

Boron aggregation in the ground states of boron-carbon fullerenes

Stephan Mohr, Pascal Pochet, Maximilian Amsler, Bastian Schaefer, Ali Sadeghi, Luigi Genovese, Stefan Goedecker

▶ To cite this version:

Stephan Mohr, Pascal Pochet, Maximilian Amsler, Bastian Schaefer, Ali Sadeghi, et al.. Boron aggregation in the ground states of boron-carbon fullerenes. Physical Review B: Condensed Matter and Materials Physics (1998-2015), 2014, 89 (4), 10.1103/PhysRevB.89.041404. hal-02137672

HAL Id: hal-02137672 https://hal.science/hal-02137672v1

Submitted on 22 Jul 2024

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

Boron aggregation in the ground states of boron-carbon fullerenes

Stephan Mohr,¹ Pascal Pochet,² Maximilian Amsler,¹ Bastian

Schaefer,¹ Ali Sadeghi,¹ Luigi Genovese,² and Stefan Goedecker¹

¹Institut für Physik, Universität Basel, Klingelbergstr. 82, 4056 Basel, Switzerland

²Laboratoire de simulation atomistique (L_Sim), SP2M,

UMR-E CEA / UJF-Grenoble 1, INAC, Grenoble, F-38054, France

(Dated: September 25, 2018)

We present novel structural motifs for boron-carbon nano-cages of the stochiometries $B_{12}C_{48}$ and $B_{12}C_{50}$, based on first principle calculations. These configurations are distinct from those proposed so far by the fact that the boron atoms are not isolated and distributed over the entire surface of the cages, but rather aggregate at one location to form a patch. Our putative ground state of $B_{12}C_{48}$ is 1.8 eV lower in energy than the previously proposed ground state and violates all the suggested empirical rules for constructing low energy full erenes. The $\rm B_{12}C_{50}$ configuration is energetically even more favorable than $B_{12}C_{48}$, showing that structures derived from the C_{60} Buckminsterfullerene are not necessarily magic sizes for heterofullerenes.

PACS numbers: 61.48.-c, 31.15.E-, 81.07.Nb, 81.05.ub

¹³ it by adding substitutional or endohedral atoms, e.g. in ¹⁴ the context of hydrogen storage [3].

For future applications it would be advantageous to ¹⁶ have more such basic building blocks. One possibility is ¹⁷ to modify the original carbon fullerene by substitutional ¹⁸ doping. A very popular choice for the dopant atoms are ¹⁹ boron and nitrogen since they are neighbors to carbon in ²⁰ the periodic table. Various boron-carbon heterofullerenes $_{21}$ have been observed experimentally [4, 5]. The existence $_{22}$ of cross-linked $N_{12}C_{48}$ fullerenes could explain experi-²³ mental measurements of thin solid films [6]. The case ²⁴ of boron is of particular importance as it is the p-type ²⁵ counterpart of the n-type nitrogen doping in fullerene ²⁶ and graphene used to tune their electronic or catalytic 27 properties [7, 8].

In order to determine the energetically most favorable structure, it is in principle necessary to perform a nu-³⁰ merically costly unbiased global structure search, which became possible only very recently [9–12].

32 Previous work on heterofullerene cages was therefore based on biased searches that constrained the exploration ³⁴ of the energy landscape to certain structural motifs. For $_{35}$ the stochiometries $B_n C_{60-n}$ this constraint typically con- $_{36}$ sisted in starting the search from the perfect C_{60} fullerene $_{37}$ and substituting *n* carbon atoms by boron. Garg *et* $_{38}$ al. [13] extensively investigated the geometries $B_n C_{60-n}$ 39 for n = 1 - 12. They concluded that the boron is ar-45 smaller fullerenes again confirmed that boron atoms are 82 furthermore we have inserted compact boron icosahe-

Since its discovery by Kroto et al. in 1985 [1], the 46 most preferably situated at opposite sites in a hexagon, 10 C₆₀ fullerene has found a wide range of applications as a 47 thereby increasing the bond lengths in their neighbor-¹¹ building block in the field of nano-science. For instance $_{48}$ hood. For the heterofullerene $B_{12}C_{48}$, which will be $_{12}$ it is possible to directly form solids out of it [2] or to dope $_{49}$ one of the two stochiometries investigated in this pa-⁵⁰ per, Manaa *et al.* [15] performed a detailed study; they ⁵¹ claimed that the best structure was the same that was $_{52}$ previously found for N₁₂C₄₈ [16], thereby again confirm-53 ing the previous results stating that the boron atoms 54 should be spread over the entire carbon cage and isolated. ⁵⁵ We will refer to this class of structures as "diluted".

> 56 We reinvestigated the boron-carbon heterofullerenes 57 by performing for the first time a systematic and unbi-58 ased search for low energy minima for the stochiometries ⁵⁹ $B_{12}C_{48}$ and $B_{12}C_{50}$.

> 60 The Minima Hopping Method (MHM) [12] was used 61 for our unbiased search of new configurations. All cal-62 culations were done at the level of Density Functional ⁶³ Theory, using the BigDFT package [17]. This code uses ⁶⁴ Daubechies wavelets [18] as basis set and HGH pseudopo-⁶⁵ tentials [19] to simulate the core electrons. The exchange 66 correlation part was described by the PBE functional ⁶⁷ [20], which has shown to give highly reliable energy dif-68 ferences between different structural motifs in boron [21] ⁶⁹ and is therefore used [22] in this work. Convergence pa-⁷⁰ rameters in BigDFT were set such that total energy dif- $_{\rm 71}$ ferences were converged up to $10^{-5}\,{\rm Ha}$ and all configu-72 rations were relaxed until the maximal force component 73 on any atom reached the noise level of the calculation, ⁷⁴ which was of the order of 1 meV/Å.

75 In order to speed up our exhaustive configurational 76 search we started both from diluted and aggregated con- $_{40}$ ranged such that a pentagon ring does not contain more π figurations with a wide structural diversity, based on var- $_{41}$ than one and a hexagon not more than two boron atoms $_{78}$ ious C_n backbones (with n=60, 58 or 48). For aggre-42 (at non-adjacent sites). Putting more boron atoms in a 79 gated configurations we considered both filled hexagons 43 ring increases the bond lengths and decreases the sta- 80 and filled pentagons as they were demonstrated to be the ⁴⁴ bility. A study by Viani and Santos [14] on various ⁸¹ building blocks [23, 24] in the B₈₀ boron fullerene [25]; $_{\rm 83}$ drons in opened ${\rm C}_{60}$ fullerenes. In addition we generated structures of high symmetry for the stoichiometry C_{48} 84 85 and added 12 boron atoms at locations where it seemed ⁸⁶ appropriate by intuition. Some short MHM runs start-⁸⁷ ing from the energetically most promising configurations ⁸⁸ allowed us to see trends leading to an energy lowering. From these ones a second set was derived by applying ad-89 ditional modifications (e.g. exchanging boron and carbon 90 ⁹¹ atoms) in order to speed up the exploration in a second ⁹² step of MHM. Finally we systematically exchanged boron 93 and carbon atoms up to second-nearest neighbors for the ⁹⁴ most favorable structures emerging from this process. In ⁹⁵ this way we could generate more than thousand configurations containing a large variety of structural motifs. 96

Among our $B_{12}C_{48}$ structures obtained in this way we 97 found several being considerably lower in energy than the 98 three most favorable ones identified by Manaa *et al.* [15]. 90 Whereas the new configurations agree with them in the overall shape exhibiting a cage-like structure, they differ 101 ¹⁰² substantially by the fact that the boron is not distributed over the entire cluster, but aggregated in a patch, thereby 103 104 separating the surface of the compound in a boron-rich and a boron-poor part. This is in strong contrast to the 105 widely accepted belief that the boron atoms should be 106 isolated [26], i.e. be always separated by one or several 107 carbon atoms. We will refer to our novel structural motif 108 109 as "patched".

The low energy part of the spectrum that we have ex-110 ¹¹¹ plored is shown in Fig. 1, together with the structures ¹¹² of the 12 lowest isomers that we have found, the lowest structure exhibiting a filled pentagon and the three most 113 favorable diluted structures. The latter ones turned out 114 to be identical to the three lowest structures identified 115 by Manaa et al. In total we found 143 new structures ¹¹⁷ that are lower in energy than the putative ground state proposed so far. We made however no effort to find all 118 ¹¹⁹ the structures in this energy interval and so more than 143 structures are expected to exist. The energy levels 120 ¹²¹ are colored on a scale from 0 to 1 which describes the 122 relative amount of carbon atoms being first neighbors to $_{123}$ boron. Thus a value of 0 (red) means that the boron 124 atoms are only surrounded by boron – which can obvi-125 ously not happen –, whereas a value of 1 (blue) means that the boron atoms are only surrounded by carbon. 126 Consequently the coloring of the patched structures tends 127 128 towards red values, while the coloring of the diluted ones tends towards blue values. In the lowest structures the 129 boron atoms form a patch with frayed boundaries, which 130 ¹³¹ results in astonishing configurations where carbon atoms have four boron atoms as first neighbors. Furthermore 139 132 133 134 135 hexagons, and twice two adjacent pentagons, which is in 142 the lowest structure. We can see that our new ground ¹³⁶ general very disadvantageous [27]. However these pen-¹⁴³ state is 1.8 eV lower in energy than the putative ground 137 tagons do not only consist of carbon, but there are some 148 state proposed so far. In the second column we present ¹³⁸ substitutional boron atoms contained within them.



FIG. 1. Plot of the 12 energetically most favorable structures, the most favorable one containing a filled heptagon and the three lowest diluted configurations for $B_{12}C_{48}$, together with the low energy part of the spectrum. The coloring scheme is explained in the text.

Tab. I gives some more information about the strucit is surprising that the lowest structure exhibits a hep-140 tures shown in Fig. 1. The first column shows the entagon, which is usually less favorable than the penta- and $_{141}$ ergy separation ΔE of the configurations with respect to 146 the HOMO-LUMO gaps of the structures. The values

	ΔE	gap	ΔH	\mathbf{PG}	RMSD
	(eV)	(eV)	(eV)		(bohr)
1st	0.000	0.457	0.340	C_{s}	0.000
2nd	0.232	0.477	0.344	C_{s}	1.003
3rd	0.362	0.646	0.346	C_s	1.717
4th	0.462	0.645	0.348	C_1	1.092
5th	0.553	0.295	0.350	C_{s}	1.589
6th	0.557	0.236	0.350	C_1	0.558
$7 \mathrm{th}$	0.575	0.247	0.350	C_1	1.486
8th	0.582	0.452	0.350	C_1	1.579
9th	0.607	0.604	0.350	C_{s}	0.783
10th	0.624	0.378	0.351	C_1	0.533
11th	0.644	0.616	0.351	C_{s}	1.344
12th	0.665	0.644	0.351	C_{s}	1.490
27th	0.978	0.695	0.357	C_1	1.678
144th	1.836	0.494	0.371	S_6	3.465
295th	2.273	0.316	0.378	D_{3d}	3.501
453th	2.661	0.302	0.385	S_6	3.442

TABLE I. Properties of the structures shown in Fig. 1.

147 range from 0.2 eV to 0.7 eV, thus being rather small, 185 148 and do not exhibit any special pattern. In particular 186 formed an extended and unbiased search for the ground 149 there is no notable difference between the class of the 187 state. We again used several approaches to generate 150 patched and the diluted structures. The next column 188 many different input structures: We added two atoms to ¹⁵¹ shows the formation energies per atom ΔH with respect ¹⁸⁹ the lowest isomers of B₁₂C₄₈ as described; we replaced 153 and cubic diamond, respectively), which is defined by 191 tional interstitial boron atoms at appropriate positions; $_{154} \Delta H = (E - n_B E_B^0 - n_C E_C^0)/(n_B + n_C)$ with E being $_{192}$ and we replaced 12 carbon atoms by boron starting from ¹⁵⁵ the energy of the compound and E_X^0 and n_X being the ¹⁹³ a C₆₂ fullerene. For this last approach we took two ex-¹⁵⁶ energy per atom of the reference configurations and the ¹⁹⁴ amples that were first described by Ayuela *et al.* [29] and ¹⁵⁷ number of atoms, respectively. In the next column we ¹⁹⁵ Qian et al. [30] and turned out to be the most stable C₆₂ 158 give the point groups of the structures. Whereas the di- 196 isomers in a study by Cui et al. [31]. As for the case of $_{159}$ luted structures are rather symmetric (point groups S₆ $_{197}$ B₁₂C₄₈ we again continued by either manually rearrang-160 and D_{3d}), the new structures are of much lower symme- 198 ing the atoms or by using the configurations as input for $_{161}$ try (C_s and C₁). Finally we present the RMSD [28] of the $_{199}$ subsequent MHM runs. 162 structures with respect to the new putative ground state. 200 It turned out that the structure that we constructed ¹⁶³ It is obvious that there is a clear separation between $_{201}$ by hand from the ground state of $B_{12}C_{48}$ is energetically ¹⁶⁴ the patched structures and the diluted ones. Within the ₂₀₂ the most favorable one. In addition, at least 673 patched 165 energy and the RMSD. 166

167 168 169 plot for all structures up to 8 eV the energy difference and 207 being lowest in energy, the most favorable one contain-170 the RMSD with respect to the putative ground state. As 208 ing a filled pentagon and the two most favorable diluted 171 $_{172}$ energies are completely uncorrelated to the value of the $_{210}$ analogy to Fig. 1. As for the case of $B_{12}C_{48}$ it is clear that of about 2 bohr, separating it from energetically higher 212 motif where the boron is aggregated in a patch. 174 configurations. 175

176 $_{177}$ $B_{12}C_{48}$ by two carbon atoms – thus modifying it into a $_{216}$ – except for the few lowest structures – in general smaller $_{178}$ pentagon and a hexagon – the two adjacent pentagons $_{217}$ than the ones for $B_{12}C_{48}$; again there is no notable dif-¹⁷⁹ which are present twice on both sides of the heptagon ²¹⁸ ference between the patched and the diluted structures. $_{180}$ are turned into a pentagon and a hexagon each. Since $_{219}$ The values for the formation energy ΔH are slightly $_{181}$ this structure consists only of pentagons and hexagons $_{220}$ lower than their counterparts for $B_{12}C_{48}$ in Tab. I, in-182 and furthermore respects the isolated pentagon rule, it 221 dicating that it is more likely to encounter experimen-



FIG. 2. The energy difference versus the RMSD, both with respect to the putative ground states.

183 is a promising candidate for the global minimum of the 184 stoichiometry $B_{12}C_{50}$.

In order to confirm this assumption we again perto the bulk conformations of boron and carbon (α -boron $_{190}$ ten carbon atoms by boron in a C_{60} and added two addi-

patched ones, however, there is no relation between the 203 structures are lower in energy than the most favorable di-²⁰⁴ luted configuration which is 3.9 eV higher in energy than A more complete overview of the energies and the cor- 205 our ground state. The low energy part of the spectrum is responding RMSD values is shown in Fig. 2(a). Here we 206 shown in Fig. 3, together with figures of the 12 structures can be seen there is a broad range with structures whose 209 configurations. The energy levels are coded in colors in RMSD. However this range is sharply bounded at a value ²¹¹ all low lying minima correspond to the same structural

In Tab. II we present some more information about the 213 By filling the heptagon in the putative ground state of 218 structures shown in Fig. 3. The HOMO-LUMO gaps are



FIG. 3. The low energy part of the spectrum for $B_{12}C_{50}$, together with figures of the 12 energetically lowest structures, two most favorable diluted configurations.

²²² tally the stoichiometry $B_{12}C_{50}$ than $B_{12}C_{48}$. The point 223 groups exhibit a wider variation compared to the case of $_{224}$ B₁₂C₄₈; the energetically most favorable structures have $_{\rm 225}$ the point groups $\rm C_1,\,\rm C_2,\,\rm C_s$ and $\rm C_{2v}.$ On the other hand 226 the diluted structures are of lower symmetry than their $_{\rm 227}$ counterparts for $\rm B_{12}C_{48}$ and exhibit only the point group $_{\rm 262}$ $_{228}$ Cs. The RMSD behaves similar as for $B_{12}C_{48}$. A more $_{263}$ Computing time was provided by the CSCS and GENCI ²²⁹ complete overview of the energy versus the RMSD – anal- ²⁶⁴ (grant 6194).

	ΔE	gap	ΔH	PG	RMSD
	(eV)	(eV)	(eV)		(bohr)
1st	0.000	0.534	0.322	C_{s}	0.000
2nd	0.110	0.416	0.324	C_2	1.363
3rd	0.158	0.434	0.325	C_1	1.209
4th	0.237	0.283	0.326	C_1	0.976
5th	0.262	0.338	0.327	C_1	1.285
6th	0.358	0.308	0.328	C_{2v}	1.390
$7 \mathrm{th}$	0.377	0.154	0.328	C_s	1.168
$8 \mathrm{th}$	0.453	0.215	0.330	C_1	1.113
9th	0.494	0.249	0.330	C_1	0.530
10th	0.515	0.380	0.331	C_1	1.451
11th	0.539	0.227	0.331	C_1	0.539
12th	0.595	0.363	0.332	C_1	0.931
25th	0.939	0.296	0.337	C_{2v}	1.750
673th	3.921	0.204	0.386	C_s	3.289
965th	5.227	0.458	0.407	C_s	3.080

TABLE II. The same data as in Tab. I, this time for the structures shown in Fig. 3.

 $_{230}$ ogous to the one shown in Fig. 2(a) – is given in Fig. 2(b). ²³¹ Both the last column of Tab. II and Fig. 2(a) show again 232 a clear separation between the patched and the diluted configurations. 233

In conclusion, we have shown that the ground state of 234 ²³⁵ boron-carbon heterofullerenes is fundamentally different from what was thought previously. It consists of incomplete carbon cages whose openings are filled with boron 237 238 patches. In a broader context our results show that ²³⁹ doping in sp²-materials is not vet well understood and 240 that no universally valid rules are available to predict which structural motifs are the most stable ones in such doped structures. Our results could also give guidance to synthesis efforts [32] for such heterofullerenes. The 243 steep rise of the energy of metastable configurations $_{\rm 245}$ as a function of the distance from the ground state ²⁴⁶ shown in Fig. 2 indicates that there is a substantial ²⁴⁷ driving force towards low energy motifs with patches and suggests that a synthesis of patched structures should 248 ²⁴⁹ be possible. The energy gap between the ground state $_{\rm ^{250}}$ and the lowest metastable state (0.2 eV for $\rm B_{12}C_{48}$ and $_{251}$ 0.1 eV for $B_{12}C_{50}$) is however much smaller than in C_{60} $(1.6\,\mathrm{eV})$ and reaching the ground state might therefore 252 the most favorable one containing a filled pentagon and the 253 be difficult. The standard synthesis procedure of substi-²⁵⁴ tuting [5] carbon atoms by boron atoms is unlikely to ²⁵⁵ succeed for heterofullerenes containing a larger number ²⁵⁶ of boron atoms which then form patches. Planar boron clusters that are structurally similar to the boron patches 257 found in our ground state can however be synthesized ex-258 perimentally [33] and might form growth nuclei for such 259 heterofullerenes in a carbon rich spark or vapor chamber. 260 261

We acknowledge support from the SNF and HP2C.

- [1] H. W. Kroto, J. R. Heath, S. C. O'Brien, R. F. Curl, 265
- and R. E. Smalley, "C60: Buckminsterfullerene," Nature, 266 vol. 318, no. 6042, pp. 162-163, 1985. 267
- [2]W. Krätschmer, L. D. Lamb, K. Fostiropoulos, and D. R. 268
- Huffman, "Solid C60: a new form of carbon," Nature, 269 vol. 347, no. 6291, pp. 354-358, 1990. 270
- [3] Y. Zhao, Y.-H. Kim, A. C. Dillon, M. J. Heben, and 271 S. B. Zhang, "Hydrogen storage in novel organometallic 272 buckyballs," Phys. Rev. Lett., vol. 94, p. 155504, 2005. 273
- [4] T. Guo, C. Jin, and R. E. Smalley, "Doping bucky: 274 formation and properties of boron-doped buckminster-275 fullerene," J. Phys. Chem., vol. 95, no. 13, pp. 4948-4950, 276 1991. 277
- [5]P. W. Dunk, A. RodrÄguez-Fortea, N. K. Kaiser, H. Shi-278 nohara, J. M. Poblet, and H. W. Kroto, "Formation of 279 heterofullerenes by direct exposure of c60 to boron va-280 por," Angew. Chem.-Ger. Edit., vol. 125, no. 1, pp. 333-281 337. 2013. 282
- L. Hultman, S. Stafström, Z. Czigány, J. Neidhardt, [6] 283 N. Hellgren, I. F. Brunell, K. Suenaga, and C. Colliex, 284 "Cross-linked nano-onions of carbon nitride in the solid 285 phase: Existence of a novel $C_{48}N_{12}$ aza-fullerene," *Phys.* 286 Rev. Lett., vol. 87, p. 225503, 2001. 287
- [7]H. Wang, T. Maiyalagan, and X. Wang, "Review on 288 289 recent progress in nitrogen-doped graphene: Synthesis, characterization, and its potential applications," ACS 290 Catal., vol. 2, no. 5, pp. 781–794, 2012. 291
- R.-H. Xie, G. W. Bryant, J. Zhao, V. H. Smith, 292 8 A. Di Carlo, and A. Pecchia, "Tailorable acceptor 293 $c_{60-n}b_n$ and donor $c_{60-m}n_m$ pairs for molecular electron-294 ics," Phys. Rev. Lett., vol. 90, p. 206602, 2003. 295
- C. J. Pickard and R. J. Needs, "Ab initio random struc-[9] 296 ture searching," J. Phys.: Condens. Matter, vol. 23, 297 no. 5, p. 053201, 2011. 298
- [10]C. W. Glass, A. R. Oganov, and N. Hansen, "Uspex-299 evolutionary crystal structure prediction," Comput. 300 *Phys. Commun.*, vol. 175, no. 11-12, pp. 713 – 720, 2006. 301
- [11] Y. Wang, J. Lv, L. Zhu, and Y. Ma, "Calypso: A method 302
- for crystal structure prediction," Comput. Phys. Com-303 mun., vol. 183, no. 10, pp. 2063 - 2070, 2012. 304
- S. Goedecker, "Minima hopping: an efficient search [12]305 method for the global minimum of the potential energy 306 surface of complex molecular systems.," J. Chem. Phys., 307 vol. 120, no. 21, pp. 9911-7, 2004. 308
- I. Garg, H. Sharma, K. Dharamvir, and V. Jindal, "Sub-[13]309 stitutional patterns in boron doped heterofullerenes c60 310 nbn (n = 112)," J. Comput. Theor. Nanosci., vol. 8, no. 4, 311 pp. 642–655, 2011. 312
- L. Viani and M. D. Santos, "Comparative study of lower 313 [14]fullerenes doped with boron and nitrogen," Solid State 314 Commun., vol. 138, no. 10-11, pp. 498–501, 2006. 315
- M. Riad Manaa, H. a. Ichord, and D. W. Sprehn, "Pre-[15]316 dicted molecular structure of novel C48B12," Chem.317 Phys. Lett., vol. 378, no. 3-4, pp. 449-455, 2003. 318
- M. R. Manaa, D. W. Sprehn, and H. a. Ichord, "Pre-[16]319 diction of extended aromaticity for a novel C(48)N(12)320
- azafullerene structure.," J. Am. Chem. Soc., vol. 124, 321 no. 47, pp. 13990–1, 2002. 322
- 323 [17] L. Genovese, A. Neelov, S. Goedecker, T. Deutsch, 385

S. A. Ghasemi, A. Willand, D. Caliste, O. Zilberberg, M. Rayson, A. Bergman, and R. Schneider, "Daubechies wavelets as a basis set for density functional pseudopotential calculations.," J. Chem. Phys., vol. 129, no. 1, p. 014109, 2008.

324

325

326

327

328

331

332

333

346

3/17

351

354

357

371

- [18]I. Daubechies et al., Ten lectures on wavelets, vol. 61. 329 SIAM, 1992. 330
 - [19]C. Hartwigsen, S. Goedecker, and J. Hutter, "Relativistic separable dual-space Gaussian pseudopotentials from H to Rn," Phys. Rev. B, vol. 58, no. 7, pp. 3641-3662, 1998.
- [20] J. P. Perdew, K. Burke, and M. Ernzerhof, "Generalized 334 Gradient Approximation Made Simple," Phys. Rev. Lett., 335 336 vol. 77, no. 18, pp. 3865-3868, 1996.
- [21] C. R. Hsing, C. M. Wei, N. D. Drummond, and R. J. 337 Needs, "Quantum monte carlo studies of covalent and 338 metallic clusters: Accuracy of density functional approx-339 imations," Phys. Rev. B, vol. 79, p. 245401, 2009. 340
- 341 [22] M. A. Marques, M. J. Oliveira, and T. Burnus, "Libxc: A library of exchange and correlation functionals for density 342 functional theory," Comput. Phys. Commun., vol. 183, 343 no. 10, pp. 2272 - 2281, 2012. 344
- [23]P. Pochet, L. Genovese, S. De, S. Goedecker, D. Caliste, 345 S. A. Ghasemi, K. Bao, and T. Deutsch, "Low-energy boron fullerenes: Role of disorder and potential synthesis pathways," Phys. Rev. B, vol. 83, p. 081403, 2011. 348
- P. Boulanger, M. Moriniere, L. Genovese, and P. Pochet, [24]349 "Selecting boron fullerenes by cage-doping mechanisms," 350 J. Chem. Phys., vol. 138, no. 18, p. 184302, 2013.
- [25]N. Gonzalez Szwacki, A. Sadrzadeh, and B. Yakobson, 352 "B80 Fullerene: An Ab Initio Prediction of Geometry, 353 Stability, and Electronic Structure," Phys. Rev. Lett., 355 vol. 98, no. 16, p. 166804, 2007.
- 356 [26]F. Shakib and M. Momeni, "Isolation: A strategy for obtaining highly doped heterofullerenes," Chem. Phys. Lett., vol. 514, no. 4-6, pp. 321-324, 2011. 358
- 359 [27]H. W. Kroto, "The stability of the fullerenes Cn, with n = 24, 28, 32, 36, 50, 60 and 70," Nature, vol. 329, 360 no. 6139, pp. 529-531, 1987. 361
- [28]A. Sadeghi, S. A. Ghasemi, M. A. Lill, and S. Goedecker, 362 "Metrics for measuring distances in configuration 363 spaces," 2013. 364
- A. Ayuela, P. W. Fowler, D. Mitchell, R. Schmidt, 365 [29] G. Seifert, and F. Zerbetto, "C 62 : Theoretical Evidence for a Nonclassical Fullerene with a Heptagonal Ring," J. 367 Phys. Chem., vol. 100, no. 39, pp. 15634-15636, 1996. 368
- 369 [30]W. Qian, S.-C. Chuang, R. B. Amador, T. Jarrosson, M. Sander, S. Pieniazek, S. I. Khan, and Y. Rubin, "Syn-370 thesis of stable derivatives of c(62): the first nonclassical fullerene incorporating a four-membered ring.," J. Am. 372 373 Chem. Soc., vol. 125, no. 8, pp. 2066-7, 2003.
- Y.-H. Cui, D.-L. Chen, W. Q. Tian, and J.-K. Feng, 374 [31] "Structures, stabilities, and electronic and optical prop-375 erties of C62 fullerene isomers.," J. Phys. Chem. A, 376 vol. 111, no. 32, pp. 7933-9, 2007. 377
- 378 [32]S. De, A. Willand, M. Amsler, P. Pochet, L. Genovese, 379 and S. Goedecker, "Energy landscape of fullerene materials: A comparison of boron to boron nitride and carbon," 380 Phys. Rev. Lett., vol. 106, p. 225502, 2011. 381
- [33] H.-J. Zhai, B. Kiran, J. Li, and L.-S. Wang, "Hydro-382 carbon analogues of boron clusters-planarity, aromatic-383 ity and antiaromaticity.," Nat. Mater., vol. 2, no. 12, 384 pp. 827-33, 2003.