HAL
open science

# An example of non-uniqueness for the weighted Radon transforms along hyperplanes in multidimensions 

F G Goncharov, Roman Novikov

## - To cite this version:

F G Goncharov, Roman Novikov. An example of non-uniqueness for the weighted Radon transforms along hyperplanes in multidimensions. Inverse Problems, 2018, 34 (5), pp.054001. 10.1088/13616420/aab24d . hal-01583755v2

## HAL Id: hal-01583755 <br> https://hal.science/hal-01583755v2

Submitted on 14 Sep 2017

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire HAL, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

# An example of non-uniqueness for the weighted Radon transforms along hyperplanes in multidimensions 

F.O. Goncharov*<br>R. G. Novikov* ${ }^{*}$

September 14, 2017


#### Abstract

We consider the weighted Radon transforms $R_{W}$ along hyperplanes in $\mathbb{R}^{d}, d \geq 3$, with strictly positive weights $W=W(x, \theta), x \in \mathbb{R}^{d}, \theta \in \mathbb{S}^{d-1}$. We construct an example of such a transform with non-trivial kernel in the space of infinitely smooth compactly supported functions. In addition, the related weight $W$ is infinitely smooth almost everywhere and is bounded. Our construction is based on the famous example of non-uniqueness of J. Boman (1993) for the weighted Radon transforms in $\mathbb{R}^{2}$ and on a recent result of F . Goncharov and R. Novikov (2016).


Keywords: weighted Radon transforms, injectivity, non-injectivity
AMS Mathematics Subject Classification: 44A12, 65R32

## 1 Introduction

We consider the weighted Radon transforms $R_{W}$, defined by the formulas:

$$
\begin{equation*}
R_{W} f(s, \theta)=\int_{x \theta=s} W(x, \theta) f(x) d x,(s, \theta) \in \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{S}^{d-1}, x \in \mathbb{R}^{d}, d \geq 2 \tag{1.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $W=W(x, \theta)$ is the weight, $f=f(x)$ is a test function on $\mathbb{R}^{d}$.
We assume that $W$ is real valued, bounded and strictly positive, i.e.:

$$
\begin{equation*}
W=\bar{W} \geq c>0, W \in L^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \times \mathbb{S}^{d-1}\right), \tag{1.2}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $\bar{W}$ denotes the complex conjugate of $W, c$ is a constant.
If $W \equiv 1$, then $R_{W}$ is reduced to the classical Radon transform $R$ along hyperplanes in $\mathbb{R}^{d}$. This transform is invertible by the classical Radon inversion formulas; see [Rad17].

If $W$ is strictly positive, $W \in C^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \times \mathbb{S}^{d-1}\right)$ and $f \in C_{0}^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d}\right)$, then in [Bey84] the inversion of $R_{W}$ is reduced to solving a Fredholm type linear integral equation. Besides, in [BQ87] it was proved that $R_{W}$ is injective (for example, in $L_{0}^{2}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d}\right)$ ) if $W$ is real-analytic and strictly positive. In addition, an example of $R_{W}$ in $\mathbb{R}^{2}$ with infinitely smooth strictly positive $W$ and with non-trivial kernel $\operatorname{Ker} R_{W}$ in $C_{0}^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{R}^{2}\right)$ was constructed in [Bom93]. Here $C_{0}^{\infty}, L_{0}^{2}$ denote the spaces of functions from $C^{\infty}, L^{2}$ with compact support, respectively.

In connection with the most recent progress in inversion methods for weighted Radon transforms $R_{W}$, see [Gon17].

We recall also that inversion methods for $R_{W}$ in $\mathbb{R}^{3}$ admit applications in the framework of emission tomographies (see [GN16]).

In the present work we construct an example of $R_{W}$ in $\mathbb{R}^{d}, d \geq 3$, with non-trivial kernel $\operatorname{Ker} R_{W}$ in $C_{0}^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d}\right)$. The related $W$ satisfies (1.2). In addition, our weight $W$ is infinitely smooth almost everywhere on $\mathbb{R}^{d} \times \mathbb{S}^{d-1}$.

In our construction we proceed from results of [Bom93] and [GN16].
In Section 2, in particular, we recall the result of [GN16].
In Section 3 we recall the result of [Bom93].
In Section 4 we obtain the main result of the present work.

[^0]
## 2 Relations between the Radon and the ray transforms

We consider also the weighted ray transforms $P_{w}$ in $\mathbb{R}^{d}$, defined by the formulas:

$$
\begin{align*}
& P_{w} f(x, \theta)=\int_{\mathbb{R}} w(x+t \theta, \theta) f(x+t \theta) d t,(x, \theta) \in T \mathbb{S}^{d-1},  \tag{2.1}\\
& T \mathbb{S}^{d-1}=\left\{(x, \theta) \in \mathbb{R}^{d} \times \mathbb{S}^{d-1}: x \theta=0\right\}, d \geq 2 \tag{2.2}
\end{align*}
$$

where $w=w(x, \theta)$ is the weight, $f=f(x)$ is a test-function on $\mathbb{R}^{d}$.
We assume that $w$ is real valued, bounded and strictly positive, i.e.:

$$
\begin{equation*}
w=\bar{w} \geq c>0, w \in L^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d} \times \mathbb{S}^{d-1}\right) \tag{2.3}
\end{equation*}
$$

We recall that $T \mathbb{S}^{d-1}$ can be interpreted as the set of all oriented rays in $\mathbb{R}^{d}$. In particular, if $\gamma=(x, \theta) \in$ $T \mathbb{S}^{d-1}$, then

$$
\begin{equation*}
\gamma=\left\{y \in \mathbb{R}^{d}: y=x+t \theta, t \in \mathbb{R}\right\} \tag{2.4}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $\theta$ gives the orientation of $\gamma$.
We recall that for $d=2$, transforms $P_{w}$ and $R_{W}$ are equivalent up to the following change of variables:

$$
\begin{align*}
& R_{W} f(s, \theta)=P_{w} f\left(s \theta, \theta^{\perp}\right), s \in \mathbb{R}, \theta \in \mathbb{S}^{1}  \tag{2.5}\\
& W(x, \theta)=w\left(x, \theta^{\perp}\right), x \in \mathbb{R}^{2}, \theta \in \mathbb{S}^{1} \\
& \theta^{\perp}=(-\sin \phi, \cos \phi) \text { for } \theta=(\cos \phi, \sin \phi), \phi \in[0,2 \pi), \tag{2.6}
\end{align*}
$$

where $f$ is a test-function on $\mathbb{R}^{2}$.
For $d=3$, the transforms $R_{W}$ and $P_{w}$ are related by the following formulas (see [GN16]):

$$
\begin{align*}
& R_{W} f(s, \theta)=\int_{\mathbb{R}} P_{w} f(s \theta+\tau[\theta, \alpha(\theta)], \alpha(\theta)) d \tau,(s, \theta) \in \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{S}^{2},  \tag{2.7}\\
& W(x, \theta)=w(x, \alpha(\theta)), x \in \mathbb{R}^{3}, \theta \in \mathbb{S}^{2},  \tag{2.8}\\
& \alpha(\theta)=\left\{\begin{array}{l}
\frac{[\eta, \theta]}{|[\eta, \theta]|}, \text { if } \theta \neq \pm \eta, \\
\text { any vector } e \in \mathbb{S}^{2}, \text { such that } e \perp \theta, \text { if } \theta= \pm \eta,
\end{array}\right. \tag{2.9}
\end{align*}
$$

where $\eta$ is some fixed vector from $\mathbb{S}^{2},[\cdot, \cdot]$ denotes the standard vector product in $\mathbb{R}^{3}$, $\perp$ denotes the orthogonality of vectors. Actually, formula (2.7) gives an expression for $R_{W} f$ on $\mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{S}^{2}$ in terms of $P_{w} f$ restricted to the rays $\gamma=\gamma(x, \theta)$, such that $\theta \perp \eta$, where $W$ and $w$ are related by (2.8).

Below we present analogs of (2.7)-(2.8) for $d>3$.
Let

$$
\begin{align*}
& \Sigma(s, \theta)=\left\{x \in \mathbb{R}^{d}: x \theta=s\right\}, s \in \mathbb{R}, \theta \in \mathbb{S}^{d-1},  \tag{2.10}\\
& \Xi\left(v_{1}, \ldots, v_{k}\right)=\operatorname{Span}\left\{v_{1}, \ldots, v_{k}\right\}, v_{i} \in \mathbb{R}^{d}, i=\overline{1, k}, 1 \leq k \leq d  \tag{2.11}\\
& \Theta\left(v_{1}, v_{2}\right)=\left\{\theta \in \mathbb{S}^{d-1}: \theta \perp v_{1}, \theta \perp v_{2}\right\} \simeq \mathbb{S}^{d-3}, v_{1}, v_{2} \in \mathbb{R}^{d}, v_{1} \perp v_{2},  \tag{2.12}\\
& \left(e_{1}, e_{2}, e_{3}, \ldots, e_{d}\right) \text { - be some fixed orthonormal, positively oriented basis in } \mathbb{R}^{d} . \tag{2.13}
\end{align*}
$$

If $\left(e_{1}, \ldots, e_{d}\right)$ is not specified otherwise, it is assumed that $\left(e_{1}, \ldots, e_{d}\right)$ is the standard basis in $\mathbb{R}^{d}$.
For $d \geq 3$, the transforms $R_{W}$ and $P_{w}$ are related by the following formulas:

$$
\begin{align*}
& R_{W} f(s, \theta)=\int_{\mathbb{R}^{d-2}} P_{w} f\left(s \theta+\sum_{i=1}^{d-2} \tau_{i} \beta_{i}(\theta), \alpha(\theta)\right) d \tau_{1} \ldots d \tau_{d-2},(s, \theta) \in \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{S}^{d-1},  \tag{2.14}\\
& W(x, \theta)=w(x, \alpha(\theta)), x \in \mathbb{R}^{d}, \theta \in \mathbb{S}^{d-1} \tag{2.15}
\end{align*}
$$

where $\alpha(\theta), \beta_{i}(\theta), i=\overline{1, d-2}$, are defined as follows:
$\alpha(\theta)=\left\{\begin{array}{l}\text { direction of one-dimensional intersection } \Sigma(s, \theta) \cap \Xi\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right), \text { where } \\ \text { the orientation of } \alpha(\theta) \text { is chosen such that } \operatorname{det}\left(\alpha(\theta), \theta, e_{3}, \ldots, e_{d}\right)>0, \text { if } \theta \notin \Theta\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right), \\ \text { any vector } e \in \mathbb{S}^{d-1} \cap \Xi\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right), \text { if } \theta \in \Theta\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right),\end{array}\right.$
$\left(\alpha(\theta), \beta_{1}(\theta), \ldots, \beta_{d-2}(\theta)\right)$ is an orthonormal basis on $\Sigma(s, \theta)$,
and $\Sigma(s, \theta), \Theta\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right)$ are given by (2.10), (2.12), respectively. Here, due to the condition $\theta \notin \Theta\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right)$ :

$$
\begin{equation*}
\operatorname{dim}\left(\Sigma(s, \theta) \cap \Xi\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right)\right)=1 \tag{2.18}
\end{equation*}
$$

Formula (2.18) is proved in Section 5.
Note that formulas (2.14)-(2.18) are also valid for $d=3$. In this case these formulas are reduced to (2.7)-(2.9), where $e_{3}=-\eta$.

Note that, formula (2.14) gives an expression for $R_{W} f$ on $\mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{S}^{d-1}$ in terms of $P_{w} f$ restricted to the rays $\gamma=(x, \alpha)$, such that $\alpha \in \mathbb{S}^{d-1} \cap \Xi\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right)$.
Remark 1. In (2.16) one can also write:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\alpha(\theta)=(-1)^{d-1} \star\left(\theta \wedge e_{3} \wedge \cdots \wedge e_{d}\right), \text { if } \theta \notin \Theta\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right) \tag{2.19}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $\star$-denotes the Hodge star, $\wedge$ - is the exterior product in $\Lambda^{*} \mathbb{R}^{d}$ (exterior algebra on $\mathbb{R}^{d}$ ); see, for example, Chapters 2.1.c, 4.1.c of [Mor01].

Note that the value of the integral in the right hand-side of (2.14) does not depend on the particular choice of $\left(\beta_{1}(\theta), \ldots, \beta_{d-2}(\theta)\right)$ of (2.17).

Note also that, due to $(2.8),(2.9),(2.15),(2.16)$, the weight $W$ is defined everywhere on $\mathbb{R}^{d} \times \mathbb{S}^{d-1}, d \geq 3$. In addition, this $W$ has the same smoothness as $w$ in $x$ on $\mathbb{R}^{d}$ and in $\theta$ on $\mathbb{S}^{d-1} \backslash \Theta\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right)$, where $\Theta\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right)$ is defined in (2.12) and has zero Lebesgue measure on $\mathbb{S}^{d-1}$.

## 3 Boman's example

For $d=2$, in [Bom93] there were constructed a weight $W$ and a function $f$, such that:

$$
\begin{align*}
& R_{W} f \equiv 0 \text { on } \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{S}^{1}  \tag{3.1}\\
& 1 / 2 \leq W \leq 1, W \in C^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{R}^{2} \times \mathbb{S}^{1}\right)  \tag{3.2}\\
& f \in C_{0}^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{R}^{2}\right), f \not \equiv 0, \operatorname{supp} f \subset \overline{B^{2}}=\left\{x \in \mathbb{R}^{2}:|x| \leq 1\right\} \tag{3.3}
\end{align*}
$$

In addition, as a corollary of (2.5), (2.6), (3.1)-(3.3), we have that

$$
\begin{align*}
& P_{w_{0}} f_{0} \equiv 0 \text { on } T \mathbb{S}^{1}  \tag{3.4}\\
& 1 / 2 \leq w_{0} \leq 1, w_{0} \in C^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{R}^{2} \times \mathbb{S}^{1}\right)  \tag{3.5}\\
& f_{0} \in C_{0}^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{R}^{2}\right), f_{0} \not \equiv 0, \operatorname{supp} f \subset \overline{B^{2}}=\left\{x \in \mathbb{R}^{2}:|x| \leq 1\right\} \tag{3.6}
\end{align*}
$$

where

$$
\begin{align*}
& w_{0}(x, \theta)=W\left(x,-\theta^{\perp}\right), x \in \mathbb{R}^{2}, \theta \in \mathbb{S}^{1}  \tag{3.7}\\
& f_{0} \equiv f \tag{3.8}
\end{align*}
$$

## 4 Main results

Let

$$
\begin{align*}
& B^{d}=\left\{x \in \mathbb{R}^{d}:|x|<1\right\}  \tag{4.1}\\
& \overline{B^{d}}=\left\{x \in \mathbb{R}^{d}:|x| \leq 1\right\}  \tag{4.2}\\
& \left(e_{1}, \ldots, e_{d}\right) \text { - be the canonical basis in } \mathbb{R}^{d} . \tag{4.3}
\end{align*}
$$

Theorem 1. There are $W$ and $f$, such that

$$
\begin{align*}
& R_{W} f \equiv 0 \text { on } \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{S}^{d-1}  \tag{4.4}\\
& W \text { satisfies }(1.2), f \in C_{0}^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d}\right), f \not \equiv 0 \tag{4.5}
\end{align*}
$$

where $R_{W}$ is defined by (1.1), $d \geq 3$. In addition,

$$
\begin{equation*}
1 / 2 \leq W \leq 1, W \text { is } C^{\infty} \text {-smooth on } \mathbb{R}^{d} \times\left(\mathbb{S}^{d-1} \backslash \Theta\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right)\right) \tag{4.6}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $\Theta\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right)$ is defined by (2.12). Moreover, weight $W$ and function $f$ are given by formulas (2.15), (4.8)-(4.10) in terms of the J. Boman's weight $w_{0}$ and function $f_{0}$ of (3.7), (3.8).

Remark 2. According to (2.15), (2.16), $W(x, \theta)$ for $\theta \in \Theta\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right)$ can be specified as follows:

$$
\begin{equation*}
W(x, \theta)=W\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{d}, \theta\right) \stackrel{\text { def }}{=} w_{0}\left(x_{1}, x_{2}, e_{1}\right), \theta \in \Theta\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right), x \in \mathbb{R}^{d} \tag{4.7}
\end{equation*}
$$

Proof of Theorem 1. We define

$$
\begin{align*}
& w(x, \alpha)=w\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{d}, \alpha\right) \stackrel{\text { def }}{=} w_{0}\left(x_{1}, x_{2}, \alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}\right)  \tag{4.8}\\
& f(x)=f\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{d}\right) \stackrel{\text { def }}{=} \psi\left(x_{3}, \ldots, x_{d}\right) f_{0}\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right)  \tag{4.9}\\
& \text { for } x=\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{d}\right) \in \mathbb{R}^{d}, \alpha=\left(\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, 0, \ldots, 0\right) \in \mathbb{S}^{d-1} \cap \Xi\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right) \simeq \mathbb{S}^{1},
\end{align*}
$$

where

$$
\begin{equation*}
\psi \in C_{0}^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d-2}\right), \operatorname{supp} \psi=\overline{B^{d-2}} \text { and } \psi(x)>0 \text { for } x \in B^{d-2} . \tag{4.10}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.1), (3.4), (4.8)-(4.10) it follows that:

$$
\begin{align*}
P_{w} f(x, \alpha) & =\int_{\mathbb{R}} w\left(x_{1}+t \alpha_{1}, x_{2}+t \alpha_{2}, x_{3}, \ldots, x_{d}, \alpha\right) f\left(x_{1}+t \alpha_{1}, x_{2}+t \alpha_{2}, x_{3}, \ldots, x_{d}\right) d t \\
& =\psi\left(x_{3}, \ldots, x_{d}\right) \int_{\mathbb{R}} w_{0}\left(x_{1}+t \alpha_{1}, x_{2}+t \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}\right) f_{0}\left(x_{1}+t \alpha_{1}, x_{2}+t \alpha_{2}\right) d t \\
& =\psi\left(x_{3}, \ldots, x_{d}\right) P_{w_{0}} f_{0}\left(x_{1}, x_{2}, \alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}\right)=0 \text { for any } \alpha=\left(\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, 0, \ldots, 0\right) \in \Xi\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right) \cap \mathbb{S}^{d-1} \simeq \mathbb{S}^{1} . \tag{4.11}
\end{align*}
$$

Properties (4.4)-(4.6) follow from (2.15)-(2.17), (2.19), (3.2), (3.3), (4.7), (4.8).
Theorem 1 is proved.

## 5 Proof of formula (2.18)

Note that

$$
\begin{equation*}
\operatorname{dim}\left(\Xi\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right)\right)+\operatorname{dim}(\Sigma(s, \theta))=d+1>d \tag{5.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

which implies that the intersection $\Sigma(s, \theta) \cap \Xi\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right)$ is one of the following:

1. The intersection is the one dimensional line $l=l(s, \theta)$ :

$$
\begin{equation*}
l(s, \theta)=\left\{x \in \mathbb{R}^{d}: x=x_{0}(s, \theta)+\alpha(\theta) t, t \in \mathbb{R}\right\}, \alpha(\theta) \in \mathbb{S}^{2} \tag{5.2}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $x_{0}(s, \theta)$ is an arbitrary point of $\Sigma(s, \theta) \cap \Xi\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right)$, the orientation of $\alpha(\theta)$ is chosen such that:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\operatorname{det}\left(\alpha(\theta), \theta, e_{3}, \ldots, e_{d}\right)>0 \tag{5.3}
\end{equation*}
$$

Condition (5.3) fixes uniquely the direction of $\alpha(\theta)$ of (5.2). Formulas (2.10), (2.11), (2.12) imply that (5.3) can hold if and only if $\theta \notin \Theta\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right)$.
2. The intersection is the two-dimensional plane $\Xi\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right)$. Formulas (2.10), (2.11) imply that it is the case if and only if

$$
\begin{equation*}
s=0, \theta \perp e_{1}, \theta \perp e_{2} \tag{5.4}
\end{equation*}
$$

3. The intersection is an empty set. Formulas (2.10), (2.11) imply that it is the case if and only if

$$
\begin{equation*}
s \neq 0, \theta \perp e_{1}, \theta \perp e_{2} \tag{5.5}
\end{equation*}
$$

Note that

$$
\begin{equation*}
\text { cases } 2 \text { and } 3 \text { occur if and only if } \theta \perp e_{1}, \theta \perp e_{2} \text {, i.e., } \theta \in \Theta\left(e_{1}, e_{2}\right) \text {. } \tag{5.6}
\end{equation*}
$$

This completes the proof of formula (2.18).

## 6 Acknowledgments

This work is partially supported by the PRC $n^{\circ} 1545$ CNRS/RFBR: Équations quasi-linéaires, problèmes inverses et leurs applications.

## References

[Bey84] G. Beylkin. The inversion problem and applications of the generalized Radon transform. Communications on pure and applied mathematics, 37(5):579-599, 1984.
[BQ87] J. Boman, E. Quinto. Support theorems for real-analytic Radon transforms. Duke Mathematical Journal, 55(4):943-948, 1987.
[Bom93] J. Boman. An example of non-uniqueness for a generalized Radon transform. Journal d'Analyse Mathematique, 61(1):395-401, 1993.
[GN16] F. O. Goncharov, R. G. Novikov. An analog of Chang inversion formula for weighted Radon transforms in multidimensions. Eurasian Journal of Mathematical and Computer Applications, 4(2):23-32, 2016.
[Gon17] F. O. Goncharov. Iterative inversion of weighted Radon transforms in 3D. arXiv:1611.10209, 2017.
[MQ85] A. Markoe, E. Quinto. An elementary proof of local invertibility for generalized and attenuated Radon transforms. SIAM Journal on Mathematical Analysis, 16(5):1114-1119, 1985.
[Mor01] S. Morita. Geometry of differential forms. American Mathematical Society., 2001.
[Rad17] J. Radon. Uber die Bestimmung von Funktionen durch ihre Integralwerte längs gewisser Mannigfaltigkeiten. Ber. Saechs Akad. Wiss. Leipzig, Math-Phys, 69:262-267, 1917.


[^0]:    *CMAP, Ecole Polytechnique, CNRS, Université Paris-Saclay, 91128 Palaiseau, France; email: fedor.goncharov.ol@gmail.com
    ${ }^{\dagger}$ IEPT RAS, 117997 Moscow, Russia; email: roman.novikov@polytechnique.edu

