

# **Genomic resources and their influence on the detection of the signal of positive selection in genome scans**

S. Manel, Charles Perrier, Marine Pratlong, Laurent Abi-Rached, Julien

Paganini, Pierre Pontarotti, D. Aurelle

# **To cite this version:**

S. Manel, Charles Perrier, Marine Pratlong, Laurent Abi-Rached, Julien Paganini, et al.. Genomic resources and their influence on the detection of the signal of positive selection in genome scans. Molecular Ecology, 2016, 25 (1), pp.170-184. 10.1111/mec.13468 hal-02336047

# **HAL Id: hal-02336047 <https://hal.science/hal-02336047v1>**

Submitted on 28 Oct 2019

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

**Molecular Ecology**

# MOLECULAR ECOLOGY

# **Genomic resources and their influence on the detection of the signal of positive selection in genome scans**





# **Page 1 of 42 Molecular Ecology**



#### **Abstract**

railable, allowing better processing of short-read data<br>
riants, and improving haplotype reconstruction and<br>
riants, and improving haplotype reconstruction and<br>
since as are also becoming the raw material for selection in<br> Genome scans represent powerful approaches to investigate the action of natural selection on the genetic variation of natural populations and to better understand local adaptation. This is very useful for example in the field of conservation biology and evolutionary biology. Thanks to Next Generation Sequencing, genomic resources are growing exponentially, improving genome scan analyses in non-model species. Thousands of SNPs called using Reduced Representation Sequencing are increasingly used in genome scans. Besides, genomes are also becoming more available, allowing better processing of short-read data, offering physical localisation of variants, and improving haplotype reconstruction and data imputation. Ultimately, genomes are also becoming the raw material for selection inferences. Here, we discuss how the increasing availability of such genomic resources, notably genomes, influences the detection of signals of selection. Mainly, increasing data density and having the information of physical linkage data expand genome scans by i) improving the overall quality of the data; ii) helping the reconstruction of demographic history for the population studied to decrease false positive rates; iii) improving the statistical power of methods to detect the signal of selection. Of particular importance, the availability of a high quality reference genome can improve the detection of the signal of selection by i) allowing matching the potential candidate loci to linked coding regions under selection, ii) rapidly moving the investigation to the gene and function, and iii) ensuring that the highly variable regions in coding regions of the genomes are also investigated. For all those reasons, using reference genomes in analyses of genome scans is highly recommended.

#### **Introduction**

ariability across whole genomes or across a large numb<br>als living in distinct environments (Pritchard 2010). Th<br>identify signals of selection at the genome level in natu<br>natural selection affects genetic variation in respo Species live in a wide variety of heterogeneous and changing environments, where the environment designs large range of abiotic factors (e.g. temperature, oxygen) and biotic factors (pathogens, symbionts, sexual partners) potentially causing selection. Understanding how these environmental factors lead to genetic adaptation is a longstanding question in evolutionary biology (Kawecki & Ebert 2004). With the rapidly increasing availability of large genomic resources, this topical question can now be addressed by genome scans, i.e. the survey of genetic variability across whole genomes or across a large number of loci in a large number of individuals living in distinct environments (Pritchard 2010). The main objective of genome scans is to identify signals of selection at the genome level in natural populations and thus uncover how natural selection affects genetic variation in response to environmental heterogeneity and changes (Mitchell-Olds *et al.* 2007; Nosil *et al.* 2009; Schluter & Conte 2009).

The identification of these signatures of natural selection in genome scans has become an area of intense research, stimulated by the increasing ease with which a high number of genetic markers can be discovered and characterized in non-model species thanks to Next Generation Sequencing (NGS) (Davey *et al.* 2011). Loci identified as targets of natural selection are likely adaptively and / or functionally important (Vitti *et al.* 2013), and hence candidates for 69 involvement in **local adaptation**<sup>1</sup>, disease susceptibility, resistance to pathogens, and other traits of interest to plant and animal breeders. Here, we illustrate our discussion mainly in the field of conservation and evolutionary biology (Allendorf *et al.* 2010; Segelbacher *et al.* 2010). We focus on studies based on the analysis of the spatial sampling of geo-referenced individuals or populations in sites characterized by different environmental conditions. In

 $\overline{a}$ 

Words in bold are defined in the glossary

some cases, the measure of the geo-referenced environmental variable is also available. Those studies aims to better understand local adaptation.

113; Hemmer-Hansen *et al.* 2014; Russello *et al.* 20<br>
13) looked for genomic islands of adaptive divergence (<br>
aptation) to refine the delineation of management un<br>
ey applied an outlier based detection approach (i.e. B<sub></sub> One application of genomes scans in conservation biology is the improvement of the definition of **management units** through integrating adaptive genetic variability (Funk *et al.* 2012). This is particularly important in the case of cryptic genetic lineages which are identified only when using a sufficient number of markers (e.g. Bourret *et al.* 2013; Bradbury *et al.* 2013; Hemmer-Hansen *et al.* 2014; Russello *et al.* 2012). For instance, Bradbury et al. (2013) looked for genomic islands of adaptive divergence (ie. genomic regions associated with adaptation) to refine the delineation of management units in Atlantic cod *Gadus morhua*. They applied an outlier based detection approach (i.e. BAYESCAN, Foll & Gaggiotti (2008)) to 1536 SNPs genotyped for 466 individuals. They detected elevated divergence in 5.2% of SNPs consistent with divergent selection. Those outliers revealed a fine scale geographic differentiation both in the eastern and the western Atlantic, which enhanced individual assignment to the region of origin in comparison to neutral markers. More generally neutral markers **hitchhiking** with selected loci can provide information not only on **positive selection** but also on restrictions to gene flow, which can be used as a tool to identify management units (Gagnaire *et al.* 2015). Another important application of genome scans in conservation biology is the study of species ability to adapt in response to climate change (Pauls *et al.* 2013). The identification of current adaptive polymorphisms can help to identify and maintain adaptive genetic potential. For example Dixon et al. (2015) have identified genomic regions potentially involved in the response to selection for thermal tolerance in the coral *Acropora millepora.* This gives some clues on the possibility of adaptive evolution in future environments, which is essential for conservation (Allendorf *et al.* 2010). Then, detecting climatic variables and polymorphisms potentially involved in local adaptation can improve models of future species dynamics under climate change (Manel *et al.* 2012).

#### **Page 5 of 42 Molecular Ecology**

- Gaining information on the genetic basis of adaptation to different environments could also be
- used to improve assisted evolution of natural populations (van Oppen *et al.* 2015).
- 

EXTRIS of unknown genomic position are now widely<br>recent development of various protocols of **Reduce**<br>ted by the decreasing cost of high throughput sequen<br>2011). Alternatively, the recent increase of availabilit<br>recise op Here, we focus on genomic data and discuss only the use of NGS–derived markers. **Single Nucleotide Polymorphism** (SNP) data are the marker of choice to conduct genome scans. The physical position of these SNPs on the genome can be known or not, with different degree of precision. SNPs of unknown genomic position are now widely used in non-model species since the recent development of various protocols of **Reduced Representation Sequencing** promoted by the decreasing cost of high throughput sequencing (Davey *et al.* 2013; Davey *et al.* 2011). Alternatively, the recent increase of availability of genomes for a wide variety of species opens the perspective to locate SNPs on the genome using reference genomes (Box 1). The main benefit of moving from thousands of anonymous unpositioned markers with no reference genome to the case of having a reference genome (or long –read sequences), independently of its quality, is to be able to locate and order markers (SNPs) along the genome (Bragg *et al.* 2015) (Figure 1). This is important since in most cases, candidate SNPs identified through genome scans are not the direct target of selection but are rather physically linked to these targets. Then, the knowledge of the **physical linkage** allows the identification of genomic regions, and not only SNPs, with exceptionally high population differentiation (Tine *et al.* 2014). It also allows to explore the number and physical extent of such regions (Nosil *et al.* 2009; Roesti *et al.* 2012a), to derive robust demographic data (Huber *et al.* 2014) and to investigate subtle fine spatial structure (Leslie *et al.* 2015) that are necessary for the inference of selection.

In this review, we discuss the benefits of using additional genomic resources such as reference genomes on the ability of genome scans to detect selection in conservation and evolutionary

#### **Molecular Ecology Page 6 of 42**

biology (Figure 1). We will first discuss which inferences can be made without reference genomes which is still the rule for most species (Gagnaire *et al.* 2012), and then the perspectives that are open by the availability of a reference genome or other genomic resources (Box 1). We then discuss the main challenges remaining even when reference genome is available. First, when genome scans rely on reference genomes, only high quality assembly makes it possible to study the highly variable regions of the genomes in coding regions (Box 2). Second, genome scans only represent a screening tool to reveal potential differences among environments in the functions and histories of the candidate genes identified in these analyses. We therefore discuss more extended validations of the adaptive function of the candidate loci (Pavey *et al.* 2012).

**Genomic data used in genome scans** 

We describe here the diversity of genomic data used to conduct a genome scans in function of the availability of one or several related genomes.

environments in the functions and histories of th<br>analyses. We therefore discuss more extended validatie<br>lidate loci (Pavey *et al.* 2012).<br>**d in genome scans**<br>ne diversity of genomic data used to conduct a genome :<br>ne or On the one hand, Reduced Representation Sequencin**g (RRS)** techniques are based on the use of restriction enzyme digestion to reduce the complexity of the genome and can be performed without prior genomic resources like a reference genome, a transcriptome, or a SNP chi p. RRS allow the sequencing of a high number of short genomic regions in different individuals. They notably include Reduced Representation Libraries (RRL), Genotyping By Sequencing (GBS) and restriction-site-associated DNA sequencing (RADseq) (Box 3) and other (RAD, ddRAD, EzRAD, 2B-RAD, nextRAD **)** (Davey *et al.* 2011 ; Peterson *et al.* 2012). Such methods have been increasingly used to produce tremendous amounts of short-reads data to ultimately genotype a high number of SNPs randomly located in the genome of fairly large numbers of individuals. Note that the number of individuals can be increased by multiplexing (at the detriment of individual coverage or the number of sites targeted) or via sequencing pools of individuals (Combosch & Vollmer 2015). Similarly to RADseq, short-

#### **Page 7 of 42 Molecular Ecology**

reads sequencing of RNA, RNAseq is also increasingly used to screen polymorphism in DNA coding regions (Piskol *et al*. 2013). Such methods also have huge potential for searching signals of local adaptation since they target cDNA and give at once both DNA polymorphism data and differential expression levels (De Wit & Palumbi 2013). However, the use of transcriptome data can be limited by allele specific expression. Paralogous loci can also induce difficulties in the analysis of transcriptome sequences by creating spurious polymorphic position (Gayral *et al.* 2013). Dedicated approaches are required to limit this biases such as a search of orthologous genes ( Li *et al.* 2003 ; Pratlong *et al.* 2015) which can be complemented by the filtering method of SNPs proposed by Gayral *et al.* (2013).

Fraction of orthologous genes (Li *et al.* 2003; Pratlong *et a*<br>y the filtering method of SNPs proposed by Gayral *et a.*<br>For Review Only and the availability of reference genomes opens die<br>powerful individual data to be On the other hand, the availability of reference genomes opens different possibilities for generating more powerful individual data to be used in genome scans. First, it is possible to use reference genomes to improve RRS data. The alignment of short-reads produced by RRS methods on a reference genome can notably improve the overall quality of the SNP calling since erroneous reads would be pruned out during the alignment. Physically indexing loci also benefits to data filtering, allowing computing linkage disequilibrium (LD) among physically close loci. Loci in high LD can then be filtered out to allow the use of the dataset in software requiring unlinked loci. Instead of pruning linked loci, the LD data obtained can also be used as a complementary input to limit biases associated with the used of linked loci. Physically locating loci also increases the strength of the datasets since it allows applying a wide variety of selection detection tools, taking advantage of both allele frequencies and loci 171 physical positions (eg  $F_{ST}$  sliding windows). Lastly, the distance and LD among loci can also be used during the statistical reconstruction of **haplotypes** (Browning & Browning 2011; Stephens & Scheet 2005).

#### **Molecular Ecology Page 8 of 42**

Moreover, as discussed by Buerkle et al. (2011), analyses of multi-allelic DNA sequences (as haplotypes) rather than bi-allelic markers should help to solve the "n=1 constraint" related to the use of SNP. Besides, haplotypes can be used to improve the imputation of missing data (Browning & Browning 2007). Indeed, if some alleles are inherited more frequently together (haplotypes), and that this information is known, it is crucial to impute data considering these associations rather than only the population frequencies of the alleles being imputed. However, haplotype phasing will be increasingly difficult with increasing recombination rate and decreasing SNP density, which would be an important limitation in studies implementing RRS using relatively rare cutters and single-end short sequencing since sequenced SNP may often fall too far apart.

asing recombination rate and decreasing SNP density,<br>1 in studies implementing RRS using relatively rare cut<br>note sequenced SNP may often fall too far apart.<br>quences are also increasingly considered as raw materia<br>g the nu Genome sequences are also increasingly considered as raw material for genome scans, allowing increasing the number of SNPs detected, to construct haplotypes and at larger divergence scale to perform comparative genomics. Indeed, De novo sequencing can be used to generate a high number of SNPs for multiple individuals. While sequencing parts of the genome using RRS (described above) can bring informative results on adaptive diversity, the number of loci identified through these approaches is also much lower than with genome sequencing (up to tens of thousands compared to millions of SNPs respectively; Rellstab *et al.* 2015). **De novo assembled genome** by deep-sequencing (Chaisson *et al.* 2015a) is one of the most informative approaches for selection detection. However, such data cannot be derived yet for a high number of individuals in conservation projects because it is still too expensive. Nevertheless, a two-step strategy can be used with first de novo assembly of a reference genome by deep-sequencing one individual and followed by the resequencing of additional individuals at lower coverage (Soria-Carrasco *et al.* 2014). In their study of speciation and adaptation to different host plants in the stick insect *Timema cristinae*, Soria-Carrasco *et al.* (2014) first sequenced the genome on the basis of libraries of lengths varying from 170 to

#### **Page 9 of 42 Molecular Ecology**

across the 160 wild-caught *T. cristinae*. However, the for conservation projects needing numerous individual oaches can be increased by the number of locations alls sampled per location (Lotterhos & Whitlock 2015 duce seq 5000 bp. The total genome size was estimated around 1.3 Gb and the assembled genome was estimated to cover around 80% of the genome. Then, Soria-Carrasco *et al*. (2014) re-sequenced at lower coverage the genomes of 160 individuals on eight lanes of Illumina Hi-Seq 2000. The reads were mapped to the reference genome. They thus obtained more than  $12.10^6$  SNPs with a mean coverage of 5 per SNP and per individual. Such sequencing of several individuals then allowed to produce 4,391,556 SNPs that mapped to one of the 13 linkage group and were used in phylogenetic analysis and to characterize the distribution of genomic variation across the 160 wild-caught *T. cristinae*. However, this approach is still relatively expensive for conservation projects needing numerous individuals. As the power of genome scan approaches can be increased by the number of locations sampled and the number of individuals sampled per location (Lotterhos & Whitlock 2015), other approaches can be useful to reduce sequencing costs. Whole genome sequencing of pooled individuals is a promising and cost effective alternative to individual sequencing (Schloetterer *et al.* 2014). The cost effectiveness of pooled genome sequencing (Pool-Seq) comes from the cost of the preparation of libraries and on the sequencing of more individuals which can increase the estimates of allele frequencies (Schloetterer *et al.* 2014). In their analysis of the pros and cons of Pool-Seq, Schlöterrer *et al.* (2014), indicate their interest to study genetic differentiation, heterozygosity, or selective sweep (Boitard *et al.* 2012). For instance, Turner *et al*. (2010) have sequenced *Arabidopsis lyrata* from four populations (two from serpentine soils and two from granitic soils), with 25 individuals pooled per population, with a 39-fold genome 219 coverage. On the basis of allele frequency differences and  $F_{ST}$ , they identified candidate SNPs for the adaptation to soil types. However, Pool-Seq can be limiting for example if one is interested in linkage disequilibrium (Schloetterer *et al.* 2014).

#### **Molecular Ecology Page 10 of 42**

Finally, only high quality genomes will allow studying of highly variable regions located in coding regions (Chaisson *et al.* 2015a) (Box 2). In humans, such plastic regions of the genome are known to contain important immune gene families such as the *Major Histocompatibility Complex* (*MHC*) *class I* and *class II* genes and the *Killer-cell Ig-like Receptor* (*KIR*) genes that are both critical for the resistance to pathogens and hence for the adaptation to different environments (Sommer 2005; Vilches & Parham 2002). In summary, the above data can be directly used as raw material in the statistical analysis of genomes scans: SNPs (from a small to a high number) or haplotypes.

#### **Detecting the signal of selection without and with a reference genome**

For *P* and to a high number) or haplotypes.<br> **For All of selection without and with a reference genome**<br> **Example 10** of **selection without and with a reference genome**<br> **Example 10** onto an analyses. We introduce briefly Here we discuss how additional genomic resources improve the inferences of the signal of selection in genome scan analyses. We introduce briefly the main principle of the statistical methods, but we do not enter into the details of the available methods and software since multiple reviews have already been published on the subject (Manel *et al.* 2010; Rellstab *et al.* 2015; Schoville *et al.* 2012).

Without any reference genome, SNPs sampled in multiple populations are analyzed as independent variables with methods derived from the test of neutrality of Lewontin and Krakauer (1973) and looking for outlier loci (i.e. loci with higher or lower levels of 241 divergence than expected under neutrality). Loci with high values of  $F_{ST}$ , a measure of genetic differentiation among sampled populations, correspond to loci potentially under divergent 243 local selection while loci with low  $F_{ST}$  values correspond to loci under balancing selection (Beaumont & Balding 2004).

When environmental variables are available, it is possible to use genetic environment associations (GEA tests, Hedrick *et al.* 1976; Lotterhos & Whitlock 2015) either in a second

#### **Page 11 of 42 Molecular Ecology**

round after outlier detection methods or directly for detecting outlier loci. The first application of GEA in the context of genome scan tests the correlation between allele frequencies and environmental variables (Joost *et al.* 2007 ; Schoville *et al.* 2012); then other regression based approaches have been used (Rellstab *et al.* 2015).

d as assumed to have uniform effects across the entire provide positive outliers (Schoville *et al.* 2012). Populati-<br>quencies and increases the number of false positives ge<br>**sweeps** (Excoffier *et al.* 2009). Demographic However the signature of adaptive processes are not always distinguishable from the neutral genomic background as assumed to have uniform effects across the entire genome, generating a high number of false positive outliers (Schoville *et al.* 2012). Population structure causes correlated allele frequencies and increases the number of false positives generated by genome scans for **selective sweeps** (Excoffier *et al.* 2009). Demographic history can create patterns resembling selection, as in cases of severe bottlenecks, allele surfing during population expansion, secondary contact, and isolation by distance (Novembre & Di Rienzo 2009). Genetic incompatibilities or background selection on gene-coding regions can also confound the signal of selection (Bierne *et al.* 2013). Although, refinements have been introduced to 261 account for those confounding effects (Lotterhos & Whitlock 2015), false positives remain.

Without additional genomic resources, those analyses produce a list of loci that are potentially under selection or linked to alleles under selection, and when available the relevant environmental variables acting as pressures of selection. They generally detect single loci with important effects on adaptation. However some questions may remain, the most evident caveats being that the loci identified as potential targets of selection are usually only statistically linked with close targets of adaptive significance.

#### **Molecular Ecology Page 12 of 42**

We describe below how the reference genome may improve the power of genome scans and help to decrease the number of false positives either through the use of reference genomes to improve previous analysis, or in a direct analysis of raw data.

Extraistics along the genome since additional inferdient<br>genetic diversity on chromosomal regions become posidency.<br>The wide markers (Figure 1). In practice, a sliding wind the statistic mented to average locally those sta Mapping SNPs (e.g. identified through RRS loci) to reference genomes can give insights into the potential genes involved in adaptation (see next section) and on the distribution of population genetic statistics along the genome since additional inferences as genetic differentiation and genetic diversity on chromosomal regions become possible with a dense, ordered set of genome-wide markers (Figure 1). In practice, a sliding window sweeps across the genome, to look for regions showing significant deviation of the statistics inferred. Sliding windows are implemented to average locally those statistics and to compare them toward a random set of windows that can be taken from a larger genomic region (eg. the considered chromosome or the whole genome). This sliding-based windows method reinforces the statistical power of the detection of selection since it can highlight regions that may potentially not be spotted using non genomic outlier SNP approaches. It also allows inferring the physical extent of the signal of selection. The size of the window on which the average is calculated and the size of the step are usually defined around 150kb and 50kb, respectively, the step-size being equal or smaller than the windows-size. These windows and step sizes are crucial parameters that can largely influence the detection power of such analyses and should be defined according to the SNP density and sampling variance (Hohenlohe *et al.* 2010). It should be noted that SNP densities obtained in RRS using rare cutters would probably be too small to allow applying with robustness sliding windows along the entire genome.

292 Comparing the classical local averaged  $F_{ST}$  among populations to windows-based  $F_{ST}$  would reveal the presence of putative targets of positive selection. For example, this strategy has 294 been used to study the variation of  $F_{ST}$  in different lineages of the European sea bass

#### **Page 13 of 42 Molecular Ecology**

*Dicentrarchus labrax* using a window size of 150 kb (Tine *et al.* 2014) (Box 4). This technique can also be used on whole genome resequencing data, as illustrated in Kardos *et al.* (2015) in which they implemented windows of 100 kb, with step size of 50 kb, and found elevated FST in regions spanning growth hormone receptor gene. To go even further, Roesti *et al.* (Roesti *et al.* 2012b) suggested correcting SNP  $F_{ST}$  by local recombination rates. In fact, they showed patterns of within-chromosome large-scale variations in recombination and 301 hitchhiking and thus in  $F_{ST}$  that were probably largely influenced by chromosomes structure. They propose to correct for this potential bias by applying sliding window tests on corrected  $F_{ST}$  rather than raw  $F_{ST}$ , to avoid potential false positive and false negative outliers. Another way of considering this potential bias is to estimate locally averaged recombination rate, nucleotide diversity, and genetic differentiation and to interpret these indices in an integrated manner as illustrated in the European sea bass *Dicentrarchus labrax* (Tine *et al.* 2014).

F<sub>ST</sub>, to avoid potential bias by applying sliding windov<br>F<sub>ST</sub>, to avoid potential false positive and false negative<br>*I*, and genetic differentiation and to interpret these indiced in the European sea bass *Dicentrarchus* The information of physical linkage among SNPs also opens the possibility to detect reduced genetic diversity in the neighborhood of a selected (directional selection) site along a chromosome, which can be the consequence of **selective sweep** (Nielsen 2005). The extent of the area displaying reduced diversity will depend on the intensity of selection, on recombination rate, on the breeding system and on the age of the selective event. The elimination of slightly deleterious mutations (background selection) can be difficult to separate from selective sweeps (Nielsen, 2005). Specific statistical methods have been developed to detect selective sweeps at the population level (Nielsen 2005; Sabeti *et al.* 2006). They differ in the type of the genomic signature of selection detected (Oleksyk *et al.* 2010): local reduction in genetic variation at the proximity of the loci under selection (Oleksyk *et al.* 2008), changes in the shape of the frequency distribution of genetic variation, i.e. **site frequency spectrum** (Tajima 1989), extended linkage disequilibrium segments (Sabeti *et al.* 2002; Vatsiou *et al.* 2015), or elevated admixture contribution from one

#### **Molecular Ecology Page 14 of 42**

population (Tang *et al.* 2007). Suh methods relay on the analysis of haplotype. They open perspectives to capture the signal of selection left by both hard and soft sweep. If adaptation has been shaped by new mutations rapidly driven to high frequency in a new environment, those alleles will be detected on haplotypes with low genetic diversity and not observed in ancestral populations or environment (Stapley *et al.* 2010) . In this current issue, Vatsiou *et al* (2015) compared seven methods that either focus on patterns of long range haplotype homozygosity (Sabeti *et al.* 2002) or on the effect of linkage on multilocus genetic 327 differentiation (Chen & Slatkin 2013). Those methods open perspectives to capture the signal of selection left by both hard and soft sweep.

Example 18 Slatkin 2013). Those methods open perspectives to<br>both hard and soft sweep.<br>both hard and soft sweep.<br>dots using physically indexed SNPs, haplotype or seque<br>dots using physically indexed SNPs, haplotype or seque As previously mentioned above, neutral processes can confound the signal of selection. Sophisticated methods using physically indexed SNPs, haplotype or sequence data have been recently developed to improve the inference of demographic processes by helping to reconstruct an accurate demographic history, potentially implicating heterogeneous gene flow along the genome, for the population studied and hence decrease confounding effects (Excoffier *et al.* 2013; Gutenkunst *et al.* 2009; Liu & Fu 2015).

Lastly, the fact that adaptation may rely on polygenic traits with small changes in allele frequencies has been discussed (de Villemereuil *et al.* 2014). One interesting development here is to test outliers not on a single marker basis but on set of genes linked in biological pathways (Daub *et al.* 2013). This is possible only for species with good genomic knowledge, as it requires to assign SNPs to genes on the basis of their physical location and to use functional relationships between genes.

#### **From prioritization of candidate loci to validation**

#### **Page 15 of 42 Molecular Ecology**

*R*(2010) studied the adaptation of human to high altitutive with the strongest signal of selection was a transcription a. In this case, the consistence between the function and dy provided a strong support for this candi Genome scans characterize loci potentially involved in the adaptation to particular environments but because these methods can generate false positives, a prioritization of candidate loci help to focus on the most reliable candidates. Mapping loci on a reference genome can allow the identification of coding candidates or to loci in physically proximity to coding regions (in this case, a transcriptome can be enough to identify expressed loci). If these genes are annotated in the studied species or a closely related one, it can highlight candidate genes functionally consistent with the studied selective context. For example, using exome sequencing, Yi *et al* (2010) studied the adaptation of human to high altitudes and found that the candidate gene with the strongest signal of selection was a transcription factor involved in response to hypoxia. In this case, the consistence between the function and the environmental context of the study provided a strong support for this candidate. For the non-model organisms for which the reference genome sequence lacks functional annotations, Gene Ontology (GO) could be a useful tool to find pertinent functions in the studied context among the candidate genes (Gu *et al.* 2009). The identification of loci repeatedly involved in the same biological or ecological function in different taxonomic groups exposed to comparable pressures can also be a good argument for the choice of candidate loci (Pratlong *et al.* 2015). For example, Fischer *et al.* (2013) studied the local adaptation of *Arabidopsis halleri* to local climatic conditions by the use of SNPs obtained from Pool Seq. First they detected outlier SNPs on the basis of  $F_{ST}$  and differentiation tests. Then they tested the association between these outliers and environmental conditions while controlling for population structure. A GO enrichment was applied to the outlier loci as well and led to the discovery of the implication of functions linked with the response to biotic factors (such as "defence response to bacterium"). Conversely they considered genes with GO potentially involved in the adaptation to climate conditions: among these candidate genes, four were indeed associated with the corresponding environmental factor. This study then underlines how multiple approaches can help identify the factors involved in local adaptation.

enge is to document how functional polymorphisms and phenotypes, including quantitative traits values, wh<br>ces (Storz & Wheat 2010). In such investigations, the s<br>tures of natural selection, as well as all the steps be<br>the Finally, to improve our understanding of the genomic architecture of adaptation (and speciation) and the nature of the genes involved in these processes, genome scans can be combined with QTL mapping, genome wide association studies (GWAS) and/or sequence and functional analysis (Gagnaire *et al.* 2013; Strasburg *et al.* 2012). In cases of divergent selection, the challenge is to document how functional polymorphisms at individual genes translate into different phenotypes, including quantitative traits values, which in turn translate into fitness differences (Storz & Wheat 2010). In such investigations, the statistical tests used to detect the signatures of natural selection, as well as all the steps before the functional validation, provide the basis for functional inferences: association studies for example link polymorphism at one locus to a phenotypic difference, as was done for the shell color polymorphism in the snail *Cepaea nemoralis* (Richards *et al.* 2013). An important argument to confirm the adaptive function of a particular allele is the design of appropriate experiments to study the resulting effects on protein function or protein expression (Storz & Wheat 2010). This can be done through functional genetic approaches: in the Darwin finches for example, a genomic region with high differentiation levels corresponded to genes previously identified as involved in beak morphology (Lamichhaney *et al.* 2015). For polygenic traits, QTL approaches or GWAS are useful. RAD sequencing was also used to identify QTL associated with ecologically important traits and to gene expression differences in the lake whitefish (*Coregonus clupeaformis*) (Gagnaire *et al.* 2013). The opportunity of whole genome sequencing allows nowadays to move toward GWAS, mostly in the identification of sequence variants associated with risks of complex traits in human genetics, where genomes are available at population scales (Hawley *et al.* 2014). In this field, GWAS was used in the identification of loci linked with the specialized diet of greenlandic Inuit, and associated with

#### **Page 17 of 42 Molecular Ecology**

metabolic and anthropometric phenotypes (Fumagalli *et al.* 2015). Nevertheless, the last and probably the most difficult step will be to link phenotypic or genetic differences with fitness differences. Here the analysis of the fitness of all possible point mutants in different controlled environmental conditions open perspectives to make such link. For example, Heiptas *et al*. (2011) analyzed the effect on fitness (growth rate during binary competition in this case) of all possible point mutations for a nine-amino acid region of Hsp90 in yeast. They observed a large proportion of mutation with strong deleterious effect eliminated via purifying selection and few mutation with neutral effect which is consistent with the neutral model of molecular evolution. Linking genotype to fitness open new perspectives such as the possibility to study the population of origin (central population vs margin population) of the mutation in the species range (Rolland *et al. in press*).

**Formulation** with neutral effect which is consistent with the un.<br>
In Linking genotype to fitness open new perspect the population of origin (central population vs margin cies range (Rolland *et al. in press*).<br>
In points Finally as adaptation points to differences in fitness, an experimental validation by comparing different genotypes seems to be the most informative validation step. Experimental tests of local adaptation can be done for example with common garden or reciprocal transplant experiments with different genotypes for candidate loci (Kawecki & Ebert 2004). This should be easier for traits that not relying on too many loci.

#### **Conclusion**

In summary, the availability of a reference genome can incontestably improve the detection of the signal of selection at all steps of the genome scans: production of genomic data, statistical detection of the signal of selection, and prioritization of candidate genes. Main improvements can be summarized as follows: i) improving the overall quality of the data; ii) helping to reconstruct an accurate demographic history for the population studied and hence decrease confounding effects (Huber *et al.* 2014) ; with deep coverage, genome sequence data

#### **Molecular Ecology Page 18 of 42**

from a single individual are also sufficient to make demographic inference (Miller *et al.* 2012; Oleksyk *et al.* 2012); iii) improving the statistical power of methods to detect the signal of selection. Finally, if the available genome is of high quality, i) it allows matching the potential candidate loci to linked coding regions under selection , ii) it rapidly moves the investigation to the gene and function (Lamichhaney *et al.* 2015), iii) it ensures that the highly variable regions of the genomes in coding regions are also investigated. This last point is important when region under selection are located in such variable regions (Box 2).

For Properties and the useful to study to the useful to study of the useful to the use of the community of researchers working or allaborate with the community of researchers working or unces have long been available (huma We state that having reference genomes represent a critical step to fully address the question of local adaptation. The community of researchers working in ecology on non-model species will thus gain to collaborate with the community of researchers working on species for which large genomic resources have long been available (human and other model species), as the latter have a long tradition of sequence analysis to detect signatures of natural selection. Combining evolution, ecology, genomics and comparative genomics will help to better address the question of local adaptation, which is topical in a context of global change. Finally we should keep in mind that adaptation *sensu lato* does not only rely on genetic diversity. Indeed the question of non-genetic effects, including epigenetic mechanisms, is of great interest in evolutionary biology (Danchin 2013); yet, here again the use of genomic information should be useful to study the diversity in epigenetic modifications.

#### **Acknowledgement**

We thank the foundation ECCOREV that financed the meetings for this paper. We thank 2 anonymous reviewers for very helpful comments. We thank Amanda Xuereb for reading the manuscript. This work is a contribution to the project SEACONNECT funded by the Total

# **Page 19 of 42 Molecular Ecology**





# **Page 21 of 42 Molecular Ecology**





#### **Page 23 of 42 Molecular Ecology**



- Gagnaire P-A, Broquet T, Aurelle D*, et al.* (2015) Using neutral, selected, and hitchhiker loci
- to assess connectivity of marine populations in the genomic era. *Evolutionary Applications* **8**, 769-786.
- Gagnaire P-A, Normandeau E, Cote C, Hansen MM, Bernatchez L (2012) The Genetic Consequences of Spatially Varying Selection in the Panmictic American Eel (*Anguilla rostrata*). *Genetics* **190**, 725-U703.
- enetics 190, 725-U703.<br>
Evaluated E, Bernatchez L (2013) The gen<br>
For Fordinandeau E, Bernatchez L (2013) The gen<br>
For Review of September 2013) Reference-Free Populat<br>
For Review Online S, *et al.* (2013) Reference-Free P Gagnaire PA, Pavey SA, Normandeau E, Bernatchez L (2013) The genetic architecture of reproductive isolation during speciation-with-gene-flow in lake whitefish species pairs assessed by rad sequencing *Evolution* **67**, 2483-2497.
- Gayral P, Melo-Ferreira J, Glemin S*, et al.* (2013) Reference-Free Population Genomics from Next-Generation Transcriptome Data and the Vertebrate-Invertebrate Gap. *Plos Genetics* **9**.
- Gu J, Orr N, Park SD*, et al.* (2009) A Genome Scan for Positive Selection in Thoroughbred Horses. *Plos One* **4**.
- Gutenkunst RN, Hernandez RD, Williamson SH, Bustamante CD (2009) Inferring the Joint
- Demographic History of Multiple Populations from Multidimensional SNP Frequency Data. *Plos Genetics* **5**.
- Hawley NL, Minster RL, Weeks DE*, et al.* (2014) Prevalence of Adiposity and Associated Cardiometabolic Risk Factors in the Samoan Genome-Wide Association Study. *American Journal of Human Biology* **26**, 491-501.
- Hedrick PW, Ginevan ME, Ewing EP (1976) Genetic polymorphism in heterogeneous environements *Annual Review of Ecology And Systematics* **7**, 1-32.



- Herrera S, Reyes-Herrera PH, Shank TM (2014) *Genome-wide predictability of restriction sites across the eukaryotic tree of life*. *bioRxiv*.
- 
- Hietpas RT, Jensen JD, Bolon DNA (2011) Experimental illumination of a fitness landscape. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* **108**, 7896-7901.
- Hohenlohe PA, Bassham S, Etter PD*, et al.* (2010) Population Genomics of Parallel Adaptation in Threespine Stickleback using Sequenced RAD Tags. *Plos Genetics* **6**.
- **Formal Solutional Academy of Sciences of the United Standard Melecular Biology. Hermisson J, Hellmann I (2014) Keeping It** Huber CD, Nordborg M, Hermisson J, Hellmann I (2014) Keeping It Local: Evidence for Positive Selection in Swedish *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *Molecular Biology and Evolution*
- **31**, 3026-3039.
- Huddleston J, Ranade S, Malig M*, et al.* (2014) Reconstructing complex regions of genomes using long-read sequencing technology. *Genome Research* **24**, 688-696.
- Iliadis A, Watkinson J, Anastassiou D, Wang X (2010) A haplotype inference algorithm for trios based on deterministic sampling. *Bmc Genetics* **11**.
- Joost S, Bonin A, Bruford MW*, et al.* (2007) A spatial analysis method (SAM) to detect candidate loci for selection: towards a landscape genomics approach to adaptation. *Molecular Ecology* **16**, 3955-3969.
- Kajitani R, Toshimoto K, Noguchi H*, et al.* (2014) Efficient de novo assembly of highly heterozygous genomes from whole-genome shotgun short reads. *Genome Research* **24**, 1384-1395.

# **Page 25 of 42 Molecular Ecology**





- Lobreaux S, Manel S, Melodelima C (2014) Development of an Arabis alpina genomic contig sequence data set and application to single nucleotide polymorphisms discovery. *Molecular Ecology Resources* **14**, 411-418.
- Lotterhos KE, Whitlock MC (2015) The relative power of genome scans to detect local adaptation depends on sampling design and statistical method. *Molecular Ecology* **24**, 1031-1046.
- Macaulay IC, Voet T (2014) Single Cell Genomics: Advances and Future Perspectives. *PLoS Genet* **10**, e1004126.
- Manel S, Gugerli F, Thuiller W*, et al.* (2012) Broad-scale adaptive genetic variation in alpine

plants is driven by temperature and precipitation. *Molecular Ecology* **21**, 3729-3738.

- Manel S, Joost S, Epperson B*, et al.* (2010) Perspectives on the use of landscape genetics to detect genetic adaptive variation in the field *Molecular Ecology* **19**, 3760-3772.
- T (2014) Single Cell Genomics: Advances and Future<br>1004126.<br>**For Review Only Example 2012** Broad-scale adaptive genetic<br>ven by temperature and precipitation. *Molecular Ecology*<br>Epperson B, *et al.* (2010) Perspectives on Miller W, Schuster SC, Welch AJ*, et al.* (2012) Polar and brown bear genomes reveal ancient admixture and demographic footprints of past climate change. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* **109**, E2382-E2390.
- Mitchell-Olds T, Willis JH, Goldstein DB (2007) Which evolutionary processes influence

natural genetic variation for phenotypic traits? *Nature Reviews Genetics* **8**, 845-856.

- Nielsen R (2005) Molecular signatures of natural selection. In: *Annual Review of Genetics*, pp. 197-218.
- Nosil P, Funk DJ, Ortiz-Barrientos D (2009) Divergent selection and heterogeneous genomic divergence. *Molecular Ecology* **18**, 375-402.
- Novembre J, Di Rienzo A (2009) Spatial patterns of variation due to natural selection in humans. *Nature Reviews Genetics* **10**, 745-755.

# **Page 27 of 42 Molecular Ecology**





# **Page 29 of 42 Molecular Ecology**



Strasburg JL, Sherman NA, Wright KM*, et al.* (2012) What can patterns of differentiation



#### **Page 31 of 42 Molecular Ecology**

- Yi X, Liang Y, Huerta-Sanchez E*, et al.* (2010) Sequencing of 50 Human Exomes Reveals
- Adaptation to High Altitude. *Science* **329**, 75-78.



#### **Page 33 of 42 Molecular Ecology**

**Site frequency spectrum**. The genomic signatures of recent adaptations can be measured by the site frequency spectrum (SFS), which summarizes the counts of derived variants in a region.

**Soft sweep**: Selection can occur either on standing genetic variation, i.e. existing genetic variation, creating a **soft sweep** or on a *de novo* mutation, creating a **hard sweep.**

- 
- 

**Legend of figures** 

**Figure 1.** Schematic representation of the benefits of using additional genomic resources (mainly reference genomes) in the different steps of genome scans. GBS: Genotyping by sequencing.

**Boxes** 

#### **Box 1- A reference genome**

genomes) in the different steps of genome scans. GE<br> **Example 18 and SEC 2016**<br> **Example 8** is an assembly of a genome that is representative of a<br>
ence reads for population-genomic studies. In genom<br>
can either be the gen A reference genome is an assembly of a genome that is representative of a species and can be used to align sequence reads for population-genomic studies. In genome scan analyses, a reference genome can either be the genome of the targeted species or that of a closely related species. Similarly, this reference can be based on a single individual or on a collection of individuals; in the former situation however, the reference genomes do not capture the full extent of nucleotide or structural variation segregating within a species. With the dramatic decrease in the cost of DNA sequencing of the past few years, an ever increasing number of genome are characterized, yet the quality of these genomes can be highly dependent upon the quality of the assembly (Simpson 2014). As further developed below, reference genomes can thus be of two types: they can be represented by a single sequence ('golden path' reference genomes) or they can be representative of the genetic diversity of the species ('high quality' reference genomes). For these 'high quality' reference genomes, genetic variation does not just refer to single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) but also to structural variation that represents a large source of genomic diversity (Church *et al.* 2011).

### **High quality genome (like human, mouse or** *A. thaliana***).**

A 'high quality' reference genome is defined here as a reference sequence that is both complete in terms of coverage and representative of the genetic diversity of the species investigated. Because current sequencing technologies can only target the euchromatic portion

#### **Molecular Ecology Page 34 of 42**

of the genome (hence excluding the heterochromatin that includes the centromere and telomere regions), 'complete' refers here to the euchromatic genome. 'Finished' quality genome projects typically cover >95% of the euchromatin sequence, a target that can however be difficult to achieve depending on the genome size and complexity of the targeted species. Here genetic variation does not just refer to single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) but also to structural variation that represents a large source of genomic diversity (Church *et al.* 2011).

With the notable exception of the human genome however, most genome sequences only satisfy the first criterion ('complete' sequence) and thus represent what was defined as a 'golden path' during the course of the sequencing of the human genome: a non-redundant 825 haploid representation of the genome (Kent & Haussler 2001).

#### **A 'golden path' reference genome**

g the course of the sequencing of the human genom<br>ion of the genome (Kent & Haussler 2001).<br>**ference genome**<br>**Forence genome**<br>**Forence genome**<br>**Forence genome**<br>**Forence genome**<br>**Forence genome**<br>**Forence genome**<br>**Exergence** A 'golden path' reference genome thus represents the first level of reference sequence that could be used for genome scans. It is now possible to rapidly generate such a reference sequence thanks to modern sequencing technologies that have led to a rapid decrease in the cost of sequencing: for example in 2014-15, typical cost for re-sequencing of a human-size genome (3,000Mb) with paired-ends reads at 30X coverage on an Illumina HiSeq platform is \$4,211. This cost includes labor, administration, management, utilities, reagents, and consumables; sequencing instruments and other large equipment (amortized over three years); informatics activities directly related to sequence production; submission of data to a public database and indirect costs (source: National Human Genome Research Institute (NHGRI); http://www.genome.gov/sequencingcosts/).

837 With sufficient coverage (>30X), this approach should lead to a reference genome covering >95% of the euchromatin sequences. Those values are however highly dependent on the size of the genome and on factors such as the frequency of repeated regions in the genome. Such complete sequences are rarely obtained in conservation biology at the moment however, as illustrated by the de novo sequencing of the genome of *Arabis alpina*, which resolved less than 50% of the genome (172 Mb out of 370 Mb) (Lobreaux *et al.* 2014)**.** Similarly, complex regions with recently duplicated segments for example or plastic regions in diploid genomes may not be well resolved by this approach (Alkan *et al.* 2011).

#### **Improving quality of assembly**

#### **Page 35 of 42 Molecular Ecology**

Id become an adequate resource to establish reference<br>sequencing of the genome of the European Sea Bass w<br>titic individual (Tine *et al.* 2014). Finally, in addition t<br>quality of the reference genomes also increases with t Over the past couple of years, ways to improve initial genome assemblies have emerged. In particular, technology from Pacific Biosciences (PacBio) for long-read single molecule, real-time (SMRT) sequencing can upgrade genomes to a higher quality finished state (Huddleston *et al.* 2014). SMRT sequencing is however still costly and can thus only be applied to small genomes or to targeted resequencing of specific regions. To avoid the problems associated with sequencing plastic regions in diploid genomes, an interesting alternative is also to work with haploid cell lines generated from the same organism such as specific tissues Chaisson *et al.* 2015b) or specific life stages (Rensing *et al.* 2008). Although such cell lines will likely not be available for most organisms, single cell genomics are rapidly progressing so that single gametes could become an adequate resource to establish reference genome (Macaulay 856 & Voet 2014). The sequencing of the genome of the European Sea Bass was based on the use of a meiogynogenetic individual (Tine *et al.* 2014). Finally, in addition to the experimental improvements, the quality of the reference genomes also increases with the development of better assemblers, i.e. the software used to assemble genomes. Indeed, software now exists to help *de novo* assembly from whole – genome shotgun short reads (Kajitani *et al.* 2014) and efforts are being made to evaluate the performance of these methods (Bradnam *et al.* 2013).

**Status on genome sequencing** 



#### **Box 2- Challenges of highly variable regions**

While progress is being made to generate 'golden path' reference genomes, this will at best lead to the complete sequencing of one haploid genome in a given species. Such a sequence will be sufficient for the analysis of genome scans for the vast majority of genes and genomic regions but will be problematic to investigate the more plastic regions of the genome. Indeed, even for the highest quality mammalian genome, the human genome, it was found that some genomic regions were missing in the reference sequence (Kidd *et al.* 2010). These specific regions display structural differences between the genomes of the individuals investigated and the reference genome, either because of specific deletions or because of underrepresented multi-copy genes in the reference genome (Sudmant *et al.* 2010).

me, either because of specific deletions or because of the reference genome (Sudmant *et al.* 2010).<br>
stic regions of the genome are known to contain impo<br> *EMajor Histocompatibility Complex (MHC) class I* and<br> *Re Recept* In human such plastic regions of the genome are known to contain important immune gene families such as the *Major Histocompatibility Complex* (*MHC*) *class I* and *class II* genes and the *Killer-cell Ig-like Receptor* (*KIR*) genes that are critical for the resistance to pathogens and 879 hence for the adaptation to different environments (Sommer 2005; Vilches & Parham 2002). Indeed recent genome scans approaches on human populations underlined the critical roles of pathogens in local adaptation (Fumagalli *et al.* 2011). Both gene families display a high level of polymorphism but also gene-content variation (see Figure for the *KIR* locus) so that a single reference sequence will not represent correctly the gene content in all individuals and could lead to problematic analyses for genome scans. Indeed, not including multiple references for such regions produces misalignments of the reads and spurious variant calls. The human reference genome was thus organized to include multiple sequences for these regions (Church *et al.* 2011). Thus 'high quality' reference genomes that include multiple sequences for the plastic regions are necessary to produce unbiased results in genome scans. Such a reference sequence requires two additional steps once a first complete sequence of the genome is known: the identification of these regions and the characterization of the variation at these regions. Finally, data from these regions might need to be adapted to run some of the 892 usual tests of local adaptation such as  $F_{ST}$  outliers: for example by encoding presence/absence of genes (*KIR* locus) as SNPs or by considering complete alleles rather than individual SNP (*MHC* genes). Because these highly variable gene families have a strong impact on immune adaptation, they are often investigated by targeted analyses, outside of genome scans (candidate gene approaches)

#### **Page 37 of 42 Molecular Ecology**

Force ... **Figure.** Example of a highly-variable region of the genomes of primates: the Killer-cell Ig-like Receptor (KIR) locus. This drawing compares the organization and gene-content variability of the human and chimpanzee *KIR* loci. The branching pathways illustrate how different gene-content motifs can combine to produce different *KIR* haplotypes. Genes that are typically found on all haplotypes of both species (framework genes) are colored grey; chimpanzee-specific KIR are colored green. Humans have two broad groups of haplotypes called A and B haplotypes that differ in gene content and level of allelic variability (Parham *et al.* 2012): genes characteristic of human A haplotypes are colored red while genes characteristic of human B haplotypes are colored blue (2DP1 and 2DL1 in humans are colored grey to indicate their presence both on A and B haplotypes). Adapted from Abi-Rached et al. (Abi-Rached *et al.* 2010).

phylogenetically related species as proposed by Herrera<br>eq data can be done thanks to different software package<br>*et al.* 2013), PyRAD (Eaton 2014), RADtools (Baxter *e*<br>0), or dDozent (Puritz *et al.* 2014).<br>Pavey *et al.*  **Box 3:** Methods based on the use of restriction enzyme digestion of target genomes to reduce the complexity of the target: example of RAD-seq RAD-Seq is based on the sequencing of short sequences flanking restriction sites (Baird *et al.* 2008). It requires choosing the restriction enzyme(s) in combination with the sequencing depth and the number of individuals multiplexed in order to modulate the number of expected markers. This choice is done on the basis of genome knowledge (size and GC-content) for the target species or on phylogenetically related species as proposed by Herrera *et al.* (2014). The analysis of RAD-Seq data can be done thanks to different software packages such for example as Stacks (Catchen *et al.* 2013), PyRAD (Eaton 2014), RADtools (Baxter *et al.* 2011), GATK (DePristo et al. 2010), or dDozent (Puritz *et al.* 2014). As an illustration, (Pavey *et al.* 2015) used RAD-Seq to study the genetic basis of the differentiation between ecotypes of the American eel (*Anguilla rostrata*). They used the EcoRI restriction enzyme and analyzed 379 individuals with around 24 individuals per lane of an Illumina HiSeq 2000. After cleaning and filtering the data they retained 42 424 SNPs which corresponded to 1 SNP every 40 kb. This density allowed them to identify 331 SNPs associated with the ecotypes, with 99 SNPs corresponding to annotated protein-coding genes. 

#### **Page 39 of 42 Molecular Ecology**

#### **Box 4- Genome scan and genomic resources: a case study on the European sea bass (***Dicentrarchus labrax***)**

emaire *et al.* 2005). The European sea bass can be prese<br>nich raises the question of its adaptation to different env<br>0)). Getting genomic information on this species would<br>tionary history and would be useful for aquacultu Population genomic studies can be useful both for the management of wild and domestic hatchery populations and for a better understanding of the evolution of species, which is useful for conservation purposes. The study on the European sea bass (*Dicentrarchus labrax*) provides a good illustration of the multiple interests and applications of genomic data. This species is heavily harvested. Its distribution range, from the Atlantic Ocean to the Black Sea, encompasses an important barrier to gene flow at the Almeria-Oran front which separate two genetic lineages (Lemaire *et al.* 2005). The European sea bass can be present in different levels of salinity which raises the question of its adaptation to different environments (e.g (Lemaire *et al.* 2000)). Getting genomic information on this species would be useful to better understand its evolutionary history and would be useful for aquaculture purposes. Tine et al. (2014) published the first draft genome of *D. labrax*. The sequencing of the genome was based on a meiogynogenetic male, with an average coverage depth of 30X and used a combination of whole-genome shotgun, mate pair and BAC end sequencing. The length of the assembled genome reached 650 Mbp and 86% of the contigs were assigned to the 24 chromosomes of this species. The genome annotation led to the identification of 26,719 genes and an important collinearity was observed with other teleosts genomes. This genome corresponds to the 'golden path' genome as described in Box 1. RAD-sequencing was then used to study the polymorphism at the genome scale for 100 individuals (and three from anoutgroup, *D. punctatus*). The authors obtained around 178,000 RAD loci which, after 955 mapping on the genome, allowed them to analyze one locus every 7.5 kb and to reach a 2.5% genome coverage. The combination of the reference genome and RAD loci allowed for a better understanding of the evolutionary and adaptive history of the species. For example, the identification of signatures of positive selection in duplicates of genes involved in osmoregulation (e.g. *PRL-L2*) opened the way to a better understanding of euryhalinity in this species and in other teleosts as well. Here important information comes from the combination of a good annotation, the discovery of multiple gene copies of the same family and from statistical test of molecular evolution. The genomic analysis of differentiation between 963 Atlantic and Mediterranean lineages led to a mean  $F_{ST}$  of 0.28 but with highly heterogeneous repartition: genomic islands of differentiation were observed with lengths varying from several hundred kb to more than one Mb. These islands were negatively correlated with local recombination rate and diversity levels (with a few exceptions). Mapping SNPs obtained

#### **Molecular Ecology Page 40 of 42**

- through RAD sequencing to a reference genome is here useful to understand the evolution of
- genomic differentiation and ultimately of speciation. Similar approaches could be applied to
- the study of adaptation to different environments. Having such genomic information,
- including gene annotation and knowledge on the evolution of gene contents (i.e. duplications)
- is a highly valuable complement to the analysis of isolated SNPs.

**Page 41 of 42 Molecular Ecology**

**Formally and SIVE SINCE SINCE** (1) Genomic data (2) Detection of the signal of selection (3) Prioritization - Hypervariable regions - Physical linkage - Haplotypes - Sliding windows statistics - Haplotype analysis: demographic inference ; signal of selection - Detection of the physical closest coding gene - Detection of the functions of the gene **Steps in genome scans Genome sequences / Genomic ressources** High quality genome High quality genome **Benefits** SNPs obtained from reduced representation sequencing; High density of SNPs obtained from genome resequencing ;

# **Figure 1**

