# Predicting the growth and yield of Pinus radiata in Bolivia 

Guzmán, Pukkala, Palahí, De-Miguel

## To cite this version:

Guzmán, Pukkala, Palahí, De-Miguel. Predicting the growth and yield of Pinus radiata in Bolivia.
Annals of Forest Science, 2012, 69 (3), pp.335-343. 10.1007/s13595-011-0162-3 . hal-00930734

HAL Id: hal-00930734
https://hal.science/hal-00930734
Submitted on 11 May 2020

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire HAL, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

# Predicting the growth and yield of Pinus radiata in Bolivia 

Gustavo Guzmán • Timo Pukkala • Marc Palahí •<br>Sergio de-Miguel

Received: 23 June 2011 / Accepted: 10 November 2011 /Published online: 6 December 2011
(C) INRA / Springer-Verlag France 2011


#### Abstract

- Context Pinus radiata D. Don is the most widely planted conifer in the Inter-Andean Valleys of Bolivia. However, Bolivia lacks knowledge on stand dynamics and yield prediction of radiata pine, and the particular Bolivian conditions prevent a straightforward application of equations developed elsewhere.


## Handling Editor: Jean Daniel Bontemps

Contribution of the co-authors Gustavo Guzmám: design of sampling methods, data collection, running data analysis, and supervising the field work.
Timo Pukkala: design of sampling, running data analysis, writing the paper, and supervising the scientific work.
Marc Palahí: running data analysis and writing the paper
Sergio de-Miguel: design of sampling methods, running data analysis, writing the paper, and coordinating the research project.

## G. Guzmán

Escuela de Ciencias Forestales,
Universidad Mayor de San Simón,
Final Av. Atahuallpa s/n, Temporal de Cala Cala, Barrio Prefectural,
Cochabamba, Bolivia
T. Pukkala $\cdot \mathrm{S}$. de-Miguel Faculty of Science and Forestry, University of Eastern Finland, P.O. Box 111, 80101 Joensuu, Finland

## M. Palahí

Mediterranean Regional Office, European Forest Institute, Sant Pau Historic Site, Santa Victoria Pavilion, St. Antoni M. Claret, 167,
08025 Barcelona, Spain
S. de-Miguel ( $\triangle$ )

Centre Tecnològic Forestal de Catalunya (CTFC), Ctra. Sant Llorenç de Morunys, km. 2, 25280 Solsona, Spain
e-mail: sergio.demiguel@ctfc.es

- Aims This study developed site index models, individual tree diameter increment models, individual tree height models, and self-thinning models for Bolivian $P$. radiata plantations.
- Methods Dominant height was modeled using the algebraic difference approach. Diameter increment was modeled as a function of tree size, site index, and competition. Individual tree height was modeled as a function of tree diameter, dominant height, and dominant diameter. Self-thinning was modeled as a function of quadratic mean tree diameter.
- Results By using the models, it can be calculated that the mean annual increment in volume with the optimal rotation length is less than $10 \mathrm{~m}^{3} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ on poor sites and $25 \mathrm{~m}^{3} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ on the best sites. Rotation lengths that maximize wood production are $25-30$ years for very good sites and $35-$ 40 years for poor sites.
- Conclusion The models were assembled into a growth and yield simulator, allowing the simulation of stand development and making it possible to predict future yields and to compare alternative management schedules.

Keywords Pine plantations • Site index model • Individual tree modeling $\cdot$ Self-thinning model $\cdot$ Simulation $\cdot$ Forest management

## 1 Introduction

Pinus radiata D. Don is a fast-growing softwood conifer that has been intensively studied since the start of commercial tree plantations at the end of the nineteenth century, especially in New Zealand, Chile, Australia, and Spain, where it has been planted on a large scale (Richardson 1998). The studies have analyzed, among other things, its growth and developed models for evenaged plantation dynamics.

In New Zealand and Australia, much effort has been devoted to growth and mortality modeling and simulation (e.g., Woollons and Hayward 1985; O'Hehir et al. 2000). In Chile, P. radiata modeling has constituted a priority within the forest research agenda during the last decades, and simulation systems have been developed based on both stand and individual tree equations (e.g., Garcia 1970, 1974; Trincado and Leal 2006). More recently, several studies have proposed new equations to model the growth and mortality of local radiata pine plantations in Spain (López-Sánchez et al. 2003; Álvarez-González et al. 2004; Diéguez-Aranda et al. 2005; Castedo-Dorado et al. 2006, 2007; Crecente-Campo et al. 2009).

The history of $P$. radiata in Bolivia is much more recent than in the above-mentioned regions. Exotic species plantations were promoted mainly since the 1960s until the 1990s within international cooperation initiatives dealing with community forestry. P. radiata is locally interesting for multi-purpose forestry in Bolivia as radiata pine forests are considered one of the main sources of sawn-wood, firewood, and mushrooms in the Inter-Andean Valleys. The plantations in Cochabamba represent $71 \%$ of the total planted area in the country, and $P$. radiata represents one of the most utilized species together with Eucalyptus globulus. Tree plantations are generally found in small- or medium-sized holdings, and they are of significant economic importance in impoverished rural areas. P. radiata has been criticized as an exotic species that has been promoted to the detriment of native ones. However, it currently constitutes the only forest cover in many large deforested areas of the region and, therefore, plays an important role in providing environmental services such as reducing erosion and providing habitats of significance to biodiversity.

At present, the oldest plantations are reaching the end of the rotation. Few $P$. radiata stands are properly thinned or
otherwise managed, partly due to the lack of science-based information. Although much research has been done worldwide, Bolivia lacks knowledge on the stand dynamics and yield prediction of radiata pine. The particular Bolivian conditions, when compared to New Zealand, Australia, Chile, or Spain, namely drier climate, higher altitude, poorer soils, and smaller influence of the ocean, prevent a straightforward application of equations developed elsewhere. Therefore, in view of the importance of this species in the area, there is a need for a system that enables reliable growth and yield predictions of $P$. radiata to support plantation management and planning. Among the existing modeling approaches, the empirical individual tree growth models have higher resolution than, for instance, the standlevel ones (Pretzsch et al. 2002) and enable flexible and detailed simulations for even-aged stand dynamics.

The aim of the research reported in this article was to develop a system of models, which allow the simulation of P. radiata stand dynamics in the Inter-Andean Valleys of Bolivia. The model set consisted of site index, diameter increment, tree height, and self-thinning models. The models can be used for decision support to improve forestry decision making and to find optimal management schedules for radiata pine plantations in Bolivia.

## 2 Materials and methods

### 2.1 Data sets

Two different datasets from 45 temporary and 51 permanent plots, covering a wide altitudinal gradient at high-elevation plantations, were used. The permanent plot data were used to fit a site index model. Both datasets ( 96 plots) were used in diameter increment, height, and self-thinning modeling (Table 1).

Table 1 Summary of the data gathered from the temporary and permanent plots

| Variable | Min | Max | Mean |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | ---: |
|  |  |  | All plots | Temporary | Permanent |
| Number of trees/ha |  |  |  |  |  |
| Dominant height, m | 295 | 3,825 | 1,325 | 1,188 | 1,580 |
| Stand age, years | 1.6 | 25.4 | 7.6 | 15.7 | 7.1 |
| Dominant diameter, cm | 1 | 34 | 7.9 | 21.2 | 7.1 |
| Site index, m | 3.6 | 47.1 | 12.2 | 25.0 | 11.4 |
| Tree height, m | 10.5 | 30.8 | 21.0 | 21.4 | 20.2 |
| Diameter at breast height, cm | 1.4 | 27.0 | 6.4 | 14.2 | 5.8 |
| Stand basal area, $\mathrm{m}^{2} / \mathrm{ha}$ | 0.1 | 54.0 | 13.6 | 16.6 | 7.9 |
| Diameter increment, cm/year | 0.3 | 65.4 | 20.0 | 26.2 | 8.5 |
| Altitude, m | 0.05 | 4.90 | 0.95 | 0.6 | 1.5 |

Temporary plots were of variable size and contained approximately 75 trees each. Diameter at breast height ( $d$, centimeters) for every tree and the total tree height ( $h$, meters) and bark thickness of 12 trees of different sizes were measured. The annual growth of the past 5 years was measured for every tree from increment cores. The stand age ( $T$, years) of each plot was computed by adding 1 year to the number of annual rings counted on cores taken from three to five trees bored at $30-\mathrm{cm}$ height. Every permanent plot was $400 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ in area and was measured two to eight times: $d$ was measured from every tree and $h$ either from all trees or from at least three sampled trees. The measurement intervals ranged from 1 to 7 years.

### 2.2 Data preparation

To calculate the height of trees for which height was not measured, the first step of data preparation was to fit a plotwise model for tree height. In the permanent plot data, a separate model was fitted for every measurement. The model was as follows:
$h=1.3+d^{2} /(a+b \times d)^{2}$
where $a$ and $b$ are the parameters to be estimated for every plot or measurement.

Stand dominant height was calculated as the mean height of 100 largest trees/ha. In a very few cases, in the permanent plot data, there were less than five height measurements. In these cases, plot- and measurement-specific height model was not used, but the missing heights were calculated from all height measurements of the permanent plots using the following model, which was based on all height measurements on the permanent sample plots:
$h=1.3+T^{0.367}\left[\frac{d^{2}}{(2.504+0.340 d)^{2}}\right]$
In the temporary plot data, another model was fitted between single bark thickness (bark, millimeters) and diameter at breast height ( $d$, centimeters). This model was used to convert the measured under-bark radial increments into over-bark diameter growth. The method is a simplification but with negligible consequences. The model was common for all plots. The bark model was as follows:
bark $=7.008+0.138 \times d$
The bark model and the measured radial increments were used to backtrack the tree and stand development of the temporary plots. Diameter under- and over-bark as well as stand variables were calculated backward for 5 years using 1 -year steps. In permanent plots, diameter increment was obtained as the difference in diameter between two measure-
ments ( $d$ at the next measurement $-d$ now). If the measurement interval was longer than 1 year, the diameter difference was converted into 1 -year growth by dividing by the length of the measurement interval (in years).

### 2.3 Dominant height modeling

Temporary plots were not used to model dominant height development since only the current dominant height was available for these plots. The permanent plot data consisted of 221 pairs of stand age and dominant height. Eleven different models derived from Hossfeld (cited by Peschel 1938), Korf (1939), Schumacher (1939), Chapman-Richards (Richards 1959), Sloboda (1971), and McDill and Amateis (1992) were tested. Equations were derived using the algebraic difference approach (ADA) (Bailey and Clutter 1974), by equating subdefined ratios of base equations (Amaro et al. 1998), or utilizing the generalized algebraic difference approach (Cieszewski and Bailey 2000). The parameters were estimated using the Levenberg-Marquardt algorithm (Moré 1977) in nonlinear regression analysis using nonlinear least squares. Five best models were selected based on the statistical performance and were visually analyzed for biological consistency. Finally, one model was selected. To further test it, the selected model was visually compared to the measured dominant height developments of the plots (Fig. 1). The model selected for dominant height was used to calculate the site index of every plot. Since, according to previous research and forestry practice elsewhere, a 30-year rotation length might be suitable for this species, the base age was taken as 30 years, which means that site index is equal to the dominant height at that age. Site index was used as a potential predictor in diameter increment modeling.


Fig. 1 Comparison between the measured dominant height series and the predictions of the selected Schumacher model for site indices 15, 20,25 , and 30 m

### 2.4 Diameter increment modeling

The total number of observations for diameter increment modeling was 25,439 ( 16,526 from temporary plots and 8,913 from permanent plots). The purpose was to develop the following type of model for the future 1year diameter increment: $i_{\mathrm{d}}=f$ (tree size, site quality, competition), where $i_{\mathrm{d}}$ is future 1-year diameter increment (centimeters).

Each type of predictor (tree size, site quality, competition) was described based on several variables. The site variables available for every plot and measurement were site index and elevation (Table 1). Several variables which describe competition were calculated for each plot and tree. One of them was stand basal area $(G)$, which describes the overall stocking in the stand. Another tested competition variable was the basal area of larger trees $(B A L)$, i.e., the total basal area (square meters per hectare) of all trees of the plot which were larger than the subject tree (Wykoff 1990). An individual tree variable called dominance ( $D O M$ ) was also tested. This variable yields values between 0 and 1 and was calculated as: $D O M=1-$ $B A L / G$ (Schröder and Gadow 1999). Low values of $D O M$ represent trees at a competitive disadvantage, whereas high values represent dominant trees. Tree size was described by means of diameter at breast height. Transformations of predictors were tested. Preliminary models were first fitted separately for permanent and temporary plot data. Since the increments and the relationships were fairly similar in both sets, they were combined for the final model. Both fixed- and mixed-effects modeling approaches were tested using nonlinear least squares and maximum likelihood, respectively, in nonlinear regression analysis. Fixed-effects models may perform better when the aim is prediction in forestry practice (e.g., Temesgen et al. 2008; Pukkala et al. 2009). On the other hand, mixed effects can take into account the hierarchical structure given by the fact that trees of the same plot and same measurement occasion are correlated observations (Pinheiro and Bates 2000).

### 2.5 Height-diameter modeling

All measured heights were used to develop an individual tree height-diameter model. The total number of observations was 7,076 (434 from temporary plots and 6,642 from permanent plots). Preliminary height models were first fitted separately to both sets. The comparison of the two models showed that the relationships were rather similar in both sets. Therefore, the two data sets were combined. Different height-diameter models based on Stoffels and Van Soest (1953) power equation modified by Tomé (1989) were tested by using nonlinear regression analysis.

### 2.6 Self-thinning modeling

A self-thinning model was developed by first selecting the plots which were assumed to be on the self-thinning limit and then fitting a model between number of trees and mean diameter. The model for the self-thinning limit was fitted as follows using nonlinear regression analysis:
$N_{\max }=b_{0} \times D_{\mathrm{q}}{ }^{b_{1}}$
where $N_{\max }$ is the maximum possible number of trees per hectare and $D_{\mathrm{q}}$ is quadratic mean diameter of trees (centimeters). Moreover, several additional predictors as suggested by Schütz and Zingg (2010) were tried but without success. The self-thinning frontier was modified following the method proposed by Vanclay and Sands (2009) resulting in a model that predicts some mortality already below the self-thinning line. The statistically fitted self-thinning line was used as a reference in the manual finetuning of the Vanclay and Sands model; the latter model had to join the self-thinning line. An attempt was also made to model individual tree survival using the permanent plot data and the logistic model type. However, the model predicted unrealistically low survival rates. This is because some trees which were actually cut had been recorded as dead trees. In addition, there was high mortality in some plots, which may have been caused by factors other than competition.

### 2.7 Model evaluation

The criteria used in model evaluation were (a) agreement with current biological knowledge, (b) logical behavior in extrapolations and long-term simulations, (c) simplicity and robustness, ( d ) statistical significance ( $p$ value $<0.05$ ) and non-biasness, and (e) homoscedasticity and normal distribution of residuals. The statistical analyses were carried out using SPSS software (SPSS Inc. 2008).

### 2.8 Simulation procedure

When combined, the models can be used to simulate the stand dynamics of $P$. radiata in Bolivia. The input data consist, for instance, of diameters of $N$ trees measured within a plot or empirical diameter distribution of a stand. Dominant height $\left(H_{\text {dom }}\right)$ and age $(T)$ of the stand are needed. The diameter $(d)$ and frequency are required for every tree or diameter class. The site index $(S I)$ is calculated from $H_{d o m}$ and $T$. A 1-year time step can be simulated as follows:

1. Increment stand age by 1 year, calculate new $H_{\text {dom }}$ $\left(H_{\text {domnew }}=f\left(T_{\text {new }}, S I\right)\right)$
2. Increment tree diameters, calculate the quadratic mean diameter $\left(D_{\mathrm{q}}\right)$
3. Calculate self-thinning limit as a function of the initial stocking $\left(N_{0}\right)$ and $D_{\mathrm{q}}\left(N_{\max }=f\left(N_{0}, D_{\mathrm{q}}\right)\right)$, reduce the frequencies of trees if required (if $N>N_{\max }$ )
4. Calculate dominant diameter $\left(D_{\text {dom }}\right)$ and tree heights $(h=$ $\left.f\left(d, D_{\text {dom }}, H_{\text {dom }}\right)\right)$
5. Calculate the remaining tree-level attributes and stand characteristics

In simulation, trees having lower growth rates had a higher mortality rate (Vanclay 1994). As there were no available volume data, the taper equation fitted by Castedo-Dorado et al. (2007) for $P$. radiata was used in tree and stand-level volume estimation.

## 3 Results

### 3.1 Dominant height model

The selected model for dominant height development, based on Schumacher's (1939) equation, was as follows:
$H_{2}=\exp \left[4.778+\left(\frac{T_{1}}{T_{2}}\right)^{0.329} \times\left(\ln \left(H_{1}\right)-4.778\right)\right]$
where $T_{1}$ and $T_{2}$ are the stand ages in measurement occasions 1 and 2 and $H_{1}$ and $H_{2}$ are the dominant heights in measurement occasions 1 and 2.

The $R^{2}$ of the model was 0.962 and the mean square error was 0.768 . From this equation, site index can be obtained by using measured stand age and dominant height. If site index is known, dominant height at any projection age can be also obtained. The predictions of the dominant height model were visually compared to the measured dominant height developments of several plots (Fig. 1). The comparison shows that there are clear disagreements in some plots and very good agreements in other plots. Since the measured $H_{\text {dom }}$ series are quite different and sometimes cross each other, the disagreements shown in Fig. 1 cannot be solved by any anamorphic of polymorphic model. Therefore, Schumacher's equation was not rejected on the basis of the visual analysis.

### 3.2 Diameter increment model

After testing many combinations of predictors, the following model was selected to describe the future 1-year diameter increment:

$$
\begin{align*}
i_{\mathrm{d}}=\exp & -2.569-0.031 B A L-0.006 d^{1.41} \\
& -0.199 \ln (G)+1.134 \ln (S I)+0.147 \text { DOM }) \tag{6}
\end{align*}
$$

The $R^{2}$ is 0.427 and the residual standard error is 0.371 cm . The relative root mean square error (RMSE) in percent of the mean was $64.1 \%$. According to the model, increasing stand basal area and $B A L$ decrease diameter increment (Fig. 2). Trees at a competitive advantage (higher DOM) have higher predicted growth than dominated trees. With a given stand basal area and $B A L$, increasing diameter decreases diameter increment. Improving site index greatly increases growth rate.

### 3.3 Height-diameter model

Of the tested alternatives for tree height models, all gave rather similar predictions, but the following model was judged the best on the basis of fitting statistics, simplicity, and visual examination of the residuals and model shape:
$h=H_{\text {dom }} \times\left(d / D_{\text {dom }}\right)^{0.304-0.203 \ln \left(d / D_{\text {dom }}\right)}$

The $R^{2}$ of this model is 0.945 and the residual standard error is 0.942 m . The relative RMSE was $14.7 \%$. The model shows, for example, that the height of a tree of certain diameter is greater in an old stand than in a young stand, i.e., the $d-h$ curve moves up when the stand develops. This height model guarantees that, in simulations, the height development of individual trees follows the dominant height development of the stand; for a tree with $d$ equal to dominant diameter, the predicted height equals stand dominant height.

### 3.4 Self-thinning model

The following model was fitted for the maximum number of trees per hectare (self-thinning limit):
$N_{\max }=728,599.182 \times D_{\mathrm{q}}{ }^{-2.038}$

Based on Eq. 8, the following model was adjusted for stand-specific application of the self-thinning limit (Vanclay and Sands 2009):
$N_{\max }=\frac{N_{0}}{\left(1+\left(\left(\frac{\pi N_{0}}{40,000}\right) \frac{D_{\mathrm{q}}{ }^{2}}{55}\right)^{3.5}\right)^{\frac{1}{3.5}}}$
where $N_{0}$ is the initial stocking (number of trees per hectare).

This model agrees with the self-thinning limit based on the densest plots (Eq. 8) but is more realistic since it predicts some mortality already before reaching the self-

Fig. 2 Modeled dependence of diameter increment on basal area, $B A L, d$, and site index according to the diameter increment model

thinning limit (Fig. 3). Therefore, this latter model was finally used in simulation.

### 3.5 Simulation examples

The models were first used to simulate the development without any thinning treatments of three young plantations


Fig. 3 Self-thinning limit using Eq. 8 (self-thinning model) and using the method proposed by Vanclay and Sands (2009) to apply the selfthinning model (Eq. 9) for three different initial stockings $\left(N_{0}=3000\right.$, $N_{0}=2000$, and $N_{0}=1000$ ). The filled points represent the observations used to fit Eq. 8
(Fig. 4), the first representing site index 26.6 m (very good site), the second 22.3 (rather good site), and the third 16.5 m (rather poor site). On the best site, stand volume reached $1,000 \mathrm{~m}^{3} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ in 60 years, and $600 \mathrm{~m}^{3} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ was reached on the poorest site. Self-thinning began at 20 years on the best site and at 25 years on the poorest site. The mean annual increment (MAI) with the optimal rotation length was $24.4 \mathrm{~m}^{3} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ on the best site and $11.7 \mathrm{~m}^{3} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ on the poorest site. The rotation length that maximized wood production (maximum sustainable yield) was 27.5 years for the best site and 35.5 years for the poorest site. Therefore, the models indicate that suitable rotation lengths for $P$. radiata in wood production are 25-30 years for very good sites, 30-35 years for medium sites, and 3540 years for poor sites in the Inter-Andean valleys of Bolivia.

The model set was also used to simulate the optimal stand development that maximizes wood production under three different forest management scenarios: (a) absence of thinning, (b) one thinning, and (c) two thinnings (Fig. 5). The mean harvested volume was the highest for the scenario with two thinnings $\left(25.8 \mathrm{~m}^{3} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}\right.$ year $^{-1}$ and a 39-year optimal rotation length), followed by the onethinning scenario $\left(25.1 \mathrm{~m}^{3} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}\right.$ year $^{-1}$ and a 35 -year optimal rotation length) and by the no-thinning scenario ( $23.5 \mathrm{~m}^{3} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ year $^{-1}$ and a 30-year optimal rotation length).


Fig. 4 Model-based simulations for $P$. radiata in Bolivia: yield, survival, and MAI and CAI curves in a very good site ( $S I=26.6 \mathrm{~m}$ ), in a rather good site $(S I=22.3 \mathrm{~m})$ and in a rather poor site $(S I=16.5 \mathrm{~m})$

## 4 Discussion

This study presented a site index model, a self-thinning model, and individual tree models for diameter increment and tree height for $P$. radiata stands in the Inter-Andean Valleys of Bolivia. All modeling data represented stands younger than 35 years. Therefore, the set of models should be used with caution beyond that age.

The Schumacher polymorphic-disjoint dynamic equation, which was selected as the dominant height model, is path invariant and computes predictions directly from any age-dominant height pair without compromising


Fig. 5 Simulation of the stand volume development in optimal schedules which maximize wood production under three different management scenarios (zero, one, or two thinnings) in a 5-year-old stand growing in a very good site $(S I=26.6 \mathrm{~m})$
consistency of the predictions. The selected site index model was derived using the ADA (Bailey and Clutter 1974), which results in mathematically reliable equations that always yield coherent results. This model does not require a preselected index age; whatever the base age, height will equal site index when age equals base age. The selected model was compared with other site index equations previously developed for this species in Spain (Diéguez-Aranda et al. 2005) and in Australia (Haywood 2009) by examining whether their predictions properly followed the measured dominant height growth. None of those models was suitable for Bolivia. The Spanish model clearly underestimated the dominant height development of young stands. Both alternative models overestimated the growth in older stands and good sites.

The diameter increment model was fitted as a fixed model and as a mixed model that included a random plot factor. Both approaches resulted in similar models with the same predictors. However, similarly to previous research (e.g., Temesgen et al. 2008; Shater et al. 2011), the RMSE was smaller for the fixed-effects model than for the fixed part of the mixed model. Therefore, when plot factors are not estimated, the fixed-effects model is recommended for predicting diameter increment in $P$. radiata stands in Cochabamba (Bolivia). Theoretically, mixed models are able to incorporate the stochastic between-plot and between-tree structure alleviating problems associated with the presence of nested structure, which otherwise may
result in biased estimates of standard errors of parameter estimates.

The height-diameter model developed in this study was compared with other equations developed for P. radiata in Chile (Trincado and Leal 2006) and in Spain (CastedoDorado et al. 2006; Canga-Líbano et al. 2007) all providing similar height-diameter relationships for $P$. radiata in Bolivia in good, average, and poor sites. This model is useful, besides in growth simulations, also to predict individual tree heights in inventory situations when $H_{d o m}$ and $d$ are measured but not all trees are measured by height.

To account for mortality, a model of the self-thinning limit was developed. Schütz and Zingg (2010) suggested using $S I$ as well as different transformations of $D_{\mathrm{q}}$ to improve the model for maximal stand density. In this study, the self-thinning limit was not found to vary according to site index, and transformations of $D_{\mathrm{q}}$ were not significant additional predictors. On the other hand, it fairly well followed the Reineke (1933) law but with a slightly higher average slope of the maximum density. According to Garcia (2009), a model that complies either with Reineke or with the $-3 / 2$ power law can be trusted to behave reasonably when extrapolated. Furthermore, the model based on Vanclay and Sands (2009) was also developed to account for the slight mortality that often occurs in a stand before it reaches the self-thinning limit (Fig. 3).

Simulations were used to demonstrate how the models work together in medium and long-term growth and yield prediction. The models suggest that the mean annual volume increment, with the optimal rotation length, is less than $10 \mathrm{~m}^{3} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ on the poorest sites of Cochabamba and more than $25 \mathrm{~m}^{3} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ on the best sites. Toro and Stanley (1999) reported that the productivity of radiata pine ranges from 18 to $35 \mathrm{~m}^{3} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ year $^{-1}$ in Chile, and in New Zealand, Shula (1989) estimated a maximum productivity of $43 \mathrm{~m}^{3} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ year ${ }^{-1}$ for this species. Such differences, together with the differences in dominant height development and the lack of previous suitable individual tree diameter increment models, justify our study as they confirm the need for specific growth and yield models for the Bolivian conditions. Suitable rotation lengths for $P$. radiata in wood production are 30 to 40 years in the InterAndean valleys of Bolivia. Similar rotation lengths (from 28 to 44 years) have been proposed in northwest Spain (Sánchez et al. 2003). However, when economic profitability is maximized and thinnings are used, the optimal rotation lengths would be different since the economically optimal rotation length depends on the stand establishment costs, prices and dimensions of different timber assortments, and discounting rate.

This study is the first one providing a complete set of growth models on an individual tree basis for $P$. radiata in

Bolivia, and to our knowledge, very few attempts have been done elsewhere. P. radiata in Bolivia is of great economic and social importance, and the models presented in this study provide valuable information for further studies on optimizing the management and evaluating alternative management regimes for the species.

Acknowledgments This study has been supported by Agencia Española de Cooperación Internacional para el Desarrollo (AECID), Ministerio de Asuntos Exteriores y de Cooperación, Gobierno de España.

## References

Álvarez-González JG, Castedo-Dorado F, Ruiz González AD, López Sánchez CA, von Gadow K (2004) A two-step mortality model for even-aged stands of Pinus radiata D. Don in Galicia (northwestern Spain). Ann For Sci 61:439-448
Amaro A, Reed D, Tomé M, Themido I (1998) Modelling dominant height growth: Eucalyptus plantations in Portugal. For Sci 44:3746
Bailey RL, Clutter JL (1974) Base-age invariant polymorphic site curves. For Sci 20:155-159
Canga-Líbano E, Afif Khouri E, Gorgoso-Varela J, Cámara-Obregón A (2007) Relación altura-diámetro generalizada para Pinus radiata D. Don en Asturias (Norte de España). Cuad Soc Esp Cienc For 23:153-158
Castedo-Dorado F, Diéguez-Aranda U, Barrio-Anta M, SánchezRodríguez M, von Gadow K (2006) A generalized heightdiameter model including random components for radiata pine plantations in northwestern Spain. For Ecol Manag 229:202-213
Castedo-Dorado F, Diéguez-Aranda U, Álvarez González JG (2007) A growth model for Pinus radiata D. Don stands in north-western Spain. Ann For Sci 64:453-466
Cieszewski C, Bailey RL (2000) Generalized algebraic difference approach: a new methodology for derivation of biologically based dynamic site equations. For Sci 46:116-126
Crecente-Campo F, Marshall P, Rodríguez-Soalleiro R (2009) Modeling non-catastrophic individual-tree mortality for Pinus radiata plantations in northwestern Spain. For Ecol Manag 257:1542-1550
Diéguez-Aranda U, Burkhart HE, Rodríguez-Soalleiro R (2005) Modeling dominant height growth of radiata pine (Pinus radiata D. Don) plantations in north-western Spain. For Ecol Manag 215:271-284
Garcia O (1970) Indices de sitio para pino insigne en Chile. Instituto Forestal, Chile, Serie de Investigación, Publ. No 2.
Garcia O (1974) Ecuaciones altura-diámetro para pino insigne. Instituto Forestal, Chile. Nota Técnica 19.
Garcia O (2009) A simple and effective forest stand mortality model. MCFNS 1:1-9
Haywood A (2009) Estimation of height growth patterns and site index curves for Pinus radiata plantations in New South Wales, Australia. Southern Forests 71(1):11-19
Korf V (1939) A mathematical definition of stand volume growth law. Lesnicka Prace 18:337-339
López-Sánchez CA, Gorgoso-Varela J, Castedo-Dorado F, RojoAlboreca A, Rodríguez-Soalleiro R, Álvarez-González JG, Sánchez-Rodríguez F (2003) A height-diameter model for Pinus radiata D. Don in Galicia (northwest Spain). Ann For Sci 60:237-245
McDill ME, Amateis RL (1992) Measuring forest site quality using the parameters of a dimensionally compatible height growth function. For Sci 38:409-429

Moré JJ (1977) The Levenberg-Marquardt algorithm: implementation and theory in numerical analysis. In: Watson GA (ed) Lecture notes in mathematics. Springer, Berlin
O'Hehir JF, Leech JW, Lewis NB (2000) The evolution of growth and yield models for South Australian radiata pine plantations. Aust For 63:159-165
Peschel W (1938) Die mathematischen Methoden zur Herleitung der Wachstumsgesetze von Baum und Bestand und die Ergebnisse ihrer Anwendung. Tharandter Forstliches Jahrburch 89:169-247
Pinheiro JC, Bates DM (2000) Mixed effects models in S and S-Plus. Springer, New York
Pretzsch H, Biber P, Dursky J, von Gadow K, Hasenauer H, Kändler G, Kenk G, Kublin E, Nagel J, Pukkala T, Skovsgaard JP, Sodtke R, Sterba H (2002) Recommendations for standardized documentation and further development of forest growth simulators. Forstw Cbl 121:138-151
Pukkala T, Lähde E, Laiho O (2009) Growth and yield models for uneven-sized forest stands in Finland. For Ecol Manage 258:207-216
Reineke LH (1933) Perfecting a stand-density index for even-aged forests. J Agric Res 46:627-638
Richards FJ (1959) A flexible growth function for empirical use. J Exp Bot 10:290-300
Richardson DM (1998) Ecology and biogeography of Pinus. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge
Sánchez F, Rodríguez R, Rojo A, Álvarez JG, López C, Gorgoso J, Castedo F (2003) Crecimiento y tablas de producción de Pinus radiata D. Don en Galicia. Investig Agrar Sist Recur For 12:65-83
Schröder J, Gadow KV (1999) Testing a new competition index for maritime pine in north-western Spain. Can J For Res 29:280-283
Schumacher FX (1939) A new growth curve and its application to timber yield studies. J Forest 37:819-820
Schütz JP, Zingg A (2010) Improving estimations of maximal stand density by combining Reineke's size-density rule and the yield
level, using the example of spruce (Picea abies (L.) Karst.) and European Beech (Fagus sylvatica L.). Ann For Sci 67:507
Shater Z, de-Miguel S, Kraid B, Pukkala T, Palahí M (2011) A growth and yield model for even-aged Pinus brutia stands in Syria. Ann For Sci 68:149-157
Shula RG (1989) The upper limits of radiata pine stem-volume production in New Zealand. N Z J For 34:19-22
Sloboda B (1971) Zur Darstellung von Wachstumprozessen mit Hilfe von Differentialgleichungen erster Ordung. Mitteillungen der Badenwürttem-bergischen Forstlichen Versuchs und Forschungsanstalt, Freiburg
SPSS Inc (2008) SPSS for Windows Release 17.0.1. SPSS, Chicago
Stoffels A, van Soest J (1953) The main problems in sample plots. Ned Boschb Tijdschr 25:190-199
Temesgen H, Monleon VJ, Hann DW (2008) Analysis and comparison of nonlinear tree height prediction strategies for Douglas-fir forests. Can J For Res 38:553-565
Tomé M (1989) Modelação do crescimiento da árvore individual em povoamentos de Eucalyptus globulus Labill. (1 ${ }^{\text {a }}$ Rotação). Região Centro de Portugal. Ph D thesis, ISA, Lisbon
Toro J, Stanley G (1999) Radiata pine plantations in Chile. New Forest 18:33-44
Trincado G, Leal DC (2006) Local and generalized heightdiameter equations for radiata pine (Pinus radiata). Bosque 27:23-34
Vanclay JK (1994) Modelling forest growth and yield: applications to mixed tropical forests. CABI, Walingford
Vanclay JK, Sands PJ (2009) Calibrating the self-thinning frontier. For Ecol Manag 259:81-85
Woollons RC, Hayward WJ (1985) Revision of a growth and yield model for radiata pine in New Zealand. For Ecol Manag 11:191202
Wykoff WR (1990) A basal area increment model for individual conifers in the Northern Rocky Mountains. For Sci 36:1077-1104

