

## **Boron aggregation in the ground states of boron-carbon fullerenes**

Stephan Mohr, Pascal Pochet, Maximilian Amsler, Bastian Schaefer, Ali Sadeghi, Luigi Genovese, Stefan Goedecker

## **To cite this version:**

Stephan Mohr, Pascal Pochet, Maximilian Amsler, Bastian Schaefer, Ali Sadeghi, et al.. Boron aggregation in the ground states of boron-carbon fullerenes. Physical Review B: Condensed Matter and Materials Physics (1998-2015), 2014, 89 (4), 10.1103/PhysRevB.89.041404. hal-02137672

## **HAL Id: hal-02137672 <https://hal.science/hal-02137672v1>**

Submitted on 22 Jul 2024

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

3

## <sup>1</sup> Boron aggregation in the ground states of boron-carbon fullerenes

<sup>2</sup> Stephan Mohr,<sup>1</sup> Pascal Pochet,<sup>2</sup> Maximilian Amsler,<sup>1</sup> Bastian

 $Schaefer<sup>1</sup>$  Ali Sadeghi,<sup>1</sup> Luigi Genovese,<sup>2</sup> and Stefan Goedecker<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Institut für Physik, Universität Basel, Klingelbergstr. 82, 4056 Basel, Switzerland

<sup>2</sup>Laboratoire de simulation atomistique (L\_Sim), SP2M,

<sup>6</sup> *UMR-E CEA / UJF-Grenoble 1, INAC, Grenoble, F-38054, France*

(Dated: September 25, 2018)

We present novel structural motifs for boron-carbon nano-cages of the stochiometries  $B_{12}C_{48}$  and  $B_{12}C_{50}$ , based on first principle calculations. These configurations are distinct from those proposed so far by the fact that the boron atoms are not isolated and distributed over the entire surface of the cages, but rather aggregate at one location to form a patch. Our putative ground state of  $B_{12}C_{48}$ is 1.8 eV lower in energy than the previously proposed ground state and violates all the suggested empirical rules for constructing low energy fullerenes. The  $B_{12}C_{50}$  configuration is energetically even more favorable than  $B_{12}C_{48}$ , showing that structures derived from the  $C_{60}$  Buckminsterfullerene are not necessarily magic sizes for heterofullerenes.

<sup>8</sup> PACS numbers: 61.48.-c, 31.15.E-, 81.07.Nb, 81.05.ub

 $12$  it is possible to directly form solids out of it [2] or to dope <sup>13</sup> it by adding substitutional or endohedral atoms, e.g. in <sup>14</sup> the context of hydrogen storage [3].

 For future applications it would be advantageous to have more such basic building blocks. One possibility is to modify the original carbon fullerene by substitutional doping. A very popular choice for the dopant atoms are boron and nitrogen since they are neighbors to carbon in the periodic table. Various boron-carbon heterofullerenes have been observed experimentally [4, 5]. The existence  $_{22}$  of cross-linked  $N_{12}C_{48}$  fullerenes could explain experi- mental measurements of thin solid films [6]. The case of boron is of particular importance as it is the p-type counterpart of the n-type nitrogen doping in fullerene and graphene used to tune their electronic or catalytic 27 properties  $[7, 8]$ .

In order to determine the energetically most favorable structure, it is in principle necessary to perform a nu-<sup>30</sup> merically costly unbiased global structure search, which <sup>31</sup> became possible only very recently [9–12].

<sup>32</sup> Previous work on heterofullerene cages was therefore based on biased searches that constrained the exploration <sup>34</sup> of the energy landscape to certain structural motifs. For <sup>35</sup> the stochiometries  $B_nC_{60-n}$  this constraint typically con- $36$  sisted in starting the search from the perfect  $C_{60}$  fullerene  $37$  and substituting n carbon atoms by boron. Garg et 38 al. [13] extensively investigated the geometries  $B_nC_{60-n}$ 39 for  $n = 1 - 12$ . They concluded that the boron is ar-<sup>41</sup> than one and a hexagon not more than two boron atoms <sup>45</sup> smaller fullerenes again confirmed that boron atoms are <sup>82</sup> furthermore we have inserted compact boron icosahe-

Since its discovery by Kroto et al. in 1985 [1], the  $\ast$  most preferably situated at opposite sites in a hexagon, <sup>10</sup>  $C_{60}$  fullerene has found a wide range of applications as a  $\alpha$  thereby increasing the bond lengths in their neighbor-11 building block in the field of nano-science. For instance  $\ast$  hood. For the heterofullerene  $B_{12}C_{48}$ , which will be <sup>49</sup> one of the two stochiometries investigated in this pa-<sup>50</sup> per, Manaa et al. [15] performed a detailed study; they <sup>51</sup> claimed that the best structure was the same that was <sup>52</sup> previously found for  $N_{12}C_{48}$  [16], thereby again confirm-<sup>53</sup> ing the previous results stating that the boron atoms <sup>54</sup> should be spread over the entire carbon cage and isolated. <sup>55</sup> We will refer to this class of structures as "diluted".

> We reinvestigated the boron-carbon heterofullerenes by performing for the first time a systematic and unbi- ased search for low energy minima for the stochiometries  $B_{12}C_{48}$  and  $B_{12}C_{50}$ .

> The Minima Hopping Method (MHM) [12] was used for our unbiased search of new configurations. All cal- culations were done at the level of Density Functional Theory, using the BigDFT package [17]. This code uses Daubechies wavelets [18] as basis set and HGH pseudopo- tentials [19] to simulate the core electrons. The exchange correlation part was described by the PBE functional [20], which has shown to give highly reliable energy dif- ferences between different structural motifs in boron [21] and is therefore used [22] in this work. Convergence pa- rameters in BigDFT were set such that total energy dif- $\frac{3}{71}$  ferences were converged up to  $10^{-5}$  Ha and all configu- rations were relaxed until the maximal force component on any atom reached the noise level of the calculation, <sup>74</sup> which was of the order of  $1 \text{ meV/A}$ .

 $\omega$  ranged such that a pentagon ring does not contain more  $\pi$  figurations with a wide structural diversity, based on var-<sup>42</sup> (at non-adjacent sites). Putting more boron atoms in a <sup>79</sup> gated configurations we considered both filled hexagons <sup>43</sup> ring increases the bond lengths and decreases the sta-<sup>80</sup> and filled pentagons as they were demonstrated to be the 44 bility. A study by Viani and Santos [14] on various  $\frac{1}{10}$  building blocks [23, 24] in the B<sub>80</sub> boron fullerene [25]; <sup>75</sup> In order to speed up our exhaustive configurational <sup>76</sup> search we started both from diluted and aggregated con-<sup>78</sup> ious C<sub>n</sub> backbones (with  $n=60, 58$  or 48). For aggre-

 $\alpha$  as drons in opened  $C_{60}$  fullerenes. In addition we generated  $\mathcal{S}_4$  structures of high symmetry for the stoichiometry  $\mathrm{C}_{48}$  and added 12 boron atoms at locations where it seemed appropriate by intuition. Some short MHM runs start-<sup>87</sup> ing from the energetically most promising configurations allowed us to see trends leading to an energy lowering. From these ones a second set was derived by applying ad- ditional modifications (e.g. exchanging boron and carbon atoms) in order to speed up the exploration in a second step of MHM. Finally we systematically exchanged boron and carbon atoms up to second-nearest neighbors for the most favorable structures emerging from this process. In this way we could generate more than thousand configu-rations containing a large variety of structural motifs.

<sup>97</sup> Among our  $B_{12}C_{48}$  structures obtained in this way we found several being considerably lower in energy than the 99 three most favorable ones identified by Manaa  $et$  al. [15]. Whereas the new configurations agree with them in the overall shape exhibiting a cage-like structure, they differ substantially by the fact that the boron is not distributed over the entire cluster, but aggregated in a patch, thereby separating the surface of the compound in a boron-rich and a boron-poor part. This is in strong contrast to the widely accepted belief that the boron atoms should be isolated [26], i.e. be always separated by one or several carbon atoms. We will refer to our novel structural motif as "patched".

 The low energy part of the spectrum that we have ex- plored is shown in Fig. 1, together with the structures of the 12 lowest isomers that we have found, the lowest structure exhibiting a filled pentagon and the three most favorable diluted structures. The latter ones turned out to be identical to the three lowest structures identified by Manaa et al. In total we found 143 new structures that are lower in energy than the putative ground state proposed so far. We made however no effort to find all the structures in this energy interval and so more than 143 structures are expected to exist. The energy levels are colored on a scale from 0 to 1 which describes the relative amount of carbon atoms being first neighbors to boron. Thus a value of 0 (red) means that the boron atoms are only surrounded by boron – which can obvi- ously not happen –, whereas a value of 1 (blue) means that the boron atoms are only surrounded by carbon. Consequently the coloring of the patched structures tends towards red values, while the coloring of the diluted ones tends towards blue values. In the lowest structures the boron atoms form a patch with frayed boundaries, which results in astonishing configurations where carbon atoms have four boron atoms as first neighbors. Furthermore it is surprising that the lowest structure exhibits a hep-<sup>140</sup> tures shown in Fig. 1. The first column shows the en- tagon, which is usually less favorable than the penta- and  $141$  ergy separation  $\Delta E$  of the configurations with respect to hexagons, and twice two adjacent pentagons, which is in <sup>142</sup> the lowest structure. We can see that our new ground general very disadvantageous [27]. However these pen-<sup>143</sup> state is 1.8 eV lower in energy than the putative ground tagons do not only consist of carbon, but there are some <sup>1445</sup> state proposed so far. In the second column we present substitutional boron atoms contained within them.



FIG. 1. Plot of the 12 energetically most favorable structures, the most favorable one containing a filled heptagon and the three lowest diluted configurations for  $B_{12}C_{48}$ , together with the low energy part of the spectrum. The coloring scheme is explained in the text.

Tab. I gives some more information about the struc-the HOMO-LUMO gaps of the structures. The values

	$\Delta E$	gap	$\Delta H$	РG	RMSD
	(eV)	(eV)	(eV)		(bohr)
1st	0.000	0.457	0.340	$C_{s}$	0.000
2nd	0.232	0.477	0.344	$C_{\rm s}$	1.003
3rd	0.362	0.646	0.346	$C_{\rm s}$	1.717
4th	0.462	0.645	0.348	$C_1$	1.092
5th	0.553	0.295	0.350	$C_{\rm s}$	1.589
6th	0.557	0.236	$0.350\,$	$C_1$	0.558
7th	0.575	0.247	$0.350\,$	$C_1$	1.486
8th	0.582	0.452	$0.350\,$	$C_1$	1.579
9th	0.607	0.604	0.350	$C_{\rm s}$	0.783
10th	0.624	0.378	0.351	$C_1$	0.533
11th	0.644	0.616	$\rm 0.351$	$C_{\rm s}$	1.344
12th	0.665	0.644	$\rm 0.351$	$C_{\rm s}$	1.490
27th	0.978	0.695	$\rm 0.357$	$_{\rm C_1}$	1.678
144th	1.836	0.494	${0.371}$	$\mathrm{S}_6$	3.465
$295\mathrm{th}$	2.273	${0.316}$	${0.378}$	$D_{3d}$	3.501
453th 2.661		0.302	$\;\:0.385$	$\mathrm{S}_6$	3.442

TABLE I. Properties of the structures shown in Fig. 1.

 $_{147}$  range from  $0.2 \text{ eV}$  to  $0.7 \text{ eV}$ , thus being rather small,  $_{185}$ <sup>148</sup> and do not exhibit any special pattern. In particular <sup>186</sup> formed an extended and unbiased search for the ground <sup>149</sup> there is no notable difference between the class of the <sup>187</sup> state. We again used several approaches to generate <sup>150</sup> patched and the diluted structures. The next column <sup>188</sup> many different input structures: We added two atoms to  $\frac{1}{151}$  shows the formation energies per atom  $\Delta H$  with respect  $\frac{1}{159}$  the lowest isomers of B<sub>12</sub>C<sub>48</sub> as described; we replaced  $152$  to the bulk conformations of boron and carbon (α-boron  $190$  ten carbon atoms by boron in a C<sub>60</sub> and added two addi-<sup>153</sup> and cubic diamond, respectively), which is defined by <sup>191</sup> tional interstitial boron atoms at appropriate positions;  $\Delta H = (E - n_B E_B^0 - n_C E_C^0)/(n_B + n_C)$  with E being 192 and we replaced 12 carbon atoms by boron starting from <sup>155</sup> the energy of the compound and  $E_X^0$  and  $n_X$  being the <sup>193</sup> a C<sub>62</sub> fullerene. For this last approach we took two ex- $\frac{1}{156}$  energy per atom of the reference configurations and the  $\frac{1}{194}$  amples that were first described by Ayuela *et al.* [29] and <sup>157</sup> number of atoms, respectively. In the next column we <sup>195</sup> Qian et al. [30] and turned out to be the most stable C<sub>62</sub>  $\frac{1}{158}$  give the point groups of the structures. Whereas the di-  $\frac{1}{196}$  isomers in a study by Cui *et al.* [31]. As for the case of <sup>159</sup> luted structures are rather symmetric (point groups  $S_6$  <sup>197</sup>  $B_{12}C_{48}$  we again continued by either manually rearrang- $_{160}$  and  $D_{3d}$ ), the new structures are of much lower symme-  $_{198}$  ing the atoms or by using the configurations as input for 161 try ( $C_s$  and  $C_1$ ). Finally we present the RMSD [28] of the 199 subsequent MHM runs. <sup>162</sup> structures with respect to the new putative ground state. <sup>200</sup> It turned out that the structure that we constructed <sup>163</sup> It is obvious that there is a clear separation between <sub>201</sub> by hand from the ground state of  $B_{12}C_{48}$  is energetically  $_{164}$  the patched structures and the diluted ones. Within the <sub>202</sub> the most favorable one. In addition, at least 673 patched <sup>165</sup> patched ones, however, there is no relation between the <sup>203</sup> structures are lower in energy than the most favorable di-<sup>166</sup> energy and the RMSD.

 A more complete overview of the energies and the cor-<sup>205</sup> our ground state. The low energy part of the spectrum is responding RMSD values is shown in Fig. 2(a). Here we <sup>206</sup> shown in Fig. 3, together with figures of the 12 structures  $_{169}$  plot for all structures up to  $8 \text{ eV}$  the energy difference and  $_{207}$  being lowest in energy, the most favorable one contain- the RMSD with respect to the putative ground state. As <sup>208</sup> ing a filled pentagon and the two most favorable diluted can be seen there is a broad range with structures whose <sup>209</sup> configurations. The energy levels are coded in colors in  $\mu$ <sub>172</sub> energies are completely uncorrelated to the value of the <sub>210</sub> analogy to Fig. 1. As for the case of  $B_{12}C_{48}$  it is clear that 173 RMSD. However this range is sharply bounded at a value 211 all low lying minima correspond to the same structural of about 2 bohr, separating it from energetically higher <sup>212</sup> motif where the boron is aggregated in a patch. configurations.

<sup>176</sup> By filling the heptagon in the putative ground state of <sup>2145</sup> structures shown in Fig. 3. The HOMO-LUMO gaps are  $177 \text{ B}_{12}\text{C}_{48}$  by two carbon atoms – thus modifying it into a  $216$  – except for the few lowest structures – in general smaller  $_{178}$  pentagon and a hexagon – the two adjacent pentagons  $_{217}$  than the ones for  $B_{12}C_{48}$ ; again there is no notable dif-<sup>179</sup> which are present twice on both sides of the heptagon <sup>218</sup> ference between the patched and the diluted structures. 180 are turned into a pentagon and a hexagon each. Since 219 The values for the formation energy  $\Delta H$  are slightly <sup>181</sup> this structure consists only of pentagons and hexagons  $_{220}$  lower than their counterparts for  $B_{12}C_{48}$  in Tab. I, in-<sup>182</sup> and furthermore respects the isolated pentagon rule, it <sup>221</sup> dicating that it is more likely to encounter experimen-

0

0 0.5 1 1.5 2 2.5 3 3.5 4

RMSD (bohr)  $(b)B_{12}C_{50}$ 

FIG. 2. The energy difference versus the RMSD, both with respect to the putative ground states.

energy (eV)

0 0.5 1 1.5 2 2.5 3 3.5 4

RMSD (bohr)  $\rm (a)B_{12}C_{48}$ 

<sup>183</sup> is a promising candidate for the global minimum of the <sup>184</sup> stoichiometry  $B_{12}C_{50}$ .

In order to confirm this assumption we again per-

<sup>204</sup> luted configuration which is 3.9 eV higher in energy than

<sup>213</sup> In Tab. II we present some more information about the



FIG. 3. The low energy part of the spectrum for  $B_{12}C_{50}$ , together with figures of the 12 energetically lowest structures, the most favorable one containing a filled pentagon and the two most favorable diluted configurations.

<sup>222</sup> tally the stoichiometry  $B_{12}C_{50}$  than  $B_{12}C_{48}$ . The point <sup>223</sup> groups exhibit a wider variation compared to the case of  $_{224}$  B<sub>12</sub>C<sub>48</sub>; the energetically most favorable structures have <sup>225</sup> the point groups  $C_1$ ,  $C_2$ ,  $C_s$  and  $C_{2v}$ . On the other hand <sup>226</sup> the diluted structures are of lower symmetry than their  $_{\rm 227}$  counterparts for  $\rm B_{12}C_{48}$  and exhibit only the point group  $_{\rm 262}$  $_{228}$  Cs. The RMSD behaves similar as for  $B_{12}C_{48}$ . A more  $_{263}$  Computing time was provided by the CSCS and GENCI <sup>229</sup> complete overview of the energy versus the RMSD – anal- <sup>264</sup> (grant 6194).

	$\Delta E$	gap	$\Delta H$	РG	RMSD
	(eV)	(eV)	(eV)		(bohr)
1st	0.000	0.534	0.322	$C_{\rm s}$	0.000
2nd	0.110	0.416	0.324	C <sub>2</sub>	1.363
3rd	0.158	0.434	0.325	$C_1$	1.209
4th	0.237	0.283	0.326	$C_1$	0.976
5th	0.262	0.338	0.327	$C_1$	1.285
6th	0.358	0.308	0.328	$C_{2v}$	1.390
7th	0.377	0.154	0.328	$C_{\rm s}$	1.168
8th	0.453	0.215	0.330	$C_1$	1.113
9th	0.494	0.249	0.330	$C_1$	0.530
10th	0.515	0.380	0.331	$C_1$	1.451
11th	0.539	0.227	0.331	$C_1$	0.539
12th	0.595	0.363	0.332	$C_1$	0.931
25th	0.939	0.296	0.337	$C_{2v}$	1.750
673th	3.921	0.204	0.386	$C_{\rm s}$	3.289
965th	5.227	0.458	0.407	$C_{\rm s}$	3.080

TABLE II. The same data as in Tab. I, this time for the structures shown in Fig. 3.

230 ogous to the one shown in Fig.  $2(a)$  – is given in Fig.  $2(b)$ .  $_{231}$  Both the last column of Tab. II and Fig.  $2(a)$  show again <sup>232</sup> a clear separation between the patched and the diluted <sup>233</sup> configurations.

 In conclusion, we have shown that the ground state of boron-carbon heterofullerenes is fundamentally different from what was thought previously. It consists of incom- plete carbon cages whose openings are filled with boron patches. In a broader context our results show that  $\frac{1}{239}$  doping in sp<sup>2</sup>-materials is not yet well understood and that no universally valid rules are available to predict which structural motifs are the most stable ones in such doped structures. Our results could also give guidance to synthesis efforts [32] for such heterofullerenes. The steep rise of the energy of metastable configurations as a function of the distance from the ground state shown in Fig. 2 indicates that there is a substantial driving force towards low energy motifs with patches and suggests that a synthesis of patched structures should be possible. The energy gap between the ground state  $_{\rm 250}$  and the lowest metastable state (0.2 eV for  $\rm B_{12}C_{48}$  and <sup>251</sup> 0.1 eV for  $B_{12}C_{50}$  is however much smaller than in  $C_{60}$  (1.6 eV) and reaching the ground state might therefore be difficult. The standard synthesis procedure of substi- tuting [5] carbon atoms by boron atoms is unlikely to succeed for heterofullerenes containing a larger number of boron atoms which then form patches. Planar boron clusters that are structurally similar to the boron patches found in our ground state can however be synthesized ex- perimentally [33] and might form growth nuclei for such heterofullerenes in a carbon rich spark or vapor chamber. 261

We acknowledge support from the SNF and HP2C.

- [1] H. W. Kroto, J. R. Heath, S. C. O'Brien, R. F. Curl,
- and R. E. Smalley, "C60: Buckminsterfullerene," *Nature*, vol. 318, no. 6042, pp. 162–163, 1985.
- 268 [2] W. Krätschmer, L. D. Lamb, K. Fostiropoulos, and D. R.
- Huffman, "Solid C60: a new form of carbon," *Nature*, vol. 347, no. 6291, pp. 354–358, 1990.
- [3] Y. Zhao, Y.-H. Kim, A. C. Dillon, M. J. Heben, and S. B. Zhang, "Hydrogen storage in novel organometallic buckyballs," *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, vol. 94, p. 155504, 2005.
- [4] T. Guo, C. Jin, and R. E. Smalley, "Doping bucky: formation and properties of boron-doped buckminster- fullerene," *J. Phys. Chem.*, vol. 95, no. 13, pp. 4948–4950, 1991.
- [5] P. W. Dunk, A. RodrAguez-Fortea, N. K. Kaiser, H. Shi- ˜ nohara, J. M. Poblet, and H. W. Kroto, "Formation of heterofullerenes by direct exposure of c60 to boron va- por," *Angew. Chem.-Ger. Edit.*, vol. 125, no. 1, pp. 333– 337, 2013.
- 283 [6] L. Hultman, S. Stafström, Z. Czigány, J. Neidhardt, N. Hellgren, I. F. Brunell, K. Suenaga, and C. Colliex, "Cross-linked nano-onions of carbon nitride in the solid 286 phase: Existence of a novel  $C_{48}N_{12}$  aza-fullerene," *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, vol. 87, p. 225503, 2001.
- [7] H. Wang, T. Maiyalagan, and X. Wang, "Review on recent progress in nitrogen-doped graphene: Synthesis, characterization, and its potential applications," *ACS Catal.*, vol. 2, no. 5, pp. 781–794, 2012.
- [8] R.-H. Xie, G. W. Bryant, J. Zhao, V. H. Smith, A. Di Carlo, and A. Pecchia, "Tailorable acceptor  $c_{60-n}b_n$  and donor  $c_{60-m}n_m$  pairs for molecular electron-ics," *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, vol. 90, p. 206602, 2003.
- [9] C. J. Pickard and R. J. Needs, "Ab initio random struc- ture searching," *J. Phys.: Condens. Matter*, vol. 23, no. 5, p. 053201, 2011.
- [10] C. W. Glass, A. R. Oganov, and N. Hansen, "Uspex— evolutionary crystal structure prediction," *Comput. Phys. Commun.*, vol. 175, no. 11-12, pp. 713 – 720, 2006.
- [11] Y. Wang, J. Lv, L. Zhu, and Y. Ma, "Calypso: A method
- for crystal structure prediction," *Comput. Phys. Com-mun.*, vol. 183, no. 10, pp. 2063 – 2070, 2012.
- [12] S. Goedecker, "Minima hopping: an efficient search method for the global minimum of the potential energy surface of complex molecular systems.," *J. Chem. Phys.*, vol. 120, no. 21, pp. 9911–7, 2004.
- [13] I. Garg, H. Sharma, K. Dharamvir, and V. Jindal, "Sub- stitutional patterns in boron doped heterofullerenes c60 nbn (n = 112)," *J. Comput. Theor. Nanosci.*, vol. 8, no. 4, pp. 642–655, 2011.
- [14] L. Viani and M. D. Santos, "Comparative study of lower fullerenes doped with boron and nitrogen," *Solid State Commun.*, vol. 138, no. 10-11, pp. 498–501, 2006.
- [15] M. Riad Manaa, H. a. Ichord, and D. W. Sprehn, "Pre- dicted molecular structure of novel C48B12," *Chem. Phys. Lett.*, vol. 378, no. 3-4, pp. 449–455, 2003.
- [16] M. R. Manaa, D. W. Sprehn, and H. a. Ichord, "Pre-diction of extended aromaticity for a novel  $C(48)N(12)$
- azafullerene structure.," *J. Am. Chem. Soc.*, vol. 124, no. 47, pp. 13990–1, 2002.
- [17] L. Genovese, A. Neelov, S. Goedecker, T. Deutsch,

 S. A. Ghasemi, A. Willand, D. Caliste, O. Zilberberg, M. Rayson, A. Bergman, and R. Schneider, "Daubechies wavelets as a basis set for density functional pseudopo- tential calculations.," *J. Chem. Phys.*, vol. 129, no. 1, p. 014109, 2008.

- [18] I. Daubechies *et al.*, *Ten lectures on wavelets*, vol. 61. SIAM, 1992.
- [19] C. Hartwigsen, S. Goedecker, and J. Hutter, "Relativistic separable dual-space Gaussian pseudopotentials from H to Rn," *Phys. Rev. B*, vol. 58, no. 7, pp. 3641–3662, 1998.
- [20] J. P. Perdew, K. Burke, and M. Ernzerhof, "Generalized Gradient Approximation Made Simple," *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, vol. 77, no. 18, pp. 3865–3868, 1996.
- [21] C. R. Hsing, C. M. Wei, N. D. Drummond, and R. J. Needs, "Quantum monte carlo studies of covalent and metallic clusters: Accuracy of density functional approx-imations," *Phys. Rev. B*, vol. 79, p. 245401, 2009.
- [22] M. A. Marques, M. J. Oliveira, and T. Burnus, "Libxc: A library of exchange and correlation functionals for density functional theory," *Comput. Phys. Commun.*, vol. 183, no. 10, pp. 2272 – 2281, 2012.
- [23] P. Pochet, L. Genovese, S. De, S. Goedecker, D. Caliste, S. A. Ghasemi, K. Bao, and T. Deutsch, "Low-energy boron fullerenes: Role of disorder and potential synthesis pathways," *Phys. Rev. B*, vol. 83, p. 081403, 2011.
- [24] P. Boulanger, M. Moriniere, L. Genovese, and P. Pochet, "Selecting boron fullerenes by cage-doping mechanisms," *J. Chem. Phys.*, vol. 138, no. 18, p. 184302, 2013.
- [25] N. Gonzalez Szwacki, A. Sadrzadeh, and B. Yakobson, "B80 Fullerene: An Ab Initio Prediction of Geometry, Stability, and Electronic Structure," *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, vol. 98, no. 16, p. 166804, 2007.
- [26] F. Shakib and M. Momeni, "Isolation: A strategy for obtaining highly doped heterofullerenes," *Chem. Phys. Lett.*, vol. 514, no. 4-6, pp. 321–324, 2011.
- [27] H. W. Kroto, "The stability of the fullerenes Cn, with n = 24, 28, 32, 36, 50, 60 and 70," *Nature*, vol. 329, no. 6139, pp. 529–531, 1987.
- [28] A. Sadeghi, S. A. Ghasemi, M. A. Lill, and S. Goedecker, "Metrics for measuring distances in configuration spaces," 2013.
- [29] A. Ayuela, P. W. Fowler, D. Mitchell, R. Schmidt, G. Seifert, and F. Zerbetto, "C 62 : Theoretical Evidence for a Nonclassical Fullerene with a Heptagonal Ring," *J. Phys. Chem.*, vol. 100, no. 39, pp. 15634–15636, 1996.
- [30] W. Qian, S.-C. Chuang, R. B. Amador, T. Jarrosson, M. Sander, S. Pieniazek, S. I. Khan, and Y. Rubin, "Syn- thesis of stable derivatives of  $c(62)$ : the first nonclassical fullerene incorporating a four-membered ring.," *J. Am. Chem. Soc.*, vol. 125, no. 8, pp. 2066–7, 2003.
- [31] Y.-H. Cui, D.-L. Chen, W. Q. Tian, and J.-K. Feng, "Structures, stabilities, and electronic and optical prop- erties of C62 fullerene isomers.," *J. Phys. Chem. A*, vol. 111, no. 32, pp. 7933–9, 2007.
- [32] S. De, A. Willand, M. Amsler, P. Pochet, L. Genovese, and S. Goedecker, "Energy landscape of fullerene materi- als: A comparison of boron to boron nitride and carbon," *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, vol. 106, p. 225502, 2011.
- [33] H.-J. Zhai, B. Kiran, J. Li, and L.-S. Wang, "Hydro- carbon analogues of boron clusters–planarity, aromatic- ity and antiaromaticity.," *Nat. Mater.*, vol. 2, no. 12, pp. 827–33, 2003.