

Managing living marine resources in a dynamic environment: The role of seasonal to decadal climate forecasts

Desiree Tommasi, Charles Stock, Alistair Hobday, Rick Methot, Isaac Kaplan, J. Paige Eveson, Kirstin Holsman, Timothy Miller, Sarah Gaichas, Marion Gehlen, et al.

▶ To cite this version:

Desiree Tommasi, Charles Stock, Alistair Hobday, Rick Methot, Isaac Kaplan, et al.. Managing living marine resources in a dynamic environment: The role of seasonal to decadal climate forecasts. Progress in Oceanography, 2017, 152, pp.15-49. 10.1016/j.pocean.2016.12.011 . hal-03112989

HAL Id: hal-03112989 https://hal.science/hal-03112989v1

Submitted on 24 Jun 2021

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

1 Managing living marine resources in a dynamic environment: the role of seasonal to 2 decadal climate forecasts 3 4 Desiree Tommasi^a, Charles A. Stock^b, Alistair J. Hobday^c, Rick Methot^d, Isaac C. Kaplan^e, J. 5 Paige Eveson^c, Kirstin Holsman^f, Timothy J. Miller^g, Sarah Gaichas^g, Marion Gehlen^h, Andrew 6 Pershingⁱ, Gabriel A. Vecchi^b, Rym Msadek^j, Tom Delworth^b, C. Mark Eakin^k, Melissa A. Haltuch^d, Roland Séférian¹, Claire M. Spillman^m, Jason R. Hartog^c, Samantha Siedleckiⁿ, Jameal 7 8 F. Samhouri^e, Barbara Muhling^a, Rebecca G. Asch^a, Malin L. Pinsky^o, Vincent S. Saba^p, Sarah B. Kapnick^b, Carlos F. Gaitan^{b,q}, Ryan R. Rykaczewski^r, Michael A. Alexander^s, Yan Xue^t, 9 10 Kathleen V. Pegion^u, Patrick Lynch^v, Mark R. Payne^w, Trond Kristiansen^x, Patrick Lehodey^y, Francisco E. Werner^z 11 12 13 ^aAtmospheric and Oceanic Sciences Program, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ 08540, USA; 14 ^bGeophysical Fluid Dynamics Laboratory, NOAA, Princeton, NJ 08540, USA; ^cCSIRO Oceans and Atmosphere, Hobart Tasmania, Australia; ^dNorthwest Fisheries Science Center, National 15 Marine Fisheries Service, NOAA, Seattle, WA 98112, USA; ^eConservation Biology Division, 16 Northwest Fisheries Science Center, National Marine Fisheries Service, NOAA, Seattle, WA 17 98117, USA; ^fAlaska Fisheries Science Center, National Marine Fisheries Service, NOAA, 18 19 Seattle, WA 98115, USA; ^gNortheast Fisheries Science Center, National Marine Fisheries 20 Service, NOAA, Woods Hole, MA 02543, USA; hLaboratoire des Sciences du Climat et de 21 l'Environnement Institut Pierre Simon Laplace, Orme des Merisiers, Gif-sur-Yvette cedex, 22 France; ⁱGulf of Maine Research Institute, Portland ME 04101, USA; ^jCentre National de la Recherche Scientifique (CNRS)/CERFACS, CECI, UMR 5318, Toulouse, France; ^kNOAA 23 24 Coral Reef Watch, Center for Satellite Applications and Research, College Park, MD 20740, 25 USA; ¹Centre National de Recherches Météorologiques, UMR 3589, Météo-France/CNRS, 26 Toulouse, France; "Bureau of Meteorology, Melbourne, Australia; "Joint Institute for the Study 27 of Atmosphere and Oceanography (JISAO), University of Washington, Seattle, WA 98195; 28 ^oDepartment of Ecology, Evolution, and Natural Resources and Institute of Earth, Ocean, and 29 Atmospheric Sciences, Rutgers University, New Brunswick, NJ 08901, USA; PNortheast 30 Fisheries Science Center, National Marine Fisheries Service, NOAA, Geophysical Fluid Dynamics Laboratory, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ 08540, USA; 9Now at Arable Labs, 31 Princeton, NJ 08542, USA; ^rDepartment of Biological Sciences, Marine Science Program, 32 33 University of South Carolina, Columbia, SC 29208, USA; ^sEarth System Research Laboratory, 34 Boulder, CO 80305, USA; 'Climate Prediction Center, NCEP/NWS/NOAA, College Park, MD 35 20740, USA; "Department of Atmospheric, Oceanic, and Earth Sciences, George Mason 36 University, Fairfax, VA 22030, USA; ^vOffice of Science & Technology, National Marine 37 Fisheries Service, NOAA, Silver Spring, MD 20910, USA; "Technical University of Denmark, 38 National Institute of Aquatic Resources, Charlottenlund, Denmark; ^xInstitute of Marine 39 Research, Bergen, Norway; ^yCollecte Localisation Satellite (CLS), Toulouse, France; ^zSouthwest 40 Fisheries Science Center, National Marine Fisheries Service, NOAA, La Jolla, CA 92037, USA

41 Abstract

42 Recent developments in global dynamical climate prediction systems have allowed for 43 skillful predictions of climate variables relevant to living marine resources (LMRs) at a scale 44 useful to understanding and managing LMRs. Such predictions present opportunities for 45 improved LMR management and industry operations, as well as new research avenues in fisheries science. LMRs respond to climate variability via changes in physiology and behavior. 46 47 For species and systems where climate-fisheries links are well established, forecasted LMR responses can lead to anticipatory and more effective decisions, benefitting both managers and 48 49 stakeholders. Here, we provide an overview of climate prediction systems and advances in 50 seasonal to decadal prediction of marine-resource relevant environmental variables. We then 51 describe a range of climate-sensitive LMR decisions that can be taken at lead-times of months to 52 decades, before highlighting a range of pioneering case studies using climate predictions to 53 inform LMR decisions. The success of these case studies suggests that many additional 54 applications are possible. Progress, however, is limited by observational and modeling 55 challenges. Priority developments include strengthening of the mechanistic linkages between 56 climate and marine resource responses, development of LMR models able to explicitly represent 57 such responses, integration of climate driven LMR dynamics in the multi-driver context within 58 which marine resources exist, and improved prediction of ecosystem-relevant variables at the 59 fine regional scales at which most marine resource decisions are made. While there are 60 fundamental limits to predictability, continued advances in these areas have considerable potential to make LMR managers and industry decision more resilient to climate variability and 61 62 help sustain valuable resources. Concerted dialog between scientists, LMR managers and 63 industry is essential to realizing this potential.

64

65 **1. Introduction**

Paleoecological and contemporary analyses demonstrate that large fluctuations in fish
populations are associated with variations in climate (Baumgartner et al., 1992; Finney et al.,
2002; Lehodey et al., 2006; Finney et al., 2010; Brander, 2010; Holsman et al., 2012; Barange et
al., 2014). Clearly, climate-driven variability has always been part of the fisher and fisheries
manager experience. However, the management response to climate variability has often been
reactionary, and enacting efficient coping strategies has, at times, been difficult (McGoodwin,

2

72 2007; Chang et al., 2013; Hodgkinson et al., 2014). For instance, unrecognized periods of 73 environmentally- or climate-driven reduction in productivity contributed to the demise of Pacific 74 sardine (*Sardinops sagax*) fishery in California in the 1950s (Murphy 1966; Lindegren et al., 75 2013; Essington et al., 2015), the collapse of the Peruvian anchoveta (*Engraulis ringens*) fishery 76 in the 1970s (Clark, 1977; Sharp, 1987), and overfishing of cod (*Gadus morhua*) in the Gulf of 77 Maine (Pershing et al., 2015, Palmer et al. 2016). Unanticipated temperature-induced changes in the timing of Gulf of Maine Atlantic lobster (*Homarus americanus*) life-cycle transitions resulted 78 79 in an extended 2012 fishing season and record landings, but outstripped processing capacity and 80 market demand, leading to a collapse in prices and an economic crisis in the lobster fishery 81 (Mills et al., 2013). Similarly, an unforeseen extreme low water temperature event resulted in a 82 \$10-million-dollar loss to the Taiwanese mariculture industry in 2008 (Chang et al., 2013). 83 Failure to prepare for inevitable climate variability on seasonal to decadal scales can also alter 84 the rebuilding times of stocks that have previously been overfished (Holt and Punt, 2009; Punt 85 2011; Pershing et al., 2015) and break down international cooperative harvesting agreements for 86 border straddling stocks and highly migratory species (Miller and Munro, 2004; Hannesson, 87 2006; Hannesson, 2012).

88 Negative impacts of climate variability on coastal economies can be exacerbated when 89 fishers, aquaculturists, and fisheries managers make decisions about future harvests, harvest 90 allocations, and operational planning based on previous experience alone, without consideration 91 of potential novel climate states (Hamilton, 2007). For instance, current fisheries abundance 92 forecasts are largely based on historical recruitment (i.e. addition of new individuals to the 93 fishery) estimates, and aquaculture harvests on the basis of historical growth patterns. While this 94 approach makes harvest decisions robust to a range of historical uncertainty, it may be 95 insufficient when an ecosystem shifts to a new productivity state, when a productivity trend 96 moves beyond historical observations, or when the degree of variation in productivity changes 97 (Wayte, 2013; Audzijonyte et al., 2016). Past patterns may not always be a good indication of future patterns, especially under anthropogenic climate change (Milly et al., 2008). Species will 98 99 experience new conditions across multiple ecologically significant climate variables (Williams et 100 al., 2007; Rodgers et al., 2015), challenging our ability to manage living marine resources 101 (LMRs) under the assumption of stationarity. Adapting our decision frameworks to climate 102 variability at seasonal to decadal scales can serve as an effective step towards improving our

103 long-term planning ability under future climate change (Link et al., 2015).

104 Incorporating environmental forcing into management frameworks for LMRs is challenging because the emergent effects of climate on marine ecosystems are complex. For 105 106 example, atmospheric forcing can drive changes in ecologically significant physical or chemical 107 variables that directly affect organismal physiology and behavior (e.g. temperature-driven 108 changes in oxygen demand; Pörtner and Farrell, 2008), species distribution (e.g. Pörtner and 109 Knust, 2007), phenology (e.g. Asch, 2015), and vital rates, such as growth (e.g. Kristiansen et al., 2011; Audzijonyte et al., 2013; Audzijonyte et al., 2014; Audzijonyte et al., 2016). Additionally, 110 111 climate can indirectly impact LMR productivity by affecting key biotic processes, such as 112 variation in prey fields and energy transfer in response to fluctuations in alongshore and cross-113 shelf transport (e.g. Bi et al., 2011; Keister et al., 2011; Combes et al., 2013; Wilderbuer et al., 114 2013) or to climate-driven changes in primary productivity and phytoplankton size-structure 115 (Daufresne et al., 2009). Climate-related variations in the abundance of predators, competitors, 116 and parasites can also have an indirect effect on LMRs (e.g. Boudreau et al., 2015), and 117 concurrent responses to fishing, habitat loss, and pollution may further complicate observed 118 responses (Brander, 2007; Halpern et al., 2008; Andrews et al., 2015; Fuller et al., 2015; Halpern 119 et al., 2015). 120 While such biophysical complexities challenge efforts to implement climate-informed

121 fisheries management frameworks, concerted observational and modelling efforts across decades 122 have led to some improved understanding of climate-ecosystem interactions in many regions 123 (Lehodey et al., 2006; Alheit et al., 2010; Ainsworth et al., 2011; Hunt et al., 2011; Di Lorenzo et 124 al., 2013; Bograd et al., 2014). These gains have been mirrored by improved climate predictions 125 at the temporal and spatial scales relevant to LMRs and their management, e.g. days to decades 126 (Hobday and Lough, 2011; Stock et al., 2011). Operational seasonal predictions have now 127 enabled development of climate services for a range of applications relevant to society (Vaughan 128 and Dessai, 2014). For example, improvements in model spatial resolution have allowed skillful 129 prediction of hurricane activity at a sub-basin scale relevant to climate risk management (Vecchi 130 et al., 2014). Seasonal climate forecasts have also reduced vulnerability of the agricultural sector 131 to climate variability (Meinke and Stone, 2005; Meza et al., 2008; Hansen et al., 2011; 132 Zinyengere et al., 2011; Takle et al., 2014, Zebiak et al., 2015 and references therein) and have 133 informed water resources decision making (Hamlet et al., 2002; Abawi et al., 2007).

134 Furthermore, seasonal climate forecasts have been incorporated into human health early warning 135 systems for diseases, such as malaria, that are influenced by climatic conditions (Abawi et al., 136 2007) and for outbreaks of noxious jellyfish (Gershwin et al., 2014). Enhanced capability has 137 also made possible skillful seasonal forecasts of LMR-relevant variables at fine spatial and 138 temporal scales useful to industry (defined here to include fisheries and aquaculture industries) 139 and management (Stock et al., 2015; Siedlecki et al., 2016). While multi-annual to decadal 140 predictions are at an initial stage of development and are not yet operational (Meehl et al., 2014), 141 in specific ocean regions, particularly the North Atlantic, multi-annual forecasts appear skillful 142 over several years (Yang et al., 2013; Msadek et al., 2014a; Keenlyside et al., 2015), and may 143 show promise for some LMR applications (Salinger et al., 2016).

144 The objective of this paper is to assess present and potential uses of these advances in 145 climate predictions to facilitate improved management of wild and cultured LMRs. This effort 146 was initiated at the workshop "Applications of Seasonal to Decadal Climate Predictions for 147 Marine Resource Management" held at Princeton University on June 3-5 2015, which brought 148 together 60 scientists spanning climate and marine resource disciplines. This resulting synthesis 149 establishes a common understanding of the prospects and challenges of seasonal to decadal forecasts for LMRs to support further innovative and effective application of climate predictions 150 151 to management decisions. In Section 2, we describe climate prediction systems and discuss their 152 strengths and limitations. In Section 3, we briefly summarize climate-sensitive decisions made 153 within management of commercially exploited species, protected and endangered species, and 154 for fishing and aquaculture industry applications. Section 4 presents case studies drawn from 155 peer-reviewed literature highlighting the scope of past and present applications. Sections 5 and 6 156 distill successful components across these existing applications and identify priority 157 developments based on the material in Sections 2-4. Section 7 offers concluding remarks on 158 prospects for expanded use of climate predictions for marine resource management. 159

160 2. Predicting environmental change across space and time scales

161 Advances in global dynamic climate prediction systems raise the prospect of skillful 162 environmental prediction at the time scales relevant to LMR management and industry decisions. 163 In this section, we first describe these prediction systems (Section 2.1), emphasizing 164 characteristics relevant to informing the management decisions which will be described in

Section 3, and then discuss evaluation of forecast skill (Section 2.2). Lastly, we provide a brief
overview of existing studies of prediction skill for LMR-relevant climate variables (Section 2.3).

167

168 2.1. Overview of climate prediction systems

169 There exist two types of climate prediction models: dynamical models based on knowledge of 170 the underlying physics of the climate system, and statistical models based on empirical 171 relationships. The focus here is on dynamical seasonal to decadal prediction systems derived 172 from Global Climate Models (GCMs), but it is important to note that statistical climate 173 prediction models have also been used with success at seasonal time scales (Xue et al., 2000; van 174 den Dool, 2007; Muñoz et al., 2010; Newman et al., 2011; Barnston et al., 2012; Ho et al., 2013; 175 Barnston and Tippett, 2014; Chapman et al., 2015). Statistical climate predictions require 176 considerably less computing resources than dynamical prediction systems and are used by 177 climate offices throughout the world, particularly where high-performance computing facilities 178 are not available. However, when developing a statistical forecast, care must be taken to not 179 impart artificial skill through the method used to select predictors (DelSole and Shukla, 2009) or through the forecast sets used for training and skill assessment not being sufficiently independent 180 of each other. Statistical predictions are also limited by the assumption that historically observed 181 182 statistical relationships between climate variables will be maintained in the future (Mason and 183 Baddour, 2007). By contrast, dynamical seasonal to decadal climate predictions arise more 184 directly from fundamental physical principles expected to hold under novel climate states 185 (Randall et al., 2007). Dynamical models can also forecast quantities that are difficult to observe 186 and thus develop statistical models for (e.g., bottom temperature). We note, however, that many 187 small-scale processes, such as cloud microphysics or submesoscale fronts and eddies, are not 188 resolved by most GCMs and uncertainty connected to the parameterization of such "sub-grid 189 scale" processes within GCMs can impact prediction skill (Warner, 2011). 190 Dynamical climate predictions on seasonal to decadal time scales rest on the premise that knowledge of the present climate and the dynamic principles governing its evolution may yield 191 192 useful predictions of future climate states. Four core components are thus required to make such

- 193 predictions at global scales and translate them for users: 1) global dynamical climate models, 2)
- 194 global observing systems, 3) a data assimilation system, and 4) analysis and dissemination

systems to provide predictions to stakeholders across sectors. We provide a brief overview ofeach of these components below.

- 197
- 198

224

2.1.1. Dynamical coupled global climate models for seasonal to decadal prediction

199 GCMs are comprised of atmospheric, ocean, sea-ice and land physics and hydrology 200 components, each governed by dynamical laws of motion and thermodynamics solved 201 numerically on a global grid. GCMs used for seasonal to decadal prediction are largely 202 analogous to those used for century-scale climate change projection (e.g. Stock et al. 2011), but 203 the simulation design is different (Fig. 1). In the climate change case (Fig. 1, bottom), the goal is 204 to track the evolution of the climate over multi-decadal time scales as it responds to 205 accumulating greenhouse gases (GHGs) and other anthropogenic forcing. The simulations have 206 three components: a pre-industrial control of several hundred to several thousand years where the 207 model comes to quasi-equilibrium with preindustrial GHGs and aerosol concentrations, a 208 historical segment where GHGs increase in accordance with observed trends, and a projection 209 following one of several future GHGs scenarios (Moss et al., 2010; van Vuuren et al., 2011). 210 Because initial conditions at the start of the preindustrial period are largely "forgotten" except 211 possibly in the abyssal ocean, the only aspects linking historical and future simulations to a 212 specific year are the GHGs, land cover changes, solar forcing, land use changes, and other 213 radiatively active atmospheric constituents (e.g. aerosols). Internal climate variations arising 214 from interactions in the components of the climate system itself such as the El Niño Southern Oscillation (ENSO) are represented in climate simulations, but their timing/chronology does not 215 216 and is not expected to agree with past observations. The objective is to obtain an accurate 217 representation of the evolving climate statistics over multiple decades, including the statistics of 218 internal climate variation, rather than precise predictions of the climate state at a given time. 219 Indeed, ensembles of historical and future simulations begun from different initial conditions, 220 and containing different realizations of internal climate variations, are often employed in 221 obtaining these statistics (Kay et al., 2015). 222 On the other hand, seasonal (months to a year) prediction skill (Fig. 1, top) largely 223 depends on initializing the model using information specific to the current climate state. Owing

5-10 days (e.g. Lorentz, 1963; Goddard et al., 2001). In seasonal forecasts, the predictability

to the chaotic nature of the atmosphere, daily weather has a deterministic predictability limit of

horizon is extended by forecasting monthly or seasonally-integrated statistics rather than daily

227 weather, and by exploiting the more slowly evolving elements of the climate system, such as the

228 ocean. It is assumed that the initial climate state sufficiently determines the future evolution of

229 internal climate variations so that skillful predictions of climate states within the forthcoming

230 months are possible. The presence of ENSO in June, for example, will impact extra-tropical sea-

231 surface temperature (SST) in September via teleconnections that are now substantially captured

by many GCMs, albeit some important biases remain (Deser et al., 2010).

In today's coupled dynamical prediction systems, seasonal prediction is thus classified as an initial value problem rather than a boundary value problem. As the response to changes in external forcing like GHGs occurs over much longer time scales, their predictive skill is more

236 dependent on initialization to current climate conditions rather than boundary conditions (i.e.

external forcing). Although external forcing changes are typically small over periods spanned by

238 individual seasonal forecasts, they can be significant over the multi-decadal periods spanned by

239 successive real time forecasts and the accompanying retrospective forecasts discussed in Section

240 2.1.3, and therefore should ideally remain included in seasonal forecast models (Doblas-Reyes et

al., 2006; Liniger et al., 2007). Annual to decadal predictability (1 to 30 years), in contrast, arises

242 from both predictable internal climate variations following model initialization and external

243 forcing, presenting a hybrid problem (Fig. 1, middle panel, Meehl et al., 2014).

244 Another difference between GCMs configured for climate projections and seasonal to

245 decadal predictions systems has been the successful expansion of the climate change GCM

configuration to earth system models (ESMs) that include biogeochemistry (e.g. Bopp et al.,

247 2013). ESMs can simulate biological and chemical properties (e.g. oxygen, pH, nutrients,

primary and secondary production) strongly linked to LMRs (Stock et al., 2011), and thus they

249 have been broadly applied to assess climate change impacts on LMRs (e.g. Cheung et al., 2009;

250 Barange et al., 2014). While incorporation of earth system dynamics in global seasonal to

251 decadal prediction models remains in an early stage of development (Séférian et al., 2014; Case

252 Study 4.6), it may yield benefits at the seasonal to decadal scale. In Section 2.3, discussion of

253 LMR-relevant seasonal to decadal predictions will be focused on the physical variables produced

254 by the operational seasonal to decadal global forecast systems, but priority developments to

255 expand biogeochemical prediction capabilities will be discussed in Section 6.

256

257 2.1.2. The global climate observing system supporting climate prediction

258 The initialization of seasonal to decadal climate predictions is generated via a range of 259 data assimilation approaches (Section 2.1.3) that draw observational constraints from the global 260 climate observing system. This system collates diverse observations of many climate quantities 261 across the globe including those obtained from satellites, land-based weather stations,

262 radiosondes, weather radars, aircrafts, weather balloons, profiling floats, moored and drifting 263 ocean buoys, and ships (see

264 http://www.wmo.int/pages/prog/gcos/index.php?name=ObservingSystemsandData for a list of 265 the global climate observing system's observational networks and climate variables). Expansion 266 of the global climate observing system across decades has improved prediction skill. For 267 instance, establishment of the Pacific Tropical Atmosphere-Ocean (TAO) moored buoy array in 268 the early 1990s (McPhaden, 1993) was key in enhancing seasonal prediction skill of ENSO and 269 ENSO-related SSTs (Ji and Leetmaa, 1997; Vidard et al., 2007). Similarly, the addition of Argo 270 profiling floats to the global ocean observing network improved seasonal SST forecast skill 271 (Balmaseda et al., 2007).

272

273

2.1.3. Assimilating observations to constrain the initial climate state

274 While the advent of satellites and of observing platforms, such as the TAO array and 275 Argo floats, have considerably increased the number of available observations, much of the 276 Earth system, particularly in the deep ocean (> 2000 m), remains unobserved. Climate prediction 277 systems combine observational and model constraints using a data assimilation system to fully 278 initialize climate predictions. Diverse approaches are used, from nudging methods to four-279 dimensional variational analyses and ensemble Kalman filters. For instance, the NOAA 280 Geophysical Fluid Dynamics Laboratory (GFDL) coupled data assimilation system produces an 281 estimate of the present climate state by using an ensemble Kalman filter algorithm to combine a 282 probability density function (PDF) of observations, both oceanic and atmospheric, with a prior PDF derived from the dynamically coupled model (Zhang et al., 2007). For more details on data 283 284 assimilation techniques we refer readers to Daley et al. (1991), Kalnay et al. (2003), Tribbia and 285 Troccoli (2007), Edwards et al. (2015), Zhang et al. (2015), and Stammer et al. (2016). 286 Assimilating observations produces an initialized climate state that differs from what the 287 climate models would simulate were they running freely. This is because dynamical climate

288 models are an approximation of the real world, and as such can show systematic bias (Warner, 289 2011). Once a seasonal forecast begins, dynamical models drift back to their freely running state. 290 In some cases, drifts can be as large as the signal being predicted, particularly for longer lead-291 times, and can degrade forecast skill (Goddard et al., 2001; Magnusson et al., 2013; Smith et al. 292 2013). It is therefore important to remove this drift to obtain the signal of interest for input into LMR models. While diverse approaches for this have been proposed, they primarily involve 293 294 subtracting the mean drift from across a set of retrospective forecasts (hindcasts). For example, 295 to correct for model drift in a January-initialized SST anomaly forecast for May, the mean drift 296 for January-initialized May forecasts from the past 30 years is subtracted from the predicted 297 temperature trend.

298 While a primary goal of data assimilation is forecast initialization, the estimates of 299 atmospheric or ocean state produced via data assimilation are also useful for model verification 300 and calibration, retrospective studies of past ocean variability, and "nowcasts" of present 301 conditions. Such historical time series of past ocean state estimates are referred to as reanalysis 302 datasets. While often taken as "observations" they are obtained using the model and a data 303 assimilation system in the same way as was described for model initialization. Hence, reanalyses 304 are model-dependent and each climate prediction center produces its own version of what the 305 earth system looked like in the past (Table A1). While such reanalyses are generally in 306 agreement for variables that are widely sampled (e.g. SST after the advent of satellites) over 307 scales resolved by the GCMs, there are differences, reflecting model uncertainty, the scarcity of observational data, and the fact that single observations may not be representative of the large-308 309 scale climate state. One way to estimate uncertainties among ocean reanalyses is to conduct 310 ocean reanalysis intercomparisons (Balmaseda et al., 2015). Table A1 lists six operational ocean 311 reanalysis products that are available for the period from 1979 to present and that are used in a 312 Real-time Ocean Reanalysis Intercomparison Project (Xue et al., in review). One example of 313 uncertainties of ocean reanalysis products is shown in Fig. 2 for temperature anomalies at a depth of 55 m during April 2015. Some areas, such as the west coast of North America, clearly stand 314 315 out as being consistent between reanalysis products. This has also been shown in some recent 316 seasonal forecast efforts in the region (Siedlecki et al., 2016), increasing confidence in their 317 treatment as "observations". By contrast, temperature values along the Northeast shelf of North 318 America are more uncertain. This highlights the importance of confirming consistency of

reanalyses with observations at the scales of interest when possible (Stock et al., 2015), and the
paucity of oceanic variables for which we can robustly evaluate prediction skill.

321 2.1.4. Analysis and dissemination in support of diverse stakeholders

322 The goal of analysis and dissemination systems is to take the raw output from the 323 predictions and package it in a way that can be easily accessible and understood by stakeholders. 324 Generally, because of the variety of users and applications of seasonal forecasts, most climate 325 prediction centers focus on ensuring that seasonal climate model output is corrected for model 326 drift (see Section 2.1.3 for more details) and verified. Forecast verification, which entails an 327 assessment of forecast skill, is described in Section 2.2. Any further post-processing, such as 328 downscaling to application-relevant spatial scales, is performed on an ad hoc basis in 329 collaboration with users.

330 Climate forecasts are inherently uncertain because of the chaotic nature of the climate 331 system, whereby small differences in initial conditions can lead to a diverse range of climate 332 states (Lorenz, 1963; Wittenberg et al., 2014), as well as our imperfect understanding of the 333 climate system. In an attempt to capture some of this uncertainty, a collection of forecasts differing in their initial conditions or model parametrizations, referred to as an ensemble, is 334 335 produced (see Section 2.2 for more details). For a forecast to be useful for decision making, it 336 needs to represent the likelihood of different outcomes. Probabilistic forecasts constructed from 337 information provided by the ensemble forecast fill this need. Such forecasts are commonly communicated as probabilities that the outcome will be in the lower, middle or upper tercile of 338 339 the climatological PDF (Fig. 3), although many other possibilities exist. Reliability, the property 340 that forecast probabilities are similar to observed frequencies, is crucial for decision making. 341 However, probabilistic forecasts based on raw forecast output tend to be overconfident, and are 342 thus often recalibrated to improve their reliability (Sansom et al., 2016). Deterministic forecasts 343 describing the average outcome of the forecast ensemble are also sometimes disseminated. While 344 relatively simple to interpret, they are generally less useful than probabilistic forecasts because 345 they contain no measures of uncertainty or the likelihood of alternative outcomes. 346 Once the climate predictions are verified, most prediction centers deliver forecasts to 347 users via the internet. For example, seasonal forecasts from NOAA NCEP, GFDL, and numerous 348 other modeling centers can be downloaded from the North American Multi-Model Ensemble

(NMME) (Kirtman et al., 2014) website at http://www.cpc.ncep.noaa.gov/products/NMME/.
Hindcasts (i.e. retrospective forecasts) are archived on the same site, and skill assessment maps
are also made available. It should be noted that because of the large variety of users and the
limited resources devoted to delivery systems, model output presentation and visualization is
rarely customized to specific user needs. Thus, there is utility in repackaging standard forecasts
specifically for the fisheries and aquaculture sectors as "targeted forecasts" (Hobday et al., 2016;
Siedlecki et al., 2016).

356

357 2.2. Forecast skill

358 In addition to providing users with information on forecast uncertainty through well-359 calibrated probabilistic forecasts as discussed above, skill information is essential for LMR 360 managers or fishing industry personnel to assess confidence in seasonal to decadal forecasts. 361 Hence, model verification, which assesses prediction quality of the forecast through skill 362 assessment, is essential for seasonal to decadal predictions to be practically useful to decision-363 making. As well as enabling drift correction as described in Section 2.1.3, retrospective forecasts are used by climate prediction centers to establish forecast skill. This involves initializing a suite 364 365 of predictions across the past several decades and testing whether predictions would have been 366 successful (e.g. given an estimate of climate conditions in January of 1982, how well can the 367 model predict temperature and precipitation anomalies for the rest of 1982). These retrospective 368 forecast suites are also made available to potential users to assess predictability of particular 369 variables of interest.

370 Numerous prediction skill measures have been developed (Stanski et al., 1989; von 371 Storch and Zwiers, 2001; Jolliffe and Stephenson, 2003; Mason and Stephenson, 2007; van den 372 Dool, 2007; Wilks, 2011). Generally, stakeholders are interested in the correctness of a forecast 373 (Mason and Stephenson, 2007), and thus the anomaly (see Section 3.1.3 for details on how 374 anomalies are calculated) correlation coefficient (ACC) and root mean square error (RMSE) 375 between the model retrospective forecast and observations are among the most commonly used 376 prediction skill measures for deterministic forecasts. For a probabilistic forecast, the Brier Score 377 (BS) is often used to measure of the mean squared probability error of whether an event 378 occurred. The value of the dynamical prediction can also be assessed by comparing the skill of a 379 dynamical forecast output to that of climatology. For instance, the ranked probability skill score

380 (RPSS), a commonly used measure of probabilistic prediction, is used to reflect the relative 381 improvement given by the forecast over climatology (Fig. 3). Seasonal to decadal prediction skill 382 is also often compared against that of a persistence forecast. A persistence forecast is a forecast 383 produced by simply projecting forward the current climate anomaly. For example, a January one-384 month lead SST forecast would be compared against a persistence forecast derived from 385 maintaining the December temperature anomaly into January. Statistical predictions, particularly 386 for decadal forecasts whose skill also depends on changes in radiative forcing not represented in 387 a persistence forecast, can also act as useful tools against which to assess dynamical prediction 388 skill (Ho et al., 2013). While statistical or persistence forecasts provide an important benchmark 389 against which to assess the added value of dynamical seasonal forecasts, a skillful statistical (e.g. 390 Eden et al., 2015) or persistence forecast can be as relevant to users as a skillful dynamical 391 forecast.

392 As discussed in Section 2.4.1, for a forecast to be useful to LMR managers and the 393 fisheries and aquaculture industries, not only does it need to be skillful, but its uncertainty has to 394 be representative of the spectrum of potential outcomes. Climate prediction uncertainty arises 395 from different sources (Payne et al., 2016), with internal variability and model uncertainty being 396 the most important for seasonal to decadal predictions, particularly at regional scales (Hawkins 397 and Sutton, 2009). Internal variability uncertainty stems from emergent chaotic properties of the 398 climate system, and causes predictions differing only a little in initial conditions to evolve to 399 quite different climate states (Lorenz, 1963; Wittenberg et al., 2014). In an attempt to capture 400 some of this internal variability uncertainty, climate prediction centers produce different 401 forecasts characterized by the same global dynamic model started with slightly different initial 402 conditions chosen to reflect equally probable initial states given a set of observational 403 constraints. The collection of such forecasts is referred to as a single-model ensemble. 404 Forecast uncertainty also arises from our incomplete understanding of the climate system, 405 as reflected in the forecast model being a simplification of the real world. Model error can stem 406 from uncertainties in the parameterizations of physical processes that are either not well 407 understood, act at a scale below the model's spatial or temporal resolution, or are too 408 computationally expensive to be modeled explicitly. Errors in numerical approximations also add 409 to model uncertainty. Multi-model ensembles are a way to characterize forecast uncertainty 410 arising from this model uncertainty. In such ensembles, simulations from entirely different

411 models, often from various prediction centers, are combined to produce a forecast output. The 412 North American Multi-Model Ensemble (NMME) (Section 2.1.4) is an example of such a 413 forecast. Seasonal forecasts from leading US and Canadian prediction systems are combined to 414 produce a multi-model ensemble mean seasonal forecast. Single model forecasts are also 415 provided, but the multi-model mean has been shown to have higher prediction skill than any 416 single model (Becker et al., 2014). The skill increase comes from error cancellation and the non-417 linearity of model diagnostics (Becker et al., 2014). In addition to a more accurate measure of 418 central tendency, use of a multi-model ensemble often allows for a more complete representation 419 of forecast uncertainty. Ensemble methods thus allow forecasts to be probabilistic, reflecting the 420 range of all potential outcomes (Goddard, 2001). To base decisions on a comprehensive 421 assessment of risk, incorporation of seasonal to decadal predictions into LMR applications 422 should include these estimates of forecast uncertainty.

423 Dynamical processes that operate at scales finer than a model's resolution must be 424 parameterized. The spatial resolution of a model grid dictates the breadth of processes that may 425 be simulated, and differences in this resolution can influence model error and thus limit forecast 426 skill. Indeed, an increase in resolution from the 100 to 200-km atmospheric resolution common 427 to many of the current seasonal to decadal prediction systems (Kirtman et al., 2013), to 50-km 428 resulted in better seasonal temperature and precipitation forecast skill, particularly at a regional 429 scale (Jia et al., 2015). Nevertheless, in regions where local and/or unresolved sub-grid scale 430 processes strongly modulate the basin-scale climate signal, even such relatively high resolution 431 (50-km atmosphere and 100-km ocean) predictions have limited skill. For example, global 432 climate models that have an ocean resolution of 100-km to 200-km have a bias in both ocean 433 temperature and salinity in complex coastal environments such as the US Northeast Continental 434 Shelf (Saba et al., 2016). These biases may partially explain the relatively poor predictive skill of 435 seasonal SST anomalies predictions in this region (Stock et al., 2015). When both atmosphere 436 and ocean model resolution are increased (50-km atmosphere, 10-km ocean), such biases are 437 substantially reduced (Fig. 4) because the Gulf Stream coastal separation position as well as 438 regional bathymetry are more accurately resolved. We stress, however, that while enhanced 439 resolution appears critical for some scales and ecosystems, existing models show considerable 440 prediction skill for marine resource relevant variables at other scales and ecosystems (Section 441 2.3). High resolution GCMs (10-km ocean versus 100-km in many prediction systems), are also

442 considerably more computationally expensive to run, currently limiting their use in operational
443 climate prediction systems. Furthermore, biases can remain at this resolution, and can be quite
444 large in specific ocean regions (Delworth et al., 2012; Griffies et al., 2015). This is due, in part,

to the challenges of optimizing sub-gridscale parametrizations for higher resolution models

446 (Goddard et al., 2001).

- An alternative means of addressing resolution challenges is to embed a regional
 dynamical downscaling model in a global climate prediction system (e.g. Section 4.5, Section 6).
 Most of the world's fish catch is produced (Pauly et al., 2008) and most aquaculture operations
 are located in coastal and shelf seas. Regional models have the added advantage of improved
 resolution of coastal process (e.g. tidal mixing) that impact predictive skill of LMR-relevant
 variables at decision-relevant scales. However, these advantages must be weighed against the
 challenges, such as boundary condition inconsistencies, encountered when nesting models of
- 454 considerably different structure and resolution (Marchesiello et al., 2001; Brennan et al., 2016).
- 455 It is important to note that while some of the current uncertainty in seasonal to decadal 456 predictions can be reduced by, for example, improved model parameterizations, expanded observational networks, or increased model resolution, irreducible uncertainties will remain. 457 458 Owing to the chaotic nature of the atmosphere, there are inherent seasonal and decadal 459 predictability limits, which need to be clearly communicated to stakeholders (Vaughan and 460 Dessai, 2014; Zebiak et al., 2015). For instance, on the west coast of the US, the seasonal 461 upwelling season ends abruptly with the fall transition. This transition is driven mostly by 462 storms, and consequently may not be predictable on seasonal time scales.
- Finally, since reanalysis products are often treated as observations in forecast verification (Section 2.1.3), it is important for users to confirm the fidelity of such data sets to their specific area of interest prior to integration with LMR management frameworks. Where possible, this should be done with additional hydrographic data that may not have been incorporated in the reanalysis. We refer readers to Stock et al. (2015) for an example on how such an analysis can be performed.

469

- 470 2.3. Prediction of living marine resource-relevant physical variables
- 471 Variables routinely predicted using current seasonal to decadal forecast systems are
 472 LMR-relevant (e.g. SST), and the objectives of seasonal to decadal climate prediction are

473 consistent with the spatiotemporal scale of many of the fisheries management decisions.

- 474 However, oceanic prediction skill has often only been assessed with a view to its influence on
- 475 regional weather prediction, rather than being of primary interest in itself (Stockdale et al.,
- 476 2011). There are, however, a growing number of prediction studies for quantities and
- spatiotemporal scales relevant to LMR science and management challenges (Fig. 5). Below we
 discuss several of these, including predictability of SST anomalies, sea ice, and freshwater
 forcings that influence LMRs, along with recent advances for anticipating extreme events.
- 480 SST anomalies are both important drivers and meaningful indicators of ecosystem state 481 (e.g., Lehodey et al., 2006; Brander et al., 2010). Efforts to assess the predictability of SST 482 anomalies have emphasized ocean basin-scale modes of variability often linked to regional 483 climate patterns (e.g., ENSO; Barnston et al., 2012). However, recent work has also revealed 484 considerable SST prediction skill for many coastal ecosystems (Stock et al., 2015). Over short 485 time scales, skill often arises from simple persistence of SST anomalies due to the ocean's 486 substantial thermal inertia (Goddard and Mason, 2002). In many cases, however, skill exceeds 487 that of persistence forecasts and can extend across leads of 6-12 months (Fig. 6). Such seasonal 488 SST predictability may arise from diverse mechanisms, including the seasonal emergence of 489 predictable basin-scale SST signatures following periods dominated by less predictable local 490 variation, transitions between opposing anomalies due to the seasonal migration of ocean fronts, 491 or the predictable re-emergence of sub-surface anomalies following the breakdown of summer 492 stratification (Stock et al., 2015). Further analysis suggests that multi-model based SST 493 predictions can further improve regional SST anomaly prediction skill and more reliably 494 represent prediction uncertainty and the potential for extremes (Hervieux et al., in review). The 495 considerable prediction skill at this LMR-relevant scale has allowed for some pioneering use of 496 SST predictions for marine resource science and management (e.g., see case studies in Section 497 4), and suggests ample potential for further expansion.
- In a few ocean regions, most notably the North Atlantic, SST predictions are skillful for several years (Yang et al., 2013; Msadek et al., 2014a; Keenlyside et al., 2015). This time scale is of particular interest for many LMR applications (Fig. 5). The predictive skill on these time scales emerges from phenomena, primarily in the ocean, that have inherent decadal scales of variability (Salinger et al., 2016). Perhaps the most prominent among these is the Atlantic Meridional Overturning Circulation (AMOC). Decadal-scale variations in AMOC-related ocean

504 heat transport can influence SST over a wide area of the North Atlantic, and are thought to be a 505 critical component of North Atlantic basin-scale SST variation characterized by the Atlantic 506 Multidecadal Oscillation (AMO). For example, the abrupt warming observed in the mid-1990s in 507 the North Atlantic has been retrospectively predicted in several models (Pohlmann et al., 2009; 508 Robson et al., 2012; Yeager et al., 2012; Msadek et al., 2014a), with an increase of the AMOC 509 being responsible for the warming. The Pacific Decadal Oscillation (PDO) also has decadal 510 scales of variability and can be predicted a few years in advance, with significant impacts across 511 a broad area of the North Pacific and adjacent continental regions (Mochizuki et al., 2010; Meehl 512 and Teng, 2012). More idealized predictability studies also suggest the potential for substantial 513 decadal predictive skill in the Southern Ocean (Boer, 2004), associated with deep vertical mixing 514 and substantial decadal scale natural variability (Salinger et al., 2016). Nevertheless, unlike 515 seasonal climate predictions, which are operational, the field of decadal prediction is in a very 516 early stage (Meehl et al., 2014). Performance of decadal predictions needs to be assessed over a 517 wider range of models and systematic model errors have to be reduced further to increase their 518 utility to the marine resource community. Furthermore, the limited number of decadal-scale 519 fluctuations of the 30-40 year period for which retrospective forecasts are possible severely 520 restricts the effective sample size with which to characterize decadal prediction skill. Models 521 may demonstrate an ability to capture several prominent events over this time period, but it is 522 difficult to robustly generalize skill for this limited sample of independent decadal-scale events. 523 Sea ice is another LMR-relevant variable (Coyle et al., 2011; Hunt et al., 2011, Saba et 524 al., 2013), whose seasonal predictive skill has been assessed at a regional scale. Based on 525 estimates by the National Snow and Ice Data Center, September Arctic sea ice extent has 526 declined at a rate of about 14% per decade since the beginning of satellite records (Stroeve et al., 527 2014), a trend largely attributed to warming due to accumulating GHGs (e.g. Stroeve et al., 528 2012). In addition to these long-term changes, large year-to-year variations have been observed 529 in the position of the summer and winter sea ice edge. Operational and quasi-operational 530 initialized predictions show some skill in predicting summer Pan-Arctic sea ice extent when it 531 reaches its minimum in September, with significant correlation 3 to 6 months in advance at best 532 in a few dynamical models (Sigmond et al., 2013; Wang et al., 2013; Chevallier et al., 2013; 533 Msadek et al., 2014b). Sea ice thickness appears to provide the memory for sea ice extent 534 predictability from one summer to the next. Hence more accurate predictions could be expected

535 with improved observations of sea ice thickness and sea ice thickness initialization (Guemas et 536 al., 2016). While predictions of summer sea ice have important implications for shipping and 537 resource extraction, sea ice extent in late winter affects spring phytoplankton bloom timing and 538 ultimately fish production (Hunt et al., 2011). However, while enhanced forecast skill with up to 539 3 to 4 months of lead-time relative to a persistence forecast has been reported during fall and 540 early winter, forecast skill remains limited in late winter (Sigmond et al., 2013; Msadek et al., 541 2014b). Processes driving winter sea ice predictability include the representation of atmospheric dynamics like the position of the blocking high (Kwok, 2011), but also oceanic processes like 542 543 heat convergence that drives SST anomalies in the marginal seas (Bitz et al., 2005). On-going 544 studies based on improved model physics, improved parameterizations, and increased resolution 545 in the atmospheric and oceanic components of the models are expected to improve representation 546 of atmospheric dynamics, oceanic processes, and the mean distribution of sea ice, its seasonal 547 variations, and possibly its predictability. Such improvements may also impact SST prediction 548 skill (Stock et al., 2015).

549 While oceanic variables are of major importance for production and distribution of wild 550 and aquaculture species, river temperature and flow are additional influences on recruitment and 551 survival of commercially-important anadromous fish species, such as Pacific and Atlantic 552 salmon (Bryant, 2009; Jonsson and Jonsson, 2009) and stocks such as northwest Atlantic river 553 herring that have fallen below historical levels (Tommasi et al., 2015). In addition, these 554 variables affect nearshore ocean dynamics and hence impact aquaculture of estuarine species. 555 Seasonal stream flow predictability is thus of high interest to some industry groups and fisheries 556 management agencies. Land models incorporated in current seasonal to decadal climate 557 prediction systems, however, only provide a coarse representation of topography, river networks, 558 and land cover, and forecasts of hydrological properties are not very skillful if taken directly 559 from global dynamical forecast systems (Mo and Lettenmaier, 2014). Historically, land 560 resolution in models has limited topographic variability, which impacts snowfall, and as a result 561 has downstream influences on surface hydrology (e.g. reduced soil moisture and stream flow) in 562 mountainous regions and surrounding areas dependent on orographic precipitation and spring 563 and summer snowmelt (Kapnick and Delworth, 2013; Kapnick et al., 2014). This bias is 564 pronounced in western North America where mountain hydrology drives water availability 565 (Barnett et al., 2005). As a result, higher resolution hydrological models have been forced by the

566 larger scale input from coarser global climate models to produce hydrologic forecasts at scales 567 useful for decision makers (e.g. Mo and Lettenmaier, 2014). As prediction systems increase in 568 atmospheric and land surface resolution, precipitation and temperature prediction skill over 569 mountain regions also increases as topography is better resolved (Jia et al., 2015).

570 Aside from issues in resolution, hydrologic predictability is largely a function of initial 571 land surface conditions (primarily soil moisture and snow cover) and seasonal forecasts of 572 rainfall and temperature (Shukla et al., 2013; Yuan et al., 2015). In regions where snow and soil 573 moisture provide a long hydrological memory, such as the western United States or high altitude 574 locations, accurate initial conditions can provide skillful forecasts out to 3 to 6 months, 575 particularly during cold seasons (Koster et al., 2000; Mahanama et al., 2012; Shukla et al., 2013). 576 Similarly, in regions where the flow regime is controlled by groundwater rather than rainfall, 577 persistence of initial flow can provide a skillful seasonal forecast (e.g. Svensson, 2016). 578 However, over most of the globe, persistence skill decreases after a month (Shukla et al., 2013), 579 and improvements in the predictability of streamflow are made by incorporating climate 580 information into hydrological forecasting systems. Climate predictions systems can provide such 581 climate forcing inputs (i.e. precipitation and temperature predictions) (Mo and Lettenmaier, 582 2014). However, the precipitation prediction skill of current global dynamical forecast systems is 583 often too low to extend hydrological forecast skill beyond 1 month, particularly in dynamically 584 active regions (Mo and Lettenmaier, 2014). Skillful seasonal hydrological predictions out to 3 to 585 9 months lead-times have been obtained, however, by integrating into hydrological models 586 rainfall predictions derived from a climate index, such as the NAO, from a climate prediction 587 system (e.g. Svensson et al., 2015). Alternatively, skillful seasonal hydrological predictions have 588 been achieved by statistically integrating a climate index directly into a hydrological forecast 589 system (e.g. Piechota and Dracup, 1999; Karamouz and Zahraie, 2004; Wang et al., 2011; 590 Bradley et al., 2015).

591 Over recent years substantial effort has been placed on seasonal predictions of extreme 592 phenomena, particularly tropical (Camargo et al., 2007; Vecchi and Villarini, 2014) and 593 extratropical (e.g., Yang et al., 2015) cyclones. These extreme events threaten fishers' safety at 594 sea and can dramatically impact the aquaculture and fishing industry through lost production and 595 income with changes in fish survival and growth, reduction in water quality, and destruction of 596 essential fish habitat (e.g. coral reefs, seagrass beds) or infrastructure (Chang et al., 2013; 597 Hodgkinson et al., 2014). Although individual tropical cyclones are very much "weather" 598 phenomena, with no path to predictability beyond a few days, some aggregate statistics of 599 tropical cyclones are strongly influenced by predictable large-scale aspects of climate, such as 600 **ENSO** or other modes of variability (e.g., Gray, 1984). This has led to the development of a 601 number of skillful statistical (Klotzbach and Gray, 2009; Jagger and Elsner, 2010), dynamical 602 (Vitart and Stockdale, 2001; Vitart, 2006; Zhao et al., 2010; Chen and Lin, 2011; Vecchi et al., 603 2014; Murakami et al., 2015), and hybrid statistical-dynamical (Wang et al., 2009; Vecchi et al., 604 2011) prediction methodologies, which have targeted primarily basin-wide (e.g., North Atlantic, 605 West Pacific, etc.), seasonally-integrated statistics of tropical cyclone activity. More recently, 606 methodologies that exploit the ability of high-resolution GCMs to represent both regional 607 hurricane activity and its connection to climate variation and change have led to skillful seasonal 608 predictions of tropical cyclone activity at more regional scales (e.g., Vecchi et al., 2014; Zhang et 609 al., 2016, Murakami et al., in review). The coming years are likely to see an expansion in the 610 growth of tools for the seasonal prediction of tropical cyclones and many other extreme 611 phenomena, such as tornadoes (Elsner and Widen, 2014; Allen et al., 2015), and heat waves (Jia 612 et al., 2016) enabled by the widespread development of high-resolution dynamical prediction 613 models, improved understanding of the connection of weather extremes to large-scale conditions, 614 and the pressing societal need for information about the statistics of high-impact weather events 615 at regional scales.

- 616
- 617 618

3. Managing living marine resources in a dynamic environment

619 Management of LMRs is an exercise in trade-offs, requiring that managers balance 620 multiple, often competing objectives (e.g. Jennings et al., 2016). For instance, global policies and 621 the legal mandates of many countries require weighting conservation of commercial stocks 622 against their exploitation, protecting by catch species that are overfished or listed as endangered 623 or threatened, safeguarding of coastal economies and fishing communities, and balancing present 624 benefits to stakeholders against future losses (King et al., 2015). Fisheries managers acting on 625 the best available science are mandated to prevent overfishing while, on a continuing basis, 626 achieving high levels of benefits to society from fisheries and other seafood products. Fishers 627 must balance a parallel tradeoff between the value of current harvest and the maximum value of 628 future harvests. Similarly, aquaculture industry participants have to balance the value of expected 629 returns from capital investment against its opportunity costs.

630 LMR industry or management decisions are made all the more challenging because these 631 objectives must be achieved against the backdrop of a highly dynamic ocean environment. 632 Different decisions are made for different spatial and temporal scales (with regard to both lead-633 time and the application of the decision), and thus their effectiveness is influenced by climate-634 driven variability from across the climate system (Fig. 5). In this section, we summarize LMR 635 management and industry decisions made with lead-times from days to decades and the 636 frameworks used to make them, identifying the points where seasonal to decadal climate 637 predictions could inform decisions, and discuss the potential benefits of this information.

638

639 3.1. Industry Operations

640 For the aquaculture industry, key decisions include when to release fry, 'plant' and 641 harvest fish/shellfish, and when and what remedial actions to take to counter or avoid poor 642 conditions. Extreme events such as floods, storms, and tropical cyclones can dramatically 643 impact the aquaculture industry through reduction in water quality and destruction of 644 infrastructure (Hodgkinson et al., 2014). Anomalously warm or cold conditions can also result in 645 lost production and income via direct mortality effects, changes in growth or disease outbreaks 646 (Chang et al., 2013, Spillman and Hobday, 2014). Hence, nowcasts and daily environmental 647 forecasts are routinely used to improve the operational planning of the aquaculture industry. For 648 example, monitoring networks of coastal water chemistry have been essential to reduce the 649 impact of extremely low pH waters on oyster larval survival, increasing the economic resilience 650 of the Pacific Northwest shellfish industry (Barton et al., 2015). Similarly, estuarine conditions 651 are monitored to time release of hatchery reared salmon fry with optimal environmental 652 conditions for growth and survival (Kline et al., 2008). While information on current 653 environmental conditions is useful, seasonal forecasts of particular environmental variables can 654 further improve the operational planning activities and climate readiness of the aquaculture 655 industry by giving aquaculture farm managers time to develop and implement management 656 strategies that minimize losses to climate, as is outlined in Case Study 4.1 (Spillman and 657 Hobday, 2014; Spillman et al., 2015), or by allowing hatcheries time to adjust their release 658 schedule (Chittenden et al., 2010).

659

For the fishing industry, key decisions include investments in boats, gear and labor, as

660 well as when, where, and what to fish. Fishers rely on historical knowledge of the influence of 661 environment on fish distribution to optimize such investment and harvest decisions. However, 662 movement of environmental conditions into new ranges and associated changes in fish 663 distribution (Section 1) is now affecting the value of fishers' past knowledge, making it harder to 664 locate fish and make optimal pre-season investments, undermining their business performance 665 (Eveson et al., 2015). As demonstrated in Case Study 4.2, seasonal climate forecasts can be 666 incorporated into fish habitat models to produce fish distribution forecasts and improve the operational planning and efficiency of the fishing industry. 667

668 Such habitat models generally use correlative techniques to define regions of high 669 abundance, or high probability of occurrence, for a species of interest in relation to 670 oceanographic conditions. Species distribution data can be sourced from tagging studies, 671 fisheries-dependent records, fisheries-independent surveys, or other sources. The distribution 672 data is then related to one or multiple environmental variables (e.g. temperature, Hobday et al., 673 2011) through a variety of statistical methods, including generalized linear models (GLM), 674 generalized additive models (GAM), classification and regression trees (CART), and artificial 675 neural networks (ANN). When making century-scale projections of how fish distributions will 676 change due to shifts in climate and marine habitat distribution, other commonly used models 677 include Maxent (Phillips et al., 2006), Dynamic Bio-climate Envelope Model (DBEM; Cheung 678 et al., 2009), AquaMaps (Kaschner et al., 2006), and the Non-Parametric Probabilistic Ecological 679 Niche (NPPEN) model (Beaugrand et al., 2011). These models vary in assumptions and 680 complexity, and can at times give markedly different results when applied to the same dataset 681 (Lawler et al., 2006; Jones et al. 2013; Jones and Cheung 2014, Cheung et al. 2016a). For this 682 reason, it is advisable to use an ensemble of multiple models when it is practicable to do so. 683 Regardless of the statistical model used, all correlative habitat models assume that the 684 relationships observed between species distributions and environmental variables in the training 685 dataset are reliable proxies for actual mechanistic drivers of habitat preference. This assumption 686 can be reasonably robust, for example if statistical associations with temperature closely mirror 687 known physiological constraints, or more questionable, where a correlation is observed but the 688 mechanistic basis is unknown (Peck et al., 2013). This can limit the performance of habitat 689 models when they are extrapolated outside the range of the training dataset: either spatially into 690 other geographic regions, or temporally into past or future time periods (Brun et al. 2016).

691 Long-term industry decisions, such as long-term resource capitalization and 692 determination of optimal investment strategies for long-term sustainability can also be informed 693 by these same habitat models, driven by multi-annual to decadal rather than seasonal, climate 694 forecasts. Such long-term species distribution forecasts would help the fishing industry 695 determine, and initiate a discussion with managers on optimal licensing strategies in the face of a 696 changing environment, such as more flexible quota-transfer frameworks (McIlgorm et al., 2010). 697 For the aquaculture industry, multi-annual to decadal scale species distribution forecasts would 698 improve capital investment decisions such as where to establish a new site or estimate and sell 699 risk in a market place (Little et al., 2015).

700

701 3.2. Monitoring and closures

702 Public health officials and fisheries managers have to make decisions on when to close a 703 resource to protect the public, the resource itself, or, as for the case of bycatch species, resources 704 caught incidentally to fisheries operations. Decisions also have to be made on how best allocate 705 limited monitoring resources. Advanced estimates of stock distribution via bioclimatic habitat 706 models (Case Study 4.5) or more complex ecosystem models (Case Study 4.6) informed by 707 seasonal climate forecasts can guide planning for observer coverage and for fishery-independent 708 surveys to ensure that stocks are monitored across their distributions. Below we elaborate via 709 three examples on how short-term forecasts of climatic variability can be linked to triggers for 710 fisheries closures (e.g., harmful algal blooms), allow time to prepare response plans (e.g., in 711 response to coral bleaching), and reduce unwanted and incidental captures.

712 Harmful algal blooms (HABs), pathogens (e.g. Vibrio spp.), and dangerous marine 713 species such as jellyfish pose a significant threat to public health and fishery resources. Total 714 economic costs of HABs, including public health, commercial fishery, and tourism impacts, are 715 an average of \$49 million per year in the US alone (Anderson et al., 2000). For instance, an 716 unprecedented coastwide HAB in spring 2015 caused widespread closures of commercial and 717 recreational fisheries over the entire U.S. West Coast and led to substantial economic losses to 718 the seafood and tourism industries (McCabe et al., 2016). HAB-related fish-mortality is also 719 recognized as a significant problem in Europe (ICES, 2015), and HAB-related closures of 720 fisheries in eastern Tasmania and the west coast of North America have led to economic 721 hardship and are becoming more frequent (Lewitus et al., 2012; van Putten et al., 2015). To limit

23

such adverse effects, coastal resource managers have to estimate optimal allocation of

- monitoring resources, as well as appropriate times and locations for beach and shellfish bed
- 724 closures. If fishers can anticipate HAB-related closures, they can make informed decisions about
- which stocks to target and develop approaches to compensate for expected lost revenues.
- Nowcasts and short-term (e.g. lead-time less than a month) forecasts of pathogens and
 HAB likelihood or distribution have been successful in helping coastal planners target
 monitoring, guide beach and shellfish closures, water treatment practices, and minimize impacts
 on the tourism and fisheries and aquaculture industries

730 (http://coastalscience.noaa.gov/research/habs/forecasting; Stumpf and Culver, 2003; Constantin 731 de Magny, 2009). Such nowcasts and short-term forecasts are generally derived from an 732 empirical habitat model (Section 3.1) incorporating temperature and salinity fields from regional 733 hydrodynamic models driven by weather models (e.g. Constantin de Magny, 2009), though 734 mechanistic HAB models have also been developed (McGillicuddy et al., 2011). Integration of 735 seasonal climate forecasts into such frameworks could extend the lead-times of HABs and 736 pathogen forecasts, allowing coastal planners and impacted industries more time to develop 737 response strategies. Likewise, temperature-based surveillance tools dependent on seasonal SST 738 forecasts have been proposed to help monitor, research, and manage emerging marine disease 739 threats (Maynard et al., 2016).

740 Reduction of incidental capture of protected or over-exploited species during fishing 741 operations is an important management objective in many jurisdictions; and fisheries managers 742 are tasked with deciding what management actions are warranted to achieve this objective (e.g. 743 Howell et al., 2008; Smith et al., 2007). Spatial management strategies that restrict fisher access 744 in specific zones and at specific times have been successfully used to limit interactions between 745 bycatch species and fishing gears (Hobday et al., 2014; Lewison et al., 2015). However, as fish 746 move to remain in suitable physical and feeding conditions, fish distributions and phenology 747 change with varying ocean dynamics (Platt et al., 2003; Perry et al., 2005; Nye et al., 2009; 748 Pinsky et al., 2013; Asch, 2015), and therefore static time-area closures can be ineffective 749 (Hobday and Hartmann, 2006; Howell et al., 2008; Hobday et al., 2011; Howell et al., 2015). 750 Integration of real-time or forecast ocean conditions into a habitat preference model (Section 3.1) 751 is now being pursued to determine spatial distributions of species of concern and to set dynamic 752 time-area closures (Hobday and Hartmann, 2006; Howell et al., 2008; Hobday et al., 2011;

Howell et al., 2015; Dunn et al., 2016). For instance, nowcasts of the preferred habitat of
loggerhead and leatherback turtles are helping to reduce interactions between Hawaii swordfish
longline fishing vessels and these endangered species (Howell et al., 2008; Howell et al., 2015).
The utility of seasonal forecasts in setting effective dynamic spatial management strategies
(Maxwell et al., 2015) to reduce bycatch is exemplified in Case Study 4.7.

758

759 3.3. Provision of Catch Advice

760 Setting annual catch quotas, or adjustments to fishing seasons or effort, is one of the most 761 critical and difficult decisions taken by fisheries managers. In the United States, Annual Catch 762 Limits (ACLs) are mandated to not exceed scientifically determined sustainable catch levels 763 (Methot et al., 2014). Such intensive management of fishing levels occurs in other fishery 764 systems and has been considered key to effective control of exploitation rates (Worm et al., 765 2009). ACLs are dependent on a control rule that basically defines the fraction of the fish stock 766 that can be safely harvested each year. The control rule is designed to achieve a large fraction of 767 the biologically possible "Maximum Sustainable Yield", based on a forecast of stock abundance 768 over the next one to several years and biological reference points. Reference points, such as the fishing rate that achieves the maximum long-term average yield (F_{msy}), reflect the long-term 769 770 productivity of a fish stock and are the basis for a management system to maintain annual fishing 771 mortalities at a target level that does not lead to overfishing (Quinn and Deriso, 1999).

772 Reference points and forecasts of stock status are based upon stock assessment models, 773 which commonly are data-assimilating, age-structured models of a single stock's population 774 dynamics (Methot, 2009; Maunder and Punt, 2013). Typically, these lack spatial structure, while 775 focusing on temporal dynamics on an annual time step over several decades. We refer readers to 776 Quinn and Deriso (1999) for a detailed description of a range of stock assessment models, 777 differing in complexity and data requirements. The parameters of the model, e.g., annual 778 recruitment, natural mortality rates, annual fishing mortality rates, etc., are calibrated by 779 assimilating data on fishery catch, fish abundance from surveys, and the age or length 780 composition of fish in the surveys and catch. Nielsen and Berg (2014) illustrate recent advances. 781 The effects of ecological (e.g. predator abundance) or physical factors on population

dynamics are rarely modeled explicitly: a recent meta-analysis showed that just 24 out of the
1200 assessments incorporated such information (Skern-Mauritzen et al., 2015). These

unmeasured, non-fishing driving factors are only accounted for by allowing the models to

785 incorporate random variability in key model parameters, particularly recruitment, or by

incorporating empirical measured inputs, particularly regarding fish body weight-at-age.

787 However, without including the process causing the fluctuations in the model framework, there

is no basis for refining the random forecast into the future.

789 Reference points are thus generally computed assuming quasi-equilibrium conditions and 790 stationary stock productivity (Quinn and Deriso, 1999). However, in many fish populations, 791 ecosystem and climate can shift the production curve over time (Mohn and Chouinard, 2007; 792 Munch and Kottas, 2009; Payne et al., 2009; Payne et al., 2012; Peterman and Dorner, 2012; 793 Vert-pre et al., 2013; Bell et al., 2014; Perälä and Kuparinen, 2015), calling this assumption into 794 question. Failure to include variability in any component of productivity, such as recruitment, 795 natural mortality, and growth, into the development of reference points and annual catch advice 796 can lead to unexpected population declines when productivity shifts to unanticipated low levels 797 (Brunel et al., 2010; Brooks, 2013; Morgan et al., 2014). Furthermore, the use of static reference 798 points can contribute to inaccurate estimates of stock recovery time and rebuilding thresholds 799 (Collie and Spencer, 1993; Holt and Punt, 2009; Hammer et al., 2010; Punt, 2011; Pershing et 800 al., 2015).

801 Nevertheless, robust alternatives to the status quo definitions of reference points have yet 802 to be developed. For stocks that have undergone recognized shifts in productivity over their 803 catch history, dynamic reference points can be constructed using data from the most current 804 regime, as is currently done for Gulf of Alaska walleye pollock (Dorn et al., 2014) or southeast 805 Australian morwong (Wayte, 2013). However, performance of such reference points in achieving 806 management objectives as compared to the status quo has been mixed (Punt et al., 2014a, b). A 807 common shortcoming is that using a shorter time series leads to less biased, but more uncertain, 808 reference points (Haltuch et al., 2009; Dorner et al., 2013; Punt et al., 2014b). Furthermore, even 809 dynamic reference points assume that the recent past will be representative of near future 810 conditions. Because of the noisy nature of productivity parameters, such as recruitment, 811 productivity shifts tend to be recognizable only well after the change has taken place, preventing 812 managers from adjusting harvest strategies in a timely manner, and increasing the risk of 813 overfishing (A'mar et al., 2009; Szuwalski and Punt, 2013). Statistical techniques such as the 814 Kalman filter, which allow for time varying productivity parameters in stock assessment models,

815 have proven useful in a timely detection of productivity shifts and improved reference point

816 estimation for semelparous species (Peterman et al., 2000; Peterman et al., 2003; Collie et al.,

817 2012). Temporal variability in reference points can also be introduced via environmental

818 covariates on productivity parameters. When these environmental factors can be skillfully

819 forecasted and the environment-population dynamics relationship is robust, the fish productivity

820 forecast is improved (Maunder and Watters, 2003; Schirripa et al., 2009; Haltuch and Punt,

821 2011; Johnson et al., 2015; Miller et al., 2016).

822 Effectiveness of alternative reference point definitions and climate-robust harvest control 823 rules can be tested through Management Strategy Evaluation (MSE). MSE is a simulation tool 824 for comparing the trade-offs in the performance of alternative management strategies while 825 accounting from uncertainty from different sources, such as climate responses, biological 826 interactions, fishery dynamics, model parametrizations, observations, and management 827 approaches (Cooke, 1999; Butterworth and Punt, 1999; Sainsbury et al., 2000). While the utility 828 of accounting for the environment in achieving management objectives has been demonstrated 829 for some species (Basson, 1999; Agnew et al., 2002; Brunel et al., 2010; Hurtado-Ferro et al., 830 2010; Pershing et al., 2015; Miller et al., 2016), existing MSEs demonstrate that climate drivers 831 of stock productivity show mixed results with respect to the effectiveness of alternative, 832 potentially climate-robust, management strategies when compared to those currently 833 implemented (A'mar et al., 2009; Punt et al., 2011; Szuwalski and Punt, 2013; Punt et al., 2014). 834 One exception is the Pacific sardine fishery; whose catch targets vary with a reference point 835 dependent on a 3-year moving average of past SST (Hill et al., 2014).

Through the use of seasonal climate forecast information, climate informed reference points as used operationally for the US sardine fishery, would be more reflective of future productivity. This may help managers both adjust annual catch targets in a timely manner and set more realistic rebuilding targets (Tommasi et al., accepted.). Effectiveness of such climateinformed reference points will depend upon achieving climate forecast skill at the seasonal to decadal scale, and on past observations used to identify environmental drivers of productivity being able to adequately characterize future relationships.

Addition of climate forecast information into stock assessment models may also reduce uncertainty bounds on stock status projections by narrowing the window of probable outcomes as compared to the use of the entire historical range (Fig. 7a). Furthermore, if a stock

27

- 846 productivity parameter is subject to an environmentally-driven shift or directional trend, future
- 847 values may lie outside of the historical probability space, leading to biased estimates of stock
- status under the assumption of stationarity (Fig. 7b and 7c). As a result, a climate forecast may
- 849 serve as an advance warning of shifts in environmental conditions and stock productivity
- 850 parameters, and may reduce bias in stock status estimates (Fig. 7b and 7c).

851 It must be stressed that the theoretical value of climate forecast information detailed in 852 Fig. 7 is dependent on both the strength of the environment-fisheries relationship and climate 853 forecast skill. That is, we assume that the environment-fisheries relationship is robust and 854 stationary, that a relatively high proportion of the unexplained variability can be explained by the 855 environmental data (e.g. Basson, 1999), and the environment can be well predicted. For instance, 856 if the environment-fisheries relationship breaks down, climate-driven harvest control rules will 857 perform poorly (Fig. 2d), highlighting the need for a strong mechanistic understanding of the 858 environment-fisheries link (Dorner et al., 2013), or more conservative management approaches 859 when the fluctuations cannot be predicted with adequate precision.

860

861 3.4. Spatial Issues and Protected Areas

In addition to multi-year forecasts of stock status and revisions of reference points (Section 3.3), multi-year to decadal fisheries management decisions encompass long-term spatial planning decisions regarding changes to closed areas, the setting of future closures, preparation for emerging fisheries, and adjustment of quotas for internationally shared fish stocks. Even decisions about which management body has jurisdiction may need adjustment over time.

867 As for short-term spatial management rules aimed at bycatch reduction (Section 3.2), 868 stock distributions employed in the setting of current long-term closed areas are generally taken 869 as static. Fish assessment models generally lack spatial structure, and thus have no inherent 870 capability to forecast changes in stock distribution as ocean conditions shift the distribution of 871 the stock, nor to calculate the localized impact of a spatially restricted fishery or reserve 872 (McGilliard et al., 2015). However, the spatial distribution of many marine species has been 873 shown to be particularly sensitive to changes in climate over multi-annual to decadal scales (Nye 874 et al., 2009; Pinsky et al., 2013; Poloczanska et al., 2013; Bell et al., 2015; Thorson et al. 2016). 875 Such climate-driven distributional shifts can have important implications for spatial 876 management measures. For example, shifts of juvenile plaice (Pleuronectes platessa) towards

877 deeper waters have made a closed area (the "Plaice Box") set up in the North Sea to prevent 878 recruitment overfishing less effective (van Keeken et al., 2007). One potential solution for stocks 879 that have undergone recognized shifts distribution over their catch history is use of dynamic 880 seasonal-area closures. Climate predictions, particularly of surface and bottom temperatures, 881 could be used to drive species habitat models that help define fishery closure areas (Section 3.1; 882 Link et al., 2011; Makino et al., 2014; Shackell et al., 2014; Rutterford et al., 2015). 883 Furthermore, seasonal to decadal predictions (as well as nowcasts and hindcasts) of 884 environmental conditions may contribute to management even if they are not directly 885 incorporated within stock assessments. For instance, the Northeast US butterfish (Poronotus 886 triacanthus) assessment investigated methods to incorporate historical change in thermal habitat 887 to evaluate changing availability to the survey. While habitat-driven time-varying survey 888 catchability was not included in the final assessment, the focused effort to evaluate survey 889 catchability overall altered assessment estimates of scale, permitted more robust estimation of 890 natural mortality, and ultimately increased the catch quota relative to previous results.

891 Shifting species distributions can also create important new fishing opportunities, such as 892 the squid fishery in the Gulf of Maine that appeared during a particularly warm year (Mills et al., 893 2013). Hence, forecasts of species distributions driven by multi-year to decadal climate 894 predictions can help identify which species are likely to spark new fisheries, and then prioritize 895 them for additional research, experimental fishing programs, or short-term closures during the 896 colonization phase. Such forecasts can also warn of distributional shifts outside of the range of 897 current fisheries operations, and may prevent overfishing of the remaining portion of the stock.

898 Advance warning of shifting distributions is particularly important when they impact 899 international agreements, since negotiations can take years. For example, mackerel faced a 900 "double jeopardy" scenario when they partially shifted into Icelandic and Faeroese waters and 901 the additional harvest pressure led to overfishing of the stock (Astthorsson et al., 2012; 902 Hannesson, 2012; Dankel et al., 2015). Pre-agreements between organizations or nations can be 903 drafted to create a clear set of rules for how to adjust quotas and allocations based on indicators 904 of changes in a stock distribution, perhaps including side-payments to compensate for lost 905 fishing opportunities (Miller and Munro, 2004). For instance, forecasts of ocean conditions are 906 used to forecast the proportion of Fraser River salmon migrating around the south end of 907 Vancouver Island, thus dramatically affecting international allocation of the catch opportunity

908 (Groot and Quinn, 1987). Forecasts may also be critical for building a common understanding of909 stock trajectories and for motivating the need for pre-agreements.

910

911 4. Case Studies

912

913 The previous two sections have provided an overview of the range of marine resource 914 decisions that could be improved with climate forecasts and of climate forecast skill for LMR-915 relevant variables across decision making time scales. In this section, we highlight pioneering 916 applications of the climate predictions discussed in Section 2.

917

918 4.1 Seasonal forecasts to improve prawn aquaculture farm management

919 Pond-based prawn aquaculture in Australia is primarily located on the northeast coast of 920 Queensland (Fig. 8). Growing season length, timing of harvest, and farm production in this 921 region are strongly influenced by environmental conditions, such as air temperature, rainfall, and 922 extreme events, including tropical cyclones. Anomalously cool or warm temperatures can impact 923 production and timing of harvest, thus affecting delivery to market. Rainfall extremes, including 924 tropical cyclones, affect freshwater quality and supply to farms, road access in the case of 925 flooding, and can also cause loss of farm infrastructure. In this situation, predictions of 926 environmental conditions weeks to months in advance can improve risk management and allow 927 implementation of proactive management strategies to reduce unfavorable impacts and maximize 928 positive effects of conditions on farm production.

929 Seasonal forecast products for Queensland prawn farms were first developed in 2011-930 2012 (Spillman et al., 2015) and currently continue to be delivered via a password protected 931 website. Regional temperature and precipitation forecasts are derived from the global dynamical 932 seasonal prediction system POAMA (Predictive Ocean Atmosphere Model for Australia; 933 Spillman and Alves, 2009; Spillman et al. 2011), and then downscaled using local weather 934 station information for participating prawn farms. The forecasts were verified by assessing the 935 probabilistic skill of the model predicting the upper terciles for maximum air temperature and 936 rainfall, and the lower tercile for minimum temperature, as these were the events of greatest 937 concern to prawn farm managers. Forecast accuracy is generally higher for temperature than 938 rainfall, and declines with lead-time (Fig. 8). Forecasts out to lead-times of 2 months, which 939 aligns with several farm operational planning timeframes, such as those for feed management or

harvest time (Hobday et al., 2016), are sufficiently skillful to be integrated within prawn farm
management decision framework (Spillman et al., 2015).

942 Feedback from prawn farm managers following delivery of the first few forecasts led to
943 refinement of forecast format, visualization and delivery, and resulted in an industry award for
944 the project team. This approach has been applied to other marine aquaculture industries (e.g.
945 salmon; Spillman and Hobday, 2014), with industry recognition that a range of management
946 decisions can be supported by environmental forecasts to improve aquaculture production in the
947 face of climate variability and change.

948

949 *4.2 Seasonal forecasts to improve economic efficiency of a large-scale tuna fishery*

950 Large numbers of juvenile quota-managed southern bluefin tuna (SBT) (Thunnus 951 *maccovii*) occur in the Great Australian Bight (GAB) during the austral summer (Dec-Apr), 952 where they are caught in a purse-seine fishery worth ~AUD 60 million annually. In recent 953 fishing seasons, unexpected changes in the distribution of SBT were observed that affected the 954 timing and location of fishing activity and contributed to economic pressure on the fishery. In 955 particular, in the 2011/12 season, SBT moved through the GAB quickly and were distributed 956 further east than in the past two decades. This resulted in less than 15% of purse-seine catches 957 being taken from fishing grounds reliably used over the previous 20 years. The following season 958 (2012/13) also saw unusual SBT distribution patterns that again impacted the fishery. As a result 959 of these observed changes, the Australian Southern Bluefin Tuna Industry Association 960 recognized the need for scientific support to improve operational planning in the purse-seine 961 fishery. Many decisions central to SBT industry members planning their fishing operations need 962 to be made weeks to months in advance, so seasonal forecasts of environmental conditions were 963 regarded as a useful tool.

Environmental variables influencing the spatial distribution of SBT in the GAB during summer were explored using location data collected on SBT over many years from electronic tags, and comparing the ocean conditions where fish were found with the conditions available to them throughout the region and time period of interest (Eveson et al., 2015). SST was found to have the greatest influence, with fish preferring temperatures in the range of 19-22°C. Once habitat preferences were established, this information was coupled with POAMA (see Section 4.1) to predict locations of preferred SBT habitat in future. Both the habitat preference model 971 and POAMA were evaluated against historical observations, and it was concluded that SST-972 based habitat forecasts for SBT in the GAB have useful skill for lead-times up to 2 months. A 973 daily-updating website was created to provide industry with forecasts of environmental 974 conditions and SBT distributions for the next fortnight and next 2 calendar months from the date 975 of issue (Fig. 9), along with a suite of other relevant information, including skill of the forecasts 976 (www.cmar.csiro.au/gab-forecasts). Based on feedback from industry stakeholders obtained 977 both formally through a survey and informally through an industry liaison representative, the 978 information provided on the website has proven to be a valuable tool for fishers making 979 decisions such as when and where to position vessels and to conduct fishing operations (Eveson 980 et al., 2015). As the SBT fishery is quota-managed, the forecasting approach will not lead to 981 increased catches (and thus impact sustainability), but will enable fishers to catch their quota 982 more efficiently, thereby increasing profitability.

983

984 *4.3 A statistical seasonal forecast to improve the operational planning of a lobster fishery*

985 The US fishery for American lobster is one of the most valuable in the country. Landings 986 in Maine alone accounted for nearly US\$500M in 2015. The fishery is open year-round, but the 987 catch is highly seasonal. In Maine, where the majority of lobsters are landed, landings typically 988 begin increasing rapidly during the first week of July, when lobster migrate inland and begin to 989 molt. During 2012, the Gulf of Maine was at the center of a prolonged "marine heatwave," 990 which caused temperatures in the spring to lead the normal annual cycle by 3-4 weeks (Mills et 991 al., 2013). The annual lobster migration and molt took place nearly a month early, resulting in 992 very high catches in early June instead of early July. The supply chain was not ready for the 993 influx of newly molted soft-shell lobsters, and the imbalance between supply and demand led to 994 a severe decline in price. Furthermore, record warm air temperatures contributed to increased 995 mortality of lobsters during storage and transport. Thus, even though lobster landings set a 996 record in 2012, it was an economically challenging year for many lobstermen.

997 Motivated by the events in 2012, the possibility of an early warning indicator of lobster 998 fishery timing was explored and it was found that the date when landings in Maine begin to 999 increase is negatively correlated with subsurface temperatures in March and April. Based on this 1000 relationship, a statistical forecast system was developed that takes temperatures at 50 m from a 1001 network of coastal ocean buoys operated by the Northeast Regional Association of Coastal

32

1002 Ocean Observing Systems (NERACOOS) in spring and estimates the probability of the fishery 1003 shifting into the high-landings period during a particular week in June or July. For the last two 1004 years, the first forecast of the year has been announced to the industry at the Maine Fishermen's 1005 Forum and then updated weekly at www.gmri.org/lobster-forecast and via Twitter (Fig. 10). 1006 Forecasters have now begun to work more closely with harvesters, dealers, and marketers in the 1007 industry to assess how it can be further improved to meet their needs. Other work has identified 1008 value in using sea temperature observations and models to help forecast outbreaks of lobster 1009 epizootic shell disease (Maynard et al., 2016).

1010

1011 4.4 Seasonal forecasts to improve coral reef management

1012 Increases in ocean temperature over a coral's tolerance limit are the leading cause of 1013 coral bleaching events (Hoegh-Guldberg et al., 2007). Since 1997, NOAA's Coral Reef Watch 1014 has been using SST satellite data to provide near real-time warnings of coral bleaching (Liu et 1015 al., 2014). While coral reef managers and scientists have been able to use these nowcasts to 1016 execute operational response plans, managers recognized the need for longer lead-time forecasts 1017 to improve management responses to coral bleaching. Following these requests, NOAA Coral 1018 Reef Watch developed the first seasonal coral bleaching outlook, based on a statistical model 1019 from NOAA's Earth System Research Laboratory (Liu et al., 2009). In 2009 the Australian 1020 Bureau of Meteorology developed the first dynamical seasonal forecasts for coral bleaching risk 1021 on the Great Barrier Reef, based on seasonal SST predictions from POAMA (see Section 4.1; 1022 Spillman and Alves, 2009; Spillman, 2011). NOAA Coral Reef Watch, in turn, developed a 1023 dynamical 4 month lead coral bleaching outlook for coral reefs globally using seasonal SST 1024 predictions from the NOAA National Centers for Environmental Prediction (NCEP) global 1025 dynamical climate prediction system, the CFS model (Eakin et al., 2012). 1026 These seasonal coral bleaching forecasts are made publicly available on the internet 1027 (http://www.bom.gov.au/oceanography/oceantemp/GBR_SST.shtml, http://coralreefwatch.noaa.gov/satellite/bleachingoutlook_cfs/outlook_cfs.php) and they allow 1028 1029 coral reef managers around the world to develop timely and proactive bleaching response plans, 1030 brief stakeholders and allocate monitoring resources in advance of bleaching events. Resource 1031 managers and scientists have been using these bleaching outlooks extensively throughout the 1032 2014-16 global coral bleaching event (Eakin et al., 2014; Eakin et al., 2016).

1034 Malaysian governments closed numerous popular dive sites to reduce additional stress to 1035 severely bleached reefs (Thomas and Heron, 2011). In May 2016, Thailand again closed ten 1036 reefs, this time in advance of the bleaching peak (The Guardian 2016, 1037 https://www.theguardian.com/environment/2016/may/26/thailand-closes-dive-sites-over-coral-1038 bleaching-crisis. Accessed August 15, 2016) and in response to these forecast systems. More 1039 recently, once Coral Reef Watch alerts were issued in late June 2015 of the high potential for 1040 bleaching in Hawaiian waters (Fig. 11), the Hawaii Department of Land and Natural Resources 1041 (DLNR) immediately began preparations of resources to monitor this event. Having only seen 1042 significant multi-island bleaching in the main islands twice before, in 1996 and 2014 (Jokiel and 1043 Brown, 2004; Bahr et al., 2015), a much more comprehensive effort was needed. Additional 1044 volunteers were trained, who, together with teams from the state, University of Hawaii, NOAA, 1045 and XL Catlin Seaview Survey, were deployed across most of the islands. This group was able to 1046 document and monitor this unprecedented event, while the DLNR was able to alert the public 1047 and work with marine resource users to encourage reduction of activities that could further stress the corals during the bleaching event. Additionally, DLNR undertook an effort to collect 1048 1049 specimens of the rarest coral species from the main Hawaiian Islands and safeguard them in their 1050 coral nurseries on Oahu and Maui. Many of these species suffered severe bleaching and 1051 mortality, and DLNR staff have been unable to find one of these species alive off Oahu since the 1052 2015 event. Both Bureau of Meteorology and NOAA seasonal forecast tools were also used

For example, in August 2010, following severe coral bleaching, the Thailand and

1053 extensively by reef management during the most recent bleaching event on the Great Barrier

1054 Reef in the summer of 2015/2016, currently believed to be the worst on record

1055 (http://www.gbrmpa.gov.au).

1056

1033

1057 4.5 Seasonal forecasts of Pacific sardine habitat

1058Pacific sardines are notable as one of the few stocks managed with respect to climatic1059variability in the US. Just recently, sardine distribution and migration forecasts have been1060produced (Kaplan et al., 2016; Fig. 12) for the US Pacific Northwest and Canadian British1061Columbia, based on 6 to 9 month predictions of ocean conditions

1062 (http://www.nanoos.org/products/j-scope/; Siedlecki et al., 2016). These predictions rely upon

1063 the NOAA NCEP global dynamical climate prediction system Climate Forecast System (Saha et

1064 al., 2006) to force a high resolution (~1.5 km) Regional Ocean Modeling System (Haidvogel et 1065 al., 2008). The efforts are fully described in Siedlecki et al. (2016), including skill assessment 1066 for SST, bottom temperature, and oxygen. Relationships between sardine distribution and J-1067 SCOPE predictions of ocean physics and chlorophyll were estimated for 2009. The final fitted 1068 relationships between SST and salinity had moderate skill to predict sardine distributions 1069 (presence or absence) in summer 2013 and 2014, with up to 4 to 5 month lead-times. Skill 1070 assessment focused on a "hit rate" metric, area-under-the-curve (AUC), which balances the 1071 desire to correctly predict sardine presence against the risk of false positives. One caveat to the 1072 sardine forecasts is that they predict available sardine habitat (Fig. 12) without accounting for 1073 sardine stock size. Recent declines in sardine abundance (Hill et al., 2015) have likely meant a 1074 contraction of the stock southward (MacCall, 1990), despite availability of suitable habitat in the 1075 US Pacific Northwest and British Columbia.

1076 As with many pelagic species, sardines are seasonally migratory and forecasts of their 1077 distribution by J-SCOPE may be relevant for fisheries management and industry. The sardine 1078 stock is landed by US, Mexican and Canadian fishers and the extent of the northward summer 1079 migration is dependent on both water temperature and population contraction due to low 1080 population abundance. The sardine forecasts by Kaplan et al. (2016) predict the extent of this 1081 northward migration and could be used to plan fishing operations (e.g. whether Canadian fish 1082 processors should expect sardine deliveries) or fisheries surveys. Additionally, quotas apportion 1083 a fixed percent of sardine catch to Canadian vessels, and J-SCOPE provides foresight that that 1084 this portion may be unharvested in a particular cold year. Furthermore, sardine straddle 1085 international boundaries, and short-term seasonal forecasts may help international management 1086 and industry to cope with and prepare for the long-term distribution shifts expected under climate 1087 change (Pinsky and Mantua, 2014). To date, forecasts have primarily been delivered through 1088 collaboration with NANOOS (Northwest Association of Networked Ocean Observing Systems) 1089 via the web (http://www.nanoos.org/products/j-scope/). Web products include predictions of 1090 ecological indicators relevant to the regional fishery management council, and will soon be 1091 incorporated in NOAA's Integrated Ecosystem Assessment (Harvey et al., 2014). Other outreach 1092 efforts are ongoing and aim to produce targeted forecasts (as discussed for Australia above in 1093 Section 4.1) for fishery managers and stakeholders, and to better integrate with fishery 1094 management council needs.
1095

1096

4.6 Short-term forecasts of Indonesian tuna fisheries to control illegal fishing

1097 The last decade has seen the generalization of satellite Vessel Monitoring Systems to 1098 monitor licensed fishing vessels, the use of satellite radar images to detect illegal fishing and the 1099 development of Electronic Reporting Systems (ERS) to provide catch statistics in real time. 1100 Integration of these developments in fishery monitoring with an operational forecasting model of 1101 fish spatial dynamics that has the ability to predict the distribution of fish under the influence of 1102 both environmental variability and fishing is assisting Indonesian fishing authorities in 1103 controlling illegal fishing and implementing conservation measures. This operational monitoring 1104 framework (Gehlen et al., 2015) was developed through the INDESO project and integrates a 1105 high resolution regional model system coupling ocean physics to biogeochemistry (NEMO/ 1106 PISCES; Gutknecht et al., 2016; Tranchant et al., 2016) to a spatially explicit tuna population 1107 dynamics model (SEAPODYM; Lehodey et al., 2010; 2015). SEAPODYM simulates functional 1108 groups of organisms at the intermediate trophic levels (Lehodey et al., 2010; 2015) and the 1109 dynamics of their predators (e.g. tuna) (Lehodey et al., 2008). The model is complemented by a 1110 quantitative parameter estimation and calibration approach (Senina et al., 2008) which enables 1111 the application of the model to fish stock assessment and testing of management scenarios (Sibert et al., 2012). 1112

1113 Tuna are highly migratory species, and their habitats cover large expanses of the global 1114 ocean. Thus, the simulation of fish stock dynamics at high resolution in the Indonesian region 1115 requires accounting for exchanges (fluxes) with populations outside of the regional domain (i.e. 1116 Pacific and Indian Ocean) under the influence of both environmental variability (e.g. ENSO) and fishing mortality. Boundary conditions for the regional 1/12° SEAPODYM implementation are 1117 1118 obtained from a 1/4° global operational configuration (Fig.13) driven by temperature and 1119 currents from the operational ocean prediction system Mercator-Ocean PSY3V3 (Lellouche et 1120 al., 2013). Biogeochemical forcings (net primary production (NPP), dissolved oxygen) are either derived solely from the coupled physical-biogeochemical model NEMO/ PISCES (forecast 1121 1122 mode) or from NEMO/PISCES and satellite ocean color and SST data (to estimate NPP; 1123 Behrenfeld and Falkowski, 1997), along with climatological dissolved oxygen (O₂) (hindcast and 1124 nowcast modes). The regional operational model SEAPODYM also uses a climatological data 1125 set (i.e., monthly average of the last 5 years) of fishing effort prepared from the best available

1126 information to apply an average fishing mortality. The forecasting system runs every week and

1127 delivers one week of hindcast, one week of nowcast, and 10 days of forecast. These outputs are

1128 used by the Indonesian Fishing Authority to improve the collection and verification of fishing

1129 data, to assist illegal fishing surveillance, and to establish conservation measures (e.g.,

1130 identification and protection of spawning grounds and nurseries) required for the sustainable

1131 exploitation of this essential resource (Marion Gehlen, personal communication, June 22, 2016).

1132

1133 4.7 Seasonal forecasts for dynamic spatial management of the Australian east coast tuna fishery

1134 Since 2003, a dynamic spatial management approach has been used to limit unwanted 1135 capture of a quota-managed species, SBT, in the Australian eastern tuna and billfish fishery. The 1136 approach combines a habitat model, conditioned with temperature preference data obtained from 1137 pop-up satellite archival tags deployed on SBT and an ocean model to produce near real-time 1138 habitat nowcasts, delivered by email and utilized the same day by fishery managers during the fishing season (Hobday and Hartmann, 2006; Hobday et al., 2010). Managers use this 1139 1140 information along with other data inputs (such as recent fishing catch rates) to restrict access in 1141 the core (high probability of occurrence) zone to vessels that have both observers and SBT quota. 1142 The habitat model was extended in 2011 to include a seasonal forecasting component using 1143 ocean temperature forecasts from the seasonal prediction system POAMA, with useful forecast 1144 skill out to several months (Hobday et al., 2011). Both nowcast and seasonal forecast habitat 1145 maps produced for managers show probabilistic zones of tuna distribution coded as "OK" 1146 (unlikely to encounter SBT), "Buffer" (likely to encounter SBT) and "Core" (very likely to 1147 encounter SBT) (Fig. 14). Incorporating a seasonal forecasting component has been an 1148 important step in informing and encouraging both managers and fishers to think about decisions 1149 on longer time scales (Hobday et al., 2016). Forecasts are now delivered via a dedicated webpage 1150 (http://www.cmar.csiro.au/sbt-east-coast/). The dynamic habitat forecasting approach has 1151 reduced the need for large areas closures while still meeting the management goal, but does 1152 require fishing operators to develop more flexible fishing strategies, including planning vessel 1153 movements, home port selection and quota purchase.

1154

1155 **5. Recommended practices**

1156 Following Hobday et al. (2016) and Siedlecki et al. (2016), there are three main 1157 components to a successful LMR forecast framework: assessment of needs, forecast 1158 development, and forecast delivery. Here, we break down the forecast development and delivery 1159 stages further to provide more details of the forecast implementation process (Fig. 15). 1160 Identification of a clear management need via effective communication between climate 1161 scientists and management or industry stakeholders from the start of the forecast development 1162 process is essential for the utility and widespread adoption of climate prediction tools for LMRs 1163 (Hobday et al., 2016; Harrison and Williams, 2007; Fig. 15). This needs assessment should 1164 include the determination of relevant variables, spatial domain, spatial resolution, and timescales. Once needs have been assessed, it is incumbent upon scientists to provide balanced 1165 1166 communication of both capabilities and limitations to evaluate whether forecasts are likely to be 1167 useful to their partners.

1168 Forecast development is underpinned by an understanding of the mechanisms relating 1169 physical climate variables to the LMR of interest. Once such linkages are found, three forecast 1170 development steps follow: an assessment of the skill of the physical climate variable forecast, an 1171 assessment of the skill of the LMR model forecast, and the uncertainty associated with each. The 1172 prediction skill for the physical climate variables must be assessed at an appropriate timescale 1173 relative to the management decision timeframe and at a spatial resolution able to resolve 1174 environmental driving mechanisms. Skill assessment will make use of retrospective forecasts and 1175 observations. When reanalyses are used in lieu of observations, their accuracy at the scale of 1176 interest should be confirmed against data prior to forecast skill assessment whenever possible 1177 (Section 3). If the skill evaluation indicates that the variables of interest cannot be skillfully 1178 forecasted at an adequate lead-time and/or relevant spatial scale, stakeholder expectations may 1179 be re-evaluated and alternate variables or scales of interest investigated (i.e. it may be necessary 1180 to return to the needs assessment step). Alternatively, downscaling or bias correction techniques 1181 may improve skill at the desired scale in some cases (Section 6). Skill may be assessed using at 1182 least measures of correlation, variability, and bias between forecast and observations, although 1183 further verification analyses are possible (Mason and Stephenson, 2007).

1184 Once a physical climate variable forecast has been developed and determined to be 1185 skillful, the value of using it in an LMR model must be determined. LMR model skill assessment 1186 can employ skill metrics based on "hit rate", such as AUC or area-under-the-curve (Fielding and 1187 Bell, 1997) and the True Skill Statistics (Allouche et al., 2006), to evaluate whether the LMR 1188 forecasts reproduce biological phenomena (e.g., presence of tuna, occurrence of a coral 1189 bleaching event). While it is well known that climate affects LMRs (Section 1), most of derived 1190 climate-LMR relationships are empirical, with climate variables often acting as proxies of 1191 complex trophic effects, interspecies interactions, and dispersal processes. For climate 1192 information to be included in LMR management frameworks, the environment-fisheries 1193 relationship has to be robust and preferably based on mechanistic, ecologically-sound 1194 hypotheses. A sufficiently long observational data series is required for model calibration and 1195 verification (Haltuch and Punt, 2011), including out-of-sample validation (Francis, 2006; Mason 1196 and Baddour, 2007; Mason and Stephenson, 2007). In addition, if the environment-fisheries 1197 relationship relies on stock assessment model output (e.g. recruitment), it is important that this 1198 relationship be developed within the stock assessment model itself rather than as a post-hoc 1199 analysis to ensure uncertainties associated with the stock assessment model are properly 1200 propagated (Maunder and Watters, 2003; Brooks and Deroba, 2015). Furthermore, to increase 1201 confidence in the robustness of these empirical relationships, meta-analytical techniques can be 1202 employed to ensure that the proposed hypothesis is robust across a species range (Myers, 1998), 1203 taking into account, however, that environmental variables may affect species differently across 1204 their latitudinal range (e.g. Mantua et al., 1997).

1205 As environment-LMR associations may change over time (e.g. with changing baselines 1206 under climate change), these empirical relationships need to be periodically re-evaluated as new 1207 environmental and LMR data are collected. LMR forecast development will therefore be an 1208 iterative process and management has to be dynamic to allow for changing management 1209 decisions as the environment-fisheries relationship evolves with the continuous integration of 1210 new information. Environment-LMR correlations have been observed to be more robust when 1211 tested with new data at the edges of a species range (Myers, 1998). These populations may serve 1212 as initial case studies with which to develop dynamic management frameworks that integrate 1213 climate prediction information. Table A2 includes a list of LMRs for which a sufficient 1214 understanding of how they respond to climate variability has been achieved, and which may 1215 serve as additional case studies. These include those determined by Myers (1998) as robust to re-1216 evaluation and those that already make use of environmental information in their management as 1217 described by Skern-Mauritzen et al. (2015).

1218 To provide a thorough presentation of risk to decision makers, it will be important to 1219 assess the uncertainty of the climate prediction as well as that of the LMR models. For the 1220 climate prediction, this will involve quantification of processes, variability and model 1221 uncertainty via the use of single and multi-model ensembles (Section 3). Forecasts will be 1222 inherently probabilistic, and ensembles can be used to estimate the probability. On the fisheries 1223 side, there is also uncertainty associated with LMR models' parameterizations (Cheung et al., 1224 2016a, b). As for climate predictions, ensemble approaches can be employed in LMR models to 1225 account for the high level of uncertainty in the parameterization of biological processes (e.g. 1226 Kearney et al., 2012; Laufkötter et al., 2015; 2016). Uncertainty in the environment-LMR 1227 relationship will also need to be accounted for by, for instance, running multiple simulations of 1228 the LMR model differing in their stochastic error of the LMR-environment relationship (e.g. 1229 Lindegren et al., 2013).

1230 Finally, an effective forecast delivery mechanism is required. The climate prediction 1231 needs to be delivered in a format that can be effectively incorporated into LMR models and 1232 decision frameworks, such as population models used in fish stock assessment. As in all the 1233 stages of LMR forecast development, consistent user engagement is essential to ensure sustained 1234 use of such prediction tools (Harrison and Williams, 2007; Hobday et al., 2016). For instance, 1235 the general difficulty people have in understanding uncertainty and probabilities has limited the 1236 use of climate predictions in the natural resource sector (Nicholls, 1999; Marshall et al., 2011). 1237 Collaboration with social scientists on the most appropriate presentation and delivery options 1238 may enhance adoption of forecast information (Harrison and Williams, 2007). Automated web-1239 based delivery systems are a common delivery method, although ongoing contact with end users 1240 and acknowledgement of user feedback is important to build engagement and for continued 1241 forecast use (Hobday et al., 2016). Funding for delivery system maintenance, user engagement, 1242 and continued user training should be included in projects to maintain iterative LMR operational 1243 forecast systems.

1244 The value of integrating climate predictions into LMR decision frameworks has to then 1245 be demonstrated to managers or industry. This can be undertaken by employing cost-benefit 1246 analyses (e.g. Asseng et al., 2012) and MSE (Section 2.4, Tommasi et al., accepted). For 1247 example, MSEs can assess the performance of different management strategies (e.g. with and 1248 without climate predictions) in relation to a suite of performance metrics while taking

- 1249 uncertainty into account. They may also include economic models to better evaluate the specific
- 1250 economic value of integrating climate forecasts into LMR decisions (e.g. Richardson, 2000).
- 1251 While MSEs have been developed in the context of fisheries science, such decision support
- 1252 systems could also be applied to industry or coastal manager's decision frameworks. Results
- 1253 from these assessments would inform both climate and LMR prediction development by
- 1254 highlighting further refinements needed to better inform decisions.
- 1255

1256 6. Priority developments

1257 While the potential benefits of seasonal climate forecasts in reducing the climate 1258 vulnerability of the fishery and aquaculture industry and in improving fisheries management are 1259 clear (Section 4), barriers to their widespread adoption also exist. Social, cultural, economic, or 1260 political constraints, such as existing regulations or dissemination difficulties, can limit forecast use (Nicholls, 1999; Goddard et al., 2001; Harrison and Williams, 2007; Davis et al., 2015). 1261 1262 However, the discussion herein will be limited to priority developments aimed at reducing technical impediments to climate forecast application. These technical barriers include 1263 1264 incomplete understanding of environment-LMR relationships, limited length and availability of 1265 physical, biogeochemical and biological time series for model development and validation, and 1266 the irreducible predictability limits at seasonal to decadal scales. There is also need for 1267 methodological advancements in LMR models to explicitly consider environmental productivity 1268 indicators and spatial distributions, and apply empirical models in non-stationary systems. 1269 Finally, there is a need for reduction in climate model bias through improvements in model 1270 formulation and initialization, verification of LMR-relevant physical variables at LMR-relevant 1271 spatial scales beyond SST, the development of biogeochemical forecasting capabilities in global 1272 prediction systems, and improvements in climate predictability at LMR-relevant regional scales 1273 through higher resolution global prediction systems or the development of downscaling 1274 frameworks. 1275 On the LMR model side, predictive capacity is constrained by our incomplete 1276 understanding of environment-LMR relationships, especially their response to environmental 1277 fluctuations (e.g. Chavez et al., 2003; Di Lorenzo et al., 2009; Le Mézo et al., 2016). As a case in 1278 point, only 2% of managed fisheries worldwide explicitly integrate past environmental

1279 information into their current tactical decision making and provide an existing framework to

1280 readily incorporate climate forecast information (Skern-Mauritzen et al., 2015). This lies in stark 1281 contrast to ubiquitous climate-marine resource correlations reported in the literature (e.g. Hare et 1282 al., 2010; Mueter et al., 2011; Ottersen et al., 2013). For most populations, the length of 1283 available, co-occurring fishery, biological and environmental time series may be too short to 1284 robustly identify the environment-LMR relationship (Haltuch and Punt, 2011) or to develop a 1285 habitat preference model, highlighting the importance of maintaining and expanding existing 1286 observational data series for environment-LMR model development and verification. Funding 1287 for ocean and LMR observations is limited. Given the importance of having climate observations 1288 over a period long enough to span different environmental regimes, LMR observations that cover 1289 a wide range of population sizes, and large sample sizes to improve estimation of model 1290 parameters, establishment of new monitoring networks must be carefully balanced with the 1291 critical need to maintain current sampling programs (Haltuch and Punt, 2011; Dorner et al., 1292 2013). Maintenance and expansion of physical climate observing systems, as discussed in 1293 Section 3, are also essential to climate model development to improve climate predictability 1294 through better model initialization (e.g. Servonnat et al., 2014). Including concurrent measures of 1295 basic biogeochemical and lower-trophic-level measurements should be integrated into existing 1296 observing systems, when possible, to facilitate better understanding of physical-biological 1297 interactions in the marine environment and better assessment of model predictive capability. 1298 That said, while spatially-or temporally-constrained (or incomplete) environmental data may be 1299 limited in quantitative utility, such data can help provide qualitative context for decision-making. 1300 For example, time series of conditions can be used to delineate regime-specific parameter 1301 estimates or emergent patterns in indicators can provide justification for precautionary 1302 management actions and intensified monitoring (Zador et al., in press).

1303 Non-stationarity issues are particularly critical for decadal to centennial predictions. 1304 However, for many populations, knowledge of environment-fishery interactions is limited to 1305 basic correlations. These correlative (and often linearly approximated) relationships provide a 1306 useful, existing tool to start integrating climate predictions into LMR models. But if an 1307 ecosystem were to shift into a new, no-analog state and the ecosystem processes that were 1308 empirically described by this correlative relationship were to change, subsequent management 1309 decisions may perform poorly (Dorner et al., 2013). Similar shifts can occur at shorter time-1310 scales. For example, many species distribution models developed with one decade of data

42

1311 perform poorly when used to project species distribution during another decade (Brun et al.,

1312 2016). For bias correction of physical climate models, non-linear statistical techniques that are

1313 better at simulating distribution extremes appear to perform better under novel climate conditions

1314 (Gaitan et al., 2014). More sophisticated, model-free statistical approaches also appear promising

1315 in establishing environmental influences on LMRs that can be applied in a management

1316 framework, particularly over short timescales (e.g. Ye et al., 2015). To improve LMR predictive

1317 capacity, it will be necessary to expand the use of such techniques into tactical management

frameworks, and to characterize their benefits relative to more traditional statistical techniques aswell as ecosystem models.

1320 Dynamic ecosystem models integrate physical variables, lower-trophic-level dynamics, 1321 LMR dynamics, and human impacts, mechanistically, and are critical to enhance our 1322 understanding of LMR responses to climate variability (Travers et al., 2007; Rose et al., 2010; 1323 Le Mézo et al., 2016). Such process-based understanding is necessary to the development of 1324 models able to skillfully predict LMR under novel conditions (Evans, 2012). Furthermore, 1325 because of the inherent complexity, non-linearity, and multi-stressor characteristics of marine 1326 ecosystems, multispecies and ecosystem models can in some cases assess uncertainties and 1327 trade-offs more effectively (Pikitch et al., 2004; Link et al., 2012). Nevertheless, such models are 1328 currently only employed for strategic advice at the decadal and multi-decadal scale, rather than 1329 for short-term tactical decisions (e.g. Smith et al., 2011; Pacific Fishery Management Council 1330 and National Marine Fisheries Service 2014; Fulton et al., 2014; Marine Stewardship Council, 1331 2014). One issue of concern with the use of ecosystem models for tactical decisions is their 1332 inability to integrate all of the data streams, such as catch-at-age data, that are customary in 1333 current tactical fisheries decision frameworks. Another issue is that their complexity comes at the 1334 cost of longer running time, hindering their use within current tactical management process 1335 timelines. Also, they rely on static assumptions and parameterizations, which may not remain 1336 valid under future conditions. Finally, because more processes are modeled and there is 1337 uncertainty in each, the fully characterized uncertainty can be large. This may make decision-1338 making more difficult but, if this uncertainty accurately reflects the true uncertainty in the 1339 system, it will ultimately result in better decisions. Expanded application of such models for 1340 tactical management decisions will be dependent on improving their parameterizations, 1341 specification of initial conditions, extending quantitative model assessments, and reducing their

1342 uncertainties through additional physiological studies, process studies, and modeling

- 1343 experiments aimed at understanding the mechanisms driving LMR's responses to climate. LMR
- 1344 surveys that include more hydrographic, biogeochemical, and lower-trophic-level (plankton)
- 1345 observations will also be critical to make progress towards expanded use of ecosystem models in
- 1346 LMR forecasting applications.

1347 Highly resolved spatial and population dynamics models of a specific target species 1348 coupled to a coarser, lower-trophic-level model (Lehodey et al., 2008; Senina et al., 2008; 1349 Section 4.2) or "models of intermediate complexity" - MICE - (Lindegren et al., 2009; Collie et 1350 al., 2014; Plagányi et al., 2014) may be more immediately suited for tactical management 1351 decisions, as their uncertainties are more tractable. MICE use statistical parameter estimation 1352 methods common in current tactical fisheries models to fit multispecies models to data for small 1353 groups of interacting species. Such models are becoming sufficiently advanced, including both 1354 species interactions and impacts of temperature on population dynamics (Holsman et al,. in 1355 press.), and can be used in concert with single-species models to provide tactical fisheries advice 1356 from a multi-model suite, similar to operational prediction systems used in weather forecasts 1357 (Ianelli et al., in press.). Combining such models with seasonal and decadal forecasts will help 1358 evaluate risk profiles and trajectories of recovery plans, assess the flexibility of harvest policies 1359 to dynamic conditions, and identify areas of management vulnerability to climate change (e.g., 1360 are dynamic management policies available in hand to respond to sudden shifts in ecosystem 1361 structure or driving processes?; Holsman et al., in review). While MICE are quite promising for tactical decision making in the near future, simulation testing to determine whether they can 1362 1363 provide adequate information for tactical management under various information conditions 1364 typical of fisheries management needs to be undertaken. If successful, such applications may 1365 also provide a valuable template for the expansion of holistic whole ecosystem models from 1366 strategic to tactical management decisions.

Expanded use of seasonal to decadal forecasts is also limited by problems of relevance in terms of critical variables, and spatial and temporal scales (Nicholls, 1999; Hobday et al., 2016). For some LMR-relevant variables, there are irreducible predictability limits at seasonal to decadal scales due to the chaotic nature of the atmosphere (Deser et al., 2012). Such variables will remain unpredictable even with a perfect data assimilation system and model formulation, and hence management frameworks robust to unpredictable variation will need to be developed. 1373 It will be important for climate scientist to continue assessing predictability limits of LMR-

relevant variables and to communicate such limitations to users, e.g., by providing reliable

1375 probabilistic forecasts accompanied by appropriate measures of historical skill.

1376 For some regions and time scales, however, predictability of LMR-relevant variables is 1377 limited by the systematic errors of GCMs (Goddard et al., 2001). It is critical to find ways to 1378 either reduce this model bias or reduce its negative impacts on forecast skill through novel 1379 techniques (e.g., Batté et al., 2016). Reduction in model bias will involve improvement in both 1380 model physics and parametrizations, as well as data assimilation systems (Goddard et al., 2001; 1381 Meehl et al., 2014; Siedlecki et al., 2016). For instance, as variability in ocean circulation can 1382 depend on both temperature and salinity variations in the ocean's interior, improved observations 1383 of these quantities, as well as improved assimilation systems to make optimal use of these 1384 observations, are critical. As resolution of GCMs increases, representation of the physical 1385 processes responsible for regional climate predictability improves (e.g. Jia et al., 2015), and, in 1386 some cases, this may lead to improved forecast skill of LMR-relevant variables.

1387 Forecasts at the multi-annual to decadal time scales, while of great interest to LMR 1388 management and industry, are not yet operational (Section 3). Continued research to improve our 1389 theoretical understanding and representation of the physical processes and feedbacks responsible 1390 for decadal scale climate variability are required to reduce model bias and improve decadal 1391 forecast skill (Meehl et al., 2014). Furthermore, in order to better assess the performance of 1392 decadal forecasts, predictability studies across more models and with larger ensembles need to be 1393 carried out (Meehl et al., 2014). Demonstration of reliable skill, however, will remain limited by 1394 the small sample size available for verification due to the high time series autocorrelation and 1395 limited quantity of independent samples at decadal time scales (Kumar, 2009; Meehl et al., 1396 2014). Furthermore, it is important to stress that the decadal predictability of regions, such as the 1397 North Pacific, subject to strong atmospheric forcing, will remain limited (Branstator and Teng, 1398 2010; Meehl et al., 2014).

In addition to improvements in models and initialization, predictability across
spatiotemporal scales of more LMR-relevant physical variables such as bottom temperature, sea
surface height, onset of upwelling, or salinity need to be examined. Biogeochemical prediction
(e.g. chlorophyll biomass, net primary productivity (NPP), export production fluxes, aragonite
saturation in coastal zones, oxygen concentration) is also of major relevance to ecosystem-based

1404 management of marine resources (Levin et al., 2009; Stock et al., 2011). While biogeochemical 1405 prediction is in its early stages and no coupled physical-biogeochemical seasonal to decadal 1406 forecasting systems are yet operational (but see Case Study 4.6 for their use in sub-seasonal 1407 prediction), recent work shows some potential. Predictive skill up to several months has been 1408 shown in the northern CCS for bottom oxygen (Case Study 4.5, Siedlecki et al., 2016), and up to 1409 3 years for NPP in some oceanic domains (Séférian et al., 2014, Chikamoto et al., 2015). In most 1410 cases, the increased predictability in NPP arises from that of nutrients, which directly benefit 1411 from the initialization of the model physical fields (Séférian et al., 2014). These pioneering 1412 results demonstrate that biogeochemical prediction shows promise and highlight the need to both 1413 develop integrated physical-biogeochemical forecast systems, and further quantify 1414 biogeochemical predictive skill over a variety of space and time scales to inform ecosystem-1415 based management approaches to LMRs. Application of ESMs in a climate change framework 1416 has demonstrated that uncertainty in LMR projections can be large due to uncertainty in the 1417 many modelling components, from GCMs to upper-trophic level models, required to assess climate change impacts on LMRs (Cheung et al., 2016b). Computing and personnel resources 1418 1419 will hence be required to develop an ensemble approach for biogeochemical prediction able to 1420 account for this uncertainty. An assessment of prediction skill beyond SST to other properties 1421 driving biological responses will also necessitate supporting, collecting, and maintaining 1422 sampling programs and observing systems.

1423 The spatial resolution of global climate models poses another limitation to their skill at 1424 the regional scale relevant to LMR decisions. Downscaling techniques can be used to generate 1425 finer-scale information from large-scale climate predictions. By relating well predicted large-1426 scale factors to a local process of interest, downscaling, in addition to providing higher spatially 1427 and temporally resolved data, may produce LMR-relevant variables not skillfully generated by 1428 global prediction systems (e.g. Siedlecki et al., 2016). There are two types of downscaling 1429 techniques: statistical and dynamical. The first links the large-scale output from a global 1430 prediction system to local scale variables using statistical-empirical relationships. The second 1431 uses the large-scale output as boundary conditions to regional-scale, physics-based dynamical 1432 models.

1433 Statistical downscaling techniques are computationally inexpensive, so the large 1434 ensembles required to appropriately characterize initial condition and model uncertainty of 1435 seasonal to decadal predictions (Section 2.1.2) can be run relatively fast. The ability to quickly 1436 produce output is an advantage particularly relevant for downscaling of seasonal predictions, as 1437 they have to be produced in a timely manner to be relevant to the decision-making process 1438 (Laugel et al., 2014). However, to construct robust statistical relationships, long observational 1439 records are required (Section 4.1 and 4.3), though are not always available. Second, all statistical 1440 downscaling techniques assume that the large-scale, local climate relationship will remain the 1441 same in the future. While these assumptions may hold for the relatively short timeframe of 1442 seasonal predictions, they may deteriorate over longer-range decadal predictions.

1443 By contrast, dynamical downscaling techniques explicitly model the physical processes 1444 involved and therefore may perform better than statistical methods under changing or 1445 unprecedented conditions (e.g. van Hooidonk et al., 2015). Dynamical downscaling models, 1446 however, will still inherit any bias of large-scale GCMs, and may even amplify such systematic 1447 errors (Goddard et al., 2001; Hall, 2014). This stresses again the need to reduce bias in global 1448 predictions systems to improve predictability of LMR-relevant variables at a regional scale. 1449 Further research will also be necessary to assess the relative costs and benefits of statistical 1450 versus dynamical techniques for downscaling of LMR-relevant climate predictions. This will 1451 require more resources allocated towards the development of downscaling frameworks for LMR-1452 relevant climate predictions in regions of interest for LMRs. For instance, coupling to fine 1453 resolution coastal models, like the efforts in the northern CCS and Indonesian region (Case 1454 Studies 4.5 and 4.6), is a promising approach that warrants more studies in other regions. 1455 Furthermore, modeling studies aimed at understanding the extent to which LMR-relevant local 1456 processes are interactive with the large-scale and to what extent they are primarily "driven" by large-scale processes are required. Such studies would help to identify the type of downscaling 1457 1458 method most appropriate and indicate regions requiring higher-resolution global climate 1459 prediction systems to further enhance predictability and support decision making at fine spatial 1460 scales.

1461 7. Concluding Remarks

1462 It is widely recognized that the productivity and distribution of LMR populations change 1463 over time in response to climate and ecosystem variability and long-term trends. Fishers, 1464 aquaculturists, coastal planners, and fisheries managers recognize that many of their operational 1465 planning and management decisions should account for this dynamism. We have shown how 1466 recent improvements in global dynamical climate prediction systems have resulted in skillful 1467 predictions of LMR-relevant variables at many of the spatial and temporal scales at which LMRs 1468 are managed, and how such predictions are already helping industry and managers make 1469 decisions in dynamic environments. By describing climate prediction systems and their 1470 capabilities, as well as the range of decisions currently taken by managers and the fisheries and 1471 aquaculture sector that may benefit from the inclusion of future climate information, new 1472 applications may be developed for wider use. Successful integration of climate information into 1473 LMR decision frameworks will depend on close collaboration and open dialogue between 1474 potential users and climate scientists.

1475 While some progress has been achieved within existing frameworks and resources, 1476 challenges in both climate and fisheries models need to be addressed to further expand utility of 1477 such predictions for LMRs (Section 6). To ensure widespread application of climate forecasts 1478 into LMR decision making and prevent unintended consequences of climate and fisheries 1479 interactions, new methodological approaches that capture complex ecosystem dynamics and the 1480 full range of LMR drivers need to be developed. Such frameworks will inherently be 1481 probabilistic and consist of ensemble methods to account for uncertainties in both climate and 1482 LMR models, improve model accuracy, and help end users understand risk. These frameworks 1483 will also evolve over time as our understanding of environment-LMR links, which remains poor 1484 for many species and regions, is improved through more field observations and experimental 1485 studies. Therefore, management decision systems will need to become more flexible to the 1486 inclusion of new information streams at a variety of both spatial and temporal scales, as well as 1487 to frequent re-evaluation.

As we acknowledged above, seasonal to decadal predictions of climate and LMR dynamics will sometime fail despite the best efforts, especially given the increasing potential for no-analog system states and ecological surprises (Williams and Jackson, 2007; Doak et al., 2008). To cope with this inevitability, we also encourage the development of approaches for managing unexpected changes once they have happened (Schindler and Hilborn, 2015).

As predictability is the ultimate test of scientific theory, routinely using these climateforecast informed frameworks to make predictions of LMR dynamics will also improve understanding of ecosystem dynamics. In addition, skillful predictions at seasonal to multi-

- annual scales will lend confidence to the use of such models to project LMR dynamics over
- 1497 longer temporal scales, and can be used to build stakeholder confidence in the use of longer term
- 1498 climate projections. With exploited systems being more sensitive to environmental variability
- 1499 (Hsieh et al., 2006; Perry et al., 2010), development of such capabilities will be essential to the
- 1500 development of climate-ready management systems to effectively manage and culture LMRs in a
- 1501 future environment where long term change renders historical experience less valuable.
- 1502

1503 Acknowledgements

1504 The authors would like to thank all the participants of the workshop "Applications of Seasonal to Decadal Climate Predictions for Marine Resource Management" held at Princeton University on 1505 1506 June 3-5 2015 for the many insightful discussions that inspired this manuscript. A special thanks 1507 to A. Valerio for all the help with the workshop organization and logistics, to the Princeton 1508 University Cooperative Institute of Climate Science for hosting the workshop, and to the NOAA 1509 Fisheries' Office of Science and Technology and NOAA's Office of Oceanic and Atmospheric 1510 Research for funding the workshop. Thank you to Dr. Jon Hare for creating the figure that 1511 inspired Figure 3. Many thanks to Dr. Fernando Gonzalez-Taboada, Dr. Angel Muñoz, and three 1512 anonymous reviewers for the helpful comments and suggestions. CME and Coral Reef Watch 1513 work are supported primarily by the NOAA Coral Reef Conservation Program and the NOAA 1514 National Environmental Satellite, Data, and Information Service's Center for Satellite 1515 Applications and Research. The contents in this manuscript are solely the opinions of the authors and do not constitute a statement of policy, decision, or position on behalf of NOAA or the U.S. 1516 1517 Government. 1518

1519 **References**

- A'Mar, Z. T., Punt, A.E., Dorn, M.W., 2009. The impact of regime shifts on the performance of
 management strategies for the Gulf of Alaska walleye pollock (*Theragra chalcogramma*)
 fishery. Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences 66, 2222-2242.
- Abawi, Y., Llanso, P., Harrison, M., Mason, S.J., 2007. Water, health and early warnings. In:
 Seasonal Climate: Forecasting and Managing Risk (eds A. Troccoli, M. Harrison, D. T.
 Anderson and S. J. Mason). Springer, London, UK, pp: 351-395.

- Agnew, D. J., Beddington, J.R., Hill, S.L. 2002. The potential use of environmental information
 to manage squid stocks. Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences 59, 18511857.
- 1529 Agostini, V.N., Francis, R.C., Hollowed, A.B., Pierce, S.D., Wilson, C., Hendrix, A.N., 2006.
- 1530The relationship between Pacific hake (*Merluccius productus*) distribution and poleward1531subsurface flow in the California Current System. Canadian Journal of Fisheries and1532Aquatic Sciences 63, 2648–2659.
- Ainsworth, C., Samhouri, J., Busch, D., Cheung, W.W.L., Dunne, J., Okey, T.A., 2011. Potential
 impacts of climate change on Northeast Pacific marine foodwebs and fisheries. ICES
 Journal of Marine Science 68, 1217–1229.
- Alheit, J., Drinkwater, K.F., Perry, R.I. (Eds.), 2010. Impact of climate variability on marine
 ecosystems: A comparative approach [Special Issue]. Journal of Marine Systems 79, 227436.
- Allen, J.T., Tippett, M.K., Sobel, A.H., 2015. Influence of the El Nino/Southern Oscillation on
 Tornado and hail frequency in the United States. Nature Geoscience 8, 278–283.
- Allouche, O., Tsoar, A., Kadmon, R., 2006. Assessing the accuracy of species distribution
 models: prevalence, kappa, and the true skill statistic (TSS). Journal of Applied Ecology
 43, 1223-1232.
- Anderson, D.M., Hoagland, P., Kaoru, Y., White, A.W., 2000. Estimated annual economic
 impacts from Harmful Algal Blooms (HABs) in the United States. Woods Hole
 Oceanographic Institution Technical Report 2000-11, pp. 97.
- Andrews, K.S., Williams, G.D., Samhouri, J.F., Marshall, K.N., Gertseva, V., Levin, P.S., 2015.
 The legacy of a crowded ocean: indicators, status, and trends of anthropogenic pressures
- in the California Current ecosystem. Environmental Conservation 42, 139–151.
- 1550 Asch, R. G., 2015. Climate change and decadal shifts in the phenology of larval fishes in the
- 1551 California Current ecosystem. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the1552 United States of America 112, E4065-E4074.
- Asseng, S., McIntosh, P.C., Wang, G., Khimashia, N., 2012. Optimal N fertiliser management
 based on a seasonal forecast. European Journal of Agronomy 38, 66-73.

- Astthorsson, O.S., Valdimarsson, H., Gudmundsdottir, A., Oskarsson, G.J., 2012. Climate related variations in the occurrence and distribution of mackerel (*Scomber scombrus*) in
 Icelandic waters. ICES Journal of Marine Science 69, 1289–1297.
- 1558 Audzijonyte, A., Kuparinen, A., Gorton, R., Fulton, E.A., 2013. Ecological consequences of
- body size decline in harvested fish species: positive feedback loops in trophic interactions
 amplify human impact. Biology Letters 9, 20121103, doi: 10.1098/rsbl.2012.1103.
- Audzijonyte, A., Kuparinen, A., Fulton, E.A., 2014. Ecosystem effects of contemporary lifehistory changes are comparable to those of fishing. Marine Ecology Progress Series 495,
 219-231.
- Audzijonyte, A., Fulton, E. A., Haddon, M., Helidoniotis, F., Hobday, A.J., Kuparinen, A.,
 Morrongiello, J.R., Smith, A.D.M., Upston, J., Waples, R.S., 2016. Trends and
 management implications of human-influenced life-history changes in marine
- 1567 ectotherms. Fish and Fisheries 17, 1005-1028.
- Barange, M., Merino, G., Blanchard, J.L., Scholtens, J., Harle, J., Allison, E.H., Allen, J.I., Holt,
 J., Jennings, S., 2014. Impacts of climate change on marine ecosystem production in
 societies dependent on fisheries. Nature Climate Change 4, 211-216.
- Bahr, K.D., Jokiel, P.L., Rodgers, K.S. 2015. The 2014 coral bleaching and freshwater flood
 events in Ka ne 'ohe Bay, Hawai'i. PeerJ 3, e1136, doi: 10.7717/peerj.1136.
- Balmaseda, M., Anderson, D., Vidard, A., 2007. Impact of Argo on analyses of the global ocean.
 Geophysical Research Letters 34, L16605.
- Balmaseda, M.A., Hernandez, F., Storto, A., Palmer, M.D., Alves, O., Shi, L., Smith, G.C.,
 Toyoda, T., Valdivieso, M., Barnier, B., Behringer, D., Boyer, T., Chang, Y-S,
- 1577 Chepuring, G.A., Ferry, N., Forget, G., Fujii, Y., Good, S., Guinehut, S., Haines, K.,
- 1578 Ishikawa, Y., Keeley, S., Köhl, A., Lee, T., Martin, M.J., Masina, S., Masuda, S.,
- 1579 Meyssingnac, K., Mogensen, K., Parent, L., Peterson, K.A., Tang, Y.M., Yin, Y.,
- 1580 Vernieres, G., Wang, X., Waters, J., Wedd, R., Wang, O., Xue, Y., Chevallier, M.,
- 1581 Lemieux, J-F., Dupont, F., Kuragano, T., Kamachi, M., Awaji, T., Caltablano, A.,
- 1582 Wilmer-Becker, K., Gaillard, F., 2015. The Ocean Reanalyses Intercomparison Project
- 1583 (ORA-IP). Journal of Operational Oceanography 7, 81–99.

- Barange, M., Merino, G., Blanchard, J.L., Scholtens, J., Harle, J., Allison, E.H., Allen, J.I., Holt,
 J., and Jennings, S., 2014. Impacts of climate change on marine ecosystem production in
 societies dependent on fisheries. Nature Climate Change 4, 211-216.
- Barnett, T.P., Adam, J.C., Lettenmaier, D.P., 2005. Potential impacts of a warming climate on water availability in snow-dominated regions. Nature 438, 303-309.
- Barnston, A.G., Tippett, M.K., 2014. Climate information, outlooks, and understanding-where
 does the IRI stand? Earth Perspectives 1, 20, doi.org/10.1186/2194-6434-1-20.
- Barnston, A.G., Tippett, M.K., L'Heureux, M.L., Li, S., DeWitt, D.G., 2012. Skill of real-time
 seasonal ENSO model predictions during 2002-11 is our capability increasing? Bulletin
 of the American Meteorological Society 93, 631-651.
- Barton, A., Waldbusser, G.G., Feely, R.A., Weisberg, S.B., Newton, J.A., Hales, B., Cudd, S.,
 Eudeline, B., Langdon, C.J., Jefferds, I., King, T., Suhrbier, A., McLaughlin, K., 2015.
 Impacts of Coastal Acidification on the Pacific Northwest Shellfish Industry and
- Adaptation Strategies Implemented in Response. Oceanography 25, 146-159.
- Basson, M., 1999. The importance of environmental factors in the design of management
 procedures. ICES Journal of Marine Science 56, 933-942.
- Batté, L., Déqué, M., 2016. Randomly correcting model errors in the ARPEGE-Climate v6.1
 component of CNRM-CM: applications for seasonal forecasts, Geoscientific Model
 Development 9, 2055-2076.
- Baumgartner, T. R., Soutar, A., Ferreira-Batrina, V., 1992. Reconstruction of the history of
 Pacific sardine and northern anchovy populations over the past two millennia from
 sediments of the Santa Barbara Basin, California. California Cooperative Oceanic
 Fisheries Investigations Reports 33, 24-40.
- Beaugrand, G., Lenoir, S., Ibañez, F., Manté, C., 2011. A new model to assess the probability of
 occurrence of a species, based on presence-only data. Marine Ecology Progress Series
 424, 175-190.
- Becker, E., van den Dool, H., Zhang, Q. 2014. Predictability and forecast skill in NMME.
 Journal of Climate 27, 5891-5906.
- Behrenfeld, M.J., Falkowski, P.G., 1997. Photosynthetic rates derived from satellite-basedchlorophyll concentration. Limnology and Oceanography 42, 1-20.

- Bell, R.J., Hare, J.A., Manderson, J.P., Richardson, D.E., 2014. Externally driven changes in the
 abundance of summer and winter flounder. ICES Journal of Marine Science 71, 24162428.
- Bell, R.J., Richardson, D.E., Hare, J.A., Lynch, P.D., Fratantoni, P.S., 2015. Disentangling the
 effects of climate, abundance, and size on the distribution of marine fish: an example
 based on four stocks from the Northeast US shelf. ICES Journal of Marine Science 72,
 1311-1322.
- Bi, H.S., Peterson, W.T., Strub, P.T. 2011. Transport and coastal zooplankton communities in
 the northern California Current system. Geophysical Research Letters 38, doi:
 10.1029/2011GL047927.
- Bitz, C.M., Holland, M.M., Hunke, E., Moritz, R.E., 2005. Maintenance of the sea-ice edge.
 Journal of Climate 18, 2903-2921.
- Boer,G., 2004: Long time-scale potential predictability in an ensemble of coupled climate
 models. Climate Dynamics 23, 29-44.
- Bograd, S.J., Hazen, E.L., Howell, E.A., Hollowed, A.B. (Eds.), 2014. Special Issue: Fisheries
 Oceanography. Oceanography 27, 21-167.
- 1630 Bopp, L., Resplandy, L., Orr, J.C., Doney, S.C., Dunne, J.P., Gehlen, M., Halloran, P., Heinze,
- 1631 C., Ilyina, T., Séférian, R., Tjiputra, J., Vichi, M., 2013. Multiple stressors of ocean
 1632 ecosystems in the 21st century: projections with CMIP5 models. Biogeoscienes 10, 62251633 6245.
- Boudreau, S.A., Anderson, S.C., Worm, B., 2015. Top-down and bottom-up forces interact at
 thermal range extremes on American lobster. Journal of Animal Ecology 84, 840-850.
- 1636 Bradley, A.A., Habib, M., Schwartz, S.S., 2015. Climate index weighting of ensemble
- streamflow forecasts using a simple Bayesian approach. Water Resources Research 51,
 7382-7400.
- Brander, K.M., 2007. Global fish production and climate change. Proceedings of the National
 Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 104, 19709-19714.
- Brander, K., 2010. Impacts of climate change on fisheries. Journal of Marine Systems 79, 389-402.
- Branstator, G., Teng, H., 2010. Two Limits of Initial-Value Decadal Predictability in a CGCM.
 Journal of Climate 23, 6292-6311.

- Brennan, C.E., Bianucci, L., Fennel, K., 2016. Sensitivity of Northwest North Atlantic shelf
 circulation to surface and boundary forcing: a regional model assessment. AtmosphereOcean 54, 230-247.
- Brooks, E.N., 2013. Effects of variable reproductive potential on reference points for fisheries
 management. Fisheries Research 138, 152-158.
- Brooks, E.N., Deroba, J.J., 2015. When "data" are not data: the pitfalls of post-hoc analyses that
 use stock assessment model output. Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences
 72, 634-641.
- Brun, P., Kiorboe, T., Licandro, P., Payne, M.R., 2016. The predictive skill of species
 distribution models for plankton in a changing climate. Global Change Biology 22, 31703181.
- Brunel, T., Piet, G.J., van Hal, R., Rockmann C., 2010. Performance of harvest control rules in a
 variable environment. ICES Journal of Marine Science 67, 1051-1062.
- Bryant, M.D, 2009. Global climate change and potential effects on Pacific salmonids in
 freshwater ecosystems of southeast Alaska. Climatic Change 95, 165-193.
- Butterworth, D.S., Punt, A.E., 1999. Experiences in the evaluation and implementation of
 management procedures. ICES Journal of Marine Science 56, 985-998.
- 1662 Camargo, S.J., Barnston, A.G., Klotzbach, P., Landsea, C.W., 2007. Seasonal
 1663 tropical cyclone forecasts. WMO Bulletin 56, 297–309.
- 1664 Chang, Y., Lee, M., Lee, K., Shao, K., 2013. Adaptation of fisheries and mariculture
 1665 management to extreme oceanic environmental changes and climate variability in
 1666 Taiwan. Marine Policy 38, 476-482.
- Chapman, D., Cane, M.A., Henderson, N., Lee, D-E., Chen, C., 2015. A vector autoregressive
 ENSO prediction model. Journal of Climate 28, 8511-8520.
- 1669 Chavez, F. P., 2003. From Anchovies to Sardines and Back: Multidecadal Change in the Pacific
 1670 Ocean. Science 299, 217–221.
- 1671 Chen, J.H., Lin, S.J., 2011. The remarkable predictability of inter-annual variability
- of Atlantic hurricanes during the past decade. Geophysical Research Letters 38, L11804,
 doi:10.1029/2011GL047629.

16/4	Cheung, W.W.L., Lam, V.W.Y., Sarmiento, J.L., Kearney, K., Watson, R., Pauly, D., 2009.
1675	Projecting global marine biodiversity impacts under climate change scenarios. Fish and
1676	Fisheries 10, 235-251.
1677	Cheung, W.W.L., Jones, M.C., Reygondeau, G., Stock, C., Lam, V.W.Y., Frolicher, T.L., 2016a.
1678	Structural uncertainty in projecting global fisheries catches under climate change.
1679	Ecological Modelling 325, 57–66.
1680	
1681	Cheung, W.W.L., Frolicher, T.L., Asch, R.G., Jones, M.C., Pinsky, M.L., Reygondeau, G.,
1682	Rodgers, K.B., Rykaczewski, R.R., Sarmiento, J.L., Stock, C., Watson, J.R., 2016b.
1683	Building confidence in projections of the responses of living marine resources to climate
1684	change. ICES Journal of Marine Science 73, 1283-1296.
1685	Chevallier, M., Salas-Melia, D., Voldoire, A., Deque, M., Garric, G., 2013. Seasonal forecasts of
1686	the pan-Arctic sea ice extent using a GCM-based seasonal prediction system, Journal of
1687	Climate 26, 6092–6104.
1688	Chikamoto, M.O., Timmermann, A., Chikamoto, Y., Tokinaga, H., Harada, N., 2015.
1689	Mechanisms and predictability of multiyear ecosystem variability in the North Pacific,
1690	Global Biogeochemical Cycles 29, 2001–2019.
1691	Chittenden, C.M., Jensen, J.L.A., Ewart, D., Anderson, S., Saksida, Smith, B., Vincent, S.,
1692	Welch, D., McKinley, R.D., 2010. Recent salmon declines: A result of lost feeding
1693	opportunities due to bad timing? Plos One 5, e12423
1694	Clark, W.G., 1977. The lessons of the Peruvian anchoveta fishery. California Cooperative
1695	Oceanic Fisheries Investigations Reports 19, 57-63.
1696	Collie, J.S., P.D. Spencer. 1993. Management strategies for fish populations subject to long-term
1697	environmental variability and depensatory predation. Proceedings of the International
1698	Symposium on Management Strategies for Exploited Fish Populations, Alaska Sea Grant
1699	College Program.
1700	Collie, J.S., Botsford, L.W., Hastings, A., Kaplan, I.C., Largier, J.L., Livingston, P.A., Plagányi,
1701	E., Rose, K.A., Wells, B.K., Werner, F.E., 2104. Ecosystem models for fisheries
1702	management: finding the sweet spot. Fish and Fisheries 17, 101-125.

- Collie, J.S., Peterman, R.M., Zuehlke, 2012. A fisheries risk-assessment framework to evaluate
 trade-offs among management options in the presence of time-varying productivity.
 Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences 69, 209-223.
- Combes, V., Chenillat, F., Di Lorenzo, E., Rivière, P., Ohmane, M.D., Bograd, S.J, 2013. Crossshore transport variability in the California Current: Ekman upwelling vs. eddy dynamics.
 Progress in Oceanography 109, 78–89.
- Constantin de Magny, G., Long, W., Brown, C.F., Hood, R.R., Hug, A., Murtugudde, Colwell,
 R.R., 2009. Predicting the distribution of Vibrio spp. in the Chesapeake Bay: a Vibrio
 cholerae case study. EcoHealth 6, 378-389.
- 1712 Cooke, J.G., 1999. Improvement of fishery-management advice through simulation testing of
 1713 harvest algorithms. ICES Journal of Marine Science 56, 797-810.
- 1714 Coyle, K. O., Eisner, L.B., Mueter, F.J., Pinchuck, A.I., Janout, M.A., Cieciel, K.D., Farley,
 1715 E.V., Andrews, A.G., 2011. Climate change in the southeastern Bering Sea: impacts on
 1716 Pollock stocks and implications for the Oscillating Control Hypothesis. Fisheries
 1717 Oceanography 20, 139-156.
- 1718 Daley, R. 1991. Atmospheric Data Analysis. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- 1719 Dankel, D., Haraldsson, G., Heldbo, J., Hoydal, K., Lassen, H., Siegstad, H., Schou, M.,
 1720 Sverdrup-Jensen, S., Waldo, S., Orebech, P., 2015. Allocation of Fishing Rights in the
- 1721 NEA. Copenhagen, Denmark: Nordic Council of Ministers, doi:10.6027/TN2015-546.
- Daufresne, M., Lengfellner, K., Sommer, U., 2009. Global warming benefits the small in aquatic
 ecosystems. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of
 America 106, 12788-12793.
- Davis, M., Lowe, R., Steffen, S., Doblas-Reyes, F.J., Rodó, X. 2015. Barriers to using climate
 information: Challenges in communicating probabilistic forecasts to decision-makers. In
- 1727 J.L. Drake, Y.Y. Kontar, J.C. Eichelberger, S.T. Rupp, K.M. Taylor (Eds.),
- 1728 Communicating Climate-Change and Natural Hazard Risk and Cultivating Resilience.
 1729 Advances in Natural and Technological Hazards Research 45, 95-113.
- 1730 DelSole, T., Shukla, J. 2009. Artificial skill due to predictor screening. Journal of Climate 22,
 1731 331-345.
- 1732 Delworth, T.L., Rosati, A., Anderson, W., Adcroft, A.J., Balaji, V., Benson, R., Dixon, K.,
- 1733 Griffies, S.M., Lee, H.C., Pacanowski, R.C., Vecchi, G.A., Wittenberg, A.T., Zeng, F.R.,

1734 Zhang, R., 2012. Simulated climate and climate change in the GFDL CM2.5 High-1735 resolution coupled climate model. Journal of Climate 25, 2755-2781. 1736 Deser, C., Alexander, M.A., Xie, S., Phillips, A.S., 2010. Sea surface temperature variability: 1737 Patterns and mechanisms. Annual Reviews of Marine Science 2, 115-143. 1738 Deser, C., Knutti, R., Solomon, S., Phillips, A.S., 2012. Communication of the role of natural 1739 variability in future North American climate. Nature Climate Change 2, 775-779. 1740 Di Lorenzo, E., Fiechter, J., Schneider, N., Miller, A.J., Franks, P.J.S., Bograd, S.J., Moore, 1741 A.M., Thomas, A., Crawford, W., Pena, Herman, A., 2009. Nutrient and salinity decadal 1742 variations in the central and eastern North Pacific. Geophysical Research Letters 36, 1743 L14601. Di Lorenzo, E., Combes, V., Keister, J.E., Strub, P.T., Thomas, A.C., Franks, P.J.S., Ohman, 1744 1745 M.D., Furtado, J.C., Bracco, A., Bograd, S.J., Peterson, W.T., Schwing, F.B., Chiba, S., 1746 Taguchi, B., Hormazabal, S., Parada, C., 2013. Synthesis of Pacific Ocean climate and 1747 ecosystem dynamics. Oceanography 26, 68-81. 1748 Doak, D.F., Estes, J.A., Halpern, B.S., Jacob, U., Lindberg, D.R., Lovvorn, J., Monson, D.H., Tinker, M.T., Williams, T.M., Wootton, J.T., Carroll, I., Emmerson, M., Micheli, F., 1749 Novak, M. 2008. Understanding and predicting ecological dynamics: are major surprises 1750 1751 inevitable? Ecology 89, 952-96. 1752 Doblas-Reyes, F. J., Hagedorn, R., Palmer, T.N., Morcrette, J.-J., 2006. Impact of increasing 1753 greenhouse gas concentrations in seasonal ensemble forecasts. Geophysical Research 1754 Letters 33, L07708, doi:10.1029/2005GL025061. 1755 Dorn, M., Aydin, K., Jones, D., Palsson, W., Spalinger, K., 2014. Assessment of the walleye 1756 pollock stock in the Gulf of Alaska. In: Stock assessment and fishery evaluation report 1757 for the groundfish resources of the Gulf of Alaska. US Department of Commerce, Alaska Fisheries Science Center. 1758 1759 Dorner, B., Holt, K.R., Peterman, R.M., Jordan, C., Larsen, D.P., Olsen, A.R., Abdul-Aziz, O.I., 1760 2013. Evaluating alternative methods for monitoring and estimating responses of salmon 1761 productivity in the North Pacific to future climatic change and other processes: A 1762 simulation study. Fisheries Research 147, 10-23.

- Dunn, D.C., Maxwell, S.M., Boustany, A.M., Halpin, PN., 2016. Dynamic ocean management
 increases the efficiency and efficacy of fisheries management. Proceedings of the
 National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 113, 668-673.
- 1766 Eakin, C.M., Liu, G., Gomez, A.M., De La Cour, J.L., Heron, S.F., Skirving, W.J., Geiger, E.F.,
- 1767 Tirak, K.V., Strong, A.E., 2016. Global coral bleaching 2014-2017: Status and an appeal
 1768 for observations. Reef Encounter 43, 20-26.
- Eakin, C.M., Rauenzahn, J.L., Liu, G., Heron, S.F., Skirving, W.J., Geiger, E.F., Strong, A.E.,
 2014. Will 2014 2015 be the Next Big El Niño? If so, what might it mean for coral reefs?
 Reef Encounter 29, 30-35.
- Eakin, C.M., Liu, G., Chen, M., Kumar, A., 2012. Ghost of bleaching future: Seasonal outlooks
 from NOAA's operational climate forecast system. Proceedings of the 12th International
 Coral Reef Symposium, Cairns, Australia, 9-13 July 2012.
- Eden, J.M., van Oldenborgh, G.J., Hawkins, E., Suckling, E.B. 2015. A global empirical system
 for probabilistic seasonal climate prediction, Geoscientific Model Development 8, 39473973, doi:10.5194/gmd-8-3947-2015.
- Edwards, C.A., Moore, A.M., Hoteit, I., Cornuelle, B.D., 2015. Regional ocean data
 assimilation. Annual Reviews of Marine Science 7, 21-42.
- Elsner, J.B., Widen, H.M., 2014. Predicting spring tornado activity in the Central Great Plains by
 1 March. Monthly Weather Review 142, 259-267.
- Essington, T. E., Moriarty, P.E., Froehlich, H.E., Hodgson, E.E., Koehn, L.E., Oken, K.L., Siple,
 M.C., Stawitz, C.C., 2015. Fishing amplifies forage fish population collapses.
- Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 112,6648-6652.
- Evans, M.R., 2012. Modelling ecological systems in a changing world. Philosophical
 Transactions of the Royal Society B 367, 181-190.
- Eveson, J.P., Hobday, A.J., Hartog, J.R., Spillman, C.M., Rough, K.M., 2015. Seasonal
 forecasting of tuna habitat in the Great Australian Bight. Fisheries Research 170, 39–49.
- Fielding, A.H., Bell, J.F., 1997. A review of methods for the assessment of prediction errors in
 conservation presence/absence models. Environmental Conservation 24, 38–49.
- Finney, B.P., Gregory-Eaves, I., Douglas, M.S.V., Smol, J.P., 2002. Fisheries productivity in the
 northeastern Pacific Ocean over the past 2,200 years. Nature 416, 729-733.

- 1794 Finney, B.P., Alheit, J., Emeis, K-C., Field, D.B., Gutiérrez, D., Struck, U., 2010.
- Paleoecological studies on variability in marine fish populations: A long-term perspective
 on the impacts of climatic change on marine ecosystems. Journal of Marine Systems 79,
 316-326.
- Francis, R., 2006. Measuring the strength of environment-recruitment relationships: the
 importance of including predictor screening with cross-validations. ICES Journal of
 Marine Science 63, 594-599.
- Fuller, E., Brush, E., Pinsky, M.L., 2015. The persistence of populations facing climate shifts
 and harvest. Ecosphere 6, 153, doi: 10.1890/ES14-00533.1.
- Fulton, E.A., Smith, A.D.M., Smith, D.C., Johnson, P., 2014. An Integrated Approach Is Needed
 for Ecosystem Based Fisheries Management: Insights from Ecosystem-Level
 Management Strategy Evaluation. PLoS ONE 9, e84242.
- Gaitan, C.F., Hsieh, W.W., Cannon, A.J., 2014. Comparison of statistically downscaled
 precipitation in terms of future climate indices and daily variability for southern Ontario
 and Quebec, Canada. Climate Dynamics 43, 3201-3217.
- 1809 Gehlen, M., Barciela, R., Bertino, L., Brasseur, P., Butenschon, M., Chai, F., Crise, A., Drillet,
- Y., Ford, D., Lavoie, D., Lehodey, P., Perruche, C., Samuelsen, A., Simon, E., 2015.
 Building the capacity for forecasting marine biogeochemistry and ecosystems: recent
- advances and future developments. Journal of Operational Oceanography 8, s168-s187.
- 1813 Gershwin, L-A., Condie, S.A., Mansbridge, J.V., Richardson, A.J., 2014. Dangerous jellyfish
 1814 blooms are predictable. Journal of the Royal Society Interface 11, 20131168, doi:
- 1815 10.1098/rsif.2013.1168.
- Goddard, L., Mason, S.J., Zebiak, S.E., Ropelewski, C.F., Basher, R., Cane, M.A., 2001. Current
 approaches to seasonal-to-interannual climate predictions. International Journal of
 Climatology 21, 1111-1152.
- 1819 Goddard, L., Mason, S.J. 2002. Sensitivity of seasonal climate forecasts to persisted SST
 1820 anomalies. Climate Dynamics 19, 619-631.
- Gray, W.M., 1984: Atlantic seasonal hurricane frequency. Part I: El Niño and 30
 mb quasi-biennial oscillation influences. Monthly Weather Review 112, 1649–1668.
- 1823 Griffies, S.M., Winton, M., Anderson, W.G., Benson, R., Delworth, T.L., Dufour, C.O., Dunne,
- 1824 J.P., Goddard, P., Morrison, A.K., Rosati, A., Wittenberg, A.T., Yin, J.J., Zhang, R.,

- 1825 2015. Impacts on ocean heat from transient mesoscale eddies in a hierarchy of climate1826 models. Journal of Climate 28, 952-977.
- 1827 Groot, C., Quinn, T.P., 1987. Homing migration of sockeye salmon, *Oncorhynchus nerka*, to the
 1828 Fraser River. Fishery Bulletin 88, 455-469.
- 1829 Guemas, V., Chevallier, M., Déqué, M., Bellprat, O., Doblas-Reyes, F., 2016. Impact of sea ice
 1830 initialization on sea ice and atmosphere prediction skill on seasonal timescales.
- 1831 Geophysical Research Letters 43, 3889-3896.
- 1832 Gutknecht, E., Reffray, G., Gehlen, M., Triyulianti, I., Berlianty, D., Gaspar, P., 2016.
- Evaluation of an operational ocean model configuration at 1/120 spatial resolution for the
 Indonesian seas (NEMO2.3/INDO12) Part 2: Biogeochemistry. Geoscientific Model
 Development 9, 1523-1543.
- Haidvogel, D., Arango, H., Budgell, W., cornuelle, B.D., Curchitser, E., Di Lorenzo, E., Fennel,
 K., Geyer, W.R., Hermann, A.J., Lanerolle, L., Levin, J., McWilliams, J.C., Miller, A.J.,
- 1838 Moore, A.M., Powell, T.M., Shchepetkin, A.F., Sherwood, C.R., Signell, R.P., Warner,
- 1839 J.C., Wilkin, J., 2008. Ocean forecasting in terrain-following coordinates: Formulation
- and skill assessment of the Regional Ocean Modeling System. Journal of ComputationalPhysics 227, 3595-3624.
- 1842 Hall, A., 2014. Projecting regional change. Science 346, 1461-1462.
- Halpern, B.S., Walbridge, S., Selkoe, K.A., Kappel, C.V., Micheli, F., D'Agrosa, C., Bruno, J.F.,
 Casey, K.S., Ebert, C., Fox, H.E., Fujita, R., Heinemann, D., Lenihan, H.S., Madin,
 E.M.P., Perry, M.P., Selig, E.R., Spalding, M., Steneck, R., Watson, R., 2008. A global
- 1846 map of human impact on marine ecosystems. Science 319, 948-952.
- Halpern, B.S., Frazier, M., Potapenko, J., Casey, K.S., Koenig, K., Longo, C., Lowndes, J.S.,
 Rockwood, R.C., Selig, E.R., Selkoe, K.A., Walbridge, S., 2015. Spatial and temporal
 changes in cumulative human impacts on the world's ocean. Nature Communications 6,
- 1850 7615, doi: 10.1038/ncomms8615.
- Haltuch, M.A., Punt, A.E., 2011. On the promises and pitfalls of including decadal scale climate
 forcing of recruitment in groundfish stock assessment. Canadian Journal of Fisheries and
 Aquatic Sciences 68, 912–926.
- Haltuch, M.A., Punt, A.E., Dorn, M.W., 2009. Evaluating the estimation of fishery management
 reference points in a variable environment. Fisheries Research 100, 42-56.

- Hamilton, L.C., 2007. Climate, fishery and society interactions: Observations from the North
 Atlantic. Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography 54, 23-26.
- 1858 Hamlet, A.F., Huppert, D., Lettenmaier, D., 2002. Economic value of long-lead streamflow
- 1859 forecasts for Columbia River hydropower. Journal of Water Resources Planning and1860 Management-Asce 128, 91-101.
- Hammer, C., von Dorrien, C., Hopkins, C.C.E., Köste, F.W., Nilssen, E.M., St John, M., Wilson,
 D.C., 2010. Framework of stock-recovery strategies: analyses of factors affecting success
 and failure. ICES Journal of Marine Science 67, 1849-1855.
- Hannesson R., 2006. Sharing the herring: fish migrations, strategic advantage and climate
 change. In Climate Change and the Economics of the World's Fisheries: Examples of
 Small Pelagic Stocks (eds R. Hannesson, M. Barange, S. Herrick Jr.). Edward Elgar,
- 1867 Cheltenam, UK, 66–99.
- Hannesson, R., 2012. Sharing the Northeast Atlantic mackerel. ICES Journal of Marine Science
 70, 259–269.
- Hansen, J.W., Mason, S.J., Sun, L., Tall, A., 2011. Review of seasonal climate forecasting for
 agriculture in sub-saharan Africa. Experimental Agriculture 47, 205-240.
- Hare, J.A., Alexander, M., Fogarty, M., Williams, E., Scott, J., 2010. Forecasting the dynamics
 of a coastal fishery species using a coupled climate-population model. Ecological
 Applications 20, 452–464.
- Harrison, M., Williams, J.B., 2007. Communicating seasonal forecasts. In A. Troccoli, M.
 Harrison, D. L. T. Anderson, S. J. Mason (Eds.), *Seasonal Climate: Forecasting and Managing Risk* (167-206). Dordrecht: Springer Academic Publishers.
- Harvey, C.J., Hazen, E.L., Garfield, N., 2014. The California Current Integrated Ecosystem
 Assessment: Phase III Report. Available from http://www.noaa.gov/iea/CCIEAReport/index.
- Hawkins, E., Sutton, R., 2009. The potential to narrow uncertainty in regional climate
 predictions. Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society 90, 1095-1107.
- Hervieux, G., Alexander, M., Stock, C., Jacox, M., Pegion, K., Tommasi, D., in review. Seasonal
 sea surface temperature anomaly prediction skill for coastal ecosystems using the North
 American multi-model ensemble (NMME). Climate Dynamics.

- Hill, K.T., Crone, P.R., Demer, D.A., Zwolinski, J., Dorval, E., Macewicz, B.J., 2014.
 Assessment of the Pacific Sardine Resource in 2014 for U.S.A. Management in 2014-15.
- 1888 (US Department of Commerce, La Jolla, CA).
- Hill, K.T., Crone, P.R., Dorval, E., Macewicz, B.J., 2015. Assessment of the Pacific Sardine
 Resource in 2015 for U.S.A. Management in 2015–16. (US Department of Commerce,
- 1891 La Jolla, CA).
- Ho, C. K., Hawkins, E., Shaffrey, L., Underwood, F.M., 2013. Statistical decadal predictions for
 sea surface temperatures: a benchmark for dynamical GCM predictions. Climate
 Dynamics 41, 917-935.
- Hobday, A.J., Hartmann, K. 2006. Near real-time spatial management based on habitat
 predictions for a longline bycatch species. Fisheries Management and Ecology 13, 365380.
- Hobday, A.J., Hartog, J.R., Timmiss, T., Fielding, J., 2010. Dynamic spatial zoning to manage
 southern bluefin tuna (*Thunnus maccoyii*) capture in a multi-species longline fishery.
 Fisheries Oceanography 19, 243-253.
- Hobday, A.J., Hartog, J.R., Spillman, C.M., Alves, O., 2011. Seasonal forecasting of tuna habitat
 for dynamic spatial management. Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences 68,
 898-911.
- Hobday, A.J., Lough, J., 2011. Projected climate change in Australian marine and freshwater
 environments. Marine and Freshwater Research 62, 1000-1014.
- Hobday, A.J., Maxwell, S.M., Forgie, J., McDonald, J., Darby, M., Seto, K., Bailey, H., Bograd,
 S.J., Briscoe, D.K., Costa, D.P., Crowder, L.B., Dunn, D.C., Fossette, S., Halpin, P.N.,
- 1908 Hartog, J.R., Hazen, E.L., Lascellas, B.G., Lewison, R.L., Poulos, G., Powers, A., 2014.
- Dynamic ocean management: Integrating scientific and technological capacity with law,
 policy and management. Stanford Environmental Law Journal 33, 125-165.
- Hobday, A.J., Spillman, C.M., Eveson, J.P., Hartog, J.R. 2016. Seasonal forecasting for decision
 support in marine fisheries and aquaculture. Fisheries Oceanography 25, 45-56.
- Hodgkinson, J.A., Hobday, A.J., Pinkard, E.A., 2014. Climate adaptation in Australia's resourceextraction industries: ready or not? Regional Environmental Change 14, 1663-1678.
- 1915 Hoegh-Guldberg, O., Mumby, P.J., Hooten, A.J., Steneck, R.S., Greenfield, P., Gomez, E.,
- 1916 Harvell, C.E., Sale, P.F., Edwards, A.J., Caldeira, K., Knowlton, N., Eakin, C.M.,

- 1917 Iglesias-Prieto, R., Muthiga, N., Bradbury, R.H., Dubi A., Hatziolos, M.E., 2007. Coral
- 1918 Reefs Under Rapid Climate Change and Ocean Acidification. Science 318, 1737-1742.
- 1919 Holsman K.K., Essington, T., Miller, T.J., Koen-Alonso, M., Stockhausen, W.J. 2012.
- Comparative analysis of cod and herring production dynamics across 13 northern marine
 ecosystems. Marine Ecology Progress Series 459, 231-246.
- Holsman, K.K., Hazen, E., Hollowed, A., Aydin, K., In review. Evolution not Revolution in
 implementing "climate-ready" marine management.
- Holsman, K.K., Ianelli, J., Aydin, K., Punt, A.E., Moffitt, E.A., In press. Comparative biological
 reference points estimated from temperature-specific multispecies and single species
 stock assessment models. Deep Sea Research II, doi: 10.1016/j.dsr2.2015.08.001
- Holt, C.A., Punt, A.E., 2009. Incorporating climate information into rebuilding plans for
 overfished groundfish species of the U.S. west coast. Fisheries Research 100, 57-67.
- Howell, E.A., Kobayashi, D.R., Parker, D.M., Balazs, G.H., Polovina, J.J., 2008. TurtleWatch: a
 tool to aid in the bycatch reduction of loggerhead turtles *Caretta caretta* in the Hawaiibased pelagic longline fishery. Endangered Species Research 5, 267-278.
- Howell, E.A., Hoover, A., Benson, S.R., Bailey, H., Polovina, J.J., Seminoff, J.A., Dutton, P.H.
 2015. Enhancing the TurtleWatch product for leatherback sea turtles, a dynamic habitat
 model for ecosystem-based management. Fisheries Oceanography 24, 57-68.
- Hsieh, C.-h., Reiss, C.S., Hunter, J.R., Beddington, J.R., May, R.M., Sugihara, G., 2006. Fishing
 elevates variability in the abundance of exploited species. Nature 443, 859-862.
- 1937 Hunt, G.L., Coyle, K.O., Eisner, L.B., Farley, E.V., Heintz, R.A., Mueter, F., Napp, J.M.,
- 1938Overland, J.E., Ressier, P.H., Salo, S., Stabeno, P.J., 2011. Climate impacts on eastern1939Bering sea foodwebs: a synthesis of new data and an assessment of the Oscillating
- 1940 Control Hypothesis. ICES Journal of Marine Science 68, 1230-1243.
- Hurtado-Ferro, F., Hiramatsu, K., Shirakihara, K., 2010. Allowing for environmental effects in a
 management strategy evaluation for Japanese sardine. ICES Journal of Marine Science
 67, 2012-2017.
- 1944 Ianelli, J., Holsman, K.K., Punt, A.E., Aydin, K., In press. Multi-model inference for
- incorporating trophic and climate uncertainty into stock assessment estimates of fishery
 biological reference points. Deep Sea Research II, doi: 10.1016/j.dsr2.2015.04.002.

ICES, 2015. Interim Report of the ICES - IOC Working Group on Harmful Algal Bloom
 Dynamics (WGHABD), 13–18 April 2015, Lisbon, Portugal. ICES CM

1949 2015/SSGEPD:17, 77 pp.

- Jagger, T.H., Elsner, J.B., 2010. A consensus model for seasonal hurricane prediction. Journal ofClimate 23, 6090–6099.
- Jennings, S., Pascoe, S., Hall-Aspland, S., Le Bouhellec, B., Norman-Lopez, A., Sullivan, A.,
 Pecl, G., 2016. Setting objectives for evaluating management adaptation actions to
 address climate change impacts in south-eastern Australian fisheries. Fisheries
 Oceanography 25, 29-44.
- Ji, M., Leetmaa, A., 1997. Impact of data assimilation on ocean initialization and El Nino
 prediction. Monthly Weather Review 125, 742-753.
- Jia, L., Vecchi, G.A., Yang, X., Gudgel, R., Delworth, T., Stern, W., Paffendorf, K., Underwood,
 S., Zeng, F., 2016. The roles of radiative forcing, sea surface temperatures, and
 atmospheric and land initial conditions in U.S. summer warming episodes. Journal of
 Climate 29, 4121-4135.
- 1962 Jia, L., Yang, X., Vecchi, G.A., Gudgel, R.G., Delworth, T.L., Rosati, A., Stern, W.F.,
- 1963 Wittenberg, A.T., Krishnamurthy, L., Zhang, S., Msadek, R., Kapnick, S., Underwood,
- 1964 S., Zeng, F., Anderson, W.G., Balaji, V., Dixon, K. 2015. Improved seasonal prediction
- 1965 of temperature and precipitation over land in a high-resolution GFDL climate model.
- 1966 Journal of Climate 28, 2044-2062.
- Johnson, K.F., Rudd, M.B., Pons, M., Akselrud, C.A., Lee, Q., Hurtado-Ferro, F., Haltuch, M.A.,
 Hamel, O.S., 2015. Status of the U.S. sablefish resource in 2015. Pacific Fishery
- 1969 Management Council. 7700 Ambassador Place NE, Suite 200, Portland, OR 97220.
- Jokiel, P.L., Brown, E.K., 2004. Global warming, regional trends and inshore environmental
 conditions influence coral bleaching in Hawaii. Global Change Biology 10, 1627-1641.
- 1972 Jolliffe, I.T., Stephenson, D.B., 2003. Forecast Verification: A Practitioner's Guide in
- 1973 *Atmospheric Science*. Chichester, West Sussex, UK: John Wiley and Sons Ltd.
- 1974 Jones, M.C., Dye, S.R., Fernandes, J.A., Frolicher, T.L., Pinnegar, J.K., Warren, R., Cheung,
- 1975 W.W.L., 2013. Predicting the impact of climate change on threatened species in UK
- 1976 waters. PLoS ONE 8, e54216, doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0054216.

- Jones, M.C., Cheung, W.W.L., 2014. Multi-model ensemble projections of climate change
 effects on global marine biodiversity. ICES Journal of Marine Science 72, 741-752.
- Jonsson, B., Jonsson, N., 2009. A review of the likely effects of climatic change on anadromous
 Atlantic salmon *Salmo salar* and brown trout *Salmo trutta*, with particular reference to
 water temperature and flow. Fish Biology 75, 2381-2447.
- Kalnay, E. 2003. *Atmospheric Modeling, Data Assimilation and Predictability*. Cambridge, UK:
 Cambridge University Press.
- Kaplan, I.C., Williams, G.D., Bond, N.A., Hermann, A.J., Siedlecki, S.A., 2016. Cloudy with a
 chance of sardines: forecasting sardine distributions using regional climate models.
 Fisheries Oceanography 25, 15–27.
- Kapnick, S.B., Delworth, D.L., Ashfaq, M., Malyshev, S., Milly, P.C.D., 2014. Snowfall less
 sensitive to warming in Karakoram than in Himalayas due to a unique seasonal
 cycle. Nature Geoscience 7, 834-840.
- Kapnick, S.B., Delworth, T.L., 2013. Controls of global snow under a changed climate. Journalof Climate 26, 5537-5562.
- Karamouz, M., Zahraie, B., 2004. Seasonal Streamflow Forecasting Using Snow Budget and El
 Niño-Southern Oscillation Climate Signals: Application to the Salt River Basin in
 Arizona. Journal of Hydrologic Engineering 9, 523-533.
- Kaschner, K., Watson, R., Trites, A.W., Pauly, D., 2006. Mapping world-wide distributions of
 marine mammal species using a relative environmental suitability (RES) model. Marine
 Ecology Progress Series 316, 285-310.
- Kay, J. E., Deser, C., Phillips, A., Mai, A., Hannay, C., Strand, G., Arblaster, J., Bates, S.,
 Danabasoglu, G., Edwards, J., Holland, M. Kushner, P., Lamarque, J.-F., Lawrence, D.,
- 2000 Lindsay, K., Middleton, A., Munoz, E., Neale, R., Oleson, K., Polvani, L., and M.
- 2001 Vertenstein, 2015. The Community Earth System Model (CESM) Large Ensemble
- 2002 Project: A Community Resource for Studying Climate Change in the Presence of Internal
- 2003 Climate Variability, Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society 96, 1333-1349, doi:
 2004 10.1175/BAMS-D-13-00255.1.
- Kearney, K.A., Stock, C., Aydin, K., 2012. Coupling planktonic ecosystem and fisheries food
 web models for a pelagic ecosystem: Description and validation for the subarctic Pacific.
 Ecological modelling 237, 43-62.

2008	Keenlyside, N. S., Ba, J., Mecking, J., Omrani, N-O., Latif, M., Zhang, R., Msadek, R., 2015.
2009	North Atlantic multi-decadal variability - mechanisms and predictability. In: C-P. Chang,
2010	M. Ghil, M. Latif, and M. Wallace (Eds.), Climate Change: Multidecadal and Beyond,
2011	World Scientific Publishing.
2012	Keister, J.E., Di Lorenzo, E., Morgan, C.A., Combes, V., Peterson, W.T., 2011. Zooplankton
2013	species composition is linked to ocean transport in the Northern California Current.
2014	Global Change Biology 17, 2498-2511.
2015	King, J.R., McFarlane, G.A., Punt, A.E., 2015. Shifts in fisheries management: adapting to
2016	regime shifts. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences
2017	370, 20130277-20130277.
2018	Kirtman, B.P., Power, S.B., Adedoyin, A.J., Boer, G.J., Bojariu, R., Camilloni, I., Doblas-Reyes,
2019	F., Fiore, A.M., Kimoto, M., Meehl, G., Prather, M., Sarr, A., Schar, C., Sutton, R., van
2020	Oldenborgh, G.J., Vecchi, G. and Wang, HJ. 2013. Near-term Climate Change:
2021	Projections and Predictability. In T. F. Stocker, D. Qin, G. K. Plattner, M. Tignor, S. K.
2022	Allen, J. Boschung, A. Nauels, Y. Xia, V. Bex and P.M. Midgley (Eds.), Climate Change
2023	2013: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Fifth
2024	Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (953-1028).
2025	Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA.
2026	Kirtman, B.P., Dughong, M., Infanti, J.M., Kinter, J.L., Paolino, D.A., Zhang, Q., van den Dool,
2027	H., Saha, S., Pena Mendez, M., Becker, E., Peng, P., Tripp, P., Huang, J., DeWitt, D.,
2028	Tippet, M.K., Barnston, A.G., Li, S., Rosati, A., Schubert, S.D., Rienecker, M., Suarez,
2029	M., Li, Z. E., Marshak, J., Lim, Y-K., Tribbia, J., Pegion, K., Merryfield, W.J., Bertrand,
2030	D., 2014. The North American Multimodel Ensemble: Phase-1 Seasonal-to-Interannual
2031	Prediction; Phase-2 toward Developing Intraseasonal Prediction. Bullettin of the
2032	American Meteorological Society 95, 585–601.
2033	Kline, T. C., Boldt, J.L., Farley Jr., E.V., Haldorson, L.J., Helle, J.H., 2008. Pink salmon
2034	(Oncorhynchus gorbuscha) marine survival rates reflect early marine carbon source
2035	dependency. Progress in Oceanography 77, 194-202.
2036	Klotzbach, P.J., Gray, W.M., 2009. Twenty-five years of Atlantic basin seasonal hurricane
2037	forecasts, Geophysical Research Letters, 36, L09711, doi:10.1029/2009GL037580.

- Koster, R.D., Suarez, M.J., Heiser, M. 2000. Variance and predictability of precipitation at
 seasonal-to-internannual timescales. Journal of Hydrometeorology 1, 26-46.
- 2040 Kristiansen, T., Drinkwater, K.F., Lough, R.G., Sundby, S., 2011. Recruitment Variability in
- 2041 North Atlantic Cod and Match-Mismatch Dynamics. Plos One 6, doi:
- 2042 10.1371/journal.pone.0017456.
- Kumar, A., 2009. Finite samples and uncertainty estimates for skill measures for seasonal
 predictions. Monthly Weather Review 137, 2622-2631.
- Kwok, R., 2011. Observational assessment of Arctic ocean sea ice motion, export, and thickness
 in CMIP3 climate simulations, Journal of Geophysical Research 116, C00D05, doi:
 10.1029/2011JC007004.
- Laufkötter, C., Vogt, M., Gruber, N., Aita-Noguchi, M., Aumont, O., Bopp, L., Buitenhuis, E.,
 Doney, S.C., Dunne, J., Hashioka, T., Hauck, J., Hirata, T., John, J., Le Quéré, C., Lima,
 I.D., Nakano, H., Seferian, R., Totterdell, I., Vichi, M., Völker, C., 2015. Drivers and
 uncertainties of future global marine primary production in marine ecosystem models.
 Biogeosciences 12, 6955–6984.
- Laufkötter, C., Vogt, M., Gruber, N., Aumont, O., Bopp, L., Doney, S. C., Dunne, J.P., Hauck,
 J., John, J.G., Lima, I.D., Seferian, R., Völker, C., 2016. Projected decreases in future
 marine export production: the role of the carbon flux through the upper ocean ecosystem.
 Biogeosciences 13, 4023–4047.
- Laugel, A., Menendez, M., Benoit, M., Mattarolo, G., Mendez, F., 2014. Wave climate
 projections along the French coastline: Dynamical versus statistical downscaling
 methods. Ocean Modelling 84, 35-50.
- Lawler, J.J., White, D., Neilson, R.P., Blaustein, A.R., 2006. Predicting climate-induced range
 shifts: model differences and model reliability. Global Change Biology 12, 1568-1584.

2062 Lehodey, P., Alheit, J., Barange, M., Baumgartner, T., Beaugrand, G., Drinkwater, K.,

- Fromentin, J-M., Hare, S.R., Ottersen, G., Perry, R.I., Roy, C., van der Lingen, C.D.,
 Werner, F., 2006. Climate variability, fish, and fisheries. Journal of Climate 19, 50095030.
- Lehodey P., Senina I., Murtugudde R., 2008. A spatial ecosystem and populations dynamics
 model (SEAPODYM) modelling of tuna and tuna-like populations. Progress in
 Oceanography 78, 304–318.

- Lehodey P., Murtugudde R., Senina I., 2010. Bridging the gap from ocean models to population
 dynamics of large marine preda- tors: a model of mid-trophic functional groups. Progress
 in Oceanography 84, 69–84.
- Lehodey, P., Senina, I., Nicol, S., Hampton, J., 2015. Modelling the impact of climate change on
 South Pacific albacore tuna. Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography
 113, 246-259.
- Lellouche, J-M., Le Galloudec, O., Drevillion, M., Regnier, C., Greiner, E., Garric, G., Ferry, N.,
 Desportes, C., Testut, C.E., Bricaud, C., Bourdalle-Badie, R., Tranchant, B., Benkiran,
 M., Drillet, Y., Daudin, A., De Nicola, C., 2013. Evaluation of global monitoring and
 forecasting systems at Mercator Ocean. Ocean Science 9, 57-81.
- 2079 Le Mézo, P., Lefort, S., Séférian, R., Aumont, O., Maury, O., Murtugudde, R., & Bopp, L., 2016.
 2080 Natural variability of marine ecosystems inferred from a coupled climate to ecosystem
 2081 simulation. Journal of Marine Systems 153, 55–66.
- Levin, P.S., Fogarty, M.J., Murawski, S.A., Fluharty, D. 2009. Integrated Ecosystem
 Assessments: Developing the Scientific Basis for Ecosystem-Based Management of the
 Ocean. PLOS Biology 7: e1000014, doi: 10.1371/journal.pbio.1000014.
- Lewison, R. L., Hobday, A.J., Maxwell, S., Hazen, E., Hartog, J.R., Dunn, D.C., Briscoe, D.,
 Fossette, S., O'Keefe, C.E., Barnes, M., Abecassis, M., Bograd, S., Bethoney, N.D.,
- 2087 Bailey, H., Wiley, D., Andrews, S., Hazen, L., Crowder, L.B., 2015. Dynamic Ocean
- 2088 Management: Identifying the Critical Ingredients of Dynamic Approaches to Ocean
 2089 Resource Management. Bioscience 65, 486-498.
- 2090 Lewitus, A.J., Horner, R.A., Caron, D.A., Garcia-Mendoza, E., Hickey, B.M., Hunter, M.,
- 2091 Huppert, D.D., Kudela, R.M., Langlois, GW., Largier, J.L., Lessard, E.J., RaLonde, R.,
- 2092 Jack Rensel, J.E., Strutton, P.G., Trainer, V.L., Tweddle, J.F., 2012. Harmful algal
- blooms along the North American west coast region: History, trends, causes, and impacts.
 Harmful Algae 19, 133-159.
- Lindegren, M., Mollmann, C., Nielsen, A., Stenseth, N.C., 2009. Preventing the collapse of the
 Baltic cod stock through an ecosystem-based management approach. Proceedings of the
 National Academy of Science of the United States of America 106, 14722-14727.

- Lindegren, M., Checkley, D.M. Jr., Rouyer, T., MacCall, A.D., Stenseth, N.C., 2013. Climate,
 fishing, and fluctuations of sardine and anchovy in the California Current. Proceedings of
 the National Academy of Science of the United States of America 110, 13672-13677.
- 2101 Liniger, M. A., Mathis, H., Appenzeller, C., Doblas-Reyes, F.J. 2007. Realistic greenhouse gas
- 2102 forcing and seasonal forecasts. Geophysical Research Letters 34, L04705,
 2103 doi:10.1029/2006GL028335.
- Link, J.S., Griffis, R., Busch, S. (Editors), 2015. NOAA Fisheries Climate Science Strategy. U.S.
 Dept. of Commerce, NOAA Technical Memorandum NMFS-F/SPO-155, 70p.
- Link, J.S., Ihde, T.F., Harvey, C.J., Gaichas, S., Field, J.C., Brodziak, J.K.T., Townsend, H.M.,
 Peterman, R.M., 2012. Dealing with uncertainty in ecosystem models: The paradox of
- use for living marine resource management. Progress in Oceanography 102, 102–114.
- Link, J.S., Nye, J.A., Hare, J.A., 2011. Guidelines for incorporating fish distribution shifts into a
 fisheries management context. Fish and Fisheries 12, 461-469.
- Little, L.R., Hobday, A.J., Parslow, J.S., Davies, C.R., Grafton, R.Q., 2015. Funding climate
 adaptation strategies with climate derivatives. Climate Risk Management 8, 9–15.
- Liu, G., L.E. Matrosova, C. Penland, D.K. Gledhill, C.M. Eakin, R.S. Webb, T.R.L. Christensen,
 S.F. Heron, J.A. Morgan, W.J. Skirving, Strong, A.E., 2009. NOAA Coral Reef Watch
 Coral Bleaching Outlook System. *Proceedings of the 11th International Coral Reef*
- 2116 Symposium, Ft. Lauderdale, Florida, 951-955.
- Liu, G., Heron, S.F., Eakin, C.M., Muller-Karger, F.E., Vega-Rodriguez, M., Guild, L.S., De La
 Cour, J.L., Geiger, E.F., Skirving, W.J., Burgess, T.F.R., Strong, A.E., Harris, A., Maturi,
 E., Ignatov, A., Sapper, J., Li, J., Lynds, S., 2014. Reef-Scale thermal stress monitoring
 of coral ecosystems: new 5-km global products from NOAA Coral Reef Watch. Remote
- 2121 Sensing 6, 11579-11606.
- Lorenz, E. N. 1963. Deterministic nonperiodic flow. Journal of Atmospheric Sciences 20, 130141.
- 2124 MacCall, A. 1990. *Dynamic geography of marine fish populations*. Washington Sea Grant
 2125 Program, Seattle, WA.
- Magnusson, L., Alonso-Balmaseda, M., Corti, S., Molteni, F., Stockdale, T., 2013. Evaluation of
 forecast strategies for seasonal and decadal forecasts in presence of systematic model
 errors. Climate Dynamics 41, 2393-2409.

- Mahanama, S., Livneh, B., Koster, R., Lettenmaier, D., Reichle, R., 2012. Soil Moisture, Snow,
 and Seasonal Streamflow Forecasts in the United States. Journal of Hydrometeorology
 13, 189-203.
- Makino, A., Yamano, H., Beger, M., Klein, C.J., Yara, Y., Possingham, H.P., 2014. Spatiotemporal marine conservation planning to support high-latitude coral range expansion
 under climate change. Diversity and Distributions 20, 859-871.
- Mantua, N.J., Hare, S.R., Zhang, Y., 1997. A Pacific interdecadal climate oscillation with
 impacts on salmon production. Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society 78,
 1069-1079.
- Marchesiello, P., McWilliams, J.C., Shchepetkin, A., 2001. Open boundary conditions for longterm integration of regional oceanic models. Ocean Modelling 3, 1-20.
- 2140 Marine Stewardship Council, 2014. Fisheries Standard. Available at:
- https://www.msc.org/documents/scheme-documents/fisheries-certification-schemedocuments/fisheries-certification-scheme-documents#standard [Accessed January 1,
 2143 2016].
- Marshall, N.A., Gordon, I.J., Ash, A.J., 2011. The reluctance of resource-users to adopt seasonal
 climate forecasts to enhance resilience to climate variability on the rangelands. Climate
 Change Economics 107, 511-529.
- Mason, S.J., Baddour, O., 2007. Statistical Modelling. In A. Troccoli, M. Harrison, D. L. T.
 Anderson, S. J. Mason (Eds.), *Seasonal Climate: Forecasting and Managing Risk* (167206). Dordrecht: Springer Academic Publishers.
- Mason, S.J., Stephenson, D.B., 2007. How do we know whether seasonal climate forecasts are
 any good? In A. Troccoli, M. Harrison, D. L. T. Anderson, S. J. Mason (Eds.), *Seasonal Climate: Forecasting and Managing Risk* (167-206). Dordrecht: Springer Academic
 Publishers.
- Maunder, M.N., Punt, A.E., 2013. A review of integrated analysis in fisheries stock assessment.
 Fisheries Research 142, 61-74.
- Maunder, M.N., Watters, G.M., 2003. A general framework for integrating environmental time
 series into stock assessment models: model description, simulation testing, and example.
 Fishery Bulletin 101, 89-99.

2159 Maxwell, S.M., Hazen, E.L., Lewison, R.L., Dunn, D.C., Bailey, H., Bograd, S., Briscoe, D.K., 2160 Fossette, S., Hobday, A.J., Bennett, M., Benson, S., Caldwell, M.R., Costa, D.P., Dewar, 2161 H., Eguchi, T., Hazen, L., Kohin, S., Sippel, T., Crowder, L.B., 2015. Dynamic ocean 2162 management: Defining and conceptualizing real-time management of the ocean. Marine Policy 58, 42–50. 2163 2164 Maynard, J., van Hooidonk, R., Harvell, C.D., Eakin, C.M., Liu, G., Willis, B.L., Williams, G.J., 2165 Groner, M.L., Dobson, A., Heron, S.F., Glenn, R., Reardon, K., Shields, J.D., 2016. 2166 Improving marine disease surveillance through sea temperature monitoring, outlooks and 2167 projections. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B 371, 20150208, doi: 2168 0.1098/rstb.2015.0208. McCabe, R.M., Hickey, B.M., Kudela, R.M., Lefebvre, K.A., Adams, N.G., Bill, B.D., Gulland, 2169 2170 F.M.D., Thomson, R.E., Cochlan, W.P., Trainer, V.L. 2016. An unprecedented coastwide 2171 toxic algal bloom linked to anomalous ocean conditions. Geophysical Research Letters 2172 43, 10366-10376, doi:10.1002/2016GL070023. 2173 McGilliard, C.R., Punt, A.E., Methot, Jr., R.D., Hilborn, R., 2015. Accounting for marine reserves using spatial stock assessments. Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic 2174 2175 Sciences 72, 262-280. 2176 McGillicuddy Jr, D.J., Townsend, D.W., He, R., Keafer, B.A., Kleindinst, J.L., Manning, J.P., 2177 Mountain, D.G., Thomas, M.A., Anderson, D.M., 2011. Suppression of the 2010 Alexandrium fundyense bloom by changes in physical, biological, and chemical 2178 2179 properties of the Gulf of Maine. Limnology and Oceanography 56, 2411-2426. 2180 McGoodwin, J. R., 2007. Effects of climatic variability on three fishing economies in high 2181 latitude regions: Implications for fisheries policies. Marine Policy 31, 40-55. 2182 McIlgorm, A., Hanna, S., Knapp, G., Le Floc'H, P., Millerd, F., Pan, M., 2010. How will climate 2183 change alter fishery governance? Insights from seven international case studies. Marine 2184 Policy 34, 170-177. 2185 McPhaden, M. J., 1993. TOGA-TAO and the 1991-93 E1 Niño-Southern Oscillation event. 2186 Oceanography 6, 36-44. 2187 Meehl, G.A., Goddard, L., Boer, G., Burgman, R., Branstator, G., Cassou, C., Corti, S., 2188 Danabasoglu, G., Doblas-Reyes, F., Hawkins, E., Karspeck, A., Kimoto, M., Kumar, A., 2189 Matei, D., Mignot, J., Msadek, R., Navarra, A., Pohlmann, H., Rienecker, M., Rosati, A.,
- 2190 Schineider, E., Smith, D., Sutton, R., Teng, H., van Oldenborgh, G.J., Vecchi, G.,
- Yeager, S., 2014. Decadal climate prediction: An update from the trenches. Bulletin of
 the American Meteorological Society 95, 243-267.
- Meehl, G.A., Teng, H., 2012. Case studies for initialized decadal hindcasts and predictions for
 the Pacific region. Geophysical. Research Letters 39, L22705, doi:
- 2195 10.1029/2012GL053423.
- Meinke, H., Stone, R., 2005. Seasonal and inter-annual climate forecasting: The new tool for
 increasing preparedness to climate variability and change in agricultural planning and
 operations. Climatic Change 70, 221-253.
- Methot Jr., R.D., Tromble, G.R., Lambert, D.M., Greene, K.E., 2014. Implementing a sciencebased system for preventing overfishing and guiding sustainable fisheries in the U.S.
 ICES Journal of Marine Science 71, 183-194.
- Methot, Jr., R. D., 2009. Stock Assessment: Operational Models in Support of Fisheries
 Management. In: Future of Fisheries Science Proceedings of the 50th Annual
 Symposium of the American Institute of Fishery Research biologists, Seattle, WA.
 Springer. Fish and Fisheries Series 31, pp. 137-165.
- Meza, F. J., Hansen, J.W., Osgood, D., 2008. Economic value of seasonal climate forecasts for
 agriculture: Review of ex-ante assessments and recommendations for future research.
 Journal of Applied Meteorology and Climatology 47, 1269-1286.
- Miller, K.A., Munro, J.R., 2004. Climate and cooperation: A new perspective on the
 management of shared fish stocks. Marine Resource Economics 19, 367-393.
- 2211 Miller, T. J., Hare, J.A., Alade, L.A., 2016. A state-space approach to incorporating
- environmental effects on recruitment in an age-structured assessment model with an
 application to Southern New England yellowtail flounder. Canadian Journal of Fisheries
 and Aquatic Sciences 73, 1261-1270.
- 2215 Mills, K., Pershing, A.J., Brown, C.J., Chen, Y., Chiang, F-S., Holland, D.S., Lehuta, S., Nye,
- 2216 J.A., Sun, J.C., Thomas, A.C., Wahle, R.A., 2013. Fisheries management in a changing
- 2217 climate: Lessons from the 2012 ocean heat wave in the Northwest Atlantic.
- 2218 Oceanography 26, 191-195.

- Milly, P.C.D., Betancourt, J., Falkenmark, M., Hirsch, R.M., Kundzewicz, Z.W., Lettenmaier,
 D.P., Stouffer, R.J., 2008. Climate change Stationarity is dead: Whither water
 management? Science 319, 573-574.
- Mo, K.C., Lettenmaier, D.P., 2014. Hydrologic prediction over the conteminous United states
 using the National Multi-Model Ensemble. Journal of Hydrometeorology 15, 1457-1472.
- 2224 Mochizuki, T., Ishii, M., Kimoto, M., Chikamoto, Y., Watanabe, M., Nozawa, T., Sakamoto,
- T.T., Shiogama, H., Awaji, T., Sugiura, N., Toyoda, T., Yasunaka, S., Tatebe, H., Mori,
 M., 2010. Pacific decadal oscillation hindcasts relevant to near-term climate prediction.
 Proceeding of the National Academy of Science of the United States of America 107,
 1833-1837.
- Mohn, R.K., Chouinard, G.A., 2007. Harvest control rules for stocks displaying dynamic
 production regimes. ICES Journal of Marine Science 64, 693-697.
- Morgan, M. J., Shelton, P.A., Rideout, R.M., 2014. An evaluation of fishing mortality reference
 points under varying levels of population productivity in three Atlantic cod (*Gadus morhua*) stocks. ICES Journal of Marine Science 71, 1407-1416.
- 2234 Moss, R.H., Edmonds, J.A., Hibbard, K.A., Manning, M.R., Rose, S.K., van Vuuren, D.P.,
- 2235 Carter, T.R., Emori, S., Kainuma, M., Kram, T., Meehl, G.A., Mitchell, J.F.B.,
- 2236 Nakicenovic, N., Riahl, K., Smith, S.J., Stouffer, R.J., Thomson, A.M., Weyant, J.P.,
- Wilbanks, T.J., 2010. The next generation of scenarios for climate change research and
 assessment. Nature 463, 747–756.
 - Msadek, R., Delworth, T.L., Rosati, A., Anderson, W.G., Vecchi, G.A., Chang, Y-S., Dixon,
 K.W., Gudgel, R.G., Stern, W.F., Wittenberg, A.T., Yang, X-Q., Zeng, F., Zhang, R.,
 Zhang, S., 2014a. Predicting a Decadal Shift in North Atlantic Climate Variability Using
 the GFDL Forecast System. Journal of Climate 27, 6472-6496, doi: 10.1175/JCLI-D-13-00476.1.
 - Msadek, R., Vecchi, G.A., Winton, M., Gudgel, R.G., 2014b. Importance of initial conditions in seasonal predictions of Arctic sea ice extent. Geophysical Research Letters 41, 5208-5215.
- Mueter, F.J., Bond, N.A., Ianelli, J.N., Hollowed, A.B., 2011. Expected declines in recruitment
 of walleye pollock (*Theragra chalcogramma*) in the eastern Bering Sea under future
 climate change. ICES Journal of Marine Science 68, 1284-1296.

- Munch, S.B., Kottas A., 2009. A Bayesian modeling approach for determining productivity
 regimes and their characteristics. Ecological Applications 19, 527-537.
- 2244 Muñoz, Á. G., López, P., Velásquez, R., Monterrey, L., León, G., Ruiz, F., Recalde, C., Cadena,
- J., Mejía, R., Paredes, M., Bazo, J., Reyes, C., Carrasco, G., Castellón, Y., Villarroel, C.,
 Quintana, J., Urdaneta, A., 2010. An Environmental Watch System for the Andean
- 2247 Countries: El Observatorio Andino. Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society 91,
 2248 1645–1652.
- Murakami, H., Vecchi, G.A., Underwood, S., Delworth, T., Wittenberg, A.T., Anderson, W.,
 Chen, J.-H., Gudgel, R., Harris, L., Lin, S.-J., Zeng, F., 2015. Simulation and prediction
 of Category 4 and 5 hurricanes in the high-resolution GFDL HiFLOR coupled climate
 model. Journal of Climate 28, 9058-9079.
- Murakami, H., Vecchi, G.A., Villarini, G., Delworth, T.L., Gudgel, R., Underwood, S., Yang,
 X., Zhang, W., Lin, S.-J., In review. Seasonal Forecasts of Category 4 and 5 Hurricanes
 and Landfalling Tropical Cyclones using a High-Resolution GFDL Coupled Climate
 Model. Geophysical Research Letters.
- Murphy, G.L., 1966. Population biology of the Pacific sardine (*Sardinops Caerulea*).
 Proceedings of the California Academy of Sciences 34, 1-79.
- Myers, R.A., 1998. When do environment-recruitment correlations work? Reviews in Fish
 Biology and Fisheries 8, 285-305.
- Newman, M., Alexander, M.A., Scott, J.D., 2011. An empirical model of tropical ocean
 dynamics. Climate Dynamics 37, 1823-1841.
- Nicholls, N., 1999. Cognitive illusions, heuristics, and climate prediction. Bulletin of the
 American Meteorological Society 80, 2217-2238.
- Nielsen, A., Berg, C.W., 2014. Estimation of time-varying selectivity in stock assessments using
 state-space models. Fisheries Research 158, 96-101.
- Nye, J.A., Link, J.S., Hare, J.A., Overholtz, W.J., 2009. Changing spatial distribution of fish
 stocks in relation to climate and population size on the Northeast United States
 continental shelf. Marine Ecology Progress Series 393, 111-129.
- Ottersen, G., Stige, L.C., Durant, J.M., 2013. Temporal shifts in recruitment dynamics of North
 Atlantic fish stocks: effects of spawning stock and temperature. Marine Ecology Progress
 Series 480, 205-225.

- Pacific Fishery Management Council and National Marine Fisheries Service, 2014. Draft
 Environmental Impact Statement (DEIS) for proposed Harvest Specifications and
 Management Measures for the Pacific Coast Groundfish Fishery and Amendment 24 to
 The Pacific Coast Groundfish Fishery Management Plan. 1074 pp. PFMC and NMFS,
 Portand, OR and Seattle, WA.
- Palmer, M.C., Deroba, J.J., Legault, C.M., Brooks, E.N., 2016. Comment on "Slow adaptation in
 the face of rapid warming leads to collapse of the Gulf of Maine cod fishery." Science
 352, 423.
- Pauly D., Alder J., Booth S., Cheung W.W.L., Close C., Sumaila U.R., Swartz W., et al., 2008.
 Fisheries in large marine ecosystems: Descriptions and diagnoses. *In* The UNEP Large
 Marine Ecosystems Report: A Perspective on Changing Conditions in LMEs of the
 World's Regional Seas, *pp.* 23–40. *Ed. by* Sherman K., Hempel G., UNEP, Nairobi,
 Kenya.
- Payne, M.R., Hatfield, E.M.C., Dickey-Collas, M., Falkenhaug, T., Gallego, A., Gröger, J.,
 Licandro, P., Llope, M., Munk, P., Röckmann, C., Schmidt, J.O., Nash, R.D.M., 2009.
 Recruitment in a changing environment: the 2000s North Sea herring recruitment failure.
 ICES Journal of Marine Science 66, 272–277.
- Payne, M.R., Egan, A., Fässlerm S.M.M., Hátún, H., Holst, J.C., Jacobsen, J.A., Slotte, A.,
 Loeng, H., 2012. The rise and fall of the NE Atlantic blue whiting (*Micromesistus poutassou*). Marine Biology Research 8, 475–487.
- Payne, M.R., Barange, M., Cheung, W.W.L., MacKenzie, B.R., Batchelder, H.P., Cormon, X.,
 Eddy, T.D., Fernandes, J.A., Hollowed, A.B., Jones, M.C., Link, J.S., Neubauer, P.,
- 2295 Ortiz, I., Queiros, A.M., Paula, J.R., 2016. Uncertainties in projecting climate-change 2296 impacts in marine ecosystems. ICES Journal of Marine Science 73, 1272-1282.
- Peck, M.A., Reglero, P., Takahashi, M., Catalán, I.A., 2013. Life cycle ecophysiology of small
 pelagic fish and climate-driven changes in populations. Progress in Oceanography 116,
 2299 220-245.
- Perälä, T., Kuparinen, A., 2015. Detecting regime shifts in fish stock dynamics. Canadian
 Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences 72, 1619-1628.
- Perry, A. L., Low, P.J., Ellis, J.R., Reynolds, J.D., 2005. Climate change and distribution shifts
 in marine fishes. Science 308, 1912-1915.

- Perry, R.I., Cury, P., Brander, K., Jennings, S., Möllman, C., Planque, B., 2010. Sensitivity of
 marine systems to climate and fishing: Concepts, issues and management responses.
 Journal of Marine Systems 79, 427-435.
- 2307 Pershing, A.J., Alexander, M.A., Hernandez, C.M., Kerr, L.A., Le Bris, A., Mills, K.E., Nye,
- J.A., Record, N.R., Scannell, H.A., Scott, J.D., Sherwood, G.D., Thomas, A.C., 2015.
 Slow adaptation in the face of rapid warming leads to collapse of the Gulf of Maine cod
 fishery. Science 350, 809-812.
- Peterman, R.M., Pyper, B.J., Grout, J.A., 2000. Comparison of parameter estimation methods for
 detecting climate-induced changes in productivity of Pacific salmon (*Oncorhynchus*spp.). Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences 57, 181-191.
- Peterman, R.M., Pyper, B.J., MacGregor, B.W., 2003. Use of the Kalman filter to reconstruct
 historical trends in productivity of Bristol Bay sockeye salmon (*Oncorhynchus nerka*).
 Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences 60, 809-824.
- Peterman, R.M., Dorner, B., 2012. A widespread decrease in productivity of sockeye salmon
 (*Oncorhynchus nerka*) populations in Western North America. Canadian Journal of
 Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences 69, 1255-1260.
- Phillips, S.J., Anderson, R.P., Schapire, R.E., 2006. Maximum entropy modeling of species
 geographic distributions. Ecological Modelling 190, 231-259.
- Piechota, T.C., Dracup, J.A., 1999. Long-Range Streamflow Forecasting Using El NiñoSouthern Oscillation Indicators. Journal of Hydrologic Engineering 4, 144-151.
- Pikitch, E.K., Santora, C., Babock, E.A., Bakun, A., Bonfil, R., Conover, D.O., Dayton, P.,
 Doukakis, P., Fluharty, D., Heneman, B., Houde, E.D., Link, J., Livingston, P.A.,
- Mangel, M., McAlister, M.K., Pope, J., Sainsbury, K.J., 2004. Ecosystem-based fishery
 management. Science 305, 346-347.
- Pinsky, M.L., Mantua, N.J., 2014. Emerging Adaptation Approaches for climate ready fisheries
 management. Oceanography 27, 146-159.
- Pinsky, M.L., Worm, B., Fogarty, M.J., Sarmiento, J.L., Levin, S.A., 2013. Marine taxa track
 local climate velocities. Science 341, 1239-1242.
- Platt, T., Fuentes-Yaco, C., Frank, K.T., 2003. Spring algal bloom and larval fish survival.
 Nature 423, 398-399.

- 2334 Plagányi, E.E., Punt, A.E., Hillary, R., Morello, E.B., Thébaud, O., Hutton, T., Pillans, R.D.,
- 2335 Thorson, J.T., Fulton, E.A., Smith, A.D.M., Smith, F., Bayliss, P., Haywood, M., Lyne,
- 2336 V., Rothlisberg, P.C., 2014. Multispecies fisheries management and conservation: tactical
- 2337 applications using models of intermediate complexity. Fish and Fisheries 15, 1-22.
 - Pohlmann, H., Jungclaus, J.H., Kohl, A., Stammer, D., Marotzke, J., 2009. Initializing decadal climate predictions with the GECCO oceanic synthesis: Effects on the North Atlantic. Journal of Climate 22, 3926-3938.
- Poloczanska, E.S., Brown, C.J., Sydeman, W.J., Kiessling, W., Schoeman, D.S., Moore, P.J.,
 Brander, K., Bruno, J.F., Buckley, L.B., Burrows, M.T., Duarte, C.M., Halpern, B.S.,
- Holding, J., Kappel, C.V., O'Connor, M.I., Pandolfi, J.M., Parmesan, C., Schwing, F.,
- 2341Thompson, S.A., Richardson, A.J., 2013. Global imprint of climate change on marine2342life. Nature Climate Change 3, 919-925.
- Pörtner, H.O., Knust, R., 2007. Climate change affects marine fishes through the oxygen
 limitation of thermal tolerance. Science 315, 95-97.
- 2345 Pörtner, H.O., Farrell, A.P., 2008. Physiology and Climate Change. Science 322, 690-692.
- Punt, A.E., 2011. The impact of climate change on the performance of rebuilding strategies for
 overfished groundfish species of the U.S. west coast. Fisheries Research 109, 320-329.

2348 Punt, A.E., A'mar, Z.T., Bond, N.A., Butterworth, D.S., de Moor, C.L., De Oliveira, J.A.A.,

- Haltuch, M.A., Hollowed, A.B., Szuwalski, C., 2014a. Fisheries management under
 climate and environmental uncertainty: control rules and performance simulation. ICES
 Journal of Marine Science 71, 2208-2220.
- Punt, A.E., Szuwalski, C.S., Stockhausen, W., 2014b. An evaluation of stock–recruitment
 proxies and environmental change points for implementing the US Sustainable Fisheries
 Act. Fisheries Research 157, 28-40.
- 2355 Quinn, T.J., Deriso, R.B., 1999. Quantitative Fish Dynamics. Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- 2356 Randall, D.A., Wood, R.A., Bony, S., Colman, R., Fichefet, T., Fyfe, J., Kattsov, V., Pitman, A.,
- 2357 Shukla, J., Srinivasan, J., Stouffer, R.J., Sumi, A., Taylor, K. E., 2007. Climate models
- and their evaluation. In: Solomon, S., Qin, D., Manning, M., Chen, Z., Marquis, M.,
- Averyt, K.B., Tignor, M., Miller, H.L. (Eds), Climate Change 2007: The Physical
- 2360 Science Basis, Contribution of Working Group I to the Fourth Assessment Report of the

- Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge,
 UK, and New York, pp. 589-662.
- Richardson, D.S. 2000. Skill and relative economic value of the ECMWF ensemble prediction
 system. Quarterly Journal of the Royal Meteorological Society 126, 649-667.
 - Robson, J.I., Sutton, R., Lohmann, K, Smith, D., 2012. Causes of the rapid warming of the North Atlantic Ocean in the mid-1990s. Journal of Climate 25, 4116–4134.
- Rodgers, K.B., Lin, J., Frölicher, T.L., 2015. Emergence of multiple ocean ecosystem drivers in
 a large ensemble suite with an Earth system model. Biogeosciences 12, 3301-3320.
- Rose, K.A., Allen, J.I., Artioli, Y., Barange, M., Blackford, J., Carlotti, F., Cropp, R., Daewel,
 U., Edwards, K., Flynn, K., Hill, S., Hille Ris Lambers, R., Huse, G., Mackinson, S.,
- 2369 Megrey, B.A., Moll, A., Rivkin, R., Salihoglu, B., Schrum, C., Shannon, L., Shin, Y.,
- 2370Smith, S.L., Smith, C., Solidoro, C., St John, M., Zhou, M., 2010. End-to-end models for2371the analysis of marine ecosystems: challenges, issues, and next steps. Marine and Coastal
- Fisheries: Dynamics, Management and Ecosystem Science 2, 115–130.
- Rutterford, L.A., Simpson, S.D., Jennings, S., Johnson, M.P., Blanchard, J.L., Schön, P-J., Sims,
 D.W., Tinker, J., Genner, M.J., 2015. Future fish distributions constrained by depth in
 warming seas. Nature Climate Change 5, 569-573.
- Saba, G.K., Fraser, W.R., Saba, V.S., Iannuzzi, R.A., Coleman, K.E., Doney, S.C., Ducklow,
 H.W., Martinson, D.G., Miles, T.N., Patterson-Fraser, D.L., Stammerjohn, S.E.,
- Steinberg, D.K., Schofield, O.M., 2013. Winter and spring controls on the summer food
 web of the coastal West Antartica Peninsula. Nature Communications 5, 4318, doi:
 10.1038/ncomms5318.
- Saba, V.S., Griffies, S.M., Anderson, W.G., Winton, M., Alexander, M.A., Delworth, T.L., Hare,
 J.A., Harrison, M.J., Rosati, A., Vecchi, G.A., Zhang, R., 2016. Enhanced warming of the
 Northwest Atlantic Ocean under climate change. Journal of Geophysical ResearchOceans 121, 118-132.
- Saha, S., Nadiga, S., Thiaw, C., Wang, J., Wang, W., Zhang, Q., van den Dool, H.M., Pan, H-L.,
 Moorthi, S., Behringer, D., Stockes, D., Pena, M., Lord, S., White, G., Ebisuzaki, W.,
- Peng, P., Xie, P., 2006. The NCEP climate forecast system. Journal of Climate 19, 3483–
 3517.

- Sainsbury, K.J., Punt, A.E., Smith, A.D.M., 2000. Design of operational management strategies
 for achieving fishery ecosystem objectives. ICES Journal of Marine Science 57, 731-741.
- 2391 Salinger, J., Hobday, A.J., Matear, R., O'Kane, T.J., Risbey, J., Eveson, J.P., Fulton, E.A., Feng,
- M., Plaganyi, E.E., Poloczanska, E., Marshall, A., Thompson P.A., 2016. Decadal-scale
 forecasting of climate drivers for marine applications. Advances in Marine Biology 74, 168.
- Sansom, P.G., Ferro, C.A.T., Stephenson, D.B., Goddard, L., Mason, S.J., 2016. Best practices
 for post-processing ensemble climate forecasts, part I: selecting appropriate recalibration
 methods. Journal of Climate 29, 7247-7264.
- Schindler, D.E., Hilborn, R., 2015. Prediction, precaution, and policy under global change.
 Science 347, 953-954.
- Schirripa, M.J., Colbert J.J., 2006. Interannual changes in sablefish (*Anoplopoma fimbria*)
 recruitment in relation to oceanographic conditions within the California Current System.
 Fisheries Oceanography 15, 25-36.
- Schirripa, M.J., Goodyear, C.P., Methot, R.M., 2009. Testing different methods of incorporating
 climate data into the assessment of US West Coast sablefish. ICES Journal of Marine
 Science 66, 1605-1613.
- Shackell, N.L., Ricard, D., Stortini, C., 2014. Thermal habitat index of many Northwest Atlantic
 temperate species stays neutral under warming projected for 2030 but changes radically
 by 2060. Plos One 9, e90662.
- Sharp, G.D., 1987. Climate and fisheries: cause and effect or managing the long and short of itall. South African Journal of Marine Science 5, 811-838.
- Shukla, S., Sheffield, J., Wood, E.F., Lettenmaier, D.P., 2013. On the sources of global land
 surface hydrologic predictability. Hydrology and Earth System Science 17, 2781-2796.
- 2413 Séférian, R., Bopp, L., Gehlen, M., Swingedouw, D., Mignot, J., Guilyardi, E., Servonnat, J.,
- 2414 2014. Multiyear predictability of tropical marine productivity. Proceedings of the
 2415 National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 111, 11646-11651.
- 2416 Senina, I., Sibert, J., Lehodey, P., 2008. Parameter estimation for basin-scale ecosystem-linked
- 2417 population models of large pelagic predators: Application to skipjack tuna. Progress in
 2418 Oceanography 78, 319–335.
- 2419 Servonnat, J., Mignot, J., Guilyardi, E., Swingedouw, D., Séférian, R., Labetoulle, S., 2014.

- Reconstructing the subsurface ocean decadal variability using surface nudging in a
 perfect model framework. Climate Dynamics 44, 1–24.
- Sibert, J., Senina, I., Lehodey, P., Hampton, J., 2012. Shifting from marine reserves to maritime
 zoning for conservation of Pacific bigeye tuna (*Thunnus obesus*). Proceedings of the
 National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 109, 18221–18225.
- Siedlecki, S.A., Kaplan, I.C., Hermann, A.J., Nguyen, T.T., Bond, N.A., Newton, J.A., Williams,
 G.D., Peterson, W.T., Alin, S.R., Feely, R.A., 2016. Experiments with seasonal forecasts
 of ocean conditions for the Northern region of the California Current upwelling system.

2428 Scientific Reports 6, 27203, doi: 10.1038/srep27203.

- Sigmond, M., Fyfe, J.C., Flato, G.M., Kharin, V.V., Merryfield, W.J., 2013. Seasonal forecast
 skill of Arctic sea ice area in a dynamical forecast system. Geophysical Research Letters
 40, 529–534, doi: 10.1002/grl.50129.[stp]
- Skern-Mauritzen, M., Ottersen, G., Handegard, N.O., Huse, G., Dingsor, G.E., Stenseth, N.C.,
 Kjesbu, O.S., 2015. Ecosystem processes are rarely included in tactical fisheries
 management. Fish and Fisheries 17, 165-175.
- Smith, A.D.M., Fulton, E.A., Hobday, A.J., Smith, D.C., Shoulder, P. 2007. Scientific tools to
 support practical implementation of ecosystem based fisheries management. ICES
 Journal of Marine Science 64, 633-639.
- Smith, A.D.M., Brown, C.J., Bulman, C.M., Fulton, E.A., Johnson, P., Kaplan, I.C., LozanoMontes, H., Mackinson, S., Marzloff, M., Shannon, L.J., Shin, Y-J, Tam, J., 2011.
- 2440 Impacts of fishing low trophic level species on marine ecosystems. Science 333, 1147-2441 1150.
- Smith, D.M., Eade, R., Pohlmann, H., 2013. A comparison of full-field and anomaly
 initialization for seasonal to decadal climate prediction. Climate Dynamics 41, 33253338.
- 2445 Spillman C.M., 2011. Operational real-time seasonal forecasts for coral reef management.
- 2446Journal of Operational Oceanography 4, 13-22.
- Spillman, C.M., Alves, O., 2009. Dynamical seasonal prediction of summer sea surface
 temperatures in the Great Barrier Reef. Coral Reefs 28, 197-206.

- Spillman, C.M., Heron, S.F., Jury, M.R., Anthony, K.R.N., 2011. Climate change and carbon
 threats to coral reefs national meteorological and ocean services as sentinels. Bulletin of
 the American Metereological Society 92, 1581-1586.
- Spillman, C.M., Hobday, A.J., 2014. Dynamical seasonal ocean forecasts to aid salmon farm
 management in a climate hotspot. Climate Risk Management 1, 25-38.
- Spillman, C.M., Hartog, J.R., Hobday, A.J., Hudson, D., 2015. Predicting environmental drivers
 for prawn aquaculture production to aid improved farm management. Aquaculture 447:
 56–65.
- Stammer, D., Balmaseda, M., Heimbach, P., Köhl, A., Weaver, A., 2016. Ocean data
 assimilation in support of climate applications: Status and perspectives. Annual Reviews
 in Marine Science 8, 491-518.
- Stanski, H.R., Wilson, L.J., Burrows, W.R., 1989. Survey of common verification methods in
 meteorology. WMO World Weather Watch Technical Report No. 8, WMO/TD No. 358.
- Stock, C.A., Alexander, M.A., Bond, N.A., Brander, K.M., Cheung, W.L., Curchitser, E.N.,
 Delworth, T.L., Dunne, J.P., Griffies, S.M., Haltuch, M.A., Hare, J.A., Hollowed, A.B.,
 Lehodey, P., Levin, S.A., Link, J.S., Rose, K.A., Rykaczewski, R.R., Sarmiento, J.L.,
 Stouffer, R.J., Schwing, F.B., Vecchi, G.A., 2011. On the use of IPCC-class models to
 assess the impact of climate on Living Marine Resources. Progress in Oceanography 88,
- 2467 1-27.
- Stock, C. A., Pegion, K., Vecchi, G.A., Alexander, M.A., Tommasi, D., Bond, N.A., Fratantoni,
 P.S., Gudgel, R.G., Kristiansen, T., O'Brien, T.D., Xue, Y., Yang, X., 2015. Seasonal sea
 surface temperature anomaly prediction for coastal ecosystems. Progress in
 Oceanography 137, 219-236.
- Stockdale, T.N., Anderson, D.L.T., Balmaseda, M.A., Doblas-Reyes, F., Ferranti, L., Mogensen,
 K., Palmer, T.N., Molteni, F., Vitart, F., 2011. ECMWF seasonal forecast system 3 and
 its prediction of sea surface temperature. Climate Dynamics 37, 455–471.
- Stroeve, J.C., Kattsov, V., Barrett, A., Serreze, M., Pavlova, T., Holland, M., Meier, W.N., 2012.
 Trends in Arctic sea ice extent from CMIP5, CMIP3 and observations. Geophysical
- 2477 Research Letters 39, L16502, doi:10.1029/2012GL052676.

2478Stroeve, J., Hamilton, L.C., Bitz, C.M., Blanchard-Wrigglesworth, E., 2014. Predicting2479September sea ice: Ensemble skill of the SEARCH Sea Ice Outlook 2008-2013.

2480 Geophysical Research Letters 41, 2411-2418.

- Stumpf, R.P., Culver, M.A., 2003. Forecasting harmful algal blooms in the Gulf of Mexico.
 NOAA Technical Memorandum NOS NCCOS 1, 51-54.
- Svensson, C., 2016. Seasonal river flow forecasts for the United Kingdom using persistence and
 historical analogues. Hydrological Sciences Journal 61, 19-35.
- Svensson, C., Brookshaw, A., Scaife, A.A., Bell, V.A., Mackay, J.D., Jackson, C.R., Hannaford,
 J., Davies, H.N., Arribas, A., Stanley, S., 2015. Long-range forecasts of UK winter
 hydrology. Environmental Research Letters 10, 064006.
- Szuwalski, C.S., Punt, A.E. 2013. Fisheries management for regime-based ecosystems: a
 management strategy evaluation for the snow crab fishery in the eastern Bering Sea.
 ICES Journal of Marine Science 70, 955-967.
- Takle, E.S., Anderson, C.J., Andresen, J., Angel, J., Elmore, R.W., Graming, B.M., Guinan, P.,
 Hilberg, S., Kluck, D., Massey, R., Niyogi, D., Schneider, J.M., Shulski, M.D., Todey,
 D., Widhalm, M., 2014. Climate Forecasts for Corn Producer Decision Making. Earth
 Interactions 18, 1-8.
- Thomas, C.R., Heron, S.F., 2011. South-East Asia Coral Bleaching Rapid Response: Final
 Report. Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organization. 20 pp.
- Thorson, J.T., Pinsky, M.L., Ward, E.J. 2016. Model-based inference for estimating shifts in
 species distribution, area occupied and centre of gravity. Methods in Ecology and
 Evolution 7, 990-1002.
- Tranchant, B., Reffray, G., Greiner, E., Nugroho, D., Koch-Lattouy, A., Gaspar, P., 2016.
 Evaluation of an operational ocean model configuration at 1/12° spatial resolution for the
 Indonesian seas (NEMO2.3/INDO12) Part 1: Ocean physics. Geoscientific Model
 Development 9, 1037-1064.
- Travers, M., Shin, Y.J., Jennings, S., Cury, P., 2007. Towards end-to-end models for
 investigating the effects of climate and fishing in marine ecosystems. Progress in
 Oceanography 75, 751–770.
- 82

- Tribbia, J., Troccoli, A. 2007. Getting the coupled model ready at the starting blocks. In A.
 Troccoli, M. Harrison, D. L. T. Anderson, S. J. Mason (Eds.), *Seasonal Climate:*
- 2509 *Forecasting and Managing Risk* (93-128). Dordrecht: Springer Academic Publishers.
- Tommasi, D., Stock, C., Pegion, K., Vecchi, G.A., Methot, R.D., Alexander, M., Checkley, D.,
 Accepted. Improved management of small pelagic fisheries through seasonal climate
- prediction. Ecological Applications, doi: 10.1002/eap.1458.
- Tommasi, D., Nye, J., Stock, C., Hare, J.A., Alexander, M., Drew, K., 2015. Effect of
 environmental conditions on juvenile recruitment of alewife (*Alosa pseudoharengus*) and
 blueback herring (*Alosa aestivalis*) in freshwater: a coastwide perspective. Canadian
 Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences 72, 1037-1047.
- van den Dool, H. 2007. *Empirical Methods in Short-term Climate Prediction*. Oxford, UK:
 Oxford University Press.
- van Hooidonk, R., Maynard, J.A., Liu, Y.Y., Lee, S.K., 2015. Downscaled projections of
 Caribbean coral bleaching that can inform conservation planning. Global Change Biology
 2521 21, 3389-3401.
- van Keeken, O. A., van Hoppe, M., Grift, R.E., Rijnsdorp, A.D., 2007. Changes in the spatial
 distribution of North Sea plaice (*Pleuronectes platessa*) and implications for fisheries
 management. Journal of Sea Research 57, 187-197.
- van Putten, E.I., Farmery, A., Green, B.S., Hobday, A.J., Lim-Camacho, L., Norman-López, A.,
 Parker, R. 2015. The environmental impact of two Australian rock lobster fishery supply
 chains under a changing climate. Journal of Industrial Ecology, doi: 10.1111/jiec.12382.
- van Vuuren, D.P., Edmonds, J., Kainuma, M., Riahi, K., Thomson, A., Hibbard, K., Hurtt, G.C.,
 Kram, T., Krey, V., Lamarque, J-F., Matsui, T., Meinshausen, M., Nakicenovic, N.,
 Smith, S.J., Rose, S.K., 2011. Representative concentration pathways: An overview.
- 2530 Simul, S.J., Rose, S.K., 2011. Representative concentration pathways. An of 2531 Climatic Change 109, 5-31.
- Vanhatalo, J., Hobday, A.J., Little, L.R., Spillman, C.M., 2016. Downscaling and extrapolating
 dynamic seasonal marine forecasts for coastal ocean users. Ocean Modelling 100, 20-30.
- 2534 Vaughan, C., Dessai, S., 2014. Climate services for society: origins, institutional arrangements,
- and design elements for an evaluation framework. WIREs Climate Change 5, 587-603,
 doi: 10.1002/wcc.290

- Vecchi, G.A., Zhao, M., Wang, H., Villarini, G., Rosati, A., Kumar, A., Held, I.M., Gudgel, R.,
 2011. Statistical-Dynamical Predictions of Seasonal North Atlantic Hurricane Activity.
 Monthly Weather Review 139, 1070-1082.
- 2540 Vecchi, G.A., Delworth, T., Gudgel, R., Kapnick, S., Rosati, A., Wittenberg, A.T., Zeng, F.,
- 2541 Anderson, W., Balaji, V., Dixon, K., Jia, L., Kim, H.-S., Krishnamurthy, L., Msadek, R.,
- 2542 Stern, W.F., Underwood, S.D., Villarini, G., Yang, X., Zhang, S., 2014. On the Seasonal
- 2543 Forecasting to Regional Tropical Cyclone Activity. Journal of Climate 27, 7994-8016.
- 2544 Vecchi, G.A., Villarini, G., 2014. Next season's hurricanes. Science 343, 618-619.
- Vert-pre, K.A., Amoroso, R.O., Jensen, O.P., Hilborn, R., 2013. Frequency and intensity of
 productivity regime shifts in marine fish stocks. Proceedings of the National Academy of
 Sciences of the United States 110, 1779-1784.
- Vidard, A., Anderson, D.L., Balmaseda, M., 2007. Impact of ocean observation systems on
 ocean analysis and seasonal forecasts. Monthly Weather Review 135, 409-429.
- Vitart, F., 2006. Seasonal forecasting of tropical storm frequency using a multi-model
 ensemble. Quarterly Journal of the Royal Meteorological Society 132, 647–666.
- Vitart, F., Stockdale, T.N., 2001. Seasonal forecasting of tropical storms using coupled GCM
 integrations. Monthly Weather Review 129, 2521-2527.
- von Storch, H., Zwiers, F.W. 2001. *Statistical Analysis in Climate Research*. Cambridge, UK:
 Cambridge University Press.
- Wang, E., Zhang, Y., Luo, J., Chiew, F.H.S., Wang, Q.J., 2011. Monthly and seasonal
 streamflow forecasts using rainfall-runoff modeling and historical weather data. Water
 Resources Research 47, W05516, doi: 10.1029/2010WR009922.
- Wang, H., Schemm, J.K.E., Kumar, A., Wang, W., Long, L., Chelliah, M., Bell, G.D., Peng, P.,
 2009. A statistical forecast model for Atlantic seasonal hurricane activity based on the
 NCEP dynamical seasonal forecast. Journal of Climate 22, 4481-4500.
- 2562 Wang, W., Chen, M., Kumar, A., 2013. Seasonal prediction of Arctic sea ice extent from a
- 2563 coupled dynamical forecast system, Monthly Weather Review 141, 1375–1394.
- Warner, T.T., 2011. *Numerical Weather and Climate Prediction*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge
 University Press.

- Wayte, S., 2013. Management implications of including a climate-induced recruitment shift in
 the stock assessment for jackass morwong (*Nemadactylus macropterus*) in south-eastern
 Australia. Fisheries Research 142, 47–55.
- 2569 Wilderbuer, T., Stockhausen, W., Bond, N., 2013. Updated analysis of flatfish recruitment
- response to climate variability and ocean conditions in the Eastern Bering Sea. Deep SeaResearch II 94, 157-164.
- Wilks, D.S. 2011. *Statistical Methods in Atmospheric Science*. Burlington, MA, USA: Elsevier
 Academic Press.
- Williams, J.W., Jackson, S.T., 2007. Novel climates, no-analog communities, and ecological
 surprises. Frontiers in Ecology and the Environment 5, 475–482.
- Wittenberg, A., Rosati, A., Delworth, T.L., Vecchi, G.A., Zeng, F., 2014. ENSO modulation: Is
 it decadally predictable? Journal of Climate 27, 2667-2681.
- Worm, B., Hilborn, R., Baum, J.K., Branch, T.A., Collie, J.S., Costello, C., Fogarty, M.J.,
 Fulton, E.A., Hutchings, J.A., Jennings, S., Jensen, O.P., Lotze, H.K., Mace, P.M.,
- McClanahan, T.R., Minto, C., Palumbi, S.R., Parma, A.M., Ricard, D., Rosenberg, A.A.,
 Watson, R., Zeller, D., 2009. Rebuilding global fisheries. Science 325, 578-585.
- 2582 Xue, Y. Wen, C., Kumar, A., Balmaseda, M., Fujii, Y., Alves, O., Martin, M., Yang, X.,
- Vernieres, G., Desportes, C., Lee, T., Ascione, I., Gudgel, R., Ishikawa, I., 2016. In
 review. A Real-time Ocean Reanalyses Intercomparison Project in the context of tropical
 Pacific observing system and ENSO monitoring. Climate Dynamics.
- Xue, Y., Leetmaa, A., Ji, M., 2000. ENSO prediction with Markov models: The impact of sealevel. Journal of Climate 13, 849-871.
- Yang, X., Rosati, A., Zhang, S., Delworth, T.L., Gudgel, R.G., Zhang, R., Vecchi, G., Anderson,
 W., Chang, Y.S., DelSole, T., Dixon, K., Msadek, R., Stern, W.F., Wittenberg, AT.,
- Zeng, F.R., 2013. A predictable AMO-like pattern in the GFDL fully coupled ensemble
 initialization and decadal forecasting system. Journal of Climate 26, 650-661.
- Yang, X., Vecchi, G.A., Gudgel, R.G., Delworth, T.L., Zhang, S., Rosati, A., Jia, L., Stern, W.F.,
 Wittenberg, AT., Kapnick, S., Msadek, R., Underwood, S.D., Zeng, F., Anderson, W.,
- 2594 2015. Seasonal predictability of extratropical storm tracks in GFDL's high-resolution
- climate prediction model. Journal of Climate 28, 3592-3611.

- Ye, H., Beamish, R.J., Glaser, S.M., Grant, S.C.H., Hsieh, C-H., Richards, L.J., Schnute, J.T.,
 Sugihara, G., 2015. Equation-free mechanistic ecosystem forecasting using empirical
 dynamic modeling. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United
 States of America 112, E1569-E1576.
- Yeager, S., Karspeck, A., Danabasoglu, G., Tribbia, J., Teng, H., 2012. A decadal prediction
 case study: late twentieth-century North Atlantic Ocean heat content. Journal of Climate
 2602 25, 5173-5189, doi: 10.1175/JCLI-D-11-00595.1.
- Yuan, X., Wood, E.F., Ma, Z., 2015. A review on climate-model-based seasonal hydrological
 forecasting: physical understanding and system development. WIREs Water 2, 523-536.
- Zador, S., Holsman, K.K., Aydin, K.A., Gaichas, S., In press. Ecosystem considerations in
 Alaska: the value of qualitative assessments. ICES Journal of Marine Science, doi:
 10.1093/icesjms/fsw144.
- Zebiak, S.E., Orlove, B., Muñoz, A.G., Vaughan, C., Hansen, J., Troy, T., Thomson, M.C.,
 Lustig, A., Garvin, S., 2015. Investigating El Nino-Southern Oscillation and society
 relationships. WIREs Climate Change 6, 17–34, doi: 10.1002/wcc.294
- Zhang, S., Harrison, M.J., Rosati, A., Witternberg, A.T., 2007. System design and evaluation of
 coupled ensemble data assimilation for global oceanic climate studies. Monthly Weather
 Review 135, 3541-3564.
- Zhang, S., Han, G., Xue, Y., Ruiz, J.J., 2015. Data Assimilation in Numerical Weather and
 Climate Models. Advances in Meteorology 2015, 626893, doi: 10.1155/2015/626893.
- 2616 Zhang, W., Vecchi, G.A., Murakami, H., Delworth, T., Wittenberg, A.T., Rosati, A.,
- 2617 Underwood, S., Anderson, W., Harris, L., Gudgel, R., Lin, S.J., Villarini, G., Chen, J.H.,
 2618 2016. Improved simulation of tropical cyclone response to ENSO in the Western North
 2619 Pacific in the high-resolution GFDL HiFLOR coupled climate model. Journal of Climate
- 2620 29, 1391-1415.
- Zhao, M., Held, I.M., and Vecchi, G.A., 2010: Retrospective forecasts of the hurricane
 season using a global atmospheric model assuming persistence of SST anomalies.
 Monthly Weather Review 138, 3858–3868.
- Zinyengere, N., Mhizha, T., Mashonjowa, E., Chipindu, B., Geerts, S., Raes, D., 2011. Using
 seasonal climate forecasts to improve maize production decision support in Zimbabwe.
 Agricultural and Forest Meteorology 151, 1792-1799.

2628 Figure Captions

Figure 1. Overview of simulation design for seasonal and decadal predictions and climate projections. GHG refers to greenhouse gases. Note that the year for shifting from pre-industrial to historical forcing in climate projections, here set to 1860, can differ between climate models. "Forcings" in the climate change context refer to specified solar insolation and concentrations of radiatively active atmospheric constituents.

- Figure 2. Temperature anomalies at 55-m depth from six different ocean reanalysis products for April 2015 relative to each-product 1981-2010 climatology. The bottom left panel shows the ensemble mean, and the bottom right the ratio of signal (ensemble mean) to noise (ensemble spread).
- 2639

2640 Figure 3. Left panel: One-month lead probabilistic forecast of SST for summer (June, July, and

August, JJA) initialized in May 2016 from the North American Multi-Model Ensemble

2642 (NMME). This forecast was produced using all the ensemble members provided by each model

- 2643 participating in the NMME. It therefore reflects both initial condition and model uncertainty. 2644 Warm colors (yellow-orange) indicate areas with a significant probability of experiencing upper-2645 tercile temperatures, with the probability of such terciles ranging from 40-100% depending on the degree of shading. Analogous interpretations exist for the anomalously cool (blue colors) or 2646 2647 near climatological (gray colors) conditions. Right panel: Ranked probability skill score for the 2648 forecast presented in the left panel. The color bar represents the relative improvement of the 2649 probability forecast (left panel) over climatology, with 0 indicating no skill over climatology. 2650 Note the higher predictive skill in the North Atlantic, North Pacific and at the equator.
- 2650

2652 Figure 4. May-June surface and bottom temperature/salinity biases (model minus observations) 2653 for the US Northeast Continental Shelf. Observations are based on May-June climatologies of NOAA ship-based in situ measurements from 1977 to 2009. Model output is from each climate 2654 model's 1990 control simulation (40-year mean). The average global ocean (atmosphere) 2655 2656 resolutions for CM2.1, CM2.5FLOR, CM2.5, and CM2.6 are 100-km (200-km), 100-km (50-2657 km), 25-km (50-km), and 10-km (50-km), respectively. Note that the operational GFDL seasonal 2658 climate prediction system uses CM2.5FLOR. Refer to Saba et al. 2016 for further details on the 2659 models and experiments. 2660

- Figure 5. Temporal and spatial scales of fisheries decisions (circles) and atmospheric weather phenomena (clouds). Atmospheric weather processes adapted from Troccoli et al. (2007), Fig. 2.1. Note that "resilience and sustainability" and "rebuilding plans and protected areas" decisions are made across a range of spatial scales. Here they are associated with large spatial scales to reflect the significant impact of large scale climate processes, such as global climate change, on their outcome.
- 2667

2668 Figure 6. Anomaly correlation coefficients (ACCs) as a function of forecast initialization month

- 2669 (x-axis) and lead-time (y-axis) in the National Atmospheric and Oceanic Administration
- 2670 (NOAA) Geophysical Fluid Dynamics Laboratory (GFDL) CM2.5 FLOR and NOAA National
- 2671 Centers for Environmental Prediction CFSv2 global climate prediction systems for the Gulf of

2672 Alaska (GoA) large marine ecosystem (Stock et al. 2015). Note how late winter-early spring SST

- anomaly prediction skill exceeds persistence at long lead-times (4-12 months). Grey dots
- 2674 indicate ACCs significantly above 0 at a 5% level; white upward triangles indicate ACCs
- significantly above persistence at a 10% level with ACC > 0.5; white downward triangles
- indicate ACCs significantly above persistence at a 10% level with ACC < 0.5.
- 2677

2678 Figure 7 Left column: idealized environmental forcing historical time series, and short term 2679 forecast (±1 standard deviation) based on seasonal climate forecast (blue), forecast based on 2680 assumption that future conditions will be within the historical variability (red), and truth (black); 2681 central columns: probability density function of environmental forcing and of environmentallydependent productivity parameters; right column: productivity historical time series and its one-2682 year forecast based on a dynamic environmental driver (blue) or on average environmental 2683 2684 conditions (red). Arrows represent the different steps of an environmentally-explicit stock 2685 assessment framework.

2686

Figure 8. Regional probabilistic forecast skill for maximum air temperature (upper tercile), minimum air temperature (lower tercile), and rainfall (upper tercile) based on tercile probabilities for each lead-time. The skill score corresponds to the ratio of the number of correct forecasts to the total number of forecasts for the period of 1981-2010 (Adapted from Spillman et al., 2015).

Figure 9. Left: Maps showing the average SST for the GAB as forecast by POAMA on 17 Dec 2693 2015 for the next fortnight and the next two calendar months. The mean SST over the whole area 2694 shown is given in the top left corner of each map. The black line represents the 200-m contour. 2695 Right: Corresponding areas of preferred SBT habitat, where values > 1 indicate more preferred 2696 habitat and values < 1 indicate less preferred habitat.

2698 Figure 10. Example of the GMRI lobster forecast as delivered to the fishing industry via Twitter 2699 on March 24, 2016. The first panel shows the spring temperature from the NERACOOS coastal ocean buoys in spring 2016 (red line) used to generate the forecast. Temperatures in 2016 have 2700 2701 been higher than the 2000-2014 average. The second panel shows that SST has been 2702 anomalously warm throughout the Maine coastal region for March 2016. The bottom panel is the 2703 actual forecast, predicting a 68% chance that the season will start three weeks earlier than 2704 normal, a 31% chance that it will start two weeks early, and only a 1% chance that it will begin 2705 one week early. The normal high-landings period for Maine lobster is considered to start 2706 between July 3 and 10.

2707

2708 Figure 11. Comparison of (a) Coral Reef Watch 4-Month Bleaching Outlook with (b) 4-month

- 2709 composite of maximum Bleaching Alert Area from real-time satellite data for the same period,
- August-November 2015. The levels refer to potential bleaching intensity, with possible
- 2711 bleaching starting at a warning thermal stress level, bleaching likely at an Alert Level 1 and
- 2712 bleaching mortality likely at an Alert Level 2. Note successful prediction of severe bleaching in
- 2713 Kiribati and Hawaii.
- Figure 12. Probability of sardine presence, for July (left) and August (right) of 2015. These two
- to three month forecasts are the average of a three-member ensemble, initialized as April 15th,
- 2716 May 1, and May 15th. Due to relatively warm sea surface temperature, the forecasts predict
- 2717 habitat suitable for sardine throughout the region. The exception is low salinity water for which

- the model would expect sardine to be found at more intermediate rather than warm temperatures.
- 2719 This leads to low probability of presence in the less saline Columbia River plume. Note that
- recent declines in sardine stock size (which is not included in the model) may be resulting inunoccupied, but suitable, habitat in the northern region.
- 2722

Figure 13. Example output from the global (top) and regional (bottom) SEAPODYM modelconfigurations developed though the INDESO project.

2725

Figure 14. Habitat maps indicating zones of SBT distribution (see text for explanation of zones), obtained using POAMA seasonal forecasts of ocean temperature. The upper left plot shows the historical daily climatology of the zones (yellow ribbon), the current year's observed zone locations to date (red ribbon) and the latest monthly forecasts of zone location (red stars). The arrows along the other panels indicate whether the zones are moving north or south relative to the POAMA nowcast.

2732

Figure 15. Steps required for successful integration of climate predictions into LMR decision frameworks. (Adapted from Hobday et al., 2016).

27352736 Appendix

Table A1. List of six operational ocean reanalysis products from 1979-present used in the Real time Ocean Reanalysis Intercomparison Project. See

2739 http://www.cpc.ncep.noaa.gov/products/GODAS/multiora_body.html for a link to download

some of these reanalysis products. The data assimilation column lists the observation types used

2741 for their estimation (T/S for temperature and salinity; SLA: altimeter-derived sea level

anomalies; SST: sea surface temperature, SIC: sea-ice concentration), as well as assimilation

2743 techniques used for reanalysis: Ensemble Optimal Interpolation (EnOI), Ensemble Kalman Filter

2744 (EnKF), Variational methods (3DVar). The atmospheric surface forcing is usually provided by

atmospheric reanalyses, using either direct daily fluxes, or different bulk formulations. There are

- also systems that use fluxes from coupled data assimilation systems (Coupled DA).
- 2747

Product	Forcing	Ocean Model	Data Assim. Method	Ocean Observations	Analysis Period
NCEP GODAS (NGODAS)	NCEP-R2	1°x1/3° MOM3	3DVAR	T/SST	1979-present
GFDL (ECDA)	Coupled DA	1°x1/3° MOM4	EnKF	T/S/SST	1979-present
BOM (PEODAS)	ERA40 to 2002; NCEP-R2 thereafter	1°x2° MOM2	EnKF	T/S/SST	1970-present
ECMWF (ORAS4)	ERA40 to 1988; ERAi thereafter	1°x1/3° NEMO3	3DVAR	SLA/T/S/SST/ SIC	1979-present
JMA (MOVE-G2)	JRA55 corr + CORE Bulk	1°x0.5° MRI.CO	3DVAR	SLA/T/S/SST/ SIC	1979-present

		M3			
NASA (MERRA Ocean)	MERRA + Bulk	0.5°x1/4° MOM4	EnOI	SLA/T/S/SST/ SIC	1979-present

2750

Table A2. Living marine resources for which there is a linkage between their dynamics and

- environmental variability. These includes those determined by Myers 1998 as robust to re-
- evaluation, marked by an *, and those described by Skern-Mauritzen et al. 2015 as making use of
- 2754 environmental information in their management, marked by a †. For all other examples, the
- 2755 reference is provided.
- 2756

Species	Region	Environmental Driver	Reference
Cod*†	Barents Sea	Temperature	
Cod*	Eastern Baltic	Salinity	
Cod*	Labrador	Salinity	
Cod*	NW Atlantic	Calanus spp.	
	XX7' 1 1	abundance	
Eurasian Perch*	Baltic region	Temperature	
Pike Perch*	Netherlands and Baltic region	Temperature	
Herring*	Southern British Columbia	Temperature	
Herring*	Northern Newfoundland	Temperature	
Sardine*†	California	Temperature	
Sardine [†]	Mediterranean	Chlorophyll a	
Anchovy†	Mediterranean	Chlorophyll a	
Sea Bass*	South Britain	Temperature	
Smallmouth bass*	Lake Opeongo	Temperature	
Smallmouth bass*	North Lake Huron	Temperature	
White Hake†	Southeastern Atlantic (West Africa)	NAO	
Mutton Snapper†	South Atlantic/Gulf of Mexico	Temperature and salinity	
Yellowtail flounder*	Southern New England	Temperature	
Plaice*	Kattegat	Wind	
Skipjack tuna†	Eastern Pacific	Temperature, ocean	
		currents, primary	
		production	
Swordfish [†]	Southeastern Pacific	Ocean climate,	
		hydrography, primary	
		production	

Striped Marlin†	Northeastern Pacific	Ocean climate, hydrography, primary production	
Pacific hake	California Current	Ocean currents	Agostini et al. 2006
Sablefish	California Current	Ekman transport, sea level	Schirripa and Colbert 2006
Pink salmon†	North Pacific	Temperature and prey availability	
Coho and Chinook Salmon	Columbia River	PDO and prey availability	Peterson and Schwing 2003, Bi et al. 2011, Peterson and Burke 2013, Burke et al. 2013)
Chinook Salmon	Snake River	Air temperature, river flow, upwelling, PDO	Zabel et al. 2013
Lobster*	Gulf of Maine	Temperature	
Northern shrimp*	Gulf of Maine	Temperature	
Banana prawn*	Gulf of Carpentaria	Salinity	



Anomalous Temperature (C) at z=55m: APR 2015



50E 100E 150E 160W 110W 60W 10W

ECMWF



50E 100E 150E 160W 110W 60W 10W



50E 100E 150E 160W 110W 60W 10W



60N 40N E0 20S 40S 60S

🎽 50E 100E 150E 160W 110W 60W 10W



50E 100E 150E 160W 110W 60W 10W



່ 50E 100E 150E 160W 110W 60W 10W





RPSS for the Probabilistic SST Forecast for JJA, lead 1





Space

CM2.5 FLOR, GoA



Initializaton Month











Andrew Pershing @Sci_Officer · Mar 24

Updated **#lobster** forecast from **@GMRI**. Increasing chance of the season starting 3+ weeks early.



March 24 Forecast for the Start of the Summer Lobster Season



2015 Jun 30 NOAA Coral Reef Watch 60% Probability Coral Bleaching Thermal Stress for Jul-Oct 2015 Experimental, v3.0, CFSv2-based, 28-member Ensemble Forecast



NOAA CRW 5-km Night-Only BAA Maximum 2015/07/06-2015/10/25





Operational Global Model (¼° x week) predicting:



- Zooplankton
- Micronekton
- Skipjack
- Yellowfin
- Bigeye









Forecast in 3 months (16-Oct-2014 12:00:00)





