

Tolerance of an acute warming challenge declines with body mass in Nile tilapia: evidence of a link to capacity for oxygen uptake

F.R. Blasco, E.W. Taylor, C.A.C. Leite, D.A. Monteiro, F.T. Rantin, David J Mckenzie

► To cite this version:

F.R. Blasco, E.W. Taylor, C.A.C. Leite, D.A. Monteiro, F.T. Rantin, et al.. Tolerance of an acute warming challenge declines with body mass in Nile tilapia: evidence of a link to capacity for oxygen uptake. Journal of Experimental Biology, 2022, 225 (16), pp.jeb244287. 10.1242/jeb.244287 . hal-03097440v2

HAL Id: hal-03097440 https://hal.science/hal-03097440v2

Submitted on 22 Nov 2022

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

1 Tolerance of an acute warming challenge declines with body mass in Nile tilapia:

2 evidence of a link to capacity for oxygen uptake

3

F.R. Blasco^{1,2}, E.W. Taylor^{1,3}, C.A.C. Leite¹, D.A. Monteiro¹, F.T. Rantin¹ and D.J. McKenzie^{1,4}

- 6 ¹ Department of Physiological Sciences, Federal University of São Carlos, 13565-905, São Carlos
- 7 (SP), Brazil
- 8² Joint Graduate Program in Physiological Sciences, Federal University of São Carlos UFSCar/São
- 9 Paulo State University, UNESP Campus Araraquara, 14801-903, Araraquara SP, Brazil.
- 10⁻³ School of Biosciences, University of Birmingham, B15 2TT, UK.
- ⁴MARBEC, Université Montpellier, CNRS, Ifremer, IRD, 34095 Montpellier, France.

13 Abstract

14 It has been proposed that larger individuals within fish species may be more sensitive to global warming, due to limitations in their capacity to provide oxygen for aerobic metabolic activities. 15 This could affect size distributions of populations in a warmer world but evidence is lacking. In Nile 16 tilapia Oreochromis niloticus (n = 18, mass range 21 - 313g), capacity to provide oxygen for aerobic 17 activities (aerobic scope) was independent of mass at an acclimation temperature of 26 °C. Toler-18 ance of acute warming, however, declined significantly with mass when evaluated as the critical 19 temperature for fatigue from aerobic swimming (CTS_{max}). The CTS_{max} protocol challenges a fish to 20 meet the oxygen demands of constant aerobic exercise while their demands for basal metabolism 21 22 are accelerated by incremental warming, culminating in fatigue. CTS_{max} elicited pronounced increases in oxygen uptake in the tilapia but the maximum rates achieved prior to fatigue declined 23 very significantly with mass. Mass-related variation in CTS_{max} and maximum oxygen uptake rates 24 were positively correlated, which may indicate a causal relationship. When fish populations are 25 faced with acute thermal stress, larger individuals may become constrained in their ability to per-26 form aerobic activities at lower temperatures than smaller conspecifics. This could affect survival 27 and fitness of larger fish in a future world with more frequent and extreme heatwaves, with con-28 29 sequences for population productivity.

30 Introduction

31 Global change is having profound effects on aquatic ecosystems worldwide, with poorly known consequences for fish populations. Global warming is causing a rise in average seasonal tempera-32 tures and, more importantly, higher frequency and intensity of acute summer heatwaves (Smale 33 et al., 2019; Stillman, 2019). This has stimulated a wave of research into the mechanisms that un-34 derly tolerance of warming in fishes, especially into the Fry paradigm and its mechanistic elabora-35 tion, the Oxygen and Capacity Limited Thermal Tolerance hypothesis (here abbreviated for con-36 venience as Fry-OCLTT, reviewed in Lefevre et al., 2021). The Fry-OCLTT posits that upper thermal 37 tolerance in fishes is defined by physiological capacity to provide oxygen for the demands of aero-38 39 bic metabolism as these are increased by warming, a capacity that ultimately reaches a physiological ceiling, leading to functional collapse (Eliason et al., 2011; Fry, 1971; Pörtner, 2010; Pörtner 40 and Farrell, 2008; Schulte, 2015). Although the Fry-OCLTT paradigm seems intuitive, empirical evi-41 dence for it is mixed and therefore its universality remains open to question (Farrell, 2016; Jutfelt 42 et al., 2018; Lefevre, 2016; Lefevre et al., 2021; Pörtner, 2021). 43

A major biological phenomenon that has been correlated with ongoing global warming is a 44 progressive reduction in the adult size of many fish species (Audzijonyte et al., 2020; Baudron et 45 al., 2014; Daufresne et al., 2009). This may be a consequence of the temperature-size rule (TSR; 46 Atkinson, 1994), which derives from laboratory and field observations that adult body size declines 47 when aquatic ectotherms are grown at warmer temperatures (Audzijonyte et al., 2020; Hume, 48 49 2019; Loisel et al., 2019). The mechanisms underlying the TSR remain to be understood (Verberk et al., 2021; Wootton et al., 2022) but it has been suggested that, at warmer temperatures, larger 50 individuals may be prone to limitations in their capacity for oxygen uptake, so that species may 51 have evolved to modify their growth trajectories and avoid constraints on aerobic activities in 52 adults (Atkinson et al., 2006; Hoefnagel and Verberk, 2015; Leiva et al., 2019; Rubalcaba et al., 53 2020; Verberk et al., 2021). Modelling across species provides some support for potential oxygen 54 supply limitation of larger fishes at warm temperatures (Rubalcaba et al., 2020) but studies of how 55 body size and temperature interact to affect oxygen supply capacity within species are very rare 56 (Tirsgaard et al., 2015). 57

If we accept that oxygen supply limitation could define upper thermal tolerance in fishes and that larger individuals might be more prone to suffer from oxygen limitation at warm temperatures, a prediction would be that tolerance will decline with increasing body size. If true, this would be important in projecting how global warming will affect fish populations. Leiva et al. 62 (2019) provided evidence that, in aquatic ectotherms generally, upper thermal tolerance declines with body and cell size of species. Within fish species, studies using the critical thermal maximum 63 (CT_{max}) protocol have found that upper thermal tolerance drops with increasing body size in some 64 species, although not in all (reviewed in McKenzie et al., 2020). The CT_{max} protocol is the standard 65 method to evaluate acute thermal tolerance in fishes and ectotherms in general; animals are 66 warmed incrementally until loss of equilibrium (LOE), the tolerance endpoint (Beitinger and 67 Lutterschmidt, 2011). Although the CT_{max} is easy to perform and is a repeatable trait within fish 68 69 individuals and populations (Claireaux et al., 2013; McKenzie et al., 2020; Morgan et al., 2018), it has the weakness that the mechanisms for LOE are not understood. They presumably reflect acute 70 loss of function of critical organs such as the heart and central nervous system, but may differ 71 among species and with warming rate (Ekstrom et al., 2018; Jutfelt et al., 2019; Lefevre et al., 72 73 2021; McKenzie et al., 2020; Morgenroth et al., 2021; Rezende and Bozinovic, 2019; Rezende et al., 2011). In particular, there is evidence that LOE may not always be attributable to problems 74 75 with systemic oxygen supply, which has been a major source of contention in the debate surrounding the universality of the Fry-OCLTT paradigm (Blasco et al., 2020; Brijs et al., 2015; Ekström 76 et al., 2016; Ern et al., 2016; Lefevre et al., 2021; Wang et al., 2014). Some studies have considered 77 whether size-dependent warming tolerance might be linked to capacity for oxygen uptake within 78 79 species (Christensen et al., 2020; Messmer et al., 2017) but this remains to be tested explicitly. Blasco et al. (2020) proposed a measure of upper thermal tolerance whereby fish are 80 warmed incrementally while they perform intense but steady aerobic exercise in a swimming res-81 pirometer (Steinhausen et al., 2008), with fatigue as the tolerance endpoint. In two tropical fresh-82 water species, warming caused a progressive and profound increase in oxygen uptake up to a 83 maximum rate, at which both species transitioned from steady aerobic swimming to an unsustain-84 able anaerobic swimming gait, which rapidly led to fatigue. Fatigue in both species occurred at 85 temperatures significantly lower than their CT_{max} based on LOE (Blasco et al., 2020). The protocol 86 evaluates capacity for oxygen uptake because it challenges a fish to meet the oxygen demands of 87 a constant metabolic load, aerobic exercise, plus an incremental metabolic load, progressive 88 warming; fatigue presumably occurs when a fish can no longer meet these combined demands 89 (Blasco et al., 2020; Steinhausen et al., 2008). 90

91 We used this swimming protocol (called CT_{swim} in Blasco et al. 2020 but see later) to inves-92 tigate whether tolerance of acute warming declined with increasing body mass in Nile tilapia 93 *Oreochromis niloticus*, and whether this could be related to a reduced capacity for oxygen uptake

94 with increasing mass. The Nile tilapia is a relatively eurythermal tropical freshwater teleost (natural thermal range 14-33°C) that provides important fisheries in tropical and sub-tropical countries 95 across the globe (De Silva et al., 2004; Schofield et al., 2011). We studied a group of fish that 96 ranged over one order of magnitude in body mass; we first measured key traits of respiratory me-97 tabolism and performance at acclimation temperature (26°C) by swimming respirometry, in order 98 better to interpret any effects of mass on thermal tolerance. We then investigated effects of mass 99 on thermal tolerance using the CT_{max} and the critical thermal maximum for aerobic swimming 100 (CTS_{max}, previously called CT_{swim}) protocols. We correlated variation in CTS_{max} with variation in 101 maximum rates of oxygen uptake at fatigue, as evidence of a causal relationship. 102

103 Material and Methods

104 Ethical approval

Experiments were performed according to Brazilian National Council for Control of Animal
Experimentation (CONCEA) regulations, the protocol was approved by the Ethics Committee on
Animal Use of the Federal University of São Carlos (CEUA/UFSCAR), protocol number CEUA
3927151016.

109 Animals

110 Animals came from populations of Nile tilapia of different sizes and age classes, obtained from the 111 same supplier and reared in recirculating biofiltered water at 25±1°C in multiple outdoor tanks 112 (vol. 1000 L) at the Department of Physiological Sciences, UFSCar, São Carlos (SP), Brazil. 113 Individuals (n = 18, mass range 20.6 g to 313.0 g) were selected in three sequential groups of six relatively size-matched individuals, who each underwent the tagging and experimenting protocol 114 shown in Figure 1. That is, they were initially tagged for identification (PIT under benzocaine 115 anaesthesia) then recovered for at least 96 h in an indoor tank (vol. 100 L) in the same biofiltered 116 117 water system and with routine feeding. Animals were fasted 24 h prior to experimentation, and 118 weighed prior to overnight recovery in each experimental setting. They did not change in mass 119 between the sequential tests of performance and tolerance (see below). 120 Metabolic and performance phenotype at acclimation temperature 121 Following tagging, each individual's metabolic and performance phenotype was measured at 122 acclimation temperature (Fig 1), with a Steffensen-type swim-tunnel (volume 13.4 L) supplied with

- 123 vigorously aerated, biofiltered water at 26 \pm 0.1 °C, as described in (Blasco et al., 2020). Briefly,
- 124 fish were placed in the tunnel and left overnight at a low swimming speed equivalent to 1
- 125 bodylength·s⁻¹ (BL·s⁻¹, corrected for solid blocking effect (Blasco et al., 2020)). The following

morning swimming speed was increased each 30 min in steps of either 1 BL (mass range 20.6 to 126 86.5 g, n=12) or 0.5 BL (204 to 313 g, n=6), up to either 5 or 2.5 BL·s⁻¹, respectively. Speeds differed 127 for the size groups because relative swimming speed declines with size (length) in fishes 128 (Bainbridge, 1958; Beamish, 1978), and the objective to was obtain a range of speeds at which all 129 130 individuals exclusively engaged steady aerobic body-caudal swimming (Webb, 1998). Measurements of oxygen uptake (\dot{MO}_2) were made by stopped-flow respirometry at each speed 131 and calculated as both absolute (mmol·fish $^{-1}$ ·h $^{-1}$) and mass-corrected (mmol·kg $^{-1}$ ·h $^{-1}$) rates, to 132 subsequently derive standard metabolic rate (SMR) (Chabot et al., 2016) and active metabolic rate 133 134 AMR (Norin and Clark, 2016), and calculate AS as AMR-SMR.

Following this element of the swim test, the swimming speed was increased by 0.1 BL 135 every 10 s until fatigue, with this speed noted as maximum swimming speed (Umax; Blasco et al., 136 2020; Marras et al., 2013). When the fish fatigued and fell back against the rear screen of the swim 137 tunnel, speed was immediately reduced to 1 BL s⁻¹ and, after 30 min, it was returned to a second 138 holding tank for at least 96 h under normal rearing conditions, prior to testing thermal tolerance. 139 Blank measurements were made before and after each trial and, if they increased over a trial, 140 were presumed to do so linearly. Background respiration did not exceed 10% of fish MO₂, all data 141 142 were corrected accordingly.

During the constant acceleration element of the protocol, gait transition speed (U_{GT}) was identified as when an individual began to engage an unsteady anaerobic gait, which presaged fatigue (Blasco et al., 2020; Marras et al., 2013). The aerobic gait comprised steady body-caudal swimming (rhythmic beating of the tail) that relies upon slow twitch oxidative muscle (Hachim et al., 2021; Webb, 1998). The unsteady anaerobic gait comprised intermittent powerful tailbeats that propelled the fish forward in the swim tunnel, after which it coasted back and then repeated the powerful tailbeat, so-called 'burst and coast' swimming that relies on recruitment of fasttwitch glycolytic muscle (Hachim et al., 2021; Webb, 1998). The net difference between U_{max} and U_{GT} (U_{max}-U_{GT}) was calculated as a potential indicator of relative anaerobic swimming capacity.

152 Tolerance of warming

After suitable recovery in their holding tank, fish were measured for thermal tolerance by CT_{max}
and CTS_{max}. The order of the two tests was reversed for 50% of animals (Fig 1) to avoid any
potential systematic effect of exposure history on responses to the second test. CT_{max} was
measured on groups of tilapia that had acclimated overnight in a 68 L tank containing vigorously
aerated water at 26 °C. The following morning, water was warmed 1 °C every 30 min until loss of

equilibrium (LOE). Individual CT_{max} was then recorded as the highest temperature step fully
completed plus the proportion of the last step that the fish endured prior to LOE (Blasco et al.,
2020). Immediately upon LOE, fish were recovered at 26 °C for at least 30 min, in a 68 L tank of
aerated water. If this was the first test applied (Fig 1), the animal was then returned to a holding
tank for at least 96 h prior to the CTS_{max}.

For CTS_{max} each individual recovered overnight in the swim-tunnel at 1 BL·s⁻¹ then, the next 163 day, speed was increased over 30 min until 85% of its own U_{GT} (Blasco et al., 2020). That is, each 164 fish was exercised at a fixed proportion of their own aerobic swimming capacity, which was 165 expected to impose a metabolic load that represented a similar proportion of their AS. After 30 166 min at that speed, temperature was increased by 1°C every 30 min until fish fatigued, resting 167 against the rear screen (Blasco et al., 2020). The CTS_{max} was calculated as for CT_{max} but using 168 fatigue as endpoint (Blasco et al., 2020). The fish was immediately placed in a recovery tank at 26 169 °C for 30 min. If this was the first test applied (Fig 1), the animal was then returned to a holding 170 tank for at least 96 h prior to the CT_{max}. 171

At each temperature step during the CTS_{max} , measurements of \dot{MO}_2 were made over the last 20 min and the highest rate achieved was denoted as \dot{MO}_{2max} (Blasco et al., 2020). Fatigue in the CTS_{max} was not simply due to lack of endurance, Nile tilapia acclimated to 26 °C can swim steadily at 85% of U_{GT} for at least 9 h, exceeding the duration of the CTS_{max} (Blasco et al., 2020). Blank measurements were made before all trials and at the highest temperature achieved after all trials, increases in background were presumed to be linear over temperature. Background respiration did not exceed 10% of fish \dot{MO}_2 and all data were corrected proportionally.

179 Statistcal analysis

180 Statistics were performed with SigmaPlot 11. Relationships with body mass, of metabolic,

181 performance and tolerance variables, were assessed by least squares regression of log-

182 transformed data. Correlations between variables (CT_{max} vs CTS_{max}; CTS_{max} vs MO_{2max}) were

183 assessed by Pearson product-moment. Mean CT_{max} and CTS_{max} were compared by paired T-test,

184 assumptions of normality and equal variances were tested by Shapiro-Wilks and F-test,

185 respectively. P<0.05 was the limit for statistical significance.

186 **Results**

187 Metabolic and performance phenotype at acclimation temperature

188 Mass-independent SMR, AMR and AS showed highly significant positive relationships with mass

189 (Table 1, Fig. S1, Electronic Supplementary Material). Slopes for SMR and AMR were less than 1,

190 indicating an allometric decline in metabolic rates with increasing mass (Table 1). By contrast, the slope for AS was very close to 1, indicating that this trait scaled isometrically with mass (Table 1). 191 192 In order better to evaluate how metabolic traits depended on body mass (especially the \dot{MO}_{2max} during CTS_{max} , see below), data are presented here as plots of mass-specific MO_2 (Table 1, Figures 193 2 and 4). At 26 °C, log mass-specific SMR and AMR both showed a clear decline with increasing log 194 195 body mass, with significant negative linear relationships, (Table 1, Figure 2). Log mass-specific AS did not, however, show any significant relationship to mass, indicating that it was maintained 196 197 unchanged as mass increased (Table 1, Figure 2). Relative swimming performance declined significantly with mass, log U_{GT} and U_{max} both fell significantly with log mass, but U_{max}-U_{GT} was 198 199 independent of mass (Table 2).

200 Thermal tolerance

As fish were warmed during CT_{max} they first exhibited erratic behaviour, rolling sideways, followed
by complete LOE. During CTS_{max}, fish swam using a steady aerobic gait up to a certain
temperature, beyond which they progressively engaged unsteady burst and coast anaerobic
swimming that led to fatigue. No fish lost equilibrium during CTS_{max}. All fish from both protocols
recovered normal swimming behaviour within 10 min at 26 °C. The two thermal thresholds were
not correlated (r=0.371, P=0.129) but overall mean (± SEM) CT_{max}, at 40.7±0.23°C, was significantly
higher than CTS_{max}, at 38.1±0.29°C. Log CT_{max} had no relationship with log body mass whereas log
CTS_{max} declined significantly with mass (Figure 3, Table 2).

At the outset of the CTS_{max}, when individuals were swimming at 85% of their U_{GT} at acclimation temperature, absolute and mass specific \dot{MO}_2 declined against body mass with slopes that were similar to those for AMR (Table 1, Figure S2, Electronic Supplementary Material). When each individual's mass specific SMR was subtracted from their mass-specific \dot{MO}_2 at 85% of their U_{GT}, the net difference represented 71 ± 3% (mean ± SEM) of mass specific AS across all 18 individuals, with no significant relationship to their mass (Figure S3, Electronic Supplementary Material). During the CTS_{max}, the \dot{MO}_{2max} occurred at the temperature step that was either the penultimate or final step endured, in all individuals except for one (mass 204g, see data in (Blasco et al., 2022)). There was a highly significant negative relationship between mass-specific \dot{MO}_{2max} and mass (Figure 4A, Table 1, see Figure S1 for the reciprocal allometric scaling relationship). There was a significant positive correlation between log \dot{MO}_{2max} and log CTS_{max} (Figure 4B). **Discussion**

221 The results demonstrate that tolerance of acute warming declines with increasing body mass in a

teleost fish, when measured as the temperature at which individuals fatigue from sustained

aerobic swimming (CTS_{max}). The decline in CTS_{max} with mass was significantly correlated with a decline in \dot{MO}_{2max} , which may indicate a causal relationship.

225 Metabolic and performance phenotype at acclimation temperature

The tilapia exhibited the significant mass-specific declines in SMR and AMR at acclimation 226 temperature that reflect the allometric mass-scaling relationships of metabolic rate found in all 227 fish species. Their underlying mechanisms remain a matter of debate (Glazier, 2020; Killen et al., 228 229 2010; Killen et al., 2016). An absence of any effect of mass on AS has also been observed in multiple species, the implication being that, although SMR and AMR decline with mass the animal 230 maintains the same absolute scope to provide its tissues with oxygen (Killen et al., 2016; Lefevre et 231 al., 2017). At the outset of the CTS_{max} protocol, when individuals were swimming at 85% of their 232 U_{GT} at acclimation temperature, their associated \dot{MO}_2 declined with mass but nonetheless 233 represented a constant proportion of their AS (\sim 70%). The fact that relative U_{GT} and U_{max}, 234 measured in BL s⁻¹, declined with mass at acclimation temperature was of course a direct 235 reflection of a tight relationship between mass and length in the tilapia. It is well-established that 236 relative swimming performance declines with length in most fish species (Bainbridge, 1958; 237

238 Beamish, 1978).

239 Effects of mass on thermal tolerance and potential underlying mechanisms

The finding that CT_{max} did not decline with increasing body mass is consistent with a previous 240 study on Nile tilapia (Recsetar et al., 2012). It may indicate that LOE during CT_{max} in tilapia is not 241 due to limitations in oxygen supply but instead occurs due to another mechanism. Although LOE 242 presumably reflects loss of function of critical organs such as the heart and central nervous 243 244 system, further study is required to understand the exact mechanism in tilapia or, for that matter, in any fish species (Jutfelt et al., 2019; Lefevre et al., 2021). Given the absence of any dependence 245 of CT_{max} upon mass, it was interesting to find a clear negative dependence of CTS_{max} . This 246 dependence of CTS_{max} on mass in Nile tilapia should be investigated in other fish species, to 247 establish the generality of the phenomenon. 248

The profound decline in MO_{2max} with body mass, and the significant correlation of MO_{2max}
with CTS_{max}, are also worthy of further investigation to establish whether capacity for oxygen
uptake is indeed a mechanism underlying size-dependence of CTS_{max}. This could, for example,
include measurements of cardiac performance, blood flows and blood gases during a CTS_{max} in
individuals of different sizes, in species that are amenable to both blood vessel catheterisation and

placement of flow probes. These results in the tilapia lend support to the Fry-OCLTT paradigm 254 whereby thermal tolerance in ectotherms can be limited by capacity for oxygen uptake (Blasco et 255 al., 2020; Fry, 1971; Pörtner, 2010). The fact that size-related variation in \dot{MO}_{2max} only accounted 256 for about 60% of the variation in CTS_{max} indicates, however, that other mechanisms must have 257 contributed to fatigue in the tilapia. All individuals engaged unsustainable anaerobic swimming 258 prior to fatiguing (Blasco et al., 2020) and capacity for anaerobic exercise varies among individuals 259 in fish species (Marras et al., 2010; Marras et al., 2013). If, however, the difference between U_{max} 260 261 and U_{GT} (U_{max}-U_{GT}) is considered an indicator of relative anaerobic swimming capacity (Marras et al., 2013), this was independent of mass and length. 262

263 It is also important to understand why \dot{MO}_{2max} declined so significantly with mass, and to establish whether this is also a general phenomenon across fish species. A regression coefficient of 264 0.93 on 18 fish indicates that the relationship is unlikely to be spurious in the tilapia, which is 265 therefore a stimulus to investigate the phenomenon in other fish species. The slope for the decline 266 in log mass-specific \dot{MO}_{2max} with log mass in the tilapia, of -0.33, would be expected if the capacity 267 for oxygen uptake were subject to surface to volume geometric constraints (Glazier, 2018; Glazier, 268 2020), notably if fishes were subject to the simple geometric constraints of spherical bodies (Pauly, 269 270 1981). Fishes are not, of course, spherical bodies; their gills are folded surfaces which, as an 271 individual grows, can perfectly compensate increases in body volume with increases in respiratory surface area (Lefevre et al., 2017). This is why, at a given acclimation temperature, AS scales 272 isometrically with body mass across multiple species (Lefevre et al., 2017), as it did with the tilapia 273 in this study. It is known, however, that gill functional respiratory surface area declines with mass 274 in fishes, in tilapia it does so with a slope of -0.30 (Kisia and Hughes, 1992). This decline in gill 275 surface area with mass may be linked to the decline in mass-specific SMR, whereby basal 276 metabolic costs decline and the fish gills are then 'tailored' to maintain a constant scope for 277 aerobic performance at any given mass. Maintaining a greater gill respiratory surface area than is 278 needed for AS, at any given acclimation temperature, could have costs in terms of, for example, 279 regulating water and ion balance (Lefevre et al., 2017; Taylor, 1998). As a consequence, however, 280 the fish also show a decline in their maximum mass-specific oxygen uptake capacity at acclimation 281 282 temperature, estimated as AMR. This design characteristic, of reduced gill surface area with increasing mass, would then become a constraint when large individuals face the profound 283 284 challenge to oxygen uptake that the CTS_{max} protocol imposed. Although the established mass related decline in gill respiratory surface area in the Nile tilapia seems like a cohererent 285

explanation for the decline in \dot{MO}_{2max} with mass, there may be multiple contributing factors, including other elements of the oxygen transport cascade. This is a topic that deserves further investigation, especially on species that are amenable to catheterisation and placement of flow probes.

290 Ecological implications

291 Extreme warming events are predicted to increase in frequency and severity in aquatic habitats 292 worldwide due to accelerating global climate change (Field et al., 2012; Frölicher et al., 2018; 293 Stillman, 2019). There are clear ecological implications to the fact that, if tilapia populations experience an acute warming event, the ability of larger fishes to perform a given level of aerobic 294 295 work would be constrained at lower temperatures than that of smaller conspecifics. Although we concentrated on aerobic swimming, larger tilapia would also presumably be constrained in their 296 297 ability to perform other activities at warm temperatures, for example the specific dynamic action response that follows ingestion of a meal and is believed to be in large part the cost of tissue 298 299 anabolism and growth (McCue, 2006). The law of averages would predict that larger fishes are 300 more likely to encounter temperatures sufficiently warm to limit their performance (Field et al., 301 2012; Stillman, 2019). Therefore, stochastic extreme warming events could threaten ecological 302 performance, fitness and survival of fishes in a size-dependent manner (Habary et al., 2017; 303 Stillman, 2019). If fitness and survival of larger animals is compromised more frequently, this could have important consequences for Nile tilapia fisheries, an important source of dietary protein in 304 many countries (De Silva et al., 2004). 305

Overall, the data indicate that capacity for oxygen uptake may be a factor limiting thermal tolerance in fishes, and also that global warming may 'favour the small' (Daufresne et al., 2009). Further work is required to understand if this size-dependence in temperature tolerance is true in other fish species. The evidence we provide, that larger individuals are more prone to limitations in their capacity for oxygen uptake at warmer temperatures, is coherent with a mechanism suggested to underly the TSR (Verberk et al., 2021). That is, that species may have evolved to modify their growth trajectories at warmer temperatures, to avoid constraints on aerobic activities in adults (Atkinson et al., 2006; Hoefnagel and Verberk, 2015; Leiva et al., 2019; Rubalcaba et al., 2020; Verberk et al., 2021). This, in turn, might be linked to ongoing declines in maximum body size of fishes globally (Audzijonyte et al., 2019; Baudron et al., 2014; Daufresne et al., 2009). The rate of global warming is too fast for adaptive evolutionary responses by most fish species, so survival and resilience will depend upon the options for migration, the prevailing

- 318 plasticity in tolerance, and the existence of tolerant genotypes (Bell, 2013; Gunderson and
- 319 Stillman, 2015; Habary et al., 2017; Stillman, 2019). The current data indicate that capacity for
- 320 migration may be impaired at lower temperatures in larger fish, and that smaller animals are more
- 321 tolerant. This could also contribute to a decline in maximum body size in future populations.
- 322

323 Acknowledgements

324 We are grateful to Cesar Polettini, of Piscicultura Polettini, for donating the tilapia.

325 Funding Statement

- 326 This study was financed in part by a doctoral bursary to FRB, from the Coordenação de
- 327 Aperfeiçoamento de Pessoal de Nível Superior Brasil (CAPES) Finance Code 001.
- 328

329 References

- 330 Atkinson, D. (1994). Temperature and Organism Size—A Biological Law for Ectotherms? In
- 331 Advances in Ecological Research, pp. 1–58.
- 332 Atkinson, D., Morley, S. A. and Hughes, R. N. (2006). From cells to colonies: at what levels of body
- organization does the 'temperature-size rule' apply? *Evol. & Dev.* **8**, 202–214.
- 334 Audzijonyte, A., Barneche, D. R., Baudron, A. R., Belmaker, J., Clark, T. D., Marshall, C. T.,
- 335 Morrongiello, J. R. and van Rijn, I. (2019). Is oxygen limitation in warming waters a valid
- 336 mechanism to explain decreased body sizes in aquatic ectotherms? *Glob. Ecol. Biogeogr.* 28,
- 337 64-77.
- 338 Audzijonyte, A., Richards, S. A., Stuart-Smith, R. D., Pecl, G., Edgar, G. J., Barrett, N. S., Payne, N.
- and Blanchard, J. L. (2020). Fish body sizes change with temperature but not all species
- shrink with warming. *Nat. Ecol. Evol.* **1**, 1–6.
- 341 Bainbridge, R. (1958). The speed of swimming of fish as related to size and to the frequency and
- amplitude of the tail beat. J. Exp. Biol. **35**, 109–133.
- 343 Baudron, A. R., Needle, C. L., Rijnsdorp, A. D. and Tara Marshall, C. (2014). Warming
- 344 temperatures and smaller body sizes: Synchronous changes in growth of North Sea fishes.
- 345 *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **20**, 1023–1031.
- 346 Beamish, F. W. H. (1978). Swimming capacity. In Fish Physiology Volume 7 (ed. Hoar, W. S. and
- Randall, D. J.), pp. 101–187. New York: Academic Press.
- 348 Beitinger, T. and Lutterschmidt, W. (2011). Temperature | Measures of thermal tolerance. In
- 349 Encyclopedia of Fish Physiology: From Genome to Environment (ed. Farrell, A. P.), pp. 1695–

- 350 1702. Elsevier Ltd.
- 351 Bell, G. (2013). Evolutionary rescue and the limits of adaptation. Philos. Trans. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci.

352 **368**,.

- Blasco, F. R., Esbaugh, A. J., Killen, S., Rantin, F. T., Taylor, E. W. and McKenzie, D. J. (2020). Using
 aerobic exercise to evaluate sub-lethal tolerance of acute warming in fishes. J. Exp. Biol. 223,
- 355 jeb218602.
- 356 Blasco, F. R., Taylor, E. W., Monteiro, D. A., Leite, C. A. C., Rantin, F. T. and McKenzie, D. J.
- 357 (2022). Data for: Tolerance of an acute warming challenge declines with size in Nile tilapia:
- evidence of a link to capacity for oxygen uptake V1. *Mendeley Data* V1, doi:
- 359 10.17632/npmchftsjf.1.
- 360 Brijs, J., Jutfelt, F., Clark, T. D., Gräns, A., Ekström, A. and Sandblom, E. (2015). Experimental
- 361 manipulations of tissue oxygen supply do not affect warming tolerance of European perch. J.

362 *Exp. Biol.* **218**, 2448–2454.

- 363 Chabot, D., Steffensen, J. F. and Farrell, A. P. (2016). The determination of standard metabolic
- 364 rate in fishes. J. Fish Biol. **88**, 81–121.
- 365 Christensen, E. A. F., Svendsen, M. B. S. and Steffensen, J. F. (2020). The combined effect of body
- 366 size and temperature on oxygen consumption rates and the size-dependency of preferred
- temperature in European perch *Perca fluviatilis*. J. Fish Biol. **97**, 794–803.
- 368 Claireaux, G., Théron, M., Prineau, M., Dussauze, M., Merlin, F. X. and Le Floch, S. (2013). Effects
- of oil exposure and dispersant use upon environmental adaptation performance and fitness
- in the European sea bass, Dicentrarchus labrax. *Aquat. Toxicol.* **130–131**, 160–170.
- 371 Daufresne, M., Lengfellner, K. and Sommer, U. (2009). Global warming benefits the small in
- aquatic ecosystems. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* **106**, 12788–12793.
- 373 De Silva, S. S., Subasinghe, R. P., Bartley, D. M. and Lowther, A. (2004). Tilapias as alien aquatics
 374 in Asia and the Pacific: A Review. FAO Fish. Tech. Pap. 453 65.
- 375 Ekstrom, A., Axelsson, M., Grans, A., Brijs, J. and Sandblom, E. (2018). Importance of the
- 376 coronary circulation for cardiac and metabolic performance in rainbow trout (Oncorhynchus
- 377 mykiss). *Biol. Lett.* **14**, 20180063.
- 378 Ekström, A., Brijs, J., Clark, T. D., Gräns, A., Jutfelt, F. and Sandblom, E. (2016). Cardiac oxygen
- 379 limitation during an acute thermal challenge in the European perch: effects of chronic
- 380 environmental warming and experimental hyperoxia. Am. J. Physiol. Integr. Comp. Physiol.
- **311**, R440–R449.

- 382 Eliason, E. J., Clark, T. D., Hague, M. J., Hanson, L. M., Gallagher, Z. S., Jeffries, K. M., Gale, M. K.,
- Patterson, D. A., Hinch, S. G. and Farrell, A. P. (2011). Differences in thermal tolerance
 among sockeye salmon populations. *Science* 332, 109–12.
- 385 Ern, R., Norin, T., Gamperl, A. K. and Esbaugh, A. J. (2016). Oxygen dependence of upper thermal
 386 limits in fishes. *J. Exp. Biol.* 219, 3376–3383.
- 387 Farrell, A. P. (2016). Pragmatic perspective on aerobic scope: Peaking, plummeting, pejus and
- 388 apportioning. J. Fish Biol. **88**, 322–343.
- 389 Field, C. B., Barros, V., Stocker, T. F., Dahe, Q., Jon Dokken, D., Ebi, K. L., Mastrandrea, M. D.,
- 390 Mach, K. J., Plattner, G. K., Allen, S. K., et al. (2012). Managing the risks of extreme events
- 391 and disasters to advance climate change adaptation: Special Report of the Intergovernmental

392 *Panel on Climate Change*. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press.

393 Frölicher, T. L., Fischer, E. M. and Gruber, N. (2018). Marine heatwaves under global warming.

- 394 *Nature* **560**, 360–364.
- 395 Fry, F. E. J. (1971). The Effect of Environmental Factors on the Physiology of Fish. In Fish Physiology
- *Volume 6* (ed. Hoar, W. S. and Randall, D. J.), pp. 1–98. New York: Academic Press.
- 397 Glazier, D. (2018). Rediscovering and Reviving Old Observations and Explanations of Metabolic

Scaling in Living Systems. *Systems* **6**, 4; doi:10.3390/systems6010004.

399 Glazier, D. S. (2020). Activity alters how temperature influences intraspecific metabolic scaling:

- 400 testing the metabolic-level boundaries hypothesis. *J. Comp. Physiol. B Biochem. Syst. Environ.*
- 401 *Physiol.* **190**, 445–454.
- 402 Gunderson, A. R. and Stillman, J. H. (2015). Plasticity in thermal tolerance has limited potential to
- 403 buffer ectotherms from global warming. *Proc. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci.* **282**, 20150401.

404 Habary, A., Johansen, J. L., Nay, T. J., Steffensen, J. F. and Rummer, J. L. (2017). Adapt, move or

- die how will tropical coral reef fishes cope with ocean warming? *Glob. Chang. Biol.* 23, 566–
 577.
- 407 Hachim, M., Rouyer, T., Dutto, G., Kerzerho, V., Bernard, S., Bourjea, J. and McKenzie, D. J.
- 408 (2021). Oxygen uptake, heart rate and activities of locomotor muscles during a critical
- swimming speed protocol in the gilthead sea bream *Sparus aurata*. *J. Fish Biol.* **98**, 886–890.
- 410 Hoefnagel, K. N. and Verberk, W. C. E. P. (2015). Is the temperature-size rule mediated by oxygen
- 411 in aquatic ectotherms? J. Therm. Biol. 54, 56–65.
- 412 Hume, J. B. (2019). Higher temperatures increase developmental rate and reduce body size at
- 413 hatching in the small-eyed skate Raja microocellata: implications for exploitation of an

- elasmobranch in warming seas. J. Fish Biol. **95**, 655–658.
- 415 Jutfelt, F., Norin, T., Ern, R., Overgaard, J., Wang, T., McKenzie, D. J., Lefevre, S., Nilsson, ran E.,
- 416 Metcalfe, N. B., R Hickey, A. J., et al. (2018). Oxygen-and capacity-limited thermal tolerance:
- 417 blurring ecology and physiology. J. Exp. Biol. **221**, 2016–2019.
- 418 Jutfelt, F., Roche, D. G., Clark, T. D., Norin, T., Binning, S. A., Speers-Roesch, B., Amcoff, M.,
- 419 Morgan, R., Andreassen, A. H. and Sundin, J. (2019). Brain cooling marginally increases acute
- 420 upper thermal tolerance in Atlantic cod. *J. Exp. Biol.* **222**, jeb208249.
- 421 Killen, S. S., Atkinson, D. and Glazier, D. S. (2010). The intraspecific scaling of metabolic rate with
- 422 body mass in fishes depends on lifestyle and temperature. *Ecol. Lett.* **13**, 184–193.
- 423 Killen, S. S., Glazier, D. S., Rezende, E. L., Clark, T. D., Atkinson, D., Willener, A. S. T. and Halsey,
- 424 L. G. (2016). Ecological Influences and Morphological Correlates of Resting and Maximal

425 Metabolic Rates across Teleost Fish Species. *Am. Nat.* **187**, 592–606.

- 426 Kisia, S. M. and Hughes, G. M. (1992). Estimation of oxygen-diffusing capacity in the gills of
- 427 different sizes of a tilapia, Oreochromis niloticus. J. Zool. 227, 405–415.
- 428 Lefevre, S. (2016). Are global warming and ocean acidification conspiring against marine
- 429 ectotherms¹? A meta-analysis of the respiratory effects of elevated temperature, high CO2
- 430 and their interaction. *Conserv. Physiol.* **4**, 1–31.
- 431 Lefevre, S., McKenzie, D. J. and Nilsson, G. E. (2017). Models projecting the fate of fish
- 432 populations under climate change need to be based on valid physiological mechanisms. *Glob.*
- 433 *Chang. Biol.* **23**, 3449–3459.
- 434 Lefevre, S., Wang, T. and McKenzie, D. J. (2021). The role of mechanistic physiology in
- 435 investigating impacts of global warming on fishes. J. Exp. Biol. **224**, jeb238840.
- 436 Leiva, F. P., Calosi, P. and Verberk, W. C. E. P. (2019). Scaling of thermal tolerance with body mass
- 437 and genome size in ectotherms: a comparison between water- and air-breathers. *Philos*.
- 438 Trans. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci. **374**, 20190035.
- 439 Loisel, A., Isla, A. and Daufresne, M. (2019). Variation of thermal plasticity in growth and
- 440 reproduction patterns: Importance of ancestral and developmental temperatures. J. Therm.
- 441 *Biol.* **84**, 460–468.
- 442 Marras, S., Claireaux, G., McKenzie, D. J. and Nelson, J. A. (2010). Individual variation and
- 443 repeatability in aerobic and anaerobic swimming performance of European sea bass,
- 444 Dicentrarchus labrax. J. Exp. Biol. **213**, 26–32.
- 445 Marras, S., Killen, S. S., Domenici, P., Claireaux, G. and McKenzie, D. J. (2013). Relationships

- 446 among Traits of Aerobic and Anaerobic Swimming Performance in Individual European Sea
- 447 Bass Dicentrarchus labrax. *PLoS One* **8**, e72815.
- 448 McCue, M. D. (2006). Specific dynamic action: a century of investigation. *Comp. Biochem. Physiol.*449 A. Mol. Integr. Physiol. 144, 381–94.
- 450 McKenzie, D. J., Zhang, Y., Eliason, E. J., Schulte, P. M., Blasco, F. R., Claireaux, G., Nati, J. J. H.
- 451 and Farrell, A. P. (2020). Intraspecific variation in tolerance of warming in fishes. J. Fish Biol.
- 452 doi.org/10.1111/jfb.14620.
- 453 Messmer, V., Pratchett, M. S., Hoey, A. S., Tobin, A. J., Coker, D. J., Cooke, S. J. and Clark, T. D.
- 454 (2017). Global warming may disproportionately affect larger adults in a predatory coral reef

455 fish. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **23**, 2230–2240.

- 456 Morgan, R., Finnøen, M. H. and Jutfelt, F. (2018). CTmax is repeatable and does not reduce
- 457 growth in zebrafish. *Sci. Rep.* **8**, 1–8.
- 458 Morgenroth, D., McArley, T., Gräns, A., Axelsson, M., Sandblom, E. and Ekström, A. (2021).
- 459 Coronary blood flow influences tolerance to environmental extremes in fish. *J. Exp. Biol.* 224,
 460 jeb239970.
- 461 Norin, T. and Clark, T. D. (2016). Measurement and relevance of maximum metabolic rate in
 462 fishes. J. Fish Biol. 88, 122–151.
- 463 Pauly, D. (1981). The relationships between gill surface area and growth performance in fish: a
- 464 generalization of von Bertalanffy's theory of growth. *Berichte der Dtsch. Wissenchaftlichen*
- 465 *Kommission fur Meeresforsch.* **28**, 32.
- 466 **Pörtner, H. O.** (2010). Oxygen- And capacity-limitation of thermal tolerance: A matrix for
- 467 integrating climate-related stressor effects in marine ecosystems. J. Exp. Biol. 213, 881–893.
- 468 Pörtner, H.-O. (2021). Climate impacts on organisms, ecosystems and human societies: integrating
- 469 OCLTT into a wider context. *J. Exp. Biol.* **224**, jeb238360.
- 470 Pörtner, H.-O. and Farrell, A. P. (2008). Physiology and climate change. Science 322, 690–692.
- 471 Recsetar, M. S., Zeigler, M. P., Ward, D. L., Bonar, S. A. and Caldwell, C. A. (2012). Relationship
- 472 between fish size and upper thermal tolerance. *Trans. Am. Fish. Soc.* **141**, 1433–1438.
- 473 Rezende, E. L. and Bozinovic, F. (2019). Thermal performance across levels of biological
- 474 organization. Philos. Trans. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci. 374,.
- 475 Rezende, E. L., Tejedo, M. and Santos, M. (2011). Estimating the adaptive potential of critical
- 476 thermal limits: methodological problems and evolutionary implications. *Funct. Ecol.* 25, 111–
- 477 121.

- 478 Rubalcaba, J. G., Verberk, W. C. E. P., Hendriks, A. J., Saris, B. and Woods, H. A. (2020). Oxygen
- 479 limitation may affect the temperature and size dependence of metabolism in aquatic
- 480 ectotherms. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* **117**, 31963–31968.
- 481 Schofield, P. J., Peterson, M. S., Lowe B, M. R., Brown-Peterson, N. J. and Slack, W. T. (2011).
- 482 Survival, growth and reproduction of non-indigenous Nile tilapia, Oreochromis niloticus
- 483 (Linnaeus 1758). I. Physiological capabilities in various temperatures and salinities. *Mar.*
- 484 *Freshw. Res.* **62**, 439–449.
- 485 Schulte, P. M. (2015). The effects of temperature on aerobic metabolism: Towards a mechanistic
- understanding of the responses of ectotherms to a changing environment. J. Exp. Biol. 218,
 1856–1866.
- 488 Smale, D. A., Wernberg, T., Oliver, E. C. J., Thomsen, M., Harvey, B. P., Straub, S. C., Burrows, M.
- 489 T., Alexander, L. V., Benthuysen, J. A., Donat, M. G., et al. (2019). Marine heatwaves
- 490 threaten global biodiversity and the provision of ecosystem services. *Nat. Clim. Chang.* 9,
- 491 <u>306–312</u>.
- 492 Steinhausen, M. F., Sandblom, E., Eliason, E. J., Verhille, C. and Farrell, A. P. (2008). The effect of
- 493 acute temperature increases on the cardiorespiratory performance of resting and swimming
 494 sockeye salmon (Oncorhynchus nerka). J. Exp. Biol. 211, 3915–3926.
- 495 **Stillman, J. H.** (2019). Heat waves, the new normal: Summertime temperature extremes will
- 496 impact animals, ecosystems, and human communities. *Physiology* **34**, 86–100.
- 497 Taylor, E. W. (1998). Gills of water-breathers: Structures with multiple functions. In Principles of
- 498 Animal Design: The Optimisation and Symmorphosis Debate (ed. Weibel, E. R., Taylor, C. R.
- and Bolis, C. L.), pp. 186–194. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- 500 Tirsgaard, B., Behrens, J. W. and Steffensen, J. F. (2015). The effect of temperature and body size
- 501 on metabolic scope of activity in juvenile Atlantic cod Gadus morhua L. *Comp. Biochem.*
- 502 Physiol. Part A Mol. Integr. Physiol. **179**, 89–94.
- 503 Verberk, W. C. E. P., Atkinson, D., Hoefnagel, K. N., Hirst, A. G., Horne, C. R. and Siepel, H. (2021).
- 504 Shrinking body sizes in response to warming: explanations for the temperature–size rule with
- special emphasis on the role of oxygen. *Biol. Rev.* **96**, 247–268.
- 506 Wang, T., Lefevre, S., Iversen, N. K., Findorf, I., Buchanan, R. and McKenzie, D. J. (2014). Anaemia
- 507 only causes a small reduction in the upper critical temperature of sea bass: is oxygen delivery
- the limiting factor for tolerance of acute warming in fishes? J. Exp. Biol. **217**, 4275–4278.
- 509 Webb, P.W. (1998). Swimming. In The Physiology of Fishes (ed. Evans, D. D.), pp. 1–38. Boca

- 510 Raton: CRC Press.
- 511 Wootton, H. F., Morrongiello, J. R., Schmitt, T. and Audzijonyte, A. (2022). Smaller adult fish size
- in warmer water is not explained by elevated metabolism. *Ecol. Lett.* DOI: 10.1111/ele.13989.

513

515 Figure legends

516 Figure 1. Schematic of the treatment protocol. Individuals were PIT-tagged, recovered at least 96h 517 then submitted to a swim performance test (Swim test) in a swim tunnel with respirometry (R) to measure the performance and metabolic phenotype at acclimation temperature (26°C). After at 518 least 96h recovery, 50 % of individuals were submitted to a critical thermal maximum (CT_{max}) test, 519 520 warming in small groups until loss of equilibrium, followed by at least 96h recovery. They were 521 then submitted individually to a critical thermal maximum for aerobic swimming (CTS_{max}) test in a 522 swim tunnel until fatigue with R, to measure the maximum rate of oxygen uptake achieved prior 523 to fatigue. The other 50% were submitted in the opposite order, CTS_{max} and then CT_{max} . 524 Figure 2. Least squares regression of the log:log relationship between body mass and mass-specific rates of oxygen uptake equivalent to standard metabolic rate (SMR); active metabolic rate (AMR), 525 and aerobic scope (AS). Data are for n = 18 Nile tilapia, mass range 21 to 313g, acclimated to 26°C. 526 527 Regression lines are for variables where relationship is significant, lines denote best fit, see Table 528 1. **Figure 3.** Least squares regression of the log-log relationship between body mass and two critical 529 530 temperatures (CT) for tolerance, critical thermal maximum (CT_{max}, red symbols) and critical thermal maximum for aerobic swimming (CTS_{max} blue symbols, dotted regression line, see Table 2 for 531 532 best fit regression information). Data are for n = 18 Nile tilapia, mass range 21 to 313g, acclimated 533 to 26° C, the CTS_{max} showed a significant negative relationship with mass, see Table 1. Figure 4. (A) Least squares regression of the log:log relationship between body mass and mass-534 specific maximum rate of oxygen uptake achieved during CTS_{max} (MO_{2max}, see Table 1 for best fit 535 regression information) and (B) Pearson correlation between critical thermal maximum for aerobic 536 swimming (CTS_{max}) and \dot{MO}_{2max} , dotted line is described by log CTS_{max} = (log \dot{MO}_{2max}) x 0.061 + 537 1.491 (r = 0.637, P = 0.004). Data are for n = 18 Nile tilapia, mass range 21 to 313g, acclimated to 538 26°C. 539 540







