

## Unraveling intrinsic correlation effects with angle-resolved photoemission spectroscopy

Jianqiang Sky Zhou, Lucia Reining, Alessandro Nicolaou, Azzedine Bendounan, Kari Ruotsalainen, Marco Vanzini, J. Kas, J. Rehr, Matthias Muntwiler, Vladimir Strocov, et al.

### ▶ To cite this version:

Jianqiang Sky Zhou, Lucia Reining, Alessandro Nicolaou, Azzedine Bendounan, Kari Ruotsalainen, et al.. Unraveling intrinsic correlation effects with angle-resolved photoemission spectroscopy. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America, 2020, 117 (46), pp.28596-28602. 10.1073/pnas.2012625117. hal-03013847

## HAL Id: hal-03013847 https://hal.science/hal-03013847v1

Submitted on 9 Oct 2021

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

# Unraveling intrinsic correlation effects with angle-resolved photoemission spectroscopy

Jianqiang Sky Zhou<sup>a,b,c</sup>, Lucia Reining<sup>a,b,1</sup>, Alessandro Nicolaou<sup>d</sup>, Azzedine Bendounan<sup>d</sup>, Kari Ruotsalainen<sup>d</sup>, Marco Vanzini<sup>a,b,e</sup>, J. J. Kas<sup>f</sup>, J. J. Rehr<sup>f</sup>, Matthias Muntwiler<sup>g</sup>, Vladimir N. Strocov<sup>g</sup>, Fausto Sirotti<sup>h,1</sup>, and Matteo Gatti<sup>a,b,d,1</sup>

<sup>a</sup>Laboratoire des Solides Irradiés, École Polytechnique, CNRS, CEA/DRF/IRAMIS, Institut Polytechnique de Paris, F-91128 Palaiseau, France; <sup>b</sup>European Theoretical Spectroscopy Facility (ETSF); <sup>C</sup>Sorbonne Universitè, CNRS, Institut des Nanosciences de Paris, UMR7588, F-75252, Paris, France; <sup>d</sup>Synchrotron SOLEIL, L'Orme des Merisiers, Saint-Aubin, BP 48, F-91192 Gif-sur-Yvette, France; <sup>e</sup>Theory and Simulation of Materials (THEOS), École Polytechnique Fédérale de Lausanne, CH-1015 Lausanne, Switzerland; <sup>f</sup>Department of Physics, University of Washington, Seattle, Washington 98195-1560, USA; <sup>g</sup>Swiss Light Source, Paul Scherrer Institut, CH-5232 Villigen PSI, Switzerland; <sup>h</sup>Laboratoire de Physique de la Matière Condensée, CNRS, École Polytechnique, Institut Polytechnique de Paris, F-91128 Palaiseau, France

This manuscript was compiled on October 9, 2021

Interaction effects can change materials properties in intriguing 1 ways, and they have in general a huge impact on electronic spec-2 tra. In particular, satellites in photoemission spectra are pure many-3 body effects, and their study is of increasing interest in both exper-4 iment and theory. However, the intrinsic spectral function is only 5 a part of a measured spectrum, and it is notoriosly difficult to ex-6 tract this information, even for simple metals. Our joint experimen-7 tal and theoretical study of the prototypical simple metal aluminum 8 demonstrates how intrinsic satellite spectra can be extracted from 9 measured data using angular resolution in photoemission. A novel 10 kind of non-dispersing satellite is detected, which is due to electron-11 electron interactions and the thermal motion of the atoms. Additional 12 non-dispersing intensity comes from the inelastic scattering of the 13 outgoing photoelectron. The intrinsic spectral function, instead, has 14 satellites that disperse both in energy and in shape. Theory and the 15 information extracted from experiment describe these features with 16 very good agreement. 17

ARPES | Plasmon satellites | First principles calculations

hotoemission spectroscopy is one of the most direct experimental tools to access band structures and excitation 2 spectra of materials (1). Although the Coulomb interaction 3 between electrons leads to a renormalization of energies and 4 to lifetime broadening, the resulting quasiparticle (QP) band 5 structure can usually still be detected, and, moreover, reproduced and interpreted using first-principles theoretical approaches (2, 3). However, the QPs constitute only part of the 8 measured spectra. They are usually accompanied by an inco-9 herent background and a series of additional structures called 10 satellites, over a binding-energy range of several tens of eV. 11 The satellite part of the spectra is in general much less studied 12 than the QPs, although it is intriguing: whereas QPs can be 13 understood qualitatively in a non-interacting picture, satellites 14 are pure many-body effects (2). They cannot, by definition, 15 be interpreted from a single-particle point of view. Therefore, 16 they carry information complementary to the insight gained 17 from the band structure. 18

19 To access this information, however, is difficult, and to quantify correlation effects from experiment alone, most often 20 impossible. This holds true even for the simplest cases, such as 21 plasmon satellites in simple metals, because intrinsic spectral 22 functions are buried under strong additional contributions in 23 the experiment. Theory and first principles calculations can 24 give additional insight and indeed, the existence of satellite 25 series is understood in terms of one or more bosonic excitations 26 when an electron is removed from the sample (4-6). When the 27

bosons are due to electronic excitations, this is translated into 28 first principles calculations in the so-called GW+cumulant 29 (GW+C) approach, where the screened Coulomb interaction 30 W reflects the excitations (7); phonons can be treated in a 31 similar way (8-10). The approach is increasingly popular, 32 with an extension from the original core level spectroscopy 33 applications (1, 4-6, 11) to valence bands (12-23), where 34 completely new questions linked to the dispersion of bands 35 and satellites appear. Like for the core levels, the existence 36 and energies of the satellites are explained by GW+C also in 37 the valence band, but the satellite intensity is not: in general, 38 calculated satellites are much weaker than measured ones. 39 This is a major drawback: while the energy carries precious 40 information about the nature of the boson, the intensity is a 41 measure of the correlation strength. 42

In this work, we show that *angle-resolved* photoemission 43 spectroscopy (ARPES) can be used to overcome this difficulty. 44 In the simplest view on dispersion, one would expect excita-45 tions at each point in the Brillouin zone to be approximately 46 independent (14); in that case experiment and GW+C calcu-47 lations should find plasmon or phonon replicas that disperse 48 in energy following the QP bands. These replicas were indeed 49 observed both in theory and angle-resolved experiment (16-50 19), but no quantitative comparison could be made. The main 51 reason is the fact that first-principles calculations determine 52

#### Significance Statement

Photoemission spectra reflect the many-body electronic structure of materials. The main peaks whose energies vary as function of angle-resolved momentum usually correspond to the band structure. Replica of these peaks, called satellites, are entirely due to interactions. Therefore, they could be used to detect the strength of electronic correlation in a material, if intrinsic features were not buried by other scattering effects. This study demonstrates how intrinsic satellites can be unraveled from measured spectra using angular resolution and insights on the origin of non-dispersing satellite contributions. Consequently angle-resolved photoemission can be used to set an unambiguous lower bound on the strength of correlation.

The authors declare no competing interests

<sup>1</sup>To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail: lucia.reining@polytechnique.edu, fausto.sirotti@polytechnique.edu, matteo.gatti@polytechnique.edu.

M.G., L.R., F.S., V.S. and J.S.Z. designed the project; A.B., M.M., A.N., K.R., F.S., M.V. and J.S.Z. performed experiments; M.G., J.J.K., J.J.R and J.S.Z. performed calculations; all authors discussed the results, and M.G., L.R., F.S., and J.S.Z. wrote the paper with contributions from all authors.



Fig. 1. (a) and (c) Calculated spectral functions and (b) experimental ARPES image in the  $\Gamma$ L direction. The results of *ab initio* GW+C calculations are (a) without and (c) with the Debye-Waller contribution and extrinsic and interference effects.

the *intrinsic* spectral function *stemming from the valence band in a perfectly ordered crystal*, while this is only a small part of the experimental spectrum. In the following, we propose a way to extract this information from the measured data, and we explain effects that were not noticed previously, both in the intrinsic dispersing spectral function and in the total measured spectra.

#### 60 Results

Overview. The experimental ARPES image obtained at 624 eV 61 photon energy is shown in Fig. 1(b). One can clearly see the 62 parabolic valence band of aluminum and its replica at a shift 63 of about 15 eV. This shift is consistent with the bulk plasmon 64 energy of aluminum (24). The GW+C intrinsic theoretical 65 spectra, shown in Fig. 1(a), are in qualitative agreement with 66 experiment concerning the valence bands and the presence 67 of a dispersing satellite, similar to previous observations for 68 silicon (16–18). Moreover, the existence of higher-order satel-69 70 lite replicas is confirmed, as expected from GW+C. Still, the comparison of theoretical and experimental panels shows large 71 differences, of the order of the spectra themselves. An attempt 72 to explain the valence spectra of aluminum was also made in 73 (12, 13), by comparing results of GW+C calculations and elec-74 tron momentum spectroscopy, but this did not give access to 75 angle-resolved spectra, and significant discrepancies remained. 76 In the present work, we include corrections due to inelastic 77 scattering and temperature, leading to the final theoretical 78 results in Fig. 1(c), in very good agreement with experimental 79 spectra in Fig. 1(b). 80

The ideal intrinsic spectral function. Let us start with the cru-81 cial question: Is it possible to infer information about the 82 intrinsic spectral function from the experiment? The most 83 important contributions beyond the ideal intrinsic spectral 84 function should be due to inelastic scattering of the outgoing 85 86 photoelectron, temperature effects, and disorder. In all those cases, the photoelectron should lose its angular resolution. 87 This would mean that even if the ideal intrinsic spectral func-88 tion is only a small part of the spectra, it should dominate 89 the variation of the spectra throughout the Brillouin zone. 90

To test this hypothesis, we take the difference between spectra measured at different angles and we consider the most different spectral functions, which are observed at  $\Gamma$  and L, after subtracting a Shirley background. The resulting difference



Fig. 2. Differences between spectra at the  $\Gamma$  and L points, at 293, 624 and 1100 eV photon energies: experimental results (black dots) are compared with calculations of intrinsic spectral functions (green lines).



**Fig. 3.** (a)  $\operatorname{Im}\Sigma_{xc}^{\ell}(\omega + \varepsilon_{\ell})$  at  $\Gamma$  (black) and L (red), (b) The corresponding intrinsic spectral function  $A_{\ell}(\omega)$  at  $\Gamma$  and L. The QPs at  $\Gamma$  and L are aligned.

spectra are shown in Fig. 2 for photon energies of 293, 624 95 and 1100 eV. The negative feature close to the Fermi energy 96 is due to the QP peak at L, and the following positive one is 97 the QP at  $\Gamma$ . A clear satellite difference structure is found 98 between -15 eV and -30 eV. All experimental features are 99 perfectly well represented by the calculated difference of intrin-100 sic spectral functions. This shows that the GW+C approach 101 captures the many-body effects leading to the ideal intrinsic 102 valence band satellites in a quantitative, very precise, way. 103 Most importantly, it unambiguously supports our idea to use 104 angle resolution in order to extract intrinsic information from 105 the experiment. 106

On top of the dispersion in energy, the satellites also show 107 a strong shape dispersion. In Fig. 3(b) the calculated spectral 108 functions at  $\Gamma$  and L are compared by aligning the QP. In 109 particular, whereas the QP is much sharper at L than at  $\Gamma$ 110 due to lifetime broadening, the first intrinsic satellite is strong 111 and sharp at  $\Gamma$ , and much more washed out at L; note that 112 the satellite contribution at  $\Gamma$  looks more important at first 113 sight, because the lifetime broadening of the QP contributes 114 weight in the same energy region. 115

The fact that the satellite shape does not follow the QP shape may seem surprising. It is a feature that is intimately linked to the dispersion of the valence band: the imaginary part of the self-energy, which determines the satellites, is dominated 119



**Fig. 4.** The spectra at 624 eV photon energy at  $\Gamma$  and L. The Fermi energy is set to zero. Light green area is the ideal (i.e., zero-temperature) intrinsic angle-resolved spectral function  $A_{\mathbf{k}}^{int}(\omega)$ , yellow area is the angle-integrated  $D^{int}(\omega)$  weighted by the Debye-Waller coefficient. Their sum is the black dashed curve and corresponds to the total intrinsic spectral function. The light brown area is a Shirley background derived from the integral of extrinsic and interference spectral intensities. The total theoretical spectrum (red line) is the sum of the total intrinsic spectral function, the background, and extrinsic and interference effects as predicted by a calculation based on the parameter-free model (26). It compares very well to the ARPES data (black dots).

by the excitation of the QP plus one or more bosons, but even 120 for moderate coupling strength it also contains other possible 121 excitations. Therefore, the satellites are *not* simple replica 122 of the valence bands. In a simple metal like Al, electrons 123 are coupled with the valence plasmon, which has a parabolic 124 dispersion as a function of its wavevector **q**. In the coupling 125 with a single core level, which is very localized and has no 126 dispersion, the shape of the satellites is entirely governed by the 127 plasmon dispersion: it produces an asymmetric lineshape for 128 each satellite, in general with a tail to higher binding energies 129 (1, 6). In the valence band region of aluminum electrons are 130 delocalized, and they couple therefore mostly with plasmons 131 with momentum  $\mathbf{q}$  close to 0. Indeed, while the calculated 132 plasmon dispersion in Al ranges from 15 eV at  $\mathbf{q} \rightarrow 0$  to about 133 25 eV at  $\mathbf{q} = 1.0$  Bohr<sup>-1</sup> (see, e.g., figure 8 in Ref. (25)), the 134 peaks of the imaginary part of the exchange-correlation self-135 energy Im $\sum_{xc}^{\ell\ell} (\omega + \varepsilon_{\ell})$  shown in Fig. 3(a) are centred around 136 15 eV. Still, there is broadening, because other close lying 137 QP excitations mix in. This asymmetric broadening therefore 138 depends on the energies of the QP excitations available in 139 the neighborhood of the measured  $\mathbf{k}$  point. Since the band 140 is flat and upwards dispersing at  $\Gamma$  whereas it is steep and 141 quite symmetric at L, this neighbourhood is different for the 142 two  $\mathbf{k}$  points, so the satellites are different. More generally, 143 also close lying bands will contribute to this effect, and the 144 characteristic shape of the valence band satellites, and its 145 dispersion, is governed by the density of valence states. The 146 equations for a more formal discussion can be found in the 147 148 Methods section.

Non-dispersing satellites: a temperature effect. The excellent 149 agreement of the difference spectra in Fig. 2 leaves no doubt 150 that the intrinsic contribution of the ideal crystal to the spec-151 tral function is actually quite small. Even better than in the 152 overview Fig. 1, this can be appreciated in Fig. 4, which 153 compares experimental and calculated spectra at 624 eV pho-154 ton energy, at the  $\Gamma$  and L points. The light green areas 155 are theoretical intrinsic spectral functions, and black dots are 156 measured spectra. While some of the experimental structures 157 can be identified in the calculated spectra, in particular the 158 QPs at  $\Gamma$  and L, and part of the satellite structures, others are 159 completely absent in the calculation: for example, the shoulder 160 that is measured on the first satellite around -20 eV. This qual-161 itative disagreement suggests that more interesting features 162 remain to be discovered. In a real experiment on a real sample, 163 spectra may consist of numerous potential contributions. Here 164 we choose to concentrate on the following question: Given the 165 quasiparticles, what satellite spectra are predicted by theory, 166 how well does this prediction match experiment, and what does 167 this tell us about the physics? As we will see, even a simple 168 metal like aluminum constitutes a rich playground. 169

In order to understand satellites, one has to start with the 170 QP. In the QP region, the big difference between the measured 171 spectra and the intrinsic spectral function is the important 172 spectral weight close to the Fermi level that appears in the 173 experimental spectrum taken at  $\Gamma$ , where aluminum should 174 have no valence band intensity. The presence of such additional 175 intensity in the QP band-structure region has been discussed as 176 a consequence of Debye-Waller (DW) effects on photoemission 177 matrix elements<sup>\*</sup> (28–30): Even at temperatures as low as 178 50 K, in aluminum the disordered thermal vibrations of the 179 atoms destroy the **k**-selectivity of the ARPES, giving rise to 180 a non-dispersive component in the spectrum, which amounts 181 to integrating the different contributions from the  $\mathbf{k}$ -resolved 182 spectra over the BZ (31). For increasing photon energy and 183 temperature, the  $\mathbf{k}$ -integrated spectrum tends to become the 184 dominant component, thus being one of the limiting factors for 185 the angle resolution in hard x-ray photoemission spectroscopy 186 experiments (32-34). 187

Since aluminum is a metal, the loss of **k**-resolution explains 188 the fact that even in our experimental spectrum at  $\Gamma$ , which is 189 at the bottom of the band, much intensity is found at the Fermi 190 level. Other possible explanations such as surface photoelectric 191 effects (35, 36) and the  $k_z$  intrinsic broadening of the final 192 state (37) were discarded here since they are not sufficient to 193 reproduce this additional intensity. We can also exclude many-194 body effects neglected in GW+C, in particular electronic recoil, 195 see e.g. Sec. 4.3 in (38). The neglect of recoil is more justified 196 close to  $\Gamma$ , where the band is flat, than at L, where it is very 197 steep. Instead we observe similar agreement with experiment 198 at the two points. Moreover, the recoil approximation refers to 199 the intrinsic spectral function, so there would be no explanation 200 for the photon energy dependence. We therefore suppose that 201 DW is the dominant mechanism. 202

In the simplest approximation, the **k**-resolved and **k**integrated components are weighted by the Debye-Waller factors  $\mathcal{W}$  and  $1 - \mathcal{W}$ , respectively. We determine  $\mathcal{W}$  by fitting the spectra in the QP region, using the angle-resolved and Brillouin zone-integrated QPs of the calculated spectra (light 207

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>\*</sup>Note that this is different from the electron-phonon interaction (27), which can affect the QP energy and produce satellites in the **k**-resolved spectral function (9, 10), with binding energy smaller than the present experimental resolution.

green and vellow areas respectively). The QP spectra at  $\Gamma$  and 208 L are very well reproduced by a single coefficient,  $\mathcal{W} = 0.46$ . 209 This observation supports the assumption that temperature 210 is the main responsible for the non-dispersing QP spectral 211 weight. Moreover, according to (29) the Debye-Waller factor 212 is approximately given by:  $\mathcal{W} = \exp\left[-\frac{1}{3}\Delta k^2 \langle U^2(T) \rangle\right]$ , where 213  $\Delta k$  is the momentum transfer at the photon energy of the mea-214 surement and  $\langle U^2(T) \rangle$  is the three-dimensional mean-squared 215 vibrational displacement, which can be estimated using the 216 Debye temperature of the material and the temperature T217 of the sample. For bulk aluminum at 77 K, the model esti-218 mates  $\mathcal{W} = 0.53$  which is consistent with our finding and gives 219 additional support to our hypothesis. Finally, the fit of the 220 QP is refined by adding two extra peaks with the shape of 221 the QP at  $\Gamma$ , at 10.8 and 8 eV binding energy, respectively. 222 Their weights are very small, and given for completeness in 223 the Supplementary Information (SI). 224

While the importance of DW on the band-structure region 225 is established (28-30), its effect on satellites, to the best of our 226 knowledge, has not heretofore been investigated. The question 227 is therefore whether, and in which way, the DW physics is 228 also responsible for strong modifications of the satellites. It is 229 reasonable to surmise that plasmon satellites are created in 230 the same way in ordered and thermally disordered systems. 231 This would suggest that the angle-integrated QP component 232 due to the DW effect leads to angle-integrated satellites, in 233 the same way as for the angle-resolved QPs and their satellites. 234 If this hypothesis were true, one should be able to describe 235 QPs and satellites with a similar DW approach. We therefore 236 adopt the following procedure: We call  $A_{\mathbf{k}}^{int}$  the calculated 237 **k**-resolved intrinsic spectral function, including its satellites, 238 and  $D^{int}(\omega)$  the corresponding **k**-integrated spectrum. 239

The total intrinsic spectral function is then obtained as the 240 weighted sum  $\mathcal{W}A^{int}_{\mathbf{k}}(\omega) + (1-\mathcal{W})D^{int}(\omega)$ . The result is the 241 black dot-dashed curve in Fig. 4. One can now recognize all 242 the main features of the experimental spectra, including the 243 tendency to form a shoulder on the low-binding-energy side of 244 the satellites. Clearly, the non-dispersing DW satellites give a 245 very important contribution to the spectra, and they explain, 246 at least qualitatively, the observed spectral shape. 247

Scattering contributions to the non-dispersing satellites. It 248 should not be expected that the intrinsic spectral function 249 compares quantitatively with experiment, since it does not 250 include effects due to inelastic scattering of the outgoing pho-251 252 toelectron, called extrinsic and interference effects (39). The 253 magnitude and consequences of these effects have been subject to vivid discussion; see, e.g. (1, 40-43). Usually they are 254 neglected in first-principles calculations. Recently the model 255 approach of Refs. (6, 26, 44) was combined with first-principles 256 calculations of spectral functions to discuss angle-integrated 257 spectra of silicon (14), and comparison with experiment was 258 significantly improved with respect to a purely intrinsic cal-259 260 culation. In this approach, the enhancement of satellites due to inelastic scattering is derived from the semi-infinite homo-261 geneous electron gas. However, it applies to angle-integrated 262 spectra. Here, we extend this parameter-free approach to the 263 case of ARPES. 264

The new difficulty is that both the angle-resolved and angleintegrated intrinsic  $A_{\mathbf{k}}^{int}(\omega)$  and  $D^{int}(\omega)$  require extrinsic and interference corrections, due to the scattering of the respective photoelectrons. However, one should expect that the inelastic scattering of the outgoing electrons from the angle-resolved 269 electrons also leads to a loss of  $\mathbf{k}$ -resolution (44). This explains 270 why difference spectra directly yield the *intrinsic* spectral 271 functions. It means that it would not be correct to enhance 272 the angle-resolved satellites in the same way as the angle-273 integrated contributions. Instead, we determine the satellite 274 enhancement following the approach in (14), deduce from this 275 the scattering contributions for each  $\mathbf{k}$ -point and integrate 276 them over the Brillouin zone. Details are given in the Methods 277 section and the SL 278

Finally, there is a background of secondary processes that is 279 proportional to the part of the spectrum due to inelastic scat-280 tering. To take this into account we add a Shirley background 281 (light brown areas) created solely by the extrinsic/interference 282 contributions, reflecting the fact that most of the scattering 283 is already accounted for explicitly. The red curves in Fig. 4 284 and Fig 1(c) are our final result. The agreement with ARPES 285 data is very good. Note that besides a single factor scaling 286 the intensity of the secondary electron background, these re-287 sults have been obtained without any free parameter in the 288 description of the satellites. 289

Photon energy dependence. The photon energy dependence 290 further supports our interpretation. We have taken spectra 291 at 1100 eV and followed in detail the same procedure as for 292 624 eV. At higher photon energy the DW factor  $\mathcal{W}$  should 293 decrease, because the momentum transfer enters the negative 294 exponent, as explained above. This is indeed the case: Fig. 295 5 shows results for a photon energy of 1100 eV. Our fit on 296 the QP predicts a decrease of the Debye-Waller factor to a 297 value of  $\mathcal{W} = 0.395$ . This is consistent with the DW model 298 (29), which would yield a decrease to  $\mathcal{W} = 0.33$  at T=77 K, 299 whereas it rules out an important role of intrinsic disorder. 300 It gives further strong evidence for our conjecture, where the 301 intrinsic part of the dispersionless satellites consists of shape-302 modified replica of QPs with a loss of k-resolution due to 303 the DW effect, reflecting therefore directly the peaks in the 304 density of valence states. Also the photon-energy dependent 305 extrinsic and interference contributions are well described by 306 our calculations, as can be seen from the very good agreement 307 between experiment and the final theoretical results in Fig. 5. 308

#### Discussion

Altogether, our joint experimental and theoretical study yields 310 an understanding of the photoemission spectra of aluminum 311 well beyond the simple picture of bands and their plasmon 312 replicas, suggesting how to overcome some major problems of 313 the interpretation of photoemission data, and opening several 314 interesting and general perspectives. First, there is a long 315 standing gap between theory and experiment, with theory 316 mostly focusing on the description of correlation effects in the 317 intrinsic spectral function of the ideal crystal, which is only 318 a fraction of the experimental result. We have shown how 319 information concerning the ideal intrinsic spectral function 320 (i.e. without thermal atomic vibrations, and without extrinsic 321 scattering of the photoelectron, and interference effects) can 322 be extracted from ARPES measurements, and we have found 323 that there is excellent agreement between these experimental 324 results and the calculated intrinsic spectral functions. Interest-325 ingly, the intrinsic satellites have a shape that is determined 326 by the valence density of states, rather than by the plasmon 327

309



Fig. 5. The spectra at 1100 eV photon energy for the  $\Gamma$  and L points. The theoretical spectra (red lines) are obtained as in Fig. 4.

dispersion, which instead determines the shape of core level 328 satellites. We have also shown that atomic thermal motion 329 causes the appearance of dispersionless satellites, due to a 330 loss of momentum conservation for both the QPs and their 331 satellites. These dispersionless satellites can be pronounced 332 in the valence spectra, corresponding to replicas of peaks in 333 the density of states, and they should not be confused with 334 signals due to impurities. They are reinforced by inelastic 335 scattering of the outgoing photoelectrons, which lose momen-336 tum resolution and energy by exciting electron-hole pairs and 337 plasmons. Once cross sections and surface effects are fitted 338 on the quasiparticles, our calculations of the final spectra 339 are parameter-free, besides a scaling factor for the remain-340 ing secondary electron background. For photon energies of 341 624 eV and 1100 eV, where measurements start to be bulk 342 sensitive, they lead to very good agreement with experiment. 343 This agreement and the observed trends fully confirm our 344 conjectures. Since none of our calculations explicitly includes 345 the real surface, the agreement should be much worse at lower 346 photon energies, where the measurements are clearly surface 347 348 sensitive. Interestingly, this does not hold for the dispersing 349 part of the intrinsic spectral function that is still very well described, as can be seen in Fig. 2. This indicates that it 350 is a bulk property that can be extracted from ARPES even 351 at low photon energy. Instead, the thermal motion of atoms 352 at the surface is larger than in the bulk, which leads to an 353 enhancement of the DW effect (29). More generally, scattering 354 appears to be much increased, well beyond the predictions 355 based on the semi-infinite homogeneous electron gas (6, 26, 44). 356 An illustration for 293 eV can be found in the SI. 357

Our results open several broad perspectives: in particular, aluminum exhibits a relatively strong DW effect, but it is not a singular case: many other metals or semiconductors, such as silicon, are equally good candidates for materials where this new kind of dispersionless satellites should be observable. Indeed, one may note, e.g., several sharp dispersionless features visible in the valence band QP region of the photoemission spectra of silicon (see Fig. 1(a) of (17)), at energies correspond-365 ing to peaks in the density of states of silicon. This suggests 366 that a closer analysis of the data in the satellite region, for 367 silicon and for other materials with a similarly strong DW 368 effect, should indeed reveal their replica. The fact that valence 369 band satellites disperse not only in energy, but also in shape, 370 also merits further attention. This information is difficult to 371 extract from classical overview spectra such as the one given 372 in Fig. 1, whereas our work suggests how to simulate and 373 analyze single spectra. 374

Most importantly, since we have shown that the intrinsic 375 spectral properties may be isolated in the experiment by tak-376 ing difference spectra, the analysis of the contributions linked 377 to dispersing QPs allows one to isolate ideal intrinsic, temper-378 ature, and extrinsic/interference effects. This highlights the 379 important role that ARPES measurements may play in order 380 to unambiguously distinguish intrinsic correlation effects from 381 other factors that dominate the experiments. The importance 382 of a tight interplay of theory and experiment in order to obtain 383 deeper understanding is particularly noteworthy to stress, and 384 the procedure suggested here may be useful for many further 385 investigations on other materials. 386

#### **Materials and Methods**

We have performed state-of-the-art ARPES measurements and first-principles GW+C calculations of aluminum (45), yielding the band structure and the first three dispersing satellites along the  $\Gamma L$  direction of the Brillouin zone. Data supporting this article are available from the authors upon reasonable request.

387 388

389

390

391

392

393

Experiment. ARPES experiments were performed at about 50 K 394 using a Scienta EW4000 hemispherical electron analyzer at the 395 PEARL beamline of the Swiss Light Source (46). The Al $(\overline{101})$ 396 surface was prepared with several sputtering and annealing cycles 397 until the observation of an oxygen contamination below 1% of a 398 monolayer and a sharp low-energy electron diffraction pattern. The 399 single-crystal sample contained about 0.02% atom concentration 400 of Ta impurities. Because of their extremely high cross section, Ta 401 4f photoelectrons show up as a sharp doublet line in the spectrum 402 at the characteristic binding energies of 21.7 and 23.57 eV. Two 403 Gaussian peaks at these energies have thus been removed in the 404 angle-resolved spectra. Raw data are shown in the SI. 405

Photon-energy dependent ARPES experiments were used to 406 measure the Fermi surface periodicity in the surface-normal  $(k_z)$ 407 direction and to identify the photon energies corresponding to the 408  $\Gamma$  points of 4 consecutive Brillouin zones. ARPES experiments on 409 a 60 eV binding energy range were then performed at  $h\nu = 293$ 410 eV, 624 eV and 1100 eV photon energies. These correspond to 411 small deviations along the  $k_z$ -direction, which at  $\Gamma$  were evaluated 412 respectively as: -0.1, 0.15 and 0.29 of  $\Gamma K$  (and similarly for the 413 other points along  $\Gamma$ L). The energy and angular resolutions at 293 414 eV photon energy were 0.12 eV and 1/20 of  $\Gamma$ L, respectively; 0.18 415 eV and 1/14 of  $\Gamma$ L at 624 eV; and 0.45 eV and 1/10 of  $\Gamma$ L at 1100 416 eV. The spectra at  $h\nu = 293$  eV are highly surface sensitive and are 417 given in the SI for completeness. For quantitative comparison with 418 theory, the experimental spectra have been corrected for the change 419 of intensities throughout the Brillouin zone due to photoelectron 420 diffraction (47, 48) by normalizing intensities of non-dispersing 421 features. More details can be found in the SI. 422

Theory of the intrinsic spectral function. Most first-principles pho-423 to emission calculations determine the spectral function of the pho-424 tohole (i.e., of the material with a missing electron), which is 425 termed the intrinsic spectral function. Our calculation of this ideal 426 intrinsic spectral functions relies on the first-principles GW+C ap-427 proach described in (20, 21). We first determine matrix elements 428 of the exchange-correlation self-energy  $\Sigma_{xc}^{\ell\ell}(\omega)$  in the GW approx-429 imation (49) of many-body perturbation theory, using eigenvalue 430

- self-consistency. Matrix elements of the one-body Green's function 431
- 432 for occupied states  $\ell$  are then calculated using the time-ordered
- cumulant expression (20, 21)433

434

$$G_{\ell}(\tau) = \mathrm{i}\theta(-\tau)e^{-\mathrm{i}\varepsilon_{\ell}\tau}e^{C_{\ell}(\tau)}$$
$$C_{\ell}(\tau) = \frac{1}{\pi}\int_{-\infty}^{E_{F}-\varepsilon_{\ell}}\mathrm{d}\omega \left|\mathrm{Im}\Sigma_{xc}^{\ell\ell}(\omega+\varepsilon_{\ell})\right|\frac{e^{-\mathrm{i}\omega\tau}-1}{\omega^{2}},\qquad [1]$$

where the QP energy  $\varepsilon_{\ell} < E_F$ , with  $E_F$  the Fermi energy, is a result 435 of the GW calculation. The imaginary part of the GW self-energy 436 matrix elements reads 437

438 
$$\operatorname{Im}\Sigma_{xc}^{\ell\ell}(\omega+\varepsilon_{\ell}) = \sum_{j,s\neq 0} |V_{\ell j}^{s}|^{2} \delta(\omega+\varepsilon_{\ell}-\varepsilon_{j}+\omega_{s}).$$
[2]

439 Here,  $\omega_s$  are energies of neutral charge excitations such as plasmons and interband transitions, and  $|V_{\ell j}^s|$  are matrix elements of the 440 fluctuation potentials (6), determining the strength of the coupling 441 of these excitations to the QP. In an electron-boson coupling picture 442  $\omega_s$  are boson energies and  $|V_{\ell j}^s|$  the electron-boson coupling strength. 443 The most important contributions are given by the states j that 444 are close to  $\ell$ . Hence, one can understand the satellite shape 445 dispersion from Eq. (2): in the case of  $\Gamma$ , which is at the bottom 446 of a parabolic valence band, no state can contribute to the sum 447 with energy  $\varepsilon_j < \varepsilon_\ell$ . As a result, as shown in Fig. 3(a), the 448 shape of  $\text{Im}\Sigma_{xc}^{\ell\ell}(\omega+\varepsilon_{\ell})$  is asymmetric, with a tail towards smaller 449 binding energies. In the case of L, instead, states contributing 450 to the sum can have energies that are either larger or smaller than  $\varepsilon_{\ell}$ , which makes the shape of  $\mathrm{Im} \sum_{xc}^{\ell\ell} (\omega + \varepsilon_{\ell})$  more symmetric. 451 452 Since the dispersion at L is much steeper than at the bottom of 453 the band, there is also more broadening. This is then directly 454 reflected in the shape of the satellites in the spectral functions 455 shown in Fig. 3(b). The imaginary part of the Fourier transform of 456  $G_{\ell}$  in the frequency domain yields the intrinsic spectral function 457  $A_{\ell}(\omega) = \pi^{-1} |Im G_{\ell}(\omega)|$ . The spectral functions are evaluated along 458  $\Gamma L$ . Since the experimental paths correspond to small  $k_z$  deviations 459 from the  $\Gamma L$  path, we shift calculated energies by 0.2 eV (0.9 eV) in 460 the simulation of the 624 eV (1100 eV) photon energy spectra. These 461 shifts are no fit parameters, but obtained from our first-principles 462 calculation of the band dispersion along  $k_z$ . 463

The calculated spectra are multiplied by a constant factor to 464 match the arbitrary experimental units. For the relative weight 465 of different bands, we start from calculated intensities based on 466 a projection on atomic cross sections (50), but for valence bands 467 of delocalized-electron materials like aluminum, this is not precise 468 enough. We therefore fit the ratio of the cross sections of the two 469 valence bands to the experimental QP ratios. This changes the 470 intensity of the QP at L by about 50 %. Note again that only QP 471 intensities are adjusted, whereas no parameter is used concerning 472 the satellites, which are the topic of the present work. We include 473 474 Gaussian broadenings to account for the experimental angle and energy resolutions and multiply all the spectra by a Fermi function 475 with a temperature of 50 K. For computational details see the SI. 476

Inelastic scattering. To include extrinsic and interference effects, 477 following (14) Im  $\Sigma_{xc}(\omega + \varepsilon)$  is multiplied by a frequency ( $\omega$ )- and 478 photon energy ( $\nu$ )-dependent enhancement factor  $R_{\nu}(\omega)$  derived 479 from the semi-infinite electron gas in (6, 26, 44). For  $R_{\nu} = 1$  the 480 extrinsic and interference terms cancel and the spectra are given by 481

the intrinsic spectral function. 482

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS. Computation time was granted by 483 GENCI (Project No. 544). This work has received funding from the 484 European Research Council (ERC Grant Agreement n. 320971) and 485 from a Marie Curie FP7 Integration Grant within the 7th European 486 Union Framework Programme. This work was also supported by 487 a public grant overseen by the French National Research Agency 488 (ANR) as part of the "Investissements d'Avenir" program (Labex 489 NanoSaclay, reference: ANR-10-LABX-0035) and by the Labex 490 Palm (Grant No. ANR-10-LABX-0039-PALM). JJR and JJK ac-491 492 knowledge funding support from DOE Office of Science BES Grant No. DE-FG02-97ER45623. We acknowledge the Paul Scherrer In-493 stitut, Villigen, Switzerland for synchrotron radiation beamtime at 494 the PEARL beamline of the Swiss Light Source. 495

1. S Hüfner, Photoelectron Spectroscopy: Principles and Applications, (Springer, Berlin), 496 (2003).497 498

499

500

501

502

503

504

505

506

507

508

509

510

511

512

515

516

517

518

519

520

521

524

525

528

529

530

531

532

533

534

535

536

537

538

539

540

541

542

543

544

545

546

547

548

549

550

551

552

553

554

555

556

557

558

559

560

561

562

563

564

565

566

567

568

569

570

577

578

579

- 2. RM Martin, L Reining, DM Ceperley, Interacting Electrons. (Cambridge University Press), (2016).
- 3. M van Schilfgaarde, T Kotani, S Faleev, Quasiparticle self-consistent aw theory, Phys. Rev. Lett. 96, 226402 (2006).
- 4 DC Langreth, Singularities in the x-ray spectra of metals. Phys. Rev. B 1, 471-477 (1970). 5. L Hedin, BI Lundqvist, S Lundqvist, Beyond the one-electron approximation: Density of states for inbteracting electrons in Electronic Density of States, ed. LH Bennett. (National Bureau of Standards (U.S.), Washington), p. 233 (1971).
- 6. L Hedin, On correlation effects in electron spectroscopies and the GW approximation. J. Phys. Condens. Matter 11, R489-R528 (1999).
- 7 F Aryasetiawan, L Hedin, K Karlsson, Multiple plasmon satellites in na and al spectral functions from Ab Initio cumulant expansion. Phys. Rev. Lett. 77, 2268-2271 (1996)
- 8 GD Mahan, Many Particle Physics, Third Edition. (Springer, New York), (2000). C Verdi, F Caruso, F Giustino, Origin of the crossover from polarons to fermi liquids in transi-9. tion metal oxides. Nat. Commun. 8, 15769- (2017).
- JP Nery, et al., Quasiparticles and phonon satellites in spectral functions of semiconductors 10. 513 and insulators: Cumulants applied to the full first-principles theory and the fröhlich polaron. 514 Phys. Rev. B 97, 115145 (2018).
- 11. F Bechstedt, Many-Body Approach to Electronic Excitations: Concepts and Applications. (Springer), (2014).
- 12 M Vos, et al., Determination of the energy-momentum densities of aluminium by electron momentum spectroscopy. J. Physics: Condens. Matter 11, 3645 (1999).
- M Vos, et al., Quantitative measurement of the spectral function of aluminum and lithium by 13. electron momentum spectroscopy. Phys. Rev. B 66, 155414 (2002).
- M Guzzo, et al., Valence electron photoemission spectrum of semiconductors: Ab Initio de 522 scription of multiple satellites. Phys. Rev. Lett. 107, 166401 (2011). 523
- 15. J Lischner, D Vigil-Fowler, SG Louie, Physical origin of satellites in photoemission of doped graphene: An Ab Initio qw plus cumulant study. Phys. Rev. Lett. 110, 146801 (2013).
- AS Kheifets, VA Sashin, M Vos, E Weigold, F Aryasetiawan, Spectral properties of quasipar 526 ticles in silicon: A test of many-body theory. Phys. Rev. B 68, 233205 (2003). 527
- 17. J Lischner, et al., Satellite band structure in silicon caused by electron-plasmon coupling. Phys. Rev. B 91, 205113 (2015).
- F Caruso, H Lambert, F Giustino, Band structures of plasmonic polarons. Phys. Rev. Lett. 114, 146404 (2015)
- JJ Kas, JJ Rehr, L Reining, Cumulant expansion of the retarded one-electron Green function. Phys. Rev. B 90, 085112 (2014).
- JS Zhou, et al., Dynamical effects in electron spectroscopy, The J. Chem. Phys. 143, 184109 (2015).
- 21. JS Zhou, M Gatti, JJ Kas, JJ Rehr, L Reining, Cumulant green's function calculations of plasmon satellites in bulk sodium: Influence of screening and the crystal environment. Phys. Rev. B 97 (2018).
- B Gumhalter, V Kovač, F Caruso, H Lambert, F Giustino, On the combined use of gw approx-22. imation and cumulant expansion in the calculations of quasiparticle spectra: The paradigm of si valence bands. Phys. Rev. B 94, 035103 (2016).
- F Caruso, C Verdi, S Poncé, F Giustino, Electron-plasmon and electron-phonon satellites in 23. the angle-resolved photoelectron spectra of n-doped anatase tioo. Phys. Rev. B 97, 165113 (2018).
- T Kloos, Plasmaschwingungen in al. mg. li, ng und k angeregt durch schnelle elektronen. Z. 24 Physik A 265, 225-238 (1973).
- 25. M Cazzaniga, et al., Dynamical response function in sodium and aluminum from timedependent density-functional theory. Phys. Rev. B 84, 075109 (2011).
- 26. L Hedin, J Michiels, J Inglesfield, Transition from the adiabatic to the sudden limit in coreelectron photoemission. Phys. Rev. B 58, 15565-15582 (1998)
- 27. F Giustino, Electron-phonon interactions from first principles. Rev. Mod. Phys. 89, 015003 (2017).
- 28. NJ Shevchik, Theory of angle-resolved photoemission from the bulk bands of solids, iii, effects of intra-atomic and interatomic electron-phonon interactions. Phys. Rev. B 20, 3020-3029 (1979).
- 29. Z Hussain, CS Fadley, S Kono, LF Wagner, Temperature-dependent angle-resolved x-ray photoemission study of the valence bands of single-crystal tungsten: Evidence for direct transitions and phonon effects. Phys. Rev. B 22, 3750-3766 (1980).
- J Braun, et al., Exploring the xps limit in soft and hard x-ray angle-resolved photoemission 30 using a temperature-dependent one-step theory. Phys. Rev. B 88, 205409 (2013)
- 31 P Hofmann, et al., Unexpected surface sensitivity at high energies in angle-resolved photoemission. Phys. Rev. B 66, 245422 (2002).
- 32. AX Gray, et al., Probing bulk electronic structure with hard x-ray angle-resolved photoemission. Nat. Mater. 10, 759- (2011).
- 33. L Plucinski, et al., Band mapping in higher-energy x-ray photoemission: Phonon effects and comparison to one-step theory. Phys. Rev. B 78, 035108 (2008).
- 34. C Papp, et al., Band mapping in x-ray photoelectron spectroscopy: An experimental and theoretical study of w(110) with 1.25 kev excitation. Phys. Rev. B 84, 045433 (2011).
- 35. EW Plummer, Photoemission from nearly free electron metals. Phys. Scripta 1987, 186 (1987).
- 36. ED Hansen, T Miller, TC Chiang, Surface photoemission in ag(100). Phys. Rev. B 55, 1871-571 1875 (1997) 572
- V Strocov, Intrinsic accuracy in 3-dimensional photoemission band mapping. J. Electron 37. 573 Spectrosc. Relat. Phenom. 130, 65 - 78 (2003). 574
- L Hedin, On correlation effects in electron spectroscopies and the gw approximation. J. 575 Physics: Condens. Matter 11, R489 (1999) 576
- 39. G Mahan, Electron energy loss during photoemission. Phys. Status Solidi B 55, 703-710 (1973)
- 40. WJ Pardee, et al., Analysis of surface- and bulk-plasmon contributions to x-ray photoemission

- 580 spectra. Phys. Rev. B 11, 3614–3616 (1975).
- K. CN Berglund, WE Spicer, Photoemission studies of copper and silver: Theory. *Phys. Rev.* 136, A1030–A1044 (1964).
- PM Th., M van Attekum, JM Trooster, Bulk- and surface-plasmon-loss intensities in photoelectron, auger, and electron-energy-loss spectra of al metal. *Phys. Rev. B* 18, 3872–3883 (1978).
- 43. S Tougaard, P Sigmund, Influence of elastic and inelastic scattering on energy spectra of electrons emitted from solids. *Phys. Rev. B* 25, 4452–4466 (1982).
- W Bardyszewski, L Hedin, A new approach to the theory of photoemission from solids. *Phys. Scripta* 32, 439 (1985).
- 45. HJ Levison, F Greuter, EW Plummer, Experimental band structure of aluminum. *Phys. Rev.* 591 B 27, 727–747 (1983).
- 46. M Muntwiler, et al., Surface science at the pearl beamline of the swiss light source. J. Synchrotron Radiat. 24, 354–366 (2017).
- 47. CS Fadley, Photoelectron diffraction. *Phys. Scripta* **T17**, 39–49 (1987).
- 48. MAV Alvarez, H Ascolani, G Zampieri, Excitation of phonons and forward focusing in x-ray photoemission from the valence band. *Phys. Rev. B* 54, 14703–14712 (1996).
- L Hedin, New method for calculating the one-particle green's function with application to the electron-gas problem. *Phys. Rev.* 139, A796–A823 (1965).
- 599 50. J Yeh, I Lindau, Atomic subshell photoionization cross sections and asymmetry parameters:
  600 1 le z le 103. At. Data Nucl. Data Tables 32, 1 155 (1985).