Meta-theoretical aspects of the two case studies of networking theoretical perspectives: Focusing on the treatments of theoretical terms in different networking strategies
Yusuke Shinno

HAL Id: hal-01948868
https://hal.science/hal-01948868
Submitted on 11 Dec 2018

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L’archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire HAL, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d’enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.
Meta-theoretical aspects of the two case studies of networking theoretical perspectives: Focusing on the treatments of theoretical terms in different networking strategies

Yusuke Shinno

Osaka Kyoiku University, Faculty of Education, Osaka, Japan; shinno@cc.osaka-kyoiku.ac.jp

Keywords: Networking strategies, combining and coordinating, integrating, theoretical terms.

Networking strategies and the present study

In the past decade, strategies for connecting theories have been intensively discussed (e.g., Prediger et al., 2008). According to Prediger et al. (2008), the networking strategies are structured as follows: understanding and making understandable; comparing and contrasting; combining and coordinating; and integrating locally and synthesizing. The purpose of this study is to show my/our two case studies related to the networking theories in order to consider some meta-theoretical aspects of these studies. I will briefly introduce the two case studies, which have been developed by myself (Shinno, 2016) and by a Japanese research group (Shinno et al., 2015). The first study is concerned with combining and coordinating, and the second study is concerned with locally integrating.

By reflecting the researchers’ practice on the two case studies at meta-theoretical aspects, I attempt to reconsider different treatments of theoretical terms in different strategies. This may allow us to analyse transition between pre/post statuses of the networking, although different strategies can be utilized for different purposes. Comparing the two studies, by focusing on the treatments of terms, I discuss how the elaboration of the original terms may influence the degree of integration.

The two case studies: Overview

Case study 1: Combining and coordinating

Shinno (2016) aims to characterize the development of mathematical discourses in a series of lessons in terms of the model of semiotic chaining by Norma Presmeg and the commognitive framework (Sfard, 2008). One of the research questions of this study is as follows: In what ways can the model of semiotic chaining be combined with the commognitive framework in the analysis of reification in the learning of square roots? For gaining multi-faceted insight of the reification phenomenon, Shinno (2016) attempts to coordinate the commognitive terms (such as keywords, visual mediators, endorsed narratives, and routines) with the semiotic terms (such as signifier, signified, and interpretant). By doing so, Shinno (2016) intends that the implicit meta-discursive rule (routine) may become explicitly identified as the semiotic component (interpretant).

Case study 2: Integrating locally

Shinno et al. (2015) aims to construct a theoretical framework for curriculum development for teaching proof by means of integrating different theoretical constructs related to proof. In developing a framework, the notion of Mathematical Theorem comprised of the three elements — statement, proof, and theory — is used as the foreground of the framework. Some other theoretical constructs, such as mathematical proof by Nicolas Balacheff and local organization by Hans Freudenthal, are locally integrated into the framework in order to consider the wide range of contents and levels of
statement, proof, and theory in curriculum. As a result, Shinno et al. (2015) elaborate some additional categories by introducing new terms, for example, real world logic, local theory, and quasi-axiomatic theory, which are included in a category of ‘nature of system’ based on the concepts of local organization.

Discussion: Meta-theoretical aspects

In the first study, when coordinating the semiotic and discursive terms, it seems that a theoretical term is interchangeable with another term (e.g., “an interpretant” with “a routine”). Therefore, even after the coordinating, it seems that the treatments of the terms can be preserved in both theoretical contexts. In other words, the results of the empirical studies can feedback to the original theories. In the case of Shinno (2016), it allows to analyse the reification phenomenon from the two different perspectives and to gain a deeper understanding of the phenomenon. In the second study, it seems that the basic constructs to be networked are ‘concepts’ rather than ‘theories’. Some original concepts such as local organization can be elaborated and integrated locally into new terminologies or categorizations in the constructed theoretical framework. Since elaborated terms have a consistency within the new framework and these can create new meanings, such terms cannot preserve their original senses. Thus, this networking strategy may contribute to establish a new theoretical discourse rather than to understand a certain empirical phenomenon. It seems that this strategy also can be utilized for developing or elaborating a new theoretical model.

References


Note: The digital poster can be available from the following link: http://www.osaka-kyoiku.ac.jp/~shinno/shinno/poster.html