

# Nanostructured electrodes for electrocatalytic advanced oxidation processes: From materials preparation to mechanisms understanding and wastewater treatment applications

Xuedong Du, Mehmet Oturan, M. Zhou, Nacer Belkessa, P. Su, Jingju Cai, Clément Trellu, Emmanuel Mousset

## ▶ To cite this version:

Xuedong Du, Mehmet Oturan, M. Zhou, Nacer Belkessa, P. Su, et al.. Nanostructured electrodes for electrocatalytic advanced oxidation processes: From materials preparation to mechanisms understanding and wastewater treatment applications. Applied Catalysis B: Environmental, 2021, 296, pp.120332. 10.1016/j.apcatb.2021.120332 . hal-03261468

## HAL Id: hal-03261468 https://hal.science/hal-03261468v1

Submitted on 18 Nov 2021

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

# Nanostructured electrodes for electrocatalytic advanced oxidation processes: from materials preparation to mechanisms understanding and wastewater treatment applications

Xuedong DU<sup>1</sup>, Mehmet A. OTURAN<sup>1,2,\*</sup>, Minghua ZHOU<sup>1,\*</sup>, Nacer BELKESSA<sup>3</sup>, Pei SU<sup>1</sup>, Jingju CAI<sup>1</sup>, Clément TRELLU<sup>2</sup>, Emmanuel MOUSSET<sup>3,\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Key Laboratory of Pollution Process and Environmental Criteria, Ministry of Education, College of Environmental Science and Engineering, Nankai University, Tianjin 300350, China
<sup>2</sup> Université Gustave Eiffel, Laboratoire Géomatériaux et Environnement (EA 4508), UPEM, 77454, Marne-la-Vallée, France

<sup>3</sup> Laboratoire Réactions et Génie des Procédés, Université de Lorraine, CNRS, LRGP, F-54000 Nancy,

France

## **ACCEPTED IN**

## **APPLIED CATALYSIS B: ENVIRONMENTAL JOURNAL**

\* Corresponding authors' Emails: <u>mehmet.oturan@univ-eiffel.fr</u> (Mehmet A. Oturan), <u>zhoumh@nankai.edu.cn</u> (Minghua Zhou), <u>emmanuel.mousset@univ-lorraine.fr</u> (Emmanuel Mousset)

## 1 Abstract

2 The implementation of nanostructured materials in electrochemistry implied the enhancement of conversion yield in fuel cell, in electrosynthesis of oxidants and electrolytic treatment for 3 environmental protection, while it allowed reducing the detection limit in electroanalysis. 4 Nanostructured materials are becoming a hot topic of research, especially in electrochemical 5 6 treatment for environmental applications that is strongly related to the rise of graphene and 7 subsequent 2D materials that emerged in the last ten years. Nano-structuration allows bringing new properties of the materials such as number of active sites and conductivity improvement. 8 9 It can therefore enhance the heterogeneous catalysis mechanism at electrode surface. This is primordial since it makes increase the rate of electrochemical reactions that can be the rate 10 limiting steps in electrocatalytic treatment. Such advanced materials contribute to make 11 12 advanced electrochemical processes as "greener" processes than the conventional ones.

This paper aims to be a comprehensive, critical, and accessible review of general interest. The literature covers mainly the last ten years' period due to the recent topic, especially the last five years with the considerable increase of number of publications in this period. The contents particularly devote efforts to establish links between the nanostructured-based electrode properties and electrochemical treatment efficiency through the mechanisms involved. The perspectives about mechanisms understanding and electrodes stability improvement are especially discussed.

20

Keywords: Nanostructured electrodes; electrooxidation; Electro-Fenton; Oxygen reduction
reaction, Oxygen evolution reaction, Wastewater treatment

## **Contents**

25	List of abbreviations	5
26	1. Introduction	8
27	2. General electrocatalytic mechanisms	10
28	2.1. Two-electron oxygen reduction reaction (ORR) pathway	10
29	2.2. Oxygen evolution reaction (OER) pathway for high overvoltage anodes	13
30	3. Preparation and characterization of nanostructured-based electrodes 14	
31	3.1. Preparation methods	14
32	3.1.1. Cathode materials	14
33 34 35 36 37	<ul> <li>3.1.1.1. Polymeric precursor method for metal oxide supported on carbon materials</li> <li>3.1.1.2. Hydrothermal functionalization for the heteroatoms-doped carbon nanomaterials</li> <li>3.1.1.3. Plasma discharge treatment for nanostructured preparation</li> <li>3.1.1.4. Electrochemical exfoliation synthesis of graphene followed by ink-coating</li> </ul>	. 15 15 16
38 39 40 41 42	method 3.1.1.5. Electrophoretic deposition 3.1.1.6. Microemulsion and co-precipitation to prepare bi metallic nanoparticles an mixed metal oxides nanostructures 3.1.2. Anode materials	16 18 d 18 19
43 44 45 46 47	<ul> <li>3.1.2.1. Thermochemical decomposition</li> <li>3.1.2.2. Electrodeposition</li> <li>3.1.2.3. CVD</li> <li>3.1.2.4. PVD</li> <li>3.2 Characterization techniques.</li> </ul>	19 20 21 23 23
48	4. Nanostructured-based electrode properties	30
49	4.1. Nanostructured-based cathodes	30
50	4.1.1. Carbon nanomaterials-based cathodes	32
51	4.1.2. Heteroatom-based cathodes	33
52	4.1.3. Metal- and metal-oxide based cathodes	34
53	4.1.4. Mixed metal / metal oxide and carbon-based cathodes	35
54	4.1.5. General requirement for cathode characteristics and operating conditions	36
55 56 57 58	<ul> <li>4.1.5.1. Effect of electrode surface area</li></ul>	36 37 38 38
58 59	4.1.5.5. Effect of surface composition	39
60 61 62	<ul> <li>4.1.5.6. Effect of cathode potential / current density and H<sub>2</sub> evolution overvoltage</li> <li>4.1.5.7. Effect of solution pH</li> <li>4.1.5.8. Effect of oxygen flow rate</li> </ul>	41 43 44
63	4.2. Nanostructured-based anodes	49

64	4.2.1. General requirement for anode characteristics	
65	4.2.2. Carbon nanomaterials-based electrodes	
66	4.2.2.1. CNTs	
67	4.2.2.2. Boron-doped diamond (BDD) anode	
68	4.2.3. Heteroatom-based electrodes	
69	4.2.3.1. Fluorine-doped electrodes	
70	4.2.3.2. Boron-doped electrodes	
/1	4.2.4. Metal- and metal oxide- based electrodes	
72 72	4.2.4.1. Metal-based electrodes	
73 74	4.2.4.2. Mixed metal- / metal-oxide and carbon-based electrodes	
75	5 Assessment of electrodes performance in water/wastewater treatment	73
76	5.1. Electro-Fenton process	73
77	5.2. Advanced electro-oxidation process	
78	5.3. Solar/artificial light induced photo-electrocatalytic processes	85
79	5.4. Other combined or hybrid processes	
80	5.4.1. Bio-EAOPs	
81	5.4.2. Sonoelectro-Fenton (SEF)	
82	5.4.3. EF-pyrite	100
83	5.4.4. Peroxi-electrocoagulation	
84	5.4.5. Coupling with a pre-concentration step	
85	5.4.6. Electro-peroxone	105
86	6. Perspectives and outlook	106
87	6.1. Electrocatalytic mechanism understanding requirement	106
88	6.1.1. ORR mechanisms	106
89	6.1.2. OER and oxidation mechanisms	107
90	6.2. Electrode stability improvement	109
91	6.2.1. Cathodes stability	109
92	6.2.2. Anodes stability	
93	Acknowledgment	113
94	References	
95		

## 97 List of abbreviations

Abbreviation	Definition
3D	Three-dimensional
ACF	Activated carbon fiber
AFM	Atomic force spectroscopy
AHPS	4-amino-3-hydroxy-2-p-tolylazo-naphthalene-1-sulfonic acid
ANC	Activated N-doped carbon
AOPs	Advanced oxidation processes
AR 73	Acid Red 73
ATZ	Atrazine
AY1	Acid Yellow 1
BDD	Boron-doped diamond
BDDNW	BDD nanowire
BET	Brunauer-Emmett-Teller
Blue-TNAs	Blue TiO <sub>2</sub> nanotube arrays (Blue-TNAs)
BOD <sub>5</sub>	Biochemical oxygen demand after 5 days
CF	Carbon felt
CHE	Computational hydrogen electrode
CNT	Carbon nanotube
COD	Chemical oxygen demand
CPET	Coupled proton-electron transfers
CV	Cyclic voltammetry
DFT	Density-functional theory
DO	Dissolved oxygen
DSA	Dimensionless stable anode
EAOPS	Electrochemical advanced oxidation processes
EDX	Energy-dispersive X-ray spectroscopy
EEGr	Electrochemically exfoliated graphene
EF	Electro-Fenton
EIS	Electrochemical impedance spectroscopy
FTIR	Fourier-transform infrared spectroscopy
FTO	Fluorine-doped tin oxide

GC	Glassy carbon
GDE	Gas diffusion electrode
GF	Graphite felt
HARN	High aspect ratio nanostructures
HER	Hydrogen evolution reaction
HFs	Hierarchical flower-like structure
HPCS-S	Hollow porous carbon sphere-sulfur composite
h-PEF	Heterogeneous photo-electro-Fenton
LSV	Linear sweep voltammetry
MCE	Mineralization current efficiency
MeOH	Methanol
ММО	Mixed metal oxide
MNC	Mesoporous N-doped carbon
МО	Methyl orange
MOF	Metal organic framework
MWCNTs	Multi-walled carbon nanotubes
NADE	Natural air diffusion electrode
NB	nitrobenzene
NCNT	N-doped multi-walled carbon nanotube
NF	Nickel foam
N/F-CNC	Nitrogen/fluoride co-doped carbon nanocages
NP	Nanoparticle
NS	Not specified
NTs	Nanotubes
NTA	Nanotube arrays
TNTs	TiO <sub>2</sub> nanotubes
OEP	Oxygen evolution potential
OER	Oxygen evolution reaction
ORR	Oxygen reduction reaction
PAN	Polyacrylonitrile
PANI	Polyaniline
PC	Photocatalysis
PEC	Photoelectrocatalysis

PEF	Photoelectro-Fenton
PFOA	Perfluorooctanoic acid
ppi	Pores per inch
PPM	Polymeric precursor method
PTFE	Polytetrafluoroethylene
PVD	Physical vapor deposition
Rct	Charge transfer resistance
Rd	Dynamic resistance
REM	Reactive electrochemical membrane
RGO	Reduced graphene oxide
RHE	Reversible hydrogen electrode
ROS	Reactive oxygen species
RVC	Reticulated vitreous carbon
S <sub>BET</sub>	BET specific surface area
SBR	Sequencing batch reactor
SCE	Saturated calomel electrode
SEM	Scanning electron microscopy
SDBS	Sodium dodecyl benzene sulfonate
SHE	Standard hydrogen electrode
SS	Stainless steel
SWNTs	Single-walled carbon nanotubes
TBA	Tert-butyl alcohol
TEM	Transmission electron microscopy
TNA	Nanotube array
TGA	Thermal gravimetric analysis
TiOx	Sub-stoichiometric TiO <sub>2</sub>
TOC	Total organic carbon
XPS	X-ray photoelectron spectroscopy
XRD	X-ray diffraction

99

#### 1. Introduction

Nanostructure materials have been widely developed, particularly in the last ten years, with the 100 rise of graphene - sp<sup>2</sup>-hybridized carbon atoms arranged in a honeycomb structure - and 101 associated Nobel prize attribution in 2010, and subsequent equivalent 2D materials as well as 102 graphene-based materials [1,2]. Due to their ability to modify the raw material properties such 103 as the electric and thermal conductivity, surface area, gas permeability as well as mechanical 104 resistance, their implementation in electrochemistry area as electrode material became obvious 105 [3]. It is important to note that nanostructured materials can be extended to nanostructured 106 107 electrochemical interfaces that are usually encounter for example through defects and pinholes in self-assembled monolayers or catalytic nanoparticles spread throughout less reactive 108 substrate [4]. 109

110 In parallel, for more than 20 years, electrochemical applications for environmental protection especially in wastewater gained a considerable interest [5,6]. Those based on the generation of 111 very strong oxidizing agents such as hydroxyl radical ('OH) ( $E^0$ ('OH/H<sub>2</sub>O) = 2.80 V / SHE), 112 namely electrochemical advanced oxidation processes (EAOPs), have shown impressive 113 efficiency [7-13]. They have the ability to generate continuously and in situ the reactive agents 114 115 in order to remove partially or completely - according to the treatment strategy [14] - a wide variety of organic pollutants, especially the most biorecalcitrant ones present either at high 116 concentration (chemical oxygen demand (COD) =  $1 - 100 \text{ g-O}_2 \text{ L}^{-1}$ ) or very low concentrations 117 (i.e. micropollutant concentration in the range of ng  $L^{-1}$  to  $\mu g L^{-1}$ ) [15–24]. Still, the possibility 118 to improve their performance by incorporating nanostructured materials for both cathode and 119 anode has been tested in the last decades. The promise of improvement came up with numerous 120 studies on this specific topic with an increasing number without having an overview that could 121 help giving some requirement and directions based on a critical literature review. 122

There are existing reviews on nanostructured carbon-based materials for some electrochemical 123 124 applications, but mainly for fuel cell, water splitting and electro-analysis [4,25–31]. There are also few reviews on electrocatalytic treatments but the use of nanostructured electrode materials 125 is not developed at all [5,7–9,11,14,22,32–35]. Thus, there is no detailed and systematic review 126 on nanostructured (carbon-based, metallic-based) electrodes for EAOPs applications. Indeed, 127 electrolytic treatment is implemented in EAOPs by applying current in order to make evolve 128 129 non-spontaneous reactions. Contrastingly, spontaneous reactions are involved in fuel cell and microbial fuel cells systems to generate electrical energy. It means that the properties required 130 for electrode materials are not the same in EAOPs and fuel cells, especially in terms of electrode 131 132 potential and overvoltage requirements. Focusing only on electrocatalytic treatments is therefore a way to be exhaustive and to bring a critical overview on existing nanostructured 133 materials and what could be the new insights required to improve the performance of such 134 materials in terms of specific surface area, charge transfer kinetics, number of low-coordinated 135 sites, quantum confinement, etc. [36]. 136

This review intends to bring a synthetic and critical state of the art by screening the 137 nanostructured electrode materials employed in electrocatalytic treatments that induce 138 oxidative stress represented mainly by EAOPs, which excludes the other kinds of 139 electrochemical processes such as fuel cells. As it is the first time that a detailed and exhaustive 140 141 review is published on this topic, this review can further serve as a baseline in the targeted research area. The general electrolytic mechanisms involved at either cathode or anode 142 materials are presented before exposing the main preparation routes and characterization 143 techniques of the nanostructured materials. The properties obtained with these different kinds 144 of materials are then reviewed in detail with added benefits of nano-structure, followed by the 145 thorough presentation of their contribution in the EAOPs efficiency for wastewater treatment. 146

147 Finally, perspectives and outlook are disclosed regarding the mechanism understanding148 requirement and electrode stability improvement.

- 149
- 150

### 2. General electrocatalytic mechanisms

#### 151 2.1. Two-electron oxygen reduction reaction (ORR) pathway

The two-electron oxygen reduction reaction (ORR) pathway leads to the electrogeneration of hydrogen peroxide ( $H_2O_2$ ) at the cathode surface and involve adsorbed \*OOH as intermediate species (Eq. 1) [25,37].

155 
$$O_2 + 2H^+ + 2e^- \rightarrow ^*OOH + H^+ + e^- \rightarrow H_2O_2$$
  $E^0 = 0.70 \text{ V/SHE}$  (1)

H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> is an interesting oxidant ( $E^{0}_{(H_2O_2/H_2O)} = 1.76$  V/SHE) since it is a precursor for the production of a strong oxidizing agent, i.e., 'OH ( $E^{0}_{(\cdot OH/H_2O)} = 2.80$  V/SHE), that are produced through Fenton reaction (Eq. 2) [7,38].

159 
$$Fe^{2+} + H_2O_2 \rightarrow OH + OH^- + Fe^{3+}$$
 (2)

This radical is widely implemented in environmental applications, as it is the main species 160 responsible for the degradation and mineralization of organic pollutant as well as inhibition of 161 162 microorganisms present in wastewater, as detailed in section 5. Moreover, the in situ production of  $H_2O_2$  offer a promising safer alternative compared to the use of Fenton's reagent ( $H_2O_2$  + 163  $Fe^{2+}$ ) since the storage of  $H_2O_2$  is delicate due to its explosive nature [39]. The difficulties in 164 involving the partial two-electron ORR is that the full four-electron ORR (Eq. 3) can also occur 165 through either associative mechanism (Eqs. 4a-4d) or dissociative mechanism (Eqs. 5a-5c) by 166 167 implementing adsorbed oxygenated intermediates species (\*OOH, \*O and/or \*OH) at the cathode surface (\*) [25,37,40]. The contribution of associative versus dissociative pathway is 168 depending on the kind of anode material employed and on the applied anodic potential [40]. 169

170 
$$O_2 + 4H^+ + 4e^- \rightarrow H_2O$$
  $E^0 = 1.23 V$  (3)  
171  $O_2 + 4H^+ + 4e^- \rightarrow ^*OOH + 3H^+ + 3e^-$  (4a)  
172  $^*OOH + 3H^+ + 3e^- \rightarrow 2(^*O + 2H^+ + 2e^-)$  (4b)  
173  $^*O + 2H^+ + 2e^- \rightarrow ^*OH + H^+ + e^-$  (4c)  
174  $^*OH + H^+ + e^- \rightarrow H_2O$  (4d)

175 
$$1/2O_2 + * \rightarrow *O$$
 (5a)

$$176 \quad ^{*}O + H^{+} + e^{-} \rightarrow \ ^{*}OH \tag{5b}$$

177 
$$^{*}OH + H^{+} + e^{-} \rightarrow H_{2}O + *$$
 (5c)

The generation of H<sub>2</sub>O is thermodynamically favorable, meaning that the selectivity towards the two-electron instead of four-electron pathway is therefore an important key issue. This has then an impact on the kinetics of Fenton reaction (section 6) to generate 'OH. The ORR pathway has been widely studied in its four-electron way [25,40], which is mainly due to the fuel cell studies that currently occupy an important research area in electrochemistry, especially for the promising industrial applications in energy (e.g., H<sub>2</sub> electrogeneration).

184 Still, two-electron ORR mechanism study could be find in literature. Thermodynamic analyses have been proposed as first attempt to predict the reaction feasibility, especially regarding the 185 ORR selectivity. Density-functional theory (DFT) calculation permitted to estimate the free 186 energy ( $\Delta G$ ) describing the adsorption energies of intermediates (including solvated protons 187 188 and electron) at material surfaces [41]. Using the computational hydrogen electrode (CHE) model [40],  $\Delta G$  could be drawn as function of reaction coordinate for two-electron ORR, as 189 shown in the diagram illustrated in Fig. 1a for PtHg<sub>4</sub> material [25,41]. It highlights that at 0.70 190 V (i.e., equilibrium potential) the first reaction step is uphill, which makes difficult the reaction, 191

while at 0.63 V it is easier and it corresponds to the limiting potential since it is the maximumpotential value for which the steps are downhill.

194 In addition, the electron transfer is fast in ORR, so that it is usually not considered as the kinetic rate limiting step [25]. Generally, the adsorption of oxygen (O<sub>2</sub>) on the cathode surface has been 195 considered as the limiting step in literature, especially on carbon materials [42,43]. Deeper 196 studies emphasized the fact that the formation or removal of \*OOH intermediates species from 197 the surface are the limiting steps in two-electron ORR [25] (Fig. 1a). Volcano plot allowed 198 visualizing the optimal binding energy of intermediate (\*OOH) that need to be operated in order 199 to have electrogeneration of H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> (Fig. 1b). This binding need to be not too strong (solid purple 200 line) and not too weak (solid green line). Several materials have shown to correspond to this 201 202 property such as Pt and Pd mercury alloys [41,44] as well as some carbon structures [45].

Beyond these thermodynamics data, it has been shown that parallel reactions 1 an 4b interfere in the  $H_2O_2$  selectivity [41,46]:

It means that the O-O bond dissociation from adsorbed 'OOH should be avoided in order to 205 favor H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> generation [25]. It further indicates that the catalyst must have weak oxygen binding 206 207 energies to avoid 'O formation [25]. Experimental data evidenced the selectivity towards  $H_2O_2$ when using weak oxygen binding cathodes such as Au(111) [47] or carbon-based materials 208 [48-51]. It is interesting to note that Au material does not thermodynamically favor the 209 generation of  $H_2O_2$ , which is not in agreement with the laboratory results [25]. It means that the 210 kinetics need also to be taken into account as highlighted in the free energy diagram for the 211 212 two- and four-electron ORR on Au(111) in Fig. 1c.



214

Figure 1. (a) Free energy diagram for the two-electron ORR on PtHg<sub>4</sub>, (b) volcano plot for
the two-electron ORR, (c) Free energy diagram for the two- and four-electron ORR on
Au(111). Reprinted with permission from [25]. Copyright 2018, American Chemical Society.

#### 219 2.2. Oxygen evolution reaction (OER) pathway for high overvoltage anodes

Electrooxidation of pollutants in aqueous solution can be obtained by performing the electrolysis at high anodic potentials. Depending on the potential at which the oxygen evolution reaction (OER) occur, this process does not need to add catalysts into the solution and does not produce any byproducts [52–54]. Generally, there are two types of anode materials: (1) active anodes (Pt, IrO<sub>2</sub>, and RuO<sub>2</sub> and other mixed metal oxide (MMO) anodes) with low O<sub>2</sub> overpotential and (2) non-active anodes (SnO<sub>2</sub>, PbO<sub>2</sub>, sub oxide of TiO<sub>2</sub> (like Ti<sub>4</sub>O<sub>7</sub>) and borondoped diamond (BDD)) with high O<sub>2</sub> over-potential. It is supposed that H<sub>2</sub>O is oxidized on anode M to produce physisorbed hydroxyl radical (M( $^{\circ}$ OH)) through Eq. 6, leading to the degradation and/or mineralization of organic pollutants as detailed in section 5. The surface of a non-active anode interacts so weakly with  $^{\circ}$ OH that it allows the direct reaction of organic pollutants (R) with M( $^{\circ}$ OH) (Eq. 7) [33,55].

231 
$$M + H_2O \rightarrow M(^{\circ}OH) + H^+ + e^-$$
 (6)

232 
$$M(^{\circ}OH) + R \rightarrow M + intermediates \rightarrow \rightarrow \rightarrow CO_2 + H_2O + inorganic ions$$
 (7)

The oxygen evolution potential (OEP) of an anode is very important since the higher the OEP, 233 the weaker the interaction of M('OH) with the anode surface and the higher is the chemical 234 reactivity toward organics oxidation. To improve OEP, many approaches have been attempted, 235 e.g., elemental doping and nano-structure construction. For example, when TiO<sub>2</sub> nanotubes 236 237 (TNTs) were introduced to Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb, the OEP was found to increase from 2.00 V to 2.18 V/SHE [56]. In other works it was observed that the OEP increased from 1.73 V to 2.20 V/ 238 Saturated calomel electrode (SCE) after TiO<sub>2</sub> nanotubes (TNTs) base introduced into PbO<sub>2</sub> 239 [57]. Therefore, nano-structure introduction could decline the activity of OER and improve the 240 catalytic activity. 241

242

#### **3.** Preparation and characterization of nanostructured-based electrodes

244 **3.1. Preparation methods** 

#### 245 *3.1.1. Cathode materials*

The preparation of the material is a particularly important step regarding the properties and stability of the electrode once employed in electrochemical applications. The preparation of the cathodes materials depends in general on the catalyst's composition and the desired structure.
For this purpose, a wide range of methods is used to prepare or to modify the electrodes based
on chemical, thermal and/or physicochemical methods.

251

#### 252 *3.1.1.1. Polymeric precursor method for metal oxide supported on carbon materials*

The polymeric precursor method (PPM) is used mainly in the preparation of nanostructured metal oxide electrocatalysts. Firstly, citric acid was dissolved in ethylene glycol at 60°C and then the metal precursor was added to this mixture to obtain a viscous resin [58]. Then, a desired amount of the carbon was added to the solution precursor prepared previously in order to produce the electrocatalyst. Finally, the mixture containing the electrocatalyst and the resin was homogenized in an ultrasonic bath for 1 h and then thermally treated at 400°C during 2 h under N<sub>2</sub> flow [59].

260

#### 261 *3.1.1.2. Hydrothermal functionalization for the heteroatoms-doped carbon nanomaterials*

Hydrothermal synthesis is largely used for the preparation of nanostructured materials as 262 nanosheets, nanospheres and the famous carbon nanotubes (Fig. 2a). This method allows the 263 264 morphology control of the desired compounds by the means of temperature flexibility reaching a very high values [60]. This approach is also commonly used in the case of the heteroatoms-265 doped carbon nanomaterials. An appropriate mass ratio of the desired heteroatoms source and 266 the carbon nanomaterials were mixed in the autoclave and heated at high temperature for a 267 necessary time, depending on the characteristics of the final product [61]. Then, the autoclave 268 269 was cooled to room temperature and some post synthesis treatments like carbonization under inert gas (e.g., argon) were performed to form the nanostructure [62,63]. After that, a washing 270

treatment with hydrofluoric acid can be performed to dope the carbon with fluorine heteroatom[63] (Fig. 2a).

273

#### 274 *3.1.1.3.* Plasma discharge treatment for nanostructured preparation

The plasma nanofabrication arouses a huge interest in the nanomaterials manufacturing (Fig. 275 276 2b). This method exhibits more environmental and economic advantages compared to the chemical process and it allows achieving the wanted structural and electronics properties [64]. 277 For electro-Fenton cathode, this approach was used to create a nanostructure as the case for 278 graphite. Khataee et al. [65] modified the graphite cathode to nanoflakes by the AC glow plasma 279 discharge and they increase drastically the surface area of the cathode. Briefly the plasma was 280 created by the interaction between the electric current with high voltage and gas generating 281 several particles: ions, ionized ions, radicals and electrons inside the chamber reactor as shown 282 in Fig. 2b [65], thus altering the targeted surface. 283

284

#### 285 *3.1.1.4. Electrochemical exfoliation synthesis of graphene followed by ink-coating method*

Electrochemical exfoliation synthesis is the method used only for the graphene cathode preparation from graphite powder [66–68]. The principle of this method consists on the application of voltage between two electrodes: the compressed graphite as working electrode and any counter electrode. Under the influence of the potential, the ionic species of the electrolyte goes into the graphite electrode creating an heterogeneity in the inter-layer distance, namely exfoliation step [69] (Fig. 2c).

The exfoliated graphene can then be mixed with a binder (e.g., PTFE, Nafion) in a water/ethanol mixture to obtain a suspension, namely ink, using ultrasonic bath for 1 h [67,70]. The raw carbon material can be then soaked in the ink and heated in furnace at 250°C for 1 h [67,70].



Figure 2. (a) Hydrothermal treatment for heteroatoms functionalization (Reprinted with
 permission from [63]. Copyright 2018, Elsevier), (b) Plasma discharge reactor for
 nanostructure preparation (Reprinted with permission from [65]. Copyright 2017, Elsevier)
 and (c) electrochemical exfoliation mechanism of the graphite to graphene (Reprinted with
 permission from [71]. Copyright 2014, American Chemical Society).

#### 302 *3.1.1.5. Electrophoretic deposition*

Electrophoretic deposition consists in using the raw conductive substrate material to coat as an anode, while an inert counter-electrode (e.g., Pt) can be used [72,73]. Then the graphene oxide, which has a negative charge in solution, adheres to the anode material. A reduction is subsequently done by reversing the polarity so that the graphene oxide deposited on the material is reduced [72,73]. This method avoids the use of a binder.

308

# 309 3.1.1.6. Microemulsion and co-precipitation to prepare bi metallic nanoparticles and mixed 310 metal oxides nanostructures

311 Microemulsion is among the known method used for the preparation of nanoparticles with an easier control of the particles size and distribution. It consists basically on the mixing of two 312 313 surfactant microemulsions, i.e., one with the precursor metal and another one with a reducing agent [74,75]. The metallic nanoparticles were obtained after a series of chemical and physical 314 transformation, including the interaction between the two microemulsions and then the 315 316 chemical reaction occurs to allow the formation of the metal nuclei that is growing thereafter 317 [74]. Félix-Navarro et al. [75] reported the formation of a bimetallic Pd-Pt nanoparticles using the microemulsion method. 318

Co-precipitation is another low-cost way used to prepare MMOs with high surface area. The obtained material surface contains an important number of active sites allowing an efficient adsorption of the molecules on the surface [76]. For the preparation of metal oxide nanoparticles, a salt precursor containing the metal was firstly dissolved in solvent with a base to favor the formation of the metal hydroxide precipitate. Then, the nucleation and the growth phases leads to the final dispersed nanoparticles [76]. A MMO nano spherical bismuth molybdates (Bi<sub>2</sub>Mo<sub>3</sub>O<sub>12</sub>) by the co-precipitation route could be also synthetized [77]. The prepared compound was served as a coating on titanium mesh to form a high effective nanostructured cathode for the electrogeneration of  $H_2O_2$  [77].

328

#### 329 3.1.2. Anode materials

In general, the preparation methods of nanostructured anode could be divided into two main groups: (1) chemical methods and (2) physical methods. For chemical methods, the techniques used consist of thermochemical deposition, electrodeposition and chemical vapor deposition (CVD). Physical vapor deposition (PVD) belongs to physical method. Different synthesis strategies have been chosen to introduce different components on anode support. Fig. 3 summarizes some chemical methods for anode preparation including thermochemical decomposition, electrodeposition and CVD.

337

#### 338 *3.1.2.1.* Thermochemical decomposition

Thermochemical decomposition method is the most widely applied among all the chemical 339 methods, especially for preparation of  $SnO_2$  or  $IrO_2$ -based anodes (Fig. 3a) [78–80]. In a typical 340 thermochemical decomposition procedure, metal precursor and alcoholic solvent were mixed 341 to drop or brush, and then dried and annealed at certain temperature. The isopropanol, ethanol 342 or butanol was widely used as solvent to dissolve precursors. A high temperature is necessary 343 for this method because it is beneficial to catalytic performance. The effects of preparation 344 temperatures in the range of 450 - 850 °C for Eu doped Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb electrodes on phenol 345 removal were investigated [81]. It was observed that smaller SnO<sub>2</sub> grain sizes (e.g., 8 - 10 nm) 346 were obtained at 750 °C. The removal efficiency first increased and then decreased with the 347 increase of the pyrolysis temperature, and reached the maximum at 750 °C (96.4%) with the 348 same energy consumption. However, high pyrolysis temperature (> 600 °C) was not conductive 349 350 for the service life of Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> anode; it was only 0.5-24 h [82]. When the pyrolysis temperature was 500 °C, the service life exceeded 180 h. 351

The advantage of this method is to be easy in preparation and simple in operation. However, this method still faces some disadvantage [83]: (1) poor reproducibility due to generation of cracks at high internal pressure; (2) easy loss of some metals and (3) uneven surface coating.

To solve these problems, sol-gel method has been developed. This method is based on the 355 solvolysis of organic solvent and inorganic or organic salts and water. The precursor was 356 condensed at refluxing device, and achieved the required viscosity at room temperature. Thin 357 films are prepared by dip or roll coating at intermediate temperatures and further annealed at 358 high temperatures. Makgae et al. [79] prepared a series of MMOs (SnO<sub>2</sub>-RuO<sub>2</sub>-IrO<sub>2</sub>, Ta<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-359 IrO<sub>2</sub> and RhO<sub>2</sub>-IrO<sub>2</sub>) fixed on a Ti substrate using sol-gel method, which exhibited higher 360 stability with surface roughness and internal porosity. These anodes were used to degrade 361 362 phenol, achieving more than 90% removal efficiency.

363

#### 364 *3.1.2.2. Electrodeposition*

Electrodeposition can be regarded as a facile method for the anode preparation [84–86]. In a typical electrodeposition procedure, plating bath containing metal precursor and electrolyte is controlled to regulate deposition performance via acidity and depositing current as well as depositing temperature to obtain oxide film (Fig. 3b). The advantage of this method [83] is that it is easy to prepare complex electrodes and that larges surface areas can be deposited. However, this method still has some disadvantages [83]: (1) high energy consumption, (2) generation of acidic and toxic wastewater, and (3) uneven surface coating.

Electrodeposition method is more often used for electrodeposition of PbO<sub>2</sub> anode (Fig. 3b). The temperature is one of the most critical parameters for electrodeposition of PbO<sub>2</sub>, while high temperature is beneficial to nucleation, growth and rough coating [87,88]. The current density is favorable to improve the polycrystallinity due to massive nucleation and high degree of porosity [87]. A high current density or potential polarization is important to form high surface
area [89]. Increasing of pH has significant influence on the surface morphology and crystal
forms, resulting in the decrease of current density [90].

379

380 *3.1.2.3. CVD* 

CVD is a relatively less used method for anode preparation because of complicated preparation, expensive equipment and troublesome preparation conditions (Fig. 3c). In a typical CVD procedure, chemical interaction is generated between the molecules of the volatile precursor and active sites of the substrate surface at vacuum conditions. This process can be repeated several times, and then an inert gas is purged to remove excess reactant and volatile by-products.

This method exhibits some advantages such as excellent reproducibility and uniform coating. SnO<sub>2</sub> coating on Ti plates via CVD method using SnEt<sub>4</sub> and O<sub>2</sub> as reactive gas mixture was prepared, which exhibited conformal-coverage of the surface roughness [91]. CVD method demonstrated excellent uniformity of coating, resulting in the increased service life and improved reproducibility compared with dip coating process [91,92]. The service life of BDD electrode prepared by CVD method was long and exhibited high removal and mineralization of phenol [93].



Figure 3. (a) Schematic illustration for the growth of a TiO<sub>2</sub>-NTs/SnO<sub>2</sub> electrode via 394 thermochemical decomposition. Reproduced with permission from Ref [94]. Copyright 395 (2009) American Chemical Society; (b) Electrodeposition method: schematic diagram for 396 electrolytic metal-atoms enabled manufacturing of nanostructured sensor electrodes. (I) 397 Electrodeposition of the metal atoms (P) from its corresponding ion form (Pm+) onto a 398 substrate (Q); (II) Representation of interactions at the interface between the electrodeposited 399 layer of P and the substrate Q; and (III) Electro-dissolution of P from the substrate. 400 Reproduced with permission from Ref [95]. Copyright (2020) Electrochemical Society. (c) 401 CVD apparatus: (1) Hot-wall CVD reactor. (2a) 1<sup>st</sup> bubbler for (MeCp)Ir(COD). (2b) 2<sup>nd</sup> 402 bubbler for TET. (3) Gas flow controller. (4) Pressure controller. (5) Pressure gauge. (6) Cold 403 trap. (7) Throttle valve. (8) Vacuum pump. (9) He tank. (10) O<sub>2</sub> tank. (11) Mass-flow 404 controller. Reproduced with permission from Ref [92]. Copyright (2010) Kluwer Academic 405 Publishers. 406

407

408 *3.1.2.4. PVD* 

PVD is a physical method, applying metal oxides instead of volatile precursor in CVD. In a 409 typical PVD procedure, the precursor is vapored to gas which is mixed with inert gas to deposit 410 on substrate via condensation method to generate film. The advantage of this method is the 411 careful controlling of the relative ratios of precursors. Ir<sub>x</sub>Ru<sub>1-x</sub>O<sub>2</sub> mixed metal oxide nanowires 412 were synthesized by PVD method using IrO<sub>2</sub> and RuO<sub>2</sub> as precursors, forming highly single 413 crystalline [96]. However, because of troublesome preparation conditions such as complicated 414 preparation, expensive equipment and limitations in complex substrate, very few reports have 415 been found about anodic oxidation of organics using anode prepared by PVD. 416

417

#### 418 **3.2** Characterization techniques

419 Different characterization techniques have been applied to assess the physicochemical and electrochemical properties presented in section 4: "Nanostructured-based electrode properties" 420 whose fabrication methods have been exposed in previous sub-section 3.1. The techniques 421 include: scanning electron microscopy (SEM), transmission electron microscopy (TEM), 422 energy-dispersive X-ray spectroscopy (EDX), atomic force microscopy (AFM), contact angle 423 measurements, X-Ray diffraction (XRD), X-ray photoelectron spectroscopy (XPS), Fourier-424 transform infrared (FTIR) spectroscopy, Raman spectroscopy, thermal gravimetric analysis 425 (TGA), cyclic voltammetry (CV), linear sweep voltammetry (LSV), electrochemical 426 427 impedance spectroscopy (EIS), Mott-Schottky measurements and UV-vis spectra.

Examples of characterization performance for some cathodes are illustrated in Figs. 4 and 6,while they are depicted in Figs. 5 and 7 for some anodes.

SEM, TEM and AFM could be used to observe the morphology and internal structure of
materials. The nanoflowers made of carbon supported by MnO<sub>2</sub> to enhance the ORR activity

of cathode could be observed by SEM (Fig. 4a) [97]. AFM images of plasma treated graphite 432 433 cathode could depict more roughness because of the higher number of peaks (bright part) and valley (dark part) allocated on all the surface of the material (Fig. 4b) [65]. Similarly, the more 434 uniform nano-TiO<sub>2</sub> anode film prepared by CVD method was observed by Chang et al. [98]; 435 SEM and AFM observation showed that it exhibited smaller particle size ranged from 50 to 100 436 nm with an average height of 250 nm (Fig. 5a). Besides, the Cr<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>/Fe<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> anode was showed 437 438 with regular particles (15 nm) and uniform distribution of elements based on the TEM characterization and EDX elemental mapping (Fig. 5b) [99]. 439

The hydrophilicity could be given by contact angle measurement as it has shown to play a role on ORR activity of cathodes. Graphene foam displayed high hydrophobicity, with a contact angle of 128.30° (Fig. 4c) [51], which was in concordance with the high number of apolar aromatic rings in such structure.

Crystal structure of electrodes could be obtained from XRD spectrum. For instance, CeO<sub>2</sub> high 444 aspect ratio nanostructures (HARN)/C-based electrocatalyst was investigated by XRD and it 445 showed no difference of spectra with the substrate (Fig. 4d) [100]. It meant that the 446 semicrystalline structure was not altered during the hydrothermal synthesis of the material. 447 448 Another example is given by the crystal lattices of TNTs on anode. The average size of anatase TiO<sub>2</sub> nanoparticles were found to be around 20 nm according to the Scherrer equation 449 calculation from XRD spectra [98]. In addition, rutile and brookite TiO<sub>2</sub> were also observed 450 451 from XRD spectrum (Fig. 5c) [101]. The surface electronic state and the composition of the electrodes could be obtained from XPS spectrum. C<sub>60</sub>-CNT cathode material in deconvoluted 452 XPS plot (Fig. 4e) suggested the higher number of C=O and C-OH bonds on the hybrid structure 453 454 compared to the raw materials [102]. Furthermore, the typical peak of Sn in nitrogen doped multi-walled CNTs (N-C@SnO<sub>2</sub>/MWCNTs) anode was obtained and the characteristic of Sn<sup>4+</sup> 455 in Sn  $3d_{3/2}$  and Sn  $3d_{5/2}$  high-resolution spectra appeared (Fig. 5d) [103]. It indicated that the 456

content of nitrogen element was 3.4%, ascribed to the pyridinic N and pyrrolic N, which could 457 458 enhance electrochemical reactivity and electronic conductivity. The Raman spectra could be used to evaluate defect structure and crystalline quality providing powerful information for peak 459 shift, resulting in change of catalytic activity. The Raman spectra of graphene and N-doped 460 graphene cathodes highlighted a higher I<sub>D</sub>/I<sub>G</sub> intensity ratio with the N-doped material (Fig. 4f) 461 [104]. This resulted in an increase of defects that should increase the number of active sites. In 462 addition, the blue-shift of anatase with peak broadening was observed in Raman spectra of the 463 anode, ascribed to the localized defects related to  $Ti^{3+}$  or oxygen vacancies (Fig. 5e) [105]. 464 These findings were combined with XPS results, indicating that more surface hydroxyl groups 465 466 were generated in new O1s peak. The FTIR spectra were used to analyze the surface functional group. The spectrum of Bi<sub>2</sub>Mo<sub>3</sub>O<sub>12</sub> deposited on Ti cathode could highlight the Mo-O stretching 467 vibration (952, 937, 908, 849 cm<sup>-1</sup>), the dioxo bridge vibration (716, 672 cm<sup>-1</sup>) and the Bi-O 468 stretching vibration (593 cm<sup>-1</sup>) (Fig. 4g) [77]. Moreover, the N-H at around 3100-3200 cm<sup>-1</sup> 469 could be ascribed to the ammonium group vibrations in methylammonium lead bromide 470 (MAPbBr<sub>3</sub>) microcrystals of anode material (Fig. 5f) [106]. The peaks at 1546 cm<sup>-1</sup>, 1471 cm<sup>-1</sup> 471 and 916 cm<sup>-1</sup> were attributed to the N-H, C-H and -CH<sub>3</sub> bonding modes, respectively. In 472 addition, the TGA curve could be used to evaluate the thermochemical stability of electrode. 473 TGA curve reported that the carbonization of aluminum-based metal organic framework (MOF) 474 (MIL-53 (Al)) occurred at temperature higher than 600°C (Fig. 4h) [63]. Another example 475 revealed that the content of SnO<sub>2</sub> in N-C@SnO<sub>2</sub>/MWCNTs composite anode was 64.35 wt% 476 when the temperature was higher than  $500^{\circ}$  C(Fig. 5g) [103]. 477





Figure 4. (a) SEM image of carbon supported MnO<sub>2</sub> nanoflowers (Reprinted with permission 479 from [97]. Copyright 2018, Elsevier), (b) 3D AFM images of plasma treated graphite 480 electrode (Reprinted with permission from [65]. Copyright 2017, Elsevier), (c) contact angle 481 measurement of graphene foam (Reprinted with permission from [51]. Copyright 2016, 482 Elsevier), (d) XRD patterns of CeO<sub>2</sub> HARN-based carbon cathodes with different proportions 483 of CeO<sub>2</sub> HARN (Reprinted with permission from [100]. Copyright 2018, Elsevier), (e) C 1s 484 core level of C<sub>60</sub>-CNT hybrid in deconvoluted XPS plot (Reprinted with permission from 485 [102]. Copyright 2019, Springer Nature), (f) Raman spectrum of graphene and N-doped 486 487 graphene cathodes (Reprinted with permission from [104]. Copyright 2019, Royal Society of

Chemistry), (g) FTIR spectrum of Bi<sub>2</sub>Mo<sub>3</sub>O<sub>12</sub> deposited on Ti cathode (Reprinted with
permission from [77]. Copyright 2019, Elsevier) and (h) TGA curve of aluminum-based metal
organic framework (MOF) (MIL-53 (Al)) (Reprinted with permission from [63]. Copyright
2018, Elsevier).





Reproduced with permission from Ref [106]. Copyright (2019) Royal Society of Chemistry;
(g) TGA curve recorded for the N-C@SnO<sub>2</sub>/MWCNTs composite under air flow. Reproduced
with permission from Ref [103]. Copyright (2014) Royal Society of Chemistry.

507

In general, CV, LSV and EIS curve were used to test electrical conductivity and electrochemical 508 activity. CV of graphene modified and unmodified carbon felt (CF) cathodes (Fig. 6a) permit 509 to show that the electroactive surface area was ten times higher than the reduced graphene oxide 510 (RGO)/CF, determined by the Randles-Sevcik equation [73]. Moreover, EIS depicted through 511 512 the Nyquist plot that the charge transfer resistance (Rct) value was 0.21  $\Omega$  against 2.38  $\Omega$  for RGO/CF and CF, respectively (Fig. 6b) [73]. The graphene-based material could enhance the 513 cathode conductivity. LSV could further address the ORR activity by emphasizing the 3.1-fold 514 515 enhancement of ORR using the graphene coated brush as compared to the raw carbon fiber brush cathode (Fig. 6c) [67]. Further examples with anode materials illustrated that the blue 516 TiO<sub>2</sub> nanotube arrays (Blue-TNAs) exhibited much lower Rct (32  $\Omega$ ) and dynamic resistance 517 (Rd) (682  $\Omega$ ) compared with the TNA (333  $\Omega$  and 2848  $\Omega$ , respectively) (Fig. 7b) [55]. In 518 addition, the higher O<sub>2</sub> overpotential (2.52 V/SCE) was obtained from CV curve (Fig. 7a). 519 520 Furthermore, the LSV revealed that the current response increased with the increase of Co(NO<sub>3</sub>)<sub>2</sub> concentration until 5 mM, while the OEP decreased from 2.12 to 1.78 V/SCE, 521 522 indicating that the anodic oxidation capacity would also decrease after Co doping (Fig. 7f) 523 [107]. UV-vis reflectance spectra could be used to study the absorbance and bandgap. Blue-TNA had a stronger infrared adsorption than TNA, while the Fe<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> NTs exhibited lower 524 absorbance intensity in UV region, and higher absorbance intensity in visible light region than 525 526 TNTs (Fig. 7d) [108]. Mott-Schottky was used to investigate the semiconductor lies in the 527 Fermi. The Blue-TNA was still the n-type semiconductor characteristics from Mott-Schottky

plots. At the same time, the donor densities were calculated from the Mott-Schottky equation,
which increased to improve the charge conductivity (Fig. 7c) [55].

The service lifetime is also important for anode stability. The accelerated lifetime test indicated
that the incorporation of ruthenium for ruthenium doped SnO<sub>2</sub>–RuO<sub>2</sub> and Ce–Ru–SnO<sub>2</sub> (318 h
and 340 h, respectively) could prolong the lifetime compared with SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> anode (1.42 h)
(Fig. 7e) [80].



534





Figure 7. (a) CV, (b) EIS and (c) Mott-Schottky plots of TNAs and blue-TNAs. Reproduced
with permission from Ref [55]. Copyright (2019) Elsevier; (d) UV-vis diffuse reflectance
spectra of TNTs and Fe<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> nanotubes prepared by electrochemical deposition method.
Reproduced with permission from Ref [108]. Copyright (2012) Elsevier; (e) Accelerated life
tests of modified SnO<sub>2</sub> anodes. Reproduced with permission from Ref [80]. Copyright (2012)
Elsevier; (f) The effect of Co on LSV. Reproduced with permission from Ref [107].
Copyright (2021) Elsevier.

### 550 4. Nanostructured-based electrode properties

#### 551 4.1. Nanostructured-based cathodes

541

The cathode property is an important parameter for  $H_2O_2$  electrogeneration efficiency. A wide range of nanostructured cathodes have been developed in literature and they have been divided into four category as follow: (i) carbon nanomaterials-based cathodes including carbon nanotubes and graphene [102,109]; carbon and graphite felt modified with graphene [66,67,110], (ii) heteroatoms-doped carbon cathodes, such as fluorine-doped [63,111], nitrogen-doped [112] and phosphore-doped [61], (iii) metal or metal oxides deposited on carbon support, like cerium oxide, vanadium, manganese oxide, tungsten oxide, zirconium and tantalum [59,61,97,113–116], (4) metal oxide cathode. All the nanostructured-based cathodes developed for  $H_2O_2$  electrogeneration have been listed in Table 1. The percentage of development of each cathode category is illustrated in Fig. 8a, according to articles found in literature.



Figure 8. (a) Percentage of development of each cathode category, (b) Carbon nanomaterialsbased cathodes repartition, (c) Heteroatoms-doped carbon cathodes repartition.

It can be seen that heteroatoms-doped carbon materials as well as mixed metal /metal oxide-566 based carbon materials have been both developed at the same level (32.5%), while 30% of the 567 568 nanostructured materials found in literature are made of carbon nanomaterials. Mixed metal / metal oxide materials have been studied in a lesser extent until now (5%). Generally, carbon-569 based materials used either as raw material or as nanomaterials catalysts have been developed 570 571 extensively, since it represents 95% of the studies. This is to be linked with the reliable properties of carbon material to promote the two-electron ORR as discussed in section 2.1 572 [66,117–124]. 573

574

#### 575 4.1.1. Carbon nanomaterials-based cathodes

Among the carbon nanomaterials-based cathode developed, there is a variety of materials (Fig. 576 577 8b) such as graphene, CNTs and carbon nanofibers coated on different carbon substrate like reticulated vitreous carbon (RVC), graphite felt (GF) and CF [125]. The cathodes having a 578 three-dimensional (3D) porous structure are known to favor H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> electrogeneration thanks to 579 their high active area, high chemical stability and low H<sub>2</sub> evolution overvoltage. In parallel, gas 580 diffusion electrodes (GDEs) was proposed and could also reach high H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> yields [123]. The 581 combination between 3D porous CF with GDEs could even improve the H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> electrogeneration 582 yield due to the enhanced oxygen mass transfer [51,126]. Another way is to modify CF cathode 583 for H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> electrogeneration improvement [127]. 584

585 Still the GDEs and/or 3D porous carbons modifications with nanostructured carbon based-586 materials have been suggested in literature to further raise the  $H_2O_2$  production. Thanks to their 587 electrochemical and physical properties, the growth of graphene and CNTs is of great interest 588 for electro-Fenton process as working electrodes. The honeycomb structure of graphene

containing  $sp^2$  hybridized carbon enhance the specific surface area [125]. The carbon containing 589 590 oxygen groups serve as an active site for oxygen adsorption and conversion to H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> through ORR [128]. Recently, Hasanzadeh et al. (2019) [102] performed a highly efficient nanocarbon 591 cathode for the hydrogen peroxide electrogeneration with fullerene  $C_{60}$  covalently bonded to 592 the CNT surface. This hybrid structure promotes the electron transfer and increase the surface 593 area of the cathode offering to this material a high performance toward the oxygen reduction 594 through the two-electron route, reaching a rate as high as 28 mM (h cm<sup>2</sup>)<sup>-1</sup> [102]. Other works 595 focused on the modification of non-nanostructured cathodes with graphene or nanocarbon 596 materials such as graphene ink-coated carbon cloth [70], graphite felt modified with 597 598 electrochemically exfoliated graphene [66], GDEs with CNTs [129] and CF coated with reduced graphene [72]. It was highlighted that the nanostructured modification of the raw 599 material improves the activity of the cathode and consequently its selectivity towards the 600 601 hydrogen peroxide production [109].

602

#### 603 4.1.2. Heteroatom-based cathodes

Doping carbon materials is a way to control the ORR activity by incorporating heteroatoms in the carbon lattice atoms [130]. The most widely used dopants were nitrogen, phosphorus, fluorine, sulfur and boron (Fig. 8c) due to their different size and electronegativity with carbon atoms, the structure distortion and charge density were modulated [131].

Recently N-doped materials received more attention for  $H_2O_2$  electrosynthesis. The works about N-doped graphene and modified graphite felt electrode with nitrogen-doped porous carbon illustrated the ability of these cathodes to reach a high yield of  $H_2O_2$  production and selectivity, with high generation rate of 1.6 mmol (h cm<sup>2</sup>)<sup>-1</sup> and a current efficiency of 68% [112]. Yu et al. (2019) reported the performances of the modified graphite felt electrode with N-doped porous carbon, the  $H_2O_2$  generation rate was 0.13 mmol (h cm<sup>2</sup>)<sup>-1</sup> [132]. Moreover, some recent works demonstrated that N-doped carbon materials could improve activity for  $H_2O_2$ synthesis, while the N-doped graphene could act as catalyst to convert the generated  $H_2O_2$  into free radicals [112,133]. Further, it was reported that graphite N could promote  $H_2O_2$  generation, while pyridinic N could catalyze  $H_2O_2$  conversion into 'OH. Therefore, a novel in-situ metal-free EAOPs was developed for efficient degradation of organic pollutants at wide pH ranges in the absence of metal catalysts.

Fluorine is known as the highest electronegative atoms in Mendeleev table and its combination 620 with carbon structure generate a redistribution in partials charges and more positives carbon 621 atoms. This allows the adsorption of O<sub>2</sub> and the <sup>\*</sup>OOH desorption [134]. Fluorine-doped 622 623 hierarchically porous carbon exhibited a high activity towards H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> electro-generation with the enhancement of selectivity and yield with  $H_2O_2$  production rate of 3.11 mmol (h cm<sup>2</sup>)<sup>-1</sup> [63]. In 624 addition, P-doped carbon single walled nanotube was also investigated for ORR activity, mainly 625 626 for H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> electrosynthesis. P as a donor atom presented a high affinity towards oxygen, modifying the charge transfer properties and improving the electrocatalysis of the doped 627 material [135]. Moreover, according to Xia et al. [61] P-CNTs GDE cathode could reach 88% 628 of current efficiency of H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> formation against 65% with CNTs cathode. 629

630

#### 631 4.1.3. Metal- and metal-oxide based cathodes

The mixed metals or metal oxides have been generally used as an heterogeneous catalyst in a wide range of electrochemical and bio-electrochemical applications such as microbial fuel cells but rarely for  $H_2O_2$  electrosynthesis from oxygen reduction [136]. As reported in several works about the electrodes materials used for the  $H_2O_2$  electrosynthesis, the mixed metal or the metal oxides such as CaSnO<sub>3</sub>, BiVO<sub>4</sub>, TiO<sub>2</sub> and WO<sub>3</sub> were widely used for the anodic production of the  $H_2O_2$  or as a photocatalysts [137], instead of doing ORR at cathode.

638 Yuan et al. (2013) [138] performed the two-electron ORR at the MMO made of  $IrO_2/Ta_2O_5$ 

coated on the titanium mesh (Ti/MMO). The maximum production of  $H_2O_2$  achieved with this

material was 0.06 mM, which is still very low compared to the metals oxide supported on carbon material [138]. The bismuth molybdate oxide coated on the titanium mesh (Bi<sub>2</sub>Mo<sub>3</sub>O<sub>12</sub>/Ti) cathode was also used by He et al. (2019) [77] for the production of hydrogen peroxide in electro-Fenton process. They report the effect of the catalyst structure on the electrochemical efficiency of the cathode. The catalyst performance was related to the presence of the oxygen vacancies in Bi<sub>2</sub>Mo<sub>3</sub>O<sub>12</sub> lattice, which allows the chemisorption of the oxygen and its reduction to H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> [77].

647

#### 648 4.1.4. Mixed metal / metal oxide and carbon-based cathodes

Some metals and metal oxides supported on GDEs have depicted considerable performance for oxygen reduction catalysis. Due to their abundance, low cost and high performance towards ORR, scientists have given great interest for their uses as cathode materials for  $H_2O_2$ electrogeneration [139].

653 GDEs made by Ta<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> nanoparticles supported on carbon black (Ta<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>/C) demonstrated high 654 catalytic efficiency making it as a promising candidate cathode for wastewater treatment. Tantalum (V), known as acid oxide, increases the surface wettability inducing more active site 655 for ORR [115]. In another work, MnO<sub>2</sub>/Vulcan XC-72 carbon nanoflowers were used to 656 657 optimize the oxygen vacancy sites. MnO<sub>2</sub>/C 3% displayed the optimal catalytic activity because of the uniform structure of MnO<sub>2</sub> nanoflowers improving the distribution on carbon support, 658 the high oxygen concentration vacancies and the high active surface area reached with metal 659 oxide incorporation [97]. Paz et al. [113] prepared a new cathode material with tungsten oxide 660 nanoparticles on carbon and the mass ratio of 1:100 (W:C) demonstrated the high H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> yield 661 and selectivity compared to the support without the metal oxide. Many other works about H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> 662 electrogeneration by means of metal oxide nanostructured cathodes have been performed such 663 as Vanadium/C [59], CeO<sub>2</sub> [58] and ZrO<sub>2</sub>-nanostructured GDE [114]. 664
Furthermore, Félix-Navarro et al. (2013) [75] reported the electrocatalytic activity of the Pt-Pd bimetallic nanoparticles on CNTs towards the  $H_2O_2$  electrosynthesis. The mixed metal nanoparticles anchored on the multi-walled CNTs (MWCNTs) exhibited a high efficiency to produce  $H_2O_2$  compared to the MWCNTs alone. The enhancement of the  $H_2O_2$  yield is ascribed to the increase of the active surface area of the catalyst by the small particle sizes of the Pt-Pd distributed on the MWCNTs surface [75].

A heterogeneous cathode on which a confined interior iron cavity of CNTs (Fe<sup>0</sup>-in-CNTs) with 671 672 extremely low iron leaching was prepared, observing a much higher H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> yield and phenol removal rate (9.7 times faster) when compared with that of iron-confined external walls of 673 CNTs (Fe<sup>0</sup>-out-CNTs) [140]. It was found that iron valence on CNTs played an important role 674 on the heterogeneous Fenton activity, supporting that Fe<sup>0</sup> was beneficial for H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> selectivity of 675 676 two-electron process (2.4 times higher) and phenol removal rate (21.44 times faster) than iron oxide. Consequently, the CNT cavity provided an isolate space for Fe<sup>0</sup>, which is decisive for 677 phenol removal based surface of Fe<sup>0</sup>-in-CNTs reaction. 678

# 679 4.1.5. General requirement for cathode characteristics and operating conditions

The nanostructure of the cathode plays a major role in the in-situ production of  $H_2O_2$ . The structural morphology and the introduction of new functional groups with various physicochemical properties affect drastically the cathode performance. It is reported in several works that the active surface area, the conductivity, the porosity, the surface composition and the wettability are the main parameter to consider in the ORR activity [109,141,142]. Some operating parameters play also an important role on two-electron-ORR activity such as electrode potential (or current density), solution pH and oxygen flow rate.

687 *4.1.5.1. Effect of electrode surface area* 

The surface area, defined by specific surface area using BET technique or electroactive surfacearea using EIS method, is a decisive parameter in the ORR activity enhancement [143]. The

influence of BET specific surface area (SBET) on the amount of H2O2 electrogenerated at 690 691 nanostructured-based cathode materials found in literature (Table 1) has been plotted in Fig. 9. It can be noted that the S<sub>BET</sub> as high as around 1000 m<sup>2</sup> can be obtained by nanostructuring the 692 materials. Interestingly, the higher surface area does not systematically lead to higher H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> 693 electrogeneration. It is known that increasing the surface area make increase the number of 694 active sites for adsorption and subsequent desorption of intermediates species. However, this 695 696 will increase the H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> production until a certain optimal value of surface area. Fig. 9 defines this range of surface area between around 30 to 100 m<sup>2</sup>. The high surface areas do not provide 697 higher H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> formation, since the rate of O<sub>2</sub> transport from bulk to the electrode surface become 698 699 then the rate-limiting step.



700

701

**Figure 9.** Influence of BET specific surface area  $(S_{BET})$  on the amount of  $H_2O_2$  electrogenerated at nanostructured-based cathode materials.

703

702

# 704 *4.1.5.2. Effect of electrode porosity*

The porous structure effect of the nanostructured cathodes was investigated in many articles. It has been demonstrated that the presence of large number of pores in the cathode material increases the mass transfer and facilitates the diffusion of the reactants and products through

the cathode [109]. Also, this porous configuration limits the diffusion resistance and creates 708 709 more active sites for oxygen reduction, enhancing in this way the ORR activity and the H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> yield [63]. Park et al. [144] reported the correlation between the well-ordered mesoporous 710 structure of N-doped-carbon (3-4 nm) catalyst and its high selectivity toward the H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> 711 electrosynthesis. In this work the effect of pores toward the H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> selectivity was investigated 712 through a comparison study between the mesoporous N-doped carbon (MNC) and activated N-713 714 doped carbon (ANC), using Koutecky-Levic plots and a rotating ring-disc electrode voltammetry [144]. High selectivity values are reached at MNC cathode compared to the ANC 715 cathode; the mesopores of the MNC allow an easier release of the produced H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>. In contrast, 716 717 the micropores of the ANC increase the residence time and as a result, the formed H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> evolves 718 to  $H_2O$ , thus affecting its selectivity [144].

- 719
- 720 *4.1.5.3. Effect of electrode conductivity*

721 The electrical conductivity of cathode material is another important factor that increase the rate of electron transfer to let occur electrochemical reaction, though this is not usually the rate-722 limiting step. This conductivity has been often characterized by the Rct given by EIS 723 724 measurement [67,70,73]. The conductivity is affected by the thickness of material and by the defects on the nanostructure. It has been shown that the increase of graphene thickness (from 725 graphene single layer to graphene foam) could decrease the resistivity of the material 726 [51,145,146]. Moreover, the presence of oxygen functional groups on carbon nanomaterial can 727 localize the  $\pi$ -electrons, which decrease their mobility and therefore the material conductivity 728 [147]. 729

730

731 *4.1.5.4. Effect of electrode wettability* 

The hydrophilicity character of the cathode materials is considered in many studies about the electrogeneration of the  $H_2O_2$ . It has been shown that the hydrophobicity can also have a positive influence on the ORR activity by enhancing the  $O_2$  gas absorption on the porous carbon-based material [148]. Contrastingly, it was observed that the nanostructures with highest hydrophilic character exhibit a high H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> production because it improved the dissolved oxygen diffusion in water and its subsequent adsorption on the cathode material [73]. The metal oxides nanostructures such as tantalum, vanadium and cerium oxides supported on carbon materials have a Lewis acid sites providing thus the wettability to the surface and allowing the interaction with adsorbed oxygen through the two-electron pathway [59,115].

741 Paz et al. [149] reported improved performance of H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> production at the tungsten oxide nanoparticles modified carbon cathode. Contact angle measurements performed emphasized 742 the importance of hydrophilic character of the modified carbon compared to the unmodified 743 one. Authors attributed this finding to the presence of tungsten nanoparticles as acidic entities 744 745 on the surface. The presence of tungsten atoms as a Lewis acid promotes interactions with the oxygen entities through the Pauling model (two-electron way), resulting in the production of 746 747 H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> [149]. The selectivity toward H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> formation was performed at modified carbon and unmodified carbon electrodes. The modified carbon materials (Printex 6L and Vulcan XC72) 748 presented a higher H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> selectivity than the unmodified one confirming the effect of the 749 tungsten oxide on the wettability and therefore on the oxygen reduction through the two-750 electron mechanism [113]. 751

752 *4.1.5.5. Effect of surface composition* 

The nanostructured carbon cathodes are widely used for the  $H_2O_2$  electrogeneration. Interestingly, the incorporation of some heteroatoms such as nitrogen, fluorine, phosphorus and sulfur to these material further increases their performance towards the oxygen reduction [150]. The common feature of these dopant atoms is the difference of electronegativity and size with the carbon atoms. N-doped carbon materials emerge as the main studied cathodes in literature for  $H_2O_2$ electrosynthesis, and became models of heterostructured materials for mechanisms understanding. As known, the nitrogen is more electronegative and voluminous than carbon. Consequently, the C-N bond become polarized and creates a partial positive charge on the carbon atoms allowing its activation [132]. The oxygen is firstly adsorbed on the activated carbon and then protonated as illustrated in Fig. 10 [151].



764

Figure 10. Mechanism of the ORR on nitrogen-doped carbon materials (Reproduced with
 permission from Ref [151]. Copyright (2018) Wiley).

767

In addition to the nitrogen dopant atom, other heteroatoms with similar properties have been used to dope carbon materials. Phosphorus incorporated on CNTs exhibits a high  $H_2O_2$  yield [61]. This result is assimilated to the structural distortion of the surface caused by the C-P bonding which promotes the oxygen adsorption. Moreover, the electron donor character of the phosphorus atom boosts the electron density of the CNTs surface and enhances the electroactivity of the cathode towards the ORR [150]. Furthermore, at molecular level, it was demonstrated that the fluorine doped on carbon material played a determining role in  $H_2O_2$ selectivity. The incorporation of heteroatoms in carbon framework promotes the oxygen adsorption on the surface and the \*OOH desorption leading to the two-electron route mechanism as shown in the Fig. 11 [63].

778





Figure 11. H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> generation rate at heteroatoms doped-carbon and the corresponding
 unmodified cathode (Adapted with permission from Ref [61,63,132]. Copyrights (2018, 2019)
 Elsevier).

783

# *4.1.5.6. Effect of cathode potential / current density and H*<sup>2</sup> *evolution overvoltage*

The electrogeneration of  $H_2O_2$  is often performed at a fixed potential value (potentiostatic) or at constant current (galvanostatic) mode in an undivided cell [125]. In this configuration, the concentration profile of  $H_2O_2$  increases during the first minutes of the electrolysis and then achieves a plateau with constant  $H_2O_2$  concentration [114].

Mousset et al. [51] investigated the effect of current density on  $H_2O_2$  production on the range

of  $0.0016-1.6 \text{ mA cm}^{-2}$  with three graphene cathodes. The increase in current density does not

allow the increase in  $H_2O_2$  concentration but there is an optimal applied current density giving

the highest concentration that can be reached [51]. This behavior could be explained by the

occurring of parallel reactions including the electroreduction of the  $H_2O_2$  at the cathode (Eq. 8), the decomposition in the bulk electrolyte (Eq. 9) and the oxidation at anode following Eq. 10. The  $H_2$  evolution reaction (HER) was also evoked to be a parasite reaction under some cathode potential (Eq. 11) [67].

797 
$$H_2O_2 + 2H^+ + 2e^- \rightarrow 2H_2O$$
 (8)

798 
$$H_2O_2 \rightarrow 1/2O_2 + H_2O$$
 (9)

$$H_2O_2 \rightarrow HO_2 + H^+ + e^-$$
(10)

$$800 \quad 2\mathrm{H}^{+} + 2\mathrm{e}^{-} \rightarrow \mathrm{H}_{2} \tag{11}$$

The influence of optimal cathode potential (reported versus SHE for reliable comparison) 801 applied in literature (Table 1) at nanostructured-based cathode materials to electrogenerate 802 H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> has been displayed in Fig. 12. This optimal potential can vary from 0 to -1 V/SHE 803 according the cathode material. It is important to note that low cathode potentials could be 804 805 applied thanks to the low hydrogen evolution overvoltage of such nanostructured-based material permitting the two-electron ORR to occur. The highest amount of H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> could be 806 obtained at cathode potentials between -0.5 V/SHE and -0.1 V/SHE. Too high cathode 807 808 potentials then favor the four-electron ORR.



Figure 12. Influence of optimal cathode potential on the amount of H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> electrogenerated at
 nanostructured-based cathode materials.

# 813 *4.1.5.7. Effect of solution pH*

The proton content of the electrolyte has a significant weight on the H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> production. In fact, 814 the acidic or the alkaline medium can influence the parallel reactions and consequently the H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> 815 yield. On the one hand, the electrogeneration of  $H_2O_2$  at the cathode from the dissolved oxygen 816 needs the presence of protons. On the other hand, the higher amount of protons in the solution 817 can promote the hydrogen peroxide decomposition following Eq. 8 or the HER (Eq. 11) [132]. 818 Moreover, at low pH value the ORR occurs via the four-electron mechanism to produce water 819 820 at the cathode, leading to the decrease in  $H_2O_2$  concentration [61]. It is further important to note that the acid dissociation constant (pKa) of  $H_2O_2/HO_2^-$  couple is 11.7, and  $HO_2^-$  is not only a 821 weaker oxidant but also is not able to produce 'OH from Fenton reaction. Consequently, the 822 823 implementation of ORR in alkaline media (Eq. 12) has to be avoided [61]:

824 
$$O_2 + H_2O + 2e^- \rightarrow OH^- + HO_2^ E^0 = -0.065 V$$
 (12)

Many researches have studied the effect of the electrolyte pH medium on the electrogeneration 825 826 of H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>. Yu et al. [132] have performed the electrogeneration of H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> at different pH values of 3, 5, 7 and 9 and they have observed the increase of the H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> concentration with increase of 827 the pH from 3 to 7 and it decrease significantly at pH equal to 9. This trend is confirmed by Xia 828 et al. [61] with a similar study. Depending on the nanostructured cathode material an optimum 829 pH value lead to a maximum H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> concentration (Fig. 13). At the acidic pH, an excess of 830 protons are released in the solution and can be reduced at the cathode to form H<sub>2</sub>, competing 831 with the H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> formation [66]. When the pH increase, the quantity of protons needed to form 832  $H_2O_2$  become insufficient, resulting in low  $H_2O_2$  yield [132]. 833



Figure 13. pH effect on the H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> electrogeneration at different nanostructured cathode
materials: (a) nitrogen-porous based carbon, (b) phosphorus-CNTs, (c) fluorine-doped
hierarchically porous carbon, (d) exfoliated graphene. (Adapted with permission from
[61,63,66,132]. Copyrights (2018, 2019) Elsevier and Copyright (2017) Royal Society of
Chemistry).

# 841 *4.1.5.8. Effect of oxygen flow rate*

Oxygen is the main reagent for  $H_2O_2$  electrogeneration. It has been demonstrated that the oxygen flow rate controls the kinetic of the ORR and consequently the  $H_2O_2$  yield and the current efficiency [125]. The dissolved oxygen (DO) concentration depends on the nature of oxygen supply. With air supply, the DO concentration is 8 mg L<sup>-1</sup> at 23 °C and this value depend remarkably on the purity of the oxygen supplies, and solution temperature [152].

The accumulation of hydrogen peroxide at P-doped CNTs cathode was studied at different oxygen flow rates [61]. Despite the absence of oxygen supply, the  $H_2O_2$  was accumulated at the cathode thanks to the oxygen formed at the anode level from water oxidation. The increase of  $O_2$  flow rate improves the oxygen mass transfer to the cathode and promotes the  $H_2O_2$ formation. However, the high flow rates create an excessive mass bubbles at the cathode surface minimizing the access to the active sites. Additionally, the superfluous conditions maximize the electrolyte resistance and consequently decrease the ORR activity [153].

**Table 1.** Experimental conditions and hydrogen peroxide production performances at the

different kinds of nanostructured cathode materials.

Cathode	рН	Specific surface area (S <sub>BET</sub> ) (m <sup>2</sup> g <sup>-1</sup> )	Current density (mA cm <sup>-2</sup> ) or cathodic potential (V/SHE)	O2 flow rate (L min <sup>-1</sup> )	[H <sub>2</sub> O <sub>2</sub> ] (mmol (h cm <sup>2</sup> ) <sup>-1</sup> )*	Current efficiency (%)	Ref.
Nanostructured carbo	n-based	material					
Carbon fiber brush coated with graphene ink	3	NS	1.25 -0.8	0.2	0.07	95	[67]
Pristine graphene	3	NS	0.4 -0.39	NS	0.0117	13	[51]
Graphene/graphite	3	11.8	20 NS <sup>1</sup>	0.06	0.23	16	[109]
Graphene ink coated carbon cloth	3	NS	1.25 -0.4	0.2	0.03	23	[70]
Graphite felt modified with electrochemically exfoliated graphene	7	9.8	NS -0.856	0.7	0.23	60	[66]
Modified graphite felt	7	NS	300 mA NS	0.8	0.163	19.5	[110]
Fullerene C60-Carbon nanotubes Covalent hybrid	3	422	NS 0.044	NS	28 mM (h cm <sup>2</sup> ) <sup>-1</sup>	82.60	[102]
CF modified with electrochemically exfoliated graphene	3	NS	16.66 NS	1	0.90	23.5	[127]
CF coated with reduced graphene	3	NS	40 mA NS	NS	-	NS	[72]
Carbon nanofiber	NS	NS	200 mA NS	NS	0.05	27.6	[154]
PANI <sup>2</sup> /MWCNT <sup>3</sup> Nanocomposite on Stainless Steel	2	7.1	NS -0.356	0.3	1.37 mM h <sup>-1</sup>	40	[155]
Heteroatom-doped car	bon catl	hode					
Phosphorus-doped Carbon nanotubes GDE <sup>4</sup>	7	119	NS -0.456	0.21	2.57	88.5	[61]
N-Doped graphene	7	NS	NS -0.9	0.75	1.6175	68	[112]
Fluorine-doped porous carbon	1	1001	NS -0.156	NS	3.11	NS	[63]

<sup>855</sup> 

Modified graphite felt electrode with	7	1453	12.5 NS	NS	0.12	10	[132]
Nitrogen-Doped							
porous Carbon	2	12.0	-	0.2	0.10	22	510.43
Graphite felt modified	3	13.8	7	0.3	0.13	33	[104]
graphene			-0.106				
Graphite felt modified	7	NS	NS	1	_	NS	[156]
with nitrogen doped	,	112	NS	-		1.0	[100]
exfoliated graphene							
NCNT <sup>5</sup> /NF <sup>6</sup> /CNT <sup>7</sup>	3	NS	30	0.4	0.18	33	[157]
			NS				
N/F-CNC <sup>8</sup>	13	NS	NS	NS	92% (S)	89.6	[158]
	0.35		-1.36				
			NS		88% (S)	88	
	NG	704	0.33	NG	1.25 1	70	51 501
Glassy carbon coated	NS	/94	NS 0.2	NS	1.35 mmol	70	[159]
with HPCS-S			0.3				
Nitrogen and sulfur	24	NS	NS	NS	_	NS	[160]
doped carbon cathode	2.4	110	NS	115	-	115	
on GC <sup>10</sup>			110				
BDD	3	NS	40	0.3	0.04	0.09	[161]
			NS				
PAN <sup>11</sup> -Carbon Fiber	3	NS	300 mA	3	0.063 mmol	68	[162]
Brush on Ti wire			-0.95		h <sup>-1</sup>		
Mixed metal/metal ox	ide and c	arbon-base	ed cathode				
Ta <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> nanoparticles	2	NS	NS	0.2 bar	0.186	83.2	[115]
On carbon black			-0.8				
ZrO <sub>2</sub> -Nanostructured	2	NS	75	0.2 bar	0.39	9	[114]
GDE <sup>4</sup>			NS				
Tungsten oxide	2	NS	NS	0.2 bar	8.21	96	[113]
Nanoparticles			-0.42				
modified carbon	2	22.5	100	0.5	2.75	40	[162]
diffusion cathode	3	52.5	0.071	0.3	2.13	49	[105]
$12\% \text{ V/C GDF}^4$	NS	NS	-0.071 NS	0.2 bar	18 23 mM h <sup>-</sup>	NS	[59]
1270 V/C ODL	115	110	-1.36	0.2 001	1	110	
4 % CeO <sub>2</sub> /C	NS	NS	NS	0.2 bar	19.4 mM h <sup>-1</sup>	NS	[58]
GDE <sup>4</sup>			-1.1				
Carbon-Supported	3	191	NS	0.2 bar	0.6	NS	[97]
MnO <sub>2</sub> Nanoflowers			-0.9				
Tungsten oxide	3	NS	NS	0.2 bar	1.93	44	[149]
Nanoparticles			-2.3				
modified carbon							

Pt-Pd bimetallic nanoparticles on MWCNTs <sup>3</sup> /RVC	NS	NS	NS 0.699	NS	0.43	-	[75]	
Mn/Fe nanoparticles porous carbon	NS	351	NS -0.056	NS	0.07	-	[62]	
Gold nanoparticles deposited on the graphite cathode	3	NS	0.5 mA -0.056	NS	0.84 mM (h cm <sup>2</sup> ) <sup>-1</sup>	-	[164]	
Cobalt (II) Phthalocyanine/C GDE <sup>4</sup>	NS	NS	NS -0.7	NS	0.14	81.5	[165]	
NiFe nanostructure /Graphite	2	NS	300 mA -0.016	NS	0.015	0.15	[166]	
Nanostructured martite	6	1.8	300 mA -0.206	NS	0.038	0.2	[65]	
Mixed metal/metal oxide cathode								
Bi <sub>2</sub> Mo <sub>3</sub> O <sub>12</sub> /Ti cathode	3	NS	0.9 -0.456	NS	0.044 mmol h <sup>-1</sup>	-	[77]	
MMO <sup>12</sup> /Ti	4	NS	40 mA NS	NS	0.1	6	[138]	

856 \*calculated by dividing with the geometric surface of cathode

857 <sup>1</sup>NS: not specified, <sup>2</sup>PANI: polyaniline, <sup>3</sup>MWCNT: multi-walled carbon nanotube, <sup>4</sup>GDE: gas diffusion electrode, <sup>5</sup>NCNT: N-

858 doped multi-walled carbon nanotube, <sup>6</sup>NF: nickel foam, <sup>7</sup>CNT: carbon nanotube, <sup>8</sup>N/F-CNC: nitrogen/fluoride co-doped carbon

859 nanocages, <sup>9</sup>HPCS-S: hollow porous carbon sphere-sulfur composite, <sup>10</sup>GC: glassy carbon, <sup>11</sup>PAN: polyacrylonitrile, <sup>12</sup>MMO: mixed

860 metal oxide

#### 863 4.2. Nanostructured-based anodes

## 864 4.2.1. General requirement for anode characteristics

Different anodes have different electrochemical properties, e.g., electrode area, OEP and 865 866 conductivity. Thus some electrochemical characterization methods are employed, for example, CV and EIS Nyquist plot [167]. When nanostructure is introduced into anode, some electrode 867 properties would change. It was found that the introduction of TiO<sub>2</sub> nanostructure into Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-868 869 Sb anode resulted in a higher oxidation peak. The Rct obtained from EIS was 203 and 380  $\Omega$ for Ti/TiO<sub>2</sub>/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb and Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb anodes, respectively, indicating the enhanced 870 electrochemical conductivity [56]. This result was also supported by another work according to 871 which the value of Rct was decreased from 74.62  $\Omega$  to 2.57  $\Omega$  after the introduction of Pt at the 872 nanoscale into Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb electrode [168]. 873

#### 874 4.2.2. Carbon nanomaterials-based electrodes

875 *4.2.2.1. CNTs* 

CNT as anode is prone to corrosion at potential higher than 1.7-1.9 V/SCE [83], but it has been
widely used as adsorbents for pollutants adsorption and electrocatalysts for pollutants
electrooxidation or electrosorption in a range of small potentials and currents due to unique
hollow structure and high surface area [169,170].

880 • Raw CNTs

In order to improve the electrochemical oxidation kinetics and mass transport, electrochemical filters with 3D nanostructure have attracted much attention (Fig. 14a). In general, CNT was filtered onto the PTFE membrane as anode for use in electrochemical filtration system. A fivelayer electrochemical CNT-polyvinylidene fluoride filter was constructed for single-pass nitrobenzene removal by sequential reduction-oxidation, but not oxidation–reduction [171].

Aqueous dyes could be adsorbed by CNT filter surface without current application. However, 886 over 90% of dyes from influent could be oxidized when anodic potential was 2 and 3 887 V/(Ag/AgCl) (residence time  $\leq 1.2$  s) [172,173]. When CNT networks were used for removal 888 of methyl orange (MO), the primary removal mechanism during electrochemical filtration was 889 oxidative degradation rather than physical adsorption. Compared with MO, tetracycline (TC) 890 with multiple functional groups/moieties, tended to adsorb onto the sp<sup>2</sup> conjugated CNT 891 sidewalls. However, the MO removal was more effective at high potential with high energy 892 consumption [174]. It was observed that the efficiency of electrochemical filtration was a 893 function of CNT surface chemistry [172]. When CNT networks were used to remove non-894 sorptive ferrocyanide, electro-oxidation kinetics of ferrocyanide had good relationship with 895 896 BET specific surface area of the CNT at a low anodic potential ( $\leq 0.2 \text{ V/(Ag/AgCl)}$ , indicating that the sp<sup>2</sup> sidewalls were the predominant reaction sites. At a higher anodic potential ( $\geq 0.3$ 897 V/(Ag/AgCl), the differential ferrocyanide electrooxidation kinetics in CNT tips and sidewalls 898 correlated well with the O/C ratio of the CNT networks. It illustrated that the oxy-tips also 899 contributed to attain faster electrochemical kinetics [175]. Aqueous chloride and iodide were 900 also oxidized with minimal overpotential, which was limited by active sites on CNT surface 901 [173]. 902

Therefore, many parameters have effected the electrochemical filtration system, e.g., oxidative 903 fluxes and anodic potential. 95% 17ß-estradiol and 17a-ethinylestradiol were removed by CNT 904 electrochemical filter when the oxidative fluxes were more than  $2.94 \pm 0.05$  mmol h<sup>-1</sup> m<sup>-2</sup> at 905 the voltage of 2.5 V [176]. An anodic MWCNT micro-filter was applied to remove and 906 inactivate viruses (MS<sub>2</sub>) and bacteria (Escherichia coli (E. coli)). When the anodic potential 907 was 2 V and 3 V/(Ag/AgCl), the sieved bacteria and adsorbed viruses could be removed over 908 75.0% and 99.6% for 30 s post-filtration, respectively, indicating that it was promising at the 909 point-of-use of drinking water treatment [173]. In addition, graphene is another kind of carbon 910

nanomaterials with large surface area and conductivity, which also exhibit sp<sup>2</sup> carbon atoms
with CNT. The addition of graphene to CNT increased the water permeation rate and decreased
the liquid residence time to 0.44 s. When graphene: CNT ratio was 7:3, the filter performance
was the best because it achieved the balance between low specific surface area and high
conductivity of CNTs [177].

Additionally, the target pollutants were degraded into intermediates, which coated electrodes 916 by forming polymer. The presence of polymer and intermediate may negatively affect the 917 918 efficacy and efficiency of the device toward practical application. When an anodic potential of 1.6 V/(Ag/AgCl) was applied to CNT network for 4 h, CNT film was passivated due to 919 pollutants polymerization on the CNT network, reducing reaction current and electrochemical 920 921 performance (Fig. 14b). To obtain an active (non-passivated) CNT network to remove polymer 922 on electrode, electrode regeneration was necessary, and it was more effective to prevent the formation of polymers at higher potentials (Fig. 14c). The method of calcination and 923 924 redispersion was effective (> 97%) for the removal of the passivating electropolymer coating 925 [178].

The oxidation and adsorption at the CNT electrode, especially for Fenton reaction (Fe was 926 loaded in cathode materials), could be combined, allowing a promising process for effective 927 wastewater treatment [179–182]. The increase in surface area of cathode led to decrease the 928 cathodic resistance for charge transfer, which was beneficial to anodic potential and 929 930 electrooxidation [183]. The total organic carbon (TOC) removal rate by the coupled process between anodic oxidation and EF was 4 times higher than that of individual processes [184]. In 931 addition, electrochemical oxidation could combine with other technology (forward osmosis and 932 ozonation) based on the CNT filter [175,185]. This could simultaneously achieve the removal 933 of both phenol (3.2-fold increase) and soluble salts in forward osmosis, and decrease polymer 934

935 formation and deposition on CNT. It is therefore promising for commercially available water936 purification system.

#### 937



938

Figure 14. (a) Depiction and images of the CNT electrochemical filtration apparatus, i.e. real
images of the whole reaction cell (including the upper cap and bottom cap), anode
components (titanium ring and CNT network with cross-section and aerial images) and
cathode (the perforated stainless steel), (b) SEM image of the fresh and passivated CNT
network, respectively, and (c) SEM image of regenerated CNT. Reproduced with permission
from Ref. [178]. Copyright (2013) Elsevier.

- 945
- 946 CNTs modification
- 947

# (1) Chemical surface treatments

After anodic oxidation, CNT will inevitably undergo surface oxidation, which has certain effect on electrochemical performance. Calcination of CNT to remove amorphous carbon can lead to the opening of the ends of crude CNTs. Oxygen functional groups were generated during acid treatment. HCl treatment is advantageous compared to HNO<sub>3</sub> treatment since CNT exhibits

more surface sp<sup>2</sup>-bonded carbon positively charged in the former case and this leads to adsorb 952 953 pollutants negatively charged. In the case of HNO3 treatment CNT has negatively charged surface oxy-groups that have a longer effective retention time for adsorption and oxidation of 954 pollutants with positive charged [172]. The pre-anodization of CNT sodium sulfate electrolyte 955 increased hydroxyl group (-COH) and decreased carboxyl group (-COOH) compared with raw 956 CNT, resulting in an increased anodic phenol mineralization by two-time [184]. However, when 957 CNT was refluxed in nitric acid, the decisive functional group was -COOH, resulting in a 958 decrease of phenol mineralization by two-time (Fig. 15a). The reason was that hydrophilic -959 COH groups were beneficial to electron transfer (Fig. 15b) and exhibited more defect sites 960 961 under a similar O/C ratio. In addition, the formation of -COOH would lead to breaking of C-C bond conducting to a negative effect on CNT electrochemical activity [184]. 962

In another work, CNT was modified by sodium dodecyl benzene sulfonate (SDBS) and then dipped on polyurethane sponges as conductive nano-sponge filtration [186]. The removal efficiency of tetracycline decreased when excess SDBS was treated by concentrated HNO<sub>3</sub>. The electro-oxidation flux of this system could reach  $0.87 \pm 0.04$  mol h<sup>-1</sup> m<sup>-2</sup>, which was 36-folds more than raw CNT filtration due to the decrease of the actual filter cross-sectional area [183]. However, forming polymer/precipitate from intermediates was easier to block the active sites, decreasing the catalytic activity.

970

# (2) Heteroatom doping

Heteroatom doping of CNT was developed to improve its electrochemical filtration action for effective oxidation of pollutants. Boron and nitrogen-doping (B-CNT, N-CNT) with 1% of heteroatom as well as raw CNT were used as anode for phenol removal. It was found that the three anodes were all able to remove approximately 7 to 8 mg C L<sup>-1</sup> of the influent TOC within the 1 s liquid residence time at the anodic potential of 1.6 V/(Ag/AgCl) (Fig. 15c) [187]. Although, the TOC removal was similar for all anodes, B-CNT led to a greater extent of phenol
oxidation and yield to a higher fraction of by-products that did not polymerize. According to
the TGA and current change measurements, the B-CNT exhibited most stable and resistance
performance toward electrochemical passivation with the lowest extent of electrochemical
polymer and precipitate formation (Fig. 15d). It was suggested that it might be the optimal CNT
for anodic processes [187].

982

#### (3) Metal doping

Sb-doped SnO<sub>2</sub> CNT (Sb-SnO<sub>2</sub>-CNT) exhibited high over-potential and electrocatalytic surface 983 984 area compared with heteroatom doping CNT [172]. A nanoscale tin oxide modified CNT (SnO<sub>2</sub>-CNT) was prepared via electrosorption-hydrothermal protocol to apply it in a 985 continuous-flow system as anode. SnO<sub>2</sub> nanoparticles were uniformly distributed on the 986 987 sidewalls of CNT, resulting in a rougher tubular surface and an increased tube diameter [188]. The OEP of SnO<sub>2</sub>-CNT and BTO-CNT (CNT uniformly coated with bismuth-doped tin oxide 988 nanoparticles) was, respectively, 580 mV and 440 mV higher than that of raw CNT (1.27 V vs 989 Ag/AgCl). It resulted in an excellent anodic stability for ammonia transformation over three 990 consecutive cycles [188,189]. TOC removal by BTO-CNT was two to eight-time higher and 991 992 energy consumption was 0.2-time than that of raw CNT anode [189]. CNT loaded with Sb-SnO<sub>2</sub> and Bi-Sb-SnO<sub>2</sub> enhanced the degradation rate of phenol by 1.5 and 2.1-folds, 993 respectively and this enhancement was attributed to an effective generation of 'OH [190]. Only 994 0.8 mg L<sup>-1</sup> Sn<sup>4+</sup> was measured after 1.5 h electrolysis, indicating good stability of the anode 995 materials [188]. In addition, Ti<sup>4+</sup> was adsorbed on the CNT surface and further formed the TiO<sub>2</sub> 996 modified CNT filters (TiO2-CNT) via electrosorption-hydrothermal process. In this 997 998 electroactive filter system, simultaneous detoxification and sequestration of Sb(III) were fulfilled within pH ranging from 3 to 11 [188]. Therefore, metal doping CNTs as anode 999

exhibited excellent reactivity, current efficiency and lower energy consumption due toincreased conductivity, OEP and stability.



1003

Figure 15. Anodic performance evaluation of the CNT samples. Electrochemical conditions 1004 were flow rate =  $1.6 \text{ mL min}^{-1}$ , [phenol] = 1.0 mM and [Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>] = 100 mM unless otherwise 1005 1006 noted. (a) Average TOC removal rate over 180 minutes of continued electrochemical filtration at an anodic potential of 1.6 V/(Ag/AgCl); (b). EIS was measured with a three-electrode 1007 system over a frequency range of  $0.1-10^6$  Hz. Reproduced with permission from Ref. [184]. 1008 Copyright (2015) Royal Society of Chemistry. Effluent total organic carbon (mg C L<sup>-1</sup>) versus 1009 applied voltage (V) and time (min) (c) and percent CNT, residual, and polymer versus CNT 1010 network (d). Reproduced with permission from Ref. [187]. Copyright (2012) American 1011 Chemical Society. 1012

#### 1014 *4.2.2.2. Boron-doped diamond (BDD) anode*

BDD is one of the most promising electrodes in the field of electrocatalysis due to its low 1015 background current, noise signals, wide potential window, high mechanical strength and 1016 corrosion resistance and long-term response stability [191]. BDD has been considered as an 1017 excellent anode material for the electrochemical treatment of wastewater at a wide pH range, 1018 1019 due to its unique and excellent properties compared with dimensionally stable anodes (DSA) [192–194]. At present, BDD electrode has promising prospect in wastewater treatment 1020 especially for mineralization of bio-refractory organic pollutants [195,196]. Furthermore, when 1021 BDD was used as anode in electro-Fenton (EF) process, the pollutants removal would be greatly 1022 improved [17,197]. It has been proved that boron doping level of BDD had obvious effect on 1023 the diamond crystallites and the active sites on the surface, resulting in a better oxidation 1024 1025 performance.

1026

## • Substrates-based BDD anode

#### 1027 (1) Titanium substrate

After BDD film deposition on Ti substrate via CVD process (Fig. 15a), porous Ti was uniformly 1028 covered by BDD film, showing well-faceted crystal with the crystal size being in the range of 1029 1-2 µm [198]. 3D structure of porous Ti/BDD exhibited excellent electrochemical effective 1030 surface area for electron transfer (3.2-time) and high OEP for 'OH generation compared to flat 1031 Ti/BDD [199]. The contact angle of porous Ti/BDD electrodes were 135° compared to 72° of 1032 flat Ti/BDD electrodes, indicating that the microstructure of polycrystalline BDD could also 1033 1034 improve the hydrophobicity to some extent. The thickness of diffusion layer of porous Ti/BDD (69  $\mu$ m) was much less than that of flat BDD (117  $\mu$ m), which was decisive for mass transfer 1035 coefficient of porous Ti/BDD (1.31×10<sup>-5</sup> m s<sup>-1</sup>) compared to that of flat BDD (7.71×10<sup>-6</sup> m s<sup>-1</sup>) 1036

[200]. With the increase of boron concentration, the grain size of Ti/BDD was more obvious, 1037 1038 exhibiting more stable electrochemical properties (Fig. 17a-b) [201]. Through LSV curve measurements, it was found that oxidation peak for aspirin was observed, shifting positively 1039 with the increase of aspirin concentration. Importantly, porous Ti/BDD electrode exhibited 1040 outstanding direct electrochemical oxidation ability for aspirin with the step currents 1.4-1.8 1041 times of the values of flat Ti/BDD electrode, which was beneficial to direct oxidation of aspirin. 1042 1043 The apparent rate constants  $(k_{app})$  of porous Ti/BDD for anodic oxidation of aspirin was 1.98 times of flat BDD and 7.20 times of PbO<sub>2</sub> electrode, which could be ascribed to the more active 1044 sites provided by porous film to generate 'OH [202]. Porous Ti/BDD electrodes exhibited 1045 1046 excellent stability (service life: 111 h) than plate Ti/BDD (89 h), indicating that porous Ti improved the stability of Ti/BDD electrode (Fig. 17c) [198]. The different utilization efficiency 1047 of porous electrode surface led to discrepancy between promotion of current efficiency and 1048 1049 enhancement of 'OH [203]. On the other hand, the current efficiency of porous Ti/BDD was smaller than that of plate anode because the surface could not be exploited completely in a mass 1050 transport control situation (Fig. 17d). 1051

Porous Ti/BDD anode presented excellent potential in anodic oxidation and mineralization of
different pollutants (e.g., dyes, pharmaceuticals, phenols, etc.) [199,202,204,205].

1054 (2) Silicon substrate

A BDD nanowire (BDDNW) electrode via metal-assisted chemical etching of Si and electrostatic self-assembly of nanodiamond seeding was prepared (Fig. 16b) [206]. The average length and thickness of nanocrystalline BDD on Si substrate were 200 nm and 750 nm, respectively. The effective surface area of BDDNW was 3 times higher than that of plat BDD, providing substantially greater electrochemical reaction sites for 'OH generation. The phenol removal by BDDNW and plate BDD was 97% and 79%, respectively, and the phenol mineralization by BDDNW was 2.27-folds than that of plate BDD anode. These results
suggested that BDDNW electrode was much more efficient in electrooxidation of phenol.

1063 (3) Pla

# (3) Platinum substrate

In addition, 3D-Pt nanosheet perpendicular to BDD film was prepared by the double template method (hydrogen bubble template and metallic Zn template for displacement reaction) to control the morphology. The length and thickness of the Pt nanosheet were about 1 μm and 10 nm, respectively. Due to the size effect of the Pt and active effect of the BDD, Pt nanosheet/BDD electrode had higher electrocatalytic activity and active sites, facilitating the pollutants degradation [207].

1070 (

# (4) Nickel foam substrate

1071 The BDD could also be loaded on the Ni foam by CVD to form the 3D-BDD [208]. Compared with 2D-BDD (Ti sheet as substrate), the electroactive surface area of 3D-BDD increased by 1072 20-time. Thanks to the fluid flow channel, the 3D-BDD electrode exhibited highly efficient 1073 electrochemical oxidation of RB-19. The apparent reaction rate constant, energy consumption, 1074 and mineralization current efficiency (MCE) were 1.487 min<sup>-1</sup>, 0.03 kWh (gTOC)<sup>-1</sup> and 326%, 1075 respectively (electrolyte: 0.1 M Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> was 0.1 M; current was 0.3 A; 400 mg L<sup>-1</sup> RB-19; time: 1076 180 min) 3D-BDD electrodes prepared with different ppi (pores per inch) of Ni foam had 1077 different electro-oxidation performance [209]. The COD removal rate and energy consumption 1078 of 3D-BDD<sub>1</sub> (50 ppi) were 1.5-time and 25% of that of 3D-BDD<sub>2</sub> (35 ppi-30), respectively. 1079

1080

#### Composite electrodes with BDD and other materials

1081 (1) TiO<sub>2</sub>

1082 TiO<sub>2</sub>/BDD heterojunction electrodes were prepared via CVD method by dip-coating TiO<sub>2</sub> 1083 nanoparticles onto BDD electrodes at 700 °C, exhibiting 20 nm TiO<sub>2</sub> nanoparticles. When boron 1084  $(2 \times 10^{21} \text{ cm}^{-3})/(\text{carbon} ((2 \times 10^{19} \text{ cm}^{-3})))$  ratio in gas phase 1000 ppm and covered 500 nm thick

TiO<sub>2</sub> layer, this nanostructure of p-n junction was beneficial to the hole injection [210]. The 1085 1086 photoelectrocatalytic activity of mixed-phase TiO<sub>2</sub>/BDD electrode in 700 °C was 3-fold of that obtained at pure anatase TiO<sub>2</sub>/BDD electrode in 450 °C, which was caused by the improvement 1087 of the active area [211]. When composite TiO<sub>2</sub>/BDD electrode was prepared via 1088 electrophoretically deposited method, the thickness of TiO<sub>2</sub> layer on the BDD surface was 14.68 1089  $\mu$ m, exhibiting great ability and stability [212]. The electrocatalytic activity of TiO<sub>2</sub>/BDD was 1090 1091 proved to be improved due to the greater electroactive area compared with BDD. For instance, the degradation of Acid Blue 80 by TiO<sub>2</sub>/BDD in photoelectrocatalysis (PEC) was enhanced 1092 compared to BDD due to the higher electroactive area of the nanostructured TiO<sub>2</sub> deposition, 1093 1094 showing promising prospect for application [212].

1095 (2) SnO<sub>2</sub>

1096 Sb-doped SnO<sub>2</sub> film was constructed on BDD (Sb-SnO<sub>2</sub>/BDD) by a sol-gel method [213] with 1097 a bifunctional electrode interface: innumerable, uniform, nanosized SnO<sub>2</sub> particles and some 1098 BDD polycrystallites. For clofibric acid degradation, the reaction rate constant of Sb-1099 SnO<sub>2</sub>/BDD was 1.6-time higher than with BDD. This effect has been explained by its high OEP 1100 (2.23 V/SCE) versus that of BDD (2.35 V/SCE) and good conductivity (with electrical 1101 resistance of 175  $\Omega$  compared to that of BDD: 3850  $\Omega$ ). It would therefore be a promising anode 1102 for wastewater remediation.

1103 (3) Ni

Polycrystalline BDD on Ta substrate via electron-assisted hot filament CVD and Ninanoparticle-assisted plasma etching was prepared, providing a method for obtaining a regular porous nanostructure on the BDD surface (Fig. 16c) [214]. The etching process and the formation of the porous nanostructure on the BDD were investigated by changing the Ni sputtering time and the BDD etching time. When a porous BDD film was sputtered with Ni for 10 s and etched for 2 min, holes less than 200 nm size were densely distributed on the BDD surface, with square and triangular holes present on the (100) and (111) phases, respectively.
Compared with plate BDD electrode, porous BDD/Ta exhibited excellent electron transfer via
effective electroactive surface area (2.43-fold) and a pseudo-first-order reaction rate of 0.02
min<sup>-1</sup> for electrochemical oxidation of methylene blue.

1114 (4) Au

1115 The dendritic Au/BDD was successfully prepared with well-defined fractal structure and 0.24 nm space between the branch and the trunk [215]. This structure exhibited better reversibility 1116 than BDD electrode due to the difference between anodic and cathodic peaks. The dendritic 1117 Au/BDD with single crystal dendritic Au with dominant (111) facet exhibited numerous 1118 physisorption and chemisorption sites [215]. It was indicated that dendritic Au/BDD exhibited 1119 1120 better electrocatalytic oxidation for the sulfur containing target contaminant with higher 1121 selectivity than phenol due to preferential adsorption of target molecules to form Au-S bonds, resulting in electron transfer between Au and S [215]. 1122

In summary, nanostructuring the surface of BDD anodes (e.g., porous diamond, diamond nanowires, etc.) enhanced the degradation performance towards organic pollutants. It could further improve the electrochemical performance due to the increasing surface area for adsorption capacity, porous structure for electron transfer and rough surface for extending the life of the composite electrode.



Figure 16. (a) Schematic diagram of fabrication process for 3DN-BDD film electrode.
Reproduced with permission from Ref. [200]. Copyright (2016) Royal Society of Chemistry;
(b) Schematic of the fabrication process for a BDDNW electrode. Reproduced with
permission from Ref. [206]. Copyright (2017) Royal Society of Chemistry; (c) Schematic
diagram depicting the preparation of a porous BDD/Ta films. (c) Reproduced with
permission from Ref. [214]. Copyright (2018) Elsevier.



1139Figure 17. SEM images porous Ti/BDD electrodes: (a) Ti/BDD electrode for high boron1140concentration and (b) low boron concentration; inset: SEM images with low magnification1141corresponding to the electrodes. Reproduced with permission from Ref. [201]. Copyright1142(2012) Elsevier. (c) Accelerated life between plate and 3D-Ti/BDD electrodes in 3 mol L<sup>-1</sup>1143H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> solution. Reproduced with permission from Ref. [198]. Copyright (2015) Elsevier.1144Hydroxyl radical utilization rate as a function of electrode material (d) Reproduced with1145permission from Ref. [202]. Copyright (2015) Elsevier.

# *4.2.3. Heteroatom-based electrodes*

The interaction between the catalyst and interacting media could be improved when heteroatom
was doped in nanostructured materials to increased active surface area and electric properties
[216].

### 1151 *4.2.3.1. Fluorine-doped electrodes*

Fluorine (F) doping with high potential anode could inhibit O<sub>2</sub> evolution to improve the anodic 1152 oxidation of pollutants [217]. Because F<sup>-</sup> and O<sup>2-</sup> have similar ionic radius, the oxygen sites on 1153 the surfaces can be replaced by F<sup>-</sup> anions [218], so that F-PbO<sub>2</sub> exhibit more regular morphology 1154 with better oriented crystals of lower size (16.203 nm) than for raw PbO<sub>2</sub> (24.305 nm) 1155 [219,220]. When F-PbO<sub>2</sub> film electrode was prepared by anode co-deposition, the deposition 1156 potential had obvious effect on morphology, resulting in thinner crystal grains on the F-doped 1157 PbO<sub>2</sub> surface (Fig. 18). The spherical crystallites appeared when deposition potential was low, 1158 i.e. when F content was high (Fig. 18a-1). On the contrary, when the deposition potential was 1159 1160 high, cracks were observed on the electrode surface (Fig. 18a-2).



Figure 18. (a) SEM micrographs of the F-PbO<sub>2</sub> electrode with different doping content of F
(atomic ratio of F to Pb, 1: 0.075: 2: 0.07: 1, 3: free-doped PbO<sub>2</sub> electrode). Reproduced with
permission from Ref [218]. Copyright (2013) Wiley. (b) Schematic diagram of the structure

of F-PbO<sub>2</sub> electrode system. Reproduced with permission from Ref. [220]. Copyright (2009)

1166 Elsevier. (c) FEG-SEM images of (1) top view of TiO<sub>2</sub>NTs; (2) cross-section of TiO<sub>2</sub> NTs;

and (3) top view of boron-doped  $TiO_2NTs$  with addition of 560 ppm of NaBF<sub>4</sub> in the

electrolyte of nanotubes growth. Reproduced with permission from Ref [221]. Copyright

1169

(2015) Elsevier.

F-PbO<sub>2</sub> anode via decomposition methods was prepared to explore the mechanism of the effect 1170 of F doping on lifetime and electrochemical and degradation activity of PbO<sub>2</sub> [220]. In Fig. 17b, 1171 1172 -OH sites in gel layer were replaced by F<sup>-</sup> anions in F-PbO<sub>2</sub>, decreasing free move of oxygen atoms and coverage of reactive oxygen species (ROS) [222]. The O<sup>2-</sup> sites in crystal layer were 1173 1174 also replaced by F<sup>-</sup> anions, decreasing the formation of free oxygen and occupying the channels of the diffusion of the free oxygen atoms [219,222]. Therefore, the service life of F-PbO<sub>2</sub> anode 1175 (140 h) was three times higher than that of PbO<sub>2</sub>. Because the average surface coverage by F 1176 doping was only 6%, ROS on F-PbO<sub>2</sub> was still higher than raw PbO<sub>2</sub>, and the weight loss of F-1177 PbO<sub>2</sub> after 140 h was only 2.1%. In addition, removal efficiency of 4-chlorophenol reached 1178 97% at 120 min by F-PbO<sub>2</sub> anode, while it was 88% for non-doped PbO<sub>2</sub>. The doping of the 1179 PbO<sub>2</sub> electrode with F atom only had a significant effect on the pollutant degradation, but TOC 1180 removal was barely altered [223,224] because of modification of surface properties to improve 1181 pollutants adsorption. 1182

1183 At present, fluorine-doped tin oxide (FTO), which exhibits good chemical and physical 1184 stability, high temperature resistance, low preparation cost and high electrochemical 1185 performance, was widely used as anode [225,226]. The FTO as non-active anode could produce 1186 reactive 'OH to enhance oxidation efficiency. The degradation rate and mineralization yield of 1187 phenol by FTO anode could reach 0.014 min<sup>-1</sup> and (76  $\pm$  1)%, respectively [227]. Besides, FTO have a sufficiently transparent material to allow UV penetration. Therefore, it was modified in
many photochemical processes [227,228].

In addition, the novel F-doped Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub> electrode prepared by SnF<sub>4</sub> as the single-source 1190 precursor was used for electrochemical degradation of aqueous perfluorooctanoic acid (PFOA) 1191 [229]. Compared with other Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-X (X=Cl, Br, I, or Sb) anode, Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-F anode exhibited 1192 smooth surface, even after accelerated lifetime test, preventing penetrating of electrolyte and 1193 generating bubbles. Therefore, higher PFOA degradation within 30 min and improved 1194 accelerated lifetime (104 h) was achieved by Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-F than with other halogen-doped 1195 electrodes (less than 5h) (Figs. 18b and 19a). In Fig. 19c, Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-F electrode had larger 1196 resistance and higher OEP [218,219], which was benefit to obtain electron from H<sub>2</sub>O or PFOA 1197 and to physical adsorption of 'OH on non-active anode. Therefore, it was possible that F-doping 1198 decreased the amount of oxygen vacancy in SnO<sub>2</sub> and provided lower possibility of oxygen 1199 transfer from 'OH into crystal lattice. This further improved the stability of electrode material. 1200



1201

Figure 19. Effect of different precursors on the degradation rate of PFOA using different Snbased anodes (a); Accelerated life test of freshly prepared electrodes (b), the inset being the
enlarged view of accelerated life tests for the prepared electrodes except Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-F
electrode); and Nyquist plot for Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-F and Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb electrode (c). Measurement
conditions: EIS (solution = 10 mM NaClO<sub>4</sub>, voltage amplitude = 5 mV, frequency range = 10<sup>-</sup>

 $^{1}$ ~10<sup>5</sup> Hz, bias = 1.8 V/SCE). Reproduced with permission from Ref [229]. Copyright (2015) 1207 1208 Elsevier.

#### 1209 4.2.3.2. Boron-doped electrodes

Due to its high electrical conductivity, the BDD anode was widely used in EAOPs. Therefore, 1210 1211 the boron doped on other anode materials were suggested to achieve even higher activity. Bdoped TiO<sub>2</sub> nanotubes (B-TiO<sub>2</sub> NTs) made by electrochemical anodization (one-step doping) 1212 using NaBF<sub>4</sub> as a boron source were prepared to degrade the dye Acid Yellow 1 (AY1) in 1213 1214 photoelectrocatalytic processes [221]. The introduction of B did not change the morphology of TiO<sub>2</sub> nanotubes. Different content of NaBF<sub>4</sub> was introduced to have the B content from 0.4 to 1215 0.7 at. % in B-TiO<sub>2</sub> NTs. The mineralization efficiency (90%) of PEC for AY1 was higher than 1216 that of photocatalysis (PC) process at 90 min, indicating the effectiveness of B-TiO<sub>2</sub> NTs in 1217 electrocatalysis process. However, the photogenerated holes can produce more hydroxyl 1218 1219 radicals, promoting an increased mineralization rate after B-doping. There is still very limited understanding in the mechanism of B-doped electrodes for electrocatalysis. In addition, B-1220 1221 doped porous Si (B-doped pSi) nanoplates were design via air-oxidation process to decrease 1222 the resistance and surface oxidation and obtain high crystallinity, achieving high initial coulombic efficiency and long cycling stability [230]. 1223

1224

#### 4.2.4. Metal- and metal oxide- based electrodes 1225

The main employed anodes categorized as either metal or metal oxide based nanostructured 1226 1227 material are summarized in Fig. 20.

1228



Figure 20. Classification of metal and metal-oxide based nanostructured anodes.

1236

#### 1238 *4.2.4.1. Metal-based electrodes*

As an active anode, Pt electrode is probably the most used metal electrode for pollutants degradation due to its excellent electrocatalysis performance [231,232]. Yoon et al. (2012) investigated the use of Pt for degradation of phenol and 2-chlorophenol, observing 94% phenol and 95% 2-chlorophenol degradation at the current 300 mA for 3 h. However, this performance was worse when compared to BDD anode [232]. To improve the performance of Pt anode, Chen et al. (2019) introduced nano-sized Pt (1.2-2.2 nm) into Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> using the ethylene glycol reduction method, confirming that the decrease of the Pt particle size led to the enhancement of

the catalyst ability of degrading benzene [233].

# 1247 *4.2.4.2. Metal oxide-based electrodes*

• SnO<sub>2</sub> electrodes

Pure SnO<sub>2</sub> cannot be used as electrode material due to a low conductivity at room temperature;
however, its conductivity can be improved by doping with Ar, B, Bi, F, Cl, P and Sb [234–

1251 236]. In particular, Sb-SnO<sub>2</sub> is one of the most commonly used anode in electrochemical1252 applications.

Acting as the catalytic layer, SnO<sub>2</sub> electrode has been widely used for pollutants degradation 1253 through the formation of heterogeneous 'OH. Zhou et al. (2019) used sol-gel method to prepare 1254 a porous Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb electrode, achieving the degradation efficiency of more than 97% in only 1255 10 min at a current density of 0.2 mA cm<sup>-2</sup> [237]. Recently, self-assembled 3D hierarchical 1256 nano-structures from low dimensional nanoscale building blocks via interactions has received 1257 1258 considerable attention. The 3D hierarchical structure assembled by two-dimensional nanoplates or nanosheets can expose larger specific surface area, therefore, they are more suitable and 1259 efficient [208,234]. Wang et al. (2019) introduced a 3D hierarchical flower-like structure (HFs) 1260 constructed by 2D nanosheets on Ti-based SnO<sub>2</sub> electrode by hydrothermal method. 1261 Characterized by SEM, this Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb-HFs electrode showed a denser surface layer with the 1262 nanosheet of 29 nm than traditional Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb electrode (Fig. 21). It also had a higher oxygen 1263 evolution potential 2.25 V/SCE, and a larger electrochemical active surface area (2.28-times 1264 higher) than traditional Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb electrode. Thus, for the degradation of Acid Red 73 (AR 1265 73), the rate constant on Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb-HFs electrode was 1.58-time higher than that of Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-1266 Sb electrodes [238]. 1267



Figure 21. Surface morphologies of (a and c) Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb-HFs electrode, (b and d) Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>Sb electrode. Reproduced with permission from Ref [238]. Copyright (2019) Elsevier

On the other hand, the practical application of SnO<sub>2</sub> anode is hampered by its poor stability 1271 because SnO<sub>2</sub> film is easily fall of the substrate. To overcome this problem, SnO<sub>2</sub> is always 1272 applied as the middle layer while other metal oxide as catalytic layer [239–241]. Wang et al. 1273 1274 (2020) introduced PbO<sub>2</sub> as the catalytic layer into SnO<sub>2</sub> middle layer, which improved the electrocatalytic activity of PbO<sub>2</sub> electrode because the SnO<sub>2</sub> particles in PbO<sub>2</sub> films improved 1275 the amount of active sites on the surface, oxygen evolution potential and 'OH generation rate 1276 [242]. Duan et al. (2019) also introduced SnO<sub>2</sub> nanoparticle as the middle layer, which reduced 1277 the grain size of PbO<sub>2</sub> crystal and improved the EOP and 'OH generation capacity obtaining a 1278 better electrochemical activity for degradation of 3-chlorophenol [243]. 1279

Besides, the substrate is also an important factor for anode materials. When the nanostructure is introduced into the anode, it exhibits good electron transportation properties and help to generate 'OH on electrode surface. For example, the  $TiO_2$  NTA, due to its stake structure, effectively improved the service life of the combination of  $SnO_2$ -Sb function layer [241,244,245]. Chen et al. (2019) prepared a novel enhanced  $TiO_2$  nanotube arrays (ENTA)/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb electrode by the sol-gel method, which possessed a higher oxygen evolution potential and electrochemical stability when compared with the conventional  $Ti/SnO_2$ -Sb electrode. Its performance for the destruction of a common biocide of 2-methyl-4-isothiazolin-3-one was better than that of  $Ti/SnO_2$ -Sb [56].

#### • **PbO<sub>2</sub> electrodes**

PbO<sub>2</sub> electrode has been extensively studied for organic pollutant degradation due to its good
conductivity and high OEP. However, its catalysis performance is still not as satisfactory as
BDD anodes [239,246–248]. Therefore, nanostructured PbO<sub>2</sub> study has been a research trend.
Tan et al. (2011) fabricated PbO<sub>2</sub>/TNTs anode which possessed stronger oxidation ability than
that traditional PbO<sub>2</sub> electrode owing to the unique microstructure [247].

1295

# ZnO electrodes

El Kacemi et al. (2017) prepared a nanostructured ZnO-TiO<sub>2</sub> tin film oxide deposited on graphite felt for degradation of organic pollutants [249]. This electrode was used as anode in anodic oxidation and EF processes to remove efficiently the dye Amido Black 10B. Complete mineralization of 74 mg L<sup>-1</sup> dye solution was achieved in 6 h at 100 mA constant current electrolysis [249].

1301

#### Reduced TNT anode: Ti<sub>4</sub>O<sub>7</sub> electrodes

1302 TNT has a poor conductivity, and many efforts have been made to improve its conductivity. 1303 One of the approach is the hydrogen reduction to obtain  $Ti_4O_7$  electrode. Prepared by the gas 1304 mixture of H<sub>2</sub> and N<sub>2</sub> or Ar at high temperature,  $Ti_4O_7$  electrode was used for degradation of 1305 organic pollutants because of its high conductivity and corrosion resistance. Geng et al. (2015)

fabricated pure Magnéli Ti<sub>4</sub>O<sub>7</sub> NTA by reducing TiO<sub>2</sub>/NTA with hydrogen at 850 °C for 30 1306 1307 min [167]. The as-prepared NTA/Ti<sub>4</sub>O<sub>7</sub> had a highly-ordered tubular structure with high crystallinity, large electrochemical window of water electrolysis (2.4 V/(Ag/AgCl at pH= 6.0)) 1308 and low Rct. This anode had a 20% higher COD removal than Ti<sub>4</sub>O<sub>7</sub>, and was even more 1309 efficient than BDD and other types of Magnéli NTA. Wang et al. (2018) prepared Ti/Ti<sub>4</sub>O<sub>7</sub> 1310 electrode by plasma spraying through reducing  $TiO_2$  nanopowder [250]. They used it for the 1311 degradation of tetracycline and obtained 95.8% of degradation efficiency in 40 min [250]. A 1312 reactive electrochemical membrane (REM) composed of high purity Ti<sub>4</sub>O<sub>7</sub> was found to be 1313 promising for water treatment applications. It achieved the highest convection-enhanced rate 1314 constant for  $Fe(CN)_6^{4-}$  oxidation in an electrochemical flow-through reactor [251]. Oturan's 1315 group found that plasma elaborated sub-stoichiometric Ti<sub>4</sub>O<sub>7</sub> ceramic electrode could constitute 1316 an alternative to BDD anode for a cost effective electro-oxidation process, and this electrode 1317 was more efficient for paracetamol degradation in SO4<sup>2-</sup>, NO3<sup>-</sup> and ClO4<sup>-</sup> media, but less 1318 effective in Cl<sup>-</sup> medium [252,253]. Their other works on imatinib degradation by EF process 1319 proved that the Ti<sub>4</sub>O<sub>7</sub> anode exhibited better mineralization performance than DSA and Pt 1320 anode, reaching 82% TOC removal efficiency at 12.5 mA cm<sup>-2</sup> [254]. 1321

1322

# • Reduced TNT anode: Blue-TNA electrodes

1323 The second approach to improve the conductivity of TNT is the electrochemical reduction into 1324 Blue-TNT anode. During the electrochemical reduction of TNA, the color of TNA turns from gray to blue, forming the so-called Blue-TNA, which has been explored as the anode for electro-1325 oxidation [105,255–260]. Kim et al. (2014) revealed that Blue-TNA exhibited excellent electro-1326 catalytic activity in generating chlorine and hydroxyl radicals, which was comparable to the 1327 commercial DSA and BDD electrodes, respectively. Thus this Blue-TNA was suggested as a 1328 potential cost-effective anodic material in industrial electrochemistry [261]. Chang et al. (2014) 1329 investigated the performance of Blue-TNA for degradation of salicylic acid (SA) [262]. It 1330
possessed a much higher over-potential than Pt electrode for OER, exhibiting a 6.3 times higher 1331 1332 electrocatalytic activity toward SA oxidation. Stability tests indicated that Blue-TNA electrodes were very stable during eight cycles of electrochemical oxidation of SA [262]. The high 1333 electrocatalytic activity and stability of Blue-TNA enabled by the facile electrochemical 1334 reduction can be attributed to the decrease of Ti(IV), the increase of Ti(II) and Ti(III) and the 1335 increase of the oxygen vacancies, as well as significant improvement in the donor density. Cai 1336 1337 et al. (2019) prepared Blue-TNA having a higher 'OH production activity than BDD), inducing a higher TOC and COD removal of phenol with a lower energy consumption of 9.9 kWh (kg 1338 COD)<sup>-1</sup> [55]. 1339

1340

## 1341 4.2.5. Mixed metal-/metal-oxide and carbon-based electrodes

Due to the fact that carbon-based materials are cheaper and more modular to be adapted to specific reactor design, nanostructured metal or metal oxide deposited on the carbon material would reduce the cost of metal-based material while the electrocatalytic activity would be usually enhanced [263–266].

For the carbon based metal electrodes, the commonly used one is Pt/C. Li et al. (2013) prepared 1346 the Pt-Bi/C nanostructured electrode using square-wave potential method for the degradation 1347 1348 of MO dye, greatly reducing the energy consumption when compared with carbon fiber electrode [263]. Besides, different supporting carbon materials significantly affect the 1349 performance of the supported Pt nano-particles. Chen et al. (2010) compared single-walled 1350 1351 carbon nanotubes (SWNTs), MWNTs and Vulcan XC-72 carbon as the supporting carbon materials to prepare Pt electrode [264]. It indicated that Pt/SWNTs exhibited the highest current 1352 density, the lowest onset oxidation potential and the best stability for methanol electro-1353 1354 oxidation [264].

For the carbon-based metal oxide anodes, the mainly used one is  $RuO_2$ -TiO<sub>2</sub> electrodes. Li et al. (2018) prepared  $RuO_2$ -TiO<sub>2</sub> nano-graphite electrode using sol-gel and hot press technology for the degradation of ceftriaxone sodium, achieving a 97% removal efficiency which was much higher than that on raw nano-graphite electrode (77%) [266]. Tsele et al. (2017) indicated that the prepared TiO<sub>2</sub>-MWCNT and RuO<sub>2</sub>-MWCNT electrodes gave the best electron transport properties towards the oxidation of epinephrine compared with MWCNT, RuO<sub>2</sub> and TiO<sub>2</sub> electrodes [265].

1362

## 5 Assessment of electrodes performance in water/wastewater

1363 treatment

The treatment at the source of water polluted by toxic/persistent micropollutants turns out to be 1364 the most efficient and cost-effective way to avoid the contamination of natural water body 1365 1366 [7,267-269]. The so-called methods advanced oxidation processes (AOPs) have been developed to offset the non-effectiveness of conventional treatment techniques to remove such 1367 1368 contaminants from water [9,33,270]. The AOPs are the processes based on the in situ generation 1369 of strong oxidants (mainly the hydroxyl ('OH) radicals) under mild conditions [271]. The EAOPs were emerged during last decades as among the most efficient processes for the 1370 degradation of persistent organic micropollutant [8,16,34,272,273]. 1371

1372 **5.1. Electro-Fenton process** 

Among the EAOPs, the electro-Fenton (EF) process has become a popular electrochemicalprocess for effective destruction of organic pollutants [7,273].

1375 EF is an indirect EAOPs; it originates from Fenton's chemistry, which constitutes a chemical

1376 way to produce 'OH in acidic medium from activation of  $H_2O_2$  by ferrous iron, via the Fenton

1377 reaction (Eq. 2) [274,275]. Although the Fenton process has been applied to the treatment of

industrial wastewater since the 1980s, the presence of several inconveniences (use of large amount of chemicals, the generation of process sludge, low efficiency due to the involvement of parasitic reactions) disadvantaged its development [267,276,277]. Therefore, the EF process has been implemented and developed in the late 1990s in two versions; gas diffusion cathode (Brillas' team) and CF cathode (Oturan's team) to overcome the major drawbacks of conventional Fenton process [278,279].

The main features of EF process are the continuous electrogeneration of  $H_2O_2$  in the solution to be treated from electroreduction of DO (Eq. 1), avoiding the cost and risks associated to the production, transport and storage of  $H_2O_2$  and the electro-regeneration of the catalyst (Fe<sup>2+</sup>) (Eq. 12), avoiding thus the formation and management of process sludge. Therefore, reactions (1), (2) and (12) ensure a permanent catalytic production of 'OH, allowing destruction of organic micropollutants [7,280,281].

1390 
$$Fe^{3+} + e^{-} \rightarrow Fe^{2+}$$
 (12)

The in situ generation of H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> in a controlled way by the application of an appropriate current 1391 or potential to the electrochemical reactor is one of the main characteristics of the EF process. 1392 1393 Therefore, the use of suitable cathode materials is primordial. The first cathode materials used in this process to produce H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> were mercury pool [282], carbon-PTFE-O<sub>2</sub> gas diffusion 1394 cathode [278]. Then 3D carbonaceous materials such as CF [280], carbon sponge [124,283], 1395 activated carbon fiber [284], graphite [285,286], [287] and graphene foam were introduced and 1396 applied as a cathode in the EF process. Indeed, carbon-based cathodes are material of interest 1397 1398 as discussed in sections 2.1, 3.1 and 4.1, especially because of their large H<sub>2</sub> evolution overpotential, good electrical conductivity stability and low cost. Recently, modified carbon-1399 based materials [254,288-291] in which iron ions incorporated were successfully used to 1400 perform the heterogeneous EF process in mild pH conditions. The development and use of CNT 1401 composite cathodes [292,293] or graphene-based cathodes [156,294] constitutes new trends in 1402

EF process. For instance, Yang et al. (2019) [156] reported strongly high concentration (400 1403 mg  $L^{-1}$ ) of H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>, using CF modified with electrochemically exfoliated graphene (EEGr) 1404 cathode compared to the raw CF cathode (400 mg L<sup>-1</sup>). Once produced, H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> reacts with Fe<sup>2+</sup> 1405 ion to produce 'OH, which is a nonselective strong oxidant and is able to oxidize any organic 1406 pollutants [10,254,295]. The Fe<sup>2+</sup> ion is externally added at a catalytic amount (mostly in sulfate 1407 salt) and regenerated in the process through  $Fe^{3+}/Fe^{2+}$  cycle. Therefore, there is no accumulation 1408 of the following wasting reactions (Eqs. 13 and 14) of the Fenton process because they occur 1409 at high  $H_2O_2$  and  $Fe^{2+}$  concentrations, respectively: 1410

1411 
$$\cdot OH + H_2O_2 \rightarrow H_2O + HO_2 \cdot$$
 (13)

1412 
$$^{\circ}\text{OH} + \text{Fe}^{2+} \rightarrow \text{Fe}^{3+} + \text{OH}^{-}$$
 (14)

1413 Moreover, this process has other practical advantages such as easy handling, 1414 degradation/mineralization efficiency, amenability and versatility since it can be applied to 1415 effluents with a large range of organic matter [7,273,290,296].

The nature of anode material is also of great importance in the EF process efficiency. In fact, by using an appropriate anode (M) material, the anodic oxidation processes can be incorporated into the EF process. In this case, there is production of supplementary hydroxyl radicals M('OH) on the surface of the anodes from oxidation of water (Eq. 15), increasing thus the process efficiency.

1421 
$$M + H_2O \rightarrow M(^{\circ}OH) + H^+ + e^-$$
 (15)

The extent of the contribution of the heterogeneous hydroxyl radicals, M('OH), to the EF process efficiency is directly related to the anode material. In the case of active anodes, i.e., Pt, DSA, M('OH) are strongly adsorbed on the anode surface and therefore less available for reacting with organic pollutants [7,267]. In contrast, M('OH) generated on non-active anodes (BDD, PbO<sub>2</sub>, Ti<sub>4</sub>O<sub>7</sub>) are loosely adsorbed on the surface and are more available for participating in the oxidative degradation/mineralization of organic pollutants [197,252,297,298]. M('OH)
generated from the latter kind of anodes are particularly efficient for the mineralization of
carboxylic acids resistant to homogeneous 'OH. Nanostructured materials have also been
developed for enhancing the oxidation of pollutants at the anode, as discussed in the next section
(5.2).

1432 Apart from electrode material, several operating parameters such as solution pH, applied current, catalyst nature and concentration, electrolyte composition, etc., influence the EF 1433 1434 efficiency for the removal of organics from water [7]. The optimal value of some of these parameters, such as the solution pH value (around 3), nature and concentration of the electrolyte 1435  $(0.05 \text{ M Na}_2\text{SO}_4)$  for the CF version and catalyst nature and concentration (about 0.1 mM Fe<sup>2+</sup>) 1436 1437 are now well-known [8,299,300]. The inconvenient of working at pH 3 can be overcome using 1438 the heterogeneous EF process as explained above or by using solid catalysts such as pyrite, iron oxides (magnetite, goethite, hematite) and MOF derived composite catalysts [301–305]. 1439

Since EF is an electrochemical process, the current (undivided cell) or potential (divided cell) 1440 applied to the cell are obviously of great importance for the process efficiency because these 1441 parameters directly affect the rate of  $H_2O_2$  generation (Eq. 1), the rate of regeneration of  $Fe^{2+}$ 1442 (Eq. 12) and consequently the rate of formation of 'OH (Eq. 14) [285,306–308]. It influences 1443 1444 also strongly the production of M('OH), particularly at low currents [7,309,310]. In general, oxidation/mineralization efficiency increases with rising the current up to an optimal value for 1445 1446 which parasitic reactions (HER at the cathode and/or O<sub>2</sub> evolution reaction at the anode) start to harm the efficiency of the process. High currents above this optimal value can also lead to 1447 the enhancement of wasting reactions given in Eqs. 16 and 17. This situation also conducts to 1448 lower current efficiency and increases energy consumption [8,123,311–314]. An example of 1449 1450 the effect of current on the oxidation efficiency of the antibiotic sulfamethazine and TOC removal rate of its aqueous solution is depicted in Fig. 22. 1451

1452 
$$H_2O_2 + OH \rightarrow HO_2 + H_2O$$
 (16)

1453 
$$2 M(^{\circ}OH) \rightarrow 2M + O_2(g) + 2 H^+ + 2e^-$$
 (17)

Therefore, to reach a high oxidation efficiency, MCE and low energy cost, the EF process 1454 should be conducted under optimized conditions: optimal current, suitable electrodes (anode 1455 and cathode), solution pH near 3 (for homogeneous process), suitable catalyst nature ( $Fe^{2+}$ ) and 1456 concentration, air/O<sub>2</sub> flow rate to saturate the solution to be treated and high stirring rate (batch 1457 reactor) or liquid flow rate (flow reactor) [7,272,273,313]. The electrolyte composition is also 1458 1459 important, since chloride and ammonia ions can lead to the formation of chlorinated and nitrogen intermediates that can be unwanted (e.g. chlorate, nitrate, etc.) [315,316]. Considering 1460 the high numbers of influent parameters, the modeling of the EF process is not easy. However, 1461 an interesting kinetic modeling for mineralization route of phenol, including the formation of 1462 several intermediates and their successive oxidation steps until complete mineralization was 1463 1464 recently carried out by Mousset et al. (2016) [317].



1465

Figure 22. Effect of applied current density on (a) the decay kinetics and (b) TOC removal
efficiency during EF treatment of 0.2 mM (57.5 mg L<sup>-1</sup>) of 300 mL sulfamethazine solution in
0.05 M Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> solution at pH 3 and room temperature using the BDD anode/graphite felt
cathode. Reprinted with permission from Sopaj et al., 2016 [248]. Copyright 2016 Elsevier.

### 1471 **5.2.** Advanced electro-oxidation process

Advanced electro-oxidation processes are based on the development of suitable anode materials 1472 1473 for promotion of the oxidation of organic pollutants. Various mechanisms can be involved as thoroughly described in section 2.2. Direct electron transfer can occur at the electrode-solution 1474 interface, thus resulting in selective oxidation of some organic compounds. Anode materials 1475 1476 with high overvoltage for OER can also generate physisorbed hydroxyl radicals ('OH) (Eq. 19) from the one-electron oxidation of water [9,33]. These radicals are available for reaction with 1477 1478 organic compounds in a non-selective way, but they are accumulated only in a thin layer close to the anode surface ( $<1.0 \mu m$ ) because of their short lifetime [318]. The formation of sulfate 1479 radicals (SO4<sup>-</sup>), known as very powerful oxidant species, have also been reported in the 1480 1481 literature [9,55] during the electro-oxidation process when using sodium sulfate as electrolyte. 1482 Besides, mediated oxidation in the bulk solution can be promoted depending on the reaction of inorganic compounds in the solution to treat. Particularly, the formation of active chlorine from 1483 1484 oxidation of chloride ions as well as persulfate (that can be then further activated to sulfate radicals) from oxidation of sulfate ions are usually the most predominant mechanisms of 1485 mediated oxidation of organic compounds in the bulk [9,319]. The reactivity of nanostructured 1486 electrodes and their ability to promote these different reaction mechanisms tightly depend on 1487 1488 their chemical characteristics, as described in section 4. Another important parameter is the 1489 electro-active surface area of anode materials to favour reactions with organic pollutants at the electrode-solution interface. Nano-structured electrodes present a key advantage in this area. 1490

The advanced electro-oxidation process also faces the problem of mass transport of organic pollutants from the bulk to the anode surface [24,33,251,320,321]. As a result of the fast kinetic processes at the anode surface, treatment systems using electrodes in parallel plate configuration are usually limited by the diffusion of organics to the electrode surface, particularly for treating low concentrations of pollutants. The diffusion boundary layer is 1496 usually in the range of  $10 - 100 \mu m$ . Thus, features of nanostructured electrode roughness are 1497 smaller than the diffusion length and become averaged into the diffusion field [322]. The use 1498 of nanostructured electrode in flow-through configuration is therefore a key parameter to really 1499 take advantage of their high electro-active surface area. In fact, electro-oxidation is strongly 1500 enhanced because of the fast mass transport inside small pores as well as the possibility to 1501 increase the convective mass transport by simply increasing the filtration flux [251,323].

The Table 2 gives an overview of the efficiency of advanced electro-oxidation process using 1502 nanostructured electrodes. Two groups of materials have been mainly investigated. First, 1503 1504 several studies have focused on the use of materials based on CNTs. This kind of nanostructured material present several advantages including high conductivity, large specific surface area (50 1505  $-1000 \text{ m}^2 \text{ g}^{-1}$ ) and good mechanical strength [323]. Both sorption and oxidation mechanisms 1506 1507 have to be taken into consideration in order to explain the removal of organic pollutants from water. CNT-based electrodes have been mainly used in flow-through configuration. Most of 1508 CNT-based electrochemical filters are made of a thin layer (e.g., 41 µm) of randomly oriented 1509 multi-walled CNT supported by a porous membrane (e.g., PTFE membrane). Small pore size 1510 can be obtained depending on the nature of CNT. For example, the average pore size was 115 1511  $\pm$  47 nm by using CNT of 15 nm diameter and 100  $\mu$ m of length [323]. Thus, convection-1512 1513 enhanced mass transport combined with fast mass transport inside the CNT network can result in very fast degradation of target compounds. A single passage through the CNT network with 1514 a flow rate of 130 L m<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup> (resulting in a residence time in the filter of  $\tau \le 1.2$  s) was able to 1515 achieve 80% degradation of 89 mg  $L^{-1}$  of tetracycline with a total cell potential of 2 V [183]. 1516 Most importantly, the energy consumption of advanced electro-oxidation can be significantly 1517 improved. For example, energy consumption below 1.0 kWh m<sup>-3</sup> or even below 0.1 kWh m<sup>-3</sup> 1518 was reported (Table 2). However, CNT-based electrodes also present some critical drawbacks. 1519 CNTs are usually operated under very low current density or anodic potential (Table 2) in order 1520

1521	to avoid corrosion. For example, corrosion of uncoated CNT was reported to start from 1.4
1522	V/(Ag/AgCl) [189]. CNTs also present low overpotential for OER (active electrode), thus
1523	limiting the generation of nonselective oxidizing species such as 'OH. The OEP of uncoated
1524	CNT was, for example, 1.27 V/(Ag/AgCl) in 0.5 M H <sub>2</sub> SO <sub>4</sub> [189]. By comparison, the OEP of
1525	BDD (gold standard for advanced electro-oxidation) is around 2.1 V/(Ag/AgCl). As a
1526	consequence, CNT-based electrodes present selective oxidation features. While fast
1527	degradation of target pollutants is usually reported, only partial mineralization is achieved
1528	because of the recalcitrance of some degradation by-products. One of the most explored ways
1529	to improve the effectiveness of CNTs is to synthesize modified CNTs (e.g., chemical surface
1530	modification, incorporation of Bi-doped SnO2 NPs) in order to increase the overvoltage of OER
1531	or to promote interaction (particularly adsorption) between the electrode surface and target
1532	pollutants. For example, negligible corrosion was obtained up to 2.2 V/(Ag/AgCl) and the OEP
1533	was increased to 1.71 V/(Ag/AgCl) by using a Bi-doped SnO <sub>2</sub> -coated CNT network [189].

					Operat	ing condit	ions			Treated	solution	Process efficiency						
Anode	Cathode	P/G	CD	An. Pot.	Cell Pot.	An. Surface	Batch (Volume)	S/V	Flow- through (flux)	Pollutant C	Electrolyte C	Deg. / Time	<b>k</b> <sub>app</sub>	Min. / Time	MCE	]	EC	Ref
			$mA cm^{-2}$	V/( Ag/AgCl)	V	<i>cm</i> <sup>2</sup>	mL	cm <sup>-1</sup>	$L m^{-2} h^{-1}$	mg L <sup>-1</sup>	mM	%/h	min <sup>-1</sup> (x10 <sup>-2</sup> )	%/h	%	kWh m <sup>-3</sup>	kWh kgCOD <sup>-1</sup>	
CNT	CNT	Р	-	-	10	28	-	-	1700	X-3B 50	-	94 / 1.5	-	58 / 1.5	26		150	[324]
			-	-	2					МО		70 / SP	-	-	-	0.22	4	
Modified CNT	SS	Р	-	-	3	7	-	-	130	327	$Na_2SO_4$	92 / SP	-	-	-	0.96	15	[172]
			-	-	3					Phenol 97	100	-	-	20 / SP	-	-	-	
CNT/D: dopod			1.4	<1.1	2.7					Qualata	No.SO.	50 / SP	-	50 / SP	100	-	5 (TOC)	
CNT/Bi-doped SnO <sub>2</sub> NP	SS	G	8.6	2	4.3	7	-	-	130	367	10 10 10	95 / SP	-	95 / SP	30	-	30 (TOC)	[189]
CNT/Graphene	Ti	Р	0.4	0.8	2.5	7	-	-	130	Phenol 51	real reservoir water	76 / SP	-	Partial	-	0.075	1.9	[177]
CNT	CNT	Р	1		2	7	-	-	130	Tetracycline 89	Na <sub>2</sub> SO <sub>4</sub> 10	80 / SP	-	Partial	-	0.084	-	[183]
Carboxylated CNT	Ti	Р		0.9	2	9.5	-	-	130	Ibuprofene 20	NaCl 10	75 / SP		Partial	-	-	-	[325]
CNT/PANI UF	Ti	Р	0.17	1.7	3	4	40	0.1	-	MB	Cl from MB salt	32 / 1	-	-	-	-	-	[326]
			-				-	-	20	5	wid sait	85 / SP	-	-	-	2.5	-	
BDD/Sb-doped SnO2 NP	Ti	G	20	-	-	1.2	Batch	-	-	2,4-D 100	Na <sub>2</sub> SO <sub>4</sub> 100	98.5 / 2	-	82.2 / 2	19.8	3.3	-	[327]

**Table 2.** Overview of the efficiency of advanced electro-oxidation processes for the removal of organic pollutants reported in recent studies using nano-structured electrode materials.

Ti/Sb-doped SnO2 modified with CNT	Ti	G	50	-	-	8	150	0.05	-	AR 73 1000	Na2SO4 100	96 / 3	1.6	80 / 3	58	-	121	[241]
TNT/Fe-doped PbO <sub>2</sub>	Ti	G	-	-	-	5	100	0.05	-	p- nitrophenol 50	Na <sub>2</sub> SO <sub>4</sub> 30	90 / 1	6.9	-	-	-	280	[328]
TNT	Pt	G	5	-	-	1	-	-	-	Salicyclic acid 30	H <sub>2</sub> SO <sub>4</sub> 100	-	11.5	-	-	-	-	[262]
TNT/PbO2	Ti	G	10	-	-	5	100	0.05	-	p- nitrophenol 50	Na <sub>2</sub> SO <sub>4</sub> 30	82 / 3	-	42 / 3	-	9.5	-	[329]
Nano- graphite/TiO2- RuO2	Ti	Р	-	-	2	-	40	-	-	Ceftriaxone 10	Na <sub>2</sub> SO <sub>4</sub> 100	90 / 1.7	-	-	-	-	-	[330]
Ti4O7 NT	Ti4O7 NT	G	2.5	-	-	-	Batch	-	-	Phenol 100	Na <sub>2</sub> SO <sub>4</sub> 100	85 / 2	1.5	95 / 3	43	-	-	[167]
TNT/Sb-doped SnO <sub>2</sub>	SS	G	10	-	-	5	100	0.05	-	Phenol 50	Na2SO4 100	70 / 2	1	-	-	-	-	[244]
Blue TNT	Blue TNT	G	5		5.2	6	Batch	-	-	Wastewater 330 (COD)	-	-	-	60 / 2	-	-	150	[331]
Ti <sub>4</sub> O <sub>7</sub>	SS	Р	-	2.65	-	0.35	-	-	789	Terephtalic acid 16.6	NaClO4 100	60 / SP	-	-	-	-	-	[332]
Blue TNT	SS	G	2.5	-	-	3	100	0.05	-	Phenol 100	Na2SO4 100	97 / 5	0.7	60 / 5	90	-	9.9	[55]

2,4-D: 2,4-dichlorophénoxyacétique ; An. Pot.: anodic potential; An. Surface: geometric anodic surface ; AR 73 : acid red 73 ; C: concentration ; CD: current density ; Cell Pot.: cell potential ; CNT: carbon nanotube ; COD : chemical oxygen demand ; Deg.: degradation ; EC : energy consumption ; G: galvanostatic ;  $k_{app}$  : apparent degradation rate constant ; MB : methylene blue ; MCE : mineralization current efficiency ; Min.: mineralization ; MO : methyl orange ; NP: nanoparticles ; NT: nanotube ; P: potentiostatic ; PANI : polyaniline ; S: surface ; SP : single passage ; TNT: TiO<sub>2</sub> nanotube ; TOC : total organic carbon ; UF : ultrafiltration ; V: volume ; X-3B : reactive brilliant red

The second group of materials is those having high overvoltage for OER, also called as non-1534 1535 active electrodes. Materials based on TiO2 NTA have been mostly studied. They present an interesting nanostructuration for the application in water treatment. For example, by following 1536 a conventional anodization method, TiO<sub>2</sub> NTA obtained by [55] presented a length of 1537 approximately 15 µm, a diameter of 100 nm and a tube wall of 54 nm. However, anatase TiO<sub>2</sub> 1538 NTA present a very low conductivity [261]. One of the strategies for solving this issue is the 1539 1540 deposition of conductive metal oxide layer. IrO<sub>2</sub> and RuO<sub>2</sub> layers resulted in the formation of active anodes with low overpotential for OER, while a layer of PbO<sub>2</sub> and SnO<sub>2</sub> (with possible 1541 addition of doping agents such as Sb) can form non-active anodes with high overpotential for 1542 1543 OER. Therefore, these latter are able to generate nonselective oxidants such as M('OH) and 1544 both degradation and mineralization of complex organic compounds can be achieved as reported in Table 2. Another strategy for improving the reactivity and stability of TNT arrays 1545 comes from the synthesis of Blue and Black TiO2 NTA from cathodic polarization and 1546 reduction of a variable number of Ti(IV) sites to Ti(III). By comparison with Magnéli phases 1547 obtained from high temperature thermal processes, cathodic polarization might be more a cost-1548 effective method. These materials are able to generate both 'OH and SO<sub>4</sub><sup>-</sup> radicals [55,331], 1549 1550 thus resulting also in high mineralization rate of organic compounds (see Table 2). However, 1551 none studies have been reported on the use of electrodes based on TiO<sub>2</sub> NTA in flow-through configuration. Advanced electro-oxidation in batch configuration is therefore limited by the 1552 mass transport of organic compounds through the diffusion boundary layer. Therefore, such 1553 1554 nanostructured electrodes do not significantly improve energy consumption of advanced electro-oxidation and become only cost-effective for treating concentrated effluents. As regards 1555 1556 to non-active electrodes, only sub-stoichiometric titanium oxide (TiO<sub>x</sub>) electrodes have been successfully applied in flow-through configuration. Most of recent studies have focused on 1557 microstructured materials with pore size in the range  $1 - 5 \mu m$  [251,322,333], however Navak 1558

and Chaplin (2018) [332] also showed that nanostructuration of such materials (using a simple
chemical etching step) was also able to increase the rate of oxidation of probe molecules such
as oxalic acid or terephthalic acid.

1562 Overall, CNT-based electrodes operated in flow-through configuration are promising materials for improving the energy consumption of advanced electro-oxidation because of the high 1563 electro-active surface area and suitable properties for optimization of mass transport of organic 1564 pollutants at the electrode/solution interface. A high degradation rate of organic pollutants can 1565 be achieved after only a single passage through such electrochemical filter. The main drawback 1566 1567 of these electrodes is their low overvoltage for OEP that reduces their capacity for generation of nonselective oxidant species and results in selective oxidation of organic compounds and 1568 1569 low mineralization rate. By comparison, electrodes based on TiO<sub>2</sub> NTA arrays or TiO<sub>x</sub> are able 1570 to achieve a higher mineralization rate of complex organics, thanks to the generation of 1571 hydroxyl and/or sulphate radicals. However, further studies are required on the implementation of such nanostructured electrodes in flow-through configuration in order to avoid mass 1572 1573 transport limitations.

1574 For all nanostructured electrodes used in advanced electro-oxidation, two important challenges 1575 can be highlighted. The first one is related to the development of methods for synthesizing large geometric surface area to scale-up such processes. Most of data reported in the literature have 1576 been obtained with electrodes presenting a geometric surface area in the range of 3 to 9 cm<sup>2</sup> 1577 (Table 2). The second challenge is related to the lifetime of these electrodes. The optimization 1578 of the synthesis method [331], surface modification [172] and the addition of doping agents 1579 1580 [189] have been mainly studied for improving corrosion resistance and lifetime. However, in the case of TiO<sub>2</sub> NTA-based and TiO<sub>x</sub> electrodes, a promising strategy for the regeneration of 1581 the oxidation capacity might also be the implementation of sequential cathodic polarization 1582 [331,334]. 1583

## 1584 5.3. Solar/artificial light induced photo-electrocatalytic processes

As reported previously, organic pollutants can be electrochemically oxidized through different 1585 pathways. Solar or artificial light represents an additional source of energy allowing the 1586 generation of further oxidant species. The main pathways of degradation of organic pollutants 1587 during photochemical processes include, (i) direct photolysis and (ii) reaction with 'OH 1588 generated from PC when using a suitable photocatalyst. Photoelectrocatalytic processes can be 1589 implemented either in sequential reactors or in hybrid reactors where photochemical and 1590 1591 electrochemical mechanisms are combined into a single reactor. This latter type of reactor allows for the promotion of synergistic effects and is therefore the focus of most of recent 1592 1593 studies [296,335–341].

1594 The photoelectro-Fenton (PEF) has been developed to obtain a more efficient process, mainly 1595 by Brillas and coworkers and great results have been obtained for the degradation and mineralization of organic compounds [335,337]. It is based on the application of the EF process 1596 as described in section 5.1 but with an additional source of energy from artificial or solar light. 1597 1598 Therefore, as described previously, nanostructured materials can be mainly used for the enhancement of the H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> production at the cathode or for improving the reactivity of the iron 1599 source when using heterogeneous catalysts. The main synergistic effects induced from the 1600 artificial/solar light is related to the photolysis of Fe(III)-monohydroxy complex under UVA 1601 irradiation that leads to the formation of additional 'OH and the enhanced regeneration of Fe(III) 1602 1603 into Fe(II) (Eq. 18).

1604 
$$[Fe(OH)]^{2+} + h\nu \rightarrow Fe^{2+} + OH$$
(18)

1605 Therefore, faster degradation and mineralization kinetics are observed compared to the EF 1606 process. Several authors have also proposed various reactor designs for pre-industrial 1607 applications using the well-known CF or gas-diffusion carbon cathodes [342,343]. Compared to the EF process, reactor design must also take into consideration the optimization of theirradiation of the solution.

1610 There are also several different ways to combine electrochemical and photochemical processes. EAOPs can also be implemented as described in sections 5.1 and 5.2, while, in addition, a 1611 photocatalytic material as well as artificial or solar light is provided to the system. Such 1612 treatment strategies allow the formation of additional oxidant species by combining different 1613 pathways for the generation of oxidant species into a single reactor [227,339,344]. 1614 1615 Nanostructured materials can therefore be used for improving the effectiveness of each single pathway. Various synergistic effects can also take place such as the formation of 'OH by 1616 homolytic cleavage of electrochemically generated H2O2 or photoactivation of other 1617 electrochemically generated species such as S<sub>2</sub>O<sub>8</sub><sup>2-</sup> into sulfate radicals or HClO into chloride 1618 1619 and hydroxyl radicals [339,345]. A particular attention must also be given to the reactor design in order to be able to promote all the different pathways at the same time. For example, the use 1620 1621 of transparent electrode materials (e.g. fluorine-doped SnO<sub>2</sub>) has been proposed for improving light irradiation inside the reactor [227]. 1622

Interestingly, it is also possible to combine electrochemical and photochemical processes by 1623 using a single material playing the role of both photocatalyst and electrode. These photo-1624 electrocatalytic (PEC) processes aim at reducing charge recombination occurring during PC by 1625 coating the photocatalytic material on a so-called photo-anode. Thus, both photocatalytic and 1626 1627 electrooxidation processes can take place at the same time with high synergistic effects. In this area, several nanostructured materials have been recently developed in order to increase the 1628 reactive surface area of the heterogeneous photo-electrocatalysts. An overview of the 1629 effectiveness of the PEC process using nanostructured materials is given in Table 3. The 1630 synergistic effects occurring during PEC have been highlighted in several publications 1631 comparing the effectiveness of PC, electro-oxidation and PEC. For example, using blue-TiO<sub>2</sub> 1632

nanotubes as photo-anode for the degradation of 100  $\mu$ g L<sup>-1</sup> of 4-chlorophenol at anodic 1633 potential of 1.43 V/(Ag/AgCl) (KCl, 3 M) during 2 h, standalone electrooxidation and PC only 1634 achieved <5% and 30% degradation, respectively, while PEC achieved >99% abatement of 4-1635 chloropenol [346]. In an another example, RGO-polyaniline/TiO<sub>2</sub> was used as photo-anode for 1636 the degradation of 10 mg L<sup>-1</sup> of phenol at anodic potential of 1.03 V/(Ag/AgCl) (KCl, 3 M) 1637 during 8 h; standalone electrooxidation and PC only achieved 68% and 42% degradation, 1638 1639 respectively, while PEC achieved >99% degradation [347]. The Table 3 highlights also some important trends on the way to implement PEC as well as on the effectiveness of this process. 1640 Degradation kinetics reported in the literature are usually lower than the ones reported for 1641 1642 advanced electro-oxidation. First-order apparent degradation kinetics reported in the literature are usually in the range  $0.4 - 3 \text{ min}^{-1}$  and more than one hour of treatment is usually required 1643 for achieving 90% degradation of the target pollutant. Complete mineralization of organic 1644 1645 pollutant is not always reported but several studies have shown promising results with more than 80% of TOC removal in a few hours. It is also interesting to highlight that PEC has been 1646 mainly implemented using anodic potential in the range 0.5 - 1.5 V/(Ag/AgCl). These values 1647 are lower than anodic potentials usually reported for advanced electro-oxidation. In fact, the 1648 generation of hydroxyl radicals from water oxidation at the surface of electrodes with high 1649 1650 overpotential for OER requires performing electro-oxidation in the potential region of water discharge. Similarly, low current density (in the range  $0.1 - 5 \text{ mA cm}^{-2}$ ) is usually used for 1651 performing experiments under galvanostatic conditions. Performing electrochemical processes 1652 1653 at low current density/potential is usually beneficial for lowering the energy consumption. However, such data are still very rare in the literature. Ding et al. (2014) [348] reported high 1654 MCE (47%), which seems to confirm the potential high energy-efficiency of PEC. It is also 1655 important to note that mainly potentiostatic experiments in small-scale stirred batch reactors 1656 have been performed for testing the effectiveness of this emerging process. It is therefore 1657

1658 currently difficult to assess the potential of PEC for full-scale applications. Besides, mass
1659 transport limitations related to the transfer of pollutants from the bulk to the photo-electrode
1660 could also be further investigated in order to improve the effectiveness of PEC.

Very interesting results have also been obtained by combination of PEC and PEF using either 1661 a homogeneous or heterogeneous iron source. This treatment strategy seems very promising 1662 since it allows the combination of the synergistic effects from both electro-Fenton/PC and 1663 electrooxidation/PCs. Compared to PEC, PEC/PEF process allows a strong increase of 1664 degradation kinetics. For example, Hernandez et al. (2018) reported 57% and >99% 1665 degradation of 78.6 mg L<sup>-1</sup> of paracetamol by using PEC and combined PEC/PEF processes, 1666 respectively [349]. Thus, degradation kinetics are usually much more rapid for PEC/PEF 1667 1668 compared to PEC. Complete degradation of the target pollutants are usually reported in less 1669 than 1 h. Furthermore, high MCE can be achieved, as reported by [340], who achieved 84.6% to TOC removal with a quiet high MCE of 87.6% during the treatment of Indigo Carmine dye 1670 1671 solution.

A new PEF system using a superhydrophobic natural air diffusion electrode (NADE) for the fast  $H_2O_2$  production (101.67 mg h<sup>-1</sup> cm<sup>-2</sup>) and high oxygen utilization efficiency (44.5%-64.9%) without external oxygen-pumping equipment was suggested [50]. In this system, organic contaminants can be efficiently destroyed by the combined action of Fe<sup>2+</sup>/H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>, UV/H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> and UV radiation to reach high mineralization rate (>83.5%) at low current (50 mA). In addition, the use of the NADE in EAOPs significantly reduced energy consumption compared with aeration system [111].

1679

						Ор	erating cond	litions					Treated solu	ıtion	I	Process of	efficiency	7	
Process	Anode Surface (cm <sup>2</sup> )	Cathode Surface (cm <sup>2</sup> )	Light source	Light intensity	P/G	CD	An. Pot.	Cell Pot.	рН	[Fe <sup>2+</sup> ]	V	S/V	Pollutant	Electrolyte	Deg. / Time	<b>k</b> <sub>app</sub>	Min. / Time	MCE	Ref
				W m <sup>-2</sup>		mA cm <sup>-2</sup>	V/(Ag/AgCl)	V		тM	mL	cm <sup>-1</sup>	mg L <sup>-1</sup>	mM	%/h	<i>min</i> <sup>-1</sup> (×10 <sup>-2</sup> )	% / h	%	
PEC	Indium SnO <sub>2</sub> 15	-	Hg lamp	-	Р	-	0.545	-	5.25	0	15	1	Direct Yellow 42 6.8	NaCl 500	90 / 2	1.02			[350]
PEC	CNT/TiO <sub>2</sub> 2.5	Quartz 4.9	UVC	65	Р	-	0.8	-	-	0	50	0.05	Methylene blue 5	NaCl 100	55 / 3	-			[351]
PEC	TiO <sub>2</sub> nanopore	Pt	UVC	25	Р	-	0.5	-	5.5	0	20	-	Tetracycline 20	Na <sub>2</sub> SO <sub>4</sub> 20	80 / 3	0.93			[352]
PEC	Bi <sub>2</sub> MoO <sub>6</sub> / BDD 10	Pt	Xe lamp	250	Р	-	2.045	-	-	0	100	0.1	Naproxen 15	Na2SO4 100	85 / 6		78 / 6		[353]
PEC	ZnWO4/ BDD 11	Pt	Xe lamp	200	Р	-	2.045	-	-	0	60	0.18	Red X-3B 30	Na2SO4 100	95 / 3				[354]

 Table 3. Overview of the efficiency of nanostructured materials for photo-electrocatalytic (PEC) processes and combined photo-electrocatalytic / photo-electro-Fenton (PEC / PEF) processes

PEC	TiO <sub>2</sub> 25	Pt	Hg lamp	27.3	G	0.4	-	-	2	0	1000	0.025	Indigo Carmine 24	Na2SO4 100	99 / 0.5	3	75 / 6	75	[355]
PEC	TiO2 NTA	Pt	Hg lamp	-	Р	-	0.645	-	-	0	60	-	Methyl orange 10	Na2SO4 100	58 / 3	0.49			[356]
PEC	WO <sub>3</sub> / TiO <sub>2</sub> 1	Pt	Xe lamp	-	Р	-	1	-	2	0	30	0.033	Indigo Carmine 24	Na2SO4 100	96 / 2	1.13	62 / 2		[357]
PEC	B-doped TiO <sub>2</sub> NTA 25	Ti/Ru	Hg lamp	-	Р	-	1.2	-	2	0	500	0.05	Acid Yellow 1	Na2SO4 10	95 / 1	2.35	95 / 2		[221]
PEC	Reduced TiO <sub>2</sub> NTA 4	-	Xe lamp	-	Р	-	0.445	-	-	0	80	0.05	diclofenac 5	Na2SO4 100	99 / 8				[358]
PEC	Au / TiO2 7	Pt	Hg lamp	-	G	4.3	-	-	6.7	0	-	-	Methyl Orange 5.2	Na2SO4 100	83 / 1.5				[359]
PEC	Blue TiO <sub>2</sub> NTA 4	SS 4	Xe lamp	10000	Р	-	1.43	-	6	0	80	0.05	4-chlorophenol 12.8	Na2SO4 100	99 / 2		99 / 6		[346]

PEC	RGO / polyaniline / TiO <sub>2</sub> 5	Pt	Hg lamp	-	Р	-	1.045	-	-	0	100	0.05	Phenol 10	Na2SO4 1	90 / 6	89.5 / 10	[347]
PEC	WO3 / graphite 1.3	Pt	Xe lamp	1000	G	10	-	-	6	0	100	0.013	2-nitrophenol 20	Na2SO4 100	82/3		[360]
PEC	Cu2O / TiO2 NTA 15	Pt	Xe lamp	-	Р	-	1.5	-	-	0	50	0.3	Ciprofloxacin 10	Na2SO4 100	73 / 4		[361]
PEC	BiVO4 / MnO2 / fluorine SnO2 6.5	Pt	Xe lamp	-	Р	-	1.5	-	-	0	100	0.065	Ciprofloxacin 10	Na2SO4 100	76/2		[341]
PEC	B-doped BiVO4 / WO3 / carbon NP 4	Pt	Xe lamp	-	Р	-	1.2	-	-	0	250	0.016	Orange II 5	Na2SO4 100	92 / 3		[362]
PEC	ZnO / TiO2/ Ag2Se /	Pt	blue LED	173	р	_	1.0	_	5.8	0	100	_	Oxytetracycline 5	Na2SO4 50	96.5 / 6	0.82	[363]
	fluorine SnO <sub>2</sub>		450-460 nm	115	Ĩ		1.0		5.0	U	100		Spiked urban wastewater effluent	Na2SO4 20	91 / 6	0.67	[303]

PEC	BiVO <sub>4</sub> / Ag <sub>2</sub> S / fluorine SnO <sub>2</sub> 6.5	Pt	Xe lamp	-	Р	-	1.2	-	-	0	50	0.13	Sulfamethoxazole 10	Na2SO4 100	86 / 2				[364]
PEC	Blue TiO <sub>2</sub> NTA 3.7	SS 3.75	Xe lamp	800	Р	-	-	2.4	5	0	100	-	2,4- dichlorophenoxyacetic acid 10	Na2SO4 50	80 / 1	2.95			[365]
PEC / PEF	TiO <sub>2</sub> 9.4	Carbon cloth 265	Hg lamp	750	Р	-	Cat. Pot. -0.27	-	2	0.25	250	0.038 (an.) 1.06 (cat.)	Direct Yellow 52 2	Na2SO4 50	74 / 0.83	-	66 / 0.33		[366]
PEC / h PEF	α-Fe <sub>2</sub> O <sub>3</sub> / TiO <sub>2</sub> NTA 5	Nickel	W lamp	-	Р	-	-	5	3	0	100	0.05	Phenol 10	Na2SO4 200	99 / 1				[108]
PEC / h PEF	Bi <sub>2</sub> WO <sub>6</sub> / fluorine SnO <sub>2</sub> 3	Fe@Fe <sub>2</sub> O <sub>3</sub> ACF 3	W lamp		G	0.1	-	1.2	6.2	0	-	-	Rhodamine B 5	Na2SO4 50	80 / 2	1.36	87 / 3	47	[348]
PEC / PEF	TiO <sub>2</sub> NT 4	Carbon PTFE air diffusion 3	Hg lamp	-	G	16.7	-	-	3	0.5	500	0.008	Orange G 84.5	Na2SO4 50	99 / 0.1	65	97 / 2	10	[367]
PEC / Fenton	RGO / CeO <sub>2 /</sub> TiO <sub>2</sub> NTA 6	Pt	Xe lamp	1100	Р	-	-	9	5	1	100		Bisphenol A 10	Na2SO4 50	80 / 2	1.46			[368]

PEC	Au / TiO2	SS								0					62 / 3		-		
PEC / PEF	2	10	UVA	-	Р	-	0.82	-	3	0	100	0.02	Paracetamol 78.5	Na2SO4 50	99 / 0.75		20 / 0.75		[349]
PEC / PEF	Au / TiO <sub>2</sub> 2	Carbon air diffusion	Solar	31						0.5					99 / 0.42		24 / 0.42		
PEC / PEF	TiO <sub>2</sub> NTA 3	Carbon- PTFE air diffusion 3	UVA	29	G	3	-	-	3	0.5	150	0.02	Indigo carmine 0.260 mM	Na2SO4 50	99 / 0.6	-	84.6 / 8	87.6	[340]
PEC / PEF	BiVO4 / BiOI / fluorine SnO2 2	CF	Halogen lamp	-	G	10	-	-	3	0.2	50	0.04	Paracetamol 15	Na2SO4 50	-	-	92 / 4	-	[369]

An. Pot.: anodic potential; BDD: boron-doped diamond; Cell. Pot: cell potential; CNT: carbon nanotube; Deg.: degradation; G: galvanostatic mode; h-PEF: heterogeneous photo-electro-Fenton; MCE: mineralization current efficiency; Min: mineralization; NP: nanoparticle; NT: nanotube; NTA: nanotube area; P: potentiostatic mode; PEC: photo-electrocatalysis; PEF: photo-electro-Fenton; Ref: reference; RGO: reduced graphene oxide; S/V: ratio electrode surface / volume of the treated solution; SS: stainless steel; V: volume of the treated solution.

## 1680 5.4. Other combined or hybrid processes

To enhance process efficiency and applicability of the EF process or to overcome some of its inconvenience, different couplings with other techniques have been performed. PEF or solar PEF (see section 5.3) are among such hybrid processes. Bio-electro-Fenton (bio-EF), sonoelectro-Fenton (SEF), pyrite-electro-Fenton (pyrite-EF) and peroxi-electrocoagulation are some of these combined processes [7,273].

### 1686 5.4.1. Bio-EAOPs

Hybrid processes coupling EAOPs with biological process were developed in order achieve 1687 cost-effective treatments [14]. The goal is to decrease the treatment time in order to save 1688 1689 electrical energy or to produce electrical energy that is needed for EF treatment. Therefore, 1690 there are two types of bio-EF process: the coupling between EF and biological degradation that can be performed sequentially between EF and microbial degradation reactors (EF being 1691 1692 generally the pretreatment step) or the coupling between two cells in a one-pot process: microbial fuel cell (MFC) and EF cell. In the latter case, a MFC containing biodegradable 1693 organic substrates generates electrical energy that is used by EF cell containing pollutants to be 1694 degraded; where the latter cell is operated by using the electrical energy generated by the MFC 1695 [370–372]. In fact, MCF works in this system as a "renewable energy" device converting 1696 1697 chemical energy available in organic compounds into electricity, which is used to operate the EF reactor. This system has not yet managed to produce a high amount of electricity so that the 1698 EF reactor cannot operate with high degradation rate, and needs more investigation in the 1699 future. 1700

1701 In this chapter, our attention will be focused mainly on the bio-EF process performed 1702 sequentially between EF and biological treatment. It is well known that the treatment of 1703 persistent organics by EAOPs leads to the formation of more persistent or toxic intermediate

1704 products [373]. It causes a longer treatment time and consequently more energy consumption 1705 to reach a quasi-complete mineralization (EC<sub>TOC</sub>) [374,375]. As shown in Fig. 23, long electrolysis times (to reach high mineralization rate) result in lower current efficiency and 1706 1707 higher energy consumption. To avoid these drawbacks, a pioneer study coupling the EF process as a pretreatment step for a post-biological degradation was performed by Olvera-Vargas et al. 1708 1709 (2016) [376]. In this scenario, the EF process serves to convert recalcitrant organic pollutants 1710 to biologically degradable end-products, in a relatively short electrolysis time. Indeed, several reports have demonstrated that the treatment of recalcitrant organic pollutants by AOPs 1711 enhances the biodegradability index, measured by BOD5/COD ratio (with BOD5, the 1712 1713 biochemical oxygen demand after 5 days) of treated solutions [377-380]. It has been demonstrated that EF treatment allows the oxidation of mother molecules and leads to the 1714 formation of by-products with lower molecular weight, mainly short-chain carboxylic acids, 1715 1716 that are biodegradables [381,382]. The key parameter taken into consideration in enhancement of biodegradability during combination of EF (as a pretreatment step) with biological 1717 degradation is the BOD<sub>5</sub>/COD ratio [383]. A threshold value of 0.4 attained during EF 1718 pretreatment allows the application of biological processes to mineralize the remaining organic 1719 1720 substrates.

1721



### 1722

1723Figure 23. (a) Evolution of TOC removal, (b) MCE and (c)  $EC_{TOC}$  during the mineralization1724of 230 mL of 0.1 mM FRSM ( ) and RNTD ( ) aqueous solutions (both in 0.05 M Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>1725medium at pH 3.0, room temperature and 500 mA of current) using a BDD/CF cell with1726 $[Fe^{2+}] = 0.1$  mM. The equations used to determine MCE and  $EC_{TOC}$  (in kWh (g TOC)<sup>-1</sup>) are1727given in the reference Brillas et al., 2009 [7]. Reprinted from Olvera-Vargas et al. 2016 [375],1728with permission. Copyright 2016 Elsevier.

1729

1730 In this context, an outstanding work showing the applicability of bio-EF hybrid process has 1731 been conducted by Olvera-Vargas et al. (2016) [376]. The solutions of 0.1 mM  $\beta$ -blocker 1732 metoprolol (MTPL) were treated by the EF process and an increase in the biodegradability 1733 index of treated solutions from 0.012 (strongly non-biodegradable) to 0.44 (biodegradable) was 1734 reached after a short electrolysis time of 1 h at 300 mA. The evolution of the BOD<sub>5</sub>/COD ratio and that of average oxidation state (AOS) is depicted in Fig. 24a. These values clearly indicate
that the remaining organic carbon is mainly composed of biocompatible short-chain carboxylic
acids.

The initial TOC was reduced by 46% after 1 h EF pretreatment, and then it was efficiently decreased by 90% during the following 4 days-incubation under aerobic conditions (Fig. 24b). Moreover, toxicity tests based on the use of *V. fischeri* bioluminescent bacteria (Microtox® test) evidenced the presence of harmful intermediates formed during the EF treatment, which were also destroyed, as attested by the absence of toxicity after the EF stage [376]. Recently, Arellano et al. (2020) [384] have successfully applied this hybrid process to the removal of ionic liquids from water.



1747Figure 24. Treatment of beta-blocker metoprolol by Bio-EF process: (a) Evolution of the1748 $BOD_5/COD$  ( $\boxtimes$ ) ratio and of AOS (- $\blacksquare$ -) during EF treatment of 220 mL of 0.1 mM of MTPL1749solution in 0.05 M Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> and 0.1 mM Fe<sup>2+</sup> at pH 3.0 using a CF/BDD cell operating at 3001750mA and room temperature, and (b) Time-course of the overall TOC removal 26.74 mg L<sup>-1</sup>1751(corresponding to 0.1 mM) solution. Biological phase was conducted under aerobic1752conditions using a mixture of 12 pure cultures of microorganisms. Reprinted with permission1753from Olvera-Vargas et al. (2016) [376]. Copyright 2016 Elsevier.

The bio-EF can also be used as post-treatment step after a biological treatment step. Ganzenko 1754 1755 et al., (2018) [380] investigated the application of the EF process as a pre- or post-treatment 1756 step coupled with a biological process using a sequencing batch reactor during the treatment of a pharmaceutical wastewater spiked with the pharmaceutical caffeine and 5-fluoracil and found 1757 the first scenario (EF as pretreatment) more efficient. Indeed, EF could completely degrade 1758 both drugs and reached 60% COD removal in 2 h at 200 mA. The post SBR removed 30% COD 1759 1760 attaining an overall 90% COD removal. It is noteworthy to use low currents during EF treatment to avoid higher energy consumption and mineralization of the biodegradable intermediates so 1761 1762 that they will be removed by biological post-treatment.

## 1763 5.4.2. Sonoelectro-Fenton (SEF)

The coupling between EF and sonolysis was performed by Oturan et al. (2008) [385] where the term SEF was defined for the first time. In SEF, the solutions to be treated are submitted simultaneously to the degradation of pollutants by EF and ultrasonic irradiation [385–389]. The collapse of cavitation bubbles results in local high pressures and temperatures, leading to the formation of 'OH (Eq. 19) [386]:

1769 
$$H_2(0+))) \to 0H^{\bullet} + H^{\bullet}$$
 (19)

1770 The application of ultrasound to the solutions under EF treatment, leads also to the formation 1771 of additional 'OH from the dissociation of electrogenerated  $H_2O_2$  under ultrasonic irradiation 1772 (Eq. 20).

1773 
$$H_2O_2 + ))) \rightarrow 20H^{\bullet}$$
 (20)

1774 It was shown that a synergistic effect is obtained during SEF process, because of the additional 1775 effect of the enhancement of the mass transfer rate to the electrode by sonication [385]. A Pt/CF 1776 tank reactor was placed on a ceramic piezoelectric transducer placed on the base of EF (Pt/CF) batch used to compare the performance of the EF and the SEF processes during the degradation
of the herbicides 2,4-dichlorophenoxyacetic acid and 4,6-dinitro-*o*-cresol. Results highlighted
better performance of SEF compared with EF alone at low frequencies of 28 kHz with low
energy ultrasounds of 20 and 60 W. In contrast, higher energy ultrasounds (i.e., 80 W) inhibited
the efficiency of the hybrid process, due to the depletion of O<sub>2</sub> required for the EF process
[385].

Later, there were several studies on the application of the SEF. Li et al. (2010) [386] reported 1783 1784 an enhancement in H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> production and dye degradation rate when using low frequency ultrasounds. Martínez and Uribe (2012) [390] reported quick degradation and efficient 1785 mineralization (85% TOC removal) of the dye Azur B by the SEF. Lounis et al. (2016) [391] 1786 1787 studied the degradation of Orange G by SEF in seawater and natural mineral water obtaining complete degradation rate in the former medium while 94% of the dye is degraded in the latter 1788 one. All above results concerned the application of SEF to dye solutions. Few studies have been 1789 1790 conducted with other pollutants such as nitrotoluenes and 4-chlorophenol. SEF was applied to the degradation of dinitrotoluene and 2,4,6-trinitrotoluene) in wastewater [392]. Complete 1791 1792 degradation of both nitrotoluenes was obtained despite the absence of oxygen bubbling in the solution. Authors explained this situation by O<sub>2</sub> generation at the anode and its rapid transfer 1793 1794 toward the cathode (for  $H_2O_2$  generation) thanks to enhanced mass transfer rate of  $O_2$  caused 1795 by ultrasonic irradiation. On the other hand, Nazari et al. (2018) [393] investigated the degradation of 4-chlorophenol (4-CP) in aqueous solution using two Ti/mixed metal oxide 1796 electrodes. 4-CP was hardly degraded by sonolysis while a degradation rate of 83% was reached 1797 1798 by EF. Complete degradation of 4-CP was attained by hybrid process SEF at in min under low energy (20 kHz) ultrasounds. The main contribution of ultrasound irradiation was explained by 1799 the enhancement of the mass transfer rate. The use of low energy ultrasounds was suggested as 1800

a practical and efficient approach to support the EF process in order to work without the needto cool the solution.

# 1803 *5.4.3. EF-pyrite*

The EF-pyrite is the heterogeneous version of the classical EF in which the soluble iron salt (as 1804 source of  $Fe^{2+}$  ion as catalyst) is replaced by natural pyrite (FeS<sub>2</sub>) mineral as solid catalyst. The 1805 use of pyrite as catalyst in the EF process conducted to the description of a novel EF process, 1806 so-called EF-pyrite [268,277,302,394]. In contrast to other solid catalysts to perform 1807 heterogeneous EF processes, pyrite provides some additional interesting characteristics 1808 1809 [272,301,395]. Besides its abundance in the nature and reusability, it possesses some very interesting properties for EF process. Indeed, once introduced into the solution to be treated, it 1810 behaves as a source of  $H^+$  and  $Fe^{2+}$  ions according to Eqs. 21-23. Therefore, its use as a solid 1811 catalyst in the EF process presents several advantages such as self-regulation of solution pH 1812 and the possibility to avoid external addition of acid and soluble salt catalyst (Fe<sup>2+</sup>) source 1813 1814 [303].

1815 2 FeS<sub>2</sub>(s) + 7 O<sub>2</sub>(g) + 2 H<sub>2</sub>O 
$$\rightarrow$$
 2 Fe<sup>2+</sup> + 4 SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup> + 4 H<sup>+</sup> (21)

1816 2 FeS<sub>2</sub>(s) + 15 H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> 
$$\rightarrow$$
 2 Fe<sup>3+</sup> + 14 H<sub>2</sub>O + 4 SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup> + 2 H<sup>+</sup> (22)

1817 2 FeS<sub>2</sub>(s) + 14 Fe<sup>3+</sup> + 8 H<sub>2</sub>O 
$$\rightarrow$$
 15 Fe<sup>2+</sup> + 2 SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup> +16 H<sup>+</sup> (23)

Another advantage is related to the reaction of pyrite reaction with electrogenerated H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> producing Fe<sup>3+</sup> (Eq. 22) which is then reduced to Fe<sup>2+</sup> (Eq. 23) contributing to the selfregulation of catalyst. Therefore, pyrite dosage constitutes a key parameter for oxidation kinetics of organic pollutants. The effect of this parameter has been investigated by Labiadh et al. (2015) [301] during the removal of the azo dye AHPS (4-amino-3-hydroxy-2-p-tolylazonaphthalene-1-sulfonic acid) from water (Fig. 25a). The increase in pyrite dosage from 0.5 to 2 1824 g L<sup>-1</sup> enhanced the degradation kinetics of AHPS but a further raising led to a weakened 1825 degradation kinetics, probably due to the release of an excess of  $Fe^{2+}$  ions wasting the 'OH (Eq. 1826 14).

The EF-pyrite process was successfully applied to the efficient removal (oxidative 1827 degradation/mineralization) of different organic pollutants from water. An example of 1828 mineralization kinetics, including MCE is given in Fig. 25b. An overview of other studies on 1829 the performance of the EF-pyrite process with experimental conditions and mineralization rates 1830 of treated solutions, are gathered in Table 4. This Table also includes a comparative study 1831 between EF-pyrite and classical EF with  $Fe^{2+}$  ions as a homogeneous catalyst. It is worthy of 1832 note that the excellent results were obtained with chalcopyrite (CuFeS<sub>2</sub>) as a solid catalyst 1833 1834 [396].



**Figure 25.** (a): Effect of pyrite dosage on the oxidative degradation kinetics of AHPS ( $C_0 =$ 175 mg L<sup>-1</sup>) in the EF-pyrite process and (b): Mineralization kinetics of 0.2 mM sulfamethazine using ( $\blacktriangle$ ,  $\triangle$ ) BDD/CF and ( $\blacksquare$ ,  $\square$ ) Pt/CF cells. The inset panel shows the corresponding MCE curves for ( $\blacktriangle$ ,  $\blacksquare$ ) EF-pyrite with 2.0 g L<sup>-1</sup> pyrite and ( $\triangle$ ,  $\square$ ) classical EF with 0.2 mM Fe<sup>2+</sup>. Experimental conditions: I = 300 mA, [Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>] = 50 mM. Adapted from Labiadh et al., 2015 [301] (a) and Barhoumi et al., 2016 [303] (b) with permission. Copyright 2015, 2016, Elsevier.

1835 1836

# **Table 4.** TOC removal efficiencies obtained during the EF-pyrite treatment of different contaminants and comparison with classic(homogeneous) EF process. Adapted from the reference [272], Copyright 2018, Springer

Contaminant	Cell configuration	% TOC removal (EF-Pyrite)	%TOC removal (Classic EF)	Reference
Levofloxacin	BDD-CF undivided cell (300 mA) 1 g L <sup>-1</sup> of pyrite	95 in 8 h-treatment	-	[395]
Tyrosol	BDD-CF undivided cell (300 mA) 1 g L <sup>-1</sup> of pyrite	89 in 6 h-treatment	88 in 6 h- treatment	[394]
Synthetic dye AHPS	BDD-CF undivided cell (450 mA) 2 g L <sup>-1</sup> of pyrite	>90 in 5 h-treatment	70 in 5 h- treatment	[301]
Sulfamethazine	BDD-CF undivided cell (300 mA) 2 g L <sup>-1</sup> of pyrite	95 in 8 h-treatment	90 in 8 h- treatment	[303]
Tetracycline	BDD-CF undivided cell (500 mA) 1 g L <sup>-1</sup> of chalcopyrite	92 in 2 h, 99 in 6 h- treatment	90 in 2 h, 98 in 6 h-treatment	[396]
Tetracycline	BDD-CF undivided cell (300 mA) 2 g L <sup>-1</sup> of pyrite	99 in 8 h-treatment 87% with Pt anode at 300 mA	96 in 8 h- treatment	[397]
Vanillic acid	Pt-CF undivided cell (300 mA) 1 g L <sup>-1</sup> of pyrite	89 in 4 h-treatment	-	[398]

1844

### 1845 5.4.4. Peroxi-electrocoagulation

Peroxi-electrocoagulation (called also peroxi-coagulation) is a coupling between electrocoagulation and EF processes, developed and applied to wastewater treatment by Brillas et al. [399,400]. This hybrid process involves the EF process using a sacrificial iron anode to generate iron ions (Eq. 24) and a carbonaceous cathode to produce  $H_2O_2$  according to Eq. 1 allowing the Fenton reaction (Eq. 2) to take place.

1850 
$$Fe \to Fe^{2+} + 2e^{-}$$
 (24)

In addition, ferrous iron ions leached to the solution from the iron anode (Eq. 24) is oxidized in the solution 1851 by the DO and electrogenerate H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> (Eq. 1) to form ferric iron ions that promote the coagulation process 1852 1853 through the formation of ferric hydroxide (Fe(OH)<sub>3</sub>). Thus, pollutants contained in wastewater are removed 1854 by both oxidative attacks of 'OH (produced from the Fenton reaction (Eq. 2)), and by coagulation (adsorption and entrapment in Fe(OH)<sub>3</sub> precipitates). Therefore, Brillas and Casado (2002) [400] observed 1855 higher pollutants removal efficiency in peroxi-electrocoagulation compared to the EF process. In contrast 1856 1857 to the electrocoagulation process in which pollutants are only eliminated by coagulation, the peroxi-1858 electrocoagulation allows high organics removal efficiencies thank to the action of strong oxidant 'OH generated through EF process [401-404]. Moreover, to enhance the process efficiency, the peroxi-1859 electrocoagulation has also been coupled with UV irradiation [405,406] for degradation of chlorophenoxy 1860 1861 acid herbicides in aqueous media.

Inversely to the EF, solution pH increases during the peroxi-electrocoagulation process due to the HER at the cathode (Eq. 11) [407–409]. This increase promotes coagulation and results in a high amount of sludge production in the electrochemical reactor. The formation of sludge production can be reduced by setting the solution pH to approximately 3. Under this condition, ferrous iron predominates in the solution, thus allowing the Fenton reaction to occur more efficiently. The peroxi-electrocoagulation process was recently applied to the treatment of different types of wastewater. Lizama-Bahena et al., 2015 [410] studied a mixture of three herbicides (alachlor, atrazine, and chlorbromuron) and obtained complete removal of herbicides and COD at 75 min when combined with UV irradiation. Recently different research groups successfully applied this hybrid process to the treatment of composite wastewater [411], acrylonitrile [110], cooking wastewater [412], coke-plant wastewater [413], laundry wastewater [414] with 70% COD removal in most of the cases.

## 1873 5.4.5. Coupling with a pre-concentration step

EAOPs are generally not cost-effective in the case of low/very low pollutant concentrations ( $< 10^{-3}$  mM or 1874 between µg L<sup>-1</sup> to mg L<sup>-1</sup>) because of slow mass transfer rate requiring long electrolysis times and 1875 1876 consequently high energy consumption for the removal of low amounts of pollutants. An appropriate pre-1877 concentration step before EAOPs can constitute a solution. In this context, Trellu et al. (2018) [415] reported the adsorption of phenol on activated carbon fiber (ACF) and then the ACF was used as cathode in EF 1878 process with efficient desorption and mineralization efficiency. Furthermore, such a process was suggested 1879 for regeneration of spend ACF with high regeneration efficiency [415]. Thus, ACF can be used as filter to 1880 1881 concentrate the pollutants of a very dilute (but toxic even at low concentration) pollutants and remove 1882 completely these pollutants by EF process with regeneration of ACF. Banuelos et al. (2013) [416] also proposed such approach for regeneration of granular activated carbon. Using sawdust as adsorbent material, 1883 Bouaziz et al. (2014) [417] also studied the regeneration of this material using advanced electro-oxidation 1884 with a BDD anode. Recently, Muñoz-Morales et al. (2020) [418] also applied this technique to the pre-1885 concentration on granular activated carbon using a sequential three step processes: adsorption-desorption-1886 electrolysis to treat low concentrated wastewater containing organochlorinated compounds. The process 1887 1888 was successful for chlopyralid and perchloroethylene (8-time concentration) before electrochemical oxidation step while lindane was poorly concentrated. 1889

Another strategy is to combine EAOPs with a pre-concentration step based on membrane filtration. The objective is to apply the electrochemical process on the retentate obtained after membrane filtration. For example, Lan et al. (2015) [419] have used nanofiltration for the removal of ciprofloxacin from an hospital effluent and have subsequently treated the retentate by advanced electro-oxidation using BDD anode with an energy consumption of 50 kWh per kg of COD removed.

### 1895 5.4.6. Electro-peroxone

The peroxone process is an AOP used for the abatement of organic pollutants in water. This enhanced ozonation technology consists of the combination of conventional ozonation with H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>. In fact, the reaction of O<sub>3</sub> with H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> leads to the generation of 'OH according to the Eq. 25 [420,421]. Thus, the O<sub>3</sub> (E° = 2.07 V/SHE) is transformed to a stronger oxidant (E° = 2.80 V/SHE), able to oxidize pollutants until their mineralization.

1901 
$$H_2O_2 + O_3 \rightarrow OH + O_2^- + H^+ + O_2$$
 (25)

When the  $H_2O_2$  is electrochemically in situ generated from electro-reduction of  $O_2$  (Eq. 1), the process is 1902 called electro-peroxone [422,423] and considered as one of emerging EAOPs [424,425]. This process 1903 1904 overcomes the limitation of conventional ozonation, such as the formation of toxic intermediates remaining in the treated solution, and can be easily implemented by installing a pair of electrodes (including a 1905 carbonaceous cathode) in existing ozone reactor with a minimal capital cost [426]. Therefore, different 1906 1907 configurations of electro-peroxone process were applied to the treatment of organic pollutants. For example, Yang et al. (2018) [427] developed a dual electrode system to generate simultaneously O<sub>3</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> for 1908 efficient removal (97.6%) of carbamazepine solution after 90 min electrolysis. A coupling between electro-1909 1910 peroxone and biological treatment was developed for the treatment of a simulated hospital wastewater with 1911 92.8% of TOC removal efficiency [428]. Ghalebizade and Ayati (2019) [429] showed the ability of this process to treat the effluents with high pollutant concentration using a continuous circular flow reactor with 1912 99% degradation efficiency of 500 mg L<sup>-1</sup> of Acid Orange solution at 40 min. Finally, Cornejo and Nava 1913

1914 (2021) [430] compared ozonation, AO-H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> and electro-peroxone processes for the treatment of 1915 levofloxacin in a lab scale flow plant and reported the oxidation power in the following order: electroperoxone > ozonation > AO-H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>. Electro-peroxone was able to reach 63% of mineralization of 1916 levofloxacin solution with a low energy consumption of 0.27 kWh (gTOC)<sup>-1</sup>. A flow-through electro-1917 peroxone system was developed for the disinfection of two kinds of simulated ballast water, fulfilling the 1918 efficient generation of 'OH through the reaction of ozone with in-situ electrochemical generation H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>. As 1919 a result, a higher E. coli inactivation of one order of magnitude was reached, with a very low energy 1920 consumption (0.33 and 0.12 kWh m<sup>-3</sup> for treating both solutions) compared to ozonation and electrolysis 1921 [431]. This process was found also cost-effective and promising for simultaneous tetracycline removal and 1922 disinfection of municipal secondary effluents. The main disinfection by-products such as trihalomethanes, 1923 haloacetonitrile and halonitromethanes were particularly much lower than the WHO's thresholds for 1924 drinking water [432]. 1925

1926

# 1927 **6.** Perspectives and outlook

### 1928 6.1. Electrocatalytic mechanism understanding requirement

### 1929 6.1.1. ORR mechanisms

1930 Investigations about existing ORR studies illustrate the difficulties to predict the selectivity of ORR; more 1931 developed kinetic models are required in combination with thermodynamic analysis as well as pH 1932 dependence studies to deeper understand these mechanisms of selectivity [25].

Moreover, there is a lack of studies about the influence of nanostructure on the ORR mechanisms. Still, a recent paper attempt to investigate in detail the influence of nitrogen-doped RGO on two- and four-electron ORR [433]. The authors identified the ORR active sites on sp<sup>2</sup> carbon close to oxide location and highlighted the influence of oxygen functional groups. Moreover, heteroatom structure could interfere with the catalytic activity and selectivity through modification of chemical structure. They also highlighted that a coupled proton-electron transfers (CPETs) mechanism, i.e. the proton and electron are transferred simultaneously with a single transition state, mainly occurs with metal cathode. Contrastingly, there are different possible ORR pathways with carbon-based materials. It can occur through either CPETs or non-CPETs (i.e. decoupled proton and electron transfer) mechanisms, depending on the material composition, the surface functionalization and the solution pH. This complexity of different ORR mechanisms emphasized in this specific study, has to be enlarged to other types of nanostructured-based cathode materials, which will help to get an overview of the different ORR mechanisms.

## 1945 6.1.2. OER and oxidation mechanisms

The mechanism of anodic oxidation of pollutants is mainly classified by two ways: direct electron transfer, and oxidation through the generated radicals. The direct electron transfer is usually verified by the LSV characterization via comparison of the output current in the presence/absence of pollutants. If the output current in the presence of pollutant is higher than that in the absence of pollutants, it can prove the role of direct electron transfer.

For the role of radical oxidation, there are qualitative and quantitative methods including quenching study, 1951 radical probes and electron paramagnetic resonance method [434]. Table 5 lists some common radical 1952 scavenger and probes. Methanol (MeOH) is the scavenger for  $SO_4^{\bullet}$  and OH, and tert-butyl alcohol (TBA) 1953 is supposed to scavenge only 'OH. Atrazine (ATZ) can distinguish the role of radical and non-radical 1954 oxidation. SO4<sup>-</sup> has a low reactivity to nitrobenzene (NB) oxidation and can determine the role of 'OH and 1955 1956 SO4<sup>•</sup>. From the quenching study, it can be distinguished the role of 'OH and SO4<sup>•</sup>, and furthermore the contribution of these two radicals could be calculated by Eqs. (26) and (27). In addition, there are two kinds 1957 of 'OH that supposed to exist in electrochemical oxidation, homogeneous (free 'OH) and heterogeneous 1958 (surface 'OH), which can be detected using coumarin as the 'OH probe. An 'OH adduct product of 7-1959 hydroxycoumarin can be formed through Eq. (28) which is considered to be non-oxidizable by 'OH [255]. 1960
1961 Therefore, the higher the intensity of 7-hydroxycoumarin, the higher contribution of 'OH tended to be free1962 'OH. On the contrary, 'OH is tended to be surface 'OH.

1963 
$$\lambda_{\bullet_{\text{OH}}} = \frac{k - k_{TBA}}{k} \times 100\%$$
(26)

1964 
$$\lambda_{SO_4} = \frac{k_{MeOH} - k_{TBA}}{k} \times 100\%$$
 (27)

where *k* was the rate constant of phenol degradation without addition of scavenger,  $k_{\text{TBA}}$  was the rate constant with addition of TBA,  $k_{\text{MeOH}}$  was the rate constant with addition of MeOH.

1967 
$$^{\circ}\text{OH} + \text{coumarin} \rightarrow 7 \text{-hydroxycoumarin}$$
 (28)

1968

1969

 Table 5. Common scavengers and reactive radicals.

Scavengers	Rate constant with 'OH (M <sup>-1</sup> s <sup>-1</sup> )	Rate constant with SO4 <sup></sup> (M <sup>-1</sup> s <sup>-1</sup> )	Reactive species	Ref.	
МеОН	$1.2 - 2.8 \times 10^9$	$1.6 - 7.7 \times 10^7$	'OH and	[435]	
			SO4 <sup>•</sup>		
TBA <sup>1</sup>	$3.8 - 7.6 \times 10^8$	$4.0 - 9.1 \times 10^{3}$	HO.	[436]	
$ATZ^2$	2.6×10 <sup>9</sup>	2.6×10 <sup>9</sup>	SO4	[437]	
NB <sup>3</sup>	3.9×10 <sup>9</sup>	<10 <sup>6</sup>	.ОН	[437]	

1970

<sup>1</sup> TBA: tert-butyl alcohol, <sup>2</sup> ATZ: atrazine, <sup>3</sup> NB: nitrobenzene

1971 Besides, the degradation intermediates are also important to disclose the possible degradation pathway and 1972 mechanism through analysis via gas chromatography mass spectrometry (GC-MS) or liquid 1973 chromatography mass spectrometry (LC-MS). However, these measurements are not sufficient for understanding OER and oxidation mechanism. As an anodic interface process, there is an urgent need to develop the characterization and identification method for surface reaction especially for the real-time or in situ detection of possible radicals involved in the pollutant degradation, so that an intrinsic mechanism would be well disclosed to benefit OER mechanism understanding.

#### 1978 **6.2. Electrode stability improvement**

### 1979 6.2.1. Cathodes stability

The cathode performances does not stop at achieving the desired amount of the  $H_2O_2$  but, the challenge is to keep the production capacity constant for a long time and to develop the process in a large-scale application [125]. Some papers focused on the nanostructured cathode stability or reusability by assessing either the  $H_2O_2$  generation efficiency or contaminant degradation performances after several successive cycles of electrolysis. Table 6 presents some different works that deal with the stability of the cathode toward  $H_2O_2$  electrogeneration.

Yu et al. [132] used CF modified with nitrogen-doped carbon as the cathode for the production of  $H_2O_2$ . It was concluded that the  $H_2O_2$  yield was kept relatively constant after 5 cycles with a slight loss of the concentration during the last run. Yang et al. [66] carried out the  $H_2O_2$  electrogeneration rate at the EEGr/GF cathode. Due to the cathode modification, the stability of the material was boosted and the production rate stayed almost constant after 10 cycles.

In another work Zhao et al. [63] evaluated the stability of the fluorine-doped carbon cathodes toward the H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> after 8 cycles of 3 h each, and no significant decrease of performance was observed. Xia et al. [61] prepared a phosphorus-doped CNTs GDE and the reusability of the electrode was explored through the H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> yield after 6 cycles during 1 h each. The authors reported the unchanged cathode performance after the test, which was explained by the strong covalent bond between the phosphorus atoms and carbons framework. 1997 Though promising stability have been assessed with some nanostructured modified raw cathode materials, 1998 especially those that favor chemical binding, the stability has to be proven for long-term use, i.e., over 1999 several weeks and months. Moreover, standard protocol to assess the life span performance should be 2000 established so that the international community would have a comparable and viable way to perform them.

2001

2002

Table 6. Literature on the nanostructured	cathode stability towards th	ie hydrogen j	peroxide yield.
---	------------------------------	---------------	-----------------

Nanostructured cathode	рН	Current density or cathode potential	O <sub>2</sub> flow rate (L min <sup>-1</sup> )	Time (min)	[H <sub>2</sub> O <sub>2</sub> ] (mM cm <sup>-</sup> <sup>2</sup> )	Number of successive cycles	Stability (% loss of yield)	Reference
Phosphorus-doped carbon nanotubes	7	-0.45 V vs SHE	0.21	60	1.41	6	UP <sup>1</sup>	[61]
Fluorine-doped HPC	1	-0.1 V vs RHE <sup>4</sup>	NS	180	11.42	8	UP <sup>1</sup>	[63]
NiFe nanostructure /Graphite	3	300 mA cm <sup>-2</sup>	NS	NS	0.015	15	3.59 <sup>2</sup>	[166]
Tungsten oxide nanoparticles/C	NS	-0.5 V vs SHE	NS	180	2.34	12	6 <sup>2</sup>	[113]
Exfoliated Graphene/graphite felt	7	-0.856 V vs SHE	0.7	NS	7.72 <sup>2</sup>	10	UP <sup>1</sup>	[66]
Nitrogen-doped carbon/graphite felt	7	12.5 mA cm <sup>-2</sup>	0	NS	0.4	5	9	[132]
GDE-CX 80	7	-0.8 V vs SHE	NS	120	6.60 <sup>2</sup>	10	10 <sup>2</sup>	[438]
Carbon nanotubes hybrid fullerene	3	0.044 V vs SHE	NS	NS	29	15	11.7	[102]

<sup>1</sup>UP: unchanged performance, <sup>2</sup>unit: (% loss of H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> yield), <sup>3</sup>unit: (mM h<sup>-1</sup>), <sup>4</sup>RHE: reversible hydrogen electrode 2004

## 2005 6.2.2. Anodes stability

As known, the electrode stability is an important parameter for industrial applications. There are two strategies to improve the electrode stability, one is the intermediate layer modification, the other is the

2008 electrode surface modification. Huang et al. (2020) introduced clustered TNTs intermediate layer on Ti 2009 mesh as substrate for mesh Sb-SnO<sub>2</sub> electrode (M-TNTs-SnO<sub>2</sub>), which exhibited a higher TOC removal and 2010 MCE, and longer accelerated service lifetime of 105 h for electrochemical degradation of phenol when compared with Ti mesh or Ti plate /TNTs electrodes (Fig. 26a) [235]. This enhanced performance was 2011 2012 mainly ascribed to the introduction of mutually self-supported TNTs clusters in different orientations [235]. Xu et al. (2017) explored Nb-doped TNTs interlayer for Sb-SnO<sub>2</sub> electrode [439]. The novel electrode has 2013 2014 a larger surface area and smaller crystallite particles than conventional SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb electrodes. Compared with 2015 Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb and Ti/TiO<sub>2</sub>-NTs/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb, the electrode modified by Nb-TiO<sub>2</sub>-NTs has a higher OEP of 2.29 V/(Ag/AgCl), and a lower Rct with a decrease by 65% and 79%, respectively. The service lifetime of Nb-2016 Ti/Nb-TiO<sub>2</sub>-NTs/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb was 4.9-time longer than that of Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb and 1.9-time longer than that of 2017 Ti/TiO<sub>2</sub>-NTs/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb (Fig. 26b) [439]. 2018

The anode surface modification was the more common way for improving electrode stability. Li et al. used 2019 sodium dodecyl sulfate (SDS) to modify PbO<sub>2</sub> electrode by electro-deposition method, showing that SDS 2020 2021 could obviously refine the coating particles, increase the OEP and accelerate charge transfer [440]. The modified PbO<sub>2</sub> electrode had a better electro-catalytic performance and stability. The accelerated service 2022 2023 life could reach 348 h, which was almost 3.6 times longer than that of  $PbO_2$  electrode (96 h) under the same 2024 condition (Fig. 26c) [440]. Zhang et al. (2014) employed CNT to modify Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb using a pulse electrodeposition method [241]. The modified electrode had a smaller crystallite particles, a higher OEP 2025 and its service lifetime was 4.8-time longer than that of the Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb electrode [241]. It was reported that 2026 2027 cobalt–doped Black TNT array anode had a longer lifetime (200 h) when compared with Blue-TNT (2.3 h) at 10 mA cm<sup>-2</sup> in 30 mM NaClO<sub>4</sub> (Fig. 26d) [441]. 2028

Up to now, many efforts on electrode fabrications have been made to make anodes with low cost, strong stability, long service lifetime and enhanced electrocatalytic activity. However, they are usually designed for small electrochemical devices to treat wastewater. Scale-up has not always been faced in the right way,

the full applications for industrial use, demonstration or even pilot scale applications are still very limited. This is probably due to the economic difficulties, immature electrode fabrication and lifetime duration as well as reliable reactor design. Thus, there is an urgent need to develop them at industrial scale to meet the practical demand [12].

2036



Figure 26. (a) variation of cell voltage during accelerated life tests, [235]. Copyright (2020) Elsevier; (b)
Accelerated service life tests on different electrodes in 0.5 M H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> solution with a current density of 1 A
cm<sup>-2</sup> at 25 °C, [439]. Copyright (2017) Elsevier; (c) Accelerated life test of the different PbO<sub>2</sub> electrodes
(H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>: 3 M; current density: 500 mA cm<sup>-2</sup>, [440], Copyright (2017) Elsevier and (d) Comparison of the
anodic stability of the NTA electrodes in 30 mM KClO<sub>4</sub> at a current density of 10 mA cm<sup>-2</sup>. [441],
Copyright (2018) Elsevier

2044

2037

## 2045 Acknowledgment

M. Zhou and E. Mousset would like to thank the PRC CNRS-NFSC 2095 (France-China joint programme)
for the funding of ADELWATCOZEP project (NSFC no. 21811530274). M. Zhou would also like to thank
financial support by Natural Science Foundation of China (nos. 21976096 and 21273120), National highlevel foreign experts project (G20190002011), Tianjin Science and Technology Program
(19PTZWHZ00050), and Fundamental Research Funds for the Central Universities, Nankai University.
M.A. Oturan acknowledges Nankai University and the Tianjin Foreign 1000 Talents programme for their
logistic and financial supports.

2053

# References

- [1] A. Geim, K. Novoselov, The rise of graphene, Nat. Mater. 6 (2007) 183–191. http://www.nature.com/nmat/journal/v6/n3/abs/nmat1849.html.
- Y. Hancock, The 2010 Nobel Prize in physics-ground-breaking experiments on graphene, J. Phys. D-Applied Phys. 44 (2010).
- [3] V. Chabot, D. Higgins, A. Yu, X. Xiao, Z. Chen, J. Zhang, A review of graphene and graphene oxide sponge: material synthesis and applications to energy and the environment, Energy Environ. Sci. 7 (2014) 1564. doi:10.1039/c3ee43385d.
- [4] A. Oleinick, O. Sliusarenko, I. Svir, C. Amatore, Nanostructured electrodes as random arrays of active sites: Modeling and theoretical characterization, J. Electrochem. Soc. 167 (2020) 013530. doi:10.1149/2.0302001jes.
- [5] C.A. Martínez-Huitle, M. Panizza, Electrochemical oxidation of organic pollutants for wastewater treatment, Curr. Opin. Electrochem. 11 (2018) 62–71. doi:10.1016/j.coelec.2018.07.010.
- [6] E. Brillas, A review on the photoelectro-Fenton process as efficient electrochemical advanced oxidation for wastewater remediation. Treatment with UV light, sunlight, and coupling with conventional and other photoassisted advanced technologies, Chemosphere. 250 (2020) 126198. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2020.126198.
- [7] E. Brillas, I. Sirés, M.A. Oturan, Electro-Fenton process and related electrochemical technologies based on Fenton's reaction chemistry, Chem. Rev. 109 (2009) 6570–6631. doi:10.1007/s00894-008-0358-0.
- [8] I. Sirés, E. Brillas, M.A. Oturan, M.A. Rodrigo, M. Panizza, Electrochemical advanced oxidation processes: today and tomorrow. A review., Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res. 21 (2014) 8336–8367. doi:10.1007/s11356-014-2783-1.
- [9] C.A. Martínez-Huitle, M.A. Rodrigo, I. Sirés, O. Scialdone, Single and coupled electrochemical processes and reactors for the abatement of organic water pollutants: A critical review, Chem. Rev. 115 (2015) 13362– 13407. doi:10.1021/acs.chemrev.5b00361.
- [10] E. Mousset, N. Oturan, M.A. Oturan, An unprecedented route of OH radical reactivity evidenced by an electrocatalytical process: Ipso-substitution with perhalogenocarbon compounds, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 226

(2018) 135-146. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2017.12.028.

- [11] F.C. Moreira, R.A.R. Boaventura, E. Brillas, V.J.P. Vilar, Electrochemical advanced oxidation processes: A review on their application to synthetic and real wastewaters, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 202 (2017) 217–261. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2016.08.037.
- Z. Hu, J. Cai, G. Song, Y. Tian, M. Zhou, Anodic oxidation of organic pollutants: Anode fabrication, process hybrid and environmental applications, Curr. Opin. Electrochem. 26 (2021) 100659.
   doi:10.1016/j.coelec.2020.100659.
- [13] O. Garcia-Rodriguez, E. Mousset, H. Olvera-Vargas, O. Lefebvre, Electrochemical treatment of highly concentrated wastewater: A review of experimental and modeling approaches from lab- to full-scale, Crit. Rev. Environ. Sci. Technol. 0 (2020) 1–70. doi:10.1080/10643389.2020.1820428.
- [14] E. Mousset, C. Trellu, H. Olvera-Vargas, Y. Pechaud, F. Fourcade, M.A. Oturan, Electrochemical technologies coupled with biological treatments, Curr. Opin. Electrochem. 26 (2021) 100668.
   doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.coelec.2020.100668.
- [15] E. Mousset, N. Oturan, E.D. van Hullebusch, G. Guibaud, G. Esposito, M.A. Oturan, Influence of solubilizing agents (cyclodextrin or surfactant) on phenanthrene degradation by electro-Fenton process - Study of soil washing recycling possibilities and environmental impact, Water Res. (2014). doi:10.1016/j.watres.2013.09.044.
- [16] P. V. Nidheesh, G. Divyapriya, N. Oturan, C. Trellu, M.A. Oturan, Environmental applications of boron-doped diamond electrodes: 1. Applications in water and wastewater treatment, ChemElectroChem. 6 (2019) 1–20. doi:10.1002/celc.201801876.
- [17] J. Cai, M. Zhou, Y. Pan, X. Lu, Degradation of 2,4-dichlorophenoxyacetic acid by anodic oxidation and electro-Fenton using BDD anode: Influencing factors and mechanism, Sep. Purif. Technol. 230 (2020) 115867. doi:10.1016/j.seppur.2019.115867.
- [18] J.F. Pérez, J. Llanos, C. Sáez, C. López, P. Cañizares, M.A. Rodrigo, Towards the scale up of a pressurizedjet microfluidic flow-through reactor for cost-effective electro-generation of H2O2, J. Clean. Prod. 211 (2019) 1259–1267. doi:10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.11.225.
- [19] E. Mousset, Unprecedented reactive electro-mixing reactor: Towards synergy between micro- and macro-

reactors?, Electrochem. Commun. 118 (2020) 106787. doi:10.1016/j.elecom.2020.106787.

- [20] P. Ma, H. Ma, S. Sabatino, A. Galia, O. Scialdone, Electrochemical treatment of real wastewater. Part 1: Effluents with low conductivity, Chem. Eng. J. 336 (2018) 133–140. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2017.11.046.
- [21] I. Sirés, E. Brillas, Electro-Fenton Process: Fundamentals and Reactivity, in: M. Zhou, M.A. Oturan, I. Sires (Eds.), Electro-Fent. Process. Handb. Environ. Chem., Springer, Singapore, 2017: pp. 1–28. doi:10.1007/698 2017 40.
- [22] C. Trellu, H.O. Vargas, E. Mousset, N. Oturan, M.A. Oturan, Electrochemical technologies for the treatment of pesticides, Curr. Opin. Electrochem. Just accep (2021).
- [23] E. Mousset, N. Oturan, E.D. van Hullebusch, G. Guibaud, G. Esposito, M.A. Oturan, Treatment of synthetic soil washing solutions containing phenanthrene and cyclodextrin by electro-oxidation. Influence of anode materials on toxicity removal and biodegradability enhancement, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 160–161 (2014) 666–675. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2014.06.018.
- [24] E. Mousset, Y. Pechaud, N. Oturan, M.A. Oturan, Charge transfer/mass transport competition in advanced hybrid electrocatalytic wastewater treatment: Development of a new current efficiency relation, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 240 (2019). doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2018.08.055.
- [25] A. Kulkarni, S. Siahrostami, A. Patel, J.K. Nørskov, Understanding catalytic activity trends in the oxygen reduction reaction, Chem. Rev. 118 (2018) 2302–2312. doi:10.1021/acs.chemrev.7b00488.
- [26] J. Zhang, G. Chen, K. Müllen, X. Feng, Carbon-Rich Nanomaterials: Fascinating Hydrogen and Oxygen Electrocatalysts, Adv. Mater. 1800528 (2018) 1800528(1–22). doi:10.1002/adma.201800528.
- [27] A. Ambrosi, C.K. Chua, A. Bonanni, M. Pumera, Electrochemistry of graphene and related materials., Chem.
   Rev. 114 (2014) 7150–7188. doi:10.1021/cr500023c.
- [28] D. Chen, H. Feng, J. Li, Graphene oxide: Preparation, functionalization, and electrochemical applications, Chem. Rev. 112 (2012) 6027–6053. doi:10.1021/cr300115g.
- [29] R.W. Murray, Nanoelectrochemistry: Metal nanoparticles, nanoelectrodes, and nanopores, Chem. Rev. 108 (2008) 2688–2720. doi:10.1021/cr068077e.
- [30] Y. Fan, C. Han, B. Zhang, Recent advances in the development and application of nanoelectrodes, Analyst.
   141 (2016) 5474–5487. doi:10.1039/C6AN01285J.

- [31] R. Das, C.D. Vecitis, A. Schulze, B. Cao, A.F. Ismail, X. Lu, J. Chen, S. Ramakrishna, Recent advances in nanomaterials for water protection and monitoring, Chem. Soc. Rev. 46 (2017) 6946–7020. doi:10.1039/c6cs00921b.
- [32] B.P. Chaplin, Critical review of electrochemical advanced oxidation processes for water treatment applications, Environ. Sci. Process. Impacts. 16 (2014) 1182–1203. doi:10.1039/C3EM00679D.
- [33] M. Panizza, G. Cerisola, Direct and mediated anodic oxidation of organic pollutants, Chem. Rev. 109 (2009)
   6541–6569. doi:10.1021/cr9001319.
- [34] M.A. Rodrigo, N. Oturan, M.A. Oturan, Electrochemically assisted remediation of pesticides in soils and water: a review, Chem. Rev. 114 (2014) 8720–8745. doi:10.1021/cr500077e.
- [35] E. Mousset, K. Doudrick, A review of electrochemical reduction processes to treat oxidized contaminants in water, Curr. Opin. Electrochem. 22 (2020) 221–227. doi:10.1016/j.coelec.2020.07.008.
- [36] E. Pomerantseva, C. Resini, K. Kovnir, Y. V. Kolen'ko, Emerging nanostructured electrode materials for water electrolysis and rechargeable beyond Li-ion batteries, Adv. Phys. X. 2 (2017) 211–253. doi:10.1080/23746149.2016.1273796.
- [37] J.A. Keith, T. Jacob, Theoretical studies of potential-dependent and competing mechanisms of the electrocatalytic oxygen reduction reaction on Pt(111), Angew. Chemie - Int. Ed. 49 (2010) 9521–9525. doi:10.1002/anie.201004794.
- [38] M.A. Oturan, J.-J. Aaron, Advanced Oxidation Processes in Water/Wastewater Treatment: Principles and Applications. A Review, Crit. Rev. Environ. Sci. Technol. 44 (2014) 2577–2641. doi:10.1080/10643389.2013.829765.
- [39] Anderson, Ross, Reid, Doug, Hart, Peter, Rudie, Alan, Hydrogen peroxide (H 2 O 2 ) safe storage and handling, 2011.
- [40] J.K. Nørskov, J. Rossmeisl, A. Logadottir, L. Lindqvist, J.R. Kitchin, T. Bligaard, H. Jónsson, Origin of the overpotential for oxygen reduction at a fuel-cell cathode, J. Phys. Chem. B. 108 (2004) 17886–17892. doi:10.1021/jp047349j.
- [41] S. Siahrostami, A. Verdaguer-Casadevall, M. Karamad, D. Deiana, P. Malacrida, B. Wickman, M. Escudero-Escribano, E.A. Paoli, R. Frydendal, T.W. Hansen, I. Chorkendorff, I.E.L. Stephens, J. Rossmeisl, Enabling

direct H2O2 production through rational electrocatalyst design, Nat. Mater. 12 (2013) 1137–1143. doi:10.1038/nmat3795.

- [42] I. Morcos, E. Yeager, Kinetic studies of the oxygen—peroxide couple on pyrolytic graphite, Electrochim.
   Acta. 15 (1970) 953–975. doi:10.1016/0013-4686(70)80037-8.
- [43] E. Yeager, Dioxygen electrocatalysis: mechanisms in relation to catalyst structure, J. Mol. Catal. 38 (1986) 5– 25. doi:10.1016/0304-5102(86)87045-6.
- [44] A. Verdaguer-Casadevall, D. Deiana, M. Karamad, S. Siahrostami, P. Malacrida, T.W. Hansen, J. Rossmeisl,
   I. Chorkendorff, I.E.L. Stephens, Trends in the electrochemical synthesis of H2O2: Enhancing activity and selectivity by electrocatalytic site engineering, Nano Lett. 14 (2014) 1603–1608. doi:10.1021/nl500037x.
- [45] J.W.F. To, J.W.D. Ng, S. Siahrostami, A.L. Koh, Y. Lee, Z. Chen, K.D. Fong, S. Chen, J. He, W.G. Bae, J. Wilcox, H.Y. Jeong, K. Kim, F. Studt, J.K. Nørskov, T.F. Jaramillo, Z. Bao, High-performance oxygen reduction and evolution carbon catalysis: From mechanistic studies to device integration, Nano Res. 10 (2017) 1163–1177. doi:10.1007/s12274-016-1347-8.
- [46] P. Vassilev, M.T.M. Koper, Electrochemical reduction of oxygen on gold surfaces: A density functional theory study of intermediates and reaction paths, J. Phys. Chem. C. 111 (2007) 2607–2613. doi:10.1021/jp064515+.
- [47] R.R. Adžić, S. Strbac, N. Anastasijević, Electrocatalysis of oxygen on single crystal gold electrodes, Mater.
   Chem. Phys. 22 (1989) 349–375. doi:10.1016/0254-0584(89)90005-9.
- [48] T.P. Fellinger, F. Hasché, P. Strasser, M. Antonietti, Mesoporous nitrogen-doped carbon for the electrocatalytic synthesis of hydrogen peroxide, J. Am. Chem. Soc. 134 (2012) 4072–4075. doi:10.1021/ja300038p.
- [49] Y. Liu, X. Quan, X. Fan, H. Wang, S. Chen, High-yield electrosynthesis of hydrogen peroxide from oxygen reduction by hierarchically porous carbon, Angew. Chemie - Int. Ed. 54 (2015) 6837–6841. doi:10.1002/anie.201502396.
- [50] Q. Zhang, M. Zhou, G. Ren, Y. Li, Y. Li, X. Du, Highly efficient electrosynthesis of hydrogen peroxide on a superhydrophobic three-phase interface by natural air diffusion, Nat. Commun. 11 (2020) 1–11. doi:10.1038/s41467-020-15597-y.
- [51] E. Mousset, Z. Wang, J. Hammaker, O. Lefebvre, Physico-chemical properties of pristine graphene and its

performance as electrode material for electro-Fenton treatment of wastewater, Electrochim. Acta. (2016). doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2016.08.002.

- [52] J. Rossmeisl, Z.W. Qu, H. Zhu, G.J. Kroes, J.K. Nørskov, Electrolysis of water on oxide surfaces, J. Electroanal. Chem. 607 (2007) 83–89. doi:10.1016/j.jelechem.2006.11.008.
- [53] C. Zhang, X. Lu, Y. Lu, M. Ding, W. Tang, Titanium-boron doped diamond composite: A new anode material, Diam. Relat. Mater. 98 (2019) 107490. doi:10.1016/j.diamond.2019.107490.
- [54] C.A. Martínez-Huitle, S. Ferro, Electrochemical oxidation of organic pollutants for the wastewater treatment: Direct and indirect processes, Chem. Soc. Rev. 35 (2006) 1324–1340. doi:10.1039/b517632h.
- [55] J. Cai, M. Zhou, Y. Pan, X. Du, X. Lu, Extremely efficient electrochemical degradation of organic pollutants with co-generation of hydroxyl and sulfate radicals on Blue-TiO2 nanotubes anode, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 257 (2019) 117902. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2019.117902.
- [56] M. Chen, C. Wang, Y. Wang, X. Meng, Z. Chen, W. Zhang, G. Tan, Kinetic, mechanism and mass transfer impact on electrochemical oxidation of MIT using Ti-enhanced nanotube arrays/SnO2-Sb anode, Electrochim. Acta. 323 (2019) 134779. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2019.134779.
- [57] L. Gui, J. Peng, P. Li, R. Peng, P. Yu, Y. Luo, Electrochemical degradation of dye on TiO2 nanotube array constructed anode, Chemosphere. 235 (2019) 1189–1196. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2019.06.170.
- [58] M.H.M.T. Assumpção, A. Moraes, R.F.B. De Souza, R.M. Reis, R.S. Rocha, I. Gaubeur, M.L. Calegaro, P. Hammer, M.R.V. Lanza, M.C. Santos, Degradation of dipyrone via advanced oxidation processes using a cerium nanostructured electrocatalyst material, Appl. Catal. A Gen. 462–463 (2013) 256–261. doi:10.1016/j.apcata.2013.04.008.
- [59] A. Moraes, M.H.M.T. Assumpção, R. Papai, I. Gaubeur, R.S. Rocha, R.M. Reis, M.L. Calegaro, M.R.V. Lanza, M.C. Santos, Use of a vanadium nanostructured material for hydrogen peroxide electrogeneration, J. Electroanal. Chem. 719 (2014) 127–132. doi:10.1016/j.jelechem.2014.02.009.
- [60] Y.X. Gan, A.H. Jayatissa, Z. Yu, X. Chen, M. Li, Hydrothermal Synthesis of Nanomaterials, J. Nanomater.
   2020 (2020). doi:10.1155/2020/8917013.
- [61] Y. Xia, H. Shang, Q. Zhang, Y. Zhou, X. Hu, Electrogeneration of hydrogen peroxide using phosphorus-doped carbon nanotubes gas diffusion electrodes and its application in electro-Fenton, J. Electroanal. Chem. 840

(2019) 400-408. doi:10.1016/j.jelechem.2019.04.009.

- [62] X. Zhou, D. Xu, Y. Chen, Y. Hu, Enhanced degradation of triclosan in heterogeneous E-Fenton process with MOF-derived hierarchical Mn/Fe@PC modified cathode, Chem. Eng. J. 384 (2020). doi:10.1016/j.cej.2019.123324.
- [63] K. Zhao, Y. Su, X. Quan, Y. Liu, S. Chen, H. Yu, Enhanced H2O2 production by selective electrochemical reduction of O2 on fluorine-doped hierarchically porous carbon, J. Catal. 357 (2018) 118–126. doi:10.1016/j.jcat.2017.11.008.
- [64] K. Vasilev, M.M. Ramiasa, Plasma nanoengineering and nanofabrication, 2016. doi:10.3390/nano6070122.
- [65] A. Khataee, S. Sajjadi, A. Hasanzadeh, B. Vahid, S.W. Joo, One-step preparation of nanostructured martite catalyst and graphite electrode by glow discharge plasma for heterogeneous electro-Fenton like process, J. Environ. Manage. 199 (2017) 31–45. doi:10.1016/j.jenvman.2017.04.095.
- [66] W. Yang, M. Zhou, J. Cai, L. Liang, G. Ren, L. Jiang, Ultrahigh yield of hydrogen peroxide on graphite felt cathode modified with electrochemically exfoliated graphene, J. Mater. Chem. A. 5 (2017) 8070–8080. doi:10.1039/C7TA01534H.
- [67] E. Mousset, Z. Wang, J. Hammaker, O. Lefebvre, Electrocatalytic phenol degradation by a novel nanostructured carbon fiber brush cathode coated with graphene ink, Electrochim. Acta. 258 (2017) 607–617. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2017.11.104.
- [68] O. Garcia-Rodriguez, Y.Y. Lee, H. Olvera-Vargas, F. Deng, Z. Wang, O. Lefebvre, Mineralization of electronic wastewater by electro-Fenton with an enhanced graphene-based gas diffusion cathode, Electrochim. Acta. 276 (2018) 12–20. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2018.04.076.
- [69] T.C. Achee, W. Sun, J.T. Hope, S.G. Quitzau, C.B. Sweeney, S.A. Shah, T. Habib, M.J. Green, High-yield scalable graphene nanosheet production from compressed graphite using electrochemical exfoliation, Sci. Rep. 8 (2018) 1–8. doi:10.1038/s41598-018-32741-3.
- [70] E. Mousset, Z.T. Ko, M. Syafiq, Z. Wang, O. Lefebvre, Electrocatalytic activity enhancement of a graphene ink-coated carbon cloth cathode for oxidative treatment, Electrochim. Acta. 222 (2016) 1628–1641. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2016.11.151.
- [71] K. Parvez, Z.S. Wu, R. Li, X. Liu, R. Graf, X. Feng, K. Müllen, Exfoliation of graphite into graphene in

aqueous solutions of inorganic salts, J. Am. Chem. Soc. 136 (2014) 6083-6091. doi:10.1021/ja5017156.

- [72] T.X.H. Le, M. Bechelany, J. Champavert, M. Cretin, A highly active based graphene cathode for the electro-Fenton reaction, RSC Adv. 5 (2015) 42536–42539. doi:10.1039/C5RA04811G.
- [73] T.X.H. Le, M. Bechelany, S. Lacour, N. Oturan, M. a. Oturan, M. Cretin, High removal efficiency of dye pollutants by electron-Fenton process using a graphene based cathode, Carbon N. Y. 94 (2015) 1003–1011. doi:10.1016/j.carbon.2015.07.086.
- [74] A. Zielinska-jurek, J. Nadolna, A. Zaleska-medynska, Microemulsions An Introduction to Properties and Applications, 2012. doi:10.5772/2300.
- [75] R.M. Félix-Navarro, M. Beltrán-Gastélum, M.I. Salazar-Gastélum, C. Silva-Carrillo, E.A. Reynoso-Soto, S. Pérez-Sicairos, S.W. Lin, F. Paraguay-Delgado, G. Alonso-Núñez, Pt-Pd bimetallic nanoparticles on MWCNTs: Catalyst for hydrogen peroxide electrosynthesis, J. Nanoparticle Res. 15 (2013). doi:10.1007/s11051-013-1802-3.
- [76] A. Martínez-de la Cruz, S. Obregón Alfaro, Synthesis and characterization of nanoparticles of α-Bi2Mo3O12 prepared by co-precipitation method: Langmuir adsorption parameters and photocatalytic properties with rhodamine B, Solid State Sci. 11 (2009) 829–835. doi:10.1016/j.solidstatesciences.2009.01.007.
- [77] Y. He, Y. Ma, J. Meng, X. Zhang, Y. Xia, Dual electrochemical catalysis of Bi2Mo3O12/Ti cathode for hydrogen peroxide production in electro-Fenton system, J. Catal. 373 (2019) 297–305. doi:10.1016/j.jcat.2019.04.005.
- [78] S. Ghasemian, S. Omanovic, Fabrication and characterization of photoelectrochemically-active Sb-doped Sn x -W (100-x)% -oxide anodes: Towards the removal of organic pollutants from wastewater, Appl. Surf. Sci. 416 (2017) 318–328. doi:10.1016/j.apsusc.2017.04.138.
- [79] M.E. Makgae, M.J. Klink, A.M. Crouch, Performance of sol-gel Titanium Mixed Metal Oxide electrodes for electro-catalytic oxidation of phenol, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 84 (2008) 659–666. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2008.05.021.
- [80] Y. Liu, H. Liu, J. Ma, J. Li, Preparation and electrochemical properties of Ce-Ru-SnO 2 ternary oxide anode and electrochemical oxidation of nitrophenols, J. Hazard. Mater. 213–214 (2012) 222–229. doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2012.01.090.

- [81] Y. Feng, Y.H. Cui, J. Liu, B.E. Logan, Factors affecting the electro-catalytic characteristics of Eu doped SnO2/Sb electrode, J. Hazard. Mater. 178 (2010) 29–34. doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2009.12.101.
- [82] R.J. Watts, M.S. Wyeth, D.D. Finn, A.L. Teel, Optimization of Ti/SnO2-Sb2O5 anode preparation for electrochemical oxidation of organic contaminants in water and wastewater, J. Appl. Electrochem. 38 (2008) 31–37. doi:10.1007/s10800-007-9391-4.
- [83] M. Shestakova, M. Sillanpää, Electrode materials used for electrochemical oxidation of organic compounds in wastewater, Rev. Environ. Sci. Biotechnol. 16 (2017) 223–238. doi:10.1007/s11157-017-9426-1.
- [84] H. An, H. Cui, W. Zhang, J. Zhai, Y. Qian, X. Xie, Q. Li, Fabrication and electrochemical treatment application of a microstructured TiO2-NTs/Sb-SnO2/PbO2 anode in the degradation of C.I. Reactive Blue 194 (RB 194), Chem. Eng. J. 209 (2012) 86–93. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2012.07.089.
- [85] S. Boukhchina, H. Akrout, D. Berling, L. Bousselmi, Highly efficient modified lead oxide electrode using a spin coating/electrodeposition mode on titanium for electrochemical treatment of pharmaceutical pollutant, Chemosphere. 221 (2019) 356–365. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2019.01.057.
- [86] D. Devilliers, E. Mahé, Modified titanium electrodes: Application to Ti/TiO2/PbO 2 dimensionally stable anodes, Electrochim. Acta. 55 (2010) 8207–8214. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2010.01.098.
- [87] I. Sirés, C.T.J. Low, C. Ponce-de-León, F.C. Walsh, The deposition of nanostructured β-PbO2 coatings from aqueous methanesulfonic acid for the electrochemical oxidation of organic pollutants, Electrochem. Commun. 12 (2010) 70–74. doi:10.1016/j.elecom.2009.10.038.
- [88] X. Li, D. Pletcher, F.C. Walsh, A novel flow battery: A lead acid battery based on an electrolyte with soluble lead(II). Part VII. Further studies of the lead dioxide positive electrode, Electrochim. Acta. 54 (2009) 4688– 4695. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2009.03.075.
- [89] P.K. Shen, X.L. Wei, Morphologic study of electrochemically formed lead dioxide, Electrochim. Acta. 48 (2003) 1743–1747. doi:10.1016/S0013-4686(03)00149-X.
- [90] A.B. Velichenko, R. Amadelli, E. V. Gruzdeva, T. V. Luk'yanenko, F.I. Danilov, Electrodeposition of lead dioxide from methanesulfonate solutions, J. Power Sources. 191 (2009) 103–110. doi:10.1016/j.jpowsour.2008.10.054.
- [91] P. Duverneuil, F. Maury, N. Pebere, F. Senocq, H. Vergnes, Chemical vapor deposition of SnO2 coatings on

Ti plates for the preparation of electrocatalytic anodes, Surf. Coatings Technol. 151–152 (2002) 9–13. doi:10.1016/S0257-8972(01)01618-8.

- [92] S. Klamklang, H. Vergnes, F. Senocq, K. Pruksathorn, P. Duverneuil, S. Damronglerd, Deposition of tin oxide, iridium and iridium oxide films by metal-organic chemical vapor deposition for electrochemical wastewater treatment, J. Appl. Electrochem. 40 (2010) 997–1004. doi:10.1007/s10800-009-9968-1.
- [93] J. Lv, Y. Feng, J. Liu, Y. Qu, F. Cui, Comparison of electrocatalytic characterization of boron-doped diamond and SnO 2 electrodes, Appl. Surf. Sci. 283 (2013) 900–905. doi:10.1016/j.apsusc.2013.07.040.
- [94] P. Li, G. Zhao, X. Cui, Y. Zhang, Y. Tang, Constructing stake structured TiO2-NTs/Sb-doped SnO2 electrode simultaneously with high electrocatalytic and photocatalytic performance for complete mineralization of refractory aromatic acid, J. Phys. Chem. C. 113 (2009) 2375–2383. doi:10.1021/jp8078106.
- [95] J. Jiang, C. Wang, Review—Electrolytic Metal Atoms Enabled Manufacturing of Nanostructured Sensor Electrodes, J. Electrochem. Soc. 167 (2020) 037521. doi:10.1149/2.0212003jes.
- [96] Y. Lee, H. Shin, S.H. Chun, J. Lee, W.J. Park, J.M. Baik, S. Yoon, M.H. Kim, Highly single crystalline IrxRu1-xO2 mixed metal oxide nanowires, J. Phys. Chem. C. 116 (2012) 16300–16304.
- [97] L.R. Aveiro, A.G.M. da Silva, V.S. Antonin, E.G. Candido, L.S. Parreira, R.S. Geonmonond, I.C. de Freitas, M.R.V. Lanza, P.H.C. Camargo, M.C. Santos, Carbon-supported MnO2 nanoflowers: Introducing oxygen vacancies for optimized volcano-type electrocatalytic activities towards H2O2 generation, Electrochim. Acta. 268 (2018) 101–110. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2018.02.077.
- [98] J.H. Chang, A. V. Ellis, Y.H. Hsieh, C.H. Tung, S.Y. Shen, Electrocatalytic characterization and dye degradation of Nano-TiO2 electrode films fabricated by CVD, Sci. Total Environ. 407 (2009) 5914–5920. doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2009.07.041.
- [99] H. Salari, Kinetics and mechanism of enhanced photocatalytic activity under visible light irradiation using Cr2O3/Fe2O3 nanostructure derived from bimetallic metal organic framework, J. Environ. Chem. Eng. 7 (2019) 103092. doi:10.1016/j.jece.2019.103092.
- [100] V.S. Pinheiro, E.C. Paz, L.R. Aveiro, L.S. Parreira, F.M. Souza, P.H.C. Camargo, M.C. Santos, Ceria high aspect ratio nanostructures supported on carbon for hydrogen peroxide electrogeneration, Electrochim. Acta. 259 (2018) 865–872. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2017.11.010.

- [101] C. Natarajan, N. Fukunaga, G. Nogami, Titanium dioxide thin film deposited by spray pyrolysis of aqueous solution, Thin Solid Films. 322 (1998) 6–8. doi:10.1016/S0040-6090(97)01010-9.
- [102] A. Hasanzadeh, A. Khataee, M. Zarei, Y. Zhang, Two-electron oxygen reduction on fullerene C60-carbon nanotubes covalent hybrid as a metal-free electrocatalyst, Sci. Rep. 9 (2019) 1–13. doi:10.1038/s41598-019-50155-7.
- [103] J. Xie, J. Yang, X. Zhou, A hybrid nanostructure encapsulating SnO2 nanoparticles as the anode material for lithium ion batteries with high electrochemical performance, RSC Adv. 4 (2014) 572–577. doi:10.1039/c3ra44242j.
- [104] G. Li, Y. Zhang, Highly selective two-electron oxygen reduction to generate hydrogen peroxide using graphite felt modified with N-doped graphene in an electro-Fenton system, New J. Chem. 43 (2019) 12657–12667. doi:10.1039/c9nj02601k.
- [105] X. Zhang, W. Hu, K. Zhang, J. Wang, B. Sun, H. Li, P. Qiao, L. Wang, W. Zhou, Ti3+ self-doped black TiO2 nanotubes with mesoporous nanosheet architecture as efficient solar-driven hydrogen evolution photocatalysts, ACS Sustain. Chem. Eng. 5 (2017) 6894–6901. doi:10.1021/acssuschemeng.7b01114.
- [106] Q. Wang, T. Yang, H. Wang, J. Zhang, X. Guo, Z. Yang, S. Lu, W. Qin, Morphological and chemical tuning of lead halide perovskite mesocrystals as long-life anode materials in lithium-ion batteries, CrystEngComm. 21 (2019) 1048–1059. doi:10.1039/c8ce01779d.
- [107] J. Cai, M. Zhou, X. Du, X. Xu, Enhanced mechanism of 2,4-dichlorophenoxyacetic acid degradation by electrochemical activation of persulfate on Blue-TiO2 nanotubes anode, Sep. Purif. Technol. 254 (2021) 117560. doi:10.1016/j.seppur.2020.117560.
- [108] Y. Cong, Z. Li, Y. Zhang, Q. Wang, Q. Xu, Synthesis of α-Fe2O3/TiO2 nanotube arrays for photoelectro-Fenton degradation of phenol, Chem. Eng. J. 191 (2012) 356–363. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2012.03.031.
- [109] Z. Zhang, H. Meng, Y. Wang, L. Shi, X. Wang, S. Chai, Fabrication of graphene@graphite-based gas diffusion electrode for improving H2O2 generation in Electro-Fenton process, Electrochim. Acta. 260 (2018) 112–120. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2017.11.048.
- [110] G. Ren, M. Zhou, P. Su, L. Liang, W. Yang, E. Mousset, Highly energy-efficient removal of acrylonitrile by peroxi-coagulation with modified graphite felt cathode: Influence factors, possible mechanism, Chem. Eng. J.

343 (2018) 467-476. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2018.02.115.

- [111] W. Wang, X. Lu, P. Su, Y. Li, J. Cai, Q. Zhang, M. Zhou, O. Arotiba, Enhancement of hydrogen peroxide production by electrochemical reduction of oxygen on carbon nanotubes modified with fluorine, Chemosphere. 259 (2020) 127423. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2020.127423.
- [112] P. Su, M. Zhou, X. Lu, W. Yang, G. Ren, J. Cai, Electrochemical catalytic mechanism of N-doped graphene for enhanced H2O2 yield and in-situ degradation of organic pollutant, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 245 (2019) 583–595. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2018.12.075.
- [113] E.C. Paz, L.R. Aveiro, V.S. Pinheiro, F.M. Souza, V.B. Lima, F.L. Silva, P. Hammer, M.R.V. Lanza, M.C. Santos, Evaluation of H2O2 electrogeneration and decolorization of Orange II azo dye using tungsten oxide nanoparticle-modified carbon, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 232 (2018) 436–445. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2018.03.082.
- [114] J.F. Carneiro, F.L. Silva, A.S. Martins, R.M.P. Dias, G.M. Titato, Á.J. Santos-Neto, R. Bertazzoli, M.R.V. Lanza, Simultaneous degradation of hexazinone and diuron using ZrO2-nanostructured gas diffusion electrode, Chem. Eng. J. 351 (2018) 650–659. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2018.06.122.
- [115] J.F. Carneiro, R.S. Rocha, P. Hammer, R. Bertazzoli, M.R.V. Lanza, Hydrogen peroxide electrogeneration in gas diffusion electrode nanostructured with Ta2O5, Appl. Catal. A Gen. 517 (2016) 161–167. doi:10.1016/j.apcata.2016.03.013.
- [116] L. Liang, Y. An, M. Zhou, F. Yu, M. Liu, G. Ren, Novel rolling-made gas-diffusion electrode loading trace transition metal for efficient heterogeneous electro-Fenton-like, J. Environ. Chem. Eng. 4 (2016) 4400–4408. doi:10.1016/j.jece.2016.10.006.
- [117] L. Zhou, Z. Hu, C. Zhang, Z. Bi, T. Jin, M. Zhou, Electrogeneration of hydrogen peroxide for electro-Fenton system by oxygen reduction using chemically modified graphite felt cathode, Sep. Purif. Technol. 111 (2013) 131–136. doi:10.1016/j.seppur.2013.03.038.
- [118] C. Zhang, M. Zhou, G. Ren, X. Yu, L. Ma, J. Yang, F. Yu, Heterogeneous electro-Fenton using modified ironcarbon as catalyst for 2,4-dichlorophenol degradation: Influence factors, mechanism and degradation pathway, Water Res. 70 (2015) 414–424. doi:10.1016/j.watres.2014.12.022.
- [119] X. Yu, M. Zhou, G. Ren, L. Ma, A novel dual gas diffusion electrodes system for efficient hydrogen peroxide

generation used in electro-Fenton, Chem. Eng. J. 263 (2015) 92-100. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2014.11.053.

- [120] L. Ma, M. Zhou, G. Ren, W. Yang, L. Liang, A highly energy-efficient flow-through electro-Fenton process for organic pollutants degradation, Electrochim. Acta. 200 (2016) 222–230. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2016.03.181.
- [121] L. Zhou, M. Zhou, Z. Hu, Z. Bi, K.G. Serrano, Chemically modified graphite felt as an efficient cathode in electro-Fenton for p-nitrophenol degradation, Electrochim. Acta. 140 (2014) 376–383. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2014.04.090.
- [122] F. Yu, M. Zhou, X. Yu, Cost-effective electro-Fenton using modified graphite felt that dramatically enhanced on H2O2 electro-generation without external aeration, Electrochim. Acta. 163 (2015) 182–189. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2015.02.166.
- [123] I. Sirés, J.A. Garrido, R.M. Rodríguez, E. Brillas, N. Oturan, M. a. Oturan, Catalytic behavior of the Fe3+/Fe2+ system in the electro-Fenton degradation of the antimicrobial chlorophene, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 72 (2007) 382–394. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2006.11.016.
- [124] F. Sopaj, N. Oturan, J. Pinson, F.I. Podvorica, M.A. Oturan, Effect of cathode material on electro-Fenton process efficiency for electrocatalytic mineralization of the antibiotic sulfamethazine, Chem. Eng. J. 384 (2020) 123249. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2019.123249.
- [125] W. Zhou, X. Meng, J. Gao, A.N. Alshawabkeh, Hydrogen peroxide generation from O2 electroreduction for environmental remediation: A state-of-the-art review, Chemosphere. 225 (2019) 588–607. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2019.03.042.
- [126] O. García-Rodríguez, J.A. Bañuelos, A. El-Ghenymy, L.A. Godínez, E. Brillas, F.J. Rodríguez-Valadez, Use of a carbon felt-iron oxide air-diffusion cathode for the mineralization of Malachite Green dye by heterogeneous electro-Fenton and UVA photoelectro-Fenton processes, J. Electroanal. Chem. 767 (2016) 40– 48. doi:10.1016/j.jelechem.2016.01.035.
- [127] Y.T. Wang, C.H. Tu, Y.S. Lin, Application of graphene and carbon nanotubes on carbon felt electrodes for the electro-Fenton system, Materials (Basel). 12 (2019) 1–11. doi:10.3390/MA12101698.
- [128] G. Divyapriya, P.V. Nidheesh, Importance of graphene in the electro-Fenton process, ACS Omega. 5 (2020)4725–4732. doi:10.1021/acsomega.9b04201.

- [129] H. Yang, M. Zhou, W. Yang, G. Ren, L. Ma, Rolling-made gas diffusion electrode with carbon nanotube for electro-Fenton degradation of acetylsalicylic acid, Chemosphere. 206 (2018) 439–446. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2018.05.027.
- [130] K. Gao, B. Wang, L. Tao, B. V Cunning, Z. Zhang, S. Wang, R.S. Ruoff, L. Qu, Efficient metal-free electrocatalysts from N-doped carbon nanomaterials: Mono-doping and co-doping, Adv. Mater. 31 (2019) 1– 11. doi:10.1002/adma.201805121.
- T. Zhang, T. Asefa, Heteroatom-doped carbon materials for hydrazine oxidation, Adv. Mater. 31 (2019) 1–17.
   doi:10.1002/adma.201804394.
- [132] F. Yu, L. Tao, T. Cao, High yield of hydrogen peroxide on modified graphite felt electrode with nitrogendoped porous carbon carbonized by zeolitic imidazolate framework-8 (ZIF-8) nanocrystals, Environ. Pollut. 255 (2019). doi:10.1016/j.envpol.2019.113119.
- [133] W. Yang, M. Zhou, L. Liang, Highly efficient in-situ metal-free electrochemical advanced oxidation process using graphite felt modified with N-doped graphene, Chem. Eng. J. 338 (2018) 700–708. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2018.01.013.
- [134] G. Panomsuwan, N. Saito, T. Ishizaki, Simple one-step synthesis of fluorine-doped carbon nanoparticles as potential alternative metal-free electrocatalysts for oxygen reduction reaction, J. Mater. Chem. A Mater. Energy Sustain. 3 (2015) 9972–9981. doi:10.1039/C5TA00244C.
- [135] J. Wu, Z. Yang, X. Li, Q. Sun, C. Jin, P. Strasser, R. Yang, Phosphorus-doped porous carbons as efficient electrocatalysts for oxygen reduction, J. Mater. Chem. A. 1 (2013) 9889–9896. doi:10.1039/c3ta11849e.
- [136] S. Das, A. Mishra, M.M. Ghangrekar, Production of hydrogen peroxide using various metal-based catalysts in electrochemical and bioelectrochemical systems: Mini review, J. Hazardous, Toxic, Radioact. Waste. 24 (2020) 06020001. doi:10.1061/(asce)hz.2153-5515.0000498.
- [137] S.C. Perry, D. Pangotra, L. Vieira, L.I. Csepei, V. Sieber, L. Wang, C. Ponce de León, F.C. Walsh, Electrochemical synthesis of hydrogen peroxide from water and oxygen, Nat. Rev. Chem. 3 (2019) 442–458. doi:10.1038/s41570-019-0110-6.
- [138] S. Yuan, N. Gou, A.N. Alshawabkeh, A.Z. Gu, Efficient degradation of contaminants of emerging concerns by a new electro-Fenton process with Ti/MMO cathode., Chemosphere. 93 (2013) 2796–804.

doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2013.09.051.

- [139] V.S. Antonin, M.H.M.T. Assumpcao, J.C.M. Silva, L.S. Parreira, M.R.V. Lanza, M.C. Santos, Synthesis and characterization of nanostructured electrocatalystsbased on nickel and tin for hydrogen peroxide electrogeneration, Electrochim. Acta. 109 (2013) 245–251. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2013.07.078.
- [140] P. Su, M. Zhou, G. Ren, X. Lu, X. Du, G. Song, A carbon nanotube-confined iron modified cathode with prominent stability and activity for heterogeneous electro-Fenton reactions, J. Mater. Chem. A. 7 (2019) 24408–24419. doi:10.1039/c9ta07491k.
- [141] C. Rajkumar, P. Veerakumar, S.M. Chen, B. Thirumalraj, K.C. Lin, Ultrathin sulfur-doped graphitic carbon nitride nanosheets as metal-free catalyst for electrochemical sensing and catalytic removal of 4-nitrophenol, ACS Sustain. Chem. Eng. 6 (2018) 16021–16031. doi:10.1021/acssuschemeng.8b02041.
- [142] R. Pitchai, V. Thavasi, S.G. Mhaisalkar, S. Ramakrishna, Nanostructured cathode materials: A key for better performance in Li-ion batteries, J. Mater. Chem. 21 (2011) 11040–11051. doi:10.1039/c1jm10857c.
- [143] E. Mousset, M. Zhou, Graphene-Based Nanostructured Materials for Advanced Electrochemical Water/Wastewater Treatment, in: S. Thomas, A. Thankappan (Eds.), Polym. Nanostructured Mater., Apple Acad, 2019: pp. 321–358. doi:10.1201/b22428-21.
- [144] J. Park, Y. Nabae, T. Hayakawa, M.A. Kakimoto, Highly selective two-electron oxygen reduction catalyzed by mesoporous nitrogen-doped carbon, ACS Catal. 4 (2014) 3749–3754. doi:10.1021/cs5008206.
- [145] Z. Chen, W. Ren, L. Gao, B. Liu, S. Pei, H.-M. Cheng, Three-dimensional flexible and conductive interconnected graphene networks grown by chemical vapour deposition., Nat. Mater. 10 (2011) 424–428. doi:10.1038/nmat3001.
- [146] J. Hass, F. Varchon, J.E. Millán-Otoya, M. Sprinkle, N. Sharma, W.A. de Heer, C. Berger, P.N. First, L. Magaud, E.H. Conrad, Why Multilayer Graphene on 4H-SiC(0001) Behaves Like a Single Sheet of Graphene, Phys. Rev. Lett. 100 (2008) 125504(4). doi:10.1103/PhysRevLett.100.125504.
- [147] S. Pei, H.M. Cheng, The reduction of graphene oxide, Carbon N. Y. 50 (2012) 3210–3228. doi:10.1016/j.carbon.2011.11.010.
- [148] M. Zhou, Q. Yu, L. Lei, The preparation and characterization of a graphite–PTFE cathode system for the decolorization of C.I. Acid Red 2, Dye. Pigment. 77 (2008) 129–136. doi:10.1016/j.dyepig.2007.04.002.

- [149] E.C. Paz, V.S. Pinheiro, L.R. Aveiro, F.L. Souza, M.R. V. Lanzac, M.C. Santos, Hydrogen Peroxide Electrogeneration by Gas Diffusion Electrode Modified With Tungsten, J. Brazilian Chem. Soc. 00 (2019) 1– 12.
- [150] J.P. Paraknowitsch, A. Thomas, Doping carbons beyond nitrogen: An overview of advanced heteroatom doped carbons with boron, sulphur and phosphorus for energy applications, Energy Environ. Sci. 6 (2013) 2839– 2855. doi:10.1039/c3ee41444b.
- [151] R. Shibuya, T. Kondo, J. Nakamura, Active sites in nitrogen-doped carbon materials for oxygen reduction reaction, Carbon-Based Met. Catal. Des. Appl. 1–2 (2018) 227–249. doi:10.1002/9783527811458.vol1-ch8.
- [152] Z. Qiang, J.H. Chang, C.P. Huang, Electrochemical generation of hydrogen peroxide from dissolved oxygen in acidic solutions, Water Res. 36 (2002) 85–94. doi:10.1016/S0043-1354(01)00235-4.
- [153] H. Luo, C. Li, C. Wu, W. Zheng, X. Dong, Electrochemical degradation of phenol by in situ electro-generated and electro-activated hydrogen peroxide using an improved gas diffusion cathode, Electrochim. Acta. 186 (2015) 486–493. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2015.10.194.
- [154] A. Fdez-Sanromán, V. Acevedo-García, M. Pazos, M.Á. Sanromán, E. Rosales, Iron-doped cathodes for electro-Fenton implementation: Application for pymetrozine degradation, Electrochim. Acta. 338 (2020) 1– 11. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2020.135768.
- [155] R. Babaei-Sati, J. Basiri Parsa, Electrodeposition of PANI/MWCNT nanocomposite on stainless steel with enhanced electrocatalytic activity for oxygen reduction reaction and electro-Fenton process, New J. Chem. 41 (2017) 5995–6003. doi:10.1039/c7nj00744b.
- [156] W. Yang, M. Zhou, N. Oturan, Y. Li, P. Su, M.A. Oturan, Enhanced activation of hydrogen peroxide using nitrogen doped graphene for effective removal of herbicide 2,4-D from water by iron-free electrochemical advanced oxidation, Electrochim. Acta. 297 (2019) 582–592. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2018.11.196.
- [157] Q. Tang, D. Wang, D.M. Yao, C.W. Yang, Y.C. Sun, Highly efficient electro-generation of hydrogen peroxide using NCNT/NF/CNT air diffusion electrode for electro-Fenton degradation of p-nitrophenol, Water Sci. Technol. 73 (2016) 1652–1658. doi:10.2166/wst.2015.647.
- [158] N. Jia, T. Yang, S. Shi, X. Chen, Z. An, Y. Chen, S. Yin, P. Chen, N,F-codoped carbon nanocages: An efficient electrocatalyst for hydrogen peroxide electroproduction in alkaline and acidic solutions, ACS Sustain. Chem.

Eng. 8 (2020) 2883–2891. doi:10.1021/acssuschemeng.9b07047.

- [159] G. Chen, J. Liu, Q. Li, P. Guan, X. Yu, L. Xing, J. Zhang, R. Che, A direct H2O2 production based on hollow porous carbon sphere-sulfur nanocrystal composites by confinement effect as oxygen reduction electrocatalysts, Nano Res. 12 (2019) 2614–2622. doi:10.1007/s12274-019-2496-3.
- [160] V. Perazzolo, C. Durante, A. Gennaro, Nitrogen and sulfur doped mesoporous carbon cathodes for water treatment, J. Electroanal. Chem. 782 (2016) 264–269. doi:10.1016/j.jelechem.2016.10.037.
- [161] R.F. Gutiérrez-Hernández, R. Bello-Mendoza, J.F. Valle-Mora, J.M. Peralta-Hernández, E.A. Malo, A. Hernández-Ramírez, H.A. Nájera-Aguilar, Rapid prediction of hydrogen peroxide concentration eletrogenerated with boron doped diamond electrodes, J. Adv. Oxid. Technol. 20 (2017). doi:10.1515/jaots-2017-0037.
- [162] G. Xia, Y. Lu, H. Xu, Electrogeneration of hydrogen peroxide for electro-Fenton via oxygen reduction using polyacrylonitrile-based carbon fiber brush cathode, Electrochim. Acta. 158 (2015) 390–396. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2015.01.102.
- [163] C. Ridruejo, F. Alcaide, G. Álvarez, E. Brillas, I. Sirés, On-site H2O2 electrogeneration at a CoS2-based airdiffusion cathode for the electrochemical degradation of organic pollutants, J. Electroanal. Chem. 808 (2018) 364–371. doi:10.1016/j.jelechem.2017.09.010.
- [164] A.Y. Mounia, Z. Djilali, Electrogeneration of hydrogen peroxide for electro-Fenton system by oxygen reduction using gold nanoparticle electrodeposited on graphite cathode, Desalin. Water Treat. 56 (2015) 1657– 1668. doi:10.1080/19443994.2014.954144.
- [165] R.B. Valim, R.M. Reis, P.S. Castro, A.S. Lima, R.S. Rocha, M. Bertotti, M.R. V Lanza, Electrogeneration of hydrogen peroxide in acidic medium using gas diffusion electrodes modified with cobalt (II) phthalocyanine, Electrochim. Acta. 104 (2013) 12–18. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2013.04.079.
- [166] S. Sajjadi, A. Hasanzadeh, A. Khataee, Two-electron oxygen reduction on NiFe alloy enclosed carbonic nanolayers derived from NiFe-metal-organic frameworks, (2019). doi:10.1016/j.jelechem.2019.04.025.
- [167] P. Geng, J. Su, C. Miles, C. Comninellis, G. Chen, Highly-ordered magnéli Ti4O7 nanotube arrays as effective anodic material for electro-oxidation, Electrochim. Acta. 153 (2015) 316–324. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2014.11.178.

- [168] C. Shao, J. Yu, X. Li, X. Wang, K. Zhu, Influence of the Pt nanoscale interlayer on stability and electrical property of Ti/Pt/Sb-SnO2 electrode: A synergetic experimental and computational study, J. Electroanal. Chem. 804 (2017) 140–147. doi:10.1016/j.jelechem.2017.09.057.
- [169] B. Liu, K.H. Kim, V. Kumar, S. Kim, A review of functional sorbents for adsorptive removal of arsenic ions in aqueous systems, J. Hazard. Mater. 388 (2020) 121815. doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2019.121815.
- [170] C. Thamaraiselvan, J. Wang, D.K. James, P. Narkhede, S.P. Singh, D. Jassby, J.M. Tour, C.J. Arnusch, Laserinduced graphene and carbon nanotubes as conductive carbon-based materials in environmental technology, Mater. Today. 34 (2020) 115–131. doi:10.1016/j.mattod.2019.08.014.
- [171] G. Gao, Q. Zhang, C.D. Vecitis, CNT-PVDF composite flow-through electrode for single-pass sequential reduction-oxidation, J. Mater. Chem. A. 2 (2014) 6185–6190. doi:10.1039/c3ta14080f.
- [172] G. Gao, C.D. Vecitis, Electrochemical carbon nanotube filter oxidative performance as a function of surface chemistry, Environ. Sci. Technol. 45 (2011) 9726–9734. doi:10.1021/es202271z.
- [173] C.D. Vecitis, G. Gao, H. Liu, Electrochemical carbon nanotube filter for adsorption, desorption, and oxidation of aqueous dyes and anions, J. Phys. Chem. C. 115 (2011) 3621–3629. doi:10.1021/jp111844j.
- [174] F. Li, Q. Xia, Q. Cheng, M. Huang, Y. Liu, Conductive cotton filters for affordable and efficient water purification, Catalysts. 7 (2017) 1–12. doi:10.3390/catal7100291.
- [175] H. Liu, J. Liu, Y. Liu, K. Bertoldi, C.D. Vecitis, Quantitative 2D electrooxidative carbon nanotube filter model: Insight into reactive sites, Carbon N. Y. 80 (2014) 651–664. doi:10.1016/j.carbon.2014.09.009.
- [176] G. dos S. Cunha, B.M. de Souza-Chaves, D.M. Bila, J.P. Bassin, C.D. Vecitis, M. Dezotti, Insights into estrogenic activity removal using carbon nanotube electrochemical filter, Sci. Total Environ. 678 (2019) 448– 456. doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.04.342.
- [177] Y. Liu, J.H. Dustin Lee, Q. Xia, Y. Ma, Y. Yu, L.Y. Lanry Yung, J. Xie, C.N. Ong, C.D. Vecitis, Z. Zhou, A graphene-based electrochemical filter for water purification, J. Mater. Chem. A. 2 (2014) 16554–16562. doi:10.1039/c4ta04006f.
- [178] G. Gao, C.D. Vecitis, Electrocatalysis aqueous phenol with carbon nanotubes networks as anodes: Electrodes passivation and regeneration and prevention, Electrochim. Acta. 98 (2013) 131–138. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2013.02.127.

- [179] Z. Li, C. Shen, Y. Liu, C. Ma, F. Li, B. Yang, M. Huang, Z. Wang, L. Dong, S. Wolfgang, Carbon nanotube filter functionalized with iron oxychloride for flow-through electro-Fenton, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 260 (2020) 118204. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2019.118204.
- [180] Y. Liu, J. Xie, C.N. Ong, C.D. Vecitis, Z. Zhou, Electrochemical wastewater treatment with carbon nanotube filters coupled with in situ generated H2O2, Environ. Sci. Water Res. Technol. 1 (2015) 769–778. doi:10.1039/c5ew00128e.
- [181] M.H. Schnoor, C.D. Vecitis, Quantitative examination of aqueous ferrocyanide oxidation in a carbon nanotube electrochemical filter: Effects of flow rate, ionic strength, and cathode material, J. Phys. Chem. C. 117 (2013) 2855–2867. doi:10.1021/jp3112099.
- [182] S. Yang, Y. Liu, C. Shen, F. Li, B. Yang, M. Huang, M. Yang, Z. Wang, W. Sand, Rapid decontamination of tetracycline hydrolysis product using electrochemical CNT filter: Mechanism, impacting factors and pathways, Chemosphere. 244 (2020) 125525. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2019.125525.
- [183] Y. Liu, H. Liu, Z. Zhou, T. Wang, C.N. Ong, C.D. Vecitis, Degradation of the Common Aqueous Antibiotic Tetracycline using a Carbon Nanotube Electrochemical Filter, Environ. Sci. Technol. 49 (2015) 7974–7980. doi:10.1021/acs.est.5b00870.
- [184] G. Gao, M. Pan, C.D. Vecitis, Effect of the oxidation approach on carbon nanotube surface functional groups and electrooxidative filtration performance, J. Mater. Chem. A. 3 (2015) 7575–7582. doi:10.1039/c4ta07191c.
- [185] B.M. Souza-Chaves, M. Dezotti, C.D. Vecitis, Synergism of ozonation and electrochemical filtration during advanced organic oxidation, J. Hazard. Mater. 382 (2020) 121085. doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2019.121085.
- [186] Y. Liu, F. Li, Q. Xia, J. Wu, J. Liu, M. Huang, J. Xie, Conductive 3D sponges for affordable and highlyefficient water purification, Nanoscale. 10 (2018) 4771–4778. doi:10.1039/c7nr09435c.
- [187] G. Gao, C.D. Vecitis, Doped carbon nanotube networks for electrochemical filtration of aqueous phenol: Electrolyte precipitation and phenol polymerization, ACS Appl. Mater. Interfaces. 4 (2012) 1478–1489. doi:10.1021/am2017267.
- [188] F. Li, X. Peng, Y. Liu, J. Mei, L. Sun, C. Shen, C. Ma, M. Huang, Z. Wang, W. Sand, A chloride-radicalmediated electrochemical filtration system for rapid and effective transformation of ammonia to nitrogen, Chemosphere. 229 (2019) 383–391. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2019.04.180.

- [189] H. Liu, A. Vajpayee, C.D. Vecitis, Bismuth-doped tin oxide-coated carbon nanotube network: Improved anode stability and efficiency for flow-through organic electrooxidation, ACS Appl. Mater. Interfaces. 5 (2013) 10054–10066. doi:10.1021/am402621v.
- [190] S.Y. Yang, C.D. Vecitis, H. Park, Electrocatalytic water treatment using carbon nanotube filters modified with metal oxides, Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res. 26 (2019) 1036–1043. doi:10.1007/s11356-017-8495-6.
- [191] Y. V. Pleskov, M.D. Krotova, V. V. Elkin, V.P. Varnin, I.G. Teremetskaya, A. V. Saveliev, V.G. Ralchenko, Benzene oxidation at diamond electrodes: Comparison of microcrystalline and nanocrystalline diamonds, ChemPhysChem. 13 (2012) 3047–3052. doi:10.1002/cphc.201101059.
- [192] S.T. McBeath, D.P. Wilkinson, N.J.D. Graham, Application of boron-doped diamond electrodes for the anodic oxidation of pesticide micropollutants in a water treatment process: A critical review, Environ. Sci. Water Res. Technol. 5 (2019) 2090–2107. doi:10.1039/c9ew00589g.
- [193] M. Zhou, L. Liu, Y. Jiao, Q. Wang, Q. Tan, Treatment of high-salinity reverse osmosis concentrate by electrochemical oxidation on BDD and DSA electrodes, Desalination. 277 (2011) 201–206. doi:10.1016/j.desal.2011.04.030.
- [194] M. Zhou, H. Särkkä, M. Sillanpää, A comparative experimental study on methyl orange degradation by electrochemical oxidation on BDD and MMO electrodes, Sep. Purif. Technol. 78 (2011) 290–297. doi:10.1016/j.seppur.2011.02.013.
- [195] S.O. Ganiyu, C.A. Martínez-Huitle, Nature, mechanisms and reactivity of electrogenerated reactive species at thin-film boron-doped diamond (BDD) electrodes during electrochemical wastewater treatment, ChemElectroChem. 6 (2019) 2379–2392. doi:10.1002/celc.201900159.
- [196] X. Yu, M. Zhou, Y. Hu, K. Groenen Serrano, F. Yu, Recent updates on electrochemical degradation of biorefractory organic pollutants using BDD anode: A mini review, Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res. 21 (2014) 8417– 8431. doi:10.1007/s11356-014-2820-0.
- [197] N. Oturan, E. Brillas, M.A. Oturan, Unprecedented total mineralization of atrazine and cyanuric acid by anodic oxidation and electro-Fenton with a boron-doped diamond anode, Environ. Chem. Lett. 10 (2012) 165–170. doi:10.1007/s10311-011-0337-z.
- [198] Y. He, W. Huang, R. Chen, W. Zhang, H. Lin, Improved electrochemical performance of boron-doped

diamond electrode depending on the structure of titanium substrate, J. Electroanal. Chem. 758 (2015) 170– 177. doi:10.1016/j.jelechem.2015.08.017.

- [199] Y. He, Y. Dong, W. Huang, X. Tang, H. Liu, H. Lin, H. Li, Investigation of boron-doped diamond on porous Ti for electrochemical oxidation of acetaminophen pharmaceutical drug, J. Electroanal. Chem. 759 (2015) 167–173. doi:10.1016/j.jelechem.2015.11.011.
- [200] Y. He, H. Lin, X. Wang, W. Huang, R. Chen, H. Li, A hydrophobic three-dimensionally networked borondoped diamond electrode towards electrochemical oxidation, Chem. Commun. 52 (2016) 8026–8029. doi:10.1039/c6cc03866b.
- [201] J. Sun, H. Lu, H. Lin, W. Huang, H. Li, J. Lu, T. Cui, Boron doped diamond electrodes based on porous Ti substrates, Mater. Lett. 83 (2012) 112–114. doi:10.1016/j.matlet.2012.05.044.
- [202] Y. He, W. Huang, R. Chen, W. Zhang, H. Lin, H. Li, Anodic oxidation of aspirin on PbO2, BDD and porous Ti/BDD electrodes: Mechanism, kinetics and utilization rate, Sep. Purif. Technol. 156 (2015) 124–131. doi:10.1016/j.seppur.2015.09.036.
- [203] Y. He, W. Huang, R. Chen, W. Zhang, H. Lin, Enhanced electrochemical oxidation of organic pollutants by boron-doped diamond based on porous titanium, Sep. Purif. Technol. 149 (2015) 124–131. doi:10.1016/j.seppur.2015.05.008.
- [204] Y. He, X. Wang, W. Huang, R. Chen, H. Lin, H. Li, Application of porous boron-doped diamond electrode towards electrochemical mineralization of triphenylmethane dye, J. Electroanal. Chem. 775 (2016) 292–298. doi:10.1016/j.jelechem.2016.06.023.
- [205] J. Sun, H. Lu, L. Du, H. Lin, H. Li, Anodic oxidation of anthraquinone dye Alizarin Red S at Ti/BDD electrodes, Appl. Surf. Sci. 257 (2011) 6667–6671. http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0169433211003072 (accessed June 1, 2013).
- [206] C.H. Lee, E.S. Lee, Y.K. Lim, K.H. Park, H.D. Park, D.S. Lim, Enhanced electrochemical oxidation of phenol by boron-doped diamond nanowire electrode, RSC Adv. 7 (2017) 6229–6235. doi:10.1039/c6ra26287b.
- [207] X. Tong, G. Zhao, M. Liu, T. Cao, L. Liu, P. Li, Fabrication and high electrocatalytic activity of threedimensional porous nanosheet Pt/Boron-doped diamond hybrid film, J. Phys. Chem. C. 113 (2009) 13787– 13792. doi:10.1021/jp9029503.

- [208] R. Mei, Q. Wei, C. Zhu, W. Ye, B. Zhou, L. Ma, Z. Yu, K. Zhou, 3D macroporous boron-doped diamond electrode with interconnected liquid flow channels: A high-efficiency electrochemical degradation of RB-19 dye wastewater under low current, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 245 (2019) 420–427. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2018.12.074.
- [209] Q. Wei, G. Liu, C. Zhu, B. Zhou, R. Mei, L. Ma, L. Zhang, W. Yang, W. Ye, K. Zhou, Z. Yu, Ordered structures with functional units (OSFU) enabled highly robust diamond anode for electrochemical decomposing of organic pollutants, Chem. Eng. J. 397 (2020). doi:10.1016/j.cej.2020.125465.
- [210] M. Behúl, M. Vojs, M. Marton, P. Michniak, M. Mikolášek, M. Kurniawan, H.L. Honig, D. V. Zyabkin, M.O. Ramirez, L. Spieß, D. Flock, A. Bund, M. Papula, R. Redhammer, Nanostructured boron doped diamond enhancing the photoelectrochemical performance of TiO2/BDD heterojunction anodes, Vacuum. 171 (2020) 109006. doi:10.1016/j.vacuum.2019.109006.
- [211] Y. Han, X. Ruan, J. Chen, H. Zhang, H. Zhao, S. Zhang, Photoelectrochemical properties and its application of nano-tio 2/boron-doped diamond heterojunction electrode material, Asian J. Chem. 25 (2013) 6167–6172. doi:10.14233/ajchem.2013.14299.
- [212] F. Espinola-Portilla, R. Navarro-Mendoza, S. Gutiérrez-Granados, U. Morales-Muñoz, E. Brillas-Coso, J.M. Peralta-Hernández, A simple process for the deposition of TiO2 onto BDD by electrophoresis and its application to the photoelectrocatalysis of Acid Blue 80 dye, J. Electroanal. Chem. 802 (2017) 57–63. doi:10.1016/j.jelechem.2017.08.041.
- [213] S. Chai, Y. Wang, Y. nan Zhang, H. Zhao, M. Liu, G. Zhao, Construction of a bifunctional electrode interface for efficient electrochemical mineralization of recalcitrant pollutants, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 237 (2018) 473– 481. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2018.06.023.
- [214] X. Li, H. Li, M. Li, C. Li, D. Sun, Y. Lei, B. Yang, Preparation of a porous boron-doped diamond/Ta electrode for the electrocatalytic degradation of organic pollutants, Carbon N. Y. 129 (2018) 543–551. doi:10.1016/j.carbon.2017.12.052.
- [215] S. Chai, Y. Wang, Y.N. Zhang, M. Liu, Y. Wang, G. Zhao, Selective electrocatalytic degradation of odorous mercaptans derived from S-Au bond recongnition on a dendritic gold/boron-doped diamond composite electrode, Environ. Sci. Technol. 51 (2017) 8067–8076. doi:10.1021/acs.est.7b00393.

- [216] A. El Ruby Mohamed, S. Rohani, Modified TiO2 nanotube arrays (TNTAs): Progressive strategies towards visible light responsive photoanode, a review, Energy Environ. Sci. 4 (2011) 1065–1086. doi:10.1039/c0ee00488j.
- [217] R. Amadelli, L. Armelao, A.B. Velichenko, N. V. Nikolenko, D. V. Girenko, S. V. Kovalyov, F.I. Danilov, Oxygen and ozone evolution at fluoride modified lead dioxide electrodes, Electrochim. Acta. 45 (1999) 713– 720. doi:10.1016/S0013-4686(99)00250-9.
- [218] H. Kong, W. Li, H. Lin, Z. Shi, H. Lu, Y. Dan, W. Huang, Influence of F- doping on the microstructure, surface morphology and electrochemical properties of the lead dioxide electrode, Surf. Interface Anal. 45 (2013) 715–721. doi:10.1002/sia.5146.
- [219] J. Cao, H. Zhao, F. Cao, J. Zhang, The influence of F- doping on the activity of PbO2 film electrodes in oxygen evolution reaction, Electrochim. Acta. 52 (2007) 7870–7876. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2007.06.038.
- [220] J. Cao, H. Zhao, F. Cao, J. Zhang, C. Cao, Electrocatalytic degradation of 4-chlorophenol on F-doped PbO2 anodes, Electrochim. Acta. 54 (2009) 2595–2602. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2008.10.049.
- [221] G.G. Bessegato, J.C. Cardoso, M.V.B. Zanoni, Enhanced photoelectrocatalytic degradation of an acid dye with boron-doped TiO2 nanotube anodes, Catal. Today. 240 (2015) 100–106. doi:10.1016/j.cattod.2014.03.073.
- [222] R. Amadelli, L. Armelao, E. Tondello, S. Daolio, M. Fabrizio, C. Pagura, A. Velichenko, SIMS and XPS study about ions influence on electrodeposited PbO2 films, Appl. Surf. Sci. 142 (1999) 200–203. doi:10.1016/S0169-4332(98)00707-7.
- [223] L.S. Andrade, R.C. Rocha-Filho, N. Bocchi, S.R. Biaggio, J. Iniesta, V. García-Garcia, V. Montiel, Degradation of phenol using Co- and Co, F-doped PbO2 anodes in electrochemical filter-press cells, J. Hazard. Mater. 153 (2008) 252–260. doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2007.08.046.
- [224] L.S. Andrade, L.A.M. Ruotolo, R.C. Rocha-Filho, N. Bocchi, S.R. Biaggio, J. Iniesta, V. García-Garcia, V. Montiel, On the performance of Fe and Fe, F doped Ti-Pt/PbO2 electrodes in the electrooxidation of the Blue Reactive 19 dye in simulated textile wastewater, Chemosphere. 66 (2007) 2035–2043. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2006.10.028.
- [225] P. Hasin, M.A. Alpuche-Aviles, Y. Wu, Electrocatalytic activity of graphene multilayers toward I -/I3-: Effect of preparation conditions and polyelectrolyte modification, J. Phys. Chem. C. 114 (2010) 15857–15861.

doi:10.1021/jp106130v.

- [226] S. Yang, Y. Huang, W. Zhu, B. Deng, H. Wang, Z. Zhang, P. Bao, G. Wang, Pt/3D-graphene/FTO electrodes: Electrochemical preparation and their enhanced electrocatalytic activity, Int. J. Hydrogen Energy. 39 (2014) 15063–15071. doi:10.1016/j.ijhydene.2014.07.036.
- [227] E. Mousset, V. Huang Weiqi, B. Foong Yang Kai, J.S. Koh, J.W. Tng, Z. Wang, O. Lefebvre, A new 3Dprinted photoelectrocatalytic reactor combining the benefits of a transparent electrode and the Fenton reaction for advanced wastewater treatment, J. Mater. Chem. A. 5 (2017) 24951–24964. doi:10.1039/C7TA08182K.
- [228] J.S. Yang, W.W.P. Lai, S.C. Panchangam, A.Y.C. Lin, Photoelectrochemical degradation of perfluorooctanoic acid (PFOA) with GOP25/FTO anodes: Intermediates and reaction pathways, J. Hazard. Mater. 391 (2020). doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2020.122247.
- [229] B. Yang, C. Jiang, G. Yu, Q. Zhuo, S. Deng, J. Wu, H. Zhang, Highly efficient electrochemical degradation of perfluorooctanoic acid (PFOA) by F-doped Ti/SnO2 electrode, J. Hazard. Mater. 299 (2015) 417–424. doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2015.06.033.
- [230] M. Chen, B. Li, X. Liu, L. Zhou, L. Yao, J. Zai, X. Qian, X. Yu, Boron-doped porous Si anode materials with high initial coulombic efficiency and long cycling stability, J. Mater. Chem. A. 6 (2018) 3022–3027. doi:10.1039/c7ta10153h.
- [231] Y.K. Kim, S.K. Lim, H. Park, M.R. Hoffmann, S. Kim, Trilayer CdS/carbon nanofiber (CNF) mat/Pt-TiO2 composite structures for solar hydrogen production: Effects of CNF mat thickness, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 196 (2016) 216–222. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2016.05.045.
- [232] J.H. Yoon, Y.B. Shim, B.S. Lee, S.Y. Choi, M.S. Won, Electrochemical degradation of phenol and 2chlorophenol using Pt/Ti and boron-doped diamond electrodes, Bull. Korean Chem. Soc. 33 (2012) 2274– 2278. doi:10.5012/bkcs.2012.33.7.2274.
- [233] Z. Chen, J. Mao, R. Zhou, Preparation of size-controlled Pt supported on Al2O3 nanocatalysts for deep catalytic oxidation of benzene at lower temperature, Appl. Surf. Sci. 465 (2019) 15–22. doi:10.1016/j.apsusc.2018.09.138.
- [234] Y. Chen, Y. Tu, Y. Bai, J. Li, J. Lu, Electrosorption enhanced electrooxidation of a model organic pollutant at 3D SnO2-Sb electrode in superimposed pulse current mode, Chemosphere. 195 (2018) 63–69.

doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2017.12.074.

- [235] L. Huang, D. Li, J. Liu, L. Yang, C. Dai, N. Ren, Y. Feng, Construction of TiO2 nanotube clusters on Ti mesh for immobilizing Sb-SnO2 to boost electrocatalytic phenol degradation, J. Hazard. Mater. 393 (2020). doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2020.122329.
- [236] S. Begum, M. Ahmaruzzaman, CTAB and SDS assisted facile fabrication of SnO2 nanoparticles for effective degradation of carbamazepine from aqueous phase: A systematic and comparative study of their degradation performance, Water Res. 129 (2018) 470–485. doi:10.1016/j.watres.2017.11.031.
- [237] C. Zhou, Y. Wang, J. Chen, L. Xu, H. Huang, J. Niu, High-efficiency electrochemical degradation of antiviral drug abacavir using a penetration flux porous Ti/SnO2–Sb anode, Chemosphere. 225 (2019) 304–310. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2019.03.036.
- [238] Y. Wang, H. Duan, Z. Pei, L. Xu, Hydrothermal synthesis of 3D hierarchically flower-like structure Ti/SnO2-Sb electrode with long service life and high electrocatalytic performance, 2019. doi:10.1016/j.jelechem.2019.113635.
- [239] J. Wu, K. Zhu, H. Xu, W. Yan, Electrochemical oxidation of rhodamine B by PbO2/Sb-SnO2/TiO2 nanotube arrays electrode, Chinese J. Catal. 40 (2019) 917–927. doi:10.1016/S1872-2067(19)63342-5.
- [240] B. Yang, J. Wang, C. Jiang, J. Li, G. Yu, S. Deng, S. Lu, P. Zhang, C. Zhu, Q. Zhuo, Electrochemical mineralization of perfluorooctane sulfonate by novel F and Sb co-doped Ti/SnO2 electrode containing Sn-Sb interlayer, Chem. Eng. J. 316 (2017) 296–304. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2017.01.105.
- [241] L. Zhang, L. Xu, J. He, J. Zhang, Preparation of Ti/SnO2-Sb electrodes modified by carbon nanotube for anodic oxidation of dye wastewater and combination with nanofiltration, Electrochim. Acta. 117 (2014) 192– 201. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2013.11.117.
- [242] W. Wang, X. Duan, X. Sui, Q. Wang, F. Xu, L. Chang, Surface characterization and electrochemical properties of PbO2/SnO2 composite anodes for electrocatalytic oxidation of m-nitrophenol, Electrochim. Acta. 335 (2020) 135649. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2020.135649.
- [243] X. Duan, X. Sui, W. Wang, W. Bai, L. Chang, Fabrication of PbO2/SnO2 composite anode for electrochemical degradation of 3-chlorophenol in aqueous solution, Appl. Surf. Sci. 494 (2019) 211–222. doi:10.1016/j.apsusc.2019.07.161.

- [244] Q. Wang, T. Jin, Z. Hu, L. Zhou, M. Zhou, TiO2-NTs/SnO2-Sb anode for efficient electrocatalytic degradation of organic pollutants: Effect of TiO2-NTs architecture, Sep. Purif. Technol. 102 (2013) 180–186. doi:10.1016/j.seppur.2012.10.006.
- [245] X. Zhou, S. Liu, H. Yu, A. Xu, J. Li, X. Sun, J. Shen, W. Han, L. Wang, Electrochemical oxidation of pyrrole, pyrazole and tetrazole using a TiO2 nanotubes based SnO2-Sb/3D highly ordered macro-porous PbO2 electrode, J. Electroanal. Chem. 826 (2018) 181–190. doi:10.1016/j.jelechem.2018.08.039.
- [246] Q. Dai, J. Zhou, X. Meng, D. Feng, C. Wu, J. Chen, Electrochemical oxidation of cinnamic acid with Mo modified PbO2 electrode: Electrode characterization, kinetics and degradation pathway, Chem. Eng. J. 289 (2016) 239–246. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2015.12.054.
- [247] C. Tan, B. Xiang, Y. Li, J. Fang, M. Huang, Preparation and characteristics of a nano-PbO2 anode for organic wastewater treatment, Chem. Eng. J. 166 (2011) 15–21. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2010.08.018.
- [248] F. Sopaj, N. Oturan, J. Pinson, F. Podvorica, M.A. Oturan, Effect of the anode materials on the efficiency of the electro-Fenton process for the mineralization of the antibiotic sulfamethazine, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 199 (2016) 331–341. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2016.06.035.
- [249] S. El-Kacemi, H. Zazou, N. Oturan, M. Dietze, M. Hamdani, M. Es-Souni, M.A. Oturan, Nanostructured ZnO-TiO2 thin film oxide as anode material in electrooxidation of organic pollutants. Application to the removal of dye Amido black 10B from water, Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res. 24 (2017) 1442–1449. doi:10.1007/s11356-016-7920-6.
- [250] J. Wang, D. Zhi, H. Zhou, X. He, D. Zhang, Evaluating tetracycline degradation pathway and intermediate toxicity during the electrochemical oxidation over a Ti/Ti4O7 anode, Water Res. 137 (2018) 324–334. doi:10.1016/j.watres.2018.03.030.
- [251] L. Guo, Y. Jing, B.P. Chaplin, Development and characterization of ultrafiltration TiO2 magnéli phase reactive electrochemical membranes, Environ. Sci. Technol. 50 (2016) 1428–1436. doi:10.1021/acs.est.5b04366.
- [252] S.O. Ganiyu, N. Oturan, S. Raffy, M. Cretin, R. Esmilaire, E. van Hullebusch, G. Esposito, M.A. Oturan, Substoichiometric titanium oxide (Ti4O7) as a suitable ceramic anode for electrooxidation of organic pollutants: A case study of kinetics, mineralization and toxicity assessment of amoxicillin, Water Res. 106 (2016) 171– 182. doi:10.1016/j.watres.2016.09.056.

- [253] S.O. Ganiyu, N. Oturan, S. Raffy, M. Cretin, C. Causserand, M.A. Oturan, Efficiency of plasma elaborated sub-stoichiometric titanium oxide (Ti4O7) ceramic electrode for advanced electrochemical degradation of paracetamol in different electrolyte media, Sep. Purif. Technol. 208 (2019) 142–152. doi:10.1016/j.seppur.2018.03.076.
- [254] W. Yang, N. Oturan, S. Raffy, M. Zhou, M.A. Oturan, Electrocatalytic generation of homogeneous and heterogeneous hydroxyl radicals for cold mineralization of anti-cancer drug Imatinib, Chem. Eng. J. 383 (2020) 123155. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2019.123155.
- [255] L. Gan, Y. Wu, H. Song, C. Lu, S. Zhang, A. Li, Self-doped TiO2 nanotube arrays for electrochemical mineralization of phenols, Chemosphere. 226 (2019) 329–339. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2019.03.135.
- [256] G.G. Bessegato, F.F. Hudari, M.V.B. Zanoni, Self-doped TiO2 nanotube electrodes: A powerful tool as a sensor platform for electroanalytical applications, Electrochim. Acta. 235 (2017) 527–533. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2017.03.141.
- [257] J. Han, H. Choi, G. Lee, Y. Tak, J. Yoon, Electrochemical activity of a blue anatase TiO2 nanotube array for the oxygen evolution reaction in alkaline water electrolysis, J. Electrochem. Sci. Technol. 7 (2016) 76–81. doi:10.5229/JECST.2016.7.1.76.
- [258] W.D. Zhu, C.W. Wang, J.B. Chen, Y. Li, J. Wang, Enhanced field emission from Ti 3+ self-doped TiO 2 nanotube arrays synthesized by a facile cathodic reduction process, Appl. Surf. Sci. 301 (2014) 525–529. doi:10.1016/j.apsusc.2014.02.116.
- [259] C. Kim, S. Lee, S. Kim, J. Yoon, Effect of Annealing Temperature on the Capacitive and Oxidant-generating Properties of an Electrochemically Reduced TiO2 Nanotube Array, Electrochim. Acta. 222 (2016) 1578–1584. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2016.11.143.
- [260] A. Zhang, F. Gong, Y. Xiao, X. Guo, F. Li, L. Wang, Y. Zhang, L. Zhang, Electrochemical Reductive Doping and Interfacial Impedance of TiO 2 Nanotube Arrays in Aqueous and Aprotic Solvents, J. Electrochem. Soc. 164 (2017) H91–H96. doi:10.1149/2.1231702jes.
- [261] C. Kim, S. Kim, J. Choi, J. Lee, J.S. Kang, Y.E. Sung, J. Lee, W. Choi, J. Yoon, Blue TiO2 nanotube array as an oxidant generating novel anode material fabricated by simple cathodic polarization, Electrochim. Acta. 141 (2014) 113–119. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2014.07.062.

- [262] X. Chang, S.S. Thind, A. Chen, Electrocatalytic enhancement of salicylic acid oxidation at electrochemically reduced TiO2 nanotubes, ACS Catal. 4 (2014) 2616–2622. doi:10.1021/cs500487a.
- [263] S.H. Li, Y. Zhao, J. Chu, W.W. Li, H.Q. Yu, G. Liu, Electrochemical degradation of methyl orange on Pt-Bi/C nanostructured electrode by a square-wave potential method, Electrochim. Acta. 92 (2013) 93–101. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2013.01.012.
- [264] Y. Chen, G. Zhang, J. Ma, Y. Zhou, Y. Tang, T. Lu, Electro-oxidation of methanol at the different carbon materials supported Pt nano-particles, Int. J. Hydrogen Energy. 35 (2010) 10109–10117. doi:10.1016/j.ijhydene.2010.07.170.
- [265] T.P. Tsele, A.S. Adekunle, O.E. Fayemi, E.E. Ebenso, Electrochemical detection of epinephrine using polyaniline nanocomposite films doped with TiO2 and RuO2 nanoparticles on multi-walled carbon nanotube, Electrochim. Acta. 243 (2017) 331–348. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2017.05.031.
- [266] D. Li, X. Guo, H. Song, T. Sun, J. Wan, Preparation of RuO2-TiO2/Nano-graphite composite anode for electrochemical degradation of ceftriaxone sodium, J. Hazard. Mater. 351 (2018) 250–259. doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2018.03.007.
- [267] M.A. Oturan, J.-J. Aaron, Advanced oxidation processes in water/wastewater treatment: principles and applications. A review, Crit. Rev. Environ. Sci. Technol. 44 (2014) 2577–2641. doi:10.1080/10643389.2013.829765.
- [268] S.O. Ganiyu, M. Zhou, C.A. Martínez-huitle, Heterogeneous electro-Fenton and photoelectro-Fenton processes : A critical review of fundamental principles and application for water / wastewater treatment, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 235 (2018) 103–129. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2018.04.044.
- [269] H. Monteil, Y. Péchaud, N. Oturan, M.A. Oturan, A review on efficiency and cost effectiveness of electroand bio-electro-Fenton processes: Application to the treatment of pharmaceutical pollutants in water, Chem. Eng. J. 376 (2019) 119577. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2018.07.179.
- [270] M.A. Oturan, P. V. Nidheesh, M. Zhou, Electrochemical advanced oxidation processes for the abatement of persistent organic pollutants, Chemosphere. 209 (2018) 17–19. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2018.06.049.
- [271] W.H. Glaze, J. Kang, D.H. Chapin, The chemistry of water treatment processes involving ozone, hydrogen peroxide and ultraviolet radiation, Ozone Sci. Eng. 9 (1987) 335–352. doi:10.1080/01919518708552148.

- [272] N. Oturan, M.A. Oturan, Electro-Fenton Process: Background, New Developments, and Applications, Electrochem. Water Wastewater Treat. (2018) 193–221. doi:10.1016/B978-0-12-813160-2.00008-0.
- [273] M. Zhou, M.A. Oturan, I. Sirés, Electro-fenton process : new trends and scale-up, in: Handb. Environ. Chem., Springer Singapore, 2018: p. 430.
- [274] H.J.H. Fenton, Oxidation of tartatic acid in presence of iron, J. Chem. Soc. Trans. 65 (1894) 899–910.
- [275] F. Haber, J. Weiss, P.R.S.L. A, The catalytic decomposition of hydrogen peroxide by iron salts, Proc. R. Soc. London. Ser. A - Math. Phys. Sci. 147 (1934) 332–351. doi:10.1098/rspa.1934.0221.
- [276] J.J. Pignatello, E. Oliveros, A. MacKay, Advanced oxidation processes for organic contaminant destruction based on the fenton reaction and related chemistry, Crit. Rev. Environ. Sci. Technol. 36 (2006) 1–84. doi:10.1080/10643380500326564.
- [277] B. Jain, A. Kumar, S. Hyunook, K. Eric, L. Virender, Treatment of organic pollutants by homogeneous and heterogeneous Fenton reaction processes, Environ. Chem. Lett. (2018). doi:10.1007/s10311-018-0738-3.
- [278] E. Brillas, R.M. Bastida, E. Llosa, J. Casado, Electrochemical destruction of aniline and 4-chloroaniline for wastewater treatment using a carbon-PTFE O2-Fed cathode, J. Electrochem. Soc. 142 (1995) 1733–1741. doi:10.1149/1.2044186.
- [279] M.A. Oturan, J. Pinson, Hydroxylation by electrochemically generated OH• radicals. Mono- and polyhydroxylation of benzoic acid: Products and isomers' distribution, J. Phys. Chem. 99 (1995) 13948– 13954. doi:10.1021/j100038a029.
- [280] M.A. Oturan, An ecologically effective water treatment technique using electrochemically generated hydroxyl radicals for in situ destruction of organic pollutants : Application to herbicide 2, 4-D, (2000) 475–482.
- [281] P.V. Nidheesh, R. Gandhimathi, Trends in electro-Fenton process for water and wastewater treatment: An overview, Desalination. 299 (2012) 1–15. doi:10.1016/j.desal.2012.05.011.
- [282] M.A. Oturan, J. Pinson, J. Bizot, D. Deprez, B. Terlain, Reaction of inflammation inhibitors with chemically and electrochemically generated hydroxyl radicals, J. Electroanal. Chem. 334 (1992) 103–109. doi:10.1016/0022-0728(92)80563-J.
- [283] A. Özcan, Y. Şahin, A. Savaş Koparal, M.A. Oturan, Carbon sponge as a new cathode material for the electro-Fenton process: Comparison with carbon felt cathode and application to degradation of synthetic dye basic

blue 3 in aqueous medium, J. Electroanal. Chem. 616 (2008) 71-78. doi:10.1016/j.jelechem.2008.01.002.

- [284] A. Wang, J. Qu, J. Ru, H. Liu, J. Ge, Mineralization of an azo dye Acid Red 14 by electro-Fenton's reagent using an activated carbon fiber cathode, Dye. Pigment. 65 (2005) 227–233. doi:10.1016/j.dyepig.2004.07.019.
- [285] A. da Pozzo, L. di Palma, C. Merli, E. Petrucci, An experimental comparison of a graphite electrode and a gas diffusion electrode for the cathodic production of hydrogen peroxide, J. Appl. Electrochem. 35 (2005) 413– 419. doi:10.1007/s10800-005-0800-2.
- [286] P.V. Nidheesh, R. Gandhimathi, N.S. Sanjini, NaHCO3 enhanced Rhodamine B removal from aqueous solution by graphite–graphite electro Fenton system, Sep. Purif. Technol. 132 (2014) 568–576. doi:10.1016/j.seppur.2014.06.009.
- [287] J. Fu, X. Zhang, L. Lei, Fe-modified multi-walled carbon nanotube electrode for production of hydrogen peroxide, Acta Phys. - Chim. Sin. 23 (2007) 1157–1162. doi:10.1016/S1872-1508(07)60060-6.
- [288] Y. Wang, H. Zhao, G. Zhao, Highly ordered mesoporous Fe3O4@Carbon embedded composite: High catalytic activity, wide pH range and stability for heterogeneous electro-Fenton, Electroanalysis. 28 (2016) 169–176. doi:10.1002/elan.201500488.
- [289] E. Rosales, G. Buftia, M. Pazos, G. Lazar, M.A. Sanromán, Highly active based iron-carbonaceous cathodes for heterogeneous electro-Fenton process: Application to degradation of parabens, Process Saf. Environ. Prot. 117 (2018) 363–371. doi:10.1016/j.psep.2018.05.014.
- [290] S.O. Ganiyu, T.X. Huong Le, M. Bechelany, N. Oturan, S. Papirio, G. Esposito, E. van Hullebusch, M. Cretin, M.A. Oturan, Electrochemical mineralization of sulfamethoxazole over wide pH range using FeIIFeIII LDH modified carbon felt cathode: Degradation pathway, toxicity and reusability of the modified cathode, Chem. Eng. J. 350 (2018) 844–855. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2018.04.141.
- [291] W. Yang, M. Zhou, N. Oturan, M. Bechelany, M. Cretin, M.A. Oturan, Highly efficient and stable FeIIFeIII LDH carbon felt cathode for removal of pharmaceutical ofloxacin at neutral pH, J. Hazard. Mater. 393 (2020) 122513. doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2020.122513.
- [292] M. Ghasemi, A. Khataee, P. Gholami, R.D.C. Soltani, A. Hassani, Y. Orooji, In-situ electro-generation and activation of hydrogen peroxide using a CuFeNLDH-CNTs modified graphite cathode for degradation of cefazolin, J. Environ. Manage. 267 (2020) 110629. doi:10.1016/j.jenvman.2020.110629.
- [293] M. Ranjbar, N. Majidian, M. Samipourgiri, Heterogeneous electro-Fenton process by MWCNT-Ce/WO3 nanocomposite modified GF cathode for catalytic degradation of BTEX: Process optimization using response surface methodology, Electrocatalysis. 10 (2019) 628–642. doi:10.1007/s12678-019-00550-5.
- [294] X. Mi, J. Han, Y. Sun, Y. Li, W. Hu, S. Zhan, Enhanced catalytic degradation by using RGO-Ce/WO3 nanosheets modified CF as electro-Fenton cathode: Influence factors, reaction mechanism and pathways, J. Hazard. Mater. 367 (2019) 365–374. doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2018.12.074.
- [295] A. Thiam, M. Zhou, E. Brillas, I. Sirés, Two-step mineralization of Tartrazine solutions: Study of parameters and by-products during the coupling of electrocoagulation with electrochemical advanced oxidation processes, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 150–151 (2014) 116–125. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2013.12.011.
- [296] E. Brillas, C.A. Martínez-Huitle, Decontamination of wastewaters containing synthetic organic dyes by electrochemical methods. An updated review, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 166–167 (2015) 603–643. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2014.11.016.
- [297] A. Kraft, Doped diamond: A compact review on a new, versatile electrode material, Int. J. Electrochem. Sci. 2 (2007) 355–385.
- [298] A. Kapalka, H. Baltruschat, C. Comninellis, Electrochemical oxidation of organic compounds induced by electro-generated free hydroxyl radicals on BDD electrodes, in: E. Brillas, C.A. Martinez-Huitle (Eds.), Synth. Diam. Film. Prep. Electrochem. Charact. Appl., Wiley, Hoboken/New Jersey, 2011.
- [299] E. Guivarch, N. Oturan, M.A. Oturan, Removal of organophosphorus pesticides from water by electrogenerated Fenton's reagent, Environ. Chem. Lett. 1 (2003) 165–168. doi:10.1007/s10311-003-0029-4.
- [300] N. Oturan, E.D. Van Hullebusch, H. Zhang, L. Mazeas, H. Budzinski, K. Le Menach, M.A. Oturan, Occurrence and removal of organic micropollutants in landfill leachates treated by electrochemical advanced oxidation processes, Environ. Sci. Technol. 49 (2015) 12187–12196. doi:10.1021/acs.est.5b02809.
- [301] L. Labiadh, M.A. Oturan, M. Panizza, N. Ben Hamadi, S. Ammar, Complete removal of AHPS synthetic dye from water using new electro-fenton oxidation catalyzed by natural pyrite as heterogeneous catalyst, J. Hazard. Mater. 297 (2015) 34–41. doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2015.04.062.
- [302] P. V. Nidheesh, Heterogeneous Fenton catalysts for the abatement of organic pollutants from aqueous solution: A review, RSC Adv. 5 (2015) 40552–40577. doi:10.1039/c5ra02023a.

- [303] N. Barhoumi, N. Oturan, H. Olvera-Vargas, E. Brillas, A. Gadri, S. Ammar, M.A. Oturan, Pyrite as a sustainable catalyst in electro-Fenton process for improving oxidation of sulfamethazine. Kinetics, mechanism and toxicity assessment, Water Res. 94 (2016) 52–61. doi:10.1016/j.watres.2016.02.042.
- [304] H. Jiang, Y. Sun, J. Feng, J. Wang, Heterogeneous electro-Fenton oxidation of azo dye methyl orange catalyzed by magnetic Fe3O4 nanoparticles, Water Sci. Technol. 74 (2016) 1116–1126. doi:10.2166/wst.2016.300.
- [305] Z. Ye, E. Brillas, F. Centellas, P.L. Cabot, I. Sirés, Expanding the application of photoelectro-Fenton treatment to urban wastewater using the Fe(III)-EDDS complex, Water Res. 169 (2020) 115219. doi:10.1016/j.watres.2019.115219.
- [306] A. Lahkimi, M.A. Oturan, N. Oturan, M. Chaouch, Removal of textile dyes from water by the electro-Fenton process, Environ. Chem. Lett. 5 (2007) 35–39. doi:10.1007/s10311-006-0058-x.
- [307] O. Iglesias, J. Gómez, M. Pazos, M.Á. Sanromán, Electro-Fenton oxidation of imidacloprid by Fe alginate gel beads, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 144 (2014) 416–424. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2013.07.046.
- [308] M. Panizza, M.A. Oturan, Degradation of Alizarin Red by electro-Fenton process using a graphite-felt cathode, Electrochim. Acta. 56 (2011) 7084–7087. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2011.05.105.
- [309] M. Diagne, V.K. Sharma, N. Oturan, M.A. Oturan, Depollution of indigo dye by anodic oxidation and electro-Fenton using B-doped diamond anode, Environ. Chem. Lett. 12 (2014) 219–224. doi:10.1007/s10311-013-0437-z.
- [310] E. Brillas, S. Garcia-Segura, Benchmarking recent advances and innovative technology approaches of Fenton, photo-Fenton, electro-Fenton, and related processes: A review on the relevance of phenol as model molecule, Sep. Purif. Technol. 237 (2020) 116337. doi:10.1016/j.seppur.2019.116337.
- [311] S. Garcia-Segura, J. a Garrido, R.M. Rodríguez, P.L. Cabot, F. Centellas, C. Arias, E. Brillas, Mineralization of flumequine in acidic medium by electro-Fenton and photoelectro-Fenton processes., Water Res. 46 (2012) 2067–76. doi:10.1016/j.watres.2012.01.019.
- [312] H. Zazou, N. Oturan, M. Sönmez-Çelebi, M. Hamdani, M.A. Oturan, Mineralization of chlorobenzene in aqueous medium by anodic oxidation and electro-Fenton processes using Pt or BDD anode and carbon felt cathode, J. Electroanal. Chem. 774 (2016) 22–30. doi:10.1016/j.jelechem.2016.04.051.

- [313] H. Monteil, Y. Pechaud, N. Oturan, C. Trellu, M.A. Oturan, Pilot scale continuous reactor for water treatment by electrochemical advanced oxidation processes: Development of a new hydrodynamic / reactive combined model, Chem. Eng. J. 404 (2020) 127048. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2020.127048.
- [314] N. Oturan, J. Wu, H. Zhang, V.K. Sharma, M.A. Oturan, Electrocatalytic destruction of the antibiotic tetracycline in aqueous medium by electrochemical advanced oxidation processes: Effect of electrode materials, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 140–141 (2013) 92–97. doi:http://dx.doi.org/doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2013.03.035.
- [315] E. Mousset, S. Pontvianne, M.-N. Pons, Fate of inorganic nitrogen species under homogeneous Fenton combined with electro-oxidation/reduction treatments in synthetic solutions and reclaimed municipal wastewater, Chemosphere. 201 (2018) 6–12. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2018.02.142.
- [316] E. Mousset, L. Quackenbush, C. Schondek, A. Gerardin-Vergne, S. Pontvianne, S. Kmiotek, M.N. Pons, Effect of homogeneous Fenton combined with electron transfer on the fate of inorganic chlorinated species in synthetic and reclaimed municipal wastewater, Electrochim. Acta. 334 (2020) 135608. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2019.135608.
- [317] E. Mousset, L. Frunzo, G. Esposito, E.D. V Hullebusch, N. Oturan, M.A. Oturan, A complete phenol oxidation pathway obtained during electro-Fenton treatment and validated by a kinetic model study, Appl. Catal. B Environ. (2016). doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2015.06.014.
- [318] A. Kapałka, G. Fóti, C. Comninellis, The importance of electrode material in environmental electrochemistry Formation and reactivity of free hydroxyl radicals on boron-doped diamond electrodes, Electrochim. Acta. 54 (2009) 2018–2023. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2008.06.045.
- [319] J. Radjenovic, D.L. Sedlak, Challenges and opportunities for electrochemical processes as next-generation technologies for the treatment of contaminated water, Environ. Sci. Technol. 49 (2015) 11292–11302. doi:10.1021/acs.est.5b02414.
- [320] P. Cañizares, I.F. De Marcos, M.A. Rodrigo, J. Lobato, Measurement of Mass-Transfer Coefficients by an Electrochemical Technique, J. Chem. Educ. 83 (2006) 1204–1207. doi:10.1021/ed083p1204.
- [321] E. Mousset, M. Puce, M.N. Pons, Advanced electro-oxidation with boron-doped diamond for acetaminophen removal from real wastewater in a microfluidic reactor: Kinetics and mass-transfer studies,

ChemElectroChem. 6 (2019) 2908–2916. doi:10.1002/celc.201900182.

- [322] C. Trellu, C. Coetsier, J.-C. Rouch, R. Esmilaire, M. Rivallin, M. Cretin, C. Causserand, Mineralization of organic pollutants by anodic oxidation using reactive electrochemical membrane synthesized from carbothermal reduction of TiO 2, Water Res. 131 (2018) 310–319. doi:10.1016/j.watres.2017.12.070.
- [323] H. Liu, C.D. Vecitis, Reactive transport mechanism for organic oxidation during electrochemical filtration: Mass-transfer, physical adsorption, and electron-transfer, J. Phys. Chem. C. 116 (2012) 374–383. doi:10.1021/jp209390b.
- [324] J. Yang, J. Wang, J. Jia, Improvement of electrochemical wastewater treatment through mass transfer in a seepage carbon nanotube electrode reactor, Environ. Sci. Technol. 43 (2009) 3796–3802. doi:10.1021/es8034285.
- [325] A.R. Bakr, M.S. Rahaman, Electrochemical efficacy of a carboxylated multiwalled carbon nanotube filter for the removal of ibuprofen from aqueous solutions under acidic conditions, Chemosphere. 153 (2016) 508–520. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2016.03.078.
- [326] W. Duan, A. Ronen, S. Walker, D. Jassby, Polyaniline-coated carbon nanotube ultrafiltration membranes: Enhanced anodic stability for in situ cleaning and electro-oxidation processes, ACS Appl. Mater. Interfaces. 8 (2016) 22574–22584. doi:10.1021/acsami.6b07196.
- [327] G. Zhao, P. Li, F. Nong, M. Li, J. Gao, D. Li, Construction and high performance of a novel modified borondoped diamond film electrode endowed with superior electrocatalysis, J. Phys. Chem. C. 114 (2010) 5906– 5913. doi:10.1021/jp909248w.
- [328] Y. Jiang, Z. Hu, M. Zhou, L. Zhou, B. Xi, Efficient degradation of p-nitrophenol by electro-oxidation on Fe doped Ti/TiO2 nanotube/PbO2 anode, Sep. Purif. Technol. 128 (2014) 67–71. doi:10.1016/j.seppur.2014.03.015.
- [329] Z. Hu, M. Zhou, L. Zhou, Y. Li, C. Zhang, Effect of matrix on the electrochemical characteristics of TiO<sub>2</sub> nanotube array-based PbO<sub>2</sub> electrode for pollutant degradation., Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res. Int. 21 (2014) 8476– 84. doi:10.1007/s11356-014-2792-0.
- [330] X. Guo, D. Li, J. Wan, X. Yu, Preparation and electrochemical property of TiO2/Nano-graphite composite anode for electro-catalytic degradation of ceftriaxone sodium, Electrochim. Acta. 180 (2015) 957–964.

doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2015.09.055.

- [331] Y. Yang, M.R. Hoffmann, Synthesis and stabilization of blue-black TiO2 nanotube arrays for electrochemical oxidant generation and wastewater treatment, Environ. Sci. Technol. 50 (2016) 11888–11894. doi:10.1021/acs.est.6b03540.
- [332] S. Nayak, B.P. Chaplin, Fabrication and characterization of porous, conductive, monolithic Ti4O7 electrodes, Electrochim. Acta. 263 (2018) 299–310. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2018.01.034.
- [333] A.M. Zaky, B.P. Chaplin, Porous substoichiometric TiO2 anodes as reactive electrochemical membranes for water treatment, Environ. Sci. Technol. 47 (2013) 6554–6563. doi:10.1021/es401287e.
- [334] Y. Jing, S. Almassi, S. Mehraeen, R.J. LeSuer, B.P. Chaplin, The roles of oxygen vacancies, electrolyte composition, lattice structure, and doping density on the electrochemical reactivity of Magnéli phase TiO2 anodes, J. Mater. Chem. A. 6 (2018) 23828–23839. doi:10.1039/c8ta03719a.
- [335] R. Salazar, E. Brillas, I. Sirés, Finding the best Fe2+/Cu2+ combination for the solar photoelectro-Fenton treatment of simulated wastewater containing the industrial textile dye Disperse Blue 3, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 115–116 (2012) 107–116. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2011.12.026.
- [336] S. Garcia-Segura, R. Salazar, E. Brillas, Mineralization of phthalic acid by solar photoelectro-Fenton with a stirred boron-doped diamond/air-diffusion tank reactor: Influence of Fe3+ and Cu2+ catalysts and identification of oxidation products, Electrochim. Acta. 113 (2013) 609–619. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2013.09.097.
- [337] S. Garcia-Segura, E. Brillas, Mineralization of the recalcitrant oxalic and oxamic acids by electrochemical advanced oxidation processes using a boron-doped diamond anode., Water Res. 45 (2011) 2975–2984. doi:10.1016/j.watres.2011.03.017.
- [338] S. Garcia-Segura, S. Dosta, J.M. Guilemany, E. Brillas, Solar photoelectrocatalytic degradation of Acid Orange 7 azo dye using a highly stable TiO2 photoanode synthesized by atmospheric plasma spray, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 132–133 (2013) 142–150. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2012.11.037.
- [339] E. Mousset, D.D. Dionysiou, Photoelectrochemical reactors for treatment of water and wastewater: a review, Environ. Chem. Lett. 18 (2020) 1301–1318. doi:10.1007/s10311-020-01014-9.
- [340] R. Oriol, I. Sirés, E. Brillas, A.R. De Andrade, A hybrid photoelectrocatalytic/photoelectro-Fenton treatment

of Indigo Carmine in acidic aqueous solution using TiO2 nanotube arrays as photoanode, J. Electroanal. Chem. 847 (2019) 113088. doi:10.1016/j.jelechem.2019.04.048.

- [341] B.O. Orimolade, B.N. Zwane, B.A. Koiki, L. Tshwenya, G.M. Peleyeju, N. Mabuba, M. Zhou, O.A. Arotiba, Solar photoelectrocatalytic degradation of ciprofloxacin at a FTO/BiVO4/MnO2 anode: Kinetics, intermediate products and degradation pathway studies, J. Environ. Chem. Eng. 8 (2020) 103607. doi:10.1016/j.jece.2019.103607.
- [342] S. Garcia-Segura, E.B. Cavalcanti, E. Brillas, Mineralization of the antibiotic chloramphenicol by solar photoelectro-Fenton. From stirred tank reactor to solar pre-pilot plant., Appl. Catal. B Environ. 144 (2014) 588–598. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2013.07.071.
- [343] C. Espinoza, J. Romero, L. Villegas, L. Cornejo-Ponce, R. Salazar, Mineralization of the textile dye acid yellow 42 by solar photoelectro-Fenton in a lab-pilot plant, J. Hazard. Mater. 319 (2016) 24–33. doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2016.03.003.
- [344] K. Barbari, R. Delimi, Z. Benredjem, S. Saaidia, A. Djemel, T. Chouchane, N. Oturan, M.A. Oturan, Photocatalytically-assisted electrooxidation of herbicide fenuron using a new bifunctional electrode PbO2/SnO2-Sb2O3/Ti//Ti/TiO2, Chemosphere. 203 (2018) 1–10. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2018.03.126.
- [345] I. Sirés, E. Brillas, The use of nanomaterials in electro-Fenton and photoelectro-Fenton processes, in: J. Filip,
  T. Cajthaml, P. Najmanová, M. Černík, R. Zbořil (Eds.), Adv. Nano-Bio Technol. Water Soil Treat., Springer
  International Publishing, 2020: pp. 257–288. doi:https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-29840-1 11.
- [346] M.S. Koo, K. Cho, J. Yoon, W. Choi, Photoelectrochemical degradation of organic compounds coupled with molecular hydrogen generation using electrochromic TiO2 nanotube arrays, Environ. Sci. Technol. 51 (2017) 6590–6598. doi:10.1021/acs.est.7b00774.
- [347] W. Cui, J. He, H. Wang, J. Hu, L. Liu, Y. Liang, Polyaniline hybridization promotes photo-electro-catalytic removal of organic contaminants over 3D network structure of rGH-PANI/TiO2 hydrogel, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 232 (2018) 232–245. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2018.03.069.
- [348] X. Ding, Z. Ai, L. Zhang, A dual-cell wastewater treatment system with combining anodic visible light driven photoelectro-catalytic oxidation and cathodic electro-Fenton oxidation, Sep. Purif. Technol. 125 (2014) 103– 110. doi:10.1016/j.seppur.2014.01.046.

- [349] R. Hernández, I. Olvera-Rodríguez, C. Guzmán, A. Medel, L. Escobar-Alarcón, E. Brillas, I. Sirés, K. Esquivel, Microwave-assisted sol-gel synthesis of an Au-TiO2 photoanode for the advanced oxidation of paracetamol as model pharmaceutical pollutant, Electrochem. Commun. 96 (2018) 42–46. doi:10.1016/j.elecom.2018.09.009.
- [350] M.H. Habibi, N. Talebian, J.H. Choi, Characterization and photocatalytic activity of nanostructured indium tin oxide thin-film electrode for azo-dye degradation, Thin Solid Films. 515 (2006) 1461–1469. doi:10.1016/j.tsf.2006.04.037.
- [351] B. Gao, C. Peng, G.Z. Chen, G. Li Puma, Photo-electro-catalysis enhancement on carbon nanotubes/titanium dioxide (CNTs/TiO2) composite prepared by a novel surfactant wrapping sol-gel method, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 85 (2008) 17–23. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2008.06.027.
- [352] Y. Liu, X. Gan, B. Zhou, B. Xiong, J. Li, C. Dong, J. Bai, W. Cai, Photoelectrocatalytic degradation of tetracycline by highly effective TiO2 nanopore arrays electrode, J. Hazard. Mater. 171 (2009) 678–683. doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2009.06.054.
- [353] X. Zhao, J. Qu, H. Liu, Z. Qiang, R. Liu, C. Hu, Photoelectrochemical degradation of anti-inflammatory pharmaceuticals at Bi2MoO6-boron-doped diamond hybrid electrode under visible light irradiation, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 91 (2009) 539–545. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2009.06.025.
- [354] X. Zhao, H. Liu, J. Qu, Photoelectrocatalytic degradation of organic contaminant at hybrid BDD-ZnWO4 electrode, Catal. Commun. 12 (2010) 76–79. doi:10.1016/j.catcom.2010.08.013.
- [355] T.T. Guaraldo, S.H. Pulcinelli, M.V.B. Zanoni, Influence of particle size on the photoactivity of Ti/TiO2 thin film electrodes, and enhanced photoelectrocatalytic degradation of indigo carmine dye, J. Photochem. Photobiol. A Chem. 217 (2011) 259–266. doi:10.1016/j.jphotochem.2010.10.019.
- [356] L. Li, Z. Zhou, J. Lei, J. He, S. Zhang, F. Pan, Highly ordered anodic TiO 2 nanotube arrays and their stabilities as photo(electro)catalysts, Appl. Surf. Sci. 258 (2012) 3647–3651. doi:10.1016/j.apsusc.2011.11.131.
- [357] T.T. Guaraldo, T.B. Zanoni, S.I.C. de Torresi, V.R. Gonçales, G.J. Zocolo, D.P. Oliveira, M.V.B. Zanoni, On the application of nanostructured electrodes prepared by Ti/TiO2/WO3 "template": A case study of removing toxicity of indigo using visible irradiation, Chemosphere. 91 (2013) 586–593. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2012.12.027.

- [358] X. Cheng, Q. Cheng, X. Deng, P. Wang, H. Liu, A facile and novel strategy to synthesize reduced TiO2 nanotubes photoelectrode for photoelectrocatalytic degradation of diclofenac, Chemosphere. 144 (2016) 888– 894. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2015.09.070.
- [359] C. Fu, M. Li, H. Li, C. Li, X. guo Wu, B. Yang, Fabrication of Au nanoparticle/TiO2hybrid films for photoelectrocatalytic degradation of methyl orange, J. Alloys Compd. 692 (2017) 727–733. doi:10.1016/j.jallcom.2016.09.119.
- [360] E.H. Umukoro, M.G. Peleyeju, J.C. Ngila, O.A. Arotiba, Towards wastewater treatment: Photo-assisted electrochemical degradation of 2-nitrophenol and orange II dye at a tungsten trioxide-exfoliated graphite composite electrode, Chem. Eng. J. 317 (2017) 290–301. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2017.02.084.
- [361] B.A. Koiki, O.A. Arotiba, Cu2O as an emerging semiconductor in photocatalytic and photoelectrocatalytic treatment of water contaminated with organic substances: A review, RSC Adv. 10 (2020) 36514–36525. doi:10.1039/d0ra06858f.
- [362] G.M. Peleyeju, E.H. Umukoro, J.O. Babalola, O.A. Arotiba, Solar-light-responsive titanium-sheet-based carbon nanoparticles/B-BiVO4/WO3 photoanode for the photoelectrocatalytic degradation of Orange II dye water pollutant, ACS Omega. 5 (2020) 4743–4750. doi:10.1021/acsomega.9b02148.
- [363] K. Changanaqui, E. Brillas, H. Alarcón, I. Sirés, ZnO/TiO2/Ag2Se nanostructures as photoelectrocatalysts for the degradation of oxytetracycline in water, Electrochim. Acta. 331 (2020) 135194. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2019.135194.
- [364] B.O. Orimolade, O.A. Arotiba, Towards visible light driven photoelectrocatalysis for water treatment: Application of a FTO/BiVO4/Ag2S heterojunction anode for the removal of emerging pharmaceutical pollutants, Sci. Rep. 10 (2020) 1–13. doi:10.1038/s41598-020-62425-w.
- [365] X. Xu, J. Cai, M. Zhou, X. Du, Y. Zhang, Photoelectrochemical degradation of 2,4-dichlorophenoxyacetic acid using electrochemically self-doped Blue TiO2 nanotube arrays with formic acid as electrolyte, J. Hazard. Mater. 382 (2020) 121096. doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2019.121096.
- [366] J.M. Peralta-Hernández, Y. Meas-Vong, F.J. Rodríguez, T.W. Chapman, M.I. Maldonado, L.A. Godínez, In situ electrochemical and photo-electrochemical generation of the fenton reagent: A potentially important new water treatment technology, Water Res. 40 (2006) 1754–1762. doi:10.1016/j.watres.2006.03.004.

- [367] L.C. Almeida, B.F. Silva, M.V.B. Zanoni, Photoelectrocatalytic/photoelectro-Fenton coupling system using a nanostructured photoanode for the oxidation of a textile dye: Kinetics study and oxidation pathway, Chemosphere. 136 (2015) 63–71. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2015.04.042.
- [368] Q. Zhou, A. Xing, J. Li, D. Zhao, K. Zhao, M. Lei, Synergistic enhancement in photoelectrocatalytic degradation of bisphenol A by CeO2 and reduced graphene oxide co-modified TiO2 nanotube arrays in combination with Fenton oxidation, Electrochim. Acta. 209 (2016) 379–388. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2016.05.094.
- [369] B.O. Orimolade, B.N. Zwane, B.A. Koiki, M. Rivallin, M. Bechelany, N. Mabuba, G. Lesage, M. Cretin, O.A. Arotiba, Coupling cathodic electro-fenton with anodic photo-electrochemical oxidation: A feasibility study on the mineralization of paracetamol, J. Environ. Chem. Eng. 8 (2020) 104394. doi:10.1016/j.jece.2020.104394.
- [370] X. Zhu, J. Ni, Simultaneous processes of electricity generation and p-nitrophenol degradation in a microbial fuel cell, Electrochem. Commun. 11 (2009) 274–277. doi:10.1016/j.elecom.2008.11.023.
- [371] C.-H. Feng, F. Li, H.-J. Mai, X. Li, Bio-electro-Fenton process driven by microbial fuel cell for wastewater treatment, Environ. Sci. Technol. 44 (2010) 1875–1880. doi:10.1021/es9032925.
- [372] C. Feng, F. Li, H. Liu, X. Lang, S. Fan, A dual-chamber microbial fuel cell with conductive film-modified anode and cathode and its application for the neutral electro-Fenton process, Electrochim. Acta. 55 (2010) 2048–2054. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2009.11.033.
- [373] N. Oturan, S. Trajkovska, M.A. Oturan, M. Couderchet, J.-J. Aaron, Study of the toxicity of diuron and its metabolites formed in aqueous medium during application of the electrochemical advanced oxidation process "electro-Fenton," Chemosphere. 73 (2008) 1550–1556. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2008.07.082.
- [374] O. Ganzenko, D. Huguenot, E.D. van Hullebusch, G. Esposito, M.A. Oturan, Electrochemical advanced oxidation and biological processes for wastewater treatment: a review of the combined approaches., Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res. Int. 21 (2014) 8493–524. doi:10.1007/s11356-014-2770-6.
- [375] H. Olvera-Vargas, N. Oturan, D. Buisson, M.A. Oturan, A coupled Bio-EF process for mineralization of the pharmaceuticals furosemide and ranitidine: Feasibility assessment, Chemosphere. 155 (2016) 606–613. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2016.04.091.
- [376] H. Olvera-Vargas, T. Cocerva, N. Oturan, D. Buisson, M.A. Oturan, Bioelectro-Fenton: A sustainable

integrated process for removal of organic pollutants from water: Application to mineralization of metoprolol, J. Hazard. Mater. 319 (2016) 13–23. doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2015.12.010.

- [377] I. Oller, S. Malato, J.A. Sánchez-Pérez, Combination of advanced oxidation processes and biological treatments for wastewater decontamination-A review., Sci. Total Environ. 409 (2011) 4141–4166. doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2010.08.061.
- [378] F. Ferrag-Siagh, F. Fourcade, I. Soutrel, H. Aït-Amar, H. Djelal, A. Amrane, Electro-Fenton pretreatment for the improvement of tylosin biodegradability., Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res. Int. 21 (2014) 8534–42. doi:10.1007/s11356-014-2771-5.
- [379] C. Trellu, O. Ganzenko, S. Papirio, Y. Pechaud, N. Oturan, D. Huguenot, E.D. van Hullebusch, G. Esposito, M.A. Oturan, Combination of anodic oxidation and biological treatment for the removal of phenanthrene and Tween 80 from soil washing solution, Chem. Eng. J. 306 (2016) 588–596. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2016.07.108.
- [380] O. Ganzenko, C. Trellu, S. Papirio, N. Oturan, D. Huguenot, E.D. van Hullebusch, G. Esposito, M.A. Oturan, Bioelectro-Fenton: evaluation of a combined biological—advanced oxidation treatment for pharmaceutical wastewater, Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res. 25 (2018) 20283–20292. doi:10.1007/s11356-017-8450-6.
- [381] A. Dirany, I. Sirés, N. Oturan, A. Özcan, M.A. Oturan, Electrochemical treatment of the antibiotic sulfachloropyridazine: Kinetics, reaction pathways, and toxicity evolution, Environ. Sci. Technol. 46 (2012) 4074–4082. doi:10.1021/es204621q.
- [382] E. Mousset, Z. Wang, H. Olvera-Vargas, O. Lefebvre, Advanced electrocatalytic pre-treatment to improve the biodegradability of real wastewater from the electronics industry — A detailed investigation study, J. Hazard. Mater. 360 (2018) 552–559. doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2018.08.023.
- [383] D. Mansour, F. Fourcade, I. Soutrel, D. Hauchard, N. Bellakhal, A. Amrane, Mineralization of synthetic and industrial pharmaceutical effluent containing trimethoprim by combining electro-Fenton and activated sludge treatment, J. Taiwan Inst. Chem. Eng. 53 (2015) 58–67. doi:10.1016/j.jtice.2015.02.022.
- [384] M. Arellano, N. Oturan, M. Pazos, M. Ángeles Sanromán, M.A. Oturan, Coupling electro-Fenton process to a biological treatment, a new methodology for the removal of ionic liquids?, Sep. Purif. Technol. 233 (2020) 115990. doi:10.1016/j.seppur.2019.115990.
- [385] M.A. Oturan, I. Sirés, N. Oturan, S. Pérocheau, J.-L. Laborde, S. Trévin, Sonoelectro-Fenton process: A novel

hybrid technique for the destruction of organic pollutants in water, J. Electroanal. Chem. (2008) 329-332.

- [386] H. Li, H. Lei, Q. Yu, Z. Li, X. Feng, B. Yang, Effect of low frequency ultrasonic irradiation on the sonoelectro-Fenton degradation of cationic red X-GRL, Chem. Eng. J. 160 (2010) 417–422. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2010.03.027.
- [387] A. Babuponnusami, K. Muthukumar, Advanced oxidation of phenol: A comparison between Fenton, electro-Fenton, sono-electro-Fenton and photo-electro-Fenton processes, Chem. Eng. J. 183 (2012) 1–9. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2011.12.010.
- [388] P. V. Nidheesh, M. Zhou, M.A. Oturan, An overview on the removal of synthetic dyes from water by electrochemical advanced oxidation processes, Chemosphere. 197 (2018) 210–227. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2017.12.195.
- [389] J. Casado, Towards industrial implementation of electro-Fenton and derived technologies for wastewater treatment: A review, J. Environ. Chem. Eng. 7 (2019) 102823. doi:10.1016/j.jece.2018.102823.
- [390] S.S. Martínez, E.V. Uribe, Enhanced sonochemical degradation of azure B dye by the electro-Fenton process, Ultrason. Sonochem. 19 (2012) 174–178. doi:10.1016/j.ultsonch.2011.05.013.
- [391] M. Lounis, M.E. Samar, O. Hamdaoui, Sono-electrochemical degradation of Orange G in pure water, natural water, and seawater: effect of operating parameters, Desalin. Water Treat. 57 (2016) 22533–22542. doi:10.1080/19443994.2015.1129513.
- [392] W.S. Chen, C.P. Huang, Decomposition of nitrotoluenes in wastewater by sonoelectrochemical and sonoelectro-Fenton oxidation, Ultrason. Sonochem. 21 (2014) 840–845. doi:10.1016/j.ultsonch.2013.10.026.
- [393] R. Nazari, L. Rajic, Y. Xue, W. Zhou, A.N. Alshawabkeh, Degradation of 4-chlorophenol in aqueous solution by sono-electro-Fenton process, Int. J. Electrochem. Sci. 13 (2018) 9214–9230. doi:10.20964/2018.09.46.
- [394] S. Ammar, M.A. Oturan, L. Labiadh, A. Guersalli, R. Abdelhedi, N. Oturan, E. Brillas, Degradation of tyrosol by a novel electro-Fenton process using pyrite as heterogeneous source of iron catalyst, Water Res. 74 (2015) 77–87. doi:10.1016/j.watres.2015.02.006.
- [395] N. Barhoumi, L. Labiadh, M.A. Oturan, N. Oturan, A. Gadri, S. Ammar, E. Brillas, Electrochemical mineralization of the antibiotic levofloxacin by electro-Fenton-pyrite process, Chemosphere. 141 (2015) 250– 257. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2015.08.003.
- [396] N. Barhoumi, H. Olvera-Vargas, N. Oturan, D. Huguenot, A. Gadri, S. Ammar, E. Brillas, M.A. Oturan,

Kinetics of oxidative degradation/mineralization pathways of the antibiotic tetracycline by the novel heterogeneous electro-Fenton process with solid catalyst chalcopyrite, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 209 (2017) 637–647. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2017.03.034.

- [397] N. Barhoumi, N. Oturan, S. Ammar, A. Gadri, M.A. Oturan, E. Brillas, Enhanced degradation of the antibiotic tetracycline by heterogeneous electro-Fenton with pyrite catalysis, Environ. Chem. Lett. 15 (2017) 689–693. doi:10.1007/s10311-017-0638-y.
- [398] I. Ouiriemmi, A. Karrab, N. Oturan, M. Pazos, E. Rozales, A. Gadri, M.Á. Sanromán, S. Ammar, M.A. Oturan, Heterogeneous electro-Fenton using natural pyrite as solid catalyst for oxidative degradation of vanillic acid, J. Electroanal. Chem. 797 (2017) 69–77. doi:10.1016/j.jelechem.2017.05.028.
- [399] E. Brillas, R. Sauleda, J. Casado, Peroxi-coagulation of Aniline in Acidic Medium Using an Oxygen Diffusion Cathode, J. Electrochem. Soc. 144 (1997) 2374. doi:10.1149/1.1837821.
- [400] E. Brillas, J. Casado, Aniline degradation by electro-Fenton® and peroxi-coagulation processes using a flow reactor for wastewater treatment, Chemosphere. 47 (2002) 241–248. doi:10.1016/S0045-6535(01)00221-1.
- [401] E. Brillas, B. Boye, M.M. Dieng, Peroxi-coagulation and photoperoxi-coagulation treatments of the herbicide
  4-chlorophenoxyacetic acid in aqueous medium using an oxygen-diffusion cathode, J. Electrochem. Soc. 150
  (2003) E148–E154. doi:10.1149/1.1543950.
- [402] M. Zarei, D. Salari, A. Niaei, A. Khataee, Peroxi-coagulation degradation of C.I. Basic Yellow 2 based on carbon-PTFE and carbon nanotube-PTFE electrodes as cathode, Electrochim. Acta. 54 (2009) 6651–6660. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2009.06.060.
- [403] S. Vasudevan, An efficient removal of phenol from water by peroxi-electrocoagulation processes, J. Water Process Eng. 2 (2014) 53–57. doi:10.1016/j.jwpe.2014.05.002.
- [404] I.K. Paton, M. Lemon, B. Freeman, J.D. Newman, Electrochemical peroxidation of contaminated aqueous leachate, J. Appl. Electrochem. 39 (2009) 2593–2596. doi:10.1007/s10800-009-9935-x.
- [405] B. Boye, E. Brillas, M.M. Dieng, Electrochemical degradation of the herbicide 4-chloro-2methylphenoxyacetic acid in aqueous medium by peroxi-coagulation and photoperoxi-coagulation, J. Electroanal. Chem. 540 (2003) 25–34. doi:10.1016/S0022-0728(02)01271-8.
- [406] B. Boye, M. Marième Dieng, E. Brillas, Electrochemical degradation of 2,4,5-trichlorophenoxyacetic acid in

aqueous medium by peroxi-coagulation. Effect of pH and UV light, Electrochim. Acta. 48 (2003) 781–790. doi:10.1016/S0013-4686(02)00747-8.

- [407] L.M. Ortega, R. Lebrun, J.F. Blais, R. Hausler, P. Drogui, Effectiveness of soil washing, nanofiltration and electrochemical treatment for the recovery of metal ions coming from a contaminated soil, Water Res. 42 (2008) 1943–1952. doi:10.1016/j.watres.2007.11.025.
- [408] P. V. Nidheesh, R. Gandhimathi, Effect of solution pH on the performance of three electrolytic advanced oxidation processes for the treatment of textile wastewater and sludge characteristics, RSC Adv. 4 (2014) 27946–27954. doi:10.1039/c4ra02958e.
- [409] D. Venu, R. Gandhimathi, P. V. Nidheesh, S.T. Ramesh, Effect of solution pH on leachate treatment mechanism of peroxicoagulation process, J. Hazardous, Toxic, Radioact. Waste. 20 (2016) 06016001. doi:10.1061/(asce)hz.2153-5515.0000315.
- [410] C. Lizama-Bahena, A. Álvarez-Gallegos, J.A. Hernandez, S. Silva-Martinez, Elimination of bio-refractory chlorinated herbicides like atrazine, alachlor, and chlorbromuron from aqueous effluents by Fenton, electro-Fenton, and peroxi-coagulation methods, Desalin. Water Treat. 55 (2015) 3683–3693. doi:10.1080/19443994.2014.939858.
- [411] A. Kumar, P. V. Nidheesh, M. Suresh Kumar, Composite wastewater treatment by aerated electrocoagulation and modified peroxi-coagulation processes, Chemosphere. 205 (2018) 587–593. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2018.04.141.
- [412] G. Ren, M. Zhou, Q. Zhang, X. Xu, Y. Li, P. Su, M. Paidar, K. Bouzek, Cost-efficient improvement of coking wastewater biodegradability by multi-stages flow through peroxi-coagulation under low current load, Water Res. 154 (2019) 336–348. doi:10.1016/j.watres.2019.02.013.
- [413] X. Zhou, Z. Hou, L. Lv, J. Song, Z. Yin, Electro-Fenton with peroxi-coagulation as a feasible pre-treatment for high-strength refractory coke plant wastewater: Parameters optimization, removal behavior and kinetics analysis, Chemosphere. 238 (2020) 124649. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2019.124649.
- [414] T.Y. Nayir, O. Dinc, S. Kara, A. Akyol, A. Dimoglo, Laundry wastewater treatment by peroxi-coagulation, Desalin. Water Treat. 182 (2020) 98–108. doi:10.5004/dwt.2020.25188.
- [415] C. Trellu, N. Oturan, F.K. Keita, C. Fourdrin, Y. Pechaud, M.A. Oturan, Regeneration of activated carbon

fiber by the electro-Fenton process, Environ. Sci. Technol. 52 (2018) 7450–7457. doi:10.1021/acs.est.8b01554.

- [416] J. a Bañuelos, F.J. Rodríguez, J. Manríquez Rocha, E. Bustos, A. Rodríguez, J.C. Cruz, L.G. Arriaga, L. a Godínez, Novel electro-Fenton approach for regeneration of activated carbon, Environ. Sci. Technol. 47 (2013) 7927–7933. doi:10.1021/es401320e.
- [417] I. Bouaziz, C. Chiron, R. Abdelhedi, A. Savall, K. Groenen Serrano, Treatment of dilute methylene bluecontaining wastewater by coupling sawdust adsorption and electrochemical regeneration, Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res. 21 (2014) 8565–8572. doi:10.1007/s11356-014-2785-z.
- [418] M. Muñoz-Morales, C. Sáez, P. Cañizares, M.A. Rodrigo, Improvement of electrochemical oxidation efficiency through combination with adsorption processes, J. Environ. Manage. 262 (2020). doi:10.1016/j.jenvman.2020.110364.
- [419] Y. Lan, C. Coetsier, C. Causserand, K.G. Serrano, Feasibility of micropollutants treatment by coupling nanofiltration and electrochemical oxidation: Case of hospital wastewater, Int. J. Chem. React. Eng. 13 (2015) 153–159. doi:10.1515/ijcre-2014-0136.
- [420] C. von Sonntag, U. von Gunten, Chemistry of ozone in water and wastewater treatment: From basic principles to applications, IWA Publishing, London, 2012. doi:10.2166/9781780400839.
- [421] C. Qu, S. Lu, D. Liang, S. Chen, Y. Xiang, S. Zhang, Simultaneous electro-oxidation and in situ electroperoxone process for the degradation of refractory organics in wastewater, J. Hazard. Mater. 364 (2019) 468– 474. doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2018.10.073.
- [422] Y. Wang, G. Yu, S. Deng, J. Huang, B. Wang, The electro-peroxone process for the abatement of emerging contaminants: Mechanisms, recent advances, and prospects, Chemosphere. 208 (2018) 640–654. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2018.05.095.
- [423] H. Wang, J. Zhan, W. Yao, B. Wang, S. Deng, J. Huang, G. Yu, Y. Wang, Comparison of pharmaceutical abatement in various water matrices by conventional ozonation, peroxone (O3/H2O2), and an electroperoxone process, Water Res. 130 (2018) 127–138. doi:10.1016/j.watres.2017.11.054.
- [424] S. Yuan, Z. Li, Y. Wang, Effective degradation of methylene blue by a novel electrochemically driven process,
  Electrochem. Commun. 29 (2013) 48–51. doi:10.1016/j.elecom.2013.01.012.

- [425] Y.J. Wang, The electro-peroxone technology as a promising advanced oxidation process for water and wastewater, in: M. Zhou, M.A. Oturan, I. Sirés (Eds.), Electro-Fent. Process New Trends Scale-Up, Springer, 2018.
- [426] N. Kishimoto, Y. Morita, H. Tsuno, T. Oomura, H. Mizutani, Advanced oxidation effect of ozonation combined with electrolysis, Water Res. 39 (2005) 4661–4672. doi:10.1016/j.watres.2005.09.001.
- [427] B. Yang, J. Deng, G. Yu, S. Deng, J. Li, C. Zhu, Q. Zhuo, H. Duan, T. Guo, Effective degradation of carbamazepine using a novel electro-peroxone process involving simultaneous electrochemical generation of ozone and hydrogen peroxide, Electrochem. Commun. 86 (2018) 26–29. doi:10.1016/j.elecom.2017.11.003.
- [428] H.S. Zheng, W.Q. Guo, Q.L. Wu, N.Q. Ren, J.S. Chang, Electro-peroxone pretreatment for enhanced simulated hospital wastewater treatment and antibiotic resistance genes reduction, Environ. Int. 115 (2018) 70–78. doi:10.1016/j.envint.2018.02.043.
- [429] M. Ghalebizade, B. Ayati, Acid Orange 7 treatment and fate by electro-peroxone process using novel electrode arrangement, Chemosphere. 235 (2019) 1007–1014. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2019.06.211.
- [430] O.M. Cornejo, J.L. Nava, Mineralization of the antibiotic levofloxacin by the electro-peroxone process using a filter-press flow cell with a 3D air-diffusion electrode, Sep. Purif. Technol. 254 (2021) 117661. doi:10.1016/j.seppur.2020.117661.
- [431] Y. Zhang, S. Zuo, Y. Zhang, M. Li, J. Cai, M. Zhou, Disinfection of simulated ballast water by a flow-through electro-peroxone process, Chem. Eng. J. 348 (2018) 485–493. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2018.04.123.
- [432] Y. Zhang, S. Zuo, Y. Zhang, G. Ren, Y. Pan, Q. Zhang, M. Zhou, Simultaneous removal of tetracycline and disinfection by a flow-through electro-peroxone process for reclamation from municipal secondary effluent, J. Hazard. Mater. 368 (2019) 771–777. doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2019.02.005.
- [433] H.W. Kim, V.J. Bukas, H. Park, S. Park, K.M. Diederichsen, J. Lim, Y.H. Cho, J. Kim, W. Kim, T.H. Han, J. Voss, A.C. Luntz, B.D. McCloskey, Mechanisms of two-electron and four-electron electrochemical oxygen reduction reactions at nitrogen-doped reduced graphene oxide, ACS Catal. 10 (2020) 852–863. doi:10.1021/acscatal.9b04106.
- [434] J. Cai, M. Zhou, W. Yang, Y. Pan, X. Lu, K.G. Serrano, Degradation and mechanism of 2,4dichlorophenoxyacetic acid (2,4-D) by thermally activated persulfate oxidation, Chemosphere. 212 (2018)

784-793. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2018.08.127.

- [435] Y.F. Rao, W. Chu, Y.R. Wang, Photocatalytic oxidation of carbamazepine in triclinic-WO3 suspension: Role of alcohol and sulfate radicals in the degradation pathway, Appl. Catal. A Gen. 468 (2013) 240–249. doi:10.1016/j.apcata.2013.08.050.
- [436] Z. Liu, S. Yang, Y. Yuan, J. Xu, Y. Zhu, J. Li, F. Wu, A novel heterogeneous system for sulfate radical generation through sulfite activation on a CoFe2O4 nanocatalyst surface, J. Hazard. Mater. 324 (2017) 583– 592. doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2016.11.029.
- [437] H. Song, L. Yan, J. Ma, J. Jiang, G. Cai, W. Zhang, Z. Zhang, J. Zhang, T. Yang, Nonradical oxidation from electrochemical activation of peroxydisulfate at Ti/Pt anode: Efficiency, mechanism and influencing factors, Water Res. 116 (2017) 182–193. doi:10.1016/j.watres.2017.03.035.
- [438] L. Liang, M. Zhou, X. Lu, P. Su, J. Sun, High-efficiency electrogeneration of hydrogen peroxide from oxygen reduction by carbon xerogels derived from glucose, Electrochim. Acta. 320 (2019) 134569. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2019.134569.
- [439] L. Xu, G. Liang, M. Yin, A promising electrode material modified by Nb-doped TiO2 nanotubes for electrochemical degradation of AR 73, Chemosphere. 173 (2017) 425–434. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2017.01.077.
- [440] X. Li, H. Xu, W. Yan, Effects of twelve sodium dodecyl sulfate (SDS) on electro-catalytic performance and stability of PbO2 electrode, J. Alloys Compd. 718 (2017) 386–395. doi:10.1016/j.jallcom.2017.05.147.
- [441] Y. Yang, L.C. Kao, Y. Liu, K. Sun, H. Yu, J. Guo, S.Y.H. Liou, M.R. Hoffmann, Cobalt-doped black TiO2 nanotube array as a stable anode for oxygen evolution and electrochemical wastewater treatment, ACS Catal. 8 (2018) 4278–4287. doi:10.1021/acscatal.7b04340.