

Cooperative effects induced by intruders evolving through a granular medium

Aymeric Merceron, Alban Sauret, Pierre Jop

► To cite this version:

Aymeric Merceron, Alban Sauret, Pierre Jop. Cooperative effects induced by intruders evolving through a granular medium. EPL - Europhysics Letters, 2018, 121 (3), 10.1209/0295-5075/121/34005. hal-01796920

HAL Id: hal-01796920 https://hal.science/hal-01796920

Submitted on 11 Mar 2021

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

Cooperative effects induced by intruders evolving through a granular medium

A. MERCERON, A. SAURET and P. JOP

Surface du Verre et Interfaces, UMR125 CNRS/Saint-Gobain, 39 quai Lucien Lefranc, F-93303 Aubervilliers Cedex, France

PACS 45.70.-n - Granular systems
PACS 45.70.Mg - Granular flow: mixing, segregation and stratification
PACS 81.05.Rm - Porous materials, granular materials

Abstract –Applying mechanical perturbations in a granular assembly may rearrange the configuration of the particles. However, the spatial propagation of an event is not related to the size of the external perturbation alone. Thus, the characteristic length scale of an event is not well defined. In this study, we trigger rearrangements by driving two intruders through a vertical two-dimensional packing of disks. The amplitude of the rearrangements of the granular assembly appearing around the two evolving intruders is related to their separating distances. We show that there exists a characteristic distance between intruders under which the dynamics of the grains above one intruder is influenced by the other. The size of the intruders has little effect on this characteristic length. Finally, we show that the correlation between the movements of the grains decreases with the distance away from the intruders over a larger length scale.

Introduction. – Granular materials are the most encountered raw materials and are involved in various industrial processes in which the final product may be a 3 homogeneous continuous solid. However, the transformation from an initial granular pile to a final homogeneous 5 phase is not straightforward. The granular packing may 6 be changed owing to chemical or physical transformations that induce local perturbations [1, 2]. Therefore, the spa-8 tial and temporal extension of perturbations in a granular 9 packing could help to control better or predict the evolu-10 tion of a pile. The typical length scale over which a per-11 turbation propagates in a granular medium is related to 12 both the amplitude of the perturbation and the contact 13 network. Indeed, the local destabilization of an assem-14 bly of grains, observed for example when removing some 15 grains, can induce plastic rearrangements close to and far 16 from the perturbation (e.g., [3]). 17

The propagation of the perturbation is induced by large 18 spatial heterogeneities of the amplitude of the contact 19 forces in static or flowing granular piles [4]. The descrip-20 tion of these structures has led to the definition of fab-21 ric tensors that are related to the shear resistance [5, 6]. 22 However, defining relevant length scales in the structure 23 of granular media remains a challenge as they depend 24 on the phenomenon considered (dynamical heterogeneities 25

[7], flow far from a shear band [8]). For example, the 26 structural heterogeneities can induce correlated particle 27 motion by releasing mechanical constraints. Also, stable 28 arches can be formed and interrupt the discharge of silos 29 [9]. Then, the destabilization of a single grain induces the 30 collapse of the entire structure. The probability of clog-31 ging decreases when increasing the width of the orifice, 32 but the existence of a critical width beyond which clog-33 ging never occurs is still a matter of debate [10, 11]. It has 34 also been shown that the jamming probability can be dras-35 tically reduced by the nearby presence of a second outlet, 36 whose influence on the flow rate decreases exponentially 37 with the distances between them [12]. Similarly, close in-38 truders entering into a granular medium have shown a 39 repulsion effect over a distance of several intruder diame-40 ters due to the forced motion of the grains between them 41 [13,14]. Different studies have also considered the spatial 42 propagation of force fluctuations in the granular packing. 43 Such non-local effects allow the granular medium to flow 44 even where the threshold given by the local rheology is 45 apparently not overcome [15, 16]. Such observations can 46 be made by considering the velocity of the grains in a heap 47 flow that is found to decrease exponentially with the depth 48 [17,18]. As mentioned above, when the jamming transition 49 is approached, the characteristic length scales of correlated 50



Fig. 1: Populations of disks analyzed in two different experimental configurations: (a) two intruders of width $10d_g$ separated by $35d_g$ and (b) two intruders of width $2.5d_g$ separated by $5d_g$.

motions are increasing [7,19]. Most of the previous studies
have considered pushed or pulled intruders in a granular
packing, as well as the impact of a sphere on a granular
bed, to investigate the localization of the flow around the
intruder and the cooperative effects [20-27]. Generally, a
jammed state ahead the intruders is created at relatively
large velocity and governs the velocity field.

All these examples exhibit correlated motions in the 58 granular assembly. Long-range correlations can, there-59 fore, impact the dynamic of rearrangement of a perturbed 60 granular medium. In this study, we consider the evolution 61 of a two-dimensional granular medium subjected to the 62 synchronized motion of two intruders to study the long-63 distance effects induced by the transformation of several 64 grains in a granular assembly. More specifically, we focus 65 on the influence of the gap between two intruders on the 66 rearrangement processes. We go beyond the classical av-67 erage velocity field or the mean force by characterizing the 68 movement of individual grains. 69

This paper is organized as follows. After, a detailed de-70 scription of experimental and numerical tools, we present 71 the influence of the distance between of the two intrud-72 ers. We show that the width of the intruder has little 73 effect, and highlight a relevant length scale. We then ana-74 lyze the amplitude of the perturbations by considering the 75 avalanche size and discuss the existence of typical correla-76 tion length scales related to the synchronization of disks 77 movements. We finally conclude by comparing the results 78 obtained in our system with the length scales obtained in 79 different systems previously considered. 80

Experimental setup and numerical methods. -81 A two-dimensional cell made of two parallel glass plates 82 (30 cm high and 50 cm wide) separated by a gap of 3.1 mm 83 is filled with about 5600 bidisperse stainless steel disks of 84 4 and 5 mm in diameter to avoid crystallization (propor-85 tion 10:7). The experimental setup is an extension of a 86 setup previously used in [28]. The packing is constrained 87 at the top by confining weights consisting of 12 metal-88 lic plates ensuring a uniform pressure over the top of the 89 granular assembly. In the following, all lengths are ex-90 pressed in terms of diameter of the smallest grains, $d_q =$ 91 4 mm. Two 3 mm-thick metallic intruders with a semi-92 circular end and of width D_{int} are inserted at the bot-93 tom of the cell and surrounded by the disks as shown 94 in Fig. 1(a)-(b). The distance between the centers of 95 the intruders is denoted s. The two intruders are then 96 slowly pulled down, out of the cell, at a low and con-97 stant speed of 0.05 mm.s^{-1} to ensure a quasistatic evolu-98 tion of the granular packing. The Froude number in our 99 configurations is $Fr = U/\sqrt{g d_g} = 2 \times 10^{-4}$, where U 100 is the velocity of the intruder and d_g is the diameter of 101 the grains. In addition, the inertial number is very low, 102 $I = U d_g / (W \sqrt{g h}) = 2 \times 10^{-5}$, where W is the width 103 of the intruder. These conditions lead to a quasi-static 104 evolution of the system. The detailed procedure to obtain 105 a reproducible dense initial packing can be found in [28]. 106 Finally, the pictures of the packing recorded during the 107 experiments are processed with high accuracy, which en-108 ables us to obtain uncertainties on the position of each disk 109 smaller than 22 μ m. To obtain reliable statistical data, we 110 repeat each experiment approximatively 40 times for each 111 of the 9 configurations considered in this paper. 112

Besides, we perform numerical simulations with the dis-113 crete element software LMGC90 [29] to explore a larger 114 number of configurations. Each particle is modeled as 115 a hard disk interacting with its neighbors through the 116 Coulomb friction law, and the dynamics is solved using 117 a non-smooth contact dynamics method [30]. The nu-118 merical system has the same geometrical parameters as 119 the experiments. The particle-particle and particle-wall 120 dynamical friction coefficients have been measured exper-121 imentally and numerically set to 0.13. The disks are se-122 quentially deposited by gravity before computations are 123 performed to finally reach the packing stability. Then, the 124 intruders evolve by successive discontinuous steps of de-125 creasing depths ($\delta z = -1/16 \ d_q$) ending when the system 126 reaches a stable state. The decrease in depth corresponds 127 to the elevation lost by the intruder between two consecu-128 tive snapshots. We ensured that this sequential evolution 129 of the numerical intruders does not change the response of 130 the packing under quasi-static conditions. Moreover, the 131 computational time step is set to 10^{-4} s, giving a negli-132 gible overlap between disks and ensuring a good accuracy 133 of the simulation. For each of the 28 configurations, the 134 simulations were repeated between 20 and 50 times. We 135 emphasize that the ratio between the disk weight and the 136 overload confining weights is 1.74 larger than in experi-137



Fig. 2: (Colour online) (a) Average vertical displacement field γ over an experiment for two intruders of width 2.5 d_g and $s = 10 d_g$. Vertical experimental displacement profile (b) recorded just above two intruders of width $2.5d_g$, $\gamma(y = 1)$, and (c) obtained by the addition of the displacement curves measured for a single intruder. (d) Maximal value γ_{max} for two intruders (Δ) and by addition of two displacement curves measured for a single intruder (continuous line).

¹³⁸ ments without substantial quantitative changes.

Phenomenological observations. – We measured 139 the grain displacements between the first and the last im-140 ages, corresponding to an entire experiment. The resulting 141 displacement field γ is shown in Fig. 2(a) for narrow in-142 truders (width $2.5d_q$). Figure 2(b) reports the amplitude 143 of the vertical displacement along the line y = 1 for four 144 different distances s between the two intruders. For large 145 distances, the curve exhibits two peaks, which merge when 146 the distance s between the intruders decreases. We calcu-147 late the superposition of two fields measured for a single 148 intruder to test whether the displacement field for two in-149 truders can be estimated from the displacement field for 150 a single intruder. Figure 2(c) exhibits that the sum of 151 the single fields is in good agreement with the displace-152 ment above two intruders for large gaps. However, we ob-153 serve large discrepancies for smaller separation distances 154 between the intruders. In particular, Fig. 2(d) shows a 155 fast increase of the amplitude of the displacement peaks 156 in the case of two intruders whose distance is less than 157 about ten particle diameters. Therefore, the influence of 158 a second intruder cannot be described as a simple sum of 159 two displacement fields centered above the intruders. In 160 the following, we analyze the movement of the grains at 161 each time step to better characterize the evolution of the 162 dynamics with the distance of separation. 163

For both experiments and numerical simulations, we define the avalanche size N_A as the number of disks whose absolute displacement is at least equal to the vertical displacement of the intruder between two time steps [28]. The avalanche size characterizes the amplitude of a granular reorganization while the response of the granular medium is highly heterogeneous in space and time. For two different widths, we ensure that the normalized distributions of the avalanche size induced by a unique intruder obtained numerically and experimentally are in good agreement.

To measure the influence of one intruder on the neigh-174 borhood of the second, we focus our analysis on non-175 overlapping populations of grains. Instead of measuring 176 the avalanche sizes on the overall population of disks, we 177 analyze only the displacements of disks located in 30 d_{q} -178 wide squares starting from the inner edge of the intruders 179 as shown in Fig. 1. The two populations of disks con-180 sidered are always separated even when the intruders are 181 touching each other and are large enough to get a reliable 182 statistics. The analysis of the avalanche size does not re-183 veal strong differences between the left and right sides of 184 the system, so both sides are considered to investigate the 185 behavior of the packing close to an intruder in the pres-186 ence of a second one. We should emphasize here that the 187 size of the square areas limits the maximum avalanche size 188 to about 700 disks. 189

Eight separating distances $s \in [10d_g, 35d_g]$ between in-190 truders of width $10d_q$ have been studied using numeri-191 cal simulations. In this figure, the situation $s = \infty$ cor-192 responds to the single intruder case. The correspond-193 ing distributions of avalanche sizes exhibit similar pro-194 files (Fig. 3) to those obtained for a single intruder with a 195 power-law dependence for the largest avalanche sizes [28]. 196 Such observation is characteristic of processes ruled by 197 scale invariance like snow avalanches [31] and earthquakes 198 [32]. Moreover, we observe that these distributions shift 199 toward the distribution obtained for a single intruder when 200 the separation s increases. Hence, the influence of the sec-201 ond intruder spreads over a limited distance and our cell 202 is large enough to avoid boundary effects. In the following 203 section, we focus on the mean value of the avalanche size. 204

Average avalanche sizes. – We now compare the 205 properties of the size distributions when increasing the 206 distance between the two intruders, with the distribu-207 tion from a single-intruder experiment. For each intruder 208 width, the average avalanche size for the largest separation 209 distance is reported as a function of the mean avalanche 210 size from a unique intruder $\langle N_A \rangle_{\infty}$ in the inset of Fig. 4. 211 The agreement is good, underlying the independence of 212 the intruders, except for the thinnest intruder considered 213 experimentally, which leads to smaller avalanches. In that 214 case, the distribution of avalanche sizes has a flatter tail, 215 whose slope becomes closer to -2. The average value of 216 such distribution is not well defined as the distribution is 217 subjected to larger fluctuations because of the finite num-218 ber of experiments. These results show that we can probe 219 the horizontal range of the perturbations induced by the 220 second intruder. 221

We then focus on the evolution of the mean avalanche $_{222}$ size when increasing the separating distance s in Fig. $_{223}$



Fig. 3: Numerical probability density function of avalanche sizes for the 10 d_g wide intruders and for eight separating distances s, compared to the distribution for a single 10 d_g wide intruder, denoted $s = \infty$ in the legend.

224 4. Starting from the minimal distance, $s_{\min} = D_{int}$, for low separating distances the curves present an increase in 225 the maximum avalanche size before decreasing toward the 226 value obtained for a single intruder at large separation dis-227 tance. We shall comment upon the initial increase of the 228 mean avalanche size in the next section. We observe that 229 the measured mean avalanche size at the contact is close 230 to the one measured for a unique intruder having a width 231 twice the size of the single intruder. However, we also ob-232 serve small differences; which can be due to the shape of 233 the tip that is not the same in the two experiments. Thus, 234 some grains are trapped between the intruders and intro-235 duce a roughness modifying the structure compared to the 236 circular intruder. A second explanation is that the pop-237 ulation of grains considered is slightly shifted here since 238 the boundary of the domain lays on the symmetry axis 239 of the two intruders. Nevertheless, it seems intuitive that 240 the mean avalanche size would initially increase with s241 because the two intruders with trapped grains in between 242 act as a single, wider intruder, *i.e.*, up to $s - D_{\text{int}} \approx 1 d_q$. 243 However, this trend holds over few more grain diameters. 244 It shows that the behavior above one apparent intruder 245 may enhance avalanche size and that beyond this optimal 246 distance, we observe a decrease of the influence between 247 the two intruders. 248

Length scale of cooperative effects. – The small 240 value of the optimal distance between two intruders sug-250 gests that the relevant length to consider is not the dis-251 tance between the two tips but rather between the two 252 internal faces of intruders. We thus shift the separating 253 distance using the new variable $\hat{s} = s - D_{\text{int}}$. Moreover, 254 considering the asymptotic value for infinite separation, 255 we normalize the mean avalanche size by the correspond-256 ing mean avalanche size for a unique intruder $\langle N_A \rangle_{\infty}$. Fig-257



Fig. 4: (Colour online) Average avalanche size when varying the separating distances s. The open symbols correspond to experimental results, whereas the filled symbols correspond to the results obtained from numerical simulations. From the lighter to the darker symbols, we have $D_{\text{int}}/d_g = 2.5$ (Δ), 5 (\Box), 7.5 (\Diamond), 10 (\bigcirc). Inset: Comparison between the mean avalanche size for a single and two distant intruders.

ure 5 shows the normalized variables. We observe a good 258 collapse of our data for large distances. Yet, the values 259 obtained for low values of \hat{s} are still dispersed after the 260 normalization. These observations suggest that the mean 261 avalanche size does not scale linearly with the distance 262 between the intruders. Finally, comparing the numerical 263 results with the experiments, we observe the superposi-264 tion of the data for wide intruders, whereas the curve of 265 the experiment with the narrowest intruders reaches val-266 ues larger than those predicted numerically (inset of Fig. 267 5). The master curve decreases exponentially with respect 268 to the separating distance $\hat{s} > 1$ and is well fitted by the 269 expression: 270

$$\frac{\langle N_A \rangle}{\langle N_A \rangle_{\infty}} - 1 = B \exp\left(-\frac{\widehat{s}}{\lambda}\right),\tag{1}$$

where B is a fitting constant and λ is a characteristic 271 length scale of the cooperative effects expressed in d_q . For 272 our system, B = 1.16 and $\lambda = 3.2d_q$. The length λ is the 273 typical distance beyond which cooperative effects between 274 the two intruders are weak. This fit is expected not to be 275 valid for $\hat{s} < 1$, since no grain can be found between the in-276 truders and the system behaves like a single intruder. We 277 observe indeed that the points above $\hat{s} = 1.5$ lay on the 278 master curve. The good collapse of the data suggests that 279 this length does not depend on the intruder size but on 280 the properties of the granular medium and that the per-281 turbation induced by an intruder spreads over this typical 282 length. We can also note that this length represents the 283 intruder width below which arch formations and jamming 284



Fig. 5: (Colour online) Normalized mean avalanche size $\langle N_A \rangle / \langle N_A \rangle_{\infty}$ as a function of the distance between the inner faces of the two intruders \hat{s} for the same data as in the figure 4. The open symbols correspond to experimental results, whereas the filled symbols correspond to the results obtained from numerical simulations. Inset: experimental data for the 2.5 d_g wide intruders with the same exponential curve as in the main figure.

²⁸⁵ events become more frequent inside the granular packing.

The increase in the mean avalanche size for close in-286 truders corresponds to less frequent jamming events above 287 each intruder and is the consequence of the apparition of 288 correlated motions. The presence of the second intruder 289 modifies the granular structure close to the first intruder. 290 The formation of arches around the tip of one intruder 291 can be destabilized as the force chains evolve above the 292 second intruder. Indeed, when the intruders get closer 293 to each other, stable structures above each intruder share 294 common disks and, as a consequence, the probability of 295 simultaneous collapse is increased. We expect that this ef-296 fect should be promoted by the narrowness of the intruders 297 as we know that arches are more stable above narrow silo 298 outlets than they are above large silo outlets. This effect 299 is indeed observed to decrease with the width of the in-300 truders (Fig. 5), moreover, for the narrowest intruders, we 301 confirm the existence of long lasting stable arches. In ad-302 dition, when the intruders get closer to each other, stable 303 structures above each intruder share common disks and, as 304 a consequence, the probability of simultaneous collapse is 305 increased. Similar phenomena have been found in granular 306 flows through sieves in which the distance between holes 307 is small [33]. In silos with multiple exit orifices and for 308 larger separating distances, the interaction of two arches 309 leads to secondary structures called flying buttresses [34]. 310 Moreover, the critical spacing between two orifices to ob-311 serve a mutual influence on the clogging rate lays between 312 2 and $3d_q$. In our case, we should emphasize that the 313

evolution of the granular medium is quasi-static. The am-314 plitude of the perturbation is thus not controlled by the 315 speed of the intruder contrary to the creeping motion close 316 to a shear band [15], in silos with multiple exit orifices 317 [12] or in granular bed impacted by multiple projectiles 318 [14]. In addition, the particle-particle friction coefficients 319 should play a role on the typical length found. For ex-320 ample, larger friction coefficients between particles allow 321 the stabilization of arches containing more grains [35]. We 322 would expect an increase in the characteristic length for 323 larger friction coefficients even if the dissipation of local 324 perturbations would be exacerbated. 325

Synchronization around intruders. – Beyond the 326 amplitude of the mean avalanche size that decreases with 327 the distance between the two intruders, we consider the 328 spatial correlation between events. Indeed, as the intrud-329 ers get closer and closer to one another, large events lo-330 cated just above an intruder seem to synchronize with the 331 second. To quantify this effect, a correlation function is 332 used to measure how the avalanches occuring on both sides 333 are correlated: 334

$$C_{i} = \frac{\left\langle (N_{A}^{l}(t) - \langle N_{A}^{l} \rangle)(N_{A}^{r}(t) - \langle N_{A}^{r} \rangle) \right\rangle_{t}}{\sigma_{i}(N_{A}^{l})\sigma_{i}(N_{A}^{r})}, \qquad (2)$$

where $\langle N_A^l \rangle$ stands for the average avalanche size over one experiment *i* in the vicinity of the left-hand intruder and $\sigma_i(N_A)$ is its standard deviation. The values C_i obtained for each realization in a given configuration are then averaged so that $C = \langle C_i \rangle$. The correlation coefficient is plotted with respect to the separating distances *s* for different intruder widths in the Fig. 6(a).

The decrease of the value of C at large separating dis-342 tance is expected, but the evolution of C for close intrud-343 ers is more surprising. We note that the results from the 344 simulations increase and exhibit a maximum. When using 345 the shifted distance \hat{s} , this maximum is located around 346 the separating distance $\hat{s} = 3d_g$, which corresponds to the 347 characteristic length scale of the decay of the avalanche 348 size with \hat{s} [inset of Fig. 6(a)]. These unexpected lower 349 correlation coefficients for close intruders can be inter-350 preted by considering the structure. We hypothesize that 351 the structure of the medium is stabilized by the gap be-352 tween the tips of the two intruders. The few grains be-353 tween the intruders may act as a stable barrier and screen 354 the propagation of the perturbation through the force net-355 work. This stable structure lowers the coupling between 356 each side of the twin intruders. At large separation dis-357 tance, we observe a common behavior that follows an ex-358 ponential decrease as shown in Fig. 6(b). The dash-dotted 359 line is proportional to $\exp(-\hat{s}/10)$. This average slope 360 thus presents a characteristic length which is relatively 361 large, larger than the short length scale revealed by the 362 analysis of the size of the avalanches. This new length 363 scale can be compared to the common lengths observed in 364 granular flows where the typical size of a localized shear 365 band is of the order of ten grain diameters. We mea-366



Fig. 6: (Coulour online) (a) Coefficients of correlation between the left and the right intruder as defined in Eq. 2 as a function of the distance s between the intruders. The open symbols correspond to experimental results, whereas the filled symbols correspond to the results obtained from numerical simulations. From the lighter to the darker symbols: $D_{\rm int}/d_g = 2.5$ (\triangle and ○), 5 (□), 7.5 (◊), 10 (\bigcirc and \triangledown). Inset: same data as a function of the shifted distance \hat{s} . The dashed line is located at $\hat{s} = 3.2d_q$. (b) Normalized coefficient of correlation as function of \hat{s} . The dash-dotted line is an exponential function of characteristic length of $10d_q$.

sure the decay of the correlation function around a unique 367 intruder and compute the response of two uncorrelated 368 avalanche fields to estimate if this observation can be con-369 sidered as a simple superposition of the avalanche fields. 370 For a simple superposition, we observe that the decrease 371 of the correlation function is much faster. Our result thus 372 underlines the horizontal reach of the perturbation. Other 373 configurations documented in the literature exhibit com-374 parable length scales. For example Kunte et al. [12] ob-375 serve an exponential increase of the probability of clogging 376 in a silo perforated by a twin aperture whose character-377 istic separation is of the order of $7-8d_g$. Pacheco *et al.* 378 measure a repulsive force between penetrating discs that 379 vanishes at an inter-distance of $6d_q$ [14], even if this last 380 situation arises from jamming. 381

Conclusion. – In this study, we investigated the dy-382 namics of a bidimensional granular packing around two 383

receding intruders numerically and experimentally. We 384 considered the influence of the intruder size as well as the 385 separating distance between them. We observed a sharp 386 increase in the mean avalanche size when the intruders are 387 closer. The associated characteristic length scale is small 388 $(3d_a)$ and does not depend on the size of the intruders. 389 This length scale characterizes the typical size of bent force 390 chains and is close to the minimal diameter of an aperture 391 to observe a continuous discharge in a silo. We also com-392 puted the correlation function of the avalanches above the 393 two intruders and found a seemingly exponential decrease 394 characterized by a larger length scale of $10d_g$. This length 395 is linked to the propagation of the perturbation induced 396 by a local rearrangement. At very small separation, we ob-397 serve a smaller response of the surrounding medium that 398 is the signature of the jammed state of the grains between 399 the tips of the intruders. From our results, we infer that 400 the density of disappearing grains in a granular pile will 401 control the intensity of the rearrangements. 402

The authors the support provided by the French ANRT 403 to AM and E. Dressaire for a careful reading of the 404 manuscript. 405

REFERENCES

[1] DORBOLO S., LUDEWIG F., VANDEWALLE N. and LAROCHE C., Physical Review E, 85 (2012) 051310.

406

407

408

409

410

411

412

413

414

415

416

417

418

419

420

421

422

423

424

425

426

427

430

433

434

435

436

- GOUILLART E., TOPLIS M. J., GRYNBERG J., CHOPINET [2]M.-H., Sondergard E., Salvo L., Suéry M., DI MICHIEL M. and VAROQUAUX G., Journal of the American Ceramic Society, 95 (2012) 1504.
- [3] MALONEY C. E. and LEMAÎTRE A., Physical Review E, **74** (2006) 016118.
- [4] RADJAI F., JEAN M., MOREAU J.-J. and ROUX S., Physical Review Letters, 77 (1996) 274.
- [5] VOIVRET C., RADJAÏ F., DELENNE J.-Y. and EL YOUS-SOUFI M. S., Physical Review Letters, 102 (2009) 178001.
- [6] AZÉMA E. and RADJAÏ F., Physical Review Letters, 112 (2014) 078001.
- [7] DAUCHOT O., MARTY G. and BIROLI G., Physical Review Letters, 95 (2005) 265701.
- NICHOL K. and VAN HECKE M., Physical Review E, 85 [8] (2012) 061309.
- ZURIGUEL I., GARCIMARTN A., MAZA D., PUGNALONI [9] L. A. and PASTOR J. M., Physical Review E, 71 (2005) 051303.
- JANDA A., ZURIGUEL I., GARCIMARTN A., PUGNALONI [10]428 L. A. and MAZA D., Europhysics Letters, 84 (2008) 429 44002.
- [11] THOMAS C. C. and DURIAN D. J., Physical Review E, 87 431 $(2013)\ 052201.$ 432
- [12] KUNTE A., DOSHI P. and ORPE A. V., Physical Review *E*, **90** (2014) 020201.
- [13] NELSON E. L., KATSURAGI H., MAYOR P. and DURIAN D. J., Physical Review Letters, 101 (2008) 068001.

- [14] PACHECO-VAZQUEZ F. and RUIZ-SUAREZ J., Nature
 Communications, 1 (2010) 123.
- [15] REDDY K. A., FORTERRE Y. and POULIQUEN O., *Phys- ical Review Letters*, **106** (2011) 108301.
- 441 [16] VAN HECKE M., Comptes Rendus Physique, 16 (2015) 37.
- [17] KOMATSU T. S., INAGAKI S., NAKAGAWA N. and NASUNO
 S., *Physical Review Letters*, 86 (2001) 1757.
- [18] KAMRIN K. and KOVAL G., *Physical Review Letters*, 108
 (2012) 178301.
- [19] KEYS A. S., ABATE A. R., GLOTZER S. C. and DURIAN
 D. J., Nature Physics, 3 (2007) 260.
- 448 [20] WASSGREN C., CORDOVA J., ZENIT R. and KARION A.,
 449 Physics of fluids, 15 (2003) 3318.
- 450 [21] SEGUIN A., BERTHO Y. and GONDRET P., *Physical Re-* 451 view E, 78 (2008) 010301.
- 452 [22] CANDELIER R. and DAUCHOT O., *Physical review letters*,
 453 103 (2009) 128001.
- [23] CLARK A. H., KONDIC L. and BEHRINGER R. P., *Phys- ical review letters*, **109** (2012) 238302.
- 456 [24] BRZINSKI III T. A., MAYOR P. and DURIAN D. J., *Phys-* 457 *ical review letters*, **111** (2013) 168002.
- ⁴⁵⁸ [25] KOLB E., CIXOUS P., GAUDOUEN N. and DARNIGE T.,
 Physical Review E, 87 (2013) 032207.
- 460 [26] TAKEHARA Y. and OKUMURA K., *Physical review letters*,
 461 112 (2014) 148001.
- [27] SEGUIN A., COULAIS C., MARTINEZ F., BERTHO Y. and
 GONDRET P., *Physical Review E*, 93 (2016) 012904.
- [28] MERCERON A., SAURET A. and JOP P., *Physical Review E*, 93 (2016) 062904.
- [29] DUBOIS F., JEAN M., RENOUF M., MOZUL R., MARTIN
 A. and BAGNERIS M., *Lmgc90* in proc. of *10e colloque national en calcul des structures* 2011 pp. Clé–USB.
- [30] RADJA F. and DUBOIS F., Discrete-element modeling of
 granular materials (Wiley-Iste) 2011.
- [31] BIRKELAND K. W. and LANDRY C. C., Geophysical Research Letters, 29 (2002) 49.
- 473 [32] GUTENBERG B. and RICHTER C. F., Science, 83 (1936)
 474 183.
- 475 [33] CHEVOIR F., GAULARD F. and ROUSSEL N., *Europhysics* 476 Letters (EPL), **79** (2007) 14001.
- 477 [34] MONDAL S. and SHARMA M. M., *Granular Matter*, **16** 478 (2014) 125.
- [35] TO K., LAI P.-Y. and PAK H. K., *Physical Review Letters*, 86 (2001) 71.