On the 12 principles and the innovation pathways in doubly green chemistry

C. Bliard*; <u>B. Kurek</u>**; E. Garnier***; J. van Niel***; A. Youssef*** F.D. Vivien***; M. Nieddu***



***EA 6292 REGARDs



**INRA UMR 614



* CNRS UMR 7312

The French National Research Agency



ANR-09-CP2D-01-01







On the 12 principles and the innovation pathways in doubly green chemistry

- Articles; Patents; Awards
- Interviews (i.e. Gembloux)
- Focus groups
- Economists ; Chemists













OR



The turning point in Green Chem

- **1990's**: GC deals primarily with problems of **pollution**, **ecotoxicity** and (late 90's) **global warming** and **remediation**
- From 2000 on: GC deals primarily with using Renewable Carbon
 - Green Chem: 57 of the 63 articles (forthcoming in 2012), while it would be hard to find one in the first issue of the journal -1999).
 - Presidential Green Chemistry Challenge Awards USA): Of the first 16 awarded in 1996, 1997, 1998, only two referred to the seventh principle. Over the past three years, 11 out of 15 awards can be directly referred to bio-based products as reactants or as substrates.

But is chemistry of renewable carbon always green and sustainable? New playing ground for a "Doubly Green Chemistry" ?

Green Chemistry : the need of systemic points of view

" Even when we approach some of the big sustainability challenges... we approach these challenges in a fragmented manner. ... We often wind up doing the "right things, wrong".

We purify water with acutely lethal substances. We make energy-efficient bulbs with neurotoxins, and solar energy with scarce, depleting and toxic metals."

foreword of P. Anastas to R. Höfer (Editor) (2009) **Sustainable Solutions for Modern Economies (RCS Ed)**

Origins, Status, and Challenges of Green Chemistry Anastas and Kirchhoff

- 1. It is better to prevent waste than to treat or clean up waste after it is formed.
- Synthetic methods should be designed to maximize the incorporation of all materials used in the process into the final product.
- Wherever practicable, synthetic methodologies should be designed to use and generate substances that possess little or no toxicity to human health and the environment.
- 4. Chemical products should be designed to preserve efficacy of function while reducing toxicity.
- The use of auxiliary substances (e.g. solvents, separation agents, etc.) should be made unnecessary wherever possible and innocuous when used.
- Energy requirements should be recognized for their environmental and economic impacts and should be minimized. Synthetic methods should be conducted at ambient temperature and pressure.
- A raw material of feedstock should be renewable rather than depleting wherever technically and economically practicable.
- Unnecessary derivatization (blocking group, protection/deprotection, temporary modification of physical/chemical processes) should be avoided whenever possible.
- 9. Catalytic reagents (as selective as possible) are superior to stoichiometric reagents.
- Chemical products should be designed so that at the end of their function they do not persist in the environment and break down into innocuous degradation products.
- Analytical methodologies need to be further developed to allow for real-time, in-process monitoring and control prior to the formation of hazardous substances.
- Substances and the form of a substance used in a chemical process should be chosen so as to minimize the
 potential for chemical accidents, including releases, explosions, and fires.

FIGURE 1. The 12 Principles of Green Chemistry.

Four Dimensions to observe systematic points of view

Science: GC is more than just synthetic chemistry! Physico-Chemistry, Biochemistry, Biology Materials science and "omics"

Technology:

How can novelty integrate existing technologies with new ones to achieve coherence? **Economy**: Not only technical change,

but also actors' interests; How they seek to preserve their supply chain?

<u>Social</u>: Preserving the territories or activities of social groups and meet the challenges of protecting the biosphere

Has biomass a problem with green chemistry?



Or the opposite?

How does this inhibit / trigger innovation? How does this regulate strong but hasty expectations?

Two philosophies of chemistry Four productive heritages

"Intensive deconstruction" pathways (typical of oil industry, although conceptually well-mastered by petrochemists)

PH1 – Extensive thermal deconstruction to $C_1 - C_6$ syngas, FDC, HMF Thermo chemical transformation of biomass into syngas and reforming. PH2 - Biotechnological Extensive deconstruction to $C_2 - C_{10}$ EtOH, PLA, PHA Enzymatic/Microbial transformation of biomass into small molecules, synthons, building blocks (for chemiosynthetic polymers e.g. PLA PHA)

Moderate "destructuring" pathways (i.e. : which preserve the functional properties contained in complexity of living organisms).

PH3 - Limited chemical modification of extracted $C_5 - C_{30}$ Use of naturally occurring synthons (e.g. modified fatty acids for polymers) PH4 - Limited deconstruction and transformations $C_x - C_n$ Use of plant components complexity using innovative technologies (e.g. reactive extrusion, modif. Starch, whole plant process)



Each productive heritage claims its own use of some of the 12 principles



Each productive heritage claims its own use of some of the 12 principles



It is better to prevent waste that

Origins, S

Synthetic methods should be d the final product.

Wherever practicable, synthetic possess little or no toxicity to hi Chemical products should be d The use of auxiliary substances wherever possible and innocuo Energy requirements should be 6. minimized. Synthetic methods a A raw material of feedstock sho 7. practicable.

5.

Unnecessary derivatization (blo 8. physical/chemical processes) s Catalytic reagents (as selective 9. 10. Chemical products should be d environment and break down in

- 11. Analytical methodologies need control prior to the formation of
- Substances and the form of a s potential for chemical accidents

Each PH seeks to enforce its own green identity



Good news: Economy requires this lasting variety

Scientific competition, but satisfaction of specific needs, and complementarities of market niches



Fashions and expectations of a for biomass conversion

- "Universal" plant (miscanthus?)
- "Miraculous" process (one pot)
- "Super enzyme cluster" for breaking down biomass recalcitrance
- "The big bang" building block (one of the top 10?)



Fig. 1 – HMF as a precursor for a range of commercial chemicals.

A. Boisen et al. Chem. Eng. Res. Des., 2009, 87, 1318.

Furfural



F. Martel et al. Top. Curr. Chem., 2010, 294, 79.

Succinic Acid





J.J Bozell, G.R Petersen, GreenChem., 2 012, 12, 539.



Fig : Isosorbide as a renewable platform Chemical.

M. Rose, R. PalKovits, ChemSusChem, 2012, 5, 167.

No universal solutions, but two systemic learning pathways



Fundamentals + Combination of technologies and Work, Work, Work.....

Innovations

Green washing: = social education; recognition of the problems; short term + transition solutions

Greening and re-engineering: = economic innovation as the driver; revision of all pathways

Green revolution: from « old ressources » to the « new end-users »



Conclusions

Green economy needs new green products and not only a greening of the existing products (Energy seems apart) **1. Economic dimension**

Easy transformation into small molecules to obtain versatile building-block and fighting with the complexity and variability of renewable material

4. Scientific Dimension

Portfolio of solutions and pertinent recombination are more important than one leading technology (Chemistry vs Energy) **2. Technological dimension**

3. Social dimension

New "producers": biomass from agriculture; sea; wastes; ...

New "end-user"; Jobs and territories: small local vs huge harbor biorefineries





Bazancourt-Pomacle – Near REIMS (Fr)

THE REPAIR OF A DEPARTMENT OF A

Biomass and Biorefinery :

what can be really expected?

Pr. Daniel THOMAS University of Technology of Complegne

Pdt French Competitiveness cluster « Industries a



www.college-de-france.fr



Biorefinery: toward an industrial metabolism

Thank you for your attention!!!! IN STITUT CARNOT **3BCAR** Ga Re E N ww.epa.gov/greenchemistry C He M₈ I S R RICHEBOURG \mathbf{O} Henri Jayer Chemistr Centre of Excellence Green iversity o Green Chemist Chemistry York Network Centre India Chemistry Network U **GREEN CHEMISTRY CENTRES** What is Green Chemistry? COLLABORATIVE INITIATIVE TO WORK TOGETHER ON GLOBAL

CHALLENGES

Green Chemistry Intre, UAN Brazilian Green Chemistry School **GREEN** CHEMISTRY