

# **Long term decrease of 137Cs bioavailability in French pastures: results from 25 years of monitoring**

Khaled Brimo, Marc Andre Gonze, Laurent Pourcelot

### **To cite this version:**

Khaled Brimo, Marc Andre Gonze, Laurent Pourcelot. Long term decrease of 137Cs bioavailability in French pastures: results from 25 years of monitoring. Journal of Environmental Radioactivity, 2019, 208-209, pp.106029. 10.1016/j.jenvrad.2019.106029 . hal-02454921

# **HAL Id: hal-02454921 <https://hal.science/hal-02454921v1>**

Submitted on 24 Jan 2020

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



[Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution - NonCommercial - NoDerivatives 4.0](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/) [International License](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/)

# **Long term decrease of 137Cs bioavailability in French pastures: results from 25 years of monitoring**

Khaled Brimo<sup>a\*</sup>, Marc André Gonze<sup>a</sup>, Laurent Pourcelot<sup>a</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Institut de Radioprotection et de Sûreté Nucléaire (IRSN), LEREN, Cadarache, 13115 Saint

Paul lez Durance, France

\*Corresponding authors: Khaled Brimo

Tel: + 33 04.42.19.91.09

E-mail: [khaled.brimo-proman@irsn.fr](mailto:khaled.brimo-proman@irsn.fr)

#### 1 **1. Introduction**

2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 The atmospheric nuclear weapons testing and the nuclear accidents such as Chernobyl and Fukushima Daiichi disasters in 1986 and 2011 respectively led to the release of huge quantities of radionuclides into the atmosphere and among them cesium 137  $(^{137}Cs)$ , which in turn contaminated the terrestrial and aquatic environments (Ashraf et al., 2014; UNSCEAR, 2000). The long term behavior of  $^{137}Cs$  is still ongoing topic of research due to its highly persistent nature, and bioavailability for vegetation uptakes(Comans et al., 1989; Cremers et al., 1988; Gillham et al., 1980; Smolders et al., 1997). The soil of pastures still represents an important sink for  $137Cs$  in the contaminated territories, and thereby cesium may readily enter the food chain and reach the human body through the soil-grass-cow's milk pathway (Strebl et al., 2002).

12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 Few years after a nuclear accident,  $137$ Cs is retained in the surface layer of soil despite being subjected to various loss processes. Loss mechanisms at long term include radioactivity decay (radioactivity decay constant: 2.3 x  $10^{-2}$  year  $^{-1}$ ), uptake by plants, leaching and physical mass transport (e.g. watershed runoff and erosion) (Ehlken and Kirchner, 2002; IAEA-TECDOC-472, 2010; Mück, 2003).In addition to those processes, it is well known that the bioavailability of radiocaesium in soil decreases with time due to its diffusion into the illite lattice (Absalom et al., 1995; Smith et al., 1999), a process commonly known as "aging". Aging is a crucial process in the assessment of environmental risks as it leads to the decrease of the contamination levels in grass and thereby in the food chain.

21 22 23 24 Information on the decline of  $^{137}Cs$  bioavailability in pasture ecosystem components and their mathematical modeling are crucial for an accurate assessment of long term impacts after a nuclear accident. In this respect, several models were developed and applied during the last two decades in order to predict the fate and transport of radionuclides in pastures. Some 25 26 27 28 29 30 31 32 33 34 35 36 37 38 39 40 41 42 43 44 45 46 47 48 49 examples of such models are the semi-mechanistic model of Absalom et al. (2001) which predicts the activity concentrations of radiocaesium transferred to plants from the contaminated soil, the radiological risk assessment tool (ASTRAL) to account for the dose ambient rates in agricultural and forest systems (Calmon and Mourlon, 2002),and also the European Decision Support System (RODOS) for nuclear emergencies (Ehrhardt and Weis, 2000). These models differ largely by their complexity, structure, assumptions, and mathematical formalisms but a common problem of determining the best sets of model parameters remains an issue (Almahayni et al., 2019). One key parameter for most of these radiological models is the effective half-life parameter which is defined as the time during which the radionuclides activity content, in an environmental component, is reduced to half by the action of all processes including the physical decay(IAEA-TECDOC-472, 2010). These parameters are often required as inputs in assessment tools and determination of their values as accurately as possible is, therefore, crucial for optimum prediction results. Estimating the values of effective half-life for  $^{137}Cs$  in pasture ecosystem components has been well treated in literature but only a few studies such as those by Corcho-Alvarado et al. (2016) and Roussel-Debet et al.(2007) have estimated their values by measurements followed on a time scale of more than 15 years after a nuclear accident. Studies over greater time may therefore be required for more realistic estimations because of the quite high persistence of  $137Cs$  in the environment. Additionally to this, there is a little or no data about the uncertainty associated with these parameters although this is essential information to perform probabilistic assessments. Here we present a study examining the long term effective half**lives** values in different pasture components as a first step towards more robustness and reliability of radiological risks assessment models. The main goal was to use more than twenty five years monitoring data, collected at dozen of French pasture sites by the IRSN (Institute for Radiological and Protection Nuclear Safety), in order to estimate the average

50 51 52 values of the long term effective half-lives with their associated uncertainty in soil-grasscow's milk components. An additional goal was then to evaluate the decrease of  $^{137}Cs$ bioavailability rates that are required in radiological assessment models.

#### 53 **2. Monitoring data**

#### 54 **2.1. Monitoring sites**

55 56 57 58 59 60 61 62 63 64 65 66 67 68 69 70 71 72 73 Locations of the ten monitoring sites are shown in Fig. 1. These sites are distributed in eastern, south-eastern and northern regions of France which are regarded as the most contaminated areas by  $137Cs$  atmospheric fallouts over the French territory. Eight of the sampled sites are grazing areas located around the Electricité de France nuclear power plants (CHO, CAT, NOG, FES, BUG, CRM, CRU, TRI), while the two additional investigation sites, Mercantour (MER) and Beaune-Le-Froid (BLF), are both located in permanent prairie areas. The main sources of  $^{137}Cs$  contamination in the monitoring sites were the depositions from nuclear weapons tests and Chernobyl fallouts (Roussel-Debet et al., 2007). Additionally to these depositions, a very minor and negligible amount was also received after the Fukushima accident in spring 2011(Masson et al., 2011; Parache et al., 2011). The contribution of  $^{137}Cs$ originating from nuclear reactor releases to the total  $^{137}Cs$  content in terrestrial environment can be ignored (Duffa et al., 2004). All sites are used for cow grazing and therefore grass and cow's milk sampled from these sites are used to assess the transfer of  $137Cs$  from soil to grass and from grass to milk. In winter cows are kept in barns and fed by hay harvested during the summer. Cows also receive very small amounts of supplement that contain vitamins and proteins (usually flour corn or soya). Overall, at grazing as for indoor feeding, the feeding rates did not change over time. Table <sup>1</sup> gives the names and the corresponding abbreviations of the sites of interest, their geographical location, the periods of observation, the target component and the corresponding ranges of  $137$ Cs activities. The granulometry and soil organic 74 75 76 77 78 79 content in the studied sites have been summarized in Table 2. The soil is loamy with low organic matter content in all studied sites except for Nogent and Mercantour in which clay soil and organic soil predominate respectively (IAEA classification, (IAEA-TECDOC-472, 2010)). The monitoring sites are, in general, all located in areas where oceanic climate prevails except for Mercantour for which high-mountain climate prevails (Pourcelot et al., 2003).

80

#### 81 **2.2. Sampling and analytical methodology**

82 83 84 85 86 87 88 89 90 91 At each of the selected pastures plot (surface ranges between 2,000 and 10,000  $m<sup>2</sup>$  about) soil from the upper 5 cm layer was taken following methodology described in Roussel-Debet et al. (2007). At the same plot, grass (stems and shoots) covering one to two square meters was collected using shears, 2-5 cm above the ground in order to prevent any contamination by soil particles. At the same time, about <sup>5</sup> L of cow's milk was also sampled at the farm when cow's herd was grazing in the fields. Back to the laboratory, soil sample was first sieved to remove  $>$ 2 mm material. Then soil and grass samples were dried at 80 °C for 5 days. Milk sample was dried by lyophilization. Finally dried samples of grass and milk were ashed at 480°C for 24 h and crushed prior to  $^{137}Cs$  analyses. Low level gamma spectrometry allows us to quantify  $137Cs$  activity, following methodology given by Bouisset and Calmet (1997).

92

### **2.3. Available data and sélection criteria**

93 94 95 96 97 98 Data used for this study were aggregated from the results of long term radioactivity monitoring programs conducted during the period from 1992 to 2017 at various monitoring sites in France. Overall, we had access to about 600 measurement data of  $137Cs$  activities across the monitoring sites continuously sampled at the same areas. Measurements were collected either from only one plot or from several plots that were located within area delineated by a circle having a diameter of less than 30 km. Given the fact that these data

99 100 101 102 103 104 105 106 107 108 109 110 111 were obtained from various studies and monitoring programs, some were incomplète or not suitable for this study purposes due to the relatively short period of their observation which was not long enough to reveal a significant decline in  $^{137}Cs$  content. To avoid potential misleading results and ensure that our parameters estimation was as reliable and accurate as possible, we set criteria for data selection. Hence, for  $137Cs$  half-life estimations, the data sets that covered a time period of at least ten years with at least ten measurements were only selected. We applied later an additional criterion: the simple exponential model explained in section 3, to which our data were fitted, should be able to explain at least 50% of the data variation (i.e. the determination coefficient value  $R^2$  derived from a least squares analysis should be equal or greater than  $(0.5)$ . In the light of this analysis, the simultaneous availability of data sets on <sup>137</sup>Cs measurements in soil, grass and milk was limited to three sites (BLF, CHO and CRM) whereas data of the remaining sites were limited to one or two of these components (see Table <sup>1</sup> and Fig. 1).

#### 112 **3. Data modeling**

#### 113 **3.1. Theory**

114 115 116 Following a nuclear accident, contamination of grass vegetation can result from either wet/dry atmospheric deposition onto the aerial part (i.e. foliage) or by root uptake of bioavailable radiocesium from the soil layer.

117 118 119 120 121 However, the contribution of the foliar pathway becomes negligible after some years, while uptake by roots becomes the major process controlling the radiocesium activity concentration in grass but also in cow s' milk, as the ingested grass is the major source of contamination in milk at the sites investigated here (i.e. the contribution of other feedstuffs and drinking water is negligible). On the long term, it is usually assumed that radiocesium activity concentrations 122 123 in grass and milk are in equilibrium with the activity concentration of bioavailable radiocesium in soil (denoted Cav hereafter).

124 125 126 127 128 129 On the long term, the decrease of bioavailable radiocesium in soil after deposition can be described as a two-phase process, with a rapid initial decrease during the first few years, followed by a much slower decrease with a characteristic time greater than a decade typically. The decrease is caused mainly by the combined effect of: fixation of radiocesium on specific and non-specific sites, leaching of the upper rooting layer by downward infiltration, soil erosion and plant uptake. Mathematically, this can be expressed as follows:

$$
C_{\rm av}(t) \propto P_{\rm fast} \exp(-(k_{\rm fast} + \lambda).t) + (1 - P_{\rm fast}) \exp(-(k_{\rm slow} + \lambda).t) \tag{1}
$$

130 131 132 133 134 135 136 Where  $C_{av}(t)$  is the sum of the labile and non-labile bioavailable radiocesium concentrations in the root layer at time t (in years),  $\lambda$  is the physical decay rate (2.31 x 10<sup>-2</sup> year<sup>-1</sup>) and k<sub>fast</sub> and  $k_{slow}$  (in year <sup>-1</sup>) are the apparent first order kinetic rates for the fast ( $P_{fast}$ ) and slow (1-Pfast) declining fractions respectively. Absalom et al. (1999) used a similar equation to predict the soil-to-plant transfer of radiocesium using soil characteristics. Mück (2003) had reported long term measurements of radiocesium activity in cow's milk from 4 European countries after the Chernobyl accident which showed effectively a two phase decline.

137 138 139 140 In case of long term monitoring that started after the initial phase has ceased (i.e.  $exp(-(k_{fast} + \lambda) \cdot t) \rightarrow 0)$ , equation (1) shows that C<sub>av</sub> decays exponentially at a rate equal to  $(k_{slow} + \lambda)$ . The latter can be quoted as an effective half-life of bioavailable radiocesium (in years) as follows:

$$
T_{\text{eff-slow}}^{\text{av}} = \frac{\ln(2)}{k_{\text{slow}} + \lambda} \tag{2}
$$

141 142 On the other hand, the long term rates of change of the total radiocesium content in soil (i.e. the sum of bioavailable and non-bioavailables fractions) is commonly described by assuming 143 144 that the decline in radiocesium concentration in soil  $C_s$  is exponential, and the corresponding effective half-life can therefore be given as follows:

$$
T_{\text{eff-slow}}^{\text{soil}} = \frac{\ln(2)}{\lambda_{\text{soil}}} \qquad (3)
$$

145 146 147 148 149 Here,  $\lambda_{\text{solid}}$  is greater than  $\lambda$  and refers to the radiocesium loss mainly caused by physical decay, plant uptake, erosion and leaching processes. If the contribution of the environmental processes other than physical decay is small compared to the contribution of adsorption and fixation mechanisms, the total radiocesium concentration in soil would then change with a rate close to the physical decay (i.e.  $C_s \propto \lambda$ ).

150 151 152 In this work the hypothesis of exponential decline in the three different pasture components soil, grass and milk was tested by analyzing the long term decrease-of radiocesium activity concentrations in sample collected at the studied sites.

#### 153 **3.2. Mathematical and statistical data analysis**

154 155 156 157 158 159 160 161 162 We estimated the values of kinetic rate constants ( $k_{slow}$ ,  $\lambda_{sol}$ ) with their associated uncertainties at confidence intervals of 95% using the multiple linear regression tool of Excel software (Microsoft, USA, 2010). The coefficient of determinations ( $\mathbb{R}^2$ ) was used as indicator of the goodness of fit. The fitting of ( $k_{slow} + \lambda$ ) required for equation (2) was performed by either the slope of logarithmically transformed concentrations of <sup>137</sup>Cs in grass versus time ( $\rightarrow$  T<sub>eff-slow</sub> = T<sub>eff-slow</sub>) or from the slope of logarithmically transformed concentrations of  $^{137}Cs$  in milk versus time ( $\rightarrow$  T<sub>eff-slow</sub> =  $T_{eff-slow}^{milk}$ ). The kinetic rate  $\lambda_{solid}$  required for equation (3) was determined from the slope of logarithmically transformed concentrations of total  $^{137}Cs$  in soil versus the elapsed time.

163 164 To evaluate the long term decrease of the bioavailable pool of  $^{137}Cs$ , the characteristic time of the decrease of cesium bioavailability  $(T<sup>slow</sup>)$  was calculated as follows:

$$
\frac{1}{T^{\text{slow}}} = \frac{1}{T^{\text{grass}}_{\text{eff-slow}}} - \frac{1}{T^{\text{soil}}_{\text{eff-slow}}} \quad (4)
$$

165 166 167 168 169 170 171 172 173 174 175 176 Where  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}^{\text{grass}}$ ,  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}^{\text{sol}}$  are the distributions of effective half-lives values for grass and soil respectively averaged over the sites where experimental data are available (i.e. BLF, CHO, CRM, FES, NOG for grass and BLF, BUG, CAT, CHO, CRM, CRU, NOG for soil).The soilto-grass transfer factor (TF) defined as the ratio of the  $^{137}Cs$  content in grass (Bq. kg $_{\text{dm}}^{-1}$  where "dm" stands for dry mass) to that in soil  $(Bq \t{.} kg<sub>dm</sub><sup>-1</sup>)$ , was also calculated. TF for a site of interest was calculated for each pair of soil and grass samples taken on the same monitoring year. TF calculations were limited to the sites where experimental data were available (i.e. BLF, CRM, CHO, NOG). Statistical analysis of the results was performed by Matlab software package (Mathwork, USA) using the one analysis of variance (ANOVA,  $p < 0.05$ ) (Mohammed et al., 2016) in order to assess whether significant differences existed between the distributions of T<sub>eff-slow</sub> values estimated for  $^{137}Cs$  in soil, grass and milk at each of the studied sites.

#### 177 **4. Results and discussion**

#### 178 **<sup>137</sup> 4.1. Temporal trends in Cs activity concentrations**

179 180 181 182 183 184 185 186 Fig.2 shows the long term temporal changes observed in the activity concentrations of  $^{137}Cs$ in soil, grass and milk for the BLF (Fig.2a), CHO (Fig.2b) and CRM (Fig.2c) sites. Results for the remaining sites are presented in Fig.A.1 in Appendix. Overall, it could be seen from these measurements that activity concentrations for all investigated sites tend to decrease slowly with time. The rates of decline of  $^{137}Cs$  activity concentrations in soil are generally slower than observed in milk or grass with also smaller fluctuations over time for all studied sites. Such observations in fact may be likely attributed to the slow irreversible fixation of  $137Cs$  in soil that is frequently reported as a limiting factor of bioavailability and mobility of 187 188 189 190 191 192 193 194 195 196 197  $^{137}Cs$  (Absalom et al., 1995; Smith et al., 1999). We may also notice that the relatively large spatial variability in the measurements of  $^{137}Cs$  activity concentrations at CRM, NOG, BUG sites (where soil samples were collected from several observation plots) surprisingly does not affect the emergence of clear decline trends. However, in contrast to the trends observed in the root layer, the activity concentrations in milk and grass reveal temporal and spatial fluctuations at all investigated sites. Moreover, it is noted that the ratio between the activity concentrations measured in grass to that in milk varies largely between sites. While the activity concentrations in grass are approximately 10 and 20 times higher than those recorded in milk at the two sites CHO and CRM sites (Fig. 2b and Fig. 2c respectively), it is only two times higher at BLF site (Fig.2a). Potential reasons to explain these variations cannot be derived from this study.

#### 198 **4.2. Estimation of long term effective half-lives (Teff-slow)**

199 200 201 202 203 204 205 206 207 208 209 210 211 When possible, the distributions of  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  values for milk, grass and soil at each investigated site were calculated. They are displayed in Fig.3. These distributions reflect, indeed, the uncertainties that were caused by both the selected model (i.e. the simple exponential equation) and measurement errors including the spatial variability in the data used. In fact, results from all studied sites demonstrate that the long term loss of  $137Cs$  for the three components can be described to a good degree of significance with a simple exponential equation (see Fig. 3) as evidenced by the relatively high values of coefficient of determinations ( $\mathbb{R}^2$  > 0.65 with p-values much below 0.05 in most cases). A good consistency could be observed between the probability distributions of  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}^{\text{milk}}$ obtained at all studied sites (see Fig.3a), except for the two sites TRI and CRU in which the uncertainties were relatively large as indicated by the ninety-five percent confidence limits. The median values are found to range between 6.1 and 12.6 years. Similar results could also be observed in the case of grass (Fig.3b) but with uncertainties larger over all investigated sites, particularly in 212 213 214 215 216 217 218 219 220 221 222 FES where the long term distributions of  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}^{\text{grass}}$  values ranged from 12.0 to 52.9 years with a median value of 19.8 years. With the exception of FES, the median values in grass ranged from 5.9to 12.6 years which are very close to those obtained in milk. The results obtained for soil were also consistent over all sites (Fig.3c) with median values ranging between 12.0 and 24.9 years (i.e. corresponding to variations of a factor of  $\sim$ 2 similar to those in milk and grass). The highest uncertainties at BUG and CRU sites may be attributed to the relatively large spatial variability in the used data. In overall, it is noted that whatever the investigated site or the environmental component, the median  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  values estimated in soil, grass or milk are significantly lower than the physical decay (30 years), indicating therefore that the environmental conditions and their complex interactions are the factors driving the long term fate and transfer of radiocesium in pasture ecosystems.

### 223

### **4.3. Comparison of Teff\_slow at monitoring sites**

224 225 226 227 228 229 230 231 232 233 234 235 The variances between the distributions of effective half-life values in milk, grass and soil were evaluated independently for each studied site by means of one way analysis of variance tests (ANOVA,  $p \le 0.05$ ). These tests were limited to the sites where at least 2 compartments were monitored (i.e. BLF, CRM, CRU, NOG and CHO). The *p* values yielded by the statistical tests are all summarized in Table A.1 in Appendix. For BLF and CRM sites, independently, significant differences appeared between the distributions of effective half-life values estimated in milk ( $T_{\text{eff-slow}}^{\text{milk}}$ ) or grass ( $T_{\text{eff-slow}}^{\text{grass}}$ ) against that estimated in soil (T $_{\text{eff-slow}}^{\text{soil}}$ ) (ANOVA,  $p < 0.05$ ). In contrast, no such significant differences were found between T<sub>eff-slow</sub>and T<sub>eff-slow</sub>(ANOVA,  $p > 0.05$ ). Similar results were also found at CRU site with respect to the difference between grass and soil, and at CHO site with respect to the difference between grass and milk. Indeed, these statistic findings, of no significant differences between grass and milk but significant differences with respect to soil, support the 236 237 238 239 240 241 242 243 244 245 view that the bioavailable pool of <sup>137</sup>Cs is likely controlled by the slow irreversible fixation of cesium to the soil matrix. This, in turn, limits its bioavailability for vegetation uptake and its transfer to milk for cows that are fed with locally produced vegetation. Moreover, these statistic findings are also in agreement with the conclusion frequently reported in other previous studies that the milk could be a robust indicator of contamination in grass(e.g. Mück and Gerzabek,1995; Pourcelot et al., 2007). However, results inconsistent with these findings suggesting differences between grass and soil were found for CHO and NOG sites. These differences may be related to the variability across studied sites so that the fixation process at those two sites was less important in affecting  $137Cs$  bioavailability compared to the aforementioned sites.

246 247 248 249 250 251 252 253 254 255 256 In order to evaluate the difference in half-lives values between the three environmental components over all sites, the distributions of  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  values averaged over all investigated sites were calculated for each environmental component using the geometric mean. They are presented in Fig.4 (bars denoted with the letter F). Calculations were made by Monte-Carlo simulations procedure using as inputs the related distributions calculated at each site. Gaussian distributions were assumed with mean and standard deviation values equal to those derived through linear regression. Hence, the distributions yielded by this procedure reflect the average variability of  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  values among sites. Results show that the median values of these distributions decrease in the following order soil >> grass >milk with corresponding values of 17.0, 11.0, 9.0 years respectively. The larger uncertainties of  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  values in soil and grass are related to the large uncertainties in input distributions.

257 258 259 260 Based on joint analysis of exponential decline rates in soil versus in grass, the characteristic time of the decrease of  $^{137}Cs$  bioavailability in soil (T<sup>slow</sup>) was then calculated according to equation (4). Its median value was found to be in the order of 26 years with corresponding bioavailability decrease rate  $(k_{slow}=ln(2)/T^{slow})$  of 0.026 year<sup>-1</sup> (the 95 % CI ranges between 261 262 263 264 265 266 267 268 269 270 271 272 273 274 275 276 0.008 and 0.044 year<sup>-1</sup> with corresponding characteristic times from 13 to 61 years in soil). The impact of aging of bioavailable pool of  $^{137}Cs$  was also shown when the soil-to-grass transfer factor (TF) values calculated within different decades were compared. The obtained TF values were found to decrease with time and to range from 1.3  $\times 10^{-2}$  to 65.8 x 10<sup>-2</sup> with a median value of 7.7 x 10<sup>-2</sup> within the first decade after Chernobyl accident (i.e. t  $\leq$  1996), from 0.6  $\times 10^{-2}$  to 5.7 x 10<sup>-2</sup> with a median value of 2.5 x 10<sup>-2</sup> within the second decade after Chernobyl accident (1997 - 2006) and from  $1.03 \times 10^{-2}$  to  $1.36 \times 10^{-1}$  with a median value of 2.1 x  $10^{-2}$  within the third decade after Chernobyl accident (2007 - 2016). All TF values are in the lower bound of the range of  $10^{-2}$ -5.0 given by IAEA-TECDOC-472, (2010). These can be explained by the "old" contamination of monitoring sites since our  $137Cs$  measurements were performed many years after the initial deposit. It is important to stress here that our findings regarding the evolution of bioavailable fraction of  $^{137}Cs$  with time were based on long term monitoring data (i.e.  $\sim$  6-30 years from the Chernobyl accident) and therefore it is impossible at present time, due to absence of measurements, to predict whether the decrease in the bioavailable fraction in the very long term (i.e.  $>$ 30 years) will still continue as in the long term or a steady state can be reached. More investigations are still required.

277

### **4.4. Comparison to other findings**

278 279 280 281 282 283 284 285 Roussel-Debet et al. (2007) calculated  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}^{\text{solid}}$  based on  $^{137}$ Cs measurements collected at BLF, BUG, CAT, CHO and CRM sites through the period from 1991 to 2004. The reported T<sup>soil</sup><br>reported T<sub>eff-slow</sub>values are given in Table 3. Although measurement have been made on the same plots, comparison of these values with our values makes obvious that our median The T<sub>eff-Slow</sub> values are higher by approximately 1.6 to 2.8 times at all sites except at BLF where The Teff-Slow value is lower by 7 years. This remarkable difference may be partly explained by the low goodness of fit index repeated by Roussel-Debet et al,  $(2007)(R^2$  of 0.2, 0.3, 0.6, 0.4, 0.4 for BLF, BUG, CAT, CHO, CRM respectively).

286 287 288 289 290 291 292 293 294 295 296 297 298 299 300 301 302 303 304 305 306 307 308 309 310 Our results are then compared with the long term  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  values reported in the literature. Table 3 summarizes the values of T<sub>eff-slow</sub> reviewed in literature from 6 different studies in cow's milk, 5 in grass and 4 in soil. For a consistent comparison, all reviewed studies were carried out in pasture plots located in Western Europe where  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  values were estimated by means of  $137$ Cs data originated from both the nuclear weapons tests and the Chernobyl accident like in the previous section. For each environmental component, the distribution of the T<sub>eff-slow</sub> values averaged over the reviewed studies were calculated by Monte Carlo simulations. For comparison purpose, the averaged long term  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  values yielded by these calculations were also presented in Fig.4 (bars denoted with the letter L). Similar to our findings, the averaged  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  using data from literature were found to decrease in the order soil >> grass > milk with median values of 15.0 , 9.0 and 8.0 years respectively and with a global tendency to underestimate slightly the values derived in this study. This slight difference of about 2-3 years may be caused by several reasons. In addition to the aforementioned reason of low goodness of fit, this difference may be attributed to the difference in the length and starting time of time series used in  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  estimation. Indeed, despite the finding by Mück, (2003)that the effective slow decline rate of  $^{137}Cs$  begins only 6-7years after Chernobyl accident (1993), many studies estimated  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  values from time series observed before this date (Table 3). Moreover, some reported  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  were derived from time periods that ceases even earlier than 1993 such as the reported values by Pröhl. et al. (2006) in grass, by Fesenko et al. (1995)in milk and by Isaksson et al. (2001) in soil. Also with respect to this point, the effective half-lives given by these two latter authors of 11.7 and 13.0 years respectively seemed to be not reliable since they were estimated by fitting to experimental data measured only for short time periods of about 3 years which are much less than their reported  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  values. In contrast to this,  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  values yielded by this work were estimated by data collected over longer period of almost 25 years since about 1993.Another 311 312 313 314 315 316 317 possible reason is that the  $^{137}Cs$  content in pastures might decrease progressively with time (i.e.by multiple decline phases rather than only two, fast and slow, phases) and therefore it is reasonable to assume that the longer time series led to larger  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  values. However, this hypothesis can be rejected by our measurements that displayed only one long term decline rate of  $^{137}Cs$  as shown in Fig. 2. Additionally to the above mentioned reasons, one may argue that this difference may be related to the difference in sampling strategy between different works. However, this was found to have no or minor influence in our case.

#### 318 **5. Summary and conclusions**

319 320 321 322 323 324 325 326 327 328 329 330 331 332 333 334 335 The long term effective half-lives of radiocesium together with their associated uncertainties were estimated and analyzed by using of more than twenty five years monitoring data collected at ten of French pasture sites. Estimations were performed by a simple exponential model for describing the long-term radiocesium transfer processes in a pasture contaminated by atmospheric fallouts. On average, it was found that the median values of effective halflives of radiocesium T<sub>eff-slow</sub> were in the order of 17.0, 11.0 and 9.0 years for soil, grass and milk respectively and which were slightly greater than literature values by about 2-3 years (Fig.4). The rates of decline of radiocesium observed in milk closely correspond to those observed in grass. Based on  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  values obtained in grass and soil, the decrease rate of  $137$ Cs bioavailability in the long term was found to range between 0.008 and 0.044 year<sup>-1</sup>. We found that the soil to grass transfer factor values were concentrated in the lower bound of the range of values given by IAEA-TECDOC-472, (2010) and this was explained by the old contamination of monitoring sites. The question of whether the decrease in the bioavailable fraction in the very long term (i.e. >30 years) will still continue as in the long term or reach a steady state is still unsolved at the present and requires further investigations. Future work, in our opinion, should be devoted to testing of the reliability of model parameters linked to the fast decline phase  $P_{\text{fast}}$ ,  $k_{\text{fast}}$  and to estimate the uncertainties associated with their values using

- field data collected in the first years after the Chernobyl or Fukushima accidents to enable a
- 337 more accurate prediction of radiocesium contamination impacts.

### **Acknowledgements**

- 340 We would like to thank the Électricité de France (EdF) for funding parts of the measurements.
- We are grateful to Dr. Jean-Michel Méteivier for his assistance in producing Fig 1.Authors
- thank Dr. Marie Simon-Cornu and Dr. Gregory Mathieu for reading the manuscript prior to
- submission.

#### 345 **References**

- 346 Absalom, J.P., Young, S.D., Crout, 1995. Radio- caesium fixation dynamics: measurement in
- 347 six Cumbrian soils. Eur. J. Soil Sci. 46, 461-469. [https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2389.1995.tb01342.x)

348 [2389.1995.tb01342.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2389.1995.tb01342.x)

- 349 Absalom, J.P., Young, S.D., Crout, N.M.J., Nisbet, A.F., Woodman, R.F.M., Smolders, E., Gillett,
- 350 351 A.G., 1999. Predicting soil to plant transfer of radiocesium using soil characteristics. Environ. Sci. Technol. 33, 1218-1223.
- 352 Absalom, J.P., Young, S.D., Crout, N.M.J., Sanchez, A., Wright, S.M., Smolders, E., Nisbet, A.F.,
- 353 354 Gillett, A.G., 2001. Predicting the transfer of radiocaesium from organic soils to plants using soil characteristics. J. Environ. Radioact. 52, 31-43.
- 355 356 357 Almahayni, T., Beresford, N.A., Crout, N.M.J., Sweeck, L., 2019. Fit-for-purpose modelling of radiocaesium soil-to-plant transfer for nuclear emergencies: a review. J. Environ. Radioact. 201, 58-66. <https://doi.org/>10.1016/j.jenvrad.2019.01.006
- 358 Ashraf, M.A., Akib, S., Jamil, M., 2014. Cesium-137: radio-chemistry, fate, and transport,
- 359 remediation, and future concerns. Crit. Rev. Environ. Sci. Technol. 44, 1740-1793.
- 360 <https://doi.org/10.1080/10643389.2013.790753>
- 361 Astori, E., Bianchi, D., Cammarata, E., Gastaldo, S., Marzolla, N., Rabbia, G., Vescovi, A., Priano, L.,
- 362 1999. Surface contamination ofradiocesium measured and calculated in South Piemonte (Italy).

363 J. Environ. Radioact. 45, 29-38. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0265-931X\(98\)00071-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0265-931X(98)00071-X)

- 364 Bouisset, P., Calmet, D., 1997. Hyper pure gamma-ray spectrometry applied to low-level
- 365 environmental sample measurements, in: Proceedings of the International Workshop on the
- 366 Status of Measurement Techniques for the Identification of Nuclear Signatures.
- 367 368 Calmon, P., Mourlon, C., 2002. Equations et paramètres du logiciel ASTRAL v2. IRSN. Rapport DPRE/SERLAB/LMODE no 02-29, p. 99.
- 369 Comans., R.N.J., Middelburg., J.J., Zonderhuis., J., Woittiez., J.R.W., Lange., G.J. De, Das., H.A.,
- 370 371 Weijden., C.H. Van Der, 1989. Mobilization of radiocaesium in pore water of lake sediments. Nature 339, 367-369.
- 372 Corcho-Alvarado, J.A., Balsiger, B., Sahli, H., Astner, M., Byrde, F., Rollin, S., Holzer, R.,
- 373 Mosimann, N., Wüthrich, S., Jakob, A., Burger, M., 2016. Long-term behavior of 90Sr and
- 374 137Cs in the environment : Case studies in Switzerland. J. Environ. Radioact. 160, 54-63.
- 375 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j>.jenvrad.2016.04.027
- 376 377 Cremers., A., Elsen., A., Preter., P. De, Maes., A., 1988. Quantitative analysis of radiocaesium retention in soils. Nature 335, 247-249. <https://doi.org/10.1038/335247a0>
- 378 Duffa, C., Masson, M., Gontier, G., Claval, D., Renaud, P., 2004. Synthèse des études
- 379 radioécologiques annuelles menées dans l environement des centrales électronucléaires
- 380 francaises deupuis 1991. Radioprotection 39, 233-254.
- 381 382 383 Ehlken, S., Kirchner., G., 2002. Environmental processes affecting plant root uptake of radioactive trace elements and variability of transfer factor data: a review. J. Environ. Radioact. 58, 97-112. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0265-931X\(01\)00060-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0265-931X(01)00060-1)
- 384 385 Ehrhardt., J., Weis., A., 2000. RODSOS: Decision support for off-site nuclear emergency management in Europe. Eeuropean comission, Brussels, Report EUR 19144.
- 386 Fesenko, S. V., Alexakhin, R.M., Spiridonov, S.I., Sanzharova, N.I., 1995. Dynamics of 137Cs
- 387 concentration in agricultural products in areas of Russia contaminated as a result of the accident
- 388 at the Chernobyl nuclear power plant. Radiat. Prot. Dosimetry 60, 155-166.
- 389 <https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordjournals.rpd.a082712>
- 390 Gillham, R.W., Cherry, J.A., Lindsay, L.E., 1980. Cesium distribution coefficients in unconsolidated
- 391 392 geological materials. Health Phys. 39, 637-49. [https://doi.org/10.1097/00004032-198010000-](https://doi.org/10.1097/00004032-198010000-00006)  [00006](https://doi.org/10.1097/00004032-198010000-00006)
- 393 394 IAEA-TECDOC-472, 2010. Handbook of parameter values for the prediction of radionuclide transfer in terrestrial and freshwater. Vienna.



419 soils in mountain areas. J. Environ. Radioact. 68, 215-233.

- 420 Pourcelot, L., Steinmann, P., Froidevaux, P., 2007. Lower variability of radionuclide activities in
- 421 upland dairy products compared to soils and vegetation : Implication for environmental survey.

422 Chemosphere 66, 1571-1579. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2006.08.008>

- 423 Pröhl., G., Ehlken., S., Fiedler., I., Kirchner., G., Klemt., E., Zibold., G., 2006. Ecological half-lives of
- 424 90Sr and 137Cs in terrestrial and aquatic ecosystems. J. Environ. Radioact. 91, 41-72.
- 425 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j>.jenvrad.2006.08.004
- 426 427 Roussel-Debet, S., Renaud, P., Métivier, J., 2007. 137Cs in French soils : Deposition patterns and 15 year evolution. Sci. Total Environ. 374, 388-398. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2006.12.037>
- 428 Smith, J.T., Fesenko, S. V., Howard, B.J., Horrill, A.D., Sanzharova, N.I., Alexakhin, R.M., Elder,
- 429 D.G., Naylor, C., 1999. Temporal change in fallout 137Cs in terrestrial and aquatic systems : A
- 430 whole ecosystem approach. Environ. Sci. Technol. 33, 49-54. <https://doi.org/10.1021/es980670t>
- 431 432 Smolders, E., Van Den Brande, K., Merckx, R., 1997. Concentrations of 137Cs and K in soil solution plant availability of 137Cs in soils. Environ. Sci. Technol. 31, 3432-3438.
- 433 <https://doi.org/10.1021/es970113r>
- 434 Strebl, F., Ringer, W., Gerzabek, M.H., 2002. Radiocaesium contamination of meadow vegetation -
- 435 Time-dependent variability and influence ofsoil characteristics at grassland sites in Austria. J.

436 Environ. Radioact. 58, 143-161. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0265-931X\(01\)00063-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0265-931X(01)00063-7)

- 437 UNSCEAR, 2000. Sources and effects of ionizing radiation. New York.
- 438

## 1 **Table 1:** Main characteristics of the investigated sites



<b>Site</b>	Clay $(\% )$	Silt $(\% )$	Sand $(\% )$	Organic matter (%)
Beaune-Le-Froid	27.0	41.5	31.5	9.4
<b>Bugey</b>	18.0	23.2	58.5	5.2
Cattenom	39.2	46.3	14.5	6.4
Chooz	16.9	44.1	39.0	5.5
Creys-Malville	15.1	31.5	53.4	4.4
Cruas	10.6	37.7	52.1	2.3
Fessenheim	16.2	35.2	48.6	4.5
Mercantour	33.4	35.8	30.8	$30 - 68$
Nogent	35.0	38.2	26.8	8.1
Tricastin <sup>®</sup>				

3 Table 2: Soil granulometry and organic matter content in the different investigated sites

\*: No data was available for Tricastin site

Component	T <sub>eff-slow</sub> [years]	<b>Observation period</b>	Study area	<b>Source</b>
Milk				
	5.6	1994-1998	Austria	Mück, 2003
	$2.4 - 38.6^a$	1994-2013	Switzerland	Corcho-Alvarado et al., 2016
	$2.6 - 11.7$ <sup>a</sup>	1990-1992	Russia	Fesenko et al., 1995
	$7.1 - 9.1$ <sup>a</sup>	1993-2007	Austria	Lettner et al., 2009
	$4.0 - 6.7a, b$	1990-2003	Finland	Kostiainen, 2005
	$4.4^{\rm b}$	1989-1999	Germany	Pröhl. et al., 2006
	$(9.9)^{d}$	$(1992 - 2017)$	France	(This study)
<b>Grass</b>				
	$5.6 - 25.1$ <sup>a</sup>	1994-2013	Switzerland	Corcho-Alvarado et al., 2016
	$4.1 - 10.0^{a, b}$	1989-1999	Russia	IAEA, 2009
	4.1 - $6.0^{a, b}$	1990-1997	Sweden	Andersson et al., 2001
	$0.8 - 5.7a, b$	1988-1991	Poland	Pröhl. et al., 2006
	6.4	1992-1999	Austria	Strebl et al., 2002
	$(12.5)^d$	$(1993 - 2016)$	France	(This study)
<b>Soil</b>				
	$17.8 - 28.2$ <sup>a</sup>	1994-2013	Switzerland	Corcho-Alvarado et al., 2016
	8.0-10.0	1988-1998	Sweden	Isaksson et al., 2001
	19.4	1990-1997	Sweden	Andersson et al., 2001
	13.0	1989-1990	Italy	Astori et al., 1999
	$28.8^{\circ}$ (21.5)	1991-2004 (1993-2016)	<b>BLF</b>	
	$7.7^{\circ}$ (21.5)	1992-2004 (1995-2016)	<b>BUG</b>	Roussel-Debet et al., 2007
	$6.7^{\circ}$ (14.2)	1991-2004 (2005-2016)	<b>CAT</b>	
	$5.1^{\circ}$ (13.1)	1992-2004 (1992-2016)	<b>CHO</b>	
	$7.3^{\circ}(12.0)$	1992-1999 (1995-2016)	CRM	
	$(18.7)^d$	$(1992 - 2016)$	France	(This study)

**137 Table 3**: Reported long term  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  values in literature for  $^{137}Cs$  in milk, grass and soil of pastures pastures

7 (<sup>a</sup>)These values have been averaged over several monitoring plots, locations, soil types or soil textures thus they

8 may differ from those found directly in the cited papers. The two given numbers are the ninety-five percent

- 9 confidence limits for the average of reported values along with their associated uncertainties in the cited paper.
- 10 Calculations were established based on10 $^6$  Monte-Carlo simulations and a Gaussian probability distribution.
- 11 (b) When the cited paper indicated that the action of the physical decay of cesium (T<sub>r</sub>=30.2 years) was not
- 12 included in the calculations of their reported values ( $T_{ecological-slow}$ ), the corresponding  $T_{eff-slow}$  values were then

13 derived as follows:  $1/T_{\text{eff-slow}}=1/T_{\text{ecological-slow}}+1/T_{\text{r}}$ 

- 14 15 16 ( $^{\circ}$ )The data reported by Roussel-Debet et al. (2007) in soils of the same sites investigated by this work were not included in calculation of the averaged  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  values of literature (i.e. those presented in Fig. 4). For comparison purpose, the median of the corresponding  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  values with their observation periods obtained by
- 
- 17 this study were given in brackets
- 18 ( $d$ ) For a comparison purpose, the median of the distributions of T<sub>eff-slow</sub> values averaged over all investigated
- 19 sites are also given in the above table.

#### 1 **Figure captions**

2 3 4 5 **Fig.** 1: Location of the selected sites with indication of the environmental component targeted by long term monitoring (i.e. root soil/grass/cow's milk). The sites are denoted as follows: CHO: Chooz; CAT: Cattenom; NOG: Nogent; FES: Fessenheim; BUG: Bugey; CRM: Creys-Malville; BLF: Beaune-le-Froid; MER: Mercantour; CRU: Cruas ; TRI:Tricastin.

6 7 8 9 10 11 12 Fig. 2: Time series of  $137$ Cs activity concentrations in soil grass and milk at three sites a) Beaune- Le-Froid (BLF), b) Chooz (CHO) and c) Crey-Malville (CRM).  $^{137}$ Cs activity concentrations in milk are given in  $Bq.L^{-1}$  whereas  $137Cs$  activity concentrations in grass and soil are given in Bq.  $kg^{-1}_{dm}$ . Lines represent the result of the linear regression analysis of the data assuming a simple exponential decline. Long term effective half-life quoted refers to the median values of these parameters (i.e. 50% confidence intervals). The error bars indicate one standard deviation.

13 14 15 16 17 Fig. 3: Estimated long term effective half-lives  $(T_{\text{eff-slow}})$  of  $^{137}Cs$  in a) milk, b) grass and c) soil over the studied sites. Median values of  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  as well as the 5 and 95 percentiles are given to right of bars. The *n* value corresponds to the number of observation whereas  $R^2$  value is the goodness of fit of a simple exponential equation to the data accompanied with p-values in brackets.

18 19 20 **Fig.** 4: Comparison between the distributions of averaged  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  values obtained from the literature (denoted with the letter L) against those estimated in France (denoted with the letter F). Median values of  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  as well as the 5 and 95 percentiles are given in numbers.

21







28 Fig. <sup>1</sup>

29











 $\circ$ 

**CHO** 

EES

**NOG** 











- 
- 
- 

# **Appendix**

# **Long term decrease of 137Cs bioavailability in French pastures: results from 25 years of monitoring**

Khaled Brimo, Marc André Gonze, Laurent Pourcelot

Content: Six pages, one table, one figure

	p value <sup>'</sup>					
<b>Site</b>	mgrass rgrass eff-slow-VS. Teff-slow	mgrass eff-slow .vs. Teff-slow	$T_{\text{eff-slow}}^{\text{milk}}$ vs. $T_{\text{eff-slow}}^{\text{soil}}$			
<b>BLF</b>	0.1899	0.0016	0.0015			
<b>BUG</b>	nd	nd	nd			
<b>CAT</b>	nd	nd	nd			
<b>CHO</b>	0.3368	0.9487	0.0943			
<b>CRM</b>	0.8615	0.0146	0.03			
<b>CRU</b>	nd	nd	0.043			
<b>FES</b>	nd	nd	nd			
<b>MER</b>	nd	nd	nd			
<b>NOG</b>	nd	0.584	nd			
<b>TRI</b>	nd	nd	nd			

**Table A.1**: The*p* values yielded by one-way ANOVA for testing at each site the variances between the distributions of  $T_{\text{eff-slow}}$  values in milk, grass and soil

(\*) bold value indicates to a significant difference *(p*<0.05)

nd: not determined because of insufficient data











Fig. A.1: Series of <sup>137</sup>Cs activity concentrations in soil grass and milk at three sites a) Bugey (BUG), b) Cattenom (CAT), c) Cruas (CRU), d) Fessenheim (FES), e) Mercantour (MER), f) Nogent (NOG) and g) Tricastin (TRI).  $^{137}Cs$  activity concentrations in milk are given in Bq.L<sup>-</sup> <sup>1</sup> whereas <sup>137</sup>Cs activity concentrations in grass and soil are given in Bq. kg $_{\text{dm}}^{-1}$  . Lines represent the result of the linear regression analysis of the data assuming a simple exponential decline. Long term effective half-life quoted refers to the median values of these parameters (i.e 50% confidence intervals). The error bars indicate one standard deviation.