

## Female reproductive senescence across mammals: A high diversity of patterns modulated by life history and mating traits

Jean-François Lemaître Lemaître, Victor Ronget, Jean-Michel Gaillard

### ▶ To cite this version:

Jean-François Lemaître Lemaître, Victor Ronget, Jean-Michel Gaillard. Female reproductive senescence across mammals: A high diversity of patterns modulated by life history and mating traits. Mechanisms of Ageing and Development, 2020, 192, pp.111377. 10.1016/j.mad.2020.111377 . hal-03060282

## HAL Id: hal-03060282 https://hal.science/hal-03060282

Submitted on 14 Dec 2020

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

## **1** Female reproductive senescence

# <sup>2</sup> across mammals: a high diversity of

**3 patterns modulated by life history** 

## **and mating traits**

#### 

### 6 Jean-François Lemaître<sup>1</sup>, Victor Ronget<sup>2</sup> & Jean-Michel Gaillard<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Univ Lyon, Université Lyon 1, CNRS, Laboratoire de Biométrie et Biologie Évolutive UMR 5558, F-69622, Villeurbanne, France. <sup>2</sup> Unité Eco-anthropologie (EA), Muséum National d'Histoire Naturelle, CNRS, Université Paris Diderot, F-75016 Paris, France. Article for the special issue "Understanding the biology of aging to better intervene" 

21 ABSTRACT

22

23 Senescence patterns are highly variable across the animal kingdom. However, while empirical 24 evidence of actuarial senescence in vertebrates is accumulating in the wild and life history 25 correlates of actuarial senescence are increasingly identified, both the extent and variation of 26 reproductive senescence across species remain poorly studied. Here, we performed the first 27 large-scale analysis of female reproductive senescence across 101 mammalian species that 28 encompassed a wide range of Orders. We found evidence of reproductive senescence in 68.31% of the species, which demonstrates that reproductive senescence is pervasive in 29 mammals. As expected from allometric rules, the onset of reproductive senescence occurs 30 later and the rate of reproductive senescence decreases with increasing body mass and 31 32 delayed age at first reproduction. Moreover, for a given pace of life, females displaying a high level of multiple mating and/or with induced ovulation senesce earlier than females displaying 33 34 a low level of multiple mating and/or with spontaneous ovulation. These results suggest that both female mating behavior and reproductive physiology shape the diversity of reproductive 35 36 senescence patterns across mammals. We propose future avenues of research regarding the role played by environmental conditions or reproductive features (e.g. type of placentation) on 37 38 the evolution of reproductive senescence.

39

40

41 *Keywords*: Aging, Comparative biology, Fertility, Life-history, Reproduction

42

43

44

- 46 **1. Introduction**
- 47

From an evolutionary biology perspective, the process of senescence corresponds to a 48 49 decrease in the age-specific contribution to fitness (Cohen et al., 2020; Gaillard and Lemaître, 2020; Monaghan et al., 2008). Therefore, senescence is mostly studied through a 50 51 decline in demographic rates with increasing age (i.e. actuarial and reproductive senescence). 52 Historically, senescence was thought to not show up in the wild because animals were 53 expected to die from harsh environmental conditions or anthropogenic effects (e.g. hunting) 54 before experiencing a decline in age-specific survival or reproductive rates (Nussey et al., 2013). Thanks to the increasing number of long-term field studies - where individuals are 55 56 monitored from birth to death (Clutton-Brock & Sheldon 2010), and the subsequent 57 demographic analyses of these populations, the view that demographic senescence does not 58 occur in the wild has been totally revisited (Nussey et al. 2013). Yet, after pioneer descriptive 59 studies suggesting that mortality increases in late life (e.g. Caughley, 1966), empirical 60 evidence currently indicates that actuarial senescence is pervasive across vertebrates with determinate growth in the wild (Brunet-Rossinni and Austad, 2006; Nussey et al., 2013), 61 62 whereas reproductive senescence was considered to be inexistent in the wild for a much longer period (e.g. Caughley, 1976). On the contrary, the negative effects of age on 63 reproductive performance have been documented in laboratory rodents (e.g. Leslie and 64 Ranson, 1940) and human populations (e.g. Tietze, 1957) for a while. The first reports of 65 reproductive senescence in the wild only emerged in the late 70s (Coulson and Horobin, 66 67 1976; Ollason and Dunnet, 1978; Perrins and Moss, 1974; Sinclair, 1977), following the 68 insightful work by Emlen (1970), who stated that age-specific reproductive rates should increase to a peak, then stay relatively constant during a prime-age stage (i.e. the period of 69 70 adulthood between the beginning of the reproductive peak and the onset of reproductive 71 senescence) before declining in late life.

72 Empirical evidence of reproductive senescence from wild populations of vertebrates is 73 now compelling (Nussey et al., 2013). So far, these case studies have been almost entirely performed on females (but see Lemaître and Gaillard, 2017 for a review of evidence in 74 75 males), simply because accurate paternity assignments in the wild require the use of 76 molecular tools. Age-specific declines in a wide array of traits reflecting female reproductive 77 success have been documented, such as breeding proportions (e.g. Photopoulou et al., 2017), 78 birth rates (e.g. Lee et al., 2016), number of offspring produced at birth (e.g. Sparkman et al., 79 2017) or at the end of parental care (i.e. at weaning or fledgling, e.g. Thorley et al., 2020), and

offspring survival (e.g. Karniski et al., 2018). Interestingly, it has been suggested that female 80 reproductive senescence patterns can markedly differ across species (Baudisch and Stott, 81 82 2019; Jones et al., 2014), even between closely related species. For instance, a populationlevel comparison of reproductive senescence in terms of breeding success across three 83 84 albatross species has revealed that the age at the onset of reproductive senescence was much 85 earlier in the wandering albatross (Diomedea exulans) than in both the black-browed albatross 86 (Thalassarche melanophris) and the grey-headed albatross (Thalassarche chrysostoma) (Froy 87 et al., 2017). Likewise, the southern fulmar (Fulmarus glacialoides) showed clear evidence of 88 senescence in breeding success, whereas the snow petrel (*Pagodroma nivea*) did not (Berman 89 et al., 2009). Despite these reports of contrasted patterns of age-specific decline in 90 reproductive performance with increasing age, there has been so far no attempt to quantify the 91 occurrence and the variation in reproductive senescence across a wide range of species, or to 92 identify the ecological and biological factors underlying the diversity of patterns. This 93 contrasts with the increasing number of comparative analyses that focused on actuarial 94 senescence (Bronikowski et al., 2011; Lemaître et al., 2020c; Péron et al., 2019b; Ricklefs, 95 1998, 2006; Ricklefs and Scheuerlein, 2001), which have notably revealed that life-history 96 strategies (e.g. Garratt et al., 2013; Ricklefs, 2010) and environmental conditions (Colchero et 97 al., 2019; Lemaître et al., 2013; Tidière et al., 2016) modulate both the onset and the rate of 98 actuarial senescence. So far, most comparative analyses of age-specific reproductive data in mammals have focused on the evolution of post-reproductive lifespan (e.g. Alberts et al., 99 2013; Cohen, 2004; Ellis et al., 2018) and did not investigate among-species differences in the 100 101 onset or rate of reproductive senescence. Only Jones and colleagues (2008) analyzed 102 interspecific differences in female reproductive senescence patterns (i.e. measured as the age-103 specific decline in the number of recruited offspring) across 19 species of birds and mammals. 104 They found that the rate of reproductive senescence decreased with increasing generation 105 time, a reliable measure of the species position along the slow-fast continuum (Gaillard et al., 106 2005). Thus, slow-living species had a lower rate of reproductive senescence than fast-living 107 species (Jones et al., 2008; see also Gaillard et al., 2016).

The aim of this work is twofold. First, we assess whether female reproductive senescence is the rule rather than the exception across mammals by accurately quantifying reproductive senescence using a large sample of mammalian species that display a high diversity of lifestyles and life history strategies. This first step allowed quantifying amongspecies variation in both the onset and the rate of reproductive senescence. Second, we investigate the role of several ecological, biological and life history traits in shaping the diversity of reproductive senescence patterns observed across mammalian females. Among these factors, we focus on the role played by the phylogeny, the species position along the slow-fast continuum, the mating behavior and the ovulation mode.

110

117 Following comparative analyses of many life history traits (e.g. Kamilar and Cooper, 118 2013; Wootton, 1987), notably the rate of actuarial senescence (e.g. Lemaître et al., 2020b), we expected closely related species to share more similar reproductive senescence patterns 119 120 than distant species across the phylogeny. We also expected the onset and the rate of 121 senescence to occur earlier and to increase, respectively, with increasingly fast-living life 122 history as a direct consequence of the covariation among all biological times (i.e. life history 123 traits expressed in time units that positively covary across species, see Gaillard et al., 2016; 124 Ronget and Gaillard, 2020). Moreover, we investigated whether the number of mating 125 partners and the ovulation mode influenced the timing and intensity of reproductive 126 senescence. In most mammals, females generally copulate with more than one male during a 127 given reproductive event (Gomendio et al., 1998; Hayssen and Orr, 2017; Soulsbury, 2010). 128 The propensity of females to mate repeatedly within a reproductive event increases from 129 monogamous species to polyandrous or polygynandrous species, which is considered as a 130 way to increase fitness through genetic benefits (e.g. increased genetic diversity among 131 offspring, Jennions and Petrie, 2000; Stockley, 2003). However, multiple mating promotes 132 sperm competition (i.e. when sperm from two or more males compete to fertilize a given set of ova, Parker, 1970), which in turn can lead to intense sexual conflicts between sexes 133 (Stockley, 1997). Physiological and subsequent fertility costs associated to these sexual 134 135 conflicts have been widely documented (see Arnqvist and Rowe, 2005; Stockley, 1997 for 136 reviews) and might increase with female age. Thus, the risk of contracting infectious diseases 137 increases steadily with age in species displaying high levels of multiple mating (Nunn et al., 138 2014) and the negative consequences of such infections in terms of female fertility are likely 139 to be amplified at old ages due to the progressive (and taxonomically widespread) decline un 140 immune performance throughout the lifetime (Peters et al., 2019). We thus tested whether the 141 degree of multiple mating by females leads to an earlier and/or steeper reproductive senescence. We also investigated whether the ovulation mode influences mammalian 142 143 reproductive senescence. Ovulation is a physiological process governed by complex 144 interactions between hormonal levels and external cues (e.g. photoperiod, mating) (Hayssen 145 and Orr, 2017). Mammalian females are typically divided between spontaneous and induced ovulators (Soulsbury and Iossa, 2010). When spontaneous, ovulation is mostly triggered by 146 147 endogenous hormonal changes, whereas with induced ovulation, the mating event triggers a

physiological cascade that leads to ovulation. Comparative analyses performed so far have revealed that the intensity of sperm competition is stronger in species with spontaneous ovulation (Iossa et al., 2008; Soulsbury and Iossa, 2010). Since sperm competition can be associated with long-term aging costs in females, including a decline in age-specific physiological performance and fertility in females (Lemaître et al., 2020a; Stockley, 1997), we expect females from species with spontaneous ovulation to suffer from an earlier and/or steeper reproductive senescence than females from species with induced ovulation.

- 155
- 156 2. Material and methods
- 157

#### 158 2.1. Data collection

159 Age-specific reproductive data for females were extracted from an unpublished database 160 (entitled 'Malddaba') built and managed by VR, JFL and JMG, and currently under 161 development. This database contains sex- and age-specific demographic data for wild 162 populations of mammals gathered from published life tables or extracted from graphs (using WebPlotDigitizer (https://automeris.io/WebPlotDigitizer/)) over the past few years. We 163 164 focused mainly on reporting the m<sub>x</sub> series, defined as number of daughters alive at birth that 165 are produced by a female of age x. For each study we collected the mean m<sub>x</sub> value at each 166 age, as well as corresponding sample size. In some studies, the sample size was not directly reported but the information on the age distribution of females was provided. In those cases, 167 we extracted the age distribution and used the number of females expected to be alive at age x 168 169 as the sample size of the  $m_x$  series. When  $m_x$  series were not available, we reported either the 170 age-specific litter size or the age-specific pregnancy (or birth) rates with the sample sizes (i.e. 171 in monotocous species, the  $m_x$  is equivalent to the birth rates divided by 2 when assuming a 172 balanced sex ratio at birth). Only one population per species was considered in this study. When age-specific reproductive parameters were available for several populations of the same 173 174 species, we selected the one based on the best data quality and with the largest sample size 175 (see Supplementary datasets for the full list of populations included in our comparative 176 analysis).

Based on the accuracy of the methods used to assign the age of the individuals, we distinguished two main categories of studies. The first type of study (i.e. longitudinal data) corresponds to age-specific reproductive estimates obtained from the long-term monitoring of individuals marked at birth or early in life when age can be accurately identified. In the second type of studies (i.e. cross-sectional data), age is generally estimated through indirect

182 methods (e.g. tooth wear) and subject to uncertainty. These cross-sectional data correspond to age-specific reproductive rates obtained from a single assessment of individual reproductive 183 184 status using individuals either controlled alive in the population or recovered as dead in the 185 field. In cross-sectional studies performed from dead recoveries, the count of embryos or 186 placental scars often provide estimates of the litter size (e.g. Lieury et al., 2017). Sampled populations were also classified as hunted vs. non-hunted according to the information 187 reported in the original publication. Finally, we used the age-specific reproductive data 188 189 provided in the life tables to recover the age at first reproduction. We limited our research to 190 wild or semi-captive (i.e. where individuals can freely reproduce) mammalian populations. 191 However, we observed that this selection did not allow including small (and fast) mammalian species, which is easily explained by the lack of long-term field studies for such species. 192 193 Therefore, to avoid any bias in our interpretation of the diversity of reproductive senescence 194 patterns across mammals, we included in our dataset age-specific reproductive rates gathered 195 in three captive populations of rodents, all belonging to the Cricetidae family (Field vole, 196 Microtus agrestis, Orkney vole, Microtus arvalis and Tundra vole, Microtus oeconomus). At 197 the end of our literature survey, we gathered age-specific reproductive data for 101 198 mammalian species (including 52 longitudinal studies and 49 cross-sectional studies) 199 encompassing a wide diversity of mammalian Orders (Figure 1). Carnivora and Cetartiodactyla were the most represented Orders (35.6% and 27.7% of the species, 200 201 respectively) followed by Rodentia and the Primates (16.8% and 11.8% of the species, 202 respectively).

203 When possible, we extracted data on female body mass from the population where we 204 retrieved age-specific reproductive data. When this information was lacking, we looked for 205 female adult body mass from other populations. In mammals, there is widespread evidence 206 that testes mass (relative to body mass) is a reliable indicator of the level of multiple mating 207 that is experienced by females during a given reproductive event (Harcourt et al., 1995; 208 Lemaître et al., 2009; Ramm et al., 2005; Soulsbury, 2010). Indeed, multiple mating promotes 209 sperm competition among males, which in turn selects for large testes (Parker, 2016). We thus used published reviews to compile data on combined adult testes mass and the corresponding 210 211 adult male body mass (e.g. Lüpold, 2013). Data on ovulation mode were retrieved from 212 Soulsbury (2010) and Soulsbury and Iossa (2010). All data and associated references are 213 provided in the Supplementary datasets.

214

#### 215 2.2. Measures of reproductive senescence

216 In living organisms, age-specific fertility is predicted to "rise with age to a peak, which may 217 occur at almost any age depending on the sort of organism considered, and then fall" (Emlen 218 1970). When looking at age-specific variation in reproductive rates across mammals, this 219 prediction is most likely verified but also associated with substantial variation across species 220 in the strength of the initial increase, the form of the reproductive pattern near the peak of 221 reproduction and the strength of the decrease. For instance, in the bighorn sheep (Ovis 222 *canadensis*), three distinct phases are observed (Figure 2). First, the reproduction rate steadily increases with age from 2 to 4 years of age and then slightly increases during the prime-age 223 224 stage between 4 and 12 years of age when the reproduction rate peaks and then reproductive 225 senescence begins to occur (i.e. fertility is decreasing with increasing age from 12 years of 226 age onwards). Although many mammalian species display this three-phase pattern, there is 227 still a lot of variation. For instance, the prime-age stage associated with high and constant 228 reproductive rates is not consistently observed. Reproductive rates can slightly but 229 consistently increase (such as in Bighorn sheep, Figure 2) or decrease during this prime-age 230 stage or this plateau phase can simply not exist when reproductive senescence occurs for 231 instance right after the age at first reproduction (e.g. in Short-finned pilot whale, 232 Globicephala macrorhynchus, Kasuya and Marsh, 1984). Lastly, reproductive senescence has 233 not been detected in all mammal species studied so far (e.g. Northern elephant seal, Mirounga 234 angustrirostris, Le Boeuf and Laws, 1994).

To identify the different phases of age-specific variation in reproductive rates and 235 estimate when possible both the age at the onset of reproductive senescence and the rate of 236 237 reproductive senescence, we modeled age-specific changes of reproductive rates using 238 segmented models from the R-package segmented (Muggeo, 2017). We acknowledge that this 239 approach is not necessarily the most accurate to model age-specific variation in a reproductive 240 trait for each species included in our dataset. However, our goal was to assess at the large 241 scale of mammalian species the existence of reproductive senescence using a standardized 242 method, and when present to estimate both the age at the onset of reproductive senescence 243 and the rate of reproductive senescence. To account for the diversity of age-specific trajectories of reproductive rates, we fitted four models of variation in reproductive rates: a 244 245 constant model with age, a linear model with age, a model with one threshold age including 246 two linear segments (i.e. one before and one after the threshold age) and a model with 2 247 threshold ages including 3 linear segments (i.e. one before the first age threshold, one 248 between the two age thresholds, and one after the second age threshold).

249 Models were fitted by weighting the age-specific reproductive trait by sample size. Standard deviation of the reproductive trait was not used because it was not reported in most 250 251 cases contrary to sample size. Aggregated mean values per age were used for the model fitting 252 and, as we did not have access to the raw individual data in most cases, we had to make an 253 assumption about the distribution of the mean reproductive trait. Following the central limit 254 theorem, we considered each mean trait value to be normally distributed because individual 255 reproductive traits studied here were either binomial or Poisson distributed. All models were 256 fitted between the age at first reproduction and the last age reported in the study. For three 257 species (Crabeater seal, Lobodon carcinophagus; Leopard, Panthera pardus; Western 258 Jumping Mouse, Zapus princeps) we set the reproductive trait to 0 one year before the age at 259 first reproduction to anchor the models and help reach numeric convergence. For each 260 species, the most parsimonious model was selected using the Akaike Information Criterion 261 (AIC). We calculated AIC weights (AICw) to assess the relative likelihood that a given model 262 was the best among all the three fitted models (Burnham and Anderson, 2002). We selected 263 the model with the lowest AIC. To account for the propensity of AIC to retain a too complex 264 model (Link and Barker, 2006), when the difference in AIC (denoted  $\Delta AIC$ ) of two 265 competing models was less than two units, we retained the simplest model in accordance with 266 parsimony rules, except in two species (Alpine marmot, Marmota marmota and Wolf, Canis 267 *lupus*) for which the original studies reported statistical evidence of reproductive senescence using threshold models (i.e. Berger et al., 2015, Stahler et al., 2013). In both cases, we 268 269 retained the model including senescence and checked that our estimates of the age at the onset 270 of reproductive senescence matched those provided in the original sources. Depending on the 271 model selected, we used a pre-defined procedure to assess the occurrence of reproductive 272 senescence (see *Appendix B* for detailed procedure).

273

#### 274 2.3. Statistical analyses of the factors influencing reproductive senescence

275 To avoid any statistical issue due to phylogenetic inertia (Felsenstein, 1985), all the following 276 analyses involved phylogenetically controlled models. We used Phylogenetic Generalized 277 Least-Squares models (PGLS), with a variance-covariance matrix extracted using the R-278 package ape (Paradis et al., 2004). The strength of the phylogenetic signal on the error 279 structure of each model was assessed with the Pagel's  $\lambda$  (Pagel, 1999, henceforth called ' $\lambda$ '), 280 which is incorporated into the analysis to control for the phylogenetic dependence among 281 species (Symonds and Blomberg, 2014). Here,  $\lambda$  was estimated with maximum likelihood by using the PGLS command from the R-package *caper* (Orme et al., 2013). In most cases,  $\lambda$ 282

283 varies between 0 (no phylogenetic signal) and 1 (the observed pattern is predicted by the phylogeny; similarity among species scales proportionally to their shared evolutionary time 284 285 following a Brownian motion model; Pagel, 1999). As it is not possible to estimate  $\lambda$  for binary data, we used the D statistic for this specific analysis (Fritz and Purvis, 2010), which 286 287 we estimated with the R-package *caper* (Orme et al., 2013). The D statistic is equal to 1 if the 288 trait of interest has a phylogenetically random distribution across the species included in the 289 phylogeny and to 0 if its evolution follows a Brownian motion model (Fritz and Purvis, 290 2010). For all the phylogenetically-controlled analyses, data were linked to a super-tree of extant mammals that provides information on both topology and branch length (Bininda-291 292 Emonds et al., 2008, 2007). To identify factors shaping the interspecific variation in both the 293 onset and the rate of reproductive senescence, our statistical analyses were run in the 294 following four steps.

295 First, we tested whether the probability to detect reproductive senescence was 296 influenced by the sample size (i.e. total number of reproductive records in the population; log-297 transformed in the analysis), the hunting status of the population, the type of data (i.e. 298 longitudinal vs. cross-sectional) or the age at first reproduction (to control for the pace of 299 life). For this, we ran phylogenetically controlled logistic regressions with the presence or 300 absence of reproductive senescence using the R-package phylolm (Ives and Garland, 2010). 301 To identify the best models of the onset and of the rate of reproductive senescence, we 302 performed a model selection procedure using AIC (see above for a description of the 303 procedure). Second, we estimated the phylogenetic signal in both the onset and the rate of 304 reproductive senescence (see Kamilar and Cooper, 2013 for a similar approach). Third, we 305 focused on all the candidate factors for the whole set of species displaying reproductive 306 senescence (N = 69 species). We thus tested whether the onset of reproductive senescence and the rate of reproductive senescence were influenced by both the age at first reproduction and 307 308 the female body mass (entered as covariates). We also included potential confounding factors 309 such as data quality (entered as a two-level categorical data: longitudinal vs. cross-sectional 310 data) and the hunting status of the population (entered as a two-level categorical data: hunted 311 vs. non-hunted population). As expected, the age at first reproduction was positively associated with the female body mass (slope of  $0.20 \pm 0.04$ ,  $R^2 = 0.31$ ,  $\lambda = 0.83$ , on a log-log 312 scale, Appendix C - Figure S1). However, we kept both variables in our model selection 313 314 procedure because the Pearson coefficient of correlation between the age at first reproduction 315 and female body mass (r = 0.56) was below the threshold of 0.7 indicating statistical issues 316 due to a collinearity among predictor variables (Dormann et al., 2013). In addition, to get

317 estimates of the rate of reproductive senescence independently of the onset of reproductive senescence (slope between rate and onset of reproductive senescence of  $-0.81 \pm 0.22$ , R<sup>2</sup> = 318 319 0.17,  $\lambda = 0.87$ , Figure 3), we included the age at the onset of reproductive senescence among our set of covariates in the pool of models seeking to explain interspecific variation in the rate 320 321 of reproductive senescence. To identify the best models of the onset and of the rate of 322 reproductive senescence, we performed a model selection procedure using the AIC (see above). Fourth, we tested on a subset of species (N = 54) for an effect of relative testes mass 323 on both the onset and the rate of reproductive senescence. For these analyses, we added as 324 325 covariates both testes mass and male body mass (Freckleton et al., 2002; Gage and 326 Freckleton, 2003) to the factors found to influence reproductive senescence traits in the 327 previous analyses, and we then updated the model selection. Fifth, we analyzed the influence 328 of the ovulation mode (i.e. spontaneous vs. induced ovulation) using another subset of species 329 (N = 40). We followed the exact same procedure by adding the ovulation mode (as a 330 categorical variable) to the previously identified set of factors influencing reproductive 331 senescence and by running model selection, for the onset and the rate of reproductive 332 senescence, respectively. For all the statistical analyses, the onset of reproductive senescence, 333 the rate of reproductive senescence, the age at first reproduction, testes mass and both female 334 and male body mass were log-transformed. All PGLS models were performed with R 4.0.0 (R 335 Core Development Team) using the packages ape (Paradis et al., 2004) and caper (Orme et 336 al., 2013). Unless otherwise stated, parameter estimates are given as  $\pm$  one standard error.

337

#### 338 **3. Results**

339

#### 340 3.1. Occurrence of female reproductive senescence across mammalian species

Reproductive senescence was detected in 68.31 % of the species (69 out of 101 species). The 341 342 probability to detect senescence was moderately influenced by the phylogeny (D = 0.61). 343 When looking at the different traits that putatively had an influence on the probability to 344 detect senescence, the selected model contains the data quality, the hunting status and the 345 sample size (Appendix C, Table S1; Table 1a). As we could expect, reproductive senescence was more often detected in longitudinal studies (80.77 %, 42 out of 52 studies) than in cross-346 sectional studies (55.10 %, 27 out of 49 studies) and the probability to detect reproductive 347 senescence increased with the sample size (slope of  $0.36 \pm 0.15$ , Table 1a, Appendix C -348 Figure S2). When the sample size was large (> 80 individuals), the probability to detect 349 reproductive senescence was above 0.5 (computed on the entire dataset). Reproductive 350

senescence was also more often detected in non-hunted populations (73.41 %, 58 out of 79
populations) than in hunted populations (50 %, 11 out of 22 populations).

353

#### **354 3.2.** Factors modulating female reproductive senescence

355 The age at the onset of senescence was strongly influenced by the phylogeny ( $\lambda$ =0.96, 95% CI 356 [0.88, 0.99]). Species that displayed a late age at the onset of reproductive senescence were 357 typically long-lived mammals (e.g. Proboscidae), which could confound the effect of the 358 phylogeny (Figure 1). To disentangle these effects, we scaled the age at the onset of 359 reproductive senescence by the age of the oldest individual sampled in the population. The 360 influence of the phylogeny on the standardized age at the onset of reproductive senescence 361 was still statistically significant but lower than the one previously observed for the absolute 362 age at the onset of reproductive senescence ( $\lambda$ =0.66, 95% CI [0.22, 0.88]; Figure 1). Three 363 cetaceans known to display extended periods of post-reproductive lifespan (see Péron et al., 364 2019a) showed very early *relative* ages at the onset of reproductive senescence (i.e. onset 365 located at 11.5%, 24.5% and 35.4% of the lifespan for G. macrorhynchus, O. orca and P. crassidens, respectively). Interestingly, when applying our statistical procedure to study 366 367 reproductive senescence in human populations (see Appendix D for an illustration), which 368 display the longest post-reproductive life ever reported in mammals, we noted a possible 369 association between an early onset of reproductive senescence and the existence of an 370 extended period of post-reproductive lifespan.

371 The selected model of among-species variation in the age at the onset of reproductive 372 senescence included both age at first reproduction (slope of  $0.45 \pm 0.12$ ) and body mass 373 (slope of  $0.10 \pm 0.04$ ) (Table 1b, Appendix C - Table S2A). As expected from the existence of 374 both time and allometric constraints on overall life histories, the onset of reproductive 375 senescence increased with both age at first reproduction and female body mass (Figure 4a, 376 4b). Once scaled, the effect of the age at first reproduction was stronger than the effect of 377 body mass (slope of  $0.40 \pm 0.11$  vs.  $0.26 \pm 0.12$ ), with an effect 1.54 times stronger. Although 378 not retained in the selected model, data quality and hunting status were also included in the 379 model with the lowest AIC value (Appendix C - Table S2A) suggesting that, for a given age at 380 first reproduction and a given body mass, the age at the onset of reproductive senescence 381 tends to be later in populations monitored longitudinally and hunted (Table 1c, Appendix C -382 Figure S3).

We then analyzed the effect of testes mass (relative to body mass) on the onset of reproductive senescence. The selected model only included the age at first reproduction 385 (Appendix C - Table S2B) but the model with the lowest AIC value included an additional negative effect of relative testes mass on the onset of reproductive senescence (slope of -0.12 386 387  $\pm$  0.07, Table 1d). For a given age at first reproduction, females with high levels of multiple 388 mating (i.e. species where males carry large testes relative to body mass) tend to show an 389 earlier age at the onset of reproductive senescence (Figure 5). Finally, the onset of 390 reproductive senescence was earlier in species with induced ovulation than in species with 391 spontaneous ovulation (Figure 6). Indeed, the selected model included both the age at first 392 reproduction and the ovulation mode (Appendix C - Table S2C, Table 1e). Moreover, the 393 effect of the ovulation mode remained statistically significant when the relative testes mass 394 was added to the model (Table 1e). Interestingly, when considering this model, the effect of 395 testes mass (controlled for body mass) was also statistically significant (Table 1f).

396 Similar to the onset of reproductive senescence, the rate of senescence was strongly 397 influenced by the phylogeny ( $\lambda$ =0.94, 95% CI [0.84, 0.99], Appendix C - Figure S4). The 398 retained model explaining variation in the rate of reproductive senescence across mammalian 399 species included both the age at first reproduction and female body mass (Table S3A), as 400 expected from both time and allometric constraints. Thus, the rate of senescence decreased 401 with increasing age at first reproduction and female body mass (Table 1g, Figure 2c, 2d). 402 However, contrary to what was observed for the age at the onset of reproductive senescence, 403 the effect of body mass on the rate of reproductive senescence was 1.48 times stronger than the effect of the age at first reproduction once both traits were scaled (slope of  $-0.83 \pm 0.22$ 404 405 vs.  $-0.56 \pm 0.20$ ). Here, we can notice that the onset of reproductive senescence was not 406 retained in the selected model (Appendix C Table S3A), which highlights that the three 407 biological times included in the analysis positively covaried, with the age at first reproduction 408 being more closely associated to the rate of reproductive senescence than the age at the onset 409 of reproductive senescence. Subsequent analyses did not reveal any detectable influence of 410 either relative testes mass or ovulation mode on the rate of reproductive senescence (Appendix 411 C - Table S3B, S3C). Importantly, when we restricted our analyses to species for which age-412 specific reproductive data are based on m<sub>x</sub> series, all results were qualitatively unchanged 413 (Appendix C - Table S3D).

414

#### 415 **4. Discussion**

#### 416 *The widespread occurrence of reproductive senescence in mammalian females*

417 Our comparative analysis provides firm evidence that reproductive senescence is widespread 418 across mammals in the wild. More specifically, we found support for an age-specific decline in reproductive performance in more than two-third (68.3%) of the species included in our
analysis, and at least four lines of evidence suggest that we currently underestimate its
occurrence.

422 First, the ability to detect reproductive senescence was much higher when analyzing 423 age-specific reproductive traits from longitudinal trajectories rather than cross-sectional data. 424 A higher accuracy in age assessment of longitudinal data compared to cross-sectional data is most likely to be involved. For instance, while longitudinal studies are performed from 425 426 known-aged individuals (generally marked near birth or within the early life period), cross-427 sectional data rely on age estimates most often based on tooth wear, which varies in reliability 428 among species (Hamlin et al., 2000). This difference in the quality of the age estimation thus 429 likely explains our results.

430 Second, the probability to detect reproductive senescence increased with sample size (i.e. the number of reproductive records per species). Therefore, the absence of reproductive 431 432 senescence in e.g. Sea Otter (Enhydra lutris) or Orangutan (Pongo pygmaeus) might simply 433 be a direct consequence of low sample size (N = 36 and N = 58 for which the probability to 434 detect senescence was only 0.40 and 0.46, respectively; see Appendix C - Figure S2). This 435 shows that we faced a lack of statistical power to detect a statistically significant decline in 436 reproductive performance in late life in some hunted populations (e.g. racoon dog, Nyctereutes procyonydes, Helle and Kauhala, 1993). It is also noteworthy that sample size 437 also influenced the shape we identified for the reproductive senescence patterns because the 438 number of segments (from 1 to 3) increased with the sample size (Appendix C - Table S5). 439

440 Third, we might have failed to detect reproductive senescence in some of the species 441 due to discrepancies between our approach and the approaches used in the original studies. To 442 compare reproductive senescence across mammalian species, we had to apply a standardized 443 approach to estimate parameters of reproductive senescence across all species, which has led to some differences in the data themselves (aggregated data per age in our study vs. individual 444 445 data in the original study) and also in the way data were analyzed. For instance, in Columbian 446 ground squirrels (Spermophilus columbianus), Broussard and colleagues (Broussard et al., 447 2003) detected reproductive senescence by comparing two groups of females (2-5 years old 448 vs. 6-9 years old), whereas we did not detect reproductive senescence by analyzing the full 449 age-dependent reproductive trajectory. Despite these constraints the species-specific estimates 450 we reported for the onset of reproductive senescence closely matched the information 451 provided in the original source (Appendix A, Table S2).

452 Lastly, there is now widespread evidence that the senescence process is asynchronous 453 among traits (Gaillard and Lemaître, 2017; Promislow et al., 2006). For instance, some 454 immune traits drop sharply with increasing age, while others remain quite constant throughout 455 life (Cheynel et al., 2017). Interestingly, the asynchrony in senescence patterns can also occur among traits within the single reproductive function (Lemaître and Gaillard, 2017). Let 456 457 compare for instance reproductive senescence in Alpine marmot (Marmota marmota) and 458 Soay sheep (Ovis aries). In marmots, female litter size decreases with increasing age but 459 offspring mass stays constant with maternal age (Berger et al., 2015b), whereas the opposite 460 is observed in Soay sheep (Hayward et al., 2013). Our analysis mostly focused on the m<sub>x</sub> 461 values but we cannot exclude that species in which we did not detect reproductive senescence 462 display age-specific decline in at least another reproductive trait. For instance, a recent meta-463 analysis demonstrated that a decreasing offspring survival with increasing maternal age is 464 widespread in mammals (Ivimey-Cook and Moorad, 2020).

Overall, current evidence suggests that reproductive senescence is - similarly to actuarial senescence - the rule rather than the exception in mammals. Nevertheless, the shape of reproductive senescence (here depicted by the variable number of segments included in the selected model, *Appendix A*, Table S1) as well as its timing (i.e. age at the onset of reproductive senescence) and intensity (i.e. rate of reproductive senescence) display a high diversity across mammalian species.

471

The influence of life history, mating behavior and ovulation mode on reproductive senescence 472 473 As predicted, we found that both the onset and the rate of reproductive senescence were 474 tightly associated with the age at first reproduction. In absence of data required to estimate 475 generation time, the age at first reproduction constitutes the most reliable proxy of the species 476 position along the slow-fast continuum (Gaillard et al., 2005). As previously acknowledged 477 by Jones et al. (2008), slow species show a later age at reproductive senescence and a lower 478 rate of reproductive senescence compared to fast species. The species ranking according to 479 the pattern of covariation in biological times is the most recognized axis of variation across 480 mammalian species (Gaillard et al., 2016; Stearns, 1983). Since both the onset and the rate of reproductive senescence can be expressed in time units (years and years<sup>-1</sup>, respectively), these 481 482 two metrics are logically aligned with the other biological times (e.g. generation time, age at 483 first reproduction, lifespan or gestation length). Moreover, as several life history traits 484 measured in time units are known to be strongly influenced by phylogeny (e.g. Capellini et 485 al., 2008 for the sleep duration; Wootton, 1987 for the age at first reproduction, Lemaître et al. 2020b for adult lifespan), it is not so surprising that both the onset and the rate of
reproductive senescence also depend on the species taxonomic position. When the onsets of
reproductive senescence are scaled by the maximum lifespan recorded in the focal
populations, (i.e. standardized for the species pace of life), the influence of the phylogeny was
unsurprisingly strongly reduced.

491 Once controlled for the species-specific pace of life, we found that traits associated 492 with female mating behavior and physiology influenced the timing of reproductive 493 senescence. Interestingly, the rate of reproductive senescence was not detectably influenced 494 by mating patterns, which adds to the growing evidence that both the onset and the rate of 495 senescence have to be investigated simultaneously when it comes to identify factors influencing senescence patterns. Contrary, to our expectations, the onset of reproductive 496 497 senescence was earlier in species with induced ovulation than in those with spontaneous 498 ovulation. This might seem surprising at first glance because the intensity of sperm 499 competition (and its possible deleterious consequences for females) are known to be higher in 500 presence of spontaneous ovulation (Iossa et al., 2008; Soulsbury and Iossa, 2010). Yet, two 501 hypotheses can be proposed to explain this unexpected result. First, in many species with 502 induced ovulation, males bear keratinized spines on the surface of the penis (e.g. Dixson, 503 1991 common marmoset Callithrix jacchus; Lemaître et al., 2012 in bank voles, Myodes 504 glareolus), which could be involved in the induction of ovulation during the mating (Parag et 505 al., 2006; Stoddart and Milligan, 1979). The density of spines on the male genitalia can in 506 some species be high, with spines being particularly sharp (Orr and Brennan, 2016; Parag et 507 al., 2006; Stockley, 2002). On the long run, repeated injuries caused by spines to the female 508 reproductive tract likely impair female's reproductive condition and might be responsible for 509 the earlier age at the onset of reproductive senescence we reported for these species. While 510 this hypothesis clearly deserves further consideration from studies performed both within and 511 across species, it might not be the whole story, as some species with spontaneous ovulation can also bear spines (e.g. in some primates, see Stockley, 2002). Another (non-mutually 512 513 exclusive) explanation is that the efficiency of the neuro-endocrinological pathway regulating 514 the relationship between mating and ovulation (reviewed in Bakker and Baum, 2000) 515 decreases with increasing age. So far, the ageing of many physiological functions governing female reproduction has been described in human and laboratory rodents (vom Saal et al., 516 517 1994). However, whether neuronal mechanisms controlling the cascade of physiological 518 responses (e.g. release of reproductive hormones by the hypothalamic-pituitary-gonadal axis)

following mating in species with induced ovulation are particularly prone to senesce iscurrently unknown.

521 We also found that - independently of the ovulation mode - species where females 522 mate multiply with different males during a given reproductive bout (i.e. when male's relative 523 testes mass is high) also suffer from an earlier onset of reproductive senescence. This 524 contrasts with a previous comparative analysis that revealed that females displaying such 525 behavior do not pay any costs in terms of reduced lifespan or strengthened actuarial 526 senescence (Lemaître and Gaillard, 2013). Overall, this suggests that the physiological costs 527 associated with multiple mating in females are paid in terms of reproductive senescence rather 528 than actuarial senescence. A few hypotheses can be elaborated to explain this link. For 529 instance, evidence that infectious diseases negatively impact reproductive success is 530 increasing (e.g. Nguyen et al., 2015; Pioz et al., 2008). The increased risk of contracting 531 sexually transmitted diseases throughout life in promiscuous females (Nunn et al., 2014) 532 might compromise reproductive performance in late life. In addition, mammalian females 533 might also suffer from the repeated exposure to the male seminal fluid. Such deleterious 534 consequences have been reported in Drosophila melanogaster, for which some specific 535 seminal fluid proteins influence various aspects of female reproductive physiology, notably 536 receptivity (see Chapman, 2001 for a review). The composition of the seminal fluid is also complex in mammals (Poiani, 2006) and can impact female reproductive physiology (e.g. by 537 inducing ovulation in some camelids, see Ratto et al., 2010). However, whether male seminal 538 fluid proteins are associated with long-term deleterious effects on female reproductive success 539 540 is yet to be investigated and constitutes one promising avenue of research.

541

#### 542 *Future directions*

We provide a first evidence of the high diversity of reproductive senescence patterns across mammals in the wild and identify key biological and behavioral factors that shape this diversity. Yet, we are only scratching the surface of the reproductive senescence conundrum and we point out below some of the most promising avenues for future research in this area.

We found a huge diversity of reproductive senescence patterns across mammalian species. Nevertheless, whether this interspecific variation translates to high variation among populations within a given species remains unknown. Indeed, while there is now compelling evidence that environmental conditions modulate age-specific survival patterns, as individuals in captivity have longer lifespan and similar or later onset of actuarial senescence than their wild conspecifics (Tidière et al. 2016), similar large-scale comparative studies are lacking for 553 reproductive senescence. Empirical studies have revealed that the amount of resources available in the environment positively influences the female reproductive output (e.g. 554 555 Persson, 2005). However, as females age, their ability to maintain large home range (e.g. Froy 556 et al., 2018 in Soay sheep, Ovis aries and red deer, Cervus elaphus), to acquire resources (e.g. 557 MacNulty et al., 2009 in wolves) or to eat and digest food (e.g. Gaillard et al. 2015 for a study 558 on tooth wear in ruminants) are impaired, which ultimately decreases the efficiency of food 559 provisioning to their progeny during the energy-demanding period of maternal care 560 (Gittleman and Thompson, 1988; Clutton-Brock et al. 1989; see also below) and thereby 561 jeopardizes their reproductive success. However, whether the quality and quantity of 562 resources available in the environment mitigate the reproductive ageing cost of these 563 functional declines remains to be investigated. Moreover, following a resource-based 564 allocation trade-off, a high reproductive effort during early life can be paid in terms of 565 increased reproductive senescence (Douhard et al., 2020; Lemaître et al., 2015; Nussey et al., 2006). For instance, it has been suggested that the early onset of reproductive senescence 566 567 reported in domestic mammals might be due to the strong artificial selection for a high 568 reproductive effort during early life in domestic animals (Mysterud et al., 2002 for sheep, 569 Grange et al. 2009 for horses, Equus caballus). Alternatively, whether these costs are rather 570 induced by a mismatch with environmental conditions remains unknown. In that context, 571 comparing mammalian populations facing contrasted environmental conditions would allow 572 assessing whether some species simply escape reproductive senescence or whether 573 particularly good environmental conditions prevent reproductive senescence to occur.

574 While we found that female mating behavior, ovulation mode, allometry and pace of 575 life all shape reproductive senescence, many other biological factors are likely to influence 576 either its onset or its rate. It is beyond the scope to list all of them but we can emphasize two 577 aspects we consider as being particularly promising: the cost of lactation and the type of placentation. In mammals, the lactation period constitutes the most energy-demanding part of 578 579 the reproductive cycle (Clutton-Brock et al., 1989) and to produce high quality milk in 580 sufficient quantity, females need to increase their food intake. Interestingly, the magnitude of 581 this extra food intake varies substantially across species (see Douhard et al., 2016; Hayssen 582 and Orr, 2017 for reviews), and the energy intake required by lactating females can 583 sometimes be two- or threefold that required during the non-breeding period (see Speakman, 2008 for some striking examples in rodents and insectivores). The physiological costs 584 585 associated to lactation are diverse and well-documented, ranging from organ remodeling (e.g. 586 increased size of liver, pancreas and mammary glands) to a risk of hyperthermia or bone loss

587 (due to the need to transfer calcium to the offspring) (Dufour and Sauther, 2002; Jasienska, 2013; Speakman, 2008). On the contrary, much less is known on the long-term fitness costs of 588 589 lactation, notably in terms of ageing. We hypothesize that the repeated physiologically costly 590 periods of lactation should translate into an earlier/and or stronger reproductive senescence. 591 Moreover, such costs are likely to be buffered or exacerbated by the quality of the 592 environment, which in turn might constitute selective pressures towards specific reproductive 593 tactics. For instance, the harsh environmental conditions faced by female white-tailed deer 594 (Odocoileus virginianus) in Minnesota (i.e. severe winters and wolf predation) might explain 595 their relatively low allocation to reproduction throughout their lives, a tactic that might ultimately minimize reproductive senescence as reported by DelGuidice and colleagues 596 597 (DelGiudice et al., 2007) in this population. Another interesting feature of the mammalian 598 reproductive machinery is the structure of the placenta that can influence the amount of 599 nutrients transferred by the mother to the fetus(es). Indeed, the morphology of the placenta is 600 highly variable across species, notably in its degree of invasiveness and interdigitation 601 (Wildman, 2011), which ultimately modulates the degree and the surface for nutrient transfer 602 during gestation (Capellini et al., 2011). Therefore, the placenta constitutes a critical organ for 603 parent-offspring conflicts (Haig, 1993). It has already been observed that the embryo growth 604 rate is approximately twice as fast in more interdigitated placentas (Capellini et al., 2011) and 605 that placenta types covary with the pace of life. Slow-living species are generally 606 characterized by an invasive placenta (i.e. hemochorial placenta) while fast species are most 607 often characterized by less invasive placenta types (i.e. endotheliochorial or epitheliochorial 608 placenta) (Garratt et al., 2013). The evolution of a less invasive placenta has allowed mothers 609 to limit fetal manipulation (i.e. when food transfer during gestation is largely under the 610 fetus(es) control) and to control better food provisioning among offspring and across 611 reproductive events (Garratt et al., 2013). Therefore - everything else being equal - such placenta types might confer to females a way to buffer reproductive senescence. 612

613 As mentioned earlier, our work focused on female reproductive rate, as females 614 concentrate the huge majority of the data published so far. However, recent studies have 615 highlighted the evolutionary relevance of studying male reproductive senescence (Lemaître 616 and Gaillard, 2017; Monaghan and Metcalfe, 2019), as well as its potential medical 617 implications (Levine et al., 2018). As a consequence, evidence that male reproductive 618 senescence is pervasive in the wild (reviewed in Lemaître and Gaillard, 2017) is 619 accumulating. Similar to what we have discussed above for females, male reproductive 620 senescence can be assessed through a large variety of traits, notably an age-specific decline in

secondary sexual traits, ejaculate quality, mating rate or reproductive success. However, to be 621 622 directly comparable, male and female reproductive senescence need to be investigated on the same trait and the potential confounding effects of the partner's age need to be accounted for 623 624 (Thorley et al., 2020). Surprisingly, we still lack a comprehensive theoretical framework for the evolution of sex differences in reproductive senescence. However, following our current 625 626 life history framework, we can expect polygynous mammals where males disproportionately 627 allocate to sexual competition to display most strongly male-biased reproductive senescence. 628 Data available so far suggest that this scenario might be true. In the monogamous meerkat 629 (Suricata suricatta), no sex difference in reproductive senescence has been detected (Thorley 630 et al., 2020) while in polygynous red deer (Cervus elaphus), the rate of reproductive senescence (measured through annual fecundity) is much steeper in males than in females 631 632 (Nussey et al., 2009; see also Muller et al., 2020 in chimpanzee, Pan troglodytes 633 schweinfurthii but see Festa-Bianchet, 2012 for some counter-examples, e.g. Bighorn sheep, 634 Ovis canadensis, in Ram mountain). Studies investigating these questions in a wider range of 635 species are now required.

- 636
- 637
- 638

#### 639 Acknowledgements:

We are thankful to Prof. Alan Cohen and Prof. Tamàs Fülöp for organizing the symposium *"Understanding the biology of aging to better intervene*" that stimulated the writing of this
article. We are grateful to Alan Cohen, Marco Festa-Bianchet and one anonymous reviewer
for their insightful comments that markedly improved our manuscript.

644

#### 645 Author contributions

JFL and JMG designed the study. JFL, JMG and VR collected, analyzed and wrote themanuscript.

648

#### 649 **Funding sources**

J. -F. L. and J. -M. G. were supported by a grant from the Agence Nationale de la Recherche
(ANR-15-CE32-0002-01). This work was performed within the framework of the LABEX
ECOFECT (ANR-11-LABX-0048) of Université de Lyon, within the program
"Investissements d'Avenir" (ANR-11-IDEX-0007) operated by the French National
Research Agency (ANR).

655	
656	<b>Declaration of Competing Interest</b>
657	The authors declare no conflict of interest
658	
659	

#### 660 **References**

- Alberts, S.C., Altmann, J., Brockman, D.K., Cords, M., Fedigan, L.M., Pusey, A., Stoinski,
  T.S., Strier, K.B., Morris, W.F., Bronikowski, A.M., 2013. Reproductive aging patterns
  in primates reveal that humans are distinct. Proceedings of the National Academy of
  Sciences 110, 13440–13445.
- Arnqvist, G., Rowe, L., 2005. Sexual conflict. Princeton University Press.
- Bakker, J., Baum, M.J., 2000. Neuroendocrine regulation of GnRH release in induced
   ovulators. Frontiers in neuroendocrinology 21, 220–262.
- Baudisch, A., Stott, I., 2019. A pace and shape perspective on fertility. Methods in Ecology
  and Evolution 10, 1941–1951.
- Berger, V., Lemaître, J.-F., Gaillard, J.-M., Cohas, A., 2015a. How do animals optimize the
  size-number trade-off when aging? Insights from reproductive senescence patterns in
  marmots. Ecology 96, 46–53.
- Berger, V., Lemaître, J.-F., Gaillard, J.-M., Cohas, A., 2015b. How do animals optimize the
  size-number trade-off when aging? Insights from reproductive senescence patterns in
  marmots. Ecology 96, 46–53.
- Berman, M., Gaillard, J.-M., Weimerskirch, H., 2009. Contrasted patterns of age-specific
  reproduction in long-lived seabirds. Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological
  Sciences 276, 375–382.
- Bininda-Emonds, O.R., Cardillo, M., Jones, K.E., MacPhee, R.D., Beck, R.M., Grenyer, R.,
  Price, S.A., Vos, R.A., Gittleman, J.L., Purvis, A., 2008. Erratum: The delayed rise of
  present-day mammals. Nature 456, 274–274.
- Bininda-Emonds, O.R., Cardillo, M., Jones, K.E., MacPhee, R.D., Beck, R.M., Grenyer, R.,
  Price, S.A., Vos, R.A., Gittleman, J.L., Purvis, A., 2007. The delayed rise of presentday mammals. Nature 446, 507.
- Bronikowski, A.M., Altmann, J., Brockman, D.K., Cords, M., Fedigan, L.M., Pusey, A.,
  Stoinski, T., Morris, W.F., Strier, K.B., Alberts, S.C., 2011. Aging in the natural world:
  comparative data reveal similar mortality patterns across primates. Science 331, 1325–
  1328.
- Broussard, D.R., Risch, T.S., Dobson, F.S., Murie, J.O., 2003. Senescence and age-related
   reproduction of female Columbian ground squirrels. Journal of Animal Ecology 72,
   212–219.
- Brunet-Rossinni, A.K., Austad, S.N., 2006. Senescence in wild populations of mammals and
  birds, in: Handbook of the Biology of Aging (Sixth Edition). Elsevier, pp. 243–266.
- Burnham, K.P., Anderson, D.R., 2003. Model selection and multimodel inference: a practical
   information-theoretic approach. Springer Science & Business Media.
- 696 Capellini, I., Barton, R.A., McNamara, P., Preston, B.T., Nunn, C.L., 2008. Phylogenetic
  697 analysis of the ecology and evolution of mammalian sleep. Evolution: International
  698 Journal of Organic Evolution 62, 1764–1776.
- Capellini, I., Venditti, C., Barton, R.A., 2011. Placentation and maternal investment in mammals. The American Naturalist 177, 86–98.
- Caughley, G., 1976. Wildlife management and the dynamics of ungulate populations. In
   'Applied Biology'.(Ed. TH Coaker.) pp. 183–246. Academic Press: New York.

- 703 Caughley, G., 1966. Mortality patterns in mammals. Ecology 47, 906–918.
- Chapman, T., 2001. Seminal fluid-mediated fitness traits in Drosophila. Heredity 87, 511–
   521.
- Cheynel, L., Lemaître, J.-F., Gaillard, J.-M., Rey, B., Bourgoin, G., Ferté, H., Jégo, M.,
  Débias, F., Pellerin, M., Jacob, L., 2017. Immunosenescence patterns differ between
  populations but not between sexes in a long-lived mammal. Scientific reports 7, 13700.
- Clutton-Brock, T.H., Albon, S.D., Guinness, F.E., 1989. Fitness costs of gestation and
  lactation in wild mammals. Nature 337, 260.
- Cohen, A.A., 2004. Female post-reproductive lifespan: a general mammalian trait. Biological
   Reviews 79, 733–750.
- Cohen, A.A., Kennedy, B.K., Anglas, U., Bronikowski, A.M., Deelen, J., Dufour, F.,
  Ferbeyre, G., Ferrucci, L., Franceschi, C., Frasca, D., *et al.* 2020. Lack of consensus on
  an aging biology paradigm? A global survey reveals an agreement to disagree, and the
  need for an interdisciplinary framework. Mechanisms of ageing and development 191,
  111316.
- Colchero, F., Jones, O.R., Conde, D.A., Hodgson, D., Zajitschek, F., Schmidt, B.R., Malo,
  A.F., Alberts, S.C., Becker, P.H., Bouwhuis, S., 2019. The diversity of population
  responses to environmental change. Ecology letters 22, 342–353.
- Coulson, J.C., Horobin, J., 1976. The influence of age on the breeding biology and survival of
   the Arctic Tern Sterna paradisaea. Journal of Zoology 178, 247–260.
- DelGiudice, G.D., Lenarz, M.S., Powell, M.C., 2007. Age-specific fertility and fecundity in northern free-ranging white-tailed deer: evidence for reproductive senescence? Journal of Mammalogy 88, 427–435.
- Dixson, A.F., 1991. Penile spines affect copulatory behaviour in a primate (*Callithrix jacchus*). Physiology & behavior 49, 557–562.
- Dormann, C.F., Elith, J., Bacher, S., Buchmann, C., Carl, G., Carré, G., Marquéz, J.R.G.,
  Gruber, B., Lafourcade, B., Leitão, P.J., 2013. Collinearity: a review of methods to deal
  with it and a simulation study evaluating their performance. Ecography 36, 27–46.
- Douhard, F., Lemaître, J.-F., Rauw, W.M., Friggens, N.C., 2016. Allometric scaling of the
   elevation of maternal energy intake during lactation. Frontiers in Zoology 13.
- Douhard, M., Festa-Bianchet, M., Pelletier, F., 2020. Sons accelerate maternal aging in a wild
   mammal. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 117, 4850–4857.
- Dufour, D.L., Sauther, M.L., 2002. Comparative and evolutionary dimensions of the
   energetics of human pregnancy and lactation. American Journal of Human Biology 14,
   584–602.
- Franks, D.W., Nattrass, S., Cant, M.A., Bradley, D.L., Giles, D., Balcomb, K.C.,
  Croft, D.P., 2018. Postreproductive lifespans are rare in mammals. Ecology and
  evolution 8, 2482–2494.
- Emlen, J.M., 1970. Age specificity and ecological theory. Ecology 51, 588–601.
- Felsenstein, J., 1985. Phylogenies and the comparative method. The American Naturalist 125,
  1–15.
- Festa-Bianchet, M., 2012. The cost of trying: weak interspecific correlations among life history components in male ungulates. Canadian Journal of Zoology 90, 1072–1085.

- Freckleton, R.P., Harvey, P.H., Pagel, M., 2002. Phylogenetic analysis and comparative data:
  a test and review of evidence. The American Naturalist 160, 712–726.
- Fritz, S.A., Purvis, A., 2010. Selectivity in mammalian extinction risk and threat types: a new measure of phylogenetic signal strength in binary traits. Conservation Biology 24, 1042–1051.
- Froy, H., Börger, L., Regan, C.E., Morris, A., Morris, S., Pilkington, J.G., Crawley, M.J.,
  Clutton-Brock, T.H., Pemberton, J.M., Nussey, D.H., 2018. Declining home range area
  predicts reduced late-life survival in two wild ungulate populations. Ecology letters 21,
  1001–1009.
- Froy, H., Lewis, S., Nussey, D.H., Wood, A.G., Phillips, R.A., 2017. Contrasting drivers of
   reproductive ageing in albatrosses. Journal of Animal Ecology 86, 1022–1032.
- Gage, M.J., Freckleton, R.P., 2003. Relative testis size and sperm morphometry across mammals: no evidence for an association between sperm competition and sperm length.
  Proceedings of the Royal Society of London. Series B: Biological Sciences 270, 625–632.
- Gaillard, J.-M., Allaine, D., Pontier, D., Yoccoz, N.G., Promislow, D.E., 1994. Senescence in natural populations of mammals: a reanalysis. Evolution 48, 509–516.
- Gaillard, J.-M., Lemaître, J.-F., 2020. An integrative view of senescence in nature. Functional
   Ecology 34, 4–16.
- Gaillard, J.-M., Lemaître, J.-F., 2017. The Williams' legacy: A critical reappraisal of his nine
   predictions about the evolution of senescence. Evolution 71, 2768–2785.
- Gaillard, J.-M., Lemaitre, J.F., Berger, V., Bonenfant, C., Devillard, S., 2016. Axes of
   variation in life histories. The Encyclopedia of Evolutionary Biology: Elsevier 312–23.
- Gaillard, J.-M., Yoccoz, N.G., Lebreton, J.-D., Bonenfant, C., Devillard, S., Loison, A.,
  Pontier, D., Allaine, D., 2005. Generation time: a reliable metric to measure life-history
  variation among mammalian populations. The American Naturalist 166, 119–123.
- Garratt, M., Gaillard, J.-M., Brooks, R.C., Lemaitre, J.-F., 2013. Diversification of the
  eutherian placenta is associated with changes in the pace of life. Proceedings of the
  National Academy of Sciences 110, 7760–7765.
- Gittleman, J.L., Thompson, S.D., 1988. Energy allocation in mammalian reproduction.
   American zoologist 28, 863–875.
- Gomendio, M., Harcourt, A.H, Roldan, Eduardo, 1998. Sperm competition in mammals. In
   Sperm competition and sexual selection (Edited by T.R. Birkhead & A.P. Moller).
   Academic Press.
- Grange, S., Duncan, P., Gaillard, J.-M., 2009. Poor horse traders: large mammals trade
  survival for reproduction during the process of feralization. Proceedings of the Royal
  Society B: Biological Sciences 276, 1911–1919.
- Haig, D., 1993. Genetic conflicts in human pregnancy. The Quarterly review of biology 68, 495–532.
- Hamlin, K.L., Pac, D.F., Sime, C.A., DeSimone, R.M., Dusek, G.L., 2000. Evaluating the
  accuracy of ages obtained by two methods for Montana ungulates. The Journal of
  Wildlife Management 441–449.
- 788 Harcourt, H., Purvis, A., Liles, L., 1995. Sperm competition: mating system, not breeding

- season, affects testes size of primates. Functional Ecology 468–476.
- Hayssen, V., Orr, T.J., 2017. Reproduction in mammals: the female perspective. JHU Press.
- Hayward, A.D., Wilson, A.J., Pilkington, J.G., Clutton-Brock, T.H., Pemberton, J.M., Kruuk,
   L.E., 2013. Reproductive senescence in female Soay sheep: variation across traits and
   contributions of individual ageing and selective disappearance. Functional Ecology 27,
   184–195.
- Helle, E., Kauhala, K., 1993. Age structure, mortality, and sex ratio of the raccoon dog in
  Finland. Journal of Mammalogy 74, 936–942.
- Iossa, G., Soulsbury, C.D., Baker, P.J., Harris, S., 2008. Sperm competition and the evolution
   of testes size in terrestrial mammalian carnivores. Functional Ecology 22, 655–662.
- 799 Ives, A.R., Garland Jr, T., 2010. Phylogenetic logistic regression for binary dependent
   800 variables. Systematic biology 59, 9–26.
- Ivimey-Cook, E., Moorad, J., 2020. The diversity of maternal-age effects upon pre-adult
   survival across animal species. Proceedings of the Royal Society B 287, 20200972.
- Jasienska, G., 2013. The fragile wisdom: an evolutionary view on women's biology and
   health. Harvard University Press.
- Jennions, M.D., Petrie, M., 2000. Why do females mate multiply? A review of the genetic
   benefits. Biological Reviews 75, 21–64.
- Jones, O.R., Gaillard, J.-M., Tuljapurkar, S., Alho, J.S., Armitage, K.B., Becker, P.H., Bize,
  P., Brommer, J., Charmantier, A., Charpentier, M., 2008. Senescence rates are
  determined by ranking on the fast-slow life-history continuum. Ecology Letters 11,
  664–673.
- Jones, O.R., Scheuerlein, A., Salguero-Gómez, R., Camarda, C.G., Schaible, R., Casper, B.B.,
  Dahlgren, J.P., Ehrlén, J., García, M.B., Menges, E.S., 2014. Diversity of ageing across
  the tree of life. Nature 505, 169.
- Kamilar, J.M., Cooper, N., 2013. Phylogenetic signal in primate behaviour, ecology and life
   history. Phil. Trans. R. Soc. B 368, 20120341.
- Karniski, C., Krzyszczyk, E., Mann, J., 2018. Senescence impacts reproduction and maternal
  investment in bottlenose dolphins. Proc. R. Soc. B 285, 20181123.
- Kasuya, T., Marsh, H., 1984. Life history and reproductive biology of the short-finned pilot
  whale, Globicephala macrorhynchus, off the Pacific coast of Japan. Report of the
  International Whaling Commission, Special 6, 259–310.
- Le Boeuf, B.J., Laws, R.M., 1994. Elephant seals: population ecology, behavior, and physiology. Univ of California Press.
- Lee, P.C., Fishlock, V., Webber, C.E., Moss, C.J., 2016. The reproductive advantages of a
  long life: longevity and senescence in wild female African elephants. Behavioral
  ecology and sociobiology 70, 337–345.
- Lemaître, J.-F., Berger, V., Bonenfant, C., Douhard, M., Gamelon, M., Plard, F., Gaillard, J. M., 2015. Early-late life trade-offs and the evolution of ageing in the wild, in: Proc. R.
   Soc. B. p. 20150209.
- Lemaître, J.-F., Gaillard, J.-M., 2017. Reproductive senescence: new perspectives in the wild:
   Reproductive senescence in the wild. Biological Reviews 92, 2182–2199.

- Lemaître, J.-F., Gaillard, J.-M., 2013. Polyandry Has No Detectable Mortality Cost in Female
   Mammals. PLoS ONE 8, e66670. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0066670
- Lemaître, J.-F., Gaillard, J.-M., Lackey, L.B., Clauss, M., Müller, D.W.H., 2013. Comparing
  free-ranging and captive populations reveals intra-specific variation in aging rates in
  large herbivores. Experimental Gerontology 48, 162–167.
- Lemaître, J.-F., Gaillard, J.-M., Ramm, S.A., 2020a. The hidden ageing costs of sperm
  competition. Ecology Letters. https://doi.org/10.1111/ele.13593
- Lemaître, J.-F., Garratt, M., Gaillard, J.-M., 2020b. Going beyond Lifespan in Comparative
  Biology of Aging. Advances in Geriatric Medicine and Research 2.
- Lemaître, J.-F., Ramm, S.A., Barton, R.A., Stockley, P., 2009. Sperm competition and brain
  size evolution in mammals. Journal of Evolutionary Biology 22, 2215–2221.
  https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1420-9101.2009.01837.x
- Lemaître, J.-F., Ramm, S.A., Jennings, N., Stockley, P., 2012. Genital morphology linked to
  social status in the bank vole (*Myodes glareolus*). Behavioral Ecology and Sociobiology
  66, 97–105. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00265-011-1257-4
- Lemaître, J.-F., Ronget, V., Tidière, M., Allainé, D., Berger, V., Cohas, A., Colchero, F.,
  Conde, D.A., Garratt, M., Liker, A., 2020c. Sex differences in adult lifespan and aging
  rates of mortality across wild mammals. Proceedings of the National Academy of
  Sciences 117, 8546–8553.
- Leslie, P.H., Ranson, R.M., 1940. The mortality, fertility and rate of natural increase of the
  vole (*Microtus agrestis*) as observed in the laboratory. The Journal of Animal Ecology
  27–52.
- Levine, H., Mohri, H., Ekbom, A., Ramos, L., Parker, G., Roldan, E., Jovine, L., Koelle, S.,
  Lindstrand, A., Immler, S., Mortimer, S., Mortimer, D., van der Horst, G., Ishijima, S.,
  Aneck-Hahn, N., Baldi, E., Menkveld, R., Rothmann, S.A., Giwercman, A.,
  Giwercman, Y., Holmberg, M., Kvist, U., Björndahl, L., Holmberg, R., Arver, S.,
  Flanagan, J., Drevet, J.R., 2018. Male reproductive health statement (XIIIth
  international symposium on Spermatology, may 9th–12th 2018, Stockholm, Sweden.
  Basic and Clinical Andrology 28, 13. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12610-018-0077-z
- Lieury, N., Drouet-Hoguet, N., Ruette, S., Devillard, S., Albaret, M., Millon, A., 2017. Rural
  populations of the red fox Vulpes vulpes show little evidence of reproductive
  senescence. Mammalian biology 87, 146–151.
- Link, W.A., Barker, R.J., 2006. Model weights and the foundations of multimodel inference.
  Ecology 87, 2626–2635.
- Lüpold, S., 2013. Ejaculate quality and constraints in relation to sperm competition levels
   among eutherian mammals. Evolution 67, 3052–3060.
- MacNulty, D.R., Smith, D.W., Vucetich, J.A., Mech, L.D., Stahler, D.R., Packer, C., 2009.
  Predatory senescence in ageing wolves. Ecology letters 12, 1347–1356.
- Monaghan, P., Charmantier, A., Nussey, D.H., Ricklefs, R.E., 2008. The evolutionary
  ecology of senescence. Functional Ecology 22, 371–378.
- Monaghan, P., Metcalfe, N.B., 2019. The deteriorating soma and the indispensable germline:
  gamete senescence and offspring fitness. Proc. R. Soc. Lond. B 286, 20192187.
- Muggeo, V.M., 2017. Interval estimation for the breakpoint in segmented regression: a
   smoothed score-based approach. Australian & New Zealand Journal of Statistics 59,

875 311–322.

- Nguyen, N., Fashing, P.J., Boyd, D.A., Barry, T.S., Burke, R.J., Goodale, C.B., Jones, S.C.,
  Kerby, J.T., Kellogg, B.S., Lee, L.M., 2015. Fitness impacts of tapeworm parasitism on
  wild gelada monkeys at Guassa, Ethiopia. American journal of primatology 77, 579–
  594.
- Nunn, C.L., Scully, E.J., Kutsukake, N., Ostner, J., Schülke, O., Thrall, P.H., 2014. Mating
  competition, promiscuity, and life history traits as predictors of sexually transmitted
  disease risk in primates. International Journal of Primatology 35, 764–786.
- Nussey, D.H., Froy, H., Lemaitre, J.-F., Gaillard, J.-M., Austad, S.N., 2013. Senescence in natural populations of animals: widespread evidence and its implications for biogerontology. Ageing research reviews 12, 214–225.
- Nussey, D.H., Kruuk, L.E., Donald, A., Fowlie, M., Clutton-Brock, T.H., 2006. The rate of
  senescence in maternal performance increases with early-life fecundity in red deer.
  Ecology Letters 9, 1342–1350.
- Nussey, D.H., Kruuk, L.E., Morris, A., Clements, M.N., Pemberton, J.M., Clutton-Brock,
   T.H., 2009. Inter-and intrasexual variation in aging patterns across reproductive traits in
   a wild red deer population. The American Naturalist 174, 342–357.
- Ollason, J.C., Dunnet, G.M., 1978. Age, experience and other factors affecting the breeding
   success of the Fulmar, *Fulmarus glacialis*, in Orkney. The Journal of Animal Ecology
   961–976.
- Orme, D., Freckleton, R., Thomas, G., Petzoldt, T., Fritz, S., 2013. The caper package:
  comparative analysis of phylogenetics and evolution in R. R package version 5, 1–36.
- 897 Orr, T.J., Brennan, P.L., 2016. All features great and small—the potential roles of the
  898 baculum and penile spines in mammals. Integrative and comparative biology 56, 635–
  899 643.
- Pagel, M., 1999. Inferring the historical patterns of biological evolution. Nature 401, 877–
   884.
- Paradis, E., Claude, J., Strimmer, K., 2004. APE: analyses of phylogenetics and evolution in
   R language. Bioinformatics 20, 289–290.
- Parag, A., Bennett, N.C., Faulkes, C.G., Bateman, P.W., 2006. Penile morphology of African
   mole rats (Bathyergidae): structural modification in relation to mode of ovulation and
   degree of sociality. Journal of Zoology 270, 323–329.
- 907 Parker, G.A., 2016. The evolution of expenditure on testes. Journal of Zoology 298, 3–19.
- 908 Parker, G.A., 1970. Sperm competition and its evolutionary consequences in the insects.
  909 Biological Reviews 45, 525–567.
- 910 Péron, G., Bonenfant, C., Lemaitre, J.-F., Ronget, V., Tidiere, M., Gaillard, J.-M., 2019a.
  911 Does grandparental care select for a longer lifespan in non-human mammals? Biological
  912 Journal of the Linnean Society 128, 360–372.
- Péron, G., Lemaître, J.-F., Ronget, V., Tidière, M., Gaillard, J.-M., 2019b. Variation in
  actuarial senescence does not reflect life span variation across mammals. PLoS biology
  17, e3000432.
- Perrins, C.M., Moss, D., 1974. Survival of young Great Tits in relation to age of female
  parent. Ibis 116, 220–224.

- Persson, J., 2005. Female wolverine (*Gulo gulo*) reproduction: reproductive costs and winter
  food availability. Canadian Journal of Zoology 83, 1453–1459.
- Peters, A., Delhey, K., Nakagawa, S., Aulsebrook, A., Verhulst, S., 2019. Immunosenescence
  in wild animals: meta-analysis and outlook. Ecology letters.
- Photopoulou, T., Ferreira, I.M., Best, P.B., Kasuya, T., Marsh, H., 2017. Evidence for a postreproductive phase in female false killer whales Pseudorca crassidens. Frontiers in zoology 14, 30.
- Pioz, M., Loison, A., Gauthier, D., Gibert, P., Jullien, J.-M., Artois, M., Gilot-Fromont, E.,
  2008. Diseases and reproductive success in a wild mammal: example in the alpine
  chamois. Oecologia 155, 691–704.
- 928 Poiani, A., 2006. Complexity of seminal fluid: a review. Behavioral Ecology and
  929 Sociobiology 60, 289–310.
- 930 Promislow, D.E., 1991. Senescence in natural populations of mammals: a comparative study.
  931 Evolution 45, 1869–1887.
- 932 Promislow, D.E., Fedorka, K.M., Burger, J.M., 2006. Evolutionary biology of aging: future
  933 directions, in: Handbook of the Biology of Aging. Elsevier, pp. 217–242.
- Ramm, S.A., Parker, G.A., Stockley, P., 2005. Sperm competition and the evolution of male
  reproductive anatomy in rodents. Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B:
  Biological Sciences 272, 949–955.
- 837 Ratto, M.H., Huanca, W., Adams, G.P., 2010. Ovulation-inducing factor: a protein
  838 component of llama seminal plasma. Reproductive Biology and Endocrinology 8, 44.
- Ricklefs, R.E., 2010. Life-history connections to rates of aging in terrestrial vertebrates.
   Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 107, 10314–10319.
- 941 Ricklefs, R.E., 2006. Embryo development and ageing in birds and mammals. Proceedings of
   942 the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 273, 2077–2082.
- 943 Ricklefs, R.E., 1998. Evolutionary theories of aging: confirmation of a fundamental
  944 prediction, with implications for the genetic basis and evolution of life span. The
  945 American Naturalist 152, 24–44.
- Ricklefs, R.E., Scheuerlein, A., 2001. Comparison of aging-related mortality among birds and
   mammals. Experimental gerontology 36, 845–857.
- Ronget, V., Gaillard, J.-M., 2020. Assessing ageing patterns for comparative analyses of
   mortality curves: Going beyond the use of maximum longevity. Functional Ecology.
- 950 Sinclair, A.R.E., 1977. The African buffalo; a study of resource limitation of populations.
- Soulsbury, C.D., 2010. Genetic patterns of paternity and testes size in mammals. PLoS One 5, e9581.
- Soulsbury, C.D., Iossa, G., 2010. The impact of ovulation mode on sperm quantity and quality
   in mammals. Evolutionary ecology 24, 879–889.
- Sparkman, A.M., Blois, M., Adams, J., Waits, L., Miller, D.A., Murray, D.L., 2017. Evidence
   for sex-specific reproductive senescence in monogamous cooperatively breeding red
   wolves. Behavioral ecology and sociobiology 71, 6.
- 958 Speakman, J.R., 2008. The physiological costs of reproduction in small mammals.
   959 Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 363, 375–398.

- 960 https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2007.2145
- Stahler, D.R., MacNulty, D.R., Wayne, R.K., VonHoldt, B., Smith, D.W., 2013. The adaptive
  value of morphological, behavioural and life-history traits in reproductive female
  wolves. Journal of Animal Ecology 82, 222–234.
- Stearns, S.C., 1983. The influence of size and phylogeny on patterns of covariation among
  life-history traits in the mammals. Oikos 173–187.
- Stockley, P., 2003. Female multiple mating behaviour, early reproductive failure and litter
  size variation in mammals. Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B: Biological
  Sciences 270, 271–278.
- Stockley, P., 2002. Sperm competition risk and male genital anatomy: comparative evidence
   for reduced duration of female sexual receptivity in primates with penile spines.
   Evolutionary Ecology 16, 123–137.
- Stockley, P., 1997. Sexual conflict resulting from adaptations to sperm competition. Trends in
   Ecology & Evolution 12, 154–159.
- Stoddart, D.M., Milligan, S.R., 1979. The copulatory pattern of the bank vole (Clethrionomys glareolus) and speculation on the role of penile spines. Journal of Zoology 188, 279–283.
- 977 Symonds, M.R., Blomberg, S.P., 2014. A primer on phylogenetic generalised least squares,
  978 in: Modern Phylogenetic Comparative Methods and Their Application in Evolutionary
  979 Biology. Springer, pp. 105–130.
- Thorley, J., Duncan, C., Sharp, S.P., Gaynor, D., Manser, M.B., Clutton-Brock, T., 2020. Sex independent senescence in a cooperatively breeding mammal. Journal of Animal
   Ecology 89, 1080–1093.
- Tidière, M., Gaillard, J.-M., Berger, V., Müller, D.W.H., Bingaman Lackey, L., Gimenez, O.,
  Clauss, M., Lemaître, J.-F., 2016. Comparative analyses of longevity and senescence
  reveal variable survival benefits of living in zoos across mammals. Scientific Reports 6.
  https://doi.org/10.1038/srep36361
- Tidière, M., Gaillard, J.-M., Müller, D.W., Lackey, L.B., Gimenez, O., Clauss, M., Lemaître,
  J.-F., 2015. Does sexual selection shape sex differences in longevity and senescence
  patterns across vertebrates? A review and new insights from captive ruminants.
  Evolution 69, 3123–3140.
- 991 Tietze, C., 1957. Reproductive span and rate of reproduction among Hutterite women.
  992 Obstetrical & Gynecological Survey 12, 727–728.
- vom Saal, F.S., Finch, C.E., Nelson, J.F., 1994. Natural history and mechanisms of
   reproductive aging in humans, laboratory rodents, and other selected vertebrates. The
   physiology of reproduction 2, 1213–1314.
- Wildman, D.E., 2011. Toward an integrated evolutionary understanding of the mammalian
   placenta 32, S142–S145.
- Wootton, J.T., 1987. The effects of body mass, phylogeny, habitat, and trophic level on mammalian age at first reproduction. Evolution 41, 732–749.

1001 Table 1: Phylogenetically controlled comparative analyses of the probability to detect 1002 reproductive senescence and on factors influencing both the onset and the rate of reproductive 1003 senescence. This table provides parameter estimates from the models discussed in the text 1004 (statistically significant effects occur in bold). For each model displayed below, the estimates 1005 are not scaled.

	Dependent variables	Independent variables	Slope ± SE	t	λ [95% CI]	N	R <sup>2</sup>
a	Probability to detect						
	reproductive senescence	Intercept	$1.29\pm0.40$	3.22	NA	101	NA
		Sample size	$0.36 \pm 0.15$	2.32			
		Hunting status	$-1.24 \pm 0.55$	-1.72			
		Data quality	$-0.71 \pm 0.41$	-1.72			
b	Onset of reproductive						
	senescence	Intercept	$0.78\pm0.59$	1.31	0.75 [NA; 0.93]	69	0.4
		Age at first	$0.45\pm0.12$	3.68			
		reproduction					
		Female body mass	$0.10\pm0.04$	2.19			
c	Onset of reproductive						
	senescence	Intercept	$0.95 \pm 0.51$	1.85	0.63 [NA; 0.91]	69	0.5
		Age at first	$0.52\pm0.12$	4.39			
		reproduction					
		Female body mass	$0.08\pm0.04$	1.92			
		Hunting status	$0.26 \pm 0.16$	1.6			
		Data quality	$\textbf{-0.28} \pm \textbf{0.13}$	-2.19			
d	Onset of reproductive						
	senescence	Intercept	$0.42 \pm 0.47$	0.91	0 [NA; 0.80]	54	0.704
		Age at first	$0.62\pm0.13$	5.05			
		reproduction					
		Testes mass	$-0.12 \pm 0.07$	-1.75			
		Male body mass	$0.16 \pm 0.07$	2.35			
e	Onset of reproductive						
	senescence	Intercept	$1.70 \pm 0.13$	13.04	0 [NA; 0.367]	40	0.74
		Age at first	$0.71 \pm 0.09$	7.96			
		reproduction					
		Ovulation mode	$-0.50 \pm 0.18$	-2.71			
f	Onset of reproductive						
	senescence	Intercept	$0.45 \pm 0.55$	0.81	0 [NA; 0.45]	34	0.78
		Age at first	$0.53 \pm 0.13$	4.11			
		reproduction					
		<b>Ovulation mode</b>	$-0.74 \pm 0.22$	-3.38			
		Testes mass	$-0.25 \pm 0.10$	-2.44			
		Male body mass	$0.23\pm0.09$	2.61			
g	Rate of reproductive						
	senescence	Intercept	$0.81\pm0.96$	0.85	0.58 [0.18;	69	0.49
		Age at first	$\textbf{-0.64} \pm \textbf{0.23}$	-2.78	0.86]		
		reproduction					
		Female body mass	$\textbf{-0.31} \pm \textbf{0.08}$	-3.85			

1006

#### 1008 Captions for figures

1009

Figure 1: Phylogenetic tree of the species analyzed. The inner band displays the occurrence
of reproductive senescence (i.e. presence vs. absence), the middle band displays the *absolute*onset of reproductive senescence (in years) and the outer band displays the *relative* onset of
reproductive senescence (absolute onset of reproductive senescence divided by the age of the
oldest individual sampled in the population, in proportion).

1015

**Figure 2**: Age-specific  $m_x$  in Bighorn sheep, *Ovis canadensis* at Ram mountain. The fit of the selected two-threshold segmented model is presented. There are three distinct phases in the age-specific reproductive trajectory. The section (A) corresponds to the increasing phase of the reproductive output for young adult females. The section (B) corresponds to a phase for prime-age females during which  $m_x$  slightly increases and the section (C) corresponds to a senescent phase characterized by both an onset and a rate of reproductive senescence.

1022

**Figure 3:** Relationship between the rate of reproductive senescence and the onset of reproductive senescence (on a log-log scale) (Slope of -0.81  $\pm$  0.22; R<sup>2</sup> = 0.17; *N*=69 species).

**Figure 4:** Relationship between the age at the onset of reproductive senescence (a) or the rate of reproductive senescence (c), and the age at first reproduction (on a log-log scale) (N=69 species). In panels (a) and (c) data are represented independently of female body mass while in panels (b) and (d) data are split according to the female body mass category (light, N=34species, heavy, N=35 species in each body mass category).

1031

**Figure 5**: Relationship between the onset of reproductive senescence and the relative testes mass (N=54 species). The onset of reproductive senescence corresponds to the residuals of the regression of the onset of reproductive senescence against the age at first reproduction (on a log-log scale). The relative testes mass corresponds to the residuals of the regression of the testes mass against the male body mass (on a log-log scale). In this model, the influence of the phylogeny is not statistically different from 0 ( $\lambda = 0$  [NA, 0.80]) and the residuals of the models were thus computed with Ordinary Least Square regressions.

**Figure 6**: Box-plot displaying the differences in the onset of reproductive senescence between species with spontaneous (N=28) and induced (N=12) ovulation. The onset of reproductive senescence corresponds to the residuals of the regression of the onset of reproductive senescence against the age at first reproduction (on a log-log scale, N=40 species). In this model, the influence of the phylogeny is not statistically different from 0 ( $\lambda = 0$  [NA, 0.37]) and the residuals of the models were thus computed with Ordinary Least Square regressions.













