

Spatial gradients of introgressed ancestry reveal cryptic connectivity patterns in a high gene flow marine fish

Tony Robinet, Valérie Roussel, Karine Cheze, Pierre-Alexandre Gagnaire

► To cite this version:

Tony Robinet, Valérie Roussel, Karine Cheze, Pierre-Alexandre Gagnaire. Spatial gradients of introgressed ancestry reveal cryptic connectivity patterns in a high gene flow marine fish. Molecular Ecology, 2020, 10.1111/mec.15611. hal-02925509

HAL Id: hal-02925509 https://hal.science/hal-02925509

Submitted on 29 Aug2020

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

Spatial gradients of introgressed ancestry reveal cryptic connectivity patterns in a high gene flow marine fish

3

4 Tony Robinet (1)*, Valérie Roussel (2), Karine Cheze (¹) and Pierre-Alexandre
5 Gagnaire (3)

- 6
- 7

8 ABSTRACT

9

Assessing genetic connectivity among populations in high gene flow species is 10 sometimes insufficient to evaluate demographic connectivity. Genetic differentiation 11 quickly becomes zero as soon as a few dozen migrants are exchanged per generation. 12 This provides little information to determine whether migration can ensure 13 demographic coupling. The resulting difficulties in delineating conservation units for 14 the management of commercially exploited marine fish species are well illustrated in 15 the case of the European sea bass (*Dicentrarchus labrax*). Previous attempts to assess 16 connectivity patterns in the northeast Atlantic have been hampered by a lack of 17 spatial genetic structure. In contrast, mark-recapture data suggested low migration 18 rates between regional spawning areas. Here, we show how a spatial gradient of 19 introgressed Mediterranean ancestry across the northeast Atlantic reflects cryptic 20

2 d'Histoire Naturelle, CNRS, IRD, SU, UCN, UA ; Station marine de Concarneau,

7

^{1 1} Biologie des Organismes et Ecosystèmes Aquatiques (BOREA) ; Muséum National

³ Quai de la Croix, 29900 Concarneau, France

^{4 2} Université de Bretagne Occidentale, Institut GéoArchi EA7462, 6 avenue Le

⁵ Gorgeu, 29100 Brest, France

^{6 3} ISEM, Univ Montpellier, CNRS, EPHE, IRD, Montpellier, France.

^{8 *} corresponding author : <u>robinet@mnhn.fr</u>

patterns of genetic and demographic connectivity. Using a 1K SNP chip dataset in 21 22 827 individuals sampled from Portugal to the North Sea, we found null overall genetic differentiation across the northeast Atlantic. We however detected a subtle 23 latitudinal admixture gradient originating at the edge of the contact zone with the 24 Mediterranean sea bass lineage. Two significant breaks in the ancestry gradient at the 25 tip of Galicia and northern Brittany indicated barriers to effective dispersal between 26 demographically distinct units. Moreover, a northward expansion signal in Irish and 27 North Seas was revealed by the surfing of rare Mediterranean alleles at the edge of 28 the species range. Our results show that introgressed ancestry gradients offer a 29 powerful alternative to assess genetic and demographic connectivity when the 30 neutral migration-drift balance is not informative. (250 words) 31

32

33 Keywords: admixture, expansion, genetic and demographic connectivity,34 introgression, spatial structure, stock delineation

35 1 | INTRODUCTION

36

Assessment of genetic connectivity among populations is widely used in 37 conservation biology and species management to evaluate effective dispersal and the 38 consequences of spatially-dependent evolutionary processes on species persistence, 39 resilience and adaptability (Cayuela et al. 2018; Gagnaire 2020). Using polymorphism 40 data from individuals sampled across the landscape, the genetic approach can detect 41 local barriers to gene flow separating distinct populations that exchange measurable 42 amounts of migrants per generation. Demographic independence between such 43 populations can be assumed when the fraction of exchanged migrants is too small to 44 ensure population persistence in case of negative intrinsic growth rate (Pulliam, 1988; 45 Lowe & Allendorf, 2010). Measuring migratory exchanges using genetic data may, 46 however, be a difficult task. 47

The power of the population genetics approach depends on the relative intensity 48 of two opposed forces, migration (m) and genetic drift $(1/N_e)$. When migration 49 overwhelms the effect of genetic drift (i.e. when the number of migrants exchanged 50 per generation $(N_e m)$ exceeds a few dozen), genetic differentiation between 51 populations is close to zero. Null genetic differentiation can result from a variety of 52 equilibrium scenarios ranging from high connectivity among small populations to 53 54 nearly complete demographic independence among large populations. Consequently, assessing demographic connectivity in species with both large 55 populations and high migration rates has been a long-standing challenge to 56 population genetic approaches (Waples, 1998). Such combinations of biological 57 parameters are frequently encountered in marine species with a dispersive larval 58 stage (Hedgecock et al., 2007). Therefore, a persistent gap between evolutionary and 59 ecological scales often prevents managers to use genetic connectivity information for 60

fisheries management (Palumbi, 2003; Waples & Gaggiotti, 2006; Waples, Punt &
Cope, 2008).

Molecular markers influenced by selection can compensate the lack of signal at 63 neutral loci when the migration-drift equilibrium is not informative. The use of 64 adaptive differentiation signals has been proposed as a solution to improve the 65 delineation of management units (Funk et al., 2012). This approach is now greatly 66 facilitated by the availability of large polymorphism datasets to scan genomes for 67 outlier markers influenced by selection (Stapley et al., 2010; Savolainen et al., 2013; 68 Narum et al., 2013). Several studies in marine species that typically show weak to no 69 genetic differentiation at neutral markers have found stronger signals of spatial 70 structure at different scales using outlier loci (e.g. Bekkevold et al., 2016; Benestan et 71 al., 2016; Van Wyngaarden, 2017). Although these could help in delineating cryptic 72 evolutionary management units, the variation patterns displayed by outlier loci often 73 remain challenging to translate into quantitative assessments of demographic 74 connectivity. One of the main reasons is that observed genetic variation patterns can 75 be generally attributed to a variety of possible selective mechanisms (Bierne et al. 76 2013), potentially involving complex relationships between local adaptation and gene 77 flow (Tigano & Friesen, 2016). Contextualizing the eco-evolutionary history of the 78 studied species thus helps to discern the mechanisms underlying the patterns of 79 differentiation displayed by outlier loci, toward a better understanding of 80 connectivity (Liggins et al. 2020). 81

Genetic admixture between differentiated lineages is a particularly informative evolutionary context to learn about connectivity. When two divergent taxa come into secondary contact and exchange genes, the spatial diffusion of foreign genetic material can be used to reveal the population genetic connectivity within each introgressed lineage (Sedghifar et al., 2015; Bertl et al., 2018; Duranton et al., 2019). If

the recipient lineage is not genetically structured, the spatial homogenization of 87 foreign allele frequencies is a quick process. However, local barriers to gene flow 88 may slow down the spread of foreign alleles and generate steps in the admixture and 89 introgression gradients within the recipient lineage (Gagnaire et al., 2015). Although 90 allele frequencies equilibrate quickly at neutral loci following secondary contact, 91 barrier loci involved in partial reproductive isolation have a reduced effective 92 migration rate between lineages and therefore retain their signal of differentiation for 93 longer (Sedghifar et al., 2016). Semi-permeable species boundaries characterized by 94 heterogeneous rates of introgression among loci thus provide favorable conditions to 95 reveal cryptic barriers to gene flow within introgressed lineages, even after several 96 thousands of generations of introgression (Gagnaire et al., 2015). Post-glacial lineages 97 that are nowadays in contact and exchange genes through natural hybridization 98 represent suitable cases for using spatial introgression gradients to study 99 connectivity. 100

The European sea bass (Dicentrarchus labrax L.) is a marine fish species that 101 ranges from northwestern Africa to southern Norway in the Atlantic, and 102 throughout the Mediterranean and Black Seas (Vandeputte et al. 2019). The species is 103 genetically subdivided into two distinct lineages, one Atlantic (ATL) and one 104 Mediterranean (MED), which naturally hybridize at the Atlantic-Mediterranean 105 transition zone (Naciri et al., 1999; Lemaire et al., 2005; Souche et al., 2015). 106 Population genomic studies based on RAD-sequencing (Tine et al., 2014) and whole-107 genome resequencing (Duranton et al., 2018) have revealed several important aspects 108 of the of the European sea bass evolutionary history: (*i*) genetic divergence between 109 ATL and MED lineages is the result of about 270 kyrs of allopatric divergence, (ii) 110 secondary contact has started after the last glacial retreat about 11.5 kyrs ago, and 111 since then (iii) gene flow occurs at variable rates across the genome due to partial 112

reproductive isolation between the two lineages. (iv) For a still unknown reason, 113 postglacial gene flow has been more pronounced from the Atlantic into the 114 Mediterranean than in the opposite direction. As a result, contemporary ATL 115 genomes are made of ~5% of MED genetic material, while western and eastern MED 116 genomes contain ~31% and 13% of ATL ancestry, respectively (Duranton et al., 2018). 117 Such levels of introgression are sufficiently high to provide information on genetic 118 connectivity within both sea bass lineages. In the Mediterranean, Duranton et al. 119 (2019) analyzed the neutral decay of introgressed haplotype length as a function of 120 distance from the contact zone to estimate a mean per-generation dispersal distance 121 of 5 to 50 km. This quantitative approach, based on a small number of whole-genome 122 sequences, did not have the spatial resolution required to provide a detailed map of 123 connectivity. Here, we used a different strategy based on moderate genome coverage 124 125 but extensive spatial sampling to identify local barriers to gene flow within the Atlantic lineage. Our objective was to study both the neutral and non-neutral 126 diffusion of MED alleles across Atlantic sea bass populations to evaluate their fine-127 scale spatial genetic structure. 128

Atlantic sea bass populations are of high economic importance to European 129 fisheries, but overfishing probably combined with other factors have led to a decline 130 in landings since 2009-2010, particularly north of the 48th parallel (ICES, 2019). Sea 131 bass stock assessment by scientific authorities (ICES: International Council for the 132 Exploration of the Sea) in the northeastern Atlantic currently relies on four 133 presumably distinct stocks: northern Atlantic, southern Ireland/western Scotland, 134 Biscay and Iberia. However, stock delineation remains poorly understood, making it 135 difficult to properly assess population connectivity and implement effective 136 management programs. Population genetic studies generally found non-significant 137 genetic structure across the northeastern Atlantic (Frisch et al., 2007; Coscia & 138

Mariani, 2011; Souche et al., 2015), possibly due to insufficient spatial and genomic 139 coverage. In parallel, mark-recapture data indicated restricted individual movement 140 between the Bay of Biscay and the English Channel-Celtic Sea region (Fritsch et al., 141 2007), a result partly explained by the fidelity to winter spawning areas recently 142 evidenced with tagging data (de Pontual et al., 2019). A small number of effective 143 migrants per generation may account for the absence of genetic differentiation at 144 neutral markers despite high fidelity to spawning grounds. Therefore, it is possible 145 that independent demographic units have remained undetected by previous 146 population genetic studies. Here, we investigate fine-scale connectivity patterns 147 among Atlantic sea bass populations using the spatial diffusion of Mediterranean 148 alleles from southern Portugal toward the northern part of the species range. We 149 document the existence of two significant steps in the Mediterranean ancestry 150 gradient along the Atlantic coast, which most likely delineate demographically 151 independent populations that slightly differ from current management units. We also 152 find molecular signatures of a recent northward expansion, consistent with recently 153 expanding sea bass fisheries in the northern part of the species range. 154

155

156

157 2 | MATERIALS AND METHODS

158

159 **2.1** | Sampling

Fin clips from 846 individuals were sampled from southern Portugal to the Irish Sea and North Sea in the period Oct. 2012 to May 2015 (Supplementary Table S1). Samples were mostly collected in fish markets, only from fresh fish with a known geographical origin indicated by its ICES statistical rectangle (precision 0.5° in latitude and 1° in longitude) and a known fishing day. The quality of the spatial

fishing information of each individual was checked with the name of the fishingvessel by tracking its position history on http://www.marinetraffic.com.

Tissues were preserved in 85 % ethanol at -20 °C. Individual genomic DNA was 167 extracted following cellular lysis and proteinase K digestion using the Qiagen 168 DNeasy Blood & Tissue kit, and then conserved in TE. DNA extraction quality was 169 controlled using a NanoDrop spectrophotometer keeping samples with an 170 A260/A280 ratio between 1.8 and 2.0. Concentration of double-stranded DNA was 171 then measured with the Qbit dsDNA Broad Range kit with a standard benchmark (0-172 100 ng/ μ l) on a qPCR BioRAD. Individual dsDNA were finally normalized at 25 ng/ 173 μ l and randomly distributed across nine 96-well plates before genotyping. 174

175

176 **2.2** | Genotyping and data quality control

Genotyping was performed by the Labogena platform (Jouy-en-Josas, France) using 177 an iSelect Custom Infinium Illumina array specifically developed in the European sea 178 bass (Faggion et al., 2019). The chip contains 1531 validated SNPs covering the whole 179 genome while being homogeneously distributed along the recombination map, and 180 presents no ascertainment bias between Atlantic and Mediterranean sea bass 181 lineages. Individual genotypes and hybridization intensities generated by Illumina's 182 BeadStudio software were reanalyzed using the R package Argyle (Morgan et al., 183 2016) to perform SNP quality control. Markers were filtered based on their rate of no-184 call genotypes (per locus missingness < 0.1), rate of heterozygosity (Het < 0.55), and 185 minor-allele frequency within the whole Atlantic dataset (MAF > 0.01), in order to 186 include even variants that are frequent or fixed within the Mediterranean, but rare in 187 the Atlantic. Individuals with an excess of missing genotypes were also excluded 188 (per sample missingness < 0.1). 189

In order to remove a few miscalled markers which variation profile was correlated with samples arrangement in the 96-well plates, we performed a genotype-plate association analysis in *Plink* (Purcell et al., 2007, p-value exclusion threshold=1e-4).

Reference Mediterranean genotypes of 10 MED individuals (four from eastern MED and six from western MED) were merged to our final dataset to compare allele frequencies between ATL and MED populations. These reference genotypes were extracted from high-quality whole-genome resequencing data without any missing genotype at the retained loci (Duranton et al., 2018).

199

200 **2.3** | Spatial genetic variation on different datasets

The 827 quality-filtered specimens were stratified into three different datasets to 201 reach variable levels of precision in spatial genetics analyses: (i) a 'regional dataset' of 202 827 specimens distributed into 7 regions; (ii) a 'main dataset' in which the 827 203 specimens were assigned to 21 localities corresponding to single ICES rectangles or 204 groups of adjacent rectangles, with a minimum precision of 1.5° in latitude and 3° in 205 longitude, and a number of individuals per locality ranging from 11 to 111 (mean=40, 206 Figure 1, Supplementary Figure S1 and Table S1 for more details); (iii) a 'refined 207 dataset', more precise in space, consisting of 761 specimens distributed into 31 208 localities, with a minimum precision of 30' in latitude and 1° in longitude, and a 209 minimal number of 8 individuals per locality (from 8 to 43, mean = 24, 210 Supplementary Figure S2). The main dataset was used for all analyses, unless stated 211 otherwise. 212

The proportion of polymorphic markers among the 1012 retained SNPs was calculated for each of the 21 localities. A regression model of the proportion of polymorphic markers as a function of sample size per location was fitted using a

nonlinear least squares analysis with two parameters in order to account for the effect of sample size. We then tested for a linear relationship between the localities' residuals to the fitted model and the latitude of localities. We also tested the existence of a linear correlation between the mean observed heterozygosity per sample locality and latitude. Sample groupings from the regional dataset were then used to test for deviations from expectations under Hardy-Weinberg Equilibrium within each of the seven regions defined above with the *Pegas* R package (Paradis, 2010).

A redundancy analysis (RDA) was performed using the R package *Vegan* (Oksanen et al., 2019) in order to evaluate the extent to which SNP variation is influenced by geographic and temporal factors. We first fitted the model Y (individual genotype) ~ (Latitude + Longitude + Month + Year of capture) and assessed the significance of each explanatory factor using 1000 permutations of genotypic data before refitting the model.

Overall FST was calculated among all of the 21 Atlantic locations using all loci 229 and pairwise FST were then calculated for each pair of sampling locations including 230 the two reference MED populations, as well as for pairs of regions using the 'regional 231 dataset'. We used the Hierfstat R package (Goudet, 2005) to calculate FST values and 232 assess their significance using 5000 random permutations of genotypes among 233 localities and among regions. A sequential Bonferroni correction (Hommel, 1989) was 234 applied to empirical p-values with the function *p.adjust()* of the R-base package *Stats*. 235 In order to assess the presence of an isolation-by-distance pattern among ATL 236 locations, we tested the linear correlation between [FST / (1 - FST)] and geographic 237 distance between pairs of localities. We also performed a Mantel test between 238 matrices of pairwise genetic and geographic distances with 10.000 permutations 239 using ADEGENET (Jombart 2008). Pairwise geographic distances were calculated as 240

the shortest path by the continental plateau between two localities (i.e. bathymetry <
200m) using the R package *Marmap* (Pante & Simon-Bouhet, 2013).

We used the directionality index statistics Ψ (Peter & Slatkin, 2013) to test 243 whether genetic differentiation among pairs of localities was due to isolation-by-244 distance at equilibrium or to a recent range expansion in the Atlantic distribution 245 area of D. labrax. Briefly, the directionality index uses comparisons of two-246 dimensional site frequency spectra to capture deviations from symmetric migration, 247 such as those generated during range expansions. We used the R package 248 rangeExpansion (https://github.com/BenjaminPeter/rangeexpansion) to calculate Ψ 249 for all pairs of Atlantic locations, and used pairwise geographic distances between 250 251 locations to infer the most likely spatial origin of a possible range expansion.

252

253

2.4 | MED introgression in ATL genomes

In order to estimate the fraction of MED alleles present in ATL individuals, we used 254 the program *Admixture* (Alexander, Novembre & Lange, 2009), which infers 255 individual ancestry proportions from *K* ancestral populations (here *K* was set to 2). 256 Our unsupervised ancestry inference included 10 MED reference individuals in 257 addition to the 827 ATL samples, so that the two ancestral populations correspond to 258 the ATL and MED sea bass lineages. We set the termination criterion for the 259 optimization algorithm to 100 iterations to ensure convergence and used 1000 260 bootstrap replicates to estimate the standard error of individual ancestry 261 proportions. 262

The effects of sampling date and geographic distance to the southernmost Atlantic location (Sines in southern Portugal, code "SINE") on the extent of Mediterranean introgression were tested using a Global Linear Model (GLM, family=Gaussian), with the percentage of MED ancestry as the dependent variable.

The date of capture (using the 'as.date()' class in R) and the distance to the SINE locality (calculated as the shortest path by the continental plateau) were used as explanatory factors.

The effect of geographic distance to the southernmost ATL location (SINE) on the 270 extent of MED ancestry was then tested alone using a linear regression model. The 271 distance to the SINE location was calculated as the shortest path by the continental 272 plateau. In order to test for the existence of potential breaks in the admixture 273 gradient, we then performed a piecewise regression of MED ancestry as a function of 274 distance to SINE. Breaks separating different linear regression models were 275 introduced one by one and, and at each step, every possible break position was 276 examined by calculating the residual standard error of the piecewise regression 277 278 model. The significance of the reduction in the residual sum of squares of each piecewise regression model compared to the simple regression model was tested 279 using an ANOVA, taking into account the number of additional parameters in the 280 piecewise regression model. 281

282

283 **2.5** | Genome scans

We then evaluated the impact of variable rates of introgression between ATL and 284 MED sea bass lineages on allele frequency gradients within the Atlantic. We more 285 specifically tested the theoretical prediction that the genomic regions with reduced 286 rates of introgression between lineages tend to exhibit the strongest spatial allele 287 frequency patterns within the ATL range due to propitious ratios of between- to 288 within-lineage gene flow intensities (Gagnaire et al., 2015). We thus expected that the 289 loci showing the strongest genetic differentiation within the Atlantic would generally 290 also be FST outliers between ATL and MED lineages. Given the relatively low density 291 of markers in our data set (about 1 SNP per cM), the candidate loci detected by 292

genomes scans for differentiation are most likely to be indirectly influenced by 293 selection through linkage with a nearby selected locus. A previous quantification 294 indicated that the genomic island regions under the influence of the strongest 295 reproductive isolation barriers between Atlantic and Mediterranean lineages occupy 296 about 4% of the sea bass genome (Duranton et al. 2018). Therefore, our SNP panel is 297 expected to contain at least 40 SNPs in strong linkage with reproductive isolation 298 barriers between the two sea bass lineages, plus variants showing intermediate 299 degrees of linkage with them. To identify those loci, we used two different genome 300 scan methods to detect FST outlier SNPs. Both methods were applied to the analysis 301 of genetic differentiation at two different scales: (*i*) within the ATL range among the 302 21 localities, and (*ii*) between the ATL and MED sea bass lineages. 303

The first method used was *Lositan* (Beaumont & Nichols, 1996; Antao et al., 2008), which performs coalescent simulations under the symmetric island model to generate a neutral distribution of FST conditioned on the mean expected heterozygosity among populations. The mean FST calculated across all markers was used as a target value to simulate 1 million SNPs, from which we empirically determined the 99.5th percentile of the FST distribution to identify candidate outlier loci showing an excess of genetic differentiation among locations.

We then used BayeScan (Foll & Gaggiotti, 2008), a Bayesian outlier detection 311 method that relies on the multinomial-Dirichlet model. The difference in allele 312 frequency between every sampling location and a common theoretical gene pool was 313 measured by a subpopulation-specific FST coefficient in order to account for 314 differences in effective sizes and migration rates among subpopulations. Selection 315 was introduced by decomposing for each locus the subpopulation-specific FST 316 coefficient into a subpopulation-specific component shared by all loci and a locus-317 specific component shared by all subpopulations. Deviation from neutrality for a 318

given locus was assumed when the locus-specific component was needed to explain 319 the observed diversity pattern. The posterior probability that a locus is influenced by 320 selection after accounting for multiple testing was determined by the Posterior Odds 321 (PO), which is the ratio of posterior probabilities between the selection and neutral 322 models. The minimum false discovery rate (FDR) at which a given locus reached 323 significance was determined using the q-value of each locus. A q-value threshold of 324 0.05 was used for outlier detection in most analyses, corresponding to an FDR 325 threshold of 5%. BayeScan chain parameters were set to 5.000 outputted iterations 326 with 5.000 steps for pilot runs and 50.000 burn-in steps. 327

328

229 2.6 | Analysis of introgression gradients around barrier loci

Simulations of secondary contact between two genetically subdivided lineages 330 exhibiting partial reproductive isolation show that neutral markers linked to barrier 331 loci can display substantial allele frequency steps within the introgressed lineage 332 (Gagnaire et al., 2015). These steps appear at the place where local barriers to gene 333 flow slow down the diffusion of introgressed alleles. They are dynamically 334 maintained by differences in flow intensity, and are amplified when gene flow 335 between lineages is slightly higher than the rate of homogenization within the 336 introgressed lineage. Depending on the age of the secondary contact, the steps in 337 allele frequencies magnified by foreign introgression may appear at variable 338 recombination distances from the barrier loci. 339

To explore that effect, we first focused on the subset of SNPs that were the most strongly associated to barrier loci in our dataset, using only outlier loci that were detected in the *BayeScan* MED-ATL genome-scan with a stringent FDR threshold of 1%. Since genetic differentiation is strong between ATL and MED within genomic islands, the minor frequency allele found at each of these loci in the ATL most often

corresponds to the major frequency allele in the MED. Therefore, gradients of introgression of Mediterranean alleles at those loci are expected to generate minor allele frequency (MAF) clines within the Atlantic distribution range. In order to test for a cryptic population structure within the Atlantic, we thus compared the mean MAF of MED-ATL outlier loci to that of neutral SNPs as a function of the distance to the southernmost ATL location (SINE).

Finally, we evaluated how different degrees of linkage to barrier loci affect MAF gradients within the Atlantic. We assigned SNPs to different categories defined by their level of allele frequency difference (Δp) between ATL and MED. Our rationale was that stronger Δp values between ATL and MED are associated to stronger linkage to barrier loci, which was supported from earlier works (Duranton et al., 2018).

357

358

```
359 3 | RESULTS
```

360

361

3.1 | SNP genotyping and quality filtering

After excluding non-variable markers corresponding to polymorphisms private to 362 the Mediterranean sea bass lineage as well as marker genotyping failures, 1361 SNPs 363 were successfully genotyped in 846 specimens over the 1531 markers present on the 364 array, representing an overall call-rate of 90.7%. SNPs with a minor allele frequency 365 366 (MAF) lower than 0.01 within the Atlantic were subsequently excluded, as were individuals with more than 10% of non-scored genotypes. A few additional SNPs 367 showing variation profiles significantly correlated with the samples' mapping within 368 369 the 96-wells plates used for genotyping were also discarded to avoid experimental

effects. After these steps of quality-filtering, 1012 bi-allelic SNP markers that were
genotyped in 827 individuals were retained in the final main dataset (Supplementary
Table S1), resulting in an overall genotyping call rate of 96.87%.

373

374 **3.2** | Genetic diversity gradient and spatial structure

The average fraction of polymorphic markers per sampling location calculated across 375 the 1012 SNPs was negatively correlated to latitude after standardizing for the 376 number of specimens genotyped by locality (adjusted $R^2 = 0.77$; p < 0.001; Figure 2a), 377 providing evidence of a latitudinal decrease in genetic diversity across the ATL sea 378 bass range. Similarly, the mean observed heterozygosity per sample location was 379 negatively correlated to latitude (adj. r2=0.66; p < 0.001; Supplementary Figure S3), 380 decreasing by nearly 10 % from Southern Portugal to northeastern UK 381 (Supplementary Table S2). 382

383 The proportion of the total genotypic variance explained by the redundancy analysis constrained by (latitude + longitude + month + year of capture) was low 384 (0.64 %) but highly significant (p-value < 0.001). However, constrained ordination 385 only revealed significant marginal effects on SNP variation for the two spatial 386 variables (latitude: p-value < 0.001; longitude: p-value = 0.037). The RDA1 axis 387 received a large contribution of latitude, as illustrated by the gradient in individual 388 coordinates distributions among the 7 regions from Portugal to the North Sea (Figure 389 2b). 390

The overall FST calculated over all loci among the 21 Atlantic locations was not significant (FST = 0.0002, p > 0.05). Pairwise FST values calculated between pairs of ATL locations or regions were consistently low and most often non-significant (Supplementary Tables S3-S5), and only few pairwise FST values reached significance among the 7 ATL regions considered (Supplementary Table S6). By contrast, genetic

differentiation was much higher between ATL and MED sea bass lineages (average 396 FST = 0.1474) using the same marker dataset, consistently with previous studies (Tine 397 et al. 2014; Duranton et al. 2018). A weak but significant positive correlation was 398 found between geographic distance separating pairs of ATL localities and genetic 399 distance estimated by FST / (1- FST) (adj. $r^2 = 0.078$; p < 0.001; Figure 2c). This 400 isolation-by-distance (IBD) pattern was remarkably stronger when the analysis was 401 restricted to the northern part of the Atlantic range, that is, excluding Portugal, 402 Biscay and southwestern Channel locations (adj. $r^2 = 0.236$; p-value < 0.001; 403 Supplementary Figure S4). This was also confirmed by the Mantel test 404 (Supplementary Table S7). 405

406 The analysis of directionality index Ψ based on the method by Peter and Slatkin (2013) detected a strongly significant deviation from an isolation-by-distance at 407 equilibrium model. Instead, a spatial expansion scenario was supported with an 408 inferred origin located in the northwestern part of the Celtic Sea (p-value $< 10^{-10}$, 409 Figure 2d). The gradient in the relative fit as expansion origin showed a steep 410 decrease in likelihood location towards the southern Celtic Sea and northern Biscay, 411 and a smoother gradient towards the northeastern part of the range (Irish Sea, 412 English Channel and North Sea). Together with the decreasing latitudinal gradient in 413 heterozygosity, these results support a recent northeastern range expansion from a 414 region located in the northwestern Celtic Sea. 415

416

417 **3.3** | Spatial gradient of MED ancestry in the ATL

Our inferences of individual MED ancestry proportions showed a clear northwarddecreasing gradient (Figure 3). The southernmost location in Portugal (SINE), which
is the closest to the ATL-MED transition zone, showed a significantly higher average

level of MED ancestry (11.2 %) compared to all other locations and a strongervariance in MED ancestry among individuals.

The GLM analysis showed that the explanatory variable "distance to SINE" had a very significant negative effect (p < 2e-16) on the percentage of MED ancestry, whereas no significant effect could be detected for the date of sampling (p=0.135).

The spatial gradient in MED ancestry was even more obvious when individual ancestry proportions were averaged by sampling location (Figure 4a). The mean fraction of MED ancestry per location was negatively correlated with the distance to SINE in the simple linear regression model (adj. r2 = 0.6026, p-value < 0.001), and the correlation was strengthened when the SINE location (which is highly admixed) was removed from the analysis (adj. r2 = 0.7405; p-value < 0.001).

The piecewise regression approach detected two significant break points in the 432 spatial admixture gradient. Taking into account the presence of two additional 433 parameters, the model with three different linear regression displayed a significantly 434 better fit to the data than the simple linear regression model (ANOVA for model 435 comparison: p-value = 3.094e-9; best model with 3 regression lines: adj. r2 = 0.93, p-436 value = 1.3e-9). The strongest break occurred in the southwestern English Channel 437 near the GONB locality in the Gulf of Saint-Malo, more than 2000 km northward to 438 SINE by the plateau (Figure 4b). The second break was detected at the tip of Galicia 439 between CORU and ASTU sampling locations (Figure 4c). Consistent with the 440 dilution of MED ancestry toward the north, the average fraction of MED alleles 441 decreased from 5.7 % [0.037, 0.076] in the Portugal region, to 2.6 % [0.013, 0.041] in 442 the Bay of Biscay and southwestern English Channel, and 1.2 % [0.004, 0.022] in the 443 north of Brittany from Celtic Sea to Irish and North Seas (Figure 3). Each of these two 444 steps was characterized by a more than two-fold reduction in the mean MED 445 ancestry from south to north (Figure 4d). Although we found negative regression 446

slopes indicating a decreasing mean MED ancestry with increasing distance to SINE in both the Portugal and Biscay-southwestern Channel regions, the slope was significantly positive to the north of the Gulf of Saint-Malo breakpoint. This striking result, indicating an inversed latitudinal gradient in MED ancestry in the northern part of the range, remained visible separately in a western Channel-Irish Sea transect and an eastern Channel-North Sea transect using the more spatially 'refined dataset' containing 31 localities (Supplementary Figure S5a).

454

455 **3.4** | Within-ATL outliers are enriched for between-lineages outliers

Genome scans for highly differentiated SNPs were performed both at the within-ATL
scale to detect outlier loci within the northeastern Atlantic and between ATL and
MED samples to detect outlier loci showing an excess of differentiation between the
two European sea bass lineages.

Lositan detected 32 outliers exceeding the 99.5th percentile of the neutral distribution of FST at the within-ATL scale (Supplementary Figure S6a) and 183 outliers between ATL and MED lineages (Supplementary Figure S6b). Within-ATL outliers were highly significantly enriched for between-lineages outliers (21 out of 32 within-ATL outliers belong to the 183 ATL-MED outliers, hypergeometric test pvalue = 1.9e-9).

Comparatively, the *BayeScan* analysis was more stringent in detecting outlier loci showing q-values < 0.05, with only 7 candidate outliers being found at the within-ATL scale (Supplementary Figure S6c) and 74 outliers detected between ATL and MED lineages (Supplementary Figure S6d). All of the outliers identified with BAYESCAN were also detected by LOSITAN. Here again, the outliers detected at the within-ATL scale were highly significantly enriched for between-lineages outliers (5 out of 7 within-ATL outliers belong to the 74 ATL-MED outliers, hypergeometric test
p-value = 3.4e-5).

474

475 **3.5** | Minor allele frequency steps at genomic islands associated loci

We used a stringent subset of 52 outlier loci that were detected in the BAYESCAN 476 MED-ATL genome-scan with an FDR < 0.01 to characterize the gradient in mean 477 MAF as a function of the distance to SINE. Major steps were observed directly 478 northward to CORU and GONB in these mean MAF profiles, which were not 479 detected using non-outlier loci (Figure 5). In order to refine the spatial positions of 480 these steps, the same analysis was made based on the spatially refined dataset (31 481 localities). Mean MAF were represented separately along two transects: one from 482 Portugal toward the Irish Sea and one toward the North Sea (Supplementary Figure 483 S5b). Both profiles revealed low MAF values in the western Channel area (after 484 PBRE-CRNW and PBRE-GONB), with the lowest values being found in IRIS, 485 CRNW2 and 3, ISWI2 and BSEI1. Northward to these regions, the mean MAF profiles 486 steadily increased towards WALE-SGEO (Irish Sea) and DOVE-ANGL-NEUK (North 487 Sea), on both sides of Britain. 488

Finally, the evolution of mean MAF profiles was evaluated as a function of the degree of marker linkage to MED-ATL islands of divergence assessed with difference in allele frequencies between ATL and MED (Δp). Progressively flattening MAF profiles were found for groups of loci showing from high to low Δp values (Supplementary Figure S7).

494

495

496 **4** | **DISCUSSION**

497

Genetic connectivity assessment in high gene flow species generally provides little 498 information on the degree of demographic connectivity among populations (Waples, 499 1998; Lowe & Allendorf, 2010). This shortcoming typically arises when genetic 500 differentiation at neutral markers is null or close to zero, so that no real signal can be 501 used to determine whether migration rates are sufficiently high to ensure 502 demographic coupling among populations. Here, we found non-significant overall 503 genetic differentiation across the vast majority of the European sea bass northeastern 504 Atlantic range. The sea bass thus represents one of the many borderline cases where 505 neutral markers may remain silent to conservation and management issues. 506

As for many other species, however, the spatial distribution of genetic diversity 507 in sea bass has retained signals of historical and contemporary admixture. Two sea 508 bass lineages, one Atlantic and one Mediterranean, have diverged in allopatry during 509 ca. 300,000 years and have subsequently experienced a postglacial secondary contact 510 which started less than 15,000 years BP (Tine et al., 2014; Duranton et al., 2018). Since 511 that time, gene flow has been strongly asymmetrical from the Atlantic into the 512 Mediterranean lineage. However, gene flow has been also occurring in the opposite 513 direction, accounting for less than 5% of introgressed Mediterranean alleles within 514 Atlantic sea bass genomes (Duranton et al., 2018). Here, we show that the northward 515 diffusion of Mediterranean alleles within the Atlantic sea bass populations can be 516 used to reveal two dispersal barriers separating demographically independent units, 517 and an ongoing expansion in the northern part of the species range. These findings 518 could provide useful new elements to improve the delineation of European sea bass 519 stocks in fisheries management programs. 520

521

522 4.1 | Cryptic dispersal barriers revealed by introgression clines

Introgression between differentiated lineages can be used as an alternate way to 523 assess within-species genetic and demographic connectivity (Gagnaire et al., 2011; 524 Gagnaire et al., 2015; Duranton et al., 2019). Several marine species display large 525 spatial scale allele frequency patterns that can be attributed to ongoing gene flow 526 between divergent units (e.g. Milano et al., 2014; Dahle et al., 2018; Lehnert et al., 527 2018; Wennevik et al., 2019). These admixture gradients originate at the edge of 528 contact zones and sometimes attenuate over large distances beyond the contact 529 zones. They are dynamically maintained by continuing gene flow between lineages, 530 combined with a delayed rate of homogenization within the introgressed lineages 531 due to spatially limited dispersal. Selection against introgressed fragments may also 532 contribute to maintaining these admixture gradients (Sedghifar et al., 2016). Spatial 533 discontinuities in admixture gradients indicate local reductions in the spread of 534 introgressed alleles (Gagnaire et al., 2015). Therefore, they can be used to identify 535 cryptic dispersal barriers that are not strong enough to produce genetic 536 differentiation at migration-drift equilibrium. 537

Here, the analysis of individual ancestry proportions within the Atlantic revealed 538 the existence of a wide admixture gradient extending from southern Portugal to the 539 British Isles. Our closest sampling location from the contact zone with the 540 Mediterranean sea bass lineage (Sines, South Portugal) displayed the highest mean 541 and variance in individual Mediterranean ancestry (mean=0.11, s.d.=0.09). This was 542 mainly driven by the presence of admixed genotypes with significantly higher 543 proportions of Mediterranean ancestry above the background population level (e.g. 6 544 individuals between 0.15 and 0.40 in Sines), which most likely represent late-545 generation backcrosses. Therefore, our results support that ongoing gene flow 546 between the two sea bass lineages contributes to maintain the admixture gradient. 547

Northward to Sines (SINE), the level of Mediterranean ancestry mostly remained 548 below 5%, displaying a general decreasing trend with increasing latitude. A detailed 549 examination of this admixture gradient revealed the existence of two significant 550 breakpoints located at the tip of Galicia (CORU) and near the Gulf of Saint-Malo 551 (GONB). Two-fold reductions in mean Mediterranean ancestry were observed 552 between sampling sites directly located in the southern vs. northern sides of these 553 two breaks. Such a magnitude of change cannot be easily explained by insufficient 554 sampling coverage generating spurious breaks in an otherwise continuous gradient. 555 Instead, it indicates the presence of cryptic barriers that significantly reduce gene 556 flow over relatively short distances, on a scale of a hundred kilometers or less (i.e. the 557 distance between two consecutive sampling sites). 558

The observed discontinuities in admixture proportions are predicted under 559 spatial admixture models, and can be maintained as long as differences in allele 560 frequencies exist between hybridizing lineages (Gagnaire et al., 2015). For marine 561 species with large population sizes and a planktonic larval stage, it is often assumed 562 that a rapid erosion of allele frequency differences occurs upon secondary contact. 563 However, the existence of genetic barriers to gene flow between Atlantic and 564 Mediterranean sea bass lineages have potentially delayed the dissipation of allele-565 frequency gradients for a substantial amount of time (Tine et al., 2014; Duranton et 566 al., 2018). Our results support this interpretation since most outlier loci found within 567 the Atlantic were likely explained by the introgression of Mediterranean alleles 568 (Figure 5). Moreover, loci showing delayed rates of introgression between lineages 569 also displayed the largest steps in allele frequencies within the Atlantic, as predicted 570 by theory (Gagnaire et al., 2015; Supplementary Figure S7). 571

572 Our results suggest that migration rates between populations on either side of 573 the identified breaks are too low to ensure demographic coupling, otherwise the

breaks would not have been observed. However, quantifying the rate of effective 574 migration across these breaks would require additional data on the intensity of 575 selection acting at the barrier loci and their recombination rate with the neutral 576 markers we used here. This remains challenging, and therefore calls for the use of 577 complementary information on individual movement, as inferred for instance from 578 archival tags (de Pontual et al., 2019) or scale microchemistry (Cambiè et al., 2016). 579 Such a coupling between life-history migration and genetic data has the potential to 580 refine our understanding of sea bass demographic connectivity in the northeastern 581 Atlantic. 582

583

584 4.2 | Surfing of introgressed alleles owing to northward range expansion

Northward to the break identified near the Gulf of Saint-Malo, the mean 585 Mediterranean ancestry surprisingly increased towards the northernmost localities of 586 WALE-SGEO (Irish Sea) and DOVE-ANGL-NEUK (North Sea) on both sides of 587 Britain (Supplementary Figure S5). This result was explained by an increased 588 variance in Mediterranean ancestry among individuals (Figure 3). The mean 589 Mediterranean ancestry in the English Channel is close to 1%, and therefore the 590 increased variance in ancestry in the Irish Sea and North Sea results in increased 591 average ancestry due to border effect (i.e. individual ancestries can deviate more 592 strongly when they lie above versus below the 1% average ancestry). 593

A possible mechanism underlying the increased variance in Mediterranean ancestry is a recent range expansion in the northern part of the species distribution area. This spatial expansion hypothesis was supported both by the decreasing latitudinal gradient in heterozygosity and the directionality index analysis. A number of direct observations also support the recent increase in sea bass abundance around Britain (Wright et al. 2020). This is exemplified by the rapid increase of

Eastern Channel, North and Irish Seas populations attributed to increased seawater winter temperatures (Henderson, 2007; Pawson et al., 2007), and the new or expanding sea bass fisheries in UK and Irish seas (Cheung et al., 2012).

In a spatially expanding population, the intensity of genetic drift is amplified at 603 the wave front, which leads to increased variance in allele frequencies compared to 604 the core population (Edmonds et al., 2004; Klopfstein et al., 2006). Putting this in the 605 sea bass context may help explain how range expansion affects Mediterranean 606 ancestry in the northern part of the species range. Alleles of Mediterranean origin 607 segregate at low frequencies at the place where spatial expansion occurs. Therefore, 608 most of these low-frequency Mediterranean alleles are likely to be lost by random 609 610 genetic drift or to remain at low frequency during range expansion. Some alleles of Mediterranean origin, however, can successfully surf on the wave of advance and 611 reach significantly higher frequencies. These two opposite effects of genetic drift (i.e. 612 small decrease in frequency for most Mediterranean alleles but successful surfing for 613 part of them) is expected to increase the variance in ancestry among individuals 614 living in the expansion zone. Thus, our results are consistent with the surfing of a 615 fraction of the rare Mediterranean alleles, as a consequence of ongoing northward 616 expansion of sea bass populations on both sides of Britain. A more thorough 617 examination of this hypothesis would require denser genome-wide polymorphism 618 data to test the surfing of local ancestry blocks of Mediterranean origin. 619

A possible alternative explanation for the observed ancestry patterns is selection against weakly deleterious introgressed fragments of Mediterranean origin. Since the rate of introgression is particularly reduced in low-recombining regions of the sea bass genome, selection against introgression is thought to rely on many loci of small individual effects (Duranton et al., 2018). In the large populations of Portugal, Biscay and western Channel, selection against introgressed tracts of Mediterranean origin

could be sufficiently efficient to progressively decrease Mediterranean ancestry as the distance to the contact zone increases. By contrast, lower effective population sizes in the northern margins of the species range could reduce the efficacy of selection against introgression, resulting in slightly increased mean Mediterranean ancestry in these regions. The two proposed mechanisms (i.e. surfing of introgressed alleles and reduced efficacy of selection against introgression) are not mutually exclusive and may collectively explain the spatial ancestry patterns documented here.

- 633
- 634

635

4.3 | Applications to conservation and management

636

Our results mirror previous findings that support the existence of dispersal barriersin the two identified regions of Galicia and Brittany for other marine taxa.

The northwestern coast of the Iberian Peninsula is characterized by complex 639 seasonal oceanographic circulation patterns that may act as potential barriers to 640 dispersal (Varela et al., 2005). Mixed evidence from genetic studies point out that, on 641 the one hand, most marine species lack genetic structure across northwestern Iberia 642 (reviewed in Gomes-Gesteira et al., 2011). On the other hand, some exceptions have 643 been found such as in Littorina saxatilis (Piñeira et al., 2008) or in Fucus ceranoides 644 (Neiva et al., 2012), which both lack planktonic dispersive stages. In these species, 645 however, genetic breaks may also be attributed to past secondary contacts. 646

Brittany represents a less controversial biogeographic transition zone between marine biotas. In some species like *Fucus vesiculosus*, the genetic break occurs near the Ushant thermal front that lies off the coast of western Brittany (e.g. Almedia et al., 2017), and separates cold inshore surface waters from warm stratified offshore

waters (Chevallier et al., 2014). Another important transition zone, visible in species
assemblages of benthic macrofauna (Gaudin et al., 2018), and contact zones between
divergence lineages (Bierne et al., 2003; Jolly et al., 2005), corresponds to the Gulf of
Saint-Malo that separates western from eastern English Channel.

Most interestingly, a genetic connectivity study in the marine trematode parasite 655 *Bucephalus minimus,* whose final and most vagile host is *Dicentrarchus labrax,* revealed 656 significant population structure along the northeastern Atlantic coastline (Feis et al., 657 2015). Population samples of parasites taken from both sides of the two dispersal 658 barriers evidenced here exhibited genetic differentiation, which in turn suggested 659 some level of isolation among their host sea bass populations. By contrast, 660 661 population genetic studies conducted in sea bass generally failed to detect any significant genetic structure between populations of the Bay of Biscay and English 662 Channel-Celtic Sea (Frisch et al., 2007; Coscia & Mariani, 2011; Souche et al., 2015). 663 On the other hand, mark-recapture data indicated restricted movement between 664 these two populations, thus supporting their demographic independence (Fritsch et 665 al., 2007). An important component in the maintenance of independent demographic 666 units is the fidelity to winter spawning areas, recently evidenced with tagging data 667 (de Pontual et al., 2019). Limited effective dispersal of larvae across barriers in Galicia 668 and Brittany is also implicitly supported by our findings, and could be explained by 669 the location of spawning areas in relation to the main oceanic current features. 670

The results presented here are thus broadly consistent with previous findings. They confirm that (*i*) Atlantic sea bass populations exhibit strong genetic connectivity at neutral markers, which implies that (*ii*) gene flow is high enough to ensure the spread of adaptive variants among populations. (*iii*) However, the number of migrants per generation among populations separated by barriers does not seem sufficiently large to homogenize the latitudinal gradient in Mediterranean ancestry

across the whole genome. This supports the existence of already suspected 677 demographically independent units, maintained by behavioral processes and 678 spatially limited larval dispersal. Finally, (*iv*) northern Atlantic sea bass populations 679 seem to exhibit genetic signatures of ongoing northward expansion on both sides of 680 Britain. The demographic independence of these expanding populations with respect 681 to neighboring populations from Celtic Sea and English Channel could not be 682 specifically addressed here and will need further examination. However, the finding 683 of weak but significant genetic differentiation between Irish-Celtic Seas and North 684 Sea populations, indicates demographic independence over long distances. 685

These conclusions potentially have direct implications for the management of 686 687 European sea bass populations in the northeastern Atlantic. The most recent report of 688 the ICES advisory committee for sea bass populations (ICES, 2019) states that spawning-stock biomass has been declining since 2009-2010 and is now just above or 689 below the maximum sustainability yield, depending on the region considered. The 690 need for precise stock assessment is therefore more crucial than ever for a proper 691 management of fisheries. To this end, the spatial delineation of at least three main 692 stocks would need to be revised to account for these new findings. Namely, the 693 northern management unit comprising populations from the North Sea, Irish Sea, 694 English Channel, Bristol Channel, and Celtic Sea includes areas that most likely 695 belong to the northern part of the Bay of Biscay population. Moreover, the Bay of 696 Biscay south, which is currently grouped with the Atlantic Iberian Waters, most 697 likely belongs to the Bay of Biscay population. 698

To conclude, the approach presented in this study supports that introgression gradients consisting of less than 5% of introgressed ancestry are sufficient to detect cryptic contemporary barriers to gene flow, even using moderate genome coverage. Estimation of migration rates across these barriers and identification of ideal

conditions for quantitative assessments will require further development. However,
we believe that these will be encouraged by the frequent discovery of admixture in
many species, thus expanding the possibilities of studying genetic connectivity in
other taxa.

707

708 DATA ACCESSIBILITY STATEMENT

- Raw data, genotypes per site, variables associated with sampling sites have
been deposited here : <u>https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.3899247</u>

711 - All scripts used have been deposited here :
 712 <u>https://github.com/tonyrobinet/introgression</u>

- 713
- 714

715 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This study was funded by France Filière Pêche (FFP, convention PH/2013/11) 716 and the Muséum National d'Histoire Naturelle (MNHN, SJ 833-13). Authors thank 717 Morgane Ramonet (FFP) and Thierry Guigues (Pêcheurs de Bretagne) for supporting 718 this work from the project (2012) to the final report (2018). Thanks to producer's 719 organizations for their collaboration (Coopérative Maritime Étaploise, Cobrenord, 720 Pêcheurs de Bretagne, Pêcheurs d'Aquitaine, Plymouth Trawler Agents), and to the 721 722 34 fish markets that kindly opened their doors, nights and days. Special thanks to: Mickaël Drogou and the Ifremer LBH lab in Brest for sharing tissues from Biscay; 723 Ifremer sea campain in the Bay of Biscay (N/O Thalassa, EVOHE 2012-14); the 724 725 fishing vessel Les Calanques (South Ireland); Jasmin Hilien and Filip Volckaert (Leuven Univ.) for sharing some tissues from UK; David Righton, Stephen Shaw 726 (CEFAS Lowestoft), John Ashworth (Newlyn) for collecting fin-clips in UK waters (in 727

fish markets and on N/O Endeavour); Alison M. Pessell (Plymouth Trawler Agents); 728 Eva Maria Velasco Gil (Instituto Espanol de Oceanografia, Gijon) and Eneko Aierbe 729 Sarasola (Gijon) for collecting fin-clips in Asturian fish markets; Alexandre Alonso-730 Fernandez, Fran Saborido-Rey and David Villegas-Rios (Instituto de Investigaciones 731 Marinas, CSIC, Vigo-Pontevedra) for their kind collaboration in Galicia; Joana Robalo 732 and Carla Sousa Santos (ISPA MARE, Lisboa) for collecting fin-clips in Portuguese 733 fish markets. Thanks to Daniel Sellos (MNHN Concarneau) for his kind help in the 734 lab. The genotyping chipset was designed by both François Allal (Ifremer Palavas) 735 and PAG. The last special-special-thanks go to the numerous little hands from the 736 marine station MNHN of Concarneau, for their much appreciated effort (Claudie 737 Guenguant, Thomas Barreau, Bernard Bourlès, Marie Cadou, Guillaume Dirberg, 738 Lou Frotté, Samuel Iglésias, Pierre-Yves Lebon, Sébastien Mayot, Julien Ringelstein, 739 Héloïse You!). The manuscrit was improved by three anonymous reviewers, that we 740 would like to acknowledge for their time, positive assessment and helpful comments. 741

742

743

744

AUTHORS CONTRIBUTIONS

TR and VR wrote the proposal, raised funds; TR collected specimens with many others; PAG conducted and supervised the analysis, with the help of TR and VR; TR and KC managed collections and prepared DNA for genotyping; TR and PAG analyzed and interpreted the results; TR and PAG wrote the paper, with the help of VR.

750

751

752 **REFERENCES**

- Alexander, D. H., Novembre, J., & Lange, K. (2009). Fast model-based estimation of
 ancestry in unrelated individuals. *Genome research*, 19(9), 1655-1664.
- 755 Almeida, S. C., Nicastro, K. R., Zardi, G. I., Pearson, G. A., Valero, M., & Serrão, E. A.
- (2017). Reproductive strategies and population genetic structure of *Fucus* spp.
 across a northeast Atlantic biogeographic transition. *Aquatic Living Resources*, 30,
 16.
- Antao, T., Lopes, A., Lopes, R. J., Beja-Pereira, A., & Luikart, G. (2008). LOSITAN: a
 workbench to detect molecular adaptation based on a FST-outlier method. *BMC bioinformatics*, 9(1), 323.
- Beaumont MA, Nichols RA (1996) Evaluating loci for use in the genetic analysis of
 population structure. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London, Series B: Biological Sciences*, 263, 1619–1626.
- Bekkevold, D., Gross, R., Arula, T., Helyar, S. J., & Ojaveer, H. (2016). Outlier loci
 detect intraspecific biodiversity amongst spring and autumn spawning herring
 across local scales. *PloS one*, 11(4).
- Benestan, L., Quinn, B. K., Maaroufi, H., Laporte, M., Clark, F. K., Greenwood, S. J., ...
 & Bernatchez, L. (2016). Seascape genomics provides evidence for thermal
 adaptation and current-mediated population structure in American lobster
 (*Homarus americanus*). *Molecular Ecology*, 25(20), 5073-5092.
- Bertl, J., Ringbauer, H., & Blum, M. G. (2018). Can secondary contact following range
 expansion be distinguished from barriers to gene flow?. *PeerJ*, *6*, e5325.
- Bierne, N., Borsa, P., Daguin, C., Jollivet, D., Viard, F., Bonhomme, F., & David, P.
 (2003). Introgression patterns in the mosaic hybrid zone between *Mytilus edulis*
- and *M. galloprovincialis*. *Molecular Ecology*, 12(2), 447-461.

- Bierne, N., Roze, D., & Welch, J. J. (2013). Pervasive selection or is it...? why are FST
 outliers sometimes so frequent? *Molecular ecology*, 22(8), 2061-2064.
- Cambiè, G., Kaiser, M. J., Marriott, A. L., Fox, J., Lambert, G., Hiddink, J. G., ... &
 McCarthy, I. D. (2016). Stable isotope signatures reveal small-scale spatial
 separation in populations of European sea bass. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, 546,
 213-223.
- Cayuela, H., Rougemont, Q., Prunier, J. G., Moore, J. S., Clobert, J., Besnard, A., &
 Bernatchez, L. (2018). Demographic and genetic approaches to study dispersal in
 wild animal populations: A methodological review. *Molecular Ecology*, 27(20),
 3976-4010.
- Cheung, W. W., Pinnegar, J., Merino, G., Jones, M. C., & Barange, M. (2012). Review
 of climate change impacts on marine fisheries in the UK and Ireland. *Aquatic Conservation: Marine and Freshwater Ecosystems*, 22(3), 368-388.
- Chevallier, C., Herbette, S., Marié, L., Le Borgne, P., Marsouin, A., Péré, S., ... &
 Reason, C. (2014). Observations of the Ushant front displacements with
 MSG/SEVIRI derived sea surface temperature data. *Remote sensing of environment*,
 146, 3-10.
- Coscia, I., & Mariani, S. (2011). Phylogeography and population structure of
 European sea bass in the north-east Atlantic. *Biological Journal of the Linnean Society*,
 104(2), 364-377.
- Dahle, G., Quintela, M., Johansen, T., Westgaard, J. I., Besnier, F., Aglen, A., ... &
 Glover, K. A. (2018). Analysis of coastal cod (*Gadus morhua* L.) sampled on
 spawning sites reveals a genetic gradient throughout Norway's coastline. *BMC genetics*, 19(1), 42.

- 801 Duranton, M., Allal, F., Fraïsse, C., Bierne, N., Bonhomme, F., & Gagnaire, P. A.
- (2018). The origin and remolding of genomic islands of differentiation in the
 European sea bass. *Nature communications*, 9(1), 2518.
- Duranton, M., Bonhomme, F., & Gagnaire, P. A. (2019). The spatial scale of dispersal
 revealed by admixture tracts. *Evolutionary Applications*. 12(9) 1743-1756.
- Edmonds, C. A., Lillie, A. S., & Cavalli-Sforza, L. L. (2004). Mutations arising in the
 wave front of an expanding population. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 101(4), 975-979.
- Faggion, S., Vandeputte, M., Chatain, B., Gagnaire, P. A., & Allal, F. (2019).
 Population-specific variations of the genetic architecture of sex determination in
 wild European sea bass Dicentrarchus labrax L. *Heredity*, 122(5), 612.
- Feis, M. E., Thieltges, D. W., Olsen, J. L., de Montaudouin, X., Jensen, K. T., Bazaïri,
 H., ... & Luttikhuizen, P. C. (2015). The most vagile host as the main determinant
 of population connectivity in marine macroparasites. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, 520, 85-99.
- Foll, M., & Gaggiotti, O. (2008). A genome-scan method to identify selected loci
 appropriate for both dominant and codominant markers: a Bayesian perspective. *Genetics* 180:977-93.
- Fritsch, M., Morizur, Y., Lambert, E., Bonhomme, F., & Guinand, B. (2007).
 Assessment of sea bass (*Dicentrarchus labrax*, L.) stock delimitation in the Bay of
 Biscay and the English Channel based on mark-recapture and genetic data. *Fisheries Research*, 83(2-3), 123-132.
- Funk, W. C., McKay, J. K., Hohenlohe, P. A., & Allendorf, F. W. (2012). Harnessing
 genomics for delineating conservation units. *Trends in ecology & evolution*, 27(9),
 489-496.

- Gagnaire, P. A., Minegishi, Y., Zenboudji, S., Valade, P., Aoyama, J., & Berrebi, P.
 (2011). Within-population structure highlighted by differential introgression
 across semipermeable barriers to gene flow in *Anguilla marmorata. Evolution: International Journal of Organic Evolution*, 65(12), 3413-3427.
- 830 Gagnaire, P.A., Broquet, T., Aurelle, D., Viard, F., Souissi, A., Bonhomme, F.,
- Arnaud-Haond, S., & Bierne, N. (2015). Using neutral, selected, and hitchhiker loci
- to assess connectivity of marine populations in the genomic era. *Evolutionary Applications*, 8 (8), 769–786.
- Gagnaire, P. A. (2020). Comparative genomics approach to evolutionary process
 connectivity. *Evolutionary Applications*, 13(6), 1320-1334.
- Gaudin, F., Desroy, N., Dubois, S. F., Broudin, C., Cabioch, L., Fournier, J., ... &
 Thiébaut, É. (2018). Marine sublittoral benthos fails to track temperature in
 response to climate change in a biogeographical transition zone. *ICES Journal of Marine Science*, 75(6), 1894-1907.
- Gomez-Gesteira, M., Beiras, R., Presa, P., & Vilas, F. (2011). Coastal processes in
 northwestern Iberia, Spain. *Continental Shelf Research*, *31*(5), 367-375.
- Goudet, J. (2005). Hierfstat, a package for R to compute and test hierarchical F–
 statistics. *Molecular Ecology Notes*, 5(1), 184-186.
- Hedgecock, D., Barber, P. H., & Edmands, S. (2007). Genetic approaches to
 measuring connectivity. *Oceanography*, 20(3), 70-79.
- 846 Henderson, P. A. (2007). Discrete and continuous change in the fish community of
- the Bristol Channel in response to climate change. *Journal of the Marine Biological Association of the United Kingdom*, 87(2), 589-598.
- Hommel, G. (1989). A comparison of two modified Bonferroni procedures. *Biometrika*, 76(3), 624-625.

- ICES. 2019. Sea bass (*Dicentrarchus labrax*) in Divisions 4.b–c, 7.a, and 7.d–h (central and southern North Sea, Irish Sea, English Channel, Bristol Channel, and Celtic Sea). In Report of the ICES Advisory Committee, 2019, bss.27.4bc7ad-h, https://doi.org/10.17895/ices.advice.4779
- 855 Jolly, M. T., Jollivet, D., Gentil, F., Thiébaut, É., & Viard, F. (2005). Sharp genetic
- break between Atlantic and English Channel populations of the polychaete
- 857 *Pectinaria koreni*, along the North coast of France. *Heredity*, 94(1), 23.
- Jombart, T. (2008). adegenet: a R package for the multivariate analysis of genetic
 markers. *Bioinformatics*, 24(11), 1403-1405.
- Klopfstein, S., Currat, M., & Excoffier, L. (2006). The fate of mutations surfing on the
- wave of a range expansion. *Molecular biology and evolution*, 23(3), 482-490.
- Lehnert, S. J., DiBacco, C., Jeffery, N. W., Blakeslee, A. M., Isaksson, J., Roman, J., ... &
- 863 Hamilton, L. C. (2018). Temporal dynamics of genetic clines of invasive European
- green crab (*Carcinus maenas*) in eastern North America. *Evolutionary Applications*,
 11(9), 1656-1670.
- Liggins, L., Treml, E. A., & Riginos, C. (2020). Seascape genomics: contextualizing
 adaptive and neutral genomic variation in the ocean environment. *Population Genomics: Marine Organisms*, 171-218.
- Lowe, W.H., & Allendorf, F.W. (2010). What can genetics tell us about population
 connectivity? *Molecular Ecology* 19, 3038-3051.
- Lemaire, C., Versini, J. J., & Bonhomme, F. (2005). Maintenance of genetic
 differentiation across a transition zone in the sea: discordance between nuclear
 and cytoplasmic markers. *Journal of Evolutionary Biology*, 18(1), 70-80.

- Milano, I., Babbucci, M., Cariani, A., Atanassova, M., ... & Bargelloni, L. (2014).
- 875 Outlier SNP markers reveal fine-scale genetic structuring across European hake
- populations (*Merluccius merluccius*). *Molecular Ecology* 23(1), 118-135.
- Morgan, A. P. (2016). argyle: an R package for analysis of Illumina genotyping
 arrays. *G3: Genes, Genomes, Genetics*, 6(2), 281-286.
- Naciri, M., Lemaire, C., Borsa, P., & Bonhomme, F. (1999). Genetic study of the
 Atlantic/Mediterranean transition in sea bass (*Dicentrarchus labrax*). *Journal of Heredity*, 90(6), 591-596.
- 882 Narum, S. R., Buerkle, C. A., Davey, J. W., Miller, M. R., & Hohenlohe, P. A. (2013).
- Genotyping-by-sequencing in ecological and conservation genomics. *Molecular ecology*, 22(11), 2841-2847.
- Neiva, J., Pearson, G. A., Valero, M., & Serrão, E. A. (2012). Fine-scale genetic breaks
 driven by historical range dynamics and ongoing density-barrier effects in the
 estuarine seaweed *Fucus ceranoides* L. *BMC Evolutionary Biology*, 12(1), 78.
- 888 Oksanen, J., Blanchet, F. G., Kindt, R., Legendre, P., O'hara, R. B., Simpson, G. L., ... &
- 889 Wagner, H. (2019). Vegan: community ecology package. R package version 2.5-6.
- 890 <u>https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/vegan/</u> (accessed 2020.03.22)
- Palumbi, S. R. (2003). Population genetics, demographic connectivity, and the design
 of marine reserves. *Ecological applications*, *13*(sp1), 146-158.
- Pante, E., & Simon-Bouhet, B. (2013). marmap: a package for importing, plotting and
 analyzing bathymetric and topographic data in R. *PLoS One*, 8(9), e73051.
- Paradis, E. (2010). pegas: an R package for population genetics with an integrated–
 modular approach. *Bioinformatics*, 26(3), 419-420.
- Pawson, M. G., Kupschus, S., & Pickett, G. D. (2007). The status of sea bass
 (*Dicentrarchus labrax*) stocks around England and Wales, derived using a separable

- catch-at-age model, and implications for fisheries management. *ICES Journal of Marine Science*, 64(2), 346-356.
- Peter, B. M., & Slatkin, M. (2013). Detecting range expansions from genetic data. *Evolution*, 67(11), 3274-3289.
- Piñeira, J., Quesada, H., Rolán-Alvarez, E., & Caballero, A. (2008). Genetic
 discontinuity associated with an environmentally induced barrier to gene
 exchange in the marine snail *Littorina saxatilis*. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, 357,
 175-184.
- Pontual (de), H., Lalire, M., Fablet, R., Laspougeas, C., Garren, F., Martin, S., Drogou,
 M., & Woilez, M. (2019). New insights into behavioural ecology of European
 seabass off the West Coast of France: implications at local and population
 scales. *Ices Journal of Marine Science*, 76(2), 501-515.
- Pulliam, H. R. (1988). Sources, sinks, and population regulation. *The American Naturalist*, 132(5), 652-661.
- Purcell, S., Neale, B., Todd-Brown, K., Thomas, L., Ferreira, M. A., Bender, D., ... &
 Sham, P. C. (2007). PLINK: a tool set for whole-genome association and
 population-based linkage analyses. *The American journal of human genetics*, 81(3),
 559-575.
- 917 Savolainen, O., Lascoux, M., & Merilä, J. (2013). Ecological genomics of local
 918 adaptation. *Nature Reviews Genetics*, 14(11), 807-820.
- Sedghifar, A., Brandvain, Y., Ralph, P., & Coop, G. (2015). The spatial mixing of
 genomes in secondary contact zones. *Genetics*, 201(1), 243-261.
- Sedghifar, A., Brandvain, Y., & Ralph, P. (2016). Beyond clines: lineages and
 haplotype blocks in hybrid zones. *Molecular ecology*, 25(11), 2559-2576.

- 923 Souche, E. L., Hellemans, B., Babbucci, M., MacAoidh, E., Guinand, B., Bargelloni,
- L., ... & Volckaert, F. A. (2015). Range-wide population structure of European sea
 bass *Dicentrarchus labrax*. *Biological Journal of the Linnean Society*, 116(1), 86-105.
- 926 Stapley, J., Reger, J., Feulner, P. G., Smadja, C., Galindo, J., Ekblom, R., ... & Slate, J.
- (2010). Adaptation genomics: the next generation. *Trends in ecology & evolution*,
 25(12), 705-712.
- Tigano, A., & Friesen, V.L. (2016). Genomics of local adaptation with gene flow. *Molecular Ecology*, 25, 2144–64.
- 931 Tine, M., Kuhl, H., Gagnaire, P. A., Louro, B., Desmarais, E., Martins, R. S., ... &
- Dieterich, R. (2014). European sea bass genome and its variation provide insights
- into adaptation to euryhalinity and speciation. *Nature communications*, *5*, 5770.
- Vandeputte, M., Gagnaire, P. A., & Allal, F. (2019). The European sea bass: a key
 marine fish model in the wild and in aquaculture. *Animal genetics*, 50(3), 195-206.
- 936 Van Wyngaarden, M., Snelgrove, P. V., DiBacco, C., Hamilton, L. C., Rodríguez-
- 937 Ezpeleta, N., Jeffery, N. W., ... & Bradbury, I. R. (2017). Identifying patterns of
- dispersal, connectivity and selection in the sea scallop, *Placopecten magellanicus*,
- using RAD seq-derived SNP s. *Evolutionary Applications*, 10(1), 102-117.
- Varela, R. A., Rosón, G., Herrera, J. L., Torres-López, S., & Fernández-Romero, A.
 (2005). A general view of the hydrographic and dynamical patterns of the Rías
 Baixas adjacent sea area. *Journal of Marine Systems*, 54(1-4), 97-113.
- Waples, R. S. (1998). Separating the wheat from the chaff: Patterns of genetic
 differentiation in high gene flow species. *Journal of Heredity*, 89, 438–450.
- Waples, R. S., & Gaggiotti, O. (2006). What is a population? An empirical evaluation
 of some genetic methods for identifying the number of gene pools and their
 degree of connectivity. Molecular Ecology, 15(6), 1419–1439.

Waples, R.S., Punt, A.E., & Cope J.M. (2008). Integrating genetic data into
management of marine resources: how can we do it better? *Fish and Fisheries*2008(9), 423-449.

Wennevik, V., Quintela, M., Skaala, Ø., Verspoor, E., Prusov, S., & Glover, K. A.
(2019). Population genetic analysis reveals a geographically limited transition zone
between two genetically distinct Atlantic salmon lineages in Norway. *Ecology and Evolution*, 9(12), 6901-6921.

Wright, P. J., Pinnegar, J. K., & Fox, C. (2020). Impacts of climate change on fish,
relevant to the coastal and marine environment around the UK. *MCCIP Science Review* 2020, 354-381.

958

959

960 FIGURES CAPTIONS

961

Figure 1. Sampling map of the 827 Atlantic sea bass individuals analyzed in this study. In the 'main dataset', the 827 specimens were assigned to 21 localities corresponding to single ICES rectangles or groups of adjacent rectangles represented with the same color. In the 'regional dataset', specimens were grouped into 7 regions represented by colored polygons. Total number of samples is indicated below each region name. Details about sample locations and the spatially 'refined dataset' are provided in Fig. S1 and Table S1.

969

Figure 2. Spatial genetic variation. a: Negative correlation between standardized
polymorphism corrected for sampling size and latitude of the 21 sampling
localities. The blue line shows the linear regression (slope p<0.001, r²=0.77) and its

0.95 confidence interval (grey shade). b: Distribution of individual coordinates on 973 RDA1 axis as a function of latitude for each of the 7 regions: Portugal (Po), South 974 Biscay (SB), North Biscay (NB), Celtic Sea (CS), Channel (Ch), Irish Sea (IS) and 975 North Sea (NS). The RDA was constrained using only spatial coordinates. For each 976 region, the boxplot horizontal line represents the mean, whiskers the standard 977 deviation and vertical lines the 0.95 confidence interval. Dots indicate outlier 978 individuals, and whisker width cover the latitudinal range of each region. c: 979 Positive correlation between genetic differentiation represented by Fst/(1-Fst) and 980 distance by the plateau (in km) between pairs of localities. The blue line shows the 981 linear regression (slope p<0.001, r²=0.078) and its 0.95 confidence interval (grey 982 shade). d: Results of the directionality index analysis showing the gradient in the 983 relative fit as expansion origin (color scale) and most likely origin of expansion in 984 southern Ireland (blue cross). For each of the 21 sampling localities, the inner circle 985 indicates the mean heterozygosity (grey scale) and the color of the outer circle 986 indicates the group identified with the admixture gradient analysis (blue: 987 Portugal, pink: Biscay, green: Celtic Sea - Channel - North Sea, see Fig. 3). 988

989

Figure 3. Individual ancestry proportions. Individual proportions of Mediterranean 990 ancestry inferred with ADMIXTURE (point estimation and standard error bars) 991 are displayed for the 10 reference Mediterranean samples (MED) and the 827 992 Atlantic individuals. Three groups of sampling locations that differ in their 993 average ancestry proportions (shown with the means of lower and upper values) 994 are delimited by vertical dashed bars: Portugal, Biscay, and Celtic Sea - Channel -995 North Sea. Individuals are ranked by their specimen code number, as referred in 996 the dataset, so their ranking within the groups is meaningless. 997

998

Figure 4. Determination of the positions of barriers to dispersal. a: Mean proportion 999 of MED ancestry (shown with the means of lower and upper values) inferred with 1000 ADMIXTURE for each of the 21 localities, as a function of the distance to SINE by 1001 the plateau (km). b: Plot of the residual standard error obtained using different 1002 breakpoint values (x axis) between two linear models of mean MED ancestry as a 1003 function of distance. The position with the minimal residual standard error is 1004 directly northward to the GONB locality (red line). c: Detection of a second 1005 breakpoint directly northward to the CORU locality (red line). d: Representation 1006 of the best piecewise regression model with the two break positions determined in 1007 b and c. Colored dots: mean MED ancestry for each group of locations: Portugal 1008 (blue), Biscay (pink) and Celtic Sea - Channel - North Sea (green). 1009

1010

Figure 5. Loci linked to genetic barriers to gene flow between ATL and MED lineages 1011 display stronger genetic differentiation within the Atlantic. a: Scaled distributions 1012 of per-locus FST values between ATL and MED lineages for non-outlier (N = 960, 1013 red density curve) and outlier SNPs (N=52, blue density curve). Candidate outliers 1014 for between-lineage divergence were identified with BayeScan using a q-value 1015 threshold of 0.01. b: Spatial profiles of mean minor allele frequency (MAF) for non-1016 outlier (N = 960, red dots) and outlier SNPs (N=52, blue triangles), as a function of 1017 the distance to SINE by the plateau (km). 1018

1019





1020 Figure 1.







1021 Figure 2.

1022



1044 Figure 3.









1059 Figure 5.