

# The Wolf in Virgil

Lee Fratantuono

# ▶ To cite this version:

Lee Fratantuono. The Wolf in Virgil. Revue des études anciennes, 2018, 120 (1), pp.101-120. hal-01944509

# HAL Id: hal-01944509 https://hal.science/hal-01944509

Submitted on 23 Sep 2019

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

Copyright



# REVUE DES Etudes Anciennes

TOME 120 2018 - N°1

UNIVERSITÉ BORDEAUX MONTAIGNE PRESSES UNIVERSITAIRES DE BORDEAUX

# THE WOLF IN VIRGIL

## Lee FRATANTUONO\*

*Résumé*. – Le loup figure parmi les animaux les plus significatifs du bestiaire du corpus poétique de Virgile. Une étude minutieuse de chaque occurence de cet animal dans les œuvres de Virgile révèlera comment le poète utilise cette image lupine pour créer un effet particulier dans sa description de la transformation des coutumes troyennes en coutumes romaines.

*Abstract.* – The wolf is among the most significant animals in the zoology of Virgil's poetic corpus. A careful study of each appearance and reference to the animal in Virgil's works will reveal how the poet employs lupine imagery to special effect in his narrative of the transformation of Trojan customs and culture into Roman.

*Mots-clés.* – Virgile, loup, lycanthropie, Camilla, Romulus, pastorale.

Keywords. - Virgil, Wolf, Lycanthropy, Camilla, Romulus, Pastoral.

<sup>\*</sup> Ohio Wesleyan University ; lmfratan@owu.edu

Among the myriad animals that populate the zoological landscape of Virgilian verse, the wolf holds a preeminent place.<sup>1</sup> We shall consider the various appearances of wolves and lupine imagery in Virgil's extant works, with particular attention to the poet's use of the animal as a key element in the natural landscape of his epic *Aeneid*. Our investigation will illustrate the Virgilian employment of the wolf as a multifaceted creature in the author's commentary on the nascent Augustan regime, and on the continuing unfolding of the history of the Roman children of the wolf.<sup>2</sup> We shall also see how seemingly disconnected allusions to wolves and lupine lore in Virgil's epic contribute to an important element of the poet's consideration of the founding of Rome, and of its renewal under Augustus. In particular, we shall observe how Virgil uses lycanthropic folklore as a key element in his depiction of the transformation of Troy into Rome.<sup>3</sup>

#### I. – LUPINE REFERENCES IN THE ECLOGUES

We begin with a reference to the wolf as a classic predator from Virgil's second eclogue:

torva leaena lupum sequitur, lupus ipse capellam, florentem cytisum sequitur lasciva capella, te Corydon, o Alexi: trahit sua quemque voluptas. (E. II, 63-65)<sup>4</sup>

The carnivorous wolf pursues the herbivorous nanny goat; the wolf is not, however, the apex predator in its environment, for the savage lioness hunts down the smaller beast. The sentiment in an erotic context was not original to Virgil, as the commentators have noted together with the element of poetic fancy (for lionesses do not in reality hunt wolves, and, in

<sup>1.</sup> On Virgilian wolves see especially S. ROCCA, «Lupo» in F. DELLA CORTE, ed., *Enciclopedia virgiliana* III, Roma 1987, p. 286-287; L. FRATANTUONO, «Wolves» in R. F. THOMAS, J. M. ZIOLKOWSKI eds., *The Virgil Encyclopedia* (hereafter *VE*), *Volume III*, Malden 2014, p. 1391; J. M. C. TOYNBEE, *Animals in Roman Life and Art*, London 1973, p. 101-102. Note also W. RICHTER, «Wolf» in Pauly-Wissowa, *Realencyclopädie*, Suppl. XV (1978), especially C 2 («Charakter») and C 3 («Physiognomik»), columns 965-966, with particular reference to negative connotations of lupine imagery. I am indebted to the helpful criticisms, suggestions, and corrections of the two referees that vastly improved this study; all errors that remain are my own.

<sup>2.</sup> For the celebrated place of the wolf in the diverse strands of early Roman mythography and history, note C. MAZZONI, *She-Wolf: The Story of a Roman Icon*, Cambridge 2010. More generally, note W. H. ROSCHER, *Ausführliches Lexikon der griechischen und römischen Mythologie, Zweiter Band, Zweite Abteilung*, Leipzig 1894-1897.

<sup>3.</sup> In his presentation of the Volscian heroine Camilla, who, as we shall consider, may have lycanthropic associations; we shall see how her destruction by the wolf-slayer Arruns results in the salvation of Aeneas, and, implicitly, the successful progression from a Trojan past to an Italian future.

<sup>4.</sup> All references to Virgil's text are taken from G. B. CONTE ed., *P. Vergilius Maro: Aeneis*, Berlin-New York 2009.

any case, they were unknown to the poet's contemporary European wilderness).<sup>5</sup> Throughout Virgil's works, unsurprisingly the bloodthirsty character of the wolf is repeatedly highlighted as its defining trait.

No Italian farmer or herdsman, to be sure, needed to reminded of the threat of lupine incursion:

*D. Triste lupus stabulis, maturis frugibus imbres, arboribus venti, nobis Amaryllidos irae.* (*E.* III, 80-81)

Once again the wolf is associated with its characteristic predatory behavior, and once again the context is amatory: the wolf is baleful to livestock, just as the wrath of Amaryllis is a bitter cross for Damoetas.<sup>6</sup> Wolves, downpours, and winds are all natural metaphors for the wrath of an aggrieved lover.

The wolf is so reliably savage that its pacification is seen as a symptom of a *de facto* Golden Age:

nec lupus insidias pecori, nec retia cervis ulla dolum meditantur: amat bonus otia Daphnis. (E. V, 60-61)

The wolf does not contemplate any trick or act of treachery against sheep and cattle, for Daphnis has arrived at the threshold of Olympus (E. V, 57-58).<sup>7</sup> Again, the salient lupine attribute is predation; the cessation of hostile behavior is a mark of a renewed, more pacific world.<sup>8</sup> Otium is possible once the wolf is rendered peaceful.

At *E*. VII, 51-52, the shepherd Thyrsis makes reference to how little wolves care for «number»:

hic tantum Boreae curamus frigora quantum aut numerum lupus aut torrentia flumina ripas.

Safe and comfortable in the presence of a hearth and its blazing fire, the cold is a distant memory of no concern; the comparison of the shepherds' carefree attitude is to the behavior of wolves and rushing rivers: the former are not concerned with «number», the latter with their

<sup>5.</sup> For the literary pedigree of the trope, see W. CLAUSEN, *A commentary on Vergil «Eclogues»*, Oxford 1994, *ad loc.*; on the non-existence of European lions in Virgilian times and the diet of lionesses, the notes of R. COLEMAN, Vergil, *Eclogues*, Cambridge 1977.

<sup>6.</sup> The threat from wolves in twentieth-century Italy is discussed by E. FRAENKEL, *Horace*, Oxford 1957, p. 186 n. 3; cf. R. G. M. NISBET, M. HUBBARD, *A Commentary on Horace*, *Odes*, *Book I*, Oxford 1970, *ad* c. 1.22.9 *lupus*. On certain aspects of the significance of the poet's description of what is «baleful» (*triste*), J. VEREMANS, *Éléments symboliques dans la III<sup>e</sup> Bucolique de Virgile*, Bruxelles 1969, p. 69.

<sup>7.</sup> The cessation of hunting was associated with the coming of peace and tranquility; for the topos see further A. CUCCHIARELLI, *Publio Virgilio Marone: Le Bucoliche*, Roma 2012, *ad loc*.

<sup>8.</sup> See further here M. C. J. PUTNAM, Virgil's Pastoral Art: Studies in the Eclogues, Princeton 1969, p. 184-185.

banks. The commentators have questioned the precise referent of *numerum*; it may refer either to the wolf's ovine prey, or to the pursuing hunters who seek revenge.<sup>9</sup> The river is seen as a destructive force, and the wolf, too, is exceptional in its violence toward flocks; there is no strength in numbers for hapless lambs in the face of canid assault. The *torrentia flumina* recall the *imbres* of *E*. III, 80; the wolf is once again cast as a particularly violent element of the natural world, a destructive force alongside the hazards of flood and inundation.<sup>10</sup>

Just as it would be a mark of *aurea saecula* for wolves to abandon their favorite pursuit, so it would be impossible ever to imagine the wolf fleeing from the sheep:

nunc et ovis ultro fugiat lupus, aurea durae mala ferant quercus, narcisso floreant alnus (E. VIII, 52-53)

A miniature catalogue of *adynata* commences with a lupine impossibility; the passage reinforces the image of the wolf as vicious killer of weaker animals.

All of the wolfish passages cited above match the expectations of Virgil's pastoral song. The wolf is the classic hazard to domestic animals; in a utopia, the fierce antagonist will lay aside all ferocity (we might think of the ultimate in peaceful lupine images for a Roman audience – the she-wolf's suckling of Romulus and Remus).

There is more to the Virgilian presentation of the wolf, however, than mere reminders of the animal's sanguinary repasts. Lupine lore made room for the belief that human beings could be transformed into wolves – the phenomenon of lycanthropy.<sup>11</sup> The eighth eclogue includes a Virgilian reference to such lupine metamorphosis:

has herbas atque haec Ponto mihi lecta veneno ipse dedit Moeris (nascuntur plurima Ponto); his ego saepe lupum fieri et se condere silvis Moerim, saepe animas imis excire sepulcris, atque satas alio vidi traducere messis. (E. VIII, 95-99)

Moeris is able to raise the dead and to transfer crops from one field to another; he is possessed of the ability to transform himself into a wolf.

<sup>9.</sup> Cf. Page's «The 'number' of the sheep does not terrify the wolf; he despises it.» (T. E. PAGE, *P. Vergili* Maronis Bucolica et Georgica, London 1898, ad loc.).

<sup>10.</sup> The poet may be thinking here of the Tiber's periodic floods; cf. R. MAYER, *Horace: Odes Book I*, Cambridge 2012, *ad* c. 1.2.13-20.

<sup>11.</sup> Note here N. METZGER, Wolfsmenschen und nächtliche Heimsuchungen: Zur kulturhistorischen Verortung vomoderner Konzepte von Lykanthropie und Ephilates, Remscheid 2011; G. SCHMELING, A Commentary on the Satyrica of Petronius, Oxford 2011, ad 62.6. Lycanthropic lore is alluded to in the description of the witch in the cemetery at Tibullus, c. 1.5.53-56 (where see R. MALTBY, Tibullus, Elegies, Leeds 2002, ad loc.).

From a conventional enough presentation of the wolf as ovine marauder, Virgil has proceeded to introduce perhaps the most famous of all the elements of wolfish folklore – lycanthropic metamorphosis. The magician Moeris recurs, too, in the ninth eclogue, where the poet alludes to yet another lupine legend:

nunc oblita mihi tot carmina, vox quoque Moerin iam fugit ipsa; lupi Moerin videre priores. (E. IX, 53-54)

Moeris has suffered loss of voice on account of a wolf's having seen him first – a superstition that can be found as early as Plato.<sup>12</sup> It is possible that the association of wolves with aphonia was a natural outgrowth and concomitant of belief in lycanthropy: the lycanthrope, after all, loses the ability to speak.<sup>13</sup> The Moeris of the eighth eclogue is able to transform himself into a wolf; one consequence of that metamorphosis, as it were, is referenced in the ninth – the loss of the ability to speak. The name «Moeris» evokes the Greek for «fate» or «destiny»; for Moeris, fate equals the silent curse of lycanthropy.<sup>14</sup>

The wolf of Virgilian pastoral is a classic predator; it is also associated with certain elements of folklore and superstition. We shall see how the poet expands on these facets of lupine lore in his subsequent works.

#### II. - LUPINE REFERENCES IN THE GEORGICS

Virgil blames Jupiter for the depradations of wolves; lupine raids are listed among the baleful features of life after the Saturnian Age:

praedarique lupos iussit... (G. 1.130)

Men must contend with wolves; Jupiter wished that via the insertion of challenges and threats to safety and security, humanity might develop such skills as arts as hunting and similar pursuits.<sup>15</sup> Jupiter oversees a transition to a world in which labor reigns supreme (G. 1.145... *labor omnia vicit*).<sup>16</sup>

<sup>12.</sup> Cf. *Respublica* 336D; Theocritus, *Id.* XIV, 22 (with Gow's notes *ad loc.*); Pliny the Elder, *HN* VIII, 80 (with Pline l'ancien, *Histoire naturelle, Livre VIII, Magie et pharmacopée*, J. ERNOUT éd., Paris 2003). For the «lupus in fabula» proverb, see Martin on Terence, *Adelphoe* 537 (R. MARTIN, Terence, *Adelphoe*, Cambridge 1976).

<sup>13.</sup> Cf. the frightening portent of farm animals suddenly gifted with the ability to speak referenced at G. I, 478-479, with G. B. MILES, *Virgil's* Georgics: A New Interpretation, Berkeley-Los Angeles-London 1980, p. 106-107.

For the name see especially F. JONES, Virgil's Garden: The Nature of Bucolic Space, London 2011, p. 100-102.
 On Jupiter's action see further M. C. J. PUTNAM, Virgil's Poem of the Earth: Studies in the Georgics, Princeton 1979, p. 31-34; also L. P. WILKINSON, «Virgil's Theodicy», CQ 13, 1963, p. 75-84; for Jupiter's concern

<sup>regarding «idyllic sloth» cf. R. A. B. MYNORS, Virgil,</sup> *Georgics*, Oxford 1990, p. 25.
16. For the so-called theodicy note R. F. THOMAS, Virgil, *Georgics, Volume I: Books I-II*, Cambridge 1988, p. 87. On the connection between the Saturnian world alluded to in the *Georgics* and the kingdom of Latinus in *Aeneid* VII, see Jones, *op. cit.*, p. 54-55.

We may be reminded here of the Ovidian vision of Jovian anger in the matter of Lycaon (*Metamorphoses* I, 163-252).<sup>17</sup> Lycaon violated all sense of hospitality and decency in his murder of a Molossian hostage and attempted cannibalistic horrors; he is punished by lupine transformation, the first metamorphosis in Ovid's epic of a mortal man into an animal.<sup>18</sup> The Lycaon story associates Jupiter's judgment on wicked humanity with lycanthropy and, implicitly, the savagery of wolves; in Virgil the explanation for why we have a lupine problem in the first place is to be found in the verdict of the supreme god on the state of the world. We shall return to this point regarding Jovian responsibility for the bane of wolves.

The howling of wolves is portentous; it is cited among the baleful omens at the assassination of Julius Caesar and the advent of renewed civil strife:

... et altae per noctem resonare lupis ululantibus urbes. (G. I, 485-486)

The mention of wolves near the start of the book is thus echoed near its close.<sup>19</sup> To be seen first by a wolf may render a pitiable victim mute; the baying of wolves provides a memorable part of the soundscape of disaster for the Roman children of the Romulean she-wolf.

The wolf preys on flocks; like all creatures, however, the wolf rushes into fury and fire under the force of Amor:

*Omne adeo genus in terris hominumque ferarumque et genus aequoreum, pecudes pictaeque volucres, in furias ignemque ruunt: amor omnibus idem.* (G. III, 242-244)

*quid lynces Bacchi variae et genus acre luporum atque canum? quid quae imbelles proelia cervi? (G. III, 264-265)* 

Wolves are like lynxes, deer, and the rest of nature in terms of susceptibility to the power of love. But wolves (and other canids) constitute a *genus acre* – the same description that is applied to the men of Italy in the celebrated *laudes Italiae* of G. II, 167.<sup>20</sup> In that memorable description of the glories of the Italian peninsula, Virgil noted the Marsi, the Sabellians, the

<sup>17.</sup> Virgil briefly mentions Lycaon (as the father of Arctos) at G. 1.138, amid his theodicy.

<sup>18.</sup> There may be a deliberate bit of learned amusement in the Molossian identity of Lycaon's victim; Molossian dogs were celebrated for their vigilance against lupine incursions (cf. G. III, 404-408). «... der Name des Volks um Dodona in Epirus; ihre Hunderasse lebt in Rom nur mythisch.» (M. ERREN, P. Vergilius Maro: Georgica, Band 2: Kommentar, Heidelberg 2003, ad loc.). Lycaon is also the name of the Cretan craftsman who fashioned the sword that Ascanius gives to Euryalus before the fateful night raid (A. IX, 303-305); the evocation of wolves may connect to Euryalus' companion Nisus' failed prayer to Diana and the fact that his father Hyrtacus was a hunter (IX, 403-409).

<sup>19.</sup> Note here C. G. PERKELL, *The Poet's Truth: A Study of the Poet in Virgil's* Georgics, Berkeley-Los Angeles-London 1989, p. 98-99. Cf. A. II, 488, where the Trojan women are said to howl in the wake of the Greek invasion of the city.

<sup>20.</sup> On the parallel see further R. F. THOMAS, Virgil, Georgics, Volume II: Books III-IV, Cambridge 1989, p. 90.

Ligurians and Volscians; the Decii, the Marii, the Camilli; the Scipios and Augustus Caesar.<sup>21</sup> The passage distantly presages the mention of the Volscians and Camilla in what we shall soon enough see as the lupine drama of the eleventh *Aeneid*. The Volscians (whose leader in the *Aeneid* is Camilla) constitute a *genus acre* – and so do wolves.

There are two final lupine references in the *Georgics*. The first is the aforementioned note that those with Molossian guard dogs need not fear wolfish incursions (III, 404-408). The second is a detail that the wolf – like the rest of the animal world – is susceptible to plague; a wolf afflicted with such a mortal illness does not care to pursue its usual nocturnal assaults on the sheepfold:

non lupus insidias explorat ovilia circum nec gregibus nocturnus obambulat: acrior illum cura domat...(G. III, 537-539)

Virgil composes here an eerie – some might say bizarre – reinvention of one element of the Golden Age trope.<sup>22</sup> The horror of plague and pestilence quells the ferocious predelictions of wolves; of course it also kills all animals in its path, sheep and wolf alike.<sup>23</sup> Amor and pestilence are thus the two noteworthy enemies of the wolf; the fearsome canid can be conquered either by love or plague.

For the poet of the *Georgics*, then, the wolf's predations were part of the Jovian plan to compel mortals to exert *labor* in daily life; no amount of human effort can eradicate utterly the lupine threat, though both passion and pestilence can subdue the beast.

#### III. - LUPINE REFERENCES IN THE AENEID

It is no surprise to discover that the first reference to wolves in the poet's great national epic of Rome's mythic foundations is the god Jupiter's announcement of the Romulean she-wolf:

inde lupae fulvo nutricis tegmine laetus Romulus excipiet gentem et Mavortia condet Moenia Romanosque suo de nomine dicet. (A. I, 275-277)

<sup>21.</sup> For the poetic plurals with reference to Marius and Camillus, see Thomas *ad loc*. Was Gaius Marius inserted in lieu of Julius Caesar?

<sup>22.</sup> On this theme see especially M.R.GALE, Virgil on the Nature of Things: The Georgics, Lucretius, and the Didactic Tradition, Cambridge 2000, p. 223-224.

<sup>23.</sup> The Virgilian description of the cattle plague at Noricum is analyzed at length by E. J. HARRISON, «The Noric Plague in Virgil's Third *Georgic*» in F. CAIRNS ed., *Papers of the Liverpool Latin Seminar* 2, 1979, p. 1-65.

The seemingly conventional enough reference to the she-wolf was questioned even in Servius: in *fulvo nutricis tegmine laetus* are we to imagine that Romulus was wearing a wolf-skin, perhaps even the pelt of the animal that nurtured his infancy?<sup>24</sup> Servius notes that the lupine attire was that of shepherds: «... pelle lupae, qua utebatur more pastorum».

Romulus will be happy in the tawny pelt of the wolf; the Romans will bear the name of this *de facto* child of a she-wolf. Shepherds must defend their flocks against lupine rapine; not surprisingly, the shepherd would wear the pelt of the animal he hunted down in pastoral solicitude for his livestock.<sup>25</sup> This is a vision of pacified lupine ferocity; the wolf has been tamed in the person of Romulus, the child of the *lupa*.

The next appearance of wolfish imagery in the *Aeneid* comes amid the Trojan hero Aeneas' recollection at Dido's banquet of the night Troy fell. Aeneas compares the actions of his band of Trojan warriors to that of rapacious wolves:

... inde, lupi ceu raptores atra in nebula, quos improba ventris exegit caecos rabies catulique relicti faucibus exspectant siccis, per tela, per hostis vadimus haud dubiam in mortem mediaeque tenemus urbis iter; nox atra cava circumvolat umbra. (A. II, 355-360)

The simile owes much to Homer, *Iliad* XVI, 156-163, of Achilles with his Myrmidons as he prepares to send them out to assist Patroclus in the defense of the ships.<sup>26</sup> The scene in Troy on the last night of the city is different in many regards from that of Homer's vision; for Homer's Achilles, however, the death of Patroclus is a loss perhaps as great as that of Troy for Aeneas.<sup>27</sup> We have returned to a vision of wolfish mayhem and predation, though with the strange twist that these wolves are inside the sheepfold.

Some salient points can be made about the lupine simile. First, as we shall see, Virgil carefully balances his wolf comparisons. There are four wolf similes in the *Aeneid*; the first refers to Aeneas and his men, the last to his doublet Arruns, and the middle two to the Rutulian

<sup>24.</sup> See further here the commentaries of R. G. AUSTIN, Virgil, *Aeneidos Liber Primus*, *P. Vergili Maronis*, Oxford 1971, and R. S. CONWAY, *P. Vergili Maronis Aeneidos Liber Primus*, Cambridge 1935. Conway notes that the pelt must be that of the famous she-wolf and not that of some other animal: «... but Romulus need not have won his charming attire by force; to whom else should she bequeath it?»

<sup>25.</sup> Livy notes that the young Romulus and Remus were not sluggish in the matter of farm and flock:... cum primum adolevit aetas, nec in stabulis nec ad pecora segnes (Ab Vrbe Condita I, 4.8).

<sup>26.</sup> See here S. CASALI, Virgilio, Eneide 2, Pisa 2017, ad 355.

<sup>27.</sup> On the question of poetic imputation of moral failing on Aeneas and his Trojans via the lupine comparison, see the extended note of N. HORSFALL, Virgil, *Aeneid 2, A Commentary*, Leiden-Boston 2008, *ad* 355-358. More generally on Virgilian comparisons, note especially R. RIEKS, «Die Gleichnisse Vergils», *ANRW* II.31.2, 1981, p. 1011-1110).

#### THE WOLF IN VIRGIL

Turnus.<sup>28</sup> Next, soon after the comparison of Aeneas and his Trojans to lupine predators, Coroebus conceives the idea of exchanging Trojan armor for Greek in the wake of the defeat of Androgeos.<sup>29</sup> We might think of the proverb of the wolf in sheep's clothing; the Trojans will be able to wreak much havoc in the disguise of Greek armor.<sup>30</sup> The plan eventually backfires, as Trojans attack the «Greeks».<sup>31</sup> Shepherds sometimes dressed in wolf-skin apparel; we shall return below to this theme of false dress – a theme that has some connection to the lycanthropic image of the transformation of a man into a wolf.<sup>32</sup> For the moment, at least, Aeneas is compared explicitly to the savagery of a wolf – and in the first comparison of the Trojan hero to an animal in the epic.<sup>33</sup> The comparison is not flattering to Aeneas, and does not redound to his credit; the imagery offers a negative appraisal of the hero's actions on Troy's last night.

We turn next to the seer Helenus' admonitory warning to Aeneas at Buthrotum about the monstrous Scylla; wolves form part of the fearsome zoological horror of the mythological hazard:

prima hominis facies et pulchro pectore virgo pube tenus, postrema immani corpore pistrix delphinum caudas utero commissa luporum. (A. III, 426-428)

Dolphin tails, and a belly or womb of wolves: the hybrid Scylla has a pack of wolves emerging from or constituting her mid-section.<sup>34</sup> The description has occasioned critical comment; Heyworth and Morwood call it simply «a monstrously difficult line».<sup>35</sup> Wolves were not typically associated with Scylla; Horsfall notes here, «Actual wolves... seem a further

<sup>28.</sup> For Arruns as *Doppelgänger* of Aeneas see below on XI, 809-815); the other similes are at IX, 59-66 and IX, 563-566, in the book of the epic that witnesses Turnus' greatest victories.

<sup>29.</sup> II, 386 ff.

<sup>30.</sup> For the theme see B. PERRY, *Aesopica: a series of texts relating to Aesop or ascribed to him or closely connected with the literary tradition that bears his name.* Vol. 1, *Greek and Latin texts*, Urbana-Chicago 1952, p. 550; cf. chapter VII, verse 15 of the gospel of Matthew.

<sup>31.</sup> II, 411-413.

<sup>32.</sup> The Trojans pretend to be Greeks; we shall see soon enough how lupine imagery is employed in the Virgilian presentation of the movement from Trojan to Roman.

<sup>33.</sup> C. J. MACKIE, *The Characterisation of Aeneas*, Edinburgh 1989, p. 50-51, notes that Aeneas is here described in language that will later be used of his antagonist Turnus – though the Rutulian is working under the explicit instigation of Allecto's venom, while Aeneas is acting in accord with his own instincts.

<sup>34.</sup> Dolphins figure in the poet's description of the complex movements of the equestrian ballet that is the *lusus Troiae* at V, 592-595. In the image of Scylla, wolves are joined with dolphins; if dolphins represent the future scions of Rome in the description of the Sicilian games, we may in Scylla see the fusion of the lupine element into the irenic marine image. Dolphins also appear on the shield of Aeneas, just before the depiction of Actium (VIII, 671-674).

<sup>35.</sup> S. HEYWORTH, J. MORWOOD, A Commentary on Vergil, Aeneid 3, Oxford 2017, ad loc. Essential reading on Scylla lore = M. G. HOPMAN, Scylla: Myth, Metaphor, Paradox, Cambridge 2012.

aspect of Virgilian hyperbole».<sup>36</sup> Scylla was associated with female wantonneness and lust; some scholars have seen a connection between the mention of wolves and the use of *lupa*, «she-wolf», as a term to describe a prostitute.<sup>37</sup>

In Virgil's reference to Scylla's lupine *uterus*, we may recall too the nurturing care of the *lupa* responsible for the suckling of Romulus and Remus. Traditionally Scylla was associated with dogs (cf. III, 432 *caeruleis canibus*); Virgil makes reference to the monster's canine nature, though only after highlighting her lupine feature.<sup>38</sup> Virgil's Scylla – hints of sexual voracity aside – is a *virgo* (III, 426); the point in part may be to highlight that this maiden – and her pack of wolves – will not bear any children.<sup>39</sup> We shall return to this question soon enough.

A similarly monstrous lupine reference comes next in the Virgilian catalogue of wolves, with the poet's reference to the victims of the sorceress Circe:

saevire ac formae magnorum ululare luporum, quos hominum ex facie dea saeva potentibus herbis induerat Circe in vultus ac terga ferarum. (VII, 18-20)

Aeneas and his Trojan exiles never encounter Scylla, and they avoid Circe as well; the howls of wolves are an indicator of the nearness of the witch's lair.<sup>40</sup> Lycanthropy again: Circe transforms men into animals. The wolves, we might note, are once again not Homeric; Virgil

<sup>36.</sup> N. HORSFALL, Virgil, *Aeneid 3, A Commentary*, Leiden-Boston 2006. Horsfall also comments on the exact meaning of *uterus*, which he takes as «womb» for «belly» rather than «belly» for «womb». For *uterus* note J. N. ADAMS, *The Latin Sexual Vocabulary*, Baltimore 1982, p. 100.

<sup>37.</sup> Cf. here Horsfall's note *ad loc.*; also D. Lowe, *Monsters and Monstrosity in Augustan Poetry*, Ann Arbor 2015, p. 73-78. Prostitutes apparently were noted for exercising their craft near tombs (cf. P. HoweLL, *A Commentary on Book One of the Epigrams of Martial*, New York 1980, p. 181); there may have been an association between witchcraft/lycanthropy lore and prostitution in terms of the common ground of cemetery haunts.

<sup>38.</sup> For the etymological associations of the name «Scylla» with pups, see J. J. O'HARA, *True Names: Vergil and the Alexandrian Tradition of Etymological Wordplay*, Ann Arbor 2017, p. 144-145. Ovid emphasizes the dogs at *Metamorphoses* VII, 65; XIII, 732; XIV, 60; so also Lucretius (*De Rerum Natura* V, 892 ff., where see G. CAMPBELL, *Lucretius on Creation and Evolution: A Commentary on De Rerum Natura* 5.772-1104, Oxford 2003, *ad loc.*).

<sup>39.</sup> On the «demonisation» of virginity in Virgil, see J. K. NEWMAN, F. S. NEWMAN, *Troy's Children: Lost Generations in Virgil's* Aeneid, Hildesheim-Zürich-New York 2005, p. 200.

<sup>40.</sup> See further here H. BOAS, Aeneas' Arrival in Latium: Observations on Legends, History, Religion, Topography and Related Subjects in Vergil, Aeneid VII, 1-135, Amsterdam 1938, p. 39-52.

introduces a lupine element in his evocation of Circean lore.<sup>41</sup> The monster Scylla had wolves as part of her anatomy; the monster Circe transforms some of her prey into wolves whose howls provide a suitably frightening auditory backdrop for her lair.<sup>42</sup>

We proceed to the hero Caeculus, founder of Praeneste, son of the god Vulcan and ally of Turnus (VII, 677-681). His followers include men who have donned wolf-skin caps:

... fulvosque lupi de pelle galeros tegmen habent capiti (VII, 688-689)

The tawny pelt of the she-wolf of I, 275 is evoked; these Italian warriors are distinguished – like Romulus – by lupine apparel.<sup>43</sup>

And there are other associations that the Virgilian depiction of Caeculus evokes. Some of his men are from the region around the River Amasenus – a body of water connected with the Volscian Camilla.<sup>44</sup> Some of his contingent wield slings – a weapon mentioned elsewhere in the epic only of Camilla and the Etruscan Mezentius.<sup>45</sup> Caeculus' men are also explicitly linked to the goddess Juno, the inveterate divine enemy of the Trojans.<sup>46</sup>

From the son of Vulcan and his wolfish men, we proceed to the god's depiction of the she-wolf on the shield of Aeneas:

<sup>41.</sup> Note here A. HEUBECK, A. HOEKSTRA, A Commentary on Homer's Odyssey: Volume I, Books IX-XVI, Oxford 1989, p. 50-52. We shall return below to the significance of the Greek name of Circe (= «hawk» or «falcon») in light of the Virgilian depiction of Camilla. On the reception of the Homeric Circe, indispensable is C. SEGAL, «Circean Temptations: Homer, Vergil, Ovid», TAPhA 99, 1968, p. 419-442. Relevant here may be Pseudo-Oppian, Cynegetica III, 302 ff., where the poet identifies the kirkos or harpax as a type of wolf superior in size and with long limbs, the swiftest in speed of all lupine creatures. The kirkos/harpax goes out early in the morning in pursuit of prey; when winter comes and the chilly snow falls, the beast ventures closer to cities and snatches its prey with its claws. See further Richter, op. cit., column 961. Camilla is noted for her exceptional swiftness (cf. VII, 806 ff.); on certain aspects of the poet's physical description of the heroine and her athletic attributes and loveliness see P. HEUZÉ, L'image du corps dans l'œuvre de Virgile, Rome 1985, p. 434-436.

<sup>42.</sup> The verb *ululare* is not exclusively associated with wolves in Virgil; the present passage and G. I, 168 are the only two. At II, 488 it is used of the howls of Trojan women on the last night of the city; at IV, 168 of mountain nymphs; at IV, 609 of Hecate; at VI, 257 of dogs (cf. G. I, 168); and at XI, 668 of the tumult raised by the Amazons to whom Camilla and her sorority of Italian maidens is compared. *Ululatus* is used of women's laments at IV, 667; also of the maddened women of VII, 395; IX, 477 of Euryalus' mother; XI, 190 (at Pallas' requiem). A striking association, then, with feminine referents.

<sup>43.</sup> For Caeculus note especially N. HORSFALL, Virgil Aeneid 7, Leiden-Boston-Köln 2000, ad 678-690; L. FRATANTUONO, «Aeterno Devinctus Amore: Vulcan in Virgil», Paideia 70, 2015, p. 6 n. 22.

<sup>44.</sup> Cf. VII, 685 and XI, 547-549.

<sup>45.</sup> Cf. VII, 686-687 and IX, 586 ff.; XI, 578 ff.

<sup>46.</sup> VII, 682-683.

fecerat et viridi fetam Mavortis in antro procubuisse lupam, geminos huic ubera circum ludere pendentis pueros et lambere matrem impavidos, illam tereti cervice reflexam mulcere alternos et corpora fingere lingua. (VIII, 631-634)<sup>47</sup>

This is the companion piece to the solemn announcement of Jupiter to Venus at I, 275-277; there Romulus was viewed as a warrior, clad in the lupine vesture of his upbringing; here the god of the forge has presented the she-wolf – pregnant, or perhaps newly whelped, or teeming with young at any rate (an image of fecundity and fertility) – and the twins Romulus and Remus, unafraid as veritable sons of a wolf. The she-wolf fashions the human pups with her tongue; she molds them, as it were, for the destined Roman future – one that will implicitly be one of civil war and internecine strife.<sup>48</sup>

Romulus is the son of the she-wolf, as it were; he is depicted in wolfish attire in Jupiter's description, and he will be engraved on Aeneas' shield by Vulcan. Vulcan's son Caeculus – the Romulus of Praeneste, we might think – leads men garbed in lupine dress to battle. We have yet to see the poet's full development of lupine lore in association with his Volscian huntress/ warrior Camilla, but Virgil's wolfish references continue to proceed in deliberate fashion and careful order.

Aeneas and his men were compared to wolves on the night Troy fell; Turnus is also given lupine associations, not once but twice. The first reference comes as the Rutulian seeks to assault the Trojan camp:

> ac veluti pleno lupus insidiatus ovili cum fremit ad caulas ventos perpessus et imbris nocte super media; tuti sub matribus agni balatum exercent, ille asper et improbus ira saevit in absentis; collecta fatigat edendi ex longo rabies et siccae sanguine fauces: haud aliter Rutulo muros et castra tuenti ignescent irae, duris dolor ossibus ardet. (IX, 59-66)

The simile has a rich literary history from both Homeric and Apollonian sources.<sup>49</sup> Aeneas and his men were inside the sheepfold, as it were – though ineffectual in their protective

<sup>47.</sup> At VIII, 633 the reading *reflexam* is vexed; the accusative is the reading of the Medicean and the bulk of the Carolingians, while *reflexa* is found in the Palatinus, the Romanus, the Wolfenbüttel, etc. – and is read by Mynors. The choice of reading does not affect the arguments in this study.

<sup>48.</sup> Remus, after all, will be killed by his own brother.

<sup>49.</sup> Odyssey VI, 130-143 (of Odysseus and Nausicaa); Argonautica I, 1243-1247 (of Polyphemus and Hylas); see further P. HARDIE, Virgil, Aeneid Book IX, Cambridge 1994; J. DINGEL, Kommentar zum 9. Buch der Aeneis Vergils, Heidelberg 1997, ad loc.

lupine role – Turnus is frustrated by his inability to enter the Trojan camp. Closely related to this simile is the comparison of Turnus to an eagle of Jupiter or a wolf of Mars:

> qualis ubi aut leporem aut candenti corpore cycnum sustulit alta petens pedibus Iovis armiger uncis, quaesitum aut matri multis balatibus agnum Martius a stabulis rapuit lupus. (IX, 563-566)<sup>50</sup>

Once again, the bleating of the lambs – but here, the mother is not protecting her offspring, but searching in vain for the prey of the warlike wolf.<sup>51</sup> Significantly, the description of Turnus as a wolf (a conventional enough epic comparison) comes as the Rutulian hero stalks the warrior Lycus, whose name means «wolf».<sup>52</sup> And, too, the mention of the god Mars recalls the divine parentage of Romulus and Remus.<sup>53</sup> At XII, 331-336, we might note, Turnus will be compared explicitly to the war god – the only character in the epic accorded such a description.<sup>54</sup> Indeed, the Rutulian is powerfully linked here to two major gods.<sup>55</sup> Lycus' name may mean «wolf», but in the menagerie that poetically describes his end, he is associated with a hare or a rabbit, and his killer with an eagle or a wolf of Mars – that is, with the Romulean she-wolf.<sup>56</sup>

#### IV. - LUPINE REFERENCES IN THE AENEID: CAMILLA AND THE CAMILLIAD

We come at last to the poet's Volscian princess Camilla. One of the victims of the heroine Camilla's battle exploits has a wolf's head quasi-helmet:

... procul Ornytus armis ignotis et equo venator Iapyge fertur, cui pellis latos umeros erepta iuvenco pugnatori operit, caput ingens oris hiatus et malae texere lupi cum dentibus albis, agrestisque manus armat sparus; ipse catervis vertitur in mediis et toto vertice supra est. (XI, 677-683)

<sup>50.</sup> For the Homeric antecedents of the simile see L. FRATANTUONO, «A Poetic Menagerie: The Animal Similes of Virgil's *Aeneid*», *Eranos* 107, 2012-2013, p. 83.

<sup>51.</sup> Cf. IX, 61-62.

<sup>52.</sup> Lycus also has associations with rivers; see further here C. J. FORDYCE, P. Vergili Maronis Aeneidos Libri VII-VIII, Oxford 1977, p. 157.

<sup>53.</sup> Cf. VIII, 631.

<sup>54.</sup> For the Homeric tradition of comparing heroes to Ares, see R. TARRANT, Virgil, Aeneid Book XII, Cambridge 2012, ad 331-340.

<sup>55.</sup> The prey of the Jovian bird is a swan, which was sacred to Venus; we may compared XI, 751-758, where the Etruscan Tarchon is compared to an eagle as he assaults Venulus, whose name recalls the Trojan patroness Venus.

<sup>56.</sup> For the Roman fondness for hunting hares, see R. KATZ, «Hares» in VE II, p. 587.

The Tyrrhenian Ornytus is a hunter, and he wears the hide of a giant bullock (a stereotypical sacrificial animal). He has also assumed a lupine head covering, apparently the «gaping mouth and teeth of a wolf's skull».<sup>57</sup> Unlike Caeculus' men (or Romulus for that matter), there is no wolf's pelt here, but rather that of a steer; we might be tempted to imagine that Ornytus is a shepherd, a pastoral figure who has previously slain a wolf and taken the skull as a macabre trophy of his successful defense of his flocks. Camilla taunts him as she makes short work of her foe, noting that he is woefully mistaken if he thinks the present cavalry engagement is another hunt.<sup>58</sup>

Camilla's victory over the wolfish Ornytus is given a lupine parallel in the defeat she suffers at the hands of another Etruscan, the Apollonian devotee Arruns. In the aftermath of his successful assault on the Volscian, Arruns is explicitly compared to a wolf:

ac velut ille, prius quam tela inimica sequantur, continuo in montis sese avius abdidit altos occiso pastore lupus magnove iuvenco, conscius audacis facti, caudamque remulcens subiecit pavitantem utero silvasque petivit; haud secus ex oculis se turbidus abstulit Arruns contentusque fuga mediis se immiscuit armis. (XI, 809-815)

For the last appearance of lupine imagery in the epic, Camilla is now the shepherd or the *iuvencus*, and the doomed Arruns a wolf – but a wolf with its tail literally between its legs, in frightened (XI, 813 *pavitantem*) flight as it seeks to escape the hateful weapons (XI, 809 *tela inimica*) of its pursuers.<sup>59</sup> And this wolf will be slain, as Diana's nymph Opis takes vengeance for the loss of the goddess' favorite.<sup>60</sup>

At this juncture we may take stock of the poet's use of wolf imagery in his epic. The first mention of the animal in the poem – not surprisingly – is in the context of the Romulean she-wolf. But it is not, strictly speaking, the classic image of the she-wolf suckling the twins. Rather, it is a reference to Romulus in a wolf's pelt, of the Romulus who will take over the *gens* 

<sup>57.</sup> So R. F. THOMAS, «Ornytus» in VE II, p. 945. «Ornytus est remarquable par l'étrangeté barbare de son accoutrement» (A. CARTAULT, L'Art de Virgile dans l'Énéide, Paris 1926, p. 800).

<sup>58.</sup> IX, 685-689.

<sup>59.</sup> The simile is modeled on Homer, *Iliad* XV, 586-588) – but the canine of the Homeric simile is deliberately changed into a bullock to underscore the sacrificial, pastoral image – and to recall the death of Ornytus, whose killing foreshadowed Camilla's own end. On the emotional state of Arruns in the wake of his audacious deed, note J. THOMAS, *Structures de l'imaginaire dans l'*Énéide, Paris 1981, p. 59. «No other Italian leader is prince and shepherd alike» (W. P. BASSON, *Pivotal Catalogues in the* Aeneid, Amsterdam 1975, p. 154).

<sup>60.</sup> XI, 836 ff. Significantly, Opis will taunt Arruns in much the same way that Camilla mocked Ornytus; in both cases, it is noted that the victim is falling prey to an outstanding figure – Camilla in self-boasting with Ornytus, and Diana in the more modest insult of Opis (cf. XI, 688-689 and XI, 857). Indeed, Opis makes quite clear in sarcastic verbal assault that Arruns does not deserve even to be named as a casualty of the goddess.

#### THE WOLF IN VIRGIL

(I, 276 *Romulus excipiet gentem*), who will establish Mavortian walls, and who will bestow the name «Roman» after his own. It is a grand prophecy of the future; suitably consolatory to Venus as she worries about the fate of her beloved Trojans.

It also proves to be incomplete in light of what Jupiter announces to Juno at XII, 833-840, where we learn that the future *gens* (XII, 840) that will spring from the fusion of Trojans and Italians will honor Juno with special devotion. The Ausonians, Jupiter notes, will retain their *sermo* and *mores*; the Teucrians will sink down (XII, 836 *Teucri subsident*), and all will become Latins (XII, 837... *faciamque omnis uno ore Latinos*).<sup>61</sup>

From Virgil's reference to Romulus in his wolfish attire – Romulus, a true son of a wolf – we advance to Aeneas and his Trojans, the first human beings to be compared to wolves in the poem. The scene from Troy's last night is strange; the wolves, as we have observed, are in a sense already in the sheepfold. The Trojans will become veritable wolves in sheep's clothing as they don Greek arms. But the whole enterprise is doomed to failure; the Trojans are not Greeks, and they are more akin to sheep than to rapacious predators in the final tally of the city's doom. A very different sort of lupine association from that of Romulus – these Trojans are not – at least yet – proto-Romans.

Two monstrous wolfish images follow, and both involve magical transformation (not mere simile or assumption of lupine garb). Scylla was transformed into vicious, ghastly horror, complete with a uterine wolf pack – and Circe enacts the metamorphosis of some of her victims into wolves. Aeneas never encounters either Scylla or Circe; he is no Odysseus in his regard.<sup>62</sup> Both Scylla and Circe have learned avian associations; «Scylla» was connected to the mythical *ciris*, and Circe's name evokes the Greek for «hawk» or «falcon».<sup>63</sup> The Circean allusion to birds of prey is echoed at XI, 718-724), where Camilla's slaughter of a Ligurian warrior is compared to an accipiter's evisceration of a dove.<sup>64</sup> We might also note that Virgil mentions a «Circaean ridge» just before he introduces Camilla, thus signaling the connection between the two women.<sup>65</sup>

Virgil moves, then, from the remembrance of the magical, nascent Roman world where a she-wolf can nurture a human infant, to images of lupine transformation and horror. Aeneas and his Trojans are not truly wolves on the last night of Priam's city – and they will not fall prey either to the lupine belly of Scylla or to the lycanthropic sorcery of Circe.

<sup>61. «...</sup> there shall be racial, not cultural fusion.» (W. S. MAGUINNESS, Virgil, *Aeneid XII*, London 1953, *ad loc.*). On certain (deliberately?) ambiguous elements of Virgil's presentation of Roman origins, note Y. SYED, *Vergil's* Aeneid *and the Roman Self: Subject and Nation in Literary Discourse*, Ann Arbor 2005, p. 205 ff.

<sup>62.</sup> On certain aspects of the differences between the two heroes, see E. DEKEL, *Virgil's Homeric Lens*, London-New York 2012, p. 72-74.

<sup>63.</sup> The connection of Scylla the monster to Scylla the daughter of Nisus is problematic; for an introduction to the main issues, see the two entries of M. Hopman in *VE* III, p. 1136 («Scylla and Charybdis» and «Scylla Nisi»); cf. R. O. A. M. LYNE, *Ciris: A Poem Attributed to Vergil*, Cambridge 1978, p. 5 ff.

<sup>64.</sup> A bird that was sacred to Venus. The Ligurians have connection to the Etruscans; see further A. MONTENEGRO DUQUE, *La onomastica de Virgilio y la antigüedad preitálica*, Salamanca 1949, p. 246 ff.

<sup>65.</sup> VII, 799.

Caeculus' men are like Romulus: they have lupine attire, and Caeculus was to Praeneste what Romulus was to Rome. The catalogue of Italian heroes closes with the virgin Camilla, who has no explicit lupine associations in the pendant to Book VII (803-817) – except, perhaps, in that she bears a Lycian quiver and a pastoral myrtle (VII, 816-817), details that evoke the shepherd's life (cf. the detail of XI, 811, where she is also connected to a *pastor*) and, just possibly, lupine associations.<sup>66</sup>

Caeculus is a son of Vulcan, and Vulcan is responsible for the shield of Aeneas that depicts the she-wolf and the infant twins; Caeculus is on the side of Turnus, and Turnus is compared to a wolf not once but twice in Book IX, the second time in direct association with Mars, the Romulean god referenced also on the shield for his cave that provides shelter for the she-wolf and her charges.<sup>67</sup> Turnus is truly a wolf in the sense of a classic lupine predator: he is outside the sheepfold that is the Trojan camp, and he succeeds in slaying Lycus – who is himself, at least onomastically, a wolf.

In the image of a wolf killing another wolf, we might be tempted to think of Romulus' slaying of Remus – but there is perhaps another association. We have seen that shepherds naturally sometimes donned lupine costumes – and indeed, the Servian tradition preserves the strange lore of the «Hirpi Sorani», shepherds from the region around Mount Soracte who encountered a strange lupine problem.<sup>68</sup> Wolves had stolen *exta* from sacrificial fires; shepherds pursued the animals to a cave, where a *pestiferus halitus* soon killed those who were standing too near the entrance. A plague followed, all apparently in consequence of the pursuit of the wolves. The answer (presunably oracular) to the problem was suitably mysterious: the shepherds should imitate wolves («lupos imitarentur»), that is, live off of plunder («id est, rapto viverent»). For Servius, the explicit comparison of Arruns to a wolf is a reminiscence of the Hirpi Sorani; the ancient commentator inteprets Arruns as one of these wolf-priests of Apollo Soranus.

A wolf against a wolf: Camilla implicitly assumes associations with a she-wolf if her killer is one of the Hirpi Sorani. Indeed, Arruns refers to the Volscian heroine as a *dira pestis*, language that may remind us of both the Dirae of Roman mythology and the predations of wolves on livestock.<sup>69</sup> Significantly, though, Camilla had already been introduced as having

<sup>66.</sup> In «Lycia» do we faintly hear «lukos»? Perhaps not; for the connection of the name to images of brightness and light (as befitting a haunt associated with Apollo), see M. PASCHALIS, *Virgil's* Aeneid: *Semantic Relations and Proper Names*, Oxford 1997, p. 57. In any case, shepherds have a clear enough connection to the hazard of wolves. Did the quiver come from the spoils of a previous victory? Lycia was in any case famous for archers (cf. Herodotus 7.77). Evander presented Anchises with Lycian arrows (VIII, 166); Chloreus has a Lycian bow (XI, 773). Lycia took up the cause of Octavian in the aftermath of Caesar's killing (see further D. A. SECCI, «Lycia and Lycii,» in *VE* II, p. 768). The myrtle was associated with Venus; for connections between this detail and the poet's preoccupation with Camilla's loveliness, see P. HEUZÉ, *op, cit.*, 1985, p. 266-267.

<sup>67.</sup> VIII, 630.

<sup>68.</sup> The extended Servian note is to be found *apud* XI, 785 sancti custos Soractis Apollo, in reference to the Virgilian description of Arruns.

<sup>69.</sup> XI, 792. Cf. also VII, 722, of the dira litora of Circe's abode.

pastoral associations, and she is explicitly compared to a shepherd or sacrificial bullock in the description of the wolfish Arruns in the aftermath of the assault.<sup>70</sup> If there were some lycanthropic spell on Camilla, it is broken, we might note, in death, as the wolf reverts to a sheperd. We advance in the Camilla narrative from the pastoral image of the close of Book VII to that of the slain shepherd in the wake of Arruns' attack. The wolf's skull of Ornytus in some sense prefigures the dying of the wolf.

There are four instances, then, where Virgil directly compares someone to a wolf: Aeneas with his Trojans in Book II, Turnus twice in Book IX, and Arruns in Book XI. The framing lupine similes associate Aeneas with Arruns, who functions as something of an eerie doublet of the Trojan hero.<sup>71</sup> Those who dress in wolf-skins include Romulus and certain followers of Caeculus; the doomed Ornytus, for his part, has a wolf's skull for a macabre hat.<sup>72</sup>

Turnus killed Lycus – and Camilla, for her part, slays one Harpalycus.<sup>73</sup> The name means «snatcher wolf», and recalls the Thracian Harpalyce to whom Venus is compared when she appears to Aeneas in the guise of a Diana-like huntress.<sup>74</sup> Harpalyce is the «snatcher she-wolf»; she has affinities with Camilla, and both her name and the association of the Thracian (cf. Opis' provenance) maiden with Camilla may point to/lend support to a theory of lycanthropic folklore.<sup>75</sup>

What is the point, then, of Virgil's clear enough evocation of lycanthropic lore (at least in the case of Circe, if not also Camilla), and of the wolf-priests of Apollo Soranus? Does mere indulgence in antiquarianism explain why the poet would devote such attention to seemingly obscure lupine lore? The answer to this question may lie in the consequences of Camilla's death for the larger strategic action of the fateful battle before the walls of Latinus' city.

When Camilla dies, Turnus is so overcome with emotional rage and distress that he abandons his plan to ambush Aeneas and his infantry as they march *ex insidiis* against the Latin capital.<sup>76</sup> The messenger who brings the news of Camilla's death to Turnus is her devoted

<sup>70.</sup> A neat frame for the poet's description of his heroine.

<sup>71.</sup> See further here especially L. R. KEPPLE, «Arruns and the Death of Aeneas», *AJPh* 97, 1976, p. 344-360. Aeneas does not meet either Circe or Camilla, in contrast to Odysseus with Circe and Achilles, for that matter, with Penthesilea in the cyclic epic tradition.

<sup>72.</sup> In a sense the Etruscan Ornytus prefigures the Etruscan Arruns; both may well seek to «imitate» wolves as a means of destroying a wolf. We may compare the effort of Aeneas and his Trojans to wear Greek armor to trick Greek invaders. We might note, too, that both Arruns and Turnus' victim Lycus are in flight when they are respectively killed by Opis and the Rutulian. Does Lycus have implicit associations with Lycian Apollo and the same tradition of wolf-slayers we find in the Soractian/Soranian lore?

<sup>73.</sup> XI, 675.

<sup>74.</sup> I, 316-317. For the connections between Harpalyce and Camilla see P. E. KNOX in VE II, p. 587.

<sup>75.</sup> See further here J. L. LIGHTFOOT, *Parthenius of Nicaea*, Oxford 1999, p. 446 ff. Harpalyce, we might note, also has avian associations (like Camilla, Circe, and, for that matter, the Harpies). See further M. A. BRUCIA, «The Double Harpalyce, Harpies, and Wordplay at *Aeneid* 1.314-17», *CQ* 51, 2001, p. 305-308.

<sup>76.</sup> Cf. XI, 896 ff.

comrade Acca, who tends to the heroine's final moments.<sup>77</sup> The name «Acca» recalls that of Acca Larentia, the foster mother of Romulus and Remus.<sup>78</sup> Camilla's death leads directly to Turnus' abandonment of his siege and the safe passage of Aeneas; the death of Camilla ensures that Aeneas will live both to fight another day and to win. The «savage divine power of Jove», Virgil notes, demanded nothing less.<sup>79</sup> If Camilla is indeed lycanthropic – and the association of the Volscian with Acca points to the lore of the she-wolf - then we may wonder if the poet intended for Camilla to be seen as a key figure in the nurturing of the future Roman order.<sup>80</sup> In the final disposition of affairs in Italy, the sermo and mores of a Turnus or a Camilla would be destined to be ascendant over those of the Trojan Aeneas. But Aeneas, of course, is fated to survive the war (even if not by many years), and so in the immediate he must escape Turnus' ambush.<sup>81</sup> The death of Camilla is the catalyst that ensures the salvation of Aeneas. The supreme god who brought the curse of wolves to humanity has also ensured that this particular she-wolf will be a savior of Rome, even if her destruction is a *sine aua non* for the coming of a new order. In short, Camilla will die – but her death will ensure the survival of Aeneas, and ultimately, her side will prove victorious in the final disposition of affairs in the future Rome.82

Aeneas and his men attempted to disguise themselves as Greeks amid the fall of Troy; ultimately, Trojan and Latin will be fused into one *gens* – the Roman – with the Latin winning out in the matter of *sermo* and *mores*. Camilla – whose name recalls that of the republican hero Marcus Furius Camillus – offers a tangled skein of allusions and associations that include the lupine, and which evoke the question of transformation (even if only by way of imitation) from human to wolf.<sup>83</sup> This lycanthropic theme accords well with the image of the nurturing she-wolf that tended to Romulus and Remus; it speaks *in fine* to the warlike nature of the

79. XI, 901... *et saeva Iovis sic numina poscunt*. All of this is of particular interest in light of Jupiter's address at the divine council at X, 104 ff. about the question of mortal destinies and divine interference therein. See further here A. THORNTON, *The Living Universe: Gods and Men in Virgil's* Aeneid, Leiden 1976, p. 128 ff. We move metonymically from the *secundus Mars* of XI, 899 (of the Trojans and their allies) to the *adversus Mars* of XII, 1 (of the Latins and their allies). On the difficult question of the relationship between Jupiter and *Fatum* see especially P. BOYANCÉ, *La religion de Virgile*, Paris 1963, p. 39 ff.

80. And so Camilla is fittingly seen too as a shepherd; the lupine Camilla evokes the Romulean she-wolf, while the human Camilla is revealed ultimately as a shepherd – one slain, to be sure, by the false wolf Arruns, as a sacrifice to ensure the survival of Aeneas.

81. The death of Arruns is a prefigurement of that of Aeneas; on the tradition of the latter's death, note especially J. T. DYSON, *King of the Wood: The Sacrificial Victor in Virgil's* Aeneid, Norman 2001, p. 50 ff.

82. *I.e.*, the Jovian declaration of XII, 829 ff. Turnus abandons his ambush in accord with the savage will of Jupiter; he is emotionally overwrought in the wake of Camilla's death. Is he a casualty of *amor* and passion for the Volscian heroine?

83. On the importance of Camillus to the Augustan program, see W. CLAUSEN, *Virgil's* Aeneid: *Decorum*, *Allusion, and Ideology*, München-Leipzig 2002, p. 135-139. It is beyond the scope of this paper to consider the relevance of Camilla's associations with Cleopatra at Actium (where she faced Lucius Arruntius, a name that recalls

<sup>77.</sup> Cf. XI, 823 ff.

<sup>78.</sup> Cf. Ovid, *Fasti* III, 55 (with Frazer's extensive commentary). Acca is not named with Camilla's *Italides* at XI, 655-658; she appears only in the aftermath of Camilla's fatal wounding.

Roman children of the wolf. After all, if Romans are prone to wars both civil and domestic, we should not be surprised given the place of both Mars and the she-wolf in their genealogy.<sup>84</sup> For Virgil – as for his Roman audience – the wolf is an ambiguous, indeed contradictory animal.<sup>85</sup> Savagery and a predatory nature notwithstanding, it was lupine nurturing that ensured the safety and survival of Romulus. In the drama of the *Aeneid*, via his depiction of the Volscian heroine Camilla, the poet displays both the rapacious and the sustaining aspects of the wolf, an animal that must be both vanquished and reverentially immortalized.

both lupine and Arruntian Virgilian associations); in a strange sense, Cleopatra too made possible the Augustan victory. On all this see further L. FRATANTUONO, *The Battle of Actium 31 B.C.: War for the World*, Barnsley 2016, p. 82-93 (for the cavalry battle of *Aeneid* XI as allegorized Actium).

<sup>84.</sup> For Mars' importance in the Virgilian presentation of Roman origins, note P. HARDIE, Virgil's Aeneid: Cosmos and Imperium, Oxford 1986, p. 360-361.

<sup>85.</sup> It is possible that this ambiguity is also employed to reflect any possible ambivalence of the poet as to the nascent Augustan regime.

# REVUE DES ÉTUDES ANCIENNES TOME 120, 2018 N°1

# SOMMAIRE

### ARTICLES :

Milagros Navarro Caballero, María del Rosario Hernando Sobrino, À l'ombre de Mommsen :	
retour sur la donation alimentaire de Fabia H[]la	3
Michele BELLOMO, La (pro)dittatura di Quinto Fabio Massimo (217 a.C.): a proposito di alcune	
ipotesi recenti	37
Massimo BLASI, La consecratio manquée de L. Cornelius Sulla Felix	57
Sophie HULOT, César génocidaire ? Le massacre des Usipètes et des Tenctères (55 av. JC.)	73
Lee FRATANTUONO, The Wolf in Virgil	101
Gabrielle FRIJA, Les notables de Stratonicée de Carie à l'époque antonine : hétérogénéité	
juridique, homogénéité sociale	121

## QUESTIONS ET PERSPECTIVES

Claude Azıza, L'Antiquité au cinéma	41
-------------------------------------	----

# LECTURES CRITIQUES

Philippe ROUSSEAU, Un parcours audacieux : Hésiode de l'Enûma elish au Paradis perdu	149
Françoise-Hélène Massa-Pairault, Des Attalides à Rome. Perspectives sur Pergame	163

Comptes rendus	187
Notes de lectures	323
Liste des ouvrages reçus	327

В



