerranée orientale, Rev. Paleobot., Palynol., 11, 227-238, 1971.
- Rossignol-Strick, M., Analyse polliniques des niveaux sapropelliques quaternaires de deux carottes en Mediterranée orientale (RC9-174 et RC9-182), INQUA 9th, 152-159, 1973.
- Rossignol-Strick, M., Mediterranean Quaternary sapropels, an immediate response of the African Monsoon to variation of insolation, Paleogeogr., Paleoclimat., Paleoecol., 49, 237-263, 1985. Rossignol-Strick, M., W. Nesteroff, P. Olive and C. Vergnaud-Grazzini,
- After the deluge: Mediterranean stagnation and sapropel formation, Nature 295, 105-110, 1982.
- Rossignol-Strick, M., African monsoons, an immediate climate response to orbital insolation, *Nature*, 304, 46-49, 1983. Rossignol-Strick, M. and N. Planchais, Climate patterns revealed by
- pollen and oxygen isotope refords of a Tyrrhenian sea core, Nature, 342, 413-416, 1989.
- Shackleton, N. J., Oxygen isotopes, ice volume and sea level, Quatrenary Science Reviews, 6, 183-190, 1987.
- Sowers, T., M. Bender, L. Labeyrie, D. Martinson, J. Jouzel, D. Raynaud, J.-J. Pichon and Y. S. Korotkevitch, A 135,000-year Vostok-SECMAP common temporal framework, Paleoceanography, 8, 737-766, 1993.
- Sowers, T., M. Bender, D. Raynaud, Y. Korockevich, J. Orchardo, The  $d^{18}O$  of atmospheric O<sub>2</sub> from air inclusions in the Vostok ice core: Timing of CO<sub>2</sub> and ice volume changes during the penultimate
- delaciation, Paleoceanography, 6, 679-696, 1991. Vergnaud-Grazzini, C., W. B. F. Ryan, and M. B. Cita, Stable isotope fractionation, climate change and episodic stagnation in the eastern Mediterranean during the late Quaternary, Mar. Micropal., 2, 353-370, 1977.
- Vostok Project Members Internationaleffort helps decipher mysteries of Paleoclimate from Antarctic ice cores, EOS, 76, 169-170, 1995.
- Wijmstra, T. A., Palynology of a first 30 meters of a 120 m deep section in northern Greece, Acta Bot. Neer. 18, 511-527, 1969.

M.-A. Mélières, Laboratoire de Glaciologie et Géophysique de l'Environnement, CNRS, Université Joseph Fourier de Grenoble, 54 Rue Molière, 38402 Saint-Martin d'Hères cedex, France. (e-mail: Molieres@glaciog.ujf-grenoble.fr) M. Rossignol-Strick, Laboratoire de Paléontologie et Stratigraphie,

Boite 106, Université P. et M. Curie, 4 Place Jussieu, 75252 Paris cedex

Botte 106, Universite P. et M. Cuile, 4 Hace Jussiea, 1922 Faile College 05, France. (e-mail: mrstrick@ccr.jussieu.fr) B. Malaizé, Laboratoire de Modélisation du Climat et de l'Environnement, CEA/DSM CE Saclay, 91191 Gif sur Yvette, France. (e-mail: malaize@asterix.saclay.cea.fr)

(Received: January 16, 1997; revised: March 10, 1997; accepted March 20, 1997)