

# Non-precious Co3O4-TiO2/Ti cathode based electrocatalytic nitrate reduction: Preparation, performance and mechanism

J. N. Gao, B. Jiang, C. C. Ni, Y. F. Qi, Y. Q. Zhang, Nihal Oturan, Mehmet

A. Oturan

## ► To cite this version:

J. N. Gao, B. Jiang, C. C. Ni, Y. F. Qi, Y. Q. Zhang, et al.. Non-precious Co3O4-TiO2/Ti cathode based electrocatalytic nitrate reduction: Preparation, performance and mechanism. Applied Catalysis B: Environmental, 2019, 254, pp.391-402. 10.1016/j.apcatb.2019.05.016 . hal-03254305

# HAL Id: hal-03254305 https://hal.science/hal-03254305v1

Submitted on 22 Oct 2021

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution - NonCommercial 4.0 International License

# Non-precious Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode based electrocatalytic nitrate reduction: Preparation, performance and mechanism

Jianan Gao<sup>1</sup>, Bo Jiang<sup>1,2,\*</sup>, Congcong Ni<sup>1</sup>, Yuanfeng Qi<sup>1</sup>, Yanqing Zhang<sup>1</sup>, Nihal Oturan<sup>2</sup>, Mehmet A.

Oturan<sup>2,\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup> School of Environmental and Municipal Engineering, Qingdao University of Technology, Qingdao 266033, P.R. China;

<sup>2</sup> Université Paris-Est, Laboratoire Géomatériaux et Environnement, (EA 4508), UPEM, 5 Bd Descartes, Université Paris-Est, 77454 Marne-la-Vallée, Cedex 2, France.

\* Corresponding author:

bjiang86upc@163.com (Bo Jiang)

Mehmet.Oturan@univ-paris-est.fr (Mehmet A. Oturan)

#### 1 Abstract

2 The presence of high nitrate  $(NO_3)$  concentration in natural water constitutes a serious issue to the environment and human health. Therefore, the development of low-cost, stable non-precious metal 3 4 catalysts is imminent for efficient NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction. In this study, we prepared a Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode via combining sol-gel and calcination methods and evaluated its performance for 5 6 electrocatalytic NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction. The dispersion of the Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> catalyst particles was improved by the addition of PVP to the coating liquid. The presence of anatase could effectively stabilize Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> and 7 prevent the releasing of toxic Co ions into the solution. The Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode with the 8 9 optimized performance for NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction could be prepared by four times coating at calcination 10 temperature of 500 °C. The electrocatalytic reduction of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> was negligibly impacted by solution 11 pH in the range of 3.0-9.0, while it could be facilitated by elevating the current density from 2.5 to 25 mA cm<sup>2</sup>. Ammonium ions were the main final NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction product, and the presence of Cl<sup>-</sup> 12 was capable to oxidize ammonium ions to N2 due to the electrochemical production of reactive 13 chlorine species. The electrochemical analyses, scavenging experiments and density functional 14 theory calculations collectively confirm that  $NO_3^-$  reduction was mainly induced by the 15  $Co^{2+}-Co^{3+}-Co^{2+}$  redox process instead of being directly resulted from the electrons generated at the 16 cathode. Unlike noble metal (e.g., Pd and Ag) based catalytic reaction systems, in the present Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> 17 18 mediated electrocatalytic reaction process, atomic H\* would more favorably turn to H<sub>2</sub> by Heyrovsky and Tafel routes and therefore contributed marginally to the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction. Generally, 19 20 this study provided a new paradigm for designing the stable and cost-effective cathode for  $NO_3^{-1}$ reduction. 21

22

23 **Keywords:** Nitrate reduction; Electrocatalysis;  $Co_3O_4$ -Ti $O_2$ /Ti cathode;  $Co^{3+}/Co^{2+}$  redox couple;

24 Non-precious catalyst

25

#### 26 **1. Introduction**

In water, nitrate  $(NO_3)$  is considered an underlying hazardous material that is derived from 27 28 various sources including the feedlot runoff, the excessive use of nitrogen fertilizer and natural degradation of pollutants [1]. The presence of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> in drinking water can cause serious health 29 problems such as the cancers, liver damage and blue baby syndrome due to its transformation 30 product, i.e. nitrite anions  $(NO_2)$  [2]. To diminish this potential health risk, the concentration limit 31 for NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> in drinking water is set at 10 and 11.3 ppm by the United States EPA and the European 32 Drinking Water Directive, respectively [3,4]. In this regard, the removal technologies of  $NO_3^-$  are 33 34 imperious demands in populated regions.

Physicochemical treatments such as electrodialysis, ion exchange and reverse osmosis are the 35 most common technologies for NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> removal from water [5], but the post-treatments are still needed 36 37 to address the concentrated solutions produced in these methods. Although biological denitrification can gradually convert  $NO_3^{-1}$  to  $N_2$  [6], it is a time-consuming process and its performance is strongly 38 impacted by the variable conditions, such as dissolved oxygen and temperature. Recently, zero valent 39 metals (e.g. iron [7], aluminum [8], and magnesium [9]) based stoichiometrically chemical reduction 40 of  $NO_3^-$  has been increasingly explored. Unfortunately, the flexibility of this strategy is greatly 41 confined by the formation of inert oxide surface, deteriorating the electron transfer efficiency, and 42 the inevitable production of secondary solid sludge. More recently, some catalytic hydrogenation 43 processes with the combined noble/promoting metals (e.g., Pd/Cu and Pd/Fe) have been proposed for 44  $NO_3^-$  reduction [10,11]. In these processes, the reduction of  $NO_3^-$  is mainly initiated by promoter 45 metal (Eq. (1)) with the formation of  $NO_2^-$ , and the subsequent reduction process is gradually 46 47 achieved by the noble metal activated hydrogen (Eq. (2)) [12]. However, catalytic hydrogenation 48 reduction requires H<sub>2</sub> as a reducing agent or electron donor, and there are safety hazards in the 49 transport and use of H<sub>2</sub>, which greatly limits its industrial application potential [13].

50 
$$\operatorname{NO_3}^- + 2M[] \rightarrow [M_2O]_{\operatorname{surf}} + \operatorname{NO_2}^-$$

$$H_2 + 2Pd[] \rightarrow 2Pd[H] \tag{2}$$

(1)

Considering the advantages of self-produced hydrogen, environmental compatibility and 52 ambient operating conditions, electrocatalysis has been regarded as a promising method for 53 denitrification [14], in which the reduction of  $NO_3^-$  can be obtained by either a direct or an indirect 54 pathway at the cathode surface. Direct reduction of  $NO_3^-$  is initiated by the electron tunneling or 55 56 generation of chemisorbed complex between the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and cathode whereas in the indirect pathway,  $NO_3^-$  is reduced by a surface-adsorbed atom H<sup>\*</sup>, which is produced from the reduction of protons by 57 electron via the Volmer process [15]. Specially, Pd-based catalysts have recently been distinguished 58 59 mainly because of their potential to electrochemically reduce oxyanion contaminants in water in which the indirect reduction mediated by atomic H<sup>\*</sup> plays a leading role compared to the direct 60 electron transfer from the cathode to  $NO_3^{-}$  [16]. Nevertheless, considering the extremely expensive 61 price of Pd, the research significance of the Pd-based catalyst is obviously theoretical but not 62 practical. Additionally, despite the fact that the indirect reduction mechanism of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> has been well 63 explored in electrochemical noble metal-based process, the targeted strategies to develop some 64 specific catalysts for the direct reduction of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> is sparsely reported. 65

The cost-effective cobalt oxide ( $Co_3O_4$ ) is a typical p-type metal oxide, which exhibits a normal spinel structure with  $Co^{2+}$  ions in tetrahedral interstices and  $Co^{3+}$  ions in octahedral interstices. During the recent decades,  $Co_3O_4$  has been demonstrated to own strong catalytic reduction activity and thus extensively used in electrochemical hydrogen evolution reaction [17] and

reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> [18] and NO<sub>x</sub> [19]. Recently, Su et al. [20] reported that the pure Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> loaded 70 onto the titanium substrate by thermal sintering could also electrocatalytically reduce NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> in the 71 water. However, the Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-mediated electrochemical mechanism of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction has remained 72 unclear. Moreover, it is known that the biologically toxic cobalt ion probably causes human 73 carcinogen, and the discharge standard of cobalt ions in industrial wastewater is 1 mg L<sup>-1</sup> based on 7475 GB/T 25467-2010 of China. Therefore, efforts should be made to improve the stability of the cobalt-based catalyst and prevent its leaching from the substrate and leaking into the water. To this 76 end, we prepared a novel cathode, Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti, by combining sol-gel and calcination methods, 77 78 which seems to be promising for remarkably facilitate the electrocatalytic reduction of  $NO_3^-$ . The effects of electrode preparation factors (calcination temperature and coating times) and operation 79 parameters (pH, current density and chloride ions concentration) on NO3<sup>-</sup> reduction were also 80 81 investigated. In addition, based on the characterization of the prepared catalysts using XRD, SEM, HRTEM, EDS elemental mapping and XPS, we tried to relate the results to the catalytic activity. 82 Furthermore, electrochemical analyses, radical scavenging experiments and density functional theory 83 84 calculations were utilized to inspect the possible  $NO_3^-$  reduction mechanisms.

85

#### 86 2. Experimental section

#### 87 **2.1. Reagents and materials**

Titanium (Ti) plate (99.99% purity, thickness 1.0 mm) and IrO<sub>2</sub>-RuO<sub>2</sub>/Ti plate were purchased from Yunxuan Metallic Materials Co. Ltd. Potassium iodide (KI, >99%), mercuric iodide red (HgI<sub>2</sub>, > 90 99.5%), potassium sodium tartrate tetrahydrate (NaKC<sub>4</sub>H<sub>4</sub>O<sub>6</sub>·4H<sub>2</sub>O, > 99%), sulfamic acid 91 (NH<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>3</sub>H, > 99%), sulfanilamide (C<sub>6</sub>H<sub>8</sub>N<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>S, > 99%), titanium butoxide (C<sub>16</sub>H<sub>36</sub>O<sub>4</sub>Ti), cobalt

hexahydrate ( $Co(NO_3)_2 \cdot 6H_2O_1 > 99\%$ ), sodium chloride (NaCl, > 99.5%), sodium pyrophosphate 92 (Na<sub>4</sub>P<sub>2</sub>O<sub>7</sub>, > 99%), cobaltic oxide (Co<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>, > 99%), sodium acetate (C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>3</sub>NaO<sub>2</sub>, > 99%), ethanol 93 (95%), hexadecyl trimethyl ammonium bromide ( $C_{19}H_{42}BrN$ , TBA, > 99%), polyvinyl pyrrolidone 94 K30 (( $C_6H_9NO$ )<sub>n</sub>, PVP), ammonium chloride (NH<sub>4</sub>Cl, 99.8%), potassium nitrate (KNO<sub>3</sub>, > 99.5%), 95 96 sodium nitrite (NaNO<sub>3</sub>, > 99%), H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> (95%–98%), HCl (36%-38%), NaOH (>96%) were provided 97 by Sinopharm Chemical Reagent Co. Ltd., China. All the reagents were analytical grade and used without further purification. All working solutions were prepared using ultrapure water (18.2 M $\Omega$  cm 98 resistivity). The experiments were done triplicate. 99

#### 100 **2.2. Preparation of the working cathode**

The substrate of electrode was Ti plate with size of  $2.5 \times 5.0$  cm. The Ti plate was first 101 102 polished with 300-mesh emery paper and then boiled in 20% sulfuric acid for 40 min. Next, the Ti 103 plate was cleaned by ultrapure water, sonicated for 15 min, and dried for use. To synthesize the typical Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode, 0.5 mL titanium butoxide, 0.1 mL hydrochloric acid and 0.15 mL 104 ultrapure water were dissolved in 8.5 mL ethyl alcohol. Then, 0.5 g PVP was added and stirred 105 106 vigorously for 0.5 h. Subsequently, 2.69 g Co(NO<sub>3</sub>)<sub>2</sub>•6H<sub>2</sub>O (1 M) was added and stirred to obtain a 107 purplish red liquid. The prepared sol-gel was pasted to the both faces of the pretreated Ti plates using a brush. The painted Ti plate was dried at 100 °C for 10 min. Then it was sintered at 500 °C for 2 h in 108 109 a muffle oven to remove all organic substances with the formation of the oxide. The above 110 procedures were repeated 4 times and the electrode films were annealed for 6 h at 500 °C in the last time. Other different kinds of cathodes were prepared with the same process with that for the 111 112 Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti (without PVP) cathode. Furthermore, the coating times (2, 4, 6 and 8) and the calcination temperatures (300 °C, 400 °C, 500 °C, 600 °C and 700 °C) were adjusted to optimize the 113

114 preparation factors.

#### 115 **2.3. Electrocatalytic reduction of NO3**<sup>-</sup>

A DC potentiostat (GPS-3030D, Gwinstek, China) was utilized as the power supply for 116 electrochemical experiments. The electrocatalytic NO3<sup>-</sup> reduction experiments were carried out in a 117 150 mL electrolytic cell at room temperature (25 °C). If not specially mentioned, the volume of the 118 working solution was 100 mL, NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentration was 50 mg L<sup>-1</sup>, and 0.1 M Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> was used as 119 120 supporting electrolyte to maintain the conductivity of the solution. The solution pH was adjusted using concentrated NaOH and H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>. The 12.5 cm<sup>2</sup> Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>-PVP electrodes were used as 121 cathode and 12.5 cm<sup>2</sup> IrO<sub>2</sub>-RuO<sub>2</sub>/Ti electrodes were used as anode. The distance between the 122 electrodes was 2 cm. The typical electrochemical experiment was conducted at current density of 10 123 mA cm<sup>-2</sup>. All experiments were repeated at least twice. 124

#### 125 **2.4.** Physicochemical characterizations and DFT calculation

The crystalline nature of the surface of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode was examined by X-ray 126 127 diffraction (XRD) measurement and the 2 $\theta$  values acquired within the range of 10° to 80° using a Bruker D2 PHASER X-ray diffractometer that uses Cu K<sub>a</sub> radiation. The morphology of the 128 cathode surface was depicted by a scanning electron microscopy (SEM, FEI QUANTA FEG250) and 129 high-resolution transmission electron microscope (HRTEM, JEM-2100F). The X-ray photoelectron 130 spectroscopy (XPS) was obtained using a Thermo Fisher ESCALAB 250Xi system with Al K<sub>a</sub> as an 131 X-ray source. C 1s peak at 284.8 eV from residual carbon was conducted to correct the binding 132 133 energy of other elements. The details of DFT calculation were provided in the supplementary 134 material.

#### 135

#### 2.5. Electrochemical characterizations

All electrochemical measurements were performed on an electrochemical station (PGSTAT 136 302N, Metrohm). A standard three-electrode system was used in which the working electrode was a 137 home made Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>-/Ti cathode, the counter electrode was a platinum plate, and the reference 138 139 electrode was a saturated calomel electrode (SCE). The effective working area of the working and counter electrodes was 12.5 cm<sup>2</sup>. The electrolyte for linear sweep voltammetry (LSV) and cyclic 140 voltammetry (CV) tests was composed of 0.1 M Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> solution with or without 50 mg L<sup>-1</sup> NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>. 141 CV tests were recorded between 0.0 V and -1.5 V/SCE at a scan rate of 20 mV s<sup>-1</sup>. Electrochemical 142 impedance spectroscopy (EIS) measurements were operated in 0.1 M Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> solution using the 143 frequency ranged from  $10^5$  to  $10^{-2}$  Hz and the amplitude of the potential of 10 mV. 144

#### 145 **2.6. Chemical analyses**

The concentrations of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>, NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> and NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> were determined with a UV-vis spectrophotometer as it has been depicted in detail in the previous literature [21]. The residual NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> ratio ( $R_{NO_3}^-$ ), the generated NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> ratio ( $S_{NO_2}^-$ ), the generated NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> ratio, ( $S_{NO_4}^+$ ), the total nitrogen (TN) removal efficiency, ( $R_{TN}$ ) and N<sub>2</sub> selectivity ( $S_{N_2}$ , were calculated by the following equations:

150 
$$R_{NO_3^-}(\%) = \frac{[NO_3^-]_t}{[NO_3^-]_0} \times 100$$
(3)

151 
$$S_{NO_2^-}(\%) = \frac{[NO_2^-]_t}{[NO_3^-]_0} \times 100$$
 (4)

152 
$$S_{NH_4^+}(\%) = \frac{[NH_4^+]_t}{[NO_3^-]_0} \times 100$$
 (5)

153 
$$R_{TN} = 1 - R_{NO_3^-} - S_{NO_2^-} - S_{NH_4^+}$$
(6)

154 
$$S_{N_2}(\%) = \frac{R_{TN}}{1 - R_{NO_3^-}} \times 100$$
 (7)

where  $[NO_3^-]_0$  is the initial concentration of  $NO_3^-$  and  $[NO_3^-]_t$ ,  $[NO_2^-]_t$  and  $[NH_4^+]_t$  are the concentrations of  $NO_3^-$ ,  $NO_2^-$  and  $NH_4^+$  at time t. 157

#### 158 **3. Results and discussion**

#### 159 **3.1. Catalytic NO3<sup>-</sup> reduction by different cathodes**

160 The comparative NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction process efficiency at different cathodes was depicted in Fig. 1. As shown in Fig. 1(a), the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> removal efficiency of TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode was only 45% at current 161 density of 10 mA cm<sup>-2</sup> after 120 min. However, as for Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti (without PVP) cathode, NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> 162 163 removal efficiency suddenly became twice that of TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode, reaching approximately 80%. Moreover, with the introduction of the dispersant PVP, the removal efficiency of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> was further 164 165 increased to 89%. Although the addition of TiO<sub>2</sub> resulted in a slight decrease (nearly 6%) in the removal efficiency of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> compared to Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti cathode, the release of Co ions into the aqueous 166 solution was remarkably inhibited, probably due to the stabilization effect of TiO<sub>2</sub> (see Fig. 1(b)). In 167 the case of  $Co_3O_4/Ti$  cathode, the leaching of Co ions ( $Co^{2+}/Co^{3+}$ ) reached 0.2 mg L<sup>-1</sup> after 120 min, 168 while Co ions were barely detected for both the Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti and Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti (without PVP) 169 cathodes. Recently, many non-precious catalysts for NO3<sup>-</sup> reduction have been developed as the 170 171alternatives to conventional noble Pd catalyst. As shown in Table S1, the Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode 172 exhibits significantly superior NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction activity over other non-precious electrodes.

- 173
- 110

174

#### <Fig. 1>

175

As shown in Fig. 1(c), the profiles of ammonium  $(NH_4^+)$  formation as a function of electrolysis time have similar trends with those of  $NO_3^-$  removal in the above reaction systems. The amount of  $NH_4^+$  formed in the case of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti cathode was larger than those of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti and

Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti (without PVP) cathodes. In addition, among all the cathodes tested, the TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti 179 produced the lowest amount of NH4<sup>+</sup>, due to its inferior performance for NO3<sup>-</sup> reduction. During 180 181  $NO_3^-$  reduction process, the toxic intermediate  $NO_2^-$  was negligibly detected in the cases of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti, Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti (without PVP) and Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti cathodes, while a significant amount 182 183 (around 1%) of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> was transformed into NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> when using TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti as the cathode. Although NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction efficiency of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode was slightly lower than that of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti cathode, the 184 TN removal efficiency and N<sub>2</sub> selectivity for the former were comparable to that of the latter as 185 shown in Fig. S1. Besides, the TN removal efficiency and N2 selectivity of Co3O4-TiO2/Ti (without 186 187 PVP) and TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathodes were much lower than those of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode.

Fig. 2 shows the XRD pattern of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode calcinated at the temperature of 500 188 °C. A comparison was performed between the obtained XRD data and standard patterns of various 189 190 cobalt oxide and titanium oxide structures including cubic phase Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> (PDF#42-1467), Ti (PDF#44-1294), anatase TiO<sub>2</sub> (PDF#21-1272), and rutile TiO<sub>2</sub> (PDF#21-1276). It is observed that all 191 the detectable peaks agree well with standard cubic phase Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>, anatase TiO<sub>2</sub>, and rutile TiO<sub>2</sub>. And 192 the main characteristic peaks of  $Co_3O_4$  are at  $2\theta = 31.3^\circ$ ,  $36.9^\circ$ ,  $38.6^\circ$ ,  $44.8^\circ$ ,  $59.4^\circ$ ,  $65.2^\circ$ ,  $77.3^\circ$ , 193 which correspond to (220), (311), (222), (400), (511), (440), and (533) planes, respectively. This 194 shows that the main components of the as-prepared cathode were the target catalyst Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> and the 195 196 dispersant carrier TiO<sub>2</sub>.

197

198

<Figs. 2>

199

200 SEM images (Fig. 3) illustrate the morphology of as-prepared catalysts. Figs. 3(a)-(c)

201 correspond to Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti, Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti (without PVP), and Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti cathodes, respectively. It can be clearly seen that Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> particles on Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode were small and uniform, whereas 202 that on Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti (without PVP) and Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti cathodes were apparently agglomerated and 203 represented in the forms of disordered nanotubes and irregular aggregates, respectively, showing the 204 205 successful role of PVP as surface dispersant by mixing PVP and metal-salt precursor solution [22]. Figs. 3(d)-(h) provide the EDS maps of Co and Ti elements at the above three cathodes. Obviously, 206 the presence of PVP could effectively improve the uniformity of Co and Ti distribution on the 207 surface of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode, which was therefore better than that of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti (without 208 209 PVP) cathode. As for Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti cathode, the aggregation of Co element was more pronounced in comparison with the other two cathodes, indicating the worst distribution of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> on Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti 210 cathode. The electrocatalytic property could be improved by using PVP as surface stabilizer and 211 212 growth modifier since it could effectively alleviate the agglomeration of the catalysts and enhance the relative population of stable clusters during the synthesis of nanoparticles (NPs), thereby more 213 active sites are exposed at the cathode surface. [23-24] Therefore, it can be concluded that both the 214 TiO<sub>2</sub> and the PVP dispersant could evidently promote the distribution and stability of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> on the 215 Ti plate, which will expose more active sites and inhibit the leaching of catalyst from the electrode 216 surface. This may explain the superior catalytic performance and stability of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode 217 218 over Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti (without PVP) and Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti cathodes as shown in the Fig. 1. HRTEM images of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti in Fig. 4(a) presents dark Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> species with a 10–50 nm diameter. The primarily 219 exposed crystal planes of as-synthesized Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> are (311) with the lattice spacing (d) of 0.244 nm 220 221 (Fig. 4(b)), which is consistent with the XRD patterns.

222

223

#### <Figs. 3 and 4>

224

#### **3.2. Preparation parameters**

#### 226 **3.2.1. Effect of coating times**

The Co ions concentration of 0, 0.5, 1.0, and 2.0 M with 4 coating times was investigated. The 227 NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentration decay kinetics and LSV curves (Fig. S2) demonstrate that 1.0 M was compatible. 228 In this section, the studied number of coating times was 2, 4, 6, and 8 with Co ions concentration of 229 230 1.0 M, which was represented as 2-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti, 4-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti, 6-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti and 8-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathodes, respectively. Although, as shown in Fig. S3, the coating times negligibly 231 affected the morphology of the electrode surface, too many or too few coating times were not 232 conducive to NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction. The NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> removal efficiencies for 2-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti, 4-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti, 2336-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti and 8-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathodes were 80%, 89%, 64% and 61%, respectively, within 234 120 min. Thus, the optimum number of coating times was 4. As illustrated in Fig. 5(b), 235 4-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode has the largest response current intensity. And the trend of response current 236 intensity at the same voltage was consistent with the  $NO_3^-$  reduction trend of Fig. 5(a). The above 237 238 experimental and LSV results can be explained by the fact that when the number of coating times was below 4, insufficient Co loadings may not afford enough active sites for NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction. In 239 contrast, when the number of coating times was more than 4, the catalyst coating on the Ti plate was 240 241 thick, which probably deteriorated the electron transfer, and the increased potential would exacerbate 242 the occurrence of hydrogen evolution side reactions, therefore led to a decrease in NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction efficiency. 243

244

245

246

247 **3.2.2. Effect of calcination temperature** 

In this section, the effect of calcination temperatures on the performance of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti 248 cathode was investigated. The as-prepared cathodes sintered at 300 °C, 400 °C, 500 °C, 600 °C and 249 250 700 °C were marked as 300-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti, 400-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti, 500-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti, 600-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti and 700-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti, respectively. Fig. 6(a) shows that there were significant 251differences in NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction efficiency between the cathodes sintered at different temperatures. The 252 optimum NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> removal efficiency was observed for the cathode calcination in the temperature range 253of 300-500 °C, e.g., approximately 89% for 500-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode. A moderate NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> removal 254efficiency was obtained for 600-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode (67%) while the 700-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode 255256had the marginal  $NO_3^-$  removal efficiency, approximately 34%. The variation trend of response current intensity observed from the LSV measurements (Fig. 6(b)) was in good accordance with that 257 of the cathodes for NO3<sup>-</sup> removal, which confirmed the best performance of the 258 500-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>-PVP cathode. 259

- 260
- 261

#### <Fig. 6>

262

As shown in Fig. 2, the main characteristic peaks of  $Co_3O_4$  in XRD spectra for  $Co_3O_4$ -TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode became narrower and sharper as the calcination temperature increased in the range of 300 -700 °C. According to the previous studies, complete conversion of  $Co_3O_4$  can be achieved in the sol-gel and calcination process when the temperature exceeds 270 °C [20]. Better crystallinity 267 structure of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> could be obtained at higher calcination temperatures. Nevertheless, Ti plate has some problems when being sintered at relatively high temperature. Specially, as demonstrated in the 268 previous literature [20], the conductivity of Ti plate was greatly reduced when the calcination 269 temperature reached 600 °C. Besides, the phase structure, composition, and crystallinity of TiO<sub>2</sub> are 270 271 of great influence on its electrocatalytic activity and electrochemical properties [25]. Therefore, XRD 272was also used to analyze the changes of  $TiO_2$  phase on the cathodes sintered at various temperatures. It can be seen from the XRD patterns presented in Fig. 2 that the calcination temperature 273 significantly impacted the crystallization and phase structures of surface catalysts on Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti 274 cathode. For Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathodes sintered at the temperature of 300-500 °C, except the 275 diffraction peaks of Ti substrate and Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>, two broad peaks at  $2\theta = 53.9^{\circ}$  and  $76.0^{\circ}$  can be attributed 276 to the (105) and (301) plane diffraction, respectively, of anatase TiO<sub>2</sub>. However, as for 277  $600-Co_3O_4-TiO_2/Ti$  cathode, small peaks at  $2\theta = 27.4^\circ$ ,  $36.1^\circ$ ,  $54.3^\circ$ ,  $56.6^\circ$ ,  $69.0^\circ$ , and  $69.8^\circ$  correspond 278to (110), (101), (211), (220), (301), and (112) plane diffraction, respectively, of rutile. Notably, the 279 intensity of rutile diffraction peaks of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode increases sharply at the calcination 280 temperature of 700 °C. This suggests the occurrence of phase transformation of anatase to rutile 281 when elevating the calcination temperature from 300 to 600 °C, which was even more pronounced 282 for 700 °C. Furthermore, with the calcination temperature increase to 600 °C and 700 °C, the crystal 283 turned to aggregation, which was probably responsible for the decrease of  $NO_3^-$  reduction efficiency 284 (Fig. S4). Based on these results, it can be concluded that the phase transformation of TiO<sub>2</sub> began to 285take place at the calcination temperature above 500 °C. When calcination temperature reaches 600 °C, 286 the rutile phase even became the prevalent phase of the composite. This was consistent with the 287results in the previous literature papers [26]. 288

Based on the EIS measurements, the Nyquist plots of various Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathodes sintered 289 at various temperatures are provided in Fig. 6(c). The radius of semicircle was related with the 290 charge transfer resistance and the sample with smaller arc radius indicates faster interfacial electron 291 transfer [27]. The calcination temperature exerts a significant effect on the electrochemical properties 292 293 of the electrodes. In this study, when the calcination temperature was increased from 300 to 500 °C, the radius of the arc did not appear, indicating that the charge transfer resistance was small. However, 294 when the calcination temperature rose to 600 °C, the arc radius appeared, suggesting the fact that 295 increasing calcination temperature caused an increase in impedance for Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode. And 296 the charge transfer resistance of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode obtained at the calcination temperature of 297 700 °C was larger than that of 600 °C. The change of EIS results indicates that the phase 298 transformation of anatase to rutile with elevating calcination temperature could inhibit the charge 299 300 transfer within the cathode, which adverse to  $NO_3^-$  reduction [28]. This can be ascribed to the higher electric resistance of rutile than that of anatase [28]. 301

Therefore, the relatively low  $NO_3^-$  reduction efficiencies for 600-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti and 700-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathodes could be explained by the increase in the charge transfer resistance of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode prepared at a high calcination temperature. Consequently, appreciable Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathodes could be obtained at the calcination temperature of 300-500 °C, in which cobalt precursor could be completely transformed to Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> and the relatively low charge transfer resistance could be also ensured.

308

#### **309 3.3. Effect of electrochemical reaction parameters**

#### 310 **3.3.1. Effect of solution pH and current density**

311	As illustrated in Fig. 7, the effect of solution pH $(3.0-9.0)$ on NO <sub>3</sub> <sup>-</sup> reduction was evaluated in
312	this section. Figs. 7 (a) and 7(b) show the reduction curves of $NO_3^-$ over time and the final solution
313	pH for different initial pH values. Contrarily to the previous studies [29], Fig. 7(a) shows that
314	different pH conditions did not play significant role on NO3 <sup>-</sup> reduction efficiency over the
315	electrolysis time. This indicates that Co <sub>3</sub> O <sub>4</sub> -TiO <sub>2</sub> /Ti cathode prepared in this study has a wide
316	working pH range and can be potentially used to treat the NO <sub>3</sub> <sup>-</sup> containing wastewaters in a relatively
317	large pH range. Besides, Fig. 7(b) shows that, regardless of the initial pH, the pH value was
318	significantly increased after 120 min reaction. For example, after 2 h of nitrate reduction, the solution
319	pH increased from 3.0, 5.0, 7.0 and 9.0 to 9.0, 10.6, 10.9 and 11.0, respectively. The explanation for
320	this pH variation will be discussed in the following section 3.4.

- 321
- 322

#### <Fig. 7>

323

On the other hand, the reduction efficiency of NO3<sup>-</sup> was significantly enhanced with the 324 increase of current density from 2.5 to 10 mA cm<sup>-2</sup> (Fig. 8(a)). However, when the current density 325 was increased from 10 to 25 mA cm<sup>-2</sup>, the removal efficiency of  $NO_3^-$  was not greatly improved. Fig. 326 S5 shows that the reduction of 50 mg L<sup>-1</sup> NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> followed a zero-order kinetic trend at the current 327 density of 2.5 and 5 mA cm<sup>-2</sup> with the rate constant increased from 0.190 ( $R^2 = 0.99$ ) to 0.440 ( $R^2 =$ 328 0.98) min<sup>-1</sup> (indicating a charge controlled kinetic stage) while a first-order kinetic trend was 329 observed at the current densities of 10 and 25 mA cm<sup>-2</sup> (indicating a mass controlled kinetic stage) 330 with the rate constant of 0.018 ( $R^2 = 0.99$ ) and 0.027 ( $R^2 = 0.99$ ) min<sup>-1</sup>, respectively. As the current 331 density was increased from 10 to 25 mA cm<sup>-2</sup>, more energy was used to generate hydrogen bubble, 332

333	so that the increase in the $NO_3^-$ removal efficiency was not significant as expected. There is a good
334	correspondence between the amount of $NH_4^+$ produced and the amount of $NO_3^-$ reduced as shown on
335	Fig. 8(b). Low current density leads to lower energy consumption, but in actual use, it is necessary to
336	seek the balance between the energy saving and the NO3 <sup>-</sup> treatment requirements to gain the highly
337	appreciable treatment performance.

- 338
- 339

<Fig. 8>

- 340
- . . .

#### **341 3.3.2. Effect of chlorine concentration**

As can be seen in Fig. S1, the main product of the electrocatalytic reduction of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> was NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>, 342 which is also a contaminant that needed to be removed. The removal of NH<sub>3</sub> is primarily takes place 343 344 through direct oxidation on the anode surface and indirect oxidation mediated by active chlorine in the solution bulk. In the direct oxidation process, the NH<sub>3</sub> is first adsorbed on the surface of the 345 anode and subsequently oxidized to N<sub>2</sub>, as shown in Eq. (8) [30]. However, NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> cannot be oxidized 346 directly at the anode. Hence it is necessary to adjust the solution pH to reach the pKa of the 347  $NH_4^+/NH_3$  acid-base pair (i.e., pH > 9.25). [32] In addition to the direct oxidation of  $NH_3$  on the 348 anode, the generated active chlorine species (Eqs. (9) and (10)) at the anode could also be involved 349 in the oxidative transformation of  $NH_4^+$  to nitrogen gas (Eq. (11)) or  $NO_3^-$  (Eqs. (12)) as well as the 350 oxidation of  $NO_2^-$  to  $NO_3^-$  (Eq. (13)) in the homogeneous solution, so-called indirect (or mediated) 351 oxidation [30]. Furthermore, HOCl reacts also on NH<sub>3</sub> to form chloramines (Eqs. (14)-(16)). 352 Compared with direct ammonia oxidation, the chlorine-mediated ammonia oxidation is much more 353 efficient and feasible due to the abundant presence of chloride ion in wastewaters. 354

355
$$2NH_3 + 6OH^- \rightarrow N_2 + 6H_2O + 6e^-$$
(8)356 $2Cl^- \rightarrow Cl_2 + 2e^-$ (9)357 $Cl_2 + H_2O \rightarrow HOCl + H^+ + Cl^-$ (10)358 $2NH_4^+ + 3HOCl \rightarrow N_2 + 3H_2O + 3Cl^- + 5H^+$ (11)359 $NH_4^+ + 4HOCl \rightarrow NO_3^- + H_2O + 6H^+ + 4Cl^-$ (12)360 $NO_2^- + HClO \rightarrow NO_3^- + H_2O + H^+ + Cl^-$ (13)361 $HOCl + NH_3 \rightarrow NH_2Cl + H_2O$ (14)362 $HOCl + NH_2Cl \rightarrow NHCl_2 + H_2O$ (15)

$$363 \qquad \text{HOCl} + \text{NHCl}_2 \rightarrow \text{NCl}_3 + \text{H}_2\text{O} \tag{16}$$

Chloride ions are widely presented in drinking water and industrial water. For instance, the 364 concentration of chloride ions in the bulk drug manufacturing industrial wastewater and zinc refinery 365 wastewater reached 3119 and 10000 mg L<sup>-1</sup>, respectively [35]. Considering the role of chloride ions 366 in oxidation of NH4<sup>+</sup>, various concentrations of chloride ions were added to the solution in order to 367 study its effect. As shown in Fig. 9(a), the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> removal efficiency was almost unaffected by the 368 presence of chloride ions. But, as the concentration of chloride ions increased from 0 to 2000 mg  $L^{-1}$ , 369 the formation of NH4<sup>+</sup> progressively decreased (Fig. 9(b)). For instance, when the concentration of 370 chloride ions increased to 2000 mg L<sup>-1</sup>, the generated NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> ions ratio initially slightly increased to 7% 371 within 40 min but then gradually decreased to approximately 0 after 100 min reaction time. Besides, 372 it appears from Fig. 9(c) that the formation of NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> could be deteriorated with increasing chloride 373 ions concentration from 0 to 2000 mg L<sup>-1</sup>, with the highest NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> generation of 0.47%. It can also be 374 seen from Fig. S6 that the TN removal efficiency and N2 selectivity of Co3O4-TiO2/Ti cathode 375increased with the increase of chloride ions concentration. When the chloride ions concentration 376

377 reached 2000 mg L<sup>-1</sup>, the TN removal efficiency and N<sub>2</sub> selectivity reached 82% and 100%,
378 respectively.

- 379
- 380

#### <Fig. 9>

381

NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> formation curves plotted in Fig. 9(d) clearly show that its amount formed at Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti 382 cathode (49%) was about twice of that formed at Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode (24%) after 120 min 383 reaction at the same chloride ions concentration of 1000 mg L<sup>-1</sup>. Fig. S6 shows that the TN removal 384 efficiency and N<sub>2</sub> selectivity for Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode were 60% and 71%, respectively, while the 385 corresponding values for Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti cathode were 42% and 46%, respectively. The difference in NT 386 removal efficiency between Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti and Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti cathodes in the presence of chloride ions 387 388 was much larger than in the chloride-free cases as observed in Fig. S1. The indirect oxidation mechanism of NH4<sup>+</sup> was similar to the intensively studied breakpoint chlorination [31]. First, the 389 NH4<sup>+</sup> reacts with the active chlorine (HOCl or OCl<sup>-</sup> depending to the solution the pH) to produce 390 intermediate products such as monochloramine, dichloramine and tri-chloramine, and were finally 391 oxidized to N<sub>2</sub> [32]. It is worth noting that the oxidation process of the  $NH_4^+$  began to occur only 392 when active chlorine/ammonia mole ratio reaches 1.5 [33]. Specially, Ding et al. [34] found that 393 higher active chlorine/ammonia mole ratio (>5) brought about 100% removal of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>, while less 394 efficient removal efficiencies (nearly 50%) were achieved with lower mole ratio (< 2). Thus, it can 395 be inferred that electrochemical ammonia oxidation in these reaction systems was closely related 396 with the active chlorine/ammonia mole ratio. As demonstrated in Fig. 1, the efficiency of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> 397 reduction to NH4<sup>+</sup> with Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti cathode was higher than that with Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode. This 398

would result in less mole ratio of active chlorine/ammonia in the former case compared with that in the latter case. Therefore, as shown in Fig. 9(d), the indirect oxidation of ammonia was more favorable for the  $Co_3O_4$ -TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode mediated electrochemical system.

402

#### 403 **3.4. The NO3<sup>-</sup> removal mechanism**

#### 404 **3.4.1 Direct reduction**

405 Electrochemical reduction of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> is a complex process involving a range of intermediates and broad valence changes (from +5 to -3). The process mainly includes direct reduction and indirect 406reduction. Direct reduction is mainly achieved by electrons and H<sup>+</sup>, and indirect reduction is mainly 407 caused by atomic H\* [35]. This mechanism was verified in the present electrochemical reaction 408system by CV tests as depicted in Fig. 10(a). When 50 mg  $L^{-1}$  NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> was added to the reaction 409 solution, the peak current density of -2.4 and -4.0 mA cm<sup>-2</sup> appeared at the potential of -0.9 and -1.2 410 V/SCE, respectively, at TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode. These reduction peaks can be attributed to the electron 411 412 transfer from the cathode to NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> because no peak was observed in the absence of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>. Thus, it is rational that approximately 45% NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> was reduced at TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode (Fig. 1(a)). According to the 413 414previous studies [36], these two reduction peaks correspond to the reduction of  $NO_3^-$  to  $NO_2^-$  and the formation of NH4<sup>+</sup>, respectively. Furthermore, single reduction peak does not mean single electron 415 416 transfer [37]. In contrast, the peaks were completely disappeared in the case of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode, regardless of the presence or absence of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>. Notably, the experimental results presented 417 in Fig. 1 show that the  $NO_3^-$  reduction efficiency was greatly increased in the presence of  $Co_3O_4$ . 418 Therefore, the disappearance of the reduction peak was not ascribed to the poor catalytic activity of 419 the Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> toward the electrocatalytic reduction of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>. This peculiar phenomenon just became a 420

421 breakthrough point to understand the mechanism of the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> electrocatalytic reduction by Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>. It is known that two processes, i.e., heterogeneous charge transfer and diffusional mass transport, 422 mainly determine the shape of the CV curve [38]. The CV curve can reflect the heterogeneous charge 423 transfer from the electrode to electroactive species. However, it fails to reflect the charge transfer and 424 valence change inside the electrode.  $Co_3O_4$  contains  $Co^{2+}$  ions in tetrahedral interstices and  $Co^{3+}$  ions 425 426 in octahedral interstices. Thus, it can be inferred that NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> probably did not directly receive electrons from the cathode via the circuit, but from the "electron porter" of the structural Co<sup>2+</sup> ions. This 427proposition can be validated by the density functional theory (DFT) calculation results, which can be 428 seen in Fig. 11. Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> (222) was selected considering XRD detection and NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction 429 experiments. The DFT calculation results show that the O atom in NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and the Co atom on the 430 surface of  $Co_3O_4$  (222) are thermodynamically favorably bonded with the required energy of -9.04 431 432 eV. Besides, the differential charge density distribution indicates that electrons can transfer from the Co atoms on the surface of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> (222) to NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>. Differential charge density analysis further showed 433 that the O atoms in NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> obtained 0.41, 0.65, and 0.57 electrons, respectively, and the N atoms lost 4340.82 electrons, and a total of 0.81 electrons were transferred from the Co atom to  $NO_3^{-1}$ . 435

In order to further confirm this, the electrochemical reduction of  $NO_3^-$  at  $Co_3O_4$ -TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode was investigated at different cathode potentials, and the experimental results are shown in Fig. 10(b). Nearly no  $NO_3^-$  was removed at the applied potential of -0.5 and -0.7 V/SCE within 120 min. The  $NO_3^-$  removal efficiency of 36% and 40% were attained at -1.0 and -1.2 V/SCE, respectively. Besides,  $NO_3^-$  removal efficiency finally raised to 98% after 120 min electrolysis when the applied potential was further decreased to -1.3 V/SCE. However, the  $NO_3^-$  reduction efficiency was decreased to approximately 94% when further decreasing the cathode potential to -1.5 V/SCE. 443 This can be attributed to the enhancement of hydrogen evolution reaction at this potential and the hindrance of hydrogen bubbles to the electron transfer at the cathode surface [39]. The strong 444 dependence of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction on the cathode potential corresponding to reduction peaks of CV curve 445 is in agreement with the literature [40]. This confirms the above conjecture that electrons were 446 transferred from the power source to the cathode surface through a circuit, in which Co<sup>3+</sup> was 447 reduced to Co<sup>2+</sup> via accepting an electron. Then nitrogen-containing contaminants, such as NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>, 448receive the electrons from the structural  $Co^{2+}$  ions. This particular reaction process cannot be directly 449 detected by CV test, explaining the disappearance of the reduction peak in Fig. 10(a) and the strong 450451 voltage-dependent phenomenon in Fig. 10(b).

- 452
- 453

#### <Fig. 10>

454

In the above process, the ratio  $Co^{2+}/Co^{3+}$  would definitely change. To further confirm this 455 statement, XPS analysis was used. The XPS wide-survey scan of Co(2p) is illustrated in Fig. 10(c). 456The peaks at 780 and 795 eV (binding energy) should be assigned to  $Co(2p_{3/2})$  and  $Co(2p_{1/2})$ , 457 respectively [41]. The Co  $(2p_{3/2})$ /Co  $(2p_{1/2})$  ratio value of almost 2:1 was consistent with the previous 458literature report [42]. The peaks of Co<sup>2+</sup> were located at 781.5 and 796.6 eV, while the peaks at 780 459 and 794.8 eV should be assigned to Co<sup>3+</sup> [43, 44]. Besides, the peaks at 786.8 and 804 eV were 460 attributed to the shake-up satellite peaks of  $Co^{2+}$  [45]. Moreover, the  $Co^{2+}/Co^{3+}$  ratios of the pristine 461 and used Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathodes were calculated as 1.49 and 0.42, respectively, which indicated the 462transformation of  $Co^{2+}$  to  $Co^{3+}$  during the electrochemical NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction process. This confirms the 463 electrochemical redox cycle  $Co^{2+}-Co^{3+}-Co^{2+}$  and the electron transfer from  $Co^{2+}$  to  $NO_3^{-}$  during the 464

465 electrocatalytic  $NO_3^-$  reduction process.

466

467

#### <Fig. 11>

468

#### 469 **3.4.2. Indirect reduction**

In the indirect pathway, electrons from the cathode could produce surface-adsorbed atomic H<sup>\*</sup> 470 via the reduction of protons, which is known as Volmer process [15]. Here, we employed CV 471 technique to qualitatively detect the formed H\* during the electrochemical reaction process, which 472 473 has been well introduced by Jiang et al. [46] and Liu et al. [47]. First, the cathode was repeatedly scanned for activation in a potential range of -0.20 to 0.90 V/SCE in 0.1 M Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> electrolyte at 474 sweep rate of 100 mV s<sup>-1</sup>. Electrochemical analysis did not start until a stable CV curve was obtained 475 476 [46]. As shown in Fig. 10(d), the starting potential was set from -1.20 to -1.35 V/SCE and the termination potential was 0.45 V/SCE. As reported in the previous study involving C-Pd cathode for 477 nitrate reduction [46]; the lower the starting potential, the stronger the corresponding oxidation peak. 478 And the oxidation peaks of molecular hydrogen and atomic H\* were located at -0.80 to -0.60 V/SCE 479 and -0.10 to -0.00 V/SCE, respectively. Fig. 10(d) shows that at different initial potentials, reduction 480 peaks were observed at the potentials from -0.6 to -0.1 V/SCE, corresponding to the oxidation of 481 molecular H<sub>2</sub> and H<sup>\*</sup>, respectively. After adding 10 mM TBA, the intensity of the oxidation peak 482 corresponding to atomic H\* immediately weakened. This markedly suppressed the availability of the 483 formed H\* for the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction. 484

Figs. 10(e) and (f) show LSV curves and  $NO_3^-$  reduction results, respectively, after the addition of 10 mM TBA. As illustrated in Fig. 10(e), the current intensity was significantly enhanced after the

addition of 5 and 50 mg L<sup>-1</sup> NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>. However, the current intensity was decreased as TBA was added, 487 which was more pronounced at higher TBA concentration. In addition, as shown in Fig. 10(f), 488 increasing TBA concentration could gradually inhibit the NO3<sup>-</sup> removal efficiency. When TBA 489 concentration was 0.2 mM, the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> removal efficiency was decreased by approximately 10%, and it 490 491 was further decreased by 18% at TBA concentration of 1 mM. But negligible difference in the NO3<sup>-</sup> 492 reduction efficiency between 1 and 10 mM TBA was observed, suggesting nearly complete hindering of the contribution of the formed  $H^*$  to  $NO_3^-$  reduction when TBA concentration was 1 mM. 493 Therefore, we can reasonably speculate that approximately 18% NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction proceeded via the 494 indirect pathway mediated by the atomic H\* during the electrocatalytic reduction of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> process. 495

Atomic H\* would accordingly be generated first by Volmer mechanism (Eq. (17)), which can 496 explain the increase of solution pH observed for the Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>-PVP cathode. In some noble metal 497 498catalysts (e.g., Pd and Ag)-based reaction systems, atomic H\* would be favorably preserved for NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction [12]. As a result, after the addition of 1 mM and 10 mM TBA in the Pd-mediated process, 499 the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> removal rate constant was reduced by 38% and 81%, respectively, which fully demonstrates 500 the importance of atomic H\* for NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction. For Pd-based catalysts, the high efficiency of the 501 use of protons to generate atomic H\* at low overpotentials (Eq. (17)) and the strong adsorption of 502 atomic H\* to Pd atoms make Eqs. (18) and (19) difficult to occur [47, 48]. Even if atomic H\* is 503 converted to H<sub>2</sub>, Pd atoms can cleave H<sub>2</sub> and regenerate atomic H\* (this mechanism belongs to 504 catalytic reduction) [12]. Through such electrocatalytic reduction processes, the indirect reduction of 505NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> by Pd-based catalysts is dominant. In contrast, in present Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-based electrochemical system, 506 the produced H\* was inclined to transform to H<sub>2</sub> by Heyrovsky and Tafel routes (Eqs. (17)-(19)) [15]. 507Consequently, as for Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>-PVP cathode, the indirect reduction mediated by atomic H\* 508

accounted for only 18% of  $NO_3^-$  reduction. Thus, the role of atomic H\* in the electrocatalytic reduction of  $NO_3^-$  at the  $Co_3O_4$ -TiO\_2-PVP electrode was secondary, while the direct electron transfer was mainly responsible for  $NO_3^-$  reduction. In view of this, future research should focus on improving the atomic H\* adsorption capacity of non-precious metal catalysts.

513 
$$H_2O + e^- \rightarrow H^* + OH^-$$
 (Volmer) (17)

514 
$$H_2O + H^* + e^- \rightarrow H_2(g) + OH^-$$
 (Heyrovsky) (18)

515  $2H^* \rightarrow H_2(g)$  (Tafel) (19)

516

#### 517 **3.4.3. Proposed reaction pathway**

It was observed from Fig. 1 that the  $NH_4^+$  concentration gradually increased over the reaction time for all cathodes containing  $Co_3O_4$  catalyst as it was the main product of electrocatalytic  $NO_3^$ reduction, while  $NO_2^-$  was the minor intermediate product at a relatively low concentration. According to the aforementioned discussion and the experimental results, there are two main pathways (i.e., Co-mediated direct reduction and atomic H\*-mediated indirect reduction) responsible for the electrocatalytic reduction of  $NO_3^-$  by the  $Co_3O_4$  bearing cathodes investigated in this study.

It is known that the reduction of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> to NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> (Eq. (20)) is the kinetically rate-determining step for the electrocatalytic reduction of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>. This step actually consists of the reactions set presented through Eqs. (21)-(23) which is known as an electrochemical-chemical-electrochemical path [35]. The elementary electron transfer reactions lead to the generation of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup> (ad) and NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> (ad), which are adsorbed short-lived intermediates. Then, NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> (ad) converts to an unstable dianion radical, namely NO<sub>2</sub><sup>2-</sup> (ad) , by direct electron transfer (Eq. (24)), which would quickly hydrolyzes to form NO<sub>(ad)</sub> (Eq. (25)) [35]:

531 
$$NO_3^- + 2H^+ + 2e^- \rightarrow NO_2^- + H_2O$$
  $E^\circ = 0.01 \text{ V/SHE}$  (20)

532 
$$NO_{3(ad)} + e^{-} \rightarrow NO_{3(ad)}^{2-}$$
  $E^{\circ} = -0.89 \text{ V/SHE}$  (21)

533 
$$NO_{3(ad)}^{2-} + H_2O \rightarrow NO_{2^{\bullet}(ad)} + 2OH^{-}$$
  $k = 5.5 \times 10^4 \text{ s}^{-1}$  (22)

534 
$$\operatorname{NO}_{2^{\circ}(ad)} + e^{-} \rightarrow \operatorname{NO}_{2(ad)} + H_2O$$
  $E^{\circ} = 1.04 \text{ V/SHE}$  (23)

535 
$$NO_{2(ad)} + e^{-} \rightarrow NO_{2(ad)}^{2-}$$
  $E^{\circ} = -0.47 \text{ V/SHE}$  (24)

536 
$$NO_{2(ad)}^{2-} + H_2O \to NO_{(ad)} + 2OH^-$$
 (25)

537 According to the previous studies, the stepwise reduction of  $NO_{(ad)}$  eventually forms  $NH_4^+$ , 538 which is regarded as an electrochemical-electrochemical path, as depicted in Eqs. (26)-(31) [49]:

539  $NO_{(ad)} + H^+ + e^- \leftrightarrows HNO_{(ad)}$   $E^\circ = -0.78 \text{ V/SHE}$  (26)

540 
$$\text{HNO}_{(ad)} + \text{H}^+ + e^- \rightarrow \text{H}_2\text{NO}_{(ad)}$$
  $\text{E}^{\circ} = 0.52 \text{ V/SHE}$  (27)

541 
$$H_2NO_{(ad)} + H^+ + e^- \rightarrow H_2NOH_{(ad)}$$
  $E^\circ = 0.90 \text{ V/SHE}$  (28)

542 
$$H_2NOH + H^+ \rightleftharpoons H_3NOH^+$$
 (29)

543 
$$H_2NOH + 2H^+ + 2e^- \rightarrow NH_3 + H_2O$$
  $E^\circ = 0.42 \text{ V/SHE}$  (30)

544 
$$NH_3 + H^+ \hookrightarrow NH_4^+$$
  $pK_a = 9.25$  (31)

The direct electron transfers in above reactions are mostly single electron transfer processes. 545 The above experimental results demonstrated that the redox process  $Co^{2+}-Co^{3+}-Co^{2+}$  accelerates the 546electron transfer during NO3<sup>-</sup> reduction. The source of electrons for NO3<sup>-</sup> reduction is directly 547 derived from Co<sup>2+</sup> instead of the cathode through the circuit. Co<sup>2+</sup> gives an electron to NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> or its 548 daughter intermediates with the formation of Co<sup>3+</sup>, and then Co<sup>3+</sup> would transform to Co<sup>2+</sup> via 549obtaining an electron from the cathode surface. Thus, during the whole reaction, Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> mainly acts 550as an electron shuttle rather than a reducing agent. Moreover, H<sup>+</sup> is consumed in many NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> 551reduction steps, which is consistent with the pH variation as shown in Fig. 7(b). 552

553 At the same time, due to the strong reducibility of atomic hydrogen ( $E_{\circ(H+/H)} = -2.31$  V/SHE) 554 [49], the indirect reduction path of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> can not be ignored. Atomic H\* involved in Eqs. (32)-(37).

555	$NO_{3(ad)} + 2H^* \rightarrow NO_{2(ad)} + H_2O$	(32)
556	$NO_{2(ad)}$ + H* $\rightarrow$ $NO_{(ad)}$ + OH <sup>-</sup>	(33)
557	$NO_{(ad)} + 2H^* \rightarrow N_{(ad)} + H_2O$	(34)
558	$N_{(ad)} + H^* \rightarrow NH_{(ad)}$	(35)
559	$NH_{(ad)} + H^* \rightarrow NH_{2(ad)}$	(36)
560	$NH_{2(ad)} + H^* \rightarrow NH_{3(ad)}$	(37)

561

#### 562 4. Conclusions

A novel Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode was synthesized for removal of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> from water by its 563 electrocatalytic reduction of. It was proved that adding a certain amount of PVP in the coating liquid 564could improve the dispersibility of the catalyst and therefore promote the electrocatalytic reduction 565 of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>. More importantly, the release of toxic Co ions into the solution was almost completely 566 prohibited during the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction process due to the stabilization effect of TiO<sub>2</sub>. The introduction 567 of a certain amount of chloride ions into the electrolyte significantly increased the N<sub>2</sub> selectivity and 568 total nitrogen removal efficiency. When the concentration of chloride ions reached 2000 mg  $L^{-1}$ , 569 almost no NH4<sup>+</sup> was detected after 100 min of electrolysis. The electrocatalytic mechanism of NO3<sup>-</sup> 570 reduction consisted of direct reduction and indirect reduction, which are mediated by the 571 Co<sup>2+</sup>-Co<sup>3+</sup>-Co<sup>2+</sup> redox cycle and atomic H\*, respectively. Notably, the former route played a 572 superior role in NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction over the latter one. Generally, considering the abundant chloride ions 573in industrial/municipal wastewaters, the developed Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode in this study might be a 574

575 promising alternative for the electrocatalytic treatment of aqueous effluents loaded with  $NO_3^{-}$ .

576

## 577 Acknowledgments

- 578 This work is financially supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (No.
- 579 51608284), National Major Science and Technology Program for Water Pollution Control and
- 580 Treatment (No. 2017ZX07101-006), China Postdoctoral Science Foundation (No. 2017M610413),
- 581 Shandong Province Postdoctoral Science Foundation (No. 201702041).

582

#### References

- X. Huo, D.J.V. Hoomissen, J. Liu, S. Vyas, T.J. Strathmann, Hydrogenation of aqueous nitrate and nitrite with ruthenium catalysts, Appl. Catal. B: Environ., 211 (2017) 188-198.
- [2] Z. Hou, F. Chen, J. Wang, C.P. François-Xavier, T. Wintgens, Novel Pd/GdCrO<sub>3</sub> composite for photo-catalytical reduction of nitrate to N<sub>2</sub> with high selectivity and activity, Appl. Catal. B: Environ., 232 (2018) 124-134.
- [3] Q. Song, M. Li, L. Wang, X. Ma, F. Liu, X. Liu, Mechanism and optimization of electrochemical system for simultaneous removal of nitrate and ammonia, J. Hazard. Mater., 363 (2019) 119-126.
- [4] Z. Gao, Y. Zhang, D. Li, C.J. Werth, Y. Zhang, X. Zhou, Highly active Pd–In/mesoporous alumina catalyst for nitrate reduction, J. Hazard. Mater., 286 (2015) 425-431.
- [5] M. Duca, N. Sacré, A. Wang, S. Garbarino, D. Guay, Enhanced electrocatalytic nitrate reduction by preferentially-oriented (100) PtRh and PtIr alloys: the hidden treasures of the 'miscibility gap', Appl. Catal. B: Environ., 221 (2018) 86-96.
- [6] S.K. Sharma, R.C. Sobti, Nitrate removal from ground water: a review, J. Chem., 9 (2012) 1667-1675.
- [7] E. Lacasa, P. Cañizares, C. Sáez, F.J. Fernández, M.A. Rodrigo, Removal of nitrates from groundwater by electrocoagulation, Chem. Eng. J., 171 (2011) 1012-1017.
- [8] A.P. Murphy, Chemical removal of nitrate from water, Nature, 350 (1991) 223.
- [9] M. Kumar, S. Chakraborty, Chemical denitrification of water by zero-valent magnesium powder, J. Hazard. Mater., 135 (2006) 112-121.
- [10] H. Kominami, T. Nakaseko, Y. Shimada, A. Furusho, H. Inoue, S.Y. Murakami, Y. Kera, B. Ohtani, Selective photocatalytic reduction of nitrate to nitrogen molecules in an aqueous suspension of metal-loaded titanium(IV) oxide particles, Chem. Commun., 23 (2005) 2933-2935.
- [11] Y. Yoshinaga, T. Akita, I. Mikami, T. Okuhara, Hydrogenation of nitrate in water to nitrogen over Pd–Cu supported on active carbon, J. Catal., 207 (2002) 37-45.
- [12] J. Martinez, A. Ortiz, I. Ortiz, State-of-the-art and perspectives of the catalytic and electrocatalytic reduction of aqueous nitrates, Appl. Catal. B: Environ., 207 (2017) 42-59.

- [13] U. Prüsse, M. Hähnlein, J. Daum, K.D. Vorlop, Improving the catalytic nitrate reduction, Catal. Today, 55 (2000) 79-90.
- [14] B.P. Dash, S. Chaudhari, Electrochemical denitrificaton of simulated ground water, Water Res., 39 (2005) 4065-4072.
- [15] M.G. de Chialvo, A. Chialvo, Kinetics of hydrogen evolution reaction with Frumkin adsorption: re-examination of the Volmer–Heyrovsky and Volmer–Tafel routes, Electrochim. Acta, 44 (1998) 841-851.
- [16] B.P. Chaplin, M. Reinhard, W.F. Schneider, C. Schüth, J.R. Shapley, T.J. Strathmann, C.J. Werth, Critical review of Pd-based catalytic treatment of priority contaminants in water, Environ. Sci. Technol., 46 (2012) 3655-3670.
- [17] X. Zhou, Z. Liu, Y. Wang, Y. Ding, Facet effect of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> nanocrystals on visible-light driven water oxidation, Appl. Catal. B: Environ., 237 (2018) 74-84.
- [18] S. Gao, X. Jiao, Z. Sun, W. Zhang, Y. Sun, C. Wang, Q. Hu, X. Zu, F. Yang, S. Yang, Ultrathin Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> layers realizing optimized CO<sub>2</sub> electroreduction to formate, Angew. Chem. Int. Ed., 55 (2016) 698-702.
- [19] B. Meng, Z. Zhao, X. Wang, J. Liang, J. Qiu, Selective catalytic reduction of nitrogen oxides by ammonia over Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> nanocrystals with different shapes, Appl. Catal. B: Environ., 129 (2013) 491-500.
- [20] L. Su, K. Li, H. Zhang, M. Fan, D. Ying, T. Sun, Y. Wang, J. Jia, Electrochemical nitrate reduction by using a novel Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti cathode, Water Res., 120 (2017) 1-11.
- [21] W. Teng, N. Bai, Y. Liu, Y. Liu, J. Fan, W.X. Zhang, Selective nitrate reduction to dinitrogen by electrocatalysis on nanoscale iron encapsulated in mesoporous carbon, Environ. Sci. Technol., 52 (2017) 230-236.
- [22] G.M. Tomboc, F.O. Agyemang, H. Kim, Improved electrocatalytic oxygen evolution reaction properties using PVP modified direct growth Co-based metal oxides electrocatalysts on nickel foam, Electrochim. Acta, 263 (2018) 362-372.
- [23] Z. Daşdelen, Y. Yıldız, S. Eriş, F. Şen, Enhanced electrocatalytic activity and durability of Pt nanoparticles decorated on GO-PVP hybride material for methanol oxidation reaction, Appl. Catal. B: environ, 219 (2017) 511-516.

- [24] H. Tsunoyama, T. Tsukuda, Magic numbers of gold clusters stabilized by PVP, J. Am. Chem. Soc., 131 (2009) 18216-18217.
- [25] J. Yu, J. Xiong, B. Cheng, S. Liu, Fabrication and characterization of Ag–TiO<sub>2</sub> multiphase nanocomposite thin films with enhanced photocatalytic activity, Appl. Catal. B: Environ., 60 (2005) 211-221.
- [26] H. Yue, L. Xue, F. Chen, Efficiently electrochemical removal of nitrite contamination with stable RuO<sub>2</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti electrodes, Appl. Catal. B: Environ., 206 (2017) 683-691.
- [27] T. Hong, Z. Liu, X. Zheng, J. Zhang, L. Yan, Efficient photoelectrochemical water splitting over Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> and Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ag composite structure, Appl. Catal. B: Environ., 202 (2017) 454-459.
- [28] J. Yu, B. Wang, Effect of calcination temperature on morphology and photoelectrochemical properties of anodized titanium dioxide nanotube arrays, Appl. Catal. B: Environ., 94 (2010) 295-302.
- [29] Y. Ren, J. Yang, J. Li, B. Lai, Strengthening the reactivity of Fe<sup>0</sup>/(Fe/Cu) by premagnetization: Implications for nitrate reduction rate and selectivity, Chem. Eng. J., 330 (2017) 813-822.
- [30] C. Zhang, D. He, J. Ma, T.D. Waite, Active chlorine mediated ammonia oxidation revisited: Reaction mechanism, kinetic modelling and implications, Water Res., 145 (2018) 220-230.
- [31] T.A. Pressley, D.F. Bishop, S.G. Roan, Ammonia-nitrogen removal by breakpoint chlorination, Environ. Sci. Technol., 6 (1972) 622-628.
- [32] Z. Qiang, C.D. Adams, Determination of monochloramine formation rate constants with stopped-flow spectrophotometry, Environ. Sci. Technol., 38 (2004) 1435-1444.
- [33] L. Li, Y. Liu, Ammonia removal in electrochemical oxidation: mechanism and pseudo-kinetics, J. Hazard. Mater., 161 (2009) 1010-1016.
- [34] J. Ding, Q. Zhao, Y. Zhang, L. Wei, W. Li, K. Wang, The eAND process: enabling simultaneous nitrogen-removal and disinfection for WWTP effluent, Water Res., 74 (2015) 122-131.
- [35] S. Garcia-Segura, M. Lanzarini-Lopes, K. Hristovski, P. Westerhoff, Electrocatalytic reduction of nitrate: Fundamentals to full-scale water treatment applications, Appl. Catal. B: Environ., 236 (2018) 546-568.
- [36] M. Hasnat, S.B. Aoun, S.N. Uddin, M.M. Alam, P. Koay, S. Amertharaj, M. Rashed, M.M. Rahman, N. Mohamed, Copper-immobilized platinum electrocatalyst for the effective reduction

of nitrate in a low conductive medium: Mechanism, adsorption thermodynamics and stability, Appl. Catal. A: Gen., 478 (2014) 259-266.

- [37] J.F. Su, I. Ruzybayev, I. Shah, C.P. Huang, The electrochemical reduction of nitrate over micro-architectured metal electrodes with stainless steel scaffold, Appl. Catal. B: Environ., 180 (2016) 199-209.
- [38] J. Heinze, Cyclic voltammetry—"electrochemical spectroscopy". New analytical methods (25), Angew. Chem. Int. Edit., 23 (1984) 831-847.
- [39] A. Li, X. Zhao, Y. Hou, H. Liu, L. Wu, J. Qu, The electrocatalytic dechlorination of chloroacetic acids at electrodeposited Pd/Fe-modified carbon paper electrode, Appl. Catal. B: Environ., 111 (2012) 628-635.
- [40] C. Liu, A.Y. Zhang, D.N. Pei, H.Q. Yu, Efficient electrochemical reduction of nitrobenzene by defect-engineered TiO<sub>2-x</sub> single crystals, Environ. Sci. Technol., 50 (2016) 5234-5242.
- [41] Y. Liu, R. Luo, Y. Li, J. Qi, C. Wang, J. Li, X. Sun, L. Wang, Sandwich-like Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/MXene composite with enhanced catalytic performance for Bisphenol A degradation, Chem. Eng. J., 347 (2018) 731-740.
- [42] X. Qiu, J. Yu, H. Xu, W. Chen, W. Hu, G. Chen, Interfacial effects of the Cu<sub>2</sub>O nano-dots decorated Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> nanorods array and its photocatalytic activity for cleaving organic molecules, Appl. Surf. Sci., 382 (2016) 249-259.
- [43] M. Kang, M.W. Song, C.H. Lee, Catalytic carbon monoxide oxidation over CoO<sub>x</sub>/CeO<sub>2</sub> composite catalysts, Appl. Catal. A: Gen., 251 (2003) 143-156.
- [44] K.Y.A. Lin, B.C. Chen, Efficient elimination of caffeine from water using Oxone activated by a magnetic and recyclable cobalt/carbon nanocomposite derived from ZIF-67, Dalton Trans., 45 (2016) 3541-3551.
- [45] J. Li, G. Lu, G. Wu, D. Mao, Y. Guo, Y. Wang, Y. Guo, Effect of TiO<sub>2</sub> crystal structure on the catalytic performance of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst for low-temperature CO oxidation, Catal. Sci. Technol., 4 (2014) 1268-1275.
- [46] G. Jiang, M. Lan, Z. Zhang, X. Lv, Z. Lou, X. Xu, F. Dong, S. Zhang, Identification of active hydrogen species on palladium nanoparticles for an enhanced electrocatalytic hydrodechlorination of 2, 4-dichlorophenol in water, Environ. Sci. Technol., 51 (2017)

7599-7605.

- [47] R. Liu, H. Zhao, X. Zhao, Z. He, Y. Lai, W. Shan, D. Bekana, G. Li, J. Liu, Defect sites in ultrathin Pd nanowires facilitate the highly efficient electrochemical hydrodechlorination of pollutants by H<sup>\*</sup><sub>ads</sub>, Environ. Sci. Technol., 52 (2018) 9992-10002.
- [48] B. Jiang, Y. Gong, J. Gao, T. Sun, Y. Liu, N. Oturan, M.A. Oturan, Reductive detoxification of Cr (VI) mediated by environmentally relevant carboxylic acids: State-of-the-art and perspectives, J. Hazard. Mater., 365 (2018) 205-226.
- [49] A. De Vooys, M. Koper, R. Van Santen, J. Van Veen, The role of adsorbates in the electrochemical oxidation of ammonia on noble and transition metal electrodes, J. Electroanal. Chem., 506 (2001) 127-137.

#### **FIGURE CAPTIONS**

**Figure 1.** NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentration decay kinetics (a), and evolution of concentration of Co (b), NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> (c) and NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> (d) during electrolysis time. Experimental conditions:  $[NO_3^-]_0 = 50 \text{ mg } \text{L}^{-1}$ , pH = 7.0, current density = 10 mA cm<sup>-2</sup>.

**Figure 2.** XRD patterns of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathodes calcined at 300 °C, 400 °C, 500 °C, 600 °C and 700 °C. The locations of the characteristic peaks for Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> (C), Ti substrate (Ti), anatase (A), and rutile (R) are represented by the vertical dashed lines.

**Figure 3.** SEM images of  $Co_3O_4$ -Ti $O_2$ /Ti (a), (b)  $Co_3O_4$ -Ti $O_2$ /Ti (without PVP) (b) and  $Co_3O_4$ /Ti (c) cathodes. Elemental mapping of  $Co_3O_4$ -Ti $O_2$ /Ti (d,e),  $Co_3O_4$ -Ti $O_2$ /Ti (without PVP) (f,g)  $Co_3O_4$ /Ti (h) cathodes. Elemental mapping: (d–h) correspond to Co, Ti, Co, Ti and Co maps, respectively.

Figure 4. HRTEM images of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti.

**Figure 5.**  $NO_3^-$  concentration decay kinetics (a) and LSV curves (b) for different coating times. Experimental conditions: (a)  $[NO_3^-]_0 = 50 \text{ mg } \text{L}^{-1}$ , pH = 7.0, current density = 10 mA cm<sup>-2</sup>, (b) 0.1 M  $SO_4^- + 50 \text{ mg } \text{L}^{-1} \text{ NO}_3^-$  solution, scan rate: 100 mV s<sup>-1</sup>).

**Figure 6.** NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentration decay kinetics at different calcination temperature (a) under experimental conditions:  $[NO_3^-]_0 = 50 \text{ mg L}^{-1}$ , pH = 7.0, current density = 10 mA cm<sup>-2</sup>), LSV curves at different calcination temperature (b) in 0.1 M SO<sub>4</sub><sup>-</sup> + 50 mg L<sup>-1</sup> NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> solution at a scan rate of 100 mV s<sup>-1</sup> and (c) EIS Nyquist plots of the cathodes at different calcination temperature by applying an impedance amplitude of 10 mV with the frequency range from 10<sup>5</sup> to 10<sup>-2</sup> Hz.

**Figure 7.**  $NO_3^-$  concentration decay kinetics at different pH (a) and Final solution pH for various initial pH after 120 min reaction (b). Experimental conditions:  $[NO_3^-]_0 = 50 \text{ mg } \text{L}^{-1}$ , current density = 10 mA cm<sup>-2</sup>.

**Figure 8.** NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentration decay kinetics (a) and NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> generation (b) at different current density. Experimental conditions:  $[NO_3^-]_0 = 50 \text{ mg L}^{-1}$ , pH = 7.0.

**Figure 9.** Effect of Cl<sup>-</sup> concentration on NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> decay kinetics (a), NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> generation (b), NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> generation (c) with Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode, and NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> generation with Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti and Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti cathodes (d). Experimental conditions:  $[NO_3^-]_0 = 50 \text{ mg L}^{-1}$ , pH = 7.0, current density = 10 mA cm<sup>-2</sup>.

**Figure 10.** Cyclic voltammograms of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction (a) at TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti and Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathodes (scan rate: 20 mV s<sup>-1</sup>); Effect of cathode potential on NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentration decay kinetics (b) at Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode (Experimental conditions:  $[NO_3^{-1}]_0 = 50 \text{ mg L}^{-1}$ , pH = 7.0, current density = 10 mA cm<sup>-2</sup>); XPS spectra of Co 2p for fresh and used Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti (c); Cyclic voltammograms obtained with Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode (d) in 0.1 M SO<sub>4</sub><sup>-</sup> in the presence (dotted line) and absence (full line) of 10 mM TBA; LSV curves of different electrolyte (e); and concentration decay kinetics of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> at Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode (f) with various TBA concentrations (Experimental conditions: [NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>]<sub>0</sub> = 50 mg L<sup>-1</sup>, pH = 7.0, current density = 10 mA cm<sup>-2</sup>).

**Figure 11.** (a) Adsorption configuration of  $NO_3^-$  on  $Co_3O_4$  (222) surface and corresponding adsorption energy, (b) Differential charge density distribution of  $NO_3^-$  on  $Co_3O_4$  (222) surface. Electron accumulation and electron deletion are represented by yellow and blue, respectively.



 $NO_3^-$  concentration decay kinetics (a), and evolution of concentration of Co (b),  $NH_4^+$  (c) and  $NO_2^-$ (d) during electrolysis time. Experimental conditions:  $[NO_3^-]_0 = 50 \text{ mg L}^{-1}$ , pH = 7.0, current density  $= 10 \text{ mA cm}^{-2}$ .



Figure 2

XRD patterns of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathodes calcined at 300 °C, 400 °C, 500 °C, 600 °C and 700 °C. The locations of the characteristic peaks for Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> (C), Ti substrate (Ti), anatase (A), and rutile (R) are represented by the vertical dashed lines.



SEM images of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti (a), (b) Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti (without PVP) (b) and Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti (c) cathodes. Elemental mapping of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti (d,e), Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti (without PVP) (f,g) Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti (h) cathodes. Elemental mapping: (d–h) correspond to Co, Ti, Co, Ti and Co maps, respectively.



## Figure 4

## HRTEM images of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti.





 $NO_3^-$  concentration decay kinetics (a) and LSV curves (b) for different coating times. Experimental conditions: (a)  $[NO_3^-]_0 = 50 \text{ mg } \text{L}^{-1}$ , pH = 7.0, current density = 10 mA cm<sup>-2</sup>, (b) 0.1 M SO<sub>4</sub><sup>-</sup> + 50 mg L<sup>-1</sup> NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> solution, scan rate: 100 mV s<sup>-1</sup>).



 $NO_3^-$  concentration decay kinetics at different calcination temperature (a) under experimental conditions:  $[NO_3^-]_0 = 50 \text{ mg L}^{-1}$ , pH = 7.0, current density = 10 mA cm<sup>-2</sup>), LSV curves at different calcination temperature (b) in 0.1 M SO<sub>4</sub><sup>-</sup> + 50 mg L<sup>-1</sup> NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> solution at a scan rate of 100 mV s<sup>-1</sup> and (c) EIS Nyquist plots of the cathodes at different calcination temperature by applying an impedance amplitude of 10 mV with the frequency range from 10<sup>5</sup> to 10<sup>-2</sup> Hz.



**Figure 7.**  $NO_3^-$  concentration decay kinetics at different pH (a) and Final solution pH for various initial pH after 120 min reaction (b). Experimental conditions:  $[NO_3^-]_0 = 50 \text{ mg L}^{-1}$ , current density =  $10 \text{ mA cm}^{-2}$ .



 $NO_3^-$  concentration decay kinetics (a) and  $NH_4^+$  generation (b) at different current density.

Experimental conditions:  $[NO_3^-]_0 = 50 \text{ mg } L^{-1}$ , pH = 7.0.



Figure 9

**Figure 9.** Effect of Cl<sup>-</sup> concentration on NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> decay kinetics (a), NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> generation (b), NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> generation (c) with Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode, and NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> generation with Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti and Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti cathodes (d). Experimental conditions:  $[NO_3^{-}]_0 = 50 \text{ mg L}^{-1}$ , pH = 7.0, current density = 10 mA cm<sup>-2</sup>.



Cyclic voltammograms of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction (a) at TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti and Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathodes (scan rate: 20 mV s<sup>-1</sup>); Effect of cathode potential on NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentration decay kinetics (b) at Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode (Experimental conditions:  $[NO_3^{--}]_0 = 50 \text{ mg L}^{-1}$ , pH = 7.0, current density = 10 mA cm<sup>-2</sup>); XPS spectra of Co 2p for fresh and used Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti (c); Cyclic voltammograms obtained with Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode (d) in 0.1 M SO<sub>4</sub><sup>--</sup> in the presence (dotted line) and absence (full line) of 10 mM TBA; LSV curves of different electrolyte (e); and concentration decay kinetics of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>--</sup> at CO<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ti cathode (f) with various TBA concentrations (Experimental conditions:  $[NO_3^{--}]_0 = 50 \text{ mg L}^{-1}$ , pH = 7.0, current density = 10 mA cm<sup>-2</sup>).



(a) Adsorption configuration of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> on Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> (222) surface and corresponding adsorption energy,
(b) Differential charge density distribution of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> on Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> (222) surface, electron accumulation and electron deletion are represented by yellow and blue, respectively.

# Graphical abstract

