

# Deep water provenance and dynamics of the (de)glacial Atlantic meridional overturning circulation

Jörg Lippold, Marcus Gutjahr, Patrick Blaser, Emanuel Christner, Maria Luiza de Carvalho Ferreira, Stefan Mulitza, Marcus Christl, Frank Wombacher, Evelyn Böhm, Benny Antz, et al.

# ▶ To cite this version:

Jörg Lippold, Marcus Gutjahr, Patrick Blaser, Emanuel Christner, Maria Luiza de Carvalho Ferreira, et al.. Deep water provenance and dynamics of the (de)glacial Atlantic meridional overturning circulation. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 2016, 445, pp.68 - 78. 10.1016/j.epsl.2016.04.013 . hal-01587481

# HAL Id: hal-01587481 https://hal.science/hal-01587481

Submitted on 28 Jun 2021

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

1	Deep water provenance and dynamics of the (de)glacial Atlantic meridional overturning
2	circulation
3	Jörg Lippold <sup>1,2*</sup> , Marcus Gutjahr <sup>3,4</sup> , Patrick Blaser <sup>2</sup> , Emanuel Christner <sup>2</sup> , Maria Luiza de
4	Carvalho Ferreira <sup>2</sup> , Stefan Mulitza <sup>5</sup> , Marcus Christl <sup>6</sup> , Frank Wombacher <sup>7,8</sup> , Evelyn Böhm <sup>2,9</sup> ,
5	Benny Antz <sup>2</sup> , Olivier Cartapanis <sup>1</sup> , Hendrik Vogel <sup>1</sup> , Samuel L. Jaccard <sup>1</sup>
6	
7	<sup>1</sup> Institute of Geological Sciences and Oeschger Centre for Climate Change Research,
8	University of Bern, 3012 Bern, Switzerland.
9	<sup>2</sup> Institute of Environmental Physics, University of Heidelberg, 69120 Heidelberg, Germany.
10	<sup>3</sup> Bristol Isotope Group, Department of Earth Sciences, Wills Memorial Building, Bristol BS8
11	1RJ, UK.
12	<sup>4</sup> GEOMAR Helmholtz Centre for Ocean Research Kiel, 24148 Kiel, Germany.
13	<sup>5</sup> MARUM - Center for Marine Environmental Sciences, University of Bremen, 28359
14	Bremen, Germany.
15	<sup>6</sup> ETH Zurich, Laboratory of Ion Beam Physics, 8093 Zurich, Switzerland.
16	<sup>7</sup> Institut für Geologie und Mineralogie, Universität zu Köln, 50674 Köln, Germany.
17	<sup>8</sup> Steinmann Institut, Universität Bonn, 53115 Bonn, Germany.
18	<sup>9</sup> LSCE, Gif-Sur-Yvette, France.
19	<sup>*</sup> corresponding author: joerg.lippold@geo.unibe.ch
20	
21	Keywords: ${}^{231}$ Pa/ ${}^{230}$ Th; $\epsilon_{Nd}$ ; Atlantic Meridional Overturning Circulation; deep sea sediments;
22	Last Glacial Maximum; deglaciation
23	Abstract
23	
24	Reconstructing past modes of ocean circulation is an essential task in paleoclimatology and
25	paleoceanography. To this end, we combine two sedimentary proxies, Nd isotopes ( $\varepsilon_{Nd}$ ) and
26	the <sup>231</sup> Pa/ <sup>230</sup> Th ratio, both of which are not directly involved in the global carbon cycle, but
27	allow the reconstruction of water mass provenance and provide information about the past
28	strength of overturning circulation, respectively. In this study, combined $^{231}$ Pa/ $^{230}$ Th and $\epsilon_{Nd}$
29	down-core profiles from six Atlantic Ocean sediment cores are presented. The data set is

- 30 complemented by the two available combined data sets from the literature. From this we
- 31 derive a comprehensive picture of spatial and temporal patterns and the dynamic changes of
- 32 the Atlantic Meridional Overturning Circulation over the past ~ 25 ka. Our results provide
- 33 evidence for a consistent pattern of glacial/stadial advances of Southern Sourced Water along
- 34 with a northward circulation mode for all cores in the deeper (> 3,000 m) Atlantic. Results

from shallower core sites support an active overturning cell of shoaled Northern Sourced
 Water during the LGM and the subsequent deglaciation. Furthermore, we report evidence for

a short-lived period of intensified AMOC in the early Holocene.

## 38 1 Introduction

39 Today, the Atlantic Meridional Overturning Circulation (AMOC) accounts for ~50 % of the 40 planetary poleward advection of heat and contributes to the removal of  $CO_2$  from the surface ocean through the formation of nutrient-depleted North Atlantic Deep Water (NADW) 41 42 (Sabine et al., 2004). A change in the relative volumetric contribution of North Atlantic-43 versus Southern Ocean-sourced waters during the last deglaciation is considered to have 44 significantly impacted the efficiency of the marine soft tissue pump and associated alkalinity feedbacks, thereby directly altering the partitioning of CO<sub>2</sub> between the ocean interior and the 45 46 atmosphere (Jaccard et al., 2016).

Studies using the non-conservative nutrient-tracers  $\delta^{13}C$  and Cd/Ca in benthic foraminifera or 47 radiocarbon ventilation ages have provided a wealth of evidence that the water mass 48 49 distribution in the glacial North Atlantic was significantly different from the modern 50 geometry (e.g. (Curry and Oppo, 2005)). Today NADW occupies most of the water column in 51 the western North Atlantic. During the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM) waters below about 52 2,500 to 3,000 m were dominated by nutrient-rich deep waters likely originating from the 53 Southern Ocean (Southern Component Water, SCW), while the upper limb was bathed by a 54 relatively fresher water mass referred to as Glacial North Atlantic Intermediate Water 55 (GNAIW) (Lynch-Stieglitz and Fairbanks, 1994). During the deglaciation the GNAIW depth 56 distribution evolved into the modern situation of NADW, dominating the North Atlantic 57 down to ~5,000 m water depth. However, reconstruction of the exact spatial and temporal 58 sequence of events characterising deglacial AMOC mode changes is not straightforward and 59 remains a matter of debate.

60 Our current understanding of the glacial, deglacial and Holocene evolution of Atlantic Ocean circulation patterns is mainly based on paleoceanographic reconstructions gleaned from 61 carbon isotopes, in particular benthic foraminifera  $\delta^{13}$ C. While benthic foraminifera-derived 62 63  $\delta^{13}$ C provide useful information about the geometry of subsurface circulation patterns, it only provides incomplete constraints about flow rates. Furthermore, the benthic  $\delta^{13}$ C signal is 64 influenced by a number of factors, complicating its interpretation. The average  $\delta^{13}C$  of the 65 global ocean is a function of changes in the amount of carbon stored on land and is affected 66 by changes in the sinks and sources of carbon reservoirs. Furthermore,  $\delta^{13}$ C may be sensitive 67 to the balance of photosynthesis versus respiration, microhabitat conditions and CO<sub>2</sub> air-sea 68

69 gas exchange, because the equilibration timescale in the surface ocean is proportional to the 70 ratio of dissolved inorganic carbon to  $CO_2$  (Galbraith et al., 2015).

Seawater-derived <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th and Nd isotopes provide two independent, yet complementary 71 72 proxies of past ocean circulation, which are insensitive to variations in the global carbon 73 cycle. While the first proxy, based on the sedimentary distribution of protactinium/thorium 74 isotopes  $(^{231}Pa/^{230}Th)$ , provides quantitative information about the strength and the dynamics of overturning circulation (McManus et al., 2004), the second proxy, based on the authigenic 75 neodymium isotopic composition (<sup>143</sup>Nd/<sup>144</sup>Nd), allows the fingerprinting of water mass 76 provenance and therefore constraining flow paths throughout the deep ocean (e.g. Frank, 77 78 2002; Piotrowski et al., 2004).

Although, the spatial and temporal coverage of  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  and  $^{231}Pa/^{230}Th$  data sets from the last 79 glacial cycle is continuously improving, the lack of direct comparison between circulation 80 81 strength-, water mass provenance- and nutrient- proxies still does not provide a consistent 82 picture of glacial and deglacial AMOC changes. There is a coherent picture of a glacial deep 83 Atlantic dominated by SCW, which was gradually replaced by NCW during the deglacial and the Holocene (e.g. (Gutjahr et al., 2008; Piotrowski et al., 2004)) indicated by Nd-isotope 84 85 signatures in agreement with findings based on carbon isotopes (e.g. (Curry and Oppo, 2005; Sarnthein et al., 1994)). Compilations of <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th data sets (Bradtmiller et al., 2014; 86 87 Gherardi et al., 2009; Lippold et al., 2012b) found generally higher values in the deep Atlantic 88 and unchanged or lower values in shallower waters compared to the Holocene. These studies 89 suggest that the shallower circulation cell exhibited stronger overturning than the deeper cell 90 during the LGM and are also consistent with the interpretation of a still active but reduced net 91 ocean overturning during Heinrich Stadial 1 (HS1). The first publication presenting combined  $^{231}$ Pa/ $^{230}$ Th (McManus et al., 2004) and  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  (Roberts et al., 2010) from two neighbouring 92 93 sediment cores from the Bermuda Rise (GGC5 and GGC6) revealed a high degree of 94 synchronicity between the changes in water mass provenance and circulation strength across 95 the last glacial termination. More recently this approach was extended, in another adjacent 96 Bermuda Rise sediment core from a similar water depth (ODP1063, Table 1), covering the 97 last 140 ka (Böhm et al., 2015). These studies found a gradual transition from a SCW 98 dominated deep North-West Atlantic during the LGM into a Northern Component Water 99 (NCW) dominated vigorous circulation state. This active circulation prevailed for most of the 100 last glacial cycle with a continuous strong contribution of NCW in the deep Atlantic as 101 indicated from Nd isotope signatures, while the domination of sluggishly ventilated SCW was 102 restricted to time ranges around the peak glacial. Although temporaly highly resolved, these

reconstructions were derived from a single location and thus may be subject to local 103 obfuscating factors. Here we present combined measurements of  ${}^{231}$ Pa/ ${}^{230}$ Th and  ${}^{143}$ Nd/ ${}^{144}$ Nd 104 from two published and six new data sets, spanning a latitudinal transect across the entire 105 106 Atlantic, to infer past changes in both the strength and geometry of the AMOC back to the 107 LGM. Particular attention is paid to consistencies and discrepancies between the combined 108 proxy records and the presence or absence of gradients between neighbouring core sites. Our 109 results thus aim to provide an updated illustration of the potential of this combined multi-core  $^{231}\text{Pa}/^{230}\text{Th}$  and  $\epsilon_{Nd}$  isotope approach. 110

## 112 **2** Materials and methods

# 113 **2.1 Overview of core locations, measurements and age controls**

The eight sediment core locations cover a meridional transect through the North and South 114 Atlantic Ocean with a wide range of water depths and hydrological settings from 42°N to 115 116 40°S (Table 1). The six new combined profiles are measured from sediment cores featuring 117 well-established, published age models (supplementary material, S4), with the exception of GeoB1523-1, for which a chronology was determined by comparison of its down-core  $\delta^{18}$ O 118 record to the adjacent <sup>14</sup>C dated core GeoB1515-1 (Vidal et al., 1999). Results are provided in 119 120 the supplementary material (Table S6). Two locations from the literature with combined  $^{231}$ Pa/ $^{230}$ Th and  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  down-core profiles complement the compilation: GeoB3808-6 from the 121 South Atlantic (Jonkers et al., 2015) and a high-resolution composite from the Bermuda Rise 122 123 based on records from three adjacent sediment cores (GGC5: (McManus et al., 2004), GGC6: 124 (Roberts et al., 2010) and ODP1063: (Lippold et al., 2009), (Gutjahr and Lippold, 2011)). 125



Fig. 1: (a) Core locations (new data: white, literature data: black) overlain by surface silicate concentrations from World Ocean Atlas 2013. The black line tracks the section of water stations used for Fig.1b. White crosses indicate locations of nearest water stations with seawater measurements of Nd isotopes (see supplementary material S2).

(b) A longitudinal section showing the core locations and published  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  in seawater from the West-Atlantic Ocean (black dots) (Jeandel, 1993; Lambelet et al., 2015; Osborne et al., 2014;

*Piepgras and Wasserburg, 1987) highlighting the distinct Nd isotope compositions of NCW and SCW.* 

127 Table 1: Overview of measurements and age models of sediment cores with combined

128  $^{231}$ Pa/ $^{230}$ Th and  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  data sets including the published data sets from the Bermuda Rise

129 (ODP1063 and GGC5/6) and the South Atlantic (GeoB3808-6). Further information on

130 the age models is provided in the supplementary material S4. Pa/Th core water lat. long. **E**Nd number depth Ν Е in [m] figures this study **IODP Site** this study 1 3426 41.0 -33.0 this study U1313 2 4250 29.7 -72.9 (Gutjahr et al., 12JPC this study and 2008) (Lippold et al., 2012b) (Holocene and LGM time slices) 3 GeoB1515-1 3129 4.2 -43.7 this study this study and (Lippold et al., 2011; Lippold et al., 2012b) (Holocene and LGM time slices) GeoB1523-1 3292 this study 4 3.8 -41.6 this study and (Lippold et al., 2011; Lippold et al., 2012b) (Holocene and LGM time slices) 5 1299 12.1 -61.2 this study this study and M35003-4 (Lippold et al., 2012b) (Holocene and LGM time slices) 6 ODP Site 1089 4621 -40.9 9.9 this study this study and (Lippold et al., 2012a) (Holocene and LGM time slices literature data ODP Site 1063 4584 33.7 -57.6 7 (Böhm et al., (Böhm et al., 2015; Lippold 2015; Gutjahr and et al., 2009) Lippold, 2011) GGC5/GGC6 4550 33.7 -57.6 (Roberts et al., (McManus et al., 2004) 7 2010) 8 GeoB3808-6 3213 -30.8 -14.7 (Jonkers et al., (Jonkers et al., 2015) 2015)

#### 132 **2.2 Neodymium isotopes**

133 In recent years the measurement of Nd isotopes on sub-millennial timescales has been 134 developed and applied using bulk sediment leachates, foraminifera coatings, deep-sea corals 135 and fish teeth (e.g. (Colin et al., 2010; Elmore et al., 2011; Gutjahr et al., 2008; Pahnke et al., 136 2008; Piotrowski et al., 2004; Roberts et al., 2010)). The rationale for using Nd isotopes as a 137 water mass provenance tracer is based on the empirical observation that large parts of 138 northern North America bordering the Labrador Sea consist of Archean and Proterozoic continental crust featuring low (unradiogenic) <sup>143</sup>Nd/<sup>144</sup>Nd ratios, whereas young mantle-139 derived rocks display high (radiogenic) isotopic compositions. For convenience, the 140 radiogenic Nd isotope ratio <sup>143</sup>Nd/<sup>144</sup>Nd is expressed as the deviation from a chondritic 141 142 uniform reservoir (CHUR) in epsilon (ε) notation:

$$\epsilon_{
m Nd} = \left[rac{^{143}
m Nd/^{144}
m Nd_{
m sample}}{^{143}
m Nd/^{144}
m Nd_{_{
m CHUR}}} -1
ight] imes 10^4$$

143

144 Neodymium is dominantly supplied to the oceans through weathering of continental crust or 145 boundary exchange along continental margins. Labrador Sea Water (LSW) is characterised by a very distinct unradiogenic Nd isotopic composition ( $\epsilon_{Nd} \approx -14$ ) (Lacan and Jeandel, 2005a; 146 147 Piepgras and Wasserburg, 1987). LSW is admixed to the Deep Western Boundary Current 148 (DWBC) to form North Atlantic Deep Water (NADW). While NADW is characterised by 149 unradiogenic values, SCW is characterised by a consistently more radiogenic Nd isotopic 150 composition ( $\epsilon_{Nd} \approx -8$  today) due to the admixture of radiogenic Pacific waters ( $\epsilon_{Nd} \approx -4$ ) in 151 the Antarctic Circumpolar Current. In the open ocean Nd behaves semi-conservatively with a 152 residence time between ~500 and 2000 years, making it an ideal proxy to trace water mass 153 exchange between the major ocean basins (Frank, 2002).

154 Neodymium is enriched in the authigenic Fe-Mn oxyhydroxide fraction of marine sediments. 155 This fraction records the dissolved Nd isotope composition of the sediment-bottom water 156 interface (Gutjahr et al., 2007; Piotrowski et al., 2004). For this study, the isotope composition 157 of authigenic Nd was derived from bulk sediment leachates and applied as a palaeo-water 158 mass proxy. This approach, however, has some limitations which need to be considered 159 carefully (e.g. Elmore et al. 2011). Firstly, boundary exchange is an efficient mechanism to alter the  $\epsilon_{Nd}$  of bottom water along ocean margins (Lacan and Jeandel, 2005b). However, the 160 161 consistent north-south gradient of  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  in Atlantic waters, observable for marginal locations, 162 implies that local boundary exchange does not affect the first-order spatial distribution of dissolved Nd. However, in order to minimise potential bias on  $\epsilon_{Nd}$  it is recommended to 163

164 examine the authigenic Fe-Mn oxyhydroxide fraction of marine sediments from locations 165 where ocean water is well mixed. Another source of uncertainty may arise from non-selective leaching of volcanic ash in the sediments. At locations in the vicinity of Iceland  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  values 166 167 have been reported to be different from seawater composition. All sediment cores used in this 168 study are located outside these areas of potential ash contamination (Elmore et al., 2011). 169 Nonethelss, the reliablity of our leaching method has been tested by comparing the  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  from 170 the youngest available Holocene sample leachate to the water-derived  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  from the closest 171 available water cloumn station (supplementary material, S2).

## 172 Sample preparation and measurement

173 The method applied here follows the procedure outlined by Gutjahr et al. (2007). Briefly, 174 approximately 0.25 g of ground bulk sediment was first leached with MgCl<sub>2</sub> in order to 175 remove loosely adsorbed metals. Subsequently, the sediment was decarbonated with buffered 176 acetic acid and finally the authigenic metal oxyhydroxide fraction was extracted with a 177 reductive cocktail containing 0.03 M EDTA, 0.05 M hydroxylamine-hydrochloride and 15% 178 acetic acid, buffered to a pH of 4 using NaOH. The Fe-Mn oxyhydroxide leaching step was 179 carried out at room temperature for 2 hours under constant agitation. The leachate was 180 decanted after centrifugation and subsequently purified for isotope analysis. The purification 181 by column chemistry followed standard procedures as described in Böhm et al. (2015). The 182 Rare Earth Elements (REE) were first separated from the bulk matrix using 50W-X8 resin and 183 after conversion to nitrate Nd is separated from the other REE with LN spec resin. Our Nd 184 isotope measurements were performed on two Thermo Finnigan Neptune multiple collector inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometers (ICP-MS) at the University of Bristol (UK) 185 186 and the National Oceanography Centre Southampton (UK). Instrumental mass discrimination was corrected relative to  ${}^{146}$ Nd/ ${}^{144}$ Nd = 0.7219 using the mass bias correction procedure of 187 Vance and Thirlwall (2002). All Nd isotope compositions were normalised to  ${}^{143}$ Nd/ ${}^{144}$ Nd = 188 0.512115 for the JNdi-1 standard (Tanaka et al., 2000). External reproducibility of the 189  $^{143}$ Nd/ $^{144}$ Nd based on repeated standard measurements amounted to 0.20  $\epsilon_{Nd}$ . Results are 190 191 given in the supplementary data table S3.

# 192 **2.3**<sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th as a kinematic circulation proxy

The radioisotopes  ${}^{231}$ Pa (t<sub>1/2</sub>: 32.5 ka) and  ${}^{230}$ Th (t<sub>1/2</sub>: 75.2 ka) are formed by alpha decay of natural  ${}^{235}$ U and  ${}^{234}$ U, respectively, at a constant activity ratio of 0.093, globally. While U is soluble, Pa and Th are highly particle reactive and are thus readily scavenged from seawater by sinking particles resulting in the accumulation of excess- or unsupported  ${}^{230}$ Th and  ${}^{231}$ Pa in underlying sediments (i.e.  ${}^{231}$ Pa/ ${}^{230}$ Th<sub>xs</sub>, termed  ${}^{231}$ Pa/ ${}^{230}$ Th thereafter).  ${}^{231}$ Pa is however less

rapidly removed than <sup>230</sup>Th and has a residence time approaching the transit time of deep 198 water in the Atlantic basin. As a result, approximately half of the <sup>231</sup>Pa produced in Atlantic 199 200 water is exported along with North Atlantic Deep Water into the Southern Ocean instead of being buried in Atlantic sediments. Hence, <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th from modern north Atlantic core-top 201 sediments displays values below the production ratio, reflecting a deficit of <sup>231</sup>Pa as a 202 203 consequence of the net export by NADW to the Southern Ocean (McManus et al., 2004). However, sedimentary <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th is not only a function of circulation strength and geometry, 204 but may also be affected by particle composition - with biogenic opal preferentially 205 scavenging <sup>231</sup>Pa (Chase et al., 2002) -, particle size (Kretschmer et al., 2008), particle flux 206 207 (Christl et al., 2010) and water depth (Gherardi et al., 2009; Lippold et al., 2011; Scholten et al., 2008). Sediments from shallower waters of the North Atlantic are characterised by high 208 <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th because a strong circulation regime produces high <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th, as a result of 209 enhanced scavenging of <sup>231</sup>Pa close to the surface combined with the downstream ingrowth of 210 211 <sup>231</sup>Pa (Luo et al., 2010). Due to this complex behaviour reconstructions of past AMOC by <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th should include samples from several water depths and latitudes as different modes 212 of AMOC are capable of producing similar sedimentary <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th at different locations (Luo 213 et al., 2010). The interpretation of <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th is further complicated by the fact that 214 <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th may provide information about the export of <sup>231</sup>Pa but no information about the 215 direction of this lateral export. Consequently, the application of  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  combined with  $^{231}$ Pa/ $^{230}$ Th 216 217 holds promise for reconstructing both past water mass provenance and circulation strength of 218 the Atlantic Ocean.

# 219 Pa/Th-sample preparation and measurement

Sedimentary <sup>231</sup>Pa-excess was determined by isotope dilution using a <sup>233</sup>Pa spike milked from 220 <sup>237</sup>Np. A <sup>229</sup>Th and a <sup>236</sup>U spike were used to determine the concentrations of <sup>230</sup>Th, <sup>232</sup>Th and 221 222 <sup>238</sup>U with MC-ICP-MS, respectively. The chemical separation and cleaning followed standard procedures (e.g. (Böhm et al., 2015)). The <sup>233</sup>Pa spike was calibrated against the reference 223 224 standard material UREM-11 (Geibert and Vöge, 2008). U, Th and Pa isotopes from cores 225 GeoB1515-1, GeoB1523-1, 12JPC and M35003-4 were measured using a Neptune MC-ICP-226 MS at the joint Cologne/Bonn mass spectrometer laboratory at the Universität Bonn. The abundance of <sup>231</sup>Pa in samples from ODP Site 1089 have been measured using the AMS 227 228 system TANDY following the method described by Christl et al. (2007), whereas the U and 229 Th fractions were measured using a Neptune MC-ICP-MS. U, Th and Pa isotopes from 230 IODP1313 were measured using the Thermo Finnigan Element 2 ICP-MS at the University of 231 Heidelberg. Data and uncertainties are provided in the supporting material S6.

The measured bulk sediment concentrations of <sup>231</sup>Pa and <sup>230</sup>Th comprise contributions from 232 233 the lithogenic (produced by radioactive decay of U present in the mineral lattices) and authigenic fractions (produced by decay of U that was incorporated under reducing 234 235 conditions), which need to be accounted- and corrected for. The lithogenic contribution was corrected considering a distinct lithogenic  $^{238}U/^{232}$ Th activity ratio for each core location. In 236 several cases a basin-wide lithogenic  ${}^{238}U/{}^{232}Th$  in the range of 0.6±0.1 would have led to 237 systematic inaccuracies due to local variations (Bourne et al., 2012). When oxygen 238 239 concentrations at the sediment-water interface were high enough to prevent authigenic uranium enrichments the bulk <sup>238</sup>U/<sup>232</sup>Th minima were used as an upper limit for the 240 lithogenic correction. Accordingly, for GeoB1515-1 and GeoB1523-1 a (<sup>238</sup>U/<sup>232</sup>Th)<sub>lith</sub> value 241 of 0.47 has been considered. For 12JPC and M35003-4 values of 0.55 and 0.60 have been 242 used, respectively. High bulk <sup>238</sup>U/<sup>232</sup>Th ratios at both IODP Site U1313 and ODP Site 1089 243 indicate consistent authigenic U enrichment throughout the deglacial interval. Thus, a 244 (<sup>238</sup>U/<sup>232</sup>Th)<sub>lith</sub> value of 0.6 for IODP Site U1313 and ODP Site 1089 respectively has been 245 applied. Further, a disequilibrium of 4% for <sup>234</sup>U/<sup>238</sup>U in the lithogenic fraction has been 246 considered to account for preferential <sup>234</sup>U loss via the recoil-effect (Bourne et al., 2012). The 247 selection of (<sup>238</sup>U/<sup>232</sup>Th)<sub>lith</sub> is of subordinate importance for the final <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th ratios, as 248 249 shown in the supplementary material S3, with the exception of the shallowest core M35003-4. 250 Even for this core the relative variations of <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th are not substantially influenced by the  $(^{238}U/^{232}Th)_{lith}$  value. 251

#### 252 Biogenic Opal

Since <sup>231</sup>Pa shows a higher affinity for biogenic silicate particles (Chase et al., 2002) the sedimentary opal content has been carefully monitored before interpreting <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th in terms of ocean circulation strength (supplementary material, S5). Opal measurements were performed by either automated leaching or by Fourier transformation infrared spectroscopy (FTIRS).

258 **3 Results and discussion** 

Six new combined  ${}^{231}$ Pa/ ${}^{230}$ Th and  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  down-core profiles represent a considerable improvement in the available data bases of both proxies. We therefore present a short outline of the new results from each core before discussing what can be deduced from a comprehensive compilation of all data sets along with the literature records.

263 In order to provide support of the applications  $^{231}$ Pa/ $^{230}$ Th results are also presented as a 264 function of of opal concentrations in section 3.6. For Nd isotopes the comparison of seawater measurements to late Holocene Fe-Mn oxide leachates provide evidence for the reliability of our bulk sediment leachates in recording a past seawater  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  signal. No core top samples could be used for this study, but  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  values from the youngest samples (5.5 – 0.1 ka) of each core are in good agreement with the seawater compositions from the closest available stations (supplementary material, S2).

#### 270 **3.1 IODP U1313**

271 The northernmost core location, IODP Site U1313 (3,426 m water depth, (Channell et al., 2006)) displays  ${}^{231}$ Pa/ ${}^{230}$ Th values (n=21) that are always clearly below the production ratio 272 273 and with relatively low variability throughout the record (min=0.046, max=0.068; Fig. 2a). 274 The variability is much smaller compared with the <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th records from the Bermuda 275 Rise, where the prodution ratio of 0.093 was reached during HS1 and HS2 (Lippold et al., 2009; McManus et al., 2004). The values are generally in good agreement with  $^{231}$ Pa/ $^{230}$ Th 276 277 data from a shallower adjacent core (MD95-2037 (Gherardi et al., 2009), supporting material 278 S1). There is no pronounced increase during HS1, which may be, however, a result of the low 279 temporal resolution towards the younger part of the record.

The Nd isotope record delineates two distinct levels of more radiogenic glacial values followed by rather unradiogenic  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  in the deglacial and the Holocene with a relatively sharp transition at ~ 17 ka. This general trend is similar to the  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  records from deep north-west-Atlantic locations (e.g. (Gutjahr et al., 2008; Roberts et al., 2010)), but the onset to less radiogenic values occurs earlier. In contrast to its  ${}^{231}Pa/{}^{230}Th$  record, the  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  of IODP Site U1313 is more similar to the records from the other cores sites of this study (Fig. 2).

# 286 **3.2 12JPC**

287 We complemented an existing  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  profile (Gutjahr et al., 2008) from core 12JPC (4,250 m water depth, (Keigwin, 2004)) with  ${}^{231}$ Pa/ ${}^{230}$ Th measurements (n=18) from the identical 288 sample material (Fig. 2b). The transition from radiogenic Nd isotope signatures during the 289 LGM to more unradiogenic Nd isotopes during the Holocene ( $\Delta \epsilon_{Nd} \approx 3$ ) is also recorded by a 290 shift towards lower <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th.. The relative gradient in <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th, however, is less 291 pronounced than the glacial-interglacial gradient in the  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  signatures. The gradient between 292 maximum (0.083) and minimum (0.058) <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th values is comparable to the gradient 293 294 observed for IODP U1313. But unlike for IODP Site U1313 the record can be separated into 295 higher glacial ( $^{231}$ Pa/ $^{230}$ Th average=0.076, n=5) and deglacial (average=0.077, n=8) values, 296 followed by clearly lower Holocene values (average=0.058, n=4) This record is more similar to the deglacial <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th profile from Bermuda Rise (McManus et al., 2004), although 297

featuring significantly higher values during the LGM as well as lacking the distinctive
 <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th peak during HS1.

#### 300 **3.3 GeoB1515-1 and GeoB1523-1**

In order to evaluate the consistency and variability of the signals recorded by <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th and 301 302  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$ , we used sample material from two neighbouring core locations. GeoB1515-1, recovered 303 from 3,129 m and GeoB1523-1 from 3,292 m water depth from the eastern and south-western 304 Ceara Rise, located 1,000 km and 800 km northeast from the Amazon River mouth, respectively and situated only ~240 km apart. Results for  ${}^{231}$ Pa/ ${}^{230}$ Th and  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  from both cores 305 display a high level of coherency, testifying to the robustness of the methodological and 306 307 analytical approach (Fig. 2c,d, supporting material S4). For  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$ , similar to the trends of Site 308 12JPC and the Bermuda Rise records, the Holocene and the glacial display distinct values  $(\Delta \epsilon_{Nd} = 2-3)$ , similar to the trends seen in  $\delta^{13}C$  from epibenthic foraminifera (Mulitza et al., 309 310 1998). Most unradiogenic values in  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  are not reached at the uppermost (youngest) samples, 311 but during the mid-Holocene at these sites, as previously also reported for 12JPC (Gutjahr et 312 al., 2008), the Bermuda Rise record (Roberts et al., 2010) and the Wyville-Thomson Ridge (ODP 980) (Crocket et al., 2011) (supporting material S1). Analogous to  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  signatures, the 313  $^{231}$ Pa/ $^{230}$ Th record shows values distinguishing the Holocene (average=0.056, n=6) from the 314 peak glacial (average=0.071, n=4) and the deglacial (average=0.079, n=10) parts. In contrast 315 to  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  or the <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th record from 12JPC, highest <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th ratios are observed between 316 317 11 and 15 ka. There is some evidence of increased biogenic particle fluxes in GeoB1523-1 318 during this time period (Kasten et al., 2001), as well as higher opal concentrations in a 319 number of equatorial sediment cores (Bradtmiller et al., 2007) in relative proximity to GeoB1515-1 and GeoB1523-1, which would be capable of increase the <sup>231</sup>Pa scavenging 320 321 efficiency. But low concentrations of biogenic opal (< 3 %, see following section 3.6) at these sites argue against opal being a primary control on the sedimentary distribution of <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th 322 (e.g. the highest opal concentration of GeoB1515-1 is measured at 24 ka when <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th 323 324 was low). The available data sets cannot distinguish between a signal of weaker AMOC 325 around the YD as found from the high resolution Bermuda Rise record (McManus et al., 326 2004) or higher particle fluxes induced by increased Amazon river outflow (Mosblech et al., 327 2012).

#### 328 **3.4 M35003-4**

329 Core M35003-4 is the shallowest core of our compilation, retrieved from 1,299 m water 330 depth. In comparison to the deeper cores its variability in both  ${}^{231}Pa/{}^{230}Th$  and  $\epsilon_{Nd}$  is substantially smaller, although the relatively low temporal resolution may mask some of the variability (Fig. 2e). The  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  profile is in very good agreement with values from the neighbouring core MD99-2198 (Pahnke et al., 2008), but lower temporal data coverage does not allow resolving increased northward propagation of AAIW during HS1 or the YD as observed at site MD99-2198 (supporting material S1).

336 The  ${}^{231}$ Pa/ ${}^{230}$ Th values are close to the production ratio and persistently higher compared to the deeper cores as a consequence of the shallow water-depth: In the Atlantic Ocean high 337 circulation intensity above a specific location causes <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th to decrease with water depth 338 because of the permanent advective <sup>231</sup>Pa export due to higher residence time in comparison 339 to <sup>230</sup>Th. Along with enhanced scavenging of <sup>231</sup>Pa close to the surface the result is higher 340 <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th in shallower waters than in deeper waters (Lippold et al., 2011; Luo et al., 2010). 341 342 Thus, these high absolute values may not be interpreted directly as an indicator of weak 343 circulation.

#### 344 **3.5 ODP Site 1089**

The southernmost core site of this study, ODP Site 1089, is located in the south-eastern South Atlantic at the northern flank of the Agulhas Ridge in the southern Cape Basin at 4,621 m water depth. Today the site is situated at the interface of NADW and Circumpolar Deep Water (CDW) with a strong influence of Antarctic Bottom Water (AABW) (Govin et al., 2009).

350 Our  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  record (Fig. 2f) corroborates the records from adjacent sites RC11-83 (Piotrowski et 351 al., 2004) and MD07-3076 (Skinner et al., 2013) very well (supporting material S1). Due to 352 its southern position the Holocene  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  signatures are far more radiogenic than in the North- or 353 Equatorial Atlantic, but clearly indicate a contribution of NADW featuring average Holocene 354 values of -9.3. The temporal trend in  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  mirrors the trends of the other deep cores with 355 radiogenic glacial values and a subsequent gradual decrease of  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  into the Holocene, but with a far later turning point than the other deeper cores.  ${}^{231}$ Pa/ ${}^{230}$ Th at ODP Site 1089 equally 356 357 develops from high glacial towards lower Holocene values.



Fig. 2: (a-f) New combined  ${}^{231}Pa/{}^{230}Th$  and  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  records from six sediment cores located across the entire Atlantic basin extended by combined data sets from the literature below the dotted line (g: Bermuda Rise and h: South Atlantic GeoB3808-6:(Jonkers et al., 2015)). The Bermuda Rise record (g) is a combination of the  ${}^{231}Pa/{}^{230}Th$  and  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  profiles reported by (Gutjahr and Lippold, 2011; Lippold et al., 2009; McManus et al., 2004; Roberts et al., 2010). Y-axes ranges have been kept constant with exception of  ${}^{231}Pa/{}^{230}Th$  at the shallowest core M35003-4 (e) and  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  at the two southern cores ODP Site 1089 and GeoB3808-6 (f,h). Vertical bars indicate the time ranges of the LGM, Heinrich Stadial 1, Younger Dryas and the early and later Holocene.

# 358 **3.6 Opal and <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th**

As mentioned above, we examined whether variations in  ${}^{231}$ Pa/ ${}^{230}$ Th were accompanied by 359 corresponding variations in the sedimentary opal concentrations. In general no significant 360 positive correlation ( $R^2=0.11$ , n=108) between  ${}^{231}Pa/{}^{230}Th$  and opal can be found across all 361 examined time periods and sediment cores (cross-plot in Fig. 3a and time-series in 362 363 supplementary material S5) in agreement with recent measurements from water column 364 samples from a cross-Atlantic transect (Hayes et al., 2015). As previously found by Rutberg 365 et al. (2000) for deep seawater, on a basin-wide scale opal concentrations show a correlation with  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  instead (Fig. 3b). This correlation is likely a result of opal preservation in SCW 366 influenced sediment-water interfaces providing indirect evidence for the northward advances 367 368 of SCW during the last glacial and the deglacial compared to the Holocene. Given the effect 369 of enhanced opal-preservation in locations bathed by SCW and the lack of correlation between  ${}^{231}$ Pa/ ${}^{230}$ Th and opal, increased  ${}^{231}$ Pa/ ${}^{230}$ Th values during times of radiogenic  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$ 370 371 most likely indicate changes in ocean circulation and not in particle composition. We hence consider variations in <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th from all sites, with the possible exception of the 372 373 southernmost ODP Site 1089, as predominantly driven by circulation changes.

The opal concentrations from ODP 1089 vary in concert with <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th (supplementary 374 375 material S5.) suggesting a possible influence of opal on the scavenging efficiency of <sup>231</sup>Pa  $(R^2=0.78, n=35)$ . The location of ODP Site 1089 is very close to the southern opal belt. Given 376 the coincident increase in both opal and <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th it seems plausible that a northward 377 migration of the opal belt during the glacial (Asmus et al., 1999) may have influenced 378 <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th. However, despite the clearly higher sedimentary opal content in core ODP1098, 379 the <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th values are generally similar to the range of <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th values recorded in other 380 locations spanning the Atlantic Ocean (Fig. 3a). Hence increased opal flux may have shifted 381 <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th towards higher values, but ocean circulation still exerts the primary control over 382  $^{231}$ Pa/ $^{230}$ Th at this location. 383





b



Fig. 3:

Opal concentrations versus a)  $^{231}Pa/^{230}Th$  and b)  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  for all available data pairs from this study and for the Bermuda Rise (ODP1063)(Böhm et al., 2015). The negative slope of the basin wide regression line does not suggest an influence of opal on  $^{231}Pa/^{230}Th$  (a). Opal concentrations generally increase with stronger contributions from SCW as indicated by the correlation with  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  (b).

#### 386 **3.7** Glacial-Holocene variations of water mass provenance indicated by $\varepsilon_{Nd}$

387 The Holocene distribution of authigenic  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  robustly reflects the geometry of NCW and SCW 388 in the modern Atlantic Ocean (Fig. 1b and S2). During the LGM a general shift toward more 389 radiogenic values at all sites indicates increased influence of SCW over the entire glacial 390 Atlantic (Fig. 4a). However, the magnitudes of the shifts in  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  vary with the core location. 391 Sediments in the western North Atlantic (12JPC, Fig. 2b; GeoB1515-1, Fig. 2c; GeoB1523-1, 392 Fig. 2d; Bermuda Rise, Fig. 2g) undergo a shift of at least 2-3  $\Delta \epsilon_{Nd}$ . This is interpreted as 393 reflecting a transition in the deep water mass regime, from glacial SCW to Holocene NCW 394 bathing these sites (cf. (Gutjahr et al., 2008)). The smallest LGM-Holocene gradient is 395 observed for the shallowest core M35003-4 ( $\Delta \epsilon_{Nd} = 0.6$ , Fig. 2e). The glacial-interglacial 396 difference for M35003-4 is barely above the analytical uncertainties, implying a persistent 397 presence of NCW and a sustained northern overturning cell during the LGM in the shallower 398 North Atlantic (Lippold et al., 2012b). Although the northernmost core of this study, IODP 399 Site U1313 (Fig. 2a), is located deeper than GeoB1515-1 and GeoB1523-1 (Fig. 2c,d), which 400 are fully bathed by SCW during the LGM,  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  at Site IODP Site U1313 never rises above -401 11.3 due to its more northern position. For comparison Bermuda Rise, 12JPC and Ceara Rise 402 maxima during the LGM are -10.3, -9.6 and -9.7, respectively. Hence, the North Atlantic  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$ 403 records imply a shoaling of the GNAIW/SCW interface towards the south during the LGM 404 rather than a separation of SCW and GNAIW at a specific water depth (Gebbie, 2014).

405 The cores from the southern hemisphere also evidence a pronounced dominance of SCW 406 during the glacial, indicated by radiogenic  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  as suggested previously (Piotrowski et al., 407 2004). While the deep ODP Site 1089 (Fig. 2g) witnesses contributions from NCW today ( $\varepsilon_{Nd}$ 408 = -9.3), it was barely influenced by contributions from NCW during the LGM ( $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  = -7.3). 409 This effect is even more pronounced for the shallower site GeoB3808-6 (Fig. 2h, Holocene 410  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  = -10.7, LGM  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  = -7.5), which was completely isolated from any supply from NCW. 411 The presence of SCW in the entire Atlantic lasted beyond the LGM at all core sites, indicated 412 by relatively radiogenic SCW Nd isotope signatures at least until 17 ka (Fig. 2). For the  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$ 413 down-core-profiles of the cores below 3,000 m water depth a distinct time can be identified 414 after which values started to evolve towards more unradiogenic signatures. This change 415 emerges first at the northernmost core IODP U1313 around 17 ka. Having already been 416 influenced by the GNAIW overturning cell during the LGM, the  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  signatures from this core 417 reacted most readily to the incipient retreat of SCW. For 12JPC, GeoB1515-1, GeoB1523-1 418 and the Bermuda Rise cores the turning points were reached later (approximately 2 ka) at 419 around the Bølling/Allerød warm period. For ODP1089 in the deep south-eastern Atlantic it 420 took longest (around 12 ka BP) before a steady descent towards unradiogenic values was 421 initiated. In contrast to an earlier appearance of this switch at other core locations in the South 422 Atlantic (e.g. GeoB3808-6 and MD07-3076 (Skinner et al., 2013)), strong influence of NCW 423 reached the deep South Atlantic at ODP1089, east of the Mid Ocean Ridge, several ka later. 424 The gradual decrease of  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  at all sites lasted around 5,000 years eventually reaching the least 425 radiogenic values in the course of the Holocene with subsequent tendencies towards more 426 radiogenic contributions afterwards. The deglacial evolution from a SCW dominated Atlantic 427 towards a NCW regime did therefore not occur as a sudden switch from GNAIW to NADW, but instead was a progressive process, as also suggested from other  $^{231}Pa/^{230}Th$  and  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  based 428 429 studies (Böhm et al., 2015; Skinner et al., 2013). This gradual substitution of SCW by NCW 430 implies a slow deglacial evolution of the AMOC until maximum NCW domination was 431 reached during the early Holocene.

432 Another time period of interest is HS1 (~15 to 18 ka). Within error the HS1  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  compositions 433 were virtually identical to the LGM (Fig. 2). This is most likely a result of the fact that SCW 434 already occupied most of the volume of the abyssal Atlantic during the LGM. Hence no 435 significant changes in  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  resulting from a potentially weaker contribution of NCW during 436 HS1 can be observed (Fig. 4b). The only exception is IODP U1313 (Fig. 2a), which, due to its 437 northernmost position, makes it more sensitive to the relative contributions of the NADW 438 forming water masses (Iceland-Scotland Overflow Water, Denmark Strait Overflow Water, 439 LSW). Variable rates of admixture of LSW at our core site may have produced more 440 unradiogenic signatures towards the end of HS1 (Wilson et al. 2014), while the cores located 441 to the southwest were still dominated by SCW (Figs. 3, 5b).

443



Fig. 4: Water depth versus

- a)  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  for the time slices of the Holocene (averaged from 0-10 ka, red) and the LGM (averaged from 19-23 ka, blue). Dashed lines indicate the changes in  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$ . Numbers within the symbols refer to the individual cores (Table 1). Error bars give the standard error for the average of each time slice. If only one datum is within the limits of the time slice, the analytical external reproducibility is given.
- b)  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  of HS1 (averaged from 15-18 ka, grey) is added.

a

b

#### 444 **3.8** Glacial-Holocene evolution of ocean circulation from a two-proxy point of view

The absolute values and trends in the  ${}^{231}$ Pa/ ${}^{230}$ Th down-core records presented in this study (Fig. 2) confirm that information about past changes in AMOC strength should ideally be derived from a set of different core locations, both geographically and from various water depths. In conjunction with  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  records, an even more comprehensive picture of the LGM water mass advection can be reconstructed.

Holocene <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th ratios, featuring values clearly below the production ratio, reflect active 450 export of <sup>231</sup>Pa out of the Atlantic Ocean along with NADW (Fig. 5, red). A general deficit of 451 <sup>231</sup>Pa is observed for the LGM (blue) as well, but significantly higher ratios for almost all 452 453 locations imply less vigorous water mass advection, in particular in the deep ocean. The cores 454 that have experienced significant glacial/interglacial changes in  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  indicative of a change in the source of the water mass also display the most pronounced changes in <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th 455 456 (GeoB1515-1, GeoB1523-1, 12JPC, Bermuda cores, ODP Site 1089). At this point it is important to note that the <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th of these deeper cores does not provide information about 457 458 the strength of shallower GNAIW since the core sites were bathed by SCW, and because the predominant part of the <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th signal is generated within ~1 km above the sediment 459 460 (Thomas et al., 2006). Instead during the LGM these deeper locations consistently indicate a weaker circulation (higher <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th compared to the Holocene) related to the SCW cell. 461 462 Both proxies record the transition of a SCW dominated deep Atlantic Ocean to a NCW 463 dominated North Atlantic from the onset of the deglaciation in good agreement with findings based on nutrient-based proxies such as benthic  $\delta^{13}$ C and Cd/Ca (Gebbie, 2014). However, 464 there are three cores characterised by unchanged (IODP U1313, M35003-4) or even lower 465 (GeoB3808-6)<sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th during the LGM (Fig. 5a). Such invariable <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th values stand 466 in contrast to the varying  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$ -signatures at IODP Site U1313 and GeoB3808-6, which follow 467 468 the general trend of more radiogenic values in the glacial and more unradiogenic values in the Holocene. The glacial decrease in  $^{231}$ Pa/ $^{230}$ Th at GeoB3808-6 may be a consequence of a  $^{231}$ Pa 469 depletion of the water mass caused by the northward migration of the opal belt (Negre et al., 470 2010) (also indicated by the correlation of <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th with opal concentrations at ODP Site 471 1089). But more likely the deep South Atlantic may have become a source of <sup>231</sup>Pa for the 472 473 deep North Atlantic due to the dominance of northward flowing SCW during the glacial, 474 turning over the interglacial situation (Jonkers et al., 2015).

In the north  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  at IODP Site U1313 equally indicates more radiogenic signatures during the glacial, but with more unradiogenic absolute values (LGM average  $\varepsilon_{Nd} \approx -12$ ), which is indicative of significant NCW admixtures to glacial local deep water. Similarly, the shallowest core M35003-4 shows a barely resolvable shift towards more radiogenic signatures ( $\Delta \epsilon_{Nd}$ =0.6). Since the water mass provenance signal and the circulation strength at IODP Site U1313 and M35003-4 changed far less than the deeper and more southerly cores, we conclude that there was still an active northern overturning cell of GNAIW during the LGM.

482 Combining the above observations, we find support for a sluggishly ventilated, SCW-483 dominated deep Atlantic during the LGM as suggested by the distribution of  $\delta^{13}$ C (Curry and 484 Oppo, 2005; Sarnthein et al., 1994). Additionally, information about the strength and 485 directions of deep water circulation is observed (Fig. 6). Still, as yet the spatial resolution 486 does not allow distinguishing between the situation in the eastern and the western basins or 487 for more specific water depths.

## 488 **3.9 Heinrich Stadial 1**

Heinrich Stadial 1 that followed the LGM featured no pronounced changes in <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th 489 490 compared to the LGM for most of the locations, implying a still active NCW overturning cell 491 during HS1 (Bradtmiller et al., 2014; Oppo et al., 2015). Lower HS1 values at ODP Site 1089 492 and higher values at the Bermuda Rise were accompanied by changes in opal concentrations 493 (S5, (Keigwin and Boyle, 2008; Lippold et al., 2009)) and may not be solely explained by circulation changes. The largest change in <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th during HS1 compared to the Holocene 494 495 or the LGM was observed for M35003-4 (Fig. 5b). The two lower values during HS1 may 496 indicate an intensified GNAIW circulation cell. However, the low sampling resolution for this 497 record prevents an unbiased interpretation during this time interval. There is an obvious need 498 of higher temporal and spatial resolution to better constrain the structure of the upper branch 499 of the past AMOC during HS1.

501

a



b



Fig. 5:

- a) Water depth versus  $^{231}Pa/^{230}Th$  for the time slices of the Holocene (averaged from 0-10 ka, red) and the LGM (averaged from 19-23 ka, blue). Dashed lines indicate the changes in  $^{231}Pa/^{230}Th$ . Numbers within the symbols refer to the individual cores (Table 1). Error bars give the standard error for the average of each time slice. If only one datum is within the limits of the time slice, the analytical external reproducibility is given.
  b) <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th averages of HS1 (averaged from 15-18 ka, grey) are added.



Fig. 6: LGM AMOC circulation scheme based on  ${}^{231}Pa/{}^{230}Th$ ,  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  and  $\delta^{13}C$  (values indicated by contour lines and colour code (Curry and Oppo, 2005)) indicate a shoaled NCW overturning cell. Overlain on the  $\delta^{13}C$  compilation are directions and relative advection strengths during the LGM derived from  ${}^{231}Pa/{}^{230}Th$  and  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  for each core location. Shadings of the arrows indicate the contribution of NCW (white) relative to SCW (black) according to a linear end-member mixing model. Lengths of the arrows are scaled to the relative changes in  ${}^{231}Pa/{}^{230}Th$  between the LGM and the Holocene. Numbers underneath the core names indicate the differences in  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  and relative increases in  ${}^{231}Pa/{}^{230}Th$  values during the LGM compared to the average Holocene values.

#### 503 **3.10 Variability of the Holocene AMOC**

504 Another noteworthy feature in the down-core profiles of both proxies is the sporadic appearance of lower values in  ${}^{231}$ Pa/ ${}^{230}$ Th and/or  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  for several of the cores (Fig. 2, and 505 506 supporting material S1) in the early or mid-Holocene. More negative  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  values alone may simply indicate an increased contribution of LSW to NADW. However, concurrent decreases 507 in some of the <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th profiles point to a stronger contribution of NCW compared to the 508 509 more recent time period of the Holocene. In this case such values may reflect an enhanced 510 AMOC circulation mode (Thornalley et al., 2013) facilitating the basin-wide spreading of 511 NADW at higher advection rates during distinct time intervals of the Holocene. The timing of the appearances of these low values in  $^{231}\text{Pa}/^{230}\text{Th}$  and  $\epsilon_{Nd}$  are however not always 512 concordant: the minima in  $^{231}$ Pa/ $^{230}$ Th and  $\epsilon_{Nd}$  are observed not only at the onset of the 513 514 Holocene, but also sometimes around the mid-Holocene (ODP Site 1089, IODP U1313), or 515 the minima are observed for one proxy only (12JPC, IODP U1313). Consequently, the 516 suggestion of an early Holocene AMOC overshoot needs further corroboration.

#### 517 4 Conclusions

518 We observe no basin wide correlation of the  ${}^{231}$ Pa/ ${}^{230}$ Th with the abundance of opal, with the 519 exception of the southernmost core (ODP Site 1089). For all the northern locations the 520 generally robust correlation of  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  with opal concentrations suggests that opal is better 521 preserved at core locations bathed by SCW. Hence, co-variation of  ${}^{231}$ Pa/ ${}^{230}$ Th with opal does 522 not necessarily indicate a causal link (i.e., high opal causes high  ${}^{231}$ Pa/ ${}^{230}$ Th) but instead results 523 from a change in the water mass provenance.

The new data presented here spanning the entire Atlantic contribute to improving the spatial resolution of the past AMOC variability by applying two independent proxies, <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th and Nd isotopes. These proxies, unaffected by changes in the global carbon cycle, allow the reconstruction of circulation strength and deep water provenance.

528 Our basin wide analysis of the combined data sets of six new and two published <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th 529 and  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  records consistently suggest higher <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th and more radiogenic  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  values during 530 the LGM and HS1 compared with the Holocene. These results confirm the increased 531 influence, as well as the northward advection, of sluggishly ventilated SCW deep waters 532 during the LGM and HS1, followed by a subsequent change towards a NCW dominated and 533 stronger ventilated North Atlantic, supporting the classical paleoceanographic point of view 534 (Curry and Oppo, 2005; Sarnthein et al., 1994). 535 Exceptions to these general features are observable at the northernmost (IODP U1313) and 536 shallowest (M35003-4) core locations of this study, evidencing the presence of NCW 537 contributions (GNAIW) to prevailing SCW and an active shallow overturning cell during the 538 LGM.

539 During the deglaciation both proxies indicate a gradual transition, lasting several millennia, 540 towards a NCW dominated and stronger ventilated North Atlantic. The imprints of the 541 reorganisation of the circulation pattern can be found earliest in the North (IODP U1313) at 542 about 17 ka and arrives latest in the deep south-east Atlantic (ODP1089) at about 11 ka.

543 There are periods in the Holocene when  ${}^{231}Pa/{}^{230}Th$  and/or  $\epsilon_{Nd}$  from some of the new records

545 Holocene variations in the AMOC. However, insufficient data coverage during the Holocene,

indicate a more active AMOC than during the later Holocene, suggesting potential intra-

546 and different timing of these peaks, do not allow a clear identification of an early Holocene

547 AMOC overshoot and/or a mid-Holocene "Super-AMOC" mode.

# 548 **5** Acknowledgements

544

This project was funded by DFG grant Li1815/2. J. Lippold was further supported by the 549 550 FP7-PEOPLE-2013-IEF, Marie Curie proposal 622483. We thank the ODP core repository 551 and the MARUM GeoB Core Repository in Bremen for dedicated support. Stefan Mulitza 552 was supported through the DFG Research Center/Cluster of Excellence "The Ocean in the 553 Earth System". E. Böhm acknowledges support from the European Research Council grant 554 ACCLIMATE/no 339108. S.L. Jaccard and O. Cartapanis were supported by the Swiss 555 National Science Foundation (grant PP00P2\_144811). Chris Coath at the University of Bristol 556 and Andy Milton at the University of Southampton are thanked for excellent machine support 557 and Carsten Münker for access to the Neptune lab in Bonn. We thank Alexander Thomas and 558 two anonymous reviewers for their constructive criticism and Derek Vance for very helpful 559 editorial handling. Figure 1 was generated using the Ocean Data View software by Reiner 560 Schlitzer.

## 561 6 References

- Asmus, T., M. Frank, C. Kochschmieder, N. Frank, R. Gersonde, G. Kuhn, Mangini, A., 1999.
   Variations of biogenic particle flux in the southern Atlantic section of the Subantarctic zone during the late Quaternary: Evidence from sedimentary <sup>231</sup>Pa<sub>ex</sub> and <sup>230</sup>Th<sub>ex</sub>. Marine Geology 159, 63-78.
- Böhm, E., J. Lippold, M. Gutjahr, M. Frank, P. Blaser, B. Antz, J. Fohlmeister, N. Frank,
   M.B. Andersen, Deininger, M., 2015. Strong and deep Atlantic Meridional Overturning
   Circulation during the last glacial cycle. Nature 517, 73-76.

569 3. Bourne, M., A. Thomas, C. Niocaill, Henderson, G., 2012. Improved determination of marine sedimentation rates using <sup>230</sup>Th<sub>xs</sub>. Geochemistry Geophysics Geosystems 13, Q09017. 570 4. Bradtmiller, L., McManus, J.F., Robinson, L.F., 2014. <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th evidence for a weakened but 571 572 persistent Atlantic meridional overturning circulation during Heinrich Stadial 1. Nature 573 Communications 5, 5817. 574 5. Bradtmiller, L., R. Anderson, M. Fleisher, Burckle, L., 2007. Opal burial in the equatorial 575 Atlantic Ocean over the last 30 kyr: implications for glacial-interglacial changes in the ocean 576 silicon cycle. Paleoceanography 22, PA4216. 577 6. Channell, J., T. Sato, T. Kanamatsu, R. Stein, C. Alvarez Zarikian, and the Expedition 578 303/306 Scientists, 2006. Expedition 303/306 synthesis: North Atlantic climate Proc. IODP, 579 303/306. College Station, TX (IODP Management International). 580 7. Chase, Z., R. Anderson, M. Fleisher, Kubik, P., 2002. The influence of particle composition 581 and particle flux on scavenging of Th, Pa and Be in the ocean. Earth and Planetary Science 582 Letters 204, 215-229. 8. Christl, M., J. Lippold, A. Hofmann, L. Wacker, Y. Lahaye, Synal, H., 2010. <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th: a 583 584 proxy for upwelling off the coast of West Africa. Nuclear Instruments and Methods in Physics 585 Research B 268, 1159–1162. 586 9. Christl, M., Wacker, L., Lippold, J., Suter, M., 2007. Protactinium-231, a new radionuclide for 587 AMS. Nuclear Instruments and Methods in Physics Research B 262, 379–384. 588 10. Colin, C., N. Frank, K. Copard, Douville, E., 2010. Neodymium isotopic composition of deep-589 sea corals from the NE Atlantic: implications for past hydrological changes during the 590 Holocene. Quaternary Science Reviews 29, 2509-2517. 591 11. Crocket, K., D. Vance, M. Gutjahr, G. Foster, Richards, D., 2011. Persistent Nordic deep 592 water overflow to the glacial North Atlantic. Geology 39, 515-518. 593 12. Curry, W., Oppo, D., 2005. Glacial water mass geometry and the distribution of d<sup>13</sup>C of CO<sub>2</sub> in 594 the western Atlantic Ocean. Paleoceanography 20, PA1017. 595 13. Elmore, A., A. Piotrowski, J. Wright, Scrivner, A., 2011. Testing the extraction of past 596 seawater Nd isotopic composition from North Atlantic deep sea sediments and foraminifera. 597 Geochemistry Geophysics Geosystems 12, 009008. 598 14. Frank, M., 2002. Radiogenic isotopes: Tracers of past Ocean Circulation and erosional input. 599 Reviews of Geophysics 40, 1001. 600 15. Galbraith, E., E. Kwon, D. Bianchi, M. Hain, Sarmiento, J., 2015. The impact of atmospheric 601 pCO<sub>2</sub> on carbon isotope ratios of the atmosphere and ocean. Global Biogeochemical Cycles 602 29, 307–324. 603 16. Gebbie, G., 2014. How much did Glacial North Atlantic Water shoal? Paleoceanography 29, 604 190-209. 605 17. Geibert, W., Vöge, I., 2008. Progress in determination of 227-Ac in sea water. Marine 606 Chemistry 109, 238-249. 607 18. Gherardi, J., L. Labeyrie, S. Nave, R. Francois, J. McManus, Cortijo, E., 2009. Glacialinterglacial circulation changes inferred from <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th sedimentary record in the North 608 Atlantic region. Paleoceanography 24, PA2204. 609 610 19. Govin, A., Elisabeth Michel, Laurent Labeyrie, Waelbroeck, C., 2009. Evidence for northward 611 expansion of Antarctic Bottom Water mass in the Southern Ocean during the last glacial 612 inception. Paleoceanography 24, PA1202. 613 20. Gutjahr, M., Lippold, J., 2011. Early arrival of Southern Source Water in the deep North 614 Atlantic prior to Heinrich event 2. Paleoceanography 26, PA2101.

- 615 21. Gutjahr, M., M. Frank, C. Stirling, L. Keigwin, Halliday, A., 2008. Tracing the Nd isotope
  616 evolution of North Atlantic Deep and Intermediate Waters in the western North Atlantic since
  617 the LGM from Blake Ridge sediments. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 266, 61–77.
- 618 22. Gutjahr, M., M. Frank, C. Stirling, V. Klemm, T. van de Flierdt, Halliday, A., 2007. Reliable
  619 extraction of a deepwater trace metal isotope signal from Fe–Mn oxyhydroxide coatings of
  620 marine sediments. Chem Geol 242, 351–370.
- 621 23. Hayes, C., Anderson, R.F., Fleisher, M.Q., Vivancos, S.M., Lam, P.J., Ohnemus, D.C., Huang,
  622 K.-F., Robinson, L.F., Lu, Y., Cheng, H., Edwards, R.L., Moran, S.B., 2015. Intensity of Th
  623 and Pa scavenging partitioned by particle chemistry in the North Atlantic Ocean. Marine
  624 Chemistry 170, 49-60.
- 4. Jaccard, S.L., Galbraith, E.D., Martínez-García, A., Anderson, R.F., 2016. Covariation of deep
  Southern Ocean oxygenation and atmospheric CO2 through the last ice age. Nature 530, 207210.
- 428 25. Jeandel, C., 1993. Concentration and isotopic composition of neodymium in the South
   Atlantic Ocean. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 117, 581-591.
- 630 26. Jonkers, L., Zahn, R., Thomas, A., Henderson, G., Abouchami, W., François, R., Masque, P.,
  631 Hall, I.R., Bickert, T., 2015. Deep circulation changes in the central South Atlantic during the
  632 past 145 kyrs reflected in a combined <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th, Neodymium isotope and benthic record.
  633 Earth and Planetary Science Letters 419, 14-21.
- 634
  635
  636
  27. Kasten, S., R. Haese, M. Zabel, C. Rühlemann, Schulz, H., 2001. Barium peaks at glacial terminations in sediments of the equatorial Atlantic Ocean-relicts of deglacial productivity pulses? Chem Geol 175, 635–651.
- 637 28. Keigwin, D., Boyle, E., 2008. Did North Atlantic overturning halt 17,000 years ago?
  638 Paleoceanography 23, PA1101.
- 639
   29. Keigwin, L., 2004. Radiocarbon and stable isotope constraints on Last Glacial Maximum and
   640 Younger Dryas ventilation in the western North Atlantic. Paleoceanography PA4012.
- 641 30. Kretschmer, S., W. Geibert, C. Schnabel, M. Rutgers van der Loeff, Mollenhauer, G., 2008.
   642 Distribution of <sup>230</sup>Th, <sup>10</sup>Be and <sup>231</sup>Pa in Sediment Particle Classes. Geochimica et
   643 Cosmochimica Acta 72.
- 644 31. Lacan, F., Jeandel, C., 2005a. Acquisition of the neodymium isotopic composition of the
   645 North Atlantic Deep Water. Geochemistry Geophysics Geosystems 6, Q12008.
- 646 32. Lacan, F., Jeandel, C., 2005b. Neodymium isotopes as a new tool for quantifying exchange
  647 fluxes at the continent ocean interface. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 232, 245-257.
- 33. Lambelet, M., van de Flierdt, T., Crocket, K., Rehkämper, M., Kreissig, K., Coles, B.,
  Rijkenberg, M.J.A., Gerringa, L.J.A., de Baar, H.J.W., Steinfeldt, R., 2015. Neodymium
  isotopic composition and concentration in the western North Atlantic Ocean: results from the
  GEOTRACES GA02 section. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 177, 1-29.
- 4. Lippold, J., J. Gherardi, Luo, Y., 2011. Testing the <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th paleocirculation proxy A data versus 2D model comparison. Geophysical Research Letters 38, L20603.
- 4 35. Lippold, J., J. Grützner, D. Winter, Y. Lahaye, A. Mangini, Christl, M., 2009. Does
   4 sedimentary <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th from the Bermuda Rise monitor past Atlantic Meridional Overturning
   4 Circulation? Geophysical Research Letters 36, L12601.
- 657 36. Lippold, J., S. Mulitza, G. Mollenhauer, S. Weyer, Christl, M., 2012a. Boundary scavenging at
  658 the east Atlantic margin does not negate use of Pa/Th to trace Atlantic overturning. Earth and
  659 Planetary Science Letters 333–334, 317-331.
- 37. Lippold, J., Y. Luo, R. Francois, S. Allen, J. Gherardi, S. Pichat, B. Hickey, Schulz, H.,
  2012b. Strength and geometry of the glacial Atlantic Meridional Overturning Circulation.
  Nature Geoscience 5, 813-816.

- 38. Luo, Y., R. Francois, Allen, S., 2010. Sediment <sup>231</sup>Pa/<sup>230</sup>Th as a recorder of the rate of the Atlantic meridional overturning circulation: insights from a 2-D model. Ocean Science 6, 381-400.
- 466 39. Lynch-Stieglitz, J., Fairbanks, R.G., 1994. A conservative tracer for glacial ocean circulation
  and palaeo-nutrient measurements in benthic foraminifera. Nature 369,
  and an analysis of the second se
- 40. McManus, J., R. Francois, J. Gherardi, L. Keigwin, Brown-Leger, S., 2004. Collapse and rapid
  resumption of Atlantic meridional circulation linked to deglacial climate change. Nature 428,
  834-837.
- 41. Mosblech, N.A.S., Bush, M.B., Gosling, W.D., Hodell, D., Thomas, L., van Calsteren, P.,
  673 Correa-Metrio, A., Valencia, B.G., Curtis, J., van Woesik, R., 2012. North Atlantic forcing of
  674 Amazonian precipitation during the last ice age. Nature Geoscience 5, 817-820.
- 42. Mulitza, S., C. Rühlemann, T. Bickert, W. Hale, J. Pätzold, Wefer, G., 1998. Late Quaternary d<sup>13</sup>C gradients and carbonate accumulation in the western equatorial Atlantic. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 155, 237-249.
- 43. Negre, C., R. Zahn, A. Thomas, P. Masque, G. Henderson, G. Martinez-Mendez, I. Hall, Mas,
  J., 2010. Reversed flow of Atlantic deepwater during the Last Glacial Maximum. Nature 468,
  84 89.
- 681 44. Oppo, D., W. Curry, McManus, J., 2015. What do benthic  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O data tell us about Atlantic circulation during Heinrich Stadial 1? Paleoceanography 30, 353–368.
- 45. Osborne, A.H., Haley, B.A., Hathorne, E.C., Flögel, S., Frank, M., 2014. Neodymium isotopes
  and concentrations in Caribbean seawater: Tracing water mass mixing and continental input in
  a semi-enclosed ocean basin. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 406, 174-186.
- 46. Pahnke, K., Goldstein, S., Hemming, S., 2008. Abrupt changes in Antarctic Intermediate
  Water circulation over the past 25,000 years. Nature Geoscience 1, 870-874.
- 47. Piepgras, D., Wasserburg, G., 1987. Rare earth element transport in the western North Atlantic
   inferred from Nd isotopic observations. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 51, 1257-1271.
- 48. Piotrowski, A., S. Goldstein, S. Hemming, R. Fairbanks, 2004. Intensification and variability
  of ocean thermohaline circulation through the last deglaciation. Earth and Planetary Science
  Letters 225, 205-220.
- 693 49. Roberts, N., A. Piotrowski, J. McManus, Keigwin, L., 2010. Synchronous Deglacial
  694 Overturning and Water Mass Source Changes. Science 327, 75-78.
- 50. Rutberg, R., Sidney R. Hemming, Goldstein, S.L., 2000. Reduced North Atlantic Deep Water
  flux to the glacial Southern Ocean inferred from neodymium isotope ratios. Nature 405.
- 51. Sabine, C.L., Feely, R.A., Gruber, N., Key, R.M., Lee, K., Bullister, J.L., Wanninkhof, R.,
  Wong, C.S., Wallace, D.W.R., Tilbrook, B., Millero, F.J., Peng, T.-H., Kozyr, A., Ono, T.,
  Rios, A.F., 2004. The Oceanic Sink for Anthropogenic CO<sub>2</sub>. Science 305, 367-371.
- 52. Sarnthein, M., K. Winn, S. Jung, J. Duplessy, L. Labeyrie, H. Erlenkeuser, Ganssen, G., 1994.
  Changes in east Atlantic deepwater circulation over the last 30,000 years: Eight time slice
  reconstructions. Paleoceanography 9, 209-267.
- 53. Scholten, J., J. Fietzke, A. Mangini, D. Garbe-Schönberg, A. Eisenhauer, P. Stoffers,
   Schneider, R., 2008. Advection and Scavenging: Effect on <sup>230</sup>Th and <sup>231</sup>Pa distribution off
   Southwest-Africa. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 271, 159-169.
- 54. Skinner, L.C., Scrivner, A.E., Vance, D., Barker, S., Fallon, S., Waelbroeck, C., 2013. North
  Atlantic versus Southern Ocean contributions to a deglacial surge in deep ocean ventilation.
  Geology 41, G34133.34131.
- 55. Tanaka, T., S. Togashi, H. Kamioka, H. Amakawa, H. Kagami, T. Hamamoto, M. Yuhara, Y.
  Orihashi, S. Yoneda, H. Shimizu, T. Kunimaru, K. Takahashi, T. Yanagi, T. Nakano, H.

711 712	Fujimaki, R. Shinjo, Y. Asahara, M. Tanimizu, Dragusanu, C., 2000. JNdi-1: a neodymium isotopic reference in consistency with La Jolla neodymium. Chem Geol 168, 279–281.
713 714 715	56. Thomas, A., G. Henderson, Robinson, L., 2006. Interpretation of the <sup>231</sup> Pa/ <sup>230</sup> Th paleocirculation proxy: New water-column measurements from the southwest Indian Ocean. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 241 493– 504.
716 717 718	57. Thornalley, D.J.R., Blaschek, M., Davies, F.J., Praetorius, S., Oppo, D.W., McManus, J.F., Hall, I.R., Kleiven, H., Renssen, H., McCave, I.N., 2013. Long-term variations in Iceland– Scotland overflow strength during the Holocene. Climate of the Past 9, 2073-2084.
719 720	<ol> <li>Vance, D., Thirlwall, M., 2002. An assessment of mass discrimination in MC-ICPMS using Nd isotopes. Chem Geol 185, 227–240.</li> </ol>
721 722	59. Vidal, L., Schneider, R.R., Marchal, O., Bickert, T., 1999. Link between the North and South Atlantic during the Heinrich events of the last glacial period. Climate Dynamics 15, 909-919.
723 724 725	60. Wilson, D., Crocket, K.C., van de Flierdt, T., Robinson, L.F., Adkins, J.F., 2014. Dynamic intermediate ocean circulation in the North Atlantic during Heinrich Stadial 1: A radiocarbon and neodymium isotope perspective. Paleoceanography 29, PA002674.
726	
727	