



How can an epic be reliable to the historian ?

Nicole Revel

► To cite this version:

Nicole Revel. How can an epic be reliable to the historian ?. The Journal of History, 2017. hal-02493942

HAL Id: hal-02493942

<https://hal.science/hal-02493942>

Submitted on 28 Dec 2020

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

How Can an Epic Be Reliable for the Historian?

Nicole Revel

Abstract

As a matter of fact, communication between humans can be written, but prior to all, it is oral and relies upon human voice, speech skills and memory. It is also kinesics - body postures, gestures and motions - musical and rhythmic. Memory of events can be kept by way of the Script or by way of Oral Memory.

Oral Tradition is a wealth in the Philippines. After taping oral performances in their genuine contexts, we have established the first written texts, transcribed according to the phonology of each vernacular language and translated into English. Since the 1960s, several linguistic and ethnographic descriptions have been published and can be of use to complement our knowledge. However, the most important is a long-lasting dialogue and collaboration in situ with the singers of tales and other knowledgeable local persons.

As the historian looks for documents with a selective intellectual activity, he digs into them in order to turn them useful for the analysis and understanding of the various issues he is focusing on. Nowadays, what is available to him is more

diverse and can help him to access a new understanding of a problem, of a period of time, or an area of civilization.

We shall illustrate this paper with some comments on tultul (epic) among the Pala'wan, kissah (true stories), kata-kata (fictive stories) among the Sama and the Sama Dilaut, uwaging (epic) among the Tala-andig, and provide new insights to the historian. This would have been enriched by the insights of our missing colleagues at the conference.¹

Keywords: *Epic, history memory, oral tradition, narrative identity*

"Historical narratives are an answer to oblivion as time passes...."

- Paul Ricoeur, *La mémoire, l'histoire, l'oubli*, 2000.

New trends in History since *l'École des Annales* (The *Annales* School) with Lucien Febvre and Marc Bloch, the notion of *l'Histoire globale* (Global History) exemplified by Fernand Braudel on the Mediterranean Culture, followed by *La Nouvelle Histoire* (The New History) led by medievalist Jacques Le Goff, who dedicated himself to the Anthropology of Western Europe during the Medieval Period (XII and XIII centuries),² as well as Emmanuel Le Roy Ladurie and his famous monograph *Montaillou, village occitan de 1294 à 1324* (1975), *Love, Death, and Money in the Pay d'Oc* (1982), and *The French Peasantry: 1450 -1680* (1987), provide us with some landmarks.

Echoing Marcel Mauss and Marc Bloch in order to understand "Witchcraft" as a total social fact, Emmanuel Le Roy Ladurie referred and analyzed a poem written by Jacques Boë in 1842, "*Françouneto*," based on a traditional French peasant folktale. The historian contended that the poem contains many authentic traces of folk beliefs about witchcraft in rural France during the 17th and 18th centuries. We can also refer to the works of Georges Duby: *The Three Orders: Feudal Society Imagined* (1982) followed by *The Age of the Cathedrals* (1981).

In the 1970s, Jean-Pierre Vernant, historian of the Ancient Greece, was joined by Pierre Vidal-Naquet and Marcel Detienne. This group of scholars formed what the American Hellenists called *l'École de Paris* (The Paris School). Inspired by the structural anthropology of Claude Lévi-Strauss, they focused on "the way the people think," the so called "representations," and considered this approach essential to the comprehension of facts and events in History.³

The activities of the collective Memory aimed at turning Present what is no longer present, what is part of the Past, are constructions linked to historical contexts. There are several forms of Memory that are re-constructions of the Past:

The Individual Memory: linked to the person's memory, to the inquiry about his/her own past: confessions, personal diaries, autobiographies, the writing of historical novels.⁴

The Social Memory: linked to collective groups, social groups who build their common Past and build their Identity in different ways.

The Memory of the Historian: considering it has happened, the Past is the object of the discipline to which the historian adds a demand for the truth. "Every past event, what has happened in time, is relevant to a scientific approach, to a critical reconstruction, is an object of pure knowledge in a quest for truth."⁵

To these three I would add:

The Memory of Artists: the restitution of an historical event by a work of art: a novel, a poem, a play, an epic as a sung narrative, a film, a painting, a symphony. These artistic compositions are able to move the witnesses and the listeners as they re-produce the dramatic moments or events of the Past.

Paul Ricoeur has shown that historical memory is linked to forms of narratives, the spoken image, the image produced by poetry. But I would add: the image on a vase, or on a scroll of silk, is some kind of a “look like,” “*un faux-semblant*.”

Then three terms are at play: the spectator or the listener, the product, and the thing imitated. For us spectators, what is the relationship between the product and what it imitates?

In other words, what is the relationship between the fiction and the reality it reproduces by way of a painting, of a play, or of a long sung narrative, an epic?

Then one can ask: What is a “true narrative,” what is a “true story”? The Tausugs considered *kissa* as “true stories” in contrast to *kata-kata* (fictive stories or fictions), surrounded by a religious and a spiritual aura, and sung by the Sama Dilaut in order to heal a sick, for instance.

Ricoeur analyzes the crossways of History and Fiction, two distinct types of discourse:

Fiction is when the *Phantasia*, the imagination or narrative imagery, comes in, as an event is set into a plot. By way of the “emplotment” of an historical event, the oralist offers a testimony of the Past, his images, descriptions together with the modulations and timbre qualities of his voice, that tend to recreate the climate of a past event.

On the other hand, the historian is in quest of the truth and the documents that are traces of the Past in the Present. Ricoeur observes: “Any effort to comprehend a sector of reality implies the setting in motion of mental techniques, of intellectual procedures in order to master this field.”

Oral Tradition and the Living Memory

In cultures with an oral tradition, filiation, affinity, genealogies, customary law, heirlooms, territory, do not rely upon written

documents, but on the living memory of oralists, griots, bards, *mānunultul*, *ulahigen*, *uwegingun*, etc.⁶ As specialists of memory, they are in charge of safeguarding and transmitting from generations to generations the beliefs and values, local knowledge and worldview, the so-called “shared knowledge” of a human society. In such a context, Memory is omniscience.⁷

Long sung narratives have been transcribed, translated and published in books, and now all these documents are available as e-publications, thanks to the Philippine Epics and Ballads Archive of the Ateneo de Manila University at the following address: <http://epics.ateneo.edu/epics> (see Fig. 1 for the information item). As a matter of fact, this multimedia archive offers a new set of documents available to historians. Thanks to digital technology and Digital Humanities (DH), we now have access to various forms of sung narratives as Guardians of the Past.

History of human societies has to rest on an analysis of material structures as well: organized groups (kindred, groups of neighbors, associations, sects, companies, etc.), the situation of the individual within these networks together with the space occupied by the group, the space cultivated, the division of work between men and women, the distribution of food or of wealth, etc.

On this respect, if we compare various traditional cultures in the Philippine archipelago, I tend to perceive areal sets and subsets. For instance:

- In the Visayas area, Pala'wan, Hanunóo, and Sama Dilaut are three distinct types of egalitarian societies and I tend to conceive them as three sub-cultures with shared features common to a Sulu Basin culture.
- In Mindanao, stratified type of societies - quite opposite to the previous set - with a hierarchical organization between groups and a dominant attitude towards other groups, like the Maranao, the Magindanao, the Sulu Sultanates, form another set.

- Another type of society emerges with inter-personal conflicts and the distribution of power among competing and war-oriented *bagani* in Mindanao, like Manobo groups, Tala-andig Bukidnon, T'boli cultures.
- Inter-ethnic relationships in a specific area with hegemonic/subordination type of relationships, like the Tausug/Sama and Sama Dilaut, form another set.

Jesuits missionaries as well as ethnographers in the past have observed, described, and attempted to comprehend all these aspects of social life. Anthropologists compare all these distinct social structures and related worldviews. What is of high interest to these analysts is less the ancient patterns than the various illustrations of social life forms and patterns observed in synchrony and the resonance of the Past in the Present.

New Fields of Inquiries, New Insights

Hence, new sources are available and new fields and queries are opening up: What is the system of values of a given society that governs the behavior of the people within a given society? It nurtures dreams and utopias and conveys prohibitions and moral codes, *Adat*. What is the self-image of each society?

The study of mental attitudes, of ideologies, opens new areas of investigation and could provide new insights to the historian: "*l'Histoire des mentalités*," or the study of what the values system of the people is, not just of what people did, but of how they conceive the world they inhabit,⁸ their system of values and attitudes, and how ideals and social reality are in a dynamic relationship with one another.

As a matter of fact, ideologies - in a wide sense - are holistic systems offering a representation of a society by way of images, myths, ideas, concepts and values, that are all integrated in a particular social organization and worldview. As the power of myths, of words, of metaphors rests upon Tradition, they reassure the people give

them a sense of belonging, of stability, of strength. They can make them reluctant to change as well.

Various systems of representation might compete and antagonisms might arise if a given ideology is confronted with the influence of a foreign culture. Tausug culture / Spanish culture / American culture / and Philippine central state are one example. Pala'wan forest people / Ilanen maritime warfare / and Balangingi raiders are another example.

The New Sources, What are They?

- Propaganda, edifying discourses, sermons, pamphlets, epitaphs, biography of heroes.
- The vocabulary used in narratives, in letters, in plays, and in long sung narratives, epics and ballads when faithfully transcribed and translated.
- The tangible documents like costumes, ornaments.
- The kinesics observation of gestures, postures, mimics and motions.
- The setting of feasts and rituals, the related social spaces and their organization.

All these elements are included as descriptions in the epic of "*Agyu*," an immense sung mosaic shared by various *bagani* cultures in Mindanao: Manobo,⁹ Bagobo,¹⁰ Tala-andig-Bukidnon.¹¹ They provide the historian with many traces that offer some kind of a fresco, as the songs are highly descriptive of reality and offer us "a blueprint of traditional life," which Rita Cembrano observed and formulated it writing: "Finally epic singing is paying homage to the revered Ancestors and becomes a unifying force because the Manobo knows that he descends from the Immortals" (Cembrano 2005, 110-111).

The written lived experiences among the *Lumad*, the actions and observations by the Jesuits in Mindanao, together with more recent

archeological excavations have been referred too by historians in the Philippines. The attempt of Greg Hontiveros on a history of events following successive periods during 1,000 years in Butuan is an example of this linear History (Hontiveros 2004).

I suggest that we approach Epics as traces of the Past in the Present. If in a scientific quest for truth the historian follows a project of objectivity, if he focuses on Social History, then these new available documents could be taken into account: Mental attitudes, collective views and ideologies, which are new objects good to think about, as Past and Present eventually shed mutual light on each other.

Favoring a dialogue between disciplines, *New History* was the name given by Jacques Le Goff for what we know today as *Historical Anthropology*. The problems focused upon and the methods set in motion are distinct from *Ethno-history* in the U.S.

Narrative Identity and Memory: Some Illustrations and Excerpts

A. Pala'wan Highlanders Culture and Maritime raiders

Let me refer to my monographic work on the oral knowledge of a non-violent, animist society, rainforest food gatherers, hunters with blowpipe and swidden agriculturists, the Pala'wan Highlanders, living in the south of the main island that bears a similar name, Palawan. This society is strictly egalitarian, without any strong leadership, without hierarchy, without power, without authority, but where social life rests on interpersonal relationships and a customary law, *adat*, referred to daily.

The Pala'wan society has been qualified as "anarchic" (in the etymological sense of "equal social status"), where the individuals aggregate or split by personal decision and choice, where groups merge or burst into factions because of agreements or disagreements, affinities or choices. This society presents what Charles Macdonald qualified as "anarchic life style" or "open aggregated." This *modus vivendi* is also found among the Semai, *Orang Asli* of the Malay Peninsula, the Punan of central Borneo, the Sama Dilaut¹² and Bajau Laut¹³ in Southern Western Tawi-Tawi and Sabah.¹⁴ This type of social

organization seems to be characterized by what anthropologists named a "structural looseness."

In the long Past, it could eventually reflect an Austronesian way of life and could have some resilient features in contemporary Philippine society.

Let me illustrate briefly what kind of mental attitudes convey the Pala'wan long sung narratives. Performed by a *mānunultul*, a singer of an epic, a *tultul*, always conveys and illustrates the ethical behavior of a heroic character or a heroic couple: Kudaman and his lovely wives. The ladies, *linamin*, he successively marries after each natural phenomenon. As a model of man, he behaves with calm and has a low profile. He is self-controlled, courteous, peace-oriented and opposed to conflict and war, as it would be a wrong committed towards Ampuq, the Weaver. Kudaman's wives' profiles and moral attitudes follow the same code of conduct, the same *adat*, and we can perceive a similar lucid but silent, courageous, self-controlled and polite attitude in today's world as well.

However, during many centuries, the Pala'wans have been all confronted by an opposite attitude in life - violent, brutal and rabid - of the *Ilanän* (Iranun) coming in multitudes from Illana Bay, with powerful fleets of raiders in the Sulu zone. In the epic, the *Ilanän* take the opportunity of a feast to attack and ravish Kudaman's wives, in order to enslave them. As the hero embodies the ideal of wisdom, moderation and seamliness, manifested by his elegant manner to speak, to move, to act, and finally to enter in a single combat with the chief of the *Ilanän*, two types of society, two ethos face each other and contrast dramatically.

Of course, warfare and hegemonic violent attacks by the maritime raiders - *Iranun* from the coast of Western Mindanao, *Balangingi Samal* from a poor island in Sulu, and *Iban* from Borneo - were conducted for tribute extortions and enslavement on the shorelines of Palawan, the Visayan Islands and all the coasts of the Philippine Islands and the archipelagos of the Southeast Asia, going as far as the Bengale Gulf and Eastern Indonesia in the 18th and 19th centuries. All these are facts are known to historians.¹⁵

A gigantic human trafficking phenomenon was the counterpart of the growing external trade: opium from India in exchange for tea for the benefit of the British and the Chinese; guns, powder and slaves for the benefit of Tausug datus and many other Malay chiefs.

Here are some excerpts of the “Kudaman” epic¹⁶ (see Box 15.10 on the web site):

The Ilanān are so numerous, the waves of the sea can no longer dance ...

As for him, Kudaman is seated below a mosquito net with seven veils.

On the high sea, Ilanān are approaching...

As they fire their guns, leaves of trees are few compared to multiple bullets.

As Kudaman hears the guns their sound keeps on crackling like tirabun grass.

Earth is shaking. They come in multitude...

The story says, Ilanān and his raiders are already on the ground surrounding the houses ...

They keep on flowing in ...

Simultaneously they fired and the house of Kudaman is smashed to pieces.

Bullets burst and sparrows seem a few...

Their High Chief is still alive and his turban is said to be of iron

Ilanen's house is made of iron stones as smooth as wax ...

Even the nails of their chief are of gold

Another *tultul*, “*Kāqislam–islaman*,” describes the arrival in multitude of raiding boats “as fast as a typhoon, *bagyu buraq*,” the *lanong* or *joanga* with a crew of 150 to 200 men, or the *salisipan*, a long narrow oar-propelled craft used for inshore and coastal settlement raids.

Historian James Francis Warren describes:

At the end of the 18th century, slaving expeditions were composed of scores fleets the largest and most important included more than 100 joanga and between 10 to 15 thousands of raiders. They were run autocratically, there was a strict chain of command and code of conduct with unquestioning loyalty and obedience from their crews. They generally cruised in squadrons of 30 to 40 joanga with a single fleet commander and a nakodah, a captain, on board each joanga. They were many warriors of various ethnic groups and slaves would be used to fight. ...

The remains of many Spanish sites along the coasts of Ilocos, Catanduanes, Albay, Leyte, Samar [and I would add Northern Palawan] bear silent witness to the advent of sudden affluence in the Sulu sultanate and deep despair, displacements and dispersion of people throughout the Philippines.¹⁷

In “*Datuq āt “Pānārangsangan*” (Sunset Datu), a six-nights long *tultul* like “*Kudaman*,” the Ilanān define themselves clearly - their profile, skills and intentions:

As for us, said Ilanen, Little One, we are not trained to speak,

As for us we are not trained to talk,

As for us, we are not used to drink,

As for us, we fight, just to compare who is most powerful in another world.

In “*Kāswakan*” (Broken-Branch), the hero starts his voyage in quest for a wife and immediately finds on his way a devastated hamlet, blood everywhere, and by chance, a baby girl still alive, spared from massacre by a large winnow. The hero decides to take care of her and raises her as his daughter, before she becomes his wife. Then the story develops and other episodes take place.

“*Durus mata*” (Oblique Eye) sings of a dreadful attack by the *Kānipaqan*, the people of *Nipa fruticans*, the palms on the rivers’ mouths and estuaries, their sudden attacks and slaughtering of everyone inshore, except the hero who by chance was left alive, but is from then on a wandering orphan. He will be given hospitality and protection by two ladies, the “*Cordylone Lady*” and her cousin

the “Basel Lady,” two plants suggesting the house of a shaman in the hinterlands. Later, as an adolescent - together with a companion who underwent the same fate - Oblique Eye, as a silent young man with a low profile but great determination, would go to the shoreline to take revenge for the death of his elder brother, and he would succeed in killing in single combat the Chief of the Ilanen who led the former raid.

All these features of violence, desolation, and despair are clearly alluded to and illustrated in the long *tutul* sung by the Pala’wan, by ways of descriptions, comparisons, and metaphoric images. In fact, these anguishing threats revealed by dreams, these violent attacks and massacres are at the very core of each plot that I know.

But what is interesting to grasp from these sung narratives are the respective profiles and mental attitudes of the maritime alien raiders and of their preys, the Pala’wan who live along the coastal lines of Sulu Sea, a raid prone area. They suffered violent slaving expeditions composed of scores fleets every year in the approach of the strong monsoon winds - end of August-September-October - the so called “pirate wind.” Balangingi raiders probably brought between 2000 to 3000 captives to Sulu each year from voyages which focused on Central Philippines. Many were absorbed in Sulu population but many more were resold to rulers in Borneo or further afield. James Francis Warren estimates that during the period 1770-1870, between 200,000 and 300,000 captives were taken to Sulu, most of them from the Philippines (Warren 1985, 208).

Therefore, we are now also able to capture the Past in the Present of a long sung performance as a written document (transcribed, translated, and accessible on the web as an e-publication).

B. Sama Dilaut and Tausug Cultures in Tawi-Tawi

I wish to provide another insight to the study of Memory by opening a reflection on Sulu oral memory, narrating or singing *kissah* (true stories), a repertoire of narratives found among the Tausug and the Samal, focusing on their inter-ethnic relationships that can be problematic.¹⁸

This oral memory has many implications not only for the narrator, but also between groups, families, factions, political commitments, and struggles generating impossible alliances of marriages for instance, or conflicting relationships with the successive governments, during the Spanish times, the American Period or the central government in Manila.

In the Sulu setting, performing a sung narrative with or without music accompaniment, as act of remembering, is understood as an act of resistance. In other words, creative resistance is achieved via storytelling.

This is of course valid for each cultural community in Sulu, Tawi-Tawi and Mindanao. Personal stories and memories are the dimensions of the respective identities that are resisting the impact on their life of a dominant culture, and it is an ethical task of a minorities person to tell his/her story as the highest form of resistance to any hegemonic group. We could say that through a narrative, a form of autonomy is affirmed and preserved.

- | | |
|--|---|
| 16. Bagay tilaw tilaw
ni sawpagdagangan | <i>Friend, only asking
how much are you selling
fishes?</i> |
| Bagay hangpuq taglima
ba angkatuhugan
Anduq saga Suk
karina kaw sambatan
Bagay, bang kaw mabayaq
Magsambiq hal luan | <i>Friend, P15.00
per bundle.
Oh, Tausug,
please come, (and buy).
Friend, if you like
we will barter our goods.</i> |
| 17. Iq na patukad brother panyataan
Indagginis na sa
Inan sasambiqan.
Anduq indagginis na
Sainan sasambiqan
Bay na siga ni mapaghangkut
Kinakan. | <i>He came up to the ground.
Various foods
are there for barter.
Oh, various kinds of food
are there for barter.
They were already carrying
their food.</i> |

18. Anduq Mattoqa Tandan	<i>Oh, Old man Tandan</i>
Sinukuq na anambatan	<i>suggested:</i>
Anduq mailu na kam	<i>Oh, you stay here</i>
Ma lepa kam magballa takakan.	<i>And cook your food on the boat.</i>

Source: Box 2. Sama; 2.15 Tandan, a Sama Dilaut Respected Leader of Tong Bangkaw, Belatan, in <http://epics.ateneo.edu/epics>.

On the background of a daily simple barter scene, between Tadan, a Sama Dilaut respected fisherman gifted with mystical powers, and a Tausug buyer, the plot develops into an arbitrary murder of the three companions of the Hero that were left on the boat and the related consequences.

C. Bagani Cultures in Mindanao

In the *bagani* cultures of Mindanao, singing the *ulagin* of Great Agyu and its numerous *uwaging*, inspires and gives courage and strength to a Manobo, a Bagobo and a Tala-andig leader. For the later, this epic provides the model of a firm style of leadership and governance based on customary laws, like that of Agyu's high leadership and command. Singing Agyu refers to and reminds a cosmic time, affirms a set of values and a genuine cultural identity linked to the memory of "Supreme Peace," *Nalandanan*, abode of the Immortals, as warriors defending their territory never die.

Here is a brief excerpt, which alludes to the elegant, fast motions of Agyu rushing to another world to meet for the first time a lovely maiden who could become his wife, upon the suggestions his guardian spirits. One can perceive a man of determination and authority, in command of his people.

<i>Huge Man said:</i>	<i>Invincible one declared:</i>
<i>The timetable is only ten days,</i>	<i>The schedule, is eleven days only</i>
<i>Like the sun you will be expected,</i>	<i>at the hall of Peaceful place</i>
<i>That day you will be expected</i>	<i>at the hall of Stormy Wind Blowing</i>

This one you could not deny.

<i>For when the instruction was given</i>	<i>Handsome Jolly Man</i>
<i>When the statement was received</i>	<i>Handsome Man</i>
<i>Immediately walk down the stairs,</i>	<i>walked straight forward,</i>
<i>and walked fast.</i>	

<i>And we will be entertained</i>	<i>when he reached the ground</i>
<i>because he merely passed</i>	<i>the defense wall</i>
<i>protecting Peaceful place</i>	

<i>Just after, they passed the fort of</i>	<i>Peaceful place...</i>
<i>And there you will be amused</i>	
<i>They looked like a spotted hawk</i>	<i>flowing in the sky.</i>
<i>As if they were flying</i>	<i>like the feathered-head hawk</i>
<i>And we will be entertained even more,</i>	<i>because they look like</i>
	<i>twinkling little stars</i>

Along the seashore.

Source: Box 5. Tala-andig Bukidnon; 5.3 Bunuanen Kagwasen "Handsome Jolly Man," in <http://epics.ateneo.edu/epics>.

The link between Memory and Space, the territory of Agyu and his people, and the strong kinship ties uniting all of them, are encapsulated in this vast mosaic of *ulaging*, making up the epic as a total world and provide the Tala-andig an ideal reference of how to evolve and how to defend and secure their territory.¹⁹

For Paul Ricoeur, "Narrative identity shares a dialectical relationship with Memory." This mutual shaping of both Identity and Memory through narration is considered *ethical*, as it conveys the desire to live with and for others in fair relationships and attitudes as well as in just institutions.

The act of narrating is not only a way of gaining a strong sense of self-hood, it also implies the formation and sustenance of collective memories that are shared with others and provides a sense of belonging, a sense of Identity.

As each listener refigures the narrative, a poetic empowerment occurs.

By framing the notions of Identity and Memory in terms of Ricoeur's theory of narrative,²⁰ one is able to preserve a autonomy through narration. "Creatively imitating life through the threefold mimesis can and should be done, in the service of others, the reader or the listener."

Listening to the voices and attentively reading the plots and descriptions of these long narratives could open new pathways for the historian in quest of truth. These would give him new insights to access and comprehend in his attempt to reconstitute and interpret other worlds of ideas and moral codes often too distant in time and space, if not somehow alien to the analyst's conceptual world.

Notes

¹ Unfortunately, and for various reasons, Manolete Mora, who has worked on the music and the "Tudbulul" epic among the T'boli; the late Gérard Rixhon, an anthropologist among the Tausug and the Sama Dilaut; Rita Cembrano, who in her lifetime devoted a lot of energy to the Manobo and the Mamanwa cultures; Victorino Saway - Datu Migketay, oralist and anthropologist among the Tala-andig Bukidnon, and his sister, Irene Llesis-Saway, oralist too and archivist of Folk Tradition at Xavier University Museum, were not able to join this conference. All of them have worked with us for many years on oral traditions among the Lumad groups in Mindanao and the Islamized groups of Sulu and Tawi-Tawi. Their comments and interpretation of the long sung narratives would have enlightened us all.

² Jacques Le Goff, *The Medieval Imagination*, trans. by Arthur Goldhamer (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1988); *History and Memory*, trans. by Steven Rendall and Elizabeth Claman (New York: Columbia University Press, 1992). Le Goff has 14 books translated into English.

³ Jean-Pierre Vernant, *Mythe et pensée chez les Grecs. Etudes de psychologie historique* (Paris : Editions Maspéro, 1965), followed by *Mythe et tragédie en Grèce ancienne* with Pierre Vidal-Naquet (Paris: F. Maspéro, 1972). As an historian of the Greek world, Vernant also published *Le Chasseur noir. Formes de pensées et formes de société dans le monde grec* (Paris: Maspéro, 1981) and *Le Monde d'Homère* (with Vidal-Naquet; Paris : Perrin, 2000). Then Marcel Détienne in collaboration with Jean-Pierre Vernant, *Les Ruses de l'intelligence. La métis des Grecs* (Paris: Flammarion, 1989). These references illustrate the new trends up to the end of the 20th century.

⁴ Recently, in France, an ongoing pluri-disciplinary method was set in motion on the oral memory of the recent tragic event "13-Novembre," lived at different levels by 1,000 people whose testimonies are videotaped at different periods of time by an historian, Denis Peschanski, and a neuropsychologist, Francis Eustache, in collaboration with sociologists, lexicographers, jurists and mathematicians. They try to see how this collective representation is building itself in real time and attempt to capture its dialogue with individual memories.

⁵ Jean-Pierre Vernant, *La Traversée des frontières* (Paris: Le Seuil, 2004).

⁶ Margarita R. Cembrano, "Uweging: Epic Songs of Agusan Manobo Northeast Mindanao," Ch. 6, pp. 95-113; Victorino L. Saway, "The Ulagang Epic and Survival of the Tala-andig People," Ch. 4, pp. 75-84; Irene Saway-Llesis, "Experiences in Ulagang Documentation and Research," Ch. 5, pp. 85-93; Talib Lim Sangogot, "The Tawi-Tawi Sama Voice," Ch. 3, pp. 59-73; Gérard Rixhon, "A Journey into Sama Literature," Ch. 2, pp. 23-58. All these are chapter contributions in Nicole Revel (ed.), *Literature of Voice: Epics in the Philippines* (Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University, 2005). Also, Gérard Rixhon, et.al. (comp. and ed.), *Voices from Sulu: A Collection of Tausug Oral Traditions* (Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press, 2010).

- ⁷ Nicole Revel, "Literature of Voice: Kata-kata, Kissa, Tenes-tenes, Sama Dilaut Epics and Ballads Sung in Tawi-Tawi," in Birgit Abels (ed.) with Hanafi Hussin and MCM Santamaria, *Oceans of Sound Sama Dilaut Performing Arts*, Gottingen Studies in Ethnomusicology, Vol. 3 (Hildesheim/Zürich/New York: Georg Olms Verlag, 2012), pp. 127-140.
- ⁸ This approach has been developed by Jacques Le Goff on the long-lasting Middle Ages.
- ⁹ Elena Maquiso's extensive work with a Manobo *datu* is housed in Siliman University and only partly published (5 volumes).
- ¹⁰ Arsenio Manuel has several publications on the Bagobo epic: *Tuwaang: The Maiden of the Buhong Sky, A Fragment of the Bagobo Tuwaang Epic Cycle* (Quezon City: College of Liberal Arts, University of the Philippines, 1957); *Tuwaang Attends a Wedding: The Second Song of the Manuvu' Ethnoepic Tuwaang* (Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press, 1975). And also on the Ilianon epic: *Agyu: The Ilianon Epic of Mindanao* (Manila: University of Santo Tomas, 1969).
- ¹¹ Victorino Saway and Irene Llessis-Saway on seven episodes of *Agyu*, Box 5: Tala-andig Bukidnon, in <http://epics.ateneo.edu/> epics, and other unpublished works.
- ¹² Nicole Revel, "An Ethnographic Reading of *Silungan Baltapa*," in N. Revel with the collaboration of H. Arlo Nimmo, A. Martenot, G. Rixhon, T. Sangogot, and O. Tourny, *The Voyage to Heaven of a Sama Hero / Le Voyage au ciel d'un héros Sama / Silungan Baltapa*, Trilingual Edition: Sinama-French-English (Paris: Geuthner, 2005). 370 pp., 4 black and white photos, 1 DVD video (1 audio file: the song + 1 file of 110 photos, slides show with a narrative [French/English], "Réalisation," by A. Martenot & N. Revel), pp. 205-223. See also <http://epics.ateneo.edu/epics>, Box 2. Sama, 2.9 "*Silungan Baltapa*."

- ¹³ Clifford A. Sather, *The Bajau Laut: Adaptation, History, and Fate in a Maritime Fishing Society of South-Eastern Sabah* (Kuala Lumpur, Singapore and New York: Oxford University Press, 1997).
- ¹⁴ Charles H. Macdonald, "Uncrystallized Society and Libertarian Spirit" (2013), in https://www.researchgate.net/publication/278754316_Uncrystallized_society_and_libertarian_spirit. Accessed on 19 April 2016. Modern Philippine society presents a number of traits that have puzzled or fascinated social scientists: an apparent looseness of organization, institutional fuzziness, intense factionalism, moral values geared toward smooth interpersonal interaction, a weak sense of public good, and a bilateral kinship system. This article revisits these points and makes sense of them by using a model of society called "anarchic" or "open-aggregated." Its principles are those of sharing, equality of status ("anarchic" in the etymological sense), and networks of weak and immanent ties. Its operation is dependent on what I call "conditions of felicity" of collective life.
- ¹⁵ James Francis Warren, *Iranun and Balangingi: Globalisation, Maritime Raiding and Birth of Ethnicity* (Singapore: Singapore University Press, 2002). See Maps on pp. 55, 75, 127.
- ¹⁶ Nicole Revel-Macdonald, *Kudaman. Une épopée Palawan chantée par Usuj* (La Haye/Paris, Mouton: *Les Cahiers de l'Homme*, 1983), 385 pp., 11 illustr. A. Fer, 1 disque 33t; *Kudaman, Isang Epikong Palawan na Inawit ni Usuy*, trans. by de E. B. Maranan and N. Revel-Macdonald (Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press, 1992), 401 pp.
- ¹⁷ James Francis Warren, *The Sulu Zone, 1768-1898* (Singapore: Singapore University Press, 1981), p. 208, Part III. Slavery in the Sulu Sultanate, pp. 215-236. Mentioned also by Antony Reid, *Charting the Shape of Early Modern Southeast Asia* (Chiang Mai: Silkworm Books, 1999), p. 211. James Francis Warren, "The Role of Maritime Raiding in the Economy of the Sulu Zone, 1768-1878," in *Philippines: An Archipelago of Exchanges* (Paris: Quai Branly Museum, 2013), pp. 146-151.

- ¹⁸ During the 2016 PNHS national conference, Talib Lim Sangogot presented four *parang sabil* related to various periods, in an attempt to illustrate this oral tradition and explain its meaning and motivation.
- ¹⁹ Saway 2005, pp.75-84.
- ²⁰ See Paul Ricoeur, *Temps et récit* [Time and Narrative] (Paris: Seuil, 1983), Ch 3, Vol. I, pp. 104-169, "La triple mimèsis." The concept of threefold *mimèsis* in a narrative involves: 1) the prefiguration of symbolic elements; 2) their configuration into a narrative; and, 3) the re-figuration of the narrative by the reader (or the listener).

References

- Cembrano, Margarita R. "Uwaging: Epic Songs of Agusan Manobo Northeast Mindanao," in Nicole Revel (ed.), *Literature of Voice: Epics in the Philippines* (Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University, 2005), Ch. 6, pp. 95-113.
- Détienne, Marcel and Jean-Pierre Vernant. *Les Ruses de l'intelligence. La métis des Grecs*. Paris: Flammarion, 1989.
- Duby, Georges. *The Three Orders: Feudal Society Imagined*. Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1982.
- _____. *The Age of the Cathedrals*. Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1981.
- Hontiveros, Greg. *Butuan of a Thousand Years*. Butuan City: Butuan Historical & Cultural Foundation, Inc., 2004.
- Ladurie, Emmanuel Le Roy. *Montaillou, village occitan de 1294 à 1324*. Paris: Gallimard, 1975.
- _____. *Love, Death, and Money in the Pay d'Oc*. London: Scolar Press, 1982.

- _____. *The French Peasantry: 1450 -1680*. London: Scolar Press, 1987.
- Le Goff, Jacques. *The Medieval Imagination*, trans. by Arthur Goldhammer. Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1988.
- _____. *History and Memory*, trans. by Steven Rendall and Elizabeth Claman. New York: Columbia University Press, 1992.
- Macdonald, Charles H. "Uncrystallized Society and Libertarian Spirit" (2013), in https://www.researchgate.net/publication/278754316_Uncrystallized_society_and_libertarian_spirit. Accessed on 19 April 2016.
- Manuel, E. Arsenio. *Tuwaang: The Maiden of the Buhong Sky, A Fragment of the Bagobo Tuwaang Epic Cycle*. Quezon City: College of Liberal Arts, University of the Philippines, 1957.
- _____. *Tuwaang Attends a Wedding: The Second Song of the Manuvu' Ethnoepic Tuwaang*. Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press, 1975.
- _____. *Agyu: The Ilianon Epic of Mindanao*. Manila: University of Santo Tomas, 1969).
- Maquiso, Elena. *Ulahingan: An Epic of the Southern Philippines*, 5 vols. Dumaguete City: Silliman University, 1977 (partly published).
- Philippine Epics and Ballads Archive*, in <http://epics.ateneo.edu/epics>. Accessed on 19 April 2016.
- Reid, Antony. *Charting the Shape of Early Modern Southeast Asia*. Chiang Mai: Silksworm Books, 1999.
- Revel, Nicole (ed.). *Literature of Voice: Epics in the Philippines*. Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University, 2005.

Revel, Nicole. "An Ethnographic Reading of *Silungan Baltapa*," in N. Revel with the collaboration of H. Arlo Nimmo, A. Martenot, G. Rixhon, T. Sangogot, and O. Tourny, *The Voyage to Heaven of a Sama Hero / Le Voyage au ciel d'un héros Sama / Silungan Baltapa*, Trilingual Edition: Sinama-French-English (Paris: Geuthner, 2005).

_____. "Literature of Voice: Kata-kata, Kissa, Tenes-tenes, Sama Dilaut Epics and Ballads Sung in Tawi-Tawi," in Birgit Abels (ed.) with Hanafi Hussin and MCM Santamaria, *Oceans of Sound Sama Dilaut Performing Arts*, Gottingen Studies in Ethnomusicology, Vol. 3 (Hildesheim/Zürich/New York: Georg Olms Verlag, 2012), pp. 127-140.

Revel-Macdonald, Nicole. *Kudaman. Une épopée Palawan chantée par Usuj*. La Haye/Paris, Mouton: Les Cahiers de l'Homme, 1983.

_____. *Kudaman, Isang Epikong Palawan na Inawit ni Usuy*, trans. by de E. B. Maranan and N. Revel-Macdonald. Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press, 1992.

Ricoeur, Paul. *La mémoire, l'histoire, l'oubli*. Paris: Seuil, 2000.

_____. *Temps et récit* [Time and Narrative]. Paris: Seuil, 1983.

Rixhon, Gérard. "A Journey into Sama Literature," in Nicole Revel (ed.), *Literature of Voice: Epics in the Philippines* (Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University, 2005), Ch. 2, pp. 23-58.

_____, et. al. (comp. and ed.). *Voices from Sulu: A Collection of Tausug Oral Traditions*. Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press, 2010.

Sangogot, Talib Lim. "The Tawi-Tawi Sama Voice," in Nicole Revel (ed.), *Literature of Voice: Epics in the Philippines* (Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University, 2005), Ch. 3, pp. 59-73

Sather, Clifford A. *The Bajau Laut: Adaptation, History, and Fate in a Maritime Fishing Society of South-Eastern Sabah*. Kuala Lumpur, Singapore and New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.

Saway, Victorino L. "The *Ulag* Epic and Survival of the Tala-andig People," in Nicole Revel (ed.), *Literature of Voice: Epics in the Philippines* (Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University, 2005), Ch. 4, pp. 75-84.

Saway-Llesis, Irene. "Experiences in *Ulag* Documentation and Research," in Nicole Revel (ed.), *Literature of Voice: Epics in the Philippines* (Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University, 2005), Ch. 5, pp. 85-93.

Vernant, Jean-Pierre. *Mythe et pensée chez les Grecs. Etudes de psychologie historique*. Paris: Editions Maspero, 1965.

_____. *Le Chasseur noir. Formes de pensées et formes de société dans le monde grec*. Paris: Maspero, 1981.

_____. *La Traversée des frontières*. Paris: Le Seuil, 2004.

Vernant, Jean-Pierre and Pierre Vidal-Naquet. *Mythe et tragédie en Grèce ancienne*. Paris: F. Maspero, 1972.

_____. *Le Monde d'Homère*. Paris: Perrin, 2000.

Warren, James Francis. *The Sulu Zone, 1768-1898: The Dynamics of External Trade, Slavery, and Ethnicity in the Transformation of a Southeast Asian Maritime State*. Singapore: Singapore University Press, 1981.

_____. *Iranun and Balangingi, Globalisation, Maritime Raiding and Birth of Ethnicity*. Singapore: Singapore University Press, 2002.

_____. "The Role of Maritime Raiding in the Economy of the Sulu Zone, 1768-1878," in *Philippines: An Archipelago of Exchanges* (Paris: Quai Branly Museum, 2013), pp. 146-151.