HAL open science

Reply to 'Strongly-driven Re + CO2 redox reaction at high-pressure and high-temperature'

Mario Santoro, Federico A. Gorelli, Roberto Bini, Ashkan Salamat, Gaston Garbarino, Claire Levelut, Olivier Cambon, Julien Haines

To cite this version:

Mario Santoro, Federico A. Gorelli, Roberto Bini, Ashkan Salamat, Gaston Garbarino, et al.. Reply to 'Strongly-driven Re + CO2 redox reaction at high-pressure and high-temperature'. Nature Communications, 2016, 7, pp.13538. 10.1038/ncomms13538 . hal-01531002

HAL Id: hal-01531002

https://hal.science/hal-01531002v1

Submitted on 8 Jun 2021

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License

nature COMMUNICATIONS

DOI: 10.1038/ncomms13538 OPEN

Correspondence: Reply to 'Strongly-driven $Re + CO_2$ redox reaction at high-pressure and high-temperature'

Mario Santoro[1,2], Federico A. Gorelli[1,2], Roberto Bini[2,3], Ashkan Salamat[4], Gaston Garbarino[4], Claire Levelut[5], Olivier Cambon[6] & Julien Haines[6]

Nature Communications 7:13538 doi: 10.1038/ncomms13538 (2016); Published 29 Nov 2016

Santamaria-Perez *et al.*[1] attempt to reproduce our CO_2–SiO_2 solid solution[2]. In their study[1], mixtures of CO_2 and SiO_2 similar to those studied in our work[2] were indirectly laser heated up to 2,400 K and 50 GPa by using Re as an internal heater, and a CO_2–SiO_2 solid solution was not obtained. Instead, the only temperature quenched crystalline phases identified by X-ray diffraction were: known polymorphs of pure CO_2 and SiO_2, Re and ReO_2. In particular, the structure of ReO_2 was identified as being the β-ReO_2 (Pbcn), which is a well known phase of this oxide discovered many decades ago (ref. 9 in the letter). ReO_2 was then inferred to form from a high P–T, $Re + CO_2$ redox reaction. Moreover, it is shown that β-ReO_2 may provide a better fit to our XRD pattern than the cristobalite-like CO_2–SiO_2 solid solution. A shadow is then cast on the very existence of this solid solution.

In light of this study[1], we have reanalysed all our data, and realized that more complex chemical reactions may have occurred in our samples due to the extreme high temperatures: $T > 4{,}000$ K. To make the reaction between CO_2 and SiO_2 as efficient as possible, we understood that starting from confined CO_2 in a SiO_2 zeolite was not sufficient and then we planned and managed to heat the sample at conditions where both CO_2 and SiO_2 are fluid. The aim was to react them together starting from an ideal, hot, highly mobile mixture. For achieving very high temperatures, we insulated diamond using thick NaCl layers pelleted on it. Then, in principle, we carefully avoided laser heating the Re gasket. Nevertheless, we recognize that the laser spot may have hit the gasket at some point and/or the hot fluid sample may have drifted toward the gasket where spurious reactions with Re may have occurred. We have now reanalysed all our XRD patterns, including those at room pressure where potential volatile components (for example, CO_2) are absent making data interpretation as simple and clean as possible. Indeed, we confirm that the β-ReO_2 provides a better fit to the new phase than cristobalite. The lack of XRD Bragg peaks of stishovite in our samples, which was found in the letter by Santamaria-Perez, may be easily explained with liquid SiO_2 being temperature quenched in a glassy form. Our results thus do not prove the existence of a CO_2–SiO_2 solid solution and β-ReO_2 is indeed one of the materials synthesized in our experiment. Also, Raman data show that the chemistry was even more complex in our study. We now have an alternative explanation for the dominant Raman peak with five, fine-structure components[2]. This spectrum matches exactly that of crystalline Cl_2 (ref. 3), which clearly came from a partial dissociation of the NaCl insulating layers. Incidentally, we note that very recent studies show that simple salts, such as NaCl and KCl, may undergo major chemical changes upon laser heating at high pressures[4,5] (see also ref. 5 for an updated Raman spectrum of solid Cl_2). We recall, as noted in our original paper[2], that some microcrystalline/amorphous carbon was also formed in our laser-heated sample. In conclusion, we think that our revised data interpretation is consistent with the very complex chemistry that occurred in our study under extreme conditions, one potential chemical reaction path being CO_2 decomposed and, as a result, both Re from the gasket and NaCl were partially oxidized by the available free oxygen. Pure, molecular chlorine was then released after oxidization of NaCl. Decomposition of CO_2 and oxidation of Re and NaCl finally led to free carbon available to form graphite. We can resume this potential reaction as:

$$n\mathrm{Re} + 2m\mathrm{NaCl} + l\mathrm{CO_2} \rightarrow n\mathrm{ReO_2} + \mathrm{Na}_{2m}\mathrm{O}_h + m\mathrm{Cl_2} + l\mathrm{C(graphite)},\ \text{with}\ h + 2n = 2l. \quad (1)$$

[1] Istituto Nazionale di Ottica, Consiglio Nazionale delle Ricerche (INO-CNR), 50019 Sesto Fiorentino, Italy. [2] European Laboratory for Non Linear Spectroscopy (LENS), 50019 Sesto Fiorentino, Italy. [3] Dipartimento di Chimica dell'Università di Firenze, 50019 Sesto Fiorentino, Italy. [4] European Synchrotron Radiation Facility, 38343 Grenoble, France. [5] Laboratoire Charles Coulomb, UMR 5221, Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique (CNRS), Département Colloïdes, Verres et Nanomatériaux (CVN), Université Montpellier 2, 34095 Montpellier, France. [6] Institut Charles Gerhardt Montpellier, UMR 5253, Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique (CNRS), Equipe C2M, Université Montpellier 2, 34095 Montpellier, France. Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to M.S. (email: santoro@lens.unifi.it).

References

1. Santamaria-Perez, D. *et al.* Correspondence: strongly-driven Re + CO_2 redox reaction at high-pressure and high-temperature. *Nat. Commun.* **7,** 13647 (2016).
2. Santoro, M. *et al.* Carbon enters silica forming a cristobalite-type CO_2–SiO_2 solid solution. *Nat. Commun.* **5,** 3761 (2014).
3. Johannsen, P. G. & Holzapfel, W. B. Effect of pressure on Raman spectra of solid chlorine. *J. Phys. C* **16,** L1177–L1179 (1983).
4. Zhang, W. *et al.* Unexpected stable stoichiometries of sodium chlorides. *Science* **342,** 1502–1505 (2013).
5. Zhang, W. *et al.* Stability of numerous novel potassium chlorides at high pressure. *Sci. Rep.* **6,** 26265 (2016).

Additional information

Competing financial interests: The authors declare no competing financial interests.

Reprints and permission information is available online at http://npg.nature.com/reprintsandpermissions/

How to cite this article: Santoro, M. *et al.* Correspondence: Reply to 'Strongly-driven Re + CO_2 redox reaction at high-pressure and high-temperature'. *Nat. Commun.* **7,** 13538 doi: 10.1038/ncomms13538 (2016).

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article's Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in the credit line; if the material is not included under the Creative Commons license, users will need to obtain permission from the license holder to reproduce the material. To view a copy of this license, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/

© The Author(s) 2016