



**HAL**  
open science

## **Prediction of Evapotranspiration and Yields of Maize: An Inter-comparison among 31 Maize Models**

Bruce Kimball, K. Boote, J. Hatfield, L. Ahuja, C. Stockle, S. Archontoulis,  
C. Baron, Bruno Basso, Patrick Bertuzzi, M. Chen, et al.

► **To cite this version:**

Bruce Kimball, K. Boote, J. Hatfield, L. Ahuja, C. Stockle, et al.. Prediction of Evapotranspiration and Yields of Maize: An Inter-comparison among 31 Maize Models. Meeting of working Group Medicago sativa, Oct 2017, Tampa, United States. pp.1. hal-01604530

**HAL Id: hal-01604530**

**<https://hal.science/hal-01604530>**

Submitted on 5 Jun 2020

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution - ShareAlike 4.0 International License

**Prediction of Evapotranspiration and Yields of Maize:  
An Inter-comparison among 31 Maize Models**

**By**

**Bruce A. Kimball<sup>1</sup>, Kenneth J. Boote<sup>2</sup>, Jerry L. Hatfield<sup>3</sup>, Laj R. Ahuja<sup>4</sup>, Claudio Stockle<sup>5</sup>,  
Sotirios Archontoulis<sup>6</sup>, Christian Baron<sup>7</sup>, Bruno Basso<sup>8</sup>, Patrick Bertuzzi<sup>9</sup>, Ming Chen<sup>10</sup>,  
Julie Constantin<sup>11</sup>, Delphine Deryng<sup>12</sup>, Benjamin Dumont<sup>13</sup>, Jean-Louis Durand<sup>14</sup>,  
Frank Ewert<sup>15,16</sup>, Thomas Gaiser<sup>16</sup>, Sebastian Gayler<sup>17</sup>, Timothy Griffis<sup>10</sup>,  
Munir Hoffman<sup>18</sup>, Qianjing Jiang<sup>19</sup>, Soo-Hyung Kim<sup>20</sup>, Jon Lizaso<sup>21</sup>, Sophie Moulin<sup>9</sup>,  
Claas Nendel<sup>15</sup>, Philip Parker<sup>15</sup>, Taru Palosuo<sup>22</sup>, Eckart Priesack<sup>23</sup>, Zhiming Qi<sup>19</sup>, Amit  
Srivastava<sup>16</sup>, Tommaso Stella<sup>15</sup>, Fulu Tao<sup>22,24</sup>, Kelly Thorp<sup>1</sup>, Dennis Timlin<sup>25</sup>, Tracy E.  
Twine<sup>10</sup>, Heidi Webber<sup>16</sup>, Magali Willaume<sup>11</sup>, Karina Williams<sup>26</sup>**

<sup>1</sup>U.S. Arid-Land Agricultural Research Center, USDA-ARS, Maricopa, AZ 85138  
([bruce.kimball@ars.usda.gov](mailto:bruce.kimball@ars.usda.gov); [kelly.thorp@ars.usda.gov](mailto:kelly.thorp@ars.usda.gov); 1-520-316-6369)

<sup>2</sup>University of Florida, Agronomy Department, Gainesville, FL 32611 ([kjboote@ufl.edu](mailto:kjboote@ufl.edu); 1-352-273-2215)

<sup>3</sup>National Laboratory for Agriculture and the Environment, USDA-ARS, Ames, IA 50010-3120  
([Jerry.Hatfield@ars.usda.gov](mailto:Jerry.Hatfield@ars.usda.gov); 1-515-294-1829)

<sup>4</sup>Agricultural Systems Research Unit, USDA, Agricultural Research Service, 2150 Centre Avenue, Bldg. D., Suite 200, Ft. Collins, 80526 CO, ([laj.ahuja@ars.usda.gov](mailto:laj.ahuja@ars.usda.gov), Phone: (970) 492-7315)

<sup>5</sup>Biological Systems Engineering, Washington State University, 1935 E. Grimes Way, PO Box 646120, Washington State University, Pullman WA 99164-6120 ([stockle@wsu.edu](mailto:stockle@wsu.edu); 509-335-1578)

<sup>6</sup>Iowa State University, Department of Agronomy, Ames, Iowa 50010 ([sarchont@iastate.edu](mailto:sarchont@iastate.edu); 1-515-294-7413)

<sup>7</sup>CIRAD UMR TETIS, Maison de la Télédétection, 500 rue Jean François Breton, Montpellier, 34093, France ([christian.baron@cirad.fr](mailto:christian.baron@cirad.fr); |Tel: 33 (0)4 67 54 87 28)

<sup>8</sup>Michigan State University, Dept. Geological Sciences and W.K. Kellogg Biological Station, 288 Farm Ln, 307 Natural Science Bldg., East Lansing, MI, 48824 ([basso@msu.edu](mailto:basso@msu.edu); 1-517-353-9009)

<sup>9</sup>INRA centre de recherche Provence-Alpes-Côte d'Azur, 228, route de l'Aérodrome, CS 40 509, Domaine Saint Paul, Site Agroparc, 84914 Avignon Cedex 9, France  
([patrick.bertuzzi@paca.inra.fr](mailto:patrick.bertuzzi@paca.inra.fr), Tél. : +33 (0)4 32 72 22 25; [sophie.moulin@paca.inra.fr](mailto:sophie.moulin@paca.inra.fr), Tél. : +33 (0)4 32 72 23 76)

<sup>10</sup>University of Minnesota, Department of Soil, Water, and Climate, 1991 Upper Buford Cir, Falcon Heights, MN 55108 ([tgriffis@umn.edu](mailto:tgriffis@umn.edu), Tel: 1-612-625-3117; [chen1718@umn.edu](mailto:chen1718@umn.edu); [twine@umn.edu](mailto:twine@umn.edu), 1-612-625-7278)

- <sup>11</sup>AGIR, Université de Toulouse, INRA, INPT, INP- EI PURPAN, CastanetTolosan, France (julie.constantin@toulouse.inra.fr; Tel: +33 (0)5 61 28 50 26; [magali.willaume@ensat.fr](mailto:magali.willaume@ensat.fr); Tel: +33 (0)5 61 28 54 23).
- <sup>12</sup>University of Chicago, Computation Institute, 5735 S Ellis Ave Chicago, IL 60637 ([deryng@uchicago.edu](mailto:deryng@uchicago.edu))
- <sup>13</sup>ULg-GxABT, University of Liege, Gembloux Agro-Bio Tech Faculty, Dpt. Agronomy, Bio-Engineering and Chemistry, Crop Science Unit, Passage des Déportés, 2, 5030, Gembloux, Belgium ([Benjamin.Dumont@ulg.ac.be](mailto:Benjamin.Dumont@ulg.ac.be); Tel : +32(0)81.62
- <sup>14</sup>Unité de Recherche Pluridisciplinaire Prairie et Plantes Fourragères, INRA, 86 600 Lusignan, France ([jean-louis.durand@lusignan.inra.fr](mailto:jean-louis.durand@lusignan.inra.fr))
- <sup>15</sup>Leibniz Centre for Agricultural Landscape Research, Eberswalder Straße 84, 15374 Müncheberg, Germany ([frank.ewert@uni-bonn.de](mailto:frank.ewert@uni-bonn.de); [Parker@zalf.de](mailto:Parker@zalf.de) Tel: +49-33432-32-471; [tommaso.stella@zalf.de](mailto:tommaso.stella@zalf.de) Tel: +49 33432 82 455)
- <sup>16</sup>Institute of Crop Science and Resource Conservation, University of Bonn, Katzenburgweg 1 D-53115 Bonn, Germany ([tgaiser@uni-bonn.de](mailto:tgaiser@uni-bonn.de); [amit.srivastava@uni-bonn.de](mailto:amit.srivastava@uni-bonn.de); [hwebber@uni-bonn.de](mailto:hwebber@uni-bonn.de); Tel: +49 228 73-2876)
- <sup>17</sup>Universität Hohenheim, Institute of Soil Science and Land Evaluation, Biogeophysics, Emil-Wolff-Str. 27, D-70593 Stuttgart, Germany ([sebastian.gayler@uni-hohenheim.de](mailto:sebastian.gayler@uni-hohenheim.de), Tel: +49 (0)711-45922323)
- <sup>18</sup>Crop Production Systems in the Tropics, Georg-August-Universität, Grisebachstraße 6, Göttingen, Germany ([mhoffma@gwdg.de](mailto:mhoffma@gwdg.de); TEL: +49 551/39-33790)
- <sup>19</sup>Department of Bioresource Engineering, Macdonald Campus, McGill University, 1-024 Macdonald-Steward Hall, Sanite-Anne-de-Bellevue, QC, Canada H9X 3V9 ([qianjing.jiang@mail.mcgill.ca](mailto:qianjing.jiang@mail.mcgill.ca); [zhiming.qi@mcgill.ca](mailto:zhiming.qi@mcgill.ca); 514-398-7983)
- <sup>20</sup>University of Washington, Center for Urban Horticulture, Seattle, WA 98105 ([soohkim@uw.edu](mailto:soohkim@uw.edu))
- <sup>21</sup>Technical University of Madrid (UPM), Dept. Producción Agraria-CEIGRAM, Ciudad Universitaria, 28040 Madrid, Spain ([jon.lizaso@upm.es](mailto:jon.lizaso@upm.es))
- <sup>22</sup>Natural Resources Institute Finland (Luke), Vantaa FIN-01370, Finland ([taru.palosuo@luke.fi](mailto:taru.palosuo@luke.fi); [fulu.tao@luke.fi](mailto:fulu.tao@luke.fi))
- <sup>23</sup>Helmholtz Center Munich, Institute of Biochemical Plant Pathology, Ingolstaedter Landstr. 1 85764 Neuherberg, Germany ([priesack@helmholtz-muenchen.de](mailto:priesack@helmholtz-muenchen.de), Tel: + 49 89 3187 3354)
- <sup>24</sup>Institute of Geographic Sciences and Natural Resources Research, Chinese Academy of Science, 11A, Datun Road, Chaoyang District, Beijing, 100101, China ([taofl@igsnr.ac.cn](mailto:taofl@igsnr.ac.cn))
- <sup>25</sup>Crop Systems and Global Change Research Unit, USDA-ARS, Beltsville, MD ([Dennis.Timlin@ars.usda.gov](mailto:Dennis.Timlin@ars.usda.gov); 1-301-504-6255)
- <sup>26</sup>Climate Adaptation Scientist Meteorological Office, FitzRoy, Road Exeter Devon EX1 3PB, United Kingdom ([karina.williams@metoffice.gov.uk](mailto:karina.williams@metoffice.gov.uk); Tel: +44 (0)1392 884857)

|

An important aspect that determines the ability of crop growth models to predict growth and yield is their ability to predict the rate of water consumption or evapotranspiration (ET) of the crop, especially for rain-fed crops. If, for example, the predicted ET rate is too high, the simulated crop may exhaust its soil water supply before the next rain event, thereby causing growth and yield predictions that are too low. In a prior inter-comparison among maize growth models, ET predictions varied widely, but no observations of actual ET were available for comparison. Therefore, another study has been initiated under the umbrella of AgMIP (Agricultural Model Inter-Comparison and Improvement Project). This time observations of ET using the eddy covariance technique from an 8-year-long experiment conducted at Ames, IA are being used as the standard. Simulation results from 31 models have been completed. In the first "blind" phase for which only weather, soils, and management information were furnished to the modelers, estimates of seasonal ET varied from about 200 to about 700 mm. A detailed statistical analysis of the daily ET data from 2011, a "typical" rainfall year, showed that, as expected, the median of all the models was more accurate across several criteria (correlation, root mean square error, average difference, regression slope) than any particular model. However, some individual models were better than the median for a particular criteria. Predictions improved in later stages when the modelers were provided additional leaf area, growth, and the actual ET observations that allowed them to "calibrate" some of the parameters in their models to account for varietal characteristics, etc.

Bruce A. Kimball et al., 2017, Prediction of Evapotranspiration and Yields of Maize: An Inter-comparison among 31 Maize Models, American Society of Agronomy Meeting in Tampa, Florida, 22-25 October 2017.