

# **Benthic algae stimulate leaf litter decomposition in detritus-based headwater streams: a case of aquatic priming effect?**

Michael Danger, Julien Cornut, Eric Chauvet, Paola Chavez, Arnaud Elger, Antoine Lecerf

# **To cite this version:**

Michael Danger, Julien Cornut, Eric Chauvet, Paola Chavez, Arnaud Elger, et al.. Benthic algae stimulate leaf litter decomposition in detritus-based headwater streams: a case of aquatic priming effect?. Ecology, 2013, vol. 94, pp. 1604-1613. 10.1890/12-0606.1 . hal-00958357

# **HAL Id: hal-00958357 <https://hal.science/hal-00958357v1>**

Submitted on 12 Mar 2014

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



# Open Archive TOULOUSE Archive Ouverte (OATAO)

OATAO is an open access repository that collects the work of Toulouse researchers and makes it freely available over the web where possible.

This is an author-deposited version published in : http://oatao.univ-toulouse.fr/ Eprints ID : 11102

> **To link to this article** : doi:10.1890/12-0606.1 URL : http://dx.doi.org/10.1890/12-0606.1

**To cite this version** : Danger, Michael and Cornut, Julien and Chauvet, Eric and Chavez, Paola and Elger, Arnaud and Lecerf, Antoine Benthic algae stimulate leaf litter decomposition in detritus-based headwater streams: a case of aquatic priming effect? (2013) Ecology, vol. 94 (n° 7). pp. 1604-1613. ISSN 0012-9658

Any correspondance concerning this service should be sent to the repository administrator: staff-oatao@listes-diff.inp-toulouse.fr

# Benthic algae stimulate leaf litter decomposition in detritus-based headwater streams: a case of aquatic priming effect?

MICHAEL DANGER, <sup>1,5</sup> JULIEN CORNUT, <sup>1,2</sup> ERIC CHAUVET, <sup>3,4</sup> PAOLA CHAVEZ, <sup>3</sup> ARNAUD ELGER, <sup>3,4</sup> AND ANTOINE LECERF<sup>3,4</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Université de Lorraine, UMR CNRS 7360, Laboratoire Interdisciplinaire des Environnements Continentaux, Avenue du Général Delestraint, 57070 Metz, France<br>2 Leibniz-Institute of Freshwater Ecology and Inland Fisheries, Department of Limnology of Stratified Lakes, Alte Fischerhütte 2,

16775 Stechlin-Neuglobsow, Germany<br><sup>3</sup>Université de Toulouse, INP, UPS, EcoLab (Laboratoire Ecologie Fonctionnelle et Environnement), 118 Route de Narbonne,

31062 Toulouse, France<br><sup>4</sup>CNRS, EcoLab, 31062 Toulouse, France

Abstract. In detritus-based ecosystems, autochthonous primary production contributes very little to the detritus pool. Yet primary producers may still influence the functioning of these ecosystems through complex interactions with decomposers and detritivores. Recent studies have suggested that, in aquatic systems, small amounts of labile carbon (C) (e.g., producer exudates), could increase the mineralization of more recalcitrant organic-matter pools (e.g., leaf litter). This process, called priming effect, should be exacerbated under lownutrient conditions and may alter the nature of interactions among microbial groups, from competition under low-nutrient conditions to indirect mutualism under high-nutrient conditions. Theoretical models further predict that primary producers may be competitively excluded when allochthonous C sources enter an ecosystem. In this study, the effects of a benthic diatom on aquatic hyphomycetes, bacteria, and leaf litter decomposition were investigated under two nutrient levels in a factorial microcosm experiment simulating detritusbased, headwater stream ecosystems. Contrary to theoretical expectations, diatoms and decomposers were able to coexist under both nutrient conditions. Under low-nutrient conditions, diatoms increased leaf litter decomposition rate by 20% compared to treatments where they were absent. No effect was observed under high-nutrient conditions. The increase in leaf litter mineralization rate induced a positive feedback on diatom densities. We attribute these results to the priming effect of labile C exudates from primary producers. The presence of diatoms in combination with fungal decomposers also promoted decomposer diversity and, under low-nutrient conditions, led to a significant decrease in leaf litter C:P ratio that could improve secondary production. Results from our microcosm experiment suggest new mechanisms by which primary producers may influence organic matter dynamics even in ecosystems where autochthonous primary production is low.

Key words: aquatic hyphomycetes; aquatic priming effect; bacteria; diatoms; leaf litter decomposition; microbial assemblage; nutrient level; primary producer–decomposer interactions.

#### **INTRODUCTION**

Primary production and the decomposition of detritus are fundamental processes driving ecosystem functioning (Lindeman 1942, Odum 1956). Ecological research on these two processes has largely developed independently, despite plausible mechanisms linking the activities of primary producers and microbial decomposers. The balance between detritus mineralization by decomposers and competition for inorganic nutrients in a producer–decomposer system determines the rate of carbon (C) and nutrient cycling in ecosystems (Bratbak and Thingstad 1985, Harte and Kinzig 1993, Daufresne and Loreau 2001, and Fig. 1). High C-to-nutrient ratios of plant detritus entail that decomposers must immobilize inorganic nutrients from their environment to fulfill their stoichiometric demand (Daufresne and Loreau 2001, Moore et al. 2004). Decomposers are better competitors than producers for nutrient resources (Currie and Kalff 1984), and the growth of primary producers can be strongly reduced in the presence of decomposers (Bratbak and Thingstad 1985, Gurung et al. 1999, Mindl et al. 2005, Danger et al. 2007b). The dependence of decomposers on the production of detritus by producers is therefore an important condition allowing the stable coexistence of both groups, and competitive exclusion of producers should be expected in the case of high allochthonous C supply (Daufresne and Loreau 2001).

Based on metabolism estimates using energy and  $5$  E-mail: michael.danger@univ-lorraine.fr have nutrient budgets or isotopic approaches, ecologists have

long distinguished between primary producer- and detritus-based systems where primary production or decomposition, respectively, are thought to be the dominant drivers of ecosystem functioning (Moore et al. 2004). In detritus-based systems, autochthonous primary production is often limited by abiotic (e.g., light) and/or biotic (e.g., grazing) factors. Consequently, the detrital pool is mainly fueled by allochthonous organic matter inputs from adjacent producer-based systems (Fisher and Likens 1973). Numerous studies have quantified the importance of primary production and allochthonous detritus decomposition in detritusbased systems (e.g., Rosenfeld and Roff 1991, Findlay et al. 1993, Roberts et al. 2007), and primary production is now increasingly recognized as a nonnegligible process. However, little is known concerning the influence of primary production on decomposers activity and on the potential interactions between the two types of energy sources, allochthonous and autochthonous.

A minor contribution of autochthonous primary production to ecosystem metabolism and energy flows may not necessarily indicate that living primary producers are unimportant for ecosystem functioning. In particular, living primary producers may stimulate allochthonous organic matter degradation by providing high-quality resource subsidies to heterotrophic decomposers and detritivores. There is evidence that small amounts of labile C exudates released by primary producers can substantially accelerate the decomposition of slow-turnover pools of organic matter (often referred to as recalcitrant organic matter), a process called the ''priming effect'' in both terrestrial (Kuzyakov et al. 2000, Fontaine and Barot 2005) and aquatic (Guenet et al. 2010, Bianchi 2011) ecosystems. In a recent review, Guenet et al. (2010) proposed that algaemediated stimulation of the detrital pathway may depend on nutrient concentrations. Under high-nutrient conditions (Fig. 1A), competition for nutrients between decomposers and primary producers is expected to be low. Nutrient-unlimited algae should also decrease the fraction of their production released as C exudates (Scott et al. 2008, Ziegler and Lyon 2010). In contrast, under low-nutrient conditions (Fig. 1B), competition for inorganic nutrients should be maximized, resulting in reduced algal growth, since decomposers are superior competitors for nutrients than plants (Currie and Kalff 1984). Nutrient-limited algae should also increase their release of labile C exudates (Scott et al. 2008, Ziegler and Lyon 2010), which could potentially stimulate the mineralization of recalcitrant organic matter through a "priming effect" (Guenet et al. 2010). In detritus-based ecosystems, oligotrophic conditions often prevail, suggesting that even low densities of living primary producers may enhance allochthonous organic matter decomposition. In addition to the priming effect, primary producers could also directly alter detritus elemental and biochemical quality, which could affect detritivore feeding and rates of organic matter process-





FIG. 1. A conceptual model of the interactions between benthic algae and decomposers in headwater streams (adapted from Daufresne and Loreau [2001]). Arrows represent matter transfers; arrow width is proportional to the magnitude of transfers. Dotted and continuous lines represent competitive interactions and mutualistic pathways, respectively. (A) Under high-nutrient conditions, competition is reduced, and C exudates released by nutrient-unlimited algae represent a minimal fraction of primary production (Scott et al. 2008, Ziegler and Lyon 2010). (B) Under low-nutrient conditions, competition for inorganic nutrient is high, resulting in reduced algal growth, since decomposers are superior to plants in competition for nutrients (Currie and Kalff 1984). Nutrient limitation also stimulates the release of algal C exudates (Lyon and Ziegler 2009). The use of this labile C by decomposers should, in turn, increase the mineralization of recalcitrant organic matter through a ''priming effect'' (Guenet et al. 2010).

ing. Plant detritus is often a poor source of nutrients (high C to nutrient ratios, Hessen et al. 2004, 2008) and essential fatty acids (Torres-Ruiz and Wehr 2010) for detritivores. Living primary producers are rich in these essential compounds, and consumption of litter-associated primary producers by detritivores may help meet their nutritional requirements and maintain high detritus-processing activity (Franken et al. 2005, Torres-Ruiz and Wehr 2010).

Studies of forested streams, where allochthonous leaf litter is the main source of energy and nutrients (Fisher and Likens 1973, Tank et al. 2010), have contributed greatly to our knowledge about the structure and functioning of detritus-based ecosystems (Moore et al. 2004). In addition to detritivorous invertebrates, submerged leaf litter is colonized and processed by bacteria and aquatic hyphomycetes (fungi), with the latter being the pioneer microbial decomposers that are dominant both in terms of biomass and litter-processing efficiency (Gessner and Chauvet 1994, Hieber and Gessner 2002). Although primary production is typically low in forested streams due to shading (Hill et al. 1995), benthic algae are often found on submerged leaf litter (Hax and Golladay 1993, Franken et al. 2005, Albariño et al. 2008). Recent studies have established links between light, aquatic hyphomycetes, invertebrate detritivores, and leaf litter decomposition, which have all been interpreted as indirect evidence of a response of litter consumers to litter-associated algae (Franken et al. 2005, Rier et al. 2007, Albariño et al. 2008, Lagrue et al. 2011). However, these studies fell short of elucidating the mechanisms underlying the apparent control of algae presence on leaf litter decomposition rates.

In this study, we used experimental microcosms to examine interactions between periphytic algae and microbial decomposers (fungi  $+$  bacteria), focusing on how algae alter decomposer activity and detritus decomposition. Because the nature and strength of the interactions between decomposers and primary producers are likely to be determined by inorganic nutrients (Fig. 1), we adopted a factorial design to assess effects of algae and nutrients on microbial decomposition of leaf litter. We also assessed the consequences of the presence of algae on detritus elemental quality. We specifically predicted that (1) decomposer activity would be controlled by nutrient availability and the presence of primary producers, such that algal production would elicit a ''priming effect'' on leaf litter decomposition that would be more pronounced under low-nutrient conditions; (2) primary producers would control the interactions between bacteria and fungi; and (3) primary producers would improve detritus nutrient content.

### **METHODS**

### Experimental design

We conducted a  $3 \times 2 \times 4$  factorial microcosm experiment, manipulating the composition of microorganism inoculum (three microbial assemblages, algae, fungi, and algae  $+$  fungi) and dissolved nutrient availability (two levels, high and low N and P contents) with measures repeated four times (10, 21, 31, and 42 d after the beginning of the experiment). On each sampling date, microcosms were destructively sampled at random to determine microbial responses. There were three (algae only) and four (fungi and algae  $+$  fungi) replicates per nutrient treatment.

Microcosms consisted of 250-mL Erlenmeyer flasks incubated at  $15^{\circ}$ C under a 12:12 hour photoperiod at 100  $\mu$ mol·m<sup>-2</sup>·s<sup>-1</sup> photosynthetically active radiation intensity. Flasks were placed on orbital shakers set at 70 rpm to ensure continuous water aeration. All microcosms were supplied with 30 sterile (autoclaved, 15 min at 121°C) 15-mm-diameter disks of freshly abscised, airdried leaves of alder (Alnus glutinosa Gaertn.), the dominant riparian tree species in southwestern France. The average initial leaf disk mass was determined to the nearest 0.01 mg from four independent sets of 30 autoclaved and freeze-dried leaf disks. Initial molar C:N and C:P ratios of autoclaved alder leaf litter were 20.6 and 3899, respectively. Microcosms were filled with 75 mL of either a low-nutrient (560  $\mu$ g N/L and 60  $\mu$ g P/L) or high-nutrient (5.6 mg N/L and 600 µg P/L) sterile medium. The N:P ratio of the culture medium  $(=20.7 \text{ on } 200)$ a molar basis) was comparable with values determined in the water of headwater streams of southwestern France. Preliminary studies enabled us to determine nutrient and C levels (1.58 g leaf C/L) in this batch experiment, in order to (1) avoid total nutrient depletion before the culture medium was renewed (i.e., 65 mL every five or six days) in high-nutrient conditions, and (2) to reach P limitation in low-nutrient conditions. Silicon (Si) was supplied in excess (250 µmol Na<sub>2</sub>SiO<sub>3</sub>/ L), resulting in high Si:N ratios that prevented Silimitation of diatom growth (Gilpin et al. 2004). The culture medium also consisted of all the other mineral elements making up the COMBO medium (Kilham et al. 1998), but for these elements, a fivefold dilution was applied to match the nutrient conditions of the oligotrophic softwater streams from which algae, fungi, and bacteria originated.

# Biological assemblages

Microcosms were inoculated with an assemblage of six abundant, co-occuring species of aquatic hyphomycetes (Tetrachaetum elegans Ingold, Tricladium chaetocladium Ingold, Tetracladium marchalianum de Wildeman, Flagellospora curvula Ingold, Lemmoniera terrestris Tubaki, and Articulospora tetracladia Ingold), and/or a dominant diatom species (Nitzschia palea  $(Kütz.)$  W. Smith). We did not use more algal species for this experiment because diatoms, notably the genus Nitzschia, are by far the most abundant algal group occurring on decaying leaves in streams of southern France (A. Lecerf, personal observation). In addition, all microcosms were inoculated with an assemblage of bacteria contained in 1 mL of filtered stream water passed through sterile glass microfiber filters (GF/C, nominal cutoff: 1.2 µm; Whatman Filters, Clifton, New Jersey, USA). The purpose of this inoculation procedure was to ensure the presence of a taxonomically and functionally diverse assemblage of bacteria in the microcosms (Leflaive et al. 2008).

Aquatic hyphomycetes were isolated from single spores collected in foam from forested streams in southern France. Fungal cultures were maintained in axenic conditions on malt-agar, in petri dishes. Spores suspension of each fungal species were produced by submerging pieces of axenic colonies in agitated Erlenmeyer flasks containing a mineral salt solution  $(100 \text{ mg } CaCl_2, 2H_2O/L, 10 \text{ mg } MgSO_4, 7H_2O/L, 0.5 \text{ g})$ of 3-morpholinopropanesulfonic acid/L, 100 mg  $KNO<sub>3</sub>/$ 

L, and 550 µg  $K_2HPO_4/L$ ) at pH 7.0. Spores (*n* = 10<sup>3</sup>) from each species were introduced to microcosms (treatments: fungi, fungi + algae). Nitzschia palea was isolated in the field and maintained in laboratory conditions. Precultures were grown in COMBO medium supplied with higher levels of Si (250 µmol  $\text{Na}_2\text{SiO}_3/L$ ). Algal cells  $(n = 10<sup>4</sup>)$  were introduced to microcosms (treatments: algae, fungi  $+$  algae) at the beginning of the experiment.

#### Response variables

On each sampling date, we determined the abundance of diatoms (free and detached from the microcosm walls) and aquatic hyphomycete spores in the culture medium of each microcosm. Using leaf disks recovered on each sampling date, we quantified the density of attached algae, biomass of leaf-associated mycelium, leaf mass remaining, and leaf C:N:P ratios. In addition, we determined bacterial density on leaf disks recovered at day 31, when algal development reached maximal values in most treatments. Diatom, fungal spore, and bacterial samples were preserved in 2% buffered formaldehyde, and stored at  $4^{\circ}$ C until processing. Leaf disks for determination of fungal biomass, leaf mass remaining, and C:N:P ratios were frozen at  $-18^{\circ}$ C prior to analyses.

Diatoms that were not attached to leaf disks (i.e., free and attached to microcosm walls) were counted using a photonic microscope (Olympus BX41, Olympus, Tokyo, Japan) and a Malassez counting grid, which enables the determination of a minimum density of  $10^3$  cells/mL. Attached diatoms were sonicated on ice for one minute, to remove cells from leaf surfaces, and counted  $(>\!\!300$ cells per sample) using a Malassez counting grid. Total algal abundance represents the sum of all attached and free cells counted within each microcosm.

Culture medium (1–5 mL) was filtered through a membrane filter (5 µm pore size; Millipore, Bedford, Massachusetts, USA) to trap aquatic hyphomycete spores, which were stained with 0.1% Trypan blue in 50% lactic acid. At least 200 spores were counted and identified at a magnification of  $100-200\times$ . Fungal species diversity was assessed by the Simpson's diversity index  $(D)$  calculated as follows:

$$
D = 1 - \sum_{i=1}^{S} p i^2
$$

where  $p_i$  represents the proportion of spores of species  $i$ and S is species richness (Magurran 2004). Fungal biomass on leaf disks was estimated using ergosterol content (Gessner and Chauvet 1993). Frozen litter samples (five leaf disks) were freeze-dried to dryness, weighed, and ergosterol extracted and partially purified by solid-phase extraction (Oasis HLB, 60 mg, 3 mL; Waters Corporation, Milford, Massachusetts, USA). Ergosterol was separated and quantified using highperformance liquid chromatography. Ergosterol concentrations were converted to fungal biomass assuming a conversion factor of 5.5 µg ergosterol/mg fungal dry mass (Gessner and Chauvet 1993). Ergosterol measurements also were used to monitor fungal contamination in algae-alone treatments.

Leaf mass remaining in each microcosm was estimated as the leaf disk mass minus the microbial biomass, i.e., attached algae and fungal mycelia. Leaf mass remaining was expressed as the percentage of final to initial mass of leaf disks. Diatom dry mass was estimated as the product of cell density per unit of leaf surface estimated through direct counts and the mean biomass of individual cells (estimated using a Nitzschia *palea* culture,  $2.09 \times 10^{-10}$  g/cell). Considering the low biomass of algae on leaf disks (maximum of 6.5% of leaf disk mass), potential differences in cell sizes between treatments were assumed to have a negligible effect on leaf mass loss estimations.

The density of bacteria on leaf disks was estimated to control for the development of the inoculated bacterial community in the microcosms and to assess the response of bacteria to the presence of fungi and/or algae. A 500 lL subsample of the sonicated sample used for attached algae counting, as described previously, was stained with 4',6-diamidino-2-phenylindole (DAPI) in the dark for 15 min. A small volume of the suspension was filtered on a black polycarbonate filter (Whatman, Nucleopore 0.2 um). Bacterial densities were assessed by counting a minimum of 300 cells per treatment in stained samples (Porter and Feig 1980) using an epifluorescent light microscope (Olympus BX41).

To assess the effect of microbial inoculum treatment on leaf detritus stoichiometry, C:N:P ratios were determined on 10 freeze-dried, weighed, and ground leaf disks. C and N content were determined using a CHN elementary analyzer (NA 1500 Series 2, Fisons, Manchester, UK). Total P content was determined after persulfate digestion and ammonium molybdate reaction. All elemental ratios are expressed as molar ratios.

# Statistical analyses

Treatment effects on responses were assessed using three-way ANOVA with the microbial treatment, nutrient level, and time set as fixed factors. The condition of independence was achieved thanks to the destructive sampling design adopted in our study. For parameters determined once (cumulative spore number and Simpson's diversity index, bacterial abundance), a two-way ANOVA was performed with microbial treatment and nutrient level as fixed factors. Logtransformation was performed when necessary to meet the assumptions of normality and homoscedasticity. Multiple comparisons were conducted using Tukey's HSD test. Leaf litter decomposition rates  $(k)$  were estimated using an exponential model ( $m_R = m_0 \times e^{-kt}$ ), where  $m_R$  is the leaf mass remaining at time t (days) and  $m_0$  is the initial leaf mass (Bärlocher 2005), and were compared among treatments using profile-likelihood 95% confidence intervals (Venables and Ripley 2002).



FIG. 2. Effects of nutrient level and microbial assemblage on the growth of microorganisms during the 42-day experiment. (A) Numerical response of the diatom Nitzschia palea to nutrient level and presence of aquatic hyphomycetes. (B) Response of mycelial biomass in leaf litter to nutrient level and presence of N. palea. Vertical bars represent  $\pm$ SE.

All statistical analyses were performed using the program R (R Development Core Team 2010). The significance threshold was set at  $P < 0.05$ .

## **RESULTS**

Diatom abundance (Fig. 2A) was on average twofold higher under high- vs. low-nutrient conditions ( $F_{1,40}$  = 41.5,  $P < 0.0001$ ). A significant time  $\times$  fungi  $\times$  nutrient interaction ( $F_{3,40} = 9.1$ ,  $P = 0.0002$ ) hinted at complex responses of diatoms to treatments. The growth of diatoms under high-nutrient conditions was reduced in the presence of aquatic hyphomycetes (peak algal abundance occurred 10 days later). In contrast, under low-nutrient conditions the presence of aquatic hypho-

TABLE 1. Effects of nutrients and algae on production and diversity of aquatic hyphomycete spores.

Nutrient conditions/ microbial assemblage	Cumulative spore number $(10^3 \text{ spores/mL})$	Simpson diversity index
Low nutrient/fungi alone High nutrient/fungi alone Low nutrient/algae $+$ fungi High nutrient/algae $+$ fungi	$67 \pm 11$ $167 \pm 27$ $60 \pm 82$ $198 \pm 41$	$0.53 \pm 0.07$ $0.53 \pm 0.17$ $0.58 \pm 0.08$ $0.63 \pm 0.05$

Notes: Spore production is represented by the cumulative number of spores per milliliter throughout the 42-day experiment. All values are mean  $\pm$  SD.

mycetes led to an increase in diatom abundance on the last date of the experiment (Fig. 2A).

Fungal biomass (Fig. 2B) was not significantly influenced by nutrients  $(F<sub>1,48</sub> = 0.04, P = 0.84)$  or algae  $(F_{1,48} = 4.0, P = 0.051)$ . However, maximal fungal biomass was reached earlier in high- vs. low-nutrient microcosms (time  $\times$  nutrient interaction,  $F_{3,48} = 11.9$ , P  $<$  0.0001). Cumulative spore production (Table 1) was threefold greater under high- than under low-nutrient conditions ( $F_{1,12} = 85.9$ ,  $P < 0.0001$ ). The diversity of spores produced throughout the experiment was relatively constant under high-nutrient conditions, but sharply decreased at the last date of the experiment under low-nutrient conditions (time  $\times$  nutrient interaction,  $F_{3,48} = 10.9$ ,  $P = 0.0001$ , data not shown). Throughout the experiment, the presence of diatoms positively influenced fungal spore diversity as determined by the Simpson index ( $F_{1,48} = 12.0$ ,  $P = 0.001$ ; Table 1). In contrast, diatoms had no significant effect on cumulative spore production ( $F_{1,12} = 0.9$ ,  $P = 0.35$ ).

After 31 days of incubation, when spore production and diversity reached their maximal values, the density of bacteria attached to leaf disks was found to significantly differ among treatments (Fig. 3). Nutrient enrichment had a significant but moderate effect on



FIG. 3. Effects of nutrient level and microbial assemblage on the density of bacteria attached to leaf litter after 31 days of decomposition. Vertical bars represent +SE. The same letters above the bars indicate no significant difference ( $P < 0.05$ ) between treatments according to Tukey's post hoc test.



FIG. 4. Effects of nutrient level and microbial assemblage on leaf litter decomposition, represented as (A) percentage of leaf litter mass remaining through time, and (B) daily decomposition rate  $(k)$ . Vertical bars represent standard errors. Same letters above the bars indicate no significant difference between treatments according to profile-likelihood 95% confidence intervals.

bacteria, with densities being 1.2-fold as great under high- vs. low-nutrient conditions ( $F_{1,14} = 10.2$ ,  $P =$ 0.007). Diatom presence had a strong positive effect on bacterial abundance compared to the fungi-alone treatment  $(F_{2,14} = 43.3, P < 0.0001;$  Fig. 3). This response was absent or reduced when fungi were also added (algae  $+$  fungi) to low- or high-nutrient microcosms  $(F_{2,14} = 8.1, P = 0.005;$  Fig. 3).

Leaf litter decomposition was slowest in the absence of fungi, i.e., only in the presence of bacteria and diatoms, irrespective of the nutrient level (Fig. 4A, B). Under low-nutrient conditions, the addition of diatoms to fungi stimulated leaf litter decomposition (Fig. 4A, B). Despite delayed initial decomposition (Fig. 4A), litter decomposition rates in the presence of diatoms did not significantly differ between low- and high-nutrient microcosms (Fig. 4B). Nutrient level significantly affected litter mass remaining in microcosms  $(F_{1,64} = 35.0, P < 0.0001).$ 

Nutrients, diatoms, and fungi interactively influenced litter stoichiometry (Fig. 5). Leaf litter C:P and C:N ratios were lower under high- vs. low-nutrient conditions  $(F_{1,61} = 205.7, P < 0.0001 \text{ and } F_{1,63} = 66.5, P < 0.0001,$ respectively). The presence of fungi was an important factor controlling the decline in C:P and C:N ratios through time (microbial assemblage:  $F_{2,61} = 12.7$ ,  $P <$ 0.0001 and  $F_{2,63} = 70.6$ ,  $P < 0.0001$ , respectively). On the last date, under low-nutrient conditions, the algae  $+$ fungi treatment showed much lower leaf litter C:P ratios compared to the other microbial assemblages (microbial assemblage  $\times$  nutrient  $\times$  time interaction,  $F_{6,61} = 2.3$ ,  $P =$ 



FIG. 5. Effects of nutrient level and microbial assemblage on leaf litter elemental composition (molar ratios) through time. Vertical bars represent  $\pm$ SE.

0.043). In contrast, algae did not significantly alter leaf litter C:N ratios in low-nutrient treatments through time (microbial assemblage  $\times$  nutrient  $\times$  time interaction,  $F_{2,15} = 1.2, P = 0.33$ .

### **DISCUSSION**

Primary producers and heterotrophic decomposers are keystone functional groups within ecosystems, which can interact in complex ways (Bratbak and Thingstad 1985, Harte and Kinzig 1993, Daufresne and Loreau 2001). Primary producers rely on heterotrophic decomposers for the mineralization of essential nutrients, whereas decomposers are dependent on primary producers to supply energy resources. However, both groups may actively compete for the same inorganic nutrients (Bratbak and Thingstad 1985, Harte and Kinzig 1993). Considering that heterotrophic microorganisms are better competitors for nutrients than primary producers, theoretical models predict that primary producers and decomposers can only coexist if decomposers are limited by the carbon provided by coexisting producers (Bratbak and Thingstad 1985, Daufresne and Loreau 2001). In detritus-based stream ecosystems, decomposers rely almost exclusively on allochthonous organic matter, since autochthonous production is often very low (Fisher and Likens 1973). This large decoupling between plant detritus production and decomposition implies that primary producers should be competitively excluded by decomposers. This prediction was not supported by our experimental study, since diatoms were never totally excluded from fungal treatments. Our results are also in accordance with previous observations on the ubiquity of benthic algae in detritus-based streams, and repeated reports of autotrophic biofilms on submerged leaf litter (e.g., Hax and Golladay 1993). However, observations of algal presence on decaying leaf litter do not rule out the competitive dominance by fungal decomposers. Competition for inorganic nutrients may explain why diatom growth was negligible during the exponential increase in fungal biomass at the beginning of the experiment. Diatom density increased substantially following a decline in fungal biomass, when competition for nutrients was probably less important (Fig. 1). A weak competitive ability of algae has been demonstrated in bacterioplankton–phytoplankton systems (Currie and Kalff 1984, Mindl et al. 2005, Danger et al. 2007a). Therefore, in addition to low light levels (Hill et al. 1995), competition for nutrients between heterotrophic and autotrophic microorganisms constitutes a reasonable explanation for the generally low production of algae in detritus-based streams (Fisher and Likens 1973).

In ecological literature, interactions between bacteria and fungi have often been questioned. Total microbial activity and microbial growth can be increased when bacteria and fungi co-occur (e.g., Bengtsson 1992). Nevertheless, most studies have shown that relationships between bacteria and fungi are antagonistic, owing to antibiotic substances produced by fungi (Drews 2000) and to competition for resources (Mille-Lindblom et al. 2006). In forested headwater streams, fungi are often considered as the main decomposers of leaf litter, whereas bacteria play a secondary role during later decomposition stages (Hieber and Gessner 2002). The functional importance and strong competitive ability of aquatic hyphomycetes is supported in our study by the much faster decomposition and substantially reduced bacterial abundance in microcosms with fungi, irrespective of the nutrient level.

In the presence of algae, bacteria were greatly stimulated, and the negative effect of fungi on bacteria was reduced, which may be explained by the availability of labile, algal-based C exudates (Baines and Pace 1991, Danger et al. 2007b, Ziegler and Lyon 2010). Bacteria colonizing detritus are more likely to be limited by the recalcitrance of leaf C than fungi, which did not seem to grow better in the presence of algae. The latter observation is consistent with the fact that the specific enzymes and physiology of fungi enable them to break down and assimilate refractory plant polymers such as lignin and hemicellulose (Romani et al. 2006). Because fungal biomass may be only loosely related to ergosterol content, especially due to the inclusion of nonliving mycelium (Mille-Lindblom et al. 2004), fungal spore production may be more relevant to assess the influence of algal exudates on fungi. Although the presence of diatoms did not significantly stimulate fungal spore production, it did lead to an increase in spore diversity. It is plausible that algae may facilitate the coexistence of multiple fungal species through a diversification of C sources. However, this effect may be less important in streams than in our microcosms due to the high diversity of C sources available in natural ecosystems.

Despite their moderate densities in low-nutrient conditions, diatoms also strongly stimulated the decomposition of leaf litter ( $\sim$ 20% increased mass loss). After 42 days, leaf litter mass remaining was similar under low- and high-nutrient conditions in the presence of algae. Nutrient stress is known to enhance the production of C exudates by algae (Baines and Pace 1991, Scott et al. 2008, Ziegler and Lyon 2010), and these exudates likely constitute an important C resource for decomposers in nutrient-poor streams (Lyon and Ziegler 2009). The ''priming effect'' mediated by algal C exudates provides a reasonable explanation of diatom-enhanced decomposition of leaf litter in our study. This process alters the mineralization rate of low-turnover pools of organic matter following inputs of high-turnover pools of C, especially in low-nutrient environments, and is mainly explained by the utilization of labile C by decomposers to process more refractory compounds (Guenet et al. 2010). The subsequent increase in inorganic nutrients released by decomposers also may explain why diatom abundance increased sharply on the last date of the experiment. This positive feedback is in

accordance with the hypothesis of mutualistic interactions between primary producers and decomposers (Harte and Kinzig 1993, Daufresne and Loreau 2001; Fig. 1). In real stream ecosystems, the intensity of the priming effect and nature of interactions between decomposers and algae may also conceivably vary with time due to changes in key abiotic factors (i.e., light and temperature). Specifically, a strong priming effect is expected to occur in spring, i.e., when primary productivity peaks (e.g., Roberts et al. 2007) and fungal biomass (and thus competition for inorganic nutrients) declines as litter becomes scarcer.

In aquatic ecosystems, labile C inputs can yield an increase of 10–500% in the mineralization rate of refractory C (Guenet et al. 2010). This wide range of variation may partially be explained by differences in labile C concentrations across the studied systems. Specifically, intensity of priming effect could be expected to be lower in streams than in standing water owing to high dilution of algal exudates in flowing water. Our closed microcosms represented an intermediate condition between lotic and lentic habitats, since culture medium was renewed periodically over the experiment, avoiding excessive exudate accumulation. In addition, an exacerbation of algal exudates importance in our microcosms can certainly be rejected based on the following calculation (see the Appendix for more details). When culture conditions are controlled (i.e., low emigration/immigration, low mortality), short-term biomass accrual rate can be used as an index of productivity (Steinman et al. 2006). Fitting exponential growth models on biomass accrual curves (Gessner and Chauvet 1997), maximal algal production in our experiment reached 11 µg C·mg  $C^{-1}$  h<sup>-1</sup>. Considering a C excretion of 45% of total algal primary production (the maximal value found in Ziegler and Lyon 2010), attached algal biomass (4.5 mg C per microcosm) and algal exudates accumulated at the end of the experiment (3.05 mg C per microcosm) were likely to represent a maximum of 3.8% and 2.6% of total allochthonous C (litter), respectively. These proportions are broadly comparable to those commonly found in headwater streams. For example, a headwater stream survey carried out by Rosenfeld and Roff (1991) showed that total autochthonous C produced over one year, including algal biomass accrual and C excretion, represented  $\sim$ 7% of total allochthonous C inputs.

Consistent with previous findings (Cross et al. 2003), leaf litter C to nutrient ratios were primarily determined by both nutrient availability and fungal growth. Changes in nutrient content often result from microbial respiration (C loss) and nutrient immobilization by fungi (Güsewell and Gessner 2009, Sinsabaugh et al. 2009). In the absence of fungi, C:P ratios strongly increased at the beginning of the experiment, probably through leaching of P-rich compounds. The decrease in C:P ratios occurring later can be explained by the growth of nutrient-rich diatoms on the surface of leaf disks. Additionally, after 42 days of decomposition, the association of diatoms and fungi significantly enhanced organic matter elemental quality through a reduction in C:P ratios in low-nutrient microcosms. Leaf litter C:N ratios were unaffected by the presence of diatoms, probably because of the high N:P ratios of culture media favoring P rather than N limitation of microbial growth. Phosphorus is a limiting element for microorganisms and invertebrates in many headwater stream ecosystems (Gessner and Chauvet 1994, Frost and Elser 2002, Cross et al. 2003). Large elemental imbalances exist between consumers and their food in detritus-based ecosystems compared with living plant-based systems, particularly with regard to P content (Cross et al. 2003, 2005). Although we still have a poor understanding of the genuine influence of detritus stoichiometry on detritivore life history traits (but see Danger et al. 2012), studies on plant–herbivore interactions have revealed that consumer growth rates are directly related to the C:P ratios of their resources (e.g., Frost and Elser 2002). Considering the generally elevated C to nutrient ratios of detritus, such elemental constraints could be far more pronounced for detritivores than for herbivores (Cross et al. 2003, 2005). Consequently, the nearly twofold decrease in leaf litter C:P ratio induced by algae in lownutrient conditions could alleviate nutrient imbalances for detritivorous invertebrates and may indirectly promote secondary production and efficiency of energy and nutrient transfers to higher trophic levels in realworld ecosystems (Cross et al. 2003).

To conclude, our experimental study sheds new light on an interesting yet complex relationship between primary producers and decomposers in detritus-based ecosystems. Algal presence in combination with fungal decomposers promoted decomposer diversity, accelerated leaf litter decomposition, and improved the quality of detritus. Such positive feedbacks of algal presence were mainly observed under low-nutrient conditions, suggesting that environmental factors can alter the functional impact of primary producers in detritus-based ecosystems. Moreover, as invertebrates were not included in our experiment, we cannot rule out the possibility that the priming effect is less important in real-world ecosystems due to consumer control on microorganisms. If priming effect is reduced in nutrient-rich conditions, invertebrates could also reduce its intensity through local nutrient enrichment related to invertebrate excretion (Hillebrand and Kahlert 2001). Since heterotrophic streams and other detritus-based ecosystems are key sites for organic matter processing and nutrients and C retention (Moore et al. 2004, Cole et al. 2007), a better grasp of the role of autochthonous C on the fate of allochthonous material in these ecosystems is clearly needed.

#### **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

M. Danger, E. Chauvet, A. Elger, and A. Lecerf designed the experiments; M. Danger, J. Cornut, and P. Chavez carried out the experiments; and M. Danger and A. Lecerf wrote the

manuscript. We are grateful to Sylvain Lamothe and Didier Lambrigot for their help in laboratory analyses, and to Loïc Ten-Hage for furnishing the algal strain. The manuscript also benefited from constructive suggestions by John S. Kominoski, Florence Maunoury-Danger, Peter R. Leavitt, Kevin A. Kuehn, and two anonymous reviewers. This study was funded through a project of the French National Program EC2CO (2009-2010) to A. Lecerf and the InBioProcess project of the ANR Biodiversity Program (ANR-2006-BDIV-007) to E. Chauvet.

#### LITERATURE CITED

- Albariño, R., V. Díaz Villanueva, and C. Canhoto. 2008. The effect of sunlight on leaf litter quality reduces growth of the shredder Klapopteryx kuscheli. Freshwater Biology 53:1881– 1889.
- Baines, S. B., and M. L. Pace. 1991. The production of dissolved organic matter by phytoplankton and its importance to bacteria: patterns across marine and freshwater systems. Limnology and Oceanography 36:1078–1090.
- Bärlocher, F. 2005. Leaf mass loss estimated by litter bag technique. Pages  $171-176$  in M. A. S. Graça, F. Bärlocher, and M. O. Gessner, editors. Methods to study litter decomposition: a practical guide. Springer-Verlag, Dordrecht, The Netherlands.
- Bengtsson, G. 1992. Interactions between fungi, bacteria and beech leaves in a stream microcosm. Oecologia 89:542–549.
- Bianchi, T. S. 2011. The role of terrestrially derived organic carbon in the coastal ocean: a changing paradigm and the priming effect. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences USA 108:19473–19481.
- Bratbak, G., and T. F. Thingstad. 1985. Phytoplanktonbacteria interactions: an apparent paradox? Analysis of a model system with both competition and commensalism. Marine Ecology: Progress Series 25:23–30.
- Cole, J. J., et al. 2007. Plumbing the global carbon cycle: Integrating inland waters into the terrestrial carbon budget. Ecosystems 10:171–184.
- Cross, W. F., J. P. Benstead, P. C. Frost, and S. A. Thomas. 2005. Ecological stoichiometry in freshwater benthic systems: recent progress and perspectives. Freshwater Biology 50: 1895–1912.
- Cross, W. F., J. P. Benstead, A. D. Rosemond, and J. B. Wallace. 2003. Consumer-resource stoichiometry in detritusbased streams. Ecology Letters 6:721–732.
- Currie, D. J., and J. Kalff. 1984. A comparison of the abilities of freshwater algae and bacteria to acquire and retain phosphorus. Limnology and Oceanography 29:298–310.
- Danger, M., J. Cornut, A. Elger, and E. Chauvet. 2012. Effects of burial on leaf litter quality, microbial conditioning and palatability to three shredder taxa. Freshwater Biology 57: 1017–1030.
- Danger, M., J. Leflaive, C. Oumarou, L. Ten-Hage, and G. Lacroix. 2007a. Control of phytoplankton-bacteria interactions by stoichiometric constraints. Oikos 116:1079–1086.
- Danger, M., C. Oumarou, D. Benest, and G. Lacroix. 2007b. Bacteria can control stoichiometry and nutrient limitation of phytoplankton. Functional Ecology 21:202–210.
- Daufresne, T., and M. Loreau. 2001. Ecological stoichiometry, primary producer-decomposer interactions, and ecosystem persistence. Ecology 82:3069–3082.
- Drews, J. 2000. Drug discovery: a historical perspective. Science 287:1960–1964.
- Findlay, S., K. Howe, and D. Fontvielle. 1993. Bacterial-algal relationships in streams of the Hubbard Brook experimental forest. Ecology 74:2326–2336.
- Fisher, S. G., and G. E. Likens. 1973. Energy flow in Bear Brook, New Hampshire: an integrative approach to stream ecosystem metabolism. Ecological Monographs 43:421–439.
- Fontaine, S., and S. Barot. 2005. Size and functional diversity of microbe populations control plant persistence and longterm soil carbon accumulation. Ecology Letters 8:1075–1087.
- Franken, R. J. M., B. Waluto, E. T. H. M. Peeters, J. J. P. Gardeniers, J. A. J. Beijer, and M. Scheffer. 2005. Growth of shredders on leaf litter biofilms: the effect of light intensity. Freshwater Biology 50:459–466.
- Frost, P. C., and J. J. Elser. 2002. Growth responses of littoral mayflies to the phosphorus content of their food. Ecology Letters 5:232–240.
- Gessner, M. O., and E. Chauvet. 1993. Ergosterol-to-biomass conversion factors for aquatic hyphomycetes. Applied and Environmental Microbiology 59:502–507.
- Gessner, M. O., and E. Chauvet. 1994. Importance of stream microfungi in controlling breakdown rates of leaf litter. Ecology 75:1807–1817.
- Gessner, M. O., and E. Chauvet. 1997. Growth and production of aquatic hyphomycetes in decomposing leaf litter. Limnology and Oceanography 42:496–505.
- Gilpin, L. C., K. Davidson, and E. Roberts. 2004. The influence of changes in nitrogen: silicon ratios on diatom growth dynamics. Journal of Sea Research 51:21–35.
- Guenet, B., M. Danger, L. Abbadie, and G. Lacroix. 2010. Priming effect: bridging the gap between terrestrial and aquatic ecology. Ecology 91:2850–2861.
- Gurung, T. B., J. Urabe, and M. Nakanishi. 1999. Regulation of the relationship between phytoplankton Scenedesmus acutus and heterotrophic bacteria by the balance of light and nutrients. Aquatic Microbial Ecology 17:27–35.
- Güsewell, S., and M. O. Gessner. 2009. N:P ratios influence litter decomposition and colonization by fungi and bacteria in microcosms. Functional Ecology 23:211–219.
- Harte, J., and A. P. Kinzig. 1993. Mutualism and competition between plants and decomposers: implications for nutrient allocation in ecosystems. American Naturalist 141:829–846.
- Hax, C. L., and S. W. Golladay. 1993. Macroinvertebrate colonization and biofilm development on leaves and wood in a boreal river. Freshwater Biology 29:79–87.
- Hessen, D. O., G. I. Agren, T. R. Andersen, J. J. Elser, and P. C. De Ruiter. 2004. Carbon sequestration in ecosystems: the role of stoichiometry. Ecology 85:1179–1192.
- Hessen, D. O., and T. R. Anderson. 2008. Excess carbon in aquatic organisms and ecosystems: physiological, ecological, and evolutionary implications. Limnology and Oceanography 53:1685–1696.
- Hieber, M., and M. O. Gessner. 2002. Contribution of stream detrivores, fungi, and bacteria to leaf breakdown based on biomass estimates. Ecology 83:1026–1038.
- Hill, W. R., M. G. Ryon, and E. M. Schilling. 1995. Light limitation in a stream ecosystem: responses by primary producers and consumers. Ecology 76:1297–1309.
- Hillebrand, H., and M. Kahlert. 2001. Effect of grazing and nutrient supply on periphyton biomass and nutrient stoichiometry in habitats of different productivity. Limnology and Oceanography 46:1881–1898.
- Kilham, S. S., D. A. Kreeger, S. G. Lynn, C. E. Goulden, and L. Herrera. 1998. COMBO: a defined freshwater culture medium for algae and zooplankton. Hydrobiologia 337:147– 159.
- Kuzyakov, Y., J. K. Friedel, and K. Stahr. 2000. Review of mechanisms and quantification of priming effects. Soil Biology and Biochemistry 32:1485–1498.
- Lagrue, C., J. S. Kominoski, M. Danger, J.-M. Baudoin, S. Lamothe, D. Lambrigot, and A. Lecerf. 2011. Experimental shading alters leaf litter breakdown dynamics in streams of contrasting riparian canopy cover. Freshwater Biology 56: 2059–2069.
- Leflaive, J., M. Danger, G. Lacroix, E. Lyautey, C. Oumarou, and L. Ten-Hage. 2008. Nutrient effects on the genetic and functional diversity of aquatic bacterial communities. FEMS Microbiology Ecology 66:379–390.
- Lindeman, R. L. 1942. The trophic-dynamic aspect of ecology. Ecology 4:399–417.
- Lyon, D. R., and S. E. Ziegler. 2009. Carbon cycling within epilithic biofilm communities across a nutrient gradient of headwater streams. Limnology and Oceanography 54:439– 449.
- Magurran, A. E. 2004. Measuring biological diversity. Blackwell, Oxford, UK.
- Mille-Lindblom, C., H. Fischer, and L. J. Tranvik. 2006. Antagonism between bacteria and fungi: substrate competition and a possible tradeoff between fungal growth and tolerance towards bacteria. Oikos 113:233–242.
- Mille-Lindblom, C., E. Von Wachenfeldt, and L. J. Tranvik. 2004. Ergosterol as a measure of living fungal biomass: persistence in environmental samples after fungal death. Journal of Microbiological Methods 59:253–262.
- Mindl, B., B. Sonntag, J. Pernthaler, J. Vrba, R. Psenner, and T. Posch. 2005. Effects of phosphorus loading on interactions of algae and bacteria: reinvestigation of the 'phytoplanktonbacteria paradox' in continuous cultivation system. Aquatic Microbial Ecology 38:203–213.
- Moore, J. C., et al. 2004. Detritus, trophic dynamics and biodiversity. Ecology Letters 7:584–600.
- Odum, H. T. 1956. Primary production in flowing waters. Limnology and Oceanography 1:102–117.
- Porter, K. G., and Y. S. Feig. 1980. The use of DAPI for identifying and counting aquatic microflora. Limnology and Oceanography 25:943–948.
- R Development Core Team. 2010. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria.
- Rier, S. T., K. A. Kuehn, and S. N. Francoeur. 2007. Algal regulation of extracellular enzyme activity in stream microbial communities associated with inert substrata and detritus. Journal of the North American Benthological Society 26: 439–449.
- Roberts, B. J., P. J. Mulholland, and W. R. Hill. 2007. Multiple scales of temporal variability in ecosystem metabolism rates: results from 2 years of continuous monitoring in a forested headwater stream. Ecosystems 10:588–606.
- Romani, A. M., H. Fischer, C. Mille-Lindblom, and L. J. Tranvik. 2006. Interactions of bacteria and fungi on decomposing litter: differential extracellular enzyme activities. Ecology 87:2559–2569.
- Rosenfeld, J., and J. C. Roff. 1991. Primary production and potential availability of autochthonous carbon in southern Ontario streams. Hydrobiologia 224:99–109.
- Scott, J. T., J. A. Back, J. M. Taylor, and R. S. King. 2008. Does nutrient enrichment decouple algal-bacterial production in periphyton? Journal of the North American Benthological Society 27:332–344.
- Sinsabaugh, R. L., B. H. Hill, and J. J. Follstad Shah. 2009. Ecoenzymatic stoichiometry of microbial organic nutrient acquisition in soil and sediment. Nature 462:795–798.
- Steinman, A. D., G. A. Lamberti, and P. R. Leavitt. 2006. Biomass and pigments of benthic algae. Pages 357–379 in F. R. Hauer and G. A. Lamberti, editors. Methods in stream ecology. Elsevier, Burlington, Massachusetts, USA.
- Tank, J. L., E. J. Rosi-Marshall, N. A. Griffiths, S. A. Entrekin, and M. L. Stephen. 2010. A review of allochthonous organic matter dynamics and metabolism in streams. Journal of the North American Benthological Society 29:118–146.
- Torres-Ruiz, M., and J. D. Wehr. 2010. Changes in the nutritional quality of decaying leaf litter in a stream based on fatty acid content. Hydrobiologia 651:265–278.
- Venables, W. N., and B. D. Ripley. 2002. Modern applied statistics with S. Fourth edition. Springer.
- Ziegler, S. E., and D. R. Lyon. 2010. Factors regulating epilithic biofilm carbon cycling and release with nutrient enrichment in headwater streams. Hydrobiologia 657:71–88.

## SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIAL

#### Appendix

Determining the genuine importance of algae and algal exudates in microcosms (*[Ecological Archives](http://www.esapubs.org/archive/ecol/E094/145/)* E094-145-A1).