

## Southern African summer-rainfall variability, and its teleconnections, on interannual to interdecadal timescales in CMIP5 models.

Bastien Dieppois, Benjamin Pohl, Julien Crétat, Jonathan Eden, Moussa Sidibe, Mark New, Mathieu Rouault, Damian Lawler

#### ▶ To cite this version:

Bastien Dieppois, Benjamin Pohl, Julien Crétat, Jonathan Eden, Moussa Sidibe, et al.. Southern African summer-rainfall variability, and its teleconnections, on interannual to interdecadal timescales in CMIP5 models.. Climate Dynamics, 2019, 53 (5-6), pp.3505-3527. 10.1007/s00382-019-04720-5 . hal-02281266

### HAL Id: hal-02281266 https://hal.science/hal-02281266v1

Submitted on 4 Dec 2023

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

# Southern African summer-rainfall variability, and its teleconnections, on interannual to interdecadal timescales in CMIP5 models

Dieppois, B, Pohl, B, Cretat, J, Eden, JM, Sidibe, M, New, M, Rouault, M & Lawler, D Author post-print (accepted) deposited by Coventry University's Repository

#### **Original citation & hyperlink:**

Dieppois, B, Pohl, B, Cretat, J, Eden, JM, Sidibe, M, New, M, Rouault, M & Lawler, D 2019, 'Southern African summer-rainfall variability, and its teleconnections, on interannual to interdecadal timescales in CMIP5 models' *Climate Dynamics*, vol. 53, no. 5-6, pp. 3505-3527. <u>https://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00382-019-04720-5</u>

 DOI
 10.1007/s00382-019-04720-5

 ISSN
 0930-7575

 ESSN
 1432-0894

 Publisher:
 Springer

The final publication is available at Springer via <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00382-019-</u>04720-5

Copyright © and Moral Rights are retained by the author(s) and/ or other copyright owners. A copy can be downloaded for personal non-commercial research or study, without prior permission or charge. This item cannot be reproduced or quoted extensively from without first obtaining permission in writing from the copyright holder(s). The content must not be changed in any way or sold commercially in any format or medium without the formal permission of the copyright holders.

This document is the author's post-print version, incorporating any revisions agreed during the peer-review process. Some differences between the published version and this version may remain and you are advised to consult the published version if you wish to cite from it.

1	Southern African summer-rainfall variability, and its teleconnections, on
2	interannual to interdecadal timescales in CMIP5 models
3	
4	Bastien Dieppois <sup>1, 2, 3</sup> , Benjamin Pohl <sup>4</sup> , Julien Crétat <sup>4, 5</sup> , Jonathan Eden <sup>1</sup> , Moussa Sidibe <sup>1</sup> ,
5	Mark New <sup>6</sup> , Mathieu Rouault <sup>2,7</sup> , Damian Lawler <sup>1</sup>
6	
7	<sup>1</sup> Centre for Agroecology, Water and Resilience, Coventry University, Coventry, UK
8	<sup>2</sup> Department of Oceanography, MARE Institute, University of Cape Town, Cape Town, RSA
9	<sup>3</sup> School of Geography, Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Birmingham,
10	Birmingham, UK
11	<sup>4</sup> Centre de Recherches de Climatologie, UMR 6282 Biogéosciences, CNRS/Université de
12	Bourgogne Franche Comté, Dijon, France
13	<sup>5</sup> IPSL/Laboratoire des Sciences du Climat et de l'Environnment, CEA-CNRS-UVSQ,
14	Université Paris Saclay, Gif-sur-Yvette, France
15	<sup>6</sup> African Climate & Development Initiative, University of Cape Town, Cape Town, RSA
16	<sup>7</sup> Nansen-Tutu Center for Marine Environmental Research, University of Cape Town, Cape
17	Town, RSA
18	
19	
20	Correspondence to: Bastien Dieppois, Centre for Agroecology, Water and Resilience
21	(CAWR), Coventry University, Ryton Gardens, Ryton on Dunsmore, Coventry, CV8 3LG,
22	UK. E-mail: <u>bastien.dieppois@coventry.ac.uk</u>
23	
24	
25	

<u>±</u>

This study provides the first assessment of CMIP5 model performances in Abstract 26 simulating southern Africa (SA) rainfall variability in austral summer (Nov-Feb), and its 27 teleconnections with large-scale climate variability at different timescales. Observed SA 28 rainfall varies at three major timescales: interannual (2–8 years), quasi-decadal (8–13 years; 29 QDV) and interdecadal (15-28 years; IDV). These rainfall fluctuations are, respectively, 30 associated with El Niño Southern Oscillation (ENSO), the Interdecadal Pacific Oscillation 31 (IPO) and the Pacific Decadal Oscillation (PDO), interacting with climate anomalies in the 32 South Atlantic and South Indian Ocean. CMIP5 models produce their own variability, but 33 perform better in simulating interannual rainfall variability, while QDV and IDV are largely 34 35 underestimated. These limitations can be partly explained by spatial shifts in core regions of SA rainfall variability in the models. Most models reproduce the impact of La Niña on rainfall 36 at the interannual scale in SA, in spite of limitations in the representation of ENSO. Realistic 37 38 links between negative IPO are found in some models at the QDV scale, but very poor performances are found at the IDV scale. Strong limitations, *i.e.* loss or reversal of these 39 teleconnections, are also noted in some simulations. Such model errors, however, do not 40 systematically impact the skill of simulated rainfall variability. This is because biased SST 41 variability in the South Atlantic and South Indian Oceans strongly impact model skills by 42 modulating the impact of Pacific modes of variability. Using probabilistic multi-scale 43 clustering, model uncertainties in SST variability are primarily driven by differences from one 44 model to another, or comparable models (sharing similar physics), at the global scale. At the 45 regional scale, *i.e.* SA rainfall variability and associated teleconnections, while differences in 46 model physics remain a large source of uncertainty, the contribution of internal climate 47 variability is increasing. This is particularly true at the QDV and IDV scales, where the 48 individual simulations from the same model tend to differentiate, and the sampling error 49 increase. 50

52 Keywords Southern African rainfall variability · Interannual to interdecadal timescales ·
 53 Sea-surface temperature anomalies · Teleconnections · CMIP5 models

54

#### 55 **1. Introduction**

Southern Africa (SA, south of 20°S) is known to be particularly vulnerable to climate change 56 due to a combination of a naturally high degree of climate variability and high reliance on 57 climate-sensitive activities, such as rain-fed agriculture (Conway et al. 2015). In particular, 58 during the main rainy season, i.e. austral summer (Nov-Feb, NDJF), SA rainfall has been 59 shown to vary over ranges of timescales from synoptic (3-7 days; e.g. Todd and Washington 60 1999; Hart et al. 2012; Macron et al. 2014) to decadal ( $\geq 10$  years; e.g. Dyer and Tyson 1977; 61 Tyson 1981 1986; Mason and Jury 1997, Dieppois et al. 2016), as well as potential complex 62 63 interactions across timescales. For instance, Cook (2001) and Ratnam et al. (2014) proposed that El Niño Southern Oscillation (ENSO) generates atmospheric Rossby waves in the Southern 64 Hemisphere, which could be responsible for longitudinal shifts of the South Indian 65 Convergence Zone (SICZ), where synoptic-scale rain bearing systems that affect southern 66 Africa, such as tropical-temperate troughs (TTTs), preferentially develop (Todd and 67 68 Washington 1999; Hart et al. 2012; Macron et al. 2014). Similarly, Dieppois et al. (2016) and Pohl et al. (2018), highlighted that part of the non-linearity in the relationship between ENSO 69 and summer SA rainfall, which is prominent at the interannual timescale, could be explained 70 by interactions with the Interdecadal Pacific Oscillation (IPO) and the Pacific Decadal 71 Oscillation (PDO) at the quasi-decadal (8–13 years; QDV) and interdecadal (15–28 years; IDV) 72 timescales, respectively. These studies also suggested that ENSO-like shifts and modulations 73 of the Walker circulation in response to the IPO and PDO are interacting with regional ocean-74 atmospheric circulations, such as the South Indian Ocean Dipole (Morioka et al. 2015), leading 75

to shifts in the SICZ and modulations of the TTT occurrence. However, despite the importance
of these decadal timescales in SA rainfall variability, and their impact on societies, little has
been done to examine the ability of global climate models, particularly those that constitute the
Coupled Model Intercomparison Project-phase 5 (CMIP5), to reproduce such processes on
interannual to interdecadal timescales.

81

Model-based studies in southern Africa have highlighted large differences between climate 82 models, especially in their estimates of historical rainfall (Hewitson and Crane 2006; Nikulin 83 et al. 2012; Kalogomou et al. 2013; Dieppois et al. 2015; Munday and Washington 2016 2018). 84 While models reproduce the annual cycle of rainfall reasonably well, there are large 85 discrepancies in rainfall amount, and in particular in austral summer (e.g. Dieppois et al. 2015; 86 Munday and Washington 2016 2018). As illustrated in Fig. 1a-b, most CMIP5 models 87 88 significantly overestimate summer-rainfall, especially in areas of greater rainfall such as the north-eastern region of southern Africa (where more than 60% of models show an average wet 89 bias of 34 mm.months<sup>-1</sup> or +41%). However, long-term SA rainfall variability has been poorly 90 91 studied despite of the extensive use of CMIP5 models for climate impact assessment.

92

93 Some authors have proposed that part of such bias in SA rainfall could be explained by significant model-dependency on the strength of the Angola Low amongst CMIP5 models 94 (Munday and Washington 2016; Lazenby et al. 2016), but underlying drivers of these model 95 uncertainties remain unclear. Such uncertainties in CMIP5 models could also be explained 96 through misrepresentations of the linkage between regional circulation and large-scale modes 97 of climate variability. This is, for instance, the case for ENSO (Dieppois et al. 2015), which has 98 major influences on SA rainfall variability (e.g. Ropelewski and Halpert 1987 1989; Lindesay 99 1988; Mason and Jury 1997; Rouault and Richard 2005; Kane 2009; Crétat et al. 2012; Ratnam 100

et al. 2014; Hoell et al. 2015; Dieppois et al. 2016). Dieppois et al. (2015) thus pointed out that 101 anomalous westward extensions of ENSO patterns in the CMIP5 models were leading to wet 102 biases in SA during El Niño events, as a response to anomalously continental locations of the 103 SICZ. This is consistent with recent findings from James et al. (2018), who identify too many 104 TTTs, and too much rainfall from TTTs in HadGEM3-GC2. Similarly, decadal ENSO-like 105 patterns related to the IPO and PDO, and their interactions with atmospheric regional 106 circulations, which also play an important role in SA rainfall variability (Dieppois et al. 2016; 107 Malherbe et al. 2016; Pohl et al. 2018), could potentially contribute to CMIP5 model 108 uncertainties over the region. Decadal rainfall anomalies have, for instance, been shown to 109 explain a large part of the persistent drought in this region between the 1960s and 1990s (e.g. 110 Richard et al. 2001; Rouault and Richard 2005; Dieppois et al. 2016; Malherbe et al. 2016; Pohl 111 et al. 2018). 112

113

At the global scale, decadal rainfall variance has been shown to be largely underestimated in 114 the CMIP3 and CMIP5 models (Ault et al. 2012). Decadal sea-surface temperature (SST) 115 variability is often underestimated in the Pacific (Ault et al. 2013; Laepple and Huybers 2014; 116 Henley et al. 2017; Power et al. 2017) and overestimated in the North Atlantic (Ba et al. 2014; 117 Menary et al. 2015). This suggests that future climate projections could poorly represent 118 decadal variability, and offer a limited view of prolonged drought and hydro-meteorological 119 risks. Underlying drivers of such model uncertainties however remain unclear, especially at 120 these timescales, and might be region-dependent (Hawkins and Sutton 2009; Deser et al. 2012). 121 So far, no study has attempted to address these issues in SA. Using a time-space approach based 122 on spectral analysis and a probabilistic clustering, this study then aims to: i) identify potential 123 key sources of uncertainties in the CMIP5 models at different timescales; ii) discuss the 124 respective contributions of different model physics and internal climate variability to the 125

CMIP5 model uncertainties at those timescales; iii) better understand processes driving SA
 rainfall variability, especially using CMIP5 multimodel ensemble.

128

This paper is organized as follows. In section 2, the datasets and methods are described. In 129 section 3, we analyse the ability of CMIP5 models to simulate observed timescales of summer 130 SA rainfall variability. In section 4, we assess model skill to simulate global SST variability at 131 decadal timescales, and the teleconnections between SA rainfall and global SST. In section 5, 132 we discuss the potential uncertainties related to the sample sizes (i.e. length and number of 133 simulations per model), and the capability of each model, using longer-term model simulations. 134 135 We then show in section 6 how four contrasting CMIP5 models represent atmospheric bridges linking the Pacific Ocean and SA. Finally, our main results are interpreted and discussed in 136 section 7. 137

138

#### 139 2. Data & Methods

#### 140 **2.1.** *Observations*

The Climatic Research Unit (CRU) dataset is used to compare observed and simulated summer 141 SA rainfall variability (Harris et al. 2014; Table 1). The summer-rain region, which is here 142 defined as the region where the wettest months occur in NDJF, extends to all the north-eastern 143 part of southern Africa (Fig. 1c). To optimally investigate summer-rainfall variability and its 144 teleconnections, a summer-rainfall index (SRI) has been constructed by averaging the values 145 over the summer region, as displayed in Fig. 1c. According to Dieppois et al. (2016), the quality 146 of the SRI is quite stable throughout the 20<sup>th</sup> century, as a satisfactory number of rain gauges 147 was always available over the region. In addition, very similar results were found using Global 148 Precipitation Climatology Centre full data reanalysis version 7.0 (Schneider et al. 2014). 149

To examine the summer teleconnections with global SSTs, we used the extended reconstructed 151 SST version 4 (ERSST.v4) of the National Climatic Data Centre (Huang et al. 2015; Table 1). 152 Version 4 does not use satellite data, and is thus coherent over the whole time period. It is not 153 affected by the cold SST bias induced by the use of satellite observations at the end of the 20<sup>th</sup> 154 century (Reynolds et al. 2002). Uncertainty related to the choice of the observed SST datasets 155 has been assessed in Dieppois et al. (2016), who compared the composite SST anomalies 156 associated with SA rainfall from ERSST.v4 to those obtained using the HadISST1 (Rayner et 157 al. 2003) and COBE SST2 (Hirahara et al. 2014) datasets: an agreement greater than 90% 158 between datasets was found regardless the timescale, ensuring the reliability of our reference 159 SST dataset. 160

161

As recommended in Zhang et al. (2013), the 20<sup>th</sup> Century Reanalysis version 2c (20CR.v2c; 162 163 Compo et al. 2006 2011) is used as reference to discuss the representation of atmospheric bridges between the Pacific Ocean and SA (Table 1). Such atmospheric bridges are here 164 depicted through velocity potential ( $\varphi$ ) and stream function ( $\psi$ ) composite anomalies in the 165 lower and upper troposphere (850-600 and 400-150 hPa). The 20CR.v2c assimilates only 166 surface pressure, and uses monthly SST and sea ice distributions as boundary conditions. Such 167 168 a modelling and data assimilation strategy that remains constant over the entire time period allows spectral decompositions in analysing atmospheric circulation across different timescales 169 with a reduced sensitivity to time-varying availability of observational datasets. The density of 170 the observational network, e.g. amounts of assimilated data, as well as the quality of the SST 171 field used as boundary conditions, remains nevertheless an intractable problem. This is likely 172 to reduce the quality of the reanalyses, and the consistency between its different members, for 173 the first decades of the period (Pohl et al. 2018). However, atmospheric composite anomalies 174 associated with SA rainfall from all reanalysis members were consistent and significantly 175

correlated with the ensemble mean, suggestive of weak inter-member uncertainty (Dieppois etal. 2016).

178

#### 179 2.2. CMIP5 model output

Performances have been assessed against observations using historical runs from 28 CMIP5 180 models (Table 1), which simulate climate variability from the mid-19<sup>th</sup> century to the early 21<sup>st</sup> 181 centuries, and are driven by observed estimate of anthropogenic and natural forcings (Taylor et 182 al. 2012). Initialization schemes are model dependent. Models from the same institutions or 183 different institutions can share (successive) versions of the same atmospheric, oceanic, land 184 185 surface and sea-ice components, and, therefore use very similar physics for simulating some parameterized processes of the climate system (Table 2). The spatial resolutions also change 186 from one model to another (Table 1). The ocean grids were interpolated on orthogonal 187 188 curvilinear grid in some models, making comparison difficult with regular grids, and have thus been remapped on a regular  $2^{\circ} \times 2^{\circ}$  resolution grid using bilinear interpolation. 189

190

To assess the contribution of internal climate variability, all calculations have been performed on each individual member, giving a total of 95 simulations (Table 1). In addition, to test the uncertainties associated with the sample sizes (*i.e.* length and number of simulations per model), which might be limiting at decadal timescale, longer-term pre-industrial control (piControl) simulations have been used in Section 5 (Table 1).

196

Model-simulated SRI has been calculated by averaging summer-rainfall amounts spatially in each historical and piControl runs from the 28 CMIP5 models (Fig. 1c). The simulated summerrainfall region matched well with that observed, although their spatial extension sensibly varies from one model to another (Fig. 1c).

#### 202 **2.3.** Timescales of variability and associated teleconnections

In section 3, we first compare the significant timescales of observed SRI variability with those 203 simulated in the 95 members from the 28 selected CMIP5 models using fast Fourier transform 204 (FFT). Significance tests of the FFT spectrum assumes a red-noise background spectrum for 205 the null hypothesis, which is tested by 10,000 Monte Carlo simulations of first-order 206 autoregressive (AR[1]) processes (Ghil et al. 2002). We next compare the SRI variance 207 according to the three dominant timescales identified in observations (*i.e.* interannual: 2–8 year; 208 QDV: 8-13 year; IDV: 15-28 year; Dieppois et al. 2016) by submitting observed and simulated 209 210 time series to FFT band-pass filtering. To reduce trend effects (Wu et al. 2007), the SRI indices are preliminary detrended using a locally weighted linear regression, with span equal to the 211 length of the data. We then compute the centered ratio of standard deviation (rSD), here 212 213 expressed as a percentage:

214 centered. 
$$rSD = 1 - \frac{sd(SRI[obs]^t)}{sd(SRI[sim]^t)} \times 100$$
 (1)

where *sd* refers to the standard deviations of the time series, and *t* indicates the corresponding timescales. Statistical significance of equality between observed and simulated variance is estimated using a two-sided Fisher's *F* test at p = 0.05. The same procedure is then applied to each grid-point over the SA region, and to global SST in section 4.

219

In section 4, we also assess the ability of CMIP5 models to simulate teleconnection between SRI and global SSTs. After replicating the filtering procedure described above to SST datasets, composite analyses are performed to construct typical states of global SSTs associated with SA rainfall fluctuations. Two sets of SST anomalies are produced for each timescale, where the SRI exceeds  $\pm$  1 standard deviation (*i.e.* wet and dry anomalies); the resulting composites thus describe the difference in SST between wet and dry conditions over SA. Statistical significance is estimated by testing the difference in mean between wet and dry SST anomalies using a twosided Student's *t* test at p = 0.05. When time series are serially correlated, the degrees of freedom are adjusted by recalculating the "effective sample size" (N<sup>eff</sup>). This is given by the following approximation (Yue and Wang 2004):

230 
$$\frac{N}{N^{\text{eff}}} = 1 + \frac{2}{N(N-1)(N-2)} \sum_{i=1}^{t} (N-i-1)(N-i-2) ts(i)$$
 (2)

where *N* is the number of observations in the sample, ts(i) is the serial correlation between ranks of the observations for lag *i*, and *t* is the maximum time lag considered. This procedure has then been replicated for piControl simulations in section 5, and to examine the performance of the models to reproduce atmospheric bridges between the Pacific basin and SA in section 6. Note that, while the present study aims at identifying climate processes associated with different ranges of SA rainfall fluctuations, some non-linearity between SST anomalies associated with wet and dry years only emerge at the interannual timescale (Fig. A1).

238

#### 239 2.4. Assessing and narrowing model uncertainties

In sections 3 and 4, model performance is systematically assessed through Taylor diagrams 240 (Taylor et al. 2001). As mentioned in earlier studies (Hawkins and Sutton 2009; Deser et al. 241 2012), at the regional scale, model uncertainties are increasing at decadal timescales due an 242 increasing contributions of internal climate variability, adding to problems in model physics. 243 This enhances diversity in the CMIP5 simulations, as simulations of the same model are likely 244 to drift from one another, making meaningless the use of simple statistics (e.g. model mean and 245 spread). Similarly to previous studies (e.g. Jun et al. 2008; Knutti et al. 2010 2013), a clustering 246 approach has therefore been used to quantify the similarities between all models, and between 247 simulations of the same model without predefined assumption. The relative contributions of 248 model physics and internal climate variability could thus be discussed by assessing the inter-249 simulation spread within the CMIP5 framework, while identifying recurrent patterns. 250

252 The similarities between the 95 simulated spatial patterns of SA rainfall variability, global SST variability and composite SST anomalies (cf. sections 2.3-4), have thus been quantified at each 253 timescale using Ward's agglomerative criteria applied to Euclidean distances (Ward 1963; 254 Crétat et al. 2018). In addition, we used a multi-scale bootstrap approach, allowing for 255 estimation of the probability of each cluster (Shimodaira 2002, 2004), to optimize the 256 identification of recurrent and spatially coherent clusters within the multimodel ensemble (Fig. 257 A2). To estimate approximately unbiased probability that a cluster appears in the replicate, 258 10,000 bootstrap resampling over 33 different spatial lengths of the data (2% to 180% of the 259 260 spatial domain, *i.e.* 330,000 iterations) are used (Fig. A2). Randomly resampling the spatial domain with different sizes thus enables to reduce the uncertainty associated with the selected 261 grid-resolution, and to balance the weight of different regions (e.g. Pacific vs. Atlantic). Only 262 263 clusters showing  $p \ge 0.90$  have been considered as robust (Fig. A2). Clusters have been named as #CL1[pr]- to n[pr]-int for rainfall variability at the interannual timescale, and as #CL1[pr] to 264 *n*[pr]-QDV and IDV at the QDV and IDV timescales (abbreviation [sstvar] and [sstano] have 265 been used for clusters of global SST variance and composite anomalies, respectively). 266

In addition, in section 5, we discussed the sampling uncertainties in simulating observed statistics using historical and the longer-term piControl runs. The capability to significantly simulate observed SRI variance and global SST teleconnections at the three different timescales has been calculated by replicating the procedure described in section 2.3 for every 113 year time-period through the course of historical and piControl runs. The Fisher *F* test of equal variance at p = 0.05 and Pearson's spatial correlation have been used to quantify the capability to simulate rainfall variance and SST teleconnection, respectively.

#### **3.** Summer SA rainfall variability

#### 277 **3.1. SRI variability**

The ability of CMIP5 models to simulate SRI variability (including its timescales and variance) is displayed in Fig. 2. Corroborating Dieppois et al. (2016), observed SRI exhibits three significant timescales of variability over the 20<sup>th</sup> century (Fig. 2a): interannual (2–8 years), QDV (8–13 years) and IDV (15–28 years). Simulated and observed FFT spectra strongly differ (Fig. 2a). There are also large differences between FFT spectra from different models, and between simulations from the same model (Fig. 2a), indicating that CMIP5 simulations tend to produce their own variability.

285

However, as illustrated in Fig. A3, most models, and almost all institutions, can produce 286 significant variability within the interannual, QDV and IDV timescales, suggesting that 287 288 differences in simulated FFT spectra mostly result from internal climate variability, different resolutions and physics. The ratios of standard deviation between CMIP5 models and 289 observation have thus been calculated at the three different timescales (Fig. 2b). CMIP5 290 models, perform better in simulating SRI variability at the interannual timescale (-6% average 291 bias) than at the QDV and IDV timescales (-15 and -37% average bias; Fig. 2b). At the 292 interannual timescale, more than 50% of the simulations show similar variance to observations 293 (Fig. 2b), while significant underestimations and overestimations are detected in 35 and 14% 294 of model simulations, respectively (Fig. 2b). At the QDV and IDV timescales, only about 30 295 and 14% of the CMIP5 simulations, respectively, show significant variance close to 296 observation (Fig. 2b). These simulations always correspond to models producing realistic 297 rainfall variance at the interannual timescale (Fig. 2b), suggesting cross-linkages between 298 timescales in the model errors. Biases in simulating SRI variance are indeed proportionally 299 stronger from the interannual to IDV timescales, especially for model simulations 300

underestimating SRI interannual variability (box plots on Fig. 2b). 51 and 77% of model
 simulations thus significantly underestimate SRI QDV and IDV, respectively (Fig. 2b).

303

#### 304 **3.2.** Core regions of summer SA rainfall variability

*305 3.2.1. Observations* 

Observed interannual rainfall variability explains approximately 70% of the total variance on 306 average over SA (Fig. 3a). As for the raw data, interannual rainfall variability is clearly more 307 pronounced in the northern and eastern regions (Fig. 3a), where summer-rainfall amounts are 308 greater (Fig. 1a). At the QDV and IDV scales, which both can express more than 10% of the 309 310 total variance over SA, similar patterns of rainfall variability are identified (Fig. 3a). The QDV is more pronounced on the eastern coastal regions of South Africa, but does not contribute much 311 to total rainfall variability northeast of the central plateau (SA highlands; Fig. 3a), while the 312 313 IDV is more pronounced in this region (Fig. 3a). In addition, according to earlier studies (Tyson 1981 1986; Mason and Jury 1997; Dieppois et al. 2016; Malherbe et al. 2016), the QDV can 314 explain up to 26% of the total rainfall variance over the southwestern regions (Fig. 3a). 315

316

#### 317 *3.2.2. Model performances*

CMIP5 models show good skills in simulating spatial patterns of summer SA rainfall 318 variability at the interannual timescale (Fig. 4a). Spatial correlations between CMIP5 319 simulations and observation often exceed 0.7 (up to  $\geq 0.9$ ), while the normalized mean bias is 320 lower than 1 (Fig. 4a). Model skills remain moderately good at the QDV and IDV timescales 321  $(0.5 \le r \le 0.85)$ , although these scores substantially drop in some simulations at the IDV scale 322 (approaching 0; Fig. 4c). Although some models substantially overestimate spatial variability 323 at each timescale, simulated patterns of rainfall variability are often close to the observed one, 324 suggesting similar patterns than in observation (Fig 4a-c). 325

#### 327 3.2.3. CMIP5 model diversity

Multi-scale bootstrapped clustering has been used to identify the recurrent and spatially coherent patterns in simulating summer SA rainfall variability within the CMIP5 multimodel ensemble. While 13 significant clusters are identified at the interannual scale, model diversity substantially increases at the QDV and IDV timescales with 28 and 21 significant clusters, respectively (Fig. 4d).

333

At the interannual timescale, clusters primarily refer to the different models and institutions 334 (Fig. 4d). Different parameterizations of the LMDZ atmospheric model however lead to 335 differentiations of the distinct versions of the IPSL model (Fig. 4d). Similarly, CMCC-CESM, 336 which includes carbon cycle feedbacks, differs from other CMCC models (Fig. 4d). Models 337 from different institutions sharing the same atmospheric model (or different versions; Table 2) 338 also tend to be clustered together at the interannual timescale (e.g. ACCESS1-0 and MOHC, 339 CMCC-CESM and MPI, or CESM1-BCG and CCSM4; Fig. 4d). In addition, some models 340 from different institutions (e.g. ACCESS1-3, CSIRO-Mk3-6-0 and MIROC5), are also 341 regrouped (Fig. 4d). Although the similarities between these models could not be explain here 342 343 through similarities in model physics, all these models are found to overestimate interannual SRI variability (Fig. 2). 344

345

At the QDV and IDV scales, individual simulations from the same or comparable models, gradually differentiate, increasing cluster diversity (Fig. 4d). For instance, four significant clusters emerge from CNRM-CM5 at the QDV scale, and this is also the case for most models (Fig. 4d). ACCESS1-3, CSIRO-Mk3-6-0 and MIROC5, which all overestimate interannual SRI variability, still have some simulations clustered together at the QDV and IDV timescales (Fig. 4d). This differentiation between simulations of the same models suggests larger contributions of internal climate variability to model biases. The different clusters could also still partly discriminate different model physics. This is confirmed in Fig. A4, as correlations between simulations from the same models decrease from interannual to IDV timescales, but remain stronger than correlations between different models.

- 356
- 357

#### 3.2.4. Simulated spatial patterns of SA rainfall variability

Such diversity of simulated SA rainfall variability at the three different timescales is illustrated
in Fig. 5. For clarity, names of model simulations describing each clusters are provided in Fig.
A5.

361

According to observation, CMIP5 models generally simulate greater variability in the NE than 362 363 in the SW regions regardless of the timescale (Fig. 5). However, slight misrepresentations of core regions of SA rainfall variability help explaining biases detected in SRI variability at all 364 timescales. CMIP5 simulations overestimating SRI variability (#CL1[pr]-int, #CL1-2[pr]-365 QDV, #CL1, 6[pr]-IDV; Fig. A5) show very realistic patterns, but overestimate rainfall 366 fluctuations in the north-west of the summer-rain region (Fig. 5a-c). In NASA-GISS models 367 (#CL13[pr]-int, #CL5[pr]-QDV, #CL12[pr]-IDV; Fig. A5), rainfall variability is strongest in 368 the eastern coastal regions of SA at all timescales, hence large underestimations further inland 369 (Fig. 5a). At the interannual and QDV scales, MPI models and CMCC models (#CL10[pr]-int 370 and #CL25[pr]-QDV; Fig. A5) simulate too strong rainfall variability in the western region, 371 and underestimate it further east (Fig. 5a). Interestingly, the best performing simulations of SRI 372 variability (#CL2, 6, 7, 10[pr]-int, #CL21, 24[pr]-QDV; Fig. A5) also show significant biases 373 in rainfall variability over SA (Fig. 5a). 374

In summary, although the NE-SW gradient in SA rainfall variability is generally well reproduced for all timescales, slight shifts in core regions of SA rainfall variability could explain part of the biases in simulating SRI variability. This leads to great model diversity, suggesting contrasted links with large-scale and/or regional circulation patterns in CMIP5.

380

# 4. Interannual to interdecadal global SST variability and teleconnections with SA rainfall

We examine here the ability of CMIP5 models to simulate global modes of SST variability at these timescales, and their teleconnections with SA rainfall.

385

#### 386 **4.1. Observations**

In observations, ENSO is the dominant mode of global SST variability at the interannual 387 388 timescale (Mann and Park 1994; Klein et al 1999; Ghil et al. 2002; Sarachick and Cane 2010; De Viron et al. 2013), hence significant fluctuations in the equatorial Pacific at p = 0.05 (Fig. 389 3b). Positive SRI anomalies are thus primarily related to La Niña events, which are associated 390 with cooler tropical Indian Ocean SSTs (Fig. 3c). Observed interannual SRI variability is also 391 related to the South-West Indian Ocean SST dipole (Reason 1998; Reason and Mulenga 1999; 392 Reason 2001; Behera and Yamagata 2001; Washington and Preston 2006; Hoell et al. 2017, 393 2018), the South Atlantic SST dipole (Fauchereau et al. 2003; Hermes and Reason 2005; 394 Vigaud et al. 2009), and SST fluctuations reminiscent of Benguela Niños/Niñas (Lubbecke et 395 al. 2010; Rouault 2012; Reason and Smart 2015). 396

397

The pattern of SST variability at the QDV timescale is similar to that of ENSO (Tourre et al. 1999 2001 2005; Fig. 3b). Wet conditions in SA are once again related to cold anomalies in the east Pacific flanked by a horseshoe pattern of opposite sign, confirming the results by Dieppois

et al. (2016). This is consistent with the negative IPO pattern after the definition provided by 401 Power et al. (1999), and revisited by Di Lorenzo et al. (2015). This negative IPO occurs 402 concomitantly with cold anomalies in the tropical Indian Ocean (Fig. 3c), as highlighted in 403 Allan et al. (2003). Dipole SST anomalies in the South Atlantic Ocean and the SW Indian Ocean 404 have also been related to SA rainfall at this timescale, in response to shifts in the atmospheric 405 circulation (Venegas et al. 1996 1997; Dieppois et al. 2016). Climate anomalies in the SW 406 Indian Ocean were however clearer in Jury et al. (2014) and Morioka et al. (2015), using a 407 shorter period and other datasets. 408

409

410 As shown in Tourre et al. (1999 2001 2005), SST variability is particularly pronounced in the North Pacific at the IDV timescale (Fig. 3b). At this timescale, Pacific SST anomalies 411 associated with SRI fluctuations display a horseshoe pattern, which is reminiscent of the PDO 412 413 (e.g. Mantua et al. 1997; Mantua and Hare 2002; Newman et al. 2016). SRI fluctuations have also been connected to SST anomalies in the South Atlantic and Indian Oceans at the 414 interdecadal timescale (Dieppois et al. 2016; Pohl et al. 2018). We thus note cold anomalies in 415 the tropical Indian and South Atlantic Oceans, and warm anomalies in the extra-tropics (Fig. 416 3c). These regional SST anomalies in the adjacent oceans could be associated with enhanced 417 atmospheric circulation in the Southern Hemisphere (Venegas et al. 1996 1997; Dieppois et al. 418 2016), and to the Southern Annular Mode (SAM; Ciasto et al. 2011; Malherbe et al. 2014 2016). 419 420

421

#### 4.2. Model performances

The performance of CMIP5 models for simulating spatial patterns of global SST variability at the three different timescales are summarized in Fig. 6a. Their respective skills in simulating global SST anomalies associated with SA rainfall variability are displayed in Fig. 6b. Model performances in simulating global SST variability are reasonably good at the interannual timescale (spatial correlation comprised between 0.45 and 0.75 against observations). Correlations gradually decrease at the QDV (0.3 < r < 0.7) and IDV (0.1 < r < 0.65) scales (Fig. 6a-b). For the teleconnections between SA rainfall and global SST (Fig. 6b), most models show correlations greater than 0.4 at the interannual timescale. Correlations are weaker at the QDV scale (-0.6 < r < 0.7) and weaker still at the IDV scale (-0.4 < r < 0.4; Fig. 6a-b).

431

Global SST variability can be too strong in CMIP5 models regardless the timescale (Fig. 6a).
However, some regions, such as the Arctic and the Southern Ocean, strongly suffer from large
uncertainties in observation due to data scarcity (Hirahara 2014; Huang et al. 2016). More
specifically for SA rainfall, the teleconnections with global SST show very contrasted skills at
all timescales, suggesting large model diversity.

437

438 **4.3.** *Model diversity* 

The number of significant clusters of global patterns of SST variability (14, 13 and 15 from the 439 interannual to IDV) and of global SST anomalies associated with SA rainfall (22, 24, 19) is 440 almost constant regardless the timescale (Fig. 6c). The clusters of global SST variability 441 discriminate resembling models (sharing some components 442 patterns mostly or 443 parameterizations; Table 2), in spite of some exceptions (like the different versions of the IPSL model). The situation is far less clear for global SST-SA rainfall teleconnections, especially at 444 the QDV and IDV scales, where intra-ensemble similarities are as much or more important than 445 inter-model similarities (Fig. A6). At these timescales, all CMIP5 model ensembles produce 446 different clusters of global SST-SA rainfall teleconnections, suggesting major contributions of 447 internal climate variability. For instance, CSIRO-Mk3-6-0 simulations, which were converging 448 at the interannual scale, drift into 6 and 5 different clusters at the QDV and IDV scales (Fig. 449 6c). 450

#### 452

#### 4.4. Simulated global SST variability, and teleconnections with SA rainfall

453 CMIP5 model diversity in simulating global patterns of SST variability and SST-SA rainfall 454 teleconnection is illustrated in Figs. 7 and 8, respectively. For clarity, names of model 455 simulations describing each clusters are provided in Fig. A5.

456

At the interannual timescale, ENSO patterns are extending too far west and too tightly confined 457 to the equator (AchutaRao and Sperber 2006; Capotondi et al. 2006, Lin 2007; Guilyardi et al. 458 2009; Fig. 7a), which could substantially impact SA rainfall variability, as suggested in 459 460 Dieppois et al. (2015). Most models link wet conditions in SA to La Niña SST anomalies in the Pacific, and to cold tropical Indian Ocean (#CL4, 6, 9, 10[sstano]-int; Figs. 8a, A5). However, 461 simulated La Niña SST anomalies extend too far west (e.g. #CL4, 6, 9[sstano]-int), and/or are 462 too confined to the equatorial latitudes (#C10, 14[sstano]-int; Fig. 8a). These models also 463 simulate the teleconnections with SA rainfall in the South Atlantic and South Indian Oceans 464 (Fig. 8a), but SST anomalies there are too strong, given the systematic overestimations of SST 465 variability (Fig. 7a). This systematic overestimations of SST variability could be due to 466 limitations in simulating wind-stress in the mid-latitude and subtropical regions, which has been 467 reported too strong by as much as 55% in CMIP3 and CMIP5 (Lee et al. 2013). These biases 468 in the adjacent oceans have major implication for SA rainfall variability. As illustrated in Figure 469 9, even though most simulations (~60%) reproduce the main teleconnection with ENSO at 470 interannual scale, only half of them lead to realistic representation of SA rainfall variability. 471 This is because ENSO-induced large-scale climate anomalies are almost always associated with 472 biased regional climate anomalies over the South Atlantic and South (and Tropical) Indian 473 Oceans (Fig. 9), which can substantially modulate their impact on the continent (Hoell et al. 474 2017). 475

477 In other models (e.g. #CL7[sstano]-int.; Fig. A5), SA rainfall variability is not significantly related to ENSO at the interannual scale (Fig. 8a). In these models, interannual SRI variability 478 is primarily linked to the South Indian and South Atlantic Oceans (Fig. 8a), denoting changes 479 in the regional atmospheric circulation, *i.e.* changes in wind-stress modifying sensible and latent 480 heat fluxes (Fauchereau et al. 2003). Such regional changes in SSTs could also be associated 481 with the SAM (Ciasto et al. 2011), whose the component driven by ENSO (including the impact 482 on austral summer-rainfall) is not captured in most CMIP5 models (Lim et al. 2016). 483 Interestingly, although those regional climate anomalies are systematically biased, they can lead 484 485 to good representation of SA rainfall variability (Fig. 9), suggesting error compensations. Underestimations of ENSO anomalies in austral summer could however be at least partly 486 explained by misrepresentations of the seasonality in ENSO variability in some models (Fig. 487 488 A7). For instance, ENSO activity is peaking between March and August in IPSL models, and is slightly delayed in ACCESS1-3 (Fig. A7). This is not true for CCSM4 and CESM-BCG, 489 which show realistic seasonal timing in ENSO activity, even though largely overestimated (Fig. 490 A7). In some CCSM4 simulations (#CL8[sstano]-int; Fig. A5), wet conditions occur during El 491 Niño events (Fig. 8a), *i.e.* a reversed-sign association compared to observations. 492

493

At the QDV timescale, tropical SST variability in the central Pacific is far too weak in most CMIP5 models (Fig. 7b), suggesting large underestimations of IPO variability. In addition, according to Henley et al. (2017), CMIP5 models locate IPO variability too far west (#CL1, 2, 4, 8 and 12[sstvar]-QDV; Figs. 7b, A5). Some models thus simulate negative IPO anomalies associated with cold anomalies in the tropical Indian Ocean (#CL1, 21, 24[sstano]-QDV; Figs. 8b, A5). A skilful representation of the IPO teleconnection is however rarely associated with a good representation of SA rainfall variability (Fig. 9). We also systematically found SST dipole anomalies in both the South Atlantic and South Indian Oceans (Fig. 8b). Interestingly, although,
these climate anomalies in the adjacent oceans are biased in most models, they can lead to good
reproduction of SA rainfall variability (Fig. 9). This suggests error compensations at the QDV
scale also. Some models simulate weak or even reversed relationships between SA rainfall and
Pacific SSTs (Fig. 2b). For instance, in #CL11 [sstano]-QDV (Fig. A5), wet conditions are
linked to positive IPO (Fig. 8b).

507

At the IDV timescale, the PDO variability is systematically confined to the North Pacific in 508 most CMIP5 models (Fig. 7c), while it should extend further in the tropics in response to ENSO 509 510 forcing (Schneider and Cornuelle 2005). Very few simulations, which are the best performing in simulating SRI variability at this timescale (Fig. 2b), link wet conditions over SA to negative 511 PDO anomalies (#CL1-2[sstano]-IDV; Figs. 8c, 9, A5). These simulations also simulate cold 512 513 (warm) SST anomalies in the tropical (extra-tropical) Indian and South Atlantic Oceans (Fig. 8c). However, the same simulations tend to link SA rainfall to decadal ENSO-like SST 514 anomalies, reminiscent of negative IPO in the tropical Pacific Ocean (Fig. 8c). Indeed, many 515 simulations overestimate IPO-like variability in the equatorial Pacific at the IDV scale (e.g. 516 #CL1, 11[sstvar]-IDV; Figs. 7c, A5). Although this could highlight systematic biases in CMIP5 517 518 models (e.g. Fleming and Anchukaitis 2016), concomitance between IPO and PDO patterns might arise from internal climate variability. In-phase variability of these low-frequency modes 519 is very rare, and has not been observed at this timescale over the instrumental period (Fig. 3b-520 c). 521

522

#### 523 5. Sample size uncertainties and model capabilities

With an increasing contribution of internal climate variability, regional model evaluations could
be influenced by the sample sizes (*i.e.* length and number of simulations per model). This is

particularly true at decadal timescales, where historical runs only capture ~14 and ~7 life cycles of QDV and IDV, hence limiting the chance to match the observed "realisation". In this section, we thus discuss the capability of each model by quantifying the chance to reproduce SRI variance and its global SST teleconnections for every 113 year time-period though the course of all historical runs and using the longer-term piControl simulations (Fig. 10). The number of samples used to quantify the model capabilities is not constant, and should be used as an indicator of robustness (Fig. 10).

533

At the interannual timescale, half of the CMIP5 models show very good capability (> 80%) to 534 significantly simulate SRI variance equal to observation in historical and piControl runs (Fig. 535 10a). In addition, model capabilities are most of the time weaker in piControl runs than 536 historical runs (Fig. 10a), suggesting that interannual SA rainfall variability is strongly 537 modulated by internal climate variability in longer runs. The capability to simulate significant 538 similar SRI variance between models and observation progressively decreases at the QDV and 539 IDV timescales (Fig. 9a). At the QDV timescale, ~75 and ~90% of CMIP5 models show 540 moderate to low capability in historical and piControl runs, respectively (Fig. 9a). At the IDV 541 timescale, a third and half of the CMIP5 models show some capability using historical and 542 piControl runs, respectively (Fig. 9a). At the QDV and IDV scales, model capabilities are also 543 generally greater in piControl runs than in historical runs (Fig. 9). This suggests that, at these 544 decadal timescales, better performance could be obtained in many models using longer runs (or 545 large-ensembles, which also account better for internal climate variability). 546

547

548 More mixed results are identified when analysing simulated teleconnections between SRI and 549 global SST anomalies. At the interannual timescale, 50% and 70% of CMIP5 models show 550 moderate to good capability in historical and piControl runs, respectively (Fig. 9b). Better performance could have thus been found at the interannual scale using longer runs (or largeensembles). Similar results are found at the QDV timescales, even if very few models show good capabilities. Model capabilities are however insensitive to the sample sizes, and are always null, at the IDV timescale (Fig. 10b).

555

Interestingly, capabilities in simulating global SST-SA rainfall teleconnection are always 556 weaker than in SRI variance, which are generally greater at all timescales (Fig. 9a-b). This 557 suggest that misrepresentations of atmospheric bridges between the Pacific and SA, and its links 558 to the regional circulation (cf. Sect. 4.4), remain even through the course of piControl runs, and 559 are very little sensitive to internal climate variability. In this regard, GFDL-CM3 could be 560 considered as a reference in simulating both summer SA rainfall and their teleconnections at 561 the interannual timescale (Fig. 10a-b). Some models, such as CSIRO-Mk3-6-0 and, in 562 particular, MPI-ESM-LR, provide good capabilities to portray consistent interannual to QDV 563 fluctuations in both teleconnections and SRI variability (Fig. 10a-b). 564

565

#### 566 6. Atmospheric bridges

567

#### 6.1. Observed atmospheric anomalies associated with SRI variability

568 Observed atmospheric bridges between the Pacific and SA are examined through velocity 569 potential and stream function composite anomalies in the lower and upper troposphere (Fig. 570 11).

571

At the interannual timescale, La Niña SST events (which favour wet conditions over SA; Fig. 3c), are associated with large-scale lower-layer convergence over the western Pacific, and divergence over the eastern Pacific, and reverse signals in the upper troposphere (Fig. 11). This denotes conditions favourable to large-scale ascending motion over the Maritime Continent and

subsiding motions in the eastern Pacific, which is consistent with a westward shift and 576 intensification of the Walker circulation. According to Hoell et al. (2015), changes in vertical 577 winds and convection over the western Pacific result in tropospheric diabatic heating, which in 578 turn force a Gill-Matsuno response over the Indian Ocean basin and surrounding continents 579 (Fig. 11). The Gill-Matsuno response is materialized in the lower troposphere by significant 580 cyclonic circulation poleward and westward of the anomalous diabatic heating over the 581 Maritime Continent, while anticyclonic circulation is detected in the upper layers (Fig. 11). In 582 the Southern Hemisphere, this initiates a Rossby wave-train between the tropics and SA 583 (Hoskins and Ambrizzi 1993; Cook 2001), thereby evidenced by an anticyclonic ridge (Fig. 584 585 11). This contributes to an enhancement of the South Atlantic High. Dieppois et al. (2016) argued that westerlies driven by the South Atlantic High then converge with easterlies from the 586 Indian Ocean, leading to ascending motions and convection in SA (Fig. 11). This pattern also 587 588 corresponds to a westward shift of the SICZ, favouring wet conditions in SA.

589

Similar mechanisms are identified at the QDV and IDV scales, where both negative IPO and PDO anomalies are associated with a westward shift and intensification of the Walker-type circulation, as well as a Gill-Matsuno response over the Indian Ocean basin (Fig. 11). However, at the QDV timescale, the resulting Rossby wave-train shows a quasi-meridional propagation, and acts to enhance the South Indian High (Fig. 11). This promotes easterly moisture flux from the Indian Ocean (Dieppois et al. 2016), and convergence with south-easterly fluxes from the Atlantic (Fig. 11), increasing rainfall over SA.

597

At the interdecadal timescale, atmospheric anomalies are much weaker, consistently with the lower contributions of IDV to SA rainfall variability (Pohl et al. 2018). There, the Rossby wavetrain, evidenced by cyclonic circulation over subtropical SA, and anticyclonic circulation further north (Fig. 11), modulates the regional circulation over SA. At the same time, significant changes in the meridional circulations take place in the Southern Hemisphere, discernible as alternating cyclonic and anticyclonic circulations in the extra-tropics (Fig. 11). Dieppois et al. (2016) argued that such anomalies could help to enhance both the South Atlantic and South Indian Highs, and potentially the SAM (Malherbe et al. 2016), which then favours convergence and ascending motions over SA (Fig. 11).

607

608

#### 6.2. Atmospheric anomalies associated with SRI variability in CMIP5 models

Fig. 12 displays circulation composite anomalies in the lower troposphere as simulated by four
CMIP5 models with contrasted performances according to section 5.

611

In some models, neither rainfall variability nor their SST teleconnections are adequately 612 613 simulated (Fig. 10). In GISS-E2-R-CC, for instance, underestimations of La Niña SST anomalies at the interannual timescale lead to a weak response of the atmosphere. Significant, 614 but far too weak, ascending motions are identified over the western Pacific, and subsidence 615 occurs over the eastern Pacific (Fig. 12). This is consistent with a westward shift and 616 intensification of the Walker circulation, but the associated Gill-Matsuno response over the 617 Indian Ocean is far too weak (Fig. 12). At the QDV and IDV scales, none of these circulation 618 anomalies are simulated (Fig. 12). This is due to major difficulties in simulating IPO and PDO 619 variability in the equatorial Pacific (Figs. 8, 9). Large underestimations of ENSO variability, 620 which is a common feature in NASA-GISS models (Fig. A7), leads to underestimate SRI 621 variability. 622

623

In other models, rainfall variability at the interannual and QDV timescales is adequately reproduced, but as a response to different large-scale ocean-atmospheric processes (Fig. 10). In

IPSL-CM5B-LR, for instance, the relationship between SA rainfall and ENSO is reversed, and 626 consists of an eastward shift in the Walker circulation. Southward shifts of the South Atlantic 627 and South Indian Highs are also identified, as well as ascendance over the eastern coast of 628 Africa, potentially associated with warm SST there (Fig. 12). This increases rainfall over SA. 629 At the QDV and IDV scales, none of the observed circulation anomalies are simulated (Fig. 630 12), due to unrealistic IPO and PDO variability (Figs. 7-8). Rainfall QDV is therefore not 631 directly influenced by the Pacific Ocean, but by anomalously strong cyclonic circulations in the 632 subtropics. 633

634

635 GFDL-CM3 is the best performing model at the interannual timescale (Fig. 10). The westward shift and intensification of the Walker circulation, as well as the Gill-Matsuno response over 636 the Indian Ocean are well simulated (Fig. 12). The intensity and the location of the South 637 Atlantic High, and thus convergence and ascendance over SA (i.e. the SICZ activity), fluctuate 638 from one simulation to another (Fig. 12). Similarly, contrasting performances are obtained over 639 the Pacific Ocean at the QDV and IDV timescales (Fig. 12): negative IPO-like and PDO-like 640 circulation anomalies are detected in one simulation only. At these timescales, rainfall 641 variability is primarily driven by enhanced activity in the subtropical Highs in the Southern 642 643 Hemisphere, in approximate agreement with observations (Fig. 12).

644

MPI models perform well at the interannual and QDV timescales (Fig. 10). In MPI-ESM-LR, the westward shift and intensification of the Walker circulation associated with wet conditions in SA is realistic in all simulations at both timescales (Fig. 12). However, at the interannual timescale, the Gill-Matsuno response over the Indian Ocean in response to diabatic heating anomalies over the western Pacific is not reproduced (Fig. 12): this may reflect Indian Ocean SSTs, which are too cold, but further work is needed here. In MPI models, interannual rainfall variability is then not directly linked to the Pacific Ocean, but to regional changes in the South
Atlantic and South Indian Highs (Fig. 11), which could be related to the SAM (Ciasto et al.
2011). At the QDV timescale, the Gill-Matsuno response is simulated too far west, and is
reversed compared to observation (Figs. 11-12), consistently with too cold SSTs over the
Maritime continent (Fig. 8). Interestingly, strong anomalous Gill-Matsuno responses (*e.g.*r1i1p1) lead to overestimate SA rainfall QDV, while weak anomalous Gill-Matsuno response
(e.g. r3i1p1) lead to underestimations (Figs. 2, 12).

658

Taken together, the results of this section show that, while atmospheric bridges between the Pacific Ocean and SA are crucial at all timescales in the observations, only few CMIP5 models are able to reproduce it. In some models, simulated rainfall in SA is likely to be associated with error compensations and strongly biased large-scale mechanisms even in cases where regionalscale properties are realistically reproduced.

664

#### 665 **7. Discussion & Conclusion**

This study is a first assessment of CMIP5 model performances in simulating SA rainfall
variability and its teleconnections with large-scale modes of variability at different timescales.
Historical runs from 28 models, and their associated piControl run ensembles, have been used
to document the weight of sampling errors and internal climate variability.

670

Firstly, we examined the ability of CMIP5 models to simulate realistic summer SA rainfall variability, which exhibits three major timescales in observation (Dieppois et al. 2016): interannual (2–8 years), QDV (8–13 years) and IDV (15–28 years). CMIP5 models produce their own variability, but tend to perform better in simulating interannual timescales of SRI variability. Indeed, most models strongly underestimate rainfall variability at the QDV and IDV scales, suggesting a limited view of prolonged drought and hydro-meteorological risks in CMIP5 models over SA. Highest skills in simulating SRI QDV and IDV are however obtained with best performing models at the interannual timescale, suggesting cross-linkages in model biases between timescales which could be used to improve the future generations of climate models. These limitations in simulating SRI variability are partly due to spatial shifts in the core regions of rainfall variability.

682

Secondly, CMIP5 model performances in portraying global SST variability at the three different 683 timescales was assessed, as well as their teleconnections with SA rainfall. In observation, wet 684 685 rainfall conditions over SA are associated with cold SSTs in the Pacific, mostly driven by ENSO, the IPO and the PDO, which interact with regional climate anomalies in the South 686 Atlantic and South Indian Ocean (Dieppois et al. 2016; Pohl et al. 2018). Most models 687 reproduce La Niña effects on rainfall at the interannual timescale, in spite of biases in the 688 representation of ENSO (e.g. AchutaRao and Sperber 2006; Guilyardi et al. 2009). At the QDV 689 timescale, some models succeed in reproducing the association between the IPO and SA 690 rainfall, but IPO variability is systematically too weak, and extends too far west (Henley et al. 691 2017). Similarly at the IDV timescale, very few models reproduce negative PDO anomalies. 692 693 Yet, good performances in simulating the large-scale teleconnections with the Pacific do not systematically lead to good representation of SA rainfall variability. This is because Pacific 694 modes of variability are most of the time associated with biased regional climate anomalies in 695 the adjacent oceans to SA, which, according to Hoell et al. (2017), can substantially modulate 696 their impact on the continent. 697

698

Some CMIP5 simulations do not reproduce, or even significantly reverse, the average link
 between SA rainfall and Pacific SST variability at the interannual and QDV scales. Even though

this result suggests strong model limitations, such an unlikely configuration has already been 701 observed in rare occasions: during the exceptionally strong El Niño event of 1997/98, for 702 instance (Lyon and Mason 2007). In IPSL models and ACCESS1-3, such an unlikely 703 704 association between SA rainfall and El Niño anomalies could be due to errors in modelling the seasonality of ENSO (Fig. A7). CMIP5 model limitations in fully-capturing the relationship 705 between the SAM and ENSO, and their combined impact on summer-rainfall in the Southern 706 707 Hemisphere, could also be crucial, as suggested in Lim et al. (2016). However, such errors do not systematically impact the realism of simulated rainfall variability here. This is because of 708 error compensations, mostly resulting from substantial overestimation of SST variability in the 709 710 South Atlantic and South Indian Oceans, leading to appropriate simulations of SA rainfall variability. 711

712

713 All together these results also highlight the potential importance of the South Atlantic and Indian Ocean SSTs for SA rainfall, as suggested in earlier studies (Nicholson and Kim 1997; 714 Reason 1998 2001; Reason et al. 1999; Hoell et al. 2015, 2017, 2018; Morioka et al. 2015), and 715 in modulating the skills of CMIP5 models. They also emphasize the need for process-oriented 716 studies rather than merely descriptive work for model evaluation, since statistically coherent 717 regional variability can be obtained from biased large-scale teleconnections and mechanisms. 718 This issue is of crucial importance for operational seamless predictions and future climate 719 projections (e.g. Mason 1998; Landman and Beraki 2012; Beraki et al. 2014; Landman et al 720 2017). 721

722

Thirdly, the respective contributions of model errors and internal climate variability to overall uncertainties have been disentangled using probabilistic multi-scale clustering. This new methodology is strongly recommended for future model evaluation studies at regional and

decadal scales to assess and narrow the impact of internal climate variability. At the global 726 727 scale, model uncertainties in SST variability are primarily driven by differences from one model to another. At the regional scale, *i.e.* SA rainfall variability and associated teleconnections, 728 model uncertainties are also mainly related to differences in model physics at the interannual 729 timescale. At the QDV and IDV scales, however, individual simulations from the same models, 730 or comparable models, progressively differentiate, which, consistently with Keenlyside et al. 731 732 (2008), suggests larger contributions of internal climate variability. Uncertainties related to the sample size (length and number of simulations) have also been assessed using piControl runs, 733 and suggest that better performances could be obtained, at least on interannual and QDV scales, 734 in many CMIP5 models using longer-runs. Better impact-assessment of future prolonged 735 drought and hydro-meteorological risks over SA could therefore be obtained using large-736 ensemble (e.g. Kay et al. 2015). 737

738

#### 739 Acknowledgements

ERSST.v4, 20CR.v2, GPCC.v7 and COBE SST2 data were provided by 740 the NOAA/OAR/ESRL PSD, Boulder, Colorado, USA. from their website 741 at http://www.esrl.noaa.gov/psd/. The CRU TS 3.24.1 rainfall field were available from the Centre 742 743 for Environmental Data Archival (CEDA) at http://catalogue.ceda.ac.uk/uuid/3f8944800cc48e1cbc29a5ee12d8542d. The authors would 744 like to thank Noel Keenlyside, Thomas Toniazzo and Yushi Morioka for their helpful 745 discussions. 746

747

748 **References** 

AchutaRao K, Sperber KR (2006) ENSO simulation of coupled ocean-atmosphere models: are
 the current models better? Clim Dyn 27:1–15

- Allan RJ, Lindesay JA, Reason CJC (2003) Multidecadal variability in the climate system over
   the Indian Ocean region during the austral summer. J Clim 8:185 –1873.
- Ault TR, Cole JE, St. George S (2012) The amplitude of decadal to multidecadal variability in
- precipitation simulated by state-of-the-art climate models. Geophys Res Lett 39: L21705.
  doi: 10.29/2012GL053424..
- Ault TR, Deser C, Newman M, Emile-Geay J (2013) Characterizing decadal to centennial
  variability in the equatorial Pacific during the last millennium. Geophys Res Lett 40:3450–
  3456.
- 759 Ba J, Keenlyside N, Latif M, Park W, Ding H, Lohmann K, Mignot J, Menary M, Ottera O,
- Wouters B, Salas y Melia D, Oka A, Belluci A, Volodin E (2014) A multi-model comparison
  for Atlantic multidecadal variability. Clim Dyn 9:2333-2348.
- Beraki AF, DeWitt DG, Landman WA, Olivier C (2014) Dynamical Seasonal Climate
  Prediction Using an Ocean-Atmosphere Coupled Climate Model Developed in Partnership
  between South Africa and the IRI. J Clim 27:1719–1741.
- Capotondi A, Wittenberg A, Masina S (2006) Spatial and temporal structure of Tropical Pacific
- interannual variability in 20th century coupled simulations. Ocean Modelling 15:274–278.
- 767 Ciasto LM, Alexander MA, Deser C, and England MH (2011) On the persistence of cold-season
- SST anomalies associated with the Annular Mode. J Clim 24:2500–2515.
- Compo GP, Whitaker JS, and Sardeshmukh PD (2006) Feasibility of a 100 year reanalysis using
   only surface pressure data. Bull Amer Met Soc 87:175–190.
- 771 Compo GP, Whitaker JS, Sardeshmukh PD, Matsui N, Allan RJ, Yin X, Gleason BE, Vose
- RS, Rutledge G, Bessemoulin P, Brönniman S, Brunet M, Crouthamel RI, Grant AN,.
- Groisman PY, Jones JD, Kruk M, Kruger AC, Marshall GJ, Maugeri M, Mok HY, Nordli
- Ø, Ross TF, Trigo RM, Wang XL, Woodruff SD, Worley SJ (2011) The twentieth century
- reanalysis project. Quaterly J Roy Meteorol Soc 137:1–28.

- Conway D (2015) Climate and southern Africa's water-energy-food nexus. Nat Clim Change
  5:837–846.
- Cook KH (2001) A Southern Hemisphere wave response to ENSO with implications for
   southern Africa precipitation. J Atmos Sci 15:2146–2162.
- 780 Crétat J, Pohl B, Dieppois B, Berthou S, Pergaud J (2018) The Angola Low: relationship with
- southern African rainfall and ENSO. Climate Dynamics Published online.
   doi.org/10.1007/s00382-018-4222-3
- 783 Crétat J, Richard Y, Pohl B, Rouault M, Reason CJC, Fauchereau N (2012) Recurrent daily
- rainfall patterns over South Africa and associated dynamics during the core of the austral
  summer. Int J Climatol 32:261–273.
- De Viron O, Dickey JO, Ghil M (2013) Global modes of variability. Geophys Res Let 40:1832–
  1837.
- Deser C, Phillips A, Bourdette V, Teng H (2012) Uncertainty in climate change projections:
  the role of internal climate variability. Clim Dyn 38:527–546.
- Dieppois B, Rouault M, New M (2015) The impact of ENSO on Southern African rainfall in
   CMIP5 ocean atmosphere coupled climate models. Clim Dyn 45:2425–2442.
- Dieppois B, Pohl B, Rouault M, New M, Lawler D, Keenlyside N (2016) Interannual to
   interdecadal variability of winter and summer southern African rainfall, and their
   teleconnections. J Geophys Res-Atmos 121: 6215–6239
- Di Lorenzo E, Liguori G, Schneider N, Furtado JC, Anderson BT, Alexander MA (2015) ENSO
   and meridional models: A null hypothesis for Pacific climate variability. Geophys Res Let
   42:9440–9448.
- Fauchereau N, Trzaska S, Richard Y, Roucou P, Camberlin P (2003) Sea-surface temperature
   co-variability in the southern Atlantic and Indian Oceans and its connections with the
   atmospheric circulation in the Southern Hemisphere. Int J Clim 23:663–677.

- Fleming LE, Anchukaitis KJ (2016) North Pacific decadal variability in the CMIP5 last
  millennium simulations. Clim Dyn 47:3783–3801.
- <sup>803</sup> Ghil M, Allen MR, Dettinger MD, Ide K, Kondrashov D, Mann ME, Robertson AW, Sauders
- A, Tian Y, Varadi F, Yiou P (2002) Advanced spectral methods for climatic time series.
  Reviews of Geophysics 40:3-1-3-41.
- <sup>806</sup> Guilyardi E, Wittenberg A, Fedorov A, Collins M, Wang C, Capotondi A, van Oldenborg GJ,
- Stockdate T (2009) Understanding El Niño in Ocean-Atmosphere General Circulation
  Models: Progress and Challenges. Bull Amer Meteor Soc 90:325–340.
- Harris I, Jones PD, Osborn TJ, Lister DH (2014) Updated high-resolution grids of monthly
  climatic observations the CRU TS3.10 Dataset. Int J Clim 34:623–642.
- 811 Hart NCG, Reason CJC, Fauchereau N (2012) Cloud bands over southern Africa: seasonality,
- contribution to rainfall variability and modulation by the MJO. Clim Dyn 41:119–1212.
- Hawkins E, Sutton R (2009) The potential to Narrow Uncertainty in Regional Climate
  Predictions. Bull Amer Meteor Soc 90:1095–1108.
- Henley BJ, Meehl G, Power SB, Folland CK, King A, Brown JN, Karoly DJ, Delage F, Gallant
- AJE, Freund M, Neukom R (2017) Spatial and temporal agreement in climate model simulations of the Interdecadal Pacific Oscillation. Environ Res Lett 12:044011.
- Hermes JC, Reason CJC (2005) Ocean Model Diagnosis of Interannual Coevolving SST
  Variability in the South Indian and South Atlantic Oceans. J Clim 18:2864–2882.
- Hewitson BC, Crane RG (2006) Consensus between GCM climate change projections with
  empirical downscaling: precipitation downscaling over South Africa. Int J Clim 26:1315–
  1337.
- Hiraha S, Ishii M, Fukuda Y (2014) Centennial-scale sea surface temperature analysis and its
  uncertainty. J Clim 27:57–75.

825	Hoell A, Funk C, Magadzire T, Zinke J, Husak G (2015) El Niño-Southern Oscillation diversity
826	and Southern Africa teleconnections during Austral Summer. Clim Dyn 45:1583–1599.
827	Hoell A, Funk C, Zinke J, Harrison L (2017) Modulation of the Southern Africa precipitation
828	response to the El Niño Southern Oscillation by the subtropical Indian Ocean Dipole. Clim
829	Dyn 48:2529–2540.
830	Hoell A, Cheng L (2018) Austral summer Southern Africa precipitation extremes forced by the
831	El Niño Southern Oscillation and the subtropical Indian Ocean Dipole. Clim Dyn 50:3219-
832	3236.
833	Hoskins BJ, Ambrizzi T (1993) Rossby Wave Propagation on a Realistic Longitudinally
834	Varying Flow. J Atmos Sci 50:1661–1671.
835	Huang B, Banzon VF, Freeman E, Lawrimore J, Liu W, Peterson TC, Smith TM, Thorne PW,
836	Woodruff SD, Zhang HM (2015) Extended Reconstructed Sea Surface Temperature Version
837	4 (ERSST.v4). Part I: Upgrades and Intercomparisons. J Clim 28:911–930.
838	Huang B, Thorne PW, Smith TM, Liu W, Lawrimore J, Banzon F, Zhang H-M, Peterson TC,
839	Menne M (2015) Further Exploring and Quantifying Uncertainties or Extended
840	Reconstructed Sea Surface Temperature (ERSST) Version 4 (v4). J Clim 29:3119–3142.
841	James R, Washington R, Abiodun B, Kay G, Mutemi J, Pokam W, Hart N, Artan G, Senior C
842	(2018) Evaluating climate models with an African lens. Bull Amer Meteor Soc 99:313–336.
843	Jun M, Knutti R, Nychka DW (2008) Local eigenvalue of CMIP3 climate model errors. Tellus
844	A 60:992–1000.
845	Kalogomou EA, Lennard C, Shongwe M, Pinto I, Favre A, Kent M, Hewitson B, Dosio A,
846	Nikulin G, Panitz H-J, Buchner M (2013) A Diagnostic Evaluation of Precipitation in
847	CORDEX Models over Southern Africa. J Clim 26:9477–9506.
848	Kane RP (2009) Periodicities, ENSO effects and trends of some South African rainfall series:
849	an update. S Afr J Sci 105:199–207.

350	Kay JE, Deser C, Phillips A, Mai A, Hannay C, Strand G, Arblaster JM, Bates SC, Danabasog	glu
-----	---	-----

- G, Edwards J, Holland M, Kushner P, Lamarque J, Lawrence D, Lindsay K, Middleton A,
- Munoz E, Neale R, Oleson K, Polvani L, Vertenstein M (2015) The Community Earth
- 853 System Model (CESM) Large Ensemble Project: A Community Resource for Studying
- Climate Change in the Presence of Internal Climate Variability. Bull Amer Meteor Soc 96:
- 855 1333–1349
- Keenlyside NS, Latif M, Jungclauss J, Kornblueh L, Roeckner E (2008) Advancing decadalscale climate prediction in the North Atlantic sector. Nature 453:84–88.
- Klein SA, Soden BJ, Lau NC (1999) Remote sea surface variations during ENSO: evidence
  for a tropical atmospheric bridge. J Clim 12:917–932.
- Knutti R. (2010) The end of model democracy? Climatic Change 102:395–404.
- Knutti R, Meehl GA, Allen R, Stainforth DA (2006) Constraing climate sensitivity from the
  seasonal cycle in surface temperature. J Clim 19:4224–4233.
- Laepple T, Huybers P (2014) Ocean surface temperature variability: Large model-data differences at decadal and longer periods. Proc Natl Acad Sci 111:16682–16687.
- Landman WA, Beraki A (2012) Multi-model forecast skill for mid-summer rainfall over
  southern Africa. Int J Clim 32:303–314.
- Landman WA, Engelbrecht F, Hewitson B, Malherbe J, van der Merwe J (2017) Towards
  bridging the gap between climate change projections and maize producers in South Africa.
- 869 Theor Appl Climatol 132:1153–1163.
- Lazenby C, Todd M, Wang Y (2016) Climate model simulation of South Indian Ocean
  Convergence Zone: Mean state and variability. Clim Res 68:59–71.
- Lee T, Waliser DE, Li JL, Landerer FW, Gierach MM (2013) Evaluation of CMIP3 and CMIP5
- 873 Wind Stress Climatology Unising Satellite Measurements and Atmospheric Reanalysis
- 874 Produc. J Clim 26:5810–5826.

- Lim E-P, Hendon HH, Arblastger JM, Delage F, Nguyen H, Min S-K, Wheeler MC (2016) The 875
- 876 impact of the Southern Annular Mode on Future changes in Southern Hemisphere rainfall. Geophys Res Lett 43:7160-7167. 877
- Lin J-L (2007) The Double ITCZ Problem in IPCC AR4 Couple GCMs: Ocean-Atmosphere 878 Feedback Analysis. J Clim 20:4497–4525. 879
- Lindesay JA (1988) South African rainfall, the Southern Oscillation and a Southern Hemisphere 880 semi-annual cycle. J Climatol 8:17-30. 881
- Lübbecke JF, Böning CW, Keenlyside NS, Xie S-P (2010) On the connection between 882
- Benguela and equatorial Atlantic Niños and the role of the South Atlantic Anticyclone. J 883 Geophys Res-Oceans 115:C0915. doi:10.1029/2009JC005964.

- Lyon B, Mason SJ (2007) The 1997-98 summer season in southern Africa. Part I: Observations. 885 J Clim 20:5134–5148. 886
- 887 Macron C, Pohl B, Richard Y, Bessafi M (2014) How do tropical-temperate troughs form and develop over southern Africa? J Clim 27:1633–1647. 888
- Malherbe J, Landman WA, Engelbrecht FA (2014) The bi-decadal rainfall cycle, Southern 889
- Annular Mode and tropical cyclones over the Limpopo River Basin, southern Africa. Clim 890 891 Dyn 42:3121–3138.
- 892 Malherbe J, Dieppois B, Maluleke P, Van Staden M, Pillay DL(2016) South African droughts and decadal variability. Nat. Hazards 80:657-681. 893
- Mann ME, Park J (1994) Global modes of surface temperature variability on interannual to 894 century timescales. J Geophys Res-Atmos 99:25819-25833. 895
- Mantua NJ, Hare SR (2002) The Pacific Decadal Oscillation. J Oceanogr 58:35-44. 896
- Mantua NJ, Hare SR, Zhang Y, Wallace JM, Francis RC (1997), A Pacific Interdecadal Climate 897
- Oscillation with Impacts on Salmon Production. Bull Amer Meteor Soc 78:1069–1079. 898

- Mason SJ (1998) Seasonal forecasting of South Africa rainfall using a non-linear discriminant
   analysis model. Int J Clim 18:147–164.
- Mason SJ, Jury M (1997) Climatic variability and change over the Southern Africa: a reflection
   on underlying processes. Prog Phys Geo 21:23–50.
- Menary MB, Hodson DLR, Robson JI, Sutton RT, Wood RA, Hunt JA (2015) Exploring the
- 904 impact of CMIP5 model biases on the simulation of North Atlantic decadal variability.
  905 Geophys Res let 14:5926–5934.
- Morioka Y, Engelbrecht F, Behera S (2015) Potential sources of multidecadal climate
  variability over southern Africa. J Clim 28:8695–8709.
- Munday C, Washington R (2016) Circulation controls on southern African precipitation in
   coupled models: The role of the Angola Low. J Geophys Res-Atmos 122:861–877.
- Munday C, Washington R (2018) Systematic Climate Model Rainfall Biases over Southern
  Africa: Links to Moisture Circulation and Topography. J Clim 31:7533–7548.
- 912 Newman M, Alexander MA, Ault T, Cobb KM, Deser C, Di Lorenzo E, Mantua NJ, Miller AJ,
- 913 Minobe S, Nakamura H, Schneider N, Vimont DJ, Phillips AS, Scott JD, Smith CA (2016)
- The Pacific Decadal Oscillation, Revisited. J Clim 29:4399–4427.
- Nicholson SE, Kim J (1997) The relationship of the El Niño-Southern Oscillation to African
  rainfall. Int J Clim 17:117–135.
- 917 Nikulin G, Jones C, Giorgi F, Asrar G, Buchner M, Cerezo-Mota R, Christensen OB, Déqué
- 918 M, Fernandez J, Hansler A, van Meijgaard E, Samuelsson P, Sylla MB, Sushama L (2012)
- 919 Precipitaiton Climatology in an Ensemble of CORDEX-Africa Regional Climate
  920 Simulations. J Clim 25:6057–6078.
- Pohl B, Dieppois B, Crétat J, Lawler DM, Rouault M (2018) From synoptic to interdecadal
  variability in southern African rainfall: towards a unified view across timescales. J Clim
  31:5845–5872.

- Power S, Casey T, Folland CK, Colman A, Mehta V (1999) Inter-decadal modulation of the
  impact of ENSO on Australia. Clim Dyn 15:319–323.
- Power S, Delage F, Wang G, Smith I, Kociuba G (2017) Apparent limitations in the ability of
  CMIP5 climate models to simulate recent multi-decadal change in surface temperature:
  implications for global temperature projections. Clim Dyn 49:53–69.
- Ratnam JV, Behera SK, Masumoto Y, Yamagata T (2014) Remote effects of El Niño and
  Modoki events on the Austral Summer Precipitation of Southern Africa. J Clim 27:3802–
  3815.
- Rayner NA, Parker DE, Horton EB, Folland CK, Alexander LV, Rowell DP, Kent EC, Kaplan
  A (2003) Global analyses of sea surface temperature, sea ice, and night marine air
  temperature since the late nineteenth century. J Geophys Res-Atmos 108:4407.
  doi:10.1029/2002JD002670
- Reason CJC (1998) Warm and cold events in the southeast Atlantic/southwest Indian Ocean
  region and potential impacts on circulation and rainfall over southern Africa. Meteorog
  Atmos Phys 69:49–65.
- Reason CJC (2001) Subtropical Indian Ocean SST dipole events and southern African rainfall.
  Geophys Res Lett 28:2225–2227.
- Reason CJC, Mulenga H (1999) Relationships between South African rainfall and SST
  anomalies in the southwest Indian Ocean. Int J Climatol 19:1651–1673.
- Reason CJC, Smart S (2015) Tropical south east Atlantic warm events ad associated rainfall
  anomalies over southern Africa. Front Environ Sci 3:1-11. doi:10.3389/fenvs.2015.00024
- Reynolds RW, Rayner NA, Smith TM, Stokes DC, Wang W (2002) An improved in situ and
- satellite SST analysis for climate. J. Clim., **15**, 1609–1625.

- Richard Y, Fauchereau N, Poccard I, Rouault M, Trzaska S (2001) XXth century droughts in
  Southern Africa: spatial and temporal variability, teleconnections with oceanic and
  atmospheric conditions. *Int. J. Clim.*, 21, 873–885.
- Ropelewski CF, Halpert MS (1987) Global and regional scale precipitation patterns associated
  with the El Niño/Southern Oscillation. Mon Wea Rev 115:1606–1626.
- Ropelewski CF, Halpert MS (1989) Precipitation patterns associated with the high indices
  phase of the southern oscillation. J Clim 2:268–284.
- Rouault M (2012) Bi-annual intrusion of tropical water in the northern Benguela upwelling.
- 955 Geophys Res Lett 39:L12606. doi:10.1029/2012GL052099
- Rouault M, Richard Y (2005) Intensity and spatial extent of droughts in Southern Africa.
  Geophys Res Lett 32:L15702. doi:10.1029/2005GL022436.
- Sarachick ES, Cane MA (2010) The El Niño-Southern Oscillation Phenomenom. Cambridge
  University Press, Cambridge.
- Schneider N, Cornuelle BD (2005) The forcing of the Pacific Decadal Oscillation. J Clim
  18:4355–4373.
- 962 Schneider U, Becker A, Finger P, Meyer-Christoffer A, Ziese M, Rudolf B (2014) GPCC's new
- land surface precipitation climatology based on quality controlled in situ data and its role in
  quantifying the global water cycle. Theor Appl Climatol 115:15–40.
- 965 Shimodaira H (2002) An approximately unbiased tests of phylogenetic tree selection.
- 966 Systematic Biology 51:492–508.
- Shimodaira H (2004) Approximately unbiased tests of regions using multistep-multiscale
  bootstrap resampling. Annals of Statistics 32:2616–2641.
- <sup>969</sup> Taylor KE, Stouffler RJ, Meehl GA (2012) An overview of CMIP5 and the experiment design.
- 970 Bull Am Meteorol Soc 93:485–498.

971	Todd MC, Washington R (1999) Circulation anomalies associated with tropical-temperate
972	troughts in southern Africa and the southwest Indian Ocean. Clim Dyn 15:937–951.

- 973 Tourre YM, Cibot C, Terray L, White WB, Dewitte B (2005) Quasi-decadal and inter-decadal
- climate fluctuations in the Pacific Ocean from a CGCM. Geophys Res Lett 32:L07710.
- 975 doi:10.1029/2004GL022087
- Tourre YM, Kushnir Y, White WB (1999) Evolution of interdecadal variability in sea level
  pressure, sea surface temperature, and upper ocean temperature over the Pacific Ocean. J
  Phys Oceanogr 9:1528–1541.
- 79 Tourre YM, Rajagopalan B, Kushnir Y, Barlow M, White WB (2001) Patterns of coherent
- 980 ocean decadal and interdecadal climate signals in the Pacific basin during the 20<sup>th</sup> century.
- 981 Geophys Res Lett 28:2069–2072.
- 782 Trenberth K (1997) The Definition of El Niño. Bull Am Meteorol Soc 78:2771–2778.
- Tyson PD (1981) Atmospheric circulation variations and the occurrence of extended wet and
  dry spells over southern Africa. J Climatol 1:115–130.
- Tyson PD (1986) *Climatic Change and variability over southern Africa*. Oxford University
  Press, Cape Town.
- Venegas S, Mysak LA, Straub DN (1997) Atmosphere-ocean coupled variability in the South
  Atlantic. J Clim 10:2904–2920.
- 989 Vigaud N, Richard Y, Rouault M, Fauchereau N (2009) Moisture transport between the South
- Atlantic Ocean and southern Africa: relationships with summer rainfall and associated
  dynamics. Clim Dyn 32:113–123.
- Ward JH (1963) Hierarchical Grouping to Optimize an Objective Fundion. Journal of the
   American Statistical Association 58:236–244.
- 994 Washington R, Preston A (2006) Extreme wet years over southern Africa: Role of Indian Ocean
- sea surface temperatures. J Geophys Res-Atmos 111:D15104. doi:10.1029/2005JD006724

996	Wu Z, Huang NE, Long SR, Peng C-K (2007) On the trend, detrending, and variability of
997	nonlinear and nonstationary time series. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 104:14889-14894.
998	Yue S, Wang C (2004) The Mann-Kendall test modified by effective sample size to detect trend
999	in serially correlated hydrological series. Water Resources Management 18:201–218.
1000	Zhang Q, Kornich H, Holmgren K (2013) How well do reanalyses represent the southern
1001	African precipitation. Clim Dyn 40:951–962.
1002	
1003	
1004	
1005	
1006	
1007	
1008	
1009	
1010	
1011	
1012	
1013	
1014	
1015	
1016	
1017	
1018	
1019	
1020	

- **Table 1** Summarized information on observation data and CMIP5 models used in the study.
- 1024**Table 2** Different components of CMIP5 CGCMs used in the study. Shades of orange, blue,
- 1025 green and grey indicate shared components between CGCMs from different institutions.
- 1026

Fig. 1 Summer (NDJF) differences between simulated and observed SA rainfall fields. a 1027 1028 Multimodel mean of 95 historical runs from 28 CMIP5 models of summer-rainfall average minus the CRU TS 3.24.01 observations, compared to the NDJF rainfall climatology (black 1029 dashed contours), between 1901 and 2005. Statistical significance of differences in mean (white 1030 *colours*) has been estimated using a Student *t*-test at p = 0.05. b CMIP5 Multimodel agreement 1031 in the difference in summer-rainfall average compared with observation **c** Spatial distribution 1032 1033 of the summer-rainfall region in the CMIP5 models (coloured contours refer to each individual 1034 model; cf. Table 1) and in the CRU TS 3.24.01 observations (grey shaded). d Multimodel 1035 agreement in the location of the summer-rainfall region in the CMIP5 models compared to 1036 observation (grey contour). The summer-rainfall region, which is used to calculate the SRI, has been defined as the area in which the wettest month of the year occur between November and 1037 1038 February on average between 1901 (1850/60) and 2005 in the observations (CMIP5 models).

- 1039
- 1040
- 1041
- 1042
- 1043
- 1044

Fig. 2 Timescales of variability in the simulated and observed SRI. a Comparison between FFT 1045 spectra from observation (CRU TS 3.24.01: 1901–2005) and 95 historical runs from 28 CMIP5 1046 models (1850/60–2005). Bold contour lines show the probability limits at p = 0.05 based on 1047 1048 1000 Monte Carlo simulations of the red noise background spectrum. White crosses indicate area where FFT power spectral density could have been influenced by the sampling period. **b** 1049 1050 Centred Ratio of standard deviation (1-rSD), here expressed in percentage, between simulations 1051 and observation according to the three dominant time-scales of variability. Bold contour lines 1052 indicates CMIP5 models simulating significantly equal SRI variance than observations at p =0.05 according to the Fisher's F-test. Summary of the mean biases per timescales is provided 1053 1054 on the bottom left corner (all model simulations: black; model simulation overestimating [underestimating] interannual variability: blue [red]). 1055

1056

1057 Fig. 3 Summary of observed summer (NDJF) SA rainfall variability and its teleconnection with global SSTs at three different timescales. a Spatial patterns of rainfall standard deviations in 1058 1059 observations (CRU TS 3.24.01). b Observed spatial patterns of global SST standard deviations 1060 (ERSSTv.4). Bold red contour lines delineates area where observed interannual to IDV variance are significantly greater than the red noise background spectrum at p = 0.05 based on 1000 1061 1062 Monte Carlo simulations. c Observed global SST composite anomalies (ERSSTv.4) during enhanced SRI fluctuations ( $\pm 1$  SD: wet years minus dry years) at the three different timescales. 1063 Statistical significance (contours) has been estimated by testing the difference in mean between 1064 SST anomalies during periods of rainfall variability greater and lower than 1 SD, through a 1065 modified *t*-test accounting for pseudoreplication in the series at p = 0.05. Displayed composite 1066 SST anomalies refer to wet conditions in SA, but are strictly opposite during dry conditions (cf. 1067 Fig. A1). 1068

Fig. 4 Evaluation of model performance and their diversity in simulating SA rainfall variance 1070 at three different timescales. a-c Taylor diagram of summer (NDJF) rainfall variance spatial 1071 patterns of 95 historical runs from 28 CMIP5 models (coloured dot referring to each individual 1072 1073 *model*; cf. Table 1) and from observations (CRU TS 3.24.01; grey dot) at the IDV to interannual timescales. The diagram is a function of the root mean square (RMS, green dashed circles-x-1074 axis), the correlation coefficient (black dashed lines-y-axis) and the SD (blue dashed compared 1075 to solid circles-x-axis). Since the values are normalized the reference (observation values) has 1076 1077 a SD of 1. d Cluster diversity as determined using AHC, and in assessing significance of each cluster using multiscale bootstrapping. Colours indicate different clusters, and non-significantly 1078 1079 clustered simulations are in white. Simulated rainfall fields have been remapped on a regular  $0.5^{\circ} \times 0.5^{\circ}$  resolution grid to be compared to observation. 1080

1081

1082 Fig. 5 Summer-rainfall variance over SA at three different timescales in CMIP5 models. a-c Spatial patterns of rainfall standard deviations in six selected clusters from full CMIP5 1083 1084 multimodel ensemble at the interannual to IDV timescales. Dark red to dark blue contours lines 1085 on the bottom panels delineates areas where IDV to interannual variance are significantly different than in observations at p = 0.05 according to the Fisher's F-test. The selected six 1086 clusters are ranked according to their variance (var), here expressed as the percentage of 1087 simulations in each cluster. Spatial correlations (cor[obs.]) between simulated and observed 1088 patterns are displayed for information purpose. Asterisks indicate significant Pearson's 1089 correlations at p = 0.05 between the cluster and the observed pattern. Note that QDV and IDV 1090 1091 standard deviations have been multiplied by 2 for illustrative purpose. Simulated rainfall fields have been remapped on a regular  $0.5^{\circ} \times 0.5^{\circ}$  resolution grid to be compared to observation. 1092

Fig. 6 Evaluation of model performance and their diversity in simulating NDJF SST variance and global SST composite anomalies at three different timescales. a Taylor diagram of NDJF SST variance spatial patterns of 95 historical runs from 28 CMIP5 models (coloured dot referring to each individual model; cf. Table 1) and from observations (ERSSTv.4; grey dot) at the IDV to interannual timescales. **b** as for **a** but for SST composite anomalies during enhanced SRI (±1 SD: wet years minus dry years). c Cluster diversity for global SST variance and composite anomalies as determined using AHC, and in assessing significance of each cluster using multiscale bootstrapping. Colours indicate different clusters, and non-significantly clustered simulations are in white. 

Fig. 7 NDJF global SST variance at three different timescales in CMIP5 models. a-c Spatial patterns of global SST standard deviations in six selected clusters from full CMIP5 multimodel ensemble at the interannual to IDV timescales. Dark red to dark blue contours lines delineates areas where SST variance are significantly different than in observations at p = 0.05 according to the Fisher's F-test. The selected six clusters are ranked according to their variance (var), here expressed as the percentage of simulations in each cluster. Spatial correlations (cor[obs.]) between simulated and observed patterns are displayed for information purpose. Asterisks indicate significant Pearson's correlations at p = 0.05 between clusters and the observed pattern.

Fig. 8 as Fig. 7 but for global SST composite anomalies in the CMIP5 models. *Black and grey* 1119 contours indicate that statistical significance of composite anomalies was reached in 50% of 1120 the model defining the cluster. Composite anomalies and statistical significances have been 1121 1122 estimated as defined in Figure 3. The selected six clusters are ranked according to their variance (var), here expressed as the percentage of simulations in each cluster. Spatial correlations 1123 (cor[obs.]) between simulated and observed patterns are displayed for information purpose. 1124 Asterisks indicate significant Pearson's correlations at p = 0.05 between clusters and the 1125 observed pattern. 1126

1127

Fig. 9 Comparison of performances in simulating SRI variability and associated SST 1128 teleconnections in the different ocean basins. Percentage of CMIP5 simulations associated with 1129 contrasted performances in SST variability and associated teleconnections has been quantified. 1130 1131 +SST/+SRI refers to simulations with good SRI variability (i.e. significantly equal variance according to a Fisher F-test at p = 0.05) and good SST teleconnection patterns (*i.e.* Person 1132 correlations with observation  $\geq 0.5$ ). OppSST indicates simulations with good SRI variability, 1133 1134 but opposite SST teleconnection patterns (*i.e.* Person correlation with observation < 0). +SST/-SRI refers to simulations with poor SRI variability (i.e. not significantly equal variance 1135 according to a Fisher F-test at p = 0.05), but with good SST teleconnection patterns. -SST/+SRI 1136 denotes simulations with good SRI variability, but with poor SST teleconnection patterns (i.e. 1137 Person correlations with observation < 0.5). 1138

1139

1140

1141

**Fig. 10** Sample size uncertainties and model capabilities at the three different timescales. **a** Capability to simulate observed SRI variance (significant equal variance according to a Fisher F-test at p = 0.05) in all historical runs from the 28 CMIP5 models (*top*), and in their associated pi-Control runs (*bottom*). **b** Capability to simulate similar teleconnections (*i.e.* Pearson correlations  $\geq 0.5$ ) in all historical runs from the 28 CMIP5 models (*top*), and in their associated pi-Control runs (*bottom*). **b** Capability to simulate similar teleconnections (*i.e.* Pearson correlations  $\geq 0.5$ ) in all historical runs from the 28 CMIP5 models (*top*), and in their associated pi-Control runs (*bottom*). Grey dot sizes refer to the number of sampled used to estimate the model capabilities, and should be used as an indicator of robustness.d

1150

**Fig. 11** Atmospheric bridges between the Pacific Ocean and SA in 20CR.v2c. NDJF velocity potential ( $\varphi$ ; *shaded*) and stream function ( $\psi$ ; *contours*) composite anomalies between 850 and 600 hPa (*left*), and between 400 and 150 hPa (*right*), during enhanced SRI fluctuations (±1 SD: wet years minus dry years) at the three different timescales. Composite anomalies and statistical significances have been estimated as defined in Figure 3. Only significant velocity potential and stream function anomalies at p = 0.05 are displayed. Note: IDV anomalies are multiplied by 1.5 to be clearly displayed.

1158

**Fig. 12** Atmospheric bridges between the Pacific Ocean and SA in selected CMIP5 models. **ac** Simulated NDJF velocity potential ( $\varphi$ ; *shaded*) and stream function ( $\psi$ ; *contours*) composite anomalies between 850 and 600 hPa during enhanced SRI fluctuations ( $\pm 1$  SD: wet years minus dry years) at the three different timescales. Composite anomalies and statistical significances have been estimated as defined in Figure 3. Only significant velocity potential and stream function anomalies at p = 0.05 are displayed. Note: IDV anomalies are multiplied by 1.5 to be clearly displayed.

Fig. A1 Comparison between SST composite anomalies associated with wet and dry conditions 1167 1168 in SA. a-c Scatterplot of observed SST composite anomalies during wet (positive SRI anomalies = +1 SD) and dry (negative SRI anomalies = -1 SD) conditions at the interannual 1169 1170 (left), QDV (middle) and IDV (right) timescales. d-f as a-c but for 95 historical runs from 28 CMIP5 models. Scatter plots are smoothed and coloured (*low to high probability = blue, yellow* 1171 to red) using a 2D kernel density estimate. Red and black lines refer to the regression lines 1172 1173 between wet and dry SST composite anomalies, and associated correlation coefficients are provided in the lower left corner on each panel. 1174

1175

**Fig. A2** Step-by-step process of the multi-scale bootstrap clustering. Step-0: 10 simulated patterns of global SST variability are submitted to the clustering approach. Step-1: simulated patterns are resampled ni times, using rj scales (referring to different sizes of the spatial domain). Step-2: ni × rj Agglomerative hierarchical clustering are produced, using Ward's agglomerative criteria applied to Euclidian distances. Step-3: the probability of each simulations to be clustered with the others (red values) is estimated. Here, only two clusters are significantly robust at  $p \ge 0.90$ .

1183

**Fig. A3** Percentage of occurrence of significant signals within the interannual, QDV and IDV timescales of SRI variability in all (95) model simulations, in all (28) models and all (16) institutions using the CMIP5 historical experiments. Statistical significance was estimated at p=0.05 based 1000 Monte Carlo simulations of the red noise background spectrum.

1188

Fig. A4 Boxplots of the correlations between simulations of the same models (intra-ensembles; blue), and of different models (inter-models; red), of the CMIP5 historical experiments in reproducing spatial patterns of SA rainfall variability at the three different timescales.

**Fig. A5** Distributions of model simulations in clustering patterns of SA rainfall variability, global SST variability, and teleconnections at the interannual to interdecadal timescales. The six selected clusters, which are shown in Figures 5, 7 and 8, are in bold.

1196

Fig. A6 Boxplots of the correlations between simulations of the same models (intra-ensembles; blue), and of different models (inter-models; red), of the CMIP5 historical experiments in reproducing spatial patterns of global SST variability (shaded), and SST composite anomalies associated with SA rainfall variability (not shaded) at the three different timescales.

1201

**Fig. A7** Mean annual cycle of monthly standard deviations of SST anomalies over the Niño3.4 region (*i.e.* 5°S-5°N and 120-170°W) in the CMIP5 models (*coloured contours refer to each individual model; cf. Table 1*) and in the CRU TS 3.24.01 observations (*grey shaded*). SST anomalies are here calculated by subtracting the monthly climatology according to the definition of the Niño3.4 index (Trenberth 1997). To reduce the influence of the global trends, SST anomalies are detrended using a locally weighted linear regressions, with span equal to the length of the data.

























Table 1	or ID	0	0	0																									
	C C																												
	Atmos. Grid (lat x lor	1 × 1	0	2 x 2	2.7906 x 2.8125	1.13 x 1.13	2.7906 x 2.8125	3.4431 x 3.75	0.7484 x 0.75	3.7111 x 3.75	1.4008 x 1.40625	1.25 x 1.875	1.8653 x 1.875	1.5 x 2	1.8947 x 3.75	1.2676 x 2.5	1.8947 x 3.75	1.4008 x 140625	1 J5 v 1 875		1.8653 x 1.875		2 x 2.5		1.25 x 0.94	1 8947 x 2 5		2 x 2.5	c.z x czzu.z 1.25 x 0.94
	piControl length (yr)	0	0	0	500	400	966	277	329	500	850	500	500	500	1000	300	300	670	240	577	1000 1000	780	850	251	1051	501	252	500	500
	Hist. period	1901-2014		1901-2014			1850-2005		1850-2005		1850-2005	1850-2005	1850-2005	1850-2005		1850-2005		1850-2005	1860-2005		1850-2005		1850-2005		1850-2005	1850-2005	) ) ) ) 1	1860-2005 1661 2005	1850-2005
	Variable	pr sst φ, ψ		φ, ψ	pr, sst, φ, ψ		pr, sst, <i>φ, ψ</i>		pr, sst, <i>φ, ψ</i>		pr, sst, <i>φ, ψ</i>	pr, sst, φ, ψ	pr, sst, φ, ψ	pr, sst, <i>φ, ψ</i>		pr, sst, <i>φ, ψ</i>		pr, sst, <i>φ, ψ</i>	nr sst <i>m ili</i>	۲۱, ععد, <del>ب</del> , ب	pr, sst, φ, ψ		pr, sst, <i>φ, ψ</i>		pr, sst, <i>φ, ψ</i>	nr sst <i>m th</i>	L.) ( +) +	pr, sst, φ, ψ	pr, sst, <i>φ, ψ</i>
	Member	0	0	56	ŝ	3	5	1	1	-	10	<del>,</del> , ,,	10	Ч	9	ŝ	1	5	Ч	4	сю	9	9	1	9	£		<del>،</del> ח	
	Name	CRU TS 3.24.1	ERSS.v4	20CR.v2c	bcc-csm1-1	bcc-csm1-1-m	CanESM2	CMCC-CESM	CMCC-CM	CMCC-CMS	CNRM-CM5	ACCESS1-0 ACCESS1-3	CSIRO-Mk3-6-0	inmcm4	IPSL-CM5A-LR	IPSL-CM5A-MR	IPSL-CM5B-LR	MIROC5	HadGEM2-CC	HadGEM2-ES	MPI-ESM-LR MPI-ESM-MR	GISS-E2-H	GISS-E2-R	GISS-E2-R-CC	CCSM4	NorESM1-M	NorESM1-ME	GFDL-CM3	CESM1-BCG
	Institution	CRU, UK	NOAA-NCDC, USA	NUAA-NCUC, USA NOAA-CIRES, USA BCC, China CCCma, Canada CCCma, Laly		CNRM, <i>France</i>	CSIRO-BOM, Australia	CSIRO-QCCCE, Australia	INM, Russia		IPSL, France		MIROC, Japan	WUHC 11K		MPI-M, <i>Germany</i>		NASA-GISS, USA		NCAR, USA	NCC Norway		NOAA-GFDI, <i>USA</i>	NSF-DOE-NCAR, USA					
		<b>'</b> S	qO										san	dţr	ן סו	əp	οM	Sd		C									

Table 2	Sea-lce Comp.	SIS			LIM		GELATO	JUIC	כרר	~CICE	0		LIM		COCO	CICF	]	C			0		CICE	CICE	C C C	SIS	CICE
	Land Comp.	BCC-AVIM1-0 CTEM			SILVA		ISBA			0	0		ORCHIDEE		MATSIRO	MOSES2		ISBACH			0		CLM4	CLMM		LM3	CLM4
	Ocean Comp.	MOM4-1	CanOMA		OPA8-2		NEMO3-2			MOM2-2	INMOM		NEMO3-2		COCO	HadGOM1		MDI-OM		Russel	HYCOM		РОР	MICOM		MOM4-1	POP2
	Atmospheric Comp.	BCC-AGCM2-1	DUC-AGUNZ-1		ECHAM5		ARPEGE	HadCM3	MO GA1-0	CSIRO-MK3	INMAM			LMDZ5B	FRCGCM	HadCM3		ECHAM6			ModelE2		CAM4	COMA		AM3 AM2	CAM4
	Name	bcc-csm1-1	CanFSNA7	CMCC-CESM	CMCC-CM	CMCC-CMS	CNRM-CM5	ACCESS1-0	ACCESS1-3	CSIRO-Mk3-6-0	inmcm4	IPSL-CM5A-LR	IPSL-CM5A-MR	IPSL-CM5B-LR	<b>MIROC5</b>	HadGEM2-CC	HadGEM2-ES	MPI-ESM-LR	MPI-ESM-MR	GISS-E2-H	GISS-E2-R	GISS-E2-R-CC	CCSM4	NorESM1-M	NorESM1-ME	GFDL-CM3 GFDL-ESM2M	CESM1-BCG
	Institution	BCC, <i>China</i>	Crma Canada	CCCma, <i>Canada</i> CMCC, <i>Italy</i>		CNRM, France	CNRM, France CSIRO-BOM, Australia		CSIRO-QCCCE, Australia	INM, Russia		IPSL, France		MIROC, Japan	MOHC. UK		MPI-M Germany			NASA-GISS, USA		NCAR, USA	NCC Morniau		NOAA-GFDL, USA	NSF-DOE-NCAR, USA	
									!	sìn	dţr	ן סו	əp	οM	Sd	IW:	)										