



# Difficulty of the ethical decision-making process in withholding and withdrawing life-sustaining treatments in French EDs during COVID pandemic

Marion Douplat, Laurent Jacquin, Soizic Frugier, Karim Tazarourte, Pierre Le Coz

## ► To cite this version:

Marion Douplat, Laurent Jacquin, Soizic Frugier, Karim Tazarourte, Pierre Le Coz. Difficulty of the ethical decision-making process in withholding and withdrawing life-sustaining treatments in French EDs during COVID pandemic. *Scandinavian Journal of Trauma, Resuscitation and Emergency Medicine*, 2020, 28 (1), pp.78. 10.1186/s13049-020-00772-3 . hal-03027166

**HAL Id: hal-03027166**

**<https://hal.science/hal-03027166>**

Submitted on 19 Oct 2023

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License

LETTER TO THE EDITOR

Open Access



# Difficulty of the ethical decision-making process in withholding and withdrawing life-sustaining treatments in French EDs during COVID pandemic

Marion Douplat<sup>1,2\*</sup> , Laurent Jacquin<sup>3</sup>, Soizic Frugier<sup>1</sup>, Karim Tazarourte<sup>3</sup> and Pierre Le Coz<sup>2</sup>

France is one of the most impacted countries in the world by the COVID-19 pandemic, with more than 170,000 confirmed cases. Thus, one of the ethical dilemmas faced by French emergency physicians concerns the decision of withholding or withdrawing life-sustaining treatments, especially given the impact of the COVID-19. What's more, we have already shown, prior to the outbreak of COVID-19, that the decision-making process of these decisions is especially difficult in the context of emergency medicine because of the lack of time and the absence of anticipation in chronic diseases [1]. In the context of COVID-19, healthcare teams face several challenges with the decisions to withhold or withdraw life-sustaining treatments.

The first challenge is the fair allocation of medical resources depending on the area of France. Indeed, the Great East region, which was hit first by the pandemic, was the most impacted because of a shortage of critical care beds. The other regions were able to get organized in time and increased their ICU bed capacity. Several recommendations have since been proposed, setting the respect of ethical values and the necessity to treat people equally as a priority [2].

The second challenge is the communication between healthcare teams and relatives. We showed that healthcare teams expressed difficult experiences regarding the announcement and the communication with the patients

and their relatives concerning these decisions [3]. Moreover, we found that relatives suffered after a decision of withdrawing or withholding life-sustaining treatments and displayed symptoms of anxiety and depression, which persisted over time [4]. During the COVID-19 pandemic, the relatives were not physically present in EDs because of the ban on hospital visits. Therefore, lots of announcements were made by phone and may have induced additional trauma, given that relatives were not able to accompany their loved ones.

The third challenge we identified is the impact of these decisions on the healthcare teams. We found in a previous study that the decision-making process to withhold or withdraw life-sustaining treatments often triggers a feeling of isolation and being overwhelmed among ED physicians. Mental health issues have been reported among healthcare workers, especially for those who were directly engaged in the care of patients with COVID-19 [5], but no data was available concerning the impact of the decisions to withhold or withdraw life-sustaining treatments. Training healthcare teams to develop an effective communication strategy in the context of a pandemic is a fundamental step in preventing stress disorders, and must be evaluated for improvement.

## Acknowledgements

We thank Ashley Doerwald and Benjamin Douplat for the English proofreading of the manuscript.

## Authors' contributions

The original idea for this presentation was conceived by MD and PLC encouraged MD to investigate a specific aspect and supervised the findings of this work. All authors discussed the results and contributed to the final manuscript. LJ, SF and KT provided substantial input and reviewed this final manuscript. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

\* Correspondence: [marion.douplat@chu-lyon.fr](mailto:marion.douplat@chu-lyon.fr)

<sup>1</sup>Emergency Department, Lyon Sud Hospital, University Hospital, Hospices Civils of Lyon, 165 chemin du Grand Revoynet, F-69495 Pierre Bénite, France

<sup>2</sup>UMR ADÉS 7268, Aix-Marseille University/ EFS / CNRS, Espace éthique méditerranéen, Timone Adulte's Hospital, Marseille, France

Full list of author information is available at the end of the article



© The Author(s). 2020 **Open Access** This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons licence, and indicate if changes were made. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article's Creative Commons licence, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article's Creative Commons licence and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this licence, visit <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>. The Creative Commons Public Domain Dedication waiver (<http://creativecommons.org/publicdomain/zero/1.0/>) applies to the data made available in this article, unless otherwise stated in a credit line to the data.

### Funding

There is no financial support for the investigation or manuscript development.

### Competing interests

The author(s) declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship and/or publication of this article.

### Author details

<sup>1</sup>Emergency Department, Lyon Sud Hospital, University Hospital, Hospices Civiles of Lyon, 165 chemin du Grand Revoyet, F-69495 Pierre Bénite, France.

<sup>2</sup>UMR ADÉS 7268, Aix-Marseille University/ EFS / CNRS, Espace éthique méditerranéen, Timone Adulte's Hospital, Marseille, France. <sup>3</sup>Emergency Department, Édouard-Herriot Hospital, Lyon University Hospital, Hospices Civiles of Lyon, 5 place d'Arsonval, F-69003 Lyon, France.

Received: 7 July 2020 Accepted: 28 July 2020

Published online: 13 August 2020

### References

1. Douplat M, Berthiller J, Schott AM, Potinet V, Le Coz P, Tazarourte K, et al. Difficulty of the decision-making process in emergency departments for end-of-life patients. *J Eval Clin Pract*. 2019;25:1–7.
2. Emanuel EJ, Persad G, Upshur R, Thome B, Parker M, Glickman A, Zhang C, Boyle C, Smith M, Phillips JP. Fair allocation of scarce medical resources in the time of Covid-19. *N Engl J Med*. 2020;382(21):2049–55.
3. Douplat M, Fraticelli L, Claustre C, Peiretti A, Serre P, Bischoff M, Jacquin L, Freyssenge J, Schott AM, Tazarourte K, Frugier S, Khoury CEL, LAT group. Management of decision of withholding and withdrawing life-sustaining treatments in French EDs. *Scand J Trauma Resusc Emerg Med*. 2020;28(1):52.
4. Douplat M, Masbou H, Tazarourte K, Berthiller J, Potinet V, Le Coz P, Schott AM, Jacquin L. Symptoms of anxiety and depression in relatives after decisions of withholding and withdrawing life-sustaining treatments in emergency departments. *Eur J Emerg Med*. 2020. <https://doi.org/10.1097/MEJ.0000000000000669>.
5. Lai J, Ma S, Wang Y, et al. Factors associated with mental health outcomes among health care workers exposed to coronavirus disease 2019. *JAMA Netw Open*. 2020;3(3):e203976.

### Publisher's Note

Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

**Ready to submit your research? Choose BMC and benefit from:**

- fast, convenient online submission
- thorough peer review by experienced researchers in your field
- rapid publication on acceptance
- support for research data, including large and complex data types
- gold Open Access which fosters wider collaboration and increased citations
- maximum visibility for your research: over 100M website views per year

**At BMC, research is always in progress.**

Learn more [biomedcentral.com/submissions](https://biomedcentral.com/submissions)

