

# Genetic insights into recolonization processes of Mediterranean octocorals

D. Aurelle, J. Tariel, F. Zuberer, A. Haguenauer, C. Ribout, M. Masmoudi, H. Kara, L. Chaoui, J. Garrabou, J.-B. Ledoux, et al.

# ► To cite this version:

D. Aurelle, J. Tariel, F. Zuberer, A. Haguenauer, C. Ribout, et al.. Genetic insights into recolonization processes of Mediterranean octocorals. Marine Biology, 2020, 167 (6), pp.73. 10.1007/s00227-020-03684-z . hal-02569518

# HAL Id: hal-02569518 https://hal.science/hal-02569518

Submitted on 11 May 2020

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

- **1** Genetic insights into recolonization processes of Mediterranean octocorals
- 2

Authors : D. Aurelle <sup>1,2,3</sup> , J. Tariel <sup>3,4</sup> , F. Zuberer <sup>5,6</sup> , A. Haguenauer <sup>3,6</sup> , C. Ribout <sup>3,7</sup> , M.
Masmoudi <sup>3,8</sup> , H. Kara <sup>8</sup> , L. Chaoui <sup>8</sup> , J. Garrabou <sup>1,9</sup> , JB. Ledoux <sup>9,10</sup> , M. C. Gambi <sup>11</sup>
1 Aix Marseille Univ, Université de Toulon, CNRS, IRD, MIO, Marseille, France
2 Institut de Systématique, Evolution, Biodiversité (ISYEB), Muséum national d'Histoire naturelle,
CNRS, Sorbonne Université, EPHE, 57 rue Cuvier, 75005 Paris, France
3 Aix Marseille Univ, Avignon Université, CNRS, IRD, IMBE, Marseille, France
4 Université Claude Bernard Lyon 1, CNRS UMR 5023, ENTPE, Laboratoire d'Ecologie des
Hydrosystèmes Naturels et Anthropisés, F-69622 Villeurbanne, France
5 Aix Marseille Univ, CNRS, IRD, OSU PYTHEAS, Marseille, France
6 EPHE, PSL Research University, UPVD, CNRS, USR 3278 CRIOBE, Moorea Polynésie, France
7 Centre d'Etudes Biologiques de Chizé (CEBC), UMR 7372 CNRS- La Rochelle Université, F-
79360 Villiers-en-bois,France
8 Université d'Annaba Badji Mokhtar, Laboratoire Bioressources marines, Annaba, Algérie.
9 Institut de Ciències del Mar CSIC, Passeig Maritim de la Barceloneta 37-49, E-08003, Barcelona,
Spain
10 CIIMAR/CIMAR, Centro Interdisciplinar de Investigação Marinha e Ambiental, Universidade
do Porto, Porto, Portugal
11 Stazioner Zoologica Anton Dohrn. Dpt. Integrative Marine Ecology, Villa Comunale 80121,
Napoli, Italy
Corresponding author: Didier Aurelle didier.aurelle@univ-amu.fr

24 Keywords: octocorals, population genetics, colonization, artificial substrates, microsatellites

### 25 Abstract

26 Marine ecosystems are strongly impacted by the consequences of human activities, such as habitat 27 destruction or artificialization, and climate change. In the Mediterranean Sea, sessile benthic 28 species, and particularly octocorals, have been affected by mass mortality events linked with 29 positive thermal anomalies. The future survival of octocoral populations impacted by global change 30 will depend on their recolonization abilities facing local extirpation or important modification of 31 their habitat. We studied these processes in Mediterranean octocorals in two situations: the 32 colonization of artificial substrates (wrecks) by the red gorgonian Paramuricea clavata, and the 33 recolonization following mortality events in the yellow gorgonian Eunicella cavolini. With 34 microsatellite markers (seven for *P. clavata*, five for *E. cavolini*), we analyzed the genetic diversity 35 of populations on artificial substrates and their differentiation from other neighboring populations. For *P. clavata* the populations on artificial substrates were not or lowly differentiated from the 36 37 closest populations (1.3 to 1.6 km) on natural substrates, and showed similar levels of genetic 38 diversity. Artificial substrates can then be considered as an interesting substitute for natural 39 substrates for this species. For E. cavolini we did not detect any variation in diversity nor 40 relatedness following recuperation after mortality events. In both cases our results suggest the input 41 from different populations in the recolonization process, which helps in maintaining the genetic 42 diversity. These results are useful for the management of these species and of associated 43 ecosystems.

44

### 45 Introduction

46 Marine biodiversity is increasingly impacted by global and local pressures such as climate change, 47 overfishing, introduction of invasive species, habitat destruction and pollution (Boudouresque et al. 48 2017; Gattuso et al. 2018). The combination of these pressures questions the possibility of evolution 49 and persistence of numerous marine species. Whereas the global impact of human activities on 50 biodiversity is still increasing, different solutions (from reduction of greenhouse gas concentrations 51 to manipulation of ecological adaptation and habitat restoration) are explored to mitigate this impact 52 in the marine realm, but with uncertainties regarding their efficiency and trade-offs (Gattuso et al. 53 2018).

54 Additionally, coastal areas face an expansion of artificial structures such as dikes, offshores 55 structures or even wrecks (Dafforn et al. 2015). The development of artificial structures can have 56 contrasting consequences on marine biodiversity such as habitat loss or indirect modifications of the environment (Dafforn et al. 2015). Conversely, artificial structures can provide new habitats, and 57 58 act as artificial reefs and connectivity nodes. Artificial structures can increase habitat complexity in 59 seabed, complexity which has been impacted by activities such as trawling. Therefore, despite their 60 negative effects, artificial structures can be considered as potential management tools in a context of 61 global change. The future of marine biodiversity will then depend on the evolutionary trajectories of 62 populations in this changing and anthropized environment. These evolutionary trajectories include 63 the possibility of genetic adaptation, acclimatization, gene flow, recolonization and range shift (Bell 64 and Collins 2008). Global change can then be considered as a wide scale adaptive challenge for 65 many species, submitting biodiversity to important and new selective pressures (Otto 2018). 66 In this context, population genetics can be used to study genetic connectivity, the possibility of 67 sustaining gene flow among habitats, including artificial ones, and the recolonization processes 68 following disturbances. For example, a study of two scleractinian species, Pocillopora damicornis 69 and *Seriatopora hystrix*, has shown a recolonization pattern mainly from neighbouring populations,

70 but with occasional more distant sources (Starger et al. 2010). It is also important to consider the 71 consequences of recolonization on genetic diversity, for example through founder effects. A 72 founder effect will lead to changes in allele frequencies between source and sink populations, and to 73 a reduction in genetic diversity (Allendorf et al. 2017). Nevertheless, this is not always the case. For 74 instance, in the gastropod *Nucella lapillus*, no significant genetic effect of local extinction and 75 recolonization was detected, despite *a priori* low dispersal abilities (Colson and Hughes 2004). 76 Depending on the ecology of the species (e.g. age at sexual maturity), the strength of founder 77 effects during recolonization will vary ranging from drastic reduction of intra-population genetic 78 diversity and an increase in genetic differentiation between populations, to a lack of effect 79 (Austerlitz et al. 2000). The type of habitat (natural / artificial) can also impact the level of genetic 80 diversity, as observed in the gastropod *Patella caerulea* where populations on urban structures 81 showed less genetic diversity than populations on natural rocky habitats (Fauvelot et al. 2009).

82

83 The Mediterranean Sea, with a combination of an important species diversity and strong human 84 pressures including climate change, is a hotspot of biodiversity (Coll et al. 2010, 2012; Cramer et al. 85 2018). Mass mortality events induced by thermal anomalies have been observed in the last decades 86 in the northern Mediterranean (Garrabou et al. 2009; Verdura et al. 2019). These mortality events 87 have impacted several sessile groups of species such as sponges and octocorals. For a given species, 88 the impact was different among regions and depths (Garrabou et al. 2009). Global (e.g. warming) or 89 local (e.g. habitat destruction) pressures can lead to population decline or extinction (extirpation). 90 This combination of human pressures raises the question of the survival of octocoral populations 91 facing global change, which is linked to their adaptive potential. For example, octocoral populations 92 from different depths show in some cases different thermotolerance levels, and this diversity could 93 be important for adaptive evolution (Haguenauer et al. 2013; Ledoux et al. 2015; Pivotto et al. 94 2015). At a metapopulation level, population decline or extirpation can be compensated by 95 migration from other populations, which can have positive demographic and genetic effects (Ronce

96 2007). In this context, the aforementioned increasing availability of artificial substrates should be 97 considered, as artificial structures can allow the development of new local populations and modify 98 the connectivity network. Studying the recolonization abilities of octocorals at a genetic level, on 99 natural and artificial substrates, is therefore of paramount importance to better understand their 100 future evolution and conservation.

101 Population genetic studies of Mediterranean octocorals have regularly evidenced a significant genetic differentiation at short distance, from a few tens to hundred meters. This was the case, at 102 103 different levels, for the red coral *Corallium rubrum* (e.g. Costantini et al. 2007; Ledoux et al. 2010a, 2010b; Pratlong et al. 2018), the red gorgonian *Paramuricea clavata* (Mokhtar-Jamai et al. 2011; 104 105 Arizmendi-Mejía et al. 2015), and the vellow gorgonian *Eunicella cavolini* (Masmoudi et al. 2016; Cánovas-Molina et al. 2018). This marked genetic structure could be the result of a combination of 106 107 reduced mean dispersal distance (Ledoux et al. 2010a), an important genetic drift, and of priority 108 effect (Orsini et al. 2013). Studying the genetic diversity of recently colonized or recolonized sites 109 would then be interesting to better understand the processes shaping the genetic structure of these 110 species. For example a founder effect along with a priority effect could lead to a persistent genetic 111 differentiation at unexpected short distance. Genetic data on recolonization are scarce in 112 Mediterranean octocorals. Arizmendi-Mejía et al. (2015) observed that a recently established 113 population of *P. clavata* in Ibiza island (Balearic Islands, East Spain), probably originated from several source populations, which can explain its relatively high levels of genetic diversity 114 115 compared to the other investigated populations. In the same species, a lack of marked founder effect 116 was also suggested during recolonization process following last glacial maximum (Ledoux et al. 2018). Focusing on Eunicella cavolini, Cánovas-Molina et al. (2018) suggested that colonies 117 118 established on artificial reefs in the area of Marseille (South-East France) could come from different populations. 119

In the present study we propose to extend our knowledge regarding colonization processes in these
species with two case studies: the colonization of two artificial substrates (wrecks) by *P. clavata*,

and the recolonization of a natural substrate after a strong mortality event in *E. cavolini*. In both
cases we aim to estimate the contribution of neighboring populations to the newly (re)colonized
population. We also test if the dynamics of these colonizations are associated with founder events
(i.e. a reduction in genetic diversity, or a differentiation of the new populations from neighbouring
ones). This study sheds new light on the origin of short distance genetic differentiation in
Mediterranean octocorals and should improve our understanding regarding the evolution of marine
biodiversity in changing and artificializing seascapes.

129

#### 130 Material and methods

131 Sampling and population history:

132 All colonies were sampled by scuba diving. Regarding *P. clavata*, we sampled two populations 133 established on the ships « Donator » (DON) and « Le Grec » (GRE), both ships wrecked in 1945 in 134 the same area in southeastern France. Eight additional populations on natural substrates were sampled, with increasing distance from the wrecks, up to the Marseilles area for the most distant 135 136 sites (up to 75 km by sea; Table 1 and Fig. 1). The distance with the closest population on natural 137 substrate (SAR) is around 1.3 km for GRE and 1.6 km for DON. The sample size for P. clavata varied between 29 and 39 colonies. For *E. cavolini*, we focused on the sampling of four populations 138 139 around the island of Ischia (Tyrrhenian Sea, West Italia; Table 1 and Fig. 1) which experienced 140 strong mortality events: Sant'Angelo (SAN), Secca delle Formiche (SFV), and La Nave (LAN) where mortality was documented in 2002, 2003, 2005 (except in LAN) and 2009 (Gambi et al. 141 142 2006, 2010; Garrabou et al., 2009; Cigliano and Gambi 2007; Gambi 2014), and La Grotta Azzurra at Palinuro (GAZ, Salerno; 15-25 m depth), a semi-submerged cave where a strong mortality event 143 144 was registered in October 2008, with 77% of dead colonies at 15 m depth (Gambi et al. 2010), and a 145 slight recovery of the population already observed in July 2011 (Gambi and Barbieri 2012). We also 146 sampled two populations that, to our knowledge, did not experience any recent mortality event: the 147 Nisida island (NISB, Gulf of Naples), and the Secchitello bank (UST, Ustica island, North Sicily)

148 where *E. cavolini* is distributed relatively deep (below 30 m depth). In the sites affected by mortality events we likely sampled both young *E. cavolini* individuals and residual individuals 149 which recruited before the mortality events. These *E. cavolini* populations were sampled in June 150 151 and July 2013. Therefore we sampled from 4 to 11 years after mortality events for impacted populations. Regarding the evolution of density and the size structure of *E. cavolini* at the site GAZ 152 153 after the 2008 mortality event (Gambi and Barbieri 2012), samples mainly come from colonies recruited after this event. The sample size for E. cavolini varied between 14 and 38 colonies. For 154 both species, 3-4 cm fragments from an apical branch were sampled from each colony, and stored in 155 156 ethanol 95% at -20°C before DNA extraction.

157

158 Microsatellite markers:

DNA extraction was performed according to Mokhtar-Jamai et al. (2011), Ribout and Carpentieri
(2013), and Masmoudi et al. (2016) depending on the samples. The *P. clavata* colonies have been
genotyped with the loci Para9, Para10, Para12, Para14, Para17, Pard and Para2-37 as in Molecular
Ecology Resources Primer Development Consortium et al. (2010) and Mokhtar-Jamai et al. (2011).
Data from GAB, PTV, MTM, RIO, RIS and IMP were available from Mokhtar-Jamai et al. (2011).

164 The *E. cavolini* colonies have been genotyped with the loci S14, C21, C30, C40 and Mic56

165 following Masmoudi et al. (2016).

166

167 Genetic diversity:

168 We identified repeated multilocus genotypes (MLGs) and we computed the probability of

169 occurrence of multiple MLGs under sexual reproduction with the poppr 2.8.3 R package (Kamvar et

al. 2014, 2015). For all following analyses we kept one representative of each MLG. Observed and

171 expected heterozygosities were computed with the Genetix 4.05 software (Belkhir et al. 1999).

172 Allelic richness was estimated with a rarefaction procedure with the ADZE software (Szpiech et al.

173 2008), and by excluding for each species the sample with the lowest number of colonies.

174

175 Genetic structure within and among populations:

176 Departures from panmixia were tested with the Genepop 4.5.1 software with an exact test and with 177 heterozygote deficiency as an alternative hypothesis (Rousset 2008). The level of relatedness within 178 populations was computed with the estimator of Wang (2002) implemented in the COANCESTRY 179 software (Wang 2011). To compare the levels of relatedness between populations we used the bootstrap approach of COANCESTRY with 1000 resamplings. The level of genetic differentiation 180 was estimated with the F<sub>ST</sub> estimate of Weir and Cockerham (1984). Previous studies did not detect 181 182 a strong impact of null alleles for the loci analysed here in each species (Mokhtar-Jamaï et al., 2011; 183 Masmoudi et al., 2016). Nevertheless, regarding the F<sub>1S</sub> values observed here and in previous studies, and the missing data observed in some populations (see results), we also estimated F<sub>ST</sub> with 184 185 a correction for null allele from the FreeNA software (Chapuis and Estoup 2007). Genic 186 differentiation between populations was tested with the exact test procedure implemented in 187 Genepop. To estimate the relative differentiation of each population, we computed the population-188 specific F<sub>ST</sub> in GESTE (Foll and Gaggiotti 2006; Gaggiotti and Foll 2010). 189 The genetic differences among individuals was visualized thanks to a Principal Component 190 Analysis (PCA; function dudi.pca) with the Adegenet R package (Jombart 2008). We made an 191 individual clustering analysis with the STRUCTURE software (Pritchard et al. 2000) with 10<sup>6</sup> 192 iterations for the burn-in and 10<sup>6</sup> iterations for the main analysis, 10 replicates for each K, and by 193 testing K = 1 to K = 6 in the two species. We used an admixture model with correlated allele 194 frequencies. The results were visualized with the POPHELPER website (Francis 2017; http://pophelper.com/). 195 196 To infer the genetic origin of populations installed on artificial substrates (DON and GRE for 197 P. clavata), and of new recruits after a complete recolonization (GAZ for E. cavolini), we used the

198 GENECLASS2 software (Piry et al. 2004) with the option to infer individual assignment, by using

all other populations as references. We used the Rannala and Mountain (1997) criterion, and the

200 membership probability was computed according to Paetkau et al. (2004), with 1000 simulated

201 individuals, and a type I error of 0.01.

202

203 Results

204 Occurences of repeated MLGs:

205 For *P. clavata*, five pairs of repeated MLGs were observed: two in the GRE population, one in

206 MTM, one in DON, one in RIS. The corresponding probability of occurrence of repeated genotypes

207 under sexual reproduction (psex) ranged from 7.10<sup>-9</sup> to 2.10<sup>-5</sup>. For *E. cavolini*, three MLGs were

208 detected more than once, all in the NISB population: one was repeated nine times (psex = 0.010),

another one five times (psex = 0.014) and another one two times (psex = 0.014). The overall

210 frequency of missing genotypes was around 17% for *E. cavolini* (mainly concentrated in the SFV

and LAN populations), and 10% for *P. clavata* (mainly in PQL).

212

213 Genetic diversity and structure within populations:

214 When considering rarefied allelic richness for *P. clavata*, the DON and GRE wreck populations had

an Ar(29) of 7.6 and 7.7 respectively, similar to the value observed for the neighbouring population

216 SAR (7.5; Table 1). The expected heterozygosity for DON and GRE was 0.62 and 0.65

217 respectively, whereas it was 0.61 for SAR, the lowest value found here. Regarding *E. cavolini*, the

218 rarefied allelic richness for GAZ (recolonized population; sample size N=32) was the second

219 highest value after the LAN population (N=25), with Ar(14) = 4.9 and 5.4 respectively. The same

trend was observed when considering expected heterozygosity, with values of 0.70 and 0.71 for

221 GAZ and LAN respectively. NISB and UST, for which we have no indication of mortality events,

showed the lowest allelic richness and expected heterozygosity values, but with small sample sizes

in both cases (Table 1).

For *P. clavata*, all samples showed a significant deviation from panmixia, with heterozygote
deficiencies varying from 0.06 (PTV and GRE) to 0.16 (PQL). For *E. cavolini*, three samples over

six showed a significant deviation from panmixia, and heterozygote deficiencies varied from 0.01(SFV) to 0.20 (SAN).

Regarding relatedness levels for *P. clavata*, the PTV and MTM populations showed higher mean
relatedness than most other populations, whereas GAB, PQL and RIO tended to have lower mean
relatedness than other populations (Table 2). There was no clear tendency for the wreck populations
DON and GRE. For *E. cavolini*, NISB and SFV showed higher mean relatedness than other
populations.

233

234 Genetic differentiation and origin of new recruits:

235 Regarding population differentiation, the global F<sub>ST</sub> estimate was 0.04 for *P. clavata*, and 0.08 for 236 *E. cavolini*. For both species, all pairwise differentiation tests were significant, apart from the 237 comparison between GRE and SAR for *P. clavata*, two sites separated by 1.3 km (Table 3). For 238 *P. clavata*, the differentiation between DON and SAR was low (uncorrected pairwise  $F_{ST} = 0.02$ ; 239 corrected pairwise F<sub>ST</sub> = 0.03; spatial distance: 1.6 km) but significant. For *E. cavolini* and focusing 240 on the recolonized GAZ population, the lowest differentiation was observed with the LAN 241 population ( $F_{ST}$  = 0.08, for corrected and uncorrected estimates; distance 140 km). The mean pairwise F<sub>ST</sub> for the comparison involving GAZ was 0.1 and 0.07 for the uncorrected and corrected 242 243 estimates respectively. Accordingly, GAZ was then slightly more differentiated or at the same level of differentiation than the other populations, except UST (range 0.04 - 0.11 and 0.02 - 0.12 for the 244 245 uncorrected and corrected estimates respectively).

246 Local  $F_{ST}$  are presented in Table 4. For *P. clavata*, the PQL population displayed a higher local  $F_{ST}$ 

than other populations, and the corresponding 95% confidence interval did not overlap with those of

- 248 other populations. For *E. cavolini*, the highest local F<sub>ST</sub> was observed for NISB, but with a 95%
- 249 confidence interval overlapping with those of other populations. None of the (re)colonized
- 250 populations showed significantly different values.

251 The PCA analysis of *P. clavata* did not show any clear structure pattern, with only a few individuals

from IMP and RIS separated from the other ones on axes 1 and 2 (Fig. 2). For *E. cavolini*, the main pattern was a distinction of GAZ and UST samples on axes 1 and 2 respectively. The individuals of these two populations were genetically diverse as shown by their quite wide distribution on the PCA axes.

256 The results of the individual clustering are presented in Fig. 3. For *P. clavata*, we present the results 257 for K = 2 to K = 5 since there was no informative distinction above this value. At K = 2, one can observe a gradient between two clusters, a major one around Marseille (RIO, RIS, IMP), and a 258 259 minor one increasing in frequency in other populations. At K = 3, GAB, MTM and PTV are 260 separated from the rest. At K = 5, we also observe a slight distinction of two populations: MTM and 261 RIS. The wreck populations DON and GRE appear related to the SAR population. In all cases, the separation among clusters was not complete. For *E. cavolini*, we present the results for K = 2 to K = 262 263 4, there was no informative distinction above this value. GAZ and UST are separated from other populations at K = 2 while GAZ and UST are separated at K = 3. At K = 4 there is a distinction of 264 GAZ from other populations which are almost equally admixed among the three other clusters. 265 Nevertheless some individuals in GAZ seem more related to other populations than to the blue 266 267 cluster dominant in this population.

268 The results of assignment analyses are presented in supplementary Table 1. For *P. clavata*, if we 269 arbitrarily consider a threshold of 0.95 for membership probabilities, three over 33 individuals of DON could be related to SAR, six to PQL, three to RIO and one to IMP (this individual also 270 showed high probability for RIO). For GRE, three over 33 individuals could be related to SAR, and 271 272 seven over 33 to PQL. For E. cavolini, eight individuals over 32 displayed high membership probability for the LAN population. In both cases several individuals displayed very low 273 274 membership probabilities for all the tested populations suggesting that they come from non sampled 275 sites.

- 276
- 277 Discussion

278 Spatial patterns of recolonization:

279 Our data allow discussing and comparing the dispersal and recolonization abilities of two Mediterranean octocoral species. For *P. clavata*, we observed a genetic proximity between the 280 281 samples on the two wrecks DON and GRE, and the nearest population of natural substrate SAR. The differentiation was very low (and even non significant for GRE) between these two populations 282 283 and SAR, 1.2 km apart. The longevity of *P. clavata* may reach 50 to 100 years, but their age is difficult to estimate, for example due to variation in growth rate or breakage of some branches 284 285 (Linares et al. 2007). The age of the wrecks is known (more than 70 years), which sets an upper limit to population age, but not the age of the sampled colonies. Some colonies sampled here could 286 287 then correspond to the first generation of founders, but also be descendants from these founders, or descendants from more recent migrants. We can consider two non-mutually exclusive explanations 288 289 to the observed low differentiation among wrecks and surrounding populations. First, the initial 290 recruits came from the SAR population, with no or low enough founder effect that would have 291 induced initial differentiation. Second, gene flow from SAR after colonization could have 292 contributed to the genetic homogeneity of *P. clavata* at that scale. The lack of founder effect in 293 *P. clavata* was related to the late sexual maturity observed in this species (Coma et al. 1995; 294 Ledoux et al. 2018). Indeed, during the years following the foundation of a new population, the 295 expansion of the population is mainly due to new migrants and not to local reproduction. This 296 increases the effective population size until the first reproductive event buffering the founder effect (Austerlitz et al. 2000). Even if significant, the low differentiation observed with other populations 297 298 than SAR points to the possible participation of these populations to the newly founded ones as 299 well. This is supported by assignment analysis indicating a contribution of PQL. In their study of a 300 recently founded population of *P. clavata*, Arizmendi-Mejía et al. (2015) identified multiple source 301 populations at distances ranging from 300 m to around 1 km, which is similar to our results. The 302 larval duration of *P. clavata* has been estimated between 8 and 25 d in laboratory, which could 303 allow long distance dispersal (Linares et al. 2008). The assignment of three individuals to a

304 population from Marseille can correspond to such long distance dispersal. Similarly, Padrón et al. (2018) suggested that connectivity among coastal populations of *P. clavata*, possibly at tens of 305 306 kilometres, had contributed to their recovery after mortality events. Nevertheless, surface brooding 307 and larval behavior (negative phototaxis), and a short swimming phase may reduce the realized dispersal in this species (Linares et al. 2008). In that case, we should consider that non sampled and 308 309 closer population(s) could have contributed to the mixed diversity of the wreck populations. For *E. cavolini*, the colonies sampled in GAZ should be mainly new recruits following the 2008 310 311 mortality event. These recruits could correspond to local recruitment from the few remaining colonies (Gambi and Barbieri 2012). There was no significant reduction in genetic diversity at that 312 313 site compared to other populations. This could mean that there was enough surrounding colonies to sustain population recovery; for example one can note that the mortality event was less strong at 314 315 25 m, and this would constitute a possible refugia. Additionally, recruits could have come from 316 different populations, as suggested by the genetic differences among individuals shown by 317 clustering and multivariate analyses. The origin of these foreign recruits in the GAZ population is 318 not clear based on our sampling. The assignment analysis suggested the possibility of LAN as 319 origin of the recruits in GAZ. LAN and GAZ are distant from around 140 km apart. This is at odd 320 with the local differentiation usually observed for this species (Cánovas-Molina et al. 2018). It 321 seems more probable that non-sampled populations, either genetically akin to LAN, or 322 corresponding to another genetic group, contributed to this signal of distant recolonization of GAZ. In a preliminary study of the colonization of artificial reefs by *E. cavolini*, it was difficult to 323 324 precisely identify the population(s) of origin, but potential source populations could be distant by 325 two to three kilometres from these artificial structures (Cánovas-Molina et al. 2018). There is no 326 information on the larval biology of *E. cavolini* to further interpret these results. In the congeneric 327 species *E. singularis*, the settlement could be possible within 30 h (Weinberg 1979), but it would be 328 interesting to formally characterize the larval phase duration in *E. cavolini*.

329 In any case, the analysis of the colonized or recolonized populations in the two species studied here

330 clearly indicate a mixed origin of the recruits. Recolonization from mixed origins, with sporadic distant input, has also been observed in hexacorals (Underwood et al. 2007; Starger et al. 2010). In 331 332 the case of *E. cavolini* (GAZ), this was done in a relatively short time after mortality event 333 (mortality in 2008, sampling in 2013). Interestingly, Cupido et al. (2012) have observed an increase in recruitment for *P. clavata* following mortality events, possibly because a greater space 334 335 availability. This could both limit the erosion of genetic diversity (see below), and allow gene flow 336 from other populations. From a methodological point of view, our results underline that studying 337 recolonization in Mediterranean octocorals should not only consider neighbouring populations, but 338 increase the sampling effort to distant populations.

339

340 Consequences on the genetic diversity of the populations:

We did not observe any impact of colonization or recolonization in the population diversity of both species, nor with local F<sub>ST</sub> reflecting local drift. One can note that the expected heterozygosities observed here for *E. cavolini* are higher than those previously reported by Cánovas-Molina et al. (2018), and in the range of values obtained for populations from western Mediterranean by Masmoudi et al. (2016), but in both cases with a microsatellite panel partly different from the one used here.

347 As already mentioned, in the case of *E. cavolini* most other populations analysed here suffered from mortality events which may have reduced their genetic diversity as well. Regarding *P. clavata*, the 348 349 levels of diversity observed here are in the lower range of those observed by Mokhtar-Jamai et al. 350 (2011) or Pérez-Portela et al. (2016), again with a partially different panel of microsatellite markers. 351 In the case of this species, depth has been shown to be positively correlated with genetic diversity 352 (Pilczynska et al. 2019). Even if the sampling scheme does not allow a precise study of this 353 question, a similar tendency was observed here with a mean expected heterozygosity of 0.67 for the 354 depth range 20 to 34 m, and 0.69 for 40-41 m. In both species we observed significant heterozygote 355 deficits in most populations. This is in line with previous observations of departures from panmixia

in Mediterranean gorgonians (e.g. Ledoux et al., 2010b; Mokhtar-Jamaï et al., 2011). These
departures have been explained by a combination of inbreeding and null alleles, and this does not
seem linked with patterns of recolonization here.

359 The retention of genetic diversity and the lack of change in relatedness following recolonization can be the consequence of the mixed origin of the recruits. In *E. cavolini*, we did not observe any 360 361 genetic effect of mortality events either. Nevertheless detecting such effects of mortality might 362 require the comparison of more populations, and cohorts within populations, with more information 363 on the date and impact of mortalities. In *P. clavata*, Pilczynska et al. (2016) did not detect any reduction in genetic diversity following mortality event as well. One can note that to have a genetic 364 365 impact, any demographic shrinkage should be sustained over several generations (Allendorf 1986), whereas we consider here only a very low generation number. Additionally, partial mortality of 366 367 colonies, long generation time (Lippé et al. 2006), late sexual maturity (Ledoux et al. 2018), and an 368 increase in recruitment (Cupido et al. 2012) can buffer the genetic impact of bottlenecks or 369 demographic accidents on populations. As shown here, in a metapopulation context, exchanges 370 from more or less distant populations will also limit the genetic consequences of mortality events. 371 These conclusions might be different on a longer term. The low survivorship success of the early stages, despite the high investment in the production of gametes in *P. clavata* (Coma et al. 1995), 372 373 suggests that the species may have a low capacity to recover during large or frequent disturbances (Linares et al. 2008). More generally, if climate change induces strong and recurrent scale mortality 374 events, this might lead to a reduction of larval recruitment of different species. This has been 375 376 observed in scleractinians of the Great Barrier Reef after mass bleaching event (Hughes et al. 2019). In a context of population fragmentation, and anthropization of coastal areas, it is important to 377 378 consider the role of artificial structures as potential substrates for settlement and to enhance 379 biodiversity. In the Bay of Marseille, after 11 years of immersion, artificial reefs are already 380 colonized by several octocoral species, such as E. cavolini, E. singularis and E. verrucosa 381 (Guillemain et al., unpublished data). Our results show that the colonization of wrecks did not lead

382 to a reduction of genetic diversity at a given range depth for *P. clavata*. Similarly, Ordóñez et al. (2013) did not observe any significant difference in genetic diversity between populations of the 383 ascidian *Microcosmus squamiger* on artificial and natural substrates. Conversely a lower genetic 384 385 diversity was observed for the limpet Patella caerulea on artificial structures compared to natural rocky substrates (Fauvelot et al. 2009). Such different results are probably linked to different 386 387 population dynamics, and to different interaction with the substrates according to the species. It will 388 then have different consequences on the role of these new substrates and associated populations in 389 the connectivity and genetic diversity of populations. In the case of octocorals, our results indicate that artificial substrates provide good opportunities for the development of new populations, or the 390 391 extension of existing ones. Artificial substrates situated at a few kilometres from natural populations can possibly be colonized and allow the development of new populations. It will be interesting to 392 393 extend connectivity studies in this context to test if these populations could have other impacts, such 394 as for example act as stepping stone to allow gene flow between previously isolated areas.

395

### 396 Factors driving short distance differentiation in Mediterranean octocorals

397 Genetic differentiation at short distance has been repeatedly observed in Mediterranean octocorals 398 (e.g. Costantini et al. 2007; Ledoux et al. 2010a; Mokhtar-Jamai et al. 2011; Cánovas-Molina et al. 399 2018). Several factors could contribute to such patterns. First a short mean dispersal distance has 400 been inferred from the analysis of local genetic structure, and from the observation of related individuals at a very short distance in the red coral *C. rubrum* (Ledoux et al. 2010a). This may seem 401 402 at odd with the long larval survival (up to 42 days) estimated for this species in aquarium 403 (Martínez-Quintana et al. 2015). Also, the observation of a short-distance differentiation does not preclude for the presence of sporadic more distant exchanges allowing gene flow at a larger 404 405 metapopulation scale. Such discrepancy between the spatial scale of genetic structure and the 406 duration of larval phase has been observed for example in the fish *Elacatinus lori* (D'Aloia et al. 407 2015), calling to more detailed study of factors driving connectivity. Second, genetic drift is the

408 other important driver of genetic structure, and analyses of local genetic structure pointed to a 409 relatively low effective size in the red coral *C. rubrum* (Ledoux et al. 2010a). Finally, priority effect at the genetic level can increase genetic differentiation, when the arrival of new recruits is limited 410 411 by the presence of already installed individuals (isolation by colonization; Orsini et al. 2013). Our results, and previous ones (Arizmendi-Mejía et al. 2015), suggest that in a metapopulation context, 412 413 colonization or recolonization may not be limited by dispersal. Available habitat, either artificial or natural, following mortality, seem to be easily recolonized, at least in a metapopulation context. A 414 415 temporal survey over several generations, or indirectly the comparison of different cohorts, would allow estimating the strength of isolation following the founding of new populations. 416

417

### 418 **Perspectives:**

419 Our results show the possibility of successful (in terms of genetic diversity) colonization or 420 recolonization in Mediterranean gorgonians, including on artificial substrates. These data will be 421 useful for the spatial design of similar studies in these species. The use of a higher number of 422 markers such as SNPs could increase the power of assignment analyses as well (e.g. Glover et al. 423 2010; Benestan et al. 2015). Finally, it would be interesting to study the adaptation of these species 424 to new substrates with population genomics approaches (Manel et al. 2016). As this may be difficult 425 in a context of strong genetic structure (Pratlong et al. 2018), such results based on microsatellite 426 loci in different species will be useful to choose the best sampling scheme.

427

### 428 Acknowledgements:

The *E. cavolini* samples have been obtained thanks to an ASSEMBLE TA project granted to D.
Aurelle (grant agreement n° 227799), for an access to the Stazione Zoologica Anton Dohrn in
Naples. We thank Mr Fabio Barbieri, at the "Gambieri Marine Field Station", and the staff of the
Palinuro Sub Diving Center (Palinuro), the Ischia Diving Agency and the ANS diving (Ischia), and
the Alta Marea diving Center (Ustica) for support in collection of *E. cavolini* samples at Palinuro,

434	Ischia and Ustica, respectively; Mr Marco Cannavacciuolo and the staff of the MEDA Unit
435	(RIMAR Dept Stazione Zoologica of Naples) for sampling colonies at the Nisida island (Naples).
436	The work of M. Masmoudi in France was supported by the Algerian – French collaboration
437	program Tassili n° 12MDU853. This study has been funded by the French National Research
438	Agency (ANR) program Adacni (ANR n° ANR 12 ADAP 0016; <u>http://adacni.imbe.fr</u> ). The
439	project leading to this publication has received funding from European FEDER Fund under project
440	1166-39417. JB. Ledoux is funded by an assistant researcher contract framework of the RD Unit -
441	UID/Multi/04423/2019 - Interdisciplinary Centre of Marine and Environmental Research – financed
442	by the European Regional Development Fund (ERDF) through COMPETE2020 - Operational
443	Program for Competitiveness and Internationalisation (POCI) and national funds through
444	FCT/MCTES (PIDDAC). We thank Oscar Puebla and two anonymous reviewers who helped us
445	improve this article.
446	
447	<b>Conflict of Interest:</b> The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.
448	Sampling authorizations: all sampling have been performed with authorizations from the
449	corresponding local authorities.
450	
451	Data availability:

452 All genotypes have been deposited in the Zenodo database under reference:

453 <u>http://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.3724056</u>

# 455 **References:**

- 456
- Allendorf FW (1986) Genetic drift and the loss of alleles versus heterozygosity. Zoo Biol 5:181–
  190
- Allendorf FW, Luikart GH, Atken SN (2017) Conservation and the genetics of populations, 2<sup>nd</sup>
   edition. John Wiley & Sons.
- 461 Arizmendi-Mejía R, Linares C, Garrabou J, Antunes A, Ballesteros E, Cebrian E, Díaz D, Ledoux
  462 J-B (2015) Combining genetic and demographic data for the conservation of a
  463 Mediterranean marine habitat-forming species. PloS one 10:e0119585
- 464 Austerlitz F, Mariette S, Machon N, Gouyon P-H, Godelle B (2000) Effects of colonization
   465 processes on genetic diversity: differences between annual plants and tree species. Genetics
   466 154:1309–1321
- 467 Belkhir K, Borsa P, Goudet J, Chikhi L, Bonhomme F (1999) Genetix.
- 468 Bell G, Collins S (2008) Adaptation, extinction and global change. Evol Appl 1:3–16
- Benestan L, Gosselin T, Perrier C, Sainte-Marie B, Rochette R, Bernatchez L (2015) RAD
  genotyping reveals fine-scale genetic structuring and provides powerful population
  assignment in a widely distributed marine species, the American lobster (*Homarus americanus*). Mol Ecol 24:3299–3315
- Boudouresque C-F, Blanfuné A, Fernandez C, Lejeusne C, Pérez T, Ruitton S, Thibault D, Thibaut
  T, Verlaque M (2017) Marine Biodiversity-Warming vs. Biological Invasions and
  overfishing in the Mediterranean Sea: Take care, 'One Train can hide another.' MOJ
  Ecology & Environmental Science 2:1–13
- 477 Cánovas-Molina A, Montefalcone M, Bavestrello G, Masmoudi MB, Haguenauer A, Hammami P,
  478 Chaoui L, Kara MH, Aurelle D (2018) From depth to regional spatial genetic differentiation
  479 of *Eunicella cavolini* in the NW Mediterranean. C R Biol 341:421–432
- 480 Chapuis M-P, Estoup A (2007) Microsatellite null alleles and estimation of population
   481 differentiation. Mol Biol Evol 24:621–631
- 482 Cigliano M, Gambi MC (2007) The long hot summer: a further mortality event of Gorgonians along
  483 the Phlaegrean islands (Tyrrhenian Sea). Biol Mar Med 14:292–293
- 484 Coll M, Piroddi C, Albouy C, Ben Rais Lasram F, Cheung WW, Christensen V, Karpouzi VS,
  485 Guilhaumon F, Mouillot D, Paleczny M (2012) The Mediterranean Sea under siege: spatial
  486 overlap between marine biodiversity, cumulative threats and marine reserves. Glob Ecol
  487 Biogeogr 21:465–480
- Coll M, Piroddi C, Steenbeek J, Kaschner K, Lasram FBR, Aguzzi J, Ballesteros E, Bianchi CN,
  Corbera J, Dailianis T (2010) The biodiversity of the Mediterranean Sea: estimates, patterns,
  and threats. PloS one 5:e11842
- 491 Colson I, Hughes RN (2004) Rapid recovery of genetic diversity of dogwhelk (*Nucella lapillus* L.)
   492 populations after local extinction and recolonization contradicts predictions from life history
   493 characteristics. Mol Ecol 13:2223–2233

- 494 Coma R, Ribesl RM, Zabala M, Gilil J-M (1995) Reproduction and cycle of gonadal development
   495 in the Mediterranean gorgonian Paramuricea clavata. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 117:173–183
- 496 Costantini F, Fauvelot C, Abbiati M (2007) Fine-scale genetic structuring in *Corallium rubrum*:
  497 evidence of inbreeding and limited effective larval dispersal. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 340:109–
  498 119
- 499 Cramer W, Guiot J, Fader M, Garrabou J, Gattuso J-P, Iglesias A, Lange MA, Lionello P, Llasat
   500 MC, Paz S (2018) Climate change and interconnected risks to sustainable development in
   501 the Mediterranean. Nat Clim Chang 8(11):972-980.
- 502 Cupido R, Cocito S, Manno V, Ferrando S, Peirano A, Iannelli M, Bramanti L, Santangelo G
  503 (2012) Sexual structure of a highly reproductive, recovering gorgonian population:
  504 quantifying reproductive output. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 469:25–36
- 505 Dafforn KA, Glasby TM, Airoldi L, Rivero NK, Mayer-Pinto M, Johnston EL (2015) Marine
   506 urbanization: an ecological framework for designing multifunctional artificial structures.
   507 Front Ecol Environ 13:82–90
- D'Aloia CC, Bogdanowicz SM, Francis RK, Majoris JE, Harrison RG, Buston PM (2015) Patterns,
   causes, and consequences of marine larval dispersal. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 112:13940–
   13945
- Fauvelot C, Bertozzi F, Costantini F, Airoldi L, Abbiati M (2009) Lower genetic diversity in the
   limpet *Patella caerulea* on urban coastal structures compared to natural rocky habitats. Mar
   Biol 156:2313–2323
- Foll M, Gaggiotti O (2006) Identifying the environmental factors that determine the genetic
   structure of populations. Genetics 174:875–891
- Francis RM (2017) pophelper: an R package and web app to analyse and visualize population
   structure. Mol Ecol Res 17:27–32
- 518 Gaggiotti OE, Foll M (2010) Quantifying population structure using the F model. Mol Ecol Res
   519 10:821–830
- Gambi M (2014) L'isola d'Ischia: un osservatorio speciale per lo studio del cambiamento climatico
  globale a mare. In: Greco P Ed.: Ischia Patrimonio dell'Umanità Natura e cultura
  Doppiavoce Ed, Napoli 71–97
- Gambi M, Barbieri F (2012) Population structure of the gorgonian *Eunicella cavolinii* in the "Grotta
   Azzurra" cave off Palinuro, after the mass mortality event in 2008. Biol Mar Mediter 19:174
- Gambi M, Barbieri F, Signorelli S, Saggiomo V (2010) Mortality events along the Campania coast
   (Tyrrhenian Sea) in summers 2008 and 2009 and relation to thermal conditions. Biol Mar
   Mediter 17:126
- Gambi M, Cigliano M, Iacono B (2006) Segnalazione di un evento di mortalità di gorgonacei lungo
  le coste delle isole di Ischia e Procida (Golfo di Napoli, Mar Tirreno). Biol Mar Mediter
  13:583–587
- Garrabou J, Coma R, Bensoussan N, Bally M, Chevaldonné P, Cigliano M, Diaz D, Harmelin JG,
  Gambi MC, Kersting DK, Ledoux J-B, Lejeusne C, Linares C, Marschal C, Pérez T, Ribes
  M, Romano JC, Serrano E, Teixido N, Torrents O, Zabala M, Zuberer F, Cerrano C (2009)

- 534Mass mortality in Northwestern Mediterranean rocky benthic communities: effects of the5352003 heat wave. Glob Chang Biol 15:1090–1103
- Gattuso J-P, Magnan AK, Bopp L, Cheung WW, Duarte CM, Hinkel J, Mcleod E, Micheli F,
   Oschlies A, Williamson P (2018) Ocean solutions to address climate change and its effects
   on marine ecosystems. Front Mar Sci 5:337
- Glover KA, Hansen MM, Lien S, Als TD, Høyheim B, Skaala Ø (2010) A comparison of SNP and
   STR loci for delineating population structure and performing individual genetic assignment.
   BMC Genetics 11:2
- Haguenauer A, Zuberer F, Ledoux J-B, Aurelle D (2013) Adaptive abilities of the Mediterranean
   red coral *Corallium rubrum* in a heterogeneous and changing environment: from population
   to functional genetics. J Exp Mar Bio Ecol 449:349–357
- Hughes TP, Kerry JT, Baird AH, Connolly SR, Chase TJ, Dietzel A, Hill T, Hoey AS,
  Hoogenboom MO, Jacobson M (2019) Global warming impairs stock–recruitment dynamics
  of corals. Nature 568:387
- Jombart T (2008) adegenet: a R package for the multivariate analysis of genetic markers.
   Bioinformatics 24:1403–1405
- Kamvar ZN, Brooks JC, Grünwald NJ (2015) Novel R tools for analysis of genome-wide
   population genetic data with emphasis on clonality. Front Gen 6:208
- Kamvar ZN, Tabima JF, Grünwald NJ (2014) Poppr: an R package for genetic analysis of
   populations with clonal, partially clonal, and/or sexual reproduction. PeerJ 2:e281
- Ledoux J, Frleta Valić M, Kipson S, Antunes A, Cebrian E, Linares C, Sánchez P, Leblois R,
  Garrabou J (2018) Postglacial range expansion shaped the spatial genetic structure in a
  marine habitat forming species: Implications for conservation plans in the Eastern Adriatic
  Sea. J Biogeogr 45:2645–2657
- Ledoux J, Garrabou J, Bianchimani O, Drap P, Féral J-P, Aurelle D (2010a) Fine-scale genetic
   structure and inferences on population biology in the threatened Mediterranean red coral,
   *Corallium rubrum*. Mol Ecol 19:4204–4216
- Ledoux J-B, Mokhtar-Jamaï K, Roby C, Féral J-P, Garrabou J, Aurelle D (2010b) Genetic survey of
   shallow populations of the Mediterranean red coral [*Corallium rubrum* (Linnaeus, 1758)]:
   new insights into evolutionary processes shaping nuclear diversity and implications for
   conservation. Mol Ecol 19:675–690
- Ledoux J-B, Aurelle D, Bensoussan N, Marschal C, Féral J-P, Garrabou J (2015) Potential for
  adaptive evolution at species range margins: contrasting interactions between red coral
  populations and their environment in a changing ocean. Ecol Evol 5:1178–1192
- Linares C, Coma R, Mariani S, Díaz D, Hereu B, Zabala M (2008) Early life history of the
   Mediterranean gorgonian *Paramuricea clavata*: implications for population dynamics.
   Invertebr Biol 127:1–11
- Linares C, Doak DF, Coma R, Diaz D, Zabala M (2007) Life history and viability of a long-lived
   marine invertebrate: the octocoral *Paramuricea clavata*. Ecology 88:918–928
- 573 Lippé C, Dumont P, Bernatchez L (2006) High genetic diversity and no inbreeding in the

- 674 endangered copper redhorse, *Moxostoma hubbsi* (Catostomidae, Pisces): the positive sides
  675 of a long generation time. Mol Ecol 15:1769–1780
- Manel S, Perrier C, Pratlong M, Abi-Rached L, Paganini J, Pontarotti P, Aurelle D (2016) Genomic
   resources and their influence on the detection of the signal of positive selection in genome
   scans. Mol Ecol 25:170–184
- Martínez-Quintana A, Bramanti L, Viladrich N, Rossi S, Guizien K (2015) Quantification of larval
   traits driving connectivity: the case of *Corallium rubrum* (L. 1758). Mar Biol 162:309–318
- Masmoudi MB, Chaoui L, Topçu NE, Hammami P, Kara MH, Aurelle D (2016) Contrasted levels
  of genetic diversity in a benthic Mediterranean octocoral: Consequences of different
  demographic histories? Ecol Evol 6:8665–8678
- Mokhtar-Jamai K, Pascual M, Ledoux J-B, Coma R, Féral J-P, Garrabou J, Aurelle D (2011) From
  global to local genetic structuring in the red gorgonian *Paramuricea clavata*: the interplay
  between oceanographic conditions and limited larval dispersal. Mol Ecol 20:3291–3305
- 587 Molecular Ecology Resources Primer Development Consortium, Aurelle D, Baker AJ, Bottin L, 588 Brouat C, Caccone A, Chaix A, Dhakal P, Ding Y, Duplantier JM, Fiedler W, Fietz J, Fong Y, Forcioli D, Freitas TRO, Gunnarson GH, Haddrath O, Hadziabdic D, Hauksdottir S, 589 Havill NP, Heinrich M, Heinz T, Hjorleifsdottir S, Hong Y, Hreggvidsson GO, Huchette S, 590 Hurst J, Kane M, Kane NC, Kawakamit T, Ke W, Keith RA, Klauke N, Klein JL, Kun JFJ, 591 Li C, Li G-O, Li J-J, Loiseau A, Lu L-Z, Lucas M, Martins-Ferreira C, Mokhtar-Jamaï K, 592 593 Olafsson K, Pampoulie C, Pan L, Pooler MR, Ren J-D, Rinehart TA, Roussel V, Santos 594 MO, Schaefer HM, Scheffler BE, Schmidt A, Segelbacher G, Shen J-D, Skirnisdottir S, 595 Sommer S, Tao Z-R, Taubert R, Tian Y, Tomiuk J, Trigiano RN, Ungerer MC, Van 596 Wormhoudt A, Wadl PA, Wang D-Q, Weis-Dootz T, Xia Q, Yuan Q-Y (2010) Permanent 597 Genetic Resources added to the Molecular Ecology Resources Database 1 February 2010-598 31 March 2010. Mol Ecol Res 10:751-754
- 599 Ordóñez V, Pascual M, Rius M, Turon X (2013) Mixed but not admixed: a spatial analysis of
   600 genetic variation of an invasive ascidian on natural and artificial substrates. Mar Biol
   601 160:1645–1660
- Orsini L, Vanoverbeke J, Swillen I, Mergeay J, Meester L (2013) Drivers of population genetic
   differentiation in the wild: isolation by dispersal limitation, isolation by adaptation and
   isolation by colonization. Mol Ecol 22:5983–5999
- Otto SP (2018) Adaptation, speciation and extinction in the Anthropocene. Proc R Soc Lond B Biol
   Sci 285:20182047
- Padrón M, Costantini F, Bramanti L, Guizien K, Abbiati M (2018) Genetic connectivity supports
   recovery of gorgonian populations affected by climate change. Aquat Conserv 28:776–787
- Paetkau D, Slade R, Burden M, Estoup A (2004) Genetic assignment methods for the direct, real time estimation of migration rate: a simulation-based exploration of accuracy and power.
   Mol Ecol 13:55–65
- Pérez-Portela R, Cerro-Gálvez E, Taboada S, Tidu C, Campillo-Campbell C, Mora J, Riesgo A
  (2016) Lonely populations in the deep: genetic structure of red gorgonians at the heads of
  submarine canyons in the north-western Mediterranean Sea. Coral Reefs 35:1013–1026
- 615 Pilczynska J, Cocito S, Boavida J, Serrão E, Queiroga H (2016) Genetic diversity and local

- 616 connectivity in the Mediterranean red gorgonian coral after mass mortality events. PloS one617 11:e0150590
- Pilczynska J, Cocito S, Boavida J, Serrão EA, Assis J, Fragkopoulou E, Queiroga H (2019) Genetic
  diversity increases with depth in red gorgonian populations of the Mediterranean Sea and
  the Atlantic Ocean. PeerJ 7:e6794
- Piry S, Alapetite A, Cornuet J-M, Paetkau D, Baudouin L, Estoup A (2004) GENECLASS2: A
  Software for Genetic Assignment and First-Generation Migrant Detection. J Hered 95:536–
  539
- Pivotto I, Nerini D, Masmoudi M, Kara H, Chaoui L, Aurelle D (2015) Highly contrasted responses
  of Mediterranean octocorals to climate change along a depth gradient. R Soc Open Sci
  2:140493
- Pratlong M, Haguenauer A, Brener K, Mitta G, Toulza E, Garrabou J, Bensoussan N, Pontarotti P,
  Aurelle D (2018) Separate the wheat from the chaff: genomic analysis of local adaptation in
  the red coral *Corallium rubrum*. bioRxiv, 306456, ver. 3 peer-reviewed and recommended
  by PCI Evol Biol
- Pritchard JK, Stephens M, Donnelly P (2000) Inference of Population Structure Using Multilocus
   Genotype Data. Genetics 155:945–959
- Rannala B, Mountain JL (1997) Detecting immigration by using multilocus genotypes. Proc Natl
   Acad Sci U S A 64:9197–9201
- Ribout C, Carpentieri C (2013) Automated genomic DNA purification of marine organisms on the
   epMotion® 5075 VAC from Eppendorf. Eppendorf Application Note 281:1–6
- Ronce O (2007) How does it feel to be like a rolling stone? Ten questions about dispersal evolution.
   Annu Rev Ecol Evol Syst 38:231–253
- Rousset F (2008) genepop'007: a complete re-implementation of the genepop software for
   Windows and Linux. Mol Ecol Res 8:103–106
- 641 Starger C, Barber P, Baker A (2010) The recovery of coral genetic diversity in the Sunda Strait
   642 following the 1883 eruption of Krakatau. Coral Reefs 29:547–565
- 643 Szpiech ZA, Jakobsson M, Rosenberg NA (2008) ADZE: a rarefaction approach for counting
   644 alleles private to combinations of populations. Bioinformatics 24:2498–2504
- 645 Underwood JN, Smith LD, Van Oppen MJH, Gilmour JP (2007) Multiple scales of genetic
  646 connectivity in a brooding coral on isolated reefs following catastrophic bleaching. Mol
  647 Ecol 16:771–784
- 648 Verdura J, Linares C, Ballesteros E, Coma R, Uriz MJ, Bensoussan N, Cebrian E (2019)
  649 Biodiversity loss in a Mediterranean ecosystem due to an extreme warming event unveils
  650 the role of an engineering gorgonian species. Sci Rep 9:5911
- Wang J (2002) An estimator for pairwise relatedness using molecular markers. Genetics 160:1203–
   1215
- Wang J (2011) COANCESTRY: a program for simulating, estimating and analysing relatedness
   and inbreeding coefficients. Mol Ecol Res 11:141–145

- Weinberg S (1979) The light-dependent behaviour of planula larvae of *Eunicella singularis* and
   *Corallium rubrum* and its implication for octocorallian ecology. Bijdragen tot de Dierkunde
   49:16–30
- Weir BS, Cockerham CC (1984) Estimating F-statistics for the analysis of population structure.
   Evolution 38:1358–1370

## 661 **Figure legends**:

Figure 1: sampling locations for *Paramuricea clavata* and *Eunicella cavolini*. Asterisks indicate
populations issued from colonization (wrecks for *P. clavata*) or recolonization after mortality event
(*E. cavolini*). Maps were produced with SimpleMappr (Shorthouse, 2010).

665

- 666 Figure 2 : plots of PCA results. A) Paramuricea clavata with axis 1 (2.7 % of variance) horizontal
- and axis 2 (2.4 % of variance) vertical; B) *P. clavata* with axis 1 horizontal and axis 3 (2.2 % of
- 668 variance) vertical. C) Eunicella cavolini with axis 1 (4.7 % of variance) horizontal and axis 2 (4.4 %
- of variance) vertical; D) *E. cavolini* with axis 1 horizontal and axis 3 (3.9 % of variance) vertical.

670

- **Figure 3:** results for the individual clustering analysis with STRUCTURE for A) *Paramuricea*
- 672 *clavata* and B) *Eunicella cavolini*.

1 **Table 1, samples description:** codes of sampling sites, GPS coordinates, depth, sample size

2 without repeated MLGs (N), mean number of alleles per locus rarefied for g individuals (Ar(g); g =

3 29 for *Paramuricea clavata*, except for PQL with g = 12; and 14 for *Eunicella cavolini*, except UST

4 with g = 10), observed heterozygosity ( $H_0$ ) and expected heterozygosity ( $H_E$ ), multilocus  $F_{IS}$  (values

5 in bold correspond to significant test of panmixia after FDR correction at a 0.05 level).

6

site	code	GPS	depth (m)	year	Ν	Ar(g)	Ho	$H_{\rm E}$	F <sub>IS</sub>
Po	aramuri	cea clavata							
Pointe du Vaisseau	PTV	42°59'42.9''N 6°24'24.2''E	20-25	2008	29	7.2	0.59	0.63	0.06
Donator wreck	DON	42°59'35.9"N 6°16'26.1"E	34	2011	33	7.6	0.58	0.62	0.08
Le Grec wreck	GRE	42°59'37.0''N 6°16'42.0''E	34	2011	33	7.7	0.61	0.65	0.06
Sec de Sarraniers	SAR	42°59'16.3''N 6°17'30.2''E	40	2011	35	7.5	0.57	0.61	0.08
Gabinière	GAB	42°59'21.5''N 6°23'49.2''E	22-25	2008	32	7.8	0.63	0.69	0.09
Les Mèdes	PQL	43°01'43.0''N 6°14'28.0''E	31	2009	29	4.6	0.61	0.73	0.16
Montrémian	MTM	43°01'07.2''N 6°21'46.0''E	20-25	2008	29	6.1	0.57	0.64	0.12
Riou Marseille	RIO	43°10'21.66"N 5°23'25.16"E	20-25	2008	35	8.5	0.60	0.71	0.15
Riou Marseille	RIS	43°10'21.66"N 5°23'25.16"E	40	2008	30	8.0	0.66	0.73	0.10
Impériales Marseille	IMP	43°10'22.79''N 5°23'35.39''E	41	2007	39	8.3	0.63	0.72	0.12
E	unicella	cavolini							
Nisida Island (Napoli)	NISB	40°47'22.8''N 14°09'42.0''E	20	2013	16	3.8	0.54	0.58	0.08
Secca Formiche di Vivara (Ischia)	SFV	40°44'20.45"N 13°58'45.08"E	15	2013	38	4.5	0.64	0.65	0.01
Sant'Angelo (Ischia)	SAN	40°41'30.58''N 13°53'37.76''E	18-20	2013	31	4.6	0.53	0.65	0.20
La Nave (Ischia)	LAN	40°42'25.35"N 13°51'12.73"E	20-25	2013	25	5.4	0.59	0.71	0.17
Grotta Azzura (Palinuro, Salerno)	GAZ	40°1'53.01''N 15°16'9.01''E	15	2013	32	4.9	0.66	0.70	0.06
Ustica Island Secchitello (Palermo)	UST	38°41'25.54''N 13°10'25.35''E	35-38	2013	14	4.0	0.61	0.63	0.04

7

9

10 **Table 2, comparisons of relatedness levels:** comparison of within-population relatedness levels

11 based on the estimator of Wang (2002), A) for *Paramuricea clavata*, and B) for *Eunicella cavolini*.

12 Each comparison corresponds to the observed difference in mean relatedness between population in

13 column and population in row. Blue and red values indicate significantly positive and negative

14 differences respectively. Asterisk indicate extreme values based on 1000 bootstraps, with the

15 corresponding percentiles: \* 5 % \*\* 2.5 % \*\*\* 1 %.

16

17 A) P. clavata

1/	11) 1. ciuvatu										
	PTV	DON	GRE	SAR	GAB	PQL	MTM	RIO	RIS		
PTV											
DON	0.083***										
GRE	0.074***	-0.0092									
SAR	0.065***	-0.018	-0.0094								
GAB	0.11***	0.031***	0.032***	0.041***							
PQL	0.12***	0.036***	0.045***	0.054***	0.013						
MTM	-0.019	-0.1***	-0.093***	-0.084***	-0.13***	-0.14***					
RIO	0.14***	0.053***	0.062***	0.071***	0.03***	0.017	0.16***				
RIS	0.076***	-0.0073	0.0019	0.011	-0.03***	-0.043***	0.095***	-0.06***			
IMP	0.11***	0.029***	0.038***	0.047***	0.0056	-0.0073	0.13***	-0.024***	0.036***		
18 19	B) E. cavolini										
		NISB	SFV	SAN	LAN	N	GAZ	UST			
	NISB										
	SFV	0.14***									
	SAN	0.21***	0.071***								
	LAN	0.3***	0.15***	0.081***	*						
	GAZ	0.21***	0.073***	0.0026	-0.07	9***					
	UST	0.2***	0.2***	-0.0061	-0.08	7**	-0.0086				

- **Table 3:** pairwise F<sub>ST</sub> values for A) *Paramuricea clavata*, and B) *Eunicella cavolini*. Below
- diagonal: standard F<sub>ST</sub> estimates (Weir and Cockerham 1984); above diagonal: F<sub>ST</sub> estimates from
   FreeNA. Values in bold correspond to significant genic differentiation after FDR correction at a
   0.05 level.

A)	DON	GRE	SAR	GAB	MTM	PTV	PQL	RIO	RIS	IMP
DON	-	0.02	0.03	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.08	0.01	0.04	0.03
GRE	0.01	-	0.01	0.03	0.05	0.06	0.06	0.02	0.05	0.03
SAR	0.02	0.00	-	0.03	0.05	0.05	0.10	0.03	0.06	0.04
GAB	0.04	0.04	0.04	-	0.04	0.05	0.10	0.03	0.07	0.04
MTM	0.05	0.06	0.07	0.04	-	0.04	0.13	0.04	0.08	0.06
PTV	0.03	0.05	0.05	0.04	0.05	-	0.13	0.04	0.07	0.06
PQL	0.04	0.04	0.06	0.05	0.10	0.06	-	0.08	0.06	0.06
RIO	0.01	0.02	0.04	0.03	0.04	0.03	0.04	-	0.03	0.01
RIS	0.05	0.06	0.07	0.07	0.08	0.06	0.06	0.02	-	0.03
IMP	0.03	0.04	0.04	0.03	0.06	0.05	0.05	0.01	0.03	-

<b>B</b> )	GAZ	LAN	NISB	SAN	SFV	UST
GAZ	-	0.08	0.08	0.07	0.06	0.05
LAN	0.08	-	0.12	0.07	0.07	0.11
NISB	0.11	0.05	-	0.03	0.05	0.07
SAN	0.10	0.04	0.04	-	0.02	0.07
SFV	0.09	0.04	0.06	0.04	-	0.07
UST	0.10	0.13	0.12	0.11	0.12	-

**Table 4:** estimates of local  $F_{ST}$  with 95% highest probability density interval (HPDI).

Population	mean	95% HPDI
P. clavata		
DON	0.08	0.0556 ; 0.109
GRE	0.08	0.0545 ; 0.107
SAR	0.07	0.0471; 0.0950
GAB	0.05	0.0327 ; 0.0768
MTM	0.12	0.0779; 0.162
PTV	0.08	0.0514; 0.109
PQL	0.23	0.165 ; 0.295
RIO	0.03	0.0205 ; 0.0498
RIS	0.07	0.0489; 0.0960
IMP	0.05	0.0327; 0.0671
E. cavolini		
GAZ	0.15	0.0940 ; 0.208
LAN	0.18	0.117; 0.238
NISB	0.30	0.188; 0.427
SAN	0.17	0.107; 0.235
SFV	0.22	0.142 ; 0.302
UST	0.24	0.144; 0.332



![](_page_31_Figure_0.jpeg)

# A) P. clavata

K=2

K=3

K=4

K=5

![](_page_32_Figure_2.jpeg)

# B) E. cavolini

![](_page_32_Figure_4.jpeg)

## Genetic insights into recolonization processes of Mediterranean octocorals

# Authors : D. Aurelle, J. Tariel, F. Zuberer, A. Haguenauer, C. Ribout, M. Masmoudi, H. Kara,

# L. Chaoui, J. Garrabou, J.-B. Ledoux, M. C. Gambi

**Supplementary Table 1:** results of the assignment of individuals to other populations. For the three focal populations DON, GRE and GAZ, we indicate the probability of each individual to belong to each of the other analyzed population. Bold values correspond to probabilities superior or equal to 0.95. The mean of individual probabilities is given for each potential source population.

a) Para	a) Paramuricea clavata											
	SAR	GAB	MTM	PTV	PQL	RIO	RIS	IMP				
DON1	0.097	0.009	0.000	0.011	0.421	0.014	0.255	0.106				
DON2	0.498	0.620	0.206	0.116	0.175	0.742	0.086	0.067				
DON3	0.455	0.022	0.002	0.000	0.123	0.396	0.285	0.083				
DON4	0.323	0.686	0.068	0.160	0.707	0.457	0.303	0.108				
DON5	0.365	0.083	0.000	0.004	0.008	0.042	0.425	0.078				
DON6	0.123	0.320	0.002	0.061	0.081	0.163	0.309	0.376				
DON7	0.012	0.002	0.000	0.006	0.664	0.014	0.016	0.058				
DON8	0.375	0.221	0.059	0.155	0.124	0.226	0.695	0.108				
DON9	0.008	0.010	0.000	0.007	0.577	0.039	0.057	0.051				
DON10	0.176	0.498	0.061	0.060	0.681	0.614	0.325	0.222				
DON11	0.973	0.335	0.050	0.166	0.161	0.462	0.639	0.227				
DON12	0.552	0.072	0.014	0.097	0.993	0.906	0.301	0.676				
DON13	0.056	0.049	0.002	0.022	0.364	0.005	0.000	0.012				
DON14	0.078	0.003	0.008	0.058	0.828	0.227	0.913	0.764				
DON15	0.433	0.022	0.055	0.033	0.537	0.019	0.334	0.057				
DON16	0.313	0.003	0.000	0.001	0.767	0.012	0.055	0.006				
DON17	0.922	0.658	0.045	0.005	0.944	0.827	0.641	0.515				
DON18	0.818	0.269	0.487	0.819	0.988	0.999	0.752	0.928				
DON19	0.377	0.006	0.061	0.027	0.902	0.272	0.063	0.137				
DON20	0.475	0.116	0.069	0.364	1.000	0.909	0.131	0.510				
DON21	0.534	0.346	0.010	0.049	0.647	0.399	0.446	0.298				
DON22	0.932	0.425	0.272	0.066	0.690	0.983	0.265	0.598				
DON23	0.552	0.107	0.014	0.073	1.000	0.323	0.506	0.604				
DON24	0.077	0.010	0.001	0.007	0.040	0.034	0.032	0.178				
DON25	0.420	0.290	0.086	0.183	0.893	0.990	0.440	0.974				
DON26	0.466	0.050	0.105	0.333	0.649	0.560	0.051	0.168				
DON27	0.006	0.002	0.000	0.020	0.907	0.031	0.561	0.096				
DON28	0.954	0.260	0.059	0.002	0.594	0.770	0.462	0.785				
DON29	0.723	0.117	0.221	0.403	0.600	0.827	0.405	0.665				
DON30	0.328	0.009	0.000	0.005	0.672	0.027	0.069	0.049				

DON31	0.836	0.178	0.001	0.043	1.000	0.605	0.464	0.836
DON32	0.049	0.056	0.021	0.021	0.092	0.313	0.239	0.343
DON33	0.962	0.899	0.876	0.536	0.970	0.918	0.655	0.714
mean	0.432	0.205	0.087	0.119	0.600	0.428	0.339	0.345
GRE1	0.707	0.208	0.000	0.011	0.761	0.165	0.302	0.167
GRE2	0.491	0.144	0.005	0.091	0.965	0.136	0.610	0.667
GRE3	0.138	0.146	0.011	0.002	0.660	0.218	0.102	0.007
GRE4	0.091	0.004	0.000	0.000	0.002	0.014	0.079	0.001
GRE5	0.781	0.157	0.116	0.001	0.426	0.821	0.025	0.181
GRE6	0.663	0.287	0.023	0.048	0.999	0.262	0.491	0.924
GRE7	0.619	0.005	0.002	0.001	0.862	0.027	0.051	0.103
GRE8	0.953	0.125	0.121	0.105	0.691	0.567	0.138	0.167
GRE9	0.687	0.090	0.001	0.004	0.413	0.524	0.324	0.431
GRE10	0.373	0.018	0.002	0.003	0.101	0.052	0.090	0.025
GRE11	0.928	0.541	0.036	0.152	0.427	0.504	0.323	0.252
GRE12	0.739	0.063	0.002	0.011	0.668	0.024	0.105	0.194
GRE13	0.054	0.005	0.000	0.017	0.008	0.322	0.029	0.047
GRE14	0.022	0.027	0.000	0.093	0.660	0.061	0.038	0.088
GRE15	0.015	0.001	0.000	0.000	0.240	0.001	0.007	0.022
GRE16	0.540	0.058	0.008	0.012	0.843	0.384	0.528	0.481
GRE17	0.834	0.042	0.024	0.024	0.281	0.299	0.241	0.166
GRE18	0.183	0.003	0.000	0.016	0.705	0.101	0.126	0.076
GRE19	0.765	0.011	0.015	0.123	0.011	0.007	0.087	0.102
GRE20	0.132	0.015	0.002	0.086	0.065	0.348	0.378	0.237
GRE21	0.950	0.918	0.053	0.029	0.980	0.511	0.619	0.711
GRE22	0.906	0.001	0.006	0.003	0.958	0.080	0.454	0.457
GRE23	0.769	0.010	0.003	0.000	0.086	0.163	0.038	0.034
GRE24	0.511	0.033	0.039	0.347	0.746	0.207	0.134	0.323
GRE25	0.997	0.021	0.002	0.004	0.000	0.020	0.067	0.000
GRE26	0.096	0.012	0.001	0.000	0.229	0.443	0.003	0.132
GRE27	0.608	0.001	0.002	0.002	0.019	0.154	0.015	0.033
GRE28	0.552	0.501	0.096	0.874	0.991	0.322	0.316	0.870
GRE29	0.240	0.010	0.001	0.006	0.417	0.147	0.390	0.018
GRE30	0.888	0.083	0.148	0.328	0.957	0.793	0.523	0.919
GRE31	0.188	0.027	0.044	0.159	0.565	0.265	0.028	0.075
GRE32	0.490	0.028	0.021	0.093	0.512	0.656	0.053	0.041
GRE33	0.898	0.176	0.059	0.010	0.951	0.869	0.505	0.591
mean	0.540	0.114	0.026	0.080	0.521	0.287	0.219	0.259

### b) Eunicella cavolini

LAN NISB SAN SFV UST GAZ1 0.635 0.000 0.010 0.011 0.017 GAZ2 0.015 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.003 GAZ3 0.999 0.001 0.371 0.260 0.004 GAZ4 0.606 0.000 0.000 0.027 0.000 GAZ5 1.000 0.138 0.390 0.420 0.167 GAZ6 0.921 0.000 0.013 0.016 0.061 GAZ7 0.994 0.456 0.480 0.605 0.016 GAZ8 0.834 0.000 0.079 0.283 0.005 GAZ9 0.927 0.061 0.337 0.181 0.013 GAZ10 0.017 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.002 GAZ11 0.665 0.009 0.028 0.059 0.095 GAZ12 0.968 0.000 0.017 0.382 0.010 GAZ13 0.376 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 GAZ14 0.504 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 GAZ15 0.467 0.000 0.001 0.000 0.003 GAZ16 0.554 0.000 0.010 0.018 0.039 GAZ17 0.979 0.005 0.701 0.287 0.173 GAZ18 0.932 0.000 0.018 0.043 0.021 GAZ19 0.450 0.000 0.000 0.005 0.000 GAZ20 0.131 0.000 0.003 0.001 0.005 GAZ21 0.965 0.000 0.091 0.557 0.010 GAZ22 0.507 0.000 0.000 0.006 0.145 GAZ23 0.116 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 GAZ24 0.253 0.000 0.002 0.001 0.000 GAZ25 0.988 0.001 0.050 0.782 0.013 GAZ26 0.306 0.000 0.015 0.153 0.000 GAZ27 0.976 0.001 0.109 0.128 0.038 GAZ28 0.820 0.063 0.041 0.150 0.058 GAZ29 0.303 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 GAZ30 0.807 0.000 0.050 0.114 0.008 GAZ31 0.746 0.023 0.329 0.370 0.005 GAZ32 0.707 0.000 0.001 0.001 0.001 mean 0.640 0.024 0.098 0.152 0.029