



HAL
open science

What is the main feature of human language?

Leonardo Barón Birchenall

► **To cite this version:**

Leonardo Barón Birchenall. What is the main feature of human language?. 56è Congrès National de la Société Française de Psychologie, Sep 2015, Strasbourg, France. hal-01542545

HAL Id: hal-01542545

<https://hal.science/hal-01542545>

Submitted on 19 Jun 2017

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

What is the main feature of human language?

	Human	Great ape	Small ape	Monkey								Songbird	Bird	Rodent	Bat	Dolphin	Dog	Honey bee									
ANIMAL	Human	Chimpanzee	Bonobo	Gorilla	Lar gibbon	Silvery gibbon	Grivet	Campbell's	Polly-nosed	Black-fronted titi	Diana	Marmoset	Tamarin	Japanese macaque	European starling	Zebra finch	Japanese quail	Parrot	House mouse	Brown rat	Chinchilla	Brazilian free-tailed	Free-tailed	Nathusius pipistrelle	Oceanic	Dog	Honey bee
General																											
Partial asymmetric cerebral areas	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓									✓	✓		✓									
Awareness of others' mental states	✓	/	?	?																					?		
Sensitive period of learning	✓														✓	✓		X									
Vocal learning capacities	✓	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	✓	✓		✓	/	/	/	/	/	/			
Fast mapping	✓																	?								/	
Displacement	✓	/	/	/														?							?	✓	
Turn taking	✓	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	✓	?	?				?							?		
Innate predispositions	✓	/	/	/	/	/	/	/	/	/	/	/	/	/	✓	✓		/	/	/	/	/	/	/	/	/	/
Functionally referential	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	X	X	X	✓				✓	✓	✓	?	✓	
Reference of abstract entities	✓	?	?	?																		✓	✓	✓	?	✓	
Purpose																											
Mating, defending and alerting purposes	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Social purposes	✓	?	?	?	?	?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	?	?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Intentionality	✓	/	?	?	?	?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Flexible vocal comprehension	✓	/	/	/	/	/	/	/	/	/	/	/	/	/	✓	✓		?				/	/	/		✓	
Isochrony discrimination	✓	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	✓	✓	✓						
Detection of predictive dependencies between elements	✓	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?						
Perception																											
Words recognition in the speech signal	✓	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	✓	✓	✓						
Extraction of algebraic rules in the speech signal	✓	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	X	X	X						
Phoneme discrimination	✓	?	?	?	?	?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓						
Production																											
Vocal combinations	✓	/	/	/	✓	✓	/	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	/	/	/	✓	✓	✓		
Sign combinations	✓	✓	✓	?																							
Duality of patterning	✓	?	?	?	?	?	?	✓	?	?	?	?	?	?	✓	✓		✓									
Dialects	✓						?	?	?	?	?	?	?	?	✓	✓	✓				✓	✓	✓				
Tail recursion	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓								
Center-embedded recursion (*)	/	?	?	?								X		/	?												

Have	✓	Ongoing / Possible research	?
Have-Restricted	/	Empirical data existent	
Have not	X	Plausible generalizations / assumptions	

What is the Main Feature of Human Language?

Some theorists believe that human language has an exclusive feature called *recursion*. In plain words, recursion is a process of adding items in a sequence, as many times as needed to create a longer sequence. There are at least two kinds of recursion, *tail recursion* (TR) and *center-embedded recursion* (CER). In TR items are added in the extreme of the sequence, as in the following example (from Corballis, 2007):

This is the house that Jack built. → This is the malt that lay in the house that Jack built. → This is the rat that ate the malt that lay in the house that Jack built.

In CER items are added in the center of the sequence, as in the following example (from Corballis, 2007):

The malt that the rat ate lay in the house that Jack built. → The malt that the rat that the cat killed ate lay in the house that Jack built.

Despite the existence of empirical evidence on certain songbirds' capacity to process CER, the mainstream academic opinion is that all the non-human communication systems can be explained in terms of TR. Nevertheless, apparently CER is very difficult to process, even for humans. Some theorists have claimed that CER is not present in the children's speech, and that in the adult's speech is very rare and has serious restrictions. So, if it turns out that CER is not the main and exclusive feature of the human language, which one could it be? Just look at the table above and pick your favorite!

[Corballis, M. (2007). Recursion, Language, and Starlings. *Cognitive Science*, 31(4), 697-704]