



# Who is Governing the "New" South Africa?

Marianne Séverin, Pierre Aycard

## ► To cite this version:

Marianne Séverin, Pierre Aycard. Who is Governing the "New" South Africa?: Elites, Networks and Governing Styles (1985-2003). IFAS Working Paper Series / Les Cahiers de l' IFAS, 2006, 8, p. 13-37. hal-00799193

**HAL Id: hal-00799193**

**<https://hal.science/hal-00799193>**

Submitted on 11 Mar 2013

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



**TEN YEARS OF  
DEMOCRATIC  
SOUTH AFRICA  
TRANSITION  
ACCOMPLISHED?**

BY  
AURELIA WA KABWE-SEGATTI,  
NICOLAS PEJOUT  
AND PHILIPPE GUILLAUME

*Les Nouveaux Cahiers de l'IFAS / IFAS Working Paper Series* is a series of occasional working papers, dedicated to disseminating research in the social and human sciences on Southern Africa.

Under the supervision of appointed editors, each issue covers a specific theme; papers originate from researchers, experts or post-graduate students from France, Europe or Southern Africa with an interest in the region.

The views and opinions expressed here remain the sole responsibility of the authors. Any query regarding this publication should be directed to the chief editor.

Chief editor: Aurelia WA KABWE – SEGATTI,  
IFAS-Research director.

The text herein presented as well as back issues of *Les Nouveaux Cahiers de l'IFAS / IFAS Working Paper Series* are available on the IFAS website:  
[www.ifas.org.za/research](http://www.ifas.org.za/research)

IFAS – Research  
PO Box 542 – Newtown 2113  
Johannesburg – RSA  
Tel: +27 (0)11 836 0561  
Fax: +27 (0)11 836 5850  
Email: [secretariatrecherche@ifas.org.za](mailto:secretariatrecherche@ifas.org.za)

Institut français d'Afrique du Sud, Johannesburg, 2006  
(*Les Nouveaux Cahiers de l'IFAS / IFAS Working Paper Series* N°8).  
ISSN: 1608 - 7194

## SUMMARY

For the past ten years, South Africa has been progressively coming out of the apartheid system. Although all ties with the former regime have been severed completely, managing the heavy structural legacy has made the transition a difficult as well as an ambivalent process - difficult because the expectations of the population contrast with the complexity of the stakes which have to be dealt with; and ambivalent because the transition is based on innovations as well as continuities.

The contributions gathered in this book will try to clarify the trajectory of that transition. Offered analyses share a critical look, without complacency nor contempt, on the transformations at work. Crossing disciplines and dealing with South Africa as an ordinary and standardised country that can no longer be qualified as being a “miracle” or an “exception”, gives us an opportunity to address themes that are essential to understanding post-apartheid society: land reforms, immigration policies, educational reforms, AIDS...

This issue of IFAS Working Papers is the translation of a book published with Karthala publishers to celebrate 10 years of the Research section of the French Institute of South Africa (IFAS) and to highlight its major contribution to constructing francophone knowledge on Southern Africa.

## RÉSUMÉ

*Depuis dix ans, l'Afrique du Sud sort progressivement du système d'apartheid : si les ruptures avec l'ancien régime sont nettes, la gestion d'un héritage structurel lourd rend cette transition à la fois difficile et ambivalente. Difficile car les attentes de la population contrastent avec la complexité des enjeux à traiter. Ambivalente car cette transition est faite d'innovations et de continuités.*

*C'est cette trajectoire que les contributions réunies ici tentent d'éclairer. Les analyses proposées partagent un regard critique sans complaisance ni mépris sur les transformations à l'œuvre. Le croisement des disciplines et le traitement de l'Afrique du Sud comme un pays ordinaire, normalisé, sorti des paradigmes du « miracle » ou de l'« exception », donnent l'occasion d'aborder des thèmes essentiels à la compréhension de la société post-apartheid : réforme agraire, politique d'immigration, réformes éducatives, sida...*

*Ces Cahiers sont la traduction d'un ouvrage paru chez Karthala en 2004 à l'occasion des dix ans d'existence du pôle recherche de l'Institut Français d'Afrique du Sud (IFAS) afin de souligner sa contribution majeure à la construction des savoirs francophones sur l'Afrique australe.*

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## INTRODUCTION

Normalising Reportson South Africa, <i>by Aurelia Wa Kabwe-Segatti, Nicolas Péjout and Philippe Guillaume</i> .....	<b>5</b>
--	----------

CHAPTER 1. Who Is Governing the “New” South Africa? Elites, Networks and Governing Styles (1985-2003), <i>by Marianne Séverin and Pierre Aycard</i> .....	<b>13</b>
---	-----------

CHAPTER 2. “Big Brother” in South Africa? e-Government and Panoptic Control During and After Apartheid, <i>by Nicolas Péjout</i> .....	<b>39</b>
--	-----------

CHAPTER 3. From Free Housing Policy to the Payment of Rates and Taxes in South African Cities (1994-2003): The Cape Town and Port Elizabeth Cases, <i>by Marianne Morange</i> .....	<b>57</b>
---	-----------

CHAPTER 4. Can We Speak About Effective Land Reform in South Africa?, <i>by Ward Anseeuw</i> .....	<b>77</b>
---	-----------

CHAPTER 5. Education, Democracy and Decentralisation: Educational Policy Reforms in South Africa (1994-2004), <i>by Ingrid Bamberg</i> .....	<b>91</b>
--	-----------

CHAPTER 6. Crossing Frontiers, Changing Trajectories? Renewal of Literature in Post-Apartheid South Africa, <i>by Donald Moerdijk</i> .....	<b>107</b>
---	------------

CHAPTER 7. The Reappearance of the Khoesan in Post-Apartheid South Africa: Invention of Tradition and National Reconciliation, <i>by François-Xavier Fauvelle-Aymar</i> .....	<b>125</b>
---	------------

CHAPTER 8. Linguistic Diversity in South Africa or How to Transform a Factor of Division into a Tool for Nation - Building?, <i>by Michel Lafon</i> .....	<b>141</b>
---	------------

CHAPTER 9. Reformulating Immigration Policy in Post-Apartheid South Africa: From the Aliens Control Act of 1991 to the Immigration Act of 2002, <i>by Aurelia Wa Kabwe-Segatti</i> .....	<b>171</b>
--	------------

CHAPTER 10. HIV/AIDS in South Africa 1990-2004: Governmental Logic and Social Mobilisation, <i>by Judith Hayem</i> .....	<b>179</b>
--	------------

APPENDICES .....	<b>205</b>
Maps	
Webliography	
Acronyms and Abbreviations	
Authors	

chapter one

# who is governing the “new” south africa?

elites, networks and governing styles (1985-2003)

**marianne séverin**

**pierre aycard**

## ABSTRACT

*The political history of the ANC (African National Congress) leadership is characterised by the succession of four generations and the constitution of three networks. Looking at the internal ANC politics, their interaction with the economic sphere and the styles of government, the leadership has deeply changed between the Mandela era (1985-1994), the Government of National Unity (GNU) period (1994-1996) and the Mbeki “network” (1997-2004).*

## RÉSUMÉ

*L'histoire politique du leadership du Congrès national africain (ANC) est caractérisée par la succession de quatre générations et la constitution de trois réseaux. L'examen des luttes politiques internes à l'ANC, des interactions avec les milieux économiques et les styles de gouvernement révèle que la structure des cadres du parti a profondément changé entre l'ère Mandela (1985-1994), la période du Gouvernement d'Unité Nationale (GNU) et le réseau 'Mbeki' (1997-2004).*

After forty-two years of apartheid regime, the African National Congress (ANC), banned for thirty years (from 1960 to 1990), came into power in April 1994 following the first free elections in the history of the country with 62,7% of the votes. The ANC remained in power with an even larger majority after the June 1999 (66,3%) and April 2004 (69,8%) elections. The transformation of the South African political context was created by the coming of the ANC into power, among other things. This transformation was the result of the commitment of political actors who, today, represent the country's new “ruling category”, i.e. a “minority of individuals who hold offices and accomplish functions in such a way that they cannot but have an influence on governing society” (Aron 1965, p.25; Aron 1988, p.120). This ruling category includes individuals who have a long political experience acquired while in the opposition from the mid-1940s until the beginning of the 1990s, representing four generations of opponents to apartheid. Analysing the role and importance of each of these generations of anti-apartheid militants during the negotiations between the African National Congress and the South African government and, subsequently, within the 1994 and 1999 governments, relies on the identification of three political networks that “refer to solidarities created in prison, in exile or while members of mass organisations in the 1980s” (Lodge 1999, p.24), i.e. Exiles, Robben Islanders and Internals networks. Once the ANC came into power, did membership of these networks become the major selection criterion to the key

positions in the political and economic spheres of the new South African ruling category? Are these networks still used as reference? How do these networks fit into competition and selection strategies? Finally, does the emergence of a “Mbeki Network” not speak of the will of the head of State to establish his personal power, risking sometimes to call into question the legitimacy of the Congress as a democratic political party in its everyday exercise of power?

## SUCCESSION OF FOUR GENERATIONS AND CREATION OF THREE NETWORKS

During the mid-1940s and the 1950s, a first generation of opponents occupied the extra-parliamentarian political scene by becoming ANC members or members of allied political organisations<sup>1</sup> (Suttner & Cronin 1986). This first generation follows and/or leads, during the 1950s and at the beginning of the 1960s, a series of civil disobedience campaigns before resolving to armed struggle and creating, in December 1961, Umkhonto we Sizwe<sup>2</sup> (MK) or the “Spear of the Nation” (Bunting 1998; Barrel 1990).

This new method of opposition unavoidably results in increased political repression that leads to the well-known Rivonia Trial (1962-1964), in which the majority of the political leaders of the Congress and allied organisations are condemned to long term imprisonment on Robben Island. At the same time, the ANC and MK redeploy outside the South African borders, driving the remaining political executives into exile<sup>3</sup>.

Following the first generation – and because they were influenced by it – young militants joined the Congress and other allied organisations towards the end of the 1950s and at the beginning of the 1960s. This second generation of political opponents also took part in the collective actions of the 1950s and 1960s. Many of them who were recruited when the MK

---

<sup>1</sup> Political organisations then allied to the ANC are the South African Communist Party (SACP, illegal as early as 1950), the South African Coloured People’s Organisation (SACPO), the Natal Indian Congress (NIC) and the Transvaal Indian Congress (TIC). Except for the SACP, these organisations are movements based on identity and represent de facto racial division in South Africa. Conscious that fighting against apartheid united rather than divided is preferable, these organisations gather under the Congress of the People in 1955, adopting a Freedom Charter on the 26th of June of that year.

<sup>2</sup> Umkhonto we Sizwe (MK) was created in 1960 as a result of the Sharpeville events after a small number of Anti-Apartheid Alliance members launched a debate between partisans of non-violence and those thinking that an armed struggle was the only recourse in the face of State violence.

<sup>3</sup> In parallel to the reconstruction of the ANC in exile, the political prisoners of Robben Island carry on with their resistance underground. For this, a High Organ is created with, at its disposal, a Disciplinary Committee responsible for settling conflicts between prisoners. Subsequently, small units are set up to conduct “verbal” political education with new prisoners (those in particular who arrived in 1976 as a result of the Soweto events) and common law prisoners in order to integrate them in the ranks of the underground ANC.



was created also fell victim to the violent repression, with some incarcerated while others were forced to flee the country at the same time as their elders.

At the end of the 1960s and beginning of the 1970s, a Black Consciousness Movement (BCM) was formed in the segregated universities, revealing a third generation of activists<sup>4</sup> (Biko 1996; Karis and Gerhart 1991). Having taken part in the Soweto Uprising (16th of June 1976) characterised, among others, by extreme police violence and BCM prohibition in 1977, certain members of the third generation constituted the second wave of exiles and political prisoners. As a result, they had no other choice but to join the best organised struggle movement, the ANC, whether in exile or in the prison of Robben Island, abandoning one political ideology for another.

Despite this violence, the internal anti-apartheid movement continued with the emergence of the fourth and last generation of opponents. This generation created and/or joined various associative organisations commonly called “civics” (such as religious, women’s and professional associations) that, in 1983, gathered under the United Democratic Front (UDF) to lead, following the example of the ANC of the 1950s, an opposition demonstration movement. In parallel, the labour movement, in full development with the creation of the Federation of South African Trade Unions (FOSATU), in 1970, and the Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU), in 1985, saw the emergence, from its ranks and at its head, of individuals who also came from this last group of opponents. As with the first three generations, some of them were imprisoned or left the country to join the ANC.

In order to identify more clearly the new South African ruling category, we will recount the political path and strategies of a few key ANC leaders due to the predominant position of this party in the democratisation process and, since 1994, in the government of the new South Africa. We will deal with this subject in three phases: the first phase will aim to look at these leaders in the political context from the time of the negotiations to their coming into power, from the mid-1980s to 1994; the second phase will highlight the political choices made to balance out the forces in the State machine and the reinforcement of ANC power from 1994 to 1996; the third phase will describe existing governing styles since the end of the Mandela era and, in particular, power personalisation through what we will call the “Mbeki Network” since 1996.

---

<sup>4</sup> Following the Extension Universities Act passed in 1959 (extending Bantu education to the university system), South African universities were divided on the basis of racial category (and ethnic category for the Blacks). BCM ideology was developed within these establishments with, in particular, the creation of the South African Students’ Organisation (SASO).

## ■ FROM NEGOTIATION TO POWER: THE MANDELA ERA (1985-1994)

The first democratic multiracial elections in South African history, held on the 26-29 April 1994, were the result of long negotiations in two phases between the ANC and Pretoria. The first phase took place in secrecy from 1985 to 1989, the second as early as February 1990 and until 1994. These negotiations, benefiting from the expertise of key leaders of the Congress (acquired during their long political history within the organisation), were to lead to the settlement of the political crisis via a transitional period.

## ■ CLANDESTINE NEGOTIATORS

The first negotiation phase began with the two main fronts (Exiles and Robben Islanders). In parallel, the ANC leadership met secretly, regarding the Exiles, or after negotiating with the authorities, regarding the Robben Islanders, with the leaders of the internal opposition most in the public eye<sup>5</sup>.

This phase of secret negotiations, led mainly by Nelson Mandela, Oliver Tambo and Thabo Mbeki, benefited from the political expertise, negotiating experience and even clandestine activities of these leaders.

Nelson Mandela and Oliver Tambo, both belonging to the same political generation, became ANC members at the beginning of the 1940s. They were behind the radicalisation of the ANC through the ANC Youth League (ANCYL) of which they are founding members<sup>6</sup> in 1943-1944. While both took part in the events of the 1950s, they continued their activities in secrecy after the ANC was banned in 1960. Mandela followed the path of those who chose the armed struggle, a decision for which he was condemned to life imprisonment on Robben Island, while Tambo left the country to redeploy the ANC's anti-apartheid activities in exile. The former was part of the “Robben Islander” Front while the latter was part of the “Exiles” Front.

---

<sup>5</sup> These meetings predicted already the integration of the “Internal Front” into the ranks of the ANC at the end of apartheid.  
<sup>6</sup> After around thirty years of inefficient opposition (based on the signing of petitions), the ANC became radicalised with the arrival of young members who questioned the political methods of the “Founding Fathers”.

Coming from the second generation of political opponents, Thabo Mbeki became member of the ANCYL in 1956, at a time when his elders were being arrested and accused of treason<sup>7</sup>. In 1961, during the time when the MK was created, Mbeki created the African Students' Association (ASA). This pro-ANC student organisation was subsequently banned. On the verge of being arrested, Mbeki was ordered by the ANC to leave South Africa. Thus he went into exile as early as 1962 to study at university (subsequently obtaining a doctorate in Economics from the University of Sussex) and continued his political activities under the command of Oliver Tambo (who was then Chairman of the ANC Mission in exile).

The importance of the roles of these political leaders in the first negotiation phase becomes clear when considering their personalities. Having become an expert in secret affairs and underground political activities, Nelson Mandela, a moderate, is perceived as the uncontested leader of the ANC on Robben Island and, thus, as the only interlocutor with whom Pretoria would be able to negotiate. Founding member of the MK, he was nevertheless pragmatic enough to admit that the armed struggle could not remain the only political option. He knew that the Congress would have to open the “channels of communication with the government”, which he attempted as early as 1968<sup>8</sup>.

Transferred to Pollsmoor Prison by the prison authorities, Mandela met the first of the government's emissaries in 1985. These discussions were led without prior consultation with his early “comrades”. Two years later, he obtained from the government their anticipated release and that Oliver Tambo be approached as the leader of the Movement (Mandela 1994, p.529-552).

Outside the South African borders, the personal and political qualities of Oliver Tambo and Thabo Mbeki were just as important to create contacts. While he was not a founding member of the MK, Oliver Tambo was perceived rather as a moderate politician, with a strong capacity for negotiations, a quality acquired in exile. In exile it had fallen to Tambo to negotiate the set up of offices and representations of the organisation in host countries, an opportunity for him to meet foreign Heads of States to promote his movement. Like Mandela, he was aware that the congress must prepare for negotiations, in fact he stated “[that he] is terribly afraid that one of these days [the organisation] is going

---

<sup>7</sup> They undergo a treason trial for their involvement in the Congress of the People and their adoption of the Freedom Charter (Joseph H. 1998).

<sup>8</sup> Almost six years after his conviction, Mandela launches a debate on the issue of negotiations between the regime in power and the ANC within the High Organ of the ANC in prison (according to Allister Sparks, after a particularly stormy debate where Nelson Mandela's “moderation” inspired his fellow-prisoners with distrust; Sparks A. 1996, p.80).

to receive a message from P.W. Botha saying that he is ready to negotiate, [and that no one would understand] for want of not knowing the mental functioning [of Afrikaners]” (Sparks 1996, p. 100).

Oliver Tambo mandated Thabo Mbeki to lead the first secret meetings with various Afrikaner delegations (businessmen, intellectuals and politicians especially). As far as Tambo was concerned, the relations created before and during exile played undeniably in favour of Mbeki. Described as a courteous and reasonable diplomat as well as a fine negotiator, following the example of his elders, Mbeki seemed to be the ideal person to dissipate the reticence and break the stereotypes fabricated by governmental propaganda (Sparks *op. cit.*, p.108; Mbeki 1998, p.i-xxi). Thus, from 1987 and in May 1988 in particular, he attended all the meetings held with governmental delegations. In these meetings, he gave importance to one element in particular that would lead, at the beginning of the 1990s, to official negotiations: for Mbeki as well as Tambo, the Congress can only negotiate as a legitimate organisation, after all its political leaders have been released from prison.

#### ■ KEY OFFICIAL NEGOTIATORS: THE THABO MBEKI/JACOB ZUMA AND CYRIL RAMAPHOSA/JOE SLOVO TANDEM

While conducting secret negotiations with Pretoria, the leaders of both political fronts expressed the desire to hold discussions with a few leaders of the “Front of Internals”. Mandela (having negotiated such a meeting with the prison authorities), Tambo and Mbeki (in secrecy) met with Popo Molefe, Allan Boesak and Cyril Ramaphosa, all three members of a delegation from the UDF and COSATU (concerning Ramaphosa) representatives<sup>9</sup>.

With the election of President Frederik W. de Klerk in September 1989, the political hand changed in South Africa. Other prisoners were released as early as October of the same year; the time of petty apartheid ends and de Klerk accepted the idea of a meeting with Nelson Mandela.

---

<sup>9</sup> Allan Boesak, who comes from the fourth generation of political opponents, was one of the founding members of the UDF. After the legalisation of the ANC, he was elected as the head of the ANC for the Western Cape Region. At the provincial elections, he represented the Party but lost the vote due to his reputation being soiled by scandals. In 1998, he was found guilty of, and incarcerated for, embezzlement.

On the 2nd of February 1990, before Parliament, the new President announced the abolition of apartheid, the legalisation of all opposition organisations and, finally, the release, after 27 years of imprisonment, of Nelson Mandela on the 11th of February 1990 (Govan Mbeki was released in 1987; Walter Sisulu and Raymond Mhlaba in 1989). Once the ANC was legalised, official negotiations began with the signing of the Groote Schuur Agreement on the 4th of May 1990. The ANC abandoned the armed struggle in August 1990. We then saw the implementation of the Convention for a Democratic South Africa (CODESA) gathered for the first time on the 20th of December 1991 and in which some of the main ANC political leaders took part. These leaders came, for the most part, from the Fronts of “Exiles” and “Internals”<sup>10</sup>.

Despite the strong mobilisation of all the political forces in the 1990s negotiations, two organisations created problems: the Inkatha Freedom Party (IFP), Zulu party led by Mangosuthu Buthelezi, and the Afrikaner Volksfront, far right group led by Gen. Konstant Viljoen. With the aim of avoiding the propagation of violence in the country, Thabo Mbeki and Jacob Zuma played a key role in drawing the two parties to the negotiating table. As Regional Director of the Congress since his return from exile, Zuma succeeded in signing a peace agreement (the Empangeni-Umfolozi Agreement) in 1993, in order to end the political violence in the then Province of Natal (KwaZulu-Natal from 1994). Bolstered by such a success and following, on the 10th of April of the same year, the murder of Chris Hani, another great ANC figure and one of the main competitors within the movement, Zuma and Mbeki succeeded in integrating the Afrikaner Volksfront into the discussions<sup>11</sup>.

As to the Cyril Ramaphosa / Joe Slovo tandem, it used all its influence during the constitutional negotiations. Following a block that had severed CODESA negotiations in May 1992, and on their resumption at the end of the same year, Ramaphosa imposed the constitutional vision of the Congress: to see the new constitution adopted by a two-third

---

<sup>10</sup> CODESA consisted of five working groups. The following members of the opposition movement took part in Working Group 1 on National Peace Accord: Joe Modise, Jacob Zuma, Penuel Maduna and Prof. Kader Asmal; in Working Group 2 to negotiate the general principles of a new constitution: Cyril Ramaphosa, Mohammed Valli Moosa, Frene Ginwala and jurist Arthur Chaskalson; in Working Group 3 to discuss the organisation of an interim government and transition authorities: Thabo Mbeki, Joe Nhlanhla, Joel Netshitenzhe and Dullah Omar; in Working Group 4 to resolve the integration of the former independent homelands into the new South Africa: Alfred Nzo, Mathews Phosa and Barbara Masekela; finally in Working Group 5, to organise the agenda and implementation of the resolutions adopted by CODESA: Pallo Jordan, Zola Skweyiya and Georges Bizos. The various negotiators are appointed (or elected) within the government in 1994, except for Frene Ginwala, Chairperson of the National Assembly since 1994; Mr Justice Arthur Chaskalson appointed at the Constitutional Court in 1996; Barbara Masekela, appointed Ambassador in Paris between 1994 and beginning 1999, subsequently becoming a businesswoman on her return to South Africa (Welsh D. 1993, pp.29-43; Rantete J. 1998, p.174).

<sup>11</sup> Chris Hani is a member of the ANCYL during the same period as Thabo Mbeki. Subsequently, he integrates the SACP and MK before going into exile and becomes one of the most influential politico-military executives. His murder leads to important social and political unrest and speeds up the decision to finalise a date for the 1994 elections.

qualified majority. A Record of Understanding is signed on the 26th of September 1992 to ratify this agreement (Rantete 1998, p.197). Having won its case, the Congress must, in turn, make a major concession in order to facilitate the transition process previously weakened. Joe Slovo is the political actor who offered to Pretoria, in the form of a Sunset Clause, the possibility “of sharing power during a determined number of years after adoption of the Constitution”: this agreement gives rise, in May 1994, to the Government of National Unity (GNU)<sup>12</sup>.

### **GOVERNMENT OF NATIONAL UNITY (1994 – 1996): POWER TRANSITION IN THE STATE AND PARTISAN MACHINES**

Different questions were to emerge at the time of the GNU appointment: the new ANC ruling class never had to exercise its influence within the State machine before 1994. Yet, the appointment of political personnel to various ministries and the deputy presidency of a new government meet specific criteria that are not determined by predefined rules or laws only (Dogan 1989, p.1). These were a function of the particular context of the government to be constituted. We can therefore wonder about the criteria adopted by the Head of State in appointing his political executives. Comparing these appointments with the political and historical paths previously recounted will allow us to tell whether these appointments for “service rendered to the cause” are often the rule, or whether the experience acquired during the struggle and within various Congress structures are determining elements to a greater extent.

### **THE DIFFICULT CHOICE OF APPOINTING A DEPUTY PRESIDENT: RIVALRY BETWEEN THABO MBEKI AND CYRIL RAMAPHOSA**

On becoming President on the 5th of May 1994, Nelson Mandela appointed his Cabinet and Deputy Presidents<sup>13</sup>. The appointment of an ANC Deputy President is a cornelian choice that, to be understood, requires us to briefly review the profile of both political

---

<sup>12</sup> “Slovo’s “sunset” debate is red hot”, *Weekly Mail*, 30 October – 5 November 1992, p.16.

<sup>13</sup> The GNU was to consist of members from political parties having obtained more than 10% of the seats at the National Assembly. The National Party (NP) and the IFP were thus to be represented. Nelson Mandela appointed Frederik De Klerk as second Deputy President.

protagonists. As was underlined before, Thabo Mbeki is a pre-1960 “ANC clan” member, having adhered from very young (at the age of 14) to the ANCYL. Son of Govan Mbeki (SACP and ANC member since the 1940s, Robben Island elder, former NCOP member and who died in 2001), he came from one of the most important political family dynasties of the Congress<sup>14</sup>. He grew up under the influence of the ANC and adopted the political rules and culture of the organisation all along, whether in South Africa or in exile under the command of Oliver Tambo, thus integrating in his political behaviour the notions of secrecy, negotiation, respect of the elders and “political patience” in particular.

On the contrary, Cyril Ramaphosa (ten years younger than Thabo Mbeki), coming from the internal anti-apartheid movement (former South African Students’ Organisation then UDF and COSATU member) had been, at the time, an eminent Congress member for only four years. Particularly impatient and considered by some as being too present in the organisation, he did not manage to benefit from one of the most significant supports: that of the ANCYL that was led for a while by Thabo Mbeki. Sidelined from the race for Deputy President by Mbeki and, as a result, feeling excluded from the State machine, Ramaphosa refused to head the Foreign Affairs Department proposed in compensation, and kept the Chair of the Constituent Assembly until 1996 (Rantete *op. cit.*, p.250).

## ■ COMPOSITION OF THE NATIONAL GOVERNMENT

The government appointed by Nelson Mandela, with an average age of around 50, was a well-balanced representation of the three political networks. Out of the 27 ANC ministers and deputy ministers, 13 were already ANC members or had worked in close collaboration before the Congress was banned in 1960, the 14 others represented the post-1960 political generation (i.e. those who became members of the BCM, UDF and/or labour movement)<sup>15</sup>. Despite this balance, it appeared that, where their political profile was concerned, the Front of “Exiles” was predominant, followed by the Front of “Internals” and, finally, the Front of “Robben Islanders”, a minority group with only two former prisoners in Government (Table 1).

---

<sup>14</sup> Another such dynasty is the Sisulu family. Walter, founding member of the ANC Youth League and the MK, a Robben Islander at the same time as Nelson Mandela, dies in 2003; Albertina, ANC member in 1944 then part of the “Front of Exiles”, is elected at the National Assembly in 1994 where she remains until 1999; Max, son of Walter and Albertina, ANC member at the beginning of the 1960s, then part of the “Front of Exiles”, Head of the ANC at the National Assembly from 1994 to 1997, appointed with the support of Mbeki at the head of public armament enterprise DENEL; Lindiwe, daughter of Walter and Albertina, member of the “Front of Exiles”, Deputy Minister of Home Affairs from 1999 to 2001, then Minister of Intelligence until 2004, is today Minister of Housing.

<sup>15</sup> The oldest, Minister of Foreign Affairs Alfred Nzo, is 69 when he is appointed while the youngest, Deputy Minister of Agriculture Thoko Didiza, is 29 on her appointment.

If, *a priori*, attributing ministerial portfolios seems to have been guided by the will to reward former opponents of the outgoing regime, it is important to look beyond this. Indeed, considering the respective paths of the various ministers and deputy ministers, a few specific examples seem to indicate that expertise in certain specific domains also influenced Nelson Mandela’s choice of appointments.

Thus, the Minister of Defence and his Deputy Minister (Joe Modise and Ronnie Kasrils) had a sound military experience. While both were MK executives at the beginning of the 1960s in the mid-1990s they negotiated the integration of the ANC armed wing into the South African National Defence Force (SANDF). The Ministers of Education, Health and Sport & Recreation also had past experience in these domains. Indeed, Sibusiso Bengu (Education), as early as July 1978, was working in Geneva on promoting education in developing countries. On his return to South Africa, he became Rector of the University of Fort Hare. Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma (Health), a trained medical doctor in the United Kingdom, practiced her profession in several African countries. Steve Tshwete (Sport and Recreation), Chairman of the Association of Sportive Prisoners during his imprisonment, played a very important role in unifying South African rugby from 1991 (which enabled South Africa to come back on the international sports scene then to organise the 1995 World Cup won, that year, by South Africa).

Besides these, other appointments come as a surprise: Bantu Holomisa, appointed Deputy Minister of Environmental Affairs and Tourism, an ex-South African Army officer in the former homeland of Transkei, had never been an ANC member before the 1994 elections<sup>16</sup>. One of the first leaders of the homelands to release political prisoners and to legalise the ANC in his region at the end of apartheid, he also exposed a plot by the secret services to murder an ANC leader. This attitude towards the ANC somehow gives him “political credibility” in the eyes of Nelson Mandela in 1994.

Finally, Winnie Madikizela-Mandela obtained minor responsibilities within the government (Deputy Minister of Culture). One of the most important figures of the internal anti-apartheid movement, wife and “spokesperson” of Nelson Mandela, she was nonetheless controversial. Considered as the “Mother of the Nation” during the struggle, she was discredited after the 1980s and more so after her husband’s release. In addition, many saw

---

<sup>16</sup> Leader of the former Homeland of Transkei following a coup d’état in 1987, overthrowing George Matanzima (whose Prime Minister, Stella Sigcau, becomes Minister of Public Enterprises under Mandela), Holomisa had never allied with the struggle movement that was operating underground in Transkei).



her as being uncontrollable. Despite their appointment and after taking up their duties, Bantu Holomisa and Winnie Madikizela-Mandela were quick to openly criticise the government. This political mistake resulted in their being dismissed as early as 1996<sup>17</sup>.

While choosing a political staff at national level was a difficult exercise for Nelson Mandela, the same went for the provincial level.

■ *ANC PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENTS:  
POLITICAL PROFILE OF THE PREMIERS*<sup>18</sup>

At the 1994 provincial elections, the Congress won the presidency over seven of the nine South African provinces. Except for the Premier of the Eastern Cape Province, Raymond Mhlaba, a Robben Islander from the Rivonia Trial, the heads of ANC provinces came from internal opposition organisations, with a majority of elders from the BCM<sup>19</sup>. Mosiuoa “Terror” Lekota (Free State) was a member thereof from 1969, under the influence of Steve Biko, before being incarcerated on Robben Island where he secretly became a member of the ANC (1974). Released from prison in 1982, he became one of the founding members of the UDF. Popo Molefe (North West) became a BCM member in 1976, then a member of the UDF as soon as the organisation was created. Tokyo Sexwale (Gauteng), while in contact with the ANC, became a member of the BCM in 1970. In 1978, owing to his links with the ANC, he was condemned to 18 years of imprisonment on Robben Island. Ngoako Ramatlhodi (Limpopo), became a BCM and ANC member in 1977, before going into exile in 1980 to join the MK and work under the command of Oliver Tambo. Finally, Mathews Phosa (Mpumalanga) became a BCM member (1972) then worked secretly with the ANC (1979) before going into exile in 1985.

The election of these Premiers was due to an ANC electoral strategy based mainly on regional, ethnic and racial criteria (unsuccessful in the Western Cape and KwaZulu-Natal

---

<sup>17</sup> Concerning Bantu Holomisa, see: “The Rise and Fall of Bantu Holomisa”, <http://www.anc.org.za/ancdocs/misc/holomisa.html>, accessed on 27 February 2004; and Holomisa’s response dated July 1997: “Comrades in Corruption: Holomisa reacts to ANC Leadership Booklet”, [http://www.udm.org.za/19970617\\_holb\\_doc\\_comradescorruption.htm](http://www.udm.org.za/19970617_holb_doc_comradescorruption.htm), accessed on 27 February 2004.

<sup>18</sup> A “Premier” is the head of a Provincial Government.

<sup>19</sup> Raymond Mhlaba came from the first generation of political opponents. Like Mandela, he was condemned to life imprisonment on Robben Island before being released in 1989. As to Manne Dipico, he went into politics at the beginning of the 1980s with the student’s organisation called Azanian People’s Organisation (AZAPO) that became affiliated to the UDF and of which he became a member on creation. Subsequently, he integrated the National Union of Mineworkers (NUM) in 1985.

provinces), but also on their political reputations based on the networks they created while either in exile or on Robben Island<sup>20</sup>. This type of strategy very rapidly showed its limitations in three cases in particular: Mhlaba, Lekota and Sexwale were replaced in 1995, 1997 and 1998 respectively. The reasons for which they are evicted ranged from inability to manage either the problems of the province (Mhlaba) or the rivalries within the provincial team (as with Lekota who wanted to reshuffle his ministry without prior consent from ANC leadership) or, still, open conflict with the deputy presidency, i.e. with Thabo Mbeki (Sexwale) (Lodge *op.cit.*, pp.12-26).

An analysis of the national and provincial governments of the GNU era shows the important elements that prevailed concerning the various appointments. Yet, with the development of Thabo Mbeki's power towards the end of 1996 and even more so from December 1997, elements such as political reputation and expertise, acquired during the struggle, were no longer sufficient to maintain a post. From the Mbeki era, notions of loyalty to the political party and its leader, political prudence, obedience and, finally, membership to an identified network, became the rule even before the re-elections of the Congress in 1999: the wise balance maintained by Nelson Mandela made way for the "Mbeki Method".

## A NEW MORE INDIVIDUAL GOVERNING STYLE: THE "MBEKI NETWORK" AND ITS POLITICAL STRATEGIES (1997-2004)

Two factors facilitated Thabo Mbeki's anticipated control of the State machine: on the one hand, the withdrawal of the NP from the GNU, leaving Mbeki on his own at the head of the Deputy President's Office, the role and power of which he reinforced in anticipation of his accession to the presidency during the 1999 elections; on the other hand, his position

---

<sup>20</sup> Several factors explain the defeat of the ANC in these two provinces. In the Western Cape, the NP electoral strategy was more efficient than that of the ANC, relying on the linguistic and cultural affinity the Coloureds and Afrikaners share, grabbing every opportunity to play on the fear of the Coloured communities in the face of Black majority: The NP discredited the ANC by stressing the affirmative action policy proposed by the Congress, arguing that it would be used against the Coloured community of the Cape. Faced with this attack, the ANC, not having debated sufficiently, it seems, the Coloured issue (despite the action of Allan Boesak who heads the ANC regional office, an appointment on which Mandela insisted, creating conflicts within the Party), did not manage the tension between Coloureds and Blacks firmly enough. This reaches a peak when a group of black squatters invade a house occupied by Coloureds. In KwaZulu-Natal, the IFP defeating the ANC came as a real surprise. Such a defeat was due to the external problems of the Congress: not enough ANC electoral education in the region, violence between ANC and IFP partisans and, finally, irregularities due to the late entry of the IFP in the April 1994 elections. This electoral failure was also due to political rivalries within the Party: the Congress being divided, Jacob Zuma was appointed the candidate for the provincial elections in order to settle conflicts between leaders and unify partisans behind a single man. However, while Zuma's electoral base was weak compared with that of his rivals (who then lose interest in the campaign), he did not succeed in leading the ANC to victory (Rantete J. *op. cit.*, p.248).

as heir apparent, officialised by Nelson Mandela at the end of 1996 and confirmed at the political party's elections during its national conference, during which Mbeki was elected Party president<sup>21</sup>.

In contrast with Nelson Mandela, Mbeki adopted a governing style marked from the beginning by an increased control of the political and economic resources (with a grip on his political staff). With this new political hand within the ANC, Mbeki in fact aimed to ensure that governmental politics would be applied in the short, middle and long term, by limiting any resistance to the social transformation attempts within the state institutions and economic structures<sup>22</sup>, as well as any conflict within the supporter structures and ANC-allied organisations, i.e. the SACP and COSATU. According to Mbeki, these conflicts tended to slow down social transformation<sup>23</sup>.

In order to accomplish these objectives, strategies were implemented even before the election of Mbeki to the head of the State. They were confirmed during the electoral campaign, at provincial level in particular, and during the appointment of his Cabinet. These strategies were based on deployments and redeployments within the political and economic spheres (“political appointments”) and the co-optation of the leaders of allied organisations into the corridors of power, “while warning that moving away from the [Party] line or not performing would invite severe reprisals”<sup>24</sup>.

## ■ DEPLOYMENTS AND REDEPLOYMENTS: TOWARDS A REINFORCEMENT OF THE PRESIDENTIAL POWER

### THE POLITICAL SPHERE

Mbeki's choice concerning political personnel relied on three factors: an important peer political network consisting of very close and loyal collaborators; political executives

---

<sup>21</sup> “Mandela looks for Deputy President”, *Mail & Guardian*, 15-21 November 1996, p.6; “Mbeki gears up”, *Mail & Guardian*, 14-27 March 1997, p.6.

<sup>22</sup> Ndletyana M. 1999, “Political appointments are necessary”, *Mail & Guardian*, 26 November – 2 December 1999, p.44.

<sup>23</sup> From 1996, the ANC adopts an economic policy of free trade so as to see an increase in foreign investments in South Africa. In view of this, the Growth, Employment and Redistribution (GEAR) Programme is developed and adopted during the National Conference of December 1997. This new strategy creates tensions between the Congress and its traditional allies, i.e. COSATU and the SACP that are very critical in this regard. The GEAR Programme reflects in fact the weakening of the alliance and, especially, the transformation of the ANC into a party in power, abandoning its apartheid resistance movement status (Van Niekerk Ph. & Ludman B. 1999).

<sup>24</sup> Concerning the deployments and redeployments of political executives: ANC, 1997, pp.22-23; Mthomboni B. 1999, “Carrot and Stick”, *Financial Mail*, 21 May, p.38.

perceived as competent and “obedient” - these did not automatically come from his network; and, finally, the absence of “pretenders to the throne” who could emerge in the long run as potential rivals. Contrarily to what happened in 1994, the appointment of a Deputy President in 1999 met no difficulty. Close to Mbeki, Jacob Zuma was appointed to this position for his loyalty to the Party, his ability to work entirely under the orders of the new President, and also because he was not a potential rival of the latte<sup>25</sup>.

By weakening the role and importance of the Deputy Presidency<sup>26</sup> (while he had done the opposite under Mandela), Mbeki reinforced his executive power (the Presidency) and appointed to key positions two men considered by the South African press as his closest and most loyal collaborators: Essop Pahad, Minister in the Presidency, and Reverend Franck Chikane, Director-General in the same Office. Essop Pahad is also a representative of this generation of ANC leaders whose political path was pursued while in exile as early as the mid-1960s. With 40 years of friendship behind them, Mbeki trusts Pahad entirely. Previously, under the Presidency of Mandela, as Parliamentary Counsellor to the Deputy President, he was Mbeki’s relay with Parliament and the SACP of which he was a member in the Central Committee and Political Office. With the advent of Thabo Mbeki, Pahad’s influence was increased with the creation, in the President’s Office, of a post to suit him, making him the second most important person in the political sphere after Mbeki, the obvious reward for his loyalty<sup>27</sup>. Reverend Franck Chikane, who came from the Front of Internals, earned his “stripes” with Mbeki thanks to his political credibility and his extensive experience of bureaucracy<sup>28</sup>. He is appointed Director-General in the Deputy Presidency in 1996. In 1999, tasked with the daily control and running of the Presidency, his power was increased and he also became one of the most powerful persons of the government<sup>29</sup>.

Although ministerial appointments rely on performance as well as loyalty, certain appointments came as a surprise: Alec Erwin, one of the important figures of unionism in the 1980s, and Trevor Manuel, former BCM adept, UDF leader and Minister under Mandela,

---

<sup>25</sup> Being as old as Thabo Mbeki, Jacob Zuma will probably be too old by the time Mbeki begins his second mandate. In addition, Zuma does not seem to have the necessary charisma to be comfortable when dealing with home and foreign policy issues. Finally, his connection with and his role within the underground ANC structures during his exile, his implication in scandals (e.g. human rights violation in ANC/MK camps) and recent corruption issues are jeopardising his chances to become President (“The Power and the Party”, *Sunday Times*, 12 September 1999, p.23).

<sup>26</sup> Under Mbeki, the Deputy Presidency is stripped of most of its decision-making powers and is merely the Office where the orders of the executive power are executed.

<sup>27</sup> “He who will walk side by side with Thabo”, *The Sunday Independent*, 20 June 1999, p.4.

<sup>28</sup> Franck Chikane has been influenced by the BCM and played a major role in the religious movement during the 1980s within the South African Council of Churches.

<sup>29</sup> “A man who has faith in his leader”, *The Star*, 5 May 1999, p.17.

became supporters of Mbeki’s liberal economic policy, earning them a reward. Whereas Peter Mokaba, Deputy Minister of Tourism from 1996, despite his unconditional support to Mbeki, did not obtain a ministry<sup>30</sup>. Mosiuoa Lekota, on the contrary, although not perceived as a member of the “Mbeki Network”, obtained a key ministry, that of Defence. This promotion, after his position as Free State Premier until 1998 (which he left after Mbeki’s intervention) and his excellent chairmanship of the NCOP, is explained by his performance and loyalty to the Party.

At provincial level, Mbeki’s influence was measured as early as the April 1999 electoral campaign through his appointment of Premier candidates. In order to explain this measurement, we need to recall that the crises in the Provinces of Gauteng and the Free State (in 1996 and 1998 respectively) forced the ANC political leadership to intervene so as to end personal conflicts and intra-regional rivalries. On the recommendation of a Board of Inquiry created in 1997-1998, the Congress took a radical decision concerning provincial appointments (Lodge *op. cit.*, pp12-16; Pottie 1999, p.31). Aiming to avoid any “rampant provincialism”, the Board suggests that the Party President appointed his Premiers, considering that the ANC is “more concerned by the ability to govern the provincial administration than by the popularity of an individual” (Pottie *op. cit.*, p.31). By settling these problems as early as 1999, Thabo Mbeki sent the message that no opposition would be accepted, the role of Premier being above all to accelerate social transformation and not to satisfy personal ambition. As a result, three of the six ANC Premiers were moved aside (Free State, Gauteng and Mpumalanga) and replaced as per Mbeki’s choice <sup>31</sup>.

## THE ECONOMIC SPHERE

As desired by Thabo Mbeki, the strategy of transformation and even appropriation of the powers of governance also went through a control of the economic resources. The importance of the economic sphere and its links with the political group could be observed through the redeployment of certain members of the political sphere towards the economic sphere, and through the importance of the relations between the COSATU and the party in power. Following a policy developed by the ANC to control transformations in the economic sphere, former political and union leaders were appointed at the head of the most important firms of the country as well as public or semi-public enterprises.

---

<sup>30</sup> Considered as a “free electron” of the populists group, for the same reason as Winnie Madikizela-Mandela, he is noticed more for his distinguished political actions than for his performance as Deputy Minister.

<sup>31</sup> “ANC Candidate Premiers”, <http://www.anc.org.za/elections/lists/premiers.html>, accessed on 27 February 2004.

In 1998, the appointment of former Minister of Labour Tito Mboweni and former Deputy Minister of Finance Gill Marcus to head the Reserve Bank of South Africa (already orchestrated by Mbeki), was strongly criticised. Suspected of being unable to remain independent due to their ANC affiliation, they resigned from all their political responsibilities, thus reassuring critics as to their integrity and ability to lead the monetary policy and transformation of the Central Bank <sup>32</sup>.

State enterprises were also marked by this wave of political redeployment: Max Sisulu, close to Mbeki, was appointed to the head of public armament enterprise DENEL, and Sazi Macozoma, former parliamentarian, at the head of South African transport enterprise TRANSNET <sup>33</sup>.

#### ■ CONTROL OF THE INTERNAL OPPOSITION

The co-optation of political actors considered as the COSATU and SACP "heavy weights" was retained as a means to neutralise the particularly strong criticisms made of the government's economic policy. In order to do this, during the preparation of the 1999 electoral lists, some of these "heavy weights" were integrated into the National Assembly in particular, while others were appointed to government positions. For example, Charles Nqakula, one of the most virulent critics of Mbeki, was appointed Parliamentary Counsellor in the Presidency. Former BCM member in the middle of the 1970s, he also engaged in the union movement before going into exile in 1984, he joined the ANC and the SACP while in exile. Back in South Africa, he was elected SACP Deputy General-Secretary in December 1991, then General-Secretary after the death of Chris Hani (position in which he is maintained in April 1995). Another typical example is that of Sam Shilowa. Unionist

---

<sup>32</sup> Former member of the SACP she joined in 1969 under the influence of her family, Gill Marcus leaves South Africa during the 1960s in order to work in close collaboration with the ANC in exile, in London. Tito Mboweni is a former member of the student movement of the 1980s (fourth wave of political opponents). Frustrated by the political context and because he believes he can do more, he leaves the country to join the movement in exile.

<sup>33</sup> Growing up with Mbeki, Max Sisulu also goes into exile during the 1960s to study at university and to be part of the struggle movement in exile. Sazi Macozoma comes from the Front of Internals of the 1980s. We also witness the deliberate appointment of political leaders who, subsequently, decided to quit politics, whether temporarily or permanently, so as to pursue a career in the business world as a result of disagreements with the Party, or more particularly with Mbeki himself: Tokyo Sexwale, former Premier of Gauteng, (1994-1997), definitely quit his political career; Cyril Ramaphosa, former Chairperson of the Constitutional Assembly; former Minister of Transport Mac Maharaj as well as former Mpumalanga Premier Mathews Phosa whose name Mbeki had turned down as Premier candidate. Nonetheless, despite their conflicts or political absence, these figures are still enjoying today the same popularity within the Congress.

(President of the Transport and General Workers Union) then member of COSATU of which he was the General-Secretary in 1993, Shilowa supported the economic project of Mbeki in 1997 (and became a member of the ANC National Executive Committee). Being considered as a key COSATU figure, his support earned him the trust of Mbeki who appointed him as a candidate for the Premiership of one of the most important South African provinces, Gauteng. Shilowa was elected to the head of the Province in June 1999 <sup>34</sup>.

#### ■ THE FAILURES OF THE “MBEKI NETWORK”: CORRUPTION SCANDALS

Since his coming into power and, a fortiori, since the beginning of the Mbeki era, the ANC has regularly been damaged by scandals implicating political leaders at national as well as provincial level and demonstrating the resulting failures of the close relations between the political and economic spheres <sup>35</sup>. Winnie Madikizela-Mandela was condemned in 1995 for having accepted R75 000,00 with the aim of influencing the allocation of cheap housing contracts. In 1997, Housing Minister Sankie Mthembu was suspected for having favoured and authorised the allocation, by the Mpumalanga government, of a housing contract to the company Motheo Construction, run by her close friend Thandi Ndlovu. The two women had both gone into exile under the command of Thabo Mbeki, at a time when he was Chief of the ANC Communication Division in the 1980s. Yet, according to certain sources, at the time, the Housing Minister had taken her decision after consulting with the Deputy-Presidency (a point that Mbeki did not confirm nor refute) <sup>36</sup>.

The implication of the “Mbeki Network” in corruption scandals was even greater with the scandal affecting Deputy President Jacob Zuma, in 2003, and which finally led to his suspension as Deputy Minister by Mbeki in 2005.

The treatment given to Winnie Madikizela-Mandela is in sharp contrast with that given to Jacob Zuma. Madikizela-Mandela, successively condemned for abduction and murder (1991), elected to, stripped of, then re-elected to executive posts within the ANC (1992-1993), appointed Deputy Minister of Culture (1994), then stripped of her functions by her husband-President, reintegrated, and again stripped of her functions one month later

---

<sup>34</sup> “Striking figure in SA Labour”, *Mail & Guardian*, 2-8 February 1996, p.12.

<sup>35</sup> Lodge T. 1998a; Lodge T. 1998b.

<sup>36</sup> “Why minister axed her housing boss”, *Mail & Guardian*, 23-29 May 1997, pp.2-3; “Motheo buddies still in business”, *Mail & Guardian*, 24-30 October 1997, p.5; “Motheo: Sankie is not off the hook”, *Mail & Guardian*, 24-30 October 1997, p.31.

(1995) for corruption, has lost almost all her support, in particular that of her husband (they divorced in 1996), but kept a strong position within the activist base. The Zuma case illustrates at best the uncertainties of the system implemented by Thabo Mbeki who was not able to rid it of all the methods inherited from the underground struggle. As such, the secrecy and protection of the “cause” seem to remain untouchable values that, ironically, border on paradox, as is demonstrated by the ANC posters and radio messages that, since 2004, call for a major fight against corruption, a phenomenon into which ANC members are regularly implicated!

## CONCLUSION

After a long period of negotiations that saw the continuation of political practices developed by the ANC during the years of struggle, the underground struggle in particular, the ten years of ANC power are characterised by two very different political styles: the Mandela style, based on the “reward” and expertise of political executives who had always evolved in a context of illegal and underground opposition; and the Mbeki style, reflecting a will to rely on affinity-based political networks, rewarding and protecting not only those who had for a long time been committed to the struggle, but above all who are loyal towards the ANC and its new leader. The notion of expertise was not abandoned but was secondary to loyalty. Each model of governance has its limitations: Mandela did not really manage to prevent the rivalries that resurfaced once the need for unity in the face of apartheid had passed. While Mbeki, more authoritarian, seemed to have suppressed any vague objection and created a solid network of alliances. However, the ministerial portfolios he allocated were not always a wise choice to the point of discrediting him on his governing methods. The twenty years or so of political dealing and governance that transformed the ANC into a government party when it was an extra-parliamentarian organisation for more than eighty years, then an underground struggle movement, have also changed the political patterns of the organisation: if the tradition of secrecy has been continuing, respect of the elders and their experience made way for a quasi-personal power, controlled by one President and the “clan” he created around himself.

While there was little doubt that the ANC would remain in power after the April 2004 elections, the election results and the potential rise of opposition parties (or members of the government who have, up to now, criticised it) will help us understand the transformation of the ANC from a struggle movement into a governing party. It will also help us understand how this still quasi-dominant party is changing while faced with the diversification of oppositions and expectations of an electorate which is today impatient of seeing the full



realisation of democracy. But the observation of ten years of political life dominated by the ANC in the “new” South Africa raises especially the issue of “normalisation” of the paths taken to come into power. After the political appointments of the Mandela era based on the recognition of one’s involvement in the struggle, the personalisation of power and abuses observed in the new methods of government of the Mbeki era – as well as the migration of many a political figure towards the business world – raise questions as to the capacity of democratic South Africa to renew and mobilise its political elites.

TABLE 1 – PROFILE OF ANC FIGURES MENTIONED IN CHAPTER 1

NAME First Name	PARTIES	RELATED FRONT	POST or POSITION		1999
			1994	1996 (End of GNU)	
ASMAL Kader	Linked to the  (cannot be a member as he is not “African”) in exile, sets up a network of the movement in Great Britain. Officially a member in 1969	Exile ANC	Minister of Water Affairs and Forestry Education		Minister of
BENGU Sibusiso	ANC (1956); IFP (Founding member 1975)	Exile	Minister of Education		Retired
CHIKANE Franck	SASO (1972); South African Council of Churches (SACC); UDF (1983); ANC (1990)	Internal		Secretary of Cabinet in the Office of the Deputy President	Secretary of Cabinet in the Office of the President
ERWIN Alec	FOSATU (Founding member, 1979); COSATU (1985); ANC (1990)	Internal	Deputy-Minister of Finance	Minister of Trade and Industry	Minister of Trade and Industry
HOLOMISA Bantu	Former Army  Transkei; ANC Member in 1994	N/A General in	Deputy-Minister Environmental Affairs and Tourism	Stripped of his functions and expelled from the ANC	

TABLE 1 – (CONTINUED)

NAME First Name	PARTIES	RELATED FRONT	POST or POSITION		1999
			1994	1996 (End of GNU)	
JORDAN Pallo	ANC (1960)	Exile	Minister of Posts, Telecomm- unications and Broadcasting (1996-1996)	Minister of Environmental Affairs and Tourism of National Assembly	No longer called upon by Mbeki; Member
KASRILS Ronnie	SACP and MK secretely (1961); ANC (1980)	Exile	Deputy Minister of Defence		Minister of Water Affairs and Forestry
MADUNA Penuell	SASO (1973); ANC secretly (1977)	Exile	Deputy Minister of Home Affairs	Minister of Minerals and Energy	Minster of Justice and Constitutional Development
MAHARAJ Mac	NIC (beginning of the 1950s); SACP (1958); MK (1962). 12 years of imprisonment on Robben Island where he joins the ANC. Released in December 1976, goes into exile as early as July 1977	Robben Islander and Exile	Minister of Transport		Not called upon by Mbeki. Becomes Director of FirstRand Bank
MADIKIZELA- MANDELA Winnie	ANC and ANCWL (during the 1950s); UDF (1983)	Internal	Deputy Minister of Arts, Culture, Science and Technology	Stripped of her functions; Member of the National Assembly	Member of National Assembly
MANUEL Trevor	BCM (1973); Civics (1980); UDF (1983)	Internal	Minister of Trade and Industry	Minister of Finance	Minister of Finance
MARCUS Gill	SAPCP and ANC exile (1969)	Exile	Member of National Assembly	Deputy Minister of Finance	Deputy Governor of the South African Reserve Bank

TABLE 1 – (CONTINUED)

NAME First Name	PARTIES	RELATED FRONT	POST or POSITION		1999
			1994	1996 (End of GNU)	
MBEKI Thabo	ANCYL (1956); Member 1961)	Exile (Founding)	First Deputy President	Sole Deputy President	President
MBOWENI Tito	ANC in exile (until 1997)	Exile	Minister of Labour of the		Governor  South African Reserve Bank
MODISE Joe	ANCYL (1947); MK (Founding member, appointed in high command, 1961)	Exile	Minister of Defence		Retired (died in November 2001)
MOKABA Peter	ANC and MK secretly (1980); UDF and Civics (1985)	Internal and Robben Islander	Member of National Assembly	Deputy Minister of Environmental Affairs and Tourism	Not called upon by Mbeki Member of the National Assembly (died in June 2002)
MOOSA Mohamed Valli	SASO (1976); NIC (1979); UDF (1983); ANC (1989)	Exile	Deputy Minister of Provincial Affairs	Minister of Provincial Affairs and Constitutional Development	Minister of Environmental Affairs and Tourism
NAIDOO Jay	SASO (1970) FOSATU (1978) CASATU (1985) ANC (1989)	Internal	Minister without Portfolio (in charge of the RDP)	Minister of Posts and Telecommu- nications	Became a businessman
NHLANHLA Joe	ANC (1956); MK (1961)	Exile	Deputy Minister of Intelligence		Minister of Intelligence until January 2002 (retired)
NZO Alfred	ANCYL (1945); MK (1964)	Exile	Minister of Foreign Affairs		Retired (died in January 2000)
OMAR Dullah	UDF (1983); ANC (1990)	Internal	Minister of Justice		Minister of Transport (died in March 2004)

TABLE 1 – (CONTINUED)

NAME First Name	PARTIES	RELATED FRONT	POST or POSITION		1999
			1994	1996 (End of GNU)	
PAHAD Essop	TIC (1958); Works for the ANC in London, officially a member in 1969	Exile	Member of National Assembly	Deputy Minister in the Office of the Executive Deputy President	Minister in the Presidency
SIGCAU Stella	ANCYL (1950)	Internal	Minister of Public Enterprises		Minister of Public Works
SISULU Lindiwe	ANC (1970); MK (1977)	Exile		Deputy Minister of Home Affairs	Deputy Minister of Home Affairs then Minister of Intelligence (2002)
SKWEYIYA Zola	ANC (1956); MK (1963)	Exile	Minister of Public Service and Administration		Minister of Social Development
SLOVO Joe	ASACP (1942) MK (founding member, 1961); Member of ANC Steering Committee (1981)	Exile	Minister of Housing (died in 1995)		
TSHWETE Steve	ANC (at the end of the 1950s) MK (1962); ASA (founding member, 1960); UDF (1983)	Robben Islander Internal then Exile	Minister of Sport and Recreation		Minister of Police (died in April 2002)
ZUMA Jacob	ANC (1959); MK (1962)	Robben Islander then Exile	Member of the Executive Committee (MEC) of Economic Affairs and the Tourism for KwaZulu-Natal Provincial Government (1994)		Deputy President
DLAMINI- ZUMA Nkosazama	SASO (1970); ANC secretly (1976)	Exile	Minister of Health		Minister of Foreign Affairs

TABLE 2 – PROFILE OF ANC PREMIERS MENTIONED IN CHAPTER 1

NAME First Name	PARTIES	RELATED FRONT	POST or POSITION		1999
			1994	1996 (End of GNU)	
DIPICO Manne	AZASO (1981); ANC and MK secretly (1982); UDF (1985); NUM (1985)	Internal	Premier of the Province of the Northern Cape		Re-elected in June 1999
LEKOTA Mosiuoa	SASO (1969); ANC in Robben Island (1976); UDF (1983)	Robben Islander	Premier of the Province of the Free State	Forced by the ANC to resign; Mandela appoints him Chairperson of the NCOP	Minister of Defence
MHLABA Raymond	SACP and union movement (1943); ANC (1944); MK (1961)	Robben Islander			
MOLEFE Popo	BCM (1973 - 1977) UDF (1983); ANC (1989)	Robben Islander	Premier of the Province of the North-West		Re-elected in June 1999
PHOSA Mathews	SASO (1972); ANC and MK secretly (1979)	Exile	Premier of the Province of Mpumalanga		In conflict with Thabo Mbeki, he is not appointed as Premier candidate Retires into business
RAMATLHODI Ngoak	SASO (1977); ANC secretly (1978); MK (1980)	Exile	Premier of the Northern Province		Re-elected in June 1999
SEXWALE Tokyo	BCM (1971); ANC(1971) secretly	Robben Islander	Premier of the Province of Gauteng	Resigns after a conflict with the ANC and Thabo Mbeki; Retires into business	Businessman

## ■ REFERENCES

- ANC, 1997, *50th National Conference Report*, ANC Department of Information and Publicity, p. 22-23.
- ARON R., 1965, *Démocratie et Totalitarisme*, Paris, Editions Gallimard, p. 25.
- ARON R., 1988, *Etudes sociologiques*, Paris, P.U.F, p. 120.
- BARRELL H., 1990, *MK - the armed struggle*, Johannesburg, Penguin Book.
- BIKO S., 1996, *I Write What I like: a selection of his writings*, Johannesburg, Ravan Press.
- BUNTING B., 1998, *Moses Kotane. South Africa Revolutionnary*, Cape Town, Mayibuye Books-UWC.
- DOGAN M., 1989, *Pathways to Power. Selecting rulers in Pluralist Democracies*, Londres, Westview, p. 1.
- JOSEPH H., 1998, *If this be Treason*, Saxonworld, Contra Press.
- KARIS T.G. & GERHART G.M., 1991, *From Protest to Challenge*, Vol. 5, Nadir and Resurgence : 1882-1990, Pretoria, UNISA Press.
- LODGE T., « *Political Corruption in the new South Africa ?* », *IndicatorSA*, Vol. 50, n° 1, automne 1998, pp. 23-26
- LODGE T., « *Political Corruption in the new South Africa* », *African Affairs*, Vol.97, n° 387, avril 1998, pp. 157-187
- LODGE T., 1999, *South African Politics since 1994*, Cape Town, David Philip Publishers, p. 24
- MANDELA N., 1994, *Un long chemin vers la liberté*, Paris, Fayard, p. 529-552.
- MBEKE T., 1998, *Africa - The time has come*, Cape Town, Tafelberg publishers, p. i-xxi.
- POTTIE D., 1999, " Provincial Government, 1994-1999 ", in REYNOLDS A. (dir.), *Election'99 South Africa. From Mandela to Mbeki*, Cape Town, David Philip, p. 31.
- RANTETE J., 1998, *The African National Congress and the negotiated settlement in South Africa*, Pretoria, J.L.van Schaik Publishers, p. 197.
- SPARKS A., 1996, *Demain est un autre pays. Histoire secrète de la révolution Sud-Africaine*, Paris, IFRANE, p. 80
- SUTTNER R. & CRONIN J., 1986, *30 years of the Freedom Charter*, Johannesburg, Ravan Press.
- WELSH D., 1993, " La CODESA dans l'impasse " in DARBON D. (dir.), *La République Sud-africaine : Etat des Lieux*, Paris, Karthala, p. 29-43.
- VAN NIEKERK Ph. & LUDMAN B., 1999, *A-Z of South African Politics 1999. The Essential Handbook*, Johannesburg, Mail and Guardian.