



**HAL**  
open science

## Insights into the Mantle Geochemistry of Scandium from a Meta-Analysis of Garnet Data

Mathieu Chassé, William L Griffin, Olivier Alard, Suzanne Y. O'reilly,  
Georges Calas

► **To cite this version:**

Mathieu Chassé, William L Griffin, Olivier Alard, Suzanne Y. O'reilly, Georges Calas. Insights into the Mantle Geochemistry of Scandium from a Meta-Analysis of Garnet Data. *Lithos*, 2018, 310-311, pp.409-421. 10.1016/j.lithos.2018.03.026 . hal-01910703

**HAL Id: hal-01910703**

**<https://hal.science/hal-01910703v1>**

Submitted on 1 Nov 2018

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

1 Insights into the Mantle Geochemistry of Scandium  
2 from a Meta-Analysis of Garnet Data

3 Mathieu Chassé\*,<sup>a,b</sup>, William L. Griffin<sup>b</sup>, Olivier Alard<sup>b,c</sup>, Suzanne Y.  
4 O'Reilly<sup>b</sup>, Georges Calas<sup>a</sup>

5 <sup>a</sup>*Institut de minéralogie, de physique des matériaux et de cosmochimie (IMPMC),  
6 Sorbonne Université, Muséum national d'Histoire naturelle, UMR CNRS 7590, IRD,  
7 F-75005 Paris, France*

8 <sup>b</sup>*Australian Research Council Centre of Excellence for Core to Crust Fluid Systems  
9 (CCFS) and GEMOC, Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Macquarie  
10 University, NSW 2109, Australia*

11 <sup>c</sup>*Géosciences Montpellier, Université de Montpellier II, UMR CNRS 5243, 34095  
12 Montpellier, France*

13 *\*Corresponding author at: Institut de minéralogie, de physique des matériaux et de  
14 cosmochimie, Sorbonne Université, 4 place Jussieu, case courrier 115, F-75005 Paris,  
15 France.*

16 *E-mail address: mathieu.chasse@normalesup.org (M. Chassé).*

---

17 **Abstract**

18 The meta-analysis of about 13,000 analyses of scandium content in gar-  
19 net grains shows that, below the spinel–garnet transition, this phase carries  
20 about three-quarters of the Sc budget of the mantle, indicating its control on  
21 Sc mobility. The Sc content of garnets in mafic rocks is low, due to a dilution  
22 effect resulting from their high modal content in garnet. Garnets from ultra-  
23 mafic rocks exhibit a wider range of Sc concentrations. We assess the relative  
24 influence of thermobarometry, crystal chemistry and fluid-related events on  
25 the distribution of Sc in garnet from such rocks to improve the tracking of  
26 geochemical processes in the mantle. Pressure and temperature of equili-  
27 bration in the mantle are second-order factors influencing the Sc content of  
28 garnet, while crystal-chemistry, in particular  $\frac{Cr}{Cr+Al}$  and  $\frac{Ca}{Ca+Mg}$ , is the main

29 parameter controlling the compatibility of Sc. Scandium is incorporated in  
30 both X and Y sites of Cr-Ca-rich garnets, resulting in a behaviour interme-  
31 diate between rare-earth elements, incorporated in the X site, and trivalent  
32 transition elements, occupying the Y site. This affinity for both sites results  
33 in a mild compatibility of Sc in the garnet stability field of the mantle; hence  
34 Sc concentration in garnet increases with melt extraction and can be reduced  
35 by silicate-melt metasomatism. In contrast, metasomatism by volatile-rich  
36 fluids increases the Sc concentration in garnet. The control of garnet on the  
37 compatibility of Sc in deep lithospheric rocks demonstrates the potential of  
38 using Sc to track the conditions of formation of magmas and their residual  
39 rocks, as well as the origin and nature of metasomatic fluids.

40 *Keywords:* Crystal chemistry; Partitioning; Rare-earth elements; Melt  
41 extraction; Metasomatism; Volatile-rich fluids

---

## 42 **1. Introduction**

43 Scandium is a common trace element in the silicate Earth, with an aver-  
44 age concentration of *ca* 16.4 ppm (Palme and O'Neill, 2014). It is the lightest  
45 first-row transition element, and is sometimes considered as a rare-earth ele-  
46 ment (REE; Connelly et al., 2005). Occurring only in the trivalent state, Sc  
47 is not affected by redox conditions and shows a lithophile behaviour (Samson  
48 and Chassé, 2016). During mantle melting, Sc is mildly incompatible, being  
49 enriched in the continental crust, arc magmas and mid-ocean ridge basalts  
50 (MORB) relative to the primitive mantle, but is believed not to be mobilised  
51 in other mantle-related fluids (Lee et al., 2005).

52

53 Based on the Geochemistry of Rocks of the Oceans and Continents (GEOROC)  
54 database (Sarbas and Nohl, 2008), we show that Sc concentration varies by  
55 one order of magnitude between Sc-poor ultramafic rocks and Sc-rich mafic  
56 rocks (Fig. 1a). This selective concentration of Sc results from wide vari-  
57 ations of its compatibility in rock-forming minerals (Fig. 1b). Typical Sc  
58 concentrations in garnets are seven times higher than the estimate for the  
59 silicate Earth, well above any other mineral group. The crystal chemistry and  
60 trace-element patterns of mantle garnets record a great variety of geochemical  
61 processes (Baxter et al., 2013), associated with mantle geochemistry (Wood  
62 et al., 2013), metamorphism or tectonics (Caddick and Kohn, 2013). Garnet  
63 from the subcontinental lithospheric mantle is a key indicator of fluid-related  
64 events in the mantle (Griffin et al., 1999a) which may control Sc mobility be-  
65 tween the shallow and deep regions of the upper mantle.

66  
67 Trace-element concentration in garnet depends on site preference and  
68 crystal-chemical mechanisms of incorporation as functions of pressure, tem-  
69 perature and the chemical composition of the melt and solid phases present  
70 during garnet formation. Despite the ability of garnet to incorporate signif-  
71 icant amounts of Sc, such information is limited in natural contexts. The  
72 discovery of a Sc-bearing garnet, eringaite ( $\text{Ca}_3\text{Sc}_2(\text{SiO}_4)_3$ ; Galuskina et al.,  
73 2010), the latest of the only eight natural Sc silicate minerals discovered on  
74 Earth, demonstrates the affinity of Sc for the six-fold-coordinated Y site of  
75 calcic garnets, already known in synthetic garnets by the existence of a solid  
76 solution between andradite ( $\text{Ca}_3\text{Fe}_2(\text{SiO}_4)_3$ ) and eringaite (Quartieri et al.,  
77 2006). However, in synthetic pyrope–grossular ( $\text{Mg}_3\text{Al}_2(\text{SiO}_4)_3$ )– $\text{Ca}_3\text{Al}_2(\text{SiO}_4)_3$ )

78 solid solutions (Oberti et al., 2006; Kim et al., 2007), the pyrope end-member  
79 preferentially incorporates Sc in the eight-fold-coordinated X site. Natural  
80 compositions of mantle garnets studied here are in the range  $(\text{Mg}_{1-x-y}\text{Ca}_x\text{Fe}_y)_3(\text{Al}_{1-z}\text{Cr}_z)_2(\text{SiO}_4)_3$ ,  
81 with x in the range [0.1, 0.25], y in the range [0.1, 0.25] and z in the  
82 range [0, 0.25], corresponding to an intermediate member of the pyrope50–  
83 almandine25–uvarovite25  $[(\text{Mg}_3\text{Al}_2(\text{SiO}_4)_3)50-(\text{Fe}_3\text{Al}_2(\text{SiO}_4)_3)25-(\text{Ca}_3\text{Cr}_2(\text{SiO}_4)_3)25]$   
84 solid solution. The term garnet is used hereafter to cover this variability, of  
85 prime importance to understand Sc incorporation in this phase.

86

87 The objective of this paper is to study the influence of garnet on the geo-  
88 chemical behaviour of Sc, by gathering about 13,000 analyses of Sc content in  
89 mantle-related garnet representing about 600 different samples from 97 stud-  
90 ies published over the last 50 years. Our statistical approach demonstrates  
91 the influence of host-rock composition, crystal chemistry, thermobarometric  
92 conditions and fluid-related events on Sc content in mantle-related garnet  
93 (hereafter  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}^1$ ). This discussion demonstrates that Sc may be used to  
94 trace geochemical events, including partial melting and metasomatism, oc-  
95 ccurring below the spinel–garnet transition zone.

## 96 **2. Database and Methods**

### 97 *2.1. Constitution of the Database of Garnet Analyses*

98 The database used for this work contains about 13,000 analyses on garnet  
99 grains, mostly obtained by laser ablation–inductively coupled plasma mass

---

<sup>1</sup>More generally,  $[\text{X}]_{\text{grt}}$  stands for the concentration of the element X in garnet.

100 spectrometry. Before 2000, some data were obtained by X-ray fluorescence,  
101 mass spectrometry and instrumental neutron activation analysis on separated  
102 garnets or using proton microprobe on garnet grains. All variables analysed  
103 in at least one publication are provided (Table A.1). More than 5500 anal-  
104 yses come from GEMOC/CCFS (see Griffin et al., 1999a, 2002). The other  
105 7500 garnet analyses were gathered from the GEOROC database (Sarbas  
106 and Nohl, 2008). Most analysed grains come from the subcontinental litho-  
107 spheric mantle and were extracted from ultramafic xenoliths or concentrates  
108 from kimberlites. A minor part consists of eclogitic garnets. The analysed  
109 minerals come from 165 localities worldwide (Table A.2). Apart from gar-  
110 net xenocrysts and megacrysts, for which the lithotype of the host-rock is  
111 unknown or not relevant, six categories have been selected to obtain sta-  
112 tistically representative subsets: eclogite, pyroxenite, lherzolite, peridotite,  
113 harzburgite and wehrlite. The peridotite category is used when the host-rock  
114 was not described more precisely. A few lithotypes, do not fall into any of  
115 these categories and have been left out. When the major-element chemistry  
116 of garnet was available, garnet xenocrysts have been subclassified (Grütter  
117 et al., 2004; Schulze, 2003).

118

119 Only variables contained in at least 70 % of the records have been used,  
120 leaving Si, Al, Cr, Fe, Mn, Mg and Ca as major- and minor elements and  
121 Ce, Nd, Sm, Eu, Gd, Dy, Ho, Er, Yb, Y and Sc as trace elements. Despite  
122 appearing in only 55 % of the records, Ti analyses have been kept to classify  
123 garnet xenocrysts. The database has been analysed using the R software  
124 (version 3.3.2, R Core Team, 2016). Details on the data analysis and the

125 statistical treatment of the database are given in Appendix A.

126

## 127 *2.2. Modelling the Influence of Mantle Melting on Scandium Concentrations*

128 To assess the validity of our analysis on the influence of partial melting  
129 on Sc behaviour, we used a model based on the experimental determination  
130 of Sc concentration during the melting of a near-pyrolitic mantle in the gar-  
131 net stability field from 3 GPa to 7 GPa (Walter, 1998). For each melting  
132 experiment, the modal proportions are calculated by mass balance between  
133 the composition of the coexisting phases and the bulk composition of the  
134 system at equilibrium (Walter, 1998).

135

136 Mass balance calculations provide Sc concentration in the melt and in the  
137 residue according to the following formula:

$$138 \quad [\text{Sc}]_{\text{melt}} = \frac{[\text{Sc}]_0}{D_{\text{Sc}}^{\text{res/melt}} \cdot (1 - F) + F} \quad (1)$$

139

$$140 \quad [\text{Sc}]_{\text{res}} = \frac{D_{\text{Sc}}^{\text{res/melt}} \cdot [\text{Sc}]_0}{D_{\text{Sc}}^{\text{res/melt}} \cdot (1 - F) + F} \quad (2)$$

141 where  $[\text{Sc}]_0$  the concentration of Sc in the initial system,  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{res}}$  the Sc con-  
142 centration in the residue,  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{melt}}$  the Sc concentration in the melt,  $F$  the  
143 mass fraction of melt and  $D_{\text{Sc}}^{\text{res/melt}}$  the partition coefficient of Sc between the  
144 residue and the melt. As the melt is in equilibrium with the different phases  
145 during batch melting experiments,  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  has been obtained as follows:

$$146 \quad [\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}} = D_{\text{Sc}}^{\text{grt/melt}} \cdot [\text{Sc}]_{\text{melt}} \quad (3)$$

147 The starting Sc concentration ( $[\text{Sc}]_0$ ) corresponds to a pyrolitic mantle (*ca* 16.4 ppm,  
148 Palme and O'Neill, 2014). The partition coefficients of Sc between the residue  
149 and the melt are obtained by summing Sc partition coefficients between each  
150 phase and the melt (Davis et al., 2013), weighted by the modal proportion  
151 of the phase considered. To our knowledge, this is the only study reporting  
152 together the partition coefficients of Sc for olivine, garnet and pyroxenes,  
153 applicable to partial melting of the mantle in the stability field of garnet.  
154 Variations in the range of deviations indicated in this study do not influence  
155 the results.

### 156 **3. Results**

#### 157 *3.1. Scandium Distribution in Garnet and its Host-Rocks*

158 Garnet is the main rock-forming mineral incorporating Sc (Fig. 1b and  
159 Table A.3). Scandium concentrations in host-rocks are statistically higher in  
160 mafic than in ultramafic rocks (Fig. 1a, Tables A.3 and A.4). The Sc content  
161 in the host-rock decreases with the depletion in fusible components, but such  
162 differences are considered with care as they are not statistically significant  
163 ( $p$ -value  $> 0.05$ ). A positive correlation exists between the Sc concentration  
164 in the host-rock and the proportion of Sc incorporated in garnet, indicating  
165 that *ca* 75 % of the Sc content of the host-rock is incorporated in garnet  
166 (Fig. 2a). Where studies from the dataset report the average Sc concentra-  
167 tion in garnet, in their host-rock and the modal garnet content of the host-  
168 rock, we have used these data to estimate the proportion of Sc incorporated  
169 by garnet for each lithotype; values are in the range of 65 % to 80 % (Fig. 2b).

170



171 The bimodal distribution of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  is related to the nature of the host-  
172 rocks (Fig. 3). The low- $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  population, *ca* 50 ppm median, corresponds to  
173 mafic rocks: eclogites and pyroxenites. The main population, with a median  
174  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  of *ca* 120 ppm corresponds to peridotitic rocks.

175

176 The nature of the host-rocks (Fig. 4 and Table A.5) and the class of the  
177 garnet xenocrysts (Schulze, 2003; Grütter et al., 2004) show that Sc concen-  
178 tration in peridotitic garnet increases with the degree of melt depletion in the  
179 host-rock, confirming the compatibility of Sc in mantle-derived garnet. The  
180 statistical significance of these observations is confirmed by ANOVA tests  
181 (Table A.6).

182

183 Garnets from mafic and ultramafic host-rocks form two distinct popula-  
184 tions in terms of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ . For later discussion, the dataset considered contains  
185 only analyses of garnets from peridotitic host-rocks, according to the descrip-  
186 tion of the host-rock and to the classification by Schulze (2003) in the case  
187 of xenocrysts.

### 188 *3.2. Relationships between Scandium Concentration and Thermobarometric* 189 *Parameters of the Mantle*

190 Garnets from ultramafic rocks equilibrated with mantle olivine, enabling  
191 the use of the nickel thermometer ( $T_{\text{Ni}}$ , Ryan et al., 1996) to investigate the  
192 role of temperature on the distribution of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ . No correlation exists be-  
193 tween  $T_{\text{Ni}}$  and  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  (Fig. 5a, Table A.7,  $p$ -value  $> 0.05$ ). On the subset  
194 of data for which the thermobarometer of Brey and Köhler (1990) has been  
195 used to estimate the temperature ( $T_{\text{BKN}}$ ) and pressure ( $P_{\text{BKN}}$ ), there is no

196 correlation with  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  (Figs. 5b and c, Table A.7,  $p$ -value  $> 0.05$ ).

197

### 198 *3.3. Relationships between Scandium and Major-Element Concentrations*

199 Scandium concentration in garnet is correlated with garnet major-element  
200 chemistry (Fig. 6, Table A.8). The strongest positive correlation exists be-  
201 tween  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  and  $[\text{Cr}]_{\text{grt}}$  ( $r = 0.43$ ,  $p$ -value  $< 0.05$ ) while a negative correlation  
202 exists between  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  and  $[\text{Al}]_{\text{grt}}$  ( $r = -0.35$ ,  $p$ -value  $< 0.05$ ). A weaker posi-  
203 tive correlation exists between  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  and  $[\text{Ca}]_{\text{grt}}$  ( $r = 0.28$ ,  $p$ -value  $< 0.05$ ),  
204 while a negative correlation is found between  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  and  $[\text{Mg}]_{\text{grt}}$  ( $r = -0.20$ ,  
205  $p$ -value  $< 0.05$ ). Chromium and Al occupy the Y site of garnet while Ca and  
206 Mg occupy the X site. These correlations confirm the influence of crystal  
207 chemistry on the incorporation of Sc in natural garnets shown in experimen-  
208 tal conditions by Oberti et al. (2006); Quartieri et al. (2006) and Kim et al.  
209 (2007). However,  $\text{Cr}\#$  ( $\frac{[\text{Cr}]_{\text{grt}}}{[\text{Cr}]_{\text{grt}} + [\text{Al}]_{\text{grt}}}$ ) and  $\text{Ca}\#$  ( $\frac{[\text{Ca}]_{\text{grt}}}{[\text{Ca}]_{\text{grt}} + [\text{Mg}]_{\text{grt}}}$ ) are also indica-  
210 tors of melt extraction from the host-rock. Therefore, correlations between  
211  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  and  $[\text{Cr}]_{\text{grt}}$ ,  $[\text{Al}]_{\text{grt}}$ ,  $[\text{Ca}]_{\text{grt}}$  or  $[\text{Mg}]_{\text{grt}}$  may also reflect the degree of de-  
212 pletion of the host-rock (Fig. 7a).

213

214 Variations of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  versus  $[\text{Fe}]_{\text{grt}}$  show two main trends (Fig. 6), result-  
215 ing in the apparent absence of statistical significance ( $p$ -value  $> 0.05$ ). A  
216 negative correlation exists at high  $[\text{Fe}]_{\text{grt}}$ , and a positive correlation at lower  
217  $[\text{Fe}]_{\text{grt}}$  giving a low overall correlation ( $r = 0.07$ ). This can be related to the  
218 variable speciation of Fe:  $\text{Fe}^{2+}$  or  $\text{Fe}^{3+}$  incorporated in the X or Y site. The  
219 fertility of the host-rock may also be involved, as shown by the decrease of  
220  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  with increasing  $\frac{[\text{Mg}]_{\text{grt}}}{[\text{Mg}]_{\text{grt}} + [\text{Fe}]_{\text{grt}}}$  ( $\text{Mg}\#$ ), an indicator of depletion (Fig. 7b).

221 A negative correlation between  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  and  $[\text{Si}]_{\text{grt}}$  ( $r = -0.24$ ,  $p$ -value  $< 0.05$ )  
222 is related to the correlations between  $[\text{Si}]_{\text{grt}}$  and  $[\text{Al}]_{\text{grt}}$ ,  $[\text{Cr}]_{\text{grt}}$ ,  $[\text{Mg}]_{\text{grt}}$  and  
223  $[\text{Ca}]_{\text{grt}}$ . Silicon concentration in garnet is positively correlated with  $[\text{Al}]_{\text{grt}}$   
224 and  $[\text{Mg}]_{\text{grt}}$  and negatively correlated with  $[\text{Cr}]_{\text{grt}}$  and  $[\text{Ca}]_{\text{grt}}$  explaining the  
225 anticorrelation with  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ . The lack of a correlation between  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  and  
226  $[\text{Mn}]_{\text{grt}}$  ( $p$ -value  $> 0.05$ ) reflects the low  $[\text{Mn}]_{\text{grt}}$  in the garnets studied, hin-  
227 dering any influence on garnet crystal chemistry.

228

### 229 3.4. Relationships between Scandium and Trace-Element Concentrations

230 Scandium concentration in garnet is positively correlated with the con-  
231 centration of light rare-earth elements (LREE, *e.g.*,  $r = 0.28$  for Nd with  
232 a  $p$ -value  $< 0.05$ , Table A.9) and becomes negative for heavy rare-earth ele-  
233 ments and Y (HREE, *e.g.*,  $r = -0.20$  for Yb with a  $p$ -value  $< 0.05$ , Table A.9,  
234 Fig. 8).

235

236 Plots of  $[\text{Y}]_{\text{grt}}$  versus  $[\text{Zr}]_{\text{grt}}$  provide a signature of melt depletion and  
237 metasomatism (Griffin et al., 1999b). Such plots (Fig. 9a), on which  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$   
238 has been reported, confirm that garnets from depleted rocks are enriched in  
239 Sc compared to those in fertile ones, while indicators of metasomatism by  
240 silicate melt are weakly correlated with  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ .

241

242 The variation of  $(\text{Ce}/\text{Yb})_{\text{N}}$  versus  $(\text{Zr}/\text{Sm})_{\text{N}}$  can be used to distinguish  
243 metasomatic processes related to volatile-rich fluids or to silicate melts (Aulbach  
244 et al., 2004). In our dataset, high  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  is associated with high  $(\text{Ce}/\text{Yb})_{\text{N}}$ ,  
245 indicating that volatile-rich metasomatism positively affects  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  (Fig. 9b).

246 On the contrary, no correlation is visible between  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  and  $(\text{Zr}/\text{Sm})_{\text{N}}$ , con-  
247 firming that metasomatism by silicate melts has a limited influence on  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ .

### 248 *3.5. Evolution of Scandium Concentration During Melting*

249 The evolution of the Sc content in the residual rock, in the melt and  
250 in the garnets is estimated from melting experiments on fertile peridotite  
251 (Walter, 1998), as explained in the “Database and Methods” section. In  
252 the presence of garnet and with increasing degree of partial melting, Sc con-  
253 centration increases in the melt and decreases in the residue, whatever the  
254 pressure (Figs. 10a and b). The comparison with the modal garnet content  
255 (Fig. 10c) indicates that low modal proportions, which may result from melt-  
256 ing, increase the Sc concentration in the melt and decrease Sc concentration  
257 in the residue. The calculated values of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  are consistent with the con-  
258 centrations of the dataset, confirming the validity of this approach. With  
259 increasing degree of partial melting,  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  increases by up to 100 ppm over  
260 a range of partial melting representative of the mantle (Fig. 10d).

## 261 **4. Discussion**

### 262 *4.1. Garnet, the Main Scandium Carrier in the Deep Lithospheric Mantle*

263 At the depths considered in the dataset, between 70 km and 200 km,  
264 garnet is the main host for Sc. It accounts for *ca* 75 % of the Sc budget of the  
265 deep lithospheric mantle (Fig. 2a, regression curve), in agreement with the  
266 proportion of Sc incorporated in various lithotypes of mantle-rocks (Fig. 1b).  
267 Considering the median  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  from mafic and ultramafic rocks and estimates  
268 of the modal content of garnet (Perrillat et al., 2006; Stixrude and Lithgow-  
269 Bertelloni, 2007; Pearson et al., 2014), our estimate of the abundance of Sc

270 in the lithospheric mantle is consistent with those based on other methods  
271 (Table 1; Palme et al., 2014; Pearson et al., 2014; White and Buss, 2014),  
272 confirming that regardless of the context, garnet incorporates three-quarters  
273 of the Sc budget of the subcontinental lithospheric mantle. Such a constant  
274 high proportion, independent of the context, indicates that, in the presence  
275 of garnet, the mobility of Sc is controlled by this phase.

#### 276 *4.2. Dilution Effect*

277 The low  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  in mafic host-rocks compared to ultramafic ones cannot be  
278 attributed to a compositional effect, as the median Sc content of mafic rocks  
279 (*ca* 40 ppm, Fig. 1c) is higher than that of ultramafic rocks (*ca* 10 ppm). This  
280 could reflect a lower compatibility of Sc in garnet from mafic parent rocks.  
281 However, experimentally-determined partition coefficients are inconsistent  
282 with this hypothesis:  $D_{\text{Sc}}^{\text{grt/melt}} = 8.3$  for eclogitic garnet and  $D_{\text{Sc}}^{\text{grt/melt}} = 6.0$   
283 for peridotitic garnet (Pertermann et al., 2004; Davis et al., 2013, respec-  
284 tively). This difference must reflect a dilution effect due to the high modal  
285 garnet content of mafic rocks.

286

287 The rest of this discussion will focus on Sc concentration in garnets from  
288 ultramafic host-rocks, which constitute the major part of the dataset. The  
289 lower garnet contents of these rocks makes them insensitive to dilution effects.

#### 290 *4.3. Impact of Thermobarometric Conditions*

291 Models of the dependence of  $D_{\text{Sc}}^{\text{grt/melt}}$  on pressure, temperature and com-  
292 position have been calibrated to experiments for the X site of garnet (van

293 Westrenen and Draper, 2007). However, the incorporation of Sc in mantle-  
294 derived garnets is not correlated with pressure or temperature (Figs. 5a, b  
295 and c), indicating the predominance of compositional effects.

#### 296 *4.4. Impact of Melt Extraction*

297 Depletion of mantle peridotites by removal of mafic melts is correlated  
298 with increased  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ . Lherzolithic garnets (G9) have low  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  compared to  
299 harzburgitic ones (G10; Figs. 4a and b) and  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  increases with Cr#, a  
300 measure of depletion (Fig. 7). According to our estimates based on melting  
301 experiments,  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  increases with melt extraction (Fig. 10d) in agreement  
302 with the observations in natural garnets.

303

304 Nonetheless, at constant Cr#,  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  decreases with increasing Mg# or  
305 decreasing Ca# (Fig. 7), two indicators of depletion of the host-rock. Vari-  
306 ations of  $D_{\text{Sc}}^{\text{grt/melt}}$  thus cannot be explained by melt-extraction only, and  
307 changes in crystal chemistry must be invoked. The correlations between  
308  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  and Cr# also imply crystal-chemical effects, considering that this pa-  
309 rameter reflects the nature of the atoms occupying the Y-site.

#### 310 *4.5. Impact of Garnet Crystal Chemistry*

311 Correlations between Sc and major elements (Fig 6) indicate the affinity  
312 of Sc for the uvarovite end-member of garnet ( $\text{Ca}_3\text{Cr}_2(\text{SiO}_4)_3$ ), indicating the  
313 significance of Cr in the crystal chemistry of mantle garnet. Although often  
314 referred to as a minor element, it can hardly be considered as such when it  
315 commonly reaches 0.5 apfu. In Cr-rich systems, the crystal-chemical mecha-  
316 nisms of Sc incorporation are unknown and  $D_{\text{Sc}}^{\text{grt/melt}}$  has not been determined

317 experimentally, but experimental studies on garnet crystal-chemistry provide  
318 likely explanations on the influence of Cr. When the uvarovite component  
319 is limited, the composition is close to pyrope and Sc is mainly incorporated  
320 in the X site of garnet (Oberti et al., 2006). When the composition shifts  
321 toward the grossular end-member, with Cr content remaining low, the relax-  
322 ation of the garnet structure by substitution of  $\text{Mg}^{2+}$  ( $r(\text{VIII}\text{Mg}^{2+}) = 0.89 \text{ \AA}$ ,  
323 Shannon, 1976) for the larger cation  $\text{Ca}^{2+}$  ( $r(\text{VIII}\text{Ca}^{2+}) = 1.12 \text{ \AA}$ ) results in  
324 an enlargement of both X and Y sites (Oberti et al., 2006; Kim et al., 2007)  
325 and increases the incorporation of Sc in these sites. However, in grossular,  
326 the size of the Y octahedron is constrained by the sole presence of the small  
327  $\text{Al}^{3+}$  cation ( $r(\text{VI}\text{Al}^{3+}) = 0.54 \text{ \AA}$ ), limiting the incorporation of Sc in the Y  
328 site (Oberti et al., 2006). When Sc substitutes for the larger  $\text{Fe}^{3+}$  ion in the  
329 high-spin state (Lin and Wheat, 2012,  $r(\text{VI}\text{Fe}^{3+}, \text{high spin}) = 0.65 \text{ \AA}$ ) along  
330 the join andradite–eringaite, this barrier is removed, and Sc is incorporated  
331 exclusively in the Y site (Quartieri et al., 2006). Iron(III) has an ionic radius  
332 of similar to  $\text{Cr}^{3+}$  ( $r(\text{VI}\text{Cr}^{3+}) = 0.62 \text{ \AA}$ ). By analogy, when the uvarovite  
333 component is significant, the less compact structure of Cr-Ca-rich garnet  
334 thus will favour the incorporation of Sc in the Y site. Large Y octahedra  
335 occupied by Cr and locally related to X dodecahedra occupied by Ca should  
336 coexist with small Y octahedra occupied by Al close to X dodecahedra oc-  
337 cupied by Mg. Because Ca can reach 1.5 apfu, the result should be a highly  
338 strained structure. In these compositions, Sc might predominantly enter a  
339 highly deformed Y site close to X sites occupied by Mg, helping to reduce  
340 the strain because this X site is large compared to the one in pyrope.

341

342 This incorporation of Sc in the Y site of Ca-Cr-rich garnet is consistent  
343 with lattice-strain theory (Wood and Blundy, 2014), which relates the charge  
344 and radius of an ion to its partition coefficient in the crystallographic site  
345 of a given mineral species at a given temperature and pressure. From this  
346 theory and the experimental determination of trace-element partition coeffi-  
347 cients, Onuma diagrams (Onuma et al., 1968) have been retrieved (Fig. 11)  
348 for mantle-related garnet end-members at thermobarometric conditions rep-  
349 resentative of the mantle (Corgne and Wood, 2004; Dasgupta et al., 2009;  
350 Corgne et al., 2012). Scandium is less compatible in the X or Y sites of  
351 the pyrope end-member than in the grossular end-member (Fig. 11a). The  
352 Onuma diagram expected from the interpretation given above is presented  
353 for the Y site for the uvarovite end-member as experimental data are not  
354 available. As explained above, incorporation of Cr and Ca in the garnet  
355 structure expands the Y site, increasing the compatibility of Sc in this site  
356 (Fig. 11b). This has a prominent effect on the variability of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ . As Sc  
357 compatibility in the Y site is low in pyrope, even a small expansion of the Y  
358 site can dramatically increase Sc compatibility.

359

360 This interpretation is consistent with the relationships between  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  and  
361  $[\text{REE}]_{\text{grt}}$ . Scandium is positively correlated with LREE and negatively with  
362 HREE (Fig. 8). The small ionic radius of Sc should make it more compara-  
363 ble to a HREE in terms of compatibility in the X site of garnet (Fig. 11a).  
364 However, the decrease in  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  with increasing  $[\text{HREE}]_{\text{grt}}$  indicates that the  
365 compatibility of Sc in garnet falls as the compatibility of HREE increases.  
366 This can only be explained by the incorporation of part of the Sc in the Y site



367 of garnet, while other HREE remain incompatible in the Y site of Cr-Ca-rich  
368 garnets (Fig. 11b). The shift towards the incorporation of Sc in the Y site  
369 of garnet tracks an enlargement of the X site of garnet, increasing the com-  
370 patibility of LREE and explaining the positive correlation with Sc, while the  
371 effect on the compatibility of HREE remains limited. The incorporation of  
372 Sc in the Y site may also explain the poor correlation between  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  and the  
373 temperature and pressure of equilibration of garnet; a complex relationship  
374 depending on both X and Y sites could blur any existing trend.

375

376 The variability of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  in our database is mainly related to the capacity  
377 of the Y site of garnet to accept Sc. The X site may play a lesser role in  
378 constraining the partition coefficient of Sc for natural ranges of compositions.  
379 However, spectroscopic studies of Sc or experimental data on the partition  
380 coefficients of trace elements in the Y site of Cr-Ca-rich garnet are needed  
381 to quantify these effects.

382

#### 383 *4.6. Impact of Metasomatic Processes*

384 Metasomatism of previously depleted rocks by silicate melts is not asso-  
385 ciated with variations in  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  (Fig. 9a). According to our melting model,  
386 Sc is mildly compatible in garnet-bearing mantle rocks. The Sc content of  
387 silicate melts is close from that of a garnet peridotite and  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  is not influ-  
388 enced by silicate-melt metasomatism. However, depleted garnets can reach  
389 high  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ . A slight decrease in  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  exists along the silicate-melt metaso-  
390 matism trend (from bright red to dark purple spots, Fig. 9a). In that case,  
391 the difference in Sc concentration between the garnet and the metasomatic

392 melt is great enough to lead to a decrease in  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ .

393

394 Metasomatism by volatile-rich fluids is correlated with higher  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  (Fig. 9b),  
395 contrasting with the low mobility expected for Sc in fluids from the shal-  
396 low lithospheric mantle (Lee et al., 2005). This behaviour is expected for  
397 strongly-incompatible elements (McKenzie, 1989; Bedini et al., 1997) but Sc  
398 is compatible in the garnet stability field of the mantle. Two mechanisms  
399 could explain the influence of volatile-rich fluids on  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ . (i) At mantle  
400 pressures and temperatures, complexing of Sc by volatile elements trans-  
401 ports significant amounts of Sc and drastically decreases its compatibility.  
402 This hypothesis is consistent with the occurrence of several Sc-rich carbon-  
403 atites (up to 190 ppm Sc in whole-rock analyses, see *e.g.* Gramaccioli et al.,  
404 2000). However, few data are available on Sc-complexes in fluids except for  
405 hydrothermal fluids (Wood and Samson, 2006). Experiments indicate that  
406  $D_{\text{Sc}}^{\text{grt}/\text{fluid}}$  increases from silicate to carbonate-rich melts (Fig. 11a, Dasgupta  
407 et al., 2009). In the presence of garnet, carbonate-rich melts should not  
408 transport significant amounts of Sc compared to other melts. (ii) The sec-  
409 ond mechanism relies on the differences of compatibility between fertile and  
410 depleted garnet, which is not modified during metasomatism by volatile-rich  
411 fluids, as the fluids produced involve low volumes of melting ( $< 1\%$ , McKen-  
412 zie, 1989). Volatile-rich fluids may be generated at the base of the lithosphere  
413 (McKenzie, 1989; Bedini et al., 1997). In this context, the deeper lithosphere  
414 is more fertile than in the upper parts, and consequently is richer in Sc  
415 (Fig. 10). Scandium is also mildly compatible due to the lower  $D_{\text{Sc}}^{\text{grt}/\text{melt}}$  of  
416 fertile garnets compared to depleted ones. In this way, volatile-rich fluids can

417 be enriched in Sc compared to a depleted mantle. When these fluids ascend  
418 in the lithosphere and reach depleted parts of the mantle, the high compat-  
419 ibility of Sc in depleted garnets and the relatively high Sc concentration of  
420 the fluid combine to increase  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ .

#### 421 *4.7. Validation of the Meta-Analysis on Selected Case Studies*

422 **Impact of crystal chemistry.** Metasomatic events during the evolution  
423 of the subcontinental lithospheric mantle beneath the Siberian craton were  
424 inferred from peridotite xenoliths by Howarth et al. (2014). On the basis of  
425 the trends observed in the CaO–Cr<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> diagram, increasing  $[\text{Ca}]_{\text{grt}}$  at con-  
426 stant  $[\text{Cr}]_{\text{grt}}$  is associated with a metasomatic refertilisation of harzburgite to  
427 lherzolite (Fig. 12a, arrow 1). Comparison with  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  shows that harzbur-  
428 gitic garnets have high  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  and refertilisation is associated with increasing  
429  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ . Increased  $[\text{Ca}]_{\text{grt}}$  at constant  $[\text{Cr}]_{\text{grt}}$  increases Sc compatibility in gar-  
430 net explaining the increased  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  during this first stage of metasomatism.  
431 The second stage is attributed to metasomatism by a kimberlitic melt, a  
432 product of small-degree partial melting (Fig. 12a, arrow 2). This event is  
433 associated with a decrease of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ , from *ca* 150 ppm to *ca* 100 ppm, typi-  
434 cal of lherzolithic garnet, and a decrease in  $[\text{Ca}]_{\text{grt}}$  and  $[\text{Cr}]_{\text{grt}}$ , decreasing Sc  
435 compatibility in garnet. The third stage of metasomatism is associated with  
436 the percolation of extensive amounts of basaltic fluids (Fig. 12a, arrow 3).  
437 It is also associated with the strongest decrease of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ , from *ca* 150 ppm  
438 to *ca* 50 ppm. This metasomatic event led to complete re-equilibration of  
439 garnet and increased modal garnet content, explaining the decrease in  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ .

440

441 Peridotite xenoliths from the Western Kaapvaal Craton show three groups

442 of garnets: low- and high-Cr lherzolitic garnets and harzburgitic garnets,  
443 characterised by the shape of their REE patterns and distinct La versus  
444 Cr/Ca ratio diagrams (Gibson et al., 2008). Figure 12b shows these three  
445 groups in the Sc versus Cr/Ca plot. According to Gibson et al. (2008), the  
446 high content of LREE, such as La, in harzburgitic garnet results from an  
447 enlargement of the X site. This is linked with the distortion of the crystal  
448 network caused by the substitution of Cr for Al, similar to the enhanced  
449 incorporation of Sc in the Cr-substituted Y site of harzburgitic garnet. This  
450 explains why La and Sc behave similarly with respect to Cr/Ca ratio, even  
451 though, Sc is closer in ionic radius to HREE than to LREE. This analogy  
452 between HREE and Sc leads us to suggest that the sinuous REE patterns  
453 of harzburgitic garnets reflect a partial incorporation of the heaviest REE in  
454 the Y site of Cr-rich harzburgitic garnet. In this case, the incorporation of  
455 both LREE and HREE in garnet is favoured by increasing  $[\text{Cr}]_{\text{grt}}$  while such  
456 effects are limited for the middle-REE, between Gd and Er, which are not  
457 affected by the enlargement of the X site nor by the possibility of incorpora-  
458 tion in the Y site. This would explain the low concentration of middle-REE  
459 in REE patterns of harzburgitic garnet observed by Gibson et al. (2008).

460

461 **Impact of metasomatism.** Metasomatic events were proposed in the  
462 lithospheric mantle beneath the Canadian Shield, based on the geochemistry  
463 of xenoliths and xenocrysts from the Buffalo Hills kimberlite (Aulbach et al.,  
464 2004). The enrichment of incompatible elements in garnet and clinopyrox-  
465 ene was used to argue for an early stage of volatile-rich fluid metasomatism.  
466 In the Y–Zr diagram (Fig. 12c), most samples show high  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ , between

467 *ca* 150 ppm and *ca* 250 ppm, regardless of the degree of depletion in terms of  
468 major elements. Volatile-rich metasomatism increases  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ , explaining the  
469 disconnect between the degree of depletion and  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ . The Y–Zr diagram  
470 also suggests the effects of silicate-melt metasomatism. Samples affected by  
471 this type of metasomatism exhibit a decrease in  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  (blue spots, Fig. 12c).  
472 This confirms that, when garnets are originally Sc-rich, silicate melt metaso-  
473 matism can be seen in variations of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ .

474

475 Metasomatic processes were investigated in the lithospheric mantle be-  
476 neath the Siberian craton (Agashev et al., 2013). The difference between  
477 the concentration of incompatible elements calculated from modal mineral-  
478 ogy and those measured was interpreted as reflecting the presence of cryptic  
479 phases induced by volatile-rich fluids during the formation of the garnet-  
480 bearing xenoliths. In the  $(\text{Zr}/\text{Sm})_{\text{N}}-(\text{Ce}/\text{Yb})_{\text{N}}$  diagram (Fig. 12d), we ob-  
481 serve an increase in  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  associated with increasing  $(\text{Ce}/\text{Yb})_{\text{N}}$  at low  $(\text{Zr}/\text{Sm})_{\text{N}}$ .  
482 This trend is compatible with the influence of volatile-rich metasomatism on  
483  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ , showing that the signature of this metasomatic stage is preserved by  
484  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  despite later stages of silicate metasomatism and Fe-rich metasoma-  
485 tism described by Agashev et al. (2013).

486

## 487 5. Conclusions

488 This meta-analysis and statistical dissection of a large database of garnet  
489 compositions provides new information on the geochemistry of Sc in the  
490 deep lithospheric mantle and a basis for using  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  as a tracer of mantle

491 processes:

- 492 1. Garnet accounts for about 75 % of the Sc budget of the deep litho-  
493 spheric mantle, regardless of the context, thus controlling the mobility  
494 of Sc in the mantle.
- 495 2. High modal garnet contents in mafic rocks lead to dilution  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ , lead-  
496 ing to a specific geochemical behaviour of Sc in such host-rocks.
- 497 3. Melt extraction increases  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  showing the compatibility of this ele-  
498 ment in the presence of garnet.
- 499 4. Crystal chemistry is the major parameter controlling  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ . In partic-  
500 ular, higher Cr# and Ca# in garnet increase the compatibility of Sc  
501 in this phase.
- 502 5. Metasomatism has limited effect on  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  except in the specific case  
503 of volatile-rich fluids, which can greatly enhance  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ .

504 These conclusions and the selection of case studies show how Sc geochem-  
505 istry can help recognise fluid-related processes in the mantle. Scandium is  
506 mildly incompatible above the spinel–garnet transition zone (Mallmann and  
507 O’Neill, 2009) while this study shows that Sc behaves as a mildly compatible  
508 element in the garnet stability field. This unique behaviour results from the  
509 ability of this element to enter both X and Y sites of Cr-Ca-rich garnets,  
510 at the boundary between trivalent transition elements, which enter the Y  
511 site, and REE, which occupy the X site. This behaviour reflects the singular  
512 crystal chemistry of garnet from the lithospheric mantle, and emphasises the  
513 need for experimental studies on partitioning of trace elements in Cr-Ca-rich  
514 garnets. The balance between the variable compatibility of Sc in garnet,

515 depending on Cr# and Ca# and the modal garnet content of the host-rock  
516 induces subtle variations in compatibility which can have drastic effects on Sc  
517 contents, as shown by the unexpected effect of volatile-rich fluids on  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ .  
518 In well-constrained contexts, studying Sc concentration will help to under-  
519 stand the conditions of generation of magmas, as well as the nature of their  
520 residues.

## 521 **Declaration of Interest**

522 None.

## 523 **Acknowledgements**

524 We thank Mr Pierre Chassé and Dr Max Frenzel for fruitful discussions  
525 and help on statistical methods. The authors are indebted to Dr Roberta  
526 Oberti, Prof Douglas Smith and Dr Andrew Kerr for their comments and  
527 suggestions which helped to improve this manuscript. Mathieu Chassé has  
528 been supported by scholarships from the École normale supérieure (ENS)  
529 and Macquarie University. Olivier Alard is supported by an Australian Re-  
530 search Council grant (FT150100115). This work was funded by the Institut  
531 universitaire de France (IUF) and a Foundation Grant from the ARC Centre  
532 of Excellence for Core to Crust Fluid Systems (CCFS). This is contribu-  
533 tion 1156 from the ARC Centre of Excellence for Core to Crust Fluid Sys-  
534 tems (<http://www.cafs.mq.edu.au>) and 1222 from the GEMOC Key Centre  
535 (<http://www.gemoc.mq.edu.au>).

536 **References**

537 Agashev, A. M., Ionov, D. A., Pokhilenko, N. P., Golovin, A. V.,  
538 Cherepanova, Y., Sharygin, I. S., 2013. Metasomatism in Lithospheric  
539 Mantle Roots: Constraints from Whole-Rock and Mineral Chemical  
540 Composition of Deformed Peridotite Xenoliths from Kimberlite Pipe  
541 Udachnaya. *Lithos* 160-161, 201–215.

542 Appleyard, C. M., Bell, D. R., le Roex, A. P., 2007. Petrology and Geo-  
543 chemistry of Eclogite Xenoliths from the Rietfontein Kimberlite, Northern  
544 Cape, South Africa. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 154, 309–  
545 333.

546 Aulbach, S., Griffin, W. L., O'Reilly, S. Y., McCandless, T. E., 2004. Gen-  
547 esis and Evolution of the Lithospheric Mantle Beneath the Buffalo Head  
548 Terrane, Alberta (Canada). *Lithos* 77, 413–451.

549 Aulbach, S., Viljoen, K. S., 2015. Eclogite Xenoliths from the Lace Kimber-  
550 lite, Kaapvaal Craton: from Convecting Mantle Source to Palaeo-Ocean  
551 Floor and Back. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 431, 274–286.

552 Baxter, E. F., Caddick, M. J., Ague, J. J., 2013. Garnet: Common Mineral,  
553 Uncommonly Useful. *Elements* 9, 415–419.

554 Bedini, R.-M., Bodinier, J.-L., Dautria, J.-M., Morten, L., 1997. Evolution  
555 of LILE-Enriched Small Melt Fractions in the Lithospheric Mantle: a Case  
556 Study from the East African Rift. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*  
557 153, 67–83.



- 558 Brey, G. P., Köhler, T., 1990. Geothermobarometry in Four-Phase Lher-  
559 zolites II. New Thermobarometers, and Practical Assessment of Existing  
560 Thermobarometers. *Journal of Petrology* 31, 1353–1378.
- 561 Caddick, M. J., Kohn, M. J., 2013. Garnet: Witness to the Evolution of  
562 Destructive Plate Boundaries. *Elements* 9, 427–432.
- 563 Connelly, N. G., Damhus, T., Hartshorn, R. M., Hutton, A. T., 2005. Nomen-  
564 clature of Inorganic Chemistry: IUPAC Recommendations 2005. The Royal  
565 Society of Chemistry, Cambridge, United Kingdom.
- 566 Corgne, A., Armstrong, L. S., Keshav, S., Fei, Y., McDonough, W. F., Mi-  
567 narik, W. G., Moreno, K., 2012. Trace Element Partitioning Between Ma-  
568 joritic Garnet and Silicate Melt at 10–17 GPa: Implications for Deep Man-  
569 tle Processes. *Lithos* 148, 128–141.
- 570 Corgne, A., Wood, B. J., 2004. Trace Element Partitioning Between Majoritic  
571 Garnet and Silicate Melt at 25 GPa. *Physics of the Earth and Planetary  
572 Interiors* 143, 407–419.
- 573 Dasgupta, R., Hirschmann, M. M., McDonough, W. F., Spiegelman, M.,  
574 Withers, A. C., 2009. Trace Element Partitioning Between Garnet Lher-  
575 zolite and Carbonatite at 6.6 and 8.6 GPa With Applications to the Geo-  
576 chemistry of the Mantle and of Mantle-Derived Melts. *Chemical Geology*  
577 262, 57–77.
- 578 Davis, F. A., Humayun, M., Hirschmann, M. M., Cooper, R. S., 2013. Exper-  
579 imentally Determined Mineral/Melt Partitioning of First-Row Transition

- 580 Elements (FRTE) During Partial Melting of Peridotite at 3 GPa. *Geochim-*  
581 *ica et Cosmochimica Acta* 104, 232–260.
- 582 Galuskina, I. O., Galuskin, E. V., Lazic, B., Armbruster, T., Dzierzanowski,  
583 P., Prusik, K., Wrzalik, R., 2010. Eringaite,  $\text{Ca}_3\text{Sc}_2(\text{SiO}_4)_3$ , a New Mineral  
584 of the Garnet Group. *Mineralogical Magazine* 74, 365–373.
- 585 Gibson, S. A., Malarkey, J., Day, J. A., 2008. Melt Depletion and Enrichment  
586 Beneath the Western Kaapvaal Craton: Evidence from Finsch Peridotite  
587 Xenoliths. *Journal of Petrology* 49, 1817–1852.
- 588 Gramaccioli, C. M., Diella, V., Demartin, F., 2000. The Formation of Scandium  
589 Minerals As an Example of the Role of Complexes in the Geochem-  
590 istry of Rare Earths and HFS Elements. *European Journal of Mineralogy*  
591 12, 795–808.
- 592 Grégoire, M., Bell, D. R., Le Roex, A. P., 2003. Garnet Lherzolites from the  
593 Kaapvaal Craton (South Africa): Trace Element Evidence for a Metaso-  
594 matic History. *Journal of Petrology* 44, 629–657.
- 595 Griffin, W. L., Fisher, N. I., Friedman, J. H., O'Reilly, S. Y., Ryan, C. G.,  
596 2002. Cr-Pyrope Garnets in the Lithospheric Mantle 2. Compositional Pop-  
597 ulations and Their Distribution in Time and Space. *Geochemistry, Geo-*  
598 *physics, Geosystems* 3, 1073.
- 599 Griffin, W. L., Fisher, N. I., Friedman, J. H., Ryan, C. G., O'Reilly, S. Y.,  
600 1999a. Cr-Pyrope Garnets in the Lithospheric Mantle. I. Compositional  
601 Systematics and Relations to Tectonic Settings. *Journal of Petrology* 40,  
602 679–704.

- 603 Griffin, W. L., Shee, S. R., Ryan, C. G., Win, T. T., Wyatt, B. A., 1999b.  
604 Harzburgite to Lherzolite and Back Again: Metasomatic Processes in  
605 Ultramafic Xenoliths from the Wesselton Kimberlite, Kimberley, South  
606 Africa. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 134, 232–250.
- 607 Grütter, H. S., Gurney, J. J., Menzies, A. H., Winter, F., 2004. An Updated  
608 Classification Scheme for Mantle-Derived Garnet, for Use by Diamond  
609 Explorers. *Lithos* 77, 841–857.
- 610 Howarth, G. H., Barry, P. H., Pernet-Fisher, J. F., Baziotis, I. P., Pokhilenko,  
611 N. P., Pokhilenko, L. N., Bodnar, R. J., Taylor, L. A., Agashev, A. M.,  
612 2014. Superplume Metasomatism: Evidence from Siberian Mantle Xenoliths.  
613 *Lithos* 184-187, 209–224.
- 614 Ionov, D. A., 2004. Chemical Variations in Peridotite Xenoliths from Vitim,  
615 Siberia: Inferences for REE and Hf Behaviour in the Garnet-Facies Upper  
616 Mantle. *Journal of Petrology* 45, 343–367.
- 617 Jacob, D. E., Bizimis, M., Salters, V. J. M., 2005. Lu-Hf and Geochemical  
618 Systematics of Recycled Ancient Oceanic Crust: Evidence from Roberts  
619 Victor Eclogites. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 148, 707–720.
- 620 Kim, N., Stebbins, J. F., Quartieri, S., Oberti, R., 2007. Scandium-45 NMR  
621 of Pyrope-Grossular Garnets: Resolution of Multiple Scandium Sites and  
622 Comparison With X-Ray Diffraction and X-Ray Absorption Spectroscopy.  
623 *American Mineralogist* 92, 1875–1880.
- 624 Lee, C.-T. A., Leeman, W. P., Canil, D., Li, Z.-X. A., 2005. Similar V/Sc  
625 Systematics in MORB and Arc Basalts: Implications for the Oxygen Fu-

- 626 gacities of Their Mantle Source Regions. *Journal of Petrology* 46, 2313–  
627 2336.
- 628 Lin, J.-F., Wheat, A., 2012. Electronic Spin Transition of Iron in the Earth's  
629 Lower Mantle. *Hyperfine Interactions* 207, 81–88.
- 630 Mallmann, G., O'Neill, H. S. C., 2009. The Crystal/Melt Partitioning of  
631 V During Mantle Melting As a Function of Oxygen Fugacity Compared  
632 With Some Other Elements (Al, P, Ca, Sc, Ti, Cr, Fe, Ga, Y, Zr and Nb).  
633 *Journal of Petrology* 50, 1765–1794.
- 634 McDonough, W. F., Sun, S. s., 1995. The Composition of the Earth. *Chemical*  
635 *Geology* 120, 223–253.
- 636 McKenzie, D., 1989. Some Remarks on the Movement of Small Melt Fractions  
637 in the Mantle. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 95, 53–72.
- 638 Oberti, R., Quartieri, S., Dalconi, M. C., Boscherini, F., Iezzi, G., Boiocchi,  
639 M., Eeckhout, S. G., 2006. Site Preference and Local Geometry of Sc in  
640 Garnets: Part I. Multifarious Mechanisms in the Pyrope-Grossular Join.  
641 *American Mineralogist* 91, 1230–1239.
- 642 Onuma, N., Higuchi, H., Wakita, H., Nagasawa, H., 1968. Trace Element  
643 Partition Between Two Pyroxenes and the Host Lava. *Earth and Planetary*  
644 *Science Letters* 5, 47–51.
- 645 Palme, H., Lodders, K., Jones, A., 2014. Solar System Abundances of the El-  
646 ements, in: Holland, H., Turekian, K. K. (Eds.), *Treatise on Geochemistry*,  
647 2nd Edition, Elsevier Ltd., Amsterdam, the Netherlands, pp. 15–36.

- 648 Palme, H., O'Neill, H., 2014. Cosmochemical Estimates of Mantle Composi-  
649 tion, in: Holland, H., Turekian, K. K. (Eds.), *Treatise on Geochemistry*,  
650 2nd Edition, Elsevier Ltd., Amsterdam, the Netherlands, pp. 1–39.
- 651 Pearson, D. G., Canil, D., Shirey, S. B., 2014. Mantle Samples Included in  
652 Volcanic Rocks: Xenoliths and Diamonds, in: Holland, H., Turekian, K. K.  
653 (Eds.), *Treatise on Geochemistry*, 2nd Edition, Elsevier Ltd., Amsterdam,  
654 the Netherlands, pp. 170–253.
- 655 Perrillat, J.-P., Ricolleau, A., Daniel, I., Fiquet, G., Mezouar, M., Guignot,  
656 N., Cardon, H., 2006. Phase Transformations of Subducted Basaltic Crust  
657 in the Upmost Lower Mantle. *Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors*  
658 157, 139–149.
- 659 Pertermann, M., Hirschmann, M. M., Hametner, K., Gülnther, D., Schmidt,  
660 M. W., 2004. Experimental Determination of Trace Element Partitioning  
661 Between Garnet and Silica-Rich Liquid During Anhydrous Partial Melt-  
662 ing of MORB-Like Eclogite. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems* 5,  
663 Q05A01.
- 664 Quartieri, S., Oberti, R., Boiocchi, M., Dalconi, M. C., Boscherini, F., Sa-  
665 fonova, O., Woodland, A. B., 2006. Site Preference and Local Geometry  
666 of Sc in Garnets: Part II. the Crystal-Chemistry of Octahedral Sc in the  
667 Andradite –  $\text{Ca}_3\text{Sc}_2\text{Si}_3\text{O}_{12}$  Join. *American Mineralogist* 91, 1240–1248.
- 668 R Core Team, 2016. R: a Language and Environment for Statistical Com-  
669 puting. R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria.

- 670 Ryan, C. G., Griffin, W. L., Pearson, N. J., 1996. Garnet Geotherms:  
671 Pressure-Temperature Data from Cr-Pyrope Garnet Xenocrysts in Vol-  
672 canic Rocks. *Journal of Geophysical Research* 101, 5611–5625.
- 673 Samson, I. M., Chassé, M., 2016. Scandium, in: White, W. M. (Ed.),  
674 *Encyclopedia of Geochemistry*, Springer International Publishing, Cham,  
675 Switzerland, pp. 1–5.
- 676 Sarbas, M., Nohl, U., 2008. The GEOROC Database As Part of a Growing  
677 Geoinformatics Network, in: *Geoinformatics Conference*, Postdam, Ger-  
678 many. Geological Society of America, pp. 3–4.
- 679 Schmickler, B., Jacob, D. E., Foley, S. F., 2004. Eclogite Xenoliths from the  
680 Kuruman Kimberlites, South Africa: Geochemical Fingerprinting of Deep  
681 Subduction and Cumulate Processes. *Lithos* 75, 173–207.
- 682 Schulze, D. J., 2003. A Classification Scheme for Mantle-Derived Garnets in  
683 Kimberlite: a Tool for Investigating the Mantle and Exploring for Dia-  
684 monds. *Lithos* 71, 195–213.
- 685 Shannon, R. D., 1976. Revised Effective Ionic Radii and Systematic Studies  
686 of Interatomic Distances in Halides and Chalcogenides. *Acta Crystallo-*  
687 *graphica Section A: Foundations and Advances* A32, 751–767.
- 688 Stixrude, L., Lithgow-Bertelloni, C., 2007. Influence of Phase Transforma-  
689 tions on Lateral Heterogeneity and Dynamics in Earth’s Mantle. *Earth*  
690 *and Planetary Science Letters* 263, 45–55.
- 691 Ulianov, A., Kalt, A., Pettke, T., 2006. Aluminous Websterite and Granulite  
692 Xenoliths from the Chyulu Hills Volcanic Field, Kenya: Gabbro-Troctolitic

- 693 Cumulates Subjected to Lithospheric Foundering. *Contributions to Min-*  
694 *eralogy and Petrology* 152, 459–483.
- 695 van Achterbergh, E., Griffin, W. L., Stiefenhofer, J., 2001. Metasomatism in  
696 Mantle Xenoliths from the Letlhakane Kimberlites: Estimation of Element  
697 Fluxes. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 141, 397–414.
- 698 van Westrenen, W., Draper, D. S., 2007. Quantifying Garnet-Melt Trace  
699 Element Partitioning Using Lattice-Strain Theory: New Crystal-Chemical  
700 and Thermodynamic Constraints. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrol-*  
701 *ogy* 154, 717–730.
- 702 Walter, M. J., 1998. Melting of Garnet Peridotite and the Origin of Komatiite  
703 and Depleted Lithosphere. *Journal of Petrology* 39, 29–60.
- 704 White, A. F., Buss, H. L., 2014. Natural Weathering Rates of Silicate Min-  
705 erals, in: Holland, H., Turekian, K. K. (Eds.), *Treatise on Geochemistry*,  
706 2nd Edition, Elsevier Ltd., Amsterdam, the Netherlands, pp. 115–155.
- 707 Wood, B. J., Blundy, J. D., 2014. Trace Element Partitioning: the Influences  
708 of Ionic Radius, Cation Charge, Pressure, and Temperature, in: Holland,  
709 H., Turekian, K. K. (Eds.), *Treatise on Geochemistry*, 2nd Edition, Elsevier  
710 Ltd., Amsterdam, the Netherlands, pp. 422–448.
- 711 Wood, B. J., Kiseeva, E. S., Matzen, A. K., 2013. Garnet in the Earth's  
712 Mantle. *Elements* 9, 421–426.
- 713 Wood, S. A., Samson, I. M., 2006. The Aqueous Geochemistry of Gallium,  
714 Germanium, Indium and Scandium. *Ore Geology Reviews* 28, 57–102.

715 **Figure Captions**

716 Figure 1: Distribution of Sc concentration in minerals and mantle-related  
717 rocks: (a) box-and-whisker plots of Sc concentration in selected mantle-  
718 related rocks. The grey horizontal line corresponds to 16.4 ppm, the average  
719 Sc concentration in the silicate Earth (Palme et al., 2014); (b) box-and-  
720 whisker plots of Sc concentration in major rock-forming minerals. The box  
721 is limited by the first and third quartiles of the data distribution. The hor-  
722 izontal line represents the median, and the width of the adjacent notches  
723 shows the 95 % confidence interval about the median. Where absent, this in-  
724 terval is narrower than the thickness of the line representing the median. The  
725 “whiskers” represent the last value before 1.5 times midrange (the arithmetic  
726 mean of maximum and minimum values) beyond the first or third quartile.



728 Figure 2: Influence of host-rock parameters on  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ : (a) scatter plot of  
729 Sc concentration in the host-rock versus the estimated Sc content in the  
730 host-rock attributable to garnet. This estimate is calculated using the  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$   
731 and the modal content of garnet in the host-rock; (b) average proportion  
732 of Sc incorporated in the different mineral phases of garnet-bearing lherzo-  
733 lites, harzburgites, pyroxenites and eclogites (n: number of individual rocks  
734 analysed; after the only studies of the database reporting the required in-  
735 formation: van Achterbergh et al., 2001; Grégoire et al., 2003; Ionov, 2004;  
736 Schmickler et al., 2004; Jacob et al., 2005; Ulianov et al., 2006; Appleyard  
737 et al., 2007; Gibson et al., 2008; Aulbach and Viljoen, 2015). Values of Sc con-  
738 centration are sometimes absent for olivine and orthopyroxene grains, they  
739 are replaced by the median value calculated from the other studies reporting  
740 this content.

742 Figure 3: Density plot of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  and histograms of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  from mafic host-  
743 rock, fertile ultramafic host-rocks and depleted ultramafic host-rocks.

745 Figure 4: Variations in the distribution of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  with the lithology of the  
746 host-rock: (a) box-and-whisker plots of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  relative to the lithotype of the  
747 host-rock described in the original publications; (b) box-and-whisker plots  
748 of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  in xenocrysts classified according to Grütter et al. (2004) (Xen.:  
749 all xenocryst values, G0: unclassified, G1: low-Cr megacrysts, G3: eclogitic,  
750 G5: pyroxenitic, G9: lherzolithic, G10: harzburgitic, G11: Ti-metasomatised,  
751 G12: wehrlitic). The box is limited by the first and third quartiles of the  
752 data distribution. The horizontal line represents the median, and the width  
753 of the adjacent notches shows the 95 % confidence interval about the median.  
754 Where absent, this interval is narrower than the thickness of the line repre-  
755 senting the median. The “whiskers” represent the last value before 1.5 times  
756 midrange (the arithmetic mean of maximum and minimum values) beyond  
758 the first or third quartile.

759 Figure 5: Influence of temperature and pressure on  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ : (a) scatter plot  
760 of  $T_{\text{Ni}}$  (Ryan et al., 1996) versus  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ ; (b) scatter plot of  $T_{\text{BKN}}$  (Brey and  
761 Köhler, 1990) versus  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ ; (c) scatter plot of  $P_{\text{BKN}}$  (Brey and Köhler, 1990)  
763 versus  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ . Estimates of  $T_{\text{BKN}}$  and  $P_{\text{BKN}}$  are from the original publications.

764 Figure 6: Correlation matrix and scatter plots for  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  versus major and  
765 minor elements. Positive (respectively negative) correlations are indicated  
766 by red (respectively blue) colours and the orientation of the ellipse. The  
767 intensity of the correlation is given by the intensity of the colour (see colour  
768 bar) and the narrowness of the ellipse.

770 Figure 7: Scatter plots of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  relative to the ratios of selected major ele-  
771 ments: (a) Cr# versus Ca#; (b) Cr# versus Mg#. The colour of each point  
772 depends on the Sc content of the record, from 0 ppm (in blue) to 300 ppm  
773 (in red).

775 Figure 8: Correlation matrix and scatter plots for  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  versus REE. Positive  
776 (respectively negative) correlations are indicated by red (respectively blue)  
777 colour and the direction of the ellipse. The intensity of the correlation is  
778 given by the intensity of the colour (see colour bar) and the narrowness of  
780 the ellipse.

781 Figure 9: Scatter plots of Sc relationships to trace-element indicators of  
782 fluid-related processes in the mantle: (a)  $[Y]_{\text{grt}}$  versus  $[Zr]_{\text{grt}}$ , the fields are  
783 after Griffin et al. (1999b); (b)  $(\text{Ce}/\text{Yb})_{\text{N}}$  versus  $(\text{Zr}/\text{Sm})_{\text{N}}$ , ratios have been  
784 normalised to the values of McDonough and Sun (1995). The metasomatic  
785 trends are after Aulbach et al. (2004). The colour of each point depends on  
786 the Sc content of the record, from 0 ppm (in blue) to 300 ppm (in red).

788 Figure 10: Influence of partial melting of a fertile ultramafic mantle esti-  
789 mated from Walter (1998) experiments: (a) evolution of the Sc content of  
790 the residue; (b) evolution of the Sc content of the melt; (c) evolution of the  
792 modal garnet content; (d) evolution of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$ .

793 Figure 11: Onuma diagrams (Onuma et al., 1968) showing the partition  
794 coefficients of trace elements as a function of their ionic radius: (a) X site of  
795 garnet (Prp: pyrope, Grs: grossular); (b) Y site of garnet (Maj: majoritic  
796 pyrope, Uv: uvarovite). Diagrams for the X site after van Westrenen and  
797 Draper (2007) and Dasgupta et al. (2009); diagram for the Y site of majoritic  
798 pyrope is from Corgne and Wood (2004) and an expected curve for the Y site  
800 of uvarovite is given to illustrate the influence of Cr and Ca incorporation.

801 Figure 12: Evolution of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  with garnet composition in selected case stud-  
802 ies: (a) evolution of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  (given by the colour of each point) in the CaO–  
803  $\text{Cr}_2\text{O}_3$  diagram for garnets from the subcontinental lithospheric mantle be-  
804 neath the Siberian craton (Hz: harzburgitic garnet, Lz: lherzolitic garnet).  
805 The arrows represent three stages of metasomatism, described by Howarth  
806 et al. (2014); (b) distinction of garnet groups from the Kaapvaal craton de-  
807 pending on their relative Sc contents and Cr/Ca ratios; data are from Gibson  
808 et al. (2008); (c) evolution of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  (given by the colour of each point) in the  
809 Y–Zr diagram for garnets from the Buffalo Head Terrane (Dep.: depleted);  
810 data are Aulbach et al. (2004), and the fields are from Griffin et al. (1999b);  
811 (d) evolution of  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  (given by the colour of each point) in the  $(\text{Zr}/\text{Sm})_{\text{N}}$ –  
812  $(\text{Ce}/\text{Yb})_{\text{N}}$  diagram for garnets from the Siberian craton, data from Agashev  
813 et al. (2013). The metasomatic trends are after Aulbach et al. (2004).

815 **Table Caption**

816 Table 1: Comparisons of Sc concentration in the mantle calculated from this  
817 study with estimates from the literature for different mantle compositions.  
818 The references used for each value are given in the table. The estimated Sc  
819 concentration for this study is obtained using the following formula:  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}} * \text{Mod} / 0.75$ , with Mod the modal garnet content,  $[\text{Sc}]_{\text{grt}}$  the median concen-  
820 tration of Sc in the type of garnet considered and 0.75 our assessment of the  
821 proportion of the Sc content in the mantle that is incorporated in garnet.  
823