

# A box-model of carrying capacity of the Thau lagoon in the context of ecological status regulations and sustainable shellfish cultures

Romain Pete, Thomas Guyondet, Beatrice Bec, Valerie Derolez, Ludovic Cesmat, Franck Lagarde, Stéphane Pouvreau, Annie Fiandrino, Marion Richard

## ▶ To cite this version:

Romain Pete, Thomas Guyondet, Beatrice Bec, Valerie Derolez, Ludovic Cesmat, et al.. A box-model of carrying capacity of the Thau lagoon in the context of ecological status regulations and sustainable shellfish cultures. Ecological Modelling, 2020, 426, pp.109049. 10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2020.109049. hal-03010383

## HAL Id: hal-03010383 https://hal.science/hal-03010383v1

Submitted on 22 Aug2022

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution - NonCommercial 4.0 International License

Tittle: A box-model of carrying capacity of the Thau lagoon in the context of ecological status regulations and sustainable shellfish cultures.

Authors: Romain Pete<sup>1</sup>, Thomas Guyondet<sup>2</sup>, Beatrice Bec<sup>1</sup>, Valérie Derolez<sup>1</sup>, Ludovic Cesmat<sup>3</sup>, Franck Lagarde<sup>1</sup>, Stéphane Pouvreau<sup>4</sup>, Annie Fiandrino<sup>1</sup>, Marion Richard<sup>1</sup>

 Marine Biodiversity, Exploitation and Conservation (MARBEC). Univ Montpellier, CNRS, Ifremer, IRD, Montpellier & Sète, France
 Department of Fisheries and Oceans, Gulf Fisheries Center, P.O. Box 5030, Science Branch, Moncton, Canada NB E1C 9B6
 Syndicat Mixte du Bassin de Thau, 328, Quai des Moulins-34200 SETE
 Ifremer, Laboratoire des Sciences de l'Environnement Marin (LEMAR), 29840 Argentonen-Landunvez, France

Corresponding author : Dr. Romain Pete MARBEC, CC093, Place Eugène Bataillon, 34095, Montpellier Cedex 5, France. Romain.Pete@umontpellier.fr 1 Abstract:

2 The decrease of microbial and nutrient inputs from the watershed has long dominated lagoon 3 ecosystem management objectives. Phytoplankton biomass and abundance have drastically 4 decreased for more than a decade and Zostera meadow have gradually recovered, expressing 5 lagoon ecosystem restoration such as Thau lagoon. Do the progressive achievement of the 6 good ecological status of the Thau lagoon possibly threatens the shellfish industry in terms of 7 production and oyster quality, by reducing the carrying capacity? To provide answers about 8 the right balance to be achieved between conservation and exploitation, a new numerical tool 9 was developed to help in decision-making. We hereby propose to incorporate a Dynamic 10 Energy Budget type shellfish production model to an existing lagoon ecosystem box-model. 11 The influence of different scenarios of nutrient inputs (related to projections of population 12 growth or improvement of treatment plants) and shellfish stocks were tested on oyster 13 performances (production, oyster condition index), carrying capacity of the lagoon and 14 ecological status indices used within the EU Water Framework Directive. Model outputs 15 demonstrated that shellfish production was mainly controlled by nutrient inputs, which 16 depend on hydro-meteorological variability, and specifically by phosphorus and N:P ratios of 17 nutrient inputs. Scenarios tested, however, demonstrated smaller differences of oyster 18 production in comparison to inter-annual variability. The overall ecological status of the 19 lagoon remained in a "good" status with acceptable lagoon-scale phytoplankton depletion, 20 regardless of scenarios, setting the carrying capacity of this ecosystem to be sustainable. 21 22 Key words: shellfish farming, carrying capacity, stakeholder implication, nitrogen and

phosphorus inputs, Water Frame Directive, ecological indicators, phytoplankton depletion,
coupled Biogeochemical-DEB model.

26 1 Introduction

27 Rapid expansion of bivalve aquaculture in the last few decades with 17.1 million tons of mollusks produced worldwide (FAO, 2018) plays a key role in local socio-economic 28 29 developments. FAO therefore promoted, in its recent report, a holistic and integrated 30 ecosystem approach of aquaculture (EAA) to address management issues of sustainable 31 aquaculture. Among the key features of this EEA framework, FAO highlighted: the wide 32 stakeholder participation in planning and implementing; a comprehensive consideration of 33 major components, e.g. aquaculture, socio-economics and environmental, based on "best 34 available knowledge"; and a search for a trade-off between environment/conservation and 35 socio-economic objectives. This rapid growing economic sector has inevitably raised questions of carrying capacity and sustainability (Nunes et al., 2003). 36 37 In this context, the concept of the carrying capacity is commonly used as it involves major 38 aspects of integrated ecosystem functioning such as physics, productivity, ecology and socio-39 economics (McKindsey et al., 2006). Regarding cultured bivalves, this carrying capacity can 40 be primarily defined as the biomass of a population supported permanently by a given system 41 (Dame and Prins., 1998; Kashiwai, 1998). However, this definition has been successively 42 extended to a maximized production without affecting growth rates (Carver and Mallet, 1990) 43 to a maximized production of marketable cohorts (Bacher et al., 1998) and more recently to a 44 maximized production within the frame of environmental sustainability (Smaal et al., 1997; 45 Ferreira et al., 2008; Byron et al., 2011b; Filgueira et al., 2015). The current consensus is that 46 production carrying capacity represents the stock that maximizes harvests while ecosystem 47 responses or ecological carrying capacity deal with unwanted modifications of phytoplankton 48 abundances, nutrient cycling or organic content in sediments (McKindsey et al., 2006; Grant 49 et al., 2007; Guyondet et al., 2014;).

50 Recent research has been promoting use of mathematical models, of various complexity 51 (Dabrowski et al., 2013), to tackle the issues of cultured shellfish management. A lot of 52 efforts have been made in the representation of shellfish modeling from individual based 53 (Gangnery, 2003) to mechanistic (Bourlès et al., 2009; Kooijman, 2010; Alunno-Bruscia et al., 2011) and mixed (Brigolin et al., 2009) models. These individual models are then coupled 54 55 to ecosystem food web-based models that include most of the relevant biological 56 compartments of aquatic systems (Grangeré et al., 2009; Byron et al., 2011c; Filgueira et al., 57 2014b). These coupled models can thus be complexified by representing exchanges with the 58 outer world through simple renewal times (Grangeré et al., 2009), box-model (Chapelle et al., 59 2000; Filgueira and Grant, 2009; Raillard and Menesguen, 1994) and fully spatialized 60 hydrodynamic models (Guyondet et al., 2010). While these models give insights into the 61 carrying capacity of an ecosystem, it is crucial to derive other model outputs to evaluate 62 impacts of shellfish farming on ecosystem functioning. 63 The Thau lagoon, as many other coastal Mediterranean lagoons, has been experiencing major 64 anthropogenic pressures as it received large nutrient loadings from its watershed (La Jeunesse 65 and Elliott, 2004; Plus et al., 2006). These nutrient inputs have been identified as the main 66 cause of eutrophication issues or dystrophic crisis (Souchu et al., 1998; Harzallah and 67 Chapelle, 2002). Thus, many efforts have been made to reduce nutrient loadings mainly 68 through the installation of waste water treatment plants (WWTP) in the 1970's and their 69 refurbishment later in the 2000's. These works have drastically reduced the amount of 70 nutrient inputs from the watershed and successfully led to reach a current "good" ecological 71 status of water column of the Thau lagoon according to the EU Water Framework Directive 72 (WFD) (EC, 2000; Derolez et al, 2019). These profound changes in the lagoon inputs from 73 the watershed have raised concerns from shellfish farmers. Oyster farming, after having taken 74 precedence over mussel farming in the 1990s, has seen its activity largely impacted by

| 75 | juvenile mortality phenomena from 2008 (Pernet et al., 2012), which significantly reduced       |
|----|---|
| 76 | the overall annual shellfish production. Under current production conditions, long-term         |
| 77 | observations of farmed oyster performances have shown improved growth rates and condition       |
| 78 | index, probably linked to a decrease in the oyster stock, despite the decrease in phytoplankton |
| 79 | biomass observed (Bec et al., 2018). Considering these recent and important changes in the      |
| 80 | pressures exerted on the Thau lagoon, an assessment of its ecological carrying capacity for     |
| 81 | shellfish culture is required. We hereby present a modelling work to address concerns arising   |
| 82 | from shellfish farmers and consider realistic actions combining the achievement of regulatory   |
| 83 | constraints and the sustainability of this major socio-economic activity.                       |
| 84 | The GAMELag model (Pete et al, <i>tbs</i> ) was formerly developed for the Bages-Sigean lagoon, |
| 85 | to produce similar ecological indicators as those used in the WFD (European Community,          |
| 86 | 2000). These indicators have been established as relevant criterion to assess ecological status |
| 87 | of a given ecosystem according to different categories from "high" to "very bad". In addition,  |
| 88 | a dynamic energy budget (DEB) model for the Pacific oyster Crassostrea gigas, formerly          |
| 89 | developed on the Atlantic coast (Pouvreau et al., 2006; Bernard et al., 2011a), was             |
| 90 | parameterized for the Thau lagoon and coupled to the GAMELag model. Concomitantly to            |
| 91 | the model implementation, a major part of the presented work was realized in close              |
| 92 | partnership with shellfish growers, local and governmental management bodies and scientists.    |
| 93 | Based on this joint work, management scenarios were established on realistic working            |
| 94 | hypotheses. The objectives of this work were therefore: 1) to build a carrying capacity model   |
| 95 | and 2) to test the effects of nitrogen and phosphorus inputs and oyster stocking densities, on  |
| 96 | oyster performances (condition index, production), carrying capacity and ecological status of   |
| 97 | the Thau lagoon. This work was carried out in collaboration with managers and farmers to        |
| 98 | find the right balance between conservation and exploitation for sustainable development of     |
| 99 | shellfish farming in good ecological status coastal area.                                       |

- 100 2 Material & Methods
- 101 2.1 Study site
- 102 Thau lagoon (Figure 1) is located on the south coast of France (43.18'- 43.28'N, 3.30'-
- 103 3.45'E) and has a total area of 68 km<sup>2</sup> (19,5km long by 4.5 km width) and an average depth of
- 104 4 m (Fiandrino et al., 2017). The lagoon is connected to the sea through two inlets, i.e., the
- 105 Sète channel in the north (90% of sea water exchanges) and the Grau de Pisse-Saumes inlet in
- 106 the south. The Sète channel is 2.4 km long with a mean cross-section of about  $300 \text{ m}^2$ . The
- 107 Mediterranean climate is characterised by a wide range of temperatures (5–29 °C) and
- 108 salinities in the lagoon cover a range of 27–42 with a low spatial gradient (data from REPHY
- 109 monitoring network; Fiandrino et al., 2017).

110 The lagoon has a narrow located between the Balaruc Point and the Barrou Point, separating

- 111 the lagoon into two basins, the "Petit Etang" to the East and "Grand Etang" to the West. The
- 112 Grand Etang is the location of shellfish farming activities spread over three areas at the north
- 113 of this basin (20% of the lagoon surface). These shellfish farming zones, namely Bouzigues,
- 114 Mèze and Marseillan (Figure 1), gather around 2800 farming structures (1250 m<sup>2</sup> and a total
- area of ~640 ha) harbouring growing oyster juveniles (hereafter spat) and adults (hereafter
- 116 oyster) of the pacific oyster *Crassostrea gigas* (70% of the shellfish stocks) and mussel
- 117 Mytilus galloprovincialis.
- 118



Figure 1. Map of the Thau lagoon and its watershed. WWTP are located by symbols and distinguish
WWTP releasing to the sea (squares), using normal abatements (circles) or maximum abatements
(triangle). Hydrodynamic frontiers are represented by green lines separating three basins (numbered 1
to 3) and shellfish farming area are located by the two red boxes (numbered 4 and 5).

124

The watershed spreads mainly northward from the lagoon over an area of 280 km<sup>2</sup> and is drained by several rivers with intermittent flows. The main tributary (the Vène River) is connected to the Crique de l'Angle area and brings an annual average of 15.1 Mm<sup>3</sup> of

freshwater (about 50% of total flow, ranging from 3.1 to 24.7 Mm<sup>3</sup> between 2009 and 2016).
The population in this watershed amounts to 126604 inhabitants (French National Institute of
Statistics and Economical Studies, Insee, 2015) over 14 main cities equipped with waste
water treatment plants (WWTP). Five of these towns, Sète, Poussan, Bouzigues, Gigean and
Balaruc (Figure 1) are connected to the Sète WWTP which discards effluents 7 km offshore
in the Mediterranean Sea. The four other cities, Montbazin, Villeveyrac, Mèze-Loupian and
Pinet-Pomerols have their own WWTP releasing effluents into the Thau lagoon.

135

136 2.2 Carrying capacity model

137 The GAMELag model (Pete et al, *tbs*) was formerly developed for management purposes 138 with regards to water quality assessment under the WFD. GAMELag works on the principle 139 of a box-model, where the lagoon is represented by basins, physically homogeneous, in which 140 the stocks of the different biological compartments are simulated as well as the fluxes of 141 matter (nitrogen N and phosphorus P) connecting these compartments (Figure 2). The lagoon 142 was separated into three main boxes (green boxes, Fig. 1): "Petit Etang" (box 1), East of 143 "Grand Etang" and West of "Grand Etang" (box 2 and 3, respectively on Fig. 1). In order to 144 simplify the model and to be able to compare it with available observations, the Mèze and 145 Marseillan shellfish farming zones were gathered to form box 5, whereas Bouzigues shellfish 146 farming zone formed box 4 (red boxes, Fig. 1).

147 The hydrodynamic exchanges between box 1 and the Mediterranean Sea and between two 148 adjacent physical boxes are simulated following formalism defined by Gordon et al, 1996 149 based on daily net residual volumes and mixing volumes. While net residual volumes are state 150 variables of the hydrodynamic module of the GAMELag model, daily time series of mixing 151 volumes at frontiers of physical boxes have to be defined as forcing dataset. The 152 hydrodynamic exchanges between box 4 and physical box 1 and between box 5 and physical

153 box 2 only depend on mixing volume, there is no net residual volumes between these boxes. 154 Mixing volume takes into account wind mixing (mainly inside the lagoon) and tide-driven 155 exchange (between lagoon and the sea). These mixing volumes are therefore varying in time. 156 A 3-dimensional hydrodynamic Model for Application at Regional Scale (MARS-3D) was 157 used to compute daily time series of mixing volumes (Lagarde et al., 2019; Lazure and 158 Dumas, 2008). Descriptions of the MARS3D model applied on Thau lagoon and the forcing 159 dataset necessary for simulating water bodies circulation are provided in Fiandrino et al. 160 (2017). Same atmospheric (wind, air temperature, incident radiation) and hydrological (daily average river water fluxes (m<sup>3</sup>.s<sup>-1</sup>) from the watershed) are used to force MARS-3D and 161 162 GAMELag models. Specific dataset were used (sea level elevation in Sete Channel) to force 163 MARS-3D model at the open boundary condition for the simulated period.



165

Figure 2. Conceptual scheme of the GAMELag-Conch model representing biological compartments
(boxes) and processes (black arrows) within the water column (blue area) and sediment (brown area).
The oyster ecophysiological model is linked to the biogeochemical cycles (red boxes) through
filtration and excretion processes (red arrows).

171 In order to model the growth of an average oyster individual in the shellfish production areas

- 172 of the Thau Lagoon, a coupling of the GAMELag and DEB oyster model was carried out to
- 173 form "GAMELag-Conch" model. It involves the integration of the DEB model into the
- biogeochemical model. The dynamic energy budget of *C. gigas* model is based on the DEB

theory (Kooijman, 2009) and adapted to the Pacific oyster in the Atlantic under various
versions, 3 state variables (Pouvreau et al., 2006) or 4 state variables (Bernard et al., 2011b).
The dynamics in time of the different energy fluxes are described by a system of differential
equations (see suppl. Mat. Tables S1) and associated processes (Pouvreau et al., 2006;
Bernard et al., 2011b;). Within the frame of this work, the model was adapted and
parameterised for the Thau lagoon with additional parameters related to rearing schemes (see
suppl. Mat., Table S2).

The DEB model operates on energy flows (in joules) allocated to different functions within the individual (reserve, maintenance, growth and reproduction). Among these energy costs, some imply a dissipation of energy, which must be translated into excretion of matter to maintain steady mass balances within the GAMELag-Conch model. The oyster food resource in terms of nitrogen and phosphorus ( $X_N$  and  $X_P$ ) is assumed to be a mix of various available particles in the water column (e.g. state variables of the biogeochemical model) and is defined as:

189 
$$X_N = \alpha_{PS}PS + \alpha_{PL}PL + \alpha_{ZS}ZS + \alpha_{ZL}ZL + \alpha_{PON}PON$$
Eq. 1

190 and

191 
$$X_P = \frac{\alpha_{PS}PS + \alpha_{PL}PL}{NP_{phyto}} + \frac{\alpha_{ZS}ZS + \alpha_{ZL}ZL}{NP_{zoo}} + \alpha_{POP}POP$$
Eq. 2

where PS, PL, ZS and ZL are small and large phytoplankton and small and large zooplankton and PON the sum of labile and refractory particulate organic nitrogen. Each of these food resources is weighted by a preference coefficient  $\alpha_i$  with i = PS, PL, ZS, ZL, PON or POP. The oyster food resource is expressed in phosphorus using N to P stoichiometry of phytoplankton and zooplankton, (NP<sub>phyto</sub> and NP<sub>zoo</sub>), whereas POP is the sum of labile and refractory particulate organic phosphorus. Hence, the stoichiometry of food resources is expressed as

199 
$$NP_X = \frac{X_N}{X_P}$$
 Eq. 3

The food resource and dissipated DEB energy fluxes were translated respectively from mmol
N (or P) to Joules and from Joules to mmol N (or P) using conversion factors (see suppl. Mat.,
Table S2).

203 In the DEB model, some of the available energy is lost. First, there is the amount of material 204 ingested but not assimilated by the oyster, which is expressed in the DEB model by the 205 excretion of feces and pseudo-feces (joules per unit of time). This part of the non-assimilated 206 food either reached the sea bed to fuel sediment stock of N and P or was remineralised into 207 inorganic nitrogen and phosphorus in the water column. Once assimilated, the energy is 208 allocated into the compartments of the DEB model (structures, reserves and reproduction). In 209 order to maintain balanced stoichiometry in the DEB model, excretion is required and is 210 simulated according to the stoichiometry of the ingested material. Thus, the ratio N: P of the 211 resource (NP<sub>X</sub>) is compared to the ratio N:P of the oyster (NP<sub>0</sub>). When this NP<sub>X</sub> is greater 212 than the NPo, the regeneration of material is in the form of ammonium in the model. On the 213 contrary, when the NP<sub>X</sub> is lower than the NP<sub>0</sub>, the regeneration was assumed to be in the form 214 of orthophosphate. In this way, even if the stoichiometry of the resource is variable, the 215 individual rejects a quantity of N or P to maintain a balanced stoichiometry. This system of 216 regeneration of post-assimilation material provides available mineral forms of N and P in the water column. The maintenance costs  $(\dot{p}_M + \dot{p}_I)$  (Eq. 4), growth costs  $(\dot{p}_G (E_G - d_V \times$ 217 218  $\mu_V$  / E<sub>G</sub> (Eq. 5) and gamete production costs ( $\dot{p}_G$  (E<sub>GGo</sub> - d<sub>Go</sub> ×  $\mu_{Go}$ ) / E<sub>GGo</sub>) (Eq. 6) 219 were also added to the amounts of regenerated matter as they correspond to dissipated energy 220 (see suppl. Mat., Table S3). In the GAMELag-Conch model, these energy costs were converted into NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> or PO<sub>4</sub><sup>3-</sup> with conversion factors  $C_{ovster}$  and  $\mu_{EN}$  (energy yield of 221 222 reserves). These conversion factors are based on the available data on the chemical potential 223 of the different compartments of the oyster (Add-my-pet portal:

224 https://www.bio.vu.nl/thb/deb/deblab/add\_my\_pet/). Thus, the chemical potential of the food,

once converted to J mmol<sup>-1</sup> N, gives a conversion factor, C<sub>ovster</sub>, of 3250 J mmol<sup>-1</sup> N. The 225 226 Coyster conversion factor affects energy related to ingested but non-assimilated matter (feces 227 and pseudo-feces) and the energy related to predation on the different compartments 228 composing oyster food (ie, small and large phytoplankton, small and large zooplankton and 229 particulate organic matter). The second conversion factor,  $\mu_{EN}$ , is obtained by deriving the 230 chemical potential of bivalve reserves with the nitrogen (or phosphorus) content of the organic matter that makes up these reserves. The factor thus obtained is 3667 J mmol<sup>-1</sup> N. In 231 232 general, these conversion factors vary between 2400 and 3700 J mmol<sup>-1</sup> N depending on 233 whether food, structure or reserves are considered as N or P content (Platt and Irwin, 1973; 234 Grangeré et al., 2009).

235

236 2.3 Oyster seeding scheme in the model

237 Seeding scheme, as the introduction in farming structures of spats and oysters, is rather 238 complex in the Thau lagoon and mainly depends on environmental conditions, contamination 239 risks time frame or market dynamics. Two main periods for seeding were extracted from the 240 monograph results (Cepralmar, 2016) indicating that, according to growth durations, most 241 spats (6 to 8 mm) were mainly reared on lanterns or pearl nets and introduced between July 242 and August (47% reared over the summer) for a period of 6 to 8 months. In addition, this 243 study indicated that oysters (15 to 20 mm) were introduced within the early months of the 244 year (53% in January and February) for a duration of 12 to 14 months to reach marketable-245 size oyster. Therefore, in order to simplify this seeding time schedule for the GAMELag-246 Conch model, we assumed a common seeding scheme where oysters were introduced on the 247 first of February and harvested in mid-December. Regarding to spat seeding, the first of July 248 was used in the model to start growth of spats for a duration of 7 months. In February, 249 remaining spats from year n were then used to seed oysters in year n+1. The total abundances

were 532.1  $10^6$  and 235.7  $10^6$  individuals for spats and oysters respectively for the entire farming zone (box 4 + box 5, Figure 1). Mortality rates were also extracted from the monograph with values of 38.2% (10.5 x $10^{-4}$  d<sup>-1</sup>) during the pre-growing phase and 32.5% (8.9  $10^{-4}$  d<sup>-1</sup>) during the growing phase (Cepralmar, 2016). Seeding densities were then used to simulate stocking densities over the growing period as follows:

255 
$$\frac{dOyster}{dt} = Seeding_{Oyster} - Oyster \times mortality_{Oyster}$$
 Eq. 7

256 And

10.....

257 
$$\frac{dspat}{dt} = Seeding_{Spat} - Spat \times mortality_{Spat}$$
 Eq. 8

258 Where  $Seeding_{0yster}$  and  $Seeding_{spat}$  are densities of oysters and spats introduced as 259 described above. The number of individuals introduced was extracted from the monograph

260 (Cepralmar, 2016) and extrapolated to the farming zones with data from local authorities

261 (DDTM, 2014), which represented an average exploitation of 70% of growing structures.

262 Length (L) and dry flesh matter (DFM) were calculated at harvest for each simulated year.

263 Annual oyster production was estimated from total weight (derived from DFM, equation 16,

264 Table S1 in suppl. Material) and the number of living individuals simulated at harvest. Oyster

265 condition index (CI, %) was estimated from model outputs by using the ratio of DFM (g) over

266 267

268 2.4 Reference simulation

Length (cm).

269 The baseline simulation (e.g. "Reference", scenario n°1, Table 1) used in this study

270 represented the current conditions of the Thau lagoon functioning. This baseline simulation

271 was used to evaluate model skills (see section 2.5). This simulation covered the period from

272 2014 to 2016 and was carried out with the hydro-meteorological conditions of these three

273 years including precipitation, contributions of the natural catchment and contributions from

- 274 WWTP, based on the data of self-monitoring recorded at the entrance of the WWTP (data
- 275 from SMBT).
- Table 1. Summary of scenarios tested with reference simulation, watershed nutrient inputs and shellfish densities described according to their characteristics.

| Type of<br>scenario  | Scenario<br>number | Characteristic  | Observation – management<br>interest  | Name of<br>scenario in<br>figures |
|----------------------|--------------------|---|---|-----------------------------------|
| Reference            | 1                  | Current stocking densities, WWTP outputs<br>estimated from current average abatements                     | Use as a standard for comparing scenarios   | Ref                               |
| Watershed<br>inputs  | 2                  | Maximum yield on N& P for all WWTP<br>(≥ 90% on both N & P)   | Correspond to the scheme for<br>water management (SAGE)   | Max. yield                        |
|                      | 3                  | Normal yield on N & P for all WWTP<br>(75% N, 60% P)  | Classification off « sensitive zone » to eutrophication   | Nal yield                         |
|                      | 4                  | Projection of an increase in the number of inhabitants in the territory                                   | Correspond to the<br>comprehensive territorial<br>occupation scheme (SCOT)<br>predicting a 23% increase of<br>the population in the Thau<br>watershed by 2030 | SCOT                              |
|                      | 5                  | Partial release of water and nutrients from the<br>Sète WWTP into the lagoon                              | Operating strategy of Sète<br>WWTP  | Sète                              |
| Shellfish<br>farming | 6                  | Seeding to the maximum of the growing<br>structure capacity according to the « structure<br>scheme (DDTM) | Evaluation of the effect of the<br>maximum capacity of<br>breeding structures on the<br>lagoon ecosystem and oyster<br>production and performances            | Max. dens.                        |

278

279 Hydrological conditions of the simulated years were contrasted in terms of total rainfall and 280 associated trophic contributions. The year 2015, defined as a dry year (-255 mm compared to 281 1970-2016 average), showed low natural hydrological contributions with inputs of 0.77 t of P 282 and 12.7 t of N, whereas the years 2014 and 2016, with more intense rainfall events (+70 mm 283 and -55 mm compared to 1970-2016 average), brought natural nutrient loadings to a 284 respective estimate of 5 and 5.6 t of P and 86.6 t and 98 t of N. During wet years, 285 anthropogenic inputs from WWTP amounted for 18% of N loading against 55% for P inputs. 286 Total inputs from the watershed (natural and anthropogenic) reached 109.2, 39.4 and 113.8 287 tons of N and 10.1, 6.1 and 10.2 t of P for the three simulated years. For the year 2015, 288 WWTP discharges constituted the main source of N (62%) and P (90%) inputs, whereas for

289 the wet years 2014 and 2016, WWTP inputs accounted for up to 20% of total nutrient 290 loadings. The initialization of the biological compartments takes into account the most recent 291 observations in order to get as close as possible to the current conditions in the simulations. 292 Concerning the initialization of shellfish culture, data from the Cépralmar monograph 293 (Cépralmar, 2016) were used for livestock densities in the Bouzigues and Mèze-Marseillan 294 areas (see section Oyster seeding scheme in the model). The extrapolation of these survey 295 results to both production areas was based on the data provided by local authorities (DDTM, 296 2014) with 2632 tables in concession of which 382 were not active. The estimate of the 297 structures hosting pre-growth (spats) and growth (adults) was conducted using data from the 298 monograph (Cepralmar 2016) extrapolated to the 2250 tables in operation on each of the two 299 areas. This baseline scenario is referred as "Ref" in table 1 (scenario n°1, Table 1).

300

301 2.5 Model skills evaluation & model computation

302 The Willmott index of agreement (Willmott, 1981), d, was used to evaluate the performance. This metric is a standardized measure of the degree of model prediction error and varies 303 304 between 0 and 1. A value of 1 indicates a perfect match, and 0 indicates no agreement at all. 305 This index of agreement was used to evaluate model skills on salinity, Chl a concentration as 306 well as shell length (cm) and tissue dry weight (g) of cultured oysters. Available observations 307 for these variables were compared to simulations for the two shellfish farming zones (Figure 308 1, box 4 and 5). The GAMELag-Conch model was implemented in R (R Core Team, 2017), 309 using the deSolve package (Soetaert et al., 2010) for differential equation solving (time step: 1 310 day).

311

312 2.6 Description of scenarios

313 Scenarios of different nutrient inputs and shellfish culture strategies were determined in close 314 interactions with shellfish farmers (Mediterranean shellfish committee, CRCM), managers 315 (the Thau basin organization, SMBT; the Centre for studies of lagoon and maritime activities, 316 CEPRALMAR; the French water agency, AERM&C; Departmental Direction of Territories 317 and Sea DDTM) and scientists (MARBEC). These scenarios were built on realistic 318 management hypotheses, established during participative meetings and are based on two main 319 axes: 1) scenarios related to trophic contributions from the watershed and associated 320 management measures and 2) scenarios related to shellfish production and they are 321 summarized in Table 1. 322 The anthropogenic contributions of the watershed were tested according to different scenarios 323 corresponding to different management hypotheses around the watershed of Thau (Scenario 2 324 to 5, Table 1). The yields of the WWTPs are constrained by the environment that receives the 325 discharges and come within the context of the Regional Plan for Water Management (SDAGE 326 Rhône-Méditerranée) and the local Water Management Scheme (SAGE) applied to the Thau 327 lagoon territory. When these receiving water bodies carry a risk of eutrophication, they are 328 classified as sensitive to eutrophication according to European regulation (EC, 1991). In the 329 context of "sensitive zones", the European legislation (EC, 1991) requires WWTP to treat at 330 least 80% of phosphorus and 70 to 80% of nitrogen for cities with more than 10 000 331 inhabitant equivalents (IE). For smaller municipalities, these obligations vary and may be 332 higher depending on the case. Thau lagoon was classified as a "sensitive zone" in 2004 333 according to European recommendations (EC, 2004). On these provisions, it was concluded 334 to test initially two scenarios declining these treatments of WWTP to: 1) maximum yield 335 (scenario 2: Max. yield) with abatements greater than 90% for nitrogen and phosphorus; 2) 336 normal yield (scenario 3: Nal yield) corresponding to reductions of 75% and 60% respectively 337 for nitrogen and phosphorus. It should be noted that only the Mèze lagoon-based treatment

plant currently offers yields comparable to the high abatements required by the "sensitivezone" classification (> 90%).

340 In direct relation with the environmental management constraints, the territorial occupation 341 scheme (SCOT) and, in particular, the demographic projections of this SCOT, were evaluated 342 in this study. Indeed, an increase in population (estimated at 23% at 2030 horizon) directly 343 leads to increased WWTP effluents (wastewater discharges) and, consequently, 344 recommendations to anticipate these evolutions must be incorporated into a management 345 policy of the territory. This scenario (Scenario 4, "SCOT" Table 1) aimed at estimating the 346 impact of the population increase on the Thau catchment area by 2030 in terms of nitrogen 347 and phosphorus inputs to the lagoon, as well as its impact on ecological status and shellfish 348 cultures in the Thau lagoon. Current yields of WWTPs were then applied to these estimated 349 quantities of nitrogen and phosphorus to provide quantities entering the lagoon. 350 The following scenario (scenario 5; "Sète", Table 1) corresponded to potential management 351 leverage for freshwater and nutrient inputs (N & P) to the lagoon through an operating 352 strategy of the Sète WWTP. This scenario addressed the question of the evaluation of the 353 impact of discharges in the Sète channels and hence in the lagoon, in anticipation of important 354 modernization works on the WWTP. The Sète WWTP currently has its outfall in the sea but 355 could release discharges to the Sète channels in case of heavy rains. This scenario examined 356 the effect of an additional 69.5, 72.9 and 84.7 tons of nitrogen in 2014, 2015 and 2016 357 respectively. In terms of phosphorus, additional quantities were estimated at 3.7, 3.1 and 3.6 358 tons for the same years respectively. 359 The scenario of different oyster stocking densities tested in this study corresponded to seeding 360 conditions for which all the growing structures would be filled with oysters at the maximum 361 densities allowed by the structure scheme (DDTM, 2014). In comparison to reference seeding

362 conditions (see section Oyster seeding scheme in the model), abundances were increased by a

363 factor 2 for spats (e.g. 501  $10^6$  and 546  $10^6$  individuals for box 4 (Bouzigues) and box 5

364 (Mèze-Marseillan), respectively) and by a factor 1.3 for oysters (e.g. 158.7 10<sup>6</sup> and 129.9 10<sup>6</sup>

individuals for box 4 and box 5, respectively).

366

367 2.7 Data treatment and scenario realization

368 Prior to the simulations of these different scenarios, a first step was the WWTP data

369 processing to force the GAMELag-Conch model. Work to recover volumes and

370 concentrations of global nitrogen (NGL) and global phosphorus (PGL) at the inlets of the

371 WWTPs was performed based on data from SANDRE (portal:

372 http://www.sandre.eaufrance.fr). These data were used to establish: 1) yield matrices, for each

373 WWTP located on the Thau watershed, and 2) matrices of fractions of the different forms of

374 nitrogen and phosphorus for each of the WWTP, to allow the transformation of total nitrogen

375 and total phosphorus after treatment into their different inorganic and organic fractions

are necessary to force the model.

377 In a first step, the input data of WWTP undergoes a reduction corresponding to the scenario

tested (see abatements, Table 1) and in a second step, the output concentrations thus estimated

are fractionated according to the different forms of nitrogen and phosphorus for the

380 corresponding WWTP. This procedure allowed for multiple different yield matrices (or input

augmentations as per SCOT projections) applied to the same starting NGL and PGL datasets.

382 This method was applied for all scenarios with three matrices of yields covering current

383 treatment, maximum treatment and normal treatment (see sections on Reference and scenarios

description).

385

386 2.8 Carrying capacity evaluation

As mentioned in the introduction, the targeted carrying capacity lies in the equilibrium
between an optimised harvest without negative effects on ecological functioning. The dame
index and phytoplankton depletion index were then used where the former provides a bulk
information on ecosystem functioning and allows comparison between different ecosystems.

391 Whereas the depletion index linked more finely cultured bivalves to its resource.

*2.8.1 Dame index* 392

The Dame index was calculated from the characteristic times of the lagoon (Dame and Prins., 1998). These characteristic times included: i) the lagoon renewal time (RT: time required to renew the entire lagoon volume) which is a hydrodynamic feature, ii) the phytoplankton renewal time (PPT: equivalent to the ratio of the average phytoplankton biomass to average gross primary production); and finally, iii) the clearance time (CT: time required for the total stock of shellfish to filter the lagoon volume).

399 The renewal time (RT) was calculated for the whole lagoon using the volumes entering the400 lagoon by the Sète channel:

401 
$$RT = \frac{V_{lagune}}{\overline{V_{ln}}}$$
 Eq. 9

Where  $V_{lagune}$  and  $\overline{V_{ln}}$  were the volumes of the lagoon (m<sup>3</sup>) and mean annual incoming 402 403 volume (m<sup>3</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>), respectively. This formulation gave renewal times of 48.6, 48.4 and 48.8 404 days for the years 2014, 2015 and 2016 respectively. These RT values were in agreement with 405 the field observations reported by Fiandrino et al. (2012) where  $RT \sim 50$  days. 406 The phytoplankton renewal time (PPT) was obtained by the ratio of the annual mean 407 phytoplankton biomass (estimated from the Chl *a* concentration expressed in mmol N  $m^{-3}$ ) on 408 the mean daily gross primary production (estimated from the phytoplankton growth calculated by the model and expressed in mmol N  $m^{-3} d^{-1}$ ). 409

The clearance time (CT), time required for cultured oysters to filter the volume of the lagoon,
was calculated taking into account the oyster filtration rate according to the formulation of
Bougrier et al. (1995):

413 Filtration rate = 
$$4,825 - (0,013 \times (T_{\circ c} - 18,954)^2) \times DFM^{0,439}$$
 Eq. 10

414 Where  $T_{C}$  was the temperature in degrees Celsius and DFM the dry weight (g) at harvest.

415 The filtration rate was expressed in L ind<sup>-1</sup>  $h^{-1}$ . The clearance time CT was expressed by

416 comparing the filtered volume with the average volume of the lagoon:

417 Clearance time = 
$$\frac{Vol_{lagoon}}{filtration rate \times nb of individuals \times 24/_{1000}}$$
 Eq. 11

418 where the filtration rate was extrapolated to the number of cultured individuals for a day and 419 expressed in m<sup>3</sup> d<sup>-1</sup> and *Vol*<sub>lagoon</sub> (m<sup>3</sup>) to give a clearance time in days.

420 All these characteristic times were expressed in days and their ratios (CT:RT and CT:PPT)

421 potentially inform on the capacity of the lagoon to support or not a sustainable shellfish

422 production. The CT:RT ratio indicated whether filter feeders and its resources were controlled

423 by exchanges with the sea or by internal (including inputs from the watershed) availability of

424 nutrients. The CT:PPT ratio expressed directly the link between the resource and the shellfish

425 culture, where a ratio of 1 would indicate that all phytoplankton primary production was

426 consumed by filter feeders in culture and would therefore be a critical value.

427 2.8.2 Lagoon-scale phytoplankton depletion index

428 At the scale of the lagoon area, a phytoplankton depletion index (Filgueira et al., 2014a) was

429 calculated to determine the impact of shellfish farming on its main resource. This index

430 compared the average phytoplankton biomass in farming areas (box 4 and 5, Figure 1) with

431 the phytoplankton biomass produced outside these zones (off-table: boxes 1, 2 and 3; Figure

432 1). Negative values indicated a depletion in nutritive resource, whereas positive values

433 indicated sufficient resource for the growth of bivalves.

434 
$$Lagoon - scale depletion index = \frac{[Chla]_{farms}}{[Chla]_{off-table}} \times 100 - 100$$
 Eq. 12

435 This formula compared the daily average Chl *a* concentration of all shellfish growing areas 436 (box 4 and 5, Figure 1) with the daily average Chl *a* concentration for all off-table areas 437 (boxes 1, 2 and 3, Figure 1). 438 This index may be gauged against the natural variability of the phytoplankton biomass to 439 evaluate the sustainability of the shellfish farming activity (Grant and Filgueira, 2011). This 440 lagoon-scale depletion index is asymmetrical and a value of -100% indicates a complete 441 depletion, whereas enrichment has no upper limit. For this reason, the median annual values 442 of this index were preferred to mean values and were used to compare the scenarios. 443 444 2.9 Ecological indicators and ecological status 445 The compartments of the model relative to the dissolved organic and inorganic matter were used to estimate summer nutrient concentrations. 90<sup>th</sup> percentiles (p90) were calculated from 446 the 92 daily values obtained from June 1<sup>st</sup> to August 31<sup>st</sup> for each simulated year, of dissolved 447 448 inorganic nitrogen (DIN=  $NO_3^- + NH_4^+$ ), dissolved inorganic phosphorus (DIP), total nitrogen 449 (TN: dissolved and particulate inorganic and organic nitrogen as well as the two "small" and 450 "large" phytoplankton compartments) and total phosphorus (TP: inorganic phosphorus and 451 dissolved and particulate organic and phytoplankton compartments expressed as phosphorus 452 using the Redfield (1963) N:P ratio of 16). These four variables DIN, DIP, TN and TP, 453 represented estimates of the WFD indicators measured for the diagnosis of the ecological 454 status of lagoon water bodies (Derolez et al., 2013). These simulated indicators were used to 455 compare the "Reference" scenario with actual observations and the influence of the different 456 scenarios tested on the ecological status. The model also estimated Chlorophyll a 457 concentration in the water column using the "small" and "large" phytoplankton variables.

458 These two state variables were expressed in mmol N m<sup>-3</sup> in the model and converted to  $\mu g$ 

| 459 | Chl $a l^{-1}$ using a conversion factor of 1 (Parsons et al., 1961). The summer averages obtained |
|-----|--|
| 460 | from the simulations were used as an indicator of the phytoplankton biomass as in the WFD          |
| 461 | diagnosis. Finally, the TN to TP ratio was used as an indicator of nitrogen and phosphorus         |
| 462 | balance within the system.   |

463

464 2.10 Statistical analyses

465 Data did not fulfilled tests for both normality and homosedasticity and non-parametric,

466 Kruskal-Wallis, was therefore used for statistical analysis. Correlations were determined

467 following Spearmann correlation coefficient, ρ. Statistical analyses were considered

468 significant with p-value < 0.01. Principal component analysis (PCA) was performed on model

469 outputs presented in this work. All statistical analyses were performed using the R software

470 (R Core Team, 2017).

471

472 3 Results

473 3.1 Model skills

474 Model skills evaluation was based on model outputs of the "Reference" scenario representing

475 current situation. The GAMELag-Conch model satisfactorily simulated observations of

476 salinity (Figure 3-A) for both shellfish farming zones with a Willmott index "d" of 0.96

477 (linear regression  $r^2 = 0.91$ ). This agreement between observed and simulated values

478 prevailed the good representation of the lagoon hydrodynamics when described by 3 physical

479 boxes (see "Carrying capacity model" description").

480 Similar to salinity, model outputs were correctly correlated with the observed length (Figure

481 3-C) and dry weight (Figure 3-D) of oysters, with Willmott index of 0.69 ( $r^2 = 0.77$ ) and 0.76

482  $(r^2 = 0.76)$  respectively.



Figure 3. Biplots of simulated vs. observed salinity (A), Chl *a* concentration (µg l<sup>-1</sup>, B), oysters shell
length L (cm, C) and oyster dry weight (g, D) extracted from model outputs within the two shellfish
farming zones (box 4 and 5).

488

489 A poorer Willmott index was found for the Chl *a* variable at d=0.46 ( $r^2 = 0.03$ ). The

490 comparison of observations against simulations indicated that simulated Chl a concentrations

- 491 were within the range of observations for concentrations lower than 2.5  $\mu$ g Chl *a*.L<sup>-1</sup>.
- 492 However, the model could not capture the timing of extreme values (peaks), which explained
- 493 the mismatch on Figure 3-B for high Chl *a* concentrations.
- 494
- 495 3.2 Nutrients inputs and shellfish performances

496 For the three simulated years and all the scenarios, annual nutrient inputs varied from 25.5 to 497 198.6 tons of nitrogen and from 1.8 to 13.8 tons of phosphorus (Table 2). These ranges 498 included lower and higher values of nutrient inputs than that of the Reference scenario (39.4 499 to 111.5 t of N and 6.1 to 10.2 t of P, Table 2). Results presented in Fig. 4 and Table 2 500 highlighted the significant variability of oyster performances (weight and production) 501 according to years and scenarios of nutrient inputs. The variability of oyster production as 502 well as total weight of oyster, was mainly controlled by the hydrometeorology, with oyster 503 production being 1.8-2.3 times higher during rainy years than dry years whatever the tested 504 scenario (Table 2). Total weight of oysters at harvest varied between 36.6 to 100.5 g (Table 2) 505 according to scenarios and simulated years. Similar to production, total weight was 506 significantly higher in wet years than dry years (Kruskal-Wallis, p < 0.05), although no 507 significant differences were found between scenarios. In comparison to the current situation 508 (Reference), higher oyster productions were simulated with normal waste water treatment 509 plant efficiency (Normal Yield: 75% N, 60% P) with an additional 1700 t produced during 510 dry years corresponding to an increase in production of 25%. This increase was less important 511 during wet years (940-1200 t, +5-7%). By contrast, maximum WWTP efficiency (Max yield 512 90% N & P) induced a mean decrease of 1598 t, corresponding to a decrease of 12% in 513 comparison with mean reference production. The foreseen increase in population (SCOT 514 scenario) induced a mean increase in oyster production of 5%. Finally, in the Séte scenario, 515 oyster production was not enhanced and recorded 875 t less than reference production (Table 516 2), while nitrogen and phosphorus inputs were significantly higher than reference (1.8-2.8 517 times more N and 1.3-1.5 more P). Scenario of oyster stocking density to its authorized 518 maximum (by the French regulation body) triggered a mean increase of oyster productions by 519 7% at the expenses of thinner oysters with a lower condition index.

| Reference<br>2015         1000         1010         23.9         16077         95.9         93.7         17.5         031-051-061-02-18-08-135         48.6         17.4         17.5         17.5           2015         3034         61.0         13.3         0.0         23.9         16077         8.9         43.6         13.6         0340-45155-133-341-05         48.6         16.2         17.4 <td< th=""><th></th><th>Annual N<br/>inputs (t)</th><th>Annual P<br/>inputs (t)</th><th>Inputs N:P<br/>molar ratio</th><th>Production at<br/>harvest<br/>(tons)</th><th>Length<br/>at<br/>harvest<br/>(cm)</th><th>Total weight<br/>at harvest<br/>(g)</th><th>Condition<br/>index at<br/>harvest<br/>(%)</th><th>Ecological status <sup>a</sup><br/>[NID-PID-TN-TP-CHLA-TN:TP]<br/>Summer – P90 – (μM)</th><th>RT<br/>(days)</th><th>CT<br/>(days)</th><th>PPT<br/>(days)</th><th>Median<br/>lagoon-<br/>scale<br/>depletion<br/>index (%)</th></td<>   |                                    | Annual N<br>inputs (t)         | Annual P<br>inputs (t) | Inputs N:P<br>molar ratio | Production at<br>harvest<br>(tons) | Length<br>at<br>harvest<br>(cm) | Total weight<br>at harvest<br>(g) | Condition<br>index at<br>harvest<br>(%) | Ecological status <sup>a</sup><br>[NID-PID-TN-TP-CHLA-TN:TP]<br>Summer – P90 – (μM) | RT<br>(days)   | CT<br>(days)   | PPT<br>(days)  | Median<br>lagoon-<br>scale<br>depletion<br>index (%) |
|---|------------------------------------|--------------------------------|------------------------|---------------------------|------------------------------------|---------------------------------|-----------------------------------|---|---|----------------|----------------|----------------|--|
| $ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$   | Reference                          |                                |                        |                           |                                    |                                 |                                   |   |   |                |                |                |  |
| $ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$   | 2014                               | 109.2                          | 10.1                   | 23.9                      | 16977                              | 9.5                             | 93.7                              | 17.5                                    | [0.31-0.50-16.00-1.29-1.68-13.52]   | 48.6           | 17.4           | 6.3            | -14.1  |
| $ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$   | 2015                               | 39.4                           | 6.1                    | 14.3                      | 7896                               | 8.0                             | 43.6                              | 9.7                                     | [0.49-0.45-20.35-1.39-3.57-18.52]   | 48.4           | 20.1           | 7.1            | -12.8  |
| Mean ± stal87.5 ± 41.78.8 ± 2.321.0 ± 5.812300 ± 45428.8 ± 0.868.2 ± 25.113.6 ± 3.9 $[0.38-047-18.30-1.54-2.89-16.23]$ 48.6 ± 0.218.6 ± 1.46.9 ± 0.6-13.5 ± 0.77.3 ± 0.7 ± 0.77.3 ± 0.7   | 2016                               | 113.8                          | 10.2                   | 24.7                      | 12208                              | 8.8                             | 67.4                              | 13.6                                    | [0.34-0.46-18.56-1.35-3.43-16.65]   | 48.8           | 18.2           | 7.4            | -14.0  |
| Max. yield         93.9         5.8         35.7         15606         9.4         86.2         16.3         103.10 41-15.64 + 1.94.70.14.56]         48.6         17.3         6.0         7.2         1.24           2015         25.5         2.0         25.8         35.5         10011         8.3         55.2         11.8         1034-04719181-140-36217.821         48.8         18.0         7.4         -13.7           Mean ±ad         73.2 ± 14.         4.7 ± 2.4         33.3 ± 30         1076 ± 4515         8.4 ± 0         59.4 ± 50         12.3 ± 3.8         10.38-046-18.65-1.35-3.07-17.09]         48.6 ± 0.2         18.4 ± 1.3         6.9 ± 0.7         -13.4 ± 0.9           Normal yield         118.6         12.3         21.4         18194         9.6         100.5         18.7         (0.38-046-18.65-1.35-3.07-17.09)         48.6         17.4         6.6         -14.0           2016         20.8         12.2         22.0         13990         9.2         76.8         14.9         10.32-042+17.51-168-13.19         48.6         17.4         6.6         -14.0           2016         20.8         18.2         17.3         50.6         7.2         13.8         10.32-042+17.81-1.30-2.66-16.14         48.6 ± 0.2         18.8 ± 1.7   | $Mean \pm sd$                      | $87.5 \pm 41.7$                | 8.8 ± 2.3              | $21.0 \pm 5.8$            | $12360 \pm 4542$                   | $8.8 \pm 0.8$                   | $68.2 \pm 25.1$                   | $13.6 \pm 3.9$                          | [0.38-0.47-18.30-1.34-2.89-16.23]   | $48.6\pm0.2$   | $18.6 \pm 1.4$ | $6.9. \pm 0.6$ | $-13.6 \pm 0.7$                                      |
| $ \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   | Max. yield                         |                                |                        |                           |                                    |                                 |                                   |   |   |                |                |                |  |
| $ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$  | 2014                               | 93.9                           | 5.8                    | 35.7                      | 15606                              | 9.4                             | 86.2                              | 16.3                                    | [0.31-0.41-15.64-1.19-1.70-14.56]   | 48.6           | 17.3           | 6.0            | -14.2  |
| 2016100.26.335.5100118.355.211.8 $[0.34-0.47-19.18.1-40.3.62-17.82]$ 48.818.07.4-13.7Mean ± M73.2 ±41.44.7 ±2.433.3 ±3.910762 ±45158.4 ±0959.4 ±25.012.3 ±3.8 $[0.38-0.46-18.65-1.35-3.07-17.09]$ 48.618.4 ±1.36.9 ±0.7-13.4 ±0.9Normal yield118.612.321.4181949.6100.518.7 $[0.31-0.54-16.27-1.35-1.68-13.19]$ 48.617.46.6-14.0201546.48.112.798388.454.311.6 $[0.31-0.54-16.27-1.35-1.68-13.19]$ 48.617.46.6-14.0201620.812.222.0139099.276.818.7 $[0.32-0.42-17.81-1.30-2.66-16.14]$ 48.617.46.6-14.0Mean ± 395.3 ±42.310.8 ±2.418.7 ±5.213981 ±41789.0 ±0.677.2 ±2.3015.0 ±3.610.37.0 ±5.16±1.32.167+13.2248.8 ±0.218.8 ±1.77.1 ±0.5-13.8 ±0.5SCOT2014114.811.222.6178949.69.818.410.31.052-16±1.32.167+13.2248.60.37.1-13.22016118.912.223.3125719.069.413.810.3410.34.047+18±1.32-167+13.2248.618.410.37.4-14.22016118.912.223.3125719.069.413.810.3410.34.045+18±1.32±1.67±1.3248.610.448.617.46.6   | 2015                               | 25.5                           | 2.0                    | 28.8                      | 6669                               | 7.5                             | 36.8                              | 8.7                                     | [0.50-0.48-21.15-1.48-3.90-18.88]   | 48.4           | 19.8           | 7.2            | -12.4  |
| $ \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   | 2016                               | 100.2                          | 6.3                    | 35.5                      | 10011                              | 8.3                             | 55.2                              | 11.8                                    | [0.34-0.47-19.18-1.40-3.62-17.82]   | 48.8           | 18.0           | 7.4            | -13.7  |
| $ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$   | $Mean \pm sd$                      | $73.2 \pm 41.4$                | $4.7 \pm 2.4$          | $33.3 \pm 3.9$            | $10762 \pm 4515$                   | $8.4 \pm 0.9$                   | $59.4 \pm 25.0$                   | $12.3 \pm 3.8$                          | [0.38-0.46-18.65-1.35-3.07-17.09]   | $48.6 \pm 0.2$ | 18.4. ± 1.3    | $6.9 \pm 0.7$  | $-13.4 \pm 0.9$                                      |
| $ \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   | Normal vield                       |                                |                        |                           |                                    |                                 |                                   |   |   |                |                |                |  |
| $ \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   | 2014                               | 118.6                          | 12.3                   | 21.4                      | 18194                              | 9.6                             | 100.5                             | 18.7                                    | [0.31-0.54-16.27-1.35-1.68-13.19]   | 48.6           | 17.4           | 6.6            | -14.0  |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $  | 2015                               | 46.4                           | 8.1                    | 12.7                      | 9838                               | 8.4                             | 54.3                              | 11.6                                    | [0.49-0.40-19.43-1.30-3.14-18.59]   | 48.4           | 20.6           | 7.1            | -13.3  |
| $ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$   | 2016                               | 20.8                           | 12.2                   | 22.0                      | 13909                              | 9.2                             | 76.8                              | 14.9                                    | [0.32-0.42-17.73-1.27-3.15-16.65]   | 48.8           | 18.4           | 7.5            | -14.2  |
| SCOT         2014         114.8         11.2         22.6         17894         9.6         98.8         18.4         [0.31-052-16,14-1.32-1.67-13.32]         48.6         17.4         6.4         -14.0           2015         44.6         7.2         13.7         8610         8.2         47.5         10.3         10.3         10.3-0.45-16.31-13.22]         10.3-0.45-18.35-1.32-3.27-16.61]         48.6         17.4         6.4         -14.0           2016         118.9         12.2         23.3         12571         9.0         69.4         13.8         10.3-0.45-18.35-1.32-3.27-16.61]         48.6         18.7. ± 1.5         7.0 ± 0.5         -13.7 ± 0.6           Sète         2014         178.7         13.8         28.7         16616         9.5         91.8         17.1         [0.31-0.48-16.84-1.30-1.68-14.13]         48.7         17.3         5.9         -14.2           2015         112.3         9.2         26.9         7184         7.8         39.7         9.1         [0.51-0.50-2.35-1.48-1.30-1.68-14.13]         48.7         17.3         5.9         -14.2           2016         198.6         13.6         13.7         10654         8.5         58.8         12.4         [0.31-0.42-1.43-3.09-17.06]         48.7  | $Mean \pm sd$                      | 95.3 ± 42.3                    | $10.8 \pm 2.4$         | $18.7 \pm 5.2$            | 13981 ± 4178                       | $9.0 \pm 0.6$                   | $77.2 \pm 23.0$                   | $15.0 \pm 3.6$                          | [0.37-0.45-17.81-1.30-2.66-16.14]   | $48.6 \pm 0.2$ | 18.8. ± 1.7    | $7.1 \pm 0.5$  | $-13.8 \pm 0.5$                                      |
| $\begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$  | SCOT                               |                                |                        |                           |                                    |                                 |                                   |   |   |                |                |                |  |
| $\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$   | 2014                               | 114.8                          | 11.2                   | 22.6                      | 17894                              | 9.6                             | 98.8                              | 18.4                                    | [0.31-0.52-16.14-1.32-1.67-13.32]   | 48.6           | 17.4           | 6.4            | -14.0  |
| $ \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $   | 2015                               | 44.6                           | 7.2                    | 13.7                      | 8610                               | 8.2                             | 47.5                              | 10.3                                    | [0.50-0.43-19.97-1.35-3.41-18.58]   | 48.4           | 20.3           | 7.1            | -13.0  |
| Mean $\pm sd$ 92.8 $\pm 41.7$ 9.9 $\pm 2.3$ 19.9 $\pm 5.4$ 13025 $\pm 4658$ 8.9 $\pm 0.7$ 71.9 $\pm 25.7$ 14.2 $\pm 4.0$ $[0.38 - 0.47 - 18.15 - 1.33 - 2.79 - 16.17]$ 48.6 $\pm 0.2$ 18.7. $\pm 1.5$ 7.0 $\pm 0.5$ -13.7 $\pm 0.6$ Sète2014178.713.828.7166169.591.817.1 $[0.31 - 0.48 - 16.84 + 1.30 - 16.8 + 1.413]$ 48.717.35.9-14.22015112.39.226.971847.839.791.817.1 $[0.31 - 0.48 - 16.84 + 1.30 - 16.8 + 1.413]$ 48.717.35.9-14.22016198.613.631.7106548.558.812.4 $[0.31 - 0.49 - 19.97 - 1.43 - 3.09 - 17.06]$ 48.7 $\pm 0.2$ 18.5 $\pm 1.3$ 6.6 $\pm 0.6$ -13.6 $\pm 0.8$ Mean $\pm sd$ 163.2 $\pm 45.2$ 10.123.9187359.385.816.5 $[0.31 - 0.52 - 16.00 - 1.31 - 1.87 - 13.46]$ 48.614.16.0-15.1201539.46.114.379767.836.68.316.5 $[0.31 - 0.52 - 1.6.00 - 1.31 - 1.87 - 1.34 - 0.615 - 1.34 - 0.48 - 0.57 - 1.44 - 3.69 - 18.41]$ 48.614.16.0-15.12016113.810.224.7129368.5 $\pm 0.7$ 60.6 $\pm 24.7$ 12.4 $\pm 1$ $[0.38 - 0.43 - 17.00 - 1.24 - 2.35 - 16.07]$ 48.6 $\pm 0.2$ 15.0 $\pm 1.0$ 6.7 $\pm 0.6 - 14.3 \pm 0.9$ Mean $\pm sd$ 10.3 $\pm 0.2 \pm 0.2$ 10.123.9187359.385.816.5 $[0.31 - 0.52 - 1.6.00 - 1.31 - 1.87 - 13.46]$ 48.614.16.0   | 2016                               | 118.9                          | 12.2                   | 23.3                      | 12571                              | 9.0                             | 69.4                              | 13.8                                    | [0.33-0.45-18.35-1.32-3.27-16.61]   | 48.8           | 18.3           | 7.4            | -14.2  |
| SèteContract </td <td><math>Mean \pm sd</math></td> <td>92.8 ± 41.7</td> <td><math>9.9 \pm 2.3</math></td> <td><math>19.9 \pm 5.4</math></td> <td><math>13025 \pm 4658</math></td> <td><math>8.9 \pm 0.7</math></td> <td>71.9 ± 25.7</td> <td><math>14.2 \pm 4.0</math></td> <td>[0.38-0.47-18.15-1.33-2.79-16.17]</td> <td><math>48.6 \pm 0.2</math></td> <td>18.7. ± 1.5</td> <td><math>7.0 \pm 0.5</math></td> <td><math>-13.7 \pm 0.6</math></td>   | $Mean \pm sd$                      | 92.8 ± 41.7                    | $9.9 \pm 2.3$          | $19.9 \pm 5.4$            | $13025 \pm 4658$                   | $8.9 \pm 0.7$                   | 71.9 ± 25.7                       | $14.2 \pm 4.0$                          | [0.38-0.47-18.15-1.33-2.79-16.17]   | $48.6 \pm 0.2$ | 18.7. ± 1.5    | $7.0 \pm 0.5$  | $-13.7 \pm 0.6$                                      |
| $\begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$  | Sète                               |                                |                        |                           |                                    |                                 |                                   |   |   |                |                |                |  |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $  | 2014                               | 178.7                          | 13.8                   | 28.7                      | 16616                              | 9.5                             | 91.8                              | 17.1                                    | [0.31-0.48-16.84-1.30-1.68-14.13]   | 48.7           | 17.3           | 5.9            | -14.2  |
| $2016$ $198.6$ $13.6$ $31.7$ $10654$ $8.5$ $58.8$ $12.4$ $[0.34-0.50-20.71-1.47-3.68-18.14]$ $48.9$ $18.0$ $7.2$ $-13.8$ Mean $\pm sd$ $163.2 \pm 45.2$ $12.3 \pm 2.6$ $29.1 \pm 2.4$ $11485 \pm 4770$ $8.6 \pm 0.9$ $63.4 \pm 26.4$ $12.9 \pm 4.0$ $[0.39-0.49-19.97-1.43-3.09-17.06]$ $48.7 \pm 0.2$ $18.5 \pm 1.3$ $6.6 \pm 0.6$ $-13.6 \pm 0.8$ Max density $2014$ $109.2$ $10.1$ $23.9$ $18735$ $9.3$ $85.8$ $16.5$ $[0.31-0.52-16.00-1.31-1.87-13.46]$ $48.6$ $14.1$ $6.0$ $-15.1$ $2015$ $39.4$ $6.1$ $14.3$ $7976$ $7.8$ $36.6$ $8.3$ $[0.34-0.54-19.16-1.47-3.56-16.57]$ $48.6$ $14.1$ $6.0$ $-15.1$ $2016$ $113.8$ $10.2$ $24.7$ $12936$ $8.5$ $59.2$ $12.5$ $[0.34-0.54-19.16-1.47-3.56-16.57]$ $48.6$ $14.8$ $7.1$ $-14.5$ Mean $\pm sd$ $87.5 \pm 41.7$ $8.8 \pm 2.3$ $21.0 \pm 5.8$ $13216 \pm 5385$ $8.5 \pm 0.7$ $60.6 \pm 24.7$ $12.4 \pm 4.1$ $[0.38-0.43-17.00-1.24-2.35-16.07]$ $48.6 \pm 0.2$ $15.0 \pm 1.0$ $6.7 \pm 0.6$ $-14.3 \pm 0.9$ $\pm$ conclusion lation based on 90\% parametrils on indicators WID, PID. TN. TP and Chic Color and size the alars of these indicators "High" (hup) "Cond" (arrow) "Automore" (unline) "End" (arrow) and "turn hed" (arrow)   | 2015                               | 112.3                          | 9.2                    | 26.9                      | 7184                               | 7.8                             | 39.7                              | 9.1                                     | [0.51-0.50-22.35-1.52-3.91-18.92]   | 48.5           | 20.0           | 6.8            | -12.6  |
| Mean $\pm sd$ 163.2 $\pm 45.2$ 12.3 $\pm 2.6$ 29.1 $\pm 2.4$ 11485 $\pm 4770$ 8.6 $\pm 0.9$ 63.4 $\pm 26.4$ 12.9 $\pm 4.0$ $[0.39-0.49-19.97-1.43-3.09-17.06]$ 48.7 $\pm 0.2$ 18.5 $\pm 1.3$ 6.6 $\pm 0.6$ -13.6 $\pm 0.8$ Max density2014109.210.123.9187359.385.816.5 $[0.31-0.52-16.00-1.31-1.87-13.46]$ 48.614.16.0-15.1201539.46.114.379767.836.68.310.5 $[0.34-0.54-19.16-1.47-3.56-16.57]$ 48.814.87.1-14.5Mean $\pm sd$ 87.5 $\pm 41.7$ 8.8 $\pm 2.3$ 21.0 $\pm 5.8$ 13216 $\pm 5385$ 8.5 $\pm 0.7$ 60.6 $\pm 24.7$ 12.4 $\pm 4.1$ [0.38-0.43-17.00-1.24-2.35-16.07]48.6 $\pm 0.2$ 15.0 $\pm 1.0$ 6.7 $\pm 0.6$ -14.3 $\pm 0.9$   | 2016                               | 198.6                          | 13.6                   | 31.7                      | 10654                              | 8.5                             | 58.8                              | 12.4                                    | [0.34-0.50-20.71-1.47-3.68-18.14]   | 48.9           | 18.0           | 7.2            | -13.8  |
| Max density       109.2       10.1       23.9       18735       9.3       85.8       16.5 $[0.31-0.52-16.00-1.31-1.87-13.46]$ 48.6       14.1       6.0       -15.1         2015       39.4       6.1       14.3       7976       7.8       36.6       8.3 $[0.34-0.54-19.16-1.47-3.56-16.57]$ 48.8       14.1       6.0       -15.1         2016       113.8       10.2       24.7       12936       8.5       59.2       12.5 $[0.34-0.54-19.16-1.47-3.56-16.57]$ 48.8       14.8       7.1       -14.5         Mean $\pm sd$ 87.5 $\pm 41.7$ 8.8 $\pm 2.3$ 21.0 $\pm 5.8$ 13216 $\pm 5385$ 8.5 $\pm 0.7$ 60.6 $\pm 24.7$ 12.4 $\pm 4.1$ $[0.38-0.43-17.00-1.24-2.35-16.07]$ 48.6 $\pm 0.2$ 15.0 $\pm 1.0$ $6.7 \pm 0.6$ -14.3 $\pm 0.9$  | $Mean \pm sd$                      | $163.2 \pm 45.2$               | $12.3 \pm 2.6$         | $29.1 \pm 2.4$            | $11485 \pm 4770$                   | $8.6 \pm 0.9$                   | $63.4 \pm 26.4$                   | $12.9 \pm 4.0$                          | [0.39-0.49-19.97-1.43-3.09-17.06]   | $48.7 \pm 0.2$ | $18.5 \pm 1.3$ | $6.6 \pm 0.6$  | $-13.6 \pm 0.8$                                      |
| $\begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$  | Max density                        |                                |                        |                           |                                    |                                 |                                   |   |   |                |                |                |  |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $  | 2014                               | 109.2                          | 10.1                   | 23.9                      | 18735                              | 9.3                             | 85.8                              | 16.5                                    | [0.31-0.52-16.00-1.31-1.87-13.46]   | 48.6           | 14.1           | 6.0            | -15.1  |
| $\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $  | 2015                               | 39.4                           | 6.1                    | 14.3                      | 7976                               | 7.8                             | 36.6                              | 8.3                                     | [0.44-0.48-20.57-1.44-3.69-18.41]   | 48.4           | 16.1           | 6.8            | -13.4  |
| Mean $\pm sd$ 87.5 $\pm 41.7$ 8.8 $\pm 2.3$ 21.0 $\pm 5.8$ 13216 $\pm 5385$ 8.5 $\pm 0.7$ 60.6 $\pm 24.7$ 12.4 $\pm 4.1$ [0.38-0.43-17.00-1.24-2.35-16.07]       48.6 $\pm 0.2$ 15.0 $\pm 1.0$ 6.7 $\pm 0.6$ -14.3 $\pm 0.9$  | 2016                               | 113.8                          | 10.2                   | 24.7                      | 12936                              | 8.5                             | 59.2                              | 12.5                                    | [0.34-0.54-19.16-1.47-3.56-16.57]   | 48.8           | 14.8           | 7.1            | -14.5  |
| h applications status based on 00 <sup>th</sup> percentile on indicators: NID PID TN TP and Chin Color and sizes the place of these indicators: "Hick" (blue) "Cood" (graph) "Avannes" (sellers) "D d" (graph) and "key bad" (graph)  | $Mean \pm sd$                      | 87.5 ±41.7                     | $8.8 \pm 2.3$          | $21.0 \pm 5.8$            | 13216 ± 5385                       | $8.5 \pm 0.7$                   | $60.6 \pm 24.7$                   | $12.4 \pm 4.1$                          | [0.38-0.43-17.00-1.24-2.35-16.07]   | $48.6 \pm 0.2$ | $15.0 \pm 1.0$ | $6.7 \pm 0.6$  | $-14.3 \pm 0.9$                                      |
| . ECOLOGICAL MALLY DARCE UN 70 DETCENTIE ON INDICATORS, INTER THE AND CHAR COLOR OVER THE CLASS OF THESE INDICATORS: THEN OF THE AND COLOR OF THE | <sup>a</sup> : ecological status b | ased on 90 <sup>th</sup> perce | ntile on indicate      | ors: NID. PID. 7          | N. TP and Chla                     | L<br>Color code giv             | es the class of the               | se indicators: "                        | <br>High" (blue), "Good" (green), "Average'   | (vellow), "Bac | " (orange) and | "verv bad" (re | ed).   |

## 520 Table 2. Summary of simulations inputs and outputs for the three years (2014-2015-2016) and the six scenarios tested.

521 To conclude oyster production, the comparison of scenarios showed that only "Sète" (n°5) and "Max. yield" (n°2) scenarios induced lower oyster production than "Reference" scenario 522 523 exhibiting a decrease of 8 and 16 % respectively. All other scenarios that involved increased nutrient inputs, "Nal yield" (n°3) and "SCOT" (n°4), presented higher oyster production 524 525 levels with sensibly higher shell length and total weight (Table 2). On the contrary, if scenario 526 "Max. dens." (n° 6) rendered higher oyster production than "Reference" scenario, no increase 527 of length or total weight of individuals was apparent. Oyster condition index (CI) was used as 528 a proxy for the health of oysters and was significantly lower in 2015 (Kruskal-Wallis, p < 529 0.05) with no differences between scenarios. 530 When discriminating dry and wet years, according to the different nitrogen and phosphorus

inputs simulated, one can note on Figure 4 that oyster production values were maximized for
a mass ratio N:P of the watershed contributions around 8.3 (that is, about 100 t N for 12 t P or
a molar ratio of 18.4; Figure 4).



534

Figure 4. 3D scatter plot of production (10<sup>3</sup> t) and total weight (g) of oysters as function of N and P
inputs (t) according to scenarios and years (see legend inset).

- 538 This seemingly optimal N:P ratio was obtained for the scenarios varying nutrient loadings
- 539 "Nal yield" (n°3), "SCOT" (n°4) and "Reference" during" wet years (2014 & 2016) but not
- 540 during 2015 (Table 2) where N:P ratio was 6.6.

541 In fact, the nitrogen inputs according to the different scenarios during the dry year (2015) 542 varied from 25% to 50% of those during the two wet years (2014 and 2016) with the largest 543 difference between dry and wet years recorded for the "Max. yield" scenario (Table 2). For 544 phosphorus, the variability of the contributions according to the hydrometeorology was less 545 marked. Nevertheless, inputs of phosphorus in the dry year were 1.5 to 3 times lower than for 546 wet years. This difference between wet and dry years was also largely marked by a significant 547 modification of the contribution of the WWTP to the total inputs of the watershed reaching 548 89% on average in a dry year. Nitrogen to phosphorus mass ratios of inputs varied from 4.6 to 549 16.0 (10-35 mol:mol) depending on the year and scenario and encompassed the optimal 8.3 550 N:P value linked to the highest oyster productions obtained in our simulations.

551

552 3.3 Carrying capacity

553 While renewal time (RT) seemed constant and corresponded to 48.6 days (Table 2),

554 phytoplankton biomass renewal time (PPT) and clearance time (CT) varied according to 555 scenarios with minimal and maximal means observed for "Max density" and "Normal yield" 556 scenarios respectively (Table 2). The CT:RT ratio remained constant regardless of the nutrient 557 loading scenario (mean of 0.38) and was lower as part of the "Max density" scenario (mean 558 0.30), indicating that water renewal times exceeded clearance times. The CT:PPT ratios 559 ranged from 2.06 to 2.93 with minimal mean observed at "Max density" (Table 2, Figure 5), 560 indicating that shellfish culture pressure on phytoplankton was not critical, because clearance 561 time was of 34% to 50% of phytoplankton production potential. In other words, the renewal 562 time of phytoplankton production in the Thau lagoon was systematically twice as fast as the 563 time required for oysters to filter all the phytoplankton biomass produced. This "Max. 564 density" scenario led to the lowest CT:PPT ratios with values of 2.13, 2.45 and 1.98 for 2014,

2015 and 2016 respectively, revealing a stronger pressure of shellfish farming on itsphytoplankton resources than the other scenarios.



Inputs N:P ratio (mol:mol)

567

Figure 5. Clearance time to phytoplankton renewal time ratio as a function of inputs N:P molar ratiosplotted for the 3 simulated years and all scenarios (see legend inset).

- 572 over these three simulated years (Table 2). The CT:RT and CT:PPT ratios showed no
- 573 significant correlation with N:P ratio of catchment inputs.
- 574 For the "Reference" scenario presented (Figure 6), the median value of this index varied
- between -14% and -13% indicating that the lagoon was in slight depletion conditions but may
- 576 support shellfish production. The median lagoon-scale depletion indices appeared consistently
- 577 negative, regardless of the scenario tested (Figure 6-A, B & C). Overall median lagoon-scale

<sup>571</sup> This pressure was accompanied by the lowest lagoon-scale phytoplankton depletion index

578 depletion indices varied between -12.3 and -15.1% depending on the year and scenarios 579 tested, but they did not show a clear trend depending on the amount of nitrogen or phosphorus 580 brought by the watershed (Figure 6- A and B). The range of values of the median depletion 581 index was bounded by the scenarios "Max. density" and "Max. yield". The difference between 582 simulated years was the main contrast between these median values of the depletion index 583 (Kruskal-Wallis, p-value <0.01). Figure 6-C showed these median depletion indices as a 584 function of the N:P ratios of the catchment contributions and the values of these indices 585 decreased with decreasing N:P ratio of watershed inputs in 2015 and 2016 (Spearman 586 correlation coefficient of -0.83 and -0.94, respectively).



Figure 6. Median lagoon-scale depletion index expressed as a function of N inputs (A), P inputs (B)and inputs N:P molar ratio (C).

590

591 3.4 Ecological Status

592 Although carrying capacity can be assessed through different indices, ecological status of the

593 lagoon must be regarded as another major characteristic depending on nutrient loadings or

- shellfish culture practices. The p90 summer concentrations of DIN, DIP, TN and TP, derived
- 595 from the "Reference" simulations (Figure 7-A, B & C) were consistent with the
- 596 concentrations observed in the water column of Thau lagoon in the context of the 2011-2016
- 597 WFD diagnosis (concentrations measured: 0.2, 0.2, 22.2, 0.9 µmol.l<sup>-1</sup> respectively) (Derolez

t al., 2017). DIN p90 were significantly higher (Kruskal-Wallis, p-value < 0.001) in 2015

(mean = 0.49) than in 2014 and 2016 (mean: 0.31 and 0.33, respectively), regardless of the
scenario tested.



Figure 7. 90<sup>th</sup> percentiles for DIN (A), DIP (B), TN (C), TP (D), Chl *a* (E) and TN:TP ratio (F) as a function of inputs N:P molar ratio for all scenarios (see legend in Figure A inset). Colors correspond to simulated years (2014: blue, 2015: red, 2016: green). High/Good ecological status thresholds according to WFD are represented by blue lines for DIP, TP and Chl *a*. These thresholds were not visible for DIN (2  $\mu$ M) and TN (50  $\mu$ M).

607

601

TN p90 were contrasted between years with significant differences recorded between 2014

- and the two other years 2015 and 2016 (Kruskal-Wallis, p-value < 0.001). Finally, Chl *a* p90
- 610 were found significantly lower (Kruskal-Wallis, p-value < 0.001) in 2014 (mean =  $1.71 \,\mu g.l^{-1}$ )

611 than 2015 and 2016 (mean = 3.60 and  $3.45 \,\mu g.l^{-1}$ , respectively).

- 612 However, the model seemed to underestimate TN values (17.6 and 20.4  $\mu$ mol.l<sup>-1</sup> for the
- 613 "Reference" scenario, n=92 and all scenarios, n=552, respectively). Nitrogen and Phosphorus
- 614 inputs, associated with the different scenarios, did not seem to affect the ecological diagnosis

615 of the water column based on nutrient indicators as none of these scenarios triggered a 616 modification of ecological status classes. These simulated indicators gave p90 values in 617 agreement with the "High" status fixed by WFD (MEDDE, 2015), in accordance with the 618 High status evaluated by 2011-2016 WFD diagnosis. Only simulated DIP concentrations were 619 classified in the "good" ecological status for all scenarios (Table 2). Shellfish production at 620 harvest, for all scenarios, decreased significantly for a given year when the N:P ratio of 621 catchment contributions increased (Figure 8-A). These relationships have a Spearman 622 correlation coefficient of -0.75, -0.98 and -0.90 for years 2014, 2015 and 2016 respectively 623 (p-value <0.05 for the three relationships) although no significant relationship has been 624 established between shellfish production and nitrogen inputs or phosphorus inputs 625 independently.



Figure 8. Oyster production as a function of (A) inputs N:P ratio, (B) phosphorus inputs and (C)
median lagoon-scale depletion index for the three years (2014: blue, 2015: red, 2016: green) and all
scenarios (see legend inset).

630 In addition, production was negatively correlated with the median lagoon-scale depletion

631 index, but this relationship was not linear for a given year (Fig. 8-B).

- 632 The "Max. Dens." Scenario (n°6) had the lowest median depletion index (Figure 8-B)
- 633 indicating that it had more impact on phytoplankton biomass than scenarios with comparable
- 634 production outputs (ie "Nal Yield", scenario n°3). On the other hand, the "Max. yield" (n°2)
- and "Sète" (n°5) scenarios gave the highest median depletion indexes but at the expense of

lower oyster productions. The comparison of nitrogen and phosphorus quantities added to the
lagoon in each of the three simulated years showed the role of the hydro-meteorology on
oyster production.

639

640 4 Discussion

641 The GAMELag-Conch model was developed to address the questions related to the 642 management of the Thau lagoon ecosystem with regards to the issues of shellfish production 643 and ecological status regulations. Scenarios tested were developed from realistic management 644 hypotheses. These hypotheses included leverages on the quantities of nitrogen and 645 phosphorus potentially available through waste water treatment plant management or on the 646 quantities of cultured filter feeders introduced in farming zones.

647

#### 648 4.1 Scenarios and oyster performances

649 All scenarios tested in this study were based on achievable management objectives. In this 650 respect, little difference was highlighted from oyster performance model outputs when 651 comparing scenarios. Although, nutrient loadings, in terms of nitrogen and phosphorus, were 652 varying with these different scenarios, the highest increase in oyster production was recorded 653 at +25% ("Normal yield" scenario) in 2015 in comparison to "Reference". This specific case 654 corresponded to the modification of the Mèze WWTP efficiency, going from maximum to 655 normal abatements, and a very dry year (2015, - 200 mm) where WWTP effluents were the 656 main contributors to nutrient loadings (+7 t N and +2 t P). To a lesser extent, "SCOT" and 657 "Max. density" scenarios also demonstrated an increase in oyster production but limited to +3 658 to +9% and +1 to +10%, respectively. The effect of increased nutrient loadings, mainly 659 nitrogen, on the production of cultured filter feeders has already been reported in modelling 660 studies (Ferreira et al., 2007; Guyondet et al., 2014; Rose et al., 2015). On the opposite,

661 reducing nutrient loadings from the watershed (scenario "Max yield" in this study) through 662 the improvement of waste water treatment efficiency triggered a loss in production between -663 8% and -18% compared to our "Reference" scenario further indicating this dependence of 664 oyster farming on nutrient supply of the Thau system. However, the variation in nutrient 665 loadings quantity may not solely explain the response of cultured oyster as large addition of 666 nitrogen (+171%) in the "Sète" scenario rendered lower oyster production than "Reference" (-667 2% to -13%). This effect is probably linked to the joint influence of nitrogen and phosphorus 668 additions, the location of these inputs and the response of the biological compartments and is 669 further discussed below. In terms of oyster performances, scenarios associated with increased 670 nutrient loadings demonstrated that oysters marginally gained in length, quality (condition 671 index) and total weight at harvest but remained in the same market grade (66-85 g; according 672 to the French 6 grades weight where n°5: 30-45g, n°4: 46-65g, n°3:66-85g, n°2: 86-110g, n°1: 673 111-150g and n°0: over 151g ). However, a reduction of, as well as unbalanced, nutrient 674 loadings, produced smaller oysters and a modification of the market grade (46-65 g) with 675 potential repercussion on economic aspects (Ferreira et al., 2007). Finally, "Max. density" 676 scenario demonstrated higher oyster production but at the expenses of thinner oysters with 677 lower condition index. This scenario highlighted the density effect where an increased 678 abundance triggered a competition for the resources yielding smaller individuals (Gangnery et 679 al., 2001; Gangnery, 2003; Filgueira et al., 2014b).

The scenarios tested here have revealed differences in terms of oyster performances and productions, however, major contrasts were brought by interannual variability where dry against wet years triggered the largest variations in nutrient loadings. Consequently, oyster productions were significantly lower in years presenting evident rainfall deficit. Oyster lengths, total weight and condition index were also significantly affected with smaller, lighter and lower quality during dry years. Nevertheless, oyster production and performances

evaluated through this modelling work shall be replaced within the context of ecological
status and ecological carrying capacity to better assess overall functioning of the ecosystem
(Byron et al., 2011b; Higgins et al., 2011).

689

690 4.2 Trophic carrying capacity and ecological status

One of the objectives of this work was to assess the carrying capacity of the Thau lagoon
regarding to shellfish farming within the frame of WFD regulation. The Thau lagoon, as any
other shellfish farming sites, is characterized by complex dynamics of interacting biological
and physical processes. Within these systems, filter feeding activity may deeply modify the
energy fluxes as they clear large volume of water including suspended particles (Dowd, 2003;
Filgueira et al., 2014a).

697 To evaluate the capability of an ecosystem to support various uses, it is important to compare 698 phytoplankton production, phytoplankton biomass, lagoon hydrodynamics as well as shellfish 699 culture pressure to truly highlight the limits of the ecosystem. A first approach using these 700 different aspects of the functioning of the ecosystem is the Dame index (Dame and Prins., 701 1998). This index relates the characteristic times RT (renewal time), CT (clearance time) and 702 PPT (phytoplankton biomass renewal time) of the Thau lagoon. The CT:RT ratio indicates 703 whether filter feeders and its resources are controlled by exchanges with the sea or by internal 704 (including inputs from the watershed) availability of nutrients. The GAMELag-Conh model 705 was able to simulate oyster productions along with indicators of the ecological status, 706 depletion index and characteristic times (CT, RT, PPT) comparatively with different scenarios 707 of nutrient inputs and shellfish cultures. The relationships between oyster production and the 708 carrying capacity of the lagoon was evaluated with regards to the Dame index, particularly the 709 CT:PPT ratio, and the lagoon-scale phytoplankton depletion index. Both markers 710 demonstrated a top-down control of filter feeders on phytoplankton population. In this study,

711 simulated clearance and water renewal times, CT and RT, indicated that hydrodynamic 712 exchanges with the far field (outside the lagoon) were not efficient enough to drive the filter 713 feeder resources. Therefore, phytoplankton dynamic or its bottom-up control, would rather be 714 driven by nutrients coming from the watershed. In comparison, the Marennes-Oléron site 715 (Bacher, 1989; Dame and Prins., 1998; Raillard and Menesguen, 1994) showed slower 716 phytoplankton biomass renewal times and much faster filtration capacity resulting in a system 717 that did appear to be largely under pressure (Marennes-Oléron CT:PPT = 0.27) despite a more 718 efficient hydrodynamics than in the Thau lagoon (Marennes-Oléron RT = 7.1). The simulated values of the CT:PPT ratio suggested that the consumption of phytoplankton biomass by 719 720 farmed oysters was constrained between 34 and 50%, leaving half, or more, of the 721 phytoplankton stock available for other trophic levels. Trousselier & Deslous-Paoli (2001) 722 had also concluded that Thau lagoon was productive in the 1990s, with shellfish harvested 723 production representing about 3% of primary production. Dame and Prins (1998) postulated 724 that successful shellfish population occur when RT is less than 40 days and PPT below 4 725 days. If characteristic times calculated for the Thau lagoon are longer than these 726 recommended times, shellfish cultures have prospered in the Thau lagoon and its carrying 727 capacity did not seem to be threatened. Both ratios, CT:RT and CT:PPT, expressed the state 728 of the carrying capacity of the lagoon by comparing the characteristic times of physics, 729 phytoplankton, and shellfish in culture (Table 2). However, they do not consider the presence 730 of nutritive resources other than phytoplankton such as zooplankton or particulate organic 731 matter. The model outputs indicated that oyster production is related to the input N:P molar 732 ratio with production increasing with decreasing N:P ratios. These linear relationships were 733 contrasted between years, highlighting the strong influence of the hydrological regime and 734 hence the quantities of nitrogen and phosphorus entering the lagoon. These first relationships 735 were bounded by the maximum WWTP yield and normal WWTP yield scenarios as they

736 provided the highest and lowest input N:P molar ratio, respectively. This also revealed that, if 737 filter feeder production might be increased by decreasing the N:P ratio of inputs, the amount 738 of nutrients coming from the watershed, most probably phosphorus, would limit the 739 maximum levels of production to be reached. The shellfish productions were also increasing 740 with decreasing lagoon-scale depletion index indicating that more production would trigger 741 higher depletion of the Thau system. Once again, the most apparent contrast was linked to the 742 different simulated years where higher nutrient loadings generated higher shellfish 743 productions and hence an increased pressure on its phytoplankton resource. N:P ratio of 744 loadings, however, was similar in 2014 and 2016, whereas phytoplankton summer biomass 745 was similar in 2015 and 2015. Therefore, higher oyster production and subsequent increased 746 filter feeder pressure could not only be explained by nutrient loadings. Annual mean 747 temperature anomaly, compared to the 1970-2016 mean (15.3°C) was +1.5°C, +1.4°C and 748 +1.1°C for 2014, 2015 and 2016 respectively. In previous modelling studies (Filgueira et al., 749 2016), increased temperature has been identified as a key factor in enhancing grazer activity 750 through higher metabolism with concomitant higher pressure on phytoplankton. The highest 751 oyster production simulated in 2014 would be in agreement with highest annual average 752 temperature recorded in 2014 for the Thau lagoon. In addition, 2015 was associated with low 753 nutrient inputs, which resulted in low oyster performances, even if temperature anomaly was 754 similar to 2014. In this second relationship (e.g. oyster production against depletion index), 755 oyster production was bounded by the maximum oyster densities and the maximum WWTP yield scenarios. The use of maximum allowed stocking densities generated the highest 756 757 depletion in agreement with the density effect (Chapelle et al., 2000; Grant et al., 2007; 758 Grangeré et al., 2010).

The increase in the quantities of seeded shellfish did not lead to significantly higher harvestscompared to the "Reference" scenario (1 to 10%). Moreover, the shellfish thus produced were

761 smaller, probably because of the competition for the nutritive resource between growing 762 individuals. This scenario also exhibited the lowest CT:PPT ratios indicating a noticeable 763 pressure of farmed oysters on their phytoplankton resource. Accordingly, highest depletion 764 was recorded when increasing stocking densities, which corroborates this impact on 765 phytoplankton stock. However, Chl a concentrations, used in the ecological status evaluation, 766 were not lower in the presence of higher densities of filter feeders than with the other 767 scenarios. This might be explained either by the fact that: 1) energy stocks of filter feeders 768 during the summer are allocated to spawning rather than nutrition (e.g. filtration), or 2) the 769 increase in cultured bivalve density may have a positive feedback effect on phytoplankton 770 outside growing structures through more excretion of inorganic nutrients (Filgueira et al., 771 2014b; Kellogg et al., 2014).

772 It is important to note that shellfish farming activities occupy about 20% of the Thau lagoon 773 area (~ 30% by volume) which is probably a criterion of its durability. In agreement with the 774 occupational state of the Thau lagoon, Byron et al (2011b) reported, using the Ecopath model 775 on the Narragansett bay, another example of a low-intensity of shellfish cultures where 776 carrying capacity is not reached due to high nutrient loadings and primary productivity. These 777 authors evaluated that if shellfish cultures density remained at current levels, the growing area 778 might theoretically be extended up to 26% of the bay area without exceeding the ecological 779 carrying capacity. On the contrary, the study by Filgueira et al. (2014), concerning a bay 780 occupied at 80% in volume by the mussel farms, showed a strong impact on the phytoplankton resource, where the median bay-scale depletion index (-34.2%) was below the 781 782 sustainable threshold calculated from natural variability of Chl a concentration (-27.5%). This 783 shellfish farming pressure was also reported, to a lesser extent, in Saint Peter's Bay 784 (Guyondet et al, 2015), where only the central part of the bay exhibited depletion for a total 785 farmed area of 40%.

786 The simulated ecological indicators were chosen to correspond to the observations used in the 787 WFD diagnosis (EC, 2000). Regardless of scenarios or simulated years, these ecological 788 indicators fell into the "high" ecological status class. Only, simulated DIP concentrations 789 exceeded the "high" to "good" threshold  $(0.3 \,\mu\text{M})$ , hence placing the ecological status of the 790 lagoon into the "good" conditions for the water column chemistry. The comparison of 791 simulated years or scenarios showed significant differences for DIN between dry and wet 792 years with higher concentrations recorded during the dry year (2015) and for Chl a where 793 concentrations in 2015 and 2016 were found higher than in 2014. The main concluding 794 remarks on this ecological status evaluation is that scenarios tested in this study did not 795 altered the ecological status of the lagoon. In addition to this fulfilling "high" ecological 796 status, weak phytoplankton depletion and the moderate pressure of cultured oysters on their 797 resources, the current oyster production ("Ref", scenario n°1), oscillating between 7900 and 798 17000 tons, would therefore be sustainable and not conflicting with EU regulation nor are 799 opposed to the important efforts made to reduce nutrient inputs from the watershed. Indeed, 800 ecological carrying capacity appears as a major component in the evaluation of the whole 801 ecosystem functioning and should be carefully considered at the same level as ecological 802 status.

803

804 4.3 Control of lagoon phytoplankton and shellfish productivity

The results obtained in this modeling work of the Thau lagoon seemed to indicate a control of the system by the nitrogen and phosphorus inputs from the watershed and more precisely by the N:P ratio of these inputs. When the inputs related to the various scenarios are detailed, it appeared that if the N inputs from the watershed covered a wide range of values (25.5 to 198.6 tons), the variability of phosphorus inputs was much smaller (1.8 to 13.8 tons). The variability of N and P inputs related to the hydrometeorological regime seemed the main

driver for the variability of shellfish production. Increases of 57% and 27% in N and P inputs
during wet years led to a 36% increase in predicted oyster production.

813 By replacing shellfish production at harvest in the context of nitrogen and phosphorus inputs 814 for all scenarios and the three simulated years, an optimum of the N:P inputs molar ratio 815 appeared (~ 18.4) around which the oyster productions seemed to be maximized (in 2014 and 816 2016, wet years). Current loadings ("Reference"), both natural and anthropogenic, are just 817 over 100 tons of nitrogen in wet years (2014, 2016) for a phosphorus input of about 10 tons, 818 bringing the N:P molar ratio above 22. To obtain a molar ratio of inputs around 18.4, it would 819 therefore be necessary to bring an additional 2.5 tons of P into the system (ie 12.5 tons of P in 820 total). Phosphorus appeared to be insufficient and therefore limiting if one considers these 821 current contributions of nitrogen. The "Sète" scenario (n° 5) confirmed the hypothesis of a 822 phosphorus-controlled system, where a misleading excess of nitrogen ( $\sim +100$  tons) did not 823 help to achieve higher production because this scenario increased the phosphorus deficit in 824 the system. Although more P was brought to the lagoon, oyster production did decrease in comparison with "reference" scenario. The "Sète" scenario tested the response of the 825 826 ecosystem to excess N and P loading from a WWTP. In the current situation, this WWTP 827 releases its wastewater into the sea. This scenario involved the release of waste waters into 828 box 1 ("Petit étang") of the model. Box 1 is the box connected with the sea, hence part of 829 these inputs is exchanged with the sea, the other part reached box 2 then box 3 where cultured 830 areas are located. In the "Sète" scenario, the model shows that sediment has accumulated 831 more N (times 2.5) and has released less P (times 0.4) in box 1 than the "Reference". Along 832 with the sediment compartment, macroalgae, notably Ulva and Gracilaria, yielded higher 833 biomasses (times 2 and times 1.5 for Ulva and Gracilaria respectively) than in the reference 834 scenario. This may indicate that macrophytes enter a competition for nutrients in box 1. N & 835 P in sediment and macroalgae did not show marked differences in all other boxes of the

model. Nevertheless, this would indicate that box 1 was the first to respond to these additional
inputs. Remaining nitrogen and phosphorus were then exchanged with the sea and with box 2
and further up. Macrophytes competing for nutrient resources and a greater accumulation of
matter may have led to a lower P availability in boxes 2 and 3 including farming areas (boxes
4 and 5) and hence lower oyster production.

841 N inputs (N), P inputs (P) and N:P ratio of inputs (NP) were used in a PCA analysis (Figure 9) 842 along with shellfish culture performances variables such as production (Prod), total weight at 843 harvest (P\_tot) or condition index (CI) and ecosystem functioning variables as chlorophyll a 844 concentration in and out oyster farming zones (Chla\_OF and Chla\_out, respectively) or the 845 lagoon-scale phytoplankton depletion index (DI). Phosphorus inputs were strongly correlated 846 with shellfish performances (first axis, 71.51% of variance explained) and chlorophyll a 847 concentrations, suggesting a key role of phosphorus in controlling both phytoplankton and 848 oyster production.



Figure 9. PCA analysis (A) of model outputs including nitrogen inputs (N), phosphorus inputs (P), inputs N:P ratio (NP), oyster production (Prod), oyster total weight (P\_tot), condition index (CI), Chl a concentration in (Chla\_OF) and outside (Chla\_out) oyster farms and the median lagoon-scale phytoplankton depletion index (DI). Supplementary qualitative variables (B) representing simulated

years with coloured 95% confidence interval ellipses (individuals: dots and barycentre: square) andscenarios (named grey squares).

856

857 The phosphorus inputs were inversely correlated with the depletion index, indicating also a 858 role in regulating the carrying capacity of the Thau lagoon. Nitrogen to phosphorus ratio of 859 inputs, and to a lesser extent nitrogen inputs, explained the second dimension of this PCA 860 analysis (14.88% of variance explained; Figure 9-A) suggesting that, if phosphorus may 861 control production levels importantly, the balance between nitrogen and phosphorus in 862 loadings carried from the watershed had a major importance in the efficiency of the Thau 863 ecosystem and hence on its trophic carrying capacity. Supplementary variables, as simulated 864 years and simulated scenarios, once placed in this PCA (Figure 9-B), demonstrated the major 865 importance of contrasted hydrological conditions as suggested above, whereas the variability 866 linked to the scenarios tested in this study exhibited less difference between scenarios with no 867 clear pattern.

868 Deslous-Paoli et al. (1998) reported this control of shellfish production by phosphorus in the 869 1990s, where the oyster stocking density was around 25 to 30 000 tons of shellfish and for an 870 annual production exceeding 15 000 tons (against 9200 to 9500 tons currently reported by 871 shellfish farmers). This study also reported phosphate concentrations in water 40 times higher 872 than the current concentrations (4 µM against 0.1 µM). At the same time, even though the 873 concentrations of  $PO_4^{3-}$  in water have been decreasing since the 1970s, the significant 874 expansion of oyster farming during this period (from 1400 to 2440 tables in 20 years) would 875 have reduced the risk of eutrophication by removing about 30%, according to the authors, of 876 this readily available phosphorus from the Thau lagoon. At present, the decrease in 877 phosphorus inputs from the watershed and, consequently, the concentrations in the water 878 column, is mainly attributed to the major efforts made on the waste water treatment systems 879 (Derolez et al., 2013; La Jeunesse, 2001; Souchu et al., 2010). Depending on the year, the

contribution of anthropogenic inputs from WWTP varies importantly to supply up to 90% of
total inputs in dry years. The N:P molar ratio of these anthropogenic inputs (~5; 2009-2016
average, data not shown) is much lower than that of natural inputs (~40; 2009-2016 average,
data not shown), thus placing the lagoon in nitrogen limiting conditions in those years, the
main source of current phosphorus inputs coming from the WWTPs.

885

886 5 Conclusions

887 The GAMELag-Conch model, developed to answer the problem of reconciling resource 888 exploitation through shellfish culture and regulatory constraints, allowed an evaluation of the 889 ecosystem carrying capacity of the Thau lagoon and the simulation of various scenarios waste 890 water treatment management and shellfish farming strategies. To the best of our knowledge, 891 there are no existing model taking into account both nitrogen and phosphorus inputs within 892 the frame of carrying capacity assessment and most carrying capacity models are based solely 893 on nitrogen (Dowd, 2003; Byron et al., 2011c; Chapelle et al., 2000; Filgueira et al., 2014a; 894 Guyondet et al., 2014) or biomass data sets (Jiang and Gibbs, 2005). Under current 895 conditions, the carrying capacity of the Thau Lagoon does not appear to be limiting. The 896 interannual variability introduced by the differences in weather conditions strongly affects 897 shellfish farming in terms of production and shellfish performances rather than did the 898 contrast between the different tested scenarios. The productivity of the ecosystem seemed to 899 depend mainly on watershed inputs in which inputs from WWTPs had a predominant role in 900 dry years. Shellfish production was more specifically controlled by phosphorus as revealed by 901 unbalanced N:P ratio in loadings. The trophic resource being sufficient, the oyster control on 902 the phytoplankton was not excessive and depended on the stock density of cultured bivalves 903 or additional phosphorus brought to the lagoon. The use of high stocking densities should be 904 prohibited because if they generated higher production than current conditions, at the

expenses of thinner oysters with low condition index. Finally, the ecological status did not
appear to be threatened with regard to the current shellfish pressure. This model thus appeared
as a suitable tool for management perspectives. Another strength and recommended approach
(Byron et al., 2011a) of this work resides in the implication of shellfish farmers, stakeholders,
local and governmental management bodies as well as scientists to implement realistically
based scenarios in the search for an equilibrium between shellfish production and ecological
status regulation.

912 However, important caveats must be given here as this paper reports a global evaluation of the 913 carrying capacity through the use of characteristic times or depletion index that might vary in 914 time and space (Dame and Prins., 1998; Guyondet et al., 2014). Further work is necessary to 915 alleviate this time varying control of the carrying capacity where characteristic times or even 916 depletion index are used to identify seasonal effects and sensitive periods to be confronted to 917 shellfish production, performances and potential ecological impacts. This ongoing work shall 918 help management of shellfish culture practices in this context of maintaining "good" 919 ecological status. A perspective use of this numerical tool resides in a theoretical approach 920 that would involve large variations of nutrient loadings to seek for tipping points where 921 depletion or ecological indicators may drastically change with strong impacts on the whole 922 ecosystem functioning. Short term development of this tool would address the question of 923 anoxic crisis, which had sporadically occurred in the Thau lagoon when temperature increases 924 and weather conditions are calm. These anoxic crises have led to dramatic loss of cultured 925 bivalves hence temporarily damaging ecological conditions of the lagoon. Further 926 developments of this management tool should address questions related to climate change, 927 where the frequency and-or the intensity of meteorological events, such as temperature 928 increase or the modification of rainfall regimes should be considered concomitantly with

929 increase in population, in turn increasing watershed loadings, subsequent refit of WWTP and 930 sustainability of uses in the Thau lagoon.

931

932 6 Acknowledgements

933 This study was supported by the University of Montpellier, Ifremer and DLAL-FEAMP 934 (CAPATHAU postdoctoral fellowship). The authors thank Melaine Gourault for providing 935 the latest version of the DEB model for *Crassostrea gigas*. Thanks to Eve Mouret for 936 adapting this model to the Thau Lagoon oysters as part of her Master thesis, and Christophe 937 Lett for his help in her supervision. We express our gratitude to all the staff of the LER-LR 938 laboratory, involved in the observation networks of the REPHY, the RESCO, the RSL-DCE, 939 specifically Claude Chiantella, Eric Abadie, Clarisse Hubert, Serge Mortreux, Patrik le Gall, 940 Gregory Messiaen, Anais Crottier, Elodie Foucault, Martine Fortune, Dominique Munaron, 941 Tom Berteaux, Jocelyne Oheix, Emmanuelle Roque d'Orbcastel and the coordinators of these 942 networks (Catherine Belin, Elodie Fleury, Valérie derolez). Our thanks also go to the SMBT 943 for providing the database of nitrogen and phosphorus inputs from the watershed. The authors 944 also thank the DLAL animators (Beatrice Pary, Agnes D'Artigues) and the people involved in 945 the scenario construction (SMBT: Luc Hardy, David Cottalorda, CRCM: Denis Regler, 946 Adeline Perignon, Cepralmar: Matthew Hebert, Erika Gervasoni, Anahita Marzin, DDTM: 947 Philian Retif, AERMC: Anahi Barrera, Anais Giraud). 948

- 949
- 7 References
- 950 Alunno-Bruscia, M., Bourlès, Y., Maurer, D., Robert, S., Mazurié, J., Gangnery, A.,
- 951 Goulletquer, P., Pouvreau, S., 2011. A single bio-energetics growth and reproduction model
- 952 for the oyster *Crassostrea gigas* in six Atlantic ecosystems. J. Sea Res. 66, 340–348.
- 953 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seares.2011.07.008

- 954 Bacher, C., 1989. Capacité trophique du bassin de Marennes-Oléron : couplage d'un modèle
- 955 de transport particulaire et d'un modèle de croissance de l'huître *Crassostrea gigas*. Aquat.
- 956 Living Resour. 2, 199–214. https://doi.org/10.1051/alr:1989025
- 957 Bacher, C., Duarte, P., Ferreira, J.G., Héral, M., Raillard, O., 1998. Assessment and
- 958 comparison of the Marennes-Oléron Bay (France) and Carlingford Lough (Ireland) carrying
- 959 capacity with ecosystem models. Aquat. Ecol. 31, 379–394.
- 960 https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1009925228308
- 961 Bec, Béatrice, Valérie Derolez, Dominique Soudant, Ludovic Cesmat, Romain Pete, and
- 962 Marion Richard. 2018. Projet CAPATHAU : Capacité Trophique de la lagune de Thau.
- 963 Evolution temporelle de l'état écologique de la lagune de Thau et des performances des
- 964 coquillages en élevage au regard de la réduction des apports issus du bassin versant et des
- 965 changements météo. 58 p.
- 966 Bernard, I., de Kermoysan, G., Pouvreau, S., 2011a. Effect of phytoplankton and temperature
- 967 on the reproduction of the Pacific oyster Crassostrea gigas: Investigation through DEB
- 968 theory. J. Sea Res. 66, 349–360. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seares.2011.07.009
- 969 Bernard, I., de Kermoysan, G., Pouvreau, S., 2011b. Effect of phytoplankton and temperature
- 970 on the reproduction of the Pacific oyster *Crassostrea gigas*: Investigation through DEB
- 971 theory. J. Sea Res. 66, 349–360. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seares.2011.07.009
- 972 Bougrier, S., Geairon, P., Deslous-Paoli, J.M., Bacher, C., Jonquières, G., 1995. Allometric
- 973 relationships and effects of temperature on clearance and oxygen consumption rates of
- 974 Crassostrea gigas (Thunberg). Aquaculture 134, 143–154. https://doi.org/10.1016/0044-

975 8486(95)00036-2

- 976 Bourlès, Y., Alunno-Bruscia, M., Pouvreau, S., Tollu, G., Leguay, D., Arnaud, C.,
- 977 Goulletquer, P., Kooijman, S. a L.M., 2009. Modelling growth and reproduction of the Pacific
- 978 oyster *Crassostrea gigas*: Advances in the oyster-DEB model through application to a coastal

- 979 pond. J. Sea Res. 62, 62–71. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seares.2009.03.002
- 980 Brigolin, D., Maschio, G.D., Rampazzo, F., Giani, M., Pastres, R., 2009. An individual-based
- 981 population dynamic model for estimating biomass yield and nutrient fluxes through an off-
- 982 shore mussel (*Mytilus galloprovincialis*) farm. Estuar. Coast. Shelf Sci. 82, 365–376.
- 983 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecss.2009.01.029
- 984 Byron, C., Bengtson, D., Costa-Pierce, B., Calanni, J., 2011a. Integrating science into
- 985 management: Ecological carrying capacity of bivalve shellfish aquaculture. Mar. Policy 35,
- 986 363–370. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpol.2010.10.016
- 987 Byron, C., Link, J., Costa-Pierce, B., Bengtson, D., 2011b. Calculating ecological carrying
- 988 capacity of shellfish aquaculture using mass-balance modeling: Narragansett Bay, Rhode
- 989 Island. Ecol. Modell. 222, 1743–1755. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2011.03.010
- 990 Byron, C., Link, J., Costa-Pierce, B., Engtson, D., 2011c. Modeling ecological carrying
- 991 capacity of shellfish aquaculture in highly flushed temperate lagoons. Aquaculture 314, 87–
- 992 99. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2011.02.019
- 993 Carver, C.E.A., Mallet, A.L., 1990. Estimating the carrying capacity of a coastal inlet for
- 994 mussel culture. Aquaculture 88, 39–53. https://doi.org/10.1016/0044-8486(90)90317-G
- 995 Chapelle, A., Ménesguen, A., Deslous-Paoli, J.M., Souchu, P., Mazouni, N., Vaquer, A.,
- 996 Millet, B., 2000. Modelling nitrogen, primary production and oxygen in a Mediterranean
- 997 lagoon. Impact of oysters farming and inputs from the watershed. Ecol. Modell. 127, 161–
- 998 181. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0304-3800(99)00206-9
- 999 Dabrowski, T., Lyons, K., Curé, M., Berry, A., Nolan, G., 2013. Numerical modelling of
- 1000 spatio-temporal variability of growth of *Mytilus edulis* (L.) and influence of its cultivation on
- 1001 ecosystem functioning. J. Sea Res. 76, 5–21. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seares.2012.10.012
- 1002 Dame, R.E., Prins., T.C., 1998. Bivalve carrying capacity in coastal ecosystems. Aquatic
- 1003 Ecology 31(4):409-421. 409-421.

- Derolez, V., Ouisse, V., Fiandrino, A., Munaron, D., Bissery, C., Kloareg, M., 2013. Analyse
  statistique des données du RSL Etude des trajectoires écologiques des lagunes entre 2001 et
  2012.
- 1007 DDTM. 2014. Arrêté n° DDTM34-2016-06-04069 du 19 juin 2014 portant Schéma des
- 1008 structures des autorisations d'exploitation de cultures marines situées dans le Département de
- 1009 l'Hérault. http://www.cepralmar.org/guide\_conchylicole/documents/2.1.2-
- 1010 Structures\_Herault.pdf
- 1011 Deslous-Paoli, J.M., Souchu, P., Mazouni, N., Juge, C., Dagault, F., 1998. Relations milieu-
- 1012 ressources: Impact de la conchyliculture sur un environnement lagunaire Mediterraneen
- 1013 (Thau). Oceanol. Acta 21, 831–843. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0399-1784(99)80010-3
- 1014 Dowd, M., 2003. Seston dynamics in a tidal inlet with shellfish aquaculture: A model study
- 1015 using tracer equations. Estuar. Coast. Shelf Sci. 57, 523–537. https://doi.org/10.1016/S02721016 7714(02)00397-9
- 1017 European Community, 2000. Directive 200/60/EC of the European parliament and of the
- 1018 council of 23 October 2000 establishing a framework for community action in the field of1019 water policy.
- 1020 European Community, 1991, Council Directive 91/676/EEC of 12 December 1991
- 1021 concerning the protection of waters against pollution caused by nitrates from agricultural1022 sources.
- 1023 European Community, 2004. Case C-280/02. Commission of the European Communities v
- 1024 French Republic. Failure of a Member State to fulfil obligations Directive 91/271/EEC.
- 1025 Urban waste water treatment. Article 5(1) and (2) and Annex II. Failure to identify sensitive
- 1026 areas. Meaning of "eutrophication". Failure to implement more stringent treatment of
- 1027 discharges into sensitive areas. https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-
- 1028 content/EN/TXT/HTML/?uri=CELEX:62002CJ0280&from=FR

- 1029 Fao, 2018. World Fisheries and Aquaculture, Aquaculture. https://doi.org/issn 10
- 1030 Ferreira, J.G., Hawkins, A.J.S., Bricker, S.B., 2007. Management of productivity,
- 1031 environmental effects and profitability of shellfish aquaculture the Farm Aquaculture
- 1032 Resource Management (FARM) model. Aquaculture 264, 160–174.
- 1033 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2006.12.017
- 1034 Ferreira, J.G., Hawkins, A.J.S., Monteiro, P., Moore, H., Service, M., Pascoe, P.L., Ramos,
- 1035 L., Sequeira, A., 2008. Integrated assessment of ecosystem-scale carrying capacity in shellfish
- 1036 growing areas. Aquaculture 275, 138–151. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2007.12.018
- 1037 Fiandrino, A., Giraud, A., Robin, S., & Pinatel, C. (2012). Validation d'une méthode
- 1038 d'estimation des volumes d'eau échangés entre la mer et les lagunes et définition
- 1039 d'indicateurs hydrodynamiques associés.
- 1040 Fiandrino, A., Ouisse, V., Dumas, F., Lagarde, F., Pete, R., Malet, N., Le Noc S., de Wit, R.
- 1041 (2017). Spatial patterns in coastal lagoons related to the hydrodynamics of seawater intrusion.
- 1042 Marine Pollution Bulletin, 119(1), 132–144. http://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2017.03.006
- 1043 Filgueira, R., Comeau, L. a, Guyondet, T., Mckindsey, C.W., Byron, C.J., 2015. Modelling
- 1044 carrying capacity of bivalve aquaculture: A review of definitions and methods, Encyclopedia
- 1045 of Sustainability Science and Technology. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4939-2493-6
- 1046 Filgueira, R., Grant, J., 2009. A box model for ecosystem-level management of mussel culture
- 1047 carrying capacity in a Coastal Bay. Ecosystems 12, 1222–1233.
- 1048 https://doi.org/10.1007/s10021-009-9289-6
- 1049 Filgueira, R., Guyondet, T., Comeau, L. a., Grant, J., 2014a. A fully-spatial ecosystem-DEB
- 1050 model of oyster (Crassostrea virginica) carrying capacity in the Richibucto Estuary, Eastern
- 1051 Canada. J. Mar. Syst. 136, 42–54. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jmarsys.2014.03.015
- 1052 Filgueira, R., Guyondet, T., Comeau, L.A., Grant, J., 2014b. Physiological indices as
- 1053 indicators of ecosystem status in shellfish aquaculture sites. Ecol. Indic. 39, 134–143.

- 1054 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2013.12.006
- 1055 Filgueira, R., Guyondet, T., Comeau, L.A., Tremblay, R., 2016. Bivalve aquaculture-
- 1056 environment interactions in the context of climate change. Glob. Chang. Biol. 22, 3901–3913.
- 1057 https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.13346
- 1058 Gangnery, A., 2003. Etude et modélisation de la dynamique des populations de bivalves en
- 1059 élevage (Crassostrea gigas et Mytilus galloprovincialis) dans le bassin de Thau
- 1060 (Méditerranée, France) et des ascidies solitaires associées. Phd Thesis 1–175.
- 1061 Gangnery, A., Bacher, C., Buestel, D., 2001. Assessing the production and the impact of
- 1062 cultivated oysters in the Thau lagoon (Mediterranee, France) with a population dynamics
- 1063 model. Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci. 58, 1012–1020. https://doi.org/10.1139/f01-028
- 1064 Grangeré, K., Lefebvre, S., Bacher, C., Cugier, P., Ménesguen, A., 2010. Modelling the
- 1065 spatial heterogeneity of ecological processes in an intertidal estuarine bay: Dynamic
- 1066 interactions between bivalves and phytoplankton. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 415, 141–158.
- 1067 https://doi.org/10.3354/meps08659
- 1068 Grangeré, K., Ménesguen, A., Lefebvre, S., Bacher, C., Pouvreau, S., 2009. Modelling the
- 1069 influence of environmental factors on the physiological status of the Pacific oyster
- 1070 Crassostrea gigas in an estuarine embayment; The Baie des Veys (France). J. Sea Res. 62,
- 1071 147–158. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seares.2009.02.002
- 1072 Grant, J., Curran, K.J., Guyondet, T.L., Tita, G., Bacher, C., Koutitonsky, V., Dowd, M.,
- 1073 2007. A box model of carrying capacity for suspended mussel aquaculture in Lagune de la
- 1074 Grande-Entrée, Iles-de-la-Madeleine, Québec. Ecol. Modell. 200, 193–206.
- 1075 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2006.07.026
- 1076 Grant, J., Filgueira, R., 2011. The application of dynamic modelling to prediction of
- 1077 production carrying capacity in shellfish farming., in: Shumway, S. (Ed.), Shellfish
- 1078 Aquaculture and the Environment. Wiley-Blackwell Science Publishers, Ames, IA, pp. 135–

1079 154.

- 1080 Guyondet, T., Comeau, L. a., Bacher, C., Grant, J., Rosland, R., Sonier, R., Filgueira, R.,
- 1081 2014. Climate Change Influences Carrying Capacity in a Coastal Embayment Dedicated to
- 1082 Shellfish Aquaculture. Estuaries and Coasts 38, 1593–1618. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12237-
- 1083 014-9899-x
- 1084 Guyondet, T., Roy, S., Koutitonsky, V.G., Grant, J., Tita, G., 2010. Integrating multiple
- spatial scales in the carrying capacity assessment of a coastal ecosystem for bivalve
- 1086 aquaculture. J. Sea Res. 64, 341–359. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seares.2010.05.003
- 1087 Harzallah, A., Chapelle, A., 2002. Influence de la variabilité climatique sur l'apparition de
- 1088 crises anoxiques ou 'malaïgues' dans l' étang de Thau (sud de la France). Oceanol. Acta 25,
- 1089 79–86. https://doi.org/10.1016/s0399-1784(02)01184-2
- 1090 Higgins, C.B., Stephenson, K., Brown, B.L., 2011. Nutrient Bioassimilation Capacity of
- 1091 Aquacultured Oysters: Quantification of an Ecosystem Service. J. Environ. Qual. 40, 271.
- 1092 https://doi.org/10.2134/jeq2010.0203
- 1093 Jiang, W., Gibbs, M.T., 2005. Predicting the carrying capacity of bivalve shellfish culture
- using a steady, linear food web model. Aquaculture 244, 171–185.
- 1095 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2004.11.050
- 1096 Kashiwai, M., 1998. History of carrying capacity concept as an index of ecosystem
- 1097 productivity: (Review). Bull. Hokkaido Natl. Fish. Res. Inst. 59, 81–100.
- 1098 Kellogg, M.L., Smyth, A.R., Luckenbach, M.W., Carmichael, R.H., Brown, B.L., Cornwell,
- 1099 J.C., Piehler, M.F., Owens, M.S., Dalrymple, D.J., Higgins, C.B., 2014. Use of oysters to
- 1100 mitigate eutrophication in coastal waters. Estuar. Coast. Shelf Sci. 151, 156–168.
- 1101 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecss.2014.09.025
- 1102 Kooijman, S.A.L.M., 2010. Dynamic energy budget theory and population ecology: lessons
- 1103 from Daphnia. Philos. Trans. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci. 365, 3541–3552.

- 1104 https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2010.0167
- 1105 Kooijman, S.A.L.M., 2009. Dynamic Energy Budget Theory 514.
- 1106 Lagarde, F., Fiandrino, A., Ubertini, M., D'Orbcastel, E.R., Mortreux, S., Chiantella, C., Bec,
- 1107 B., Bonnet, D., Roques, C., Bernard, I., Richard, M., Guyondet, T., Pouvreau, S., Lett, C.,
- 1108 2019. Duality of trophic supply and hydrodynamic connectivity drives spatial patterns of
- 1109 Pacific oyster recruitment. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. https://doi.org/10.3354/meps13151
- 1110 La Jeunesse, I., 2001. Etude intégrée dynamique du phosphore dans le système bassin
- 1111 versant-lagune de Thau.
- 1112 La Jeunesse, I., Elliott, M., 2004. Anthropogenic regulation of the phosphorus balance in the
- 1113 Thau catchment-coastal lagoon system (Mediterraean Sea, France) over 24 years. Mar. Pollut.
- 1114 Bull. 48, 679–687. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2003.10.011
- 1115 McKindsey, C.W., Thetmeyer, H., Landry, T., Silvert, W., 2006. Review of recent carrying
- 1116 capacity models for bivalve culture and recommendations for research and management.
- 1117 Aquaculture 261, 451–462. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2006.06.044
- 1118 Ministère de l'Ecologie, du Développement Durable et de l'Energie (MEDDE), 2015. Arrêté
- 1119 du 27 juillet 2015 modifiant l'arrêté du 25 janvier 2010 relatif aux méthodes et critères
- 1120 d'évaluation de l'état écologique, de l'état chimique et du potentiel écologique des eaux de
- 1121 surface pris en application des articles R. 212-10, R. 212-11 et R. 212-18 du Code de
- 1122 l'Environnement. JORF n°0198, p. 15032.
- 1123 https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/eli/arrete/2015/7/27/DEVL1513989A/jo/texte.
- 1124 Nunes, J.P., Ferreira, J.G., Gazeau, F., Lencart-Silva, J., Zhang, X.L., Zhu, M.Y., Fang, J.G.,
- 1125 2003. A model for sustainable management of shellfish polyculture in coastal bays.
- 1126 Aquaculture 219, 257–277. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0044-8486(02)00398-8
- 1127 Parsons, T.R., Stephens, K., Strickland, J.D.H., 1961. On the Chemical Composition of
- 1128 Eleven Species of Marine Phytoplankters. J. Fish. Res. Bd. Can. Downloaded from

- 1129 www.nrcresearchpress.com by WAGENINGEN UR on 09 / 08 / 15.
- 1130 Pernet, F., Barret, J., Le Gall, P., Corporeau, C., Dégremont, L., Lagarde, F., Pépin, J.F.,
- 1131 Keck, N., 2012. Mass mortalities of Pacific oysters *Crassostrea gigas* reflect infectious
- 1132 diseases and vary with farming practices in the Mediterranean Thau lagoon, France. Aquac.
- 1133 Environ. Interact. 2, 215–237. https://doi.org/10.3354/aei00041
- 1134 Platt, T., Irwin, B., 1973. Caloric content of phytoplankton. Limnol. Oceanogr. 18, 306–310.
- 1135 https://doi.org/10.4319/lo.1973.18.2.0306
- 1136 Plus, M., Jeunesse, I. La, Bouraoui, F., Zaldívar, J.M., Chapelle, A., Lazure, P., 2006.
- 1137 Modelling water discharges and nitrogen inputs into a Mediterranean lagoon: Impact on the
- 1138 primary production, in: Ecological Modelling. pp. 69–89.
- 1139 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2005.07.037
- 1140 Pouvreau, S., Bourles, Y., Lefebvre, S., Gangnery, A., Alunno-Bruscia, M., 2006. Application
- 1141 of a dynamic energy budget model to the Pacific oyster, Crassostrea gigas, reared under
- 1142 various environmental conditions. J. Sea Res. 56, 156–167.
- 1143 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seares.2006.03.007
- 1144 Raillard O., Ménesguen A., 1994. An ecosystem box-model for estimating the carrying
- 1145 capacity of a macrotidal shellfish system. Mar.Ecol.Prog.Ser. 115, 117-130.
- 1146 REPHY. 2017. French Observation and Monitoring program for Phytoplankton and
- 1147 Hydrology in coastal waters. 1987-2016 Metropolitan data. SEANOE database
- 1148 (http://doi.org/10.17882/47248).
- 1149 Rose, J.M., Bricker, S.B., Ferreira, J.G., 2015. Comparative analysis of modeled nitrogen
- 1150 removal by shellfish farms. Mar. Pollut. Bull. 91, 185–190.
- 1151 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2014.12.006
- 1152 Smaal, A.C., Prins, T.C., Dankers, N., Ball, B., 1997. Minimum requirements for modelling
- 1153 bivalve carrying capacity. Aquat. Ecol. 31, 423–428.

- 1154 https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1009947627828
- 1155 Soetaert, K., Petzoldt, T., Setzer, R.W., 2010. Package deSolve : Solving Initial Value
- 1156 Differential Equations in R. J. Stat. Softw. 33, 1–25.
- 1157 Souchu, P., Bec, B., Smith, V.H., Laugier, T., Fiandrino, A., Benau, L., Orsoni, V., Collos,
- 1158 Y., Vaquer, A., 2010. Patterns in nutrient limitation and chlorophyll a along an anthropogenic
- 1159 eutrophication gradient in French Mediterranean coastal lagoons. Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci.
- 1160 753, 743–753. https://doi.org/10.1139/F10-018
- 1161 Souchu, P., Gasc, A., Collos, Y., Vaquer, A., Tournier, H., Bibent, B., Deslous-Paoli, J.M.,
- 1162 1998. Biogeochemical aspects of bottom anoxia in a Mediterranean lagoon (Thau, France).
- 1163 Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 164, 135–146. https://doi.org/10.3354/meps164135
- 1164 Troussellier, M., Deslous-Paoli, J.M., 2001. La lagune de Thau: un site atelier pour
- 1165 l'acquisition, l'intégration et la valorisation des connaissances. Oceanis 27, 257–289.
- 1166 Willmott, C.J., 1981. On the validation of models. Phys. Geogr. 2, 184–194.